

## BOOK REVIEWS

SUBMISSION IN SUFFERING AND OTHER ESSAYS ON EASTERN THOUGHT. By H. H. Rowley, D.D., F.B.A. Cardiff: University of Wales, 1951. Pp. ix + 170. 12s 6d.

The principal objective of Dr. Rowley's revision of his three monographs on Eastern thought, preponderantly Chinese, is to exemplify the techniques of a comparative method and to introduce a limited public to the relevant materials in the principal Asiatic religions concerning real or apparent "innocent suffering," together with the response to such suffering inculcated by these several religious systems. This comparative method consists primarily of comparisons between sages within a definite culture and between such sages and critical commentators; only secondarily, and in a very general way, is a comparison made between ideas and values of an Eastern culture and corresponding ideas and values in historical Christianity. Within such a limited framework these announced objectives are approximated with a scholarly detachment and with a sufficient familiarity with representative source materials.

Pursuant to these limited objectives the author introduces well-documented quotations from the Bible, from the writings of ancient Chinese ethico-culturalists, from Indian classics, from Buddhism, from Confucianism, and from Islamic sources. Interspersed among these texts are critical observations and strictures by authorities commenting upon the diverse interpretations of the meaning and significance of "innocent suffering." After much detached exposition of a variety of viewpoints the author tends to favor what he considers the best Christian attitude: "it [suffering] can be met in a spirit of consecration that converts pain into a channel of service, either service in itself, or service in the creation of a new fineness of character that shall be serviceable to God here or hereafter" (p. 73).

In his second essay, "The Chinese Sages and the Golden Rule," Dr. Rowley continues to employ his comparative method by interspersing texts from Confucius, Lao-tzu, Mencius, and Mo-tzu with critical observations by well-known commentators on the doctrines of these sages. While not really analyzing or developing the full implications of the Golden Rule as taught by Christ, the author concludes that the basis of that Rule, despite occasional verbal similarities, is infinitely superior to that of all Chinese sages, even that of Mo-tzu, the philosopher of love.

By far the best of the three essays is Dr. Rowley's critical yet sympathetic evaluation of the doctrine of universal love of "the Chinese philosopher Mo Ti." (Mo Ti and Mo-tzu are one and the same person.) Though only thirty-

two pages long, nearly half the text of this essay is taken up with footnotes referring to the most competent scholars who have rescued Mo Ti from oblivion. Having been impressed during the early thirties in China by the content of Mo Ti's philosophy and spirituality as one of the most promising bases upon which to effect a rapprochement between Chinese classical thought and Christianity, this reviewer welcomes the current contribution of Dr. Rowley to the study of Mo Ti. If the author would see fit to employ further his scholarly acumen and his gift of mediation so as to present a more expanded work and a more detailed development of Mo Ti's principles, he would be doing a great service toward that mutual international understanding so important for the unity, not the unification, of human society.

Viewed as a whole, *Submission in Suffering* obviously lacks an intrinsic unity and does not contain any clear indication of the author's philosophy and theology other than the notions of service and brotherhood. Even the self-imposed limitation of treatment to "submission to innocent suffering" would have more appeal if the problem of evil were philosophically outlined and a more positive and complete theology of the Cross offered.

*University of San Francisco*

JOHN J. O'FARRELL, S.J.

A FOREWORD TO THE OLD TESTAMENT: An Essay of Elementary Introduction. By H. St. J. Hart. New York: Oxford University Press, 1951. Pp. xv + 184. \$2.75.

This book is a revision of a pamphlet prepared in 1941-42 for the use of ordination candidates in H. M. Forces who might have unexpected opportunities for continuing their studies by correspondence. It is now hoped that the volume will also be of use to teachers who suddenly find themselves teaching Old Testament subjects and to the general reader. In the preface the author informs us that he follows the critical position of Wellhausen, S. R. Driver, and Lods, which he does not think old-fashioned or outworn. Wellhausen and Lods seem to have been relied upon most heavily.

The book is of uneven quality. In content and readability the last four chapters are superior to the first four; all eight, while containing much that is valuable, must be read with a certain caution. The assertion (p. 3) that the writers of the *OT* took slavery and human sacrifice for granted might be misleading because Prof. Hart fails to point out that the slavery which the Hebrews approved was a much more humane institution than that which we associate with the term, such as that practiced in Jamaica in the 18th century. While it is true that the Israelites of the early period through their association with the Canaanites were familiar with human sacrifice, it is going much too far to infer that it was taken for granted by the authors of

the *OT*, most of whom Hart places in a relatively late period of Israelite history. Mesha's sacrifice of his oldest son on the wall (*ca.* 850 B.C.) was considered a horrible deed by the Israelites, who were completely demoralized by the act. The writer takes a very pessimistic view of the historical books of the Bible which were produced before the Assyrian period, because in reading them you often cannot be sure that you hear the authentic accents of these ages at all. Such an opinion overlooks the archaeological finds of the past half-century which assure us that the early historical books of the Bible ring much more authentic than orthodox Wellhausenists will allow.

In the preface the author warns the reader that there are few statements in his work which cannot be challenged; this is particularly true of chapter 4, where some features of the unreformed religion are discussed. In this matter Hart follows Lods quite closely. He is of the conviction that before Amos and Hosea the men of Israel and Judah who were not polytheists were monolaters; these prophets led Israel from polytheism at the worst, and at the best from narrow and ferocious monolatry, to ethical monotheism (pp. 40, 78). Before the Age of Conflict Yahweh was territorially limited in His power. At the same time the writer admits that both Amos and Hosea assume that Yahweh has been the national God of Israel for a very long time; so it is quite difficult to see why Hart should attribute prerogatives to these prophets of which they themselves were not at all conscious. The prophetic movement was a religious and social reformation and not primarily a creative movement. It is true that Canaanite Baal-worship had made considerable inroads into Israel, especially in the period of the divided monarchy, but Yahweh was not diminished in stature on that account, because the Canaanite Baals were high gods in their own right. Nor is there any evidence for territorial henotheism in Israel, or for that matter among the Canaanites, since Baal was never considered less than cosmic in scope. The assertion that the cult of the dead was maintained in all probability in every Hebrew household at some periods (p. 64) is as gratuitous as it is obscure.

The chapter on the prophets contains a number of very interesting observations. Here we can only point out that Hart's lengthy discussion of the etymology of the word "prophet" as primarily signifying "spokesman" needs to be brought up to date. The proposal of Albright (1940) that "prophet" primarily meant "one called (by God)" seems preferable and is now being accepted by scholars. The exegesis of Jer. 7:21-23 (p. 78) is not as certain as the writer would have us believe. H. H. Rowley's arguments have convinced the reviewer that Jeremiah's apparent condemnation of all sacrifice is not as absolute as it appears *prima facie* (*Bull. of John Rylands Lib.*, Feb., 1946). It is difficult to understand why Hart refuses to accept the

later date for Hammurabi to which he refers in a footnote; the only dispute between scholars now is whether Hammurabi began to rule in 1792 or in 1728. A date in the 21st century is simply out of the question.

The printing is well done and misprints are rare. We might call attention to a slip on p. 15 where it is said that Mt. Lebanon is 6,070 feet above the Mediterranean; actually it is about 10,400 feet high. On p. 45 "passage" is misspelled and on p. 92 a disconcerting "not" has intruded into the quotation from Malachi.

In a postscript Prof. Hart gives some advice which a beginner would do well to follow: read the Old Testament itself and, when the fascinations of novelty have ceased, attempt exactness and read the commentators.

*Weston College*

MITCHELL DAHOOD, S.J.

DAS BUCH HIÖB. Translation and commentary by Artur Weiser. Das Alte Testament deutsch (ed. V. Herntrich and A. Weiser), XIII. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1951. Pp. 268.

DIE PSALMEN, II: PSALM. 61-150. Translation and commentary by Artur Weiser. Das Alte Testament deutsch, XV. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1950. Pp. 280.

These are two more volumes in the Old Testament series of the Göttinger Bibelwerk, bringing to seven (out of twenty-five) the number published in the first three years of the programme. Both are the work of Dr. Weiser, one of the editors of the series, and are good specimens of his moderate views and sound scholarship.

The Book of Job is a particularly attractive subject for a theological commentary; Dr. Weiser's work has been done *con amore*, and is no doubt the fruit of long reflection. In accordance with the character of *ATD*, which is designed mainly for those engaged in the (Protestant) pastoral ministry, he discusses only briefly textual and literary questions, concentrating chiefly on the exegesis. At the same time, the treatment of the text by a scholar of his standing cannot but be of interest to fellow exegetes.

First, on the integrity of the book. While recognizing the antiquity of the figure of Job in Hebrew legend, and that the folktale is drawn by the author from tradition, Weiser firmly holds that prologue and epilogue, in their present literary dress, are from the same hand as the poetic dialogue, and therefore essential parts of the complete book. This conclusion is of considerable importance for the interpreter; for example, it automatically rules out any such interpretation of the poetic sections as was recently offered by W. B. Stevenson in the Schweich Lectures for 1943 (published 1947). The poem on the search for wisdom (c. 28) is held to be "eine spätere Ergänzung,"

but Weiser does not say whether this supplement was added by the author himself or another. The Elihu speeches alone are definitely ascribed to a later writer. The second speech of Yahweh (40:6—41:26), in spite of its difference from the first, is also presented as an integral part of the author's plan; on this point Weiser has abandoned the position he favored in the first edition of his *Einleitung in das Alte Testament* (1939), p. 240. His reasons for now maintaining its authenticity are doctrinal rather than stylistic: the descriptions of Behemoth and Leviathan are meant to recall the primeval monsters, or powers of chaos, crushed by Yahweh on the day of creation—but they are also His creatures, which He cherishes and loves. Here is illustrated the incomprehensible mystery of the divine creative activity, which extends to the ordering of human life, and so to Job's fate. Thus Weiser's criticism may be called "conservative" in the etymological sense of the word, and his sane respect for the data of tradition deserves hearty approval.

The same attitude appears at another point. After some shrewd remarks (p. 185) on the importance of first trying to save the existent text before launching into speculative reconstruction, he renounces any attempt to rearrange cc. 24–27, taking the text as it stands and regarding Bildad's few lines and Sophar's complete silence in the third speech cycle as an effect intended by the author. This was also the view of Budde and Peters, though few others have followed them. The difficulty in the case is not the absence of two speeches, but the repeated introductions to a single one, and the apparent incongruity of 24:18–24, and still more 27:13–23, in the mouth of Job. Weiser's exegesis here is probably as good as can be offered, though the reviewer must admit to remaining unconvinced.

For the text, naturally, Weiser limits himself to a minimum of emendation and transposition. The translation (as far as a non-German may judge) is admirably done, and conveys a very fair idea of the pathos and passion of the original. Without strict metre, Weiser has given his lines a marked iambic rhythm, which produces the effect of irregular blank verse; e.g., 16:18 ff.: "O Erde, deck' mein Blut nicht zu;/mein Schreien finde keine Ruhstatt!/Auch jetzt noch, seht, im Himmel ist mein Zeuge,/mein Bürge in den Himmelshöhn!/Es spotten zwar die Freunde über mich;/doch tränend blickt mein Aug' zu Gott empör. . . ."

The importance ascribed by Weiser to the Israelite cult, as the setting, or *Sitz im Leben*, of a great part of OT literature, appears as prominently as ever in his commentary on Job. It is surprising how many elements of the *Bundeskulttradition* (as reconstructed, one must add, by himself and other German scholars) he uncovers in this work of wisdom literature, where one

would hardly look for such a background: e.g., the dispute at law, to be settled by a divine oracle, the oath of innocence included in a *Klagepsalm*, the theophany for the vindication of justice, etc. Insofar as this emphasis disproves the paradoxical opinion of Pfeiffer that the book is not an Israelite work at all, it is all to the good; but one wonders if it is not somewhat exaggerated. The law-court figure in particular, with its emphasis on arguments and pleading, suggests rather a civil tribunal than the Temple procedure.

In dealing with the solution of Job's problem in the Yahweh speeches, Weiser has provided a profound and stimulating treatment of the hagiographer's theology. After showing that the real problem of the book is not man's suffering as such, but the divine mystery, the question of how God's perfection is manifested in that suffering, Weiser goes on to show the inwardness of Job's struggle, and the seriousness of his approach to God. The friends' morality is eudaemonist—in the last analysis, they agree with the self-interest theory of the Satan—whereas Job places his happiness in God and demands only to find Him. But from man's side God is inaccessible; in c. 19 Job rises to the sublime height of confidence in his vindication after death—but this still leaves unresolved his perplexity about God's mind here and now. The theophany gives a real solution to this, but only by shifting the whole argument on to another plane. Job is rebuked, humbled, and yet satisfied and vindicated.

Just at this point the reviewer found the exposition a little disconcerting. Weiser declares that in 40:6 ff. Yahweh discloses that, though Job is innocent of ordinary wrongdoing, yet there is in him an *Urschuld* which consists precisely in his claim to be declared innocent—a claim to autonomy, a form of self-assertion, which infringes God's sovereignty, and has actually erected a barrier between himself and God. Only when, in his very last words, he renounces his innocence, is he perfectly at peace with his Maker, and "justified" by Him. It is hard to see how this *Urschuld* theory can be reconciled with declarations elsewhere in the book. In the prologue Yahweh has twice affirmed Job's moral perfection, which the Satan impugns; therefore Job, maintaining the same position, is really fighting Yahweh's battle, and the poet can hardly make the latter take back at the end what He first affirmed, without yielding Satan the victory. The poet's purpose being to exclude any *necessary* connection between sin and suffering, he must put an extreme case, and in fact he takes care to emphasize repeatedly Job's real sinlessness. (The doctrine of "original sin," hinted at by Eliphaz, has no place in the conclusion of the book.) The whole thesis is weakened if Job really is to be found guilty—as the friends maintained—of spiritual pride. Yahweh's censure can be sufficiently explained by the freedom, not to say irreverence, with

which Job, provoked by the friends, has attacked an imperfect but not wholly wrong idea of God.

Still, this is a matter of opinion, and one may say in general that the commentary is marked throughout by keen insight and reverent appreciation; the reviewer is conscious of a debt of gratitude to Dr. Weiser for many new lights on the literary beauties and doctrinal depths of this *OT* masterpiece. A select bibliography of nearly fifty titles ends the book; it includes several works in English, but not the excellent little commentary by Kissane, which (perhaps because published in 1939) seems too little known to German scholars.

The first volume of Dr. Weiser's commentary on the Psalms was reviewed in these pages last June by E. A. Cerny (XII [1951], 232-33). The second volume, whose pagination is continuous with the first, includes the translation and exposition of ninety psalms, and deserves the same praises as its predecessor. The liturgical setting attributed to most of the pieces often lends a vividness and freshness to the commentary that are most striking, e.g., the psalms on the City, or those on Yahweh's kingship. At the same time there is one disadvantage to this continued concentration on the cult background: where no such setting can be found, the commentator seems to lose interest. Thus, of the long Psalm 119 in praise of the Law, he remarks severely: "Die dichterischen Gattungen wechseln in buntem Gemisch und verstärken den unruhigen Eindruck des Ganzen. . . so dass sich aus ihnen der Sitz im Leben nicht erkennen lässt; der Psalm ist ein rein schriftstellerisches Erzeugnis" (p. 492). And he devotes scarcely more than a page to the commentary on its 176 verses. Yet many devout Christians (Pascal for one; see Calès, *Le livre des psaumes*, II, 442), undeterred by its literary artificiality, have ranked this among the most precious sections of the Psalter. It is surely a mistake in such a case to allow literary or *gattungsgeschichtliche* criticism to have the last word.

It must be added, however, that to the great majority of these psalms Dr. Weiser does full justice, and that the religious tone of his exegesis is one of the most pleasing aspects of his book.

*Jesuit Seminary, Toronto*

R. A. F. MACKENZIE, S.J.

PRIMITIVE GOSPEL SOURCES. By B. P. W. Stather Hunt. New York: Philosophical Library, 1951. Pp. xv + 344.

This book aims to offer a new solution to the complicated and vexing problem of the origin of the Synoptic Gospels, and their relation to each other in origin. His solution, in a nutshell, is that the story of Jesus was set into the framework of the prophetic testimony about the Messiah. He claims that

there were lectionaries of the Messianic prophecies in use in the Jewish synagogues. The Jews were eagerly awaiting the Messiah at this time and had gathered together the Messianic prophecies into what the author terms the Testimony Book. On Easter Day the Messiah Himself explained to the disciples at Emmaus how all the Scriptures, from Moses on through the prophets, spoke of Him. The disciples related to the apostles what Christ had told them. These in turn retold the story of Christ by setting it in the framework of the prophecies.

It was this prophetic life of Christ—a narration of the prophecy and its fulfilment, with perhaps an explanation added—that was the real basis of the Synoptic Gospels. First it was handed down orally, in the catechesis, but soon it was written down, perhaps by Matthew. Even on Easter night he may have written down some of the things related by the disciples from Emmaus. All that Matthew ever wrote was this Testimony Book, which became the chief source for Mark and Luke and the editor of "Matthew." By this dependence on the Testimony Book the author thinks we must explain the similarities in the Synoptics.

This prophetic framework is really the *Sitz im Leben*, the "form" which gave rise to the Gospels. Hunt severely criticizes the subjectivity of the exponents of Form Criticism, namely, their claim that the Gospel stories are the creation of the Christian community's imagination. He admits, however, their principle of a form into which the stories of Christ were put. His form is objective, real, historical, i.e., the prophecies of the Testimony Book, indirectly of the Old Testament.

As evidence for the existence of such a Testimony Book he appeals to the common catechesis of the New Testament Epistles and the Acts, which points to the use of the same prophetic passages and pattern. He appeals also to the text of the prophetic passages themselves as found in the Gospels, which are not always quoted according to the Septuagint. So he suggests that they were not taken directly from the Old Testament, but from the Testimony Book, which was first written in Aramaic. He appeals likewise to the subject of the prophecies in the Gospels. The Evangelists, especially Matthew, do set out to prove from the prophecies that Jesus is the Messiah. And they do that oftener than is at first apparent, because even the discourses of Christ belong to the legal testimony, inasmuch as they are the introduction of the New Covenant that was foretold. Then, too, the Evangelists have a testimony mind; they see a correspondence between Christ's story and that of Moses, for instance, when it was really not intended. Hunt also appeals to the ancient Christian writers. He makes much of Papias' witness to the Gospels, claiming that the *logia* which he ascribes to Matthew are this Testimony Book. He stresses the so-called Dialogues,



which he thinks have their origin in the Testimony Book as early as apostolic times.

We cannot touch upon everything in this book. It must be said that the author has written an orderly and clear treatise. He keeps the reader informed where he is going and sums up the results after each section. In reference to his main thesis, I believe that the author has done a good work in stressing the part the prophecies played in the writing of the Gospels. Not that this was not noted before. Catholic scholars, at least, were quite aware of the importance of the Messianic prophecies, especially in Matthew's Gospel. But all of us could perhaps emphasize that these prophecies, in keeping with Christ's explanation to the disciples at Emmaus, were an important element in the catechesis, first oral and then written, particularly for the Jewish converts. Hunt deserves credit too for rejecting the subjectivity of Form Criticism.

For the rest, any collection of Messianic prophecies, in lectionaries or otherwise, that the Jews might have had, was bound to be inadequate and could not have been taken over by Matthew or anyone else as a framework for Christ's story. The Jews were rather materialistic in the interpretation of many of the prophecies and missed others altogether. It took Christ to rectify the thinking of the disciples on this matter, especially with regard to the prophecies about His sufferings.

Again, to contend that the Testimony Book was a framework into which the story of Christ was fitted is to turn things around. The prophecies were really fitted into the life of Christ. That is what Christ did in His explanation at Emmaus. That is what Matthew did. He does not first give the prophecy and then the fulfilment, but vice versa. The same is gathered from the summaries of catechesis in the Acts. The apostles related the salient points of Christ's life and then proved that these are the fulfilment of prophecies. The center of attraction in the apostolic preaching was the personality of Christ and the historical events of His life, proved where feasible by prophecies. So the *Sitz im Leben* of the Gospel stories is not the prophetic life of Christ but His real life.

The author's claim that Papias' *logia* are not the Gospel of Matthew in Aramaic, but only the Testimony Book written by him, is not proved and is historically false. At least, Hunt's theory would prove that the *logia* are more than the discourses of Christ. As to the value of the Testimony Book for solving the Synoptic problem, it is true that it would offer a solution to some questions. But it is not the only solution possible for those questions; and, unless this Testimony Book were quite comprehensive, it would not be able to solve many of the questions.

Though Hunt is often more conservative than his fellow scholars, he still

clings to views that are unacceptable. For instance, the thesis that Matthew did not write a Gospel at all, merely the Testimony Book, and that Matthew's present Gospel is merely the work of an editor, is quite untenable by the laws of sound historical criticism. Mark's Gospel is, moreover, not the first chronologically, being written about 70 A.D. Though Hunt admits the historicity of many things in the Gospels that others have denied, he still holds the possibility of errors on the part of the inspired Evangelists. He thinks, too, that the Evangelists erred in adducing some passages as Messianic which were never intended as such.

To conclude, Hunt's thesis as a whole is not proved, and many particular points must be rejected or corrected. But we do congratulate the author for the emphasis he places on the fact of the Messianic prophecies in the early catechesis, an emphasis that seems rooted in the explanation of Jesus to the disciples at Emmaus.

*St. Conrad's Friary, Annapolis, Md.*      DOMINIC J. UNGER, O.F.M.CAP.

SAINT AUGUSTIN: LA FOI CHRÉTIENNE. Text, introduction, translation, and notes by J. Pegon, S.J. Bibliothèque augustiniennne: Oeuvres de saint Augustin. Première série: Opuscules, VIII. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1951. Pp. 522.

SAINT AUGUSTIN: LES RÉVISIONS. Text, introduction, translation, and notes by Gustave Bardy. Bibliothèque augustiniennne: Oeuvres de saint Augustin. Première série: Opuscules, XII. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1950. Pp. 663.

For those who have not seen this printing of the works of Augustine of Hippo, it may be useful to begin with a general description. Fulbert Cayré, A.A., is the director of this collection, which will eventually contain the *Opera omnia* in about eighty-five volumes. The books are pocket size (11x17 cm.), on thin but good paper, bound in limp cloth. In make-up, each volume contains Latin and French texts on facing pages, introductions in French, complementary notes, bibliographies, indexes, and tables. It would be difficult to suggest improvements in the physical appearance of the collection.

From the viewpoint of scholarship the series is equally noteworthy. Translators include most of the outstanding patrologists in France: de Labriolle, Combès, Jolivet, Finaert, Thonnard, and others. The Latin text printed is that of the Benedictines of St. Maur, a choice dictated partly by expediency no doubt, but also somewhat justified by the uneven quality of the more recent critical texts. In most volumes important textual variants are given in the footnotes. The general level of the translations is high. After

all, the French have been translating Augustine for centuries; their vernacular is well suited to his manner of expression; this should be one of the best versions.

Volume VIII, edited by Père Pegon, contains four works: *De vera religione*, *De utilitate credendi*, *De fide rerum quae non videntur*, *De fide et operibus*. Some of the work of translation and annotation on these treatises was done a few years ago by J. Clémence, but apparently the editor has reworked the whole thing. A few complementary notes are supplied by F. Cayré and A. de Veer. The bibliographies are useful but lack adequate notice of English versions and studies.

Canon Bardy's volume (XII) is wholly devoted to the *Retractationes*, Augustine's review of a good part of his own writings. Such a work provides a fine opportunity for a general discussion of the works of the saint. Bardy's long introduction (250 pages) is an exhaustive treatise and will be a standard reference for those interested in the literary career of Augustine. His chronological conclusions are sound but it is amazing that Bardy has paid no attention to S. M. Zarb's studies (*Angelicum*, X and XI) of the chronological information in the *Retractationes*. Seventy-five items are treated by Bardy in his *Notes complémentaires*; these notes are packed with historical, biographical, and literary information. Nine separate indexes complete the volume. It is doubtless one of the best in the collection.

St. Louis University

VERNON J. BOURKE

OUR SAVIOR AND HIS LOVE FOR US. By Reginald Garrigou-Lagrange, O.P. Translated by A. Bouchard. St. Louis: Herder, 1951. Pp. xii + 398. \$6.00.

Although this book is not a translation of the author's *De Christo salvatore*, but rather of his *Le Sauveur et son amour pour nous*, it is primarily a treatise on the Incarnation and redemption. Consequently the similarity between sections of this work and the *De Christo salvatore* is very marked; but many of the questions usually treated in a *De Verbo* text have been omitted, since it was the author's purpose to select only those "portions of this treatise that bear directly on the personality of the Savior, His interior life, and His love for us" (p. vi). It does, however, contain additional matter not found in a *De Verbo* treatise, especially the chapters which relate to the Holy Sacrifice.

The book is not intended for professional theologians as such. The intention of the author is "to invite interior souls to the contemplation of the mystery of Christ" (p. vii). Thus he considers the mystery of the redemptive Incarnation in a manner which is neither too technical theologically nor too "pious" devotionally. Rather, steering a middle course, he has produced a

fine spiritual book with a solid doctrinal foundation. Considering, however, the end which he had in view, some might find it a bit surprising that he "laid emphasis on several . . . problems, notably the personality of Christ (wherein it is formally constituted) . . . and the mystery of the reconciliation of Christ's liberty with his absolute impeccability" (p. viii). The same might be said of his treatment of the question of the grace of Christ and the mystics outside the Church.

The work is divided into two parts: "The Mystery of the Incarnation and the Personality of the Savior" and "Our Savior's Love for Us and the Mystery of the Redemption." After an introductory chapter, the first five chapters of the first part establish the divinity of Christ according to various parts of Scripture: the Synoptic Gospels, the Acts of the Apostles, the Epistles of St. Paul, the Gospel of St. John, and the prophecies of the Old Testament. Having thus established the dogma of the Incarnation, the eminent Dominican theologian penetrates a little into this sublime mystery by explaining the fittingness of the Incarnation according to the double principle that "God tends to communicate Himself as much as possible to man and that . . . man tends to be united as much as possible to God" (p. 80). The chapter (VII) in which this principle is discussed is one of the most inspirational of the book by reason of its explanation of the full development of personality, how it consists in effacing oneself before God and becoming more dependent upon Him who is Goodness and Truth. In the following chapter another aspect of the fittingness of the Incarnation is considered. No other "divine intervention could so successfully tear us away from evil. Nothing could have cured us so completely of our three wounds—concupiscence of the flesh, concupiscence of the eyes, and the pride of life—as the sufferings, the poverty, and the humility of our Savior. . . . At the same time . . . the Incarnation, by extricating us from the forces of evil, disposes us powerfully toward goodness. For it offers us the perfect model of all virtues and it increases tenfold . . . our faith, hope, and charity" (p. 102). The remaining chapters of this first part discuss the motive of the Incarnation, the predestination and the sanctity of Christ, and finally the human intelligence and will of the Incarnate Word.

The second part of this work is the more interesting and inspiring. It contains perhaps the two best chapters of the entire book; both are brief but excellent. The first of these is entitled "God's Love for His Son in the Mystery of the Redemption." It touches a sublime doctrine rarely treated: it explains and develops the beautiful truth that it was through love for His Son that God the Father asked of Him His act of redemptive love. The following chapter explains in turn what this redemptive love of Christ was, i.e., its strength and tenderness both for His Father and for us. In the remaining

sections Garrigou-Lagrange dwells on Christ's humility and magnanimity, His prayer, priesthood, and merits, the Sacrifice of the Cross and the Mass. Certainly the matter treated in these chapters is sufficiently solid and rich not only to enlighten interior souls but also to arouse them to a higher effective union with Christ.

The value and readability of this fine book are lessened by the use of the Douay translation, despite the availability of the Confraternity version. Finally, its fruitfulness will be limited by a rather prohibitive price tag.

*Weston College*

THOMAS G. O'CALLAGHAN, S.J.

MARIA, UNSERE HOHE LIEBE FRAU. By Otto Hophan, O.F.M.Cap. Luzern: Räber, 1951. Pp. 460. DM 22.

The author has published within the last six years *Die Apostel*, *Das Antlitz der Tage*, and *Der Kreuzweg des Kranken*. In this present work he studies the life and virtues of the Blessed Virgin. Leaving aside the apocryphal Gospels and private revelations, Fr. Hophan bases his study on Scripture. It is a devotional work, rich in content, set in an academic framework of careful documentation, and possessing useful erudition, e.g., about the customs of the Jews, and the geography and climate of the Holy Land. The Fathers of the Church and the liturgy also contribute extensive material.

The author has a special reason for using Scripture, for he has Protestant as well as Catholic readers in mind. Because the Bible has brought several groups of Protestants to Mary—here the author cites the report of a Protestant convention held in Switzerland in 1949—Fr. Hophan stresses in the Gospels the various scenes and passages where Mary is mentioned. He also points out, to allay Protestant fears that devotion to Mary will lessen the honor due to her Son, that every time Mary is mentioned in Scripture Christ is mentioned with her. Therefore, he concludes, Protestants should not fear to venerate Mary. In support of this statement Hophan cites selections from the writings of Luther and Zwingli, one from Calvin, and from present-day Protestant theologians, which show their high esteem for the Blessed Virgin.

Written in a style that is warm and lively, the work provides excellent spiritual reading. To help the reader in the choice of material a list is given of the various passages appropriate for the season and the different feasts of Christ and the Blessed Virgin. The index is adequate. Here and there short citations from certain authors, e.g., Sorge (pp. 110, 135, 230), Feckes (p. 135), and Lippert (p. 127), are quoted without any indication of their origin.

*Alma College*

EDWARD HAGEMANN, S.J.

THE FATHERHOOD OF ST. JOSEPH. By Joseph Mueller, S.J. Translated by Athanasius Dengler, O.S.B. St. Louis: Herder, 1952. Pp. 238. \$3.50.

This work is a clear, logical, well-balanced, definitive presentation of the theological background of the Catholic attitude to St. Joseph. Summarily, the author's line of thought is this: Joseph's prerogatives, dignity, and position in the Church ultimately stem from his fatherhood of the God-Man, and accordingly this unique privilege is singled out as the central theme of the book.

The marriage of Mary and Joseph, though virginal, was a true marriage, destined by God to effect the mystery of the Incarnation. From the beginning God had sanctified marriage as the fountain-head henceforth of all human life, and had conditioned the blessing with children upon marriage. Nor would He depart from this norm even when a virginal conception was to be wrought in which a man's physical co-operation was absolutely excluded. In the natural production of human beings God's role is primary: the concurrence of father and mother is a secondary factor, the preparatory and dispositive contribution to the creative act. In the miraculous conception of the divine Child, Joseph did not concur immediately or physically. His contribution was his stainless purity and virginal union with Mary whereby, jointly with her, he rendered it possible that the Son of God be conceived and born of a virginal marriage, and thus enter this world in a manner not unworthy of His ineffable purity and holiness. And through such unconditioned surrender to the divine will Mary and Joseph shared in the accomplishment of the Incarnation in the only feasible way befitting the mystery, and in consequence Mary is strictly the mother of the Word Incarnate, and Joseph, not identically but analogically, is His father.

St. Paul teaches—and the principle is commonly accepted in law—that the husband has a right over the body of his wife pertinent to the sexual functions by which human life originates. The offspring is the fruit of marriage, is born into the family, and pertains to the parents. Jesus was born to the virginal marriage of Joseph and Mary; He is the fruit of their marriage, of a union ordained by God precisely to the realization of the Incarnation, and privileged, without detriment to virginity, to enjoy the blessings of fruitfulness.

In the New Testament St. Joseph is called the father of Jesus without any qualifications, and this not only by those who knew nothing of the mystery but by Mary and the evangelist. God, therefore, in His wise providence designed Joseph to become father of Jesus in every way possible with the sole exception of natural generation, and thus the saint was accorded a participation in the eternal fatherhood of God and elevated to the order of the

hypostatic union. Joseph has been styled the foster father, the adoptive, the legal, or finally the putative father of Christ. All these qualifications fail utterly to do justice to the singular relations existing between the members of the Holy Family. The most appropriate and specific appellation would be virginal father.

Revelation testifies that Joseph's sanctity was as eminent as his lofty position. Rightly, then, do the faithful unite with the teaching authority in the Church in venerating him with what, in the absence of a more significant term, we may call *protodulia* or the highest degree of the cult shown to angels and saints. To our author, consequently, all admirers of St. Joseph are heavily indebted, and after him to Fr. Dengler who has turned the work into such idiomatic English that the reader will completely forget that he is reading a translation.

*Woodstock College*

D. J. M. CALLAHAN, S.J.

ONE AND HOLY. By Karl Adam. Translated by Cecily Hastings. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1951. Pp. 130. \$2.00.

*One and Holy* is a poignant plea to Catholics and Protestants to do what is in their power to realize Christ's prayer "that all may be one." This implies attempts at reuniting the two churches, a work which is primarily God's but which man can prepare. Today the problem has a particular urgency for German Christianity because its survival is in large measure dependent on its religious unity. A strong and a skillfully organized anti-Christian power lies in wait, and the more divided the camps of Christianity the easier the hunting. Mutual benevolence is indispensable but insufficient, for the solution of this problem requires also a serious endeavor to understand and abide by the wishes of Christ, and a willingness to labor selflessly to effect their fulfillment.

Adam resolves the whole issue into three nuclear questions: How did German Christianity come to be divided? Is a reunion possible in principle? How can it be achieved? In answer to the first, he traces through history those incidents which gradually wore away the bonds linking Germany to Rome. The picture is not a pretty one and the reprehensible apathy and greed of many of their shepherds understandably shocked both the pious and the overly critical. Cries for reform in head and members grew loud in the land; unhappily it was at this point that Luther's voice was heard—a strong, discordant, threatening voice.

Adam carefully reminds the reader that Luther's fundamental intention was not the overthrow and dissolution of the Catholic Church but its amendment and improvement. It was the common misfortune that in trying

to relieve his own tortured conscience he became the herald of a heretical theology. He found that only an all-sufficient and saving faith could rid him of the shackles of doubt and despair crippling him. Convinced that Rome's doctrine was false because inadequate in this instance, he conceived his new theology of subjective selection to be the "good news" that must be shouted from the housetops. The abuses connected with Peter's name had made him *persona non grata* and the people turned instead to this new prophet.

Since much of Luther's personal thought and teaching was quite consonant with Catholic doctrine, Adam believes that reunion of the two churches is possible. When Luther erred it was frequently by exaggerating or minimizing one aspect or other of Catholicism; hence many of his doctrinal tenets which seem irreconcilable are not really so. Adam indicates that Luther had not wandered so widely from orthodoxy that some rapprochement cannot be effected: salvation by faith alone, e.g., can be understood in a Catholic sense, and in the Confession of Augsburg Luther did recognize an objective ecclesiastical teaching authority. But the additions and subtractions of the Orthodox theologians must be bypassed and a return effected to Luther's original teachings.

Even when this has been done, however, three obstacles remain. The one durable *bête noire* is the papacy. With it Luther had no sympathy and his prejudice toward it has been the legacy of his followers. But even here Adam sees no cause for despair: if these followers are believers, an unprejudiced and prayerful examination of Mt. 16:18-19 may still reveal to them not only Peter but all his successors. Besides, the role of the Church and of tradition must also be clarified if reunion is to be achieved. To Catholics the Church as a prolongation of Christ in time is primarily an institution for salvation and consequently they consider some alliance of the personal with the institutional as indispensable in approaching God. Nor can Catholics accept the Protestant position of the sufficiency of Scripture, for to them Scripture is a book which the Church interprets and uses along with tradition. Both are sources of God's word. These three problems offer the tallest barriers Protestants have to hurdle; once over them disciplinary differences might well be taken in easy stride.

It must be emphasized, however, that belief in the divinity of Christ is the starting place for Catholics and Protestants, and it is this above all which makes reunion possible and supremely practicable. Reverence for, and an eagerness to fulfill, the desires of Christ will render the search for truth fruitful, and this along with an adult attempt to soften the antagonism that has unhappily arisen over the years between the two religions makes the progression from Christ to Peter to the *Una sancta* less unlikely than it has been



in the past. Whatever success attends Adam's endeavor, all must applaud the spirit of charity and understanding that animates it, just as all must share his conviction that it is high time for all Christians to bear a *unanimous* witness to Christ.

*Woodstock College*

JAMES L. TYNE, S.J.

ADVENT. By Jean Daniélou. Translated by Rosemary Sheed. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1951. Pp. 181. \$2.50.

Père Daniélou has given us a meaningful but possibly deceptive title. The book encompasses more than the pre-Christmas season: it considers in their full latitude the historical preparations that have been made in nations and individual souls for Christ's coming. Daniélou is still preoccupied with the problems and promises of missiology. In the introductory chapter he poses the problem and outlines his solution. The question is difficult because arguable from two apparently mutually exclusive viewpoints. Christianity fulfills and destroys, and, until the inevitableness and the meaning of both these operations are carefully considered and counterbalanced, any discussion on the meaning of missionary activity must lead to an impasse. The missionary problem has deep historical roots, and considered in an historical light it is clear that the problems which face the twentieth-century missionary are essentially the same as those which confronted the early Christians in their relations with Judaism and paganism.

Destruction and fulfilment follow in Christianity's wake as necessarily as Good Friday and Easter Sunday. Because of this dualism there have always been Christians opting for one to the exclusion of the other, and success has seldom, if ever, attended such a univocal choice. The optimist concentrates on the continuity and completion which Christianity brings to alien religions, toning down, if not ignoring, those aspects which worry the pessimist most. The latter is almost always preoccupied with the conflict that engages Christianity when it confronts other religions and this preoccupation blinds him to the assimilable elements that such religions invariably contain. To him other religions, instead of being the precursors which mysteriously ready the way for Christ, are rather irredeemable and relentless forces that work unceasingly against Him.

That non-Christian religions are incomplete rather than false, that there is contradiction and opposition only when they refuse to give way to the Christ who completes, is little more than a restatement of a familiar and uncontroverted truth. Daniélou's illustration of this truth is, however, rewardingly rich and original.

Reaching back into the beginnings of sacred history the author singles

out the representatives of various religions and indicates how they prepared their people for Christianity. When that level of spiritual progress had been reached which God intended, further revelations were given and more taxing demands made which necessitated abandoning in great part the old and adopting the new. The true precursors like Abraham, the worshiper of idols, and Melchisedech, the personification of the religion of the natural universe, uncomplainingly gave way at God's word, and such surrender enriched rather than impoverished them. When the two men met, the covenant that had been established between Abraham's seed and God replaced the covenant of Noe, just as Christ's covenant would replace Abraham's at His meeting with the Baptist.

The section on the last precursors treats of John the Baptist, the angels, and Mary. Many splendid things are said of the Baptist and the skeleton sketch presented in the New Testament is fleshed; he appears life-size and heroic. His task was to be the forerunner of Christ; this done, he could disappear into an obscurity from which only death would call him. Disinterested zeal and complete detachment characterized his work and his life, as it must the lives of all precursors, of all missionaries. The mysterious economy over the pagan peoples is best illustrated in the way in which Daniélou presents the angels and Mary constantly at work among them. According to Christian tradition the nations have been entrusted to the angels and at different times and in sundry ways they are silently preparing them to receive God's word by progressively disposing them for what is good. Allied with them is Mary, who enjoys the principal role in preparing for every coming of Christ. She too is subtly making ready the way, disposing China by its cult of the mother, India by its cult of the virgin, to accept her Son and herself.

Christ has not, of course, entrusted the salvation of souls entirely to His creatures. Daniélou shows the relation that exists between Christ's ascension and missionary expansion, and he offers profound insights into the significance of that somewhat slighted mystery. With his ascension Christ became the Head of the Mystical Body and the work of evangelization was now to be accomplished by men who drew their effectiveness from union with Him. The endeavor to unite all men in Christ will flourish through all time, for men will always be needed to point out to expectant eyes the Man on the cross, that cross which draws all of a man and all men.

*Advent* is a rich book, highly concentrated. With uncommon thoroughness and scholarship Daniélou has given us a comprehensive treatise on the problems of Christian evangelization, a serious study of the how and why of missionary activity in the Catholic Church. This activity is correctly viewed

in its historical context, and so the reader is inclined to favor the optimistic view to which the author is himself partial.

*Woodstock College*

JAMES L. TYNE, S. J.

**DIE VIELEN MESSEN UND DAS EINE OPFER.** Eine Untersuchung über die rechte Norm der Messhäufigkeit. By Karl Rahner, S. J. Freiburg: Herder, 1951. Pp. 118. 3.50 DM.

The book is a reprint of an article published in the *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie*, LXXI (1949), 257–317. As the subtitle indicates, the central problem is to find or establish, if possible, some general norm by which to judge the frequency of Mass celebration—a problem certainly of more than merely academic interest, touching as it does many and varied manifestations of the liturgical and spiritual life.

After a preliminary discussion of some fundamental notions (e.g., the glory of God, Christ's sacrifice on the Cross, the Sacrifice of the Mass and its relation to that of the Cross, the Sacrifice of the Mass as the Sacrifice of the Church) the author, with his well-known accuracy and thoroughness, examines the different opinions on the subject and finds them wanting. A further critical investigation concerning the proper understanding of the various fruits of the Sacrifice of the Mass leads him to the following general norm: "The Sacrifice of the Mass should be celebrated as often as (granted the other presuppositions of physical and moral possibility) it contributes to the glory of God and to the blessing of men. Since, however, it has been shown [in an earlier section] that through the Sacrifice of the Mass God's glory and man's blessing are increased exclusively in the measure in which man, in faith and charity, places himself through the Sacrifice of the Mass beneath the Cross of Christ, the one and only norm for the frequency of Mass can be formulated in the following proposition: The Sacrifice of the Altar should be celebrated as often and only as often as through the same a reasonable 'more' of *devotio* will be obtained, i.e., more than if Mass were celebrated either more rarely or more frequently" (pp. 76–77). The term *devotio* is understood as including the habitual degree of sanctifying grace, faith, and charity, as well as the actual devotion of the priest celebrating and the people assisting. This general norm is then applied to various practical situations, and here particular norms or rules are set forth concerning concelebration, simultaneous private Masses, Mass stipends and stipend Masses, participation in several Masses at the same time, etc. In an appendix the author deals with some objections and criticisms expressed since his article first appeared in *ZkTh*.

It may be true that, as Rahner puts it, the book does not at once create a *consensus theologorum*; but, as it calls for a re-examination of the problems involved, it will stimulate thought and enrich discussion. All in all, we have here a very worthwhile little book.

*Jesuit Seminary, Toronto*

PETER MUELLER, S.J.

DIE LITURGIE DER SAKRAMENTE. By Joseph Pascher. Münster: Aschen-dorff, 1951. Pp. 282.

In a previous volume, *Eucharistia*, Prof. Pascher has endeavored to show that serious study of the Eucharistic liturgy not only brings one in contact with much soul-uplifting beauty but also unlocks veritable treasures of grace. In the present work he undertakes the same task with respect to the remaining sacraments. The sacraments are studied from the viewpoint of their nature as symbols or, to be more precise, as symbolic actions. The author complains mildly that dogmatic theologians are not sufficiently concerned with the role of "persons" in the sacramental liturgy. True, they speak of the minister and the recipient, but they fail to point out how these too enter into the sacramental symbolism.

The section on the baptismal liturgy takes up a sizable portion of the book, about eighty pages. After an explanation of the basic symbolism involved and an examination of the double motif of rebirth (Jo. 3:5) and death and resurrection with Christ (Rom. 6:1-7), the author launches into a discussion of the actual baptismal *Kulldrama*. In his treatment of the baptism of adults, to which the major portion of this section is devoted, Pascher strives to disentangle what at first sight appears to be a complicated skein of prayers and symbolic actions. He considers successively the reception into the catechumenate, the *scrutinium*, the baptismal part of the paschal liturgy, and baptism proper. In the course of his discussion he brings several important and interesting points to light. For example, the signing of the catechumen with the sign of the cross by the sponsor is an indication that the Church regards the baptized lay person as a "Spirit-bearer and Spirit-dispenser" (*Geisträger und Geistspender*) because through his own baptism he shares in the priesthood of Christ.

There is an interesting observation on the blessing of baptismal water. It never occurred to the Church of apostolic times to impart a special blessing to water destined for baptism. But Christians were not long pondering the problem phrased later by St. Augustine: "Unde tanta vis aquae. . .?" From a very early date the epiklesis over the water occupies an important part in the baptismal liturgy—so much so that it supplied St. Cyprian with a convenient and (to him) a telling argument to support his position in the

baptismal controversy: "Oportet vero mundari et sanctificari aquam prius a sacerdote, ut possit baptismo suo peccata hominis qui baptizatur ablui . . . . Quomodo autem mundare et sanctificare aquam potest qui ipse immundus est et apud quem sanctus spiritus non est?" (*Ep.* 70). The section on baptism is concluded by a brief discussion of its social character.

The penitential liturgy as given in the *Rituale Romanum* is disposed of very briefly. Pascher devotes most of his time to the more public liturgy of the *Pontificale Romanum*. For a full understanding of the various parts of this liturgy, Pascher shows that a knowledge of the earlier penitential discipline of the Church is essential. Here, for the most part, he admittedly follows Poschmann.

Baptized sinners in early times were reconciled by readmission into the Church, which presupposes an antecedent exclusion. However, as Pascher points out, the important thing here is not expulsion from and admission into the House of God, but exclusion from and subsequent participation in the Eucharistic banquet and the communal offering. That is why, he claims, Holy Scripture so often speaks of the Kingdom of God, the Church, in terms of a feast.

In its judicial aspect penance, according to Pascher, is the sacramental representation of the redemptive judgment undergone by Christ in His death on the cross. Christ is condemned to suffer outside the holy city; the penitent sinner is excluded from the community of worshipers. Christ, after enduring the penalty of sin, returns in triumph to the Father; the sinner, his judicial sentence served, returns to the community of the faithful. In the framework of this basic symbolism the author assigns the persons involved in the sacramental drama their respective roles. The penitent represents the condemned Christ; the bishop (or priest) God the Father as Judge. Nor does this, Pascher affirms, militate against the truth that it is Christ who operates in the sacrament. The problem of principal agent in the effect produced by the sacrament must be distinguished from that other question, viz., what does the sacrament symbolize? That the authority of Christ, to whom the Father "has left all judgment" (Jo. 5:22), cannot be divorced from the effect of the sacrament, is evident. The formula of absolution, "Dominus noster Jesus Christus te absolvat, etc.," is plain enough; but the fundamental symbolism is not here expressed.

These two seemingly irreconcilable roles of Christ in the sacrament should, according to the author, cause no grave concern. We meet similar apparent antinomies in Scripture. The fact that the "Father, instead of passing judgment on any man himself, has left all judgment to the Son" (Jo. 5:22), does not contradict the Joannine statement that God did not send His Son

to judge the world but that the world might find salvation through Him (Jo. 3:17). In any event the Son judges by commission of the Father, and the Father judges through the Son.

The complete Latin text with a readable German translation is given of all the prayers in the administration of the six sacraments. Apart from the lack of paragraph indentations and a glaring typographical error on page 265, the book is well printed. There is no index.

*Jesuit Seminary, Toronto*

J. I. HOCHBAN, S.J.

THE PROGRESS OF THE LITURGY. By Dom Olivier Rousseau, O.S.B. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1951. Pp. 219. \$2.75.

The liturgical movement, which has received official recognition and direction from the highest ecclesiastical authority through the Encyclical *Mediator Dei*, began to spread in this country in the twenties through the efforts of the late Fr. Virgil Michel of St. John's Abbey, Collegeville, Minn., who founded the periodical *Orate Fratres*, now published under the name *Worship*. The annual celebration of liturgical "weeks" in most of our leading cities made the aims of the movement known to clergy and laity all over the country. Its origins, however, were never presented to the public until Dom Olivier Rousseau published in 1945 his excellent little *L'Histoire du mouvement liturgique*. Its translation into English by the monks of the newly founded Westminster Priory in Vancouver, Canada, will therefore fill a real need.

As a disciple of one of the most outstanding leaders of the liturgical movement, Dom Lambert Beauduin, monk of Mont-César in Louvain and founder of the Priory of Amay-sur-Meuse, Dom Rousseau is well qualified to trace its history. He limits himself here to the first stage, from the foundation of the Abbey of Solesmes by Abbot Prosper Guéranger to the reforms of Pius X, under whom the movement began to encircle the globe. The author sees the roots of the liturgical movement in the Romanticism of the early nineteenth century, which rediscovered the spiritual wealth of the Middle Ages and tried to restore the historical continuity of Christian civilization which had been broken by the Enlightenment and the French Revolution. It was nearly at the same time that Dom Guéranger in France, Newman and Pusey in England, and Adam Möhler in Germany grasped anew the extraordinary richness of patristic and liturgical tradition and its value for a revival of authentic Christianity. They became the "fathers" of the liturgical movement in their respective countries. Dom Guéranger was the most effective among them because he founded a monastery which carried his ideas through the generations and applied them to the various fields of patristic study, of

Gregorian Chant, and of liturgical art. To Dom Guéranger the Church is essentially "a society of divine praise." Liturgical worship is therefore not only a nice decoration but the very life of the Church. In his *Liturgical Year* (reprinted recently by the Newman Press) Dom Guéranger opened the treasures of the liturgy to the public at large. His example inspired Dom Maurus Wolter in the founding of the Archabbey of Beuron in southern Germany in 1863, which then became the center of the liturgical movement for the German-speaking nations. Dom Wolter has the special merit of having interpreted the psalter in his excellent *Psallite sapienter*. A third important step in the liturgical apostolate was taken by Dom Gerard van Caloen, a monk of the Abbey of Maredsous in Belgium, who published in 1882 the first missal for the use of the laity, the *Missel des fidèles*.

While the liturgical movement on the continent was largely supported by Benedictine abbeys belonging to the spiritual family of Solesmes, the interest in liturgical things in England was intense only among those Anglicans who had been influenced by the Oxford Movement of Newman, Pusey, and Pugin. Cardinal Wiseman was the only leading Roman Catholic who attempted to interest English Catholics in liturgical piety. The main contribution of England to the liturgical movement is rather in the field of scholarship. In an interesting appendix to their translation of Dom Rousseau's book the monks of Westminster Priory refer to the adventure of Bishop England in publishing a missal for the use of the laity in this country as early as 1822.

Dom Rousseau does not limit his study to the strictly liturgical fruits of the movement started by Abbot Guéranger. In three interesting chapters he deals with the restoration of Gregorian Chant, the revival of the sacred arts, and the importance of the liturgy for the reunion with the Orthodox Church in which the liturgy holds such a central position. In his last two chapters Dom Rousseau views the second period of the liturgical movement, inaugurated by Pius X in his numerous directives on religious music, the calendar, the liturgical psalter, and frequent Communion. The importance of the decrees of Pius X began to be realized in 1909 in Belgium through the Abbey of Mont-César, where Dom Lambert Beauduin organized the first Liturgical Week in 1910, in a tremendous effort to win the support of the clergy.

*Mount Savior, Elmira, N. Y.*

DAMASUS WINZEN, O.S.B.

VON DEN LETZTEN DINGEN. By Michael Schmaus. Münster: Regensberg, 1948. Pp. 736. DM 18.

No period in the world's history can be understood, no decision on norms of right conduct reached, unless men reflect seriously on the direction of their lives and on the ultimate future that awaits them. Any book that will

incite such reflection should be accorded an enthusiastic welcome. This is particularly true if the writer is fully alive to the unrest of the contemporary mind and performs his task in such a way as to assist his fellow men in their anxiety for a solution to the puzzles of existence. Dr. Schmaus has succeeded superlatively well. On opening the volume the reader may be appalled at the prospect of perusing the hundreds of closely-printed pages. The author frankly states that the work turned out to be longer than either he or the publisher had desired; the reader will probably append a fervent amen. The book may be excessively long; but if so, it is too much of a good thing.

A double objective is aimed at: the forging of a global synthesis of results achieved by scholarly researches, with a view to clarifying and enriching the theology of the last things, and the providing or recalling of a standard of life for men outside the professional circles of the sacred sciences. Accordingly the work is by no means a textbook. It can indeed serve the theologian as an inexhaustible treasury of information, since it is so comprehensive, and also of inspiration, since it was written with keen awareness of the peculiar trends of modern thought. But its main value lies in the knowledge it offers to those who seek truth they do not possess about the meaning of life and the destinies that confront them. Definitive solutions are presented in a form quite acceptable to modern tastes, and gain power from their sharp contrast to the gropings of the new existentialism.

The uncertainty oppressing the people of our generation is not the product of today or yesterday. It grew throughout the past century and now appears, in the despairing philosophy of desperate men, to be grounded in the very existence of the human animal. Man has come up from nothing, is characterized by nothingness, and hovers above the abyss of nothingness. No prospect of rescue from the menacing peril is possible within the framework of the world. But what the world withholds is offered by God, in whom alone man can find the security for which he hungers.

How can man find enduring reality in God? Reality becomes accessible and can be grasped by us in Christ. The appeal sent forth by man from the abyss of existence becomes an appeal to God in Christ, whom he can meet in history. But his meeting with Christ in history is not an empty recalling of the past. The past is not completely past; Christ fills the centuries, as He foretold: "Behold, I am with you all days, even to the consummation of the world." Since His ascent into heaven, Christ's presence is hid from us. Yet we have His promise that He will emerge from concealment and show Himself in His living form. His second coming will wind up the history of man and of the world. The present Christ is also the coming Christ, and faith in the present Christ turns to hope in the coming Christ.



The past life of Christ, transformed by His resurrection into incorruptible life, gives to our existence its glorious meaning. Christians are men on whom the death and resurrection of Christ have exerted a mighty power, men who have won a share in His death and resurrection. That share, like the presence of Christ, remains hidden in every age of history; but the hour is approaching when the hidden will become manifest, and that is the decisive hour for every man. It will dawn for all mankind at the second coming of the Lord; it dawns for each person when he is called at death to imperishable life.

The entire cosmos has been changed by the death and resurrection of Christ. In its existing form it is doomed; but the seed of life, the power to arise, has been planted in it. The transfiguration of the world is subject to the prevailing law of obscurity; but the obscurity will give way to manifestation at the appointed time.

*Von den letzten Dingen* describes the future as it is exhibited in Sacred Scripture and tradition, set forth by the Church, and richly elaborated by theology. The exposition starts with the situation of man in time and history. It unfolds the historical occurrences foreknown by revelation, and advances to the second coming of Christ as the definitive stage and culmination of all events. Emphasis is laid on the last things of universal history and the cosmos; the last things facing the individual envisage him as a member of the collective whole.

The two parts of the book are roughly equal in amplitude of discussion. The first part, dealing with the last things of history and the world, develops nine chapters describing man in his historical setting, the historicity of revelation, the Kingdom of God, the second coming of Christ and the signs heralding it, the overthrow of Antichrist, the resurrection of the dead, the general judgment, and the renovation of creation. The six chapters of the second part follow a familiar order: death as the inception of the last things for the individual, the particular judgment, purgatory, heaven, hell. The last chapter is a heartening epilogue about God's universal salvific will.

In almost every chapter the author rises to a climax by bringing out in a new way or with new stress some truth previously known but not thoroughly exploited. He is notably successful in his treatment of the happiness of heaven; in a section of many pages he develops the fact that God *is* happiness—happiness in person. In heaven the beatified soul is united to happiness, surrounded by happiness, drenched and immersed in absolute happiness. The power of the passage cannot be disclosed by a statement of the theme; it has to be read in full and pondered. On the other hand, the interesting suggestion about the beatific vision—that it is neither an act of the intellect as St. Thomas taught, nor an act of the will as Scotus preferred,

but an act of the soul elicited in depths where knowledge and love are not yet distinct—is put forward without demonstration of its plausibility or even possibility. A good case is presented for the gradual forgiveness of venial sins in purgatory; yet it is not good enough to sway those who have perceived the reasonableness of the Thomist position. The charitable endeavor to provide for the salvation of infants who die before baptism is marred by neglect of the doctrine of the necessity of baptism as a necessity of means, and by failure to consider the definitions proposed at the Councils of Lyons and Florence on the lot of those who perish in original sin. But the few reserves which are in place regarding matters of detail scarcely detract from the enormous importance and value of this remarkable book.

*St. Mary's College*

CYRIL VOLLERT, S.J.

LE MYSTÈRE DE LA MORT ET SA CÉLÉBRATION. *Lex orandi*, XII. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1951. Pp. 473. 870 fr.

Death, as we know from St. Paul, was a source of anguish for the Thessalonians. As a counteractive measure he wrote them this message: "But we would not, brethren, have you ignorant concerning those that are asleep, lest you should grieve, even as others who have no hope. For if we believe that Jesus died and rose again, so with him God will bring those also who have fallen asleep through Jesus." In these words he summed up the Christian outlook on death. Here is brought out the contrast between the followers of Christ and others who have no hope. Christian antiquity shows us that, for the most part, St. Paul's teaching was not merely theory, but theory put into practice and lived. Nevertheless, through the centuries the problem of the Christian attitude towards death has been constantly recurring. It is this problem that forms the burden of *Le mystère de la mort et sa célébration*, a book made up of papers and discussions held at Vanves, April 27-29, 1949. It is most encouraging to see these Catholic leaders, cleric and lay, following in the steps of St. Paul. It is all the more encouraging when we realize that their work is carried out in the midst of discouraging surroundings: more than once mention is made of the fact that this work is being carried on in a milieu that is dechristianized or Communistic.

As a whole, this is the most solid and inspiring work on the subject that this reviewer has read. To inculcate the Christian attitude towards death these writers insist that it must be linked with the entire economy of the Incarnation and work of Christ. Christ's victory over death and His resurrection (whereby He became *primogenitus mortuorum*) is the prototype of the lot of those who follow Him. This process, however, starts not with death but with baptism. Baptism is a death and resurrection, a dying and living.

Furthermore, this process is prolonged throughout life, whereby a man dies to sin and lives to God. Bodily death is a phase that one must endure in order to come to eternal life. In undergoing death the Christian knows that life is awaiting him and that one day the body that crumbles to ashes will rise in glory and be eternally reunited with the soul. Consequently the mystery of death cannot be understood unless it is linked up with the paschal mystery, with the death and resurrection of Christ. In this light, death is not terrifying and somber, but wears an aspect of joy, for the agony of death has been dissipated by the victory of Christ. In a matter of this kind, however, philosophical speculations are useless; it is only Christian faith that lights our path.

In delving into the mystery of death, special attention is paid first to the sources. Individual studies are given on the concept of death as found in the Bible, the Fathers, the early Christian cemeteries, and funeral rites. With this as a basis there follow papers on the theology of death and the future life, e.g., death, the Christian mystery, heaven and the resurrection, purgatory.

The second part of the book is concerned with Christian burial. The aim of these papers is to insist that the burial of a Christian be carried out in a truly religious manner, that it be a practical manifestation of belief in the Christian outlook on death. Themes discussed are: preaching on death, preaching at funerals, funeral music, the necessity of having funeral cards that manifest Christian faith and which do not contain sayings that are an insult to the providence of God. Also discussed are methods of doing away with funeral pomp and of controlling excesses in "classes of funerals." It is most encouraging to see these leaders criticize themselves on many of these points; it is a sign of maturity and an omen of a brighter and more Catholic future.

In the study of the sources one cannot but be impressed with the ever recurring themes of joy, hope, and optimism. H. M. Feret, in his excellent synthesis of death in the Bible, shows that the thought of death is secondary to the thought of the resurrection, that death is a step towards life. Here we are given a panoramic view of the Old and New Testament; we see how the preaching of Christ and His own death and resurrection completely revolutionized the outlook on death. Similarly, as J. Daniélou proves from the Fathers, the agony of death is overcome by the victory of Christ. To the Fathers, death is life, birth, the meeting with the Bridegroom; it is something which the Christian meets without apprehension "*quoniam tu mecum es.*" A remark by Daniélou is worthy of special emphasis and commendation. He notes that the Fathers, in describing death, often use expressions that are Platonic and Hellenistic; at the same time he stresses that these expressions,

used by men living by the Christian revelation, are surcharged with new contents and meanings. In the section on the sources it is encouraging to see a special treatise on the outlook on death as manifested in early Christian cemeteries—concrete proof of the Christian message lived and put into practice. In treating a Christian belief historically, there is a tendency to leap from Scripture to the ecclesiastical writers and to overlook completely the evidence from archaeology. Naturally, we are not asking that the theologians or the manualists be archaeologists; still there is no reason why the findings of archaeologists cannot be used in theological treatises. A splendid illustration of this is had in the paper dealing with the early Christian cemeteries. Mme. Boulet brings out that the theme of the funereal art is death and resurrection; the dominating idea in archaeology, illustrating what death meant for the Christians, is the idea of life and life eternal.

The same note of optimism is seen in the papers dealing with the theology of death, heaven and resurrection, and purgatory. The article on purgatory, however, seems out of line with the other papers. Instead of confining himself to a presentation of the dogma and theology of purgatory, P. Congar shows how the Latin and Western formulation of purgatory or abuses and practices centering about this doctrine have had an effect on our separated brethren. With this in mind he holds a dialogue first with the Protestants and then with the Orientals. The revolt on either side, he claims, is not so much a revolt against the dogma itself, but against the theology, and especially against Scholastic theology. He thinks that a “purgatoire du Purgatoire” is needed. After stating the fact of purgatory, he goes on to stress what is not *de fide* in this matter, namely, fire and flames, that purgatory is a place, and that it is a vast organization of torture. Obviously, in the matter of purgatory, any presentation that goes beyond the limits of revealed truth or sound accepted theology is to be uncompromisingly rejected. In a dialogue with Protestants and Orientals, however, I think that a spirit of ecumenism, to be ecumenic, demands that the Latins speak up also. It seems necessary to point out to those who are separated from us that the doctrine of the fire of purgatory, while not *de fide*, is the more common teaching in the Latin Church. Furthermore, I do not think that it is necessary to deprecate, by stressing, certain developments in Latin theology, e.g., the concept of *reatus culpae* and *reatus poenae*, and the idea of penal satisfaction, both of which played a part in the Latin presentation of purgatory. Congar would have done better had he given a positive exposé of the doctrine of purgatory, treating systematically its joyful aspects, e.g., the union of the soul with God by charity, the temporary nature of the postponement of the vision of God, the joy of the soul in making satisfaction and in being prepared for God. This

would show that the Latin doctrine on purgatory, even with its concept of penal satisfaction, does not conjure up the idea of a vast organization of torture; it would also show that the concepts of purgatory as a spiritual work being carried on in peace and joy, as a work of purification being carried on in souls truly saved, as a process of ripening until the soul is ready to enter heaven (concepts that are dear to the Orientals and certain Protestants), are also part of Latin theology.

By way of commendation, attention should be called to the remarks of Père Daniélou when he stresses the difference between the biblical and the pagan idea of *requies*. Although the Christians took over the pagan formula *requies*, it was given the biblical connotation of the Sabbath rest. It also conjured up the idea of quitting the world of sin and misery. The Christian *requies* was a coming to Christ, the true Sabbath, the true repose of the seventh day, in the next life (p. 185). Incidentally, St. Augustine specifically links up the Christian idea of rest and the Sabbath (*Quaest. in Hept.*, I, 172).

A work of this kind is eloquent proof of the rich heritage contained in Christianity. At the same time it is an incentive to bring home to men in the twentieth century the beauty and consolation of the Christian attitude towards death. In doing so (as this book shows and as Y. Congar emphatically brings out), theology cannot be departmentalized or regarded as just so many disjointed theses. Rather theology must be regarded as an organic whole in which each part is vitally linked with the others. It is the task of theologians to do this in their own teaching, writing, and preaching; it is their function to set the norm that other preachers can follow in their sermons.

*The Catholic University of America*

ALFRED C. RUSH, C.S.S.R.

SAINT BENEDICT AND HIS TIMES. By Ildephonse Cardinal Schuster, O.S.B. Translated by Gregory J. Roettger, O.S.B. St. Louis: Herder, 1951. Pp. 392. \$6.00.

As the author states in the first chapter, practically the only reliable source of information about the life of St. Benedict is the *Dialogues* of St. Gregory. Gregory, however, did not intend to write a biography in the modern sense, but merely to set down a collection of the more interesting and significant miracles that had occurred in the life of Benedict. Hence Gregory systematically passes over chronological and biographical matters when they are not directly connected with the miracles he is describing.

What Cardinal Schuster attempts to do is to supply the details intentionally omitted by Gregory in the *Dialogues*. Since there is no other reliable

documentary source, the Cardinal is obliged to rely on his own immense store of information on Roman antiquity, the history of the liturgy, canon law, and monastic tradition, for the reconstruction of Benedict's life. With such scanty sources this is a formidable task; no modern scholar comes better equipped for the work than Schuster. Although many of the solutions he offers for disputed questions can be accepted only as probable, his explanations are certainly the best that have been offered to date.

As the framework of his book the author uses the incidents related by Gregory in the *Dialogues*. Excellent as this plan is, we feel that he has been controlled too much by his materials. The attempt to establish an historical setting and a cultural background for each of these incidents results in sixty-three chapters, most of them disappointingly short, and some not altogether successful in establishing their thesis.

The Cardinal proposes some interesting hypotheses and he has the skill and the learning to present them in a telling manner. Some of them will not be accepted by all scholars. For example, we believe that he presumes too much in the nineteenth chapter when he implies that the *Regula monasteriorum* was supported by an official approval of the Holy See or of the local bishops as the accepted code for all the monasteries of Italy or of the West. This theory is not new; it had been proposed before by J. Chapman, and was supported by Schuster himself. Chapman held that the Rule had been written by Benedict at the request of Pope Hormisdas (d. 523) as the official codification of monastic legislation then existing in the West. In his *Note storiche su la "Regula monachorum" di S. Benedetto*, the Cardinal took a similar position but believed that the Rule had been written at the request of Pope Agapitus (535-36). This theory was rejected by other scholars, among them Cabrol and Butler, as untenable, at least on evidence supplied by the *Dialogues*. We do not feel that the arguments offered by Schuster in his new work have changed the picture perceptibly.

Basing his arguments on ecclesiastical discipline and legislation, and interpreting some data from the *Dialogues* in this light, the author defends (as he has done elsewhere) his opinion that St. Benedict was a priest. If we may suppose that Benedict did actually receive an official mandate from the Holy See to carry out the evangelization of the Campania, it would be most reasonable to suppose that he received and accepted a call to Holy Orders. The force of the argument, however, falls or stands on a fact: did he actually receive such a mandate? This point has not been certainly established. The argument based on Gregory's reference to the pastor of the Church of St. Lawrence as a "deserter" because of his attempts to frustrate the work of his fellow priest, Benedict, is telling but not entirely convincing. Other ex-

planations of the passage are possible. The author handles the context very skillfully; but he does not clinch the argument. Gregory may have been referring to the man as a deserter from his duty to the Church, or to the cause of Christ, or to his own ideals. A man who treated a fellow Christian as the pastor of St. Lawrence treated Benedict, might justly be called a deserter of the Church and a traitor to the Christian faith. Cardinal Schuster presents as good a case for the priesthood of Benedict as has yet been offered, but the question remains open.

The book is replete with erudition, yet it will prove interesting and instructive to even the casual reader. Students of the life and times of Benedict will discover an immense storehouse of information. Historians will find it provocative and a fruitful source of suggestions for a solution to many of the problems which obscure the history of a great saint and the origins of a great monastic order. The translation is good and the index adequate.

*Conception Seminary, Conception, Mo.* EDWARD E. MALONE, O.S.B.

LA CRISE RÉVOLUTIONNAIRE. By Jean Leflon. Histoire de l'Eglise, ed. Fliche-Martin, XX. Paris: Bloud and Gay, 1949. Pp. 524.

The present volume of the distinguished history of the Church edited by M. Augustin Fliche and, following the deaths of Monsignors Victor Martin and Emile Amann, by Abbé E. Jarry, is the work of M. Jean Leflon, professor at the Institut Catholique de Paris. It comprises three parts. Part I studies the Church and the French Revolution in five brilliant chapters. Here the author is truly at home and his sketch of the religious history of the Revolution is easily the best available. Part II covers the pontificate of Pius VII (1800-1823). Here again the presentation is in general excellent. For all that concerns Bonaparte and the Church in France, it would be hard to find a better short treatment. Once the story goes beyond the boundaries of France, however, the competency of the author obviously diminishes. And the farther away a country is, the less M. Leflon knows about it. In most instances he does not pretend to give an original treatment; he simply follows other summaries. The rise of the Church in North America is accorded a scant page which is not devoid of inexactitudes. Not a single American historian is even mentioned. Part III treats the pontificates of Leo XII, Pius VIII, and Gregory XVI. Here the treatment is definitely inferior to that of the other parts. On the whole, however, M. Leflon's view of Gregory XVI is fairer than the ordinarily accepted picture.

In the period treated, interest centers primarily, of course, on the increasing hostility of the Revolution to the Church and on the grandiose figure of

Napoleon. M. Leflon is right in giving them a central position in his treatment of general Church history. He brings out very well what a blow the revolutionaries aimed at religion and what a debt the Church owes to the Corsican despite his ruthlessness and open infidelity to his Catholic heritage. On the ecclesiastical side M. Leflon is also justified in making Cardinal Consalvi the hero of the survival of the Church, even somewhat at the expense of Pius VII. Justice is also done to the spiritual stature of the latter. Interest in these central figures and capital events does not blind M. Leflon to the importance of the interior life of the Church. Indeed he stresses its primary value. Unfortunately he devotes very little space to it. The politics of the Papal States receive far more attention than the resurgence of organized religious life within the Church, although this too was due in no small measure to French founders and foundresses. The treatment of the theological formation of the clergy and of the religious life of the people is also the briefest.

Despite these lacunae and some very defective proof reading, the work has lasting value. For most of the period treated the history of the Church in France is of first importance, and that history was inextricably bound up with politics.

*Woodstock College*

E. A. RYAN, S.J.

**THE TUDOR BOOKS OF PRIVATE DEVOTION.** By Helen C. White. Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin, 1951. Pp. 284. \$4.75.

We have here another addition to the impressive list of Miss White's scholarly writings on English literature of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. This book, however, is of interest and value not only to students of English literature; it should prove even more useful to theologians, historians of dogma and religious change, and historians of culture.

The materials which are the primary object of Miss White's scrutiny are sixteenth-century books of private devotion in England. These were of several classes: the Primer, manuals of instruction for prayer and meditation, and books of general spiritual direction of which portions at least were devotional in character. Miss White's book took its rise out of the hypothesis that such books of private devotion should offer valuable material for studying and estimating the very considerable degree of continuity in belief, devotions, and general religious attitudes which persisted throughout the revolutionary changes of Tudor England.

A couple of preliminary chapters summarize and discuss the rich and varied medieval inheritance of prayer and devotion as that inheritance was



kept alive in collections of prayers excerpted from the writings of St. Paul, St. Augustine, and other saints, in the Psalter and the Primer, and in the manner of life and the methods of prayer of the great orders of monks and friars. In her early chapters Miss White is much indebted to the researches of such authorities as Cuthbert Butler, Cabrol, Guardini, Fortescue, Gasquet, and Baudot.

Her own contribution begins with a full and analytical study of the development of the Primer in England. The *Horae beatissimae virginis Mariae* was, as early as the first quarter of the fourteenth century, the accepted prayer book for the medieval layman. The famous *Livres d'heures* in France, the *Hortulus animae* in Germany, and the Primer in England were but developments of the *Horae*, which itself was an offshoot of the Psalter. In almost all early Catholic versions of the *Horae* the following elements appeared: the Hours of the Blessed Virgin Mary, the Seven Penitential Psalms, the Fifteen Gradual Psalms, the Litany, the Office for the Dead, and the Comendations or prayers following the Office for the Dead. Around this stable core clustered other more variable and transient prayers and devotions. The fruit of generations of tradition and accretion and selection, the Primer was characterized by flexibility and adaptation. It was admirably suited, therefore, to the purposes of those who wished to bring about changes in the religious life and spirit. Far from discouraging the use of the Primer, the English Reformers exploited its propaganda value to the utmost.

In successive editions of the English Primer, Miss White finds, two conflicting tendencies were obviously at work. On the one hand, some editors seemed desirous of preserving as much of the traditional in Christian devotion as possible, even though in church government they had already yielded to Erastian influences and shown signs of compromise on certain of the doctrinal controversies. On the other hand, in some of these editions are to be seen the successful efforts of those who were making the Primer an instrument for insinuating new shadings of doctrine and inculcating new attitudes toward the honoring of the Mother of God and the saints, and toward the praying for the dead. For a good part of the time a large number of those who used these books must have been unaware of the significance of the gradually introduced changes. In their unawareness they absorbed the new that was fed them along with the old. The history of the sixteenth-century Primer, therefore, is a striking illustration of the way in which a traditional form might be used in a confused period for the molding of thought and feeling.

Much the same can be said of the use of other types of books of devotion. Miss White mentions (pp. 170-71) the annoyance of Fr. Robert Parsons, S.J.,

upon discovering that his *Booke of Christian Exercise, Appertaining to Resolution* (which Parsons had expanded and adapted from an Italian Jesuit's book) had been taken over and "improved and purified" by one Edmund Bunny, a minister of the Church of England. This Anglican adaptation of Parson's guide to the devout life enjoyed wide favor in Protestant circles in England and continued to exercise an influence well into the seventeenth century.

*The Tudor Books of Private Devotion* is an example of how careful investigation of one of the bypaths of human changes can yield data for generalizations which touch on the very nature of those changes and on the means by which they are effected. One is stirred to melancholy surmise as to what similar means are perhaps being exploited at present in countries in which the Church is being undermined.

*Le Moyne College, Syracuse, N.Y.*

JOHN V. CURRY, S.J.

DAS RECHT DER LAIEN IN DER KIRCHE. By Heinrich Keller, S.J., and Oswald von Nell-Breuning, S.J. Heidelberg: F. H. Kerle, 1950. Pp. 93. 1.80 DM.

Several months before his death Fr. Keller requested Fr. von Nell-Breuning to see through the press his manuscript on the juridical status of the laity in the life of the Church. After the death of the author it was found that the manuscript was in such a state of incompleteness that it could not be prepared for printing without considerable reworking. The result is that the general plan and the materials of the book are Keller's; the actual composition is due to von Nell-Breuning. The latter is quick to admit that this arrangement unhappily cannot bring out all the promise of Keller's thought.

The brochure is meant primarily to give the juridically minded Catholic layman a concise survey of the law of the Church as it touches the status of the layman. However, since all the laity have been called to a greater cooperation in the apostolate of the hierarchy, and since they have been urged on to a more dynamic membership in the Church, in an awareness that they are in some sense the Church itself, it will not be surprising if wider circles of the laity than merely the juridically inclined will find interest and utility in the present juridical study of this more vital and demanding Church-membership of the layman.

In turning to the Code of Canon Law as the source of their study the authors explicitly reject the superficial view that the law of the Church is almost exclusively clerical law, and that the few canons dealing with the layman merely argue a passive dependency of the layman on the clergy in

the life of the Church. They tell us that, if one knows how to read not merely the text of the Code itself but between and behind the lines of that text, then a far more satisfactory impression is yielded than that produced by the quick scrutiny of those relatively few canons dealing explicitly with laymen.

The method of the brochure is the following. First of all, to situate the question more exactly, an effort is made to bring out, partly in the light of canon 87, a clearer idea of what is meant by membership in the Church, a membership which is common to cleric and layman alike; and then to elaborate the distinction between the lay and clerical states. Against this general background the authors go on to survey the Code, book by book, patiently gathering and sifting whatever bears on their subject. The result is much more helpful than one might conjecture, though, as they readily admit, not wholly commensurate with the importance of the question in itself.

What does clearly emerge from the study is the fact that the layman is not merely an object of Church law, but a subject of rights who must take an active part in the life of the Church. Laicism and clericalism are alike spoilers of the integral loving service of the Kingdom of God to which all members of the Church are called. The Holy Father in his recent address to the members of the World Congress of the Apostolate of the Laity has urged that "la plus cordiale entente" obtain between priests and laymen in the work of the apostolate, and has warned against the tragic error that the apostolate of the one is, as it were, in competition with that of the other (cf. *AAS*, XLIII [1951], 789). The spirit of the present work is such that it measures up to the desires of the Holy Father.

*Weston College*

FRANCIS X. LAWLOR, S.J.

PREVIEWS AND PRACTICAL CASES: The Code of Canon Law, Book V, Delicts and Penalties, Canons 2195-2414. By Owen M. Cloran, S.J. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1951. Pp. xvi + 350. \$4.00.

Fr. Cloran's book, like its title, is something rather different. It is an attempt, and a very successful one, to present the penal law of the Code by the case method in an orderly and progressive way; and while it proposes to be practical rather than complete (p. vii), it is an unusually complete treatment of all that the author judges to be practical. Besides the familiar censures, to which many writers limit their attention, this book takes into account also the vindictive penalties occurring in each case and the various ways in which both species may or must be absolved or dispensed.

Besides its exceptional thoroughness of detail, there are several other distinctive features in Fr. Cloran's work; not all, perhaps, are equally com-

mendable. A great part of the book, for instance, is devoted to footnotes containing quotations from other writers. This might have been more discreetly limited to points which really require corroboration or discussion. Even with that limitation, the practice of excerpting passages from several books, instead of incorporating the substance of their thought, is not an indisputable advantage to the reader. The latter method would make for greater clarity and a smoother text, allow more room for presenting and evaluating the arguments, and escape the common tendency to overemphasize secondary sources. The criticism has been made that canonists are too content rather to catalogue opinions than to form them. We have many compilations but few classics.

Another distinctive feature of this book is its tolerance. In fact there are some opinions allowed "in practice," the probability of which will not be generally conceded by canonists: for example, that the reservation of a sin or censure does not obtain if the offender was unaware of the reservation itself (pp. 15-16, 81, 106, 280); that, for the verification of the "manifest public sinners" of canon 1240, n. 1, 6°, delicts—in the strictly technical sense—are required (p. 67); that the censure of canon 2319, n. 1, 1° is not incurred unless, besides the non-Catholic ceremony, there is a Catholic wedding also (pp. 60, 126). Certainly the canonist is not free to dismiss every opinion which, on its intrinsic merits alone, he considers incorrect. He must respect also those views which fulfil the conditions of an extrinsically probable opinion. It is not at all clear, however, that the opinions cited above do fulfil the conditions either of numbers, or of independence, or of authority. (In a specifically canonical question, incidentally, good *moralists* are not always good "authorities.") Granted that the norms of extrinsic probability are very fluid and inexact; still one must draw the line somewhere if we are to escape the unthinkable conclusion that every opinion appearing in print has to be accepted as probable. But the author is familiar, of course, with these generalities; he does not take any cognizance, e.g., of the view of Rodrigo and Regatillo that the habitually insane are not subject to merely ecclesiastical laws, penal or otherwise, even during lucid intervals (p. 11).

An interesting issue is raised by the interplay of probabilities in case 31. Two Catholics attempt marriage before a Protestant minister. The author concludes (1) that they do not certainly incur the censure of canon 2319, n. 1, 1°, (2) that they certainly do incur the Baltimore censure, and (3) that they could be absolved by a priest with faculties for censures reserved by the Code to the local Ordinary, because they probably *did* incur the censure of canon 2319. The problem is not the simultaneous use of both probabilities (probably not incurred and probably incurred), but whether the

two probabilities really are simultaneous in this case. To indicate the difficulty involved, let us propose the following argument. This solution seems to confuse the two notions of the *inclusion* of a case within the law, and the *incurring of a penalty*. They are not the same. If a particular situation probably is not included in the law, the penalty certainly is not incurred. The principle at issue, incidentally, is that of canon 15 (“Leges . . . in dubio iuris non urgent”), not that of canon 2245, n. 4 (“in dubio sive iuris sive facti reservatio non urget”), which supposes that a penalty is incurred and considers only a doubt about the fact or quality of reservation; the doubt in canon 2319 is not whether or how the excommunication is reserved, but whether there is an excommunication at all. In an objective doubt of law, therefore, when a case probably does not come under excommunication (for example), we do not say that the person may be treated as not excommunicated or that he probably is not an excommunicate; we say, or should say, that he *is not* excommunicated. (The distinction is more than verbal. There are some effects which automatically follow excommunication [e.g., canon 925, n. 1; 2262, n. 1]. To say, therefore, that the censure probably was incurred is to say that, notwithstanding the doubt of law, both the excommunication and these effects probably do exist in the objective order; all of which is directly contrary to the “non urgent” of canon 15.) In the case under consideration, therefore, since there is at least a real doubt of law whether the attempt of marriage on the part of two Catholics before a Protestant minister is included in canon 2319, that censure certainly is not incurred. Consequently the Baltimore censure certainly is incurred. For that case certainly is included in the Baltimore law; and to the extent that the Code law does not urge, the Baltimore law remains in force. The same would be true of such a ceremony on the part of a Catholic and an unbaptized non-Catholic. In both cases, therefore, the censure could be absolved only by one who had jurisdiction over the Baltimore censure.

On the other hand, a Catholic attempting marriage before a minister with a *doubtfully baptized* non-Catholic would certainly incur either the Code censure or the Baltimore one. Here there is no doubt of law: if the other party is actually baptized, the Code censure obtains; if not, the Baltimore censure. But there is a doubt of fact as to which it actually is. Hence, in this case, the penitent could be absolved either by a confessor who could absolve only from the Code censure or by one who could absolve only from the Baltimore censure, on the probability, in either alternative, that he has the jurisdiction required by the case. But this is something quite different from case 31.

The author has unfortunately adopted the terminology of “gold” dollars

as opposed to "devaluated" dollars (p. 260), as if the new norm of 1934 were not a gold dollar, which it is, or the former dollar were still an existing norm, which it is not. Some American canonists have, a little uncritically perhaps, borrowed from Europe a manner of speaking which was appropriate to its original problem of a discrepancy between paper currency and gold currency but not to our problem of a change in the gold standard itself. In fact the European canonists themselves did not always adjust their terminology (or their arguments) to the change in economic realities when their own gold norms were devaluated: e.g., the French franc in 1928, the Swiss franc in 1936, the Italian lira in 1927 and again in 1936, the British pound in 1949. It is not merely a question of equating paper money to gold money, but of equating one's present money to the gold values of 1918. As this book was published before the decree of the Sacred Congregation of the Consistory, July 13, 1951 (*AAS*, XLIII [1951], 602-3), obviously it does not contain the new norm for recourse to the Holy See.

In the course of the excellent specimen analysis of canon 2341 we read: ". . . it is citation [before a lay tribunal] of a cleric as *plaintiff* and *in his own name* that is penalized, and not citation of a cleric as . . . *administrator* of a *moral person* or *juridical entity*; hence a suit against the diocese as such or against an ecclesiastical institution is not included in the penalty" (p. 321). It may be possible to have a suit against a diocese which does not necessarily imply the citation of the local Ordinary. But in a situation in which the suit does indirectly but inevitably involve the citation of his person, as when the property of a diocese is held and administered by the Ordinary himself as a corporation-sole, this distinction becomes very dubious. The Sacred Congregation of the Council declared in 1928 that excommunication had been incurred by certain clerics for citing their bishop in court. The document (*AAS*, XX [1928], 146) does not give the details; but Vermeersch (who was a consultant of that Congregation at the time) comments on the case as follows: "Cum litem civilem movissent non directe contra Episcopi personam, sed indirecte, aggrediendo personam moralem ad quam temporalis administratio pertinet, falso existimarunt se propterea non esse obnoxios censurae quam canon 2341 infligit iis qui ausi sint proprium Ordinarium ad iudicem laicum trahere. Subtilem istam evasionem, S. Congregatio reiecit" (*Periodica*, XVII [1928], 138-39).

Several final observations may be grouped together as "jottings." The question of cooperation in delicts is admittedly one of the most difficult aspects of this treatise. Fr. Cloran has handled it well both in principle and in its applications. But physical cooperation is not limited to cooperation "in the very act of placing a delict" (p. 40); nor are the cooperators of canon

2209, nn. 1-3 and "necessary" cooperators simply coextensive, as the author seems to suggest (pp. 150, 320). He does not often leave any doubt as to his position on a given issue; it is not clear, however, whether he holds without qualification that integral confession is probably not required in the reception of doubtfully baptized converts, or only that it cannot be proved in general, prescinding from instructions of the Holy See for particular territories, such as the United States (p. 78, note 11). Again, the mere fact of sending a child to a sectarian school does not necessarily imply education or institution "in religione acatholica," as is suggested (p. 63). In the expression "aliud matrimonium . . . attentaverint" of canon 2356, as elsewhere, the word "attentare" is simply the proper term for attempting marriage and does not indicate that unmitigated guilt is required for the penalty (p. 147). Nor does the clause "facto verbo cum Sanctissimo" necessarily indicate an extensive interpretation (p. 112). There is apparently a slip of the pen in the conclusion of case 48 (p. 150), in which it is said that a certain party can be absolved from excommunication who, according to the preview of the case, would not have been excommunicated. The author justifies our continued enjoyment of the extended time for fulfilling the Easter Duty by a rather questionable appeal to custom based on the original indult of 1830 (p. 65, note 1). This can be explained more easily and more juridically on other principles: unlike a dispensation (canon 86), a rescript in general or a privilege in particular does not automatically cease with the cessation of its final cause; and, according to canon 4, this indult was not revoked by the Code. It remains, therefore, not as a custom but as an indult.

Fr. Cloran's book is very much up to date. He incorporates all the most recent documents of the Holy See in this matter. The extensive bibliography contains the latest editions and shows an appreciation of the many good English-language works in this field, notably the Canon Law dissertations of the Catholic University of America. He has made commendable use of the collection of particular censures and reserved sins of the American dioceses. There are several schematic charts, but the value of charts is rather in composing than in having them. One addition that would make this work an even more useful contribution would be a second index according to the canons of the Code.

*Woodstock College*

JOHN J. REED, S.J.

THE MYSTERY OF BEING, II: FAITH AND REALITY. By Gabriel Marcel. Translated from the French by René Hague. Chicago: Henry Regnery, 1951. Pp. 188. \$3.75.

Gabriel Marcel's effort in the Gifford Lectures at the University of Aberdeen in 1949 and 1950 has been concentrated on the concrete as opposed to the conceptual approach to being. It is principally because of this approach, which has a more or less existential orientation, that he has come to be known as *the* "Christian existentialist." Quite apart from any comment on the validity or aptness of such a title, there is no doubt but that the metaphysic of Marcel is somewhat unique in its point of departure and in its development—so much so, that the bulk of Scholastic philosophers find themselves a bit piqued at his heavy style and his avoidance of neatly clipped definitions.

In the first volume of these lectures (*The Mystery of Being, I: Reflection and Mystery*) Marcel's ontology developed, out of the notion of being, an exigence for the transcendent which is latent in the consciousness of being. The second volume has for its scope the further development of this exigence, a further exigence of being which is the exigence for God, i.e., "simply the exigence of transcendence disclosing its true face, a face that was shown to us before shrouded in veils." This ulterior exigence becomes ultimate when it develops into the exigence for faith in God.

Marcel's distinction between being and existence seems to mean the difference between the soul's consciousness of being and the total body-soul relationship which is existence. He quotes from Charles Du Bos' *Dialogue avec André Gide*: "from a faith which has never been shaken, not even in the bosom of religious unbelief: a faith in the existence of the soul on the one hand, and on the other of the constant watch from above which the soul keeps over all the conditions and manifestations of *me*: I am never without the mysterious feeling of the presence and at the same time the distance of the soul at every moment of our life." The seeming contradictory of "presence" and simultaneous "distance" helps man to define his own being, or better, his consciousness of his own being. Marcel says: "What Du Bos here calls the soul, is in reality my own being."

Yet, in the question of existence, a "thingness" (not Kant's *Dinglichkeit*) enters in whereby the body becomes the central criterion to which all judgments of existence must be referred. This "thingness" is neither completely immaterial nor totally corporeal. An irreducible duality lies at the basis of the existent, whereby "the existent is at the same time a thing and yet in some way more than a thing." The body is a thing in so far as it is subject to accident, but "ill-treatment can be understood only in so far as the victim is thought of as a subject or, if you like, as a centre." Ill-treatment happens "to a certain living somebody; nothing could happen to a mere *thing*, because



it has no interiority, no life of its own, it is *ownless*." These words lose all their meaning when applied to a thing which is nothing more than a thing.

Another cardinal point in Marcel's ontology lies in what he calls the inter-subjectivity of the consciousness of being: "I concern myself with being only in so far as I have a more or less distinct consciousness of the underlying unity which ties me to other beings of whose reality I already have a preliminary notion." Consequently the Cartesian *cogito* attenuates what Marcel calls the "density" of being and hence loses its validity as a starting point for the ontological enquiry. In place of "I think," Marcel begins with the inter-subjectivity of the consciousness of being which he calls "we are."

In the final analysis it is this consciousness of being as related to other beings that involves an exigence for a transcendent reality which is authentic, in which I can have faith simply because it is reality albeit transcendent. Faith in God, through the media of grace and free will, means the salvation of man. Salvation is nothing if not a liberation from death, and that liberation can be found only on a supraterrrestrial plane and in dimensions which are not those of history.

Students of Marcel's ontology will relish this second volume on the *Mystery of Being* because it rounds out conclusively the method of Marcel, a method which necessarily goes laden with an abundance of questions for the philosopher to ask.

*Fordham University*

VICTOR R. YANITELLI, S.J.

ETHICS. By Vernon J. Bourke. New York: Macmillan, 1951. Pp. xii + 497.

The first reading of Dr. Bourke's *Ethics* will undoubtedly impress one with the scholarliness and clarity of this textbook for college students of philosophy. Although the author purposely avoids giving too much attention to the history of ethical theories (this is beyond the scope of the present work), he does take cognizance of the various historical views on the subject and gives adequate references for a thorough study of them. The book may rightly be called a treatise on Christian ethics and not the study of merely natural philosophy, for the author constantly reminds the student of the inadequacy of purely natural ethics and endeavors to relate natural ethics with moral theology. This manner of treating natural ethics might have led Dr. Bourke into the mistake of devoting too much time to the very practical and interesting discussions which belong principally to moral theology, but for the most part he did not succumb to this temptation. The style is clear,

to the point, and free from undue wordiness. He manifests a deep understanding of the subject and has excellent facility in presenting the matter in an appetizing way. The topics are treated quite philosophically throughout, but any dryness that could result from purely philosophical explanations is avoided by apt and interesting illustrations.

The book is divided into two parts, respectively entitled "Moral Principles" and "Ethical Problems." Part I is made up of eight chapters of general ethics in which are elucidated the universal principles on which the practical science of ethics is based. Part II, the last eight chapters of the work, teaches the student how to apply the general principles to the typical fields of moral problems. This section treats what is usually termed special ethics. Each chapter of Part I ends with a short and useful summary of the contents of the preceding pages and this summary is followed by an appendix of English translations from the works of St. Thomas. These translations are intended to provide background reading for the student. At the end of each chapter there is also added a well-selected list of readings for the student of average ability and for those who are ready for more advanced work. The teacher should find in the "Topics for Assignment" useful suggestions for weekly written tasks. Although the index to the volume is, in general, well done, it could have been somewhat more complete. Some subjects treated in the book are not listed in the index; other subjects to which one would expect cross references are found in only one place. If the index contained complete cross references to commonly employed synonyms of the subjects treated, the value of this book would, it seems, be enhanced not a little, especially for students who consult it long after their college days are over.

The purpose which Dr. Bourke presumably had in mind was to produce a volume which would enable college and university students in our country, under the direction of a capable teacher, to learn certain fundamental principles of conduct and to acquire some readiness in applying these principles to various ways of living so as to judge correctly of their morality. In Part I the author has given a well-thought-out presentation of the general principles. Throughout he tries to keep close (in the opinion of some, perhaps too close) to the content and the mode of expression found in the works of St. Thomas. Following this procedure, Dr. Bourke provides, in the field of general ethics, explanations of such topics as "the moral law and ethics," "the nature of moral conscience," "the practical syllogism," and the like, which are clear, interesting, and adequate. But in the field of special ethics there are many matters whose importance is much greater today than in the time of St. Thomas. As the author himself notes: "St. Thomas lived under very different circumstances of life from those of the average man in the twen-

tieth century" (p. v). Dr. Bourke, then, while writing this volume, apparently adverted to this difference, but, in the opinion of this writer, he has failed to give adequate treatment to many subjects which are at present of great moment in this country. It seems, moreover, that he has included in Part II altogether too many topics for a college textbook. The list of subjects which might be studied in the field of ethics (especially in the case of Christian ethics which borrows from moral theology) is so great that some selection is called for. It would be difficult for the teacher to expound, with any attempt at adequacy, the wide variety of subjects which are found in Part II. It would seem preferable, e.g., to have omitted such treatises as those on the supernatural life, in which the author discusses many questions (such as the theological virtues and the gifts of the Holy Spirit) which do not properly belong in the field of natural philosophy. He might also have omitted such topics as divination, sorcery, tempting God, sacrilege, and simony, even though he does not develop them in great detail. The same may be said of his observations about the office of a bishop, apostasy, whipping as a punishment, and some other points of lesser importance (and perhaps of little interest) to the college or university student of philosophy. To require the teacher to explain such a wide variety of subject matter during the limited time of two semesters would be to force him to treat very superficially many topics. Such a procedure, moreover, would tend to dissipate the efforts of the student and to distract his attention from matters of greater moment. Would it not be preferable not to include the subject at all rather than to mention it only in passing? No doubt many readers will heartily approve of the author's omission of subjects such as woman's suffrage, the use of coffee and tobacco, the morality of bull-fighting and cock-fighting, but why omit topics such as duelling, boxing, and vivisection? And in such a book would not one expect to find a lengthy treatise of the many new phases of warfare which have come into prominence within the last fifteen years? Dr. Bourke does not touch upon many of the moral problems connected with modern warfare, e.g., obliteration air bombing, reprisals, the definition of combatants. The subject of war, which is so vital an issue today in the lives of a large portion of our college students, is very inadequately treated. Eugenic sterilization, a topic of great importance today, is given very brief and unsatisfactory treatment. The same may be said of euthanasia, the principle of justifiable self-defense, the strike, and social justice. What the author has written about Communism is excellent, but there is so much more which could and perhaps should have been said about the workings, the objectives, and the methods of today's Communists which would bring home to the college student the burning fanaticism, the horrible inhumanity, and the

utter folly of Communism in the world of 1952. His treatment of the menace of contraceptive practices is very abbreviated. In view of the importance which this question has for our national well-being, and in view of the tireless efforts of the Planned Parenthood groups to persuade even Catholics that artificial birth control is not only a licit but an advisable practice, one would reasonably expect a much fuller analysis of the subject than is found here. In the index one looks in vain for the words "planned parenthood," "birth control," "birth prevention," and "artificial birth control," although mention is made of "artificial contraception." In three lines the author disposes of the birth controllers' commonly employed arguments that are based on so-called social, eugenic, and economic reasons. It is quite true that the teacher can develop any of the topics of the book which are treated too sketchily, but it would be much more useful for the students if the text itself contained adequate treatment.

The points which have been adversely criticized above are not of major importance and should not be thought to deprive this volume of its substantial value. Undoubtedly teachers of ethics who are of a strictly Thomistic outlook, and many others as well, will welcome Dr. Bourke's scholarly, interesting, and practical presentation of so much of St. Thomas' writings on ethics.

*Gregorian University, Rome*

EDWIN F. HEALY, S.J.

NEWER ETHICAL PROBLEMS IN MEDICINE AND SURGERY. By Bernard J. Ficarra, M.D., K.S.G. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1951. Pp. 168. \$3.75.

Dr. Ficarra received his medical degrees from Georgetown University Medical School. He is a practicing surgeon in Brooklyn, N.Y., attached to the surgical staffs of Kings County Hospital, Brooklyn Cancer Institute, St. Peter's Hospital, and the Hospital of the Holy Family. His surgical training began at Kings County Hospital, where he served successively as surgical interne, resident in pathology, assistant resident surgeon, and finally resident surgeon. Following this residency training he served as a Fellow in Surgery at the Lahey Clinic, Boston, Mass. Author of over seventy scientific articles published in the medical and surgical journals of America and Europe, author of two books on surgery, Dr. Ficarra obviously has the background needed for a discussion of "newer ethical problems in medicine and surgery." One is pleasantly surprised to discover that his cultural life keeps abreast of his surgical attainments. We find quotations from Euripides, Erasmus, Schiller, Walter Pater, and other men of letters, science, and

government. Moreover, his understanding of ethical principles matches his knowledge of medical and surgical principles.

The book is divided into thirteen chapters. Some of the topics are those treated in all medical ethics books: abortion, ectopic gestation, mutilation, sterilization, improper use of drugs, contraception, euthanasia, artificial insemination. Quite singular to this book are the chapters on socialized medicine, autopsies, moral aspects of professional conduct, and compensation medicine. In his treatment of the subjects common to all medical ethics texts, Dr. Ficarra expresses moral truths in amazingly simple and accurate language. The ethical field is delineated clearly and quickly. Information in the sciences of anatomy, physiology, and biochemistry is not offered, since these subjects are presumably known by the doctors for whom the book is written. If one wishes simple, clear, accurate statements of the moral problems and the same kind of solution, he will find them in this work; elements of biology, the working of the RH factor, etc., he will not find.

The chapter on euthanasia is singularly well done. It runs for 39 of the 168 pages. The historical, legal, ideological, sentimental, moral and immoral arguments for euthanasia are given in proper perspective. Dr. Ficarra lists three extremely diverse opinions with respect to euthanasia: (1) voluntary euthanasia to be administered only upon request of the sufferer for whom no cure is known to medical science; (2) application of euthanasia only to those in early life who are doomed to live useless lives because of impaired development, teratological structure, or birth accidents; (3) included among those to be "euthanasized" are not only the congenital defectives, the aged, and those suffering from incurable diseases, but also the incurably insane, the paralytic, and the helpless criminal. When one reads the opinions quoted by Ficarra, one recalls the remark supposedly made by a psychiatrist when attacked for not believing in God: "The psychiatrist is too powerful and omniscient to have room for Jehovah." The tragic comedy or the comic tragedy of the whole matter is that these physicians do not realize that they are demanding for themselves or for their patients a power of God. Among the ministers in favor of euthanasia are named Potter and Dean Inge. On the other hand there are several powerful quotations of the Pope condemning euthanasia and a short statement of Lord Horder upholding the same condemnation.

In this chapter on euthanasia the legal status on the matter of mercy killing is also given. Decisions of judges and juries are presented, and it is evident that juries may be more lenient than the law. Dr. Ficarra states: "These statutes in general follow common law principles, however; therefore,

even if the element of malice be omitted mercy killing still contains all the elements of manslaughter" (p. 64). All intelligent people realize that the law may be changed. Attempts have been made to change the law in Great Britain, Nebraska, and New York by the introduction of bills justifying mercy killing. Intelligent people realize that, as long as the legal jurisprudence of Holmes is in the ascendancy, we are liable to have on the law books whatever a vociferous crowd insists is the will of the majority. This chapter of Dr. Ficarra's book brings the reader right up to the present climate of opinion in the matter of euthanasia.

The legal statutes on the various subjects treated are always given. Thus Dr. Ficarra summarizes state laws on the prohibition of contraceptives, and the legal aspect of sterilization, abortion, and artificial insemination. It is very convenient to have the legal and moral principles—their diversity and agreement—not only in one volume, but even in one chapter.

The book has eighty references and an index of six pages. Appropriate and approving forewords are given by Dr. Francis J. Connell, C.S.S.R., and Bishop John King Mussio of Steubenville, Ohio. It is a very useful and pleasant book to have at hand. Its merit lies in this: it is what it claims to be.

*Woodstock College*  
*Georgetown University Medical School*

JOHN J. McLAUGHLIN, S.J.

MARRIAGE, MORALS, AND MEDICAL ETHICS. By Frederick L. Good, M.D., LL.D., and Reverend Otis F. Kelly, M.D. New York: Kenedy, 1951. Pp. xviii + 202.

This brief, clear discussion of medico-moral problems connected with marriage is supplemented by an informative chapter-outline of psychiatry and a ten-page treatment of baptism and extreme unction. In their proper fields the high-principled and competent co-authors write with a commendable sureness and a laudable clarity. They are successful in presenting medical matters in language that can be understood by the uninitiate. Not a few, however, will be disappointed when they go to this book as "the definitive Catholic statement." It is not that, but a courageous, somewhat "dated" presentation of the mind of two responsible Catholics.

This book should have an index. Some reference should be made to the recent literature in the field. On many points—on abdominal puncture for hydramnios, for instance, or on the use of basal temperature charts as a means of calculating ovulation, or on the setting of a time limit to the use of the vaginal douche under circumstances in which it could be permitted at all—it would be most helpful to know whether the authors hold certain

opinions despite recent discussion or because they have not seen and considered the arguments advanced by other competent medical men and moralists.

*St. Mary's College*

FRANCIS P. FURLONG, S.J.

**MEDICO-MORAL PROBLEMS.** By Gerald Kelly, S.J. 3 parts. St. Louis: Catholic Hospital Association, 1949, 1950, 1951. Pp. 56, 45, 45.

Readers of *Hospital Progress*, the publication of the Catholic Hospital Association, will be familiar with most of the articles contained in these three booklets; they appeared in the magazine periodically through the years 1948-1951. It would be a mistake, however, to conclude that they will be of interest only to the administrative personnel of hospitals. While the approach to the problems is from the viewpoint of the hospital, the articles will have a much wider appeal and will be useful not only to the rest of the medical profession but to the clergy as well. The booklets contain quite thorough treatments of more than thirty modern medico-moral problems.

The approach taken by Fr. Kelly in handling medical problems is as valuable as the contents of the booklets. No medical man will set these articles down without the feeling that the subject has been handled honestly and fairly. Nowhere does Fr. Kelly assume a dogmatic role, imposing morality upon medicine. His whole purpose is to show that good morality is also good medicine. He carefully avoids the position of a referee in a supposed clash between medicine and morality, chalking up victories for morality at the expense of medicine. He is always at pains to show that a victory for morality is also a victory for medicine. He would not deny, of course, that morality often poses a challenge to medicine, but it is precisely by accepting this challenge that medicine makes progress. A clear indication is brought out in the article on abortion, where present-day figures show that (due largely to moral proddings) the distinction between therapeutic and criminal abortion has become, even medically speaking, a fiction. And once the distinction has been accepted as meaningless in medicine, we can devoutly hope that the civil law itself will give way to the facts.

While Fr. Kelly does an excellent job in bringing out the distinction between direct and indirect abortion, one wonders if the untrained mind, which tends toward an intentional rather than an objective morality, will grasp the distinction. There is a tendency to judge the morality of abortion by the intention rather than by the nature of the act itself. Would it not be better to confine the use of the term abortion to the removal of the fetus itself and distinguish it from an ordinary mutilating operation on a mother (who

happens to be pregnant)? Such terminology would bring out clearly the objective distinction between the two acts. It would be clear that the mother was the object of one act, the fetus the object of the other. With this terminology I believe the untrained would see more clearly the moral distinction between the two acts. Referring to both actions as abortion tends to confuse the moral issue in the minds of those who do not distinguish too well between the object and the effect of an act. Moreover, confining the use of the term abortion to direct abortion would allow one to set down without any qualification the principle that abortion is always illicit. There would be no danger, then, of being deceived by a good intention in determining the morality of abortion. But Fr. Kelly has had wide experience in this field and may have found the classic distinction readily understandable even to the lay mind.

Articles on current moral problems are always liable to be "dated" by subsequent pronouncements of the Holy See. Fr. Kelly's articles on artificial insemination and rhythm were originally published before the allocutions of Pius XII touching on these two subjects. He was able, fortunately, to insert a note in the reprint indicating the mind of the Pontiff on the subject of artificial insemination from the husband, but one feels that he would have done more to support the position taken by the Pope had the article been written later. The mere statement that this type of insemination is opposed to the dignity of marriage needs a little amplification to be convincing, particularly to those who may be the victims of a certain medical bias. The man with a scientific viewpoint is not apt to appreciate the advantages of a human act over a syringe as an instrument of generation. In fact, he will probably consider the latter a superior instrument. He has to be shown that marriage is a human, not simply an industrial, society and that God never intended the production of human life to be patterned on the production of automobiles or refrigerators.

Fr. Kelly was not so fortunate in bringing the article on rhythm up to date. But here the practical bearing of the allusion made by the Holy Father was not so significant. Moralists were already agreed that the indiscriminate practice of rhythm would be sinful; they were divided only on the reason why it was sinful and the gravity of the sin. The Holy Father assigned as the reason the positive duty incumbent on those who use the marriage right to provide for the conservation of the species. He also implied that the prolonged practice of rhythm without serious reason would be gravely sinful. Whether he meant to put an end to the disagreement among moralists on these two issues is not clear, but I do not doubt that moralists will rally round his position on both of them. Certainly it coincides with an opinion already expressed by Fr. Kelly himself.



The subject of lobotomy is treated in three separate articles, two dealing with lobotomy for psychic (and psychoneurotic) disorders, the third with lobotomy for intractable pain. Since this whole subject is still largely controversial and psychosurgery is very much in the experimental stage, Fr. Kelly was not able to lay down very specific norms. Following the general principles for experimental remedies he demands that lobotomy for psychic disorders be a last resort, although he would make allowance for earlier lobotomy (once it gets out of the experimental stage) where delay would make the surgery less effective. At the present time I think the "last resort" condition must be emphasized. The harassed psychiatrist, much pressed for time, feels a strong temptation to use shortcuts. One wonders, too, whether the present tendency to resort rather readily to shock treatment and psychosurgery is an indication of the value of such treatment or of the harassed condition of the psychiatrist. This much is true: psychotherapy is time consuming. The psychiatrist will accordingly have to guard constantly against the temptation to sacrifice the patient to time.

Perhaps another observation on the subject of lobotomy is in place. Fr. Kelly refers to the psychiatrists' claim that there is no impairment of intellectual activity resulting from lobotomy; they maintain that only personality changes are involved. One wonders whether these two claims can be made simultaneously. Can one change the personality of a fundamentally rational being without a change in the intellectual faculty itself? Perhaps a distinction must be made between the speculative and the practical intellect. Psychosurgery may leave speculative thinking intact but it does seem to interfere with the practical intellect. This intellect, which depends in its judgments on controlled emotional drives, must, it seems, be affected by surgery which seems to dissociate those drives.

One would like to see the eventual publication of these articles in book form. Since Fr. Kelly contributes regularly to *Hospital Progress*, it should not take long to accumulate a number of articles sufficient for the proportions of a book. When the time comes, this reviewer would cast a wholehearted vote for its publication.

*West Baden College*

JOHN R. CONNERY, S.J.

NATURE AND TREATMENT OF MENTAL DISORDERS. By Dom Thomas V. Moore, O.S.B., Ph.D., M.D. 2nd enlarged ed.; New York: Grune and Stratton, 1951. Pp. x + 362.

Having reviewed the original (1943) in these pages (V [1944], 103-4), I should like to recommend this second edition and stress its importance for

priests. Throughout the volume Dom Moore stresses the role and value of religion in therapy. That angle, in connection with the various disorders treated, makes the book almost indispensable for the priest. Very often, too, priests are asked for a short treatment of Freudian psychoanalysis (or of Jung and Adler). Dom Moore provides that here. In view of the keen interest and activity of Protestant clergymen in the field of pastoral psychology in general and in Carl Roger's non-directive therapy in particular, it is really surprising that Moore does not mention them in the enlarged edition.

The important addition to be noted here is Appendix B, on the nature and treatment of homosexual disorders. Dom Moore prudently adopts a cautious attitude in regard to the alleged biological etiology of this disorder. While the biological causation has not been adequately proved, the possible conditionings of this type of behavior are considerable (p. 345). Priests would do well to study them for use in therapy. Again, religious therapy is strongly urged and the author counsels against despair on the part either of the patient or of the therapist. Presumably speaking of overt homosexuals, he interdicts their admission to religion or, as a rule, to the ranks of the diocesan clergy. What of covert tendencies of this sort? Some moralists would not exclude them per se; they would deal with each case on its own merits. But they would demand, by way of compensation, well-schooled self-control and deep spirituality.

*Woodstock College*

HUGH J. BIHLER, S.J.

**OUR BISHOPS SPEAK: National Pastorals and Annual Statements of the Hierarchy of the United States, 1919-1951.** Edited by Raphael M. Huber, O.F.M.Conv. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1952. \$6.00.

Thirty years ago, under the auspices of the National Catholic Welfare Council, the late Msgr. Peter Guilday edited and published *The National Pastorals of the American Hierarchy, 1791-1919*. That volume, containing Bishop Carroll's pastoral letter of 1792, the pastorals issued by the various Provincial and Plenary Councils of Baltimore, and the pastoral letter of the American bishops of 1919, has long held rank as one of the most important collections of documents for the history of the Catholic Church in the United States. Now that earlier volume has been joined by an equally important sequel, again issued under the auspices of the NCWC. The inspiration for the present book stems largely from Archbishop John T. McNicholas, O.P., who unfortunately died before the work appeared. The actual task of editing the documents has been competently done by Fr. Raphael Huber of the Catholic University in Washington.

The volume is divided into four sections. The first part contains the statements issued by the bishops at their yearly meeting in the National Capital. Though at first these statements were issued irregularly, they are now a yearly event of the episcopal meeting, and are expected and received with increasing respect, not only by the Catholic faithful but by the American public in general. The second, rather brief, section contains resolutions and letters of the hierarchy sent to various individuals, from President Wilson to the Chairman of the War Manpower Commission. The third division contains various resolutions and statements of the hierarchy on a wide number of topics, ranging through the problem of disarmament, the Legion of Decency, universal military training, federal aid to education, Communist persecution of religion, and other matters. The final section contains the statements of the Administrative Board of the NCWC, again on a variety of topics, from the Bishops' Program of Social Reconstruction issued in 1919 to last year's widely noted statement on God's law as the measure of human conduct.

The student of American church history cannot afford to be without this book. Nor should it be overlooked by serious students of our present-day society who are seeking realistic criticisms of its faults and weaknesses.

*College of St. Francis Xavier,  
New York City*

FRANCIS X. CURRAN, S.J.

PAPAL PRONOUNCEMENTS ON THE POLITICAL ORDER. Edited by Francis J. Powers, C.S.V. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1952. Pp. xii + 245. \$3.50.

Fr. Powers, Assistant Professor of Politics at the Catholic University in Washington, has given us an excellent collection of 312 papal statements on the political order. Dividing his materials into six major sections, each with its own introduction, he has covered the following topics: the Church and the citizen in the social order, the origin and nature of the state and civil authority, the purpose and function of the state, Church and State, law and liberty, and the international order. Socio-economic questions are touched upon only insofar as these are the concern of the state.

The volume is subject to definite limitations, of which the editor is aware: the citations are very brief and the serious student will immediately realize the futility of appealing to short excerpts taken out of their context as conclusive indications of the fundamental thought of any particular Pontiff. This deficiency is balanced, however, by the inclusion of a complete bibliography of sources for further reference. The collection is also limited to pronouncements from the time of Leo XIII. Certainly there have been

earlier statements of crucial importance for an understanding of papal political doctrine, particularly with reference to Church and State. Gelasius and Boniface VIII are cases in point. An excerpt from the latter's *Unam sanctam* might at least render the reader wary of the purely verbal interpretation of papal documents. \

An outstanding value of this collection lies in the inclusion of so many of the recent statements of Pius XII, for it is in these pronouncements that we may discern a profound evolution of papal thought on matters political. It is frequently forgotten by modern controversialists that the modern concept of the state is a product of sociological, philosophical, and historical development. Thus the authoritative statements of the magisterium exhibit an evolving consciousness of the similarly evolving reality with which they are dealing. Today no one quotes Boniface VIII or the other medieval canonist-Popes with great enthusiasm, because their teaching is recognized as dated in many aspects. Even in Leo XIII the emphasis is on a paternalistic form of government. People are urged to be obedient, to be subservient to law and authority, and loyal to their historic traditions. Society in Leo's day was still mainly monarchical, even authoritarian.

But in the pontificate of Pius XII a revolution takes place. Now there is an almost complete preoccupation with the dynamism of the people. For the first time a Pope has not merely granted that democracy is in itself a licit form of government but has explicitly approved it as the political form seemingly best suited to the modern temperament. Moreover, this is with Pius XII not a mere speculative approval but a fundamental assumption in innumerable pronouncements. The people are to be conceived dynamically, as possessing the principle of their being and operation within themselves. The formal content of the juridical framework of each country is made the responsibility of the people. It is upon them that devolves the duty of injecting the principles of Christian morality into the legal system. No longer are the people merely to obey their rulers in conformity with the juridical arrangements of past ages; they are now urged to transform the milieu in which they live along new lines, which will combine the values of a democratic culture with the eternal values of Christianity. Take this significant declaration: "To safeguard the inviolable sphere of the rights of the human person and to facilitate the fulfilment of his duties should be the essential office of every public authority. Does this not follow from the true concept of the common good which the State is called upon to promote? Hence it follows that care of such common good does not imply a power over the members of the community so extensive that by virtue of it the public authority can interfere with the evolution of that individual activity . . . or

determine at will the manner of his physical, spiritual, religious and moral movements in opposition to the personal duties or rights of man . . ." (p. 62). Here and elsewhere Pius XII insinuates strongly that the Church must take cognizance of a new reality in social evolution and that there can be a rapprochement between the eternal principles of the Church and the similarly valid principles of democracy as it is realized in modern society, without detriment to the rights of either. Catholic scholars have yet to explore all the aspects of this problem, but their researches would seem to have pontifical approbation. Fr. Powers' little volume, therefore, should be useful, particularly for study groups, since it is well organized and of manageable length, and the price renders it more accessible than other recent collections.

*Woodstock College*

FRANCIS J. GROGAN, S.J.

**THE FLIGHT FROM GOD.** By Max Picard. Introduction by J. M. Cameron. Chicago: Henry Regnery, 1951. Pp. xxii + 183. \$2.50.

The "flight" is a state of mind, a defection from God. Although this malady has plagued man in every age, it is particularly virulent and widespread today. Notwithstanding the catastrophies of two world wars in one generation, "the men of the flight" still assert that man needs not God, for man possesses within himself infinite capacity for betterment. Rejecting God they fashion false gods, patterned in some degree on the true God; and so they indulge in devices, and mouth lifeless formulas or slogans, to deceive themselves and delude the masses. Engrossed as many of them are in economic affairs, they exalt them into "something transcendent"; they accord the economic system a reverence and service they deny to God. In their blindness they "would rather their soul were shaken by the economic system than by God" (p. 100). Lost to a true sense of values, they stress the trivial and belittle what is important. Their pernicious ideas and distortion of values have affected literature and art, religion and politics, love and the family. No phase of contemporary life has escaped their contamination. This turning away from God, this refusal to live according to His precepts, is the malignancy that threatens ruin to mankind; for, tortured by unhappiness and a soul-consuming restlessness, they seek cure in further flight, new defection and apostasy from God. But, flee as they will, God still pursues His creatures in an effort to save them from themselves and from ultimate, irrevocable disaster.

This book is not easy reading; it will mystify many. Born in Baden of Swiss-Jewish parents, Max Picard was converted to Catholicity. The translator warns the reader that Picard is a poet rather than a philosopher, a

“man of powerful imagination.” And when Picard gives free rein to his fancy the reader is taxed to discover his thought and meaning in a maze of imagery and allegory, which in one instance borders on the fantastic. Some statements, as they stand, may be challenged or denied. All in all, this is a unique book comprehensible to the few.

*West Baden College*

CHARLES H. METZGER, S.J.

THE MEANING OF CIVILIZATION. By Bohdan Chudoba. New York: Kenedy, 1951. Pp. xi + 314. \$4.00.

It is a pleasant experience to turn from the prevailing “ism-dominated” interpretations of such terms as civilization, culture, history, and progress, to this calm, erudite commentary on them, made in the light of a deep and wide acquaintance with sacred and profane knowledge. Maritain, among others, has noted how addicted the minor and major prophets of the last hundred years, allegedly the golden age of positivism, have been to mounting the tripod and prophesying on these subjects. Not the least merit of Prof. Chudoba’s book is his graceful demonstration of the essential emptiness of their oracular utterances, a situation due largely to their ignorance of the nature of man. Apart from such well-known examples as Taine, Hegel, and Spengler, the author writes wisely on such minor matters as Seignobos’ distinction between the main cause of an historical event and its secondary causes, the difference between which is to be ascertained by sympathetic insight. He points out that Toynbee’s concentration on civilizations as the only intelligible units in history can easily obscure the fact that civilizations themselves are but the products, under God, of the creative activity of man. The idealistic and materialistic explanations of man, Chudoba shows, have no meaning for the historian. Both of themselves make history irrelevant, no matter what efforts subscribers to these systems make to write history.

For the author, the primary subject of interest for an historian is the creative activity of man as an individual personality. It is this type of activity which produces that “ensemble of ideas, works, instruments, customs and institutions known to us only from historical research, or one still existent in a state in which no change at all or only slight changes are perceptible,” i.e., a civilization. The only explanation of this phenomenon which does full justice to the nature of man and his activity is the Christian. It alone fully guarantees the full freedom of the individual, from which all new human values rise. As a consequence, it alone holds the key to the true concept of progress, “every change in the life of man which excels the realm of the laws of matter and of instincts, and, by doing so, creates new values.” This

view of the role of the individual in history, based on research and observation, has been discussed, in its metaphysical implications, by Moorhouse I. X. Millar, S.J. (*The Catholic Philosophy of History*, ed. Ross J. S. Hoffman [N. Y.: Kenedy, 1931], pp. 85-109). Fr. Millar demonstrates how this Christian concept of historical man escapes both the Scylla of determinism and the Charybdis of complete indeterminism.

In the second section of the book, entitled "The Ancient Background," Chudoba surveys the values inherited by Western civilization from those which had gone before. In the third section, "Aspects of Christian Culture," the values inherent in Christianity are discussed. On the connection between the "background" and Christian civilization, the author rightly points out that the latter does not consist of a set of entirely new values, but in a transformation and perfecting of the older by the Incarnation. "The birth, life, death, and resurrection of Christ, the Incarnation of the Word of God," the author states, "is the central fact of all the Christian culture." What we do, he adds, is only a participation in Christ's heritage. This participation, however, is no small thing, as the history of the world since the Incarnation testifies. Unfortunately, historical man, as Augustine observed, apparently is not content with participation. In revolt against his own contingency, he is peculiarly vulnerable to a desire to "ape God," with the consequence that the centuries since Christ have not been notable for security and peace.

Apart from his exposition of the traditional Christian concept of man in history, Chudoba's writing contains many observations of considerable insight. Particularly relevant to the current situation is his discussion of the position of the pure individualist, the secularized remnant of the tradition of religious dissent. He sees no *tertium quid* between totalitarianism, which destroys the human person, and Christianity, which enables a human being to achieve the fullest possible development of all his capacities. Pure or secular individualism, which makes man his own measure, by that very fact prevents man from reaching his full stature. The most it can achieve, as Henry Adams rather sourly remarked, is some form of stoicism. It is more likely, however, to drift into totalitarianism by way of Nietzsche or some other "great man" theory.

A book so wide in scope and so allusive in reference does not make for easy reading. Again, it is, in form and style, more a personal book than a system of propositions or a blueprint on which to build a civilization. The circumstances of its composition, outlined in the foreword, have given to portions of the work something of the urgency and emotion of the times in which they were being thought out. Some of the author's *obiter dicta*, like all aphorisms and epigrams, may strike the reader as in need of distinction.

But as an intelligent, well-founded explanation of the ultimate sources of all civilizations, and particularly Christian civilization, and as a wise critique of the effects of dechristianization, the book is highly recommended.

*Fordham University*

VINCENT C. HOPKINS, S.J.

PHILOSOPHY OF NATURE. By Jacques Maritain. To which is added here *Maritain's Philosophy of Nature* by Yves R. Simon. New York: Philosophical Library, 1951. Pp. x + 198.

In 1935 the 1951 Cardinal Spellman-Aquinas medalist of the American Catholic Philosophical Association published *La philosophie de la nature: Essai critique sur ses frontières et son objet* (Paris: Pierre Téqui). It is this volume which Imelda C. Byrne translates and to which is here appended Simon's essay from the Maritain Volume of the *Thomist* (1943).

The theme of the book is clear. The objective is to disclose adequate answers to a battery of related questions: "Should a philosophy of nature which is at once distinct from metaphysics and from the particular sciences exist? What are its characteristic traits, its nature and definition, its spirit?" And the author is keenly aware that "for wisdom, these questions are of first-class importance."

The framework within which the answers are constructed is definite and precise. It is "that classical doctrine into which we should seek constantly to penetrate more deeply, for it is truly essential: the doctrine of the three degrees of abstraction or, let us say, the three degrees of abstractive visualization which characterize three generic types of knowledge." I respectfully submit that this choice of fundamental schema for analysis is M. Maritain's first mistake, from the damaging effects of which the book never recovers. For if one does undertake seriously, as advised, to penetrate this doctrine more deeply, it eventuates that the classical doctrine of the three degrees of abstraction is neither classical nor a single doctrine nor concerned with unambiguously three degrees of an unequivocal abstractive process.

Since, moreover, M. Maritain appears to (1) misconstrue, at least in part, the authentic thrust of the metaphysical impulse in intelligence [e.g., p. 53], (2) misunderstand completely the epistemological character and conceptual content of mathematics [e.g., p. 18], and thus (3) inevitably misinterprets the purport, the procedures, and the program of mathematical physics [e.g., p. 39], his *Philosophy of Nature* unfortunately fails to achieve its central cultural purpose: the contemporary reconstruction of an authen-



tic and acceptable synthesis of science, philosophy, and theology within the framework of genuine and not trivially verbal Thomistic insights.

Metaphysics cannot successfully be construed as the search for the *real* names of things. For it just so happens that things do not have proper names. Moreover there cannot possibly be a mathematics *of* something, as there very well may be a metaphysics of anything. For anything is just one of those things that happen to the science of everything. But there may be, and sometimes is, an identity of relational structure between the formal relations of mathematics and the real relations of physics. Hence it is isomorphism that interprets the structure of mathematical physics. And the entities of mathematics are not more or less vested in logical existence; they are completely vested in it.

If, finally, the entire enterprise of natural science is exclusively dedicated to discovering an adequate answer to the monosyllabic inquiry: what's what?, it would appear that the objective of a responsible metaphysics is to disclose, so far as is possible, an equally satisfactory reply to the identical question: what *is* what? The basic human curiosity is the same. The nuances are irreducibly different but happily complementary in an integral intelligence.

*Woodstock College*

JOSEPH T. CLARK, S.J.

## DESCRIPTIVE NOTICES

IGNACE D'ANTIOCHE, POLYCARPE DE SMYRNE: LETTRES. MARTYRE DE POLYCARPE. Greek text, introduction, translation, and notes by Th. Camelot, O.P. 2nd ed., revised and enlarged. Sources chrétiennes, X. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1951. Pp. 285. 810 fr. This second edition of the Letters of Ignatius has corrected omissions and errors of the first (cf. *TS*, IX [1948], 270-71) and profited from recent studies and the suggestions of reviewers. Thus, a paragraph on the literary character of the Letters has been carefully rewritten (pp. 18-19); the original footnote on Ignatius' acquaintance with the text of John's Gospel has been somewhat modified and enlarged (p. 35); additional notes enrich text and translation; the translation and notes of J. A. Kleist (*ACW*, I) are utilized; the literature is carried down to 1951; and an index of scriptural citations has been added. More radically, the edition is augmented by the inclusion of Polycarp's Letter to the Philippians and the account of his martyrdom. (the text for both is Funk-Bihlmeyer). Camelot admits the possibility of *two* letters to the Philippians but prefers to publish the text without interruption. Without adopting a position, he recognizes the importance of Grégoire's thesis (*Analecta Bollandiana*, LXIX [1951], 1-38) that Polycarp died in 177, not 155 or 156. Camelot's revised volume is an achievement of high quality.

MARIA UND DIE KIRCHE. By Hugo Rahner, S.J. Innsbruck: Marianischer Verlag, 1951. Pp. 127. By showing the deeper connections between Mary and the Church the author tries to clear up the apparent opposition between the ever awakening sacramental and liturgical life of the Church on the one hand and the apparent subjectivity of Mariological devotion on the other. Chapter headings include: Mary as Model and Embodiment of the Church; Mary Immaculate; Ever Virgin; Mother of God; Mother of the Faithful; The "Strong Woman"; Soul and Heart; Woman of the Apocalypse.

THE FACE OF THE HEAVENLY MOTHER. By Josef Cardinal Mindszenty. Translated from the German by Charles Donahue. New York: Philosophical Library, 1951. Pp. vii + 150. \$3.00. "In the most Blessed Virgin and Mother, God created a glorious maternal ideal." The work is a eulogy of Our Lady and many other glorious mothers who were types of Our Lady or imitated her example. The strong love which Mindszenty felt for Our Lady and his own mother glows brightly on every page and provides an intimate view of the author's heart.

**THE MAKING OF THE RESTORATION SETTLEMENT: The Influence of the Laudians, 1649-1662.** By Robert S. Bosher. New York: Oxford University Press, 1951. Pp. xvi + 309. \$5.00. Treats the settlement of the Church of England when the monarchy was restored after Cromwell's Protectorate; covers the negotiations leading up to the settlement, and in particular the activities of the Laudians, both the Anglicans in exile abroad and the members of the party at home. Their policy and success are explained by their conversion of Clarendon to the conviction that the Anglican Church had to be restored with the monarchy and without compromising concessions to the Presbyterians. The study evidences painstaking scholarship; the viewpoint is Anglican, especially in the discussion of the validity of Anglican orders.

**MORAL THEOLOGY OF THE *CONFESSIONS* OF SAINT AUGUSTINE.** By John F. Harvey, O.S.F.S. Catholic University of America Studies in Sacred Theology (2nd series), LV. Washington, D. C.: Catholic Univ., 1951. Pp. xxv + 168. \$2.00. A dissertation for the doctorate in theology. The moral teaching of the *Confessions* is recapitulated under ten headings: (1) God is man's goal, satisfying all his aspirations in a transcendent manner. (2) The infused gift of charity is necessary for the proper orientation of human friendships. (3) The foundation of charity is humility, whose chief exemplar is Christ. (4) Continence is a strictly supernatural virtue, for which one must pray: "Da quod jubes et jube quod vis." (5) Rationalization is wishful thinking, refusing to face the accusations of conscience, while avoiding unpleasant obligations and seeking pleasure. (6) A weak or divided will may be ascribed to the lack of dominant aim; a strong or unified will rests upon the concentration of all the powers of the soul on one absorbing purpose. (7) The beginning of a bad habit is found in the rebellion of the spirit against God; the consequence is the enslavement of the will by the flesh. (8) Motivated by pride, the sinner chooses the creature in place of the Creator. (9) Each kind of sin brings its special punishment. (10) Some remedies against sin are good example, reading of Scripture, and grace.

**ARMENIAN LITURGY.** By L. Arakelian. Watertown, Mass.: Mekhitarian Home, 1951. Pp. 87. \$1.00. The first half of this booklet is devoted to brief outlines of the history of Armenia and of the Armenian Catholic Church; the second half presents an English translation of the Armenian liturgy. There are many fine illustrations in both sections.

**GOD'S FRIENDSHIP:** Selections from the *Meditations* of the Venerable Servant of God, Luis de la Puente, S.J. Translated and supplemented by John M. Thill. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1951. Pp. x + 215. \$3.50. Twenty-seven meditations, five of them supplied by the translator, dealing with the divine attributes, the Incarnation, the passion, the Holy Spirit, grace, the sacraments, eternal life.

**HUMANISTIC ETHICS.** By Gardner Williams. New York: Philosophical Library, 1951. Pp. xii + 223. \$3.75. This book is intended as an introduction to the realities of ethical and value problems and is based on the analysis of what the author believes to be ultimate ethical principles. It is centered around "three seeming paradoxes, which [the author maintains] do not involve any contradictions": (1) Ultimate ethics is purely individualistic, but social obligations and the universal categorical imperative are valid. (2) Man's free will is based upon an absolute causal determinism. (3) The true essence of religion fits perfectly into a metaphysics of emergent evolutionary naturalism which ignores or denies supernaturalism and cosmic teleology.

**L'AUTORITÉ POLITIQUE INTERNATIONALE ET LA SOUVERAINETÉ DES ÉTATS:** *Fondements philosophiques de l'ordre politique.* By Robert Bernier, S.J. Montreal: Institut social populaire, 1951. Pp. 201. How reconcile a clearly needed universal political authority with the traditional autonomy of the existing states? From his analysis of answers proposed by de la Brière, Fessard, and Rommen, the author concludes that Catholic political philosophers have been betrayed by a faulty statement of the problem. The voluntarism of leading authorities such as Grotius and Suarez, and failure to distinguish nation, state, and political order, are the factors that have contributed to their confusion. As a result, proposals to satisfy the need of the universal common good have been limited to a monistic unification through conquest (clearly undesirable), or a merely contractual arrangement entered into by sovereign juridical personalities. Fr. Bernier maintains that an examination of Aristotle and St. Thomas leads one to reformulate the problematic. What does the universal common good require? The answer to that question must be sought first. In the process an objective foundation for a universal political authority will be established and at the same time the nature and extent of political authority in the states will be determined. Unity and plurality are both demanded by the nature of human society. Reconciliation of these demands may be achieved only by a strict philosophical analysis. The care needed in such an analysis

is shown, in the author's opinion, by a failure to carry it through successfully even in the case of Delos or the Maritain-Chicago school.

ENCYKLIKA OJCA ŚW PIUSA XII: "NIEZGODA RODZAJU LUDZKIEGO," HUMANI GENERIS. Translated, with an introduction and commentary, by Adolf Tymczak. Orchard Lake, Mich.: Saints Cyril and Methodius Seminary, 1951. Pp. 37. The commentary discusses, in relation to the teaching of the encyclical, the idealistic evolutionism of Hegel, the materialistic evolutionism of Marx, the modern historicism of Dilthey, and certain aspects of contemporary existentialism. On the Catholic scene, the "New Theology" is evaluated in terms of the encyclical, as are polygenism and the irenic movement in the field of dogma. The commentary closes with an explanation of the development of dogma and of the interior assent required by the ordinary teaching of the magisterium.

## BOOKS RECEIVED

[All books received are listed here whether they are reviewed or not]

### *Scriptural Studies*

- Althaus, Paul, tr. Der Brief an die Römer; übersetzt und erklärt von Paul Althaus. 6. verb. Auflage. Göttingen, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1949. 132 p. (Das Neue Testament Deutsch; neues Göttinger Bibelwerk, Teilband 6)
- L'Ancien Testament et les chrétiens, par Paul Auvray, M. Carrouges, M. Nédoncelle, L. Kammerer, etc. Paris, Ed. du Cerf, 1951. 240 p. (Rencontres, 36) 480 fr.
- Ceuppens, P. F., O.P. Questiones selectae ex Epistulis S. Pauli. Taurini, Marietti, 1951. ix, 234 p.
- Foschini, Bernard M. "Those who are baptized for the dead" I Cor. 15:29; an exegetical historical dissertation. Worcester, Mass., c/o Author, 724 N. 8th St., Newark 7, N. J., 1951. viii, 101 p.
- Gelin, A., tr. Jérémie; Les Lamentations; Le Livre de Baruch; tr. par A. Gelin. Paris, Ed. du Cerf, 1951. 310 p. (La Sainte Bible, tr. en français sous la direction de l'Ecole Biblique de Jérusalem)
- Hölscher, Gustav. Das Buch Hiob; zweite verb. Auflage. Tübingen, J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1952. 102 p. (Handbuch zum Alten Testament, erste Reihe, 17) DM 7.—
- Sanders, J. N. The foundations of the Christian faith. A study of the teaching of the New Testament in the light of historical criticism. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1952. xii, 199 p. \$3.75.
- Soisalon-Soininen, I. Die Textformen der Septuaginta-Übersetzung des Richterbuches. Helsinki, Finnish Academy of Science and Letters, 1951. 123 p. (Annales Academiae Scientiarum Fennicae, B 72, 1)
- Thomas Aquinas, Saint. Super Evangelium S. Matthaei lectura; cura P. Raphaelis Cai, O.P.; ed. V revisa. Taurini, Marietti, 1951. ix, 429 p.
- Vaux, R. de, tr. La Genèse. Paris, Ed. du Cerf. 1951. 219 p. map. (La Sainte Bible, tr. en français sous la direction de l'Ecole Biblique de Jérusalem)
- Warfield, Benjamin Breckinridge. Biblical and theological studies; ed. by Samuel C. Craig. Phila., Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Co., 1952. xlvi, 580 p. \$4.50.

*Doctrinal Theology*

- Aulén, Gustaf. *Christus Victor; an historical study of the three main types of the idea of atonement*; tr. by A. G. Hebert. N.Y., Macmillan, 1951. xvi, 163 p. \$2.50.
- Bruno de Jésus-Marie, O.C.D., ed. *Satan*. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1952. xxv, 506 p. illus. \$5.50.
- The Catholic Theological Society of America. *Proceedings of the sixth annual convention*; Detroit, Mich., June 25–27, 1951. 163 p.
- Dowey, Edward A. *The knowledge of God in Calvin's theology*. Columbia Univ. Press, 1952. x, 261 p. \$3.75.
- Galtier, Paul, S.J. *Aux origines du sacrement de pénitence*. Romae, Univ. Gregoriana, 1951. xi, 221 p. (*Analecta Gregoriana*, 54)
- Grillmeier, Aloys, S.J., ed. *Das Konzil von Chalkedon; Geschichte und Gegenwart*; im Auftrag der Theologischen Fakultät S.J. Sankt Georgen, Frankfurt, Main, hrsg. von Aloys Grillmeier S.J. und Heinrich Bacht S.J. Band I: *Der Glaube von Chalkedon*. Würzburg, Echter-Verlag, 1951. xvi, 768 p. DM 27.—
- Hirsch, Emanuel. *Hilfsbuch zum Studium der Dogmatik; die Dogmatik der Reformatoren und der altevangelischen Lehrer quellenmässig belegt und verdeutscht*. Neudruck. Berlin, W. de Gruyter, 1951. xii, 446 p.
- Hophan, Otto. *Maria, unsere hohe liebe Frau*. Luzern, Räber, 1951. 457 p. 22.00 fr.
- Landgraf, Artur Michael, ed. *Der Sentenzenkommentar des Kardinals Stephan Langton*. Münster, Aschendorff, 1952. xxxix, 158 p. (*Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters*, Band 37, Heft 1) DM 12.50.
- Messenger, E. C., ed. *Theology and evolution (sequel to Evolution and theology) by various writers; in two parts*. Westminster, Newman, 1952. 337 p. \$4.50.
- Mueller, Joseph, S.J. *The fatherhood of St. Joseph*; tr. by Rev. Athanasius Dengler, O.S.B. St. Louis, B. Herder, 1952. vii, 238 p. \$3.50.
- Riedmann, Alois. *Die Wahrheit über Gott und sein Werk*. Zweite Auflage. Freiburg, Herder, 1952. xv, 379 p. (*Die Wahrheit des Christentums*, Band I) DM 22.50.
- Rosenkranz, Gerhard. *Evangelische Religionskunde; Einführung in eine theologische Schau der Religionen*. Tübingen, J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1951. x, 258 p. DM 14.80.
- Warnach, Viktor. *Agape; die Liebe als Grundmotiv der neutestamentlichen Theologie*. Düsseldorf, Patmos-Verlag, 1951. 756 p. DM 26.50.

Williams, Michael E. The teaching of Gilbert Porreta on the Trinity as found in his commentaries on Boethius. Romae, Univ. Gregoriana, 1951. xv, 130 p. (Analecta Gregoriana, 56)

*Moral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions*

- Dürig, Walter. *Imago*; ein Beitrag zur Terminologie und Theologie der römischen Liturgie. München, K. Zink, 1952. xx, 190 p. (Münchener theologische Studien, II, 5) DM 10.—
- Galtier, F., S.J., ed. and tr. *Code oriental de procédure ecclésiastique*; traduction annotée. Beyrouth, Univ. St. Joseph, 1951. xx, 581 p. \$4.00.
- Genicot-Salsmans. *Institutiones theologiae moralis*. Ed. XVII. quam paravit A. Gortebecke, S.I. Bruxelles, L'Edition Universelle, 1951. 2 v.
- Parsch, Pius. *The Breviary explained*; tr. by William Nayden, C.Ss.R. and Carl Hoegerl, C.Ss.R. St. Louis, B. Herder, 1952. viii, 459 p. \$6.00.
- Regatillo, Eduardus F., S.J. *Institutiones iuris canonici*; ed. IV. adaucta. Santander, Sal terrae, 1951. 2 v. (Bibliotheca Comillensis) 125 ptas.
- Sotillo, Laurentius R., S.J. *Compendium iuris publici ecclesiastici*. 2a ed. Santander, Sal terrae, 1951. 367 p. (Bibliotheca Comillensis) 40 ptas.
- Steinheimer, Mauritius, O.F.M. *Die Doxa in der römischen Liturgie*. München, K. Zink, 1951. xiii, 117 p. (Münchener theologische Studien, II, 4) DM 10.—

*History and Biography, Patristics*

- Athanasius, Saint. *The letters concerning the Holy Spirit*; tr. with introd. and notes by C. R. B. Shapland. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1951. 204 p. \$6.00.
- Basilius, Saint. *Letters*, vol. 1 (1-185); tr. by Sister Agnes Clare Way, with notes by Roy J. Deferrari. N.Y., Fathers of the Church, Inc., 1951. xviii, 345 p.
- Codex Theodosianus. *The Theodosian code and novels and the Sirmondian constitutions*; a translation with commentary, glossary, and bibliography by Clyde Pharr. Princeton Univ., 1952. xxvi, 643 p. map. \$20.00.
- Daniélou, Jean. *Les anges et leur mission d'après les Pères de l'Eglise*. Editions de Chevetogne (Belgique), 1951. 154 p. (Collection Irénikon) 50 fr.
- Day, Dorothy. *The long loneliness*; the autobiography of Dorothy Day; illus. by Fritz Eichenberg. N.Y., Harper, 1952. 288 p. illus. \$3.50.
- Favre-Dorsaz, André. *Calvin et Loyola, deux reformes*. Bruxelles, Editions Universitaires, 1951. 455 p.
- Gillet, St. M., O.P. Lacordaire. Paris, Dunod, 1952. xi, 236 p. port. 540 fr.



- Graham, Aelred. *Catholicism and the world today*. N.Y., D. McKay, 1952. xiii, 234 p. \$3.00.
- Graham, Robert A., S.J. *Diplomatic relations with the Vatican*, by Robert A. Graham, S.J., and Robert C. Hartnett, S.J. Ed. by Charles Keenan, S.J., N.Y., America Press, 1952. 48 p. 25 cents.
- Harvey, John F. *Moral theology of The Confessions of Saint Augustine*. Cath. Univ., 1951. xxv, 168 p. \$2.00
- Ignatius of Antioch, Saint. *Lettres d'Ignace d'Antioche; Lettre aux Philippiens de Polycarpe de Smyrne; Martyre de Polycarpe; texte grec, introd., tr. et notes de Th. Camelot*. 2e éd., rev. et augm. Paris, Ed. du Cerf, 1951. 285 p. (Sources chrétiennes, 10) 810 fr.
- Iserloh, Erwin. *Der Kampf um die Messe in den ersten Jahren der Auseinandersetzung mit Luther*. Münster (Westf.), Aschendorff, 1952. 60 p. DM 3.50.
- Kraeling, Carl H. *John the Baptist*. N.Y., Scribner's 1951. xii, 218 p. \$2.50.
- La Gorce, Agnes de. *Saint Benedict Joseph Labre*; tr. by Rosemary Sheed. N. Y., Sheed & Ward, 1952. 213 p. \$3.00.
- Payne, Robert. *The Fathers of the Western Church*. N.Y., Viking, 1951. 312 p. illus. \$5.00.
- Picard, Max. *The flight from God; with a note on Max Picard by Gabriel Marcel and an introd. by J. M. Cameron*. Chicago, Regnery, 1951. xxii, 185 p. \$2.50.

*Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature*

- Galy, Jean. *Le sacrifice dans l'école française de spiritualité*. Paris, Nouvelles Editions Latines, 1951. 403 p.
- Hamman, A., O.F.M. *Prières des premiers chrétiens*. Paris, A. Fayard, 1952. 477 p. (Textes pour l'histoire sacrée) 750 fr.
- Truhlar, Carolus, S.J. *De experientia mystica*. Romae, Univ. Gregoriana, 1951. xvi, 252 p. (Collectanea spiritualia, 3)
- White, Helen C. *The Tudor books of private devotion*. Univ. of Wisconsin Press, 1951. 284 p. illus. \$4.75.

*Philosophical Questions*

- Brunschvicg, Léon. *Ecrits philosophiques, tome I: L'humanisme de l'occident; Descartes; Spinoza; Kant*. Paris, Presses Universitaires, 1951. 319 p. 1000 fr.
- Gardet, Louis. *La pensée religieuse d'Avicenne (Ibn Sina)*. Paris. J. Vrin, 1951. 235 p. (Etudes de philosophie médiévale, 41)

- Jarlot, Georgius, S.J. *Compendium ethicae socialis*. Romae, Univ. Gregoriana, 1951. 192 p.
- Marcel, Gabriel. *Homo viator*; introduction to a metaphysic of hope; tr. by Emma Craufurd. Chicago, Regnery, 1951. 270 p. \$3.50.
- Napoli, Joannes di. *Manuale philosophiae ad usum seminariorum*. III: *Theologia rationalis, Ethica, Paedagogia, Aesthetica, Historiologia*. IV: *Supplementum*. Taurini, Marietti, 1951. 2 v.
- The Philosophy of Communism*; with an introd. by Charles Boyer, S.J. N.Y., Fordham Univ. Press, The Declan X. McMullen Co., 1952. x, 308 p. \$5.00.
- Prentice, Robert P. *The psychology of love according to St. Bonaventure*. St. Bonaventure, The Franciscan Institute, 1951. xiv, 136 p. (Philosophy series, 6)
- Ruyer, Raymond. *Néo-finalisme*. Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1952. 272 p.
- Sertillanges, A. D. *Le problème du mal*, vol. 2: *La solution*. Paris, Aubier, 1951. 142 p.
- Siwek, Paul, S.J. *Au coeur du Spinozisme*. Paris, Desclée de Brouwer, 1952. 252 p.
- Vier, Peter C. *Evidence and its function according to John Duns Scotus*. St. Bonaventure, The Franciscan Institute, 1951. xi, 174 p. (Philosophy series, 7)

### *Special Questions*

- Charlot, F., S.J. *La pédagogie des Jésuites; ses principes, son actualité*. Paris, Editions Spes, 1951. 574 p. 1200 fr.
- Curran, Charles A. *Counseling in Catholic life and education*; pref. by Eugene Cardinal Tisserant; foreword by Michael J. Ready. N.Y., Macmillan, 1952. xxvi, 462 p. \$4.50.
- Delépierre, Jean, S.J. *Homme, où vas-tu? Tome I: Premiers cheminements*. Bruxelles, Editions Universitaires, 1951. x, 286 p. 105 fr.
- Heenan, John C. *The people's priest*. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1952. xi, 243 p. \$2.75.
- Hisham ibn-al-Kalbi. *The book of idols; being a translation from the Arabic of the Kitab al-Asnam*; tr. with introd. and notes by Nabih Amin Faris. Princeton Univ. Press, 1952. xii, 59 p. \$2.50.
- Hodgson, Leonard. *The ecumenical movement; three lectures*. Univ. of the South, 1951. 50 p.
- Huber, Raphael M., ed. *Our bishops speak; national pastorals and annual statements of the hierarchy of the United States, 1919-1951; with a*

- foreword, notes, and index by Raphael M. Huber. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1952. xxxiii, 402 p. \$6.00.
- Klenke, Sister M. Amelia. Seven more poems by Nicholas Bozon. St. Bonaventure, The Franciscan Institute, 1951. ix, 162 p. (History series, 2)
- Kuehnelt-Leddihn, Erik von. Liberty or equality; the challenge of our time; ed. by John P. Hughes. Caldwell, Idaho, Caxton Printers, 1952. x, 395 p. maps. \$6.00.
- Mauriac, François. The stumbling block. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1952. vi, 83 p. \$2.75.
- Messner, Johannes. Widersprüche in der menschlichen Existenz; Tatsachen, Verhängnisse, Hoffnungen. Innsbruck, Tyrolia Verlag, 1952. 423 p. S 68.—  
The National Catholic almanac, 1952. Paterson, St. Anthony's Guild, 1952. 816 p. Clothbound \$2.50, paperbound \$2.00.
- Nida, Eugene A. How the Word is made flesh; communicating the Gospel to aboriginal peoples. Princeton Theological Seminary, 1952. 34 p. (Princeton pamphlets, 7) 75 cents.
- Nuesse, C. J., ed. The sociology of the parish; an introductory symposium; ed. by C. J. Nuesse and Thomas J. Harte. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1951. xii, 354 p. \$4.50.
- Powers, Francis J., C.S.V., ed. Papal pronouncements on the political order. Westminster, Newman, 1952. xii, 245 p. \$3.50.
- Scheide, William H. Johann Sebastian Bach, as a biblical interpreter. Princeton Theological Seminary, 1952. 40 p. (Princeton pamphlets, 8) 75 cents.
- Willaert, Léopold, S.J. Bibliotheca Janseniana Belgica; répertoire des imprimés concernant les controverses théologiques en relation avec le Jansénisme, tome 3, années 1739-1950. Namur, Fac. de Phil. et Lettres, 1951. 729-1191 p. 550 fr.