

Africa, and Latin America (12). While relatively small in its initial phases, Pentecostalism has undergone major growth with the charismatic renewal movement in mainstream churches in the 1960s and 1970s, with many of those involved moving into more traditional Pentecostal churches after experiencing rejection within their own denominations. That rapid growth has exacerbated many of the tensions within the movement as small congregational communities developed more institutionalized structures. One impact of institutionalization has been a growing marginalization of women in ministry within the movement.

Of increasing significance is the growing body of Pentecostals engaged in theological education, raising the level of intellectual achievement and deepening the resources of the movement. This is likely to be transformational in the coming decades as Pentecostal theologians struggle to express the unique charism that the movement offers to the larger church. Nonetheless the fundamental orientation of the movement is strongly practical rather than theoretical, driven more by pragmatics than by theological analysis. V. argues that this tension, spelled out in the last chapter, will shape the movement's future.

What is most remarkable across all this complexity and diversity is the mutual recognition to be found across all the distinctive elements. While members may disagree on various aspects of belief, including key doctrines such as the Trinity, they all recognize one another as of the same "family" with a common grounding experience in what they call "baptism of the Holy Spirit." This founding experience allows members to transcend all other differences in a movement not so much bound by a common cognitive meaning as by a shared constitutive and effective meaning. In this they may offer a model for ecumenical relations for churches more broadly.

I would recommend this work for anyone wanting to get an intelligent handle on the diversity and complexity of the Pentecostal phenomenon. V. has done a service both to the Pentecostal community in putting its best foot forward, and to the wider theological community in giving his readers a sympathetic insight into its operation.

Neil Ormerod
Australian Catholic University, Sydney

The Holy Spirit—In Biblical Teaching, through the Centuries and Today. By Anthony C. Thiselton. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2013. Pp. xiii + 565. \$46.

Thiselton's work is an interesting contribution to this expanding field. As the title of the book indicates, T. seeks to combine various vast fields of biblical theology and scholarship, historical and contemporary thought. He provides useful systematic organization of complex issues and materials as well as helpful summaries of theologians, indicating major advances and questions around their approaches to the person, experience, and effects of the Holy Spirit. This approach has important strengths as well as dangers.

One strength is a helpful attempt to deal systematically with a variety of periods and approaches in a systematic way. This has the advantage of an intelligent “tour d’horizon” and allows us to appreciate the concerns of each age and thinker. It makes the point that the Spirit, though challenging and elusive in terms of our abilities to conceptualize, is nevertheless a constant and central theme of Christian thought and life. Another strength is how T.’s approach allows us to appreciate the continual discourse(s) about the Spirit that are at the heart of Christian life. Though these can often be problematic, they can also be generative, and it is useful to have a work that allows us to grasp both of these aspects from the beginning to the present. A third strength is T.’s serious engagement with the Pentecostal and Renewal theologians. His treatment is generous and irenic. Indeed, there is a sense, especially in the final sections of the book, that fostering a theological dialogue with Pentecostal theologians is one of T.’s main concerns; surely his instinct here is correct. Without overburdening the reader, in each area T. shows himself to be aware of the main developments of contemporary scholarship and the questions they raise.

The final section and the issues it identifies would be a useful place to start for structuring a course or seminar on Pneumatology; most helpful are the hermeneutical questions T. identifies and his clarity about the trinitarian structure of a theology of the Holy Spirit as well as his discussion of “experience.”

For students, T.’s survey of important theologians will be a useful guide but needs to be treated with caution. Inevitably, in trying to cover such a wide field T. risks superficiality and the danger of presenting what is essentially a résumé of some standard texts as the substance of a theologian’s thought. For example, can three pages on Aquinas and five on Augustine do these doctors justice? Even with the most succinct of writers, unless one is able to understand the deep extensive connections of Pneumatology with other areas of their thought—anthropology, ecclesiology, sacraments, grace, and history—the treatment is in danger of impoverishing rather than enriching understanding. With Aquinas, for example, while it is certainly important to identify his subtle development of Augustine’s teaching on the Trinity (*Summa theologiae* 1, qq. 27–43), it would be misleading to think that this represents Aquinas on the Holy Spirit. Reflection on the Holy Spirit is profoundly interwoven throughout his work, and once the systematic ground has been laid in the early questions of the *Summa*, it deepens and expands in his treatment of the mystery of “indwelling” and the New Law, which is the grace of the Holy Spirit. It ends the *prima secundae* and prepares us for the whole theological anthropology of the *secunda secundae*. Likewise, any treatment of Aquinas’s theology of the Holy Spirit cannot be complete without recognizing the depth of its engagement and foundation in Scripture. Unfortunately, T., in confining himself largely to the first part of the *Summa*, misses the richness and depth of Thomas’s teaching and does not seem aware of how Aquinas’s teaching—among that of other theologians—can be seen bearing new and remarkable fruit in the Pneumatology of Vatican II, another major area that T. overlooks. Vatican II’s Pneumatology would surely be a fascinating point of engagement with Pentecostal thinkers and uncover the deeper pneumatological ground of contemporary Catholic thought and ecclesiology.

Although T. does survey a few key Catholic and Orthodox thinkers, his treatment leaves a sense that his real interest is in the Protestant tradition. It is unfortunate that there is no recognition of Heribert Mühlen's *Der Heilige Geist als Person* (1980), and his understanding of "Wir" or "we-relation" that is so influential in the great Catholic theologians of the last century such as Yves Congar and Hans Urs von Balthasar. This absence is all the more noticeable because the relational nature of the Spirit is something T. himself seeks to emphasize. Likewise, it seems strange that T. should not discuss Sergius Bulgakov—mentioned only in passing—and his profound theology of the kenosis of the Spirit, such a rich source for major theologians of the Western church. In their different ways Mühlen and Bulgakov develop a dynamic, philosophically sophisticated Pneumatology that informs and shapes their ecclesiologies. It would have been interesting if T. had given more space to engage with them.

However, any work of such comprehensive ambitions risks leaving itself open to criticism about what it does and does not include. Even so, we must be grateful to T. for taking this risk. Whatever reservations one may have, they should not detract from T.'s achievement and its contribution to the theology of the Holy Spirit. There is much in this study to stimulate discussion, thought, and research. T.'s approach is itself an important example of the hermeneutics of patience and generosity that have often been lacking in the long history of theology's attempt to explore and respond to the reality of the Holy Spirit in Christian life.

James Hanvey, S.J.
Campion Hall, Oxford, UK

Wake Up, Lazarus! Volume 2, Paths to Catholic Renewal. By Pierre Hégy. Bloomington, IN: iUniverse, 2013. Pp. xii + 418. \$27.95.

"And now for something completely different. . . ." This Monty Python tagline aptly introduces this work by Hégy, a work that could well be called an essay in liturgical sociology. H., professor emeritus of sociology at Adelphi University, uses the tools of his profession—primarily observation, interviews, and statistical analysis—to understand what is going on and what is not going on in Catholic worship. The approach is refreshingly different from any other book on liturgy, and it offers a number of novel insights.

Volume 2 is a worthy sequel to volume 1, subtitled *On Catholic Renewal*, which could be called an essay in ecclesial sociology, and which analyzes the decline in church membership since the Second Vatican Council. In both books, H. compares Catholic and Protestant churches to reveal both general trends and uniquely Catholic issues. In volume 2, he bases many of his findings on 100 Sunday worship services and 100 homilies in the United States and Guatemala, which he recorded and on which he took notes. Fluent in Spanish, H. takes the Guatemalan data as indicative (but not necessarily representative) of Latin American worship and preaching.