

CURRENT THEOLOGY

THE HISTORY OF THE CHURCH FROM 1649 TO 1960: A SURVEY OF RESEARCH, 1956-1960

"The most complicated and least generally known of the major divisions of church history," is one recent writer's verdict on the past three centuries.¹ Modern civil history is even more complex; yet, its manifest utility makes it the most assiduously cultivated of all historical fields. Neglect, the unenviable peculiarity of the ecclesiastical area, has less justification after the contributions of the five years here surveyed. In the form of books and, still more, of articles, these have attained such mountainous proportions that a quantitatively complete appraisal would probably exhaust, if it did not exceed, the powers of any surveyor, and would surely overwhelm the endurance of the hardiest reader. Editorial insistence, fortified by practical necessity, demands concentration of energy circumscribed by qualitative criteria which reject all but the most original or otherwise significant products. For the most part, these continue to proceed from a few countries in western Europe and to deal with these lands. Facility in handling French, German, and Italian remains a basic skill of the English-speaking ecclesiastical historian. The Church is now solidly entrenched throughout the globe, but vast sectors rarely appear as subjects of high-caliber writings, more rarely as habitats of scholarly writers. The United States is not relegated to this category. Literature concerning it has now attained sufficient stature to fill out a separate bulletin, to be published later; it is, therefore, omitted here.

BIBLIOGRAPHIES

An elimination contest precedes a survey like the present. Survivors bedeck the following pages. The starting line-up must be sought in the bibliographies. Were it not for such compilations, historians would soon become lost in a rapidly growing forest of new books and articles, the latter multiplying the faster with the proliferation of new historical periodicals.²

EDITOR'S NOTE.—This is the fourth in a series of Church history surveys which appear each year in the March issue.

¹ James H. Nichols, *History of Christianity 1650-1950* (New York: Ronald, 1956) p. iii. This survey's verdict on this book appears below.

² Canon Roger Aubert, editor of the *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, has traced the development of periodicals devoted to Church history in the present century. Besides cataloging their vigorous growth, he also notes their areas of special competence. as well as

Bibliographies can be found appended to all serious historical productions, whether in books, periodicals, or encyclopedias; but obsolescence soon overtakes many of them. Keeping up to date is essential. To this end, the best bibliography by far for the full sweep of the subject is that found in each issue of the *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*. It is no small task merely to peruse this section alone, which for 1956-1960 exceeded 40,000 items (many of them, to be sure, relevant to the years preceding 1649 or to auxiliary subjects). A notion of the value and contents of some 1300 of them can be gained from the book reviews and "Chronique," the latter being particularly useful for summaries of articles, often those printed in periodicals very difficult of access. Extensive as this bibliography is, it is not exhaustive. Specialized bibliographies for individual countries, religious orders, etc., are needed as a supplement. For Italy, e.g., the *Rivista di storia della Chiesa in Italia* prints an excellent bibliography arranged according to period and region, with brief comments about the contents and sometimes about the value of the entries; of widest interest are its notices on papal history. For all current writings pertaining to the Society of Jesus, e.g., the lists in the *Archivum historicum Societatis Jesu* are indispensable.

The *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* is not at its best in cataloguing literature originating in the United States. Nor is its custom of restricting each work to a single entry conducive to speedy pinpointing of all topics, despite numerous subdivisions of headings. For periodical literature especially is it important but difficult to be assured that pertinent material is not being overlooked. Security is now attained for this type of writing if produced by a scholarly journal in this country or elsewhere in the English-speaking world. To the well-established and highly-esteemed *Catholic Periodical Index* and *International Index* has been added the *Index to Religious Periodical Literature*.⁸ In each of these, ecclesiastical history is only one of many subjects indexed. Between the three, without duplicating one another, none of the pertinent sources of articles are missed. Technically, all are admirable and similar in make-up, with each item listed at least twice,

their changes in emphases, formerly concentrating on Christian antiquity, nowadays more alert to modern and medieval subjects. Catholic journals, lightly esteemed around 1900, have progressed most, both in scholarship and in numbers, especially since 1918. See "Un demi-siècle de revues d'histoire ecclésiastique," *Rivista di storia della Chiesa in Italia* 14 (1960) 173-202.

⁸ Vol. 1 (1953; pp. 220) indexes the literature between 1949 and 1952; Vol. 2 (1956; pp. 114) indexes the years 1953-54; Vol. 3, not yet published, will index 1955-56; Vol. 4, (1960; pp. xiii + 305 + 99) covers the period 1957-59. The *IRPL* is published by the American Theological Library Association and distributed by Princeton Theological Seminary, Princeton, N.J.

by author and subject. The *Index to Religious Periodical Literature* admits a basically Protestant outlook; but along with indexes to scholarly and popular Protestant journals in religion and allied fields from the English-speaking world and some from France, Germany, and Japan, it also covers selected Catholic and Jewish ones which are not elsewhere indexed. Its latest volume is notable for a great increase in the number of periodicals indexed, reflected in a much bulkier book. It indexes 57 periodicals, compared with 30 in the earlier volumes, and compared with nearly 250 in the *Catholic Periodical Index* and about 175 in the *International Index*. From these journals it indexes 3563 articles by 2400 or so authors, indexing each article on an average four times for a total of 13,962 entries, plus 5912 book-review references listed under the authors' names in a separate section of 99 pages. About 200 more book-review articles are indexed in the main section. It remains thin, however, compared to the 123,000 entries in the two volumes of the *Catholic Periodical Index* for the period from June, 1956, to December, 1960.

Another new, important bibliography, whose scope is as broad as history itself, is *The American Historical Association Guide to Historical Literature*,⁴ successor to the famed *Guide to Historical Literature*, edited by G. M. Dutcher and others three decades ago under the same auspices.⁵ What precise relation is intended between the two is not explained, but the earlier guide is not supplanted. Both present highly selective lists for English-speaking nonspecialists, although foreign titles in the 1961 edition do not run too far behind those in English. The 20,000 titles, chosen by about 230 experts, more than double those of 1931; and nearly three fourths appeared since then. Emphases have been shifted to give more prominence to regions recently developed, less to Europe. Ecclesiastical history is also, without explicit mention, de-emphasized. Quantitatively and qualitatively, this section suffers from comparison with Dutcher's edition. Whereas Dutcher had a separate section of 43 pages entitled "History of Christianity," the same topic now commands 233 of the 730 titles under "History of Religion," about 1 per cent of the total entries compared to more than 4 per cent previously. More disconcerting is the inclusion of inferior and obsolete titles, and omission of recent, fundamentally important ones; failure to record English translations; placing of titles in wrong categories; erroneous, even contradictory comments on entries, and total absence of them for some items recognizable only by specialists; failure to make use of cross

⁴ Edited by George F. Howe *et al.* (New York: Macmillan, 1961; pp. xxxvi + 962).

⁵ New York: Macmillan, 1931; pp. xxviii + 1222. The 1961 edition, though shorter, has a larger format and uses double columns per page.

references to the many pertinent titles sprinkled elsewhere through the volume, a failure which the subject index (an excellent new feature) does not always remedy. In view of the wide circulation and influence this work is sure to wield, it is good to learn from early critical reviews that other sections are glowingly praised. From these the ecclesiastical historian can derive guidance to auxiliary information.

Publications devoted exclusively to digests of the contents of periodical articles, without evaluative comment, have spread to several fields of knowledge, and lately to history. *Historical Abstracts*⁶ has been digesting articles concerning the years 1775–1945 which appeared since June, 1954. Between Vols. 1 and 5, the number of periodicals searched increased from 678 to 1305, the number of abstracts per year from 2387 to 3700. For ecclesiastical historians the utility seems limited. Not all the important journals in this field are studied. In the vast majority the abstracts concern other branches of history. There is a helpful author and subject index to aid in disengaging the small amount of relevant material from the mass. Since periodicals from 70 countries are now abstracted, it is possible to obtain a grasp of the contents of many contributions in little-known tongues. The brevity of the abstracts raises the question as to the value of reducing historical materials to capsule form, especially since many depend so much on the massing of details or fulness of narrative.

*Religious and Theological Abstracts*⁷ began publication in 1958, and has increased the total of abstracts from 720 in the first volume to 1234 in the third, which enumerates 128 periodicals abstracted. Mostly these are not Catholic journals. Not more than a dozen deal mainly with ecclesiastical history. Abstracts are very brief and not always in the proper category. Serious objection can be raised against the practice of listing periodicals for abstracting and then providing few or no digests from them.

REFERENCE WORKS

Another stage in the slow progress of an indispensable reference work concerning the hierarchy was marked with the publication in 1960 of the sixth volume of *Hierarchia catholica medii et recentioris aevi*, dealing with the years 1730–99.⁸ Conrad Eubel inaugurated this great task, and pub-

⁶ *Historical Abstracts* (Santa Barbara, Calif.: 800 East Micheltorena Street; 1955 ff.).

⁷ Published by Theological Publications, Inc. (P.O. Box 928, Youngstown 1, Ohio; 1958 ff.).

⁸ Remigius Ritzler, O.F.M.Conv., and Pirminus Sefrin, O.F.M.Conv., *Hierarchia catholica medii et recentioris aevi* 6 (1730–99) (Padua: Il Messaggero di S. Antonio, 1958; pp. xiv + 487).

lished the first volume in 1898 (2nd ed., 1913). He also put out the second volume in 1901 (2nd ed., 1914), and, with collaborators, the third in 1910 (2nd ed., 1923). Gauchat was responsible for the fourth in 1935. Since then, Ritzler and Sefrin have taken over the labor, publishing a fifth volume in 1952. The importance of all these volumes is that, for the period covered, 1198-1799, they provide the best-established lists of popes, cardinals, and bishops throughout the entire world arranged according to dioceses. This information, very difficult to establish with accuracy, was obtained by long years of patient research, mainly in the Vatican Archives. The extreme wealth of footnotes, which monopolize much of the contents, is sufficient evidence of the firsthand quality of the sources. A great deal of valuable, hard-to-get detail concerning hundreds of prelates is also embedded in these notes. A seventh and final volume, reaching to 1846, is in progress. For the period 1198-1799, this series is to be preferred to Pius Gams, *Series episcoporum ecclesiae catholicae*, an earlier endeavor which relied on secondary sources. Gams is still useful for the centuries prior to the thirteenth and for the decades between 1799 and 1885.⁹

Information concerning diplomatic representatives of the Holy See, long available for the period preceding 1800, is now at hand for the decades since then, thanks to the efforts of Giuseppe De Marchi, an official of the papal Secretariate of State.¹⁰ He lists all papal secretaries and subsecretaries of state, secretaries of the Congregation of Extraordinary Ecclesiastical Affairs, and all nuncios and internuncios catalogued according to country, along with pertinent personal data about each one. Very useful is the index of titular sees of these functionaries, because the practice is for nuncios to sign documents merely with their initials, followed by their episcopal title. Direct access to the archives of the Vatican and of the Secretary of State was granted the author; so his compilation is more reliable than those of his predecessors. Elsewhere this information would be very difficult to obtain. The book is, therefore, indispensable in its field.

Religious encyclopedias are currently enjoying a boom. Prescinding from those completed before 1956, and attending solely to those especially profitable to the ecclesiastical historian, five deserve to be singled out. All are scholarly and objective. Three are under Catholic auspices, two under non-Catholic. One is completed, four incomplete. Two of these, begun since 1956, are progressing rapidly toward completion. No two are duplicates,

⁹ Original edition, 1873; later supplements, 1879, 1886. Reprinted in 1957 by Akademische Druck- und Verlagsanstalt, Graz; pp. xxiv + 963, 108, 148.

¹⁰ Giuseppe De Marchi, *Le nunziature apostoliche dal 1800 al 1956* (Rome: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 1957; pp. xx + 284).

since they vary greatly in length of articles on the same topics, in envisioned readers, in religious affiliation and other qualities of contributors, and in emphases, each tending to be fuller on matters touching the political and linguistic area of its origin.

The *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche* established in its first edition (1930–38) an extremely high reputation for solidity and accuracy in brief compass, and this reputation is being maintained in the second, which began to appear in 1957 and was half finished three years later.¹¹ Both editions number ten volumes in similar format; but the new edition will contain as much material as twelve of the former, due to longer pagination. Not only are the collaborators new; the articles, too, are new in the vast majority. This is by no means a reprint. Ecclesiastical history continues to be well cared for, despite changes in emphases, and despite the need to provide articles on all phases of the Church's teachings and life. On the average, the contributions are well under a column long (the first edition compressed 27,247 entries into 10,446 columns), but the more vital topics are allowed to occupy several columns. (The 42 columns devoted to "Jesus Christ" in the most recent volume are, however, quite exceptional). A compendious style and lavish use of cross references compact the maximum into the available space and make the shortest entries rewarding. Despite this economical attitude toward space, there is an evident readiness to be generous in freeing it for bibliographies, which may pre-empt a high percentage of an entry's room. For scholars, here is a very important bibliographical tool, carefully fashioned and up to the minute.

*Catholicisme*¹² aims to be a high-level popularization, the successor to the six-volume *Dictionnaire pratique des connaissances religieuses* (1925–28). Its tempo of publication has been slow, with only four of its seven volumes complete in 1960, twelve years after the appearance of the first. Ecclesiastical history and geography are especially well represented, and often excellently well in quality. The fifteen-column history of the Papal States, e.g., cannot readily be matched.

Closest of all these encyclopedias to the subject of Church history, and second to none of them in scholarly caliber, is the *Dictionnaire d'histoire et de géographie ecclésiastiques*.¹³ Notices can be expected here on the thousands

¹¹ Edited by Josef Höfer and Karl Rahner (Freiburg: Herder, 1957 ff.; Vols. 1–5 = pp. 50 + cols. 6608). Abbreviated title is *LThK*.

¹² *Catholicisme hier, aujourd'hui, demain*, ed. G. Jacquemet (Paris: Letouzey & Ané, 1948 ff.). Vol. 4 (1956), reaching to "Gibbons," is the sole completed volume between 1956 and 1960.

¹³ Edited by R. Aubert and E. van Cauwenbergh (Paris: Letouzey & Ané, 1912 ff.;

of persons and places (countries, towns, dioceses, religious houses, etc.) with a role in the Church's history. In length they resemble the amplitude of the *Dictionnaire de théologie catholique* much more than the conciseness of the *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche*. Where the latter, e.g., despatches three famed ecclesiastical historians, Denifle, Döllinger, and Duchesne, in two columns, the *DHGE* expands to 56. Denys the Pseudo-Areopagite merits a column and a half in the one, 45 in the other; Dublin, two thirds of a column and 139 columns respectively. Like the *DTC*, the *DHGE* intersperses exhaustive monographs among its terser articles. Perhaps these book-length contributions have set the pace of the enterprise. No doubt the world wars of this century have been a retarding factor. Whatever the reasons are, this great project is on the way towards setting a record for tardiness. More than half a century after the appearance of the first fascicule (1909), Vol. 14 has in 1960 completed only four letters of the alphabet, and barely edged its way into the appalling number of entries initiated by the remaining twenty-two letters. Progress, clearly, is its most-needed product. Acceleration of publication has been achieved, but speed is exacting its toll. Articles beginning with "A" consumed the years between 1912 and 1931, and 8036 columns filling five volumes; "B" filled 7588 columns in as many more volumes completed in 1938; "C" filled 4182 columns in three volumes terminated in 1956; but "D" was given only 1252 columns, less than one volume. Many entries in recent volumes merely refer the reader to the *DTC* or some other encyclopedia which has a satisfactory account, sometimes adding a few lines to bring the bibliography and contents up to date. Also, a host of personages and places of secondary moment are being dropped from all treatment. This is the more regrettable, since this is precisely the type of information encountered scarcely anywhere else, and which the original editor, Alfred (later Cardinal) Baudrillart, committed the project to supply (cf. Vol. 1, v-vii).

Similar in scope, length, and scientific quality to the *LThK* is the Protestant *Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, whose third edition in six volumes plus an index volume (one more than the second edition, 1927-32) began to appear in 1957.¹⁴ Three years later, four volumes were finished. The fifth reached completion in 1961. These two undertakings, requiring the co-operation of hundreds of writers, are further proof that West

Vol. 13, "Clinge-Czorna," 1956, cols. 1200; Vol. 14, "Dabert-Eger," 1960, cols. 1524). Abbreviated title is *DHGE*.

¹⁴ Edited by K. Galling (3rd ed., completely new; Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1957 ff.; Vols. 1-5). Abbreviated title is *RGG*.

German ecclesiastical scholarship has not allowed itself to be outdistanced by industry in recovering from the devastations of World War II.

The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church, sole representative of the English language in this group, completed its one volume in 1957.¹⁵ Its excellent external make-up is a good indicator of the quality of its contents. It has sought earnestly for accuracy, serenity, and objectivity; and it could, on the whole, be given an imprimatur on these scores. Historians can be especially pleased that its 6000 entries, varying in length from a few lines to 2500 words, are predominantly historical in treatment, while encompassing all aspects of Christianity. Cross references permit deeper penetration into individual subjects than the brevity of any one article might suggest. Of the 93 contributors, most were Anglicans, a handful Catholics, including one of the editor's chief assistants, Hilda Graef, who drafted or revised many of the articles. None of the articles are signed. Drafts of about half the articles, including most major ones, were handed over by the contributors to the editor. He and his assistants reduced these drafts to final form, wrote themselves the remaining articles, and compiled all the bibliographies, which can be found appended to two thirds of the entries. The heavy burden assumed by the editor during eighteen years has resulted in a unity and evenness of composition unusual in co-operative undertakings. Dr. Cross intended his bibliography to be an outstanding feature. In this he has succeeded. Omission of a bibliography is his tacit admission of the nonavailability of a suitable one. This ranks as a standard reference work, to be consulted not only by the educated public at whom it is aimed primarily, but also by scholars.

Italy has taken a cue from several other countries, and started a much-needed national biographical encyclopedia, the *Dizionario biografico degli Italiani*.¹⁶ Its 40 volumes will afford notices for some 40,000 deceased persons, either natives born since the fifth century whose role in the peninsula or abroad has been significant, or foreigners, such as ecclesiastical personages, who have been prominent in Italian life. In length, the average for the opening volume is about a column and a half (1000 or so names in 763 two-column pages); but variations in this respect are considerable. Thus, six popes entitled "Adriano" command 62 columns; and seven more styled "Alessandro," 87. "Alighieri, Dante" requires a book-length 134 columns,

¹⁵ Edited by F. L. Cross (London and New York: Oxford University Press, 1957; pp. xx + 1492). Abbreviated title is *ODCC*.

¹⁶ Edited by Alberto M. Ghisalberti (Rome: Istituto della Enciclopedia Italiana, 1960 ff.; Vol. 1, "Aaron-Albertucci," 1960, pp. xxiv + 763; Vol. 2, "Albicante-Ammorati," 1960, pp. xvi + 803).

17 being bibliographical. This generous allotment to bibliography is not proportionately high, when compared with other articles. The catalogue of collaborators is impressive in quality and quantity (262 for Vol. 1, including a dozen non-Italians). Italy has ever been prolific in men prominent in the Church. Considering the willingness of the published two volumes to record ecclesiastical figures, it is clear that this set belongs among the standard ecclesiastical reference collections.

GENERAL HISTORIES

Several general accounts of the Church deserve mention. Some treat the entire period, some only part of it. Some describe the Church universal, some the Church in a single country. They vary considerably in aim; also in the reasons for their merit.

Special importance can be attached to the two titles commented on first. Both encompass the entire Church. Between them they embrace all three centuries save for a few decades. Both are permanently valuable, yet they differ widely in fundamental respects.

The stretch between the end of the Reformation era and the start of the French Revolution, 1648–1789, forms a distinct period in Church history. It has not received as much attention as other epochs and has long awaited a top-rate, scholarly synthesis. The 26-volume series, with numerous specialist contributors under the original editorship of Fliche and Martin, the most ambitious, scientific Catholic synthesis of this century, might be expected to provide it.¹⁷ Edmond Préclin and Eugène Jarry devote a huge tome (Vol. 19 in the series) entirely to this century and a half.¹⁸ Préclin is the better known from other writings on this period. He has left Abbé Jarry, one of the present successors to Fliche and Martin as editor, with scarcely a tenth of the text. As their title succinctly indicates, the main theme is conflict in the political and doctrinal realms. With great learning and in minute detail the various facets of this topic (along with others) are carefully explored, to each its proper proportion: Church-State discords throughout Europe in the heyday of royal absolutism—with Louis XIV in France; with princes in Germanic lands infected with Febronianism; with Hapsburg rulers guided by Josephist principles of statism; internal

¹⁷ *Histoire de l'église*, ed. Augustin Fliche and Victor Martin (Paris: Bloud & Gay, 1935 ff.). Of the 26 envisioned volumes, 17 are now completed. Two more are partly finished; their completion is promised for 1962. Vols. 20 and 21, going from 1789 to 1846, appeared in 1949 and 1952.

¹⁸ *Les luttes politiques et doctrinales aux XVII^e et XVIII^e siècles* (Paris: Bloud & Gay, 1956; pp. vi + 838).

disputes because of Gallicanism, Jansenism, Quietism, Chinese rites, the suppression of the Jesuits. Along with these serious problems was the growth of disbelief parallel with the development of the rationalistic Enlightenment. On the foreign missions the effect of all these embroilments in Europe was creeping paralysis. There is, however, such a plethora of small detail that the work is more an annals than a well-integrated history, or a series of monographs. Reading is turned too much into a chore (save for Jarry's chapters). Nor can a student be expected to gain the wide view when only a couple of pages at the beginning and end are set aside for this purpose. But this is more or less characteristic of Fliche-Martin as a whole.

Kenneth Scott Latourette has taken great pains to avoid the above criticism in his history of Christianity since 1815, a detailed factual narrative with lengthy pauses for broad interpretative reflections.¹⁹ This combination imparts to his four volumes a significance not surpassed by any in this survey. With this work and the seven-volume *History of the Expansion of Christianity* (1937-45), the author has two *magna opera* to his credit, not to mention other writings of importance. He belongs in the top ranks of ecclesiastical historians produced by the United States, or even by the entire English-speaking world. When it is recalled that the present tremendous project was undertaken at the age of seventy-four, one does not know whether to admire more the man for his courage and disdain of well-earned retirement; or his thoroughness, competence, and impartiality; or his incredible speed of execution, completing four out of five volumes within three years (although long preparation must have preceded publication). If Latourette does not have Pr clin's familiarity with original sources, he has seemingly assimilated all the worth-while secondary literature, part of which is listed in his valuable, annotated bibliographies totaling seventy pages. Latourette has an extraordinary faculty for extracting from his immense reading whatever is important and characteristic, and presenting it in orderly, clear, accurate, succinct fashion. Despite its size, the broad scope of the work, detailing all aspects of the external and internal life of all Christian denominations, necessitates capsule treatment for most individual persons, movements, or conflicts. It is, among other things, a handy reference encyclopedia.

¹⁹ *Christianity in a Revolutionary Age: A History of Christianity in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries* (New York: Harper, 1958-61). Vol. 1: *The Nineteenth Century in Europe: Background and Roman Catholic Phase* (1958; pp. xiv + 498). Vol. 2: *The Nineteenth Century in Europe: The Protestant and Eastern Churches* (1959; pp. xii + 532). Vol. 3: *The Nineteenth Century outside Europe* (1961; pp. x + 528). Vol. 4: *The Twentieth Century in Europe: The Roman Catholic, Protestant, and Eastern Churches* (1961; pp. viii + 568). Vol. 5 will be entitled *The World outside Europe since 1914*.

Latourette's approach to history also prevents overconcentration on factual data. Rather, it leads him to dedicate half his first volume to the background and leading characteristics of this age, and to repeat this procedure for individual countries. It also induces him to halt regularly at the close of chapters and volumes to summarize his findings and to point out main trends. To Latourette, Christianity is living amidst a mounting revolution of unparalleled magnitude, due to all the recent political, economic, technological, scientific, social, and intellectual changes. Together these have been posing Christianity with the most serious external and internal threats to survival ever encountered. Following a procedure unusual in works of this caliber, the author confronts these phenomena with a questionnaire, which it is the book's purpose to answer. Why did this dangerous revolution arise in the traditional heartland of Christendom? What challenges did it propose to Christians? What responses did the various churches make? In what respects were the Christian groups similar and dissimilar, successful or unsuccessful, in their adaptations? Throughout, Latourette, himself a Baptist, is struck by the paradox that dechristianizing forces, formidable as they are, have been more than offset by a surprising revitalizing of Christian hosts, especially the Protestant one. To him, the nineteenth century, and the twentieth too, according to his latest volume, are above all Protestant ones. (In his treatment of the present century, however, he accords Catholics as much attention as Protestants, though only half as much in the account of the preceding one.) Not all would be satisfied with the norms applied to reach these conclusions. Not all would agree that these are the inevitable consequences to be drawn from a mountain of factual premises, so honestly set on display.

A coreligionist who does not see eye to eye with Latourette's over-all conclusions after traversing the same ground (for twice as long a spell) and with similar intent is James Hastings Nichols, Professor of Church History at the University of Chicago. Unlike his colleague from Yale, he does not flesh his *History of Christianity (1650-1950)*²⁰ with details. Instead, presupposing a firm grasp on them, he concentrates on "an orientation to the present state of Christianity." Impelling him is a belief that "few... if any interpret comprehensively the developments which lie behind the present state of the Church as a whole" (p. iii). His text is more lively and outspoken than Latourette's, but his foundations are much weaker. Protestantism he may know as well; it preoccupies nearly three fourths of his space. Catholic teachings, aims, and history are his feeblest pillars. Nor do his transparent prejudices make his judgments more palatable. His focus

²⁰ New York: Ronald, 1956; pp. vi + 494.

is also narrower than Latourette's, sighted only on adjustments to external changes, "the changing relation of Christian faith to society, culture, and the state" (p. iv). To him, a revolution in the relation of Christianity to Western culture has characterized not merely the post-Napoleonic years, but the last three centuries. The burden of his woe is that Christianity has been progressively less successful in trying to inculcate her principles into civilization, or to guide the basic forces and structures of modern times. His subtitle, "Secularization of the West," aptly epitomizes his thought. This vitally important topic can obviously profit from a great deal more soundly-based reflection. For historians, at one on factual premises, to break lances in the arena of interpretation need cause no surprise; it is no novelty.

If Latourette's diligence and output be classed as prodigious, that of Daniel-Rops defies classification. Besides turning out books and articles with short-term regularity, editing a periodical and a multivolumed encyclopedia, he is attempting what is most unusual for a lone mortal today, a ten-volume history of the Church.²¹ With eight of them in print within twelve years, success is in sight, even though each tome grows in length as it nears the present. Between 1956-60 three have seen print, describing the period from 1622 to 1878.²² These are meant to be widely read, and their popularity attests their attainment of a set goal. They are also based on wide reading well assimilated. On constant display is a sound knowledge of the external and internal life of the Church and the secular milieu. As a writer, Daniel-Rops is a master of clear, orderly synthesis of complicated themes presented interestingly and in rich detail, and interpreted with prudence. There is some unevenness, an overfondness for French affairs (as is common with the French), and a tendency to act the apologist. If his approach is personal, it is also inspiring as well as informative, as should be the case. To date, four volumes have been translated into English; the others will be translated without delay, it is to be hoped.

As English versions of Daniel-Rops arrive, they should supplant Mourret's familiar nine-volume history of the Catholic Church, now available in this language save for the final volume. As recently as 1957, Vol. 8, pertaining to 1823-78, took on English dress, twenty-seven years after these translations began, and four decades after the completion of the French

²¹ *Histoire de l'église du Christ* (Paris: Fayard, 1948 ff.).

²² Vol. 5, *L'Eglise des temps classiques*, is in two parts: Part 1: *Le grand siècle des âmes* (1958; pp. 496); Part 2: *L'Ere des grands craquements* (1958; pp. 538). Vol. 6, Part 1: *L'Eglise des révolutions: En face de nouveaux destins* (1960; pp. 1046).

original!²³ Before publication the version was dated. Especially for its full information on France, it retains value. But Daniel-Rops is better written, better organized, better proportioned, more reliable, and much more up-to-date.

E. E. Y. Hales, an English Catholic layman and sometime resident of the United States, specializes in his writings on nineteenth-century papal history, particularly in so far as they concern the interplay of religion and politics. *The Catholic Church and the Modern World*, deservedly acclaimed as a popular but authoritative survey from the French Revolution to the present, likewise limits itself to certain topics.²⁴ A combination of history and essay, it provides sufficient detail to appreciate the author's commentary on the policies of the Church in its social and political struggles, his analysis of the reasons underlying these policies, and his measurement of their success. His devotion to the Church is evident, but so is his critical talent and willingness to face thorny issues. Designedly, much is omitted; not, however, American affairs, which fare second only to western Europe. Spiritual matters do not fit into the scheme unless, like Modernism or Americanism, they are inextricably interwoven with temporal concerns or ecclesiastical "public relations." Within its self-imposed limits, the book is a valuable contribution to understanding some major problems facing the Church, more so those of the past century than this.

Syntheses of the Church as it operates in single countries possess a utility all their own. The view, if more constrained, can be more penetrating and lingering. Many more are needed than exist. Of the few which have been added in the recent past, Austria benefits from two excellent ones. The third volume of Tomek's history of the Church in Austria deals with the two centuries between 1679 and 1848 in a manner comparable to that of its two highly-regarded predecessors.²⁵ Josephism bulks large in its pages. Although aimed at nonspecialist clergy and laity, it is valuable for professional historians also, with ample references in the copious notes to original sources and modern literature. Before the text was completed, the author died. Hugo Hantsch, noted historian, put it into final form.

The entire history of the Church in Austria is narrated by Josef Wodka in a single tome, scholarly, well-informed, with good bibliography and maps.²⁶

²³ Fernand Mourret, S.S., *A History of the Catholic Church 8: 1823-1878*, tr. Newton Thompson (St. Louis: Herder, 1957; pp. xiv + 808).

²⁴ New York: Hanover, 1958; pp. 312.

²⁵ Ernst Tomek, *Kirchengeschichte Österreichs 3* (Innsbruck: Tyrolia, 1959; pp. 748).

²⁶ *Kirche in Österreich* (Vienna: Herder, 1959; pp. xii + 496).

The French are the most prolific of all races in the composition of ecclesiastical history on both the learned and popular levels. Seldom do they turn this talent to Church histories of France alone. Georges Goyau's single volume is four decades old; Dom Poulet's three small volumes, nearly two. Another, now in process, represents a type of history at which the French excel, high-level popularization by famed specialists. Three of them are co-operating now in a three-volume history of Catholicism in France, each confining himself to the era in which he is best qualified.²⁷ In the second volume (1180-1750) Latreille handles all the modern period. He will write all the concluding tome. His treatment is solidly established, interestingly written, thought-provoking as well as factually informative, with much attention devoted to religious life and practices. For those eager for a broad conspectus unencumbered by minutiae, footnotes, long bibliographies, or an index, this synthesis cannot be found bettered.

Canada is the subject of a religious history of all its Christian denominations which supplies a much-needed introduction, convenient, competent, readable, objective.²⁸ Its author, an Anglican and Associate Professor of Church History at McGill University, terms his effort a pioneering one. Forgoing for the most part matters pertaining to the inner life, he concentrates on the beginnings and growth of the various groups, their controversies, relations between sects and between religion and politics. The latter theme looms large in Canadian history. The prevailing attitude toward Church-State problems on the part of all Christian bodies differs markedly from that defended by so many in its neighbor immediately to the south.

SPECIAL TOPICS (1649-1789)

The Church in France

To fit the remaining topics into precise categories, it would be necessary to place them on a Procrustean bed. Nowhere would the procedure involve more stretching and severing than at this juncture. A diverse group will, therefore, be left loosely unified but intact. Three are monographs, matured through years of research, whose stature is not often equalled. Two are meritorious biographies of notable ecclesiastics, otherwise not akin.

French clergy of the seventeenth century have benefited from two top-

²⁷ A. Latreille et al., *Histoire du catholicisme en France 2: 1180-1750* (Paris: Spes, 1960; pp. 508).

²⁸ H. H. Walsh, *The Christian Church in Canada* (Toronto: Ryerson, 1956; pp. x + 356).

quality investigations. The first probes their reaction to one set of reform decrees of the Council of Trent. Doctrinal pronouncements at Trent have received so much publicity that they have somewhat obscured the fact that the Tridentine reform enactments likewise exceeded in importance those of any other ecumenical synod. Paul Broutin, S.J., has studied the introduction and expansion in France of the Tridentine reforms, but only in the pastoral realm; and there, only in a number of representative cases.²⁹ For his labors he has won universal critical acclaim as breaking new ground in a field too seldom tilled. Mention of the work here might seem out of place, since it concerns pastoral theology and is published in a series dealing with moral theology. Historians also can derive fruit because of the contents and approach. Published materials were found to suffice for almost all the needed sources. The innovation lies in the use made of them. Trent's pastoral legislation guided the organization of the book. It sought a reform of the hierarchy, clergy, and laity, mainly under episcopal lead, utilizing as prime instruments pastoral visits, diocesan and provincial synods, and institutions calculated to renew the pastoral clergy. In its three parts the two volumes turn successively to the reform bishops and their efforts; institutions; and literature of a pastoral kind. None of these sections provides an exhaustive cataloguing. Rather, they paint a series of tableaux, intended to be representative of various approaches to a common problem, not necessarily the most laudable or successful attempts. Thus Part 1, which fills almost all the first volume, holds up for perusal the outlook, methods, and accomplishments of eighteen bishops, personally heterogeneous and typical of seven different schools or currents. Part 2 scrutinizes three provincial synods, five endeavors to restore the life of canons, five tries to organize community life for priests, and, in the lengthiest and most widely interesting treatment of all, nine approaches to the perplexing question of a proper training for candidates to the priesthood in the recently-established system of seminaries. All are viewed in the light of the Tridentine norms. Part 3 inspects several pastoral books and ideas then influential. A fifty-page conclusion confesses the partial success of the Tridentine program and seeks the reason. Three basic factors emerge: (1) grave abuses connected with benefices, due in turn to the control kept over them by unreformed Catholic rulers; (2) quarrels between bishops and regulars; (3) Jansenism, whose nefarious effects tainted pastoral and moral as well as doctrinal fibers.

²⁹ *La réforme pastorale en France au XVII^e siècle* (2 vols.; Tournai: Desclée, 1956; pp. x + 372, 568).

Replete with penetrating analyses and observations, this lucidly written book is rich in object lessons. It should urge all readers to serious reflections, and some to further exploration in this area.

The General Assemblies of the French Clergy, an institution partly governmental, partly ecclesiastical, and entirely characteristic of the Old Regime, is the subject of a long, minutely detailed study, scholarly to the nth degree, based almost completely on archival sources, and presented in a clear, orderly manner.³⁰ Pierre Blet, S.J., has, according to his director, the famed historian Victor-L. Tapié, supplied one of the best doctoral dissertations accepted in recent years at the Sorbonne. Were the comparison extended to include the entire university world, the praise would not seem exaggerated. Blet begins at the point where Serbat ended.³¹ Thirteen meetings, ordinarily quinquennial, convened during this half century. Their manifold activities, along with that of the Estates-General of 1614 which appropriately and at great length introduces the material (1, 1-133), require a thousand pages of closely written narrative to summarize. Even at that, a complete history is not ventured, as the title indicates. What emerges is a very full and varied history, certainly—particularly rich in regard to what was ever the main function of the Assemblies: finance. To theologians, no doubt, the most memorable accomplishment of this clerical (but not exclusively hierarchical) body was the passage of the Four Articles in the 1682 meeting, the classic expression of Gallicanism. But the Assemblies existed principally to decide in conjunction with government agents the amount of monetary aid to be given by the Church to the public treasury, and the sources to tap for the agreed sum. These conferences were protracted, often heated. In good part this is a history of ecclesiastical finance. Amid the mass of detail an important trend reveals itself: the change in the character of clerical contributions from extraordinary levies to customary ones from a group always regarded, at least theoretically, as tax-exempt, signified by the name *don gratuit*, which was not dropped. Large as the total amounts were, they comprised, according to Blet's calculations, only a minimal percentage of the royal budget, and a modest drain on the income of the first estate.

Echoed in these Assemblies also were all the vital questions noised through the Church in France. New light is shed on these. Although composed in

³⁰ Pierre Blet, S.J., *Le clergé de France et la monarchie: Étude sur les Assemblées Générales du Clergé de 1615 à 1666* (2 vols.; Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1959; pp. xii + 534, 468). These are Vols. 106 and 107 in *Analecta Gregoriana*.

³¹ Louis Serbat, *Les Assemblées du Clergé de France: Origines, organisation, développement (1561-1615)* (Paris, 1906).

good part of members of the lower clergy, the meetings tended to become a sort of national council, ready to discuss disciplinary, even doctrinal matters. Pervading their outlook was Gallicanism. In view of these pretensions, and considering what occurred in 1682, it is understandable why Rome traditionally reacted to this peculiar organization with disquiet.

Père de la Chaize, one of the best known but enigmatic ecclesiastical figures in seventeenth-century France, has at last attracted a biographer.²² Inevitably portrayed are both life and times, for the Jesuit was prominent at the most powerful and glamorous court in Europe during the height of its power and glamor. The most famous of all royal confessors had Louis XIV as penitent for thirty-four years (1675-1709). So highly did the Sun King esteem his gifts of intellect, learning, and practical judgment, in addition to his priestly spirituality, that the ruler consulted him regularly as intimate adviser on ecclesiastical affairs during some of the most stirring decades in the modern Church. For these were years deeply involved in disputes over Jansenism, Gallicanism in its classic age, Quietism, revocation of the tolerance Edict of Nantes, the regalia, Chinese rites, and tensions between Versailles and the Vatican which verged on schism. These and similar matters fill the two volumes. That the King's confessor had an influential voice has long been taken for granted. But how influential? His own reticence and the confidential nature of his position have made him the despair of biographers. Guitton has been able to consult the letters which passed between de la Chaize and the Jesuit General at Rome; but these, his main source, remain mute on many points. The book is more a times than a life. The central character is still shrouded in obscurities, as he always has been; yet his influence, while defying exact assay, was clearly considerable. His personal qualities emerge in very favorable light, with the charges dispelled which have dogged his name. The biographer is at several points quite critical of his subject's Gallicanism; but this charge has not gone unanswered.²³

More influential in public affairs, at least those of a secular kind, and

²² Georges Guitton, S.J., *Le Père de la Chaize, confesseur de Louis XIV* (2 vols.; Paris: Beauchesne, 1958; pp. 278, 288).

²³ Pierre Blet, S.J., "Jésuites Gallicans au XVII^e siècle? A propos de l'ouvrage du P. Guitton sur le P. de la Chaize," *Archivum historicum Societatis Jesu* 29 (1960) 55-84. Blet concludes that de la Chaize seems to have admitted the first of the four Gallican Articles of 1682 concerning the absolute independence of the king in temporal matters. Blet also believes that some other Jesuits in France then, if not the majority, shared these beliefs. There is no proof, nor does Guitton claim there is, that de la Chaize adopted all four Gallican Articles. Nor is there any indication that he influenced the Assembly of the Clergy in 1682 in an anti-Roman sense.

more spectacular in its external manifestations, was the career of Cardinal de Bernis (1715-94), an enticing subject for his biographer, Sir Marcus Cheke, former British Minister to the Holy See.³⁴ De Bernis was a type of ecclesiastical politician possible under the Old Regime. Talented and highly gifted as a socialite, the noble but impoverished cleric shone in the salons, where he attracted the favor of Mme. Pompadour. Her patronage impelled his rapid rise at the royal court, where he became, among other things, Minister of Foreign Affairs and Ambassador to Venice, Madrid, and Rome. His flamboyant hospitality and personality made him so popular and influential in the latter post for years that he was called "King of Rome." In ecclesiastical history he is remembered as a key figure in the conclaves which chose Clement XIV and Pius VI, and as a leading negotiator in the dealings which preceded the suppression of the Jesuits. The study is well based, although the account of de Bernis' escapades with Casanova may be putting too much stock in the latter's famous *Memoirs*. Since the account is pleasingly composed, it is needless to add that it makes absorbing reading.

The Commission of Regulars, another famous institution of the Old Regime, has had its history greatly enriched, even renewed, by the thesis of Chevallier, which replaces Lemaire's study, regarded since 1926 as definitive.³⁵ The chief merit of these tightly packed volumes, which lack literary pretensions, is their exhaustive exploitation for the first time of the immense Collection de Brienne. Loménie de Brienne was a capable, diligent, ambitious ecclesiastic, infected with Voltairism and Gallicanism, who became Archbishop of Toulouse. During the French Revolution he adhered to the schismatical Constitutional Church. More pertinently, he was from the inauguration of the Commission of Regulars in 1766 a member and its *rapporteur*. As such, he gathered 111 folio volumes of its documents. In good part, Chevallier's work has been to digest and arrange systematically this mine of information, and to provide numerous citations from it. This procedure is utilized in the opening volume (pp. 36-258) to analyze the hundreds of responses by bishops, clergy, laity, and religious to inquiries from the Commission in 1766 concerning the condition of the religious orders (not merely monastic ones, as the title might indicate) and suggested reforms. From these well-informed witnesses the consensus is corroboratory of the traditional verdict of decadence. The author's main task, consuming the remaining space, is to trace the origin and organization by the government of the Commission meant to reform the life of religious, the relations

³⁴ *The Cardinal de Bernis* (London: Cassell, 1958; pp. xiii + 310).

³⁵ Pierre Chevallier, *Loménie de Brienne et l'ordre monastique (1766-1789)* (2 vols.; Paris: Vrin, 1959-60; pp. 392 + 288).

of this agency with Rome, and the regulatory work enforced: revising constitutions and customs, reorganizing, re-establishing, or suppressing orders. A carefully worded conclusion (2, 261-85) summarizes the findings and evaluates the Commission's activity. Admittedly, it was vitiated by a Gallican, regalian, rationalistic outlook on the religious vocation and by its usurpation of authority belonging to the Church. Unwittingly, it facilitated the aims of the leaders of the French Revolution, who obviated the further operation of the Commission (or Bureau of Regulars, as it was called at the end) by administering its own remedy for the ills besetting the orders: annihilation. A third volume, carrying the story from 1780 to 1789, will complete this valuable work.

Josephism

The age of royal absolutism was fertile in attempts to submit the Church to state overlordship. Heterodox trends supported autocratic Catholic rulers by theoretical justifications. Characteristic of the age were the errors of Gallicanism, Jansenism (which eventually allied with the former), Febronianism, and Josephism. It is the last-named, which imbibed from the others, which must monopolize attention here, due to the completion of a great monument to its memory.³⁶ Of all the works mentioned in this survey, none can compete in enduring value with the five huge tomes of Ferdinand Maas, S.J., a landmark in the ecclesiastical and intellectual history of the Enlightenment. Each volume is divided into two parts: documents and introductions. About three fourths of the pages consist of reproductions of more than 900 documents, extracted mostly from unpublished materials in the archives of Vienna. To aid consultation, there are brief synopses of each document in the Table of Contents, and indexes of persons and subjects. German is the language of about two thirds of the sources; Italian, French, or Latin, of the rest. In length, they vary from a few lines to around one hundred pages. Authors and recipients were high personages of Church or state: popes, emperors, chancellors, diplomats. Thus, most of the documents in the first two volumes were written by or to Kaunitz, Austrian chancellor, the father of this system of statism (just as Empress Maria Theresa was, unwittingly, its mother). Vol. 3 deals almost exclusively with the imperial counselor Heinke, the documents being writings of his; the Introduction (pp. 1-137) gives a valuable account of his life and work. Topically, the documents are as diverse as Josephism in practice. Several, including the longer ones, are theoretical in nature, explanations of the

³⁶ Ferdinand Maas, S.J., *Der Josephinismus: Quellen zu seiner Geschichte in Österreich, 1760-1850* (5 vols.; Vienna: Herold, 1951-61; pp. cxi + 2900).

nature of state and Church as worked out by Josephism's originators and leading practitioners, or refutations of these arguments by Rome.

Maas's introductions, which fill the other quarter of the tomes, constitute a learned history of the movement from birth to death, with continual reference to the pertinent documents, and commentary on them. Despite the recent spate of works on Josephism, evaluated by Maas, vital questions have gone unresolved, notably those regarding the parentage, the essence, and the spirit of the system. After Maas's expert explanations, these areas are much contracted. For long to come, students will have to prospect this mine before exhausting it.⁸⁷

SPECIAL TOPICS (1789-1960)

Papal History

The terminal date, 1799, of Pastor's forty volumes of papal history has left the ensuing period without a synthesis of comparable distinction. Schmidlin is sometimes spoken of as the continuator of Pastor; but his four tomes, extending from 1800 to 1939, are notable for their mass of factual data, often ill-digested. They are not in Pastor's class as examples of historiography.⁸⁸ One phase or another of recent papal history has come in for serious attention in the past few years. First must be noted the initial stages of works concerning the careers of two outstanding popes of the past century. Both of these bulky tomes are confined to prepapal years, supplying what must be the most extended attention ever given to that portion of pontifical lives which is normally of less than universal interest. Both rely heavily on original documentation. In other respects they could scarcely differ more sharply.

Pius VII is the subject of a projected five-volume set by J. Leflon, noted specialist on French ecclesiastical history of these decades.⁸⁹ Four tomes will concern the twenty-three-year pontificate (1800-23); for the first passes in review the fifty-eight years of Gregorio Chiaramonti terminated by his election at the conclave of 1800. By far this is the fullest and best-authenticated account of a period up to now ill-known. Whatever diligent research could unearth is here revealed. So many lacunae remain, however, that a narrative built on extant sources could never fill this book. Effectively, it is

⁸⁷ For a summary account by Maas on Josephism, see his article in *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche* 5 (1960) 1137-39, s.v. "Josephinismus."

⁸⁸ Josef Schmidlin, *Papstgeschichte der neuesten Zeit (1800-1939)* (4 vols.; Munich: Kösel & Pustet, 1933-39).

⁸⁹ J. Leflon, *Pie VII 1: Des abbayes bénédictines à la papauté* (Paris: Plon, 1958; pp. ii + 620).

a life and times—more of the latter than the former, perforce. As such, it is an excellent history of the ecclesiastical, civil, and intellectual milieu in which matured the Pope most famed for his later confrontation with Napoleon. While Bishop of Imola, he did receive a foretaste of what was in store for him in the see of Peter. The transalpine invasion of the French Revolution brought him into personal contact with General Bonaparte. These two themes occupy much of the present study.

Pius IX's fifty-four prepapal years fill a huge tome three times the length of the preceding.⁴⁰ Classification of it is somewhat of a problem. It cannot be called, like the preceding, a life and times, nor even a life; nor does it pretend to constitute a biography. Serafini calls it a diary, and indeed reprints extracts from the diary kept by Giovanni Mastai Ferretti. But he reprints a great deal else, about 3000 items in all. Together these pre-empt most of the pages. So many are letters by and to the later Pontiff that this might be termed a collection of correspondence, were it not that episcopal pronouncements and other writings also find a place. In importance, the writings vary widely. Many letters deal with small personal matters, spiritual counsel to unknown individuals, or pastoral problems, of limited interest save in disclosing the varied qualities of a great pope and saint. Originally, Serafini compiled these materials while preparing the cause for Pius IX's beatification. Such documents are printed; but they are not put on sale, nor made available readily outside Rome. Therefore, these might be designated unpublished sources. At any rate, it is as a source book that this book attains its stature. In this category its value is high and permanent, for all future biographers of Pius IX must consult it. Serafini does compose many pages himself, filling out the chronology, commenting on some of the documents, or threading them together lightly. His is not synthetic talent. His abundant footnotes do not reveal contact with secondary literature, or with sources other than those preserving Pius IX's written remains. A second volume is promised, extending to Pius IX's death. If it contains an index, it will be an immense help in a vast forest with all too few paths now.

For a partial synthesis of papal history, the modest-sized contribution of E. E. Y. Hales can be commended.⁴¹ Restricted chronologically to the three quarters of a century between 1769 and 1846, it is also restrained in scope, as the title *Revolution and Papacy* succinctly indicates, and as the subtitle *The Papacy and the Revolutionary Movement in Europe* more precisely

⁴⁰ Alberto Serafini, *Pio Nono 1: Le vie della Providenza (1792-1846)* (Vatican City: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 1958; pp. xxiv + 1760).

⁴¹ E. E. Y. Hales, *Revolution and Papacy, 1769-1846* (New York: Hanover House, 1960; pp. 320).

points out. Hales does not extend to the term "revolutionary" the broad significance that Latourette does; he is concerned solely with political upheavals and their relationships with the popes. As it turns out, the French Revolution and the Napoleonic era, its aftermath, a quarter-century in all, gain two thirds of the attention. This theme, along with an account of the suppression of the Jesuits, and Gregory XVI's condemnation of liberalism, practically complete the story. Of the six pontificates reviewed, the first three (1769-1823) march across all but the final thirty pages. From 1815 on, the coverage is meager. What is handled is, however, well handled; what is written is expertly composed. This is both narrative and interpretative history, in the manner of *The Catholic Church and the Modern World* noted above. Toward papal policies Hales is understanding and sympathetic, yet at times critical, particularly of Clement XIV for suppressing the Society of Jesus, and of Gregory XVI for ultraconservatism, and of all the pontiffs after the restoration of the States of the Church subsequent to the Congress of Vienna, for failure to resolve the increasingly grave problem posed by their dual sovereignty in the spiritual and temporal realms.

Relations of the popes with secular powers, one of the staples of ecclesiastical history, is the theme of five titles which follow. The first three concern Italy; the others, states centered beyond the Alps.

An incident, up to now insufficiently diagnosed, during the dying years of the Papal States receives a specialist's microscopic regard in a carefully researched monograph confined to a nine-month period (June, 1849-April, 1850).⁴² It begins with the crumbling of Mazzini's short-lived, anticlerical Roman Republic when faced with the expeditionary forces of Oudinot, and ends with the reinstatement of Pius IX in his capital after exile at Gaeta. The "myth of Pius IX," i.e., the fanciful belief that the newly-chosen "liberal" successor to the supposedly reactionary Gregory XVI would lead a crusade to rid the peninsula of Austrians, is first investigated and correctly classified. A second chapter centers on one of the Risorgimento's patron saints, Mazzini, and his Republic at Rome. But the main preoccupation is with the political and diplomatic questions concerning the involvement of the several European powers in the incident. Pius IX's success in regaining his territory leaves the author completely unenthused.⁴³

⁴² Alberto M. Ghisalbetti, *Roma da Mazzini a Pio IX: Ricerche sulla restaurazione papale del 1849-1850* (Milan: A. Giuffrè, 1958; pp. viii + 293).

⁴³ His final judgment is as follows: "Lo Stato papale, alla metà dell'Ottocento, come quello di Venezia un secolo prima, non era più che un sopravvissuto, la cui esistenza futura non dipendeva già dalle forze e possibilità interne, ma dalle circostanze e necessità che si avveravano ormai al di fuori di ogni sua iniziativa. Oggetto, non più soggetto di storia" (p. 281).

A much longer interval, yet crowded with conflicts in which the papacy was protagonist, is discussed from a quite different point of view in the different type of book by Jemolo, *Church and State in Italy, 1850-1950*.⁴⁴ There is no intent to delay on a detailed, factual narrative of complex events, although all the significant developments are briefly explained: the Risorgimento and its religious program; the fall of the papal temporal power; the decades of estrangement between the Church and consistently anticlerical governments; the tensions due to Fascism; the futile decades of efforts groping toward a solution of the Roman problem, finally settled under Mussolini, etc. Jemolo likes to pass quickly to the analysis of events in their underlying causes and significance. He is interested in fluctuating ideologies, variations in climates of opinion, rises and falls in the pulsations of anticlericalism, as reflected mainly in the expressions by public figures. Jemolo also has his own opinions, which he forthrightly, even passionately at times, defends. His judgments are worth an audience. As Professor of Ecclesiastical Law at the University of Rome, he is reputed a leading authority in this field. If he is a mature scholar, he is by no means a detached one. As Catholic and Italian patriot, he is torn two ways at once, more so by the latter ideal. His is the faith of a liberal Catholic of the Risorgimento, a type he admits is nearly extinct. This commits him to ardent belief in complete separation of Church and state, with the Church's functions relegated to the purely spiritual. Fascism, too, disturbs his liberal's soul, as his protracted account of its origins and ideology reveals. His sympathies and comprehensions lean more visibly toward the outlook and spokesmen of the liberal state than toward those of the Church. Jemolo's much-publicized treatment of this vital topic must, then, be appreciated in the light of his convictions.

Knowledge of the inner history of the immediate antecedents to the final settlement of the Roman Question receives its greatest increment to date with the publication of the private papers of the chief intermediary for the Holy See during the three years of delicate negotiations with the Italian government preceding 1929.⁴⁵ At his death in 1935, Francesco Pacelli confided them to his brother, then papal Secretary of State, later Pope

⁴⁴ A. C. Jemolo, *Church and State in Italy, 1850-1950*, tr. David Moore (Oxford: Blackwell, 1960; pp. viii + 344). In 1948 Jemolo wrote a book of 752 pages, *Chiesa e stato in Italia negli ultimi cento anni*, which saw several editions. The present book derives not from this but from a 1955 abridgment, *Chiesa e stato in Italia del Risorgimento ad oggi*, which sharply prunes the earlier section of the 1948 book and expands the chapters on the more recent decades.

⁴⁵ Francesco Pacelli, *Diario della Conciliazione con Verbali e appendice di documenti*, ed. Michele Maccarone (Vatican City: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 1959; pp. viii + 576).

Pius XII. Pope John XXIII has approved their printing. Their value rests on the extreme importance of the Lateran Pacts to the Holy See, to Italy, even to the whole world. It is augmented by the continuing inaccessibility of the archives of the Vatican and Italy (richer though these may someday prove to be). It is still further heightened by the informativeness of these records—much superior in this respect to those of Domenico Barone, the Italian negotiator, utilized in 1942 by Carlo Biggini in his *Storia inedita della Conciliazione*.

There are three parts to this edition: (a) the *Diario* of meetings between August 5, 1926 and June 7, 1929 (pp. 1–154); (b) *Verballi*, or records of Pacelli's fifteen conferences with Mussolini between January 8 and February 9, 1929, the weeks preceding the definitive agreement, concerned with the precise wording of texts (pp. 155–204); (c) Appendixes containing documents left by Pacelli, mostly consisting of successive versions preliminary to the final ones, which are also reproduced. Neither the *Diario* (a title supplied by the editor) nor the *Verballi* are to be regarded as personalized memoirs. They represent an outstanding jurist's precise, dispassionate digests, composed immediately after each session, and noting the time, place, subjects treated, conclusions reached, or other essential points. These audiences, which often lasted for hours, totaled 428, of which 127 were with Pius XI; 57 with the Pope and Cardinal Gasparri, Secretary of State; 53 with Gasparri alone; 10 with other Vatican officials; 102 with Barone; 39 with Mussolini; 40 with other high government dignitaries. Revealed, among many other things, is the exhaustive care lavished on every single phase of the settlement. Pius XI clearly controlled proceedings on the side of the Holy See, keeping in closest touch with Pacelli. His outlook throughout was governed by religious considerations, as Mussolini's was by those of a political nature.

Vatican relations with Austria during three quarters of a century are exposed in a work which is a model of original scholarship and historiography, and much needed.⁴⁶ The Hapsburg Empire was, like France, a great Catholic political power through these decades, both engaging in frequent and momentous dealings with Rome. Whereas the Paris-Rome contacts have developed a rich literature, those with Vienna have suffered from an undeveloped one. Inevitably, the popes and the Hapsburgs were drawn together. Both were conservative in an age of strident liberalism. Both were experiencing stormy days. Designedly, Austria interwove politics with religion, utilizing the latter as cement binding its hodgepodge of races, and

⁴⁶ Friedrich Engel-Janosi, *Österreich und der Vatikan, 1846–1918* (2 vols.; Vienna: Styria, 1958–1960; pp. xxiv + 324, xxiv + 420).

as a bulwark against the disruptive forces of nationalism. She also used her plentiful opportunities to delve into religious and political affairs at Rome. Much space is, therefore, devoted in these pages to her role in papal elections, and to her fluctuating attitude to the Roman Question, which can now for the first time be followed in detail. A multitude of other questions, major and minor, is handled objectively and masterfully. The narrative is lucid and interesting, with a flair for seizing on the numerous dramatic incidents, and with good portraits of the leading actors. The whole story is well integrated with European history in its larger aspects.

Engel-Janosi, professor now at Vienna but for years at Catholic University in Washington, has assimilated the pertinent literature, and he spent eight years exploring for sources, mainly at Vienna. It is to be remembered that he did not have access to the Vatican Archives; so he had to be content with sources that were not merely incomplete but one-sided. As he admits, his answers cannot always be regarded as definitive; nor are answers to all questions even attempted. Interest is restricted to the political and diplomatic aspects of problems; it does not extend to matters of the inner life agitated in Austria or Rome. Within the range of its predetermined focus, the picture of Rome as a factor in Austria, and vice versa, emerges large and clear. To the beholder, the equally-clear afterimage is that of recurrent frictions and mutual suspicions. The two powers did not always see eye to eye in their approach to common concerns. Nor is there evidence that Austria enjoyed special favor at the Vatican.

Vatican relations with Spanish America in the epoch of Bolivar, 1800-1835, when the Latin republics were emancipating themselves from Catholic Spain, were of crucial importance. They have been treated with the profound and original scholarship expected of Pedro de Leturia, S.J.⁴⁷ Since the varied writings now gathered together were composed in the course of three decades preceding Leturia's death in 1955, mention here can only be in passing. These articles and collections of documents first saw print, for the most part, in widely-scattered periodicals. Fortunately, their permanent value as products of a lifetime of research has been recognized and made conveniently available. This is something more than a reprint. The texts remain Leturia's. But the editors have dropped out portions, particularly

⁴⁷ Pedro de Leturia, S.J., *Relaciones entre la Santa Sede e Hispanoamérica, 1483-1835* 2: *Epoca de Bolívar, 1800-1835*, revisado por el P. C. Sáenz de Santa Maria, S.J.; 3: *Apéndices, Documentos, Índices*, revisado bajo la dirección del P. Batllori, S.J. (Rome: Gregorian Univ., 1959-60; pp. xxiv + 414, xvi + 608). Volume 1, *Epoca del Real Patronato, 1493-1800* (1959; pp. lxxii + 520), concerns the period anterior to that of this survey. The three form Vols. 101-3 of *Analecta Gregoriana*.

of earlier contributions, because supplanted by later studies. They have also done a certain amount of rearranging of materials, besides adding notes and bringing the bibliographies up to date. The unifying theme in all three volumes is the Spanish *real patronato*, the chief object, along with the life of St. Ignatius of Loyola, of the researches of the former Dean of the Faculty of Ecclesiastical History at the Gregorian University in Rome. The government of Venezuela, by acting as patron to this edition, publicizes its esteem for studies regarded as classics in the ecclesiastical history of Spanish America.

Social Catholicism

With all its blessings, the Industrial Revolution created a mammoth social problem for civil and religious society. In its present form this problem dates from the past century, when industry began its tremendous expansion. With the rise of factories came an unparalleled growth of cities populated in great part by poorly-paid, poorly-educated, poorly-housed workers herded into sprawling slums. Their moral wretchedness was worse than their physical one, bad as this was. They drifted in huge numbers from the Church, considered as indifferent to their spiritual and material needs, and friendly to their greedy oppressors. Dechristianization was a major phenomenon—"the great scandal of the nineteenth century," Pius XI called it.

Despite the attention devoted to the social question in all its aspects, it is only recently that scholarly research has turned to the historical development of the Catholic efforts to solve it. Most of the multitudinous writings have been popular, or, if scientific, limited in range. France, Belgium, and Italy have in the past few years benefited from three extremely detailed products of long, careful, original investigations. Each covers a wide area and an extended period. Each demands notice here.

Social action by French Catholics between 1871 and 1914 has been exhaustively treated by Henri Rollet.⁴⁸ This work should be studied in conjunction with that of Duroselle, who traced the beginnings of this movement during the decades immediately preceding, 1822-70—and did so with a thoroughness, competence, and clarity that has deserved the widespread acclaim accorded by the scholarly world.⁴⁹ As a synthesis, it is superior to its successor. Rollet is a Catholic industrialist who won his doctorate with his first volume. His professional demands, and his tasks involved in

⁴⁸ Henri Rollet, *L'Action sociale des catholiques en France, 1871-1914* (2 vols.; Paris: Boivin [Vol. 1]; Desclée De Brouwer [Vol. 2], 1948, 1958; pp. 725, 404).

⁴⁹ J-B. Duroselle, *Les débuts du catholicisme social en France, 1822-1870* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1951; pp. xii + 788).

his leadership of Catholic Action, may well account for the long delay in the appearance of the second.

In his endeavor to describe all the efforts by high-minded Catholics to improve the material, intellectual, and spiritual lot of the proletariat, he has catalogued minutely every organization, every activity of every organization, every person and idea at all prominent from the date of the establishment in 1871 of the first notable group, the *Oeuvre des cercles*, down to the start of World War I.

Thirty years of labor, pursued in the first volume, admittedly resulted in meager gains, not at all in proportion to the energy, good will, and talent expended. Economic liberalism still guided the capitalists. Catholic social reforms had not found place on the statute books. Most Catholics, lay and ecclesiastic, remained indifferent or hostile to Social Catholicism. Worse, this attitude was even more marked in the working class, less imbued with Catholicism than ever before.

Rollet's analysis of the reasons for this limited attainment is the most interesting feature of the volume. External forces, not fully appreciated, blocked any rapid progress, however unified or well-directed the effort. But the Social Catholics were divided among themselves; their tactics, activities, and objectives were open to criticism. If the conservatives among them, who held control of the movement, were more attractive to the mass of Catholics, they could not be less so to the proletariat because of their paternalistic, extreme-right-wing, monarchical outlook, which branded them as reactionaries and enemies of democracy. On the other hand, the Christian Democrats, more appealing to workers, lacked leadership, practical experience, knowledge of affairs; they mixed too much in politics and antagonized too many of their coreligionists (who regarded them as socialists). At the close of the last century Social Catholicism was at a low ebb.

In the present century up to 1914, some advances were made. It was a time of transition. New organizations arose, better guided, better supported by hierarchy and priests. Younger, more militant members joined. More study was spent on problems. Questions were seen more in the light of social justice, less in that of private charity. Yet, the program still lacked sufficient awareness of practical realities. Nor had deep roots been sunk into the masses. Wide popular appeal lay in the future.

Belgian Social Catholicism has been expertly synthesized from 1842, its origin, to 1909, by which time it had acquired all its present essential characteristics.⁶⁰ Written as a doctoral dissertation, the book is clear, well

⁶⁰ Rudolf Rezsöhazi, *Origines et formation du catholicisme social en Belgique, 1842-1909* (Louvain: Bibliothèque de l'Université, 1958; pp. xxxiv + 432).

organized, sound in judgment, based on extensive research—the best account available of this important topic. The Industrial Revolution entered Belgium earlier than France, and created similar problems. To meet them, a zealous minority of social-minded Catholics soon became discernible amid their conservative environment. Historical developments differed somewhat from France. Catholics were better disposed to their liberal state constitution. Social Catholics enjoyed more political influence. Indeed, the book might also be regarded as a history of Christian Democracy (a term which is not clearly differentiated, at least in practice, from that in the title; but this is observable in other works, also in their application of allied terms).

The principal organization for “intransigent” Italian Catholics in their social (and other) activities was, during its life span from 1874 to 1904, the *Opera dei Congressi*.⁵¹ It provides material for an extremely long and detailed doctoral dissertation from the Gregorian University, Rome. Despite its length, the story is limited to the origins, organization, internal development, and labors of the second section of the *Opera*, devoted to charitable, social, and economic works. An enormous amount of preparation went into the study of these topics, as is indicated by the bibliography of sources consulted, especially the archives at Venice of the *Opera* (pp. 559–84), and of printed literature (pp. 585–92). A great deal of the information is assembled in forty-seven statistical tables (pp. 611–741). The narrative section, also rich in new findings, is marred by prolixity and repetitiousness, and a tendency to scatter observations on a single point over widely separated pages. Like many another author of a dissertation, Gambasin is reluctant to commit himself to judgments, leaving this task to the reader. Italian Catholics loyal to the Holy See, the “intransigents” who belonged to the *Opera*, isolated themselves from the main stream of political life. This, and the author’s self-set limits on his scope, distinguish the book from the wider outlook observable in the two works previously discussed. But the contents are so full of previously unpublished material that they constitute a work of fundamental importance in an area increasing in interest.

Christian Democracy in Western Europe, 1820–1953 takes up a topic akin to Social Catholicism and provides therewith a much-needed synthesis, the best in English.⁵² Not only is the history of the movement narrated; its programs, too, are masterfully presented, and its past services and future

⁵¹ Angelo Gambasin, *Il movimento sociale nell'Opera dei Congressi, 1874–1904* (Rome: Gregorian Univ., 1958; pp. xx + 744).

⁵² Michael P. Fogarty, *Christian Democracy in Western Europe, 1820–1953* (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1957; pp. xviii + 461).

prospects estimated. Prof. Fogarty, a Catholic economist, active in this work, modestly refers to his effort as a pioneering one; but critics have hailed it as authoritative, if not definitive. Christian Democracy is a lay movement, and not specifically Catholic, although Catholics have been more prominent in it than Protestants. Since the past World War, its political activities have been more in the public eye; but its social program, based on the principles of the gospel, is basic to it.

HISTORY OF THE MISSIONS

Mission territories are very well served with special bibliographical tools, two in particular, which catalogue almost unfailingly every pertinent item which has ever appeared, be it source material or otherwise, up to the moment. Would that all the ecclesiastical sciences were as adequately furnished! Incomparably the most important and complete bibliography is found in the huge, inexhaustible tomes, twenty-two to date, compiled by Streit and Dindinger, and their successors, which have been appearing at intervals for nearly a half century.⁵³ After Vol. 11 came out in 1939, the next one, Vol. 15, was not printed until 1952. By 1955, Vols. 1-21 were finished, save for Vols. 12-14, dealing with China. The manuscripts of these tomes were casualties of World War II, so much so that the immense labor had to be recommenced from zero. This patient effort is now approaching completion. Between 1958 and 1960, Vols. 12 and 13, and two of the three bulky Parts of Vol. 14, saw print, detailing the mission literature on China which has been composed since 1800.⁵⁴ The last part is expected without undue delay. The practice is to dedicate individual volumes to definite areas: e.g., the Americas (1493-1909) in Vols. 2 and 3; Africa (1053-1940) in Vols. 15-20; Australia and Oceania (1525-1950) in Vol. 21. The dates in the titles refer to the years in which the literature appeared, not to the historical period covered. Within each volume, sources, books, and articles (very important and numerous in this subject) are listed, along with accurate and full information for each entry: author, time and place of publication, editions, translations, contents, and, when available, writings about author or publication. The indexes are lengthy (nearly 100 pages out of 811 in Vol. 14,

⁵³ R. Streit, O.M.I., and J. Dindinger, O.M.I., continued by J. Rommerskirchen, O.M.I.' and N. Kowalsky, O.M.I., *Bibliotheca missionum* (Vols. 1-21, in 22 volumes; Freiburg: Herder, 1916-60).

⁵⁴ Vol. 12: *Chinesische Missionsliteratur, 1800-1884* (1958; pp. 745); Vol. 13: *Chinesische Missionsliteratur, 1885-1909* (1959; pp. 807); Vol. 14, Part 1: *Chinesische Missionsliteratur, 1910-1950* (1959; pp. 811); Vol. 14, Part 2: *Chinesische Missionsliteratur, 1910-1950* (1960; pp. 640). The literature of 1700-1799 appeared in Vol. 7 (1931). Vols. 4 and 5 (1928-29) contain the literature for all Asia (1245-1699).

Part 1). Topically, history is but one of many subjects. All branches of missiology receive their due, as is true of the following title.

To keep up-to-date, it is necessary to supplement Streit-Dindinger with the equally-complete *Bibliografia missionaria*, whose modest-sized volumes have been printed annually in Italian since 1935.⁵⁵ There are several divisions according to subject, mission history being one. Every fourth volume brings together subjects and authors of the previous four years in a practical index.⁵⁶

No title in the *Bibliografia missionaria* between 1956 and 1960 more insistently demands notice than the monumental *Histoire universelle des missions catholiques*, spanning nineteen centuries and global in scope.⁵⁷ Under the direction of Msgr. Delacroix, a number of specialists have co-operated to produce a popular account high in the quality of its content and presentation, and truly remarkable for its artistic, well-chosen illustrations (thirty color plates; over 250 plates in black and white apart from the text; and many more in connection with it), and for its ninety excellent plans and maps (above all, for its seventeen colored maps). It is outside the purview of this survey to dwell on the final volume, expanding as it does over a multitude of current missiological problems; nor on the first tome, a history of mission centuries prior to the seventeenth—save to observe that thirty pages seems scant for the mission activity of the ancient Church, and less than a hundred more for that of the medieval centuries through the twelfth. In contrast, the second and third volumes, the labor of seventeen collaborators, linger for some eight hundred pages on the past three centuries. If they vary markedly in excellence, the average is lofty.

In comparison with Latourette's seven recent volumes on the same subject and on a wider scale (since they encompass also Protestant and Ortho-

⁵⁵ G. Rommerskirchen, O.M.I., et al., *Bibliografia missionaria* (Rome: Pontificia Biblioteca de Propaganda Fide, 1935 ff., annually).

⁵⁶ Livinus Vriens, O.F.M.Cap., *Critical Bibliography of Missiology*, tr. from the Dutch by Deodatus Tummers (Nijmegen: Bestelcentrale der V.S.K.B., 1960; pp. 127), can be commended as fulfilling its intended aim of supplying seminarians and seminary librarians with a basic, practical, up-to-date list of books (not articles) by Catholics. Several divisions range over the territory of missiology. The important books on mission history are noted; also the better periodicals, and fuller bibliographies. Appended comments about the contents and value of the entries should be most useful. This is the second in a projected sixteen-volume series, *Bibliographia ad usum seminariorum*. Each volume will appear simultaneously in Dutch, German, French, and English.

⁵⁷ *Histoire universelle des missions catholiques*, published under the direction of S. Delacroix (4 vols.; Paris: Grund, 1956-59; pp. 366, 422, 446, 414).

dox missions), those of Delacroix stand up well.⁵⁸ Particularly is this true of the latter's second volume, dealing with the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. The treatment is longer than Latourette's, and better. Its expert management of this period is the more welcome in that this mission era is less widely understood, although strewn with conflicts gravely harmful to the spread of the gospel: disputes over Chinese and Malabar rites; bitterness and violence due to Spanish claims of *patronato* and Portuguese ones of *padroado*; nationalistic rivalries between Catholic nations, involving even religious orders. In a telling such as this, the object lessons are beneficial, if the story is often depressing. Latourette's four volumes on the nineteenth century, to him the "Great Century," and the present one, outdo the French text; but the English one is largely devoted to Protestant endeavors. Its factual detail is richer, its bibliographies, especially for English titles, more extensive. In general, both tread the same ground calmly and perceptively. Both analyze causes for successes and failures; both are alive to the interaction of Christianity and civilization. But for attention to Catholic mission methods, the inner life of the missions, and relations with Rome, the more recent production is preferable. With their somewhat different equipage and vistas, the two supplement one another admirably and brighten thereby a vast expanse.

Within the confines of a single volume, Msgr. Mulders, veteran Professor of Missiology at the University of Nijmegen, compresses a complete history of Catholic missions in clear, orderly, serene, competent fashion.⁵⁹ His excellent introduction to the subject will, no doubt, receive more notice when the Dutch original, already turned into German, appears also in English, as is expected shortly.

South Africa is the single mission territory which requires a notice all its own.⁶⁰ In the choice of its historian it could scarcely have been more fortunate. Fr. Brown was an Oxford-trained English historian, professor, and writer. After his conversion, he studied for the priesthood, won a doctorate in theology, and taught ecclesiastical history. War injuries sent him to South Africa for health reasons. There the hierarchy wisely directed his talents into historical research for the next eleven years until his death in 1957. Michael Derrick, editor of the *Dublin* (now *Wiseman*) *Review*, and assistant

⁵⁸ Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of the Expansion of Christianity* (7 vols.; New York: Harper, 1937-45).

⁵⁹ A. Mulders, *Missiegeschiedenis* (Bussum: Paul Brand, 1957; pp. xxvi + 565).

⁶⁰ Wm. E. Brown, *The Catholic Church in South Africa* (London: Burns & Oates, 1960; pp. xiv + 384).

editor of the London *Tablet*, gave the manuscript final form and added brief synopses of the period preceding 1837 and succeeding 1922. The intervening eighty-five complex, often stormy years between the naming of the first vicar apostolic and the appointment of the first apostolic delegate fill all but thirty-two of the pages and constitute Brown's contribution. It is so solidly based, so well arranged, so lucidly and objectively composed that it might be proposed as a model for this genre. Thus, the last work in this survey is by no means the least.

Weston College

JOHN F. BRODERICK, S.J.