

Lutheran art. For instance, Luther's theology of the word found practical application in the creation of "catechetical" altarpieces that contained only text, such as the Ten Commandments (415–17). Another vivid example of artistic representations of Lutheran theology is images of the Crucifixion that have Christ's blood falling not into a chalice but directly onto an onlooker's head (406). The same quality of analysis is found in the articles on the Anabaptists, the Reformed (both Zwingli and Calvin), and the Anglicans. The essays in the Theology, Liturgy, and Art sections provide the key figures and ideas, as well as substantive footnotes, to serve as an entry point and a catalyst into the eucharistic theologies and practices during the 16th century.

The Eucharist stands as both the recipient and the generator of larger theological and philosophical commitments during the Reformation era. While at times a prior idea leads to an alteration of eucharistic theology—for instance how the Anabaptist Melchior Hoffmann's "celestial flesh Christology" precluded any eucharistic realism (132–33)—at other times the relation works in reverse, such as the subtle but decisive influence on Lessing's philosophy by Lutheran sacramental theology and his reading of Berengar of Tours, as Christopher Wild's essay demonstrates. Whether it is active or passive in relation to larger theological systems, the Eucharist truly is the "source and summit" of many Reformation debates and schisms. In that regard, this volume can be a resource for modern ecumenical dialogue, for although most conversations have focused on Scripture, tradition, and faith, it may be that the eucharistic debates themselves are the key (or at least *a* key) to understanding the modern fraction of Christ's body. If Luther and Zwingli could agree on everything besides the Eucharist at Marburg, perhaps we need to return to Marburg. Whether it is the "sacred tortilla" in the Spanish new world, as Jaime Lara so wonderfully describes it (315–17), Bucer's attempts at reconciliation, or the restructuring of liturgical space, the 16th century produced a fecundity of eucharistic speculation and practice that shaped the subsequent five centuries and continues to be a fruitful field of study.

Jonathan Martin Ciraulo
University of Notre Dame

God at the Margins: Making Theological Sense of Religious Plurality. By Aimée Upjohn Light. Winona, MN: Anselm Academic, 2014. Pp.149. \$16.95.

"Its attentiveness to the margins makes theology of religions an exciting place in which to see the latest interreligious work," writes Light in the concluding chapter of this volume (135). Theology of religions truly ought to be appreciated as the developing edge in theology since Vatican II, where the Christian understanding of God has been opened to ever-widening perspectives. L.'s contribution to this developing edge is principally descriptive and introductory. Her text features liberation theology and feminist theology as the initial wedges driven into the hegemony of doing theology from the privileged position of hierarchy, patriarchy, and the Western scholarly elite. Her descriptions of feminist and liberation theologies contextualize her principal discussion about the evolving approaches Christian theologians have taken to other religious faiths, subsuming

interreligious dialogue and comparative theology under the aegis of “theology of religions.” The book fulfills its promise to show “how doing theology ‘from the margins’ has propelled theologians to pay attention to the experiences of the poor and the experiences of women and has led to notable changes in the way interreligious scholars regard the religious other as a source for theology” (14). Theology at the margins, L. reports, listens to the voices of the poor, women, and non-Christians as privileged sources for a Christian understanding of who God is and how God acts in the world.

To make this point, L. offers succinct and thorough studies of three seemingly disparate theological movements. She defines basic concepts and terms for theological neophytes, such as “hermeneutics,” the “canon of Scripture,” “atonement theory,” and “kenosis” and covers major movements and figures in the intellectual history of Christianity. She includes effective examples of the theological practices discussed, as when she describes Paul Knitter’s “tradition-crossing” encounter with Buddhism through silent meditation (106). L. has an uncommon ability to summarize the salient aspects of these theological movements crisply, with attention to the leading figures and important texts.

Chapters 1 and 2 are roughly parallel in discussing the emergence of liberation and feminist theology respectively. These might well serve as introductions for beginning theology students to comprehend traditional theological method as one of many approaches to doing theology and to understand the importance of the emerging discipline of theologies of religion.

Chapters 3 and 4 provide considerably more detail on the variety of ways Christian scholars have approached other religious traditions. L. devotes more attention to the nuances of interreligious engagement because this is her principal field of interest. She suggests that theology of religions initially consisted of attempts to explain how Jesus Christ is the universal savior in a religiously plural world. She then describes newer and less triumphalist approaches to non-Christian traditions, including interreligious dialogue with the religious “other” and comparative theology. As with the chapters on feminism and liberation theology, those on theology of religions demonstrate an important trend in Christian theology that finds God in the experience and voices of those people whom Christian theologians have customarily ignored. As our culture becomes more pluralistic, engaging the insights of those at the margins of society, so Christian theology becomes more open to listening to the way God reveals Godself to people of all faiths and cultures.

Other valuable pedagogical features of the book are the discussion questions and the bibliographies at the end of the chapters. The questions, in particular, help novices explore the connections between liberation theology, feminist theology, and theology of religions. For example, in chapter 2, “Feminist Theology,” question 2 asks, “How might an understanding of feminist theology help a Christian theologian reconcile Christian beliefs with the reality of multiple religions in the world?” (67). The bibliographies include the major works of theologians who shaped the trends.

As Christian theology moves away from the theological siloes arranged by discipline toward intercultural, interdisciplinary, and interreligious dialogue, this book can serve as a basic resource. The chapters function as a report on the theological disciplines, strung

together with the cursory observation that systematic theology now means listening to multiple voices. L. never digs deeply into the significance of her observation. So, for example, just a few pages from the end of the text, she links the five chapters into a single idea: "As theology of religions draws on both liberation theology and feminist theology and incorporates insights from interreligious dialogue and comparative theology, which also call on liberation and feminist theology, it illumines what it means to do 'systematic theology'" (137). She follows this observation with the remark that systematics has shifted from doctrinal study to experiences of God's presence, providing several categories where this might be noted. While I accept this remark as true, I was left wanting to hear L.'s own insights into how systematic theology arrived at this point or what this widening perspective might mean for systematics, which has often functioned to defend Christianity's ideological certainty about the universality of its revelation and truth claims. L. perceives that Christian theology must engage a "post-Christian world." Yet the reader never benefits from her assessment of the "God at the margins" trajectory. I am hopeful that her next book will analyze and evaluate this trajectory, helping new and seasoned theologians realize that Christianity is entering a new phase in its development. She has much to share with all of us who do culturally contextualized theology, where voices once at the margins have now joined the conversation about who God is and how God loves humanity.

Alison M. Benders

Jesuit School of Theology of Santa Clara University

Cinquante ans après Vatican II: Que reste-t-il à mettre en oeuvre? By Gilles Routhier. Unam Sanctam, New Series. Paris: Cerf, 2014. Pp. 301. €30.

Half a century after the Second Vatican Council, the question that remains unanswered is, What still needs to be accomplished? Routhier, dean and professor of ecclesiology at Laval University (Quebec) and author of extensive publications on the subsequent "reception" of councils by the faithful, here gathers ten of his recent lectures delivered in Canada and various European settings (Belgium, Ireland, Italy, and Switzerland) that explore this topic. The essays are organized into three sections that address generational shifts, hermeneutical debates, and the future.

One especially original consideration is why the new generation of believers, the millennialists, with their particular concerns and insights, face difficulties in assessing Vatican II, which they regard as ancient history. To contextualize the council for this generation, R. shows how the earlier pastoral and extensive diplomatic ministry of Angelo Roncalli, the future Pope John XXIII, led him in a moment of inspiration to convoke Vatican II in order to promote evangelization and church unity by opening up the Church's shuttered windows. The pope's convictions are shown to have paralleled the aspirations of the pioneering French Dominican theologian Yves Congar. To inform younger Catholics, special care is needed to describe the post-Vatican I Church and to provide a compass for them to appropriate Vatican II through updated commentaries and recently published conciliar diaries of various bishops and *periti*.