

BOOK REVIEWS

THEOLOGUMENA II: DE RATIONE PECCATI POENAM AETERNAM INDUCENTIS.
By Joannes B. Manyà, Pbter. Biblioteca Teológica de Balmesiana, II, 2.
Barcelona: Editorial Balmes, 1947. Pp. 333.

In this lengthy volume the author attempts, on what he considers Thomistic principles, a new solution to the grave problem of divine justice in punishing sin eternally. Laudable as is his purpose in evolving this explanation and praiseworthy the time and effort devoted to its elaboration, this reviewer, for one, has found the new theory somewhat disquieting.

In his endeavor "to explain, confirm, evolve and complete" the doctrine of St. Thomas, the author sets forth what he considers the two basic principles of the Angelic Doctor on this matter: first, the obduracy of the will on the part of the damned is a prerequisite for the justice of eternal punishment; second, obduracy of men who are damned must be accounted for by the state of the soul after its separation from the body. All the author's conclusions follow from what he regards as the logical development of these premises. The process of argumentation is the following.

With regard to the first principle, it is most important to note the logical order set up by St. Thomas between the obduracy of the damned and the sentence of eternal punishment. Obduracy is not consequent upon the condemnatory sentence—that would be to impugn divine justice and sanctity by logically making God the author of sin in some way—but antecedent to it as a necessary condition or cause in order that eternal punishment be just. Obduracy, then, must proceed from a natural process of the freely acting will. The created will is not incapable of salutary repentance because God arbitrarily deprives it of grace, but it is deprived of grace because it is incapable of repentance. In the free determination, therefore, of the created will, St. Thomas finds the interior and ultimate cause of obduracy, an obduracy, be it remarked, that is absolute. And because it is absolute, Suarez' theory of a moral impossibility of repentance is unacceptable, since it does not preclude every possibility of the will overcoming the obstacles that encompass it.

Before tracing the author's development of his second Thomistic principle, to which the bulk of his work is devoted, it must be carefully noted that he presupposes here the theory on free will which he developed at great length in *Theologumena I: De Deo cooperante*. Scotists and Molinists, he says, maintain an active auto-determination of the will, but with St. Thomas (!), "aliter omnino nostra procedit sententia, passivam ponens libertatis conditionem sub praemotione objecti, quod ubi relativam boni plenitudinem apud conscientiam assequitur, necessario trahit ad se

voluntatem; ita quod liberum arbitrium, non eo demonstretur, quod possit objecto, in sensu composito ipsius resistere, sed eo profundiori, quod possit talem sensum compositum evertere" (*Theologumena II*, p. 10). The overthrow of this necessitating *sensus compositus* of the predominating object can be effected by the reaction of the will to the initial impulses of the object; should it not react and the object reach the point of determination, the act is still free since the will did not react when it could. Liberty, then, of the created will formally consists in something negative. (For a good critical analysis of this theory, cf. the review of Johann Stufier, S.J., *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie*, LXX [1948], 107-10).

In the light of the foregoing, one is now in a position to understand the author's conclusion that a full, explicit, definitive obduracy of the human will cannot be had in this life, but can only take place when the soul has taken on the characteristics of a spiritual substance (angel), that is, after its separation from the body. For, owing to the abstractive nature of human cognition in this life and the presence of ever changing passions, it is easy for man to retract a previous will, i.e., to overthrow a former *sensus compositus*, to obtain a "new moral state of the question."

To elucidate this conclusion, the author enters upon a lengthy treatment of the intellectual and affective life of separated spiritual substances (pp. 19-154). Many unusual opinions are advanced here that one would like to enumerate but we must be content to observe that the "vera causa sufficiens" of the angel's obduracy in sin is found in its entire psychic complex. The most important elements here are the natural intuitive character of angelic cognition and the passive condition of liberty, which bring it about that once the will has failed to react to a spontaneous, indeliberate motion of pride it is forever locked in the evil embrace of its own excellence, chosen as its last end. No new "moral state of the question" is possible because of the sweep of the intuitive knowledge under which the election was made.

But there is a tremendous contrast between the sin of the angels and the mortal sins of men in this life. Theologically, it is true, every mortal sin bespeaks an aversion from God and a conversion to a creature; every mortal sin possesses an objective "aeternitatis sensus," an irrevocable rejection of God. Psychological analysis, however, forces us to judge quite differently of this aversion from God than do the norms of theoretical logic. Man's will on earth is capable of monstrous absurdities, guided as it is by abstractive knowledge and influenced by changing passions. It is ever flexible. Man may detest his sin the moment after its commission; in fact, even while sinning he may be looking towards a future pardon. Psychologically, therefore, we may speak of a "dimidiata voluntas" in the matter of the rejection of

God, since He is not rejected totally and explicitly but only implicitly. Actually there remains a certain, as it were, virtual or radical adhesion to God as one's last end. Many mortal sins, therefore, from the psychological standpoint approach the characteristics of venial sin; in fact, what St. Thomas says of venial sin, "*reparabilia sunt*" (I-II, q. 88, a. 1), may be applied in a certain logical sense, *mutatis mutandis*, to very many mortal sins of this life. Compared with the sin of angels, mortal sin in this life does not attain to the full notion of mortal sin either in its consequences or in its intensity and force. Though it has an objective irrevocability, still in many cases a subjectively explicit, full, and definitive eternal rejection of God is lacking; hence the proximate reason for eternal punishment is not yet present (the interpretative eternal rejection of God mentioned by theologians is not such a reason) but only one that is remote. "*Ecquidem, juxta S. Thomae doctrinam a nobis hac dissertatione expositam, peccata nostra actualia, si ipsis ab hora mortis non accederet obfirmatio voluntatis in malum irrevocabilis, aeternaliter non punirentur. Itaque ratio proxima inducens immediate reatum aeternae poenae, non illa prior mala voluntas existit, sed potius novissima ipsius reaffirmatio definitiva per obstinationem*" (p. 237; cf. also pp. 155-70; 267-73).

When will this definitive reaffirmation of the former evil will take place? At the moment when the human soul takes on the psychic mode proper to spiritual substances, that is, at the moment when the intellect receives a natural intuitive cognition of itself and God. Only with the aid of this new light can the election of the will be irrevocable. There must, therefore, be a moment, at least posterior in nature to that of death, during which the soul gives a free, definitive adhesion to sin.

What, then, of the "common doctrine of theologians and the Christian conscience" (p. 206) which has always understood that the *status viae* is concluded at the last moment of the present life? Will there be a possibility of salutary repentance when the soul receives this new intuitive light? These are admittedly grave problems. Though the author feels that there is much to be said for a hypothesis of a gradual transition from "imaginal cognition" to a "non-imaginal" one (intuitive) just prior to death, still, in any event, one must say that the moment of final decision pertains to the *status viae*, even if it follows by a posteriority of nature (the soul is beyond time) the moment of real death. "*Non absurdum nec contra fidem poneret, ad mentem S. Thomae, statum viae protrahi quousque anima condiciones vitae novae perfecte assequatur, sic tamen ut hoc fiat mox seu statim post realem mortem*" (p. 220). It would be perhaps truer to say that this moment partakes of the characteristics of both *status viae* and *termini* (cf. pp.

205-28). And what of the possibility of repentance during this moment? Any obduracy, of course, at this time must result from a free election of the will; it is not automatic, as Billot suggests, thereby "*thomisticam doctrinam funditus dissipans*" (p. 238). There must be a sufficient reason for this final obduracy; "*atqui sufficientem non praebeant obdurationis rationem anteriores animae dispositiones . . . nec quidquam juvabit illam mere interpretativam voluntatem invocare . . . sed neque ex nova luce intuitivae cognitionis, redditur ratio sufficiens obdurationis. . . . Maneat igitur hoc inconcussum in doctrina S. Thomae: illa omnia eaque sola peccata poena aeternam proxima et sufficienti ratione postulare, quae naturali libertatis processu in obstinationem voluntatis aeternam, protempore mortis, resolvantur*" (pp. 239-40). What are these sins? "*Mysteria hic latent divinae gratiae et praedestinationis! mysteria etiam psychologiae libertatis, et generalis et individualis* (p. 240)!"

The author, however, is not one of the "Misericordes." He adopts a very "pessimistic view" of the possibility of salutary repentance at this moment, despite the new light, and this because of the fact that many angels sinned, despite an even greater light, but particularly because of the disposition of pride that the sinner brings with him, coupled with the difficulty of eliciting an act of perfect contrition in but a moment. Attrition will be of no avail, in fact, "*non enim difficile, etiam apud nos, componi potest attritionis quidam affectus, cum odio in Deum superbo, unde procedit obduratio et sustinetur*" (p. 153). Only one class of sinners, as the author sees it, has a good chance of salutary repentance, those, namely, who have sinned only "obiter" and have a naturally acquired habit of turning immediately to God in perfect contrition. Consequently, the doctrine proposed here is not a pernicious one, but rather salutary in its insistence on bringing the proper dispositions of soul to this decisive moment (cf. pp. 229-60).

This is not the doctrine of Hirscher and Schell, protests the author, for every mortal sin by which sanctifying grace is lost is a remote, but yet sufficient and efficacious disposition for inducing eternal punishment (cf. statement above!) and the eternal lot of the soul is irrevocably decided in the last moment of the present life ("which, however, chronologically coincides with the first moment of the next"). Regarding the opinion, however, of Klee, *viz.*, the souls of non-baptized infants receive the use of reason after death and are able to elicit an act of perfect charity, the author says: "*etiamsi certa positive non demonstretur, sed neque absurda proditur e conspectu psychologiae; ideoque ad solvendam arduam difficultatem theologicam utiliter forsitan adhiberetur, praesertim si aliae solutiones*

adaequatae deficiant" (p. 223), and proceeds to show why the opinion is not in conflict with the existence of a *limbus puerorum* or the necessity of baptism for salvation.

In a footnote it is said that God is not strictly speaking Judge at the particular judgement but only "Praeses"; "ipse peccator suimet iudex est, imo totam causam agit, voluntate definitiva eligens inter Deum et creaturam peccati . . ." (p. 278, note 1). And finally in a *Scholion* a rather unusual explanation is given for the *poena sensus* of the damned; it is said to consist in the torturing possession of that creature for whose sake God was rejected as the soul's last end.

Though the author protests throughout his work that he is presenting the genuine doctrine of St. Thomas, it is quite obvious that he is not a faithful commentator of his guide; in fact, he rejects a number of clear-cut opinions and distorts others. A good instance of this latter is the use he makes—and it is not incidental—of *De Malo*, q. 7, a. 11, ad 11. Here St. Thomas is plainly speaking of the remission of the guilt of venial sin by an act of charity after death; our author, however, finds a principle here that is applicable, *mutatis mutandis*, to mortal sins committed "dimidiata voluntate," even though St. Thomas in the body of the article states, "sed in futura vita mortale peccatum nunquam potest remitti quantum ad culpam, non enim post hanc vitam anima immutatur essentialiter immutatione per gratiae et caritatis infusionem de novo."

Contrary to the author's protestation, it seems to this reviewer that the author follows the spirit, if not the letter, of the dangerous doctrines of Hirscher and Schell; he has introduced a type of mortal sin which needs subjective confirmation after death for a just sentence of eternal damnation, a confirmation that is not automatic or *ex natura rei* but free, hence allowing the possibility of salutary repentance; he extends, contrary to Catholic doctrine, the *status viae* into the realm of *status termini*, this becomes all too obvious when he even admits "ignis purgatorius qui temporalis est, non vero aeternus infernalis, peccatoribus christianis ad illum supremum instans forsitan salutariter poenitentibus assignetur" (p. 311, note). Though the author may not be one of the "Misericordes" in personal attitude, still the principles of this group would seem to be implicit in his doctrine.

Alma College

WILLIAM A. HUESMAN, S.J.

DE SCIENTIA DEI FUTURORUM CONTINGENTIUM SECUNDUM S. THOMAM EJUSQUE PRIMOS SEQUACES. By Julianus Groblicki. Kraków, 1938. Pp. 146.

The purpose of this work, a doctorate thesis originally presented to the faculty of the Angelicum, is not to attempt a definitive solution of the problem how God knows the contingent futures nor to decide whether the Thomistic (Bannezian) or Molinistic answer represents the genuine mind of St. Thomas, but to investigate the question historically and discover how St. Thomas' first followers understood his teaching. To this end Part One studies the pertinent tests of St. Thomas himself, compares the doctrine found there with its sources (Boethius and St. Albert the Great) and with current Augustinianism as represented by St. Bonaventure, and investigates writings of a number of the Angelic Doctor's earliest disciples (Peter of Tarentaise, Hannibald de Hannibaldis, Romanus of Rome, Giles of Rome, Peter of Auvergne). The Second Part is engaged with the controversy stirred up by the vigorous opposition of the Franciscan school to the new teaching; here the author devotes his research to William de la Mare's *Corruptorium* (*Correctorium Fratris Thomae*), which gave definitive public form to the reaction, and to the various *Correctoria* written in defence of St. Thomas' position.

Analyzing these sources, some of them unedited, the author reaches the general conclusion that for St. Thomas and his first followers God knows the contingent futures in a twofold way: (1) because He sees them as present to His eternity in their real *esse*; and (2) because He is their cause.

The first conclusion is ably presented and the author merits special praise for bringing into clearer light the position of St. Thomas—that by His eternity God is present to all time and thus knows all contingents as present and existing in themselves with that real, physical *esse* they will have at some moment of time. This doctrine, found in Boethius, whom St. Thomas cites, was in opposition to St. Albert and St. Bonaventure, who maintained the presence of things to the divine eternity only in their cognitional or *intentional esse* ("in ideis," "in rationibus causalibus"); but there seems no doubt that the other is St. Thomas' meaning. It is assured by the passages from his own works, the understanding of his adversaries, and the writings of his early defenders who, with one or two exception, always acknowledged this sense of their master's teaching and strove to answer the difficulties impugning it.

In urging the second conclusion regarding divine causality the author, influenced no doubt by his preference for the Bannezian solution (of which he scatters a few hints), appears a bit tendentious, and seems to put far more accent on the divine causality as explanatory of the divine foreknowledge than St. Thomas or his early disciples did. More often the appeal to this causality is deduced from principles merely mentioned or

stated elsewhere rather than by stressing the texts engaged directly with the contingent futures. Thus the argument from the *Contra Gentiles*, I, 68, is far from convincing, since the passage is not dealing with the acts of the will in so far as they are contingent futures (these were treated in the chapter immediately preceding, c. 67), but rather with the scrutiny of hearts (as the scriptural texts alleged bear witness). This is not to say that St. Thomas does not refer to God's causality in explaining the divine foreknowledge; he does. But the point is that he seems never to have considered it a sufficient explanation. To explain the infallibility of God's cognition of the contingent futures he always turns to their presence to the divine eternity. The author (pp. 38-39) has attempted to reconcile the two conclusions, and finds himself moving in the right direction by making the link the real ontological existence of the contingent futures as the term of the divine foreknowledge; but he was stopped short of carrying his reasoning to the ultimate conclusion. In the last analysis the solution embraces the solution of the whole problem of contingency (which the author has appreciated), and in the reviewer's opinion the best exposition of St. Thomas' mind on that factor has been presented in the pages of this periodical by Fr. Bernard Lonergan in his articles, "St. Thomas' Thought on *Gratia Operans*" (THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, 1941-42; especially III [1942], 541-47).

While it is outside the scope of this review to repeat the latter writer's views, a pertinent question or two may give a clue to the proper solution. In any attempt to understand St. Thomas' answer a common fallacy "lies in supposing God's knowledge of the creature, or His creative will and operation, to be some reality in God that would not be there if He had not created. God is immutable. He is entitatively identical whether He creates or does not create. His knowledge or will or production of the created universe adds only a *relatio rationis* to the *actus purus*. They are predications by extrinsic denomination. Further, it is to be observed that a fallacy on this point is closely connected with fallacious ideas of time. For there can be no predication by extrinsic denomination without the actuality of the extrinsic denominator: else the *adaequatio veritatis* is not satisfied. Accordingly, to assert that God knows this creature or event, that He wills it, that He effects it, is also *ipso facto* to assert that the creature or event actually is" (pp. 542-43). "It is only in the logico-metaphysical simultaneity of the atemporal present that God's knowledge is infallible, His will irresistible, His action efficacious" (p. 553). It would seem, therefore, that any appeal to causality to explain the infallible foreknowledge of God must always come back to the ontological presentiality of things to the divine eternity. On this point St. Thomas seems always to insist, and he

returns to it as often as he takes up the discussion of the contingent futures. Whether or not room is left for the competing theories that came later is not the point at issue, for the work at hand is meant to be historical and nothing more. It can be said that in good part, though not entirely, that the author has achieved his objective.

Woodstock College

THOMAS A. BROPHY, S. J.

DE EUCHARISTIA. Tom. II: *De Sacrificio*. By Emmanuel Doronzo, O.M.I. Milwaukee: The Bruce Publishing Company, 1948. Pp. x + 781-1219 + [47]. \$7.00.

This volume is the seventh and last chapter of Doronzo's magnificent work on the Eucharist, the first volume of which was reviewed in *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES*, IX (1948), 460-61. The general observations made in that review are equally applicable to the second volume. It will suffice here, therefore, to call attention to the particular features of this chapter, and to add a word of comment on the author's position with reference to *formalis ratio sacrificii Missae*.

The fifteen articles of this chapter treat successively of the following questions: the nature of sacrifice in general; the existence of the sacrifice of the Mass; its essence and *formalis ratio*; its efficient cause, that is to say, its officers, principal and secondary; its complex final cause *in ordine intentionis et executionis* (seven articles); a comparison of the eucharistic sacrifice and sacrament; lastly, an article on the ceremonies of the Mass.

On the knotty question of the *formalis ratio*, the author skilfully and clearly groups the pertinent theories with their sundry variations under three main headings: *sententia sacrificii,—repraesentationis,—immolationis,—oblationis*. This detailed and comprehensive coverage is one of the outstanding features of the book, and its value is not at all diminished by the fact that Doronzo personally prefers what he considers to be the simpler explanation stemming from the "older tradition." According to this explanation, the sacrifice of the Mass consists "formaliter in ipsa oblatione atque immolatione crucis, prout repraesentative reiterata in mystica mactatione eiusdem victimae, per consecrationem peracta" (pp. 1016 sq.). The self-same "oblatio et immolatio," or "oblatio immolativa," or "Christus passus" is on Calvary "secundum esse physicum, entitativum, absolutum," and is present in the Mass "secundum esse repraesentativum, objectivum, relativum." "... Haec oblatio et immolatio in cruce exercetur secundum suum esse physicum, in missa vero secundum esse repraesentativum. Signanter dicimus 'exercetur'; ... nam in missa exercetur in ordine objec-

tivo (sicut in cruce exercitum est in ordine physico), quatenus Christus ipse, victima crucis, se subicit sacramentali ac reali mactationi quae, quamvis de se non sit sacrificialis, tamen in actu exercito reproducit quidquid physice actum est in ipsa cruce, ac ita ipsam tragoediam et sacrificium Calvariae realiter ac mystice reddit praesens in altari" (p. 1018).

Doronzo expresses the hope that this return to the earlier simplicity will put an end to "incessantibus nec foecundis inquisitionibus modernorum de essentia sacrificii Missae" (p. 1026). This reviewer can only say regretfully that the hope is unfulfilled in his case. The clock has merely been turned back, and it seems that the modern theories are necessary, if not too successful, attempts to explain *how* it is the identically same *Christus passus* on Calvary and in the Mass. It seems that either Doronzo is not clear in defending his position on this point (an unlikely supposition in view of his shining clarity elsewhere in the book) or the theory in its core defies clarification.

A final observation may be permitted. In view of the fact that the scholarly author objects to De la Taille's theory chiefly on the score that it can scarcely be reconciled with the mind and words of Trent, his book in complete fairness should carry some reference to an article by De la Taille entitled "The Last Supper and Catholic Divines from Henry VIII to the Council of Trent" (*Irish Eccl. Record*, June, 1925). It is the conviction of many serious students of history and of theology that that article (reprinted in the volume, "The Mystery of Faith and Human Opinion Contrasted and Defined," Sheed and Ward, 1930) answered the fearsome objection quite satisfactorily.

St. Mary's College

CLEMENT DE MUTH, S. J.

DE VERBO INCARNATO ET DE BEATA VIRGINE MARIA. By Corentin Larnicol, C.S.Sp. Rome: Officium Libri Catholici, 1948. Pp. 243.

This work is a text-book presenting a compendium of Christology and Mariology for the use of professors and students as well as for those engaged in the work of the ministry. For reasons of utility the author separates his treatment of common Catholic doctrine from that of controverted points. The latter are considered after the common doctrine has been established. While the usual method of presenting each point—terms, adversaries, proofs, objections—is followed, still only the necessary minimum of definitions and explanations is given. Both conciseness and completeness are thus achieved. The brevity characteristic of a compendium is furthered by citing, in the proofs of theses, a few principal Scripture texts and by referring to the index number of Rouet de Journel's *Enchiridion Patristicum* for the pertinent

doctrine of the Fathers. The author adopts definite positions on controverted points. Christ has no human personality because He lacks the act of substantial existence proper to His human nature. The hypostatic union, then, consists in the actuation of the human nature by the personal existence of the Divine Word. Christ had a strict command to die. This is conciliated with His impeccability and liberty by distinguishing a double impeccability in Christ, that of a *comprehensor* and that of a *viator*. The former is caused by the beatific vision and renders freedom with regard to precepts impossible; the latter is brought about by efficacious graces and is just as compatible with freedom under divine commands as these graces themselves. The causality of Christ as man in the production of grace and in miracles is physical as well as moral. Mary cooperated immediately in the objective redemption.

West Baden College.

JAMES J. DOYLE, S.J.

CHRISTIAN MARRIAGE. By George H. Joyce, S.J. Heythrop Theological Series, I. London: Sheed & Ward, 1948. Pp. xiii + 645. 21s.

The present volume is a second edition, revised and enlarged by Fr. Joyce, who completed his task shortly before his death in 1943; it was seen through the press by Fr. F. Courtney, S. J. The alterations are confined to the historical parts of the work. The following chapters have been rewritten to some extent: c. II, "The Formation of Christian Marriage. (i) The Essential Factor: Consent"; c. VI, "The Church's Jurisdiction over Matrimonial Causes"; c. XIII, "Monogamy: Second and Subsequent Marriages." A new section (4) has been added to c. XII, dealing with papal dispensations from the impediments arising from consanguinity and affinity. Three documents concerning dowry, marriage before a notary, and the minister of the sacrament, are new additions in the Appendix. A revised and enlarged index completes the work.

West Baden College

C. L. FIRSTOS, S.J.

CAHIERS LAËNNEC: LES ÉTATS INTERSEXUELS. (Nos. 2 & 3, 1947). Paris: P. Lethielleux, 1948. Pp. 48, 48. 80 fr. ea.

This French Journal of Medical Ethics and Medico-Moral Theology deserves the highest praise and we are indebted to its editors for many valuable contributions on such difficult and vexing problems as abortion, birth-control, hysterectomy, real and apparent death, psychoanalysis, and miracles at Lourdes. We cannot too highly recommend this scholarly review to all priests, doctors and educators. Here is found cogent evidence

of the great gain that follows from professional collaboration of priests and doctors.

Numbers 2 and 3 of the 1947 *Cahiers* treat of "Les états intersexuels" in a scholarly and sympathetic manner. The subject matter is delicate and leads into various forms of sexual aberrations. Dr. Ombredanne and Père Tesson discuss from the point of view of medicine and moral theology the problems of marriage of hermaphrodites. We must here distinguish two questions: lawfulness of operations on these hermaphrodites, and the canonical validity of their marriages. The very success of certain operations might result in the impediment of impotency, and this fact might be forgotten due to an excessive stress on the argument from the social rejection and loneliness of the hermaphrodite.

By far the greater number of pages is devoted to the study of homosexuality. A profound and searching analysis is made of its causes and mentality as seen in medical case-history, literature, psychoanalysis, spiritual direction and in the testimony of homosexuals themselves. "Tout comprendre, c'est tout pardonner." Understanding of the homosexual climate will surely aid in its treatment. As Dr. Le Moal writes: "A ces anormaux constitutionnels nous devons non pas le mépris, mais la pitié et la charité." Pharisaical condemnation or naive astonishment will doom our healing attempts to failure.

The chapter of Dr. Gengoux on homosexuality in literature is a fascinating one. We read of the conversations in Plato, of Sappho, Verlaine, Proust, Gide, Renée Vivien. Here we see homosexuality as a weary search for Infinite Beauty, a nostalgia for the serenity and innocence of childhood, the flight from future and present, the cowardly refusal to accept love, marriage, sex, children; the dream-world of mirage, the artificial paradise, the "cherchant l'éternité dans la minute brève," the affected calm, the heresy of angelism, the inversion of eternity, rebellion against God's design, the supreme egoism, the devouring of self by self, rejection by society, ensuing inferiority, pride, and justification, the liquefaction of virility, the inevitable eternity of sadness, of life that is all regret, the "facilis descensus averni", the last circle of hell, no life, no death.

The authors are at one in their insistence in distinguishing between masculine and feminine homosexuality, between homosexuality of tendency and of act, and almost all are unwilling, because of insufficient evidence, to accept innate or constitutional homosexuality. If then homosexuality is acquired, we must think in terms of causes, occasions (e.g., bisexual boarding-schools). As Claudel says so well: "Sauvez-nous du premier péché commis par surpris."

Remedies for homosexuality will be physical and/or psychical. The doctors think that hormone treatment is too risky. There is no one general remedy since there is no single type of homosexuality. All stress the importance of reeducation, a reorientation, an exposition of the nature and creative values of true married love, to obtain success in conquering the barrier of sex. "La prophylaxie de l'homosexualité est pour une large mesure un problème d'éducation sexuelle au sens plein du mot."

Priests and doctors are advised to receive the homosexual with all possible kindness and understanding, to arouse his confidence, to dispel his fatalism and despair, to be most discreet at first in questioning him, not to mention the spiritual or grace too early, lest they view grace as magic or a talisman, and lest, if they fall again, they find their last anchor is gone. We are also advised not to answer too soon their questions as to the degree of responsibility in their sin, for it takes time to determine the roles of disease and freedom. Above all, the homosexual must separate himself physically and mentally from his former companions and milieu. The authors feel that marriage may be permitted more readily to homosexual women than to men, because of what children and a home can do to restore normality. In the weaning process of men, we must expect them at first to fall in love with women who resemble their former homosexual companions. "Le mariage comme moyen thérapeutique doit être rejeté d'une façon absolue et sans condition." For many homosexual men marriage is inadvisable; for them, sublimation, other interests, social activity.

Rarely should homosexuals be allowed to go into the priesthood or the religious life. We must check closely on heredity and the cause of the homosexual deviation. True, the ideal of vocation can speed recovery, but there is always the danger that the vocation is but another escape from sex and marriage.

If to save one soul is worthwhile, if to effect one happy marriage or to prevent a disastrous one is worthwhile, if to prevent one sin is worthwhile, then every priest should study carefully these *Cahiers Laënnec*.

College of Christ the King.

J. ELLIOTT MACGUIGAN, S.J.

LA FECONDAZIONE ARTIFICIALE. By Agostino Gemelli, O.F.M. Milano: Vita e Pensiero, 1947. Pp. 75.

The distinguished Rector of the Catholic University of Milan is eminently fitted to discuss both the medical and the moral aspects of artificial fecundation, for he is a physician as well as a theologian. In this most recent of his many monographs he presents briefly and clearly both aspects of the subject

and also furnishes data as to the extent of the practice of artificial fecundation at the present day.

It is important, however, to realize that Fr. Gemelli is using the expression "artificial fecundation" in a somewhat different sense from that which is usually given it in the United States. When this expression—or its more common synonym "artificial insemination"—is employed in our country it signifies primarily the impregnation of a married woman with the seed of a man who is not her husband (heterologous artificial insemination). Fr. Gemelli is concerned for the most part with measures other than normal sexual union whereby a woman is fecundated by the seed of her own husband (homologous artificial insemination).

After briefly relating in the first two chapters the growth of the practice of artificial fecundation in Europe and in the United States, the author presents in the third chapter the opinions of theologians on the morality of this practice. Only the homologous type is discussed. Fr. Gemelli points out that all theologians agree that any procedure which involves masturbation on the part of the husband is sinful. A like condemnation must be meted out, he says, on the process of procuring seed from the seminal vesicles by massage. It is a disputed point whether or not it is licit to obtain seed by puncturing the epididymis. Most theologians allow that method of assisting the generative process which consists of drawing the seed into a syringe after it has been deposited properly in the vagina and depositing it more deeply.

Medical phases of artificial fecundation are examined in the fourth chapter. The author proposes his views on the causes of sterility, the period in which conception can take place, the danger of infection involved in the injection of seed into the uterus, etc.

In the fifth and sixth chapters Fr. Gemelli gives his own opinions on the morality of artificial fecundation, which are more rigorous than those held by many theologians, and yet seem to be deduced logically from indubitable principles. It is interesting to note the similarity between Fr. Gemelli's conclusions and those reached by Fr. W. K. Glover, S. M., in his recent doctoral dissertation *Artificial Insemination among Human Beings* (Catholic University of America, 1948), though both authors studied the question independently.

Fr. Gemelli lays down the principles that no one has the disposition of his own sexual life (since this is the exclusive right of the married partner); no one may dispose of the germinative cells of his body save in sexual intercourse; only a married person may make use of these cells at the request of his married partner. From these principles Fr. Gemelli concludes that all

the methods employed for artificial fecundation are sinful, including the process of aspirating seed from the epididymis. Even the use of a syringe to draw up the seed (after it has been properly deposited) and to force it further into the woman's body is illicit, he claims, because it is an act distinct from conjugal intercourse. Finally, he points out the immorality of artificial insemination through the aid of a "donor," whether the woman is married or unmarried.

Although Fr. Gemelli has produced an excellent work, it is to be regretted that he did not have at his disposal some of the literature on the subject of artificial insemination that has been published in the United States in recent years. Not a single American publication appears in his bibliography.

Catholic University of America

FRANCIS J. CONNELL, C.SS.R.

LA RENUNCIA ALL' UFFICIO ECCLESIASTICO NELLA STORIA DEL DIRITTO CANONICO DALLA ETÀ APOSTOLICA ALLA RIFORMA CATTOLICA. By Pier Giovanni Caron. Milan: Società Editrice "Vita e Pensiero." Pp. xviii + 413.

The purpose of the author is an adequate juridical and historical investigation of the renunciation of an ecclesiastical office from the apostolic age to the period of the Council of Trent. The prescribed qualities, formalities, and effects of a renunciation as listed in canons 184-91, for example, the influence of *melus gravis*, the written or oral form of renunciation, the necessity of acceptance and the power of acceptance, the sense, application and effects of a tacit renunciation are thoroughly examined in all legal and historical sources and in the canonical authors of the particular period. The historical treatment does not consist of a mere chronical catalogue of laws but also gives a satisfactory examination into the external occasion and motives of the various laws. The material content of the work is not of general interest, even to canonists. The formal aspect and structure of the volume constitute an outstanding example of a most laborious juridical and historical investigation of a canonical question.

Woodstock College

JOSEPH F. GALLEN, S. J.

LA MORT ET SES PROBLÈMES. By Docteur Henri Bon. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1947. Pp. x + 286. 180 Fr.

A little less than half of this book (the first 112 pages) is devoted to that varying period of time which usually precedes death and is called "the agony," even when suffering is not acute or is absent. The problems considered here are physiological, psychological, and moral. The remainder of

the book deals with the body and soul immediately after death and their ultimate destiny. Here the problems are those proper to the dogmatic treatise, *De Novissimis*, psychology, cosmology, and the natural sciences.

After an opening chapter on death and its causes, Dr. Bon gives a detailed and lengthy description of the different degrees of consciousness and sense perception that may remain even when a patient is *in extremis*. Evaluation is made of the testamentary capacity of such patients, of the juridical value of their testimony and of the effectiveness of a death-bed conversion or repentance. Many facts from the author's own experience and from that of other physicians are offered to prove that the mind and will are often active and that the sense of hearing may continue to register even when the patient appears senseless and is incapable of manifesting externally any sign of his internal activity. Hence, the priest and the physician, in the presence of those dying in an apparently unconscious state, must refrain from actions and words that may harm them if they are still conscious and sentient; and the priest should continue his ministry with the thought that the person may hear his prayers and internally cooperate with his sacramental actions. In the problem of real and apparent death, the author calls only that death "apparent" in which, after respiration and heart beat have ceased, the patient is brought back to full life by such extraordinary means as heart massage, artificial respiration, etc. Far more frequent are the cases in which, after the last heart beat, the patient could not be brought back to life by any means at the present disposal of the physician. Yet, the last heart beat is no certain sign that body and soul have separated. This period of time between the last heart beat and the moment when the soul leaves the body is called "relative" death. Only after a period of relative death, which will vary in length with the cause of death, comes real or definitive death, and the author humbly admits that it is impossible to fix its exact moment since its symptoms are gradual, uncertain and inconclusive. In those cases in which death is preceded by the general and gradual exhaustion of all the vital functions, as in old age, starvation, and general poisoning or infection, the soul will leave the body with the last breath or shortly thereafter. But, in cases of accidental death, there will always be a shorter or longer period of relative death. This is true not only in cases of death by drowning, shooting, etc., but even when death comes during a disease. Such a death may be considered accidental even when it is immediately due to the sudden collapse of one of the main vital functions, such as the heart, the lungs, or the nervous system, which involves the gradual cessation of the other vital functions. With such abundant testimony, Dr. Bon justifies the practice of conditionally administering the last sacraments to those who have

"breathed their last." There follows a brief treatment of medical homicide, accidental, indirect and justified, and unjustified; there is also a summary condemnation of dangerous experimentation on human beings, except in certain desperate cases. In treating moral problems, the author is not exhaustive but his conclusions are sound. (Dr. Bon is also the author of *Précis de médecine catholique*.)

In the rest of the book, these problems are considered: the dissolution of the body after death; the consignment of the soul to heaven, hell, purgatory, or limbo (of unbaptized infants); the possibility of sense suffering in the separated soul; the end of the world and its transformation; the resurrection of the body and the properties of a glorified body; the numerical and conscious identity of person after the reunion of the soul and the glorified body; the vision of God; the vital functions and sense activity of the blessed. The same procedure is followed throughout this section. From the Old and New Testament, the Councils, and the Fathers, Catholic doctrine is explained and proved. Then, with the premise that the wondrous effects that accompany the end of the world can evidently be produced by God's omnipotent power, Dr. Bon uses the latest discoveries of science to speculate on the role of secondary causes. Thus, he uses the discovery of isotopes to give a possible explanation for the fact that the risen body will be numerically identical with the one previously united to the soul. Once the matter of a human body has been informed by a soul, is it not possible that a part of that matter may have been so transformed by the soul that it can never become a part of another living organism even though it retain the same chemical formula?

Dr. Bon shows a depth of erudition in many fields of learning. The writing is clear, orderly and well documented. A deep Catholic spirit is revealed united to an inquiring and searching mind that is bold enough to use modern science as a help to his faith as it seeks understanding.

Woodstock College

J. DUHAMEL, S. J.

AUFBRUCH ZUR EINHEIT UND EINIGKEIT IM GLAUBEN. By Dr. Michael Buchberger. Freiburg: Verlag Herder, 1948. Pp. 44.

The Bishop of Regensburg has written this booklet on the *Una Sancta* movement not in the spirit of a party manifesto but with a desire to be of service to all to whom the urgent present crisis has revealed sectarian pluralism as an historical anachronism, and who are convinced that disunion is infidelity to Christ's redemptive mission. We have here no schemes or recipes for quick results; still less is there rating of one's opponents or scoring

of facile debating points. The spirit is that of St. John of the Cross when he wrote, "Where there is no love, there put love and you will reap love." But if reunion will be the fruit of love, it must be, in the words of Dr. Joseph Lortz whom the Bishop cites, "seinsgerechten Liebe."

Dr. Buchberger treats of recent efforts (mostly in Germany) in the direction of reunion; of the difficulties, both historical and psychological, that impede progress; of the basic postulates of reunion; and finally of the immediate tasks that lie ahead. He insists on the proximate need of fostering an *ethos*, a spiritual temper that will be favorable to a rapprochement between souls.

Theological competence and a pastoral charity that remind one of the late Bishop Marius Besson of Lausanne, make Dr. Buchberger a sure leader in these delicate tasks where ineptitude can be so damaging. One cannot but think of Blessed Peter Faber who worked for the same ends four centuries ago and whose spirit is so needed today.

Weston College.

FRANCIS X. LAWLOR, S.J.

WEHRHAFTE GLÄUBIGKEIT. By Josef Lechner. Würzburg: Echter-Verlag, 1948. Pp. 203.

Dr. Lechner tells us that it is his purpose to treat of what one means when he says "I believe," rather than to explain how one comes to believe, or how belief stands in relation to the whole process of justification. It is less the genesis and psychology of faith than the ontology of faith that commands the lines of this book. If this methodology results in a certain desiccation of the profoundly religious nature of the act of faith, the loss is only apparent; for the ontology of faith, somewhat schematically presented if you will, does bring into focus the essence of that deep movement of the spiritual man which is, though darkly and obliquely, a sharing and communion in God's own knowledge.

To realize his purpose the author discusses the meaning of faith in general, as we gather it from the experience of everyday life; the specific nature of Christian faith, as portrayed in the New Testament and especially in St. John's gospel; the act and content of revelation, with emphasis on the analogy of being as the ground of the possibility of the act of revelation; the motive of faith; the traditional teaching of the Church as the canon of faith; the role of dogmas as living and vivifying absolutes in the act of belief; the development and language of dogma; the motives of credibility; and lastly the grandeur of the burden of faith.

Recent history affords perhaps a tragic perspective to many of Dr. Lechner's developments: on the need to overcome the religious infantilism

that permits one's religious culture to lag far behind one's secular culture; on the need to resist the herd-spirit that is the fruit of mass propaganda; on the vigilance required to withstand the affective and volitive, as well as the intellectual, attacks on faith; on the urgency of a living witness to the reality and dynamism of faith in the lives of Christians.

The book is not meant for theologians, not all of whom will agree with certain of its nuances and emphases, but for educated catholics who are seeking a deeper understanding of the "scio cui credidi." It will serve its purpose well.

Weston College

FRANCIS X. LAWLOR, S.J.

THE NEW TESTAMENT IN THE WESTMINSTER VERSION OF THE SACRED SCRIPTURES FROM THE ORIGINAL GREEK. (Small edition). By the Rev, Cuthbert Lattey, S.J. Pp. ix + 479. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1948. \$4.00.

Thirty-five years ago the first of eleven fascicles of the Westminster Version was published. In the ensuing years up to 1935 the succeeding fascicles appeared at various intervals. Then the entire New Testament was published in four volumes which retailed at \$3.75 per volume. That made the price of the complete set \$15.00 which is even today rather prohibitive for a New Testament. Yet the work, into whose production went many years of painstaking labor and the best Catholic scholarship that the English-speaking world could offer, deserved the widest circulation. The obstacle to this has been removed by the "small edition."

The original edition was much more than a mere version. The extensive and very satisfying footnotes, the lengthy introductions to each book and the scholarly excursus on important problems made the work almost a commentary. It filled a great need and rendered invaluable service to the cause of Catholic biblical scholarship.

The small edition has been made possible by the omission of many of the footnotes, the abbreviation of others and of the introductions, and the omission of the excursus. A further aid to reducing the cost of production was the simplification of the typographical aids to eye and mind of the reader. The editor, venerable veteran of many years of service to the Bible, the English Jesuit, Father Lattey, would not have this small edition considered as a substitute for the larger edition but rather as an introduction to it. He has availed himself of all the constructive criticism which has been given in the intervening years and of the recent textual criticism, to produce this revised "small" edition. It is practically "pocket" size, yet is quite legible. A debt of gratitude is due the editor for making this scholarly version avail-

able in an edition within the means of the average reader, and we wish it the wide diffusion it so richly deserves.

St. Mary's Seminary, Perryville, Mo.

JOSEPH L. LILLY, C.M.

DIE ADRESSATEN DES ERSTEN KORINTHERBRIEFES. By Dr. Rudolf Hundstorfer, O.S.B. Kremsmünster: Kommissionsverlag bei Verlag "Weismühl," Weis. 1948. Pp. 72.

To whom specifically did St. Paul direct the First Epistle to the Corinthians? Special introduction texts list the three schools of opinion on this question, *viz.*, those who hold that the epistle was intended as a circular letter for the Christian communities in general, those who narrow the circle of destinies to the province of Achaia, and those who limit the original recipients to members of the church in the city of Corinth. Dr. Hundstorfer gives us the principal proponents of each of these theories together with a critical analysis of their main arguments. Methodically and with precision he proves why the first two positions are untenable, and why the third alone meets the requirements of text and context.

Intimately connected with this principal problem is the position and meaning of the individual words and phrases in the key clause, 1 Cor. 1:2. To this the author devotes the fifth and final chapter. Of particular interest is his resolution of the difficult phrases at the end of verse two, "Paulus . . . den Geheiligten in Christus Jesus, den berufenen Heiligen, sowie allen, welche anrufen den Namen unseres Herrn Jesus Christus in jedweder *Amisstellung*, der ihren sowohl, als auch der unseren" (p. 52). The translation of the Greek, *topos*, by "position," "*official rank*," "*dignity*," does not follow precedent. But a consideration of Acts 1:24f, I Cor. 14:16 and numerous passages from the early Christian writers makes his version more than plausible.

Thoroughness, exactness, orderliness characterize the presentation. Actually only one verse is treated—with the opinions of 135 authors quoted and criticized. The reviewer feels reasonably certain that Dr. Hundstorfer has given a definitive solution to the rendition of 1 Cor. 1:2 and to the problem regarding the audience to which First Corinthians was originally addressed.

St. John's Seminary

WILLIAM G. HEIDT, O.S.B.

CONIECTANEA NEOTESTAMENTICA, XI. Edited by the New Testament Seminar of Upsala. Upsala: C. W. Gleerup, 1948. Pp. 250.

This volume of miscellaneous articles on the New Testament reflects the

point of view of advanced Protestant exegesis. It is dedicated to the sixty-year-old professor of Upsala University, Dr. Anthony Fridrichsen, by his pupils and friends, to honor him for many years of conscientious work in biblical exegesis and philology, and to pay tribute to his genial personality.

The contributors are the leaders of the Form-Criticism School, M. Dibelius, R. Bultmann, W. Michaelis, and others who share their views. Assuming that the text of the New Testament, which has come down to us, is a compilation, these higher critics endeavor to discover in it what they call "primitive Christian teaching," or the "*Evangelium Christi*" as distinguished from the "*Evangelium de Christo*." The former is the Gospel preached by Christ, the "*Kerygma*"; the latter is the mythical enlargement which the primitive Gospel underwent in the second Christian generation, and which is the written Gospel that has come down to us.

"Jesus preached that man must obey God," says M. Goguel, "and he recognized in the books of the Old Testament, especially in the Law, a revelation of God . . . This he came to accomplish and to push to its furthest consequences, by requiring complete submission to God" (p. 77). "The most essential characteristic of the personality of Jesus was the feeling of living intimately and continually in union with the Father. . . He felt that his relation to God was not, as in the case of other men, interrupted by sin, and that brought about the feeling that he was not a child of God like so many others, but a Son of God in a particular sense. And this led him to think that he had received from God a message of deliverance, which he must bring to the lost sheep of the house of Israel" (p. 78). "To his disciples Jesus was the representative and interpreter of God. It is here that we must seek the point of departure for the further development of Christology. This Christology does not proceed from the revelation of a supernatural truth, but from the impression produced by a person" (p. 79).

W. R. Kuemmel asks whether the ideas and thought-processes found in the New Testament can be accepted by modern man. He thinks they can, if we rid the narrative of its mythical elements. Among these are counted "the representation of everything supernatural, of the divine as human, of what pertains to the other world as finding place in this World" (p. 111). Then coming down to particulars, he designates as mythical the passages which relate the pre-existence of Christ, his virginal birth, his descent into hell, his ascent into heaven, as well as those which represent Jesus as divine (p. 112), also the account of what happened at Jesus' baptism, and the references to the second coming of Christ and the resurrection of Jesus from the dead. The last two subjects, he admits, were used by Peter and Paul and other disciples in their preaching about Christ, but are they historical or

mythical happenings, and how must we interpret them nowadays (pp. 116 f.)?

That some miracles have only a symbolic significance is described by G. Lindeskog in the article entitled, "The Veil of the Temple." T. W. Manson shows how the present text, Mk 2:27 ff., ought to read. M. Dibelius eliminates all the miraculous elements from the story of the conversion of Cornelius in Acts 10:1-11:18. R. Bultmann indicates an early Christian hymn in I Pet. 3:18-22. W. Michaelis proves that the Paraclete title, used in John's Gospel, was not derived from Mandaeen writings. J. Jeremias discovers in *Pap. Ox.* 840 a controversy of Jesus with the Pharisees, which he thinks belongs to the oral Gospel, the *Evangelium Christi*.

Not all the articles are exegetical; philology also claims a share of them. A. Debrunner discusses several variant readings found in the Chester Beatty papyri, compares them with readings in the oldest uncials, and expresses his preferences, adding sound reasons for the same. A. Nock points out the large number of newly coined words to be found in Hermetic writings. B. Reicke compares the uncials of I Tim., and H. Risenfeld investigates the different meanings of "arneisthai."

Aside from the fact that it is impossible to eliminate the supernatural from the Gospels and other New Testament writings, which these higher critics themselves reluctantly admit, what evidence have they that the second Christian generation evolved the Christology which is the sum and substance of the written New Testament? And if it is false, how did it find credence so readily? These points alone are sufficient to condemn the Form-Criticism theory.

St. Mary's College

H. WILLMERING, S.J.

JESUS: WHAT MANNER OF MAN. By Henry J. Cadbury. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1947. Pp. xi + 123. \$2.25.

It is usual to invite a liberal Protestant theologian to give the Shaffer Lectures at the Yale School of Divinity. The 1946 lecturer, Dr. Cadbury, is the well known Hollis Professor of Divinity at Harvard, and one of the foremost living New Testament scholars. What manner of man does he find Jesus to be? He answers this question by exploring six other questions: Is not this Jesus? Whence this wisdom? Why speakest Thou in parables? What is this? New Teaching! How knoweth this man? By what authority?

In answering these questions he attempts in a modest manner to study Jesus in his specific historical environment. He is interested in how Jesus

thought rather than in any thoughts which Jesus may have had. He wishes to uncover the mental processes of this man in his daily struggle with life's problems with an eye to present day problems. Thus, while assuming that Jesus is no more than a human personality, he sets aside, or tries to set aside, all Christological speculation. He wants nothing to do with metaphysics. His field is history, facts.

To produce this historical picture of Jesus' mental processes he depends exclusively on the synoptic gospels. Even here he does not accept all the evidence as fact. He eliminates and selects, for he sees the Evangelists as interpreters as well as reporters. His aim is to free the historical Jesus not only from metaphysical and theological vagaries, but also from the Evangelists' subjective view of him.

In Jesus he finds a very special preoccupation with human conduct. His wisdom in approaching a solution to a moral problem springs from several sources: Judaism's long history, his own rabbinical training, but most of all the vigor of his own mind. From these reserves Jesus is able to construct an audacious ethic which was a challenge to his times. He often clothes his moral teaching in parables because they were characteristic of Hebrew tradition. Yet much of his teaching is immediately relevant rather than abstract, systematic, and universal. These latter qualities, the author surmises, were probably changes wrought in the development of the gospel material.

This extraordinary teaching is not revelation. Any supernatural endowment is repudiated by the author. For Professor Cadbury, while admitting very great difficulty in trying to achieve his purpose of sounding the mind of Jesus and while straining to justify his own personal view of that mind, is quite clear in rejecting any reference to divinity. For he asserts that Jesus' teaching despite its intensity and extreme character is by no means unique. He acquired all his knowledge by personal experience of moral truth in a very normal, but highly sensitive, manner and in no way was aware of any special revelation. While he spoke with authority, his influence resided solely in the validity of the truth he taught, in the force of his own conscience and in his spontaneous self-assurance.

Professor Cadbury insists that this interpretation of Jesus' mind, more psychological than logical, has importance in the present century, since we are facing many problems, especially social ones, which resemble the problems which this man of the first century had to face. Only by a deeper penetration into the secret of Jesus' mental processes will we uncover his answer to our dilemmas and doubts.

This study, which is packed with serious thought and graced with a be-

coming modesty, is worth the studious consideration of New Testament scholars. It will give them a vivid awareness of how matter-of-factly Christ's divinity is slighted, ignored, and denied in preference for a humanity which is striking and challenging, but hardly unique.

Woodstock College

JAMES T. GRIFFIN, S.J.

INITIATION BIBLIQUE. Publiée sous la direction de A. Robert et A. Tricot. Nouvelle édition, revue et augmentée. Tournai: Desclée & Cie., 1948. Pp. xxiv + 992.

Enlarged by some one hundred and fifty-eight pages, this second edition contains not only new matter, but also, in some sections, a rather definite rehandling of the first edition which was received so well in 1939. The additions include a discussion of the synoptic problem and the apocryphal books of the Old and New Testament by A. Tricot, and a description of the Temple of Jerusalem by L.-H. Vincent. L. Vaganay has replaced the former exposition of Catholic exegesis with an entirely new treatment which, among other good features, makes constant reference to the latest encyclical on Sacred Scripture. The analysis and study of individual books of the Bible receives more detailed consideration, and the history of the Jewish people has been developed.

Like its predecessor, this book deserves a prominent place in the library of professors of Scripture and Fundamental Theology, not only because of its encyclopedic scope on matters pertinent to the New and Old Testament, but also because of the competence of each of the contributors in his particular field. Familiar names, such as Cardinal Tisserant, Lagrange, Lebreton, Huby, Pirot, Bonsirven, Tricot, constitute a sufficient guarantee that what is written about inspiration, the literary genres, textual criticism, exegesis, history, geography, etc., will result in a convenient and authoritative book of reference.

Weston College

DANIEL J. SAUNDERS, S.J.

SAMMLUNG: MEDIZIN-PHILOSOPHIE-THEOLOGIE. Gegründet und herausgegeben von Univ.-Prof. Doktor Hubert Urban. Innsbruck: Tyrolia-Verlag, 1946-47. VII Hefte.

Under the leadership of Dr. Urban, head of the neurologico-psychiatric clinic of the University of Innsbruck, medical men, psychiatrists, psychologists, and theologians have united in the common endeavour to elucidate certain borderline problems of their respective fields.

In the first brochure of this series, Dr. Urban calls for openmindedness on

the part of medical men concerning such phenomena as stigmatization, ecstasies, visions, etc. In discussing in detail a case of stigmatization with which he dealt during his medical practice, he points out the differences between this authentic case and certain symptoms of hysteria, auto-suggestion, and self-mutilation.

Dr. Caruso in his essay on *Religion and Psychotherapy*, deals with essentially the same problem. Having pointed out the insufficiency of "scientific" (i.e. physico-energetic) methods, he shows, by opposing the saint and the neurotic, that there is an urgent need for religious and ethical principles of evaluation. The neurotic, faced with an existential problem, takes refuge in a pseudo-solution, while the saint, through his religious attitude and the help of grace, finds the true, transcendental solution. The author emphasizes that psychiatry must acquaint itself with such important differences, and be careful not to consider every deviation from "the norm" as necessarily "subnormal" (neurotic); it may be "supernormal," because "supernatural."

In *The Freedom of the Will as a Scientific Problem*, Dr. dal Bianco gives first a brief historical review of the problem in both philosophy and psychiatry, which leads him to the conclusion that both methods (scientific and philosophical), being supplementary to one another, must be used, in order to get a comprehensive understanding of the problem and its various implications. They are like two perspectives, and their resulting descriptions of what is called a free action are in "Koinzidental-Korrespondenz," a notion which implies neither causality nor parallelism, but intends to be nothing else but a morphological description, very useful, however, for the scientist. (In this connection the author refers to his own research work in the field of "Actual-Physiologie").

Dr. Grunewald's *Flight into Sickness* stresses the psycho-somatic nature of sickness in the strict sense. Various cases (all taken from the records of the clinic) are analysed, and the various psychological components shown. Diagnosis as well as therapy must consider both aspects, body and soul, the whole man. Dr. Neubauer, in his treatise on *The Road to Personality, in Psychology and Psychiatry*, by analysing critically the work of his predecessors in the fields of psychology and psychiatry shows that personality consists essentially of both intelligence and character, as of two intimately interwoven elements of one and the same whole. And personality is not static but extremely dynamic. It has depth, but at the same time it transcends the Ego, stretching out, as it were, into the "world of values," and creating for itself a "world-picture" which, in turn, influences all its judgments, actions, and omissions.

The psychotherapeutical value of confession is rather generally admitted by Catholics and non-Catholics alike. C. G. Jung says in one of his recent books that he always tries to get his Catholic patients to go to confession (*Religion und Psychologie*, Zürich, 1940, p. 81). Fr. Josef Miller, S.J., in the latest publication of this series, presents a very valuable analysis of the relationship between *Catholic Confession and Psychotherapy*. After a brief, but solid, exposition of the theological aspect of confession and its essential difference from psychotherapy, he brings out the nonetheless important contributions of confession to psychotherapy, by pointing to the psychotherapeutical elements of the various parts of confession, and the limitations, inherent in the essential difference between confession and psychotherapy. Some practical consequences for penitent, confessor, and doctor conclude this fine essay.

Although the individual contributions may be of different value, we welcome the series as whole.

College of Christ the King

PETER MUELLER, S.J.

WÖRTERBUCH DER RELIGION. By Anton Anwander. Würzburg: Echter-Verlag, 1947. Pp. 331.

This dictionary of religion is unusual in more ways than one. First, it not only defines terms and concepts, but also sketches the religious ideas of important writers on religion as well as the status of religion in various countries. The book therefore is conceived rather as an encyclopedia of religion. Yet it is not a cooperative enterprise, as is, e.g., the *Encyclopedia of Religion* edited by Vergilius Ferm. While 190 scholars collaborated on the latter, this is the work of one man. But the author, now a sexagenarian, was prepared for it by a lifelong study in patrology, Church history, the science of religion, etc. This long preparation, the maturity of outlook and the priestly character of the author impart to the single articles something personal, a freshness and uniformity of approach not found usually in dictionaries or encyclopedias. The information is up-to-date, and the latest problems are handled as by a master. At times, the author even looks to the future and suggests problems which, he hopes, will some day be taken up.

The list of religious terms discussed is, of course, not as long as in Ferm's *Encyclopedia*. But nothing important for general religion seems omitted, and there are articles for which no equivalent is found in other encyclopedias, as, for example, Arzt, Eros, Freude, Gebärde, Leidenschaft, Pflicht. In accordance with modern trends, stress is laid on primitive religion, on which Anwander is an authority. What principle guided the author in his

choice of religious writers, is not quite evident, but he had no doubt solid reasons for inclusion and exclusion.

Weston College

A. C. COTTER, S.J.

LITURGIE COSMIQUE: MAXIME LE CONFESSEUR. By Hans-Urs von Balthasar. Translated by L. Lhaumet and H.-A. Prentout. Paris: Aubier, 1947. Pp. 279.

The editors of the series, "Théologie," published under the direction of the Jesuit Faculty of Theology at Lyon-Fourvière, thought enough of *Kosmische Liturgie*. *Maximus der Bekenner: Höhe und Krise des griechischen Weltbilds*, to have it translated and incorporated as volume XI in their valuable collection. The decision was fortunate for the good of patristic scholarship; many theologians, who would perhaps never have become acquainted with the German original, will read the book in the series whose merits they have come to appreciate so highly.

The work has nothing to do with the flourishing liturgical movement. Its title was apparently suggested by a sentiment underlying much of the great Confessor's thinking, that all existence is adoration, a sort of solemn cult, an immense liturgical act.

In judging this painstaking study, we must recognize that P. Balthasar is almost a pioneer in the field. After an enormous initial success that held for several centuries, Maximus lost most of his following. He came to be neglected even in the Orient, where his own productions were gradually adulterated with apocryphal writings, some of which won greater renown than the genuine works that lapsed into oblivion. He had very little influence on Scholasticism. Even today there exists no major study of his theological contribution, at least none that undertakes a comprehensive evaluation of his works. Therefore the present volume is a foray that has the objective of blazing the trail rather than a definitive conquest of a difficult theological synthesis.

Such is the author's modest estimate of his own book. Only an expert on Maximus can tell whether he has accomplished more than that, and experts in this field are lacking. Certainly the impression gained from a careful reading of *Liturgie cosmique* is that P. Balthasar has done a thorough and competent piece of work, not only in his exposition of the Confessor's writings, but in his appraisal of the influences that shaped the doctrine of Maximus. Previous studies on Origen, St. Gregory of Nyssa, and Evagrius of Pontus were an excellent preparation for the task.

Four aspects that characterize the supple genius of Maximus are clearly

brought out. Maximus was a neo-Platonic and Christian mystic, an Aristotelian philosopher, a monk fashioned after the pattern of Origen, and a champion, crowned with actual martyrdom, of orthodox Christology as defined at the Council of Chalcedon. These four facets of Maximus' personality are reflected in all his writings; and as the man himself was, we may say, a synthesis, so his mind was inclined toward synthesis in its speculations. In the many important problems he investigated, he always came forward finally with a synthesis as his solution. The key to all his thinking was the Christological synthesis: divinity and humanity joined in hypostatic union in the one person of the Word. This doctrine, so basic to Christianity, inspired the whole life as well as the theological contemplation of Maximus, and fructified in his highly original conception of the world.

After reviewing the Confessor's teaching about God and critique of the ideas of pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite and Origenism, P. Balthasar presents the results of his researches into all the known writings of Maximus in three chapters that embody the Saint's attempts to unify the universe: the cosmological syntheses, the anthropological syntheses, and the spiritual syntheses. The exposition is not easy to follow, but well repays the effort, for the reader will catch a glimpse of the magnificent vision that for Maximus was the solution of all enigmas: the union of God and the world, of the eternal and the temporal, and of the infinite and the finite in the hypostasis of the God-man. Ultimately, however, the book's merit as a contribution to patristics and the history of theology surpasses the value it has for pure theology.

St. Mary's College

CYRIL VOLLERT, S.J.

LA QUESTION DES LANGUES DANS L'ÉGLISE ANCIENNE. Tome I. By Gustave Bardy. Études de théologie historique publiées sous la direction des professeurs de théologie à l'Institut Catholique de Paris. Paris: Beauchesne, 1948. Pp. vi + 293.

Gustave Bardy is a name familiar to all students of patristics and historical theology. The erudite professor of the *Institut Catholique de Paris* has published so many books and articles in the last forty years that one is awed by the vastness of his reading and the fruitfulness of his pen. His most recent work is a by-product of life-long studies of all the phases of the life of the early Church. It deals with the diversity of languages used by the Christians of the first days, and the study, as projected by the author, will consist of two volumes. In the tome published, we are taken up to the end of the fourth century, and the future volume will continue the investigation up to the time of Justinian.

There is a powerful dynamism behind the research, which at first sight would seem to deal only with an interesting curiosity of primitive Christian life. The author wishes to explain one of the fundamental reasons for the separation of the Eastern and Western Churches. The idea was suggested to him by a series of conferences he gave at the Benedictine monastery of Amay-sur-Meuse.

The work builds up the implicit thesis that Greek, amid local varieties, was the principal means of communication in the Christian beginnings; but in the West Greek had slowly fallen into disuse, so that by the end of the fourth century, Oriental modes and thought had to be translated for Occidentals and vice-versa. A complete break had not occurred because there was much contact and commerce between the two sections, and the Occidentals still clung to some rudimentary knowledge of Greek and the educated classes were still affected by a touch of Hellenism.

This thesis comes forth as a conclusion inductively reached by a presentation of the linguistic aspects of early Christian life and worship in the different regions of the classical world. Many incidental facts are brought to light which make the book a mine of secondary information for theologians: for example, statistics on the monastic population of the fourth-century Egyptian lands, which the author puts at 500,000 (p. 50); the great number of bishops in Roman North Africa, 565 for the year 411, of whom 430 were Catholics (p. 64); the extent of Augustine's knowledge of Greek (pp. 196-202).

As can be seen from the purpose of the book and from the subject treated, we are not being offered a study of world-shaking importance. Theological meditation could have gone on quite nicely without this contribution, but Bardy merits our gratitude for having drawn from the rich resources of his knowledge explanatory details of a phenomenon of early Christianity which raises many questions in the minds of investigators, and which had an important role in the separation of East and West.

With the work as such, always keeping in mind the limits imposed by the nature of the theme and by the elusive character of the effective data, there are no defects that merit mention. However, there is a great carelessness in the printing of Latin, German and English; and there are typographical errors even in French. That the title of English works are printed with no respect for the English norms of capitalization can hardly be called a defect either in Beauchesne or Bardy; the French have long ago decided that in this matter English norms need not be considered.

Woodstock College

GUSTAVE WEIGEL, S.J.

NEWMAN ET LES PÈRES. By Denys Gorce. Bruges: Charles Beyaert, 1947. Pp. 112.

Cardinal Newman once said, "The Fathers made me a Catholic." Dr. Gorce has written an interesting and instructive commentary on this impressive tribute in his brief study of the decisive influence which the Church Fathers exerted on Newman's life, thought and character. The book is divided into four parts, following, in chronological order, four periods in Newman's life. The first describes his early acquaintance with and enthusiasm for patristic literature. It was at this time that he wrote to his sister Harriet: "I am so hungry for Irenaeus and Cyprian I long for the vacation." The second period is one of intense literary activity, almost all of it inspired by his earlier patristic studies and directed towards winning his coreligionists away from Protestantism and back to the Church of the Fathers. The third period is coextensive with the crisis of his conversion. The Fathers became for Newman "*des amis compromettants*" in his Anglicanism and the *via media* crumbled under the blows of Leo and Athanasius. In one of the most eloquent passages of the *Apologia* he describes his state of mind at this time and tells how he came to see that in the fifth century, "Rome was where she is today and the Protestants were the Eutychians. . . . What was the use of continuing the controversy or defending my position if, after all, I was forging arguments for Arius or Eutyches and turning devil's advocate against the much enduring Athanasius and the majestic Leo?" In later years he often said to Anglicans, "The study of the Fathers will lead you to Rome." This was one of his deepest convictions and it was based on personal experience. The fourth part of the book deals principally with the influence of the Fathers on Newman's spiritual life after his conversion.

There is inspiration in this book as well as information and one finishes it with increased admiration for Newman himself and with renewed appreciation of the men who did so much to shape his life and thought. This is a second edition of Dr. Gorce's work, appropriately issued for the centennial of Newman's conversion (1845-1945). There is a slip on page 101 where Cyril of Jerusalem instead of Cyril of Alexandria is mentioned as the adversary of Theodoret of Cyrus.

West Baden College

WILLIAM LE SAINT, S.J.

YOUNG MR. NEWMAN. By Maisie Ward. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1948. Pp. xvii + 477. \$4.50.

This is an important contribution to Newman literature. Wilfrid Ward's official biography of the Cardinal devotes but scanty space to his life prior to

1845. There were, no doubt, good reasons for this. Maisie Ward supplies the first volume which under other conditions her father might have written. The author says her production is not a student's book; but, while awaiting something better, students will have to use it. She has drawn not only on the already published material about Newman's early life but also on a mass of letters and other documents, hitherto unexploited. Indeed the quantities of unpublished material on a man as famous as Newman understandably amazed her. It is to be regretted that she did not see her way to giving the exact dates and references to all the material she quotes. If in a second edition she does so, she will render a considerable service to students.

As it stands, the book is very readable and for the most part extremely interesting. For the period before 1833, the author describes Newman's relations with his family more fully than has ever been done before. The father and mother, brothers and sisters, are no longer vague figures in the background. The whole scene comes to life and contrary to expectations it is not a family of Evangelicals but of moderate Church of England folk which emerges. In college, it is true, the boys fell under Evangelical influence. Francis Newman, strange and enigmatic hitherto, becomes more intelligible, seen in the family circle.

These pages do not supply all the information we could desire about Evangelical influence on Newman or about his influence on the Evangelicals. This lacuna must be attributed to the dearth of scholarly work on the Evangelical movement in nineteenth-century Britain. In fact, the author does some spade work herself, especially in regard to Hannah More. The influence of Whately and the Oxford Liberals also needs further elucidation. Unquestionably Newman was a key figure in the whole spiritual and intellectual life of England during his lifetime. A definitive biography will be written only when the whole vast scene has been studied in detail. When the author reaches the Tractarian movement she is telling a familiar story. But her new material enables her to amplify what was known and to give a fuller account of Newman's thoughts and actions during the critical years. She endeavors to keep her own sympathies out of her drama; and although she is the granddaughter of two of the characters in the plot she succeeds very well. All in all her book is well-informed, widely conceived and discerning. It will surely be indispensable for a long time to come.

From the strictly theological point of view, there is nothing particularly new in the book. Przywara's conclusions and Benard's methodology are not improved upon. Indeed it becomes increasingly clear that to follow Newman's intellectual development in detail is very difficult if not impossible. The details of Newman's Anglican period do serve, strange to say, to throw

certain events into perspective. It is clear that up to 1832 when he wrote the *Arians of the Fourth Century* Newman was content with the Anglican system, or lack of system. He believed "that freedom from symbols and articles is abstractedly the highest state of Christian communion, and the peculiar privilege of the primitive Church." A few years later, after the trip to Italy, and the inauguration of Tractarianism, Newman abandoned this view and was attempting "to commence a system of theology on the Anglican idea, and based upon Anglican authorities." To his dismay he found it could not be done. "It was my portion for whole years to remain without any satisfactory basis for my religious profession, in a state of moral sickness, neither able to acquiesce in Anglicanism, nor able to go to Rome." He turned to history and the Fathers, only to find that to be deep in history was to be a Roman Catholic or an infidel. As the years passed he obtained "a clear conviction of the substantial identity of Christianity and the Roman system." Still he would not be hastened and he spent years in prayer, fasting, and study before making his momentous decision.

The salvation of many souls and the whole future of the Church in the English-speaking world depended on that long-considered choice between Rome and infidelity. To become a Catholic had, humanly speaking, everything against it: "I am going to those whom I do not know, and of whom I expect very little. I am risking the large income I make on my sermons. What can it be but a stern necessity which causes this?"

Once a Catholic, Newman's trouble did not end; he was for many years under a cloud. Neglect and misapprehension shadowed him in all his undertakings. And yet he could triumphantly proclaim that after becoming a Catholic he had no further history of his religious opinions to write. The Catholic system sufficed. In 1862, when in the deepest shadows, he asserted: "I have not had one moment's wavering of trust in the Catholic Church ever since I was received. I have ever had, and have still, an unclouded faith in her creed in all its articles; a supreme satisfaction in her worship, discipline, and teaching." In 1868 he writes: "There is a depth and power in the Catholic religion, a fullness of satisfaction in its creed, its theology, its rites, its sacraments, its discipline. This is the true secret of the Church's strength and the bond of its indissoluble unity."

The history of Newman since his death has not been altogether unlike his life. Although he shows at times a knowledge and appreciation of Suarez, he is no Thomist, Molinist, or Scotist, no Scholastic. Another and unfortunate fact is that the Modernists tried to capture one who uttered, before they were born, a very incisive condemnation of the fundamentals of their system: "From the age of fifteen, dogma has been the fundamental principle

of my religion; I know no other religion; I cannot enter into the idea of any other sort of religion; religion, as a mere sentiment, is to me a dream and a mockery." Despite this, suspicion has hung over the writings of this great thinker, who as Przywara says, stands energetically for the intellectual justification of the faith. The fact that Newman is, unlike those trained in Scholasticism, stronger in synthesis than in analysis, more of a rhetorician than a logician and more of a Plato than an Aristotle, has not helped either. Newman's strength is in his luminous ideas which stimulate thought. He has the strength of the seed but also the weakness which attaches to the seed that is as yet undeveloped. It is a tragic irony that the great champion of the Church has been so shamefully used against the Church. His brother Francis rightly saw that for the Cardinal the Church was everything.

Newman is only to be understood as a Cardinal of the one, holy, Catholic and apostolic Church. In the English-speaking world he has been the star which has led many thinkers into the fold. The rise of the English-speaking Church is perhaps the greatest fact in the history of the Church Universal since Newman's accession. It is not easy to think of a Catholic name in the English-speaking world which outshines that of the great English Cardinal. Many hold that his position with Irenaeus, Athanasius, with the Gregories, with Basil, with Augustine, with Anselm, Bernard, Thomas and Bellarmine, is assured. In many respects he is not unworthy of their company, although of course it belongs to the Church to pronounce on his holiness. It does not seem rash to say that the Church will always ponder on his words in her heart, asking herself, at times a little anxiously, why her great son held such or such an opinion. Nevertheless she will ever treasure his utterances as those of one of her noblest, clearest-headed and most devoted children.

Woodstock College

E. A. RYAN, S.J.

DANTE THEOLOGIAN: THE DIVINE COMEDY. Translation and Commentary by Rev. Patrick Cummins, O.S.B. St. Louis: B. Herder Book Co., 1948. Pp. 604. \$6.00.

If this translation of Dante cannot be particularly recommended by a responsible reviewer, no matter how sympathetic, the fault may possibly lie more with the publisher than with the author. This possibility is insinuated by the author himself. He tells us that an early familiarity with St. Thomas, dating from the era of Leo XIII, led to the discovery of Dante as the best Thomistic commentator; however, because of the whispered charges of heresy against Dante, he was not entirely at ease until Benedict XV's encyclical on Dante (reprinted in this book) silenced his scruples;

thereafter, he became an unhampered Dante enthusiast, learned the immortal poem by heart, and "dissatisfied with English versions, . . . made a new one." Fr. Cummins, in his aim to translate Dante's *terze rime* as directly as possible and to retain the melodiousness of the original, felt obliged to invent new words, to use concrete English substantives without an article as a means of preserving the *endecasillabi*, to rhyme simple and composite, positive and negative or adversative verb forms of the same stem, to form Homeric word-clusters such as "thank-freighted," and to devise such prosaic abstract rhymes as "ubication . . . interrogation." His publishers should have informed him that such a translation probably could not stand the inevitable comparison with the English versions of Fletcher, Anderson, Bandini, Binyon, Howe, and White. For example, compare the following versions of *Par. XXXIII*, 1-3:

Fletcher: "Thou Maid and Mother, Daughter of thy Son/Thou humble and high over every creature/Bourn by eternal counsel fixed upon."

Cummins: "O Virgin Mother, daughter by Son begotten: Humbly above all creatures else exalted: Predestined term of counsel unbegotten."

Despite the attractive title of the book, Fr. Cummins (and he merits praise for this) calls his generic and unhistorical remarks cautiously a spiritual, and not a theological commentary. While giving full acknowledgement to the arduous labor involved, it must nevertheless be said that the real theological commentary of the *Divina Commedia* still remains to be written. Mandonnet is absolutely sure that Dante wanted his work to be interpreted with a four-fold meaning in accord with his own interpretation of Scripture, and particularly along the lines set down by St. Thomas Aquinas (*Quaest. Quodl. VII*, a. 15; P. Mandonnet, *Dante le théologien*, Paris, Desclée, 1935, pp. 184-85).

Fr. Cummins has oversimplified the requisites for a theological commentary of Dante: "The anagogical sense of Scripture is the literal meaning, the moral sense of Scripture is the spiritual sense of Dante's poem" (p. 382). On the contrary, Dante's own interpretation in his famous letter to Can Grande della Scala is quite different and more complex; the literal-eschatological meaning has new moral and ascetico-mystical implications; furthermore, it has new allegorical bearings in the direction of a theology of history, and finally, has new anagogical outlooks on the relation of the militant and the triumphant Church to the *parousia*. Any theological commentary which omits these factors would treat the greatest poet simply as a rhymist of the prose of St. Thomas Aquinas.

THE CRITICAL THEOLOGY OF THEODORE PARKER. By John Edward Dirks. New York: Columbia University Press, 1948. Pp. viii + 173. \$2.25.

Theodore Parker merits a place in these *Studies in American Culture* because of his importance in New England Transcendentalism. In that turgid ferment of ideas his writings are easily the most learned and coherent. Though eluding precise definition, Transcendentalism may be described as an attempt by the Unitarian clergy to take up a middle ground between the supernaturalism of the Congregational churches (from which they had gone forth) and Deism's natural religion (whose limits they sought to "transcend"). Though influenced by various intuitionist philosophies (French, German, Scot), the New England Transcendentalists drew their chief inspiration from the "natural supernaturalism" of Carlyle and from Coleridge's "philosophy that is religious and religion that is philosophical." Stimulated by such tutelage, they fancied that they experienced "delicious awakenings of higher powers" which enabled them to intuit truth infallibly and to spurn the vulgarity of logical demonstration. Mr. Dirks admirably expounds how Parker, though an intuitionist, kept clear, through scholarship and sound sense, of Emersonian absurdities.

Following the prevalent fashion, Parker took every obscure mutter issuing from Tübingen as an oracle. He prostituted his "simple piety" and burned up the abundant energy of his best years in assiduous reading and translating of German books. In his own proper writings he bluffly professes the "educated" view of Scripture and maintains that he takes them "for what they are worth," but his tone of Yankee independence accords ill with the enslavement of his thought to the German critics. His operative technique on the Old Testament is that of De Wette and Eichhorn, while it is Strauss who guides his hand in the dissection of the New. As early as 1840-42 he had denied the Apostolic origin of the Gospels, had satisfied himself that miracle is myth, and was off on a safari in search of "the historical Jesus." Parker never left the ministry, convincing himself of a mission to enlighten and reform the church from within, developing a persecution complex under the impact of the anathemas of his conservative brethren.

The religious emotion stirred by Jonathan Edwards in the Congregational churches along the Charles could not check the revolt against the grim unreason of their theology. Original sin and predestination (both in the Calvinistic sense) were challenged by Unitarians and Transcendentalists with the doctrine that human nature is quite all right and endowed with immanent intuitions which guide it adequately to religious truth and moral perfection. Parker postulated a "religious element" in man, innate and

invincibly progressive. As proof of the postulate he appealed to Bible history with its triumphal progress "from the God of Genesis to the God of the Fourth Gospel." But Christianity erred grievously, he averred, in regarding as ultimate even the highest biblical idea of God, still more grievously in circumscribing Him with its irrational dogmas. For by the middle nineteenth century the "religious element in human nature" had transcended the Biblical God by its intuitions and experiences of "the God of infinite perfection." Absolute religion Parker defines as "the desire to be in harmony with the infinitely perfect God," a desire thoroughly individualistic and emancipated from churches and dogmas. And yet what validity there is in his concept of God and what solid worth in his "absolute religion" derive all too obviously from the dogmatic and moral theology of the Christian tradition. Parker appears unaware of the borrowing.

St. Mary's College

GEORGE C. RING, S.J.

CHURCH, LAW AND SOCIETY. By Gustaf Aulén, Bishop of Strängnäs, Sweden. New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1948. Pp. xvi + 114. \$2.00.

In Bishop Aulén's view the past few centuries have seen the relations between Protestantism and society all too frequently spoiled by the theological aberrations of pietism and modernism. In neither system is the Church a primitive Christian datum: pietism dissolved the Church into individualistic Christianity; modernism secularized the Kingdom of God into an evolving ethico-cultural movement. Against this background Bishop Aulén thinks that there is need for a more realistic and radical interpretation of christianity; indeed, he feels that this need is being met in varying measure by modern Protestant theology. In the present book he presents certain orientations of current Swedish theology.

In order to determine the relation between the Christian Church and society, one must first know what the Church is. History "is a drama where God's *agape* fights against the evil forces opposed to the will of God" (p. 12). The Church, in and through which Christ continues his work, "is an expression of the spontaneous and universally directed *agape*. . . . Therefore, the Church is seen from an organic and dynamic point of view. . . . She is the body of Christ and the instrument of his fighting Kingdom" (pp. 13-14).

"The Church has been entrusted with the word of God. The word of God exists as Gospel and as Law" (p. 3). "Indubitably the main duty and privilege of the Church is to proclaim the Gospel" (p. 3). When we read in the Scriptures that the Gospel has superseded the Law, that "means

that salvation is given only by the grace of God, and that it cannot be found by way of the Law" (p. 3). Yet the Law abides and has its proper function. "The Law is no way to God, but it is the way to all human relationship" (p. 4). The power of the Law is manward, its operation is horizontal; the power of the Gospel is Godward, its operation is vertical. "Just as the Gospel is a *dynamis* unto salvation, so is the Law a *dynamis* unto the establishment of human fellowship" (pp. 62-63).

We can see now the force of the title adopted by Bishop Aulén, *Church, Law and Society*. The Church must through the Law, with which she has been entrusted, bring to bear its impact on Society. "If the central function of the Law is in a realistic way to care for the human fellowship, then it has a direct reference to the life of Society, to the construction and constitution of Society" (p. 85). The Church must be "a living conscience of justice" (i.e., of the Law) in relation to Society.

Bishop Aulén's return to a more radical interpretation of Christianity has restored the Church as a primitive Christian fact, antecedent to the individual christian and not a mere collection of christians with similar religious experiences. It is a Church that is a visible, historic institution, existing now as it did in the beginning. "The starting-points for all the possibilities of the Church are the mandate and mission given to her. This mandate the Church has received from her Lord" (p. 99). "The mandate entrusted to the Church is the message from God, the message of the *agape* of God" (p. 100). "Because the divine power, Christ and his Spirit, are working in all human weaknesses, the actual Church of history is, in spite of all, more than a frail human society; she is the body of Christ and the instrument of his fighting Kingdom" (p. 14).

Professor Robert Will has said that modern Protestant ecclesiology "s'applique à reconquérir le coefficient corporel de la vie intérieure." It is in the same spirit that Bishop Aulén writes as he attempts to work out the relation of Church and society through the function of the Church as the mediator of the Law to society. It is a forward step to have overpassed the eccentricity that led Protestantism to ignore the City of Man; it is a still more decisive step to have insisted on the function of the Church as a divine instrument. It is indeed an instrumentality that is all too circumscribed in its scope; it may not be insignificant that, while the Law and the Gospel each is called a *dynamis*, the Church is never so. One might conjecture that Bishop Aulén's disregard for metaphysics and his insistence on the Lutheran doctrine of man as "simul peccator et justus" would hardly dispose him to consider the full instrumentality of the Church in the mediation of Christ's Redemption to mankind. Yet it is good that the consideration of the

Church's relation to Society has been the occasion of a more solid approach to the nature and function of the Church.

Weston College

FRANCIS X. LAWLOR, S.J.

THE PROTESTANT ERA. By Paul Tillich. Translated and with a concluding Essay by James Luther Adams. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1948. Pp. 323. \$6.00.

The fate of Protestantism should be a matter of vital concern to Catholic theologians; to too many of them unfortunately it is not. They have reached the easy conviction that it is dying. They point to the disintegration of the sects and the evaporation of the traditional dogmas as signs of approaching death. Therefore it can be safely disregarded. Let it die peacefully while we turn our attention to young and vigorous foes.

Even if this were true, it would still be important to try to foresee the direction in which Protestants will turn. It is evident, however, that they themselves do not share these convictions. They too are aware of outward disintegration. But they see in it symptoms, not of death, but of metamorphosis. The inner spirit, still strong and vigorous, is merely laboring to cast off an outworn shell in preparation for a fresh embodiment in a new structure. Denominational barriers are indeed breaking down everywhere, and doctrines once bitterly fought for are no longer held with sufficient tenacity to make a difference. But to those who are promoting the Ecumenical movement, this is all to the good. These were the very things that caused division in Protestantism and the consequent dissipation of its strength. Their disappearance is the necessary prelude to a more inclusive unity. The sooner they go, the sooner will a united Protestantism be able to bring the full force of its undivided influence to bear in the task of determining the shape of things to come.

This is one forecast by Protestants of the future of Protestantism. *The Protestant Era* presents another so radically different, that it must be no less startling to even liberal Protestants than it is to their conservative brothers and to Catholics. It is an effort to foresee the role that Protestantism will play in the transformed society that is being created by the world revolution now in process.

The author seems to be extraordinarily well equipped for his task by native endowment, training and experience. He is a distinguished German scholar, who for many years occupied chairs of philosophy and theology in several German universities. At the end of World War I, he became one of the founders of the movement that called itself religious socialism, and he

has written a number of books on that subject. With the rise of Nazism he came to this country as a refugee, and has since acted as visiting professor in several American universities. At present he is professor of philosophical theology at Union Theological Seminary in New York. He has already exercised considerable influence on Protestant thought in this country at its highest levels. He is a profound and original thinker and a keen analyst of current religious and cultural situations. He has clear-cut ideas of the needs that religion must meet in the world of the future and a bold theory of the radical transformation that Protestantism must undergo if it is to be prepared to meet them.

He distinguishes sharply between what he calls the "Protestant principle" and the various ecclesiastical, doctrinal, and cultural realizations it has assumed in the course of its history. The Protestant principle is eternal and a permanent criterion of everything temporal. It cannot be identified with any of the forms that Protestantism has taken. It is the critical and dynamic source of all Protestant realizations, and while it must be found in all of them, it is not identical with any of them. Hence, the Protestant principle is the only thing that belongs to the unchanging essence of Protestantism. Ecclesiastical structures, doctrinal formations, forms of worship, even the values it creates and the spirit it engenders, are temporary and changeable encrustations, assumed to meet the special needs of particular places and eras. They not only can be, they must be, cast aside when they have become outworn and no longer suited to the changed conditions of a new era.

The Protestant principle has both a negative or critical, and a positive or formative, function. In its negative function it fulfills its historical task of criticizing and protesting against any institution, religious, political, or cultural, that claims for itself ultimacy and finality: "It is the divine and human protest against any relativism that claims to be absolute." Thus it originated in its protest against a Catholicism that claimed to be Christianity in an absolute form, but in reality had become an "ideology," i.e., a man-made structure created for the defence and conservation of the interests of a ruling class, namely, mediaeval feudalism of which the Church was a part.

Today Protestantism itself has become an "ideology." It has lost contact with reality and survives as a bulwark for the defense of the selfish interests of a special class, the victorious bourgeoisie. This is especially manifest in the incongruity between prevailing forms of Protestantism and the proletarian situation. "The proletarian situation is the situation of that class within the capitalist system whose members are dependent exclusively on the 'free' sale of their physical ability to work and whose social destiny is

wholly dependent on the turn of the market." For the proletariat, Protestantism in its present forms has no prophetic message. It is not a religious possibility. It can do nothing to allay their fear or to remedy their loneliness, insecurity, and sense of meaninglessness. In its orthodox forms, it is totally unsuited to their needs. By fostering individual pietism, it obstructs the formation of those social attitudes that see in world transformation the primary task of religion today. Even Liberal Protestantism, while easily tolerant of changes in doctrine and ecclesiastical organization, is extremely tenacious of the individualism that is the chief source of the anti-proletarian tendencies of Protestantism today. "Only if it is Protestant to give up that sort of Protestantism to which the proletarian situation remains inaccessible, can the unconditional and universal character of the Protestant message be maintained."

Consequently the Protestant principle is today called upon to exercise its historical role against Protestantism itself. It must exert its "ideology-unveiling" power to expose all the present forms for what they are, "ideological camouflage." It must not only liquidate external structures and doctrinal formations, it must also attack and dissolve those characteristic values that have always been considered the supreme values of Protestantism: freedom, autonomy, the emancipation and defense of the individual against the tyranny of any collectivism. This may mean the total collapse of Protestantism in any of the historical forms it has assumed. It may mean the end of "the Protestant Era." If so, nothing essential will be lost. "The radical Protestant attributes only provisional importance to the Church and its forms."

After this explanation of the work to be done by the Protestant principle in its critical function, the author turns his attention to its form-creating task. He does not attempt to give a detailed and concrete description of the form Protestantism will assume in the future. He professes that this cannot be done. "It will not be," he says negatively, "a return to the Catholic era, nor a return to early Christianity. Nor will it be a new form of secularism. It is something beyond all these forms, a new form of Christianity, to be expected and prepared for, but not yet to be named. Elements in it can be described but not the new structure that must and will grow."

But if he cannot give us a detailed picture, he can and does tell us the needs it must meet and the principles it must incorporate. It must be such a religion as will fit harmoniously into a culture that is collectivistic and authoritarian; for community and authority are wide-spread demands of the masses today. There is a large scale revolt against Protestant and humanistic individualism. "Many are seeking an 'escape from freedom'.

The burden on the individual has become too heavy. Consequently many people are relinquishing individual religious or political responsibility. They are willing to sacrifice their autonomy in the hope of finding in the path of authority a new meaning in life, new symbols and forms."

If one objects that this seems to be a complete right-about-face from the position of the Reformers, Tillich agrees: "That which Protestantism denied at its rise," he says, "is today—in an altered form—the demand of the age. That demand is for an authoritative and powerfully symbolic system of mass reintegration; but it was just this—in a distorted form—against which Protestantism protested. . . . The Protestant era is finished, after nearly all the historical conditions upon which it rested have been taken away from it."

This does not mean however that the Protestantism of the future will be collectivistic and authoritarian after the manner of Catholicism, nationalism, or fascism. These are all "heteronomies," i.e., freedom-destroying systems in which an ecclesiastical or political hierarchy imposes an alien law from without. On the other hand, it cannot remain what it has become, "autonomy," i.e., an institution that does guarantee to the individual freedom to govern himself, but whose members, by their failure to obey the universal law of the absolute and unconditional, have created conflict and chaos. It must become "theonomy," i.e., an institution that imposes a superior law, but a law that is at the same time the innermost law of man himself, rooted in the divine ground which is man's own ground; the law of life transcends man, although it is, at the same time, his own."

Since none of the existing religions or cultures seem to embody these ideals, the author projects another, which he presents as a working model to guide the builders of the new Protestantism in their work of transformation. He calls it Religious Socialism. Religious Socialism, he protests, is not Marxism. Yet when he comes to describe it, he does so in terms drawn from a comparison with Marxism. One suspects that it was derived by a process of laying down Marxism as a basic pattern, and then modifying it in such wise as to bring it into conformity with the demands of the Protestant principle. Some elements of Marxism have been rejected; others are kept unchanged; still others are retained, but transformed. The resultant might be described as Protestantized Marxism, except that there does not seem to be enough Protestantism left in it to warrant that title. It certainly cannot in any traditional sense be qualified as "Christian."

The reader is tempted to label it "Communist Front." But that expression is certainly wrong here. It implies a deceitful attempt to hide the real purposes of an organization or movement behind an innocent facade. But there is no attempt at deception here. The author is frank and even

enthusiastic in his open espousal of many of the elements and principles of Marxism: "Marxism has never been accepted indiscriminately and without a serious criticism by religious-socialist movements." "Religious socialists have accepted many of the scientific results of the Marxian analysis of society because they have found them to be true." "There are above all some philosophical principles in Marxism which can and must be maintained as discoveries of lasting significance. . . ." "Existential thinking, historical materialism and the dialectical method are achievements [of Marxism] which should never be lost in religious socialism. The same is true of several sociological and economic principles of scientific Marxism." "Religious socialism in the spirit of prophetism and with the methods of Marxism, is able to understand and transcend the world of today."

From the foregoing we can gather Tillich's concept of the role that Protestantism will play in the world of the future. It would operate in a society that, he protests, cannot be called Marxist, but which, he admits, will be organized along the lines dictated by Marxist principles. In this society it will not be incorporated into any distinct ecclesiastical structure. Rather, it will be a religious quality informing all the secular cultural institutions, keeping them steadfast in their contact with the "ultimate ground and aim of being," thus purging them of all "demonic" influences and infusing them with the prophetic spirit. Tillich denies the validity of the distinction between the sacred and the secular. Religion cannot claim any clearly marked-off region of human activity as its exclusive domain. "All sharp divisions between the sacred and the secular must be eliminated in recognition of a critical and transcendent formative power which is present in both religion and culture." "Asked what is the proof for the fall of the world, I like to answer: religion itself, namely, a religious culture beside a secular culture, a temple beside a town hall, a Lord's Supper beside a daily supper, prayer beside work, meditation beside research, *caritas* beside *eros*. But although this duality can never be overcome in time, space and history, it makes a difference whether the duality is deepened into a bridgeless gap, as in periods in which autonomy and heteronomy fight each other, or whether the duality is recognized as something that should not be and which is overcome fragmentarily by anticipation, so to speak, in a theonomous period. The *Kairos* which we believed to be at hand was the coming of a new theonomous age, conquering the destructive gap between religion and secular culture."

The Protestant Era is a book written by a radical Protestant and addressed to conservative Protestants. Its purpose seems to be to break down conservative opposition to revolutionary changes by persuading the conserva-

tives that these changes are not only inevitable, but also in line with what the Protestant principle dictates in the present situation. The author is convinced that the world revolution now in progress will not only swallow up all the traditional forms of Protestantism, but that it will also destroy what up to now have been considered, and by most Protestants are still considered, the basic values of Protestantism. The pride and glory of Protestantism, its individualism and autonomy, must be surrendered and submerged in the interests of an authoritarian collectivism. We can be sure that the main body of Protestants are not yet ready to accept his theories and that they will be met by a solid block of resistance. In this connection it is interesting to note that he nowhere refers to his theory as "Protestant Socialism." For while it is possible to conceive of "Religious Socialism," and even "Christian Socialism," it does not seem possible to associate in a single concept such mutually jarring ideas as "Protestant" and "Socialism."

For the Catholic theologian the main interest in the book lies in the fact that it is a brilliant exposition of radical trends in Protestant thought at its highest levels. We cannot be indifferent to the question: "Whither Protestantism?" And while it is safe to say that not many Protestants are ready to accept the answer given in this book, it is important to know that there exists an influential school that is leavening Protestant thought in this direction, and that this school has found such a brilliant exponent.

Apart from this main interest there are some subsidiary values that make the book decidedly worth the Catholic theologian's attention. The author's criticism of certain situations find pertinent application not only in Protestantism, but also in certain regions where Catholicism is or has been the prevailing religion. It is not true that Catholicism in itself is an "ideology." Nor is it true that the Universal Church can be abused after the manner of an ideology. But recent history provides some striking examples of nations in which the masses have become estranged from the Church because of their conviction that her interests were bound up with those of a ruling class. Nor have conservative Protestants any monopoly on stubborn and interested resistance to needed changes in social and economic conditions. This latter fact is underlined by the oft-repeated statement that wealthy Catholics present the strongest resistance to the social program outlined in Papal Encyclicals. In the midst of the endless assertions with which the Catholic reviewer must completely disagree, the author's penetrating analyses of these situations furnish valuable insights with which he can fully sympathize.

INTRODUCCIÓN AL EXISTENCIALISMO. By Msgr. Francisco Vives Estévez. With a prologue by Pedro Lira Urquieta. Santiago de Chile: Editorial del Pacífico. 1948. Pp. 77.

The Chilean reader, no less than readers in other parts of the world, meets with the word existentialism all too frequently. He wishes to know what it means and he takes the shortest path at his disposal: he asks someone who should know. Msgr. Vives former Vice Rector of the Catholic University of Chile, and actual Professor of the Philosophy of Law at the same University, must have heard the question so often that he decided to write the answer.

The work is slight in size and pretensions. Msgr. Vives is speaking to an educated public with little or no philosophical training. He makes no attempt to explain with documentation or systematic completeness all or any philosophies that can be called existentialist. He merely indicates the leading names connected with the movement and proposes their fundamental ideas in the emotional context which brought them forth. If one objects that this is little, Msgr. Vives would answer that his public could not assimilate more.

The little tome has the charm of the kindly man who wrote it. The Spanish flows with the ease and grace of a mind that is at home in the realm of ideas but never loses its love and interest for those who are not.

Woodstock College

GUSTAVE WEIGEL, S.J.

LE CARDINAL BÉRULLE. By A. Molien, Priest of the Oratory. Paris: Beauchesne et ses Fils, 1947. II Vols. Pp. 391, 395.

After his death in 1629 Bérulle was all but forgotten; almost total oblivion enveloped this "Apostle of the Incarnate Word," who had inspired saints and spiritual leaders of seventeenth century France, bequeathing them a lofty ascetical doctrine capable of rich development. Richelieu's *Mémoires*, which sought to make Bérulle ridiculous, had something to do with the saintly Cardinal's eclipse; further, the vain efforts of the Jansenists to claim Bérulle did manage to put him in a bad light for a while; and finally, he was surpassed by his own disciples, notably by Jean-Jacques Olier, in the presentation of the Berullian doctrine. In recent years many studies have appeared dealing with the extraordinary founder of the French school of spirituality. The present work gives us a biographical sketch of Bérulle, a systematic exposition of his doctrine, and, best of all, a selection of his writings now not easily obtainable.

Born in 1575 at Sérilly in Champagne, ordained to the secular priesthood in 1599, Pierre De Bérulle was already a consummate director of souls. Moving among the spiritual élite of the day, and influential at court, he

pursued a life of intense spiritual and political activity animated by the highest supernatural motives and principles. He founded the French Oratory of Jesus, of which he became the first Superior General, assisted the Jesuits expelled under Henri IV, introduced the Reformed Carmelites into France, and for the rest of his life acted as superior of the French Carmels, a task which brought him many trials and criticisms. In politics he supported the English marriage of Henrietta, helped bring about the Treaty of Angoulême, urged the siege of La Rochelle, and openly opposed the policy of Richelieu by advocating a Catholic alliance as a means of preserving both Catholicism and European equilibrium. With all this he managed to write books, pamphlets, letters massive in style and remarkable for their lofty supernatural doctrine. Bérulle was raised to the cardinalate in 1627, just before he lost favor at Court and was stripped of all political influence. In 1629 he died at the altar while saying Mass, a grace he had prayed for all his life.

In the second part of this work Père Molien gives 400 pages to a systematic exposition of Bérulle's spiritual doctrine, illustrating and enforcing the points with generous quotations from the Cardinal's works. This part of the book seems excessively long; it could get along without so many quotations, especially since the third part of the work comprises about 270 pages of Bérulle's text. Père Molien warns the reader that the book will be repetitious, in an anxious desire to make Bérulle's doctrine clear. In the work of exposition he acknowledges his debt to the writings of Henri Brémont and R. P. Taveau. This reviewer wishes that he had seen fit to introduce some discussion of the reserves made by Mersch in his splendid chapter on the French school—an unreasonable wish, I suppose, since Père Molien's chosen task is one of positive exposition. No doubt he has done enough when he carefully notes that Bérulle must be read benignantly; no writer can avoid breathing the intellectual atmosphere of his time.

Cardinal Bérulle's spiritual doctrine is theocentric, Christocentric, and religious in the sense that it puts the virtue of religion in the first place. Saint Francis de Sales insists on devotion; Bérulle insists on adoration. Man becomes an adorer in spirit and in truth by disappropriating himself of himself and by adhering to the states and sentiments of the Incarnate Word, God's perfect Adorer and the perfect Religious. The mysteries and events of Christ's temporal life still exist in their spiritual reality and it is by appropriating these to himself that man truly lives and adores in Christ and by Christ. Thus the Incarnate Word is not only the model but the very means of our adoration; Christ is the supplement of our nature. One might wonder why Bérulle did not write, "The substitute for our nature," so

absolute is the self-abdication he demands. As Mersch points out, no one can quarrel with Bérulle because he demands mortification; every spirituality that is true to the Gospel must insist on the Cross. But there is noticeable in Bérulle, and more so in his disciples De Condren and Olier, a certain rigorism, a sort of disdain for human nature, an apparent unwillingness to grant human nature anything not required by the strict demands of orthodoxy. This rigorism, attributable to the Augustinian climate of the times reacting against Molinism and "Devout Humanism," still leaves Bérullism a legitimate and orthodox spirituality, indeed a magnificent code of spirituality, in which all the practises of the ascetical life gain unity and heightened significance from being seen in their strict dependence on the truth of our incorporation in Christ.

The third part of the work offers a precious selection of Bérulle's writings arranged, not chronologically, but in a manner suited to illustrate the heads of doctrine set down in the second part of the book. The study of asceticism has been advanced by so fulsome a work on the rich dogmatic spirituality of Cardinal Bérulle.

Weston College

F. A. HARKINS, S.J.

HENRI SUSO ET LE DÉCLIN DE LA SCHOLASTIQUE. By J.-A. Bizet. Paris: Aubier, 1946. Pp. 430.

Blessed Henry Suso is the most distinguished of that small group of Dominican preachers and spiritual writers known as the German mystics of the fourteenth century. His writings, though not extensive, have come down to us more completely and with greater integrity than those of his master, John Eckhart, or of his fellow-disciple, John Tauler. Though even in his lifetime a shadow of suspicion was cast upon his teaching by the condemnation in 1329 of certain propositions attributed to Eckhart, Suso's works have always been widely read and highly esteemed, especially in German-speaking countries, where his *Book of Eternal Wisdom* is said to have rivaled the popularity of the *Imitation of Christ* (DTC., "Suso," XIV, 2861). His beatification in 1831 entirely vindicated his orthodoxy.

The present work is a very scholarly study of his writings from a fivefold point of view: their authenticity, biographical content, spiritual teaching, orthodoxy, and relation to other contemporary schools of mystical theology. A twenty-five page "Bibliographical Sketch" concludes the book.

The collection of Suso's works known as the *Exemplar* has long been considered the definitive edition of his principal writings in German. The Prologue of this edition states that this compilation and revision of his earlier writings was made by Suso himself in order to correct the mutilated versions

and misrepresentations of his doctrine already in circulation. In the last century certain German scholars questioned the authenticity of this *Exemplar* edition. Internal and external evidence, they said, proved it to be the work of some zealous copyist or confrère who wrote the Prologue in which he ascribed this new edition to Suso in order to give greater authority to the emendations he had made in the original text. Bizet successfully explodes the foundation of this suspicion and restores full confidence in the authenticity of the *Exemplar*, with respect, at least, to those writings of Suso which are therein republished in a somewhat revised form. With regard to the *Life* of Suso, also contained in this edition, Bizet does not hesitate to admit that several hands had a part in its composition. The first draft was penned by one of Suso's spiritual daughters, Elsbeth Stigel, who had carefully preserved all the confidences her spiritual director had made to her in his letters and conversations. When Suso first learned of these notes, he ordered them to be burned; but later relenting he made some corrections and additions with the view of including them in the final edition of his writings. After his death further interpolations were made by his superiors or literary editor. All of this explains the varied style, apparent exaggerations, and other difficulties of this *Life*; but, according to Bizet, the facts recounted therein are substantially correct.

In the chapter in which he gives us a masterful synthesis of Suso's teaching on the soul's mystical itinerary on the way to perfection, Bizet shows that he is well acquainted with Catholic teaching on ascetical and mystical theology, as well as with recent controversies among theologians on various mystical problems. He denies Garrigou-Lagrange's claim that Suso teaches the universal call to infused contemplation as the normal goal of perfection, and proves against Delacroix that far from being a mere theorist on mysticism, Suso first lived his doctrine and only systematized it in order to explain and teach it to others. Against the old accusations of unorthodoxy Bizet shows that Suso's doctrine is in complete harmony with traditional Catholic teaching.

There is only one criticism this reviewer has to make. The title of the book leads us to expect an explanation of Suso's influence on the decline of Scholasticism, or of the effect of that decline on Suso's doctrine. What we learn is that Suso did not adhere rigidly to the method of St. Thomas, that he was not interested in futile dialectical debates, that in manner of presentation his theology was influenced by the Augustinian school, especially through the writings of St. Bonaventure, that his application of theology to the problems of every day life was more direct and practical than that of the masters of the schools. But was not all this dictated by Suso's purpose,

rather than by any disagreement with the doctrine or methods of Scholasticism? He wrote for individual souls and their directors, not for the schools. Certainly he was not so greatly affected by, nor did he so contribute to, the decline of Scholasticism as to warrant the inclusion of this phrase in the title of the book.

Since the war several other learned works on the teaching of Blessed Henry Suso have been published in France (confer *Revue d'Ascétique et de Mystique*, Avril-Juin 1948, pp. 185-96). Such reawakened interest in the mystical theology of this Dominican saint and scholar deserves to be emulated in this country. M. Bizet's scholarly, objective, and sympathetic study will serve as an excellent guide and inspiration for a similar work in English.

St. Mary of the Lake Seminary

LEO A. HOGUE, S.J.

LE BRÉVIAIRE: PRIÈRE DE TOUS. By R. Hoornaert. Bruges: Beyaert, 1948. Pp. 134. 38 fr. belg.

This is a new edition of *La Bréviaire aux mains des laïcs* (1934), which was translated into English under the title *The Breviary and the Laity*, by William Busch, O.S.B. Its purpose is to win lay people to the complete or partial recitation of the Divine Office, and to offer encouragement to lay breviary associations; the author notes the existence of such associations in Austria, Belgium, England, France, Italy, and the United States, and the beginnings of similar groups in Holland and Spain.

In view of the recent encyclical, *Mediator Dei*, the author's insinuation that lay people joining in the recitation of the breviary thereby fulfill an "official" role needs some comment: "Parmi les nombreuses autorités qui reconnaissent à la recitation, à la psalmodie ou au chant des fidèles une valeur officielle, *nomine Ecclesiae*, nous ne citerons ici que l'opinion de Saint Albert-le-Grand qui . . . prétendait que le peuple chrétien avait dans la psalmodie de l'Office un rôle officiel à jouer" (p. 12). No one will disagree with what St. Albert writes concerning the layman's power to take part in the public recitation: "Hoc est officium communitatis et totius corporis Ecclesiae in devotione Deo servientis et non officium ministrorum, ut ministri sunt, ac subinde totum conventum fidelium posse esse chorum et respondere praecinentibus in laudem Dei."

Since the issuance of *Mediator Dei*, however, it is clear that such participants must be "deputed" by the Church before their collaboration will acquire "official" standing: "Est igitur 'Divinum Officium,' quod vocamus, Mystici Iesu Christi Corporis precatio, quae Christianorum omnium nomine eorumque in beneficium adhibetur Deo, cum a sacerdotibus aliisque Ecclesiae

ministris et a religiosis sodalibus fiat, in hanc rem ipsius Ecclesiae instituto delegatis" (*AAS*, XXXIX, 573).

Saint Mary's College

GERALD ELLARD, S.J.

THE WELL OF LIVING WATERS. By Pascal P. Parente, S.T.D., Ph.D. St. Louis: B. Herder Book Co., 1948. Pp. vi + 335. \$3.50.

This is an excellent English enchainment of spirituality which puts within easy reach of everyone some of the primary sources of the ascetical life. The numerous short citations from Scripture, the Fathers, and masters of asceticism treat of the moral and cardinal virtues, the duty of tending to perfection, the means of attaining it, the counsels, the Holy Eucharist, mystical graces, etc. Although the excerpts have purposely been kept short, the exact references on each page will greatly facilitate any further study of the subject in the very sources themselves.

This collection, so obviously a work of love, will be a definite aid not only for those to whom Migne is a mystery and Sacred Scripture is not completely familiar, but also for anyone who wants a quick and definite corroboration from the Word of God or the Fathers on a particular spiritual topic.

The author realizes that there is a lack of uniformity in style throughout his work since he makes use of various English translations of the Fathers. We appreciate the difficulty, but we believe that Fr. Parente would add immeasurably to the value of his contribution if, in a later edition, he solved the problem by giving us his own English version of the passages he has so capably selected.

Weston College

DANIEL J. SAUNDERS, S.J.

FROHE BOTSCHAFT IN DIE ZEIT. By Friedrich Muckermann, S.J. Einsiedeln: Verlagsanstalt Benziger and Co., 1948. Pp. 317. 13.50 francs clothbound, 9.50 francs paperbound.

Friedrich Muckermann was known for years as a poet of no mean caliber, an enthusiastic lecturer, a prolific writer, and an effective organizer. He acquired international fame during the years preceding World War II by his outspoken criticism of the Nazi ideology and regime. Hunted from country to country, he died an exile in Switzerland at the age of 63. The book under review was edited posthumously by his sister, Marie Theresia Muckermann. It contains meditations on the gospels of all Sundays and some holydays of the year, several of which had already appeared in various periodicals.

The peculiar charm of the meditations is a manly devotion that is wholly

centered in Christ and His Church. The author knows the modern world with its uninspiring existentialism and its barren slogans. But his undivided personal devotion is for the God-Man, the God-willed center of human history and every human life. The burning desire to rally all mankind around His standard, to gather them in His kingdom on earth, stands forth on every page. This is his glad tidings for our time. The unearthly beauty which he sees in Christ and His Church, and which he portrays here to a world at the crossroads, accounts for the lofty style that often rises to the heights of lyricism and mysticism. The book is recommended to all who wish to make their spiritual reading in modern German at its best.

Weston College

A. C. COTTER, S. J.

S. THOMAS AQUINATIS SCRIPTUM SUPER SENTENTIIS MAGISTRI PETRI LOMBARDI. Recognovit atque iterum edidit R. P. Maria Fabianus Moos, O.P. Tomus IV: *De sacramentis et de resurrectione et gloria resurgentium*. Parisiis: P. Lethielleux, 1947. Pp. ii + 1142.

An octavo edition of St. Thomas' commonly called *Commentary on the Sentences of Peter Lombard* was undertaken a score of years ago by the publishing firm of Lethielleux to meet the pressing demand for this early but important work, which was hardly to be found except in the complete folio or quarto sets. The first two tomes were published in the year 1929. R. P. Mandonnet, O.P., the promoter of the enterprise, wrote the introduction to the first volume and prepared the edition, which is a mere reprint of the unsatisfactory Vivès text (Paris, 1882) except for the correction of typographical mistakes.

With the intervention of Father Moos, under whose editorship the third tome appeared in 1933 and the fourth (the present) in 1947, the scientific value of the edition was raised. Without pretending to produce an absolutely critical edition he took great pains to improve the current text. Taking the Vivès edition as his basic text he collated it with the Roman (Pina), Antwerp, Paris (Nicolai), Venice (Bernard de Rubeis) and Parma editions and with the better manuscripts at his disposal. The collation, however, is not an *ad verbum* recension, but rather a checking and probing of dubious readings for the purpose of expurgating as many errors and inaccuracies as possible. Variant readings are noted in the critical apparatus at the bottom of the page. Citations of the Fathers and of Aristotle are followed by parenthetic references to the Migne and Bekker editions respectively.

Both Mandonnet and Moos preferred to entitle this first great theological

composition of the Angelic Doctor *Scriptum* rather than *Commentum* or *Quaestiones*. It is partially a commentary, as Mandonnet observes, inasmuch as the author analyzes and explains the *Sentences*; but since the work is made up in the main of a series of questions in which St. Thomas, besides completing and rectifying the doctrine of the Master expounds his own personal views, the more fitting title would seem to be: *Quaestiones in libros Sententiarum*. Neither of these claims is prejudiced by the simple designation *Scriptum*, which, moreover, has antiquity in its favor. Father Moos changed the full title of the edition from *Scriptum super libros Sententiarum* to *Scriptum super Sententiis*. The latter, he contests, is better Latinity and can besides invoke the authority of the so-called official catalogue of the Saint's works.

The fourth tome, which treats of the Sacraments, contains Distinctions I to XII inclusive. A fifth tome yet to follow will complete the work. Thirteen codices of the thirteenth century and seven codices of the fourteenth century were consulted to establish the text. A judicious selection and practical variety of type enhances the legibility.

It would be easy, but inconsiderate, to pick flaws in an edition that was never designed to present a definitive and critically certain text and which was prepared under the adverse conditions of recent years. Notwithstanding its shortcomings this edition provides scholars with a notably improved and more intelligible text, incontestably the best available, and provisionally indispensable for scientific study. Whilst awaiting the definitive, critical Leonine edition, which will utilize the autograph preserved in the Vatican Library, scholars remain indebted to the present editor and publisher.

MORALS AND THE NEW THEOLOGY. By H. D. Lewis. New York: Harper and Brothers. Pp. 160. \$2.00.

The main theme of this book has two parts, the first of which is to show "the failure of traditionalist theology to give an account of sin and moral evil which can be reconciled with the demands of the moral consciousness." Traditionalist theology is especially represented by Brunner, Niebuhr, and Barth, although a few less significant writers are used for lengthy illustrations. The demand of the moral consciousness primarily contradicted by these men is the fact that guilt presupposes the realization of duty and the freedom to fulfill it. The contradiction, as Mr. Lewis sees it, seems to reduce itself to a theory of fallen nature which deprives man of real freedom, while at the same time charging him with guilt.

The author's second main theme is to insist on the "inexpungeable char-

acter of our ultimate ethical convictions." Insofar as this expression means anything to me, it seems to be synonymous with Mr. Lewis' oft-repeated assertion of the independence of ethical truths from other realities, particularly religious truth. This would be easy to follow, if by religious truth he meant revelation; but he seems to include even the knowledge of God among the religious truths that have no bearing—at least, no direct bearing—on ethical truths.

Besides this two-fold main theme, the book is also (and in very large part) the author's philosophizing on the world in general. Again and again I found it difficult to determine just where Mr. Lewis was going, and why he was going there. One impression that seems sufficiently clear to mention is that Mr. Lewis manifests no knowledge of Catholic thought; for him, Catholic doctrine is apparently merely a tyranny from which man was liberated—but only partially—by the Reformation.

St. Mary's College

GERALD KELLY, S.J.

DIE GROSSEN ORDENSREGELN. Edited by Hans-Urs von Balthasar. Einsiedeln: Benziger-Verlag, 1948. Pp. 348.

These pages give us the constitutions and framework of government of the great religious orders fathered by St. Basil, St. Augustine, St. Benedict, St. Francis and St. Ignatius. After a general introduction by the editor, attention is focussed in turn on each of these orders. There is in each instance an introductory essay followed by the constitution, both contributions being furnished by a member of the particular order. Treatment varies considerably in extent, the Order of St. Augustine, for example, being accorded less than half the number of pages allotted to St. Benedict's foundation. An index would have added immeasurably to the usefulness of the volume.

West Baden College

CHARLES H. METZGER, S. J.

DIRECTION SPIRITUELLE DES RELIGIEUSES. Adapted from the German of A. Ehl by J. Creusen, S. J. Brussels: L'Édition Universelle, 1948. Pp. 365. 150 Belgian francs.

The first edition of *Die Schwesterseelsorge* by Peter Ehl of Offheim was published in 1923. A second edition appeared in 1925 and this was adapted into French by P. Creusen in 1936, with the addition of recent decisions of the Holy See regarding religious, and the substitution of a French bibli-

ography. The present work is a second edition of this French version, practically unchanged, with the exception of two new chapters which have been supplied by the author himself, but which appear here for the first time, because circumstances have prevented the publication of a new German edition of Ehl's work for the time being. These two chapters deal with the special direction of Sisters engaged in teaching, and of Sisters engaged in the care of the sick.

Without pretending to give a complete course in ascetical theology or a complete treatise regarding the office of the priest as confessor, the book strives to give practical suggestions regarding all the contacts which a priest may have with nuns or sisters in his office of chaplain, confessor, or pastor. After determining and explaining the principal means of spiritual direction, the book gives some specific details regarding the direction of various categories of religious women—novices, older religious, the scrupulous, neuresthenics, religious favored with mystical graces, and the like. A chapter deals with the direction of a religious vocation. Finally, the last section of the book treats a number of pertinent points in canon law.

St. Mary's College

ADAM C. ELLIS, S.J.

PLUS DE PRÊTRES POUR LE SALUT DU MONDE! Appel à la Multiplication et à la Culture de Vocations Sacerdotales. By R. P. Hermann Fischer, S.V.D. Traduit de l'Allemand, revu et mis à Jour par l'Abbé C. Poisson. Avec Lettre-Préface de Son Excellence Mgr. l'Archevêque de Montréal. Montréal: Fides, 1948. Pp. 358. \$1.25.

What may come as a surprise to most Catholics is the detailed picture of world conditions here presented. After eleven chapters on what the Catholic priesthood means for mankind, five on the want of priests, and ten on how to increase vocations (the first three parts respectively), there are twenty-two tables of statistics. They are arranged in five series, and convey a most telling idea of how grievous and urgent religious needs in various portions of the world really are. For example, the fifteenth table lists thirty-one places (Soviet Russia being one) with an area of about fifteen million square miles and a population of nearly three hundred million where the door is closed to Catholic mission activity and there are practically no priests at all. *Plus de prêtres* should prove helpful to all who are particularly interested in recruiting sacerdotal vocations, and it is a "must" for any mission library.

Saint Mary's College

G. AUG. ELLARD, S.J.

LE SAINT DU JOUR. Brèves notices sur la fête liturgique de chaque jour de l'année. By Abbé Henri Berthet. Paris: P. Lethielleux, 1947. Pp. 331.

This work consists of two very unequal parts: one for the fixed feasts and the other for those that are movable. Aiming at bringing the saints, as the author says, from the stained-glass windows in church down to earth and everyday life, he has made an effort to fix them firmly in their historical setting of time and place, to present the main facts of their lives, and to propose these models of Christian virtue as real men and women who in spite of their human frailties can still encourage and stimulate us to imitate them. The calendar which is followed is not simply that of the Roman breviary and missal, but apparently an adaptation for French dioceses. The book could be a great help to those, for instance, who use the missal at daily Mass but have little or no knowledge of the saints whom they thus honor from morning to morning.

Saint Mary's College

G. AUG. ELLARD, S.J.

L'UNIONE CON DIO. Conference di S. Em.za Card. Adeodato Piazza, S. Ecc.za Mons. Adriano Bernareggi, P. Innocenzo Colosio, O.P., Prof. Cac. Giovanni Colombo, P. Agostino Gemelli, O.F.M., P. Michele Ledrus, S. J., P. Gabriele di S. Maria Maddalena, O.C.D., Mons. Prof. Francesco Olgiati. Milano: Società Editrice "Vita e Pensiero," 1948. Pp. x + 180.

In recent years the University of the Sacred Heart in Milan has been sponsoring "weeks of spirituality," courses of lectures on the spiritual life for intelligent and interested people, whether lay or clerical. This is the third in a series of volumes that permanently preserve the papers read there. The eight conferences all center around the general theme indicated by the title. Previous courses dealt with the schools of Catholic spirituality and with prayer. The speakers were purposely chosen so as to be broadly representative of different groups within the Church. All were men of distinction, and their lectures are learned and theological rather than popular. A striking example is the one entitled, "Union with the Most Blessed Trinity," by the Bishop of Bergamo, Mons. Adriano Bernareggi. It fills forty-one large pages and is pitched on a very high level, not only devotionally but also scientifically. The well-known Carmelite authority in mystical theology, P. Gabriele di S. Maria Maddalena, in "The Mystical Union," gives a clear and valuable summary of his ideas, and presumably those of his *confrères* on the mystical life of union with God.

Saint Mary's College

G. AUG. ELLARD, S.J.

BOOKS RECEIVED

- Aubier, Paris: *La sagesse de Sénèque*, by André de Bovis. (pp. 231, Fr. 375).
 The Beacon Press, Boston: *The Way, the Truth, the Life*, by John S. Nollen. (pp. 64, \$1.00).
- Beauchesne et ses fils, Paris: *Manrèse: les exercices spirituels de Saint Ignace mis à la portée de tous les fidèles*, by H. Pinard de la Boullaye, S.J. (pp. xxxiv + 442); *Témoignage de l'univers*, by Michel Grison. (pp. 287).
- E. J. Brill, Leiden, Holland: *Jüdische Tradition in der Septuaginta*, by Leo Prijs. (pp. xxv + 118).
- Catholic University of America Press, Washington, D. C.: *The History, Nature, and Use of Epikeia in Moral Theology*, by Lawrence Joseph Riley. (pp. xi + 495).
- Cima Publishing Co., New York: *The Happy Life: Answer to Skeptics: Divine Providence and the Problem of Evil: Soliloquies*, by St. Augustine (trans: Ludwig Schopp, Denis J. Kavanagh, O.S.A., Robert P. Russell, O.S.A., Thomas F. Gilligan, O.S.A. (From the series, "Fathers of the Church": Writings of St. Augustine, Vol. I). (pp. 450, \$4.50); *The Immortality of the Soul: The Magnitude of the Soul: On Music: The Advantage of Believing: On Faith in Things Unseen*, by St. Augustine (trans: Ludwig Schopp, John J. McMahon, Robert Catesby Taliaferro, Luanne Meagher, O.S.B., Roy Joseph Deferrari and Mary Francis McDonald, O.P. (From the series, "Fathers of the Church": Writings of St. Augustine, Vol. II). (pp. 489, \$4.00).
- Desclée de Brouwer, Bruges: *Comment naissent les hommes: la reproduction, les âges de la vie*, by J. P. Bouckaert. (pp. 305, Fr. B. 280).
- Desclée de Brouwer et Cie., Paris: *Les exercices pratiques du "séminaire" en Théologie*, (quatrième édition revue et augmentée), by J. de Ghellinck, S.J. (pp. xvi + 228).
- Echter-Verlag, Würzburg: *Isaias*, by Dr. Joseph Ziegler. (pp. 189, DM 6).
- Editions Casterman, Tournai: *Mariologie de Saint Bernard*, 2^{ème} édition, by Dom Dominique Nogues. (pp. xviii + 236, Fr.B. 54).
- Éditions du Cerf, Paris: *Clément d'Alexandrie, extraits de Théodote*, by F. Sagnard, O.P., (From the series, "Sources chrétiennes"). (pp. 277); *David, roi d'Israël*, by Jean Steinmann. (From the series, "Témoins de Dieu"). (pp. 188); *Éthérie, journal de voyage*, Latin text with introduction and notes by Hélène Pétré. (From the series, "Sources chrétiennes"). (pp. 288, Fr. 400); *La Sainte Bible, L'Évangile selon Saint Marc*, by R. P. J. Huby, S. J. (pp. 84).
- Éditions J. Duculot, Gembloux: *Les origines du Jansénisme dans les Pays-Bas catholiques*, by Léopold Willaert, S.J. (pp. 440).

- Edizioni di "Storia E Letteratura," Rome: *Das Konzil von Trient, Ein Ueberblick ueber die Erforschung seiner Geschichte*, by Hubert Jedin. (pp. 225).
- Fides, Montréal: *Vers le dogme de l'Assomption*, by various authors. (pp. xii + 445, \$4.00).
- Francesco Ferrari Editor, Rome: *Mater Christi*, Vol. I, parts I & II, by Carlo Cecchelli. (pp. part I, xxviii + 331; part II, xiv + 307).
- Gregorius-Verlag vorm Friedrich Pustet, Regensburg: *Einführung in die Geschichte der theologischen Literatur der Frühshcolastik*, by Artur Michael Landgraf. (pp. 143); *Offenbarung des Johannes*, by Alfred Wikenhauser. (pp. 143).
- Harper & Brothers, New York: *Purity of Heart*, by Søren Kierkegaard. (pp. 220, \$2.50).
- B. Herder Book Co., St. Louis: *Second Latin*, by Cora Carroll Scanlon and Charles L. Scanlon. (pp. vi + 270, \$3.50).
- Verlag Herder, Freiburg im Breisgau: *Der Dichter vor heraufziehenden Zeit*, by Reinhold Schneider. (pp. 31); *Liturgie und Mönchtum*, Laacher Hefte, Heft I. (pp. 96); *Leben aus dem Wort: Das Kommen des Herrn*, Vols. I & II, by Eugen Walter. (pp. Vol. I, 185; Vol. II, 143).
- Verlag Herder, Wien: *Die Geschichte und Gebetsschule des Rosenkranzes*, by Franz Michel Willam. (pp. ix + 231); *Missarum Sollemnia* (Erster Band), by Josef Andreas Jungmann, S.J. (pp. xix + 610).
- L'Immaculée-Conception, Canada: *Lumière et Sagesse, la grâce mystique dans la théologie de Saint Thomas d'Aquin*, by Lucien Roy, S.J. (pp. 299).
- P. J. Kenedy & Sons, New York: *Another Two Hundred Sermon Notes*, by F. H. Drinkwater. (pp. xii + 210, \$4.25).
- P. Lethielleux, Editeur, Paris: *L'assaut contre le Christ au XX^e siècle*, by Gustave Combès. (pp. 407, Fr. 600); *La spiritualité du laïc*, Jean Vitalis. (From "Cahiers Dei Amor," Série C). (pp. 81); *Si tu étais Prêtre?*, by G. Lemesle. (pp. 234).
- Longmans, Green and Co., New York: *Awake in Heaven*, by Gerald Vann, O.P. (pp. 159, \$2.50); *Transformation in Christ*, by Dietrich von Hildebrand. (pp. ix + 406, \$4.50).
- Marietti, Torino: *Quaestiones selectae ex historia primaeva*, by P. F. Ceuppens, O.P. (xxiii + 376).
- The Newman Press, Westminster: *Canonical Legislation Regarding Religious*, Authorised English Translation. (pp. 74); *A Companion to the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius*, 3rd edition, by Aloysius Ambrozzi, S.J. (pp. xviii + 348, \$3.00).

- Paulinus-Verlag, Trier: *Menschenkunde im Dienste der Seelsorge und Erziehung*, by Dr. Wilhelm Heinen and Dr. Joseph Höffner. (pp. 208).
- Presses Universitaires de France, Press: *Les religions étrusque et romaine*, by Albert Grenier: *Les religions des celtes, des germains et des anciens slaves*, by Joseph Vendryes, Ernest Tonnelat et B.-O. Unbegaun. (From the collection, "Mana", Tome II, Vol. III). (pp. 467, Fr. 500).
- Schocken Books Inc., New York: *Hammer on the Rock: A Midrash Reader*, ed. by Nahum N. Glatzer. (16 Schocken Library Series). (pp. 128, \$1.50).
- Sheed and Ward, London: *Christian Marriage*, second edition, by George H. Joyce, S. J. (pp. xiii + 645, 21s. net).
- Standard Printing Company, San Antonio: *Pastoral Spanish*, second edition, by Alphonse Simon, O.M.I. (pp. xxiii + 551).
- La Table Ronde, Paris: *Origène*, by Jean Daniélou. (From the collection, "Le génie du Christianisme," published under the direction of François Mauriac). (pp. 308).
- Verlag, J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), Tübingen: *Theologie des Neuen Testaments*, by Rudolf Bultmann. (pp. 348, DM 11).
- Verlag Josef Habbel, Regensburg: *Anruf und Zeugnis der Liebe*, by various authors. (pp. 240, —); *Die Abstammungsfrage Heute*, by Josef Ternus, S.J. (pp. 96, Kart. 2.50 DM; Halbleinen 4 DM); *Der Gegenwärtige Stand der Assumptafrage*, (pp. 61, Kart. 1.80 DM).