

THEOLOGICAL  
*Studies*

---

VOLUME 18

1957

---

*Published by the Theological Faculties  
of the Society of Jesus in the United States*

## BOOK REVIEWS

AN HISTORIAN'S APPROACH TO RELIGION. By Arnold Toynbee. New York: Oxford University Press, 1956. Pp. x + 318.

In his latest book Arnold Toynbee follows the example of Sir Thomas Browne, who gave the world *Religio medici*. Toynbee is an historian and consequently gives us a *religio historici*. The work has already produced much comment. This was inevitable, for the author is one of the most fascinating prophets of our time. Some historians who prefer to follow the more pedestrian traditions of their craft are irritated by Toynbee. He does not plod inch by inch with minute care through the lush growth of mankind's story; he soars over the field and tries to see it as an intelligible whole. Whether Toynbee's history is good history, the members of the historical brotherhood must decide. But one thing is clear: it is breathtaking and magnificent.

In his monumental *A Study of History* Toynbee made it patently evident that he considers religion the life-germ of history. This was a bold approach; it had been the mode of the previous century to consider religion a minor element of history, and a regrettable element at that. Christians were pleased with Toynbee's seeming recognition of the validity of the Christian interpretation of life, but they were disturbed when the last four volumes of the opus appeared. In them Buddhism in its Mahāyāna form seemed to be put on a par with Christianity, if not above it. Toynbee's Gifford Lectures of 1952-53, whose contents are contained in the present volume, were eagerly awaited because they would precisely define his position. The book does that, with the brilliance singularly proper to its author.

Toynbee begins with a consideration of the meaning of historiography. He sees it as an attempt to transcend the self-centeredness which is the inevitable situation of man. The historian tries to rise above his concrete singularity in order to see mankind as an objective continuity. This essay at transcendence is never totally successful, but the attempt is never a total failure. In their efforts to see mankind as a rational whole, the historians have followed two divergent paths. The Hellenic and Oriental thinkers supposed that history is cyclic, under the iron domination of impersonal necessity. The Hebrew and Christian sages considered it a moving line, spiral perhaps, but not a closed circle, progressing upwards under the direction of an intelligent, omnipotent will. Toynbee also mentions a third view held by historians in our day. According to this theory history is neither cyclic nor volitional; it is really an unintelligible chaos. For Toynbee this is not a working hypothesis; for the historian must by commitment look for order in the data. Hence it is not

really an historical theory, for it cannot function as the basic instrument in historical research. It is merely a proof that the theories operating up to now are not ascertained truths but only hypotheses open to challenge.

When the historian finds religion in his sources, he finds that there are three kinds. Man's worship is directed either to Nature, to Man himself, or to Absolute Reality. Religions in quest of Absolute Reality (Toynbee's term, which he prefers to the word, God) are "higher" religions. Such religions recognize both the impersonal and the personal aspects of God, but individually emphasize one rather than the other. Indian religion—Buddhism and Hinduism—tends to consider God impersonally, achievable in an activity of definitive self-transcendence, which is not worship. Judaic religions—Judaism, Christianity, and Islam—concentrate on the personal dimension of the Absolute Reality and they pursue it through worship and submission to the divine will.

There was a long period when man worshipped Nature; he did so because he could not dominate it. As he gradually became more proficient in making it serve him, Nature worship disappeared; for without arriving at ultimate self-transcendence man had yet transcended it. But not entirely; elements of Nature worship are to be found in all religions.

When Nature no longer commanded adoration, man adored himself. He did not do so in the crude form whereby an individual man would adore his own individual being. Religion is always an effort at self-transcendence. Hence, in place of the individual self, he adored the collective self: the tribe or nation. But this worship was destructive, because in consequence of human self-centeredness nation fights nation. Worship of one's nation is consequently a Moloch cult in which a man has to sacrifice his own life and that of his children.

The tribal god, who was only the community deified, had to cede to the ecumenical god. This god was the divinization of a wide imperial society, like Rome or Persia. He was attractive because he gave *pax Romana* to the peoples weary and afraid of intertribal slaughter. *Pax Romana* was the gift of *dea Roma*, who on analysis was the Roman Empire itself, personified in the emperor.

The ecumenical god, however, is never really satisfactory. He is more beneficent than the tribal god, for he brings peace and security. But the price he exacts is the stripping of local man of his power, for both good and bad. Moreover, the ecumenical god is too distant, with none of the homey familiarity of the gods of the tribe. Finally, he becomes an abstraction which the empire through its emperor uses to fortify its power. This god does not

truly transcend man but is transcended by the human emperor, who uses him for his human purposes.

In such a milieu the philosopher arises and makes his declaration of independence. Within himself he finds divine power to transcend gods, king, people, and nature. They and all their pomps are indifferent to him. To be one's self and follow truth achieved in autonomous meditation gives impregnable freedom. Want, misery, and even death itself, are merely phenomena, not true reality, which stands transparent to the philosopher's inner eye. The philosopher has transcended nature and community by finding reality exclusively in his own spirit. The spirit of man has become deified.

But this deification also fails to satisfy; for the human spirit cannot transcend its limited self. When all these idolatries have failed, there comes the discovery—or call it revelation, if you will—of Absolute Reality. It comes to the community through a prophet—Zarathustra, Buddha, Christ. The true transcending power is glimpsed, not seen. And it is more than power; it is also love. The divinity itself is engaged in suffering, thus manifesting love. Suffering is not merely man's cross, but his great opportunity for self-transcendence functioning through outgoing love. The religions that adopt this vision as the basis for human existence triumph.

But man's ineradicable self-centeredness does not permit the higher religions to function with thorough efficiency. The first wound they receive is from the ecumenical god. It is not the persecution of that god which hurts the higher religion: *semen est sanguis christianorum*. The hurt comes when the ecumenical god sees that he cannot destroy the new religion and then decides to live with it. He also plans to use it for his service and purposes. This is Caesaropapism, which so clearly infected Byzantine Christianity. Roman Christianity resisted the disease in the days of the Roman Empire, but finally succumbed to it in the medieval period of papal secular power.

Nor is the ecumenical god the only foe. The philosopher's god of inner human self-sufficiency also wrestles the higher religion to a fall. In order to speak to the philosopher, the higher religion must transpose its prophetic and poetic message into the rational and ephemeral categories of science. Such an effort, unavoidable as it is, produces two great evils. First, the truth to be glimpsed in prophetic poetry is above the categories of the rationalist; hence it cannot be genuinely expressed by them. Secondly, with time the categories of one scientific epoch become outdated, irrelevant, and discarded. But the higher religion tends to insist on the misleading and alien formulas it constructed for outlived philosophies.

The great temptation of the higher religion is the idolization of itself. It

substitutes its institutions or its scriptures for the Absolute Reality. It becomes partisan, narrow, and parochial. Toynbee finds that this temptation has lured Catholicism into its arrogant claim of being the exclusive bearer of revelation.

All these ideas are the factors which form the general pattern of religious history. Their discussion constitutes the first part of Toynbee's book. The second part considers our present position. Our current world is a Westernizing world, taking on everywhere more and more of post-Christian Western civilization. This civilization is called Modern Western Man. Yet, paradoxically enough, for Toynbee we of 1956 are not "Modern" but "post-Modern." The paradox is explained by the system of labels Toynbee employs. Modern Western Civilization began in the seventeenth century. In its early period it was intensely religious with the fratricidal Christianity of the Wars of Religion. In its later phase, beginning at the close of the seventeenth century and ending in 1914, it rejected Christianity, on the plea that Christianity was both stultifying and destroying Europe by its fanaticism and wars.

By way of escape, late Modern Western Civilization dedicated itself to secularism. It concentrated on empirical science, which was justified by its utility. But any attempt to eliminate religion merely substitutes one religion for another. Modern Western Civilization brought back two gods from the past—the parochial nation which is Moloch, on whose heels follows the ecumenical god.

The nationalist communities of the nineteenth century absolutized themselves religiously, so that deified Britannia ruled the waves and the United States became the goddess Columbia, gem of the ocean. Yet political ecumenicism was growing. Science had annihilated distance and Westernization rendered life everywhere increasingly uniform. Then came the League of Nations and its successor, the United Nations. These are obviously ecumenical phenomena. Moreover, the great national powers have been reduced to two, Russia and the United States, each with immense areas of ecumenical influence.

Late Modern Western Civilization also produced a third idol, Technology. Salvation was offered by technology and empirical national science was the divine word. However, this idol showed its feet of clay when atomic energy made it clear that technology was not necessarily beneficent but quite capable of universal destruction. In consequence, the freedom of technology became severely restricted by governments; and in restricting it, they deprived it of omnipotence and therefore of divinity.

In 1956 mankind universally makes three demands, for security, for social justice, for a higher material standard of living. To meet these demands, the

states—national or possibly ecumenical—must more and more restrict individual liberties. The only field where restriction will not be imposed is the inner realm of the spirit. Hence religious interest will grow; for only in that area will the spirit be free and unhampered.

This upsurging religious interest asks our religions to examine their policies. Two attitudes are demanded of them all. Parochial borders in space and thought are vanishing, with the result that pluralism is the framework of all local societies. Hence the first obligation of the higher religions is to look with tolerance on one another. Secondly, they must distinguish between the essentials of their beliefs and non-essential accretions. For the efficacy of their ecumenical apostolate all non-essentials due to fossilized philosophic categorization or parochial identification of local mores with human life must be gently but effectively eliminated.

There are seven higher religions relevant to the modern predicament. Three are Buddhaic: Hīnayāna Buddhism, Mahāyāna Buddhism, and Hinduism. There are three Judaic religions: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. The seventh religion is Parsee Zoroastrianism. In essentials all of these religions are in agreement. The approaches of each one will be different; but that is an advantage, because there cannot be only one way in which the infinite Divine Mystery may be seen. Mutual understanding, readiness to recognize validity in one another, willingness to borrow from, and lend to, one another—these are the obligations of the higher religions today.

The two most advanced religions on the scene are Christianity and Mahāyāna Buddhism. The others have not yet learned the importance of love to the same degree achieved by these two. An impression is easily gotten that Christianity and Mahāyāna Buddhism through mutual influence can coalesce into, or bring forth, a religion still higher than either of them.

This rapid summary of Toynbee's Gifford Lectures will at least manifest the vastness of the vision of the man. Unfortunately, it cannot convey the exhilaration experienced in reading the work. One moves like lightning from Inca Peru to Sumer and Akkad, from Mayan Yucatan to Phoenician Carthage, from the early Stone Age to the Technological Era. China and Rome rub elbows on many pages; India and Europe are treated with equal familiarity. Toynbee is now sixty-seven years old and he has brought his wide knowledge to bear on the subject which interests him intensely. There is also evidence of deep piety. It is moving to read the description of the author's pilgrimage to St. Benedict's cave near Subiaco, where Toynbee knelt in fervent prayer.

But the question remains: Is this scintillating work an historic analysis of the religious dimension of humanity, or rather a subtle *plaidoyer* for

Toynbee's own plan to fuse our religions into something none of them is or even wants to be?

He uses abstractions that are his own mental constructs, palming them off as labels for concrete realities. Yet there are no concrete realities corresponding to them. I submit that there exists no such thing as the Jewish religion. We have Orthodox, Reformed, and Conservative synagogues, Hassidic communities, Reconstructionists, *et al.* But they do not constitute one Jewish religion; there is no such thing. This is equally true for "Christianity." Roman Catholics, Protestants in their varied units, the Oriental Orthodox, and the minor groups outside of these divisions, are not one religion. In what real sense can a Unitarian be said to belong to the religion of the Unitarian Witnesses of Jehovah? Are they all one reductively? On Toynbee's reduction, certainly, but on no one else's.

My ignorance of Indian religions prevents me from making comments concerning them, but I suspect that the neat Toynbean trichotomy of Buddhism is as deceptive a description of Asia's religious situation as his facile fusion of Western faiths.

What Toynbee is undoubtedly doing is preaching. He is urging us on to a religious syncretism, and he so describes the realities as if this syncretism were already in part accomplished, and little more needed to make it perfect. This is psychologically improbable, given the diversity of men. Moreover, it is historically false. It is true that the religions seemingly manifest common elements. But partial community of elements, if these be taken in isolated abstraction, can be detected in utterly diverse realities where the concrete actualization of the abstracted quality is totally different in the different entities. Buddhist contemplation can take place in a Catholic cathedral; but this is in despite of the cathedral, not because of it. Nor was St. Benedict looking for Nirvāna in the *Sacro Speco*.

Theologically, Toynbee is typical of the intellectuals of our time. Their sincere religion is directed to the Absolute Reality, the Mystery of the Universe, the Ground of Being, the Binding Energy of all Reality. Words like these are currently very common. Yet they are not synonyms for God, although they pretend to be. They say much less than the traditional term. Toynbee would prefer not to employ the word, God, though he condescendingly does so. He certainly does not understand it to be Yahweh, who for him was a nature god, later elevated to the rank of a minor tribal deification of collective self-centeredness.

In all this we have nineteenth-century liberalism as it now emerges in the sea-change of the twentieth. It is universally recognized today that reverential piety and the perception of an empirically undetectable first principle

cannot be rooted out of human existence. The old liberal attempt to root it out failed palpably. Neo-liberalism frankly accepts that failure but promptly organizes the inevitable religious commitment into its own non-theistic world-vision. God is like the other side of the moon: we can't see it, but it is there. But it is merely moon, whatever it is. For the pious neo-liberal, God is the ultimate dimension of experienced existence. Existence is rooted both in nature and freedom. Hence God can be described either as necessity or as will. It depends on your interest, and on your choice of physics or psychology as the source of your symbolic vocabulary. There is no genuine revelation of God to man. There is only man's awareness of the incommensurability of his picayune self when compared with totality. This objective incommensurability is the neo-liberal god.

Toynbee has a literary mannerism which is striking. Both for Christ and the Buddha he capitalizes the personal pronouns. Buddha is "He," just as Christ is "He." Now we all know that the upper-case H was given to Christ's pronoun because of the belief that He was God, true God of true God. It seems clear enough from the sources that Siddhārtha Gautama never claimed to be God and would have brusquely rejected the insinuation. What, then, is Toynbee's "He" doing? Deifying the Buddha or undivining the Christ? Neither alternative will go down well with a Christian who believes in the Nicene Creed. But, of course, Toynbee denies the relevance of Greek metaphysical formulas as adequate expressions of the Christian vision.

We are not being given a history of religion. What is offered is an historian's preferred reconstruction of historical religions. It is tacitly assumed that the historical religions, as they stand, are obviously unacceptable. But their language and their fundamental insights can profitably be accepted if re-arranged into a pattern which rigorously eschews the supernatural, the objective validity of formulas, epistemological commitment, and precise ontal affirmation. The Hegelian dialectic has come to term. The atheism of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries sets itself in antithesis to the theism of the previous centuries. Now the children of this generation have produced the synthesis which melts together theism and atheism, objectivity and subjectivity, nature and freedom, into a religious faith which ignores all of its own aporiae. It justifies its own creation of divinity with the plea that this is the god who led us out of Egypt and who can lead us through the wilderness into the Promised Land.

It would be presumptuous to essay a refutation of so dazzling a mind as Toynbee's. In fact, a witty caricaturist has already inhibited any nascent desire to do so. The Book Review Section of the *New York Times* (Oct. 7, 1956, p. 2) carried a cartoonist's delightful dig at the possible ecclesiastical



opponents of Toynbee. The artist shows us a plushy salon in which a well-fed dowager simpering over a tea-cup puts a question to an obviously moronic but ample churchman. The question is: "Bishop, when will you refute Toynbee?"

It has not been the intention of this report to "refute" Toynbee. Its aim was much simpler. It was to summarize what Toynbee said; to express openly what his tacit assumptions were; to point out the implicit goal he was pursuing.

*Woodstock College*

GUSTAVE WEIGEL, S.J.

ALTGERMANISCHE RELIGIONSGESCHICHTE 1. By Jan de Vries. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1956. Pp. xlix + 505.

One of the problems that usually plague the historian of religion is that of origins. In the case of the Teutonic peoples, the first historical documentations date from Caesar and Tacitus, which bring us down to the end of the Iron Age. There seems to be little warrant for the extrapolation of Teutonic speakers much beyond the Iron Age. There is the mere possibility that the Battle-axe people of the Neolithic were speakers of an early Teutonic. Again the Urnsfield people who entered Germanic territory in the Late Bronze may have spoken Teutonic. But surprisingly enough there is no evidence of a stable agricultural system until the Iron Age and even the late Bronze Age cemeteries do not indicate large permanent settlements. De Vries cannot accept this Iron Age date as the earliest for Teutonic speakers in the Germanic realm and so he scans the archeological data for the Mesolithic, Neolithic and Bronze periods for some evidence of Germanic religion. The grave materials do seem to indicate ancestor worship and the rock inscriptions—some of which date, he believes, from the Bronze period—illustrate cultic scenes that might be associated with an agrarian or planter religion with its overtones of fertility rites; and perhaps some indications of gods or heroes. But the doubt remains: were they Teutonic-speakers?

Contact of the south Germans with the Romans brought impacts upon Germanic culture and religion at least in the Rhineland; and there are documents to show this. During the long period, which lasted the good part of the first Christian millenium, when various Germanic peoples were generally Christianized, we have written documents: lives of missionary saints, synodal, episcopal and papal decrees which deal with aspects of pagan German religion. In the first or second century, we find the first Runic inscriptions, which bear on magic and religion. In the *Völkerwanderung* times, names of towns provide valuable insights into the membership of the

German pantheon—and that pantheon varied strangely in different parts of the area.

The Edda-songs and Skalda poetry honor the German gods. The Snorra-Edda dates only from the 13th century, whereas the Edda and Skalda documents belong to the Viking period but probably represent a much earlier tradition. In the Snorra-Edda the gods of the Edda are glorified in novel-form. Of great importance are the Icelandic family sagas. They were written in the 12th and following centuries and provide insights into the old pagan religion, which was waning in Iceland. The author has capitalized superstitious beliefs and practices that have lasted down the centuries. These beliefs, and especially actions, sometimes veneered with Christian accretions, point to old pagan customs and beliefs. De Vries insists that these practices have to be controlled from other sources but, with these restrictions, they may be valuable indicators of the attitude of pagan ancestors. He insists that his aim is to provide not a mere catalogue of gods and lesser mythological beings but to reconstruct the religious beliefs and attitudes of the pagan Germans.

De Vries believes that religion stems, not from wonderment or quiet cosmological reasoning, but from the need and will to live in the face of titanic, often hostile forces. And so it is often mixed with magic. For this happens, according to de Vries, when man feels himself helpless and his prayers unanswered. Strongly characteristic of Germanic religion is the belief in ineluctable fate. At times, gods engineer the fate of a man; or some spirit. But even the gods are subject to fate, as in Indic religion. But, above all, the author holds that Germanic religion is engendered by, and rooted in, the group (Sippe). This is a small group of related persons, of the extended family type perhaps. As a result, birth, the giving of a name, which is often that of a deceased relative or ancestor, youthful initiation into warrior activity, marriage and other critical times and events loom large in German religion. So intensely group-bound is this faith that there is no universal morality, but only that of the group, community or tribe. The home is a sacred place, as is also the place of community or tribal worship and place of caucus, the Thing. There are protective spirits for the hearth and appropriate ceremonies are held there. On a larger scale, there are community and, less frequently, tribal sacrifices. Though animal sacrifices preponderate, there were human sacrifices in times of great crisis or for the launching of some great overseas expedition. Captives in war and criminals were also generously put to death.

The author has reserved for his second volume the full treatment of the gods of Germanic religion. But he does stress the veneration given to ances-

tors and points to an almost innumerable host of lesser mythological beings. There are elves, both light and dark, dwarfs, who dwell in rocks and underground, who were skilled in making armor and gathering treasure. Trows are fairy-like beings, who are skilled in magic and witchcraft. Vaetter are guardians of the land. The fylgja are somewhat related to the above guardians, though they are also spirit-guardians of people. The Valkyries choose the warriors for death and, as Odin's servants, conduct them to Valhalla. Here the dead heroes are living corpses. They live well and continue their fighting, sustaining wounds but recovering perfectly and then continue their happy life. There are water spirits and many other kinds as well. There are giants and demons in animal guise. It is easy to see how no phase of life could be completely divorced from the pagan German's beliefs and superstition.

De Vries insists that there are many lacunae in the history of pagan German religion but his very competent study has illumined many phases of it and we can hopefully look forward to the second volume which will do justice to the gods. Perhaps that volume will justify his position that Germanic religion is rooted more in biological or social need. Bergson admitted that there were such religions but that there was also a type based on love and more filial attitudes. Ohm has shown that in many pagan religions there is a real love of God and it is hard to think that the Germans were wholly exceptional in this regard.

*Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y.*

HUGH J. BIHLER, S.J.

THE TWO-EDGED SWORD: AN INTERPRETATION OF THE OLD TESTAMENT. By John L. McKenzie, S.J. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1956. Pp. xv + 317. \$4.50.

Several years ago, in a challenging appraisal of Origenian exegesis, ancient and modern (THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 12 [1951] 381), Fr. McKenzie remarked that "Catholic exegetes have scarcely begun to create a 'spiritual understanding' of the Old Testament based upon the vast resources of modern historical and philological science." The present volume offers, for the interested general reader, the beginnings of such an understanding. A technical evaluation of the results must be left to the competency of Scripture scholars; there is every reason to suspect that their judgment will be favorable. In its other aspects, the striking merits of the work forbid even the non-expert to be mute: tenacious honesty; wit-sprinkled sobriety; religious insight; fluent and sometimes eloquent style—these add up to a splendid introduction to the Old Testament.

The last phrase should not be misunderstood. This is not a book for dates and "facts." Not a single footnote; whole chapters without citation of

chapter or verse. All these things can now easily be found elsewhere (for example, in the excellent *Guide to the Bible* of Robert and Tricot). Nor is the book's chief value to be sought in its removal of obstacles to the intelligent reading of the Old Testament. This it does superbly. Here are some of the chapter headings: "Cosmic Origins"; "Human Origins"; "The Hope of the Future"; "The Wisdom of the Hebrews"; "The Mystery of Iniquity." The mere mention of them may suggest what popular misconceptions regarding creation, evolution, prophecy, the after-life, etc., are quietly smashed, what mental blocks arising from apologetic or dogmatic preoccupations are deftly removed by appealing simply to the fact that the inspired authors thought and wrote like the men that they were, not like the men that we are.

But even this is secondary to something more difficult and profound, the skilful delineation of what kind of God it was in whom Israel believed. The chosen people could not help but be influenced by their neighbors, but the remarkable thing was that Israel's faith remained unique. To summarize (and so to distort a little) what Fr. McKenzie spells out in magnificent detail: Whereas the gods of the Semites are projections of human aspirations and needs, celestial patrons of earthly fulfilment, Israel's God is the "wholly other," who refuses to be captured, who is not "a god you can put in your pocket"; the divine intruder who shapes men and history and is not himself shaped by them, who does not need men but is their one absolute need; who affirms through his prophets and sages "the futility of human wisdom, human power, human civilization . . . the inability of man to save himself from himself" (p. 305). It is this faith, born of mystical encounter, that makes Israel unique in the ancient world. And though the author's purpose is to expose and not to plead for this faith, he leaves no doubt that he considers it perennially relevant, especially with relation to modern secularism. In this regard, his work authoritatively challenges a too easy Christian humanism.

One other important aspect should be noted, with a question mark. The spiritual interpretation of the Old Testament, Fr. McKenzie is convinced, is not to be sought in the revival of the "spiritual sense" so dear to patristic exegesis. On this see his review of Henri de Lubac's *Histoire et Esprit* quoted above, and of *Problèmes et méthode d'exégèse théologique* by Coppens, Cerfaux, and Gribomont (*ibid.*, pp. 560 ff.). The brevity with which this subject must be treated in *The Two-Edged Sword* has resulted in something less than perfect justice for a position which has engaged the favor not merely of patrologists and liturgists but of many renowned exegetes. These see no opposition between the scientific pursuit of the literal sense and the search (also scientific, but of a higher, and therefore less "controllable," order) for the total meaning of the divine word in its total context, which is the totality

of Scripture. To favor a typical or fuller sense is not, as the author would seem to suggest (p. 19), to flee from the literal sense or reduce the Old Testament to a shadow. Admittedly, the *sensus plenior* remains shrouded in obscurity; but is this not a call for the same patience to which we are rightly exhorted where difficult historical and philological questions are involved?

The point of these remarks is this: Only the future will be able fully to evaluate the extent of Fr. McKenzie's notable achievement. If he is correct in his position on the spiritual sense, then his book will have been a pioneer in the English-speaking Catholic world in steering us from false and fanciful ways. If he is not (and the tide at present would seem to be running against him), then his approach, while it will need to be complemented, will continue to provide a solid and indispensable foundation for a more integral understanding of Holy Scripture. In the meantime, may we be favored abundantly by this gifted mind and pen.

*Woodstock College*

THOMAS E. CLARKE, S.J.

A PATH THROUGH GENESIS. By Bruce Vawter, C.M. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1956. Pp. x + 308. \$4.00.

Here is a popular commentary on Genesis which deserves and will receive much favorable attention. Some of it is already known in the *St. Louis Register* and in the author's pamphlet on Genesis published by the Knights of Columbus. The entire book is here covered in the same style.

The introduction is important, for it touches upon the Catholic attitude toward the entire Bible and the relations of the Old and New Testaments. It also introduces the reader to the existence of sources in the Pentateuch; this complex problem is proposed with brevity and lucidity, together with an explanation of the meaning of the "authorship" of Moses. In the commentary itself the text of the Confraternity version of Genesis is reproduced.

There are three points of the highest importance which are treated throughout the commentary. The first point is the meaning of "literary form" and the identification of literary forms in the narratives of Genesis. Popular readers have heard of this, but there are as yet few places where they can find out what it is; this book is one of them. The second point is the compilation of sources, which is especially clear in such passages as the deluge story, the duplications in the patriarchal narratives, and the story of Joseph. The third point is the ancient Oriental background of Genesis, to which V. constantly refers the book. Without attention to these three points it is impossible to talk about Genesis; in this book they are always prominent.

One man will do it one way, another will do it another; V. has done it his

way, and done it very well. This reviewer thinks that V. may leave himself open to misunderstanding in his statement, often repeated, that it is only in what the author "teaches" that we meet the questions of inspiration and inerrancy. I believe that this could obscure the fact that the author was inspired to write, not to teach. It is not always clear that we have a didactic purpose in the narratives of Genesis. When we deal with inspiration and inerrancy, we investigate what the author meant, not what he taught; the two are not entirely the same. In other hands this principle has led to the distillation of a summary of "doctrine" from a body of text, and it is asserted that this doctrine is what the author was inspired to write. This would solve some problems neatly, except that the summary of doctrine was written by an exegete; it is the text that was written by the inspired author.

This reviewer also believes that the cosmogonic myths of Mesopotamia could have been explained at greater length; the Hexaemeron cannot be understood without them, and they deserve more than succinct allusions. The exposition of the deluge story also would have gained in clarity if V. had shown explicitly just how many points of identity there are between the deluge of Noah and the deluge of Utnapishtim. I think also that V.'s explanation of Gn 2-3 would go better if he had applied there the principle of compilation of sources, admitting that the analysis in this passage is extremely difficult. Abraham's religion might have been shown to be an example of the worship of the "family god."

These points in no way signify an intention to find fault with the book; rather I recommend it without reservation. Popular thinking about Genesis (which sometimes reaches up as far as university and seminary faculties) is usually at the stage which was reached about 1880. It is high time that respectable books by established scholars appear which will show that biblical thinking among Catholics has at least reached the twentieth century, and that it is permissible to accept the contributions of scholarship since 1880 without peril of shipwreck. This is such a book. It is scholarly to the hilt as far as its erudition is concerned, but written in a graceful and easy style which often sparkles with wit. It ought to replace most expositions of Genesis in English, and the reviewer believes and hopes that it will.

*West Baden College*

JOHN L. MCKENZIE, S.J.

EXODE. By A. Clamer. *La sainte Bible*. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1956. Pp. 303.

This is the second part of Vol. 1 in the Pirot-Clamer Bible and merits the same high commendation which P. J. Donnelly gave to the first part, *Genèse*

(cf. *TS* 16 [1955] 613–15). The extensive commentary abounds in valuable information and well-pondered judgments on the many vexing problems of Exodus. The substantial historicity of the narrative does not mean that the work is historical in the modern sense of that term, and C. shows how, in keeping with the Israelite method of writing religious history, there is room for heightening and amplification. The accounts of the plagues and the crossing of the Sea come to mind as examples.

C. divides Exodus into two major sections, one historical and the second legislative. Chapters 1 to 18 describe the deliverance from Egyptian servitude; chapters 19 to 40 are built around the events at Sinai. One sees at a glance that Exodus is not an isolated and independent work but an integral part of a larger unit of literature. Exodus describes the fulfilment (partial) of the promises made in Genesis to the patriarchs; on the other hand, our own narrative is supplemented by the two following books which expand the historical and legislative material of Exodus. C. recognizes the presence of redactional touches in the work and admits the composite character of Exodus, comprising the triple traditions J (predominant in Exodus), E, and P; yet he vigorously emphasizes the central and unifying place of Moses in the origins and religious life of the Israelite nation. This influence, confirmed more and more by our better knowledge of the historical background of the period, is so decisive that the history of Israel, subsequent to the liberation from Egypt, is inexplicable apart from the dominating figure of the Law-giver.

All this does not imply, of course, that Exodus in its present form dates from the thirteenth century. Still, much of its material reflects an earlier age than scholars of another generation were wont to admit. Take one example, the Covenant Code. While Moses certainly did not personally write this entire block of legislation, the background from which it emerged is the Middle and Late Bronze Age and not the later Iron Age, as is clear from the recovery of codified Mesopotamian and Hittite law which antedated the Mosaic Code. What gives to Israelite law its peculiar stamp is not the legislative details, many of which can be paralleled in earlier codes, but its strong religious orientation. Its power does not come from any civil authority which could enforce it, but from Yahweh who promulgates it and promises rewards for its faithful observance.

Another example of early composition is the beautiful victory hymn imbedded in chapter 15. Those who assume a late date for the song forget that the elements of style, strophic structure, and language point to a date as early as the twelfth century for its original composition, as Cross and Freedman have persuasively argued (cf. *JNES* 14 [1955] 237–50). C. is careful to

distinguish between what is and is not supported by solid biblical tradition. For instance, we have good reason for believing that the tribes of Judah, Benjamin, Joseph, Levi, and Simeon took part in the hasty departure from Egypt; the participation of the northern tribes is still problematical, as de Vaux and others have long recognized.

The synthesis of religious teaching is clear and concise, centering around two essential affirmations of Israelite religion: the existence of one God, who alone is to be adored, and the entering into covenant, by which Yahweh has made Israel His people. From these two premises flow the doctrinal, moral, and cultic teachings of Exodus. The profound influence of Exodus on the *NT*, especially on Paul, is not overlooked. Further study of the problems which arise in Exodus can proceed from the selected bibliography and many references to articles and books throughout C.'s commentary. To the last remark I would make one exception. The fanciful theories of I. Velikovsky (p. 38) are best forgotten. This first volume of a distinguished series deserves a warm welcome; it has introduced us to an ordered world through the creative act of God and to a new community formed through the mysterious initiative of His covenant.

*Weston College*

FREDERICK L. MORIARTY, S.J.

NEW TESTAMENT ABSTRACTS. Vol. 1, No. 1 (Fall, 1956). Issued by the Jesuits of Weston College, Weston, Mass. Subscription \$3.00. Single issues \$1.00.

Students of the New Testament have often envied scientists who have such valuable tools as *Chemical Abstracts* to keep them abreast of recent literature. In the field of the Bible there are several excellent publications which give bibliographical data and valuable summaries of what has been written. There does, however, seem to be a place for a publication which gives in English a rather complete idea of articles and reviews of books on the *NT* and which would appear soon after the publication of the original articles. Furthermore, not only professional scholars but also a non-professional audience of ministers of religion, teachers, college students, and those with a serious interest in the Bible can profit from an introduction into recent *NT* literature. Such was the plan which inaugurated *New Testament Abstracts* (to be published three times a year: fall, winter, and spring), and the reaction from letters and subscriptions has justified the project.

In the present number there are 173 abstracts of articles and reviews originally published in seven languages. The length of the individual summaries is extended enough so that not only the thesis of the author is given



but also a brief indication of his argumentation. Readers will be grateful for this fuller treatment of such lively issues as R. E. Brown's book on the *sensus plenior* of Scripture, J. Levie's article on Scripture as the word of God and the word of man, and F. M. Braun's discussion of the relation to the Blessed Virgin of the Woman of Apocalypse 12.

As a help to understanding the position of the eminent Protestant exegete, Rudolf Bultmann, who has sought to take the "myth" out of the *NT*, readers will find of interest abstracts of articles by Catholic and non-Catholic authors evaluating Bultmann's contribution. Also for the much discussed problem of the Dead Sea Scrolls one can find here a survey of attitudes from the most conservative to the most radical.

In the attitude to take toward book reviews, the number and selection have constituted a problem which the editors confess was much discussed among themselves and with their correspondents. For the present issue the number of reviews seems too great, and fortunately the copy for the second number has modified the plan, so that several reviews are worked into one abstract. In this way the reader can obtain quickly the general reaction to a volume.

In an excellent suggestion made in the *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie*, Paul Gaechter, Dean of the theological faculty at Innsbruck, expressed the wish that authors would furnish abstracts of their own articles and thus confer a great benefit on their readers. Such a method would be invaluable, and some writers have promised to make this contribution to *New Testament Abstracts*. Meanwhile scholars here and abroad are being enlisted as abstracters. Vol. 1, No. 1 is a genuine contribution to *NT* studies, and we wish the journal all success.

*Weston College*

FREDERICK L. MORIARTY, S.J.

THE ORIGIN OF THE GOSPEL OF MARK. By Harold A. Guy. New York: Harper, 1955. Pp. 176. \$2.50.

The gap between the oral tradition and the finished Gospels has engaged the attention of many scholars without leading to definitive solutions. All therefore will welcome the contribution of H. A. Guy, a member of the faculty of Taunton's School, Southampton, England, who works out a very clear and rather new theory for the second Gospel. Relying for the most part on a minute examination of the Marcan text, the author discovers three stages in its development. At first, as the form critics hold, the pericopes circulated as individual units in the Church. At this point the writer introduces the results of recent manuscript studies which suggest that for Chris-

tians the Scriptures first appeared not in scrolls but in the codex or book form. If so, then the assumption that the pericopes were originally written on separate papyrus sheets receives confirmation. Actually, in the narrative portions of Mark fifty separate episodes may be counted, each averaging 630 Greek letters, so that each paragraph could be accommodated on a papyrus sheet similar in size to the pages of an Unknown Gospel, a Christian apocryphal work of the second century. Of the Marcan narrative episodes forty-five could be written on one side of the sheet, and the longest would occupy the whole of both sides.

The second stage of transition from oral tradition to the finished Gospel came when a compiler gathered together these papyrus pages and arranged them in a rudimentary order. He no doubt wished out of veneration to preserve these pages and to provide a note-book for others, but did not complete the task of setting the material in order, as is evident from the interruptions in the narrative, the doublets and repetitions, and the lack of connection between succeeding paragraphs and statements.

In the third stage of the development appeared the editor, who added some material, mostly teachings of Jesus, and inserted sentences and phrases to link the isolated stories together. Such editorial sentences and phrases occupy four pages of G.'s book and according to him point to a redactor who was a Gentile unacquainted with Palestine. It is to this editor that we owe the final form of Mark's Gospel.

Such is the broad outline of the thesis, and one naturally asks what role Mark had in the process. He would seem to have been the compiler rather than the editor, for tradition calls him the "interpreter" of Peter, a term which could describe the person who collected in written form the matter narrated by the Apostle. Mark's relation to Simon Peter might be analogous to that of the "interpreter" (Methurgeman) of a Great Rabbi in the Jewish synagogue, who passed on to the congregation the message of his master. A further argument for Mark as the compiler arises from the very imperfect order of the book, which would aptly explain the words of Papias, who felt that the Marcan order needed a defense. Finally, out of reverence for the prominent figure of Mark the later editor did not make bold to change the order within the Gospel.

Many of the details of the theory have been discussed for some time, e.g., the suggestion of pericopes circulating as detached units, the worth of the connective links in the narrative, etc. What is new is the suggestion of an editor besides St. Mark the compiler. Whether the evidence is sufficient to support the hypothesis may be debated, but I do not think that one can rule out the possibility. Since many Catholics assign a considerable role to the

Greek translator of the Aramaic Matthew, why could not a redactor have given the final form to the Gospel of Mark? But, whatever the final verdict, G. has indeed enriched the study of the Gospels by a stimulating theory ably presented.

*Weston College*

JOHN J. COLLINS, S.J.

GALILEAN CHRISTIANITY. By L. E. Elliott-Binns. *Studies in Biblical Theology* 16. Chicago: Alec R. Allenson, 1956. Pp. 80. \$1.50.

The author is convinced that a "case . . . can be made out for a division between the earlier followers of Jesus in Galilee, probably including some at least of the Twelve, and the narrower Judaistic Christianity which was growing up at Jerusalem under the leadership of St. James." After two interesting introductory chapters on Galilee in the time of Jesus and His Galilean ministry, Dr. Elliott-Binns gets down to the proof of his thesis with a discussion of Gospel evidence for the controversy between Galilee and Jerusalem. Matthew, like Mark, has a predilection for the former rather than the latter centre: "for him, Galilee is the birthplace of the Christian Church, and, as for Mark, the Holy Land where Jesus had revealed Himself." The author rests his case, however, upon citations from Ed. Meyer, J. Weiss, R. H. Lightfoot, without specific references to the Gospel texts, except for the accounts of the post-resurrection appearances, in which, he feels, "the clash of tradition between Galilee and Jerusalem is most striking, and even startling." Matthew and Mark, representing the Galilean side, are set in opposition to Luke, John, the Jerusalem view. Surely, however, it is to go beyond the evidence provided by the Gospels to postulate a "clash" because the critics find difficulty in reconciling appearances in Galilee with those in Jerusalem. Moreover, the author has admitted earlier that John "certainly had no animus against the Galileans" (p. 31). As for Luke, "in regard to the claims of Galilee and Jerusalem he pursues what may be called a policy of equation" (p. 36).

To describe the character of the Church in Galilee, as "direct evidence" is "very scanty," the letter of St. James is used as a major source. For this it is necessary to postulate Galilee as its place of origin. This is simply stated without proof: "I am persuaded that Galilee best fits the situation." It is also necessary to date the epistle very early, "before there had been time to consider the theological consequences of accepting Jesus as the Messiah and Son of God." If the reader be prepared to accept these hypotheses, he is provided with an insight into the nature of Galilean Christianity, which is concerned with Jesus' teaching, not with any teaching about Him ("the

Christology is unelaborated, if not defective"), and which believes in a remission of sins unconnected with any atonement doctrine.

It is crucial to the author's thesis to show that the Galilean Twelve were, in the early Jerusalem Church, supplanted by the dynastic party of "the brethren of the Lord" headed by St. James. Apart from the fact that the evidence adduced for such a transformation of the primitive Church is scanty, not to say shaky, it does not appear to have struck the author that, even granted such an administrative turnover, the direction of the Jerusalem Church would still be in Galilean hands (like the Lord, His brethren were also Galileans) and the supposed anti-Galileanism of that community is still without sufficient explanation.

The study concludes with a sketch of the Christian migration to Pella and of the later history of Galilean Christianity.

*Jesuit Seminary, Toronto*

D. M. STANLEY, S.J.

NOVA CREATURA: LA NOZIONE DELLA GRAZIA NEI COMMENTARI MEDIEVALI DI S. PAOLO. By Zoltan Alszeghy, S.J. *Analecta Gregoriana* 81. Rome: Gregorian University, 1956. Pp. 284.

Father Alszeghy, Dean of the Theological Faculty of the Pontifical Gregorian University, has already attained eminence in the field of medieval theology. Perhaps his major interest centers on the historical development of supernatural anthropology in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. He is not merely an historian and medievalist, but primarily a theologian, convinced of the need of a comprehensive synthesis of the organic development of revealed truth, and fully aware of the dangers of compartmentalization in theology. In a previous work, "La teologia dell'ordine soprannaturale nella Scolastica antica," *Gregorianum* 31 (1951) 414-50, A. stressed the fact that the full nuances of any medieval author's thought cannot be grasped by studying his views on detached doctrines, but only by studying his views on all the central dogmas concerning man's salvation. Since our entire economy of salvation is supernatural and the full development of the notion of the supernatural has been a slow, gradual process, it is of utmost importance to trace this evolution in the Scholastic period.

The last few decades have witnessed a stream of periodical articles and detached monographs on this subject. Fortunately the fruit of these enormous labors has been made accessible to all in the recent works of A. Landgraf (the first two volumes of his *Dogmengeschichte der Frühscholastik*, entitled *Die Gnadenlehre* [Regensburg: Pustet, 1952, 1953]) and J. Auer (*Die Entwicklung der Gnadenlehre in der Hochscholastik* [2 vols.; Freiburg:

Herder, 1942, 1951]). A.'s purpose is not to supplant but to complement the investigations of Landgraf and Auer, who drew largely from strictly theological works, by covering the same periods from exegetical sources. This task, until quite recently, would have been almost impossible because of the scarcity of manuscript material, and because of uncertainties of authorship. Here again, Landgraf has led the way; the results of his numerous studies of medieval glosses on the texts of St. Paul are summarized in his *Einführung in die Geschichte der theologischen Literatur der Frühscholastik* (Regensburg, 1948). In addition, there has been a psychological barrier against undertaking the research, so ably carried out by A., in the feeling that early medieval exegetes did nothing else but copy from the Fathers of the Church. A. shows that this psychological prejudice is unfounded (pp. 8-10).

The importance of A.'s undertaking for the history of dogma is based on the fact that the entire life of the Middle Ages was nourished by the Bible; theology itself, its teaching and development, were identified with the study of the Bible, to such an extent that theology was, in a very special way, the knowledge of Sacred Scripture. The usage of the Sacred Text, at least in the first part of the Middle Ages, was quite different from modern usage. This difference is not limited to the progress of exegesis with regard to the literal sense; whether rightly or wrongly, the medieval theologian expected to derive from the Bible not merely certainty with regard to certain detached doctrines, but also a more profound synthesis of all dogmatic truths. This was especially true of the Pauline corpus; in fact, no other book of the Bible, not even the Gospels, was so frequently commented upon as the Pauline letters, and the medieval doctrine on the supernatural and the life of grace was derived almost exclusively from St. Paul. Hence A. is eminently justified in limiting himself to medieval Pauline commentaries.

A word on A.'s methodology and sources will show not only the painstaking thoroughness of his research, but also the fact that his work will be an indispensable tool in further development (pp. 12-38). He has wisely chosen not to examine the theological content of every available manuscript containing a Pauline gloss, but rather to cover outstanding examples of each group of family of manuscripts according to the previous researches of Landgraf, Spicq, Perrier, and Stegmüller. But with this restriction only, A. explores not merely the early Scholastic period, but also exegetical development through the fourteenth century. In addition, by way of introduction to each text considered, he gives the patristic sources which chiefly influenced medieval exegesis (largely Pseudo-Ambrose, Pelagius, and St. Augustine) and concludes with the doctrine of exegetes who wrote during the Tridentine epoch (mainly Seripandus, Estius, and Cornelius a Lapide).

The body of A.'s work consists in an analysis of texts following a strictly chronological order (pp. 38–257). Among the subjects treated are: a lexicography of grace; the condition of a Christian; the deification of a Christian; the Mystical Body; the necessity of grace. Under these general headings, thirty-two passages from St. Paul are covered; of these, six are from Romans, nine from First Corinthians, six from Second Corinthians, one from Galatians, five from Ephesians, one from Philippians, two from Colossians, one from Second Timothy, and one from Titus. In three extremely valuable appendices, A. lists the medieval commentaries on St. Paul (pp. 267–69), the *incipit* of the different authors of commentaries (pp. 269–77), and an index of manuscripts (pp. 277–79).

In each of the doctrinal aspects of grace covered by A., we find the same tendency, namely, a shift from an almost exclusively psychological and moral consideration of grace to an ontological point of view. At the beginning of the Middle Ages the condition of the *nova creatura* is described as an ensemble of virtuous acts, an ethical renovation, a new moral conduct. The representatives of this view admitted clearly the revealed truths concerning new relations between the justified man and God; but for them, to be a son of God, to possess the Spirit, meant almost exclusively a newness of thoughts and affections regarding God. The metaphor of the Mystical Body expressed for them the persuasion that the justified, though quite different as persons, are united because they tend to the same goal, aid each other, complement each other, and become ever more alike in the practice of virtue under the active influence of God; the necessity of grace is reduced ultimately to a weakness of man with regard to certain actions which are too difficult.

However, as theologians began to search more for the *intellectus fidei* in Pauline texts, it became more and more apparent that the psychologico-moral concept could not give an ultimate explanation of the *nova creatura*. How is a baptized baby justified before the use of reason? Why have the most penetrating intellects and the strongest wills an absolute need of grace? The inadequacies of the earlier dynamic concept forced theologians to advance, to surpass the categories of motion, of psychological activity, and of moral conduct. The new categories were taken from Aristotelian philosophy; by applying to revealed truth the concepts of a philosophy of being (for example, the concepts of ontological perfection, of habit, and of formal cause), theologians became occupied, not as before almost exclusively with becoming, but with being, i.e., with the state in which reality is found; and in order to understand vital actions, they found it necessary to take into account vital principles. In this perspective, grace meant principally a permanent habit, sanctifying grace; the renovation of the Christian is situated in

the new state in which he is placed by a new form; he is a son of God, inasmuch as he participates in the nature of the Father; he is the temple of the Holy Spirit, because the Holy Trinity dwells in him, giving him a permanent capacity to know and love God in a manner which is not proportioned to his nature; the members of the Mystical Body are so constituted by being informed by the same soul; the necessity of grace follows from the principle that actions must be proportioned to the being from which they proceed.

According to A., the difference between these two ways of expressing the same revealed data is not purely verbal; one can be asserted without thinking of the other. However, a profound analysis of one leads to the other; the two concepts are actually two complementary aspects of the same truths considered from different points of view. Furthermore, the transition from one to the other was not conscious; succeeding authors, repeating the same formulas, displaced insensibly the former emphasis on the dynamic and stressed the ontological.

A. concludes by asking the explanation of a change which was so universal and constant; he does not attempt to give more than tentative answers. Admitting various considerations pointed out by Landgraf, Auer, Dettlof, and Bouillard, A. feels that, taken alone, they cannot be the ultimate answer; his research has shown that the two concepts manifest themselves not merely in one or another isolated aspect of the doctrine of grace, but rather penetrate all the perspectives of supernatural anthropology. He offers two interesting theories to explain these two concepts. The first is based on the modern theory of thought patterns (cf. H. Leisegang, *Denkformen* [2nd ed.; Berlin, 1951]). It is a commonly recognized fact that typological diversities produce different patterns of thought (*Denkformen*); furthermore, one type may be succeeded by another; experts in child psychology teach that something similar takes place in the individual history of every man: after the predominant sway of categories of motion, there follows the category of the permanent object, i.e., of being. This and similar examples confirm the fact that there can be different currents within the ambit of Christian thought, because the same truths are considered either under the categories of life and motion, or under the categories of being and ontological perfection; within these limits, Bouillard's metaphor (cf. H. Bouillard, *Conversion et grâce* [Paris, 1944] pp. 211-24), which was so heatedly discussed, corresponds to reality: the truths of faith are identical in two different concepts, even as the same musical melody can be expressed in different tonalities. Further research into the laws by which an identical truth can be not only expressed but also conceived in varying mentalities is perhaps one of the most fertile aspects of the problem of the development of dogma.

Finally, A. points out that the two concepts of grace are intimately connected with the medieval problem of Augustinianism and Aristotelianism. The heart of the problem is whether the doctrinal conflicts of the thirteenth century were between two schools, each of which had something positive to assert, or whether they simply manifested two phases in the penetration of Aristotelianism. Here A. notes with great wisdom that the diversity of various schools of theological thought can be compared with the diversity of differing schools of spirituality in loving the same good. But varying schools of spirituality can never be reduced to a simple formula; they are complex realities, produced by various causes, i.e., arising from an irreversible combination of material, affective and intellectual influences. The same must be said in explanation of varying schools of theological thought; it would, then, be erroneous to attempt to reduce historical forms of Christian thought as rich and splendid as Augustinianism and Aristotelianism to one factor alone.

In his last sentence, A. points out that there is an intimate connection between the fruit of his research and one of the most vital problems of contemporary theology: the notable progress in the concept of supernatural anthropology during the thirteenth century became possible only when theologians succeeded in expressing traditional doctrine in the mental forms of their time; does this not justify one of the most acutely felt trends among modern theologians?

One of the most deeply felt needs of our age is the urgent necessity of imparting universally the doctrine and intensifying the life of the Mystical Body, which stresses the fact of our ontological (and not merely moral or affective) elevation through the grace-shared communication of all Christians in the Spirit of Christ. Hence the following personal reflections on the causes of the medieval transition from the psychologico-moral outlook on grace to the ontological may be timely. In addition to the factors influencing this change brought out by A., it would be interesting to evaluate the influence of the Greek Fathers, and also to carry out in the same medieval writers a comparative study of this transition with the evolution of the dogma and theology of original sin. The result of such a study, I am inclined to think, would show an increasing awareness of the gratuity of our divinization, not merely for fallen human nature, but for all created spiritual beings. Transcending and yet pervading these and all other human factors, there was unmistakably the infallible guidance of the Holy Spirit; of this we can be sure because of subsequent dogmatic orientations espoused by the magisterium from the time of Trent to our own era, principally in the two great Encyclicals, *Divinum illud munus* of Leo XIII, and *Mystici corporis* of Pius XII.



As a result of this unmistakable dogmatic development, are we not constrained to accept the fact that the psychologico-moral outlook on grace, as developed in the history of Augustinianism up to the thirteenth century, is totally inadequate as an explanation of our supernatural life, unless it is clearly seen to be grounded in and to flow from the permanent ontological fact of the *nova creatura*? Can there be any authentic Christian psychology or genuine Christian morality which does not spring from the realized awareness of faith that the entire dynamism of Christianity, whether intellectual or moral, is a combined dynamism of the Spirit and of the *homo pneumatikos*, one who shares, not merely the thoughts and sentiments of Christ by way of moral imitation, but who also shares ontologically and permanently, by a new Spirit-communicated soul, the very life of Christ Himself? Cannot we then say that the manifest trend of medieval exegesis was a movement primarily of the Spirit to recapture and penetrate ever more profoundly, through many secondary human factors, the authentic meaning of St. Paul, for whom the exigencies of the New Law and its demands on our intellectual and moral activity are impossible of fulfilment except in our conscious and complete responsiveness to the "good tidings" that in Christ we have been made "the workmanship of God, created anew in Jesus Christ unto good works which God has made ready beforehand that we should walk in them" (Eph 2:10)? Without any doubt, this fundamental doctrine of Christianity was obscured by Nominalism and its influence on Reformation doctrine, by the *Aufklärung* and its divorce of morals from revealed truth, and, within the Church, not only by the inevitable though indirect repercussion of these errors, but also by the overemphasis on actual grace due to the sterile *odium theologicum* following as the aftermath of the bitter controversies *De auxiliis*.

In our era of prolonged and acute crisis, which can demand for any of us, and has demanded for so many, particularly in Fr. Alszeghy's beloved homeland, the extreme of heroic virtue in the practice of Christian faith, hope, charity, and the ultimate sacrifice of martyrdom, all Christians need to know the dignity, sublimity, and God-given strength of their heritage in Christ, who has conquered triumphantly the powers of darkness, and in whom alone we can be victorious. The entire trend of the development of the dogmas concerning supernatural anthropology has been to show, gradually and indeed with periods of obscurity, the profound meaning of the one fatal choice confronting each individual in history, i.e., the choice of following either the first or the second Adam, the *homo vetus* or the *Homo novissimus*. The test of the sincerity and depth of our Christianity in this age of radical change and total struggle between good and evil may well be, in the final

judgment of God, the degree of our wholehearted acceptance of the Catholic dogma expressed liturgically by the Church on Holy Saturday: "O felix culpa, quae tantum et talem meruit redemptorem."

Weston College

PHILIP J. DONNELLY, S.J.

AN APPROACH TO THE THEOLOGY OF THE SACRAMENTS. By Neville Clark. Naperville, Illinois: Allenson, 1956. Pp. 96. \$1.50.

The volumes which make up the series, *Studies in Biblical Theology*, are intended to promote the study of that branch of theology by making available to clergy and laity "the best work in Biblical scholarship both in this country and abroad." The present monograph is a real contribution to the achieving of that goal.

The book is divided into three main sections: a study of baptism, a study of the Eucharist, and the presentation in summary form of the theology of these two sacraments. In the treatment of each sacrament a discussion of its significance is preceded by a presentation of the results of scriptural investigations of these sacraments as conducted by the moderate branch of the liberal wing of Protestantism. The exegete will find this section of the work interesting, but it will merely furnish him with a compact summary of thought developed more at length elsewhere. But this summary is essential to C.'s purpose, and contributes considerably to the value of the book. It enables him to keep close contact with reality, biblical reality, in the properly theological sections of the book, and thus to avoid any neglect of the relevant biblical material, a neglect which, as the author notes, frequently has marred former efforts at formulating a theology of the sacraments. From the standpoint of sacramental theology the most interesting and important chapters of the book are the two devoted to a study of the significance of baptism and the Eucharist, respectively, and the final chapter (from which the book borrows its title), in which C. considers the moment of the two sacraments in relation to each other, and against the whole background of revelation.

C. finds the scriptural account of growth in the realization of baptism to be homogeneous in its development. It is only with St. Paul that the scriptural treatment of baptism will reach its full splendor, but Paul is fully aware of the fact that he stands in a historical tradition. There is a tension between the rite of baptism as practised by John and the fulfilment of that rite in the death, resurrection, and ascension of Christ. But the tension is that between dawn and noon. In its ultimate significance John's rite was clearly eschatological, and Christ is the *eschaton* to which John and his rite pointed.

In only one respect did C.'s masterful treatment of the Eucharist seem

just a little less sure than his handling of the sacrament of baptism. Thus, he offers no convincing reason for his statement that the Last Supper was only the promise and rehearsal for the first Eucharist (p. 61). If the Last Supper was only a rehearsal for "making eucharist," then what becomes of the reality of the consecratory formula on the lips of Christ? Such a conception jeopardizes not so much the sacrificial as the sacramental reality of the Eucharist. This is not to imply that C. neglects a consideration of either aspect of the Eucharistic reality. Quite the contrary. His explanation of the Eucharist as communion in sacrifice, union with Christ in His will to die for all men, is extremely well done. Similarly, he accomplishes the difficult feat of being both clear and yet faithful to Pauline thought in delineating the sacramental role of the Eucharist in establishing identity between the incarnate body of Christ and His resurrection body which is the Church.

It is this sustained emphasis on the Mystical Body which is the most striking feature of the book. In formulating the guiding concepts of sacramental theology, C. subsumes them under three main categories: the Christological, the ecclesiological, and the eschatological—a threefold aspect of a single context. He is obviously correct in his conviction that only within such a framework can a sacramental theology have meaning. And, if the three guiding principles may be reduced to one, surely it is the second of the three which most merits attention in any theology of the sacraments; for the sacraments are the activity of the resurrection body of Christ which is the Church. Indeed, it augurs well for the future of modern theologizing on the sacraments that their relation to the Church is more and more being investigated by Protestant and Catholic scholars alike. In the final analysis, the penetrating of the relationship between sacraments and Church is the theology of the sacraments. In his excellent monograph C. does much to further that penetration.

*Weston College*

EDWARD R. CALLAHAN, S.J.

**THEOBALD, ARCHBISHOP OF CANTERBURY.** By Avrom Saltman. London: University of London, 1956. Pp. xvi + 594. \$8.00.

The tragic story of Thomas à Becket so dominates the ecclesiastical affairs of twelfth-century England that the stature of other contemporary churchmen is largely diminished. This is true of Theobald, who preceded Thomas in the See of Canterbury. In fact he is considered, when considered at all, as one of the small ciphers between Anselm and the martyred Saint, although his career became as decisive and stormy when he attempted to set

solutions to the problems of *regnum* and *sacerdotium*. To reassess his importance and place him in proper emphasis is the object of this study, and since the chronicles and annalistic sources of the Middle Ages are not conspicuous for transmitting enlightened evaluations of the characters of their times, it has been pursued with singular caution and often heroic scholarship.

As a result Theobald emerges from this biography as an able administrator who accomplishes his office with an honesty and vigor that earned the respect even of his foes. Perhaps his greatest achievement was the ability to survive in power during a long episcopacy (1139-61), while sustaining a dual loyalty to a king harassed by the insistent claims of the Angevins, and to a series of popes apparently indifferent, often hostile to his policies. This led him through an intricate shifting of allegiance and a long quest for legatine powers from Rome to strengthen his see and the Church in England.

The author, however, does not bring Theobald to life in these pages. He is writing rather for the professional historian and offers a carefully compiled mass of data that will serve as a rich source for any further study of this period. For this same purpose he has edited in the second part of the volume some three hundred of Theobald's charters, and this project alone gives the book a special value. After an introduction explaining the peculiarities of medieval chancery practice, including an interesting study of the harangues, he introduces the charters with all the critical apparatus to make this effort a welcome advance in the field of diplomatics.

*Alma College*

EDWARD D. McSHANE, S.J.

MAZZINI AND THE SECRET SOCIETIES. By E. E. Y. Hales. New York: Kenedy, 1956. Pp. xii + 226. \$4.95.

The author of the recent well-received *Pio Nono* turns now to one of the idols in the Italian unification movement which terminated that Pontiff's temporal dominion. The result is a lucid, closely-written volume aimed at a wide audience, temperate and scholarly, more so than the sparing resort to references might suggest. Its balance and objectivity provide a welcome novelty in treatments of the Risorgimento. To contemporary conservative statesmen Mazzini was the cloak-and-dagger revolutionary par excellence; to Italians since, he has been *Il Santo*, *Il Grande*, or more commonly *Il Profeta*. The present approach is obvious from the subtitle, *The Making of a Myth*. Less than half the subject's career is covered; but these thirty-two years, if largely a record of frustrations, form a unit as the creative ones during which Mazzini worked out his complete program and built his

legendary reputation. The narrative breaks off with the start in 1837 of the long London exile, not terminated until the uprising of 1848 returned the expatriate to Rome to replace Pius IX as first triumvir of the new republic.

Attention is focused on what Hales rightly conceives to be most important: Mazzini's person and his all-absorbing activities in secret societies. Analysis of the patriot's teachings, excellently done, is reserved for the final chapter. Obscurity necessarily shrouds the doings of a hunted conspirator. But by patient utilization of available sources, including the hundred published tomes of Mazzini's writings and correspondence, the author pieces together a remarkable amount of detail. He finds the talented, studious youth an early rebel against all authority, involved in secret organizations as a schoolboy. Inevitably the Carbonari of Genoa added another member, who three years later at the age of twenty-five landed in prison. Once released, Mazzini founded his own society, Young Italy, which advocated as the bounden duty of all fellow countrymen a struggle even to death to unite the entire peninsula as an independent republic with its capital at Rome. When in 1834 the invasion of Savoy, chiefly at Mazzini's instigation, blundered into a fiasco, Young Italy gave way to an association of wider scope, Young Europe.

The driving force behind all this consecrated effort, the determining factor in devising down to minutiae a new nation, was a novel religion; for politics to Mazzini was merely a branch of religion. A child of the rationalistic Enlightenment, nurtured on study of Italy's past grandeur (though with surprisingly little first-hand knowledge of or contact with contemporary Italy), French revolutionary philosophers, Lamennais, and the romantic poets, this passionate visionary fashioned his own religion of humanity to replace a moribund Christianity and an already-dead papacy (a commentary on his prophetic gift). His God was that of deism, remote from the universe once He set it in motion and bestowed on humanity the fundamental Law of Progress. This Law, mainspring of the Mazzinian system, is meant to perfect humanity, interpreter of the divine will, as men gradually discern its intimations. Incited by his creed to view life as a mission, with martyrdom the supreme test of faith, Mazzini subordinated all private or family endeavors to the ultimate goal of an association of peoples into nations. The envisioned era of peace must be inaugurated by Italians; and so the Third Rome is to give the word of unity to the world, as the Rome of the Caesars and Popes did formerly.

Sympathetic yet alert to shortcomings, Hales probes with mild, good-humored cynicism the many defects of Mazzini as a thinker and man of action. He makes clear that this woolly-minded religious system never won more than a handful of converts. And Italy once united looked elsewhere for

political guidance. Mazzini emerges from these pages as a fanatic, rigidly doctrinaire, at war with competing ideologies of fellow partisans. Among revolutionaries he excelled as a vigorous, prolific writer; but his slight administrative capacity, poor practical judgment, and wildly impatient temperament ill suited a leader. His moral stature diminishes as H. unfolds his relations with Giuditta Sidoli, his resort to lying as a tool, and his implication in assassination plots against two rulers, one of whom, King Louis Philippe of France, was a very remote obstruction. The myth unmade is not, however, allowed to rob him of a halo merited by unstinted devotion to a cause outside himself, a sacrifice to poverty, loneliness, despair—Italy's man of sorrows. Some of his ideas have fascinated statesmen to our day; but it was from his personal example above all that his historical influence radiated. This force, exercised on men's minds and hearts, is intangible, an elusive measurement which the book prudently refrains from assaying precisely. A second volume completing the story is by all means to be encouraged.

*Weston College*

JOHN F. BRODERICK, S.J.

LES VOIES DE DIEU: LA VIE RELIGIEUSE ET LES INSTITUTS SÉCULIERS. By J. Perinelle, O.P. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1956. Pp. 526.

In the fast-moving world of today, where attempts are being made to banish not merely Christ but the very notion of God; where economic, social, and political structures are changing; where standards of morals are not what they used to be; where women enjoy a freedom and a participation in public and professional life not formerly theirs, there are men and women, whether teen-agers or older, who are looking for God and His Christ and a closer union with Them. Not all of them feel called to the same forms or to the same degrees of union. To try to meet this desire of knowing the various ways God has of calling souls to a closer union, whether in the married or the single state, whether in the world or in one of the various forms of religious life, is the purpose of the present volume.

Naturally, then, the opening chapter treats of the call of Christ, the two signs of vocations, i.e., interior inclination and necessary fitness, and the importance of making the correct response to the call. While, in general, the author summarizes moral and canonical requisites for the religious life and points out very well that the impediments to the religious life are often ways which God employs to show a person that he or she either does not belong in any form of religious life or at least not in this particular community, he never mentions any of the impediments themselves but merely advises the reader to consult some canonical commentary. In a book designedly written

to help a person to learn what Christ's call for him or her may be, this omission of all consideration of the impediments seems regrettable, especially since the author is at pains to treat, at least in summary form, all the various types of vows, forms of religious life, etc.

The first two grades of canonical perfection, religious institutes properly so called and societies of common life, are very briefly treated, while a great deal more space is given to the nature and work of the third canonical state of perfection, secular institutes.

In his treatment of the strictly contemplative form of religious life, P. notes (pp. 172-73) that recently there have been founded one community of men, *Petits Frères de Jésus* (1933), and two communities of women, *Petites Soeurs du Sacré-Coeur* (1933) and *Petites Soeurs de Jésus* (1939), which are strictly contemplative but do not cut themselves off from the world by monastic cloister, but rather by excluding all direct apostolate and all organized activity remain visible to the people and thus give perceptible witness to the gospel.

Various fundamental virtues are treated at length. Accordingly, faith is stressed in a way to counteract the attitude of much of today's world by emphasizing belief, first, in God as the infinite Good, as Creator, as omnipresent; secondly, in Christ as our Redeemer. Then follows a further study of the doctrines on grace and the Mystical Body. Charity as *the* law of Christ, whether a person lives in the world or in religious life, is explained and illustrated for practice both negatively and positively. Next, the virtue of religion is taken up, with a special section on the meaning of the priesthood of the people, as well as a complete chapter on the place of the liturgy in the spiritual life.

With all this as basic, the author discusses at length the three evangelical counsels. All the chapters on the counsels consider not only religious but also persons whose vocation keeps them in the world as single or married. In the study of each counsel there is first a definition with its explanation; then the historical development of the doctrine and the practice of the counsel; finally, various practices and problems connected with the counsel today. In discussing the problem of particular friendships, P. notes very well that this designation is a very unhappy choice of names for the fault mentioned, since its meaning is ambiguous. Even the most virtuous friendship is particular, since it is directed towards one person. Thus, the friendship between Christ and the Apostle John was a particular friendship but not, of course, in the derogatory sense. A fine chapter is devoted to the spiritual fecundity of chastity and offers inspiration to all whether inside or outside the religious state.

Finally, it may be of interest to learn that the now universal practice of the Church to have constitutions of religious communities contain a provision stating that constitutional articles which are not repetitions of divine law or of ecclesiastical laws already binding under sin, do not of themselves oblige under pain of sin, was first introduced into constitutions by the General Chapter of the Order of Preachers in 1236 (p. 489, note 2).

West Baden College

JAMES I. O'CONNOR, S.J.

A COMPLETE INDEX OF THE SUMMA THEOLOGICA OF ST. THOMAS AQUINAS. By Roy J. Deferrari and Sister M. Inviolata Barry, C.D.P. Washington: Catholic University of America Press, 1956. Pp. x + 386. \$20.00.

The world of philosophical research will long be indebted to the editors of this volume. Eight years ago, their *Lexicon of St. Thomas Aquinas* was a major event in the field of Thomistic scholarship. Based on the *Summa theologica* and selected passages of St. Thomas' other works, the *Lexicon* won universal admiration for the skill and patience of its authors. Better still, they announced their intention of soon publishing a concordance of the *Summa theologica* and eventually a dictionary of St. Thomas which would take all of his works into account. Such works were sorely needed; the *Tabula aurea* of Peter of Bergamo, the *Thomas-Lexikon* of Schütz, the indices of the Leonine edition, and, more recently, the *Dictionnaire* of Pègues had been of invaluable help, but what was needed for the perfect precision of scholarship was a first-class, exhaustive concordance and dictionary.

The present concordance to the *Summa* fulfils the first promise of the editors of the *Lexicon*, and is a long stride forward in the development of the tools of Thomistic research. A work of more than sixteen years and involving one-and-a-half million cards, the *Index* is invaluable for all students of St. Thomas, of Scholastic philosophy, and of medieval Latin grammar, vocabulary, and style. The editors have used the Leonine edition for the text of the *Summa*, but have been careful to include the matter which appears only in the Vivès edition, and have appended a table of important variants at the end of the concordance.

Since this work deals only with the frequency of words in the *Summa*, there is no indication of their meaning. In this respect, there is a significant gap between the *Lexicon*, which dealt with the usual meaning(s) of words found in the *Summa*, and the *Index*, which lists exhaustively every place in which a given word occurs. A rapid survey of the listings reveals some expected and some unexpected facts: St. Thomas' favorite verbs are *dicere*, *facere*, *habere*, *posse*, and *procedere*; his favorite nouns, *actus*, *Deus*, *homo*,



*ratio*, and *virtus*; his favorite adjectives, *bonus*, *magnus*, *secundus*, *tertius*, and *unus*. Readers may find the system of citation baffling at first, but a little practice soon renders it easily comprehensible; and considering the economy made possible by reducing the code to its barest minimum, the editors were fully justified in adopting their system.

In spite of the magnificent contribution made by this volume, however, it still remains true that Thomistic scholars are seriously in need of a concordance and dictionary for the whole of St. Thomas' works. The major obstacle to such compilations is the simple fact of 13,000,000 words—the sheer mass of the literary remains of the Angelic Doctor. The purely mechanical task of transcription, verification, analysis, and collation of such an enormous variety of data is a prospect to dismay the most sanguine and indomitable student of St. Thomas. Time is a more serious impediment even than money. Last October, Robert Busa, S.J., a professor at a seminary near Milan, announced what appears to be at least a partial solution to the problem. The mechanical marvels of IBM are to be harnessed in the service of St. Thomas; with punched cards or magnetic tape, these machines “can speedily prepare an index of all the words and ideas encountered in the writings of even the most prolific philosophers or scientists” (*America*, Oct. 13, 1956, p. 26). The pilot-operation chosen by Fr. Busa and Mr. Tasman of IBM is a concordance of the works of St. Thomas. A somewhat similar technique has been successfully employed for the recording and searching of scientific abstracts at the Center for Documentation and Communication Research of the School of Library Science at Western Reserve University. Readers interested in the theory and possible applications of this technology should consult James W. Perry, Allen Kent, and Madeline M. Berry, *Machine Literature Searching* (New York and London: Interscience Publishers, 1956).

While I have no desire to dispute the potential of IBM's products, some of which can unquestionably do more sorting, typing, and filing in one day than a whole army of stenographers, I find it difficult to believe that any machine now or hereafter constructed will be able to index the *ideas* of any philosopher worthy of the name. His words, yes; they are symbols, after all, and a properly coded machine could undoubtedly tell us exactly how often *forma* occurs in St. Thomas within a far shorter time than any other means we now possess. Indeed, these machines are capable of far greater complexities and could give us invaluable statistical information which we can acquire by no other method. But unless the mechanists are right after all, I do not see how push-button lexicography can enable us to feed electronic signals in one end and take out a philosophical dictionary at the other. And

it is precisely in the idea symbolized by the word, whether expressed by alphabetic or electronic signals, that an integral part of philosophy lies.

Technological foreshortening of the mechanical part of lexicographical research will prove to be of immense importance in the future. But the men behind the machines will never become dispensable, precisely because words are only the shells of thought, and only men can think. And while we wait for the skilled technicians who do not have the faintest idea of what *educi de potentia materiae* means, to tell us exactly how often it occurs in the works of St. Thomas, we can never be grateful enough for the untiring, unselfish, and scholarly labor of the editors of this concordance to the *Summa*.

Woodstock College

CHARLES M. WHELAN, S.J.

### SHORTER NOTICES

ST BASIL THE GREAT AND APOLLINARIS OF LAODICEA. By G. L. Prestige; edited by Henry Chadwick. London: S.P.C.K., 1956. Pp. x + 68. \$2.00. The authorship of *Epp.* 361–64 in the corpus of Basil's letters became a matter of new interest in 1892 with the publication of J. Dräseke's *Apollinarios von Laodicea*. Against their general reputation as spurious (established by Cotelier), Dräseke sought to establish their authenticity. His arguments, however, convinced only a few; the later independent work of Bolotoff had no greater success. In this posthumous work, Dr. Prestige presents a fresh, cogent, and persuasive defense of their genuinity. After a careful examination of their fit with the known historical circumstances of Basil and Apollinaris, he compares their style and vocabulary with indisputably authentic writings and ably shows that Basil, so far from denying the correspondence in 375, actually admitted that he had written at least one letter. The "Eustathian Document" which Basil did deny writing, P. believes to have been the work of Apollinaris. He has provided an English translation of the correspondence and the Document, as well as the Greek text of the latter. An appendix reprints a brief address of P. at the First Congress of Patristic Studies (Oxford, 1951) on "Ancient Misrepresentation of Apollinaris."

Charles M. Whelan, S.J.

GRÉGOIRE DE NYSSE: LA VIE DE MOÏSE OU TRAITÉ DE LA PERFECTION EN MATIÈRE DE VERTU. Introduction and translation by Jean Daniélou, S.J. 2nd ed. rev., augmented with critical text. *Sources chrétiennes* 1<sup>bis</sup>.

Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1955. Pp. xxxv + 155 (1-135 double). The revised Volume 1 of *Sources chrétiennes* supplants the original on three counts. (1) In 1942 SC presented Gregory of Nyssa's *Life of Moses* in French dress alone: the PG text was too defective to justify reprinting, and the circumstances of the time had prevented Père Daniélou from completing a collation of MSS undertaken in 1937. The revised work contains an edition based on D.'s collation of ten MSS representing all three families of the tradition, and so we are assured of a correct text, the while we await the *editio maior* promised by Werner Jaeger. (2) The *Life of Moses* is now presented in its entirety, whereas in the original volume Gregory's historical résumé preceding the spiritual contemplation was omitted, for fear of repelling the non-professional reader at the very birth of SC. (3) Progress realized in the study of Gregory since 1942 has occasioned changes in D.'s Introduction. In particular, D.'s researches on the chronology of Gregory allow him to begin with an historical exposition which situates the *Life of Moses* (ca. 392)—an exposition which scholars cannot afford to disregard. The introductory section on Gregory's spiritual doctrine has been omitted; for this the reader is referred to D.'s *Platonisme et théologie mystique* (2nd ed.; Paris, 1954). The notes have been considerably enriched, and a ten-page index of Greek words has been added. Actually, we have here a new book rather than a revised edition.

*Walter J. Burghardt, S.J.*

**SAINT JÉRÔME: SUR JONAS.** Introduction, Latin text, translation, and notes by Dom Paul Antin, O.S.B. *Sources chrétiennes* 43. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1956. Pp. 135 (50-118 double). Jerome's *In Ionam* (396) ranks among his best commentaries. In his Introduction (pp. 7-47) Antin disengages Jerome's exegetical technique from his commentaries on the prophets, and concludes that, as an exegete, Jerome was largely a popularizer who skilfully linked Antiochene literalism and Alexandrian spiritualism. A. reveals the principal theme of the *Jonas* (Jonas as type of the Savior), shows its patristic predecessors, touches on its citations from Scripture and profane authors, notes its fidelity to Jerome's customary method of exegesis (literal sense, spiritual sense), and appraises the language and style. The text is Vallarsi's (1768; reproduced in *PL* 25, with an omission at the end of 1, 3), slightly retouched, especially for orthography. A. supplies a list of MSS which could be of service to future editors. The French translation is fluent and unaffected; the notes are generous, with the accent on the lexical and with copious cross-references.

*Walter J. Burghardt, S.J.*

RUFINUS: A COMMENTARY ON THE APOSTLES' CREED. Translated and annotated by J. N. D. Kelly. *Ancient Christian Writers* 20. Westminster, Md.: Newman; London: Longmans Green, 1955. Pp. 166. \$2.75. A characteristically admirable volume in the series edited by Johannes Quasten and Joseph C. Plumpe. In his Introduction (pp. 3-27) Dr. Kelly outlines briefly Rufinus' life, personality, and literary legacy; he sketches the literary genre to which the *Commentary* belongs (Cyril of Jerusalem's *Catecheses* 6-18; the fifth of Nicetas' *Libelli instructionis*; Ambrose's *Explanatio symboli ad initiandos*; Augustine's *De fide et symbolo*); he shows its dependence (despite its air of originality) on the Church's stock of catechetical commonplaces, on Gregory of Nyssa's *Oratio catechetica*, and on Cyril's *Catecheses*; he indicates its importance for the glimpse it gives of popular Christian propaganda at the beginning of the fifth century, and for its testimony to the evolution of credal forms; and he notes Rufinus' use of the *Vetus latina* and his canon of Scripture. The English translation is based on the Latin text of Vallarsi (Verona, 1742; reprinted in *PL* 21, 335-86), and combines fidelity to the original with an attractive fluidity. Sixty-three pages of notes—historical, theological, scriptural, lexical—explain and enrich the text.

Walter J. Burghardt, S.J.

PIERRE DAMIEN ET LA CULTURE PROFANE. By J. Gonsette, S.J. *Essais philosophiques* 7. Louvain: Publications Universitaires de Louvain, 1956. Pp. 104. 60 fr.b. St. Peter Damiani, who once said that "grammar" was an invention of the devil, is commonly portrayed as one of the most extreme representatives of medieval anti-intellectualism. His invectives against the study of profane literature echo Augustine and Jerome; but, like theirs, they are frequently written in elegant Latin and richly embellished with classical allusions. Damiani's contempt for the dialectics of his age was still more vigorously expressed; he is often quoted to the effect that God could, if He wished, dispense with the principle of contradiction, reverse the order of time, and unmake everything He made (this in connection with the famous eleventh-century dispute *de reparatione corruptae*). In this short essay, Gonsette seeks to reappraise the cultural and philosophical outlook of Damiani, on the basis of a thorough study of his writings, his life, and the period in which he lived. The evidence shows clearly that the targets of Damiani's attack were much more narrow and legitimate than generally supposed; the "culture" he belittled was the "world" of St. John, and the dialectic he reviled the eleventh-century forerunner of modern logical empiricism. He knew how to appreciate secular literature intelligently and

to use it wisely in the service of God; so far from denying the principle of contradiction, he maintained it absolutely, but interpreted it as a consequence of the perfection of God, not as a limit on His omnipotence.

**HOOKER'S THEOLOGY OF COMMON PRAYER.** By John S. Marshall. Sewanee, Tenn.: University of the South Press, 1956. Pp. x + 186. A paraphrase and expansion of the fifth book of Hooker's *Ecclesiastical Polity* into a commentary on the Anglican Book of Common Prayer. Modeled on Lane Cooper's reconstructions of Aristotle, the present work is not so much a study as a rewrite of Hooker's theology of public worship and the sacraments. Prof. Marshall is well aware of Hooker's debt to the Scholastic tradition and, in particular, to St. Thomas Aquinas; he has endeavored to make appropriate strands of Scholastic philosophy and theology the warp of his rewoven "tapestry of Hooker's thought." Since M.'s purpose was simply to restate Hooker's doctrine for the benefit of modern churchmen in a more clear, explicit, and synthetic fashion than that of its original formulation, he has not been careful to indicate how much of his amalgam is attributable directly to Hooker, how much to Scholasticism, and how much to himself. As a result, his work is significant as a modern restatement and interpretation of Hooker, but not (as he himself concedes) as a critical study or evaluation.

**THE HIGH CHURCH PARTY 1688-1718.** By George Every, S.S.M. London: S.P.C.K., 1956. Pp. xvi + 196. \$4.50. Those whose knowledge of the "High Church Party" is limited to the familiar, uncritical concept of a suspiciously papist liturgical movement within the Church of England will do well to read this learned monograph on the first thirty years of the High Church. Nonconformists and Non-jurors alike, not to mention the other religious and political currents of the times, raised serious problems of religious freedom, ecclesiastical discipline, orthodoxy, and the relations of Church and state. In the face of these issues, High Churchmen attempted to construct a systematic theory of the divine right of the sacred ministry and of the independence and jurisdiction of the episcopacy, on the basis of Scripture and the practice of the primitive Church. The history of their efforts, their successes, and their failures is an interesting commentary on the fate of a church burdened with too much political and too little ecclesiastical authority.

**FAITH AND PREJUDICE; AND OTHER UNPUBLISHED SERMONS OF CARDINAL NEWMAN.** Edited by the Birmingham Oratory. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1956. Pp. 128. \$2.50. There are here published for the first time nine

sermons which Newman delivered after his entrance into the Catholic Church. The first seven form a unit, having all been preached during the year 1848, three years after the author's conversion. The last two sermons of the collection were preached much later, in 1870 and 1873 respectively. The volume has a brief introduction, by C. Stephen Dessain of the Oratory, which outlines Newman's preaching activities during his early years as a Catholic and the significance of the sermons in the collection.

HERE AND HEREAFTER. By George A. St. Paul, S.J. Westminster: Newman, 1956. Pp. xii + 299. \$4.50. This instructive and inspiring popular presentation of the main themes of the Exercises of St. Ignatius will be welcomed in particular by laymen active in the lay retreat movement. The two main divisions of the work consider man's relationships with God and with Christ from many different aspects and point up the path to spiritual progress: first lay a solid foundation acknowledging dependence upon God, then build on Christ. Designed for use as a supplementary help on formal retreats and for private reading, each chapter closes with a detailed and very practical examination of conscience most helpful in applying the meditations to the problems of everyday life.

MYSTÈRES ET FÊTES DE LA VIERGE MARIE. By Dom E. Flicoteaux, O.S.B. *L'Esprit liturgique* 12. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1956. Pp. 150. In earlier numbers of this series of liturgical essays, Flicoteaux has described the temporal cycle from Advent to Pentecost; he turns now to the sanctoral cycle and begins appropriately with the share of our Lady in the liturgy of the Church. Nevertheless, as he is careful to remark in his foreword, this participation of the Mother of God may not legitimately be reduced to the feasts instituted especially in her honor. For the first five centuries the Roman liturgy honored Mary almost exclusively in the celebration of the mysteries of her Son, and F. devotes the first part of his essay to showing how large a part the hyperdoulia still plays in the temporal cycle. Thereafter he considers the feasts of her Immaculate Conception, Assumption, and Nativity; many ancient and modern feasts of devotion; her share in the daily liturgy of the Mass and the Office; the Little Office of the Blessed Virgin; and the Office and Mass in her honor on ferial Saturdays. An appendix on the *Salve regina* meditates the anthem word by word and could well serve as the basis of a sermon on this famous hymn.

LES LIVRES LITURGIQUES DE L'EGLISE CHALDÉENNE 1. By C. Moussess. Beyrouth: La Photo-Press, 1955. Pp. xxi + 159. The purpose of this doctoral dissertation, sponsored by the Pontifical Institute of Oriental

Studies, is to promote knowledge of the Chaldean liturgy and rites. M. is aware that others have dealt with the subject before him, but he insists that their studies cover only a part of the vast material in question. His principal sources are the editions of Chaldean books published in Rome, Persia, Constantinople, and Mossoul, and MSS personally consulted in the Vatican Library and the Bibliothèque Nationale de Paris. The present volume presents the teaching of the Chaldean liturgical books concerned with the administration of the sacraments. Volume 2 will, M. hopes, treat the Chaldean books of the divine office.

**SAINT PETER DAMIANI AND HIS CANONICAL SOURCES.** By J. Joseph Ryan. *Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Studies and Texts 2.* Toronto, 1956. Pp. xviii + 214. In this "preliminary study of the antecedents of the Gregorian Reform," Fr. Ryan makes a notable contribution to our knowledge of the sources of canon law in the eleventh century. As Stephan Kuttner remarks in his preface, modern studies have uncovered the complex currents in the Roman Reform and investiture struggle and have disclosed a formerly unsuspected conflict within the Reform movement itself: an "unquestionable contrast in outlook and policies" between reforming canonists on fundamental issues of canon law. Fournier was the first to demonstrate the importance of source-study for information on a canonist's conception of his discipline; Ryan has followed ably in his footsteps with this analysis of the canonical sources utilized by St. Peter Damiani and of the conclusions to be drawn from the Saint's principles of selection. In an age weltering in the complexities and contradictions of its canon law, Damiani held fast to the inspiration of the *decreta sanctorum patrum*, the authority of the councils, and the legislative supremacy of the pope.

**LE DROIT DES RELIGIEUX: DU CONCILE DE TRENTE AUX INSTITUTS SÉCULIERS.** By Dom Robert Lemoine, O.S.B. *Museum Lessianum.* Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1956. Pp. 631. 400 fr. belg. An exposition of the gradual development and canonical recognition of the various later forms of religious life in the Church, from the exclusivity of solemn vows, through religious of simple vows and societies of common life, to the secular institutes of today. Special attention goes to the latter, which may be said to constitute the inspiration and focus of the book. The historical section (about two-thirds of the whole) analyzes the contributions of St. Ignatius Loyola, St. Philip Neri, St. Vincent de Paul, St. Francis de Sales, St. John Eudes, J.-J. Olier, St. Angela Merici, Mary Ward, and others, the evolutions of the nineteenth century occasioned by the French Revolution, and the work

of P.-J. de Clorivière—the more immediate preparation of the secular institute form. The remainder is a juridical study of these institutes, comprising a commentary on the pertinent documents of the Holy See, a discussion of their vows, and a comparison of their law with that of religious. There is also a survey of existing secular institutes, with a brief description of their respective purposes, membership, form of life, and canonical status.

*John J. Reed, S.J.*

PROCESSUS MATRIMONIALIS. By Joannes Torre. 3rd ed.; Naples: M. D'Auria, 1956. Pp. xi + 755. \$10.00 (paper), \$11.00 (cloth). A thorough, practical commentary on matrimonial procedure as contained in the Code of Canon Law and the Instruction *Provida mater* of the Sacred Congregation of the Sacraments, July 18, 1936. The book follows, article by article, the order and form of the Instruction, presenting at each article a general explanation and a discussion of particular questions, examples, and cases, with argued solutions and copious illustrations from the actual practice of the S. R. Rota. Extensive appendices contain relevant Roman documents and responses, formulae and specimens of all the *acta* of a process, and excerpts from significant decisions of the Rota. An extraordinarily detailed index is provided.

*John J. Reed, S.J.*

CATHOLICISME ALLEMAND. *Rencontres* 45. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1956. Pp. 564. 1.080 fr. Begun under the direction of Père Maydiou, who initiated the *Rencontres* studies of Catholicism in various countries, this collection of essays provides an extraordinarily rich and detailed survey of German Catholicism. In his introduction, Marc Gillod insists on the precision of the title; this book does not deal with the Catholic Church in Germany, but with those forms and problems of Catholic life that are peculiarly German. The complicated political and religious history of Germany, especially in the near past and present, lends this study great interest and importance. If there is any bias in the reporting, it is pro-German; all the authors are German Catholics except two, and they are Austrians. American readers will find the following essays of particular interest: Klaus Moersdorf on the relations of Church and state in Germany; L. J. Putz on German Catholics in the United States; Joseph Schneider and Paul Botta on the use of the press, motion pictures, radio, and book-publishing; two anonymous writers on Catholicism in the Soviet zone; and Franz Kusch on the incarnation of the Church in German industrial classes after the Second World War.



**RÉALISME OU IDOLATRIE.** By Yves Bouthillier. Paris: Editions du Cèdre, 1956. Pp. 142. 360 fr. In this sensitive diagnosis of the ills of the modern world, Bouthillier locates the fundamental malady in the worship of intellectual idols. The rationalism of the eighteenth century, the idealism of the nineteenth, and the Marxism of the twentieth have thoroughly corrupted human habits of thought; the possible has been confounded with the real, the concept with the fact, and desire with truth. The hopes raised by scientific and technological advances have been converted into a nightmare where the great majority of men do not have to think while they work; and still men persist in seeking truth and justice through an ever greater domination of the material universe. The sole hope for a cure lies in a return to critical realism, the traditional and truly Catholic habit of thought, with its submission to the facts of the real order and its indefatigable, painful search for truth. Only in this way can the idols of scientism, rationalism, nationalism, and, above all, communism be destroyed; only in this way can the true and the good rediscover their unique bond in the real.

**TOWARD THE SUMMIT.** By Raymond Leopold Bruckberger. New York: Kenedy, 1956. Pp. 160. \$2.75. This volume, a translation of three French works by Fr. Bruckberger, deals with the basic theme of man's search for God as the solution to the problem of human existence. Essential to the search for God is prayer and a knowledge of the dispositions necessary to bring one into the divine presence. The holiness of the saints, for whom the search has been successful, is the fruit of their imitation of Christ; and each one of us can find, among the rich variety of saints, inspiration for his own special situation and calling.

**THE SOCIAL THOUGHT OF THE WORLD COUNCIL OF CHURCHES.** By Edward Duff, S.J. New York: Association Press, 1956. Pp. xii + 339. \$7.50. The practical unity among Protestants achieved by the World Council of Churches is an historical fact that Catholics cannot ignore. The purpose of the Council, to bring the Churches together in discussion of common and divergent ideas, has never been limited to purely theological questions; from its inception it has been aware of the social obligations of its member Churches. It is significant that a Jesuit priest has undertaken a competent and complete study of the social thought of the Council. What Fr. Duff has produced is the first objective analysis of the history, nature, authority, social philosophy, and social policy of the W.C.C. from the original organization of the Life and Work Movement through the Amsterdam and Evanston assemblies. Working through successive drafts of World Council

documents at Geneva, he has clarified Protestant social attitudes on such questions as the role of the state, nuclear warfare, economic freedom, the United Nations, race relations, etc. Of particular excellence are the third and fourth chapters on the social philosophy and social policy of the Council. The "ethic of ends" (the purposes and particular functions of an ordered society discoverable by a rational examination of their nature and operation) and the "ethic of inspiration" (a fellowship with God whose will is sought for a present personal decision) are only two of the key divergent Protestant social theories that are analyzed. The first leads to "natural law," the other to highly personal biblical interpretations. Responsible society, corporate Christian influence on society, the international order, communism and capitalism, eschatology and ethics are discussed, and a valuable bibliography of primary and secondary sources and general reading closes a highly readable piece of scholarship. It will be profitably read by anyone interested in ecumenical thought and the problems of a just social order.

*John J. McDonald, S.J.*

## BOOKS RECEIVED

### *Scriptural Studies*

- Boismard, M.-E., O.P. Du baptême à Cana; Jean, 1, 19—2, 11. Paris, Éditions du Cerf, 1956. 165p. (Lectio Divina, 18)
- Internationale Zeitschriftenschau für Bibelwissenschaft und Grenzgebiete; Band III, 1954/55, Heft 1-2; hrsg. von Dr. Fridolin Stier. Düsseldorf, Patmos-Verlag, 1956. xi, 232p.
- McKenzie, John L., S.J. The two-edged sword; an interpretation of the Old Testament. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1956. ix, 314p. \$4.50
- Murphy, Roland E., O.Carm. The Dead Sea Scrolls and the Bible. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. xi, 119p. \$1.50
- Schelkle, Karl Hermann. Paulus Lehrer der Väter; die altkirchliche Auslegung von Römer 1-11. Düsseldorf, Patmos-Verlag, 1956. 458p.

### *Doctrinal Theology*

- Filas, Francis L., S.J. Joseph most just; theological questions about Saint Joseph. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1956. 141p. \$3.50
- Abárzuza, F. X. de, O.F.M.Cap. Manuale theologiae dogmaticae, II; de Deo uno, trino, creante, elevante ac de novissimis; ed. 2a. Madrid, Ediciones Studium, 1956. xxiv, 471p.

- Garrigou-Lagrange, R., O.P. *Beatitude: a commentary on St. Thomas' Theological Summa, Ia IIae, qq. 1-54*; tr. by Patrick Cummins, O.S.B. St. Louis, Herder, 1956. 397p. \$6.00
- Grillmeier, Aloys, S.J. *Der Logos am Kreuz; zur christologischen Symbolik der älteren Kreuzigungsdarstellung*. München, Max Hueber, 1956. xii, 150p. 12.80 DM
- Leeming, Bernard, S.J. *Principles of sacramental theology*. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. lviii, 690p. \$6.75
- Newman, John Henry Cardinal. *Pensées sur l'Église; traduction française par A. Roucou-Barthélémy*. Paris, Éditions du Cerf, 1956. 442p. (*Unam Sanctam*, 30)
- La Nouvelle Ève II; *Bulletin de la Société Française d'Études Mariales*, 1955. Paris, P. Lethielleux, 1956. ix, 119p.
- Piolanti, Antonio. *I Sacramenti*. Libreria Editrice Fiorentina, 1956. 712p. (*Nuovo Corso di Teologia Cattolica*, 7)
- Stephenson, Anthony A., S.J. *Anglican Orders*. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. 76p. \$1.75
- Thomas Aquinas, St. *Summa theologiae; cura et studio Instituti Studiorum Medievalium Ottaviensis tomus tertius complectens tertiam partem*, ed. 2a. Ottawa, Commissio Piana, 1953. lxxviii, [2413]—3089 cols.

*Moral and Pastoral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions*

- Ellard, Gerald, S.J. *The Mass in transition*. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1956. x, 387p. \$6.00
- Kendrick, Rev. Edward F. *Permission to write for publication; a discussion of canon 1386; reprinted from The Jurist*. Washington, Catholic U., 1956. 38p.
- The new ritual: liturgy and social order; 16th national liturgical week*, 1955. Elsberry, Mo., The Liturgical Conference, 1956. viii, 212p. \$2.00
- O'Donnell, Thomas J., S.J. *Morals in medicine*. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. xvii, 281p. \$3.75
- Ryan, J. Joseph. *Saint Peter Damiani and his canonical sources; pref. by Stephan Kuttner*. Toronto, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1956. xviii, 213p. (*Studies and Texts*, 2)
- The springs of morality: a Catholic symposium; ed. by John M. Todd*. N.Y., Macmillan, 1956. vii, 327p. \$6.00

*History and Biography, Patristics*

- Betz, Eva K. *Knight of Molokai; illus. by June Driscoll*. Paterson, N.J., St. Anthony Guild Press, 1956. vii, 154p. \$2.50

- Bihlmeyer, Karl. Kirchengeschichte; neubesorgt von Hermann Tüchle; 3. Teil: Die Neuzeit und die neueste Zeit; 11. und 12. Auflage. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1956. xv, [289]—583p.
- Bouyer, Louis. The spirit and forms of Protestantism; tr. by A. V. Little-dale. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. xi, 234p. \$3.75
- The Catholic Church, U.S.A.; ed. by Louis J. Putz, C.S.C. Chicago, Fides, 1956. xxiii, 415p. \$5.95
- The Confraternity comes of age; a historical symposium. Paterson, N.J., Confraternity Publications, 1956. xiii, 310p. \$4.00
- Dempsey, James. Mission on the Nile. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1956. xii, 247p. \$6.00
- Desautels, Alfred R., S.J. Les Mémoires de Trévoux et le mouvement des idées au XVIIIe siècle; 1701-1734. Rome, Institutum Historicum S.J., 1956. xxvii, 256p. \$4.00 (Bibliotheca Instituti Historici S.J., 8)
- Ellis, John Tracy. Documents of American Catholic history. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1956. xxiv, 677p. \$8.75
- Hales, E. E. Y. Mazzini and the secret societies: the making of a myth. N.Y., P. J. Kenedy & Sons, 1956. xi, 226p. \$4.95
- Ignatius von Loyola; seine geistliche Gestalt und sein Vermächtnis, 1556-1956. Würzburg, Echter-Verlag, 1956. 405p.
- Jesuits, biographical essays; ed. by Robert Nash, S.J. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. xvi, 230p. \$3.50
- Johnson, Rt. Rev. Msgr. Peter Leo, D.D. Halcyon days; story of St. Francis Seminary, Milwaukee, 1856-1956; foreword by The Most Reverend Albert G. Meyer, D.D. Milwaukee, Bruce, 1956. xiv, 416p. \$5.00
- McGlynn, Robert H. The Incarnation in the sermons of Saint Peter Chrysologus. Mundelein, Ill., St. Mary of the Lake Seminary, 1956. 150p.
- Martini, Teri. Treasure of the Mohawks; the story of the Indian maiden Kateri Tekakwitha; illus. by Robert Bradbury. Paterson, N.J., St. Anthony Guild Press, 1956. xiv, 113p. \$2.00
- Moreau, Jacques. La persécution du Christianisme dans l'Empire Romain. Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1956. 141p. 400 fr. (Mythes et Religions, 32)
- Mulert, Hermann. Konfessionskunde; die christlichen Kirchen und Sekten heute; hrsg. von Erdmann Schott. Berlin, Alfred Töpelmann, 1956. xxi, 557p.
- Spinka, Matthew. The Church in Soviet Russia. N.Y., Oxford Univ. Press, 1956. xi, 179p. \$3.25

*Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature*

- Bruckberger, Raymond Leopold, O.P. *Toward the summit*; tr. by Sister M. Camille, O.S.F., and Alastair Guinan. N.Y., P. J. Kenedy & Sons, 1956. 160p. \$2.75
- Brunner, August, S.J. *A new creation; towards a theology of Christian life*. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1956. 143p. \$4.75
- The doctrinal instruction of religious sisters; English version of Formation Doctrinale des Religieuses*; tr. by a Religious of the Retreat of the Sacred Heart. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. x, 193p. \$3.50 (Religious Life, 6)
- Faber, Frederick William, D.D. *Bethlehem*. Philadelphia, Peter Reilly, 1956. ix, 432p. \$3.95
- Faber, Frederick William, D.D. *The foot of the cross, or the sorrows of Mary*; new edition. Philadelphia, Peter Reilly, 1956. x, 406p. \$3.95
- St. Paul, George A., S.J. *Here and hereafter*. Westminster, Md., Newman, 1956. xii, 299p. \$4.50

*Philosophical Questions*

- Marcel, Gabriel. *Royce's metaphysics*; tr. by Virginia and Gordon Ringer. Chicago, Henry Regnery, 1956. xix, 180p. \$4.50

*Special Questions*

- A complete index of the *Summa Theologica* of St. Thomas Aquinas, by Roy J. Deferrari and Sister M. Inviolata Barry, C.D.P. Wash., D.C., Catholic Univ. Press, 1956. ix, 386p. \$20.00
- Duff, Edward, S.J. *The social thought of the World Council of Churches*. N.Y., Association Press, 1956. xii, 339p. \$7.50
- Encyclopedia of morals*; ed. by Vergilius Ferm. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1956. x, 682p. \$10.00
- Jaeger, Werner. *Humanisme et théologie*; traduction de l'anglais par H. D. Saffrey. Paris, Éditions du Cerf, 1956. 123p.
- Religionswissenschaftliches Wörterbuch*; hrsg. Franz König. Freiburg, Herder, 1956. lxiv, 954 cols.
- Révész, G. *The origins and prehistory of language*; tr. by J. Butler. N.Y., Philosophical Library, 1956. viii, 240p. \$7.50
- Weiser, Francis X. *The holyday book*; illus. by Robert Frankenberg. N.Y., Harcourt, Brace, 1956. 217p. \$3.00
- White, Victor, O.P., S.T.M. *God the Unknown and other essays*. N.Y., Harper & Bros., 1956. viii, 205p. \$3.00