

# THEOLOGICAL *Studies*

---

VOLUME XVI

1955

---

*Published by the Theological Faculties  
of the Society of Jesus in the United States*

## BOOK REVIEWS

GOD, MAN AND THE UNIVERSE. Edited by Jacques de Bivort de la Saudée. New York: Kenedy, 1953. Pp. xv + 421. \$7.50.

In 1937 Yvan Kologrivov edited a collection of essays entitled, *Essai d'une Somme catholique contre les sans-Dieu*, and in the same year A. Ambruzzi translated it into English. In 1950 a new edition was prepared in French entitled, *Essai sur Dieu, l'homme et l'univers*, under the direction of the present editor, and in 1953 there appeared a further revision with the addition of essays by Messenger and Congar. Since the French editions proved very popular, it was decided to translate the work into English; the translation was made from the latest revision.

The articles cover a wide range of topics: existence of God; origin of life; origin of man in view of science and religion; origin of religion; the early Church; dialectical materialism. The work is intended as a positive statement of Catholic belief against the atheist, especially of the communist variety. All of the contributors are very competent, and some are quite well known outside their own fields.

In his article on the origin of man in Genesis, E. C. Messenger summarizes the Church's teaching on creation from the decrees of the Biblical Commission in 1906 to the letter, *Humani generis*, of 1950; his conclusion is that the Church, while always insisting that God is the creator of everything, never tried to determine the *how* of that creation with respect to the body of man. He correctly rejects the Babylonian creation accounts as the source for Genesis (though, of course, a certain amount of the imagery of these accounts has been retained). M. concludes that the lofty religious ideas of Genesis must be due to revelation; but in arguing that this revelation must have been given to Moses, M. appears to rely on an inadequate notion of biblical author and of Mosaic authorship which would not appeal to all Catholic biblical scholars. In discussing the origin of man and woman in relation to the evolutionary theory, M. is on old, familiar ground. He sharply criticizes some theological interpretations of the Scriptures, and once again enunciates the position stated in his previous works. As for polygenism, M. does not see that *Humani generis* has definitively shut the door; rather, he believes, the letter rejected polygenism simply because at present no way can be found to reconcile it with Catholic belief in the unity of the human race.

This collection of essays will be very serviceable for the clergy and laity. Its positive tone is very welcome; opponents are treated only for the light that they can shed on the positive side of Catholic belief.

Woodstock College

GEORGE S. GLANZMAN, S.J.

INTERNATIONALE ZEITSCHRIFTENSCHAU FÜR BIBELWISSENSCHAFT UND GRENZGEBIETE, I (1951-1952), no. 2. Edited by F. Stier. Düsseldorf: Patmos Verlag, 1954. Pp. xii + 228. \$5.40.

In 1952 the first number of a new international review of biblical and allied periodicals appeared (cf. *TS*, XIV [1953], 458-59). In a foreword, the editor recounts some of the difficulties, including the finding of a new publisher, that had to be met in order to produce this second number. The labor, however, was very much worthwhile, for the present work shows a vast improvement over its predecessor. The type is much more attractive; the number of collaborators has been increased; some new reviews and series have been added; there are now descriptive summaries, some quite lengthy, of nearly every entry; it is now quite easy to find the different sub-titles—an improvement that can best be appreciated by those who used the first number.

The present part contains an index of book reviews under the names of the authors of the books, and an index of authors noticed in the bibliography, exclusive of those named in the review index. There is a list of corrigenda for I, 1, and a table of contents for both numbers.

The editor and his collaborators, many of whom are students, deserve the deepest gratitude from the world community of biblical scholars. They merit the whole-hearted cooperation of authors, who are invited to inform the editor of their writings. Since the review is international, it would seem advisable to extend the range of collaborators through French- and English-speaking circles. Once again, it must be strongly urged that the contributors use their own languages, or that, if they are forced to write in another language, their work be thoroughly checked by someone who knows that language natively; a good example of the necessity of this for English may be found in no. 1398.

The use of this review cannot be too strongly recommended. If the program of regular publication can be carried out, the review will be the most valuable periodical aid in the field.

*Woodstock College*

GEORGE S. GLANZMAN, S.J.

CULTS AND CREEDS IN GRAECO-ROMAN EGYPT. By H. Idris Bell. Liverpool: University Press of Liverpool, 1953; New York: Philosophical Library, 1953. Pp. x + 117. 15s.

In 1952, at the University of Liverpool, Prof. Bell delivered four public lectures on the religious life of Graeco-Roman Egypt. The present volume is a revision of these lectures together with notes and a small, "personal" bibliography.

The religious picture of Ptolemaic Egypt was a veritable "pagan amal-

gam," to which Egyptians, Hellenistic Greeks, and other peoples both Semitic and non-Semitic made their contributions. All these elements are very interestingly described by B. in his first chapter, which concludes with a discussion of the two forces—the Serapis cult and the dynastic cult—which brought unity to this mass of diversity. In the Egyptian religion B. finds certain items which, he suggests, may furnish the source for some Christian ideas; he repeats, after Breasted, the possibility that an early hymn to Ptah may be the "prehistoric background" of the Christian doctrine of the Logos (p. 12), and that a demotic papyrus from the first century A.D. may record an old tale that is the source of the parable of the rich man and Lazarus (p. 14). It is hardly necessary to say that these and similar observations do not enhance the treatment and are most unlikely.

The second chapter, "The Jews in Egypt," is very well done, though many points had necessarily to be treated briefly. While the recently published Aramaic papyri from the Brooklyn Museum have given us several new theophorous names with Bethel and Eshem elements, they have shed no new light on the vexed question of the religion of the Elephantine colony. Dupont-Sommer believes that he has found evidence for Sabbath observance at Elephantine in some of Clermont-Ganneau's ostraca; cf. his discussion in *Mémoires présentées par divers savants à l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles Lettres* (1950). These observations of Dupont-Sommer have not been used by B., who derives his whole discussion of the Elephantine colony from the earlier papyri as published by Cowley.

After a chapter on the state of religion in the Roman period, there follows a discussion of Christianity in Egypt. B. considers it most probable that the Gospel reached Egypt well before the end of the first century (p. 79), and that by the middle of the second century there was a fairly large Christian element in Middle Egypt (p. 81). His description of the state of orthodoxy in the early Church does not at all do justice to the facts (pp. 89-90). His treatment of Gnosticism is quite full and sober. However, his statement that the Gospel of John "shows some sympathy with Gnostic views" (p. 94), and his suggestion that Polycarp's failure to quote it might be explained by an idea that it was in some degree "tainted with Gnostic ideas" (pp. 94-95), must be rejected. Though the problem of Polycarp's silence remains, it might be suggested that the nature of his letter, which is not highly dogmatic, was the reason for it. In any case, the alleged Gnosticism in the Gospel of John has been shown through the discovery and study of the Qumrân scrolls to be a reflection of the religious concepts of contemporary Jewish thought. It may be characterized as "Proto-Gnosticism," out of which later Gnosticism could grow, but "without being in any way specifically

Gnostic" (cf. W. F. Albright, "The Bible after Twenty Years of Archaeology," *Religion in Life*, XXI [1952], 547-50).

In spite of these criticisms, B.'s work remains a valuable summary of the very complex picture of religious life in later Egypt. It is especially welcome since there are very few books of this type in the field.

Woodstock College

GEORGE S. GLANZMAN, S.J.

LA SAINTE BIBLE, traduite en français sous la direction de l'Ecole biblique de Jérusalem. Paris: Editions du Cerf. *Les livres de Samuel*. Translated by R. de Vaux, O.P. 1953. Pp. 244. 660 fr. *Les livres des Chroniques*. Translated by H. Cazelles, P.S.S. 1954. Pp. 248. 675 fr. *Le livre de Esdras et Néhémie*. Translated by A. Gelin, P.S.S. 1953. Pp. 126, two maps. 390 fr. *Daniel*. Translated by P. J. de Menasce, O.P. 1954. Pp. 100. 285 fr. *Habaquq, Abdias, Joël*. Translated by J. Trinquet, P.S.S. 1953. Pp. 96. 270 fr. *Le livre de l'Ecclésiastique*. Translated by H. Duesberg, O.S.B., and P. Auvray, Orat. 1953. Pp. 224. 600 fr.

With the publication of these volumes, the *Bible de Jérusalem* has reached completion. In six years, 43 fascicles have been issued, including all the books of Old and New Testaments in translation, with textual notes, exegetical notes, and introductions. It is an achievement remarkable alike for the speed and regularity of its performance and for the high quality of the work done. The style and treatment decided on at the beginning turned out to be highly satisfactory, and needed little modification. About ten of the early fascicles have already appeared in second edition, and the opportunity has been taken to enlarge the rather scanty annotation of some of them (e.g., Pautrel's *Ecclésiaste*).

In a previous notice (THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, 14 [1953], 461-65) the general characteristics of the series were described. Here a few remarks may be subjoined, mainly from the exegetical point of view, on these concluding parts of the Old Testament section.

De Vaux's *Samuel* makes a fitting pendant to his *Livres des Rois*, published in 1949. The introduction, in just 14 pages, is a model of clarity and comprehensiveness, sketching the probable literary history of the books, and at the same time putting that subject in proper perspective relative to the doctrinal content. The notes draw attention to the composition from various sources, the joins and the doublets; and they show how the hagiographers' intentions can be better appreciated when their techniques are thus traced. The emendations which are so often necessary, given the rather corrupt textual tradition of these books, are made with confidence and are always solidly probable.

The books of Chronicles present special difficulties in a commentary intended for the general public. The problem is to awaken and hold the reader's interest in a piece of writing which is alternately dry and repetitious. If looked on as history, the content of Chronicles is practically all narrated much more vividly and realistically in Kings. If looked on as doctrine, it seems to deal mainly with the externals of a worship that is long superseded and of merely antiquarian interest. Cazelles skilfully solves this difficulty by laying as much stress as possible on the Chronicler himself, his personality, interests, and aims in writing. He shows that this hagiographer has a very definitely prophetic outlook; he looks forward to what God still intends to accomplish through the descendants of David. One of his main intentions is to draw a parallel between Moses and David, presenting the latter as founder of a new epoch in Israel, one that has still to come to maturity. Cazelles' annotations draw attention to the working out of this theme, shown concretely by the various omissions, modifications, and developments that the Chronicler has imposed on his sources. The general result is to recapture to a surprising degree the interest that this theological interpretation of well-known history must have had for its original public.

Esdras-Nehemias offers difficulties of another kind. The subject matter is of obvious interest, but its composition and textual history are complex in the extreme. In a 20-page introduction Gelin sketches the general historical background, and then carefully analyzes the narrative, from both the historical and doctrinal viewpoints. In successive sections he gives a *présentation chronologique et critique* of the materials used in the book, followed by *le plan du Chroniste*, which shows how they have been combined. On the vexed question of the relative chronology of the two eponyms, Gelin explains the various solutions offered, and himself favors situating Esdras' activity between Nehemias' two terms of office, somewhere about 427 B.C. (reading, with Albright, "37th" in Esd 7:8).

The introduction to Daniel gives a good analysis of the apocalyptic style, and the eschatological treatment of the Kingdom theme. The commentator seems reluctant to commit himself to a clear statement on the literary form of cc. 1-6; his most definite remark is "les récits ne prétendent pas à être de l'histoire (au sens où le sont, par exemple, les Livres des Rois)." He sets out the various "historical difficulties" that arise if the chapters are interpreted as history, but without clearly indicating a solution. Surely we need not hesitate now to identify the genus of these chapters as "religious legends," stories originating in, and transmitted by, popular tradition, but dealing with a definite historical period and with genuinely historical personages—though their figures may be composite or confused. (One might

cite the frequent appearance of a similar genus in Second Nocturns.) As edited by the author of the book, they convey exactly what they are meant to convey—a sublime prophetic doctrine concerning God's action in Israelite and Gentile history. P. de Menasce's annotations are admirably concise and illuminating, not least in the constant references to earlier and later treatments of the same themes, especially in Ezechiel and Apocalypse.

The three Minor Prophets treated by M. Trinquet are short books, but all the more difficult for that reason. The order in which they are given is explained by the datings assigned: Habacuc, just after 600 B.C.; Abdias I, 550–450; Abdias II, about 450; Joel 1–2 and 3–4, between 400 and 350. In the text of Habacuc the translator adopts about half a dozen readings from the Dead Sea Commentary, and includes others from the more recently discovered Greek fragments in his apparatus. He maintains the unity of this book, but recognizes a dual authorship in each of the others.

Ecclesiasticus is presented by two veteran exegetes, each of whom has to his credit some outstanding works of *haute vulgarisation*; nevertheless, the reviewer must regretfully record that this fascicle alone comes as something of a disappointment. Though a Hebrew text is available for a good two-thirds of the book, the translation is based throughout on the Greek version, corrected according to the Hebrew only in a very few places where it is obviously wrong or hopelessly corrupt; a selection of the Hebrew variants is recorded in the textual notes. This is a strange procedure in a series which was announced in the publishers' leaflet of 1948 as a "traduction fidèle du texte original établi par un travail critique"; but stranger still is one of the reasons alleged for it in the Introduction (pp. 21 f). The translators speak first of the incompleteness and rather corrupt state of the surviving Hebrew material; these certainly are facts which contribute to the very difficult textual problem presented by this book. Then they go on: "Mais il y a plus grave: le texte hébreu de l'Ecclésiastique n'a jamais été canonique. . . . S'il est vrai que l'inspiration d'un texte nous est connue à travers sa canonicité, il n'y a jamais eu de canoniques que le texte grec et la version latine. [This ignores the Syriac text, which is equally part of one of the Church's official versions.] On doit donc croire à l'inspiration de l'Ecclésiastique grec. Quant à savoir si le traducteur a été directement inspiré ou s'il n'a fait que traduire correctement un original inspiré, c'est une question librement débattue. Dans ces conditions il a paru préférable de prendre pour base la recension sûrement inspirée, le texte grec. . . ."

There is no space in a review to discuss the grave questions raised in the foregoing paragraph. It must suffice to note here that it is not texts that the Church declares canonical, but books; and the function of the Christian

scholar working in the service of the Church is precisely, by means of textual criticism, to try to recover as exactly as possible the original text of the inspired and canonical book. This viewpoint is quite unequivocally expressed in *Divino afflante Spiritu*: "Primigenium illum textum explanari oportet, qui ab ipso sacro auctore conscriptus majorem auctoritatem majusque pondus habet, quam quaelibet, utut optima, sive antiqua sive recentior conversio" (AAS, 35 [1943], 307). Certainly, the texts from the Cairo Geniza are not identical with the original writing; but equally certainly, they bring us much closer to it than does the Greek or any other ancient translation. And that they can be used effectively as the (partial) basis of a translation has been demonstrated by Box and Oesterley's classic edition in Charles' *Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha*, or more concisely by Hamp's excellent rendering in the *Echter-Bibel*.

Otherwise, the introduction and annotation to Ben Sira's work are skillfully and interestingly done, as one would expect; and a particularly helpful feature is the special *Index des principaux thèmes* added at the end.

Finally, we may mention, as matter of interest, that the editorial board of *BJ* do not consider their task finished. The edition in separate fascicles is to be kept in print, but there are also to be two single-volume editions; one, a *Bible de lecture*, containing condensed summaries of introductions and notes, to be issued by the same publishers; the other, a *Bible de poche*, containing just the text, with a minimum of annotation, to be published by Desclée de Brouwer. Thus *BJ* has every chance of becoming the standard French Bible, in spite of the worthy competition offered by several other good modern translations. Happy the Catholics who have such an *embarras du choix*!

*Jesuit Seminary, Toronto*

R. A. F. MACKENZIE, S.J.

OLD TESTAMENT IN MODERN RESEARCH. By Herbert F. Hahn. Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1954. Pp. xii + 267. \$4.00.

The present work of Dr. Hahn of the Pingry School, Elizabeth, N.J., differs from the surveys edited by Willoughby and Rowley. It is the work of one man; the major stress is on objective presentation of positions, with some personal evaluation; the survey is made from the point of view of the different "approaches" in Old Testament interpretation, and covers the major trends during the past 100 years.

H. begins with the nineteenth-century school of literary critics and traces its development to the recent controversies over the book of Ezekiel. Here mention should have been made of C. G. Howie's monograph and of C. J. Mullo Weir's article in *Vetus Testamentum* for 1952. There follow treatments



of the anthropological school (including the work of comparative religion and the folklorists, of S. Mowinckel, and of J. Pedersen), of the religio-historical school (including Gunkel, Gressmann, Kittel, and Sellin), of *Formgeschichte* (Gunkel and Gressmann again, and the Scandinavians on oral tradition), and of the sociological school (Max Weber); the last two chapters are devoted to the archaeological and the theological approaches. There is a concluding summary which puts all these trends into their chronological order.

Most of H.'s criticisms and evaluations are drawn from other scholars. His own views seem to be at least partially attached to certain outmoded presuppositions of Wellhausenism. This emerges rather clearly in his evaluation of Albright's views on the nature and historical worth of Israelite traditions, and on Mosaic monotheism (pp. 218-24); those familiar with the work of Albright and his students can draw their own conclusions. At the same time, H. is aware of archaeology's contribution to Old Testament research. H. is justifiably happy at the revival of theological interest in the Old Testament, and considers that theology has become "the most important field of Old Testament scholarship" (p. 249).

The field has been covered extremely well, especially when one considers the huge mass of literature involved; there are surprisingly few omissions. The presentations are interesting and informative, and will furnish a valuable introduction to students of the Old Testament.

Woodstock College

GEORGE S. GLANZMAN, S.J.

A THEOLOGY OF SALVATION. A COMMENTARY ON ISAIAH 40-55. By Ulrich E. Simon. London: S.P.C.K., 1953. Pp. x + 266.

Professor Simon's book is an essay in theological exegesis, or, as he himself puts it, it "resumes the time-honoured tradition of making theology by the writing of an exegetical commentary" (p. 1). One may say that it aims to do on a small scale for Second Isaiah what Barth did years ago for the Epistle to the Romans. Simon approaches this section of Holy Writ as a document of timeless relevance to the human situation, a challenge as peremptory to the faith of modern Christians as it was to the contemporaries of the prophet. It is this challenge that he wishes to present and interpret to the men of our time.

The book consists of an introduction and 28 chapters of commentary; each is headed by the author's own translation of a section of the text. There is also an appendix of textual notes which explain the readings adopted in the translation and the occasional emendation found necessary. The translation, though it suffers from some odd juxtapositions of "Bible English" with modern colloquialisms, is rhetorically very effective by its roughness

and energy. But it is surprising that there is no attempt to reproduce or even indicate the poetic and rhythmic form of the oracles.

The substance of the book, however, lies in the commentary; and it is here that the average biblical student, especially if (like the present reviewer) he is unfamiliar with Barthian dialectics, will feel himself more than a little at sea. The author makes some sound remarks, in his introduction, on "the pitfalls of subjectivity, and of typology in particular (of which there is not a little in this commentary)" (p. 9); and he describes the methods by which he hopes to avoid them. One is tempted to comment that his theory is better than his practice.

One important preliminary decision has a considerable influence on the whole work. The author avows himself a convinced and ardent adherent of the view of C. C. Torrey, that the prophecy is to be dated *ca.* 400 B.C., instead of the usually accepted dating *ca.* 540 B.C., towards the end of the Babylonian captivity. For Torrey, of course, this is a necessary consequence of his rejection of the whole story of an "exile" and his rewriting of Jewish history in the 6th and 5th centuries—in which, however, he has found few, if any, scholars to agree with him. Simon, while apparently differing from Torrey on the larger question, insists on the validity of his dating of Second Isaias. He considers it crucial to the right understanding of the prophecy, and heaps scorn on the idea that the Cyrus passages, for example, might be references to a real contemporary king, namely, prophecies of his destruction of the Neo-Babylonian power and permission given to rebuild the temple at Jerusalem. The prophet's preaching must be understood as almost entirely timeless and eschatological, divorced from contemporary politics, rulers, or material circumstances. One gets the impression that only so will it be of interest, or have any value, for the Christian theologian. Simon almost seems to consider it unworthy of the prophet, *qua* prophet, to concern himself with mundane things.

This deliberate "disincarnation" of the great Isaian prophecy is really a mutilation, not a purification, of the Word of God; it cuts it off from its roots. One may reflect that by the same principles of exegesis the whole Book of Lamentations, for example, would have to be interpreted in an exclusively moral or eschatological sense, detached from its *Sitz im Leben* of siege and destruction, or any connection with the real Jerusalem. The author does well, certainly, to stress and develop the transcendence of the Word of God; the doctrine contained in these magnificent oracles rises far above the day-to-day transactions of the prophet's time. But the immanence too must not be neglected or belittled, under penalty of misunderstanding the biblical doctrine of God's action in, and on, this world.

If one seeks briefly to indicate the exact point at which such interpreta-

tion goes astray, it should probably be looked for in a too narrow concept of typology. Simon believes that a "type" must be consciously recognized as such by the hagiographer, i.e., it must be merely a metaphor or symbol. This implies, then, if the prophet's oracles have a genuine application to perennial problems of faith, of judgment, of redemption, that he cannot have been talking originally about the real Babylon, the real Cyrus, or a real geographical "return." But this is not how typology is understood and applied by Christian tradition, from Irenaeus on, or in the New Testament, or, for that matter, by the prophet himself. To take his favorite theme, the "new Exodus": he clearly supposes that the old Exodus was a real event, a real redemptive act of God, narrated for its own sake in the traditions of his people. He can hardly suppose that the ancient sources, in whatever form he knew them, present it purely as a prophetic fact, since he lays so much stress on the novelty of his own prophetic interpretation, as the revelation of a "new thing," made by God through himself. The point of similarity that provides the ground for typological analogy is the divine action, initiated or rehearsed in the type, continued or fulfilled in the antitype; but this may perfectly well exist without being revealed to the men who witness or record only the type.

In part, our author recognizes this, and he sketches an excellent analysis of the prophet's development of the Cyrus/Servant typology: "Just as Cyrus—a secular, pagan king—delivered the Jews and the world from Babylon and its oppression, so the 'Eved' incorporates this type of foreign conqueror in his Messiahship. . . . Just as Cyrus came to power although unaware of the 'Disposer Supreme,' so the 'Eved' is called to Messiahship before he is old enough to have the knowledge of God. . . . The 'Eved' recapitulates Cyrus . . . instead of being merely instrumental the 'Eved' leads the movement to restore Zion" (pp. 128 f.).

Nothing could be fairer than that; but why then must the author, a few pages earlier, cut the ground from under his own argument by fiercely denying that 45:1–4 could possibly refer to Cyrus? "The tale of the benevolent Cyrus surpasses perhaps all other legends in misleading and mischievous fictitiousness. . . . The facts were otherwise. After taking Babylon Cyrus proved no deliverer nor a servant of YHWH. He continued to acknowledge Marduk and in his name he ordered the confused state of affairs according to his own light. Jerusalem and the cities of Judah did not benefit or even come into the purview of his scheme" (p. 126). This is Torrey's position, which involves a cavalier disregard of the evidence furnished by the Chronicler and confirmed by the contemporary oracles of Aggeus and Zacharias—not to mention the evident belief of Second Isaiah and his hearers, as set forth by Simon in the passage quoted previously. It is no more likely

now to win the assent of exegetes and historians than when Torrey published *The Second Isaiah* in 1928. But for our author to write the two passages above in close juxtaposition seems to be pushing "dialectic" rather far. In particular, on the basis of the second one, one would like to ask what theological significance or value he would attribute to the Chronicler's interpretation of Israelite history, or to the "memoirs" of Esdras.

This review has perhaps dwelt overmuch on a negative aspect of Simon's work, and it is only fair to mention that he provides also many illuminating analyses, and some very stimulating applications to the modern world. He appears at his best, perhaps, in his treatment of the Servant Songs. These pericopes being, as is generally admitted, more directly prophetic than the other sections, they lend themselves better to the eschatological exegesis which the author favors. Even here, it is true, the reader is halted, from time to time, by curiously arbitrary details in the interpretation; but in the main, Simon gives a convincing exposition of the Servant figure, as the prophet's "construction" of a heaven-sent messianic individual, combining in himself all previous types of redemption, and achieving, in the name of both Israel and the Gentiles, that perfect fulfilment of God's will to which men were called yet could never attain.

*Jesuit Seminary, Toronto*

R. A. F. MACKENZIE, S.J.

NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES. By C. H. Dodd. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1954. Pp. viii + 182. \$3.00.

C. H. Dodd, professor emeritus in the University of Cambridge, who has recently enriched Gospel scholarship by his monumental work on St. John, now has gathered together several papers on various aspects of the *NT* written during the past twenty years. All eight studies had been previously published, two of them by Harvard University, but most of them were not readily available. For the convenience of scholars the writings are collected in this one volume and printed in substantially their original form.

In the first essay written in 1932, "The Framework of the Gospel Narrative," Dodd takes issue with Dr. Rawlinson, now Bishop of Derby, and K. L. Schmidt who challenged the thesis that Mark gives a fairly reliable framework for the Gospel narratives. The author's final appraisal is a balanced one: we need not be so scornful of the Marcan order as has recently become the fashion, though we should not place in it the implicit confidence it once enjoyed.

The second essay, "A New Gospel" (1936), is one of the most complete (41 pages) and to the present reviewer the most interesting of all the chapters. In 1935 Sir Harold Bell and Mr. T. C. Skeat edited and commented

on some recently discovered papyri in their book, *Fragments of an Unknown Gospel and Other Early Christian Papyri*. Several reviewers reacted unfavorably to the title, "An Unknown Gospel," for the conviction was widespread that the fragments could be sufficiently explained as embroidering of the material in the canonical Gospels. Dodd, however, after carefully studying the language of the fragments, is persuaded that the only canonical Gospel with which the papyrus text shows any clear and direct relation is the Fourth Gospel. He thinks that the writing emanated from a circle which held the Fourth Gospel to be authoritative, but which, if it knew the Synoptic Gospels, preferred at least in some cases other authorities. All in all Dodd has made out the best case I have seen to justify the title, "An Unknown Gospel."

An essay written in 1947 treats the similarities between Matthew and Paul, particularly in their eschatology, the concept of the Church, and the polemical attitude toward contemporary Judaism. Direct influence being excluded, the similarity stems rather from a common Jewish-Christian tradition.

Two studies written in 1933 and 1934 set forth the mind of Paul. In the first the man's background and the tensions of his life are portrayed and the resolution indicated which was effected by the spiritual crisis evident from II Cor. "There is nothing in the earlier letters like the quiet self-abandonment of II Cor. IV-V." The same attitude even in a higher degree is manifest in the letter written a few years later to the Philippians, for in it we can observe "what experience has made of this naturally proud, self-assertive and impatient man."

The second Pauline study is concerned with the development of his thought as discernible in the letters. Naturally this problem raises the question of the date, and incidentally the place of composition, of certain letters. In this connection Dodd disagrees with those who would assign the Captivity Letters to Ephesus. As regards the evolution of Paul's thought, the author believes that the Apostle gradually revised his eschatology, revaluated and came to recognize the goodness in the natural order, and came to a greater universalism of salvation. The decisive period for the change would be evident in II Cor. My own opinion is that other data would show that the change is not so radical as the author would have it.

The sixth essay discusses natural law in the New Testament (1946) and treats the key texts and indicates that the Word supplants the natural law and Mosaic Law as embracing all that is good in them.

The two final papers were the Ingersoll Lectures on the Immortality of Man delivered at Harvard University in 1935 and 1950. Many valuable insights will be found here on the communion of saints and eternal life. A

detailed consideration and comparison of the doctrine with that of Catholic theology would require much time and study, particularly as the reader may be in doubt whether what sounds like Catholic teaching actually has that meaning. In spite of some reservations the present volume should be welcomed as an excellent contribution to New Testament scholarship.

*Weston College*

JOHN J. COLLINS, S.J.

LES BÉATITUDES: LE PROBLÈME LITTÉRAIRE; LE MESSAGE DOCTRINAL. By Dom Jacques Dupont. Bruges: Editions de l'Abbaye de Saint-André; Louvain: Nauwelaerts, 1954. Pp. 327.

This large and compendious monograph on the Beatitudes is, from many points of view, a disappointing book. Even the learned author seems to have had misgivings, writing as he does in the preface: "The reader who is looking for something new should not open this book" (p. 5). It is nonetheless an ambitious attempt to gather together almost all that has been written, good and bad, on the text of the Beatitudes in Matthew and Luke, as well as their divergent treatment of the Sermon on the Mount. If one can forgive the overloading of the bibliography and the footnotes with the second-rate and the irrelevant, it is in its way a fine *exercice de synthèse*. For his ultimate interpretation of the Beatitudes, however, Père Dupont relies heavily on the work of his former professor at Louvain, Chanoine A. Descamps (cf. especially the latter's dissertation, *Les justes et la justice dans les évangiles* [Louvain: Gembloux, 1950]); hence those who, like the present writer, have found Descamps' work rather unconvincing in its ultimate conclusions, will find no further enlightenment in the book under review. Substantially, Descamps' theory points to an organic continuity within the three stages of the Beatitudes' development. In their primitive redaction, they promise the Messianic kingdom to those who, having nothing of their own, rely on God for all things; in the second stage, in the Gospel of Matthew, the Beatitudes become a moral exhortation, and the qualities demanded (with a view to the primitive catechumen) are rather interior and spiritual; in the last stage, the Lucan version, those Beatitudes are selected which more closely correspond to Luke's view of the early social mission of the Church to the poor, the hungry, and the oppressed (although it is because of their internal disposition rather than their social condition that the rewards are promised them).

A brief summary scarcely does justice to the riches of Dom Dupont's volume. He is a virtuoso, with a wide background of reading in all languages, equally at home in exegesis and textual criticism. And yet one gets the im-

pression that his approach, for all its learning and sincerity, is already slightly dated. Dom Dupont is at pains to gather vast bibliographical references from any school whatsoever, merely to serve, it would seem, as counterpieces for his own preconceived presentation. Bultmann, Lagrange, Dibelius, Manson, all supply him with quotations, and at times the learned author does not seem to have grasped the deep gulfs that separate the various schools of criticism, the widely different techniques employed, for example, by the English and the German schools. The result is that the actual individual theories are not, to my mind at least, fairly represented, and the book's usefulness either to scholar or to student is materially diminished.

Further (and here I am perhaps treading on controversial ground), it is not clear that Dom Dupont is fully aware of the problems connected with postulating an Aramaic Matthew (not having fully assimilated the studies of Black and others), for he seems to take it for granted without questioning. Secondly, like many other Catholic scholars, he does not seem to have appreciated the difference between literary genre and the *Form* of German criticism, for the *Form* leads logically to *Entmythologisierung*. Thirdly, his approach to textual problems shows an unsureness and a dependence on the opinions of others which is most disconcerting (divergent testimonies in an apparatus are to be analyzed and weighed, and discussed in terms of possible contamination, not simply listed as they are printed in, e.g., Merk's *editio minor*). Lastly, however much the reader may enjoy the urbane references to Sainte-Beuve, Bergson, and Guardini, *non erat his locus*.

All of this, however, is not to say that Dom Dupont is not a tireless and exacting scholar; such would be far from the truth. His book, the result of long and prodigious labor, is one which Scripture scholars will find extremely profitable. At the same time it will appear, I think, as a confirmation of the growing feeling that at this stage of scriptural studies what is needed is not wider extension so much as a deeper penetration of the vast philological and textual achievements of the last few decades, a more ruthless detection of the prejudices which have vitiated the approaches of the different schools, and, finally, a more complete presentation of all the available testimonies (manuscripts, the Fathers, etc.) as well as a determination of fundamental principles in order to arrive at a reasonably sound New Testament text.

Although Dom Dupont has not quite succeeded in the aim expressed in his preface "to try to separate the wheat from the chaff," his bread is wholesome and will provide substantial nourishment for a long time to come.

St. Andrew-on-Hudson,  
Poughkeepsie, N.Y.

HERBERT A. MUSURILLO, S.J.

**JESUS AND THE FUTURE.** An Examination of the Criticism of the Eschatological Discourse, Mark 13, with Special Reference to the Little Apocalypse Theory. By G. R. Beasley-Murray. London: Macmillan, 1954. Pp. xi + 287.

The author of this painstaking work is an active Baptist minister in England. As the subtitle indicates, his chosen field of research is the eschatological teaching of Christ, as found notably in Mark 13. Beasley-Murray reviews what others have said in explanation of the difficulties inherent in the so-called Little Apocalypse or Synoptic Apocalypse, and advances his own interpretation of what Christ prophesied about the fall of Jerusalem and the parousia.

The first chapter is given over to the origin of the Little Apocalypse theory. It did not emerge as a detached scientific study; it was the last stage of a developing emotional reaction to a theological problem proposed by agnostics. B.-M. shows how early in the nineteenth century D. Strauss, at the head of a long line of independent critics, questioned the authenticity of the eschatological discourse in Mark 13. At best, Christ was mistaken in His prophecy of the parousia. At worst, He was a fanatic, subject to delusions of grandeur, to *Schwärmerei*. A reaction set in against agnosticism, and a plethora of views were put forth seeking to redeem Christ from this degradation. Thus, it was the Synoptists who had erred; or, the Lord never really said anything about a second coming; or even, Christ never pretended to be Messiah. Part of the reaction was Timothy Colani's "Little Apocalypse Theory," as outlined in his book, *Jésus-Christ et les croyances messianiques de son temps* (1864). Colani eliminated all difficulties in the eschatological discourse by eliminating the discourse itself. In fact he divorced the teaching of Christ, and of the New Testament, from all eschatology. Such sayings attributed to Jesus had to be the work of his disciples, who applied to Christ the traditional features of Jewish messianism. Paul in particular was guilty of this, with his imagination of Jesus as Judge at the Last Day. As for Mark 13, Colani insisted that the vast majority of the discourse, vv. 5-31 (the Little Apocalypse), is nothing but an interpolation. He regarded it as "a short apocalypse by an unknown author, which the Synoptics have taken for a discourse of Jesus and inserted into their compilations." He thought it had been written shortly before 68 A.D. (his dating of St. John's Apocalypse), and that Luke's version of it was really a redaction of the discourse, made after the destruction of Jerusalem and reflecting that event.

Chapter 2 examines the subsequent developments of the Colani theory, "not in the lurid glare of controversies with agnostics, but with all the aids that criticism can give us." B.-M. then digests the views of those authors who have held the Little Apocalypse theory in substance, while adding their own interminable and involved modifications.



The following chapter investigates views on this matter held from the close of the nineteenth century on, views by men who do not accept the authenticity of the eschatological discourse in Mark 13, and yet who either reject the Little Apocalypse theory or seriously modify it. B.-M. enumerates Fr. Lagrange among them, stating that "honesty makes it impossible to include him among the defenders of the integrity of Mark 13, honesty on his part, doubtless, as well as ours" (p. 84).

An examination of various attempts to vindicate the eschatological discourse occupies chapter 4. The theories are discussed in turn: that the fall of Jerusalem was a foreshadowing of the end of the age; that Mark 13 really comprises two authentic prophecies, concerning the fall of the city and the final advent respectively; that the Synoptic Apocalypse is really and merely a continuous description of the Christian era; that we have in Mark 13 an example of "prophetic perspective," i.e., treating events widely separated in time without temporal distinction; that the discourse was constructed from sayings originally delivered separately. Some pages are added in discussion of the view that the parousia was fulfilled in 70 A.D.

A very long fifth chapter deals with the theology of Mark 13 and its relation to other writings, especially other New Testament writings. B.-M. here sets out to show that the Little Apocalypse "approximates so closely to the otherwise attested teaching of our Lord as to preclude the necessity for postulating an extraneous origin for it." Thus, argues the author, the detailed signs given in Mark 13 do not contradict other passages wherein Christ discourages the Pharisees from asking for signs, or wherein Christ professes to know neither the day nor the hour. As for the apparent mistake made by the Lord in referring the end of time to His own generation, it was no error, says B.-M. Faith enables one to explain this in the light of the "prophetic feeling of certainty" enjoyed by Christ; "his conviction of the nearness of the victory was due to the clarity of that vision in his soul" (p. 190). In fact, he goes on, the Little Apocalypse makes due allowance for a period of evangelization between resurrection and parousia. The eschatological discourse describes the fall of Jerusalem in the context of the woes of the end. Both events are connected because both must occur within a generation. The Little Apocalypse is silent on what lies between the ruin of the city and the parousia. It faithfully represents the mind of Christ; not all of His mind, though, since it is but a fragmentary record of what Christ said on the occasion. But "it is right in showing that Jesus did not know the ebb and flow of time and history" (p. 204). As for the question of the unity of Mark 13, B.-M. contents himself with suggesting two possibilities. Either the original discourse had been expanded by sayings of Christ uttered on

different occasions, or the original solitary eschatological discourse has been reproduced in fragmentary condition.

Further matters treated in the fifth chapter include the relationship between the discourse and Christ's death, between the eschatology of Jesus and that of his contemporary countrymen (similarity being due to mutual Old Testament dependence, dissimilarity owing to the significance claimed for the person of Messias), and between Mark 13 and other scriptural and apocryphal passages. B.-M. does not care to date the discourse, other than to agree with Piganiol that "it should be considered the most ancient document of Christianity." Since, furthermore, the discourse betrays evidences of Aramaic origin, the author sees here confirmatory proof of its authenticity as the words of Christ. In an appendix to the work, he offers some detached notes on disputed passages in Mark 13.

It is readily apparent, especially in the earlier chapters, that this book entailed much work and a vast amount of reading. B.-M. thoroughly digests the views of dozens of commentators; and what is more admirable, he correlates them so as to set up chronological patterns of interdependence and opposition. This is what gives the book its greater value. It is a time-saver for those doing research on the eschatology of Christ.

When B.-M. leaves off reporting and turns to interpretation he is not always so successful. Compared with the ultra-liberals who have written on this subject he is indeed conservative, as he himself claims. We can agree with him on many things, especially the authenticity of the Synoptic Apocalypse, even if we cannot agree with his less fortunate evaluation of Christ Himself. One cannot help noting that, had the author pushed his criterion of faith a bit farther so as to include the inspiration and inerrancy of Holy Writ, he would have eliminated from his appointed task a good deal of unnecessary labor.

This book labors under the serious defect of Catholic-phobia. This is painfully evident in B.-M.'s ambitious bibliography, where out of almost 200 "more notable" works on the question at issue, a pitiful handful are made to represent Catholic thinking. No mention is made of Felder's work along these lines, or that of Bonsirven, or Billot, or the recent series of articles by Feuillet in the *Revue biblique*. The works of Lagrange? Yes—at least his earliest work in this field, to which B.-M. devotes a couple of pages. And this, incidentally, exemplifies the danger of slighting Catholic scholarship. Surely it cannot be scientific to cite Lagrange as opposed to the authenticity of Mark 13 on the basis of his writings in 1906 and 1911, and to overlook the fact that in the revised and enlarged edition of his *Saint Marc* from 1928 on he had modified his earlier views considerably. Had B.-M., after commendably expending such a vast amount of energy on liberal authors,

taken just a bit more time to evaluate current Catholic opinions on this thorny problem, he would have published a more representative work, and might even have arrived at a more completely satisfactory solution to some very real problems.

*Mary Immaculate Friary,  
Garrison, N.Y.*

ERIC MAY, O.F.M.CAP.

THE WOMAN CLOTHED WITH THE SUN (AP. 12). INDIVIDUAL OR COLLECTIVE? An exegetical study. By Bernard J. Le Frois, S.V.D. Rome: Herder, 1954, Pp. xviii + 281.

For the greater part of three years Fr. Le Frois has been concerned with the problem of the identification of the woman mentioned in Apoc 12. The result is the present volume, an outgrowth of his doctoral thesis in Scripture which he ably defended at the Pontifical Biblical Institute, Rome, a defense to which the *Osservatore Romano* devoted a rather long notice.

An introduction, "Fifty Years in Retrospect," outlines the attitudes on the text in question and presents a very complete bibliography. Carefully separating the dogmatic writers from the exegetes, the author notes that not a few of the latter have rather summarily dismissed the text as being applicable to Mary in an accommodated sense only. It is to his fellow exegetes especially that the writer addresses himself.

The volume is divided into seven chapters. First the patristic testimonies are evaluated. Then follows a treatment of the Apocalypse and the apocalyptic genre. Next a study of the symbols involved: the great sign; the woman clothed with the sun; the woman in the throes of motherhood; the dragon; the woman's offspring; the woman in the wilderness. After that the writer shows how the thought content of Apoc 12 is developed according to Semitic concentric circles. There follow two chapters which prove that the woman represents both an individual and a collective personality. To complement the study there is a final chapter on the prophetic context. Nine pages are given over to indices of Scripture, authors, and topics.

One cannot fail to be impressed by the thorough and objective treatment which the author has given to each part of his study. Commentaries, both Catholic and non-Catholic, are cited with a fulness not usual even in doctorate theses, and wherever pertinent the most recent encyclical on Scripture, *Divino afflante Spiritu*, is quoted, usually at the head of a chapter. Concerning the general thesis the reviewer confesses that, though previously he had favored the accommodated sense, he now has been converted to Fr. Le Frois's interpretation: the woman represents literally both our Lady and a collective personality, the Church.

A few points from the book may be mentioned in detail. In Gen 3:15 the woman is Mary, mother of the Messias, and in Apoc 12 the woman is somehow the mother of the Messias. Now in St. John's Gospel in two messianic passages, one at the beginning of the public life (Jn 2:4) and one at the end of it (Jn 19:26), our Lord called Mary by the sole title, "woman." While the word is not disrespectful, yet it is odd that a son should use it addressing his mother. The passage in Apoc 12 would be the third Johannine passage in which Mary is designated "woman." Apparently the evangelist wished to indicate that she is the woman of Genesis and thus bring out her messianic role and her spiritual maternity. In this interpretation the author has the support of F. M. Braun, O.P., in his *Mère des fidèles* (1953).

Another stimulating thought is the doctrine that Mary is identified with the Church and suffering with it. Satan seeks to persecute the woman, but she is already reigning in glory, so that he is actually attacking her offspring. Just as Jesus from heaven could reproach Saul, "Saul, Saul, why persecutest thou me?", so Mary also realizes that she is persecuted in her children, the members of the Body of Christ.

Not only exegetes but theologians, retreat masters, and preachers can make judicious use of the documents here culled from the Fathers and the Popes. Nor is the liturgy neglected. Remarkably enough, various passages of Apoc 12 occur some twenty times in the Missal or the Office for the feasts of our Lady, though not employed for any other saint or for any feast such as the dedication of a church. Evidently the liturgy reserves the application of the apocalyptic woman solely for Mary.

*Weston College*

JOHN J. COLLINS, S.J.

THE APOSTOLIC SUCCESSION IN THE FIRST TWO CENTURIES OF THE CHURCH. By Arnold Ehrhardt. London: Lutterworth Press, 1953. Pp. 168. 16s.

That this is a learned and a provocative book will at once be conceded, yet it must be confessed that its organization at times leaves the reader in some doubt as to what exactly has been established by the author. Dr. Ehrhardt seems dissatisfied (p. 11) with the view expressed by Kenneth Kirk in the opening essay of *The Apostolic Ministry* (Hodder and Stoughton, 1946), p. 7 ff., that the ministry of grace with which our Lord endowed His Church was very early differentiated into an essential ministry (the Apostles and their successor bishops) and a dependent ministry (priests and deacons). For Dr. Ehrhardt, the apostolic succession of bishops can, indeed, be traced to the times of the Apostles, but he regards the first monarchic bishop, James of Jerusalem (whom he seems to make head of the Church), as having suc-

ceeded to the Israelitic priesthood rather than to the college of the Apostles (pp. 7, 82). The earliest episcopal succession-lists were drawn up, he feels, with the idea of continuing the succession of the Jewish high priest within the Christian Church (pp. 5, 60-61). In the course of the second century, he maintains, this concept of priestly succession was combined with the idea of succession to the traditions of apostolic teaching to give us, in Hegesippus and Irenaeus, our doctrine of apostolic succession (pp. 6-7). The bishop thus became the successor to the high priests of Israel who preached the Gospel according to the traditions of the Apostles.

Admittedly there is much in the book which proves of lasting interest, e.g., the trenchant criticism (pp. 15-20) of the theory put forth in *The Apostolic Ministry* which had made the Christian Apostle the counterpart of the Jewish *shaliach*, or the wise remarks (chap. 4) evaluating the prophetic and other extra-regular ministries of the early Church. But the thesis underlying the work is another matter.

Dr. Ehrhardt devotes his first chapter to a discussion of the New Testament evidence bearing on apostolic succession. Rightly he recognizes (p. 33) that the concept of such succession is present in 2 Tim 1:6, and in 1 Tim 4:14, but he fails to take account of what is implied with reference to the continuance of the apostolic office in our Lord's dicta in Mt 16:18, and in Mt 28:20. The assumption (p. 23) that St. James held the chair at the Council of Jerusalem and formulated its decision appears unconvincing to one who has pondered Vincent McNabb, *The New Testament Witness to Saint Peter* (Sheed and Ward, 1928), pp. 79-90.

A full chapter (pp. 62-82) is given over to the witness of the Fathers before Irenaeus. St. Ignatius of Antioch is placed among those who show "no notion" of apostolic succession (p. 76). This reviewer finds himself unable to concur in that interpretation. The Antiochean prelate does not, of course, use the term (which first appears in Hegesippus). Yet for Ignatius, orthodoxy means being at one with the Apostles (*Eph.* 11) and is the possession only of those who are at one with their bishops (*Mag.* 13; *Smyrn.* 8; *Philad.* 3; 7). That would seem to indicate that he equated bishops with Apostles. The equation itself finds expression in Ignatius' reminder to the faithful to "keep close to Jesus Christ and the bishop and the ordinances of the Apostles" (*Trall.* 7) and in his exhortation to the clergy to "keep up the bishop's spirit out of reverence for the Father and Jesus Christ and the Apostles" (*Trall.* 12).

It is not until well into this chapter (pp. 76-78) that Dr. Ehrhardt considers *I Clement* 42, 44. He does recognize that here, in 96 A.D., "the doctrine of the Apostolic Succession [is] fully established," but he never really faces up to the significance of Clement's assertion that it was the

Apostles themselves who gave us their successors (cf. Jean Colson, *L'Evêque dans les communautés primitives* [Paris, 1951], p. 70; A. Michiels, in *Dictionnaire apologétique de la foi catholique*, I, c. 1765). Yet Clement is crucial. In the light of his explicit witness, apostolic succession is shown to have been not the product of the theorizing of Judaeo-Christians adopted by the *Magna ecclesia*, but the result of direct action by the Apostles of Christ.

The author's interpretation (pp. 35-61) of the early episcopal succession-lists as intended to carry on a succession from the Jewish high priest leaves this reviewer unconvinced. One may readily admit, with Dr. Ehrhardt, that our episcopal lists are based neither upon pagan models nor upon Jewish royal or prophetic or rabbinical lists. But it does not therefore follow, "by elimination" (p. 48), that the Jewish sacerdotal lists served as pattern. There is a distinct possibility that as early as the second century the names of deceased bishops were being kept in their dioceses in order to commemorate them at Mass at the Naming of the Names. Africa, surely, had this practice well before the middle of the third century; cf. Cyprian, *Epist.* 1:2: "... apud altare Dei meretur nominari in sacerdotum prece. . . ." Yet of this possibility there is not a word in Dr. Ehrhardt.

Early Christians did, indeed, regard their bishops as high priests, but it is of importance that our most ancient episcopal consecratory prayer conceives of a priesthood which flows from Christ to the Apostles and thence to the bishop-consecrand (cf. Hippolytus, *Apostolic Tradition*, III, 3-5; ed. Dix, pp. 4-5). It may therefore be suggested that Dr. Ehrhardt would have argued more cogently had he gone to Hebrews 4:14-16 for the source of the high priesthood continued by the Christian episcopate rather than to the priesthood of Israel.

*Immaculate Conception Seminary,  
Darlington, N.J.*

HENRY G. J. BECK

LES TROIS CHAPITRES AU CONCILE DE CHALCÉDOINE. UNE ÉTUDE DE L'ANATOLIE ANCIENNE. By H. M. Diepen, O.S.B. Oosterhout (Pays-Bas): Editions de Saint Michel, 1953. Pp. 128. 12.00 fl.

The Christology of the school of Antioch has in recent decades been the object of much sympathetic study. At the turn of the century the discovery of a Syriac translation of Nestorius' *Liber Heraclidis* was the occasion for an attempted vindication of Cyril's tragic adversary by Harnack, Loofs, Bethune-Baker, etc. More recently, Nestorius' master, Theodore of Mopsuestia, has been presented in a mellower light by Devreesse, Amann, and others. Even while rejecting the radical thesis which would find in Nestorius the champion of orthodoxy and in Cyril the innovator and father of Mono-

physitism, not a few Catholic scholars conceive the great Christological controversy of the fifth century as a clash of two partial and basically orthodox positions, the more mystical Alexandrian insistence on the unity of the God-Man, and the realist two-nature Christology of Antioch.

Dom Diepen's dissertation vigorously dissents from this view, which represents, he believes, an unwarranted softness towards Antioch. Readers of the *Revue thomiste* are already familiar with his series of articles, still in progress, on the Assumptus Homo at Chalcedon. The present volume reproduces in part the early articles of this series, and seeks to determine the exact role of the Antiochene Christology in the Council of 451.

More concretely, Dom Diepen is interested in the place at Chalcedon of the three Antiochenes whom history has grouped under the heading of the Three Chapters. This expression, it will be recalled, was used of certain fragments of the writings of Theodore of Mopsuestia, Ibas of Edessa, and Theodoret of Cyrus, and was later applied to the persons of the authors themselves. Part I of this study is devoted to the Christological conceptions of Theodore and "the friends of Nestorius" (John of Antioch, Theodoret, Ibas, etc.). Part II examines the attitude of the fathers of Chalcedon towards these conceptions, both in the doctrinal discussions of the opening session and in the rehabilitation of Theodoret and Ibas (who had been deposed by the *latrocinium Ephesinum* of 449) later in the Council. Part III consists of an analysis of the definition of Chalcedon with a view to determining its sources, and of a brief exposition of the influence of St. Leo on its formulation.

The author's conclusions are unequivocal: We must reject the theory which would see in the Christology of Antioch a complement and corrective to the Christology of Cyril. Rather, the teaching of Theodore and his disciples, later to be condemned in the second Council of Constantinople, was a local and short-lived deviation from orthodoxy, abandoned in the *symbolum unionis* of 433 and rejected by Antioch's own representatives at Chalcedon. The Alexandrian current, alone true, had need of no complement, except perhaps as regards formulation. Whatever risks and lacunae were inherent in the Cyrillian line were counteracted at Chalcedon, indeed, by an Assumptus Homo Christology; this bore the stamp, however, not of Antioch but of Rome. As a beacon for the centuries against the twin reefs of Monophysitism and Nestorianism, the Council was the work of St. Leo.

This unyielding verdict is spelled out by Dom Diepen regarding numerous details in the history which he is studying, and in the course of arriving at it he breaks more than one lance with what he terms, provocatively enough, "la nouvelle Christologie." Devreesse's attempted rehabilitation of Theodore, he finds, is not supported by the evidence. (The author's lengthy

rejection of a one-hypostasis interpretation of the important fragment from Theodore's *De Incarnatione* would have found support in the careful study of this fragment by Francis A. Sullivan, S.J., in *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES*, XII [1951], 194-98). The *symbolum unionis* of 433 involved no sacrifice of doctrine or compromise for St. Cyril; in fact, Cyril's role was not that of a signatory of an agreement but that of a judge. Theodoret is not, as generally claimed, the responsible author of the *symbolum unionis*. The definition of Chalcedon is based directly on the confession of Flavian of 448, and only indirectly on the *symbolum unionis*.

Materially, and considering only his treatment of particular texts, Dom Diepen's presentation of Theodore and his followers is not radically different from that of more sympathetic interpreters. Indeed, he does attempt to nuance his critique, and recognizes that it is not the subjective intention of Theodore which is in question. Nevertheless, his refusal to allow for Theodore (and for the Antiochene school in general) any positive role in the genesis of the dogma of Chalcedon may call for reservations, and it seems doubtful that the author has established his position here. Other students of the period, in their over-all evaluations, manifest a greater willingness to allow for such factors as unstabilized terminology, inadequate metaphysical equipment, the exaggerations and blind-spots engendered by controversy, and, finally, the very poverty of human language in dealing with so profound a mystery. A greater sensitivity, too, to the dangers and limitations of the Alexandrian Christology, as manifested in the aberrations of Apollinaris and Eutyches, and in the insufficient place given to the humanity of the Savior in the soteriology of, say, St. Athanasius, has made scholars like Grillmeier (*Das Konzil von Chalkedon*, I, 144-55) considerably more receptive to Theodore's positive contributions, without losing sight of his shortcomings.

Where the balance of truth lies will become clearer, we trust, with subsequent discussions. Certainly Dom Diepen's volume possesses the essential balance which one looks for in a subject where, often, only a diaphanous membrane separates truth and error. Still, a note of uncompromise, even intransigence, recurs several times in his work, and one may ask if such a note harmonizes fully with the extremely complex and frequently obscure data offered to the historian of fifth-century Christology. An additional distraction for the reader is had in the tense and, it would seem, not very relevant allusions to the contemporary Christology of Déodat de Basly and his admirers.

Finally, the obvious and considerable merits of this work must be formally acknowledged. Based on a careful and competent reading of the sources, skilfully structured, and developed with an adequate sense of historical



and literary detail, it is an able exposition of a defensible position. Dom Diepen has already established himself as a theologian of quality. His incisive critiques of the *Assumptus Homo* tendency in ancient and contemporary Christology deserve attention, and will undoubtedly contribute to a fruitful dialogue on a difficult historical and theological question, whose virtualities will always require patient and accurate development.

*Woodstock College*

THOMAS E. CLARKE, S.J.

VOM WESEN UND AUFBAU KATHOLISCHER THEOLOGIE. By Hermann Köster, S.V.D. Steyl: Steyler Verlagsbuchhandlung Kaldenkirchen, 1954. Pp. 122.

In this brochure Fr. Köster presents two important essays, one on the nature and structure of theology in general, the other on the scientific conception of missiology. The first essay endeavors to establish a definition of theology which will put in evidence the order and organic unity of all those branches of study which are commonly regarded as theology. Theology is defined as scientific reflection on the whole revelation reality and its relationship to men. The concrete object of theological reflection, namely, the entire revelation reality, embraces the whole historical process of salvation, and everything strictly connected with it, as well as the relationship of the entire revelation reality to mankind.

Because revelation is embedded, as it were, in natural reality and thus proportioned to our human mode of knowledge, theology is said to have no method proper to itself. Rather theology must make use of the scientific methods of different natural knowledges in reflecting on its own object. What is proper to theology is the precise modal determination given to the methods used by the theologian whereby he grasps natural reality not in itself and for itself, but as the receptacle in which the revelation reality is made accessible to men. Divine revealability, therefore, which is the formal object of theology, is the modality which the methods of other sciences assume in theology.

On the basis of this notion of theology the author presents a new view of the structure of theology. In a division based on the complex, organic nature, origin, and development of the revelation reality the following branches appear in logical sequence: fundamental theology, historical theology, pastoral theology (*Seelsorge*, in a wide sense, involving the theology of the threefold office of Christ in His Church), biblical theology, and systematic theology (including speculative and moral). The special object of each branch is delineated, each with its special tasks and appropriate

methods, and the relation of the various branches to each other and to the whole of theology is pointed out.

The work in general is well done and provides many rewarding insights into a difficult problem. Here we can single out only a few points for comment. The description of the revelation reality reflects a deep insight into the complexity and extension in time and space of the object of theological reflection and needs to be pondered especially by theologians working in the fields of historical theology and canon law, who frequently tend to forget the supernatural character of the object of their study.

The explanation given of the formal object of theology is not adequately explained. The claim that theology has no method proper to itself, an observation made independently of Söhngen's previous notation to the same effect, represents a good insight into the unique character of theology, but misunderstanding will probably result because the term "method" is ambiguous in science.

The many practical difficulties involved in teaching theology according to the structure outlined are evident to the author himself, who does not attempt any practical solution to this problem. Nearly every branch must presuppose many elements treated in other parts of theology.

The second essay, entitled "Wissenschaftstheoretisches zur sogenannten Missionswissenschaft," was occasioned by the author's critical reading of André Seumoïs' universally esteemed work, *Introduction à la missiologie*, and is of special interest and importance for all missiologists. Two fundamental ideas run through the essay: (1) missiology is pure theology and nothing but theology; (2) therefore, the proper divisions of missiology are the divisions of theology itself. Hence many of the treatises and branches into which missiology has been divided are regarded by the author as so many *passus extra viam*.

The work is significant not only because it is a new attempt at a theory of missiology (Köster does not like this term), but also because it points up the very few weaknesses in Seumoïs' great work. With the aggressive, apostolic zeal of a field missionary anxious to bring the fruit of experience and theological reflection to bear on the improvement of schools preparing future missionaries, Köster is especially compelling in his description of the essential characteristics, specific functions, and requisites of a true historical theology of the missions and mission pastoral. He finds Seumoïs especially at fault, and I think with reason, in confusing "apologetics" with fundamental theology, in separating mission history from theology, and in neglecting catechetics in mission history and pastoral.

The two essays belong together and clarify each other. The value of the work would be greatly increased if a good index were provided. The absence

of a complete bibliography is excusable, since the work was written in the Orient, far from adequate library facilities. No serious student of the nature of theology or missiology will fail to study this work.

*St. Mary's College*

GERALD VAN ACKEREN, S.J.

INTRODUCTION TO THEOLOGY. Edited by A. M. Henry, O.P. Translated from the French by William Storey. Theology Library, I. Chicago: Fides, 1954. Pp. xiv + 306. \$5.95.

In France a group of Thomistic theologians, most of whom belong to the Order of Preachers, has produced a fine theological series, entitled *Initiation théologique* and published by *Les Éditions du Cerf*, Paris. The fourth and last volume of this series has been but recently released.

The series intends to be an aid, particularly to the clergy, for acquiring a theological formation which will be adequate to the demands of modern preaching and instruction. Limiting as much as possible their consideration of the conclusions which manual theologians are accustomed to draw from revealed principles, the authors of the *Initiation* have sought fully to illuminate both the fundamental themes of the Christian message and the fonts in which they are to be found. The scheme, according to which the entire exposition is ordered and which determines its unity, is that of the *Summa theologiae* in which St. Thomas, according to Father Henry (cf. I, 281 sq.), has constructed a theology which not only respects the various steps in the history of salvation, so vividly described in Scripture and in the preaching of the Fathers, but at the same time satisfies the exigencies of the speculative intellect. While the plan and inspiration for the series are thus taken from St. Thomas, each contributor has personally rethought his subject and has attempted to present it in terms and even in categories accessible to the modern reader.

During the next two years, under the direction of Louis J. Putz, C.S.C., of the Religion Department of the University of Notre Dame, Fides Publishers will issue this excellent French series in a six-volume translation entitled the Theology Library. *Introduction to Theology* is the first number to be published.

This volume treats of the theological fonts. All the elements which must be consulted in theological research are systematically presented: tradition, Sacred Scripture, liturgy, canon law, the Fathers and Doctors of the Church, the creeds, tradition in the Oriental Churches, the ecumenical councils, and Christian art. The final chapter is devoted to theology as the science of faith. At the end of each chapter a selected bibliography is given, and in several instances themes for further study are suggested in order to stimulate personal research.

The Theology Library is "a work destined to be a teacher for the men and women of our times, a real initiation into theology, in view of the day when a more perfect synthesis will be created" (p. xiv). One can question whether these studies, especially those to be presented in the future volumes, can serve as "a real initiation into theology" for those who come to them without benefit of any previous formal training in theology and who will use the volumes apart from the direction and explanations of a teacher. This difficulty arises from the excessive density which characterizes the studies as well as from the synthetic method which is used, a method little adapted to the needs of the uninitiated. Brevity appears to be a preoccupation of the authors; this brevity of exposition can lead to false emphases and to consequent misunderstandings. To cite but one example: the statement of Père Dubarle that it is very probable that "there is no subject in the Christian faith that Scripture cannot throw light upon, in other words, that Scripture contains the whole of Revelation" (p. 74), would seem to call for a more detailed explanation than he gives in order to be justified, if indeed it can be justified at all.

While there is hardly a professor of theology who will not readily admit the defects of manual theology, Henry's criticism in the matter seems unreasonably harsh and severe. Making due exception for the singular excellence of theological pedagogy within the Order of Preachers, he would have us believe that the method followed in the seminaries and in the majority of religious scholasticates "kills all taste for the intellectual quest" and, "what is worse, it renders the faith insipid since the latter can only be sustained in the believer amid the peaceful concern and anxious desire for understanding. . . . Do we not have the distressing feeling that we are assisting at the decrepitude of theology?" (p. 269). Even if these contentions were provable—and the author offers no proof other than the authority of his own testimony—they do not seem to be relevant to a humble quest for the revealed truth.

The present volume has been translated by William Storey, a student at the Medieval Institute of the University of Notre Dame. In general the translation is excellent. Occasionally, however, it follows the French too literally and makes difficult reading. At other times it is inaccurate; for example, p. 18, "the unanimity of Christian feeling," where "feeling" does not translate correctly the French "sens" as it is used in this context. On p. 20, note 3, "even if they *support* a doctrine of faith" should be the translation, rather than "even if they *rest on* a doctrine of faith."

**THE HUMAN ELEMENT IN THE CHURCH OF CHRIST.** By Paul Simon. Translated from the German by Meyrick Booth. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1954. Pp. ix + 166. \$2.75.

The intention of the late Father Simon in this short study is not to offer a theological treatise in answer to the constant objection that the Church is too much concerned with power and material things, and ever conspicuous for its human weaknesses. The aim is rather to present the human aspect of the life of the Church quite unsystematically, but in such a way that thinking men will understand the fundamentals of the question. In this he has been eminently successful and has given us a sincere, candid, and thoughtful treatment of the problem.

The Church is a divine institution. It came into the world to call men to God. The gift it brings to men is of supernatural origin, and the goal it sets before them is not of this world. But the men who came to the people on behalf of God and of Christ remained men with all the characteristics proper to that state, including human inadequacy, weakness, and the possibility of corruption. The human element in the Church is that which emanates from men—the man himself and everything that he contributes to the gift of God. From these components we obtain, in addition to all that is good, the various human weaknesses that we would prefer not to see in the Church. A man does not lay aside any of his essential characteristics when he becomes a Christian, though he be a bishop or the Pope himself.

The temptations of Christ were directed against the essence of His mission on earth, and thus are typical dangers to which the servants of the Church, the bearers of its power, are open. These temptations are the pursuit of earthly aims by means of the power that belongs to a religious mission, the use of means that do not correspond to the mission of spreading the Kingdom of God, and the placing of too great a value on worldly success in the religious field.

It was a part of God's plan of salvation that He should descend and become man, that His revelation should be clothed in the form of a human being, and that as messengers to the people He should send men of flesh and blood who would spread the Gospel more through their personal lives than through their teachings. Christianity came to men and for this reason it spoke the language of mankind, fitted itself to human customs, and, coming into contact with new races and types of civilization, incorporated much of the new in its formal presentation, and above all called upon representatives of the different races to be themselves responsible for the preaching of the Gospel to their own peoples. It would be a mistake to look upon the human element in the Church simply as a falling away from the divine

idea, as a detraction from the Gospel message. It has quite another aspect, that of an incredible gift from God, taking pity on us and going out to meet us in human form, not only through Christ but also through His Church.

There are some frank and enlightening pages on the wealth of the Church, the changes of position of the clergy and their occupational dangers, the organism that is the Church and its organization, and on the spirit of self-examination, renewal, and reform that is always present in the Church.

The visible Church represents the *civitas Dei*, and it is not through the cleverness of men and women, through human inventions, mental powers or gifts of any kind, through human persuasiveness or wisdom, but only through the power of Christ and the grace of God that the City of God will gain the final victory. Therefore, we must never confuse human success, capacity, dignity, or honor with the honor and glory of the City of God. The Church in this world has no cause whatever to deny or conceal the human qualities and weaknesses that are contained within it. However painful these may be, they serve to make plain the great truth that the Kingdom will not be founded by men but by the Son of God Himself.

*Woodstock College*

VINCENT T. O'KEEFE, S.J.

THE MYSTICAL CHRIST. By John J. Fernan, S.J. Theology: A Course for College Students, III. Syracuse: Le Moyne College, 1954. Pp. vi + 272.

Historians tell us that in the thirteenth century the great masters at the University of Paris, among them St. Thomas Aquinas, expounded theology by way of a commentary on Sacred Scripture. The masters in question felt that they were theologians and that the study of Scripture was part of the work of theology. Today something of the same approach to sacred doctrine is being tried in a number of Jesuit universities and colleges in the East. The order of the lectures and the points of doctrine to be stressed are outlined in the present series of textbooks used at Le Moyne College, Syracuse, N.Y. The integrating principle of the course is the whole Christ, Head and body, Bridegroom and bride. Volumes I and II present Christ as He is revealed in the Gospels and in the Epistle to the Hebrews: God and Man, Prophet and King, High Priest and Redeemer. Although these earlier volumes portray the prophetic, kingly, and priestly mission of Christ as continued in His Church, the nature of the Church as a hierarchical organization and a living organism is reserved for Volume III. Here Fr. Fernan allows the Acts of the Apostles and the Epistles of St. Paul to yield the inspired data for a deeper understanding of the Church's own inspirational synthesis of the Mystical Christ in the Encyclical, *Mystici corporis*. Systematic excursions into the theology of confirmation, of orders, and of the

Trinity—the last from the able pen of Edward J. Messemer, S.J.—interrupt without distracting too much from the Scripture sequence.

Fr. Fernan has unquestionably done a great service to college theology by opening up for the lay student the riches of Scripture which he would otherwise never come to know. But these riches are inexhaustible and the temptation is ever present to keep exploring without stopping long enough to catalogue and to systematize in the light of Christian tradition the riches that have been uncovered. Whether Fr. Fernan has yielded to the temptation and, more important, whether in the limited time given to college theology he is to be blamed or praised for doing so, will depend on the individual's appreciation of the peculiar genius of the present course. At any rate, if we see in theology not merely science but wisdom as well, it is quite possible that Fr. Fernan's method will result in a richer and more profound intelligence of the truths of faith than has been achieved on the college level thus far. Time and the experience of teacher and student will decide.

*Spellman Hall, Fordham University*

PAUL F. PALMER, S.J.

DU PROTESTANTISME À L'ÉGLISE. By Louis Bouyer. Unam sanctam, XXVII. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1954. Pp. xi + 251. \$2.75.

In the author's own words, the present volume "is a witness. It tells simply how adherence to the Catholic Church came to impress itself on the conscience of a former Protestant. It was not disgust with the past which turned him away from the religion of his Protestant infancy, youth, and years in the pastoral ministry" (Avant-Propos).

Through ten chapters and a conclusion the writer elaborates the story of his own conversion, not on the biographical level of a personal experience but on the higher level of an objective analysis of the relative merits of Catholic and Protestant Christianity. His conversion to the Catholic faith, he admits, required no positive denial of what he had formerly believed. Rather it was the fruit of a growing realization that the Catholic Church alone preserves and fosters the teaching of Christ in the spirit of the Gospel. The immediate reason for his acceptance of Catholicism was the picture of conflict in the ranks of Protestantism, with "conglomerate institutions hostile to each other and at the same time hostile to the Catholic Church." Whatever else may be said of the true Church of Christ, it seemed inconceivable to him that its Founder would have made the "fatal error" of sowing the seeds of discord and disunity into its very nature.

The above sentiments are expressed on the first page of the book. Thereafter the author enters on a theme which may best be characterized as "unusual." First he examines "the positive principles of the Reformation,"

which may be substantially reduced to two: the conviction that man's salvation is the result of God's grace, and that in the economy of revelation the Sacred Scriptures possess "sovereign authority." On the necessity of grace for justification and salvation, Bouyer feels that Catholics at the time of the Reformation may have given occasion for the emphasis on faith and grace among the Protestants, even to the denial of good works, as taught by Luther. In the authentic Protestant tradition, the opposition to good works was actually resistance to any concept of "an addition of our personal quota, which is extrinsic to the couplet of grace which gives and of faith which receives the gift" (p. 14). The author believes there was enough evidence in pre-Reformation piety of this "extrinsicism" to explain the Lutheran stress on "faith alone," though obviously there was no excuse for its heretical aberration. In the same way, the emphasis on Scripture among the Reformers was no mere coincidence. It came as a reaction to the current "negligence of Sacred Scripture, which had almost disappeared under the debris of a decadent Scholasticism, and had been practically replaced for the simple faithful by legends and popular formulas of piety that were far from the data of revelation" (p. 16).

The latter part of the book treats of the "negative elements in the Reformation," which Bouyer traces to the historical setting in which the Reformation was born. A comprehensive term for these elements in Protestantism would be "theological nominalism," which the Reformers borrowed from "medieval Catholicism, [whose] thought had been vitiated and corrupted" by the principles of William of Occam (p. 176). According to Occam, we must be on our guard against any idea that reason can arrive at the knowledge of God or establish a logical foundation for the acceptance of revelation. Hence follows fideism. Regarding God, the essence of Occamism is the theory of the arbitrary divine will. Yet at the dawn of the Reformation Occam's teaching was so much that of the schools through which Luther passed that the latter said, "Sum Occamicae factionis," and spoke simply of Occam as "magister meus." It is not surprising, therefore, that this "learned decadence of Christian thought, which represented nominalist theology," should have infected a sizable part of the Western world in the late Middle Ages. But where Catholic Christianity managed to purify itself of this accretion, Protestantism absorbed it into its system and ever since has been suffering the consequences.

Bouyer makes the observation that the "heretical or negative aspect of the Reformation not only did not derive from its positive principles, nor was it in any sense the necessary effect of something intrinsic to their development or defense, but it appears as the survival in Protestantism" of



the worst elements of deterioration in medieval Catholic thought. He believes that any successful effort to win the Protestant mind to sympathy and eventual conversion must include not only a forthright presentation of Catholic doctrine but also an understanding of prospective converts, "as they are in reality, and not as our prejudice and habits would have us see them." To this end, he thinks, a desire to find what is good in Protestantism will more effectively produce conversions than a penchant for exposing its errors.

There is an appendix by Père de Broglie on the primacy of the argument from Scripture in theology, written as a corrective to a possible wrong impression on the same point derived from reading the text. An index would have helped to locate the sequence of thought which runs through the book. The general impression, however, is one of deep scholarship and wide reading in a subject that is seldom investigated and yet needs to be known as a supplement to the scientific and impersonal treatise in apologetics.

*West Baden College*

JOHN A. HARDON, S.J.

LE RÔLE DU LAÏCAT DANS L'ÉGLISE. By G. Philips. Cahiers de l'actualité religieuse. Tournai-Paris: Casterman, 1954. Pp. 248.

The body of literature on the theology of the laity continues to grow, and Philips' book is the latest contribution from Belgium. His avowed purpose is to formulate precise principles of the place of the layman in the Church and to stimulate both clergy and laity to follow out these principles honestly and completely. To this end he considers in succession the current development of interest in the layman's ecclesiological position; the meaning of the term "laity"; the Church as institution and community; the relation of the Church to the world; the sacerdotal, prophetic, and royal mission of the layman; Catholic Action; the layman's apostolate; spirituality for the laity.

Appearing so soon after the publication of Congar's *Jalons pour une théologie du laïc*, Philips' work naturally invites comparison. It is interesting to note that Philips' order of treatment is practically identical with that of Congar. This is not a very neat scheme, and there is a certain amount of overlapping, some of which is perhaps inevitable. It would seem that a satisfactory structure for a theology of the laity has yet to be attained. Like Congar's book, Philips' work is a synthesis. Unlike Congar, it is not so much a doctrinal construction as a series of reflections on doctrinal themes. Although Philips does not have the detail and completeness of Congar, there is room for both approaches.

Philips' style features the taut phrase, the crisp aphorism; it has the virtues and some of the defects of this kind of writing. For the most part it is stimulating, but at times, although rarely enough, it verges on the banal. At all times the thought is solidly rooted in both doctrine and practice. On this latter point the author is explicit. "We have paid close attention to the word of God in the Gospels and in tradition. But we have also heeded the testimony of the Spirit as manifested in the directives of the magisterium and in the living response which these directives have evoked in the community of the faithful." Particularly noteworthy are the author's discussions of authority-initiative tensions, the tasks of the Catholic in political life, and the characteristics of a spirituality for laymen.

Philips admits that he is not always proposing definitive solutions. The state of this area of theology does not permit it. But, as he remarks, "The laity is seeking instruction on the nature of its vocation, whatever may be the gropings of scientific theology." He raises the presently persistent problems, and if his solutions lack inevitability, they are nevertheless moderate and sound. Many of his cautions may seem unnecessary in the American context. In this country there has been hardly enough lay activity, of the kind discussed by Philips, to call for caution. But if there is to be more "living response" to the directives of the magisterium, as some signs seem to indicate, Philips' moderation will set a salutary standard. His book is a fine introduction to the problems and to some of the solutions in this important field of the life of the Church. It can well serve as an enlightened and inspiring guide for both thought and action.

*Woodstock College*

FRANCIS M. KEATING, S.J.

THE LITURGICAL RENAISSANCE IN THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH. By Ernest B. Koenker. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1954, Pp. xi + 272. \$5.00.

Irenic and enthusiastic, this study of the liturgical movement is based on a doctoral dissertation presented to the Theological Field of the Divinity School of the University of Chicago. The thematic which orders Koenker's description and interpretation of the liturgical revival is that there has been an implicit repudiation of Tridentine teaching and a return to basic Protestant principles. To support this he cites abundant material drawn from the most prominent contemporary liturgists, though he does not sort out healthy development from eccentric distortions. No mention is made of the important international liturgical conference held at Lugano in 1953, nor does he assess fully the influence of *Mediator Dei* on liturgical revival. Rather the theme is counterpointed with the idea that the movement is in opposi-

tion to the Holy See and discouraged by the majority of the episcopate. This can hardly be sustained and, perhaps more significantly, discloses a misunderstanding of the function of the theologian in the Church.

A few specific corrections should be made. Trent did not anathematize the use of the vernacular in the Mass. To list Vonier and Masure with the advocates of the *Mysterientheologie* is very questionable grouping. While sensible of the profound scholarship of Dom Odo Casel, many theologians find his Mass theory unacceptable and untraditional. Post-Tridentine Mass theories founded on an exaggerated immolationism have long since lost currency. Does not Casel's theory suffer from the same excess of realism?

Dr. Koenker has proved with admirable stress that the constellations of liturgical actions, which compose the public worship of God, are the solvent of excessive subjectivism and individualism. And if the strictures made on his study are valid ones, the conclusion that liturgical reform is moving from classic Protestantism toward the Church is as welcome as it is sure. No better ground for ecumenicism can be found. We are in his debt not only because of his knowledgeable evaluation of many questions still open to discussion in the forum of opinion but also for one of the finest bibliographies on the liturgical movement available in English.

*Woodstock College*

EDWARD J. MURRAY, S.J.

CALVIN'S DOCTRINE OF THE WORD AND SACRAMENT. By Ronald S. Wallace. Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1953. Pp. xii + 253. 18s.

This book is not intended as a critical study nor does it trace the historical development of Calvin's thought on the Word and the sacraments. It is rather "... an attempt to express his teaching as copiously, fairly and sympathetically as possible." As a result, the book tells much about *what* Calvin taught on the Word and the sacraments, very little about *why* he so taught. The author supplies a framework of topic sentences and carefully illustrates it with more than sufficient quotations from the various writings of Calvin. The result is a somewhat repetitious mosaic of Calvin in which it is difficult to distinguish what is fundamental and important from merely secondary and inconsequential points of doctrine.

According to Calvin, man without Christ is perverse, man's "... whole soul is vitiated, from reason even to the affections." Therefore, all true knowledge of God must come through revelation. Christ is the mediator of all revelation, and has revealed God to men in the Old and New Testament through signs and symbols. Such signs and symbols are the Word and the sacraments. All Scripture is a manifestation of Christ. There are not two covenants nor is there a substantial difference between the sacraments of

the Old and New Testaments. Although Christ is more clearly manifested and the Holy Spirit more abundantly given under the so-called New Covenant, the difference is one of degree only.

Scripture, the written Word, is the only true source of our knowledge of Christ, and the sole authority in the life of the Church. No infallible Church establishes the authority of Scripture. This is the work of the Holy Spirit, who gives inner testimony to the believer. The Church merely recognizes the obvious in accepting the canon of Scripture. However, Scripture, which carries its own evidence, cannot be known to be the Word of God except by faith. Interpretation is to be left to the ministry of the Church, a ministry called by God and guided by the Holy Spirit in the office of exposition and prophecy.

Thus preaching, too, is part of the Word of God. Preaching is a means of revelation, since God speaks through the preacher. When the preacher, as an instrument of God, offers forgiveness of sins, those who hear the Word in faith are then and there absolved from their sins, for the Word of God effects what it declares. When not so received, the preached Word hardens the heart and renders man without excuse, bringing about his condemnation. This is the meaning of the power of the keys in Mt 16:19, which refers to the office of preaching. However, preaching sometimes fails to be the Word of God, since it is so transformed only through a free act of the Holy Spirit. Calvin offers no clue to indicate how men may distinguish one preaching from the other.

It is evident that faith is an all-important element in the theology of Calvin, since without faith revelation is not apprehended, the Word of God works only to condemn, and the sacraments are inefficacious. Unfortunately, faith is a rather vaguely defined concept, although Calvin confidently speaks of it as distinguished "... from that shapeless faith which the Papists have contrived." Faith seems to consist in "... rendering all our thoughts obedient to God's Word."

Submitting the seven sacraments to an arbitrary definition, Calvin finds that only baptism and the Lord's Supper are true sacraments. These are so subordinated to the Word and faith that, although Calvin does speak of the efficacy of the sacraments, in reality they become mere signs of a salvation already accomplished. Apart from the Word they differ in no respect from profane heathen rites. They are not essential to salvation except in the negative sense that their rejection is a sign that a man is not united to Christ. Since it is the Word which gives life to the sacraments, they should always be preceded by preaching. At the Word spoken by the minister one is to believe that his sins are forgiven and that he is restored to life. Baptism

is merely a sign and seal of the promise of that salvation. Although by baptism men become members of the Church, "out of which there can be neither salvation nor truth," Calvin denies that men are duly baptized unless they already belong to the body of the Church. This strange doctrine hardly makes sense, but it does indicate that baptism has no efficacy unless it is received in faith through which man is already reconciled to God. Calvin can say, however, that baptism is an effective means of grace not only when it is received, but also serves to remit sins committed after baptism whenever it is recalled in later life.

Strangely missing from this exposition is Calvin's doctrine of predestination. An author has every right to choose and limit his subject, but a doctrine developed in the context of predestination can hardly be understood apart from that context. Then, too, much that Calvin has to say about the relationship between the sacraments and the Church would be more intelligible were it clear exactly what Calvin meant by the Church. Certainly his determined opposition to the Catholic concept of the Church has greatly influenced his teaching on the nature of revelation and the role of the sacraments.

There are occasional misrepresentations of Catholic doctrine. The book has no index. It does, however, have a detailed table of contents.

*St. Mary of the Lake Seminary*

ERNEST V. MCCLEAR, S.J.

PIO NONO. A Study in European Politics and Religion in the Nineteenth Century. E. E. Y. Hales. New York: Kenedy, 1954. Pp. xii + 352. \$4.00.

This volume is not a biography of Pio Nono; it is a study of the major issues of the time as they were viewed and understood by that Pontiff. Hence it is a study of politics and religion, an analysis of the relations of Church and state, and also an essay in semantics, for, while Napoleon III or Cavour or Bismarck might talk about separating Church and state, what they meant was subordinating Church to state.

By way of introduction the author sketches the background of Mastai Ferretti, Cardinal Bishop of Imola, now become Pio Nono, and the political heritage transmitted to him by his predecessor, Gregory XVI. Attention is centered on Pio's character, interests, devotions, hopes, political aspirations and the obstacles to their realization. Pio's early reforms and concessions were not mere "sailing with the wind"; neither were they dictated by expedience"; they sprang from conviction, and they were carried through despite vigorous opposition. But to the new Pope there came a gradual awakening to the fact that his opponents were striving for objectives ir-

reconcilable with the interests and rights of the Church. The murder of his premier, Rossi, the rioting which necessitated his flight to Gaeta, the temporary triumph of Mazzini, and the abolition of the temporal power of the Pope opened the eyes of the Pontiff to the true purposes of those who masqueraded as liberals and reformers.

Hales insists that this contest between Pio Nono and Mazzini in 1849 was not a mere political clash, as many historians have contended, but a struggle between the Church and her enemies. To hold otherwise is to ignore the attitude of the principal protagonists. "The Risorgimento was essentially anti-Catholic" (p. 178). Intrigue and devious diplomacy, degenerating at times to plain lying and deception of Pio Nono by Cavour and by Napoleon III (whose treachery and double-dealing stand out), marked the decade from 1850 to 1860. Guided by "adventurous and cynical opportunism" the adversaries of the Pontiff plotted his abandonment and betrayal by France. "The responsibility for causing the Piedmontese spoliation was placed squarely by the Pope and Antonelli, with the full agreement of Catholic Europe, upon Napoleon; and the verdict has been endorsed by history" (p. 239).

In discussing the Syllabus the author is refreshingly outspoken. He observes that its real value lies in the references to which, in each case, the reader is referred, but which he rarely takes the trouble to consult; and that for its correct interpretation theological knowledge is required, because it was addressed to bishops with a view to giving them guidance on certain matters. Above all, it was not addressed to the press; it presupposed an audience "familiar with the terms of theological argument" (p. 262). Moreover, as the references to the Encyclical from which it is drawn reveal, the famous proposition 80 regarding "progress, liberalism, recent civilization" proves beyond a doubt that "it was the Piedmontese government's idea of what constituted progress and civilization with which the Pope was declining to come to terms" (p. 258). Besides, the Pope was talking in terms of "absolute and eternal principle," of perfect society, not of an existing society.

Finally, Hales insists that past views and attitudes towards the Vatican Council are yielding today to a new interpretation. Just as the Council of Trent dealt with the issues raised by Luther, Calvin, and others, so the Vatican Council was designed to clarify and proclaim the Church's stand on the issues raised by the nineteenth century. Pio was inclined to leave the definition of infallibility to the decision of the Council, in which there was unanimity as to its propriety, but difference of opinion as to its wisdom and

opportuneness, as well as to the terms in which the doctrine should be expressed.

From these pages Pio Nono emerges as the "founder of the modern papacy." He was not a politician, perhaps not much of a statesman. At all times he was guided by his conception of the duties of his office, and by the interest and good of the Church committed to his care. Even Cavour, so we are assured, understood that "for the Pope the issue was entirely one of principle, a matter of conscience" (p. 228). He was kind, devout, forgiving. We are assured that he never harbored personal animosity against his opponents, though on occasion his language could be forthright. This was true of his attitude towards Victor Emmanuel, Cavour, and others. While he hated the sin he loved the sinner.

We are indebted to Mr. Hales for a scholarly presentation of this difficult period, one long overdue. Throughout he has a British audience in mind, and he sets out to amend the impressions and attitudes created by Trevelyan and others. Repeatedly he gives us the traditional British understanding of an event or situation, and then looks for "the facts," "the reality," "the truth." He does not hesitate to observe that, turning a blind eye to the urgent need of reforms at home, the British government and public clamored for reforms in the Papal States; that they denounced the Pope as a despot while they supported the Sultan; that they declaimed against papal tyranny and countenanced tyranny in Ireland and India. Actually, says Hales, "there is no reason for stigmatizing Pio Nono's government as oppressive or corrupt, or economically backward; nor was the revolt, whether of enlightened moderates or of revolutionaries, really a revolt against oppression; it was rather a hankering after new forms and the awakening of political ambitions" (pp. 164-65). He concludes that the orthodox English liberal tradition is peculiarly out of perspective, marked by inconsistency and founded largely on ignorance. At bottom, in the eyes of the English liberal Pio was to blame because "he did not accept and adopt the ideas of Adam Smith and Cobden." Contemporary British reaction to the Vatican Council was no less erroneous and at variance with facts, for it merely echoed the opinions of Döllinger, Acton, Gregorovius, and the gossip picked up "by the Times correspondent Mozley who knew neither French nor Italian, and had therefore to depend on hearsay, but who knew that his readers expected to be given ridicule of what was going on" (p. 294). At present, so we are assured, the British attitude towards Pio Nono and the events of his pontificate is undergoing radical change. This volume will hasten the process.

KATHOLISCHE MORALTHEOLOGIE, I: DIE ALLGEMEINE MORAL. By Josef Mausbach and Gustav Ermecke. 8th rev. ed.; Münster: Aschendorff, 1954. Pp. xxxii + 444. 21 DM kart., 23 DM geb.

This first volume of the new edition of Mausbach's *Moraltheologie* by Dr. Gustav Ermecke, Paderborn, is the second in order of appearance, having been preceded last year by the third volume on the obligations of the moral virtues (cf. *TS*, XV [1954], 152). The edition is a revision of the original Mausbach, by-passing the earlier revisions of Tischleder, but so thorough and extensive that the new fundamental moral is some hundred pages longer than the basic text.

The lengthiest original contribution is found in a new section, "Grundzüge der Fundamentalmoral," serving as a sort of second preface. The material object of fundamental moral theology is the *actus humani* of a Christian, a creature humanly endowed with capacity for free action, and redeemed. The formal object is this same activity considered as the unfolding of the Christian's being, with reference to the moral obligations to be evolved and developed in special moral theology. Fundamental moral belongs neither to metaphysics nor dogmatic theology, nor yet to the science of moral norms which is ethics or moral theology; it lies between the science of being and the science of moral action and may be defined as the metaphysics and theology of human action, with a view to the establishment of moral norms.

The basic principles of fundamental moral derive from the general metaphysical law, *agere sequitur esse*, applied to man and to Christian man. Created activity follows the nature and norms of created being and, as such being is participated, so is the activity, a participation in the activity of God, an unfolding of the creature's being after the manner and type of its participation. Hence human activity is the unfolding of the nature and being of man. But Christian man has a supernatural ontology, a mystical-sacramental metaphysical structure, consisting in a new being in Christ, new life in Christ, a participation in the life of the Trinity. From this supernatural metaphysical structure derives the basic law of Christian activity: it must be the Christlike unfolding, flowering of the new being, the new life.

On the level of the act-potency structure of Christian man, this means that the Christian must endeavour to bring his grace-potential to graced actuality, supernatural action. On the level of the substance-accident structure, grace is for the substance of the soul the basis of new being, life, activity, giving to the natural faculties the capacity to place acts corresponding to the new life. On the level of the matter-form structure, the new life of the soul must dominate the proper natural dynamism and faculties of the whole man to achieve a greater Christ-likeness (new form of the new man)



in being and activity. On the level of personalist, individual action, every Christian must actualize as fully as possible the new life-ideal given to the species of redeemed man, in all its individual and actual concreteness, the ideal of maximum conformity to Christ. This is the existential fulfilment of life in Christ and in His Mystical Body, the personal realization of the Christian ideal.

Though this view of moral action and of its norm-source is not new to the moralist and has always been implicit in the thought of the theologian familiar with moral (including ascetical) and dogmatic disciplines, it has lost emphasis in that common separation of the sciences, whence moral theology tends to become a mixture of natural ethics (graced by some scriptural quotations, appeals to the magisterium, etc.), canon law, and some elements of dogma (principally sacramental)—a far cry from the science of the “*motus creaturae rationalis in Deum*” (*Sum. theol.*, I-II, proem.), through the redemption of Christ and His continued working in the Church, His Mystical Body. While we may have reservations about the felicity of some aspects and expressions of Dr. Ermecke’s presentation of this concept of moral theology, we cannot but be grateful for its forceful emphasis in the first pages of a work intended as a seminary textbook and for his insistent return to and application of this idea throughout the work.

The subtitle indicates the author’s view of the nature of fundamental moral: “*die Lehre von den allgemeinen sittlichen Pflichten der Nachfolge Christi zur Gleichgestaltung mit Christus und zur Verherrlichung Gottes in der Auferbauung seines Reiches in Kirche und Welt*”; it indicates, too, the influence of Fritz Tillmann’s *Nachfolge Christi*. However, the volume remains fundamentally and, we think, happily Scholastic in its method and treatment, losing none of the clear and scientific exposition which characterized Mausbach’s original.

There are many other additions and amplifications of significant length and moment: on the sources of moral theology (pp. 43–50), the methods of moral theology (pp. 58–63), the nature and ultimate norm of morality (pp. 70–73), penal and purely penal laws (pp. 145–49), the characteristics of conscience, natural and supernatural (pp. 163–68), the idea of perfection (pp. 310–13), etc. Other minor clarifications and additions occur on almost every page, making the present work a substantial revision, incorporating all the excellences of the very excellent original, enriched by the contribution of a penetrating mind familiar with all the relevant currents and movements in modern theological thought.

Not the least valuable product of Dr. Ermecke’s industry is the ample bibliography provided at the end of each short section, which lists all the

significant German books and periodical literature of the last twenty years. A useful key to this massive collection is found in a very complete index of names. The long scriptural index attests the author's desire to make greater use of Holy Writ as a source of moral theological truth, while some sixty pages of *index rerum* facilitate the use of the work as a ready reference volume.

*Jesuit Seminary, Toronto*

E. F. SHERIDAN, S.J.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 1953 SISTERS' INSTITUTE OF SPIRITUALITY. Edited by Joseph Haley, C.S.C. Notre Dame: University Press, 1954. Pp. ix + 211. \$3.00.

THE APOSTOLATE OF CHASTITY. By Ferdinand Valentine, O.P. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1954. Pp. viii + 245. \$3.25.

These two volumes are very acceptable additions to the rapidly growing library of books dedicated to one or other phase of the life of religious Sisters. The first of the two contains a series of articles on subjects discussed at Notre Dame University in the first Institute of Spirituality for superiors and novice-mistresses ever held in this country. The second is more of a unified and planned treatise on the religious life as viewed from the angle of the vow (and the virtue) of chastity.

Because of the disparate character of the material in the *Proceedings* (formation of novices, ascetical theology, liturgy, canon law, etc.) it is impossible in a short review to do justice to its worthwhile content. It must suffice to note here that in each article of the series will be found material helpful for all religious, and in most of them not only instruction but very solid spiritual help of a high order awaits the reader. In the article on spiritual theology, for instance, there are excellent animadversions on the virtues of religion, charity, and self-abnegation; in the liturgical article the Mass is treated fully and with practical skill; in the canon law summary the clarification of superiors' obligations and authority will do much to eradicate mistakes which have caused trouble in many communities in the past; even in so otiose a subject as the particular examen there are gems worth the effort of reading, particularly in the section devoted to an analysis of pride. The book closes, fittingly enough on the eve of the Marian Year, with a fine conference on Mary as model of religious perfection.

It might be added, in fairness to the Institute, that the course given in 1953 was but the opening one, not a self-contained or self-sufficient thing in itself, but part of what will happily be a larger whole in succeeding summers. Hence the *Proceedings*, which in this initial publication seem rather kaleido-

scopic, in the long run will turn into complete, integrated courses on the various subjects mentioned.

The second book is quite different in character. In place of a series of subjects, handled by different authors, here we have a single theme, handled from various aspects by one and the same author. The aim of the latter, admirably achieved, is to analyze the notion of chastity against the background of religious life with a view to clarifying its nature, its sphere of influence, and its fruitfulness in the apostolate. With commendable orderliness and theological precision the writer first sketches in the background of religious life against which chastity is to be illuminated; next he discusses the nature of religious chastity, and from there goes on to the spiritual maternity of the virginal Sister; in the last section, beginning with a notable chapter on "Mary Mediatrix," he opens up enticing vistas of fruitfulness stemming from the vow in practice.

In a work otherwise excellent the reviewer found difficulty in assimilating the title. Two impressions seem to be responsible for the difficulty, or at least to hold it vaguely suspended in mind: the seeming interchange of charity and of chastity as though they were synonymous, and the apparent exaltation of chastity as the all-pervasive expression of divine charity in religious life; there seemed nothing left for either poverty or obedience to do. However, this difficulty may be personal to the reviewer; at any rate, it does not detract from the positive instruction afforded by the work as a whole, or from its occasional practical, down-to-earth applications. The esteem with which the writings of the author have rightly been received in the past is sufficient guarantee of the excellence of this volume; and if it may not be listed as easy reading, it certainly falls into the category of pleasant and profitable reading.

Woodstock College

FRANCIS X. PEIRCE, S.J.

## DESCRIPTIVE NOTICES

ENCHIRIDION BIBLICUM. Documenta ecclesiastica sacram scripturam spectantia auctoritate Pontificiae Commissionis de Re Biblica edita. 2nd ed.; Naples: D'Auria, 1954. Pp. xv + 279. \$1.65. In several features this new edition of the *Enchiridion biblicum* differs from its predecessor of 1927. In external format it is smaller, while the quality of the paper has been improved and the type is more legible. However, the order in which the documents are arranged, the method of selection, and the style of presentation remain unchanged. In this edition all the documents issued either by

the Pontifical Commission or by other authoritative organs of the magisterium are published. In addition, some earlier documents which seem to be of greater importance are included for the first time. Some other documents, those which seem to be of a private character or which have been amended by later dispositions of the Holy See, have been omitted. It has been found necessary to rearrange and increase the marginal numbers, but the numbers used in the previous edition are indicated. There is a subject index, an index of names, and an index of scriptural texts.

**L'EVANGILE ET LES ÉVANGILES.** By Joseph Huby, S.J. Edited by Xavier Léon-Dufour, S.J., Paris: Beauchesne, 1954. Pp. viii + 304. The editor has considerably revised and added to the first chapter on the general background of the Gospels. The chapters on the individual Gospels remain untouched. An excellent addition to the *Verbum salutis* series.

**I PETER: A PASCHAL LITURGY.** By F. L. Cross. London: A. R. Mowbray, 1954. Pp. 50. What we have before us is an early liturgical document sponsored by Apostolic authority. Its themes are baptism, Passover, passion-resurrection and moral duties. Taken together they seem to connect the 'Epistle' with the Paschal baptismal Eucharist. The 'Epistle' partakes of both a homily and a liturgy, viz., it is the Celebrant's part for the Paschal Vigil, for which, as the most solemn occasion in the Church's year, the baptismal-Eucharist text must have been carefully prepared.

**MARY AND MODERN MAN.** Edited by Thomas J. M. Burke, S.J. N.Y.: America Press, 1954. Pp. xvi + 231. \$3.50. Ten authors, American and English, priests and laymen, explore Mary's significance as a cultural ideal for modern man. Much has been written of Marian dogma, many books teach devotion to Mary, but little has been written to illustrate the cultural values for which Mary stands. The dogmas which crown Mary with unique radiance have a meaning for the arts and for civilization. Unless we explore this aspect of Mary we shall not achieve that integral Catholicism which is the need of our times. Though quite different in content and style, these essays all emphasize the one truth that divine revelation is not fully realized until it is operative in the whole sweep of man's life, until it colors his every reaction, until it paints his pictures and makes his music.

**SAINT JOSEPH.** Edited by Henri Rondet, S.J. Paris: Lethielleux, 1953. Pp. 177. Rondet's lengthy introduction gathers all we know of St. Joseph from scriptural, patristic, and legendary sources, from liturgical

feasts, religious art, and the development of his cult by ascetical and theological writers. It concludes with a summary of the theology of the Saint. Long selections from Bossuet and Francis de Sales are quoted, together with short ones from nine authors, including Chrysostom, Bernard, and Leo XIII.

CHRISTOLOGY OF THE LATER FATHERS. Edited by Edward Rochie Hardy in collaboration with Cyril C. Richardson. Library of Christian Classics, III. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1954. Pp. 400. \$5.00. Third volume of a series "designed to present in the English language, and in twenty-six volumes of convenient size, a selection of the most indispensable Christian treatises written prior to the end of the sixteenth century." Athanasius' *On the Incarnation of the Word*, Gregory of Nazianzus' *Theological Orations* and some letters, Gregory of Nyssa's *Answer to Ablabius* and *Address on Religious Instruction*, together with twelve documents illustrating the Christology of the Ecumenical Councils (e.g., the Tome of Leo, the Chalcedonian Decree), are here translated with introductions, good selected bibliographies, and brief notes. A general introduction sketches Christological development up to 681.

THE CHRISTOLOGICAL CONTENT OF THE "SERMONES" OF ST. ANTHONY. By Juniper M. Cummings, O.F.M.Conv. Padua: Il Messaggero di S. Antonio, 1953. Pp. x + 143. All the principal doctrines of Christology as found in the writings of St. Anthony are included in this dissertation. The author's aim is to present what St. Anthony wrote about Christ; in accord with this desire he is most scrupulous in presenting Antonian doctrine as it is and not cut to fit into preconceived notions of a manual of Christology. After a brief discussion of his method, the following chapters consider the Christocentric aspects of Antonian doctrine on creation, redemption, and judgment. Thus an insight is achieved into the understanding of his theology as a whole, since it is essentially Christocentric.

HANDBUCH DER KATHOLISCHEN DOGMATIK, FÜNFTE BUCH: ERLÖSUNGSLEHRE, ERSTER HALBBAND. By Matthias Joseph Scheeben. Edited by Carl Feckes. Freiburg: Herder, 1954. Pp. 426 + xxviii. DM 18.— A short chapter on the preliminary conditions and preparations for the redemption through Christ introduces the detailed study of the dogmatic truths about Christ's constitution which are derived from Scripture and tradition and a more exact examination of the hypostatic union in the light of the modalities, properties, conditions, and causes, as well as of the origin of Christ. The study of Christ's attributes, left incomplete in this volume, handles

them in general and then concludes with the substantial attributes of Christ's person.

**CHRIST ACTS THROUGH THE SACRAMENTS.** By A. M. Roguet, O.P. Translated by the Carisbrooke Dominicans. Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 1954. Pp. 162. \$2.00. The famous French liturgist first considers the sacraments as acts of Christ, as sacred signs, as signs of grace, of faith, of the Church; then he treats the sacraments individually; finally he adds four notes on sacramental spirituality.

**LE SENS DU PÉCHÉ.** By J. Régnier. Paris: Lethielleux, 1954. Pp. 126. Written for instructors in Christian doctrine, its aim is to inculcate a sense of sin, which includes both an understanding of the fault and a sensibility to its manifestations. After examining the defects in modern consciences, three chapters on sin, the sinner, and sins delineate the precise notions needed as the basis for a genuine sense of sin. The final chapter handles practical points on exact and comprehensive instruction, on initiating a spiritual life, and on the liturgy and sacraments.

**L'ITINÉRAIRE DU FILS ADOPTIF DE DIEU.** By Louis-N. Boutin, O.M.I. Ottawa: Scolasticat Saint-Joseph, 1954. Pp. 239. Throughout this series of reflections on the theological virtues, the vows of religion, and the principal means of sanctification, the personality of Christ remains the central figure; He is the way, the truth, and the life for the adopted sons of God. The epilogue considers Mary's role in man's supernatural life. These theological meditations are marked by constant references to Scripture, especially the Gospels, and the Doctors of the Church, especially St. Thomas.

**A STUDY OF THE ECSTASIES OF THE FORTY DAYS OF ST. MARY MAGDALEN DE' PAZZI.** By Ernest E. Larkin, O.Carm. Rome: Pontificium Institutum "Angelicum," 1954. Pp. 67. This treatise, a partial reproduction of a dissertation, aims at a scientific study of the forty-day ecstasies of St. Mary Magdalen de' Pazzi. Its purpose is analytic and comparative: to establish the psychological and theological principles of the ecstasies and to relate these data to the generally accepted theological teaching in these matters. The present excerpt has omitted much of the comparative study, but since the analysis is conducted in the framework of the general teaching on ecstasy and ecstatic prayer, the main conclusions along these lines are indicated. The result is a better appreciation of the Saint's mystical life and an insight into her contribution to the knowledge of mystical prayer.

**THE PERFECTION OF MAN BY CHARITY.** By Reginald Buckler, O.P. St. Louis: Herder, 1954. Pp. ix + 235. \$3.50. Fr. Buckler's original volume on this subject appeared in 1889. The third revised edition, on which the present republished version is based, appeared first in 1912. The book is divided into two sections: the first treats of perfection in itself, while the second and more comprehensive considers the life of charity, embracing chapters on all particular phases of the spiritual life and the union of all virtues in charity.

**SPIRITUALITY.** By Antonin Gilbert Sertillanges, O.P. Translated by the Dominican Nuns, Corpus Christi Monastery, Menlo Park, California. New York: McMullen, 1954. Pp. 244. \$2.95. This is the fourth volume of conversations on matters of life-long interest which Fr. Sertillanges completed before his death. Ten chapters, each bearing a title as unique as the first two—"He" and "We"—, present the author's wise observations about the spiritual life in short, capsule-like paragraphs. Every paragraph calls for a few moments of serious reflection.

**PLUS PRÈS DE DIEU.** By Gaston Salet, S.J. Paris: Lethielleux, 1954. Pp. 223. The author calls his informal meditations in this book a series of "brief reflections for Sundays and the holy days." He has included forty-eight chapters, covering the most important Sundays of the year and the major feasts of our Lord and the Blessed Mother. His inspiring and original thoughts were written for a general audience, so that both religious and lay people will find them valuable.

**MORE BLESSED THAN KINGS.** By Vincent P. McCorry, S.J. Westminster, Md.: Newman Press, 1954. Pp. 242. \$3.00. By means of vivid sketches of minor Gospel characters such as Simeon, the wife of Zebedee, the father of the lunatic boy, the shepherds of Bethlehem, and others, Fr. McCorry draws lessons so luminous they make one squint. Readers will find out that while being amused they have learned some hard lessons. The author will be remembered for several popular works and for his current column in *America*.

**OUTLINE HISTORY OF THE CHURCH BY CENTURIES.** By Joseph McSorley. St. Louis: Herder, 1954. Pp. xxxii + 1174. \$9.00. This is the ninth revised edition of Fr. McSorley's popular and monumental textbook in Church history, which first appeared in 1943. The present work, while retaining the original, excellent divisions and chapters, has brought pertinent

tables and bibliographical entries up to date. Also included is a comprehensive bibliography on communism.

AURELIUS AUGUSTINUS. By Paul Simon. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh, 1954. Pp. 202. DM 9.20. A profile of the mind of St. Augustine, sketching the influences which contributed to its formation, and describing its impact on the philosophical and theological thought of the Western world. The aim of the book is to introduce the reader to the towering genius of Augustine and to acquaint him with the sources of his inspiration. The author's fresh approach, keen appreciation, and deft handling of his subject matter make it worthwhile reading even for the initiate.

ST. DOMINIC: SERVANT BUT FRIEND. By Sister M. Assumpta O'Hanlon, O.P. St. Louis: Herder, 1954. Pp. 182. This obviously devotional biography of Dominic attempts to illustrate the likeness in action and outlook between the servant and his Master, the Saint and his Friend. In drawing this parallel the writer employs conjecture a little too frequently, with a lack of documentary evidence. Nonetheless, it is a sincere and loving tribute to Dominic.

THE STORY OF THOMAS MORE. By John Farrow. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1954. Pp. 242. \$3.50. The author of *Damien the Leper* and *Pageant of the Popes* here adds a new volume on the English martyr-saint. This is not an exhaustive biography, in the usual sense of the word, but rather a story and a study of St. Thomas More against the rich background of the turbulent political, social, and religious upheaval of his day.

CARDINAL MANNING. By Shane Leslie. New York: Kenedy, 1954. Pp. xxiv + 226. \$3.75. A condensation, with some new materials added, of Shane Leslie's monumental *Henry Edward Manning*, published in 1921 in an attempt to undo the damage done to the Cardinal by Lytton Strachey in his "deliciously libellous" book, *Eminent Victorians*.

SOREN KIERKEGAARD AND CATHOLICISM. By H. Roos, S.J. Translated by Richard M. Brackett, S.J. Westminster: Newman, 1954. Pp. 62. The two main sections are devoted to sketching the Catholic and the anti-Catholic tendencies in Kierkegaard. His relation to Catholicism was one of "antipathetic sympathy and sympathetic antipathy." This book sketches these two conflicting tendencies, and concludes that for Catholics Kierke-



gaard is a negative proof for the necessity of an official deposit of faith. Further virtues of the treatise include a supplement listing the Catholic books in Kierkegaard's library and a good bibliography of English translations of a writer who has been for many of our outstanding contemporary thinkers a "way-station" to Catholicism.

NEUESTE KIRCHENRECHTS-SAMMLUNG, II. By Suso Mayer, O.S.B. Freiburg: Herder, 1954. Pp. 632. This compilation of Church law for German-speaking countries comprises all the laws and authoritative interpretations of the Roman Pontiffs, decrees of the Code Commission, and decisions of the Roman Congregations (except those of the Rota) which appeared during the period 1930-39. The decrees of particular law-making bodies are not included in its scope. Sources are usually cited in full, or at least with extensive excerpts which give the gist of their contents. These are arranged according to the canons of the Code, and under each canon the pertinent documents are assembled in chronological order. Each subsequent volume will deal with one decade in the same way.

THE CANON LAW DIGEST: ANNUAL SUPPLEMENT THROUGH 1953. By T. Lincoln Bouscaren, S.J., and James I. O'Connor, S.J. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1954. Pp. 80. This loose-leaf supplement to the *Canon Law Digest* contains the material from the *Acta apostolicae sedis* for 1953. It is so arranged that subsequent matter can be slipped into the large binder in the order of the canons. Included is an Index of References to documents not fully reported.

THE CANON LAW DIGEST, III. By T. Lincoln Bouscaren, S.J. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1954. Pp. ix + 762. \$11.00. The documents published in the *Acta apostolicae sedis* from January 1, 1942 to December 31, 1952, as well as unofficial documents of the same and earlier periods, are arranged according to the order of the Code. The cumulative indices, both chronological and general, of all three volumes give page references throughout.

JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES. By Royston Pike. New York: Philosophical Library, 1954. Pp. 140. Subtitled, "Who they are, what they teach, what they do," this book attempts the answers by ranging far and wide, from Judge Rutherford and Armageddon to mass baptisms and the "remnant." Written in a popular-magazine style, it is a readable if not overly penetrating exposition.

**CHRISTIANITY AND ANTI-SEMITISM.** By Nicholas Berdyaev. Translated by Alan A. Spears and Victor B. Kanter. New York: Philosophical Library, 1954. Pp. 58.

This short treatise of thirty pages meets the perennial problem of anti-Semitism as a problem essentially connected with Christianity. It outlines some fundamental causes of anti-Semitism, and then proceeds to what is called the most serious type, that once professed by Christians. After a brief analysis of this last type, posing it as a test of Christian conscience and spiritual strength, the author calls for a purified Christianity, free from formalism and conventionalism. The second portion of the book is devoted to a commentary and notes by one of the translators, Mr. Spears.

**DROITS PERSONNELS ET AUTORITÉ.** By Louis Janssens. Louvain: Editions Nauwelaerts, 1954. Pp. iv + 80. 36 fr.b.

This brief work was written solely to enlighten the fundamental direction of social thought. It considers (1) man and his essential relations to God, to the world, and to his neighbor; (2) the nature of authority in relation to the common good of society; and (3) the personal rights of man in relation to authority. Here is a lucid answer to the two-fold question: what is the objective meaning of social relations, and how should moral philosophy guide the evolution toward a society whose structure conforms more closely to this ideal?

**TREASURY OF PHILOSOPHY.** Edited by Dagobert D. Runes. New York: Philosophical Library, 1955. Pp. xxiv + 1280. \$15.00.

A bulky collection of miscellaneous excerpts from the great thinkers of the past twenty-six centuries. Brief biographies are attached to the four hundred selections.

**APPROACHES TO GOD.** By Jacques Maritain. Translated by Peter O'Reilly. New York: Harper, 1954. Pp. xvi + 128. \$2.50.

This short book brings together under one cover many of Maritain's reflections on the proofs for God's existence. The author presents (1) a rational approach to God which antecedes formally philosophic reflection; (2) a modern and compelling treatment of St. Thomas' "five ways," adding a sixth based on the spirituality of the intellect; (3) three other approaches to God: through poetic creativeness, moral experience, and the testimony of moral heroes; (4) a few short comments on the "natural desire to know God through His essence."

**AN ALTERNATIVE CLASSIFICATION FOR CATHOLIC BOOKS.** By Jeannette Murphy Lynn. 2nd ed., rev. by Gilbert C. Peterson, S.J. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University Press, 1954. Pp. 508. \$10.00.

As a most thoroughly detailed outline of the literature of Catholic theology and history, this book-

classification scheme is of interest to all theological scholars. An introduction explains the scope, function, and possible uses of this schedule. A brief glance at any of the tables analyzing, for example, Christian literature (pp. 34-157), the Eastern Rites (pp. 236-253), or Church history (pp. 300-466) will show that the usefulness of this work is not restricted to the library office. While Mrs. Lynn and Fr. Peterson deserve the major credit, the book is the result of the cooperative work of many scholars over many years; the completeness together with the accuracy of the information provided is most satisfactory. This second edition has added a full index and has omitted the essay on book-classification principles which was a large part of the first edition. The format is pleasing and the whole work is very legible, although it is offset printed from a typed original. These four parts are the general topics for which very complete outlines are provided: Christian Literature, Theology, Canon Law, Church History. A noteworthy feature is the listing of individual titles, divided where necessary into genuine and spurious works, under each outstanding author.

## BOOKS RECEIVED

[All books received are listed here whether they are reviewed or not]

*Scriptural Studies*

- Bonsirven, Joseph, S.J. *Epîtres de Saint Jean*; introduction, traduction et commentaire, nouvelle éd., revue. Paris, Beauchesne, 1954. 280p. (Verbum Salutis, IX)
- Das Buch Ijjob; hebräisch und deutsch, übertragen, ausgelegt, von Friedolin Stier. München, Kösel-Verlag, 1954. 361p. DM 25.-
- Campbell, Roderick. *Israel and the New Covenant*. Phila., Presbyterian and Reformed Publ. Co., 1954. ix, 336p. \$3.75
- Cross, F. L. *I Peter*; a paschal liturgy. London, Mowbray, 1954. 50p.
- DeWitt, Norman Wentworth. *St. Paul and Epicurus*. Minneapolis, Minn., Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1954. vii, 201p. \$4.00
- Enchiridion Biblicum*; documenta ecclesiastica sacram scripturam spectantia, ed. 2a aucta. Naples, D'Auria, 1954. xv, 279p. \$1.65
- Hahn, Herbert F. *Old Testament in modern research*. Phila., Muhlenberg Press, 1954. xii, 267p. \$4.00
- Huby, Joseph, S.J. *L'Evangile et les Evangiles*; nouvelle éd. rev. par Xavier Léon-Dufour, S.J. Paris, Beauchesne, 1954. xiii, 304p. (Verbum Salutis, XI)

- Internationale Zeitschriftenschau für Bibelwissenschaft und Grenzgebiete. Band I (1951-52) Heft 2. Düsseldorf, Patmos-Verlag, 1954. xii, 219p.
- Knox, Ronald. A New Testament commentary, II; The Acts of the Apostles, St. Paul's Letters to the Churches. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1954. ix, 322p. \$3.75
- LeFrois, Bernard J., S.V.D. The woman clothed with the sun (Ap. 12); individual or collective? Rome, Orbis Catholicus, 1954. xviii, 280p.
- Levie, Jean, S.J. L'évangile araméen de S. Matthieu est-il la source de l'évangile de S. Marc? Paris, Casterman, 1954. [679-843] (Cahiers de la Nouvelle Revue Théologique, XI)
- Malevez, L., S.J. Le message chrétien et le mythe; la théologie de Rudolf Bultmann. Bruges, Desclée de Brouwer, 1954. 167p. 80 fr.b.
- North, Robert, S.J. Sociology of the biblical jubilee. Rome, Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1954. xlv, 245p. (Analecta Biblica, 4)
- The Psalms in rhythmic prose, tr. by James A. Kleist, S.J., and Thomas J. Lynam, S.J. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1954. xii, 236p. \$4.00
- The Second Book of Maccabees, ed. by Solomon Zeitlin, with introduction and commentary; tr. by Sidney Tedesche. N.Y., Harper, 1954. xiii, 271p. \$4.00

### *Doctrinal Theology*

- Boutin, Louis-N., O.M.I. L'Itinéraire du fils adoptif de Dieu. Ottawa, Scolasticat Saint-Joseph, 1954. 239p.
- Cummings, Juniper M., O.F.M.Conv. The Christological content of the 'Sermones' of St. Anthony. Chaska, Minn., Bede's Book-Nook, 1953. x, 143p. \$2.00
- Hasseveldt, Abbé Roger. The Church a divine mystery; tr. by William Storey. Chicago, Fides, 1954. xii, 263p. \$4.50
- Die heilsgeschichtliche Stellvertretung der Menschheit durch Maria, herausgeg. von Carl Feckes. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1954. 394p.
- Introduction to theology, by a group of theologians under the editorship of A. M. Henry, O.P.; tr. by William Storey. Chicago, Fides, 1954. xiv, 306p. \$5.95 (Theology Library, I)
- Kühnel, Joseph. Maria. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1954. 62p. DM 1.50
- Marie salut du monde, par Dom Germain Leblond, François Sagnard, O.P., et al. Paris, Desclée de Brouwer, 1954. 205p.
- Mueller, William A. Church and state in Luther and Calvin; a comparative study. Nashville, Tenn., Broadman, 1954. ix, 183p. \$2.50
- Ortiques, Edmond. Le temps de la parole. Neuchâtel, Delachaux & Niestlé, 1954. 55p. 3.60 fr.s. (Cahiers Théologiques, 34)

- Premm, Matthias. *Katholische Glaubenskunde*, III/1; *Allgemeine Sakramentenlehre, Taufe, Firmung, Eucharistie*. Vienna, Herder, 1954. xiii, 376p. DM 22.-
- Regards sur l'Orthodoxie, 1054-1954; en collaboration par R. Janin, A.A., E. Herman, S.J., et al. Paris, Casterman, 1954. 138p. (*Cahiers de la Nouvelle Revue Théologique*, X)
- Scheeben, Matthias Joseph. *Handbuch der katholischen Dogmatik*, V/2; *Erlösungslehre*, herausgeg. von Carl Feckes. Freiburg, Herder, 1954. vii, 515p.
- Schmidt, Hermann. *Irrweg oder Heilsweg; eine Apologie marianischer Frömmigkeit*. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1954. 112p. DM 3.90
- Simon, Paul. *The human element in the Church of Christ*; tr. by Meyrick Booth. Westminster, Md., Newman Press, 1954. ix, 166p. \$2.75
- Tavard, George H., A.A. *Transiency and permanence; the nature of theology according to St. Bonaventure*. St. Bonaventure, N.Y., The Franciscan Institute, 1954. vii, 263p.
- Vooght, Paul de, O.S.B. *Les sources de la doctrine chrétienne d'après les théologiens du XIVe siècle et du début du XVe avec le texte intégral des XII premières questions de La Summa inédite de Gérard de Boulogne*. Bruges, Desclée de Brouwer, 1954. 496p. 250 fr.b.

*Moral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions*

- Bouscaren, T. Lincoln, S.J. *The canon law digest; officially published documents affecting the Code of Canon Law, 1942-1953*, III. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1954. viii, 762p. \$11.00
- Iorio, Thomas A., S.J. *Theologia moralis*, III; *de sacramentis*, ed. 4a. Naples, D'Auria, 1954. 773p. \$6.00
- Mausbach, Joseph. *Katholische Moraltheologie*, 10., neubearb. Auflage von Gustav Ermecke. II/1, *Der religiöse Pflichtenkreis*. Münster, Westfalen, Aschendorff, 1954. xxxii, 396p. DM 19.-
- Mayer, Suso, O.S.B. *Neueste Kirchenrechts-Sammlung*, II, 1930-1939. Freiburg, Herder, 1954. 632p.
- Paris, Pierre, P.S.S. *Les hymnes de la liturgie romaine*. Paris, Beauchesne, 1954. 139p.
- Roguet, A.-M., O.P. *Christ acts through sacraments*. Collegeville, Minn., The Liturgical Press, 1954. 162p. \$2.00
- Wiest, Donald H., O.F.M.Cap. *The precensorship of books; a history and a commentary*. Wash., Catholic University Press, 1953. xiv, 193p. (*Canon Law Studies*, 329)

*History and Biography, Patristics*

- The Acts of the pagan martyrs; *Acta Alexandrinorum*; edited with commentary by Herbert A. Musurillo, S.J. Oxford Univ. Press, 1954. xiii, 299p. \$5.60
- Carpenter, S. C. The Church in England, 597-1688. London, John Murray, 1954. 516p. 40 s.
- Church and State through the centuries; ed. and tr. by Sidney Z. Ehler and John B. Morrall. Westminster, Md., Newman Press, 1954. xiv, 625p. \$6.75
- D'Angers, Julien-Eymard, O.F.M.Cap. Pascal et ses précurseurs. Paris, Nouvelles Editions Latines, 1954. 243p. 630 fr.
- Farrow, John. The story of Thomas More. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1954. 242p. \$3.50
- Flesseman-VanLeer, E. Tradition and scripture in the early Church. Assen, Van Gorcum & Comp., 1954. 210p.
- Goodenough, Erwin R. Jewish symbols in the Greco-Roman period, IV; the problem of method, symbols from Jewish cult. N.Y., Pantheon, 1954. xiii, 229p. \$7.50 (Bollingen Series, XXXVII)
- Henderson, G. D. Presbyterianism. Aberdeen, The University Press, 1954. vii, 179p. 12/6
- Hughes, Philip. The Reformation in England, III. N.Y., Macmillan, 1954. xxix, 457p. \$7.50
- Leslie, Shane. Cardinal Manning. N.Y., Kenedy, 1954. xxiii, 226p. \$3.75
- McDonnell, Ernest W. The Beguines and Beghards in medieval culture, with special emphasis on the Belgian scene. New Brunswick, N.J., Rutgers Univ. Press, 1954. xvii, 643p. \$10.00
- McSorley, Joseph, C.S.P. An outline history of the Church by centuries; 9th rev. ed. St. Louis, Herder, 1954. xxxii, 1174p. \$9.00
- O'Hanlon, Sister M. Assumpta, O.P. St. Dominic, servant but friend. St. Louis, Herder, 1954. ix, 182p. \$2.00

*Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature*

- Buckler, Reginald, O.P. The perfection of man by charity. St. Louis, Herder, 1954. ix, 255p. \$3.50
- Charles, Pierre, S.J. Unser Leben ein Gebet. Deutsch von J. Clemens. 3. Auflage. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1954. 287p. DM 5.80
- Fessbender, Johann Adam. Nach Gottes Ebenbild; über die Gleichförmigkeit mit Christus. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1954. 237p. DM 6.80
- Larkin, Ernest E., O.Carm. A study of the ecstasies of the forty days of Saint Mary Magdalene de' Pazzi. Rome, Angelicum, 1954. 67p.

- Rossi, Giovanni. This way to God. Morristown, N.J., Villa Walsh Press, 1954. 287p. \$2.50
- Sertillanges, Antonin Gilbert, O.P. Spirituality. N.Y., McMullen Books, 1954. 244p. \$2.95

*Philosophical Questions*

- Bokser, Ben Zion. From the world of the Cabbalah; the philosophy of Rabbi Judah Loew of Prague. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1954. ix, 210p. \$3.00
- Duméry, Henry. Blondel et la religion; essai critique sur la "Lettre" de 1896. Paris, Presses Universitaires, 1954. 115p.
- Harkness, Georgia. The sources of Western morality. N.Y., Scribner's, 1954. xi, 257p. \$3.50
- Hawkins, D. J. B. Being and becoming; an essay towards a critical metaphysic. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1954. xvii, 176p. \$3.00
- Janssens, Louis. Droits personnels et autorité. Louvain, Nauwelaerts, 1954. 77p.
- Maritain, Jacques. Approaches to God. N.Y., Harper, 1954. xvi, 128p. \$2.50
- Maritain, Jacques. An essay on christian philosophy, tr. by Edward H. Flannery. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1954. xi, 116p. \$2.75
- Thomas Aquinas, Saint. Sancti Thomae de Aquino super Librum de Causis expositio, par H. D. Saffrey, O.P. Fribourg, Société Philosophique, 1954. lxxiii, 148p. 18.00 fr.s. (Textus Philosophici Friburgenses, 4/5)
- Treasury of philosophy, ed. by Dagobert D. Runes. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1954. xxiv, 1280p. \$15.00

*Special Questions*

- Berdjaev, Nicolas. Christianity and anti-Semitism. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1954. 58p. \$2.75
- Boehner, Philotheus. Escoto el Doctor Sutil. Jalisco, Mexico, Ed. Guadalajara, 1954. 174p.
- D'Arcy, Paul F., M.M. Constancy of interest factor patterns within the specific vocation of foreign missionary. Washington, D.C., Catholic Univ. Press, 1954. lx, 54p. \$1.00
- Héring, Jean. A good and a bad government according to the New Testament. Springfield, Ill., Charles Thomas, 1954. 68p. \$2.75
- Lynn, Jeannette Murphy. An alternative classification for Catholic books; 2nd ed., rev., by Gilbert C. Peterson, S.J. Wash., Catholic University Press, 1954. 508p. \$10.00

- McLaughlin, P. J. Modern science and God. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1954. 89p. \$2.75
- Martz, Louis L. The poetry of meditation; a study in English religious literature of the 17th century. New Haven, Yale Univ. Press, 1954. xiii, 375p. \$5.00
- Pike, Royston. Jehovah's witnesses. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1954. 140p. \$2.75
- Ramm, Bernard. The christian view of science and scripture. Grand Rapids, Mich., Eerdmans, 1954. 368p. \$4.00
- Roos, H., S.J. Soren Kierkegaard and Catholicism; tr. by Richard M. Brackett, S.J. Westminster, Md., Newman Press, 1954. xx, 62p.