

THEOLOGICAL
Studies

VOLUME XVI

1955

*Published by the Theological Faculties
of the Society of Jesus in the United States*

BOOK REVIEWS

PROBLÈMES D'ORIGINES. By M. Grison. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1954. Pp. 312. 1,200 fr.

Strikingly dust-jacketed with a photograph of a spiral nebula, *Problèmes d'origines* presents the current state of knowledge about the origin and development of the universe, of life, and of man. It succeeds, but is by no means a mere revision of, Jean Guibert's *Les origines* (1896). (The seventh edition of this latter book has been available in the United States in a translation by Victor A. Bast, *Whence and How the Universe?* [1928].)

Michel Grison, of the Sulpician seminary at Issy, has attempted to correlate the results of science, the conclusions of philosophy, and the data of faith. Although his work is aimed at college students, and especially at seminarians, still it is of considerable value for theologians and others interested in the problems of creation. An immense amount of information has been digested and presented in readable fashion. Among the better aspects of this book is its examination of the problems from a triple point of view—scientific, philosophical, and theological. But there is no confusion of the disciplines; the author avoids the pitfall of substituting philosophical or theological speculation for scientific fact, or vice versa.

An introductory section considers the nature of the natural sciences. This section is very brief, unfortunately; for non-scientists generally do not realize that most scientists today would in general agree with Poincaré that a scientific theory is not true so much as convenient. Apart from all discussion of the validity of such ideas, one must be aware of them if he is to understand science in the scientists' sense.

The first major section treats "the universe." Included is a description of the universe of stars and galaxies. The text is accompanied by a series of photographs (taken by the 200-inch Mt. Palomar telescope) and a diagram of our own galaxy that many will find especially informative.

The section on living beings is the next major part of the work and deals with the origin of life and the origin of species. Pasteur's work is outlined and discussed. Pasteur did not show, as some may think, that spontaneous generation is impossible; rather, he showed that its occurrence had never been proved. Of more interest, however, is the chapter on the origin of species. After an historical sketch of the subject, Grison studies the past and present diversities in living beings (aside from man) and examines the data from the viewpoints of both science and philosophy. In his presentation he uses graphs and drawings to great advantage. The stages of development of the horse, for example, are aptly displayed in a table and two sets of drawings.

The third, and most extensive, section is on man. The first chapter presents the scientific data; the second discusses science and revelation. Plates and numerous sketches implement the treatment of early man's fossil remains, his artifacts, and his art. In the second chapter the discussion concerns three chief topics: man's origin, the unity of the human race, and the initial state of man. Here, as in previous sections, the treatment is rather brief. However, realizing the purpose of the book, the reader cannot complain; he has at least the elements for further classroom and private discussion.

A convenient group of documents is appended: the Tridentine decree on original sin, extracts from *Summi pontificatus* and *Humani generis* of Pius XII, and extracts from the letter of the Secretary of the Biblical Commission to Cardinal Suhard. One may hope that the next edition will contain other related documents of Pius XII, such as the 1941 Allocution to the Pontifical Academy of Sciences and the Allocution to the First International Symposium of Medical Genetics of September 7, 1953.

Despite the use of data from the sources of revelation, this volume would be a valuable background text for courses on scientific questions connected with philosophy. Having studied this book, one is not thereby an astronomer or paleontologist. But he has more than a mere "gentleman's acquaintance" with the various scientific, philosophical, and theological aspects of the universe into which God has introduced him.

Woodstock College

J. A. McKEOUGH, S.J.

J. J. RUDDICK, S.J.

THE SECOND BOOK OF MACCABEES. An English translation by Sidney Tedesche; introduction and commentary by Solomon Zeitlin. New York: Harper, 1954. Pp. xiii + 271. \$4.00.

The Maccabee cycle appearing in the Dropsie College Series of Jewish Apocryphal Literature is now complete. This series is designed to "reclaim" such non-canonical literature for the Jewish world. The particular merit of the publications lies in the Jewish point of view and in an extensive use of Jewish sources, as evidenced in the case of the volume under review. This work is produced by the same two scholars who published 1 Mac (cf. *TS* 11 [1950] 602-4).

The translation reads smoothly enough, despite some unusual words, such as "caparisoned." The Greek text is that of Rahlfs with a critical apparatus prepared by Zeitlin; the careful judgment and argumentation concerning the form of the text, such as one finds in Père Abel's standard work, is understandably lacking in a volume of more popular nature. The lengthy introduction (97 pages) by Zeitlin covers the usual topics: historical back-

ground, the relation between the Epitomist and Jason of Cyrene, the meaning of Maccabee (Z. reiterates his claim that the term denotes a physical characteristic: Judah, the hammer-headed), and the date (written in the reign of Agrippa I, 41-44 A.D., in Antioch). In the introduction Z. incorporates much material of an exegetical nature: the problem of the letters (Z. thinks there is only one) in chapters 1 and 2, the sacred fire (1:19), Hanukkah, martyrdom, and the religious concepts of the Epitomist. The peculiar ideas of Z. concerning Christianity appear intermittently.

This volume will undoubtedly be of value to the Jewish audience for which it is intended. But the works of Bévenot and Abel, which are both cited in the bibliography, and, more recently, of Angelo Penna (1953), are of higher caliber and more serviceable to theologians.

The Catholic University of America ROLAND E. MURPHY, O. CARM.

DAS VERSTOCKUNGSPROBLEM IM ALTEN TESTAMENT. By Franz Hesse. *Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft* 74. Berlin: Töpelmann, 1955. Pp. viii + 107. DM 20.

Since the Pharaoh of the Exodus, man has grappled with the problem of his free will and divine causality. God "hardened the heart" of Pharaoh (Ex 4:21); He told Isaias (6:9 f.) to blind the Israelites lest they understand and be converted to Him; in the *NT*, Jesus speaks of His mission in terms of the mission of Isaias (Mt 13:13-15; cf. Jn 12:39-41), and Paul addresses the problem in the blindness of the Jews (Rom 9:17 ff.). Certain important aspects of this theological difficulty form the subject of Franz Hesse's admirable study. He restricts himself to the *OT* and to a descriptive analysis of the vocabulary (about thirty pages); he does not intend to answer the problem, but to show how the *OT* authors conceived and expressed it (about seventy pages). The latter task is the heart of his study and the rest of this review is concerned with it.

The *OT* view is conditioned by certain presuppositions: (1) nothing escapes the sovereign action and causality of God; (2) Yahweh has certain "demonic" traits rendering Him inexplicable and arbitrary; thus, He incites sin only to punish it (H. explains nothing by his assumption of "das Dämonische in Jahwe"—the title of Volz's well-known booklet); (3) Yahweh acts particularly in favor of Israel (*Heilsgeschichte*), so Israel's enemies are to perish. These presuppositions, if one discounts the second, are at work in the story of Pharaoh, and one detects a certain uneasiness in the description of Pharaoh's reaction. In J it is said that Pharaoh hardens his heart; in E (granting to H. the moot point that E can be detected in the plagues) it is said that God hardens Pharaoh's heart; finally, in P both expressions are

used. The "tension" between the two statements remains unresolved. The attempted solution of R(edactor), who introduces divine foreknowledge (Ex 17:13,22; 8:11,15), fails. One might counter that, while divine foreknowledge does not solve the problem (and it is too much to say that it was intended to solve it), it remains a considerable factor that need not be brushed aside so lightly. Moreover, it is too much to say, as H. does, that neither J nor E were conscious of the tension.

In contrast with these older traditions which emphasize *Heilsgeschichte*, the prophets treat that problem more from the viewpoint of the moral demands made upon Israel; human obstinacy is God's answer to man's sin. H.'s analysis of various prophets is exceedingly well done (pp. 55-72 especially), even if there is a generous measure of disagreement with him. Isaias, of course, is the outstanding example. The commission given to him in the inaugural vision (6:9 f.) is so shocking that the Greek translator took it upon himself to soften it (aorists substituted for imperatives). With Duhm, Hölscher, and others, H. adopts the view that the prophet's words are not to be taken literally. From his long and sad experience with a sinful people Isaias came a posteriori to understand his commission in the way these powerful verses formulate it. What experience taught Isaias was clear to God from the first, and so was actually a divine commission. H. admits that for this prophet the *Verstockungsauftrag* was not as total as it might appear; it is accompanied by the announcement of salvation (even though H. unfortunately eliminates 6:13), contained in the doctrine of the remnant. The prophet's own son, "Remnant shall return," is a pledge of those who shall not fall away.

This *Habilitationsschrift* is worth serious study; it is the best available study of the OT aspect of the problem. This does not mean it has no defects; one would have wished that the absolute character of Hebrew expression—the sharp black and white extremes—had been analyzed with a view to understanding the "shocking" statements. Moreover, the five-page bibliography is astounding: all German books (a few Scandinavian authors), except for three titles (remotely connected with the topic) in English. To mention but one article, Skrinjar's study in *Biblica* (1930) would have been worth considering, if only for a more exact appraisal of the doctrine of the Wisdom literature on the point under consideration.

The Catholic University of America ROLAND E. MURPHY, O. CARM.

SOCIOLOGY OF THE BIBLICAL JUBILEE. By Robert North, S.J. Rome: Pontificio Istituto Biblico, 1954. Pp. xlvi + 245. \$6.50.

The complexity of this subject and the thoroughness of its treatment

here are revealed by the extent of the classified bibliography which runs to thirty-six pages in the Introduction. As basis for the discussion Lv 25 is presented in a literal translation of the four principal sources of manuscript tradition, Hebrew, Samaritan, Greek, and Latin, and the variants from minor sources are carefully noted.

After an extensive study of the sources, biblical, ancient Oriental, and Jewish, the name "jubilee" is stripped of its connotation of rejoicing and explained as "release," while the fiftieth year is recognized as being really the forty-ninth or seventh sabbatical year. The idea of release is then applied to slaves and property, and the underlying motive of the legislation is shown to be to give help to the bankrupt. The essential features of this method of release are assigned to an author of the pre-Occupation period who could have been Moses himself. The jubilee embodied social justice and worship and aimed at promoting charity and detachment; the text has a typical sense relating to the substance of the redemption.

The jubilee law tried to prevent the accumulation of large areas in the hands of a few owners. It provided ultimate relief for small property owners who had been forced into bankruptcy. Partial relief had already been given in the provisions of the sabbatical year. These sabbatical years were not reckoned on a universal but on an individual scale. If a man had to turn over his property to a creditor, he was entitled to use this property as his own during the seventh year after he had lost it. If this enabled him to pay his debt, he recovered full possession of his property; if it did not, the property reverted to the creditor for another six years, and then the process was repeated. But on the seventh sabbatical year the original owner or his heirs recovered full possession of the property.

Property loss was closely bound up with slavery. The dispossessed owner became a tenant-farmer and gave his labor and that of his family to the creditor. This labor was regulated in a way similar to the regulation of the property. In the seventh year the slaves were freed to give them a chance to pay their debts, but if they failed after successive trials, they were set free in the seventh sabbatical or jubilee year.

The fundamental purpose behind these arrangements was to keep small properties in the possession of the original owners and so to preserve family life and promote the common good.

To reach these clear-cut and consistent conclusions it was necessary to rid the text of some obscuring expressions. This, however, involved only slight modifications or omissions as compared with the textual changes advocated by other commentators. The disturbing expressions may be remnants of earlier laws or additions made later to meet new conditions.

The conditions visualized by the original legislator probably lasted for only a few generations after the Occupation, but in the beginning the jubilee release was carried out with only such exceptions as are to be found in the evasions of other burdensome laws. Since the date of the release varied with individuals, the application of the law would not disrupt the national economy in a way to attract the notice of the ancient biblical historians. From the start there were other ways for the bankrupts to reestablish themselves, and these ways probably reduced considerably the need for having recourse to the jubilee regulations. These regulations were merely the last remedy for cases that were not settled otherwise.

In this book Fr. North has made a valuable contribution toward the proper understanding of a very obscure element in ancient Jewish history and economy.

St. Mary of the Lake, Mundelein, Ill.

WILLIAM A. DOWD, S.J.

A NEW TESTAMENT COMMENTARY. VOLUME 2: THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES; ST. PAUL'S LETTERS TO THE CHURCHES. By Ronald Knox. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1954. Pp. x + 322. \$3.75.

The brilliant activity of Msgr. Knox's pen has won him an outstanding position in the literary world, and for English-speaking Catholics he enjoys the unique distinction of being the individual who apparently has done most to familiarize them with the word of God. His rendition of the entire Bible into English and his commentaries on most of the *NT* have evoked enthusiasm in many, reservations among some, and now that his fame is so secure it may be profitable to review his contribution to the field of Catholic biblical studies.

The Knox version has been a turning point in the history of the English Catholic Bible. One might say that the new translation has three characteristic features: it is very beautiful, very modern, and rather free. No one can fail to perceive its beauty, and it has been termed a literary masterpiece. Modernity was a feature which was foremost in the translator's mind. His intent was to speak to men of this generation in the language of their time, just as the sacred writers used the language of their day; or, rather, the version sought to give a timeless English which would not sound archaic to us today or to men in a later century. On minor points one might disagree with the position taken. Thus in the Knox version distinctively Semitic phrases are removed and modern English equivalents substituted. However, in this matter there could be a further consideration. When the professors of the Pontifical Biblical Institute translated the Psalms into Latin they deliberately chose to retain some Semitisms because they desired to preserve

the coloring of the Hebrew poetry. Now there would seem to be more reason for keeping some Semitisms in an English version, for the Psalms were written in Hebrew for Hebrews, but the *NT* (with the due modifications made for Mt and Lk) was written in Greek by Jews whose Jewish thought gave an exotic coloring to their Greek language. Thus, for the first generation of Greek-speaking Christians *amen* was a foreign word, much more so than it is for us. And it is worth noting that, although a translation could be easily given, the Church has lovingly retained some foreign expressions such as *amen*, *Kyrie eleison*, *hagios athanatos*, etc. And not only in the liturgy but even in conversation and newspaper writing one can observe that Hitler was the Fuehrer and Mussolini the Duce, and the Germans waged a blitzkrieg and used flak. For this reason some favor a limited retention of Semitisms in even the latest English translations of Scripture.

But this is evidently a minor point, and in general K. is correct in realizing that the time for a break with the Douay-Rheims wording was not only desirable, but he perceived, as few others did, that not only would the Church authorities permit the change but that the faithful also would be ready to accept it. From now on any new Catholic version will be much more modern because K. has led the way.

The third characteristic, freedom of rendition, aroused much discussion on both sides, at times with an undue ardor. Fortunately the dispute has quieted down, so that one can speak of the matter and hope not to arouse animosity. The task that K. undertook was one to test the abilities of the greatest genius—the translation of the entire Bible. Without specialized training in the field of biblical languages and exegesis, though aided by experts in these fields, he recast in new and modern form the ancient writers' thought. The freer the translation the greater must be the likelihood of error, and it is not without interest to note that Moffatt and Goodspeed, who handle the text with great freedom, both spent their entire life in the field of scriptural studies. It is not surprising, then, that some exegetes found in the Knox version some renderings to which they objected. However, K.'s rapprochement with the exegetes has become constantly more marked. Moreover, interest of Catholics in scholarly studies in the Bible has grown because of K.'s version, not only among priests but also among the laity which readily purchases books published by prominent exegetes. In fine, as one teacher remarked, "There are some things in Knox which I would change, but who else can arouse such interest and love for the Scriptures?"

In the present volume, the second of K.'s commentaries on the *NT*, there is a dedication to Sebastian Bullough, O.P., an exegete who has stood staunchly by him through the years. The book is well written, though not

always with the enthusiasm one finds in some of his other works; I think the reason is that the commentary method is somewhat uncongenial to him. On disputed points where he takes a definite stand, he is careful to present the reason for his side, but on these points we are fortunate in having the New Catholic Commentary on Holy Scripture, which may treat the matter with more conviction even if in a more pedestrian way.

There are, on the other hand, many stimulating thoughts and enlightening paragraphs which will adorn not a few sermons. For example, when treating the question of the wording of Rom 9:5, where Paul contrary to his custom applies the term "God" to Christ, we read: "He writes at white heat and at top speed, continually puzzling us with odd varieties of expression. And nobody who has a sense of literature will mistake, in this passage, the daring sweep of his rhetoric." Or take the comment on Gal 6:4-5: "If only (verse 4) people would be a little more introspective, and realize their own insignificance! If only they would stop comparing themselves with other people, then (verse 5) they would reach a state of equilibrium, instead of resting their weight, most uncomfortably, on their next-door neighbour!" As for conjecture, the following is put forth modestly: while the Letter to the Galatians still lay open on the table, the Apostle was maltreated by his enemies. It could have been then that he wrote the words, "I bear the scars of the Lord Jesus printed on my body" (Gal 6:17). Many will look forward eagerly to the appearance of the final volume of the *NT* commentary.

Weston College

JOHN J. COLLINS, S.J.

THE TEXT OF THE EPISTLES. A Disquisition upon the *Corpus Paulinum*. By G. Zuntz. Oxford University Press, 1953. Pp. xvii + 287. 27s. 6d.

A disconcerting feature of the present enthusiasm for biblical studies is the little interest taken in textual criticism of the New Testament. While it is axiomatic that the recovery of the original text is indispensable for sound exegesis, this science enjoys little popularity among the present generation of exegetes. Some despairingly decry any search after the original text; many comfortably pin their faith on the achievements of past generations. The former fail to appreciate the valuable new material that is accessible to the critic today; the latter excuse themselves from the laborious task of criticism on the ground "that this work has been done, once and for all, by Westcott and Hort and their fellow revisers. . . . The agreement between our modern editions does not mean that we have recovered the original text. It is due to the simple fact that their editors . . . follow one narrow section of the evidence, namely the non-Western Old Uncials" (p. 8).

The task of the text critic today is to bridge the gap that separates the

original text from the earliest extant witnesses. This involves principally breaching the barrier of the "wild" text of the second century, which separates the "recensions" from the original text. All the available witnesses must be assessed, and in particular the Western evidence, until now largely disregarded, must be carefully sifted and weighed. All the variants must be compared and tested, and, when none is satisfactory, recourse must be had to *emendatio*, to recover by conjecture the original wording, which failed to reach the archetypes of the extant evidence.

The author applies this painstaking, rigorously exacting method to 1 Cor and Heb. The problems of the Epistles are less involved than the Gospels, and the Chester-Beatty papyrus P46 carries the text of the Epistles back to 200 A.D., perhaps even into the second century. The critic's work is not completed with the recovery of the archetype of P46. This was the text of the *Corpus Paulinum* collected and published ca. 100 A.D. Since a half century separates this text from the original, the probability of primitive corruption is very strong; for it is practically impossible to have copying without some error. The correct reading may survive in a comparatively late witness. The text of P46 must be tested by all the available evidence, and, since it is the oldest manuscript extant, its text should be used as a control to assess the value of, and the interrelation between, the other manuscripts. While the basic text of P46 is "of supreme quality," the papyrus suffers from many scribal blunders and from some ancient conjectural changes of the original wording. The scribal errors must be corrected before the papyrus is used as a control, and readings found only in P46 should never be accepted "unless their intrinsic quality can stand the severest test." The papyrus is related very closely to B and to the very important minuscule 1739. No special relationship exists between D and P46, but at times it is allied with F and G, and with the Byzantine bulk.

In assessing the Western evidence very important distinctions must be made between (W), i.e., readings known exclusively from the western part of the Roman Empire, (W†) readings of the West that occur elsewhere, and (W ω) readings found also in the Byzantine MSS. Western readings in non-Western witnesses (W†), e.g., in P46, are usually ancient survivals. "They are not in the relevant witnesses, secondary intrusions into a primarily pure form" (p. 151). While purely Byzantine readings may be ancient, "Byzantine readings which recur in Western witnesses *must* be ancient. They go back to the time before the Chester-Beatty papyrus was written; the time before the emergence of separate Eastern and Western traditions, in short they reach back deep into the second century" (p. 151).

The Caesarean text was established by the critical work of Euthalius,

who based his edition on the work of Pamphilius. Like P46 it belongs to the stream of the Alexandrian tradition. The Vulgate is a Western witness where Jerome retained Old Latin features. Where it differs from the Old Latin it becomes an important witness to the tradition of Caesarea and Alexandria. P46 B 1739 sah boh Clem Orig form a group that may be described as "Proto-Alexandrian."

In general, the position of Westcott and Hort is confirmed. The very frequent agreement of P46 with B demonstrates that the tradition represented by B reaches back to the year 200 A.D. But it was an unwarranted assumption to take the fourth century text of B and its allies as "a neutral text," as if it derived straight from the original and had not been affected by three centuries of transmission. "In a far greater number of instances than Dr. Hort's theory would allow, the true reading has been preserved by the opponents of the Alexandrian bulk. Whether Western or Byzantine or an untypical minority, these successful opponents are often joined by P46" (p. 216).

The genealogical method of criticism is no longer applicable. One can no longer assume that the extant codices grouped in the same family are so related that through them one can recover an archetype that was their common mother. The farther back one goes on the Alexandrian line the more often one meets Western readings, and the greater the Byzantine support for Western readings the more often do they occur also in one of the oldest Alexandrian witnesses. Most of these readings are genuine. "We thus begin to discern, beyond the later families, the second century reservoir from which derive all those readings, whether right or wrong, which are found in more than one of them. . . . From this reservoir—it is not a text—issued both the remarkably pure Alexandrian stream and the muddy Western tradition" (p. 214). The purity of the Alexandrian stream is the result of conscious critical labor. The distinction between a primitive and later form of the Alexandrian tradition points to generations of unknown early critics, working persistently to purge their text of the contaminations that corrupt every widely used and copied book. A table at the end of the book attempts a visual presentation of the two streams, the contaminated Western and the Alexandrian-Caesarean efforts at preservation and purification. The Alexandrian stream is not simply the continuation of a second-century text that happened to be free of contamination. Like the Western it emerges from the common reservoir. Its freedom from the impurities of the Western stream is the result of constant effort on the part of devoted text critics. The interest of Clement and the Chester-Beatty papyri in philology point

to Alexandria, the center of Greek philological studies, as the home of these first critics of the New Testament text.

This work marks a milestone in the progress of textual criticism. Like the author's study on *The Ancestry of the Harklean New Testament* it is one of the most important contributions to the reconstruction of the history of the New Testament text within the past generation. Any exegete of 1 Cor and Heb who fails to consult this monumental work cannot escape the accusation of gross negligence. The task before text critics now is to check the conclusions of Dr. Zuntz by an examination of the text of the Gospels and Acts as exhaustive and competent as his work on the Epistles.

Passionist Monastery, Union City, N.J. RICHARD KUGELMAN, C.P.

ST. PAUL AND EPICURUS. By Norman DeWitt. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1954. Pp. vii + 201. \$4.00.

St. Paul, great missionary that he was, had to endure much for the sake of the Gospel of Christ. This included "perils from false brethren," especially false teachers in local churches founded by himself. Judaizers? Yes, constantly; but also those who sought to mingle the solid food of Christianity with the tainted flavoring of pagan philosophical or gnostic errors.

Paul had his day with the pagan philosophers at Athens, the Epicureans and the Stoics (Acts 17:16-33). They heard him discourse on the "Unknown God." They sneered at him; he was only a "babbler." Because of this incident at Athens, because of Paul's birth and early education in the famous university city of Tarsus, because of his (infrequent) citations from pagan literature, and because his epistles at times seem to be directed against philosophical errors, students of the Bible quite properly ask themselves how much Paul might have been influenced in word and work by contemporary pagan philosophy. That is the question Norman DeWitt asks himself—only he limits his investigation to the influence exerted by Epicurus and his doctrine.

It is D.'s thesis that Epicureanism functioned as a bridge of transition from Greek philosophy to the Christian religion. Only past prejudice, he feels, has kept this truth from being accepted. Since Epicurus scorned miracles, prophecy, divine providence, and immortality, theology denounced him. Joined to this theology was a body of ethical doctrine which censured Epicurus as a sensualist—wrongly, since the pleasure of Epicurus was not the pleasure of the flesh. "The merit of this ethic was so superior and so widely acknowledged that Paul had no alternative but to adopt it and bless it with the new sanction of religion, though to admit his indebtedness to the

alleged atheist and sensualist [Epicurus] was inconceivable. Epicurus was consequently consigned to anonymity. When once this screen of anonymity has been penetrated, we shall find that the most beloved devotional readings in the Epistles of Paul exhibit the greatest influence of the friendly Epicurus" (p. v).

After a brief treatise on the life and teachings of Epicurus the book proper sets out on the trail of "hidden parallelisms" between the Greek philosopher and Paul in the Pauline Epistles. And D. finds so many that he thinks Paul himself had been an Epicurean at one time. The clinching proof: Gal 4:3 (which the author reinterprets): "So also with myself, when I was at the irresponsible age of adolescence, I was addicted to belief in atoms," i.e. a disciple of Epicurus (pp. 67-68). D. "penetrates the disguises of Paul" and asserts that Paul practiced the arts of writing and reasoning as taught in the Greek schools at the very same time that he was disavowing knowledge of them.

This book is a disappointment. Instead of a careful evaluation of possible data bearing on the topic at hand, it turns out to be a piece of special pleading for preconceived notions. Many of the so-called parallelisms drawn between Epicurus and Paul are forced and absurd. The author himself lists some seventy verses of the *NT* which, as a result of his investigations, would have to be "newly explained or translated."

D. has overlooked some important facts. Not only is there no shred of evidence that Paul had ever been an Epicurean; there is no cogent reason to assume that he had ever had any formal Greek training. The available evidence indicates the opposite (cf. Acts 22:3; 26:4; Phil 3:5-6). And Paul's three or four citations from the classics—if indeed they were citations and not common proverbs—are insufficient to prove a profane training before the Apostle was to sit at the feet of Gamaliel. For that matter, does not the very epithet used of Paul at Athens (*spermologos*: a picker-up-of-seeds, a babbler) imply that the Apostle was no real philosopher in the eyes of the Epicureans and Stoics? We note that the only quotation from pagan philosophy made by Paul at Athens (Acts 17:28) was taken from the Stoic Aratus (and/or Cleanthes), not Epicurus. Similarly in 1 Cor (especially chap. 15), where he does appear to have had Greek philosophical errors in mind, the only citation (or proverb) made there derives from the pre-gnostic poet Menander, not Epicurus. In fact, the only other classical quotation that we find in Paul's works (Tit 1:12, possibly repeated in Acts 17:28) is from the Greek poet Epimenides, not Epicurus.

D.'s subject of discussion is a good and legitimate one; his method and

conclusions are not justified. The author of *St. Paul and Epicurus* may know his Epicurus; his knowledge of Paul is deficient.

Mary Immaculate Friary, Garrison, N.Y. ERIC MAY, O.F.M.CAP.

THE PRIMACY OF PETER FROM THE PROTESTANT AND FROM THE CATHOLIC POINT OF VIEW. By Charles Journet. Translated from the French by John Chapin. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1954. Pp. xiv + 144. \$2.75.

Msgr. Journet replies here to Oscar Cullmann, eminent French Protestant theologian, whose *Peter, Disciple, Apostle, Martyr: A Historical and Theological Study* called for a frank and serene discussion of those points at issue among Protestants and Catholics. Confining his remarks to that portion of Protestantism which is willing to acknowledge the divinity of Christ and some kind of divine inspiration for Scripture, J.'s aim is to oppose as clearly as possible two different points of view on the question of a permanent and infallible teaching office in the Church, the privilege accorded to Peter, and succession in the primacy.

After a brief summary of Cullmann's conclusions, two irreconcilable concepts of Christianity are developed. The Catholic concept is a realistic form of Christianity with Christ really and truly present under the guise of signs, tokens, and promises. The Protestant concept is that of a mnemonic presence of Christ in Christianity, of the mere awareness through memory of an important event which took place once and for all in the past, like a meteorite which is consumed and leaves a trace only in our memory. J. lays great stress on these two concepts, since in the rest of his work he will strive to show that Cullmann, though championing some views which are not those of all Protestants, still reflects the Protestant concept of Christianity.

The exposition of the Catholic position is brief and in line with the author's limited aim. (A good summation of Cullmann's position is to be found in E. A. Ryan's review of his book in *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES* 15 [1954] 129-30.) For a fuller exposition of many points J. quite justifiably refers to his other works, especially to his monumental *L'Eglise du Verbe incarné*.

Placing the norm of faith in the living *paradosis*, that is, in the apostolic doctrine in the sense in which it has always been understood and in which it is presented to us by an infallible teaching office, points up a fundamental divergence which cannot be ignored in any discussion with Cullmann. That he himself has seen the need for explaining the relation between Scripture and tradition is shown by the appearance of his later work, *Die Tradition als exegetisches, historisches und theologisches Problem*.

Some may find certain expressions used by J. a little disconcerting, e.g.,

the "transapostolic" power granted to Peter. Others will not be too happy at his frequent references to Cajetan to enlighten scriptural passages in a work intended for Protestants and Catholics. All will find the fine level of presentation we have come to expect of Journet.

Woodstock College

VINCENT T. O'KEEFE, S.J.

ORIENTATIONS MAÎTRESSES DES APOLOGISTES CHRÉTIENS DE 270 À 361. By Joseph Rhéal Laurin, O.M.I. *Analecta Gregoriana* 61. Rome: Gregorian University, 1954. Pp. xvi + 487.

In the history of ancient Christian literature a position of prominence is occupied by a type of composition which, for want of a better word, we describe as an "apology." The Apologies of the second century are well known, but Père Laurin believes that the early decades of the fourth century are of equal if not greater importance in the development of the genre. The apologetical literature of this period has not heretofore been sufficiently studied, and the present volume was written to supply the deficiency. Not all the authors who wrote in defense of the Church during these years were men of genius, but L. is in complete sympathy with the statement of R. Pichon that "to deserve attention a writer need not be interesting himself; it is sufficient that he write during an interesting epoch."

The interest of the period 270-361 for the study of apologetical literature derives principally from a number of important influences which were at work in or on the Church at this time: (1) a resurgent paganism in the latter half of the third century, which found its philosophy in the Neoplatonism of Plotinus and Porphyry and its popular expression in such Oriental religious movements as Mithraism and syncretism; (2) the crisis created by the great persecution of Diocletian in 303; (3) the Peace of Constantine, inaugurated by the Edict of Milan in 313; (4) a growing hostility to the Church on the part of many of the ruling class, culminating in the persecution of Julian the Apostate, 361-63. In the first part of his book L. studies these influences in detail; in the second he examines the apologetic literature before the year 313; in the third he takes up the apologetic literature after this date, i.e., after the Peace of Constantine.

Actually the scope of the book is less extensive than its title indicates. Only six authors are considered: Methodius of Olympus, Eusebius of Caesarea, Arnobius, Lactantius, Athanasius, and Julius Firmicus Maternus. L. devotes most of his attention to the apologetical writings of Eusebius and Lactantius, some 350 pages of text as against about 75 pages for the other four. Nor do the works studied extend through the whole period indicated in the title, 270-361. Almost all the important Apologies con-

sidered here were composed between the years 300–320. There is a strange silence from 270 to 300; from 320 to 360 nothing is noted but two minor works of Eusebius and the fanatical treatise of Maternus, *De errore profanarum religionum*. This suggests that the physical violence of Diocletian's persecution did more to stimulate apologetical writing than did the more dangerous but less spectacular attacks of pagan philosophy and religion.

The *orientations mattresses* referred to in the title are concretized in answers given to the following questions: (1) To whom were the Apologies of the period addressed? (2) Why were they written? (3) What arguments do they develop in defense of Christianity? In working out the answers to these three questions L. has synthesized a great deal of useful and interesting information. His investigations enable him to show that apologists in the West, Arnobius and Lactantius for example, defend Christianity at a more philosophical level than do contemporary apologists in the East. This is rather paradoxical in view of the fact that pagan philosophy was more of an intellectual force in the East at this time than it was in the West. It is also observed that Latin apologists of the period almost never argue from Scripture, whereas Greek apologists do so regularly. L. is of the opinion that this may be explained by the contrasting backgrounds of the authors. Those in the West were laymen, rhetoricians, converts to the faith; those in the East were priests or bishops, born into Christian families and therefore, presumably, better acquainted with and more attached to the sacred text. The fact which the author has observed is curious but his explanation is not too convincing.

In writing his book L. may have been troubled from time to time by the discouraging thought that he was composing *ea quae nec indocti intelligere possent nec docti legere curarent*. Happily the disjunction between *docti* and *indocti* is not as complete as it sounds. There is a large group of readers between these extremes who will find pleasure and profit in this careful study, and even specialists in the fields of Church history, patrology, and apologetics will not waste their time in examining it. The bibliography is excellent and there is a good *table onomastique*.

West Baden College

WILLIAM P. LE SAINT, S.J.

LA CONSÉCRATION DES VIERGES DANS L'ÉGLISE ROMAINE. Étude d'histoire de la liturgie. By René Metz. Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1954. Pp. 501.

That this study was carried out under the guidance of the distinguished Dean of the Faculty of Catholic Theology at Strasbourg, Monseigneur Michel Andrieu, to whom M. l'Abbé René Metz professes particular in-

debtedness (p. 20), is a fact which of itself arouses expectations of the highest order. For who is there among students of liturgies who does not know Msgr. Andrieu, especially for his unrivalled contribution to the understanding of the gradual evolution of the *Pontificale* and the services with which it is concerned? Suffice it to say, at once, that M. Metz has admirably fulfilled these expectations. Whether his work be considered as that of a pupil of Andrieu or not, it gives unmistakable evidence of being the result of applying to the data of its subject the very best sort of scholarship.

The question to which M. has addressed himself is the determination of the nature, meaning, and evolution of the ritualistic formularies and prayers whereby women have been consecrated to God in the Western Church. He demonstrates, with completeness and sensitive discrimination, the relation which the status of the consecrated virgins and the ceremony of the *consecratio virginum* bear to the ancient Roman institution of vestal virgins, to the offices of deaconesses and of widows in early Christianity, and particularly to the married state and to its rites. Indeed, in the portions of his work which have to do with these matters M. will be listened to with great interest by the general social historian as well as by the liturgiologist, that specialist in a narrower and more defined division of sociological investigation.

After two preliminary chapters devoted to the place of Christian virgins in the life of the early Church, M. considers in great detail the varied mutations and developments which have characterized the ceremonial which has been employed to mark the public adoption of virginal status in Christian society in the West. He traces the growth of the simple and—be it confessed—rather rude service in vogue in urban Rome in early days into the splendid and beautifully dramatic function which was developed under the inspired hands of Romano-Frankish liturgists, and which returned itself to Rome to touch and influence the compilers of the Curial Pontifical in the early years of the thirteenth century; and he shows us how, toward the end of that century, a certain bishop of Mende, Guillaume Durand, a remarkable amalgam of liturgist, humanist, and canonist, welded together in harmonious fashion the numerous elements which he found in the work of earlier ceremonialists. Durand's fusing of these parts into one whole resulted, as M. remarks (p. 315), in the ceremonial of the consecration of nuns taking on the guise of a function "de grand style." It is the work of Durand, who conserved the primitive Roman elements and enriched them by the beautifully imaginative additions found in the Pontifical of Mayence and in certain local French Pontificals, it is his work which we find in the *Pontificale Romanum*

as we know it to-day; for the various revisions by which his book was transformed into the authorised Pontifical of the Roman Church did not materially alter what Durand had set forth *de benedictione et consecratione virginum*.

In an appendix on the ritual of matrimony, M. demonstrates very convincingly the strong link which binds these ceremonials together, and he establishes his contention that very many of the ritual acts in the *consecratio virginum* had their origin in the marriage rite. Here is valuable material for those who would stress the vital similarities between these diverse ways of life in the great Christian economy of salvation (cf. also what is said, pp. 282–83 *supra*, in respect to the elements these ceremonials alike share with that by which sacred order is conferred). The second appendix, which will be of irresistible fascination to the specialist, takes the text of the actual *Pontificale Romanum* and points out, phrase by phrase, the provenance of the elements which make it up. There are accompanying indications to the detailed treatment of these passages in M.'s pages.

The copious bibliography, the alphabetical index of liturgical *initia*, and the general index are all worthy of this splendid study, and form a fitting apparatus to a book marked by careful scholarship, sound judgment, and a spirit of broad culture in its suggestions and conclusions.

The ceremonial of the consecration of virgins has been brought into use increasingly during the past century; and the Apostolic Constitution, *Sponsa Christi*, of 1950 encouraged, at least indirectly, its even more widespread employment by terming it one of the most beautiful among the survivals of ancient liturgical usage (cf. *AAS* 43 (1951) 5–6). This learned and interesting study of its origin, meaning, and development ought to attract much attention not only among specialists in liturgiology and social history but also among those who are concerned today with the guidance of consecrated virgins. One cannot imagine, for example, a more fruitful source book than this volume for a priest who would give to nuns a series of conferences pointed basically upon the nature of their state in life and its meaning. And, no doubt, many among the *moniales* of the present day will find M.'s book of absorbing interest to them. As nurturing scholarly interest in the origin and development of their chosen mode of life, and as suggesting points of departure in respect to spiritual and social considerations founded upon a very desirable basis of liturgiological knowledge, this book is highly to be recommended to them as well as to the historians of liturgical usage to whom it is primarily addressed.

New York, N.Y.

ALASTAIR GUINAN

BEITRÄGE ZUR IKONOGRAPHIE DER KONSTANTINISCHEN SARKOPHAG-PLASTIK. By Eduard Stommel. *Theophaneia* 10. Bonn: Hanstein, 1954. Pp. 143. DM 16.

This work, dedicated to the renowned scholar, Dr. Klauser, to commemorate his sixtieth birthday, is a study of the sarcophagus of the Three Monograms. This Constantinian sarcophagus (ca. 325) was discovered in the excavations under St. Peter's and received its name from the three Chi-Rho monograms that it bears.

The sarcophagus represents the orant accompanied by Sts. Peter and Paul. To the right is depicted the cure of the woman with an issue of blood, the sacrifice of Abraham, the arrest of Peter, and the raising of Lazarus. The corresponding scenes on the left are the cure of the blind man, the slaying of the Babylonian serpent by Daniel, Moses receiving the Law, the "cock" scene (commonly called the denial scene), and the miraculous striking of water by Peter. Above this central relief is found, to the left and right, the scenes of Jonas and the three youths in the fiery furnace.

In interpreting this sarcophagus, S. makes many apt and convincing comparisons with other monuments. Here mention should be made of the sixteen beautiful plates containing thirty-one reproductions.

Of great importance are the principles for interpreting these monuments. The characters in the scenes can easily be recognized from the Scriptures and the Apocrypha. However, the arrangement and schematization of the scenes call for explanation. Early Christian art is not used merely to illustrate or narrate. This funereal art is religious in its inspiration, object, and application. By no means is it self-explanatory; it is understood only in the light of the milieu of Christian antiquity. This includes Christian literature, catecheses, and popular religious conceptions. Of prime importance is the exegesis of Scripture, where typology was so pronounced. The relation of *OT* types to *NT* antitypes, and the application of both to Christian life in general and the individual soul in particular, are crucial for understanding the art.

Consequently, the scenes are related to the departed soul as it makes its journey to paradise. On this journey, popularly considered in terms of time and space, the soul is in need of protection *de ore leonis* as it makes the passage *de morte ad vitam*. The nexus between the scenes and the orant consists in this, that the thought content of the scenes represents arguments in the prayer of the orant.

Briefly, in the two cures by Christ, the orant sees in Christ the friend of the poor and sick, and in looking to Him for help it trusts in the intercession

of the Apostles. In the scenes of Jonas and the three youths the soul asks for and is assured of deliverance from a trying situation, and of *refrigerium*. The slaying of the serpent and the sacrifice of Abraham, types of the redemption, point to the soul being snatched from the power of the serpent and coming to victory in the name of Christ. This victory, as pointed out in Heb 11:17-19, includes the resurrection. The two corner scenes, Peter striking water and the raising of Lazarus, show the relation between baptism and the resurrection (Rom 6:21). For the soul they signify the beginning and the completion of Christian existence: the beginning on earth in baptism, the completion in the resurrection on the last day.

A significant contribution is furnished in the interpretation of the Petrine scenes. The "cock" scene is not the denial of Peter; neither is it used to point out the hope of pardon after a fall. The Peter sequence is, in a word, the commission given to Peter, "Feed my lambs, etc." It represents the conferring of the primacy. The sequence, Moses receiving the Law, Christ the Lawgiver of the New Testament holding the scroll and commissioning Peter, the transfer of that scroll to Peter in the scene of his arrest, all this points out the office and function of Peter. The representation of the cock recalls the embarrassment of Peter when questioned three times about his love for Christ and when he was given the threefold command to feed the lambs and sheep. Furthermore, these scenes of Roman origin, when seen in the light of contemporary literature and liturgy (e.g., *Petri cathedra*) are portrayals in art of the organic theme: Christ, Church, Peter, Rome. On the sarcophagus the commission, "Feed my lambs," expresses the hope that the deceased who belonged to the flock of Peter on earth will be numbered in the flock of Christ in heaven.

In this significant study greater attention could have been given to the many studies on early Christian exegesis, especially in view of the importance which S. rightly attaches to it for interpreting the art. In this field he would have been given considerable help by the article of W. Burghardt, S.J., "On Early Christian Exegesis," *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES* 11 (1950) 78-116.

The author describes this book as a contribution to iconography. It is also a contribution to theology. There is a theology not only in pen and ink but also in stone. In reconstructing the thought of the past, theologians would do well to take cognizance not only of the *testimonia scripta* but also of the *documenta picta*.

SACRAMENTS AND WORSHIP. Edited with commentary by Paul F. Palmer, S.J. *Sources of Christian Theology* 1. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1955. Pp. xxii + 227. \$4.75.

Fr. Palmer needs no introduction to the readers of this periodical. His distinguished articles in the past have established his reputation as an able theologian; his *Mary in the Documents of the Church* gave American Catholics a real opportunity to think with the Church on Mary. Once again he devotes his talents to furthering the growth of theological wisdom in the minds of English-speaking Catholics. Today's seminary professor or college teacher of religion can hardly complain of a dearth of source material with which to develop and illustrate the argument from tradition. But his student, whether collegian or seminarian, more often than not experiences the acute pains of theological indigestion when, given his weakness in languages, he attempts to assimilate such a rich diet. Without the least sacrifice to the requirements of a scholarly menu Fr. Palmer has undertaken to provide the American student of theology with an ordered diet which, if followed, will make him grow in his pursuit of Christian wisdom.

The present volume inaugurates a new series of sources for positive theology. The purpose of this series is to present in English translation, and in historical-topical arrangement, the basic texts and documents which have shaped and continue to control Catholic theological teaching. The early liturgies, the writings of the Fathers, the canons and decrees of ecumenical councils, and the official pronouncements of the Holy See are the principal sources from which these texts are drawn. To bring into sharper focus the continuity of Catholic teaching as contrasted with the doctrinal innovations of the Reformation period, the series will also include quotations from the early Reformers, which express what is distinctive in Protestant denominational thinking.

This first number in the series centers about the sacraments of the Christian Church which are more usually associated with Christian worship: baptism, confirmation, and the Eucharist. Succeeding numbers will be devoted to penance, extreme unction, orders, and marriage. Separate volumes on the other major treatises of theology will complete the series.

Five major themes are covered in the first volume: (1) the early rites of initiation; (2) the early Eucharistic liturgies; (3) the sacramental system; (4) the Eucharist as a sacrament; and (5) the Eucharist as a sacrifice. The documentation for the first two sections stretches from the *Didache* to the eighth century, when the present Roman rites and liturgy are found comparatively fixed. In the last three sections the documents cover the span of twenty Christian centuries, beginning with Pope Clement's Letter to the Corinthians and ending with the teaching of Pius XII on lay participation

in the Mass; the contrasting doctrine of the Reformers is given in their own words.

If this first volume is a pledge of what is to come, then it must be said that this will not be just another series of texts but a most valuable and unique presentation of Catholic tradition. The unique value is due to manifold reasons. To begin with, many important and basic texts are made accessible for the first time in excellent English translation, which happily combines extreme accuracy with perfect readability. Secondly, the best available primary sources have been consulted, and the selection of texts, especially from the early liturgies and the writings of the Fathers, is sufficiently wide and full to give a dynamic witness of the Church's ever vital tradition. This feature is of particular value for American students, who live in an atmosphere which is indifferent to the dimension of history and to tradition. A serious use of this volume will go a long way toward putting them in conscious contact with the great stream of Catholic Apostolic teaching. Thirdly, Palmer's presentation of texts is distinctive for yet another reason. The documents are arranged in an historical-topical order which situates them not only in their doctrinal but in their historical setting as well. This approach has many obvious advantages, not the least of which is that it enables the student not only clearly to comprehend the content and the essential constancy of Catholic teaching but also to enter into a thrilling communion with and to relive the vital unfolding and explicitation of Catholic belief. Finally, a word of commendation must be said for the commentary which accompanies each document cited. It is usually brief but always pregnant with apposite doctrinal and historical clarifications. In many instances longer notes in the proper place supplement this commentary.

One may be tempted to complain that this or that patristic text has not been included or that the excellent commentary should have been expanded. However, considering the reasonable limitations imposed by the covers of a book, one should be fully satisfied with the wise selection made and be grateful for the more than adequate commentary given. Once he has seen this series to completion, perhaps the author will be encouraged by its certain success to favor us with theological essays covering the same field.

Meanwhile, for those engaged in the teaching or the study of theology and liturgy, this volume will be an indispensable enchiridion of theological sources. Thorough familiarity with it will be an enriching experience; the lack thereof can only mean an inexcusable perpetuation of an intellectual immaturity in the Catholic faith.

A COMPANION TO THE STUDY OF ST. AUGUSTINE. Edited by Roy W. Battenhouse. New York: Oxford University Press, 1955. Pp. xiv + 425. \$5.50.

This collection of fifteen essays by a group of Protestant college and seminary professors is a work of collaboration to an unusual degree. The authors are members of a small theological society, the *Duodecim*, which devoted five meetings in 1945-47 to St. Augustine. Some of the contributions were originally papers read in those discussions; others have been added. The result is an attractively presented and competent series of studies, the aim of which is to provide both the novice and the student already acquainted with the great Doctor with a serviceable introduction to his life, writings, and thought.

The three introductory essays deal, respectively, with Augustine's significance today, his life, his pastoral activity and theology. These chapters are perhaps the most undistinguished in the book—understandably so, since they are professedly general and informative in scope.

The second part offers in seven chapters critical analyses of the chief works of Augustine, exclusive of the Scripture commentaries and sermons. Because of more than one series of translations of Augustine's works now in progress, these introductions to particular groups of writings or to major works are less invaluable than they would have been several years ago. They are still, however, welcome additions to the literature of a field where English works do not abound. Three are worthy of special mention: "The Anti-Pelagian Writings," by Paul Lehmann; "The Enigma of the Trinity," by Cyril C. Richardson; and "The City of God," by Edward R. Hardy, Jr.

The final section is the most penetrating and original. It contains five essays dealing with important facets of Augustinian thought: "Faith and Reason," by Robert E. Cushman; "The Creation of the World," by William A. Christian; "The Person and Work of Christ," by Albert C. Outler; "The Christian Ethic," by Thomas J. Bigham and Albert T. Mollegen; and "The Devotional Life," by Roger Hazelton. The hope expressed by the editor that even Augustinian scholars will find fresh value in these chapters seems well founded.

In general, the work is of high quality, the attitude towards Augustine sympathetic, yet detached, and the doctrinal positions, where expressed, only rarely unacceptable. In varying degrees the contributors show themselves familiar both with the text of Augustine and with contemporary Augustinian scholarship. There are, however, a few important omissions (e.g., Marrou, Courcelle). Suggested readings, mostly works in English, conclude each chapter.

Given the cooperative nature of the enterprise, it is only natural that there should be a certain amount of overlapping on topics previously discussed in common. On the whole, this is all to the good, since the different shades of opinion are often a faithful reflection of the ambivalence present in the Saint's own thought. The influence assigned to Neoplatonism is, of course, the primary touchstone of the view which the Christian theologian will take of Augustine. The predominant tone of the present work favors the position of Boyer, Gilson, etc., rather than that of Harnack, Alfarcic, etc. Most striking, perhaps, is the christological emphasis. Not only Outler's explicit treatment of the Word Incarnate, but other contributions, too, highlight the central role of this mystery in separating Augustine from Neoplatonism. However surprised one may be at the relatively rare mention of Christ in the early works (and Battenhouse's appeal to the literary genre of the dialogues is only a partial solution to the difficulty, as he recognizes), there is no doubt that the ripened thought of the Bishop of Hippo (as found, for example, in the *City of God*) gave to the Incarnation (and, by way of corollary, to the resurrection of the body) a place in the Augustinian vision of things which imposed a notable disagreement with Neoplatonism and, more generally, with ancient paganism's flight from the material.

Nor is this to deny that a considerable residue of Augustine's Neoplatonism, and even of his Manicheism, remained with him to the end. (Outler's expression of this complexity is particularly appealing.) His teaching on marriage is a good example, and is one reason for not subscribing to the too simple equation: "The treatise *On Marriage and Concupiscence* . . . is at once the basis for and the most succinct statement of the ethical teachings of the Roman Catholic Church concerning sex" (p. 221). But it is important to remember that the residue *was* residue, and that, by and large, Neoplatonism and Manicheism served Christianity, not vice versa. One may legitimately trace the development of Augustine's Christian sense and register the imperfection even of its final stages. But it would be contrary to the evidence to accept Nygren's easy thesis of a dilution in Augustine, under Greek influence, of the pure Gospel message. It is one of the merits of this volume that it testifies, despite some reservations and even a certain amount of dissent, to the substantial homogeneity of the Augustinian and the evangelical teaching.

Woodstock College

THOMAS E. CLARKE, S.J.

THE ALL-PRESENT GOD: A STUDY IN ST. AUGUSTINE. By Stanislaus J. Grabowski. St. Louis: Herder, 1954. Pp. xi + 327. \$4.50.

The current revival of patristic studies has given us many books on St.

Augustine. This is one of the best. Fr. Grabowski has brought to his subject years of serious research. He has made himself thoroughly familiar with all the writings of Augustine. He has not taken a notion of his own and searched for corroboration in Augustine. He has taken one of Augustine's most valued ideas and followed its development and growth in the Saint's writings—and this with a care and fidelity that makes what is not always a felicitous style, always worthwhile reading.

For Augustine, as for every saint, God's presence was more real than the air he breathed and the material world which surrounded him. No one has written more profoundly than he on the Indwelling—but he did not think that the Holy Spirit is sent into our souls from afar. He not only recognized that, apart from sanctifying grace, God is present to the soul, and to all things, by what theologians call His ubiquity. He realized it. This is the theme of G.'s book.

For Augustine, who came from a culture where the gods were localized on Olympus or spread out like oil over the universe, the Catholic doctrine of God's presence, creating and conserving His universe, giving Himself in His gifts, came as an awakening to the profoundest of truths. G. first studies Augustine's sources in Scripture and tradition. Then he examines the formation of the idea of the divine omnipresence in the mind of Augustine. He shows with careful scholarship that it was Augustine's insight into the nature of God as pure spirit and *ipsum esse subsistens* that enabled him to elaborate his doctrine.

After studying Augustine's views on the ways in which beings can be present to one another, G. in two excellent chapters gives us the Saint's teaching on God's presence in creation. This dynamic presence G. calls "operation inbeing"—a wonderfully apt phrase which ought to become a permanent part of theological language. It expresses very well the simultaneously immediate contact of both power and *suppositum* of the Scholastics.

The chapter following is entitled "Static Presence: Inbeing by Essence." G. examines the polemic of the sixth-century Patriarch of Antioch, Anastasius, who complained that some Christians held that God is present to all things by His power but not by His substance. Perhaps Anastasius was ultimately responsible for the argument of the later Schoolmen on *actio in distans*. G. says: "In consequence of the early Greek Tradition (these Fathers avoid making the divine substance pervade all things for fear of implicating God in the universe in some pantheistic way) the Latin also (up to the time of St. Augustine) is practically unanimous in conceiving the all-present God in the terms and form of activity." The Latin tradition right up

until the present day is equally unanimous—so I would imagine. Since no one, even Aquinas, is more emphatic than Augustine in teaching the absolute identity of divine activity with the divine substance, it seems only just to conclude with G.: “. . . from Augustine’s copious and well-developed theology on God it is evident that God is present to all things not only in the capacity of a creator, preserver, provider, mover but also through His substance.” Perhaps it is less than just to speak of his “neglect or omission of direct mention of God’s static presence.” “Static presence” means presence by essence or substance. But is it strictly accurate to speak of God’s presence *by or through* His substance? He is present by His creative and conserving operation, and since God’s action is His substance, God is present in substance as well as in power.

The chapter on “St. Augustine, Monist or Dualist?,” strikes at least one reader as confusing. Since Augustine did not identify God with the universe (monism) nor believe Him to be so separate from it as to be irreconcilable with it (dualism), the answer G. makes is, of course, that Augustine was neither monist nor dualist. But such an answer raises the question: why ask at all?

In the following chapters G. discusses pantheism, the historical and doctrinal backgrounds of Augustine’s doctrine, and the relation between theology and Augustine’s philosophy, with a final chapter entitled “Presence of God and Life.”

The intimate and imperative nature of God’s presence in creation is brought home to us more forcefully by the Fathers than by the Scholastics. Far more than the generalities voiced, the scrupulous precision with which G. explains Augustine’s doctrine will greatly assist students of the Saint’s work.

The sentence, “It is not a power or virtue that is distinct from God to the extent of being, properly speaking, a divine Person or some other separate entity” (p. 27), should be modified. There are some unnecessary repetitions. *Synecheim* is explained in almost identical words on pp. 31 and 43. A quotation from Origen is given on p. 37 and repeated on p. 43; another on p. 38 is given again on p. 42; there is no development in the exegesis of these texts. *Choretos* on p. 41 should read *achoretos*, since the Latin contexts have *non continet* rather than *continet* (cf. p. 44). Is not Augustine’s concept of *materia informis* from Genesis rather than from Plato, Aristotle, or Plotinus (p. 285)? And is it fair to associate Dante with the monism that identifies God and the universe (p. 184)?

These points of detail do not reduce our appreciation of the wise and scholarly spirit of this book. Not only students of Augustine but every

Christian who wishes a deeper understanding of the mystery of God's presence will read this book with profit.

Alma College, Los Gatos, Cal.

JAMES A. MARA, S.J.

THE TRINITARIAN DOCTRINE AND SOURCES OF ST. CAESARIUS OF ARLES.
By Mark Dorenkemper, C.P.P.S. *Paradosis* 9. Fribourg: University Press, 1953. Pp. ix + 234. 10.40 fr.

In his introduction the author bestows generous praise upon the Benedictine scholar, Germain Morin, whose lifework and masterpiece of internal criticism made it possible for him to offer a piece of research such as this. But Morin's edition of the *Opera omnia* of St. Caesarius of Arles—the *Sermones* appearing in 1937, and the *Opera varia* in 1942—was soon consumed by fire in World War II. It is, therefore, most gratifying to report here that since Dorenkemper wrote his study the *Sermones* have appeared in a second edition, edited by Dom C. Lambot, as Vols. 103 and 104 in *Corpus christianorum*, Series latina (Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 1953). The completed edition will include an appendix by Lambot, offering *inter alia* certain new sermons by Caesarius.

The material for the first, doctrinal part of the present monograph is found principally in Caesarius' apologetical treatises, *Libellus de mysterio sanctae trinitatis* and *Breviarium adversus haereticos*. Of course, the great Archbishop of Arles was first and foremost a preacher, a practical exponent of the Trinity; but in this, during the forty years of his ceaseless appearances in the pulpit and the shepherding of his people against Semi-Arians and Semi-Pelagians, his sermons are not merely moral but of necessity also eminently doctrinal. As Dr. Dorenkemper puts it, they constantly embrace faith and action; and thus the sermons—especially the two (212, 213) on the divinity of the Holy Spirit—are also quite important for our theme.

D. begins Part 1 with Caesarius' consideration of the Trinity's consubstantiality and its sequels (pp. 13–82). A definite development in the Church's stand against the later Arians is illustrated by the creeds or symbols of those centuries, especially the so-called Athanasian Creed, the *Quicumque*; and the relationship of dependence—noted before—between this and Caesarius' divisional treatment of the Trinity is emphasized at once and in large measure determines the author's method of exposition (later, p. 139 f., he decides against Caesarian authorship of the Symbol). As in the *Quicumque*, though in less orderly and distinct division, in Caesarius' teaching, the *fact* of the subject (one God in trinity) and the *how* (consubstantiality and trinity of Persons) receive first and brief consideration. These are preparative to the all-important sequels, of which first place is

given to the equality or coequality of Father and Son. This is not accidental, for the central Semi-Arian doctrine, while granting divinity to the Son, maintained the inequality of Father and Son. The *Quicumque* states the correct doctrine on this three times, and Caesarius himself devotes by far the greatest portion of his two trinitarian works to arguing the equality of Persons, defending it from Scripture, tradition, and reason. Further sequels follow: the coeternity of the Son and Holy Spirit with the Father, their omnipotence and omnipresence. In the fifth and final sequel, termed "Lord and God," the point of emphasis, as compared with the *Quicumque*, shifts from the Son to the Spirit: conceding a divinity of sorts to the Second Person, in regard to the Third the Semi-Arians held pure Macedonianism, which denied divinity to the Holy Spirit and made Him a creature.

The remaining chapters treat Caesarius' teaching on "The Internal Processions," the generation of the Son and the procession of the Holy Spirit and the relations involved (pp. 83-100); "The Divine Missions" of the Son and the Spirit (pp. 101-14); and "Appropriation," the unity of operations and properties (of which 38 are mentioned by the Saint at the end of his *Brev. adv. haer.*) of the three Persons.

Part 2 (pp. 127-223) treats the sources of Caesarius' doctrine on the Trinity. His dependence on the *Quicumque* has already become quite apparent: the Symbol serves him as a norm of truths to be defended, and our author believes (p. 222) him to be the first certain witness to its existence. Next the "Principal Patristic Dependence" (St. Augustine, Faustus of Riez, St. Ambrose), "Secondary Patristic Dependence" (St. Hilary of Poitiers, St. Fulgentius, Ithacius of Osseona, Gennadius of Marseilles), and "No Dependence" (Eugenius of Carthage, St. Vincent of Lerins, Eugyppius of Africa) are dealt with. It is particularly to the Bishop of Hippo that Caesarius is indebted; but for his teaching on the Trinity this does not hold to the extent that it does for his doctrine on grace: for the former, in his apology and polemic against the Semi-Arians he leans heavily on Augustine, but for his trinitarian doctrine he looks to the *Quicumque*. We find here as elsewhere confirmation of D.'s insistence (p. 13) that the "practical" Archbishop of Arles never thought of writing a theology, but rather wrote and preached theological thought.

In addition to the patristic authors mentioned above, D. mentions Origen, St. Cyprian, St. Jerome, and Pomerius as certainly known to Caesarius and used by him in his sermons, but exerting no influence on his trinitarian teaching. Mention is further made of more than a dozen writers of whom selected works were examined as possible source of Caesarius. This great industry notwithstanding, D. appears to have missed a source of importance

—Rufinus of Aquileia. He mentions Rufinus only once (p. 207), for having given Caesarius contact, through his translations, with Origen. But if he had looked also into Rufinus' original writing, he would have found in the *Commentarius in symbolum apostolorum*—particularly suggestive, too, because of Caesarius' dependence on the *Quicumque*—some striking verbal correspondence. Note in Rufinus, *Comm.* 4 (PL 21, 341AB), and Caesarius, *Serm.* 9 (Morin-Lambot 48):

Deum cum audis, substantiam intellege, sine initio, sine fine Patrem cum audis, Filii intellege Patrem Hoc igitur [*ergo* = Caes.] ipso nomine quo [Morin-Lambot for Caes.: *quod*; variant *quo* in app.!] deus Pater appellatur, cum Patre pariter subsistere etiam Filius demonstratur. Quomodo autem [variant *sane*, and thus Morin-Lambot for Caes.!] deus Pater genuerit Filium, nolo discutias (. . . = omissions in Caesarius).

This Rufinian text in its word-for-word duplication in Caesarius is offered in sections by D. at pp. 160, 171 f., and 183, and set in parallel with passages in St. Augustine, Faustus of Riez (though this supposes for Caesarius "the greatest freedom of adaptation"), and St. Ambrose. I have not had the time to pursue this matter of obvious dependence further. For abundant material concerning Rufinus' own antecedents in this, see now the introduction and notes by J. N. D. Kelly to his translation of the *Commentarius*: ACW 20 (Westminster, Md., and London, 1955); cf., e.g., his observations on the patristic commonplace in "nolo discutias" at the end of the passage quoted above: p. 106, n. 24.

I stress again D.'s great industry in seeking to establish his writer's trinitarian *fontes*. As minor points of criticism: his general index is too skimpy, and misprints in the Latin texts adduced occur too often—by the dozen—to go unmentioned. The monograph, well introduced and organized and clearly written, is an interesting and valuable contribution. The contribution includes (p. 188 f.) the elimination of a lacuna left in Morin's *Opera omnia* of Caesarius.

Pontifical College Josephinum

J. C. PLUMPE

THÉOLOGIE TRINITAIRE CHEZ SAINT THOMAS D'AQUIN: EVOLUTION DU CONCEPT D'ACTION NOTIONELLE. By Paul Vanier, S.J. Montreal: Institut d'études médiévales; Paris: J. Vrin, 1953. Pp. 157.

The word "notion" in trinitarian theology signifies a note or a property whereby the Divine Persons are distinguishable from each other. Notional operations, then, are acts which are proper to a Divine Person, e.g., to

generate, as opposed to acts which are essential or common to all three Divine Persons, e.g., to know, or to create. Fr. Vanier's study endeavors to determine precisely the nature and rôle of the notional act in the words of St. Thomas. Within this limited casing the author has managed to include an extraordinary amount of material. Actually his choice of subtitle does not do justice to the range of his inquiry: the book is a close-packed study of all the fundamental metaphysical notions—procession, relation, person—in Thomas' theology.

Most rewarding is the historical excursus which opens the book and which situates Thomas' achievement. Aquinas inherited two distinct trinitarian perspectives, one originating from Augustine, the other from pseudo-Dionysius. According to the Augustinian tradition, the Divine Persons were constituted and distinguished from each other by the divine relations. In the Dionysian tradition, on the other hand, trinitarian theology was informed by the Neoplatonic vision of the self-diffusion of goodness. For this essential attribute of the supreme good, God, became confounded to a certain extent with the notional act of the First Person, the Father. The result was that the Father, as *divinitas fontalis*, seemed to be constituted a person prior to and independently of any relation. Profoundly Augustinian though it was, the theology anterior to St. Thomas could not, for various reasons, despoil itself of its deep attachment for the Areopagite. Consequently trinitarian theology was stalled in a vain attempt to reconcile the two traditions. It was set in motion again only when Thomas jettisoned the Dionysian-Neoplatonic perspective and steered his theology along a route totally and frankly Augustinian. By this complete adherence to the Aristotelian *relatio*, Thomas was able to exploit all the potentialities latent in Augustine's marvelous discovery, and to bring trinitarian theology to a peak of perfection not reached by Augustine himself.

When did this total espousal of Augustinianism occur? It is V.'s thesis that Thomas achieved his uniquely Augustinian synthesis only in the latter years of his career; that in writing the *De potentia* and, of course, in composing works earlier than the *De potentia*, Thomas was still tributary to the Dionysian tradition; and that consequently Thomas' trinitarian theology underwent a profound, and hitherto unnoticed, development.

V. seeks to prove his thesis by an exhaustive and minute comparison of the *Summa* with the *De potentia* and other theological works of St. Thomas exclusive of the *Commentary on the Sentences*. This leads him to the conviction that the *Summa* represents the culmination of a real doctrinal evolution, and he adduces (pp. 90-91) five radical differences between the *Summa* and the

De potentia which, he feels, point to a development of Thomas' thought along the lines he indicated. Consequently the *Summa* should not be completed, much less corrected, by the inchoate positions of the *De potentia*.

In the second part of the book V. deals with the major objection against his thesis: the fact that the earliest work of Thomas, the *Commentary on the Sentences*, contains a theology of the notional act which is substantially in accord with that of the *Summa*. Thus it would seem that Thomas' position, rather than developing, had in fact remained constant throughout his career, and that any evidence to the contrary is largely illusory. V. meets this objection with an hypothesis which had been seriously entertained by other commentators of Thomas, namely, that the extant text of the *Commentary* is not identical in all respects with the text which Aquinas, as a young bachelor in theology, originally published in 1254. Our present text of the *Commentary*, the author believes, is actually a second, revised edition published by the Saint in 1265. Whatever accord, then is found between our *Commentary* and the *Summa*, relative to the notional act, can be explained by retouches and emendations made by Thomas in his mature period. Likewise, V. contends, if we possessed the original 1254 edition of the *Commentary*, it would reflect the Dionysian tradition regarding the notional act.

The author supports this contention by a careful scrutiny of the extant *Commentary*, where he claims to discover several anomalies which point towards the verification of his theory. Furthermore, he examines Hannibald's resumé of the *Commentary* (i.e., of what must have been the original *Commentary*, since the resumé dates apparently from about 1261), and finds further confirmation of his theory. V. concludes, then, that the *Commentary on the Sentences*, as originally written by Thomas, contained positions on the notional act similar to those of the *De potentia* and unlike the later developments of the *Summa*. Thus he refutes the major objection against his thesis.

Speculative theologians in search of a fresh commentary on some of Thomas' *quaestiones subtiliores* will find this book, especially Part 1, very valuable. The author lends conviction to his argument that the purest and deepest expression of Thomas' trinitarian theology is located not in the *De potentia* but in the *Summa* itself. In his comparison of these two works V. discovers nuances as fine as gold leaf and as subtle as quicksilver. Highlights of this portion of the book are: the author's delineation of the rigidly scientific, architectonic structure of the *Summa's* trinitarianism; his discussion on the relation as constitutive of the person; his exposition of Thomas' genius in isolating the notion of procession; and finally his treatment of the notional acts and their location in the scheme of the *Summa*.

With regard to V.'s main thesis, it must be admitted that he marshals a great mass of internal evidence in favor of his theory. Does it wholly convince? Differences of approach, e.g., in the *De potentia* and in the *Summa*, do not necessarily indicate a real evolution in thought. Even Thomas' change of position regarding the predication of relation with person—where in the *De potentia* the essence is predicated of the person *in recto*, and the relation *in obliquo*, while in the *Summa* it is just the reverse—striking though it is, does not seem necessarily to substantiate V.'s thesis. But these are debatable issues. The incontestable weakness of the thesis lies in its basic assumption, i.e., that the *De potentia* was written before the *Pars prima* of the *Summa*. In a curious and unsatisfactory note (p. 91, n. 2) V. asserts that the anterior publication of the *De potentia* "est généralement admis." It would be interesting to hear how he would substantiate this assertion. Walz assigns the date 1266 for the *Pars prima*, and 1265–1267 for the *De potentia*. Wyser accepts 1267 for the *Pars prima*, and 1265–1266 for the *De potentia*, but he also admits that Thomas may have been writing the latter as late as 1268. Grabmann assigns 1266 for the *Pars prima*, and puts the *De potentia* somewhere in the period 1265–1271. Indeed, Grabmann is even more precise, for he asserts: "Die Quaestiones de potentia sind sonach in Rom in den Jahren 1265 bis 1266 oder 1267 entstanden, also ungefähr gleichzeitig mit der Prima . . ." (*Die Werke des hl. Th. v. Aq.* [3rd. ed.; Münster, 1949] p. 306). It is unfortunate that V. did not devote more thought to this question of chronology before attacking his problem on the basis of internal evidence. On the other hand, perhaps if he had done so we might never have been given a book which, for reasons extrinsic to its main thesis, is quite precious.

Weston College

JOHN J. WALSH, S.J.

EL YO DE JESUCRISTO: UN CONFLICTO ENTRE DOS CRISTOLOGÍAS. By Bartolomé M. Xiberta, O.Carm. Barcelona: Herder, 1954. Pp. 172.

Since the close of World War II a lively discussion has been in progress concerning the "ego" of the God-Man. Touched off by the delayed reaction, especially on the part of Pietro Parente, to Paul Galtier's *l'Unité du Christ* (1939), and complicated not a little by Léon Seiller's enthusiastic championing of the ideas of his Franciscan colleague, Déodat de Basly, the controversy has had its moments of sharp polemic, but has also stimulated some valuable reflections in this largely unexplored area of Christology.

In the present work the well-known Carmelite professor at Rome offers to a wider audience a summary of the discussions thus far, and a critique of what he considers to be an untenable position, shared, in his estimate, by

Déodat de Basly, Seiller, Galtier, and, to a lesser extent, by several theologians of the French diocesan clergy. Xiberta handles this complex and delicate problem within the framework of three questions: (1) who is the *subject* pronouncing the "I" in Christ; (2) what is the *content* of that "I"—purely divine, or purely human, or both; (3) by what psychological process does that which is human in the subject grasp that which is divine in the content? Put more simply, the chief question is, how did Christ know, in His human intellect, that He was God? The author rightly observes that the controversy over this psychological question involves broader divergencies regarding the ontological constitution of Christ. Hence it is to the more basic problem of the ontological influence of the Word on the human nature and especially on the human operations of the God-Man that he principally addresses himself.

The first half of the book presents the positions of twenty-seven contemporary theologians. This part of the work is generally fair and accurate, but is far too brief to merit the publisher's claim of "a reasoned exposition of the significance of each of these contributions."

The second part, though cogently argued, suffers from two serious methodological defects. The first is the failure clearly to delineate the precise christological teaching which is considered "dogmatically unacceptable" (p. 108). The earlier summary of positions had clearly manifested not only the great variety of opinions but also the obvious fact that there is no simple correspondence between the divergencies regarding the ontological structure of Christ and those which concern His conscious operations. Xiberta acknowledges this (p. 89) but fails to take sufficient account of it in tracing the features of the delinquent Christology. The reader is left wondering whether the unorthodoxy imputed concerns the level of being or of conscious operation, and just who of the many theologians listed come under the author's strictures.

Even more serious a flaw is the coupling in a single critique of two positions which differ on the most fundamental point. I refer to the position of Galtier and to that shared by Déodat de Basly and Seiller (the latter's book on the present subject was placed on the Index in 1951). On the very expression which the author himself acknowledges (p. 86) to be the touchstone of orthodoxy, the identity of the Word with the Son of Mary, these two positions differ sharply. No one has more emphatically asserted the identity of the Word and the Man than Galtier, whereas the two Franciscan theologians have affirmed that the Word is distinct from the Assumptus Homo. How can such radically divergent conceptions (or, at least, terminologies) permit

the respective authors to be lumped together as professing the same Christology?

This unconscious "guilt-by-association" technique leads the author to attribute to Galtier, for example, such conceptions as cooperation of the Divine Persons and the Man Christ (pp. 92, 34 f.), whereas, in the passage alluded to (*L'Unité du Christ*, pp. 268-72), it is of the human nature, not of the Man (who, to repeat, *is* the Word), that there is question. Likewise, the unsuspecting reader could easily gather that all the authors associated with this Christology assert that the hypostatic union involves the sanctification of the humanity only by way of "simple convenience" (p. 95).

Although the author is more concerned with the refutation of the "second Christology" than with a positive presentation of his own views, those who have followed the controversy will find his position interesting. An attempt to summarize this position in a brief compass would risk distortion. Let it suffice to say that Xiberta seeks a solution to the problem in terms of a dynamic influx, proper to the Word, which totally and radically supernaturalizes the human nature of the God-Man, and which, by way of communication, leaves in that human nature unique effects which are attained by the human consciousness of Christ. Experimental and infused knowledge, organically joined to the intuitive vision, give to the human intellect of Christ the awareness that He is God.

Woodstock College

THOMAS E. CLARKE, S.J.

LA VOCATION DE L'ÉGLISE. By Maurice Villain, S.M., and Joseph de Baciocchi, S.M. Paris: Plon, 1954. Pp. 288. 600 fr.

The *Credo* collection of theological essays to which this volume belongs "is addressed to educated Christians who wish to deepen their faith" by a "return to the sources," notably Scripture, the Fathers, and the liturgy. Its aim is "not to present an already elaborated doctrine, and much less anything novel, but to stimulate the faith of the Christian living in the modern world."

In pursuance of this aim, *La vocation de l'église* is a penetrating biblical analysis of the concept and mission of the Church, going back to the germinal beginnings in the *OT* and including the present-day ecumenical movement among the churches separated from Rome. The Catholic Church is first seen as the prophetic continuation of the chosen people of the Old Law, except that, where election among the Jews was based on carnal generation, a spiritual rebirth is the mark of predilection in the new dispensation. Matthew and Paul are the primary sources for our knowledge of Christ as the founder

of the Church Universal. "Recent critical scholarship has found in the Gospel of St. Matthew a very clear and symmetrically worked out plan" to trace the evolution of the Church of Christ from the ancient People of God (p. 34). Paul confirms and completes the doctrine of Matthew. Unlike the latter, Paul is not interested in the earthly, mortal life of Jesus. When he speaks of himself as a "witness" and "apostle," it is because Christ appeared to him on the way to Damascus; thus he saw the Lord and received his mission after the resurrection of Christ. "From there on, his normal approach is on a different plane (than that of the first evangelist). It is the relation of the Christian, or better, of the Christian community, to the risen Christ. No longer the horizontal viewpoint of the historian, it is the perpendicular interpretation of the theologian and mystic." However, we are not to conclude from this that Paul "ignores the historic Jesus and His decisive role in the foundation of the first community," or that "the theology of Paul is disincarnated" (p. 43).

When we come to analyze the nature of the Church, we are impressed by the fact that it not only bears a relation to Israel which makes the Church a new covenant, but also a relation to the end of the world which makes it the final covenant between God and the human race. Following consistently on this finality is the Church's universality, by which the blessings of the Incarnation are intended to reach all nations to the end of time.

The covenant of God with His people in the New Law is not only new or final; it is something distinctly superior to the alliance between Jahweh and the Israelites. "God has really and personally intervened in the existence of humanity," becoming Incarnate of the Virgin Mary (p. 86). As God Incarnate, He not only established the Church as something apart from Himself but mystically incorporated His elect as members of His own body. One aspect of the Mystical Body which is particularly stressed by Paul is its functional importance in the spiritual life. The Greek word, *melos*, means an organ, which bears a definite functional relation first to the animating principle of which it is an instrumental medium, and then to other organs in the same body. To be emphasized, therefore, is the dynamic purpose of the members of the Mystical Body as faculties through which Christ the Head may operate, necessarily dependent upon Him in order to function and necessarily diversified in order to function in different ways.

Consequent on the doctrine of the Mystical Body is the hierarchical structure of the Church, which is organic and therefore organized by divine right. On the final realization of this fact rests the success of the ecumenical movement among the Christian churches. "It is common knowledge that since the Amsterdam Assembly (1948) the most important dogmatic problem

facing the ecumenical movement is this: Are we to conceive the Church as having a Protestant form or a 'catholic' form?" (p. 116). The Catholic form, by definition, is hierarchical and organized.

Relative to the Church's sanctity, it should be noted that the Body of Christ is described in Scripture as "holy and immaculate," and at the same time as incorporating sinners among its members. When speaking of the Church's saints, it is possible to understate the issue. It is not enough to say there is sanctity *in* the Church; to be underscored is that holiness is produced *by* the Church through the Spirit of Christ which animates its members. But while vindicating the Church's sanctity we must not overlook the sinners in its ranks. "Sin is everywhere present in the Church, among the laity and among members of the hierarchy. Sin weighs the Church down, constricts it, and hinders the progress of its mission" (p. 237). While deploring its presence among the faithful, we must know how to reconcile, on theological grounds, this sinfulness with the Church's sanctity.

The final chapter is a summary application of the conclusions derived up to that point, to the "Ecumenical Task" which lies before the Christian churches. Unfortunately, an otherwise excellent book is marred by the author's attempt to bridge the gap which separates Roman Catholicism from the non-Roman denominations. "If the Body of Christ," he states, "is visibly realized in the Roman Catholic community, this does not prevent all the baptized from remaining attached to it as members—in varying degrees, it goes without saying, according to the *vestigia Ecclesiae* which their respective denominations possess: they are invisible members, but nevertheless real" (p. 257). It is difficult to reconcile this position with the doctrine of *Mystici corporis*: "In Ecclesiae membris reapse ii soli annumerandi sunt, qui regenerationis lavacrum receperunt veramque fidem profiterentur" (*AAS* 35, 202).

Except for this over-irenic attitude in the closing pages, *La vocation de l'église* should fill a practical need for evaluating the Catholic Church in the context of Sacred Scripture. Teachers of *De ecclesia* on the seminary or college level will find that it opens up a score of new insights into the meaning of the true Church, not only as a juridical organization but as the society of those who are called by God to be saints.

West Baden College

JOHN A. HARDON, S.J.

CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE. A One-Volume Outline of Christian Belief. By John Mackintosh Shaw. New York: Philosophical Library, 1954. Pp. 379. \$6.00.

The purpose of this book is "to think out afresh the great vital convic-

tions of our Christian faith back of their traditional doctrinal expression, to realize anew the wonder of them, and express them in terms which shall be relevant and meaningful for the living thought and conduct of the present" (Preface). Twenty-five years of teaching systematic theology at Queen's College, Kingston, Ontario, have surely given Dr. Shaw the right to speak for his Protestant Reformed brethren. His mild liberalism may be disconcerting to them as well as to us on occasion; his sincere desire to increase the knowledge and love of God as revealed in Jesus Christ cannot for an instant be doubted.

The book is mainly for ministers and theological students, but is intended also for ordinary Christians, as well as for ordinary non-Christians who may use it as an introduction to the faith which the author espouses. His ecumenical intent, however, leads him to avoid verbal battlefields and to choose only "properly religious" terms which will be common to most Christians of our day. He wants to "disengage abiding essential Christian truth and conviction" from its various historical doctrinal formulations, so that the historic Christian faith may be seen as a Gospel for today, too.

The book is divided into an Introduction and five main parts: God, Man and Sin, Redemption, the Christian Life, Life after Death. The Introduction lays down the central organizing principle of systematic theology: the revelation of God culminating in Jesus Christ, who is super-historical, contemporaneous with each age, through His "risen, living working in the minds and lives of the Apostles and then of those who believed in Him through their teaching" (p. 13). The great fact of religion is the Christ of history and of experience; the beliefs and convictions arising from this fact are ordered and formulated by systematic theology, using Scripture as the "primary authoritative source of Christian truth" (p. 18), as interpreted by the individual believer under the leading of the Holy Spirit.

The ultimate source of Christian belief, then, is Christian experience, by which a man is put in living contact with Christ and His living Spirit. Christian doctrine is to be "what in the Bible . . . is consistent with the Gospel or message of good news which we have through Christian revelation and experience" (p. 23). The obvious puzzle is how the believer is to know what that Gospel message is, without getting it from the Bible which contains it. Shaw seems to leave the door wide open to subjective choice of "Christian convictions" which happen to appeal to each believer, and in so doing seems to make scriptural inspiration consist merely in the power of the Book to inspire its reader with these "Christian convictions," which may or may not square with the creeds, catechisms, and councils which on his own admission are the secondary sources of Christianity.

Several instances will suffice. S. says that Christ arrived at a special knowledge of God as Father through "properly religious experience, the experience of his unique fellowship with God as Father" (p. 28). The miracles of Christ result not from any divine power He might have had, but from His unique human faith in God and His trusting Himself to God the Father's power. Christ was not morally perfect from the beginning of His life, since such perfection would have prevented His having a true human personality. Yet He was unique—the only man without life-for-self, which is sin. He was "not merely a God-possessed man, but the Son of God manifest in the flesh, and as such was with the Father the object of faith and worship" (p. 92). The Trinity is not so much revealed as demanded by Christian experience of God as Fatherly Creator, redeeming Father-Love, and as the Spirit leading to fellowship and service; it is a reasonable belief, even though to us modern men "three persons in one God" smacks of Tritheism (p. 96). "Holy Father-Love" is the essence of Godhead, and even before Calvary "there was an unseen cross in the Father's heart" (p. 216).

Such expressions, current in liberalistic Protestant circles, indicate a danger of abandoning not only the traditional formulation but also the doctrine itself when that doctrine is difficult for the "modern scientific mind" to accept. The other large section which we shall consider is that on Life after Death, where S's preoccupation with "properly religious experience" seems sometimes to lead him away from properly Christian doctrine. For the just, the resurrection will occur immediately after death, and will be one of a "spiritualized" body, with a personal continuity not of material substance but of the "spiritual organizing principle" (p. 329) which will enter a life of progressive development in character and service, since a static life of perfection is against the moral and spiritual probabilities of the case. For the unjust, S. prefers to hold out the hope of annihilation if they persist in their sin even in the future life. He calls it "Conditional Immortality or Immortality"; either God will annihilate such obstinate souls or they will fall into dissolution of themselves. The sentiment that can creep into subjective interpretation of God's revelation in Christ is well evident here: "So with all the tenderness and graciousness of His teaching, Jesus yet warned men with tears in His eyes of the terrible possibility of exclusion from the Kingdom and separation from fellowship with God. And while the doctrine of Everlasting Punishment in the traditional sense of unending, hopeless torment is revoltingly crude and harsh, and must be rejected as a pre-Christian Jewish rather than a properly Christian doctrine, we must still hold fast to the fact of everlasting penalty and privation as the necessary consequence of everlastingly continued-in sin, if such indeed there

be" (p. 349). Such a passage hardly measures up to the great Christian conviction of the historical Church that hell does exist and that eternal torment of sinners is against neither moral justice nor the character of the good and merciful God. If Christian thinking is pointing more and more to the idea of "Future Chances," it is simply becoming less and less Christian. This may easily happen if the only criterion of God's revelation is the individual's personal experience of Christ or what he thinks is Christ. But Christ Himself, says the primary record, taught otherwise; cf. Mt 25:41-46.

Most of these infelicitous expressions result from S.'s zeal to make doctrine clear to moderns; usually he embodies the traditional statement somewhere in his exposition of it. The presumption, then, is that he does hold with tradition in most matters. He is uniformly fair to the Roman Church in doctrinal matters, despite a few minor inaccuracies in details. His emphasis on the doctrines of the Trinity and the Incarnation of God puts him, definitely on the side of the angels, and he should be remembered that way.

West Baden College

DAVID J. BOWMAN, S.J.

THE GROWTH OF PAPAL GOVERNMENT IN THE MIDDLE AGES. By Walter Ullmann. London: Methuen, 1955. Pp. xviii + 482. 42s.

How the Christian Church at Rome grew from insignificance into a governmental edifice that during the High Middle Ages knew no competitor, is the story of this book. However, the reader will find here neither a simple exposition of the events which marked that unique development, nor a mere study of the varied, isolated manifestations of the hierocratic principles proposed through the medieval period as the *pièces justificatives* for papal authority beyond the clerical sphere. This book is much more. It is an ingenious attempt to combine these two scientific procedures, to assess the evolving ideas without excluding the facts, and the resulting synthesis is a rare historiographical triumph. Mr. Ullmann has succeeded in tracing the lineage of the conflicting ideologies involved in the long struggle between pope and king, and at the same time in presenting them in their relevant historical environment, so that the characters as they appear are not Church and state, two dim abstractions, but clergy and laity, two classes within the corporate Christian society.

The terminal points of the study are the fourth and the twelfth centuries, and all materials within this area that might further illumine the relationships of the two powers, such as law, liturgy, symbolism, theology, finance, diplomatic exchange, etc., are submitted to careful attention. Thus in the early chapters appears not only the familiar *discere-docere* antithesis of Gelasius which expanded into the supremacy of the *auctoritas sacrata* over

the *potestas regalis*, but also the bold plan of Gregory II to emancipate the papacy from the insistent caesaropapism of the Eastern Emperor, and the later efforts of Stephen II, whose adroit alliance with Pippin promoted this end but at the same time initiated equally annoying problems with the Frankish kings and the Roman aristocracy. Here too will be found a critical probing into the extent of influence exerted by the Pseudo-Isidorian Decrees, which were to become "the pantheon of all papal prerogatives" (p. 181), and of the other fabrications of the ninth century, in formulating more distinctly the functional qualifications of the *sacerdotium* in Christian society; the reasons behind Charlemagne's reluctance to accept the crown of the Roman Empire; the uncertain generations after Nicholas I, when papal favor was still deemed essential by the contenders for imperial honors, though the catalog of Roman pontiffs for these years reveals an administration of weakened, often depraved calibre.

Much space in this volume is understandably assigned to Hildebrand and a study of his efforts to achieve a more thorough implementation of the hierocratic theme on the grounds that the Roman Church is the embodiment of *justitia* and thereby solely qualified to issue legislation demanding unquestioned acceptance in Christian society. To this conception of a universal *societas christiana* transcending all bounds of race and culture and controlled ultimately by an unfettered papal monarchy, Henry IV opposed a diarchy of government involving a separation of power into the spiritual and temporal spheres and represented allegorically by the two swords. Thus to Henry the church "can be no more than a vaguely conceived spiritual-mystical brotherhood of Christian believers: it certainly can be no corporate, juristic entity" (p. 346). Once he was assured of the support of his German bishops, themselves attracted to a radical episcopatism, he abandoned the dualistic axiom for the more extreme *rex-sacerdos* theme of his father, in which the kingly office was alleged to be divine in origins and execution.

Usually in studies of this nature the literary exponents of the king's position receive slight attention, and, while it is true that they seem to have exerted only limited influence due to the atmosphere of the times, still an evaluation of their anti-papal tenets is needed for a fuller perception of the forces present in this battle of ideas. Therefore it is satisfying to find a chapter entitled, "The Defence of the Lay Thesis," in which appear Peter Crassus, Benzo of Alba, the *York Tracts*, etc., and their artful, often sophistic attempts to establish a doctrinal basis for the king's direct derivation of power from Christ. The anonymous author of the *York Tracts*, for example, argues that Christ had both regal and sacerdotal functions. He was king by reason of His divinity and has been king from all eternity. His priesthood,

on the other hand, was only incidental to His becoming man, and therefore subsequent and inferior to the royalty that He shared with His Father. Thus there is a direct link between king and his prototype, Christ, so that the king is in every sense a *rex* and a *sacerdos*.

Readers acquainted with other published studies of Mr. Ullmann will not be disappointed in this book. They will meet the same rich documentation and precision of expression (if we except an occasional oversimplification, e.g., in regard to the practice of penance in the pre-Hildebrandine period). It is only regrettable that space and possibly other publication demands persuaded the author to give but passing regard to the influence of the *civitas Dei*, especially in Carolingian times. St. Augustine's concept of Christianity as a *societas peregrina* exploiting the advantages of the *pax Babylonis* in the ardent pursuit of its own transcendental goal, i.e., the *pax coelestis*, became a consistent teleological force in all the motions and accelerations of medieval life. It would seem, therefore, that some critical appraisal of the Augustinian viewpoint is needed for a more complete comprehension of the governmental theories of the Middle Ages. Notwithstanding this omission, however, Mr. Ullmann has made a valuable and appreciable advance in the clarification of the medieval mind, and his book should win the enthusiastic applause of historians and all who are interested in the genetic progress of political thought.

Alma College

EDWARD D. McSHANE, S.J.

DIE THEOLOGISCHE ANTHROPOLOGIE JOHANN ADAM MOEHLERS: IHR GESCHICHTLICHER WANDEL. By Josef Rupert Geiselmann. Freiburg: Herder, 1955. Pp. xvii + 438.

The question of man's existence both as a human being and as a Christian must ever be a vital one. A thorough understanding of his existence will always be a cherished desire of man. No picture of man can be painted without God, but when we turn to our theology we find no complete, unified delineation of man. What we find are elements and parts scattered through the treatises on creation, redemption, grace, etc. Many questions which concern our human and Christian existence are barely treated or not raised at all.

Dr. Geiselmann has performed a signal service in presenting the picture of man as painted by the great Tübingen theologian, Johann Adam Möhler. No other Catholic theologian has penetrated this theological-anthropological problem more deeply than Möhler, who struggled with it up to the hour of his death.

Through G.'s skillful art we are witnesses to Möhler's struggle to get to

the core of our existence, a drama showing the manifold vital influences felt by Möhler, and the successive stages in the march of his thought. This is brought out in his reactions to the *Aufklärung*, to the spirit of Romanticism, to the idealistic theology of Schleiermacher, to the idealistic philosophy of Schelling and Hegel, and to the reawakened Lutheran orthodoxy. Geiselman treads his way carefully through the different works of Möhler, from the *Einheit* through the five editions of the *Symbolik*, showing the progress in his concept of man. The problems encountered along the way are the crucial ones: the individual and the community, pantheism, man as the image of God, man's original state, nature and the supernatural, freedom and evil, original sin and justification, faith, love, the theology of history.

Möhler's theology is not a finished system; the circle from the *Symbolik* back to the *Einheit* is not a closed one. We are still left with questions to be answered. For G. we are really left with a task which in the present theological situation consists in the working out of a theology of existence, of our human and Christian existence. This will be the reply of Catholic theology to the questions raised by the theology of a Rudolf Bultmann, whose theology of existence can derive no existential meaning from the mystery of the Blessed Trinity. Möhler certainly shows the way here, since he has placed the existential meaning of our Christian belief in the Triune God so clearly in the Christian consciousness.

G.'s book, despite the modest disclaimers in his introduction, fills a real need. We sincerely hope that he may be able to realize his plan to bring out a critical edition of the *Symbolik* as a help to further study of Möhler.

Woodstock College

VINCENT T. O'KEEFE, S.J.

THE QUICKENING WORD. A Theological Answer to the Challenge of Islam. By Lawrence E. Browne. Cambridge: Heffer, 1955. Pp. 110. 10/6.

This is just the work one would expect from Professor Browne. Now nearing his seventieth year, he has been, since his Cambridge days, a student of theology and the history of religion. What must have been a very interesting thirteen years of his life were spent—beginning with his thirty-fourth year—lecturing in India through two periods interrupted by some four years given to the study of Islam in the Near East and back at Cambridge. It seems fair to say that many of the positions of this present book grow from his earlier works, *The Eclipse of Christianity in Asia* (1933) and *The Prospects of Islam* (1944).

This series of lectures (the Hulsean Lectures for 1954) is scholarly popularization. In a flood of books concerned with Islamic countries and culture it is a joy to welcome one whose interest and spirit is essentially religious.

Browne feels that the purpose for which God raised up Islam is "to bring home to us our failure to understand the faith we profess and the gospel we preach." Hence he conceives that he has a twofold task, "to recover the meaning of the faith" and "to express the rediscovered faith in language that the Muslim can understand." He candidly adds that the modern secularized Christian stands in the same need as the Muslim.

In this day and age there is nothing new and strange in the meaning he recovers. It is a thoroughly immanentist Christianity, made to stand up to moral sense rather than to reason. If on grounds of taste and dogmatic presupposition one misses the transcendental and ontological, still the "rediscovered faith" is given a searching, earnest, and very stimulating presentation. Even where the answer cannot be accepted, it is indeed good that Browne has raised the question.

Out of a multitude of topics of interest one suggests itself for a brief, final comment. This book fills out the measure of a basic question confronting Western observers of Islam and the Near East. Students of economy, sociology, and anthropology, as they grow to a sense of the Near East's latent reluctance really to "go West," find the condemnation, "stagnant," mounting to their consciousness. Political scientists, as they come abreast of the reality often so hidden in the propaganda of the press, are driven to acknowledge against their hearts the presence of the "conservative and undemocratic." Browne, concerned with religion, finds much that he has to regard as unreasoningly traditional. The question, then, is whether in the Islamic Near East there exist the forces for change that so many Western scholars presume and desire.

Only one aspect of this question concerns us here. It is whether there exist forces for intellectual change in the strictly religious sphere in Islam and whether these forces are such as to warrant a very intellectualist reexpression of Christianity to meet them.

Browne grants that such forces are non-existent in orthodox Islam. He pins his hope on modernist Muslim circles, admitting all the time that their influence is minimal. It is well, however, to keep in mind that there is evidence—not indeed of any greater suasive power—pointing the other way. Islam at the beginning of its history adjusted itself to rationalism. The reaction took five centuries and was traditionalist. Islam has been exposed to modern Western rationalism for only a century and a half. Why must we rush things? And why may not the new reaction be traditionalist likewise?

KATHOLISCHE MORALTHEOLOGIE. Vol. 2: DIE SPEZIELLE MORAL. Part 1: DER RELIGIÖSE PFLICHTENKREIS. By Josef Mausbach and Gustav Ermecke. 10th rev. ed.; Münster: Aschendorff, 1954. Pp. xxxii + 396. MD 19 (kart.); 21 (geb.).

With this volume the Paderborn professor of moral theology completes his revision of Mausbach's own last edition of the three-volume moral manual which has deservedly enjoyed a distinguished reputation in German seminaries and scholasticates for the past thirty or forty years. The excellences of the previous volumes of this revision (cf. *TS* 15 [1954] 152; 16 [1955] 158) suffer no decline in this completion.

This first section of the special moral (the volumes did not appear in their structural sequence) studies the moral obligations of the theological virtues, of the virtue of religion, and of the related virtues of humility, obedience, and gratitude. The treatment of the virtue of religion, of its ordinary and extraordinary acts, includes the consideration of the moral obligations relative to the reception of the sacraments of penance and of Holy Communion, but Dr. Ermecke, like Mausbach, has eschewed the complete canonical study of the sacraments which is found in many moral manuals.

While remaining fundamentally Mausbach's work, this new edition undergoes an unusually thorough revision, in which are incorporated the most recent teachings of the magisterium, the historical findings, speculations, and inspirations of the best theological literature of recent decades. Rather substantial additions are made in the introduction to and general consideration of the *religiöse Pflichtenkreis* (which includes the theological virtues) and of their articulation and mutual relation (pp. 1-9); in the extended treatment of *communicatio in sacris* (pp. 55-62); in the exposition of the nature of hope (pp. 81-85); of religion (pp. 163-67); of prayer (pp. 180-88), of the sanctification of Sundays and holy days (pp. 236-46). Minor additions and revisions occur on almost every page. More important, the whole work receives something of a new inspiration and orientation.

The volume evidences the same consistent and generally happy effort at a more Christocentric moral theology which marked the earlier volumes. The use of Scripture is more frequent and more apposite than is generally the case in moral manuals; subtitles relate particular moral obligations to the general life-ideal of the following of Christ; there are frequent and effective introductions of the doctrine of the Mystical Body and its implications in the moral life, e.g., relative to the obligations of religion, of participation in the liturgy as the worship of the complete Christ.

While preserving the systematic and speculative character of the original

text, Dr. Ermecke gives greater emphasis to positive and documentary sources, e.g., the most recent encyclicals, and has introduced much that in other manuals is left to treatises of ascetical and spiritual theology. The result is a treatment which is solidly positive and edifying, in the constructive sense of that usually unhappy word.

Though the current revision is more complete in its casuistic applications than was the original, this reviewer gained the impression that it would need to be supplemented by a good *casus* book or by the lecturer's application of the principles to the cases which are of common occurrence. Moral theology is much more than casuistry, but it must be liberally laced with the latter in any seminary course.

The bibliography, like that provided in the earlier volumes, is a goldmine of the most significant books and articles which have appeared in German in the field of moral theology during the last two decades. With the exception of occasional references to Latin works, the bibliography is, unfortunately, exclusively German. Its use is much facilitated by an extensive index of names. Indexes of the citations from Scripture, from the documents of the Church, and from the Code of Canon Law, together with a massive *index rerum* of some eighty pages, enhance the value of a work recommended by solidity of doctrine and lucidity of presentation.

Jesuit Seminary, Toronto

E. F. SHERIDAN, S.J.

FEHLFORMEN DES LIEBESTREBENS IN MORAL-PSYCHOLOGISCHER DEUTUNG UND MORAL-THEOLOGISCHER WÜRDIGUNG. By Wilhelm Heinen. Freiburg: Herder, 1954. Pp. xvi + 526.

Love and all strivings originating in relation to love are taken here in a very wide sense, almost so wide that it is difficult to see that there could be any other foundation of striving but love. This usage is indeed in accord with Scholastic tradition—as evidenced by the notion of *amor naturalis*—but confusing in a work dealing with and relying on empirical psychology. Heinen apparently regards all appetitive movements, commonly called love, as basically of the same nature. While this is true inasmuch as one has to do with phenomena pertaining to the operations of the sensory and rational appetites, it is questionable whether this is not an excessive generalization. A more penetrating phenomenological analysis might reveal certain marked differences between, e.g., the striving for material possessions and that for other goals. Even material possessions have not the same significance for the miser as for the collector, nor is the way in which these two types enjoy what they acquire identical.

Three forms of love are distinguished: concupiscible love, love of a predominantly "spiritual" (*geistig*) nature, and an intermediary form which the

author calls *eros*. Having made this division, he proceeds to describe the malformations of these types of love. When man is dominated by concupiscible love, he may seek as his main goal the acquisition or retention of material possessions. To acquire and to possess is a natural tendency in man, not evil in itself but requiring control. The same applies to the striving for recognition and power. A third group of the deformed concupiscible love aims at pleasure in the shape of an overevaluation of food, sexual satisfaction, and such things as alcohol, tobacco, and drugs.

The essentially spiritual love may become deformed in its threefold manifestations of the desire for knowledge, the tendency for adoration, and *agape*. These chapters contain many subtle and interesting analytical studies on such matters as lying, boredom, fanaticism, doubt, superstition (as far as knowledge is concerned), self-adoration, anxiousness, despair, and pride (under the heading of adoration), and acedia, hatred of man and God, and the idolatry of creatures (as malformations of *agape*).

The "ambivalent" love of *eros* appears as deformed in the search for "sensational" experiences, in excessive activism; furthermore, in distortion of esteem and veneration, as in vanity, lack of reverence, shamelessness; and finally, as jealousy, envy, and unruly self-centeredness.

The author avails himself extensively of the data furnished by modern empirical psychology. Unfortunately it is almost exclusively German works that are considered. Thus, Nygren's *Eros and Agape* is quoted, but D. de Rougemont's and M. d'Arcy's works are not mentioned. There are references to Heidegger and Jaspers, but none to Marcel, whose "existentialism of hope," as F. Agúriz, S.J., has called it, might be to the point. More amazing still, the name of Kierkegaard does not occur at all.

Some statements need correction or restriction. Why should the "pathos of the fanatic" be, under all circumstances, a "false" one (p. 240)? It is conceivable that such a man be of the utmost sincerity. The remark is the more astonishing because the followers of Muhammed are named as instances of fanaticism, and one will hardly accuse them of "false pathos." Also, the notion of "sensation" is unduly narrowed if it is referred only to sensory impressions; there are also "sensational" ideas. It is perhaps a little hasty to consider certain views recently proposed by some psychiatrists (Caruso, Daim) as sufficiently reliable.

These are minor defects. What is more regrettable is a certain prolixity of presentation; the work would have gained by condensation. But, as it is, it may be welcomed as a valuable contribution to a field as yet insufficiently explored, and one will gladly recognize the novelty of approach as well as the conscientiousness of execution.

THE PRIEST AND THE UNCONSCIOUS. By Erwin Ringel and Wenzel Van Lun. Edited and translated from the German by Meyrick Booth. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1954. Pp. 118. \$2.25.

Depth psychology, if not already so, is fast becoming a sacred cow. This little book, valuable to priests for a number of reasons, loses much in effectiveness because of its large contribution to this trend. This is due in large measure to the authors' practise of setting down as psychological dogma matters that are by no means as certain as the authors would have them. For instance, the transference phenomenon is set down as universal in all psychotherapeutic situations. There are a sufficient number of competent psychologists who are satisfied that transference is an artifact of psychoanalytic therapy and is not found in other types of therapy which can and do remit neurotic disturbances. So also the authors state apodictically: "Psychotherapy is the name given to the practical application of depth psychology in the treatment of disorders." It would be closer to reality to say that the application of depth psychology is *one* of the ways of therapy. Nor need the reader be content, as the authors are, that what Freud, Jung, and Adler have said about the unconscious is all that in principle can be said about it. Not everything that the authors accept from Freud or Jung or Adler is psychologically true. The priest who reads this book will have to keep in mind St. Paul's word to the Thessalonians: "Omnia probate; quod bonum est tenete." This is a pity in a book that proposes to be a guide for the priest through the confusion which contemporary depth psychology is.

The summary and criticism that the authors make of the doctrine of Freud and Jung and Adler is clear and succinct. Though the fundamental point of view cannot really be ticked off as neatly as Ringel and Van Lun do in each of these three, nevertheless the summary is neat and gives an insight into depth psychology that is not easily found in larger and more detailed treatises. The concept of the unconscious remains cloudy, especially for readers who do not have a wide acquaintance with the varied usage various analysts make of terms psychoanalysts take to be peculiarly proper to themselves. In one instance, at least, confusion arises from a faulty translation, where the consecrated term "repression" is rendered "suppression," unwittingly bringing the mechanism out of the unconscious into the conscious.

The authors incline to Adler, though they strive to integrate all three of the systems they consider as constituting depth psychology. This integration, however, amounts to reinterpreting all three systems in some important details. It is not too certain that the founders of the systems would admit such interpretations as consistent with their principles. The authors try to

integrate their depth psychology with Scholastic principles. The result that emerges does not appeal to this reviewer as, doctrinally, an *unum per se*.

The most interesting chapter is the one dealing with the psychology of faith, where the psychological roots of loss of faith and religious practise are discussed. It consists of a clinical report of two cases treated by the senior author. There is a wealth of clinical insight displayed and a number of psychological principles presumably involved are brought to light. The chapter exemplifies a common failing in psychological writings: the case method of illustrating principles is too frequently presumed to establish these principles. This chapter should be of great interest to all priests. Though the cases adduced may not be a paradigm for situations American priests encounter in their ministry, since the psychological environment in this country is so different from that of Europe (Germany and Austria in particular), nevertheless what is said will repay thoughtful consideration.

On page 88 it is stated quite baldly that a neurotic has an obligation binding under pain of sin to seek psychiatric treatment. If one can make due allowance for such enthusiasm on the part of the authors in setting down principles and interpreting events, he will find the book a source of much information and good counsel in understanding and dealing with so many puzzling "cases" who come to him for advice and direction. It is a book that every priest should have and read.

*Jesuit House of Studies,
Spring Hill, Alabama*

JOHN A. GASSON, S.J.

BLONDEL ET LA RELIGION. By Henry Dumery. Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1954. Pp. 115.

Professor Dumery has given us a tightly-knit, rigorous analysis of Blondel's famous letter of 1896, *Lettre sur les exigences de la pensée contemporaine en matière d'apologétique et sur la méthode de la philosophie dans l'étude du problème religieux*. The very history of the *Lettre* provides many an interesting insight into the thought of Blondel. The thesis on *l'Action* had been conceived and brought to maturation in a climate of thought that was, to say the least, hostile. The rationalist and the positivist vied with the scientific humanist in making dogmatic pronouncements on nature. Nature was all that existed. Revelation and the supernatural order were clearly impossible. The more sophisticated referred to "l'indiscrétion du surnaturel." Science was the idea and the ideal. Necessary laws of nature legislated on thought.

Blondel's thesis aiming at showing that a closed concept of nature was false—a thesis aided and abetted by the Christian humanism of Ollé-

Laprune—came as somewhat of a shock to this closed circle of thinkers. Blondel's notion of transcendence as the condition for the possibility of immanence proved that each "closed" synthesis is incomplete. The "action" of the subject not only transcends whatever it unites, but it itself is the cause of the possibility of the closed synthesis in the first place. Finally, the condition for the unity of subjects is to be found in the Infinite Subject in whom "action" is *actus purus*. He is the supreme unity and the condition prior to and necessary for every inferior synthesis.

God, then, is possible and necessary. The *idea* of a communication of the divine life to man is inescapable. The supernatural is thinkable, possible, and hypothetically necessary. This does not mean that philosophy can prove that the supernatural has *de facto* been offered to man. Philosophy can only show that it is impossible to prove the impossibility of the supernatural, and it can show the conditions on which the supernatural could be offered and accepted, namely, as a pure gift, desirable but unattainable by man.

Immediately Blondel was subjected to attack from both the right and the left. Theologians (at least a few) accused Blondel of Jansenism because of the "necessary" supernatural. Universitarians criticized the "necessary" as a cheap attempt to make acceptance of the supernatural (and specifically Catholicism) a scientific necessity. To correct the second error and to defend the right of philosophy to remain "open" to the gift from on high, Blondel wrote the *Lettre*.

Dumery is today the most authoritative exponent of Blondel's thought. Blondel himself stated, shortly before his death in 1949, that D.'s *La philosophie de l'Action* was the most authentic interpretation of his philosophy up to that moment. In *Blondel et la religion* D. pushes his commentary one step farther and subjects the Letter to a rigorously critical analysis.

To explain Blondel's position and to prove his point, D. emphasizes Blondel's "méthode de la philosophie" as contained in the full title of the *Lettre*. Philosophy is critical. By reflection it sets up the critique of thought and of action. However—and this is essential to the whole discussion—philosophy does not and cannot offer itself as a substitute for the real reality upon which it reflects and passes judgment. Philosophy lies at the very heart of thought and of life, but it makes no claims to *be* the actual thinking and living. This would be to contradict the very notion of reflection upon which it must feed.

D. then goes on to show that philosophy, which subjects the whole ensemble of human activity to critical scrutiny, cannot make an exception of religion; for religion is part of the ensemble of human action which is the proper material object of philosophy. To be sure, philosophy can neither

deny nor affirm the *reality* of the supernatural, but philosophy is nonetheless obliged to examine the *idea* of the supernatural in all its ramifications and implications. Blondel focuses his critique on the intelligibility of the religious fact which emerges from reflection. He does not pass judgment on its reality. However, as D. so clearly concludes, once the intelligibility of the supernatural is shown, then the idea of the supernatural becomes a hypothesis necessarily integrated with the internal logic of Blondelian Action.

D.'s book is a masterful and subtle presentation of the nuances of Blondel's penetrating thought; few have understood him so well. There was a time when Blondel was suspect of Modernistic tendencies, despite his vigorous campaign against the errors of this form of immanentism. Today few would wish to challenge Blondel's complete orthodoxy, especially after the commendation of Pius XII praising Blondel for his monumental efforts to show the relationship between the natural and the supernatural, faith and reason, "always respecting the transcendence of revealed truth." We can be grateful to D. for the light he casts on Blondel's thought. With each passing year the stature of Blondel grows in the world of thought. Philosophers of religion here in America may well come one day to realize he was a giant.

Fordham University

VICTOR R. YANITELLI, S.J.

THE POETRY OF MEDITATION: A STUDY IN ENGLISH RELIGIOUS LITERATURE OF THE SEVENTEENTH CENTURY. By Louis L. Martz. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1954. Pp. x + 375. \$5.00.

This study attempts to modify the view of literary history which sees a "Donne tradition" in English religious poetry. It suggests instead a "meditative tradition" which found its first notable example not in Donne but in the Jesuit martyr, Robert Southwell. Without denying the great influence of John Donne upon the course of English poetry, the author argues that a broader and greater tradition than that which stems from Donne's poetry lies behind the English religious poetry of the seventeenth century.

The author, a professor of English at Yale University, finds the sources of this tradition in the art of meditation, the knowledge and practice of which he holds was to an appreciable degree responsible for the characteristic features of seventeenth-century religious poetry. By the "art of meditation" M. means that art which was developed in the great movement toward methodical religious meditation which originated on the continent in the later Middle Ages, matured in the middle of the sixteenth century, and found its most systematic and most influential presentation in the *Spiritual Exercises* of St. Ignatius Loyola. That the influence of the *Exercises* was exerted not only on the continent but also in England may be gathered

from the flood of treatises on the *Exercises*, elaborations of meditations, and manuals of prayer and devout living which poured, in translation and adaptation, into England during the last part of the sixteenth century and the earlier half of the seventeenth. A growing body of modern studies is M.'s warrant for the assertion that not only Catholic recusants but Anglicans and even, later on in the century, some Puritans showed themselves eager to take up and practice, with their own modifications, the rich imaginative exercises by which the Counter Reformation was cultivating the realm of devotion.

In the first part of the book M. gives a careful and accurate analysis of the Ignatian method of mental prayer and of other methods. He attempts to show how certain poems of Southwell, Donne, George Herbert, Crashaw, and Vaughan follow the structure of a meditation or betray the influence of such features of the Jesuit method of mental prayer as the "composition of place," the "application of the senses," and the bringing to bear of the "three powers of the soul." This Jesuit method of meditating, the author believes, must have had powerful influence on the habitual modes of thought and expression of anyone given to the practice of it, at least to the extent of focusing and disciplining the powers that a man already possessed, both his innate powers and his acquired modes of logical analysis and rhetorical development. It is M.'s contention that this method did in fact help to produce a hitherto unparalleled integration of feeling and thought, of vivid detail and theological abstraction. The peculiar timbre of Southwell's "New Prince, new pompe" and "The Burning Babe" is a result, he says, of just such an integration. Donne, too, brought up as he was in a Catholic family and the nephew of a Jesuit uncle who was in England during part of Donne's childhood, is believed by M. to have been influenced by the Jesuit method of meditation. In spite of Donne's later defection to Anglicanism and violent antipathy to Jesuits, M. argues that the finest of the "Holy Sonnets" show a powerful development from vivid composition of place, through devout analysis, to impassioned colloquy. Special attention is given by M. to Donne's two "Anniversaries" in an effort to prove that the structure, themes, and imagery of these two long poems show an indebtedness to the art of meditation.

M. does not confine himself exclusively to the influence of specifically Jesuit methods of prayer. Quoting Herbert Thurston to the effect that in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries the Bridgettine rosary, popularly known as the "*corona* of our Lady," was almost as commonly recited by the faithful as the Rosary properly so-called, he puts forward the suggestion that fourteen poems of Southwell are related in some way to this mode of meditation by

the *corona* and that the sequence by Donne entitled "La Corona" shows the same influence.

In his extensive treatment of George Herbert, M. points out certain spiritual and humanistic affinities between Herbert and St. Francis de Sales, though he does not claim any direct influence of the Saint on the poet. He does, however, claim that the prime model for those fervent colloquies which the Jesuits and other meditative writers place at the apex of their exercises, namely, the intimate dialogues in the *Imitation of Christ*, served also as Herbert's model for the way in which he in his poetry transformed the popular love dialogue of Elizabethan poetry into the "inward speaking" of Christ and the faithful soul.

This book may worthily take its place beside the recent scholarly works of Helen C. White, Rosemund Tuve, A. C. Southern, and Malcolm Mackenzie Ross, which have been building up the devotional and dogmatic context and background of seventeenth-century literature. Such works are a welcome and necessary counterbalance to the numerous studies which have over-emphasized the pressure of pessimism, skepticism, and revolt from tradition on that same literature.

Le Moyne College, Syracuse, N.Y.

JOHN V. CURRY, S.J.

DESCRIPTIVE NOTICES

LEXICAL AIDS FOR STUDENTS OF NEW TESTAMENT GREEK. By Bruce M. Metzger. Enlarged Edition. Princeton, N.J., 1955. Pp. ix + 118. \$1.25. This second edition of an original, intelligent, and practical guide for building up a *NT* Greek vocabulary deserves the same hearty recommendation it received seven years ago (cf. *TS* 9 [1948] 170). The author is Professor of *NT* Language and Literature at Princeton Theological Seminary and draws upon a long experience in teaching *NT* Greek to seminarians. If the beginner masters only the first part of this book, he will have learned over 1000 words which occur ten times or more in the *NT*. The second part introduces him into the family relationships of Greek words, classified according to their roots. The few minor errors of the first edition have been corrected and two useful appendices have been added. Appendix 4 lists the principal parts of 68 verbs which occur frequently in the *NT*. Appendix 5 catalogues all the nouns of the second declension ending in *-os* which are feminine in gender.

THE SENSUS PLENIOR OF SACRED SCRIPTURE. By Raymond Edward Brown, S.S. Baltimore: St. Mary's University, 1955. Pp. xiv + 161. A

doctoral dissertation on a keenly disputed problem of modern hermeneutics. Fr. Brown presents the contemporary position on the various scriptural senses, a historical survey of the senses through the ages, modern problems, and finally a rather full discussion of the *sensus plenior*. For a more detailed treatment of B.'s work, cf. "Current Theology: Bulletin of the Old Testament," in this issue.

LES MANUSCRITS HÉBREUX DU DÉSERT DE JUDA. By Albert Vincent. Paris: Fayard, 1955. Pp. 281. 700 frs. This is the latest book of the *L'Histoire sacrée* series edited by Daniel-Rops. V. treats of the discovery of the manuscripts and scrolls in various sections of Palestine, discusses their content, and offers an historical *essai* to evaluate these documents and their relation to the early Christian communities of the East.

MARIAGE ET CÉLIBAT. By Max Thurian. Neuchâtel: Delachaux et Niestlé, 1955. Pp. 153. 550 frs. Proposes to stimulate reflection on the Christian concepts of celibacy and marriage. No pretense is made to offer definitive solutions to the problems posed. The teachings of Christ as found in the Gospels and the writings of the early Church are carefully studied. Interpretations of traditional Christian concepts by the Reformers are criticized in the light of the constant teaching of the Church.

THE VIRTUE OF LOVE. By Paul de Jaegher, S.J. New York: Kenedy, 1955. Pp. xi + 176. \$3.00. Sixteen fully-developed meditations centered mainly on Christ, and aimed at fostering unitive, perfect love. Interspersed are practical instructions on the various virtues.

THE ROSARY OF OUR LADY. By Romano Guardini. New York: Kenedy & Sons, 1955. Pp. 94. \$2.50. The author first considers the benefits of prayer in general and the manner of saying the Rosary. In dwelling upon the mysteries, thought-provoking suggestions are introduced on the role of our Lady in the life of Christ.

CARDINAL ROBERT PULLEN: AN ENGLISH THEOLOGIAN OF THE TWELFTH CENTURY. By F. Courtney, S.J. *Analecta Gregoriana* 64. Rome: Gregorian University, 1954. Pp. xxiv + 285. A summary and appraisal of Robert Pullen's *Sententiarum libri octo*. The first two chapters are introductory: a biographical sketch of the author and a description of his works. An Englishman by birth, Pullen came to the University of Paris at a critical juncture in its history. St. Bernard had succeeded in having Abelard condemned at the Council of Sens (1140) and Fr. Courtney suggests that

Pullen was called to the University at the instance of Bernard to fill the gap left in the ranks of the orthodox theologians by the death of Hugh of St. Victor, their ablest champion. That Pullen succeeded in this task is the recurrent theme of C.'s appraisal of Pullen's *Sentences*, which are summarized in twelve succeeding chapters. A concluding chapter attempts to evaluate Pullen's theological achievement in the light of his influence on theologians of a later age. C. is of the opinion that Pullen's doctrine on the sacrament of penance had the most effect on his successors.

THE VIRTUE OF OBSERVANCE ACCORDING TO ST. THOMAS AQUINAS. By N. Benedict Joseph, O.P. Washington: Thomist Press, 1955. Pp. xii + 82. \$1.00. Stresses the obligatory rather than the gratuitous character of the virtue of respect. The author (1) considers historically the virtue of observance in Christian tradition; (2) analyzes the nature and function of the virtue; (3) constructs the specific nature of the virtue; (4) discusses the subjective parts of the virtue and its relation to the virtue of justice. The conclusion offers a neat summation of the tract.

THE DOCTRINE OF THE VOID. By Leonard A. McCann, C.S.B. Toronto: Basilian Press, 1955. Pp. 146. The purpose of this book is to present the writings of John of the Cross on the void and to analyze their testimony in the light of Thomistic principles. M. concludes that, although this doctrine on the void is not a conscious commentary on the teachings of the Angelic Doctor, yet it can be accounted for, on a different plane, in accordance with Thomas' principles and doctrine. This is especially true if we consider the treatises on grace, the virtues, and the gifts of the Holy Spirit. Consequently "we can regard St. John of the Cross expounding the doctrine on the void, not indeed as a commentator on the doctrine of St. Thomas contained in those treatises, but, in his own order, as a brilliant witness to its truth."

L'ANNONCE MISSIONNAIRE DE L'ÉVANGILE. By P. Hitz, C.S.S.R. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1955. Pp. 267. The primary function of the Church always remains that of evangelization. She announces the salvation of Christ to the pagan and periodically refreshes the life and faith of the Christian. This exposé studies primarily the role of the missionary in the home parishes. It treats the fidelity of the apostle; the kerygma of the Apostles in the New Testament; missionary sermons since the 18th century; and the contemporary mentality in view of the resources of the Church to cope with it.

CHRÉTIENS DANS LE MONDE. Cahiers de la Pierre-qui-vire. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer. Pp. 204. That it is the vocation of the Church militant to live in this world is evident. But how is it possible to cope with the seeming contradictions offered by the exigencies of our daily living and a genuinely spiritual life? In the light of history and sociology, together with Scripture, the liturgy, and theology, the present volume attempts to point out a spiritual way of life which is realistic, authentic, and free from the emotions which have complicated a problem now more actual than ever.

POINTS FOR THE MEDITATIONS AND CONTEMPLATIONS OF ST. IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. By Franz von Hummelauer, S.J. Translated by V. J. Hommel, S.J. Westminster: Newman, 1955. Pp. 443. The points for the meditations of the *Exercises* presented for retreat master or retreatant to point up the way to Christ. The volume also contains H.'s introduction to and analysis of the *Exercises*, with occasional personal notes for correlating the different meditations.

THE BROWNSON READER. Edited, with an Introduction, by Alvan S. Ryan. New York: Kenedy, 1955. Pp. xii + 370. \$4.50. A selection of Brownson's writings in many different fields: politics, education, literature, philosophy, and religion. Within each field samples have been chosen which indicate the various stages of evolution in his thought. The result is a graphic picture of Brownson as a thinker, with his strong points and his weaknesses. A biographical sketch is contained in the Preface; brief commentaries by the Editor are included at the end of each section.

THREE ARCHBISHOPS OF MILWAUKEE. By Benjamin J. Blied. Milwaukee, 1955. Pp. 160. In a series of exploratory essays Dr. Blied traces the careers of the three prelates who ruled the Milwaukee Archdiocese from 1881-1930: Michael Heiss, Frederick Katzer, and Sebastian Messmer. The studies are valuable for the light thrown on the nationalistic problems of the Church in the area, the much-controverted school question, the relation of the bishops to the Catholic University, and the general development of the Church in the North Central States. No bibliography is given, but there are copious footnotes and a complete index.

THE NIHILISM OF JOHN DEWEY. By Paul Crosser. New York: Philosophical Library, 1955. Pp. xi + 238. \$3.75. In advancing his criticism of the basic philosophy of Dewey's fundamental writings, C. limits himself to the task of clearing away the false concepts and constructs contained in Dewey's philosophy of science, art, and education. No positive

development of philosophy is offered as a norm, rather C. concerns himself with what should not be done in devising a philosophical method and construct. This inquiry thoroughly evaluates the extreme relativism of Dewey's thinking, "which constitutes the ultimate destination on the road to cognitive indeterminateness."

INTRODUCTORY METAPHYSICS. By Avery R. Dulles, S.J., James M. Domske, S.J., and Robert J. O'Connell, S.J. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1955. Pp. ix + 345. \$4.50. This college text is planned to reemphasize the unity of philosophy in accord with those educational trends which are minimizing the distinction between philosophy's various branches. The authors have achieved a carefully structured synthesis of the material normally covered in college courses of ontology, natural theology, and cosmology. A second novel feature of the book is its method. The authors introduce each topic as a problem; they select data which give meaning to that problem. After a brief summary of the solutions historically offered, the Scholastic position is then proposed in an "Analysis," and finally reduced to concise syllogistic form. A certain tone of informality pervades the whole without sacrificing the rigorous definition demanded by the subject matter.

THE LAST ESSAYS OF GEORGE BERNANOS. Trans. by Joan and Barry Ulanov. Chicago: Regnery, 1955. Pp. vi + 263. \$4.50. This book contains three lectures given by Bernanos: in September, 1946 to the Geneva Conferences ("The European Spirit"); in February, 1947 at the amphitheatre of the Sorbonne ("Revolution and Liberty"); and in the autumn of 1947 in Algiers for the Little Sisters of Charles de Foucauld ("Our Friends the Saints"). The other two texts in the volume are the result of a *montage* made necessary by the condition of the original manuscripts. They are entitled: "France before the World of Tomorrow" and "Why Freedom." An appendix offers a few exordiums and apostrophes to the public which contain Bernanos' asides to his listeners and give an insight into his versatile character.

THE SOCIAL AND POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY OF JACQUES MARITAIN. Edited by Joseph W. Evans and Leo R. Ward. New York: Scribner's, 1955. Pp. xiv + 348. \$5.00. Passages indicative of M.'s thought on humanism and Christian politics are selected from his writings between 1927 and 1952, and conveniently grouped in the following categories: The Human Person, Man and the Political Society, The Gospel and Human Society, and The New Socio-Temporal Order.

BOOKS RECEIVED

[All books received are listed here whether they are reviewed or not]

Scriptural Studies

- Bowman, John Wick. Prophetic realism and the Gospel; a preface to biblical theology. Phila., Westminster Press, 1955. 288p. \$4.75
- Brown, Raymond Edward, S.S. *The sensus plenior* of sacred scripture. Balt., St. Mary's Univ., 1955. xiv, 161p. \$2.00
- Féret, H.-M., O.P. Pierre et Paul à Antioche et à Jérusalem; le "conflit" des deux Apôtres. Paris, Du Cerf, 1955. 130p.
- Gärtner, Bertil. The Areopagus speech and natural revelation. Uppsala, Almqvist & Wilsells, 1955. 289p. (Acta Seminarii N.T. Upsaliensis, 21)
- Jeremias, Joachim. The eucharistic words of Jesus; tr. from the 2nd German ed., by A. Ehrhardt. N.Y., Macmillan, 1955. xi, 195p. \$3.75
- Klausner, Joseph. The Messianic idea in Israel; from its beginning to the completion of the Mishnah; tr. from 3rd Hebrew ed., by W. F. Stinespring. N.Y., Macmillan, 1955. xv, 543p.
- Kraft, Benedikt. Die Zeichen für die wichtigeren Handschriften des griechischen Neuen Testaments; 2 aufl. Freiburg, Herder, 1955. 48p.
- Orbe, Antonio, S.J. En los albores de la exegesis Iohanna (Ioh. I, 3); estudios valentinianos, II. Rome, Gregorian Univ. Press, 1955. 403p. (Analecta Gregoriana, 65)
- Pierce, C. A. Conscience in the New Testament. Chi., Alec Allenson, 1955. 151p. \$1.50 (Studies in Biblical Theology, 15)
- Repo, Eero. Der Begriff "Rhema" im biblisch-Griechischen, II; "Rhema" im N.T. Helsinki, Academia Scientiarum Fennica, 1954. 214p.
- Riccioni, Giuseppe. The history of Israel; tr. by Clement della Penta and Richard T. A. Murphy, O.P. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1955. 2 v. \$15.00
- Rowley, H. H. The relevance of apocalyptic; a study of Jewish and Christian Apocalypses from Daniel to the Revelation; rev. ed. N.Y., Harper, 1955. 205p. \$2.75
- Schwarz, W. Principles and problems of biblical translation; some Reformation controversies and their background. N.Y., Cambridge Univ. Press, 1955. xiv, 224p. \$4.75
- Vincent, Albert. Les manuscrits hébreux du désert de Juda. Paris, Fayard, 1955. 281p. 700 fr.

Doctrinal Theology

- Browne, Laurence E. The quickening word; a theological answer to the challenge of Islam. Cambridge, Heffer, 1955. 110p. 10/6 (The Hulsean Lectures for 1954)

- The Catholic Theological Society of America. Proceedings of the Ninth Annual Convention. N.Y., The Catholic Theol. Soc. of America, 1954. 264p. \$2.00
- Coathalem, H., S.J. Le parallélisme entre la Sainte Vierge et l'Église dans la tradition latine jusqu'à la fin du XIIe siècle. Rome, Gregorian Univ. Press, 1954. viii, 136p. (Analecta Gregoriana, 74)
- Coutinho, Lucio da Veiga. Tradition et histoire dans la controverse moderniste (1898-1910). Rome, Gregorian Univ. Press, 1954. xxiii, 275p. (Analecta Gregoriana, 73)
- Cunningham, Francis L. B., O.P. The indwelling of the Trinity. Dubuque, Priory Press, 1955. xvii, 414p. \$7.50
- Eldarov, Giorgio, O.F.M. Presenza della teologia; saggio su una recente controversia alla luce dell' enciclica, "Humani Generis". Padua, Il Messaggero di S. Antonio; Chaska, Minn., Bede's Book-Nook, 1954. 155p.
- Hill, William, O.P. Proper relations to the indwelling divine persons. Wash. D.C., Thomist Press, 1955. xvii, 120p. \$2.00
- Rahner, Karl. Schriften zur Theologie, II. Einsiedeln, Benziger, 1955. 399p. Fr.s. 19.80
- Société Canadienne d'Études Mariales. L'Immaculée Conception de la bienheureuse Vierge Maria; Journées d'études 12-13 août, 1954. Ottawa, Éditions de l'Université, 1955. 197p.
- Suenens, Léon-Joseph. L'Église en état de mission. Bruges, Desclée de Brouwer, 1955. 212p. 60 fr.
- Szabo, Titus, O.F.M. De SS. Trinitate in creaturis refulgente; doctrina S. Bonaventurae. Romae, Orbis Catholicus-Herder, 1955. 209p.
- Tolerance and the Catholic; a symposium, tr. by George Lamb. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1955. 199p.
- Vogt, Bernard, O.F.M. Duns Scotus defender of the Immaculate Conception. Paterson, N.J., St. Anthony Guild Press, 1955. ix, 30p. \$.50
- Volk, Hermann. Christus und Maria; dogmatische Grundlagen der marianischen Frömmigkeit. Münster, Aschendorff, 1955. 27p. DM 1.50

Moral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions

- Chastity; tr. by Lancelot C. Sheppard. Westminster, Md., Newman Press, 1955. x, 267p. \$4.00 (Religious Life, 5)
- Korolevskij, Cyrille. Liturgie et langue vivante. Paris, Du Cerf, 1955. xii, 235p. (Lex Orandi, 18)
- Medical guide to vocations, by René Biot and Pierre Galimard; tr. by Robert P. Odenwald. Westminster, Md., Newman Press, 1955. xx, 303p. \$4.75

- Paquin, Jules, S.J. *Morale et médecine*. Montréal, L'Immaculée-Conception, 1955. 489p.
- Plöchl, Willibald M. *Geschichte des Kirchenrechts, I; Das Recht des ersten christlichen Jahrtausends*. Wien, Verlag Herold, n.d. 439p. S 118.—
- Roelker, Edward. *Invalidating laws*. Paterson, N.J., St. Anthony Guild Press, 1955. ix, 197p. \$3.00

History and Biography, Patristics

- Abad, Camilo Maria, S.J. *El venerable Luis de la Puente de la Compania de Jesus; sus libros y su doctrina espiritual*. Comillas, Universidad Pontificia, 1954. xiii, 619p.
- Blied, Benjamin J. *Three archbishops of Milwaukee; Michael Heiss, Frederick Katzer, Sebastian Messmer*. Milwaukee, 1955. 160p. (Available from the Author, Tr. 4, Box 220, Fond du Lac, Wisc.)
- Breynat, Gabriel, O.M.I. *Bishop of the winds; fifty years in the Arctic regions*, tr. by Alan Gordon Smith. N.Y., Kenedy, 1955. x, 266p. \$3.75
- A companion to the study of St. Augustine*; ed. by Roy W. Battenhouse. N.Y., Oxford Univ. Press, 1955. xiii, 425p. \$5.50
- Daniélou, Jean. *Origen*; tr. by Walter Mitchell. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1955. xvii, 343p. \$4.50
- Dix, Gregory. *Le ministère dans l'Église ancienne (des années 90 à 410)*; tr. fr. de A. Jaermann et R. Pasquier. Neuchâtel (Suisse), Delachaux et Niestlé, 1955. 137p. Fr.s. 6.—(Bibliothèque Théologique)
- Eusèbe de Césarée. *Histoire ecclésiastique, II*. Paris, Du Cerf, 1955. viii, 238p. (Sources Chrétiennes, 41)
- Graef, Hilda C. *The scholar and the Cross; the life and work of Edith Stein*. Westminster, Md., Newman Press, 1955. viii, 234p. \$3.50
- Hohensee, H. *The Augustinian concept of authority*. N.Y., *Folia*, 1954. 77p. \$2.00 (*Folia*, Suppl. II, Nov., 1954. Available from Robert F. Moroney, 2180 Ryer Ave., N.Y. 57, N.Y.)
- Lane, Raymond A., M.M. *Ambassador in chains; the life of Bishop Patrick James Byrne, Apostolic Delegate to the Republic of Korea*. N.Y., Kenedy, 1955. 249p. \$3.50
- Milburn, R. L. P. *Early Christian interpretations of history*. N.Y., Harper, 1955. ix, 221p. (The Bampton Lectures of 1952)
- Pantin, W. A. *The English Church in the fourteenth century*. N.Y., Cambridge Univ. Press, 1955. xi, 291p. \$5.00
- Rufinus. *A commentary on the Apostles' Creed*; tr. and annotated by

- J. N. D. Kelly. Westminster, Md., Newman Press; London, Longmans Green, 1955. 166p. \$2.75 (Ancient Christian Writers, 20)
- Théodoret de Cyr. Correspondance, I; intr., texte critique, tr. et notes par Yvan Azéma. Paris, Du Cerf, 1955. 137p. (Sources Chrétiennes, 40)
- Wood, H. G. Belief and unbelief since 1850. N.Y. Cambridge, 1955. vii, 143p. \$2.75

Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature

- Chrétiens dans le monde. Paris, Desclée de Brouwer, 1955. 204p. (Cahiers de la Pierre-Qui-Vire)
- Encinas, Antonio, S.J. Los ejercicios de San Ignacio; explicación y comentario manual; 2.ed. Santander, Ed. "Sal Terrae", 1953. 851p.
- Guardini, Romano. The rosary of our Lady; tr. by H. von Schuecking. N.Y., Kenedy, 1955. 94p. \$2.50
- Jaegher, Paul de, S.J. The virtue of love; meditations. N.Y., Kenedy, 1955. xi, 176p. \$3.00
- McCann, Leonard A., C.S.B. The doctrine of the void; as propounded by St. John of the Cross and as viewed in the light of Thomistic principles. Toronto, Basilian Press, 1955. 146p.
- Marie-Eugène, Père, O.C.D. I am a daughter of the Church; tr. by Sister M. Verda Clare, C.S.C. Chi., Fides, 1955. xxvii, 667p. \$6.75 (Practical Synthesis of Carmelite Spirituality, 2)
- Montfort, Louis-Marie, St. The love of the eternal wisdom; tr. and annotated by A. Somers, S.M.M. Phila., Peter Reilly, n.d. xix, 199p. \$1.50
- O'Brien, Isidore. Seven baskets; timely essays. Paterson, N.J., St. Anthony Guild Press, 1955. vii, 175p. \$2.00

Philosophical Questions

- Berdyayev, Nicolas. The meaning of the creative act; tr. by Donald A. Lowrie. N.Y., Harper, 1955. 344p. \$4.00
- Casserley, J. V. Langmead. Graceful reason; the contribution of reason to theology. London, Longmans, 1955. ix, 163p. 12/6
- Cronan, Edward P. The dignity of the human person. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1955. xvi, 207p. \$3.00
- Donceel, J., S.J. Philosophical psychology. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1955. xiii, 363p. \$4.50
- Introductory metaphysics, by Avery Dulles, S.J., James Demske, S.J., Robert O'Connell, S.J. N.Y., Sheed & Ward, 1955. 345p. \$4.50

- Kelley, John Joseph, S.M. Bergson's mysticism; a philosophical exposition and evolution. Fribourg, St. Paul's Press; Dayton, Marianist Pubs., 1954. 151p. \$2.50
- Maritain, Jacques. The social and political philosophy of Jacques Maritain; selected readings ed. by Joseph W. Evans and Leo R. Ward. N.Y., Scribner's, 1955. xiv, 348p. \$5.00
- Souriau, Étienne. L'ombre de Dieu. Paris, Presses Universitaires, 1955. 376p. (Bibliothèque de Philosophie Contemporaine)

Special Questions

- Bernanos, Georges. The last essays of Georges Bernanos. Chi., Regnery 1955. vi, 263p. \$4.50
- Bernis, Jeanne. L'imagination. Paris, Presses Universitaires, 1954. 118p.
- Brownson reader; a selection of the writings of Orestes A. Brownson, ed., with an intro., by Alvan S. Ryan. N.Y., Kenedy, 1955. xii, 370p. \$4.50
- Bulst, Werner, S.J. Das Grabtuch von Turin. Frankfurt, Verlag Josef Knecht, 1955. 143, 34p. DM 12.80
- Foucher, Alfred. Les vies antérieures du Bouddha. Paris, Presses Universitaires, 1955. viii, 361p.
- Die Kirche in der Welt; Wegweisung für die katholische Arbeit am Menschen der Gegenwart; 7. Jahrgang, zweite Lieferung. Münster, Aschendorff, 1954. [127]—254p. DM 6.—
- Maceina, Antanas. Das Geheimnis der Bosheit; Versuch einer Geschichtstheologie des Widersachers Christi als Deutung der "Erzählung vom Antichrist" Solowjews. Freiburg, Herder, 1955. viii, 226p.
- Oraison, Marc. Médecine et guérisseurs. Paris, Lethielleux, n.d. 142p. (Centre d'Études Laënnec)
- Religions of the ancient Near East; Sumero-Akkadian religious texts and Ugaritic epics, ed. by Isaac Mendelsohn. N.Y., Liberal Arts Press, 1955. xxviii, 284p. \$1.75 (The Library of Religion, 4)
- Thurian, Max. Mariage et célibat. Neuchâtel, Delachaux et Niestlé, 1955. 153p. Fr.s. 5.50