

THEOLOGICAL
Studies

VOLUME 19

1958

*Published by the Theological Faculties
of the Society of Jesus in the United States*

BOOK REVIEWS

LES RITES ET LA CONDITION HUMAINE D'APRÈS DES DOCUMENTS ETHNOGRAPHIQUES. By Jean Cazeneuve. *Bibliothèque de philosophie contemporaine*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1958. Pp. 500.

Cazeneuve has given us a lengthy investigation of rituals among what used to be called "primitive" peoples (this is now a bad word among American anthropologists, so we substitute "aliterate," "non-industrialized," and the like). Of necessity, this book is also a study of the nature of tabu, magic, and religion. Let me say at the outset that it is a very good book. First I shall give a brief résumé of the thesis of this study, then an outline of the treatment afforded this thesis, and finally my few negative criticisms. Of course, the trouble with a résumé of an anthropological study is that it seems extraordinarily bloodless and remote from humanity. The examples from varied groups, particularly those of a non-Western tradition, give such a study richness and innumerable nuances.

A rite is a repetitive act, whose efficaciousness, at least in part, is of an extra-empirical order. Rites concern themselves with the impure (tabu and purificatory rites), the magical, and the religious. All of these rites deal with manifestations of the numinous (what Eliade calls a hierophany), which is set over against the ordinary human situation. This human situation (or condition—or nature?) is considered as existing in a matrix of normal rules. This, parenthetically, is noticeably true of aliterate, isolated groups, which are marked by an extreme conservatism. But conservatism is not a monopoly of "primitive" groups. Into this normal, rule-dominated life comes a manifestation of the numinous, the unusual, something difficult to deal with, a "mysterium tremendum et fascinans" (Otto). This unusual phenomenon causes spiritual anguish in the humans who experience it. Rites are mechanisms for dealing with the numinous and the attendant anguish.

Rites dealing with tabus and purifications are aimed at maintaining the familiar order of the human situation with its rules, or at restoring equilibrium. Magical rites deliberately depart from the human situation in order to control numinous powers which are opposed to this situation. Religious rites reveal a kind of synthesis between numinous forces and the human condition. They select an aspect of the numinous which may be regarded as a transcendent archetype, which is the foundation of the human situation and yet surpasses it; this archetype offers itself to human participation.

Of course, the observer in the field very often finds a confusion of the magical and the religious; in fact, he observes a spectrum, with magic at

one end and religion at the other. But what is clear in religious rituals throughout the "primitive" world is the desire to achieve a synthesis between (1) living within the well-defined ambit of ordinary human nature and experience, and (2) seizing on a power, indeed a very being, which transcends all limit.

This is the central thesis of the book. C. deals with it thus. After an introduction, which states the problem and reviews various theories concerning it, Part 1 treats of the impure: tabu, symbolism, purifications, and the future as impure—a very interesting chapter. Part 2 is on magical power: sympathetic magic; demons, charms, talismans, divination; the magician and the practice of magic; the relationships of tabu, magic, and religion. Part 3 deals with the sacred (C. reserves the word "sacré" for religion) and its consecrations: the sacred and its rites; the relationship between the sacred and myth; a very full discussion of initiation ceremonies and archetypical acts—here C. does a good job on the concept of sublimation, and also on eternity and time with relation to religious rites. Part 4 discusses the sacred and religious practice: prayer, oblation, and sacrifice.

In general, I must praise C. for very judicious use of, and critiques of, various philosophical and psychoanalytical theories concerning the various topics of the book. Negative criticisms are not many. The book as a whole is perhaps too wordy and repetitive. The bibliography is excellent, although I am amazed to find no reference to Fr. Schmidt's monumental *Ursprung der Gottesidee*. Even though the book under review is avowedly analytical and non-historical, the *Ursprung* is also a mine of case histories on religion. In general, the anthropological areas used do not include data from groups beloved of the Vienna school, such as the California Indians, the Pygmies, the Tierra del Fuegians. I also missed data from the Circumarctic, the Philippines, the Andaman Islands, much of South America, and so on. However, I am sure that the conclusions reached by the author are generally valid, in spite of these criticisms.

This study is a "must" for the theologian immersed in the study of comparative religion. I may be a traitor, as a book reviewer, but I must say that I think M. Eliade's *Patterns in Comparative Religion* more useful to the general theological reader.

Fordham University

J. FRANKLIN EWING, S.J.

PATTERNS IN COMPARATIVE RELIGION. By Mircea Eliade. Translation of *Traité d'histoire des religions* by Rosemary Sheed. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1958. Pp. xv + 484. \$6.50.

The minimum definition of religion, according to Eliade, is: the sacred is not the profane. Reserving for a later book the analysis of what really

constitutes the religious, E. starts with the Durkheimian description of the sacred. The sacred is manifested by hierophanies, kratophanies, and theophanies. Hierophanies are society's choices or segregations of objects or events that are sacred, not profane. They point to a reality beyond themselves. When they represent great cosmic events, such as the creation of the world, they are archetypes; and here a mysterious dynamism reveals itself. Archetypes create a need in men to repeat them, to reinstate or "actualize" them. Archetypes make man desire to abolish profane time and place, to live *in illo tempore*, in eternal archetypal time and place. Man is a prisoner of his archetypes and has a nostalgia for sacred time and "paradise." Archetypes are renewed by ritual, which re-enacts the primeval sacred event; by myths, which codify in words and somehow produce these events. Signs and symbols also "actualize" the archetypal events.

Such is, if the reviewer has correctly interpreted him, E.'s framework for the delineation of various types of religion. It would be difficult to find a more succinct treatment of sky-god religion and the vicissitudes of these gods. Equally competent and extensive is E.'s account of the many ramifications of planter religion with its gods and goddesses. And this encomium is valid whether one accepts the Durkheimian-Jungian framework or not. Each religion is considered in terms of the various hierophanies and the rich symbolism that manifest it.

Applied to the Australian scene, this archetypal repetitive scheme seems quite warranted—at least in regard to the sympathetic magic rituals so much in evidence there. From the data cited by E., we may perhaps extend the occurrence of this preoccupation with the archaic to other primitive peoples. But is it an adequate framework for the sacred and religious universally?

It would appear that E. accepts the Jungian doctrine of archetypes. A healthy scepticism dictates the query: do we have to invoke a collective unconsciousness to account for Jung's claims for the archetypes? Need we look beyond the individual himself and his needs and experience—including social inheritance? But E. has done us a real service by applying the Jungian pattern or fit to the phenomena of religion. Through the excellent translation of Rosemary Sheed, this work will now be extended to a wider audience. It will run the gauntlet of some necessary criticism but it will be highly appreciated, the reviewer feels. The Durkheimian-Jungian framework is not easy to understand at first; but it is a challenging and rewarding experience to try to understand and appreciate it.

AGAPÈ DANS LE NOUVEAU TESTAMENT: ANALYSE DES TEXTES 1. By C. Spicq, O.P. *Etudes bibliques*. Paris: Gabalda, 1958. Pp. 334.

It is not easy to speak with restraint of the splendid contributions of Père Spicq to the field of *NT* studies. His *L'Épître aux Hébreux* is and will remain for some time a standard work on the subject; the first serious threat to its completeness of treatment is the further development of comparative Qumrân–New Testament studies. The first volume of his new work is the second major step in the fulfilment of a plan he inaugurated a few years ago. In his view, *agapè* is a notion “so central to the New Covenant, a reality at once common to God, to Christ, and to men, and so complex in its manifestations, that it is possible to construct a theology of the New Testament in terms of charity.” That is precisely the task to which he has set himself (p. 5).

As a preliminary to such a synthesis, which S. wisely means to be as widely and solidly based as possible, he has undertaken a series of studies of the use of *agapaō* and its derivatives in pre-Christian and *NT* times. Three years ago S. brought out his *Agapè: Prolégomènes à une étude de théologie néo-testamentaire*, which had been foreshadowed in numerous articles scattered in various journals. The *Prolégomènes* took up the use of the word in classical Greek, in the LXX, and in the Judaic writings of the intertestamental and early Christian periods. A subsequent article, “Le lexique de l’amour dans les papyrus et dans quelques inscriptions de l’époque hellénistique,” *Mnemosyne* 8 (1955) 25–33, treated still another pertinent nonscriptural area.

Now S. turns to the *NT* and begins his analysis of the occurrences of *agapaō*, *agapè*, and *agapētos*. The plan followed is as winning in its simplicity as it is impressive in its working out. In this first of presumably two (three?) volumes concerned with the analysis of the texts, there are two parts, the first dealing with the Synoptics, and the second with Acts and the Epistles, except the Johannine. The second part must be continued in the next volume, since as we now have it only the texts from the Epistle of St. James, Acts, and the occurrence of *agapān* in the Epistles of St. Paul are treated.

In the first part S. takes up each of the Synoptics in their traditional order. In each Gospel he considers the instances of *agapān*, *agapè*, and *agapētos* (*agapè* does not occur in Mark nor *agapētos* in Luke) and draws his conclusions. Chapter 4 of the first part presents the conclusions drawn from the usage in all three Synoptics; two appendices deal with *philein* and its derivatives and with the text, “And who is my neighbor?”

By treating the Synoptics in the first part, S. has departed somewhat

from his announced intention (p. 6) of following the historical development of the concept of charity from Jesus to St. John, by way of St. James, St. Paul, and St. Peter. "From the Sermon on the Mount to the Apocalypse, 'charity' grows continuously in definition and breadth and yet remains the same; the teaching of the Apostles is only an unfolding of the notion of love revealed by Jesus" (p. 6). Such a study would ideally begin with the earliest *NT* composition and end with the latest. But since the Synoptics represent an oral tradition without which the other *NT* writings would be simply unintelligible, S. has taken the first three Gospels out of their proper chronological sequence (p. 188). Thereafter he is in a position to put his plan into execution, which he does by beginning with the Epistle of James (three texts) and following along with Acts (one text) and Paul (*agapān* only, thirty-one texts).

Whether one takes S.'s volume as a unit in itself, and therefore as a limited lexico-exegetical study of *agapān* and its derivatives, or as the second instalment of a work of major importance, it should be required reading for exegete and theologian alike. The careful and minute scholarship is above serious reproach; the coverage of the literature appears to be exhaustive (Appendix 3 contains eight closely printed pages of bibliography on *agapē* in the *NT*); and the conclusions are solidly based on all the occurrences of the words under study, at least so far as the work has progressed. In this last respect, S.'s work is certainly superior to the major effort of A. Nygren, *Eros und Agape: Gestaltwandlungen der christlichen Liebe*, which has had great influence, even though its conclusions are based on a quite restricted choice of texts. In breadth of concept and—judging by what has so far appeared—in thoroughness of treatment S.'s work will be superior also to the one-volume (756 pages) work of V. Warnach, O.S.B., *Agape: Die Liebe als Grundmotiv der neutestamentlichen Theologie*.

The notion of charity in the Synoptics is "very complex" (p. 173), but S. provides us with a one-paragraph summary: "In conclusion, *agapē* in the Synoptics is essentially a deep-seated attachment, luminous and clear; freely given by God, among men it is completely steeped in gratitude to Him; spontaneous, disinterested (*mēden apelpizontes*), and tender towards the neighbor. With everyone, it commands decision and stimulates to action, expressing itself in gifts and services: *tō aitounti se dos* (Mt 5:42). Readiness without reserve, it always involves the sacrifice of what we hold most humanly dear" (p. 174).

For a reviewer to attempt a similar summary for the notion of charity in Paul is to run the serious risk of distorting S.'s fifteen pages of conclusion by compression. A few of the ideas from this dense section may be cited,

leaving the rest to each student—for this is a book one must study—to work out for himself. In Paul the charity of God toward man is very rich and beneficent, crowned by the redemptive sacrifice of the Son, so that the whole Christian life is inspired by the charity of Christ crucified, risen, and seated at the right hand of the Father. But the grateful *redamatio* of God and Christ on the part of Christians is less heavily stressed by Paul, who prefers to emphasize *pistis*, comprising faith, hope, and charity, as the proper Christian reaction to God's charity. But, if less emphasized, the grateful love of the Christian for God is nonetheless present in Paul—indeed, “those who love God” is a definition of the Christians. This love for God and Christ is in itself permanent and stable; it is not interrupted by death. The love of the neighbor has the same characteristics as the love of God; for since the Christian is himself the object of divine love, which is convenient and gratuitous, he should in turn love his neighbor spontaneously and without seeking reward. Indeed, since the life of God is in the Christian soul, one may conclude that Christian love for God and for men does not constitute two loves, but one.

All must look forward eagerly to the completion of the analysis of the texts and even more to the end product toward which so much effort and learning is directed, the theology of the *NT* itself. It promises to be a splendid contribution toward our understanding of the Word of God.

West Baden College

JOSEPH J. DEVAULT, S.J.

MYTHE ET ALLÉGORIE: LES ORIGINES GRECQUES ET LES CONTESTATIONS JUDÉO-CHRÉTIENNES. By Jean Pépin. Paris: Aubier, 1958. Pp. 522.

This is a dissertation which had as its reporting readers Prof. Oscar Cullmann and Père de Menasce. It is a painstaking piece of historical research into the eternal magnet of allegorism for both the Western and Eastern mind, which should be valuable alike to the historian, the theologian, and the student of interpretative method.

The author's scope is in his subtitle. He explains in a foreword that the essential of his study is in its third part: the Christian reactions to the attempt of the pagans to save their mythology through allegorical exegesis. But since the Christian authors take it for granted that this exegesis is known, he must first set it forth; hence his first part. And as Jewish allegorism is a middle point chronologically and in principle, the second part has followed as a matter of course. Before all of this, there is an introduction to examine the function of myth and allegory in contemporary thought; for P. believes the same attitudes can be detected in antiquity. The denigra-

tion of myth subsequent to the Enlightenment by both the enlightened and the orthodox led, through the allegorical reaction of the romanticists and the life-is-larger-than-logic schools, to the new objective character assigned to myth in the psychoanalysis of Freud and Jung. Bultmann, who wants to demythologize the New Testament, actually shows a profound respect for myth. His argument is that the nineteenth-century rationalism, while rightly rejecting the myth, wrongly rejected the truths that the myth concealed; in seeking to recover these truths, Bultmann, for all his disavowal, becomes an allegorist. Pure allegorism, however, resolves myth, conceding to it no value in itself. P. sees in Schelling, Jung, and Jaspers—the romanticist, the psychoanalyst, and the existentialist—fighters of a common cause to vindicate the intrinsic worth of myth.

The reviewer found the first part of this work the most interesting of all, because of the evident parallel, in motive and development, between Greek allegorism and the allegorical exegesis of the Bible, whose roots, alas! are sunk far more deeply in our religious thinking than we often credit. The allegorical interpretation of Homer and Hesiod had begun already in the sixth century B.C. to counteract the bitter scandal that had been taken at their treatment of the gods. Of precisely the same spirit was born the allegorical interpretation of the Song of Songs and Augustine's "non mendacium sed mysterium." With the way prepared by Pythagoras and Heraclitus, the first systematic allegorical exegesis of Homer was by Theagenes of Rhegium, who saw veiled in it the natural sciences, while Anaxagoras in the fifth century made it a mine of ethical teaching. Reading these authors reminds one of nothing so much as rabbinical exegesis. Plato, though no enemy of myth and allegory in themselves, opposed the allegorizing of Homer and Hesiod as illusory, but with Aristotle there was a return to physical, psychological, and moral allegorism. The Cynics were not particularly interested in protecting the good name of Homer and of the gods as the earlier allegorists had been, but they used the national literature by allegorizing it as a prop to their philosophy. So also did the Stoics, with a maze of childish etymologies that again anticipate some of the rabbinical and patristic exegesis. The Epicureans and Neoplatonist sceptics both opposed the system, the former because they were against mixing piety with reason, the latter because they thought the myths not worth saving. But allegorism triumphed in the realistic approach of Euhemerus, Diodorus, and Strabo and the "unbridled" (the word is the author's) allegorism of Crates, Apollodorus, and the others who found in their Homer the font of every truth both natural and supernatural. If we are to read the future in the past, then it is depressing to see how allegorism was proof against both

reason and ridicule, ending as an established philosophical method accepted by those as otherwise diverse in time and concepts as Plutarch, Plotinus, and Macrobius.

With this preparation, we are disposed to accede to P.'s position, that Jewish allegorism was inherited from the Greek through Hellenism. It is our impression, however, that P. is no longer as assured of his ground when he enters into his second part. "By a kind of wilful inferiority and a certain taste for the exotic, the West turns periodically to the East to attribute to it the paternity of its most important movements of ideas" (p. 217), is probably an accurate enough evaluation of Philo Byblius' attempt to derive Greek allegorism from Phoenicia. But P. surely undervalues the antiquity and authenticity of Philo's sources. "On ne croit plus guère aujourd'hui à l'existence historique de ce Sanchuniathon" is not a correct appraisal of present-day scholarly opinion subsequent to the discovery of the Ras Shamra material and the studies of Eissfeldt, Albright, and others. Furthermore, particularly in view of the Qumrân literature, one may seriously question the contention that the Essenian spiritualization of the Law was allegorizing under Hellenistic influence (p. 224). On the contrary, this is a tendency authentic in Israel from the time of the earliest prophets. Still, the route of allegory from Greece to Palestine seems to be demonstrated. The early rabbinic exegesis is sparing in the use of allegorism, but beginning with the *Letter to Aristaeus* the Jews of the diaspora strive to allegorize the "crudities" of the Law for Gentile readers. Philo has predecessors enough to show that his exegesis was produced by Hellenism, as his own vocabulary and conceptual framework prove. The provenance of Josephus is less clear. Here, in fact, the reader may wonder if we are dealing with a convinced allegorist, or rather with an apologist determined at all costs to "pass" in an alien world with the loss of as little face as possible. It is not unheard of for modern Jews and Christians to demythologize their Scriptures or dogmas not for the reasons alleged by Bultmann, but for no motives nobler than shame.

Correctly, I think, P. excludes Hellenism from any direct influence on the allegorism of the New Testament. Even so, he ascribes more of Paul's conceptual background to Hellenism than modern exegetes would be disposed to allow. He takes for granted, for example (p. 251), that the Pauline *stoicheia tou kosmou*, *mystērion*, *pneuma*, *gnōsis*, *sōma pneumatikon*, etc., are at least indirectly Greek, all of which are debatable, to say the least. But Paul's allegorical interpretation of the Old Testament was drawn from Palestinian Judaism and his own religious genius. The same is true of the Synoptic Gospels and of John. These are independent of Hermeticism and simply give

a Christian equivalent of rabbinic exegesis, a policy that is continued in the other early Christian writings such as the *Epistle of Barnabas* and Hippolytus. With Clement of Alexandria, however, there was an open adoption of pagan allegorism, for Clement saw the ancient myths as a continuum with the Old and New Testaments, a perennial truth hidden by symbols and to be perceived through gnosis.

A detailed and meticulous study (pp. 276-392) is devoted to the "tripartite theology" (of the people, the poets, and the philosophers) chiefly as found in the work of Varro (first century B.C.), though it goes back to the first Stoics, and its criticism by the Christian polemicists, chiefly Tertullian and Augustine. It is curious that the Christians, who were tireless in detecting the shortcomings of the allegorical method as a defense of pagan myth, studiously refrained from exposing its equal shortcomings in biblical exegesis. The opposition to allegorism comes with better grace from an Arnobius, a Lactantius, or a pseudo-Clement, whose own religion was relatively free of it. Where the situation becomes paradoxical is when we find an Origen ridiculing pagan allegorism of myth while busily allegorizing the Old Testament against a Celsus who was ridiculing Christian attempts to allegorize the Bible and himself insisting on the validity of interpreting the myths allegorically. The paradox is not perfect, of course. Allegorism even at its worst always was adventitious to the Christian exegete, because of the historical basis of the revelation with which he was dealing; it was a *faute de mieux* which could and would be discarded, though after the fifth century where P. ends his study, with the triumph of the scientific method that is also a heritage from Greece.

The value of this work is enhanced by nine indices: of modern authors, ancient authors, Homeric citations, Hesiodic citations, scriptural citations, Greek and Latin allegorical technical terms, mythological symbolic equivalences, etymologies and wordplays, and Jewish and Christian adaptations of myth.

St. Thomas Seminary, Denver, Colo.

BRUCE VAWTER, C.M.

L'ÉVANGILE ET LE MYTHE DANS LA PENSÉE DE RUDOLF BULTMANN. By Giovanni Miegge. Translated from the Italian by Héléne Naef. *Bibliothèque théologique*. Neuchâtel and Paris: Delachaux & Niestlé, 1958. Pp. 130. 7.50 fr.s.

‡ In an excellent preface Jean-Louis, eminent Calvinist theologian, indicates the void in French writings on Bultmann that this present translation fills. Relatively few of B.'s works have been translated into French, and of

the critical studies that have appeared, they are either done from a confessional point of view (cf. the Catholic works of Malevez and Marl ) or treat a particular theological problem. Here now is an exposition of B.'s work in itself. The author, Professor of Exegesis of the Faculty of Theology of the Waldensian Church in Rome, does present a critique, but this is rather in the line of reflections permitting the reader to form his own conclusions.

Through a careful regard for the different facets of B.'s make-up as philologist, exegete, form-critic, existentialist, and theologian, M. fashions a clear presentation of B.'s thought in its proper context. After an introductory section to set up the problem found in the presentation of the *NT* and the need for a new interpretation, the first main portion of the book offers the main lines of B.'s interpretation of the *NT* where his Form-Criticism interpretation of the origins of the canonical Gospels unfolds the two terms of the *NT* problem: kerygma and myth. Illuminating pages follow on Jesus and the Palestinian community, the Hellenistic community, Paul and John, where B.'s specific competence as an exegete is brought out.

A second section treats the positive aspect of demythologization, the attempt to translate the apostolic kerygma into the terms of an existential philosophy. Here we find a discussion of what is meant by the act of God in Christ and some thoughtful remarks on paradox and miracle. This leads into the third part, where the all-important notion of myth is investigated in its different meanings: as a cosmology, as a humanization of the divine, as an intuition of the transcendent, and as a religious symbol. M. would present B. as showing that the mythical elements in the *NT* are not mythical in the proper sense, but rather symbols relating to an object that is not mythical. Thus the demythologization would apply less to the *NT* texts than to the prejudices and methods of the history-of-religions school whose influence was felt by the younger B. and his colleagues of the Form-Criticism school.

A concluding chapter evaluates briefly the positive contributions of B.'s personal vision of Christianity in its relation to existentialism and notes certain shortcomings, especially the impression left by B. that the eschatological event is not Christ but the community. The objective Christ of history and dogma tends to dissolve into the *Christus pro nobis* of the lived experience of the faithful, and the person of Christ is reduced to the benefits He confers.

An interesting phase in the Bultmann controversy seems to be emerging more clearly. In his exceptional work Marl  points out B.'s ties with Luther and notes that B., in effect, has shown in a striking way the impossible

situation of a truly believing Protestantism. Leuba, on the other hand, in his review of Marlé (cf. *Verbum caro* 11 [1957] 57-63) is surprised that the Catholic theologian has not remarked on how close B. is to certain Catholic positions, notably on the notion of time and history in relation to the Church and salvation. A similar note is sounded by Miegge, who treats the Catholic evaluations of B. in an appendix. This is a serene, intelligent appraisal based on the works in Vol. 5 of *Kerygma und Mythos* and on the studies of Malevez and Marlé. In his concluding chapter he observes that B.'s insistence on the community and his interpretation of the origins of Christianity lead B. in a direction close to the Catholic conception of the Mystical Body of Christ. Further developments in the same calm, intelligent spirit could prove both interesting and fruitful.

Woodstock College

VINCENT T. O'KEEFE, S.J.

LA RÈGLE DE LA GUERRE DES FILS DE LUMIÈRE CONTRE LES FILS DE TÉNÈBRES 1. Restoration of the text, translation, and commentary by Jean Carmignac. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1958. Pp. xx + 288. 2500 fr.

M. l'Abbé Jean Carmignac, formerly Professor of Scripture at the Grand Séminaire de St-Dié, now curate at the Eglise St-Sulpice in Paris and announced as the editor of the forthcoming *Revue de Qumrân*, has given the scholarly world interested in the Dead Sea Scrolls the first part of a masterly commentary on the War Scroll (1QM). The second part, *La règle de la guerre: Etude philologique, historique et théologique*, is being prepared. While writing this commentary, C. lived in Jerusalem at the Ecole Biblique and was in constant contact with the teams of scholars working on the Scrolls in the Palestine Archaeological Museum. Dr. Claus-Hunno Hunzinger graciously permitted him to consult the unpublished fragments of another recension of the War Scroll from Cave 4. Such consultation removed any fear that the 4Q fragments, when published, might invalidate or render obsolete such a full-scale commentary on this scroll. C. also visited Israel to consult the manuscript of 1QM itself, but "l'on n'a pas jugé opportun de l'en [de sa cachette] faire sortir pour me le montrer" (p. vii).

The brief introduction gives a résumé of the material that is to appear in the second part of the commentary: (1) literary questions, (2) author and date, and (3) theology. In Section 1 Carmignac discusses various attempts to define the *genre littéraire* of the War Scroll, finally describing it himself as "une liturgie de la guerre sainte." We would have preferred the addition of the adjective "eschatologique." In formulating his definitive description, we hope that C. will not overlook this character of the *War*. In the second

section C. maintains that the *War* was composed by the Righteous Teacher and accordingly that it was written in the second half of the second century B.C. Such a date is a departure from the one held by such names as Yadin, Dupont-Sommer, and Milik. But we must await the full treatment of this matter in the second part before we can pass judgment on it.

The introduction is followed by a bibliography of writings on the War Scroll. The basic division of the commentary follows the nineteen columns of the manuscript; but the notes (at the bottom of the page below the Hebrew text and French translation) are punctuated with sixteen chapter headings, indicating the logical divisions of the text. Column 19 is rightly labeled as "fragment détaché." The notes are clearly indicated according to column and line (a feature that facilitates rapid consultation; contrast the frustrating system of P. Wernberg-Möller, *The Manual of Discipline* [Leiden, 1957]). A supplement, dated Autumn 1957, surveys the more recent literature on 1QM. Useful indices are supplied.

In general, the commentary is well written. The translation is accurate and smooth; the notes are thorough and reveal the author's competence. One could have aimed at greater succinctness, however, for the reader is at times overwhelmed with verbiage. Many a phrase, sentence, and even paragraph might well have been trimmed or omitted (see the note on *ḥšwšrwł*, p. 43, or the paragraph, "J'aurais . . . énigmes," p. viii). Moreover, the remarks about the difficulties experienced with the Jordanian government tend in the long run only to render more difficult the relations of Western scholars in that part of the world. *Non erat his locus*.

One of the good points in the commentary is the use that C. has made of previous studies of the War Scroll. He has sifted well the various interpretations of difficult passages and differed from all of them when judged necessary. Naturally, all the difficulties have not been resolved. We will be permitted to point out a few weaknesses in detail.

On p. 14 we are told that *'lym* certainly means "the angels," but also seems to have the meaning of "les âmes des défunts, comme on le verra à la ligne 13." However, the only support for the latter meaning in line 13 is the very questionable interpretation of the phrase *šlwšh gwrłwł*. It has normally been taken to mean "three times," but C. disagrees, suggesting that *gwrł* here means "sous-parti." In each of the opposing camps of God and Belial he finds three sub-parties, one of the men on earth, one of the souls departed, one of the angels. And "au sommet de la hiérarchie, se trouve Dieu" (p. 18). Such a meaning of this word is not at all obvious; it would force us to say that the *gwrł 'l* and the *gwrł bly'l* (line 5) were divided into three sub-*gwrłwł*. And in line 14 we read that "the great hand of God"

is at work "in the seventh sub-party" (*bgwrl hšby'y*)! The interpretation of J. van der Ploeg (*Vetus testamentum* 5 [1955] 376) is still preferable.

On p. 16 the interpretation of *mhyšh* as a combination of *mn* (coordinated with following 'd) and *hy/wšh* is quite forced. The expression is admittedly quite strange, but can be nothing else than the Hiph. ptc. fem. of *hwš*, "hastening."

On p. 75 C. prefers to read *mł* (5.1) instead of *m[g]n*. Aside from the fact that this reading produces an impossible form, the final letter is a nun; it is no different from the final letter of *whmgn* in 5.5.

On p. 80 C. continues to read *ryqmh* (5.6) with the *editio princeps*. According to the photo, one should read *rwqmh*. Despite the Massoretic form *riqmāh*, the *plena scriptio* of a short *i*-vowel in a closed syllable at Qumrān is very rare. Moreover, the form *rwqmh* has been found several times by J. T. Milik, with whom I discussed this form.

On pp. 270-72 C. discusses the fragment of a Cave 4 text of the *Was* recently published by C.-H. Hunzinger (*Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft* 69 [1957] 131-51). He lists the differences between 1QM and 4QM^a, "qui dépassent la simple fantaisie orthographique." But having followed Hunzinger's transcription only, he has missed an important variant. Whereas 1QM 14.7 reads *ytmw*, 4QM^a has *ytm* (with a final mem); see the photo supplied by Hunzinger facing p. 135. At first sight the text of 1QM seems to be more correct; but the singular might possibly be defended on the basis of the preceding 3rd. sg. subjects as a Hiphil, used of God (see Ez 22:15). At any rate, this variant is significant for or against the thesis of an older recension in 4QM^a.

Such minor weaknesses do not detract from the over-all good impression one gets from this thorough and valuable commentary. It is an important contribution to the study of the Scrolls.

Woodstock College

JOSEPH A. FITZMYER, S.J.

THE SCROLLS AND THE NEW TESTAMENT. Edited by Krister Stendahl. New York: Harper, 1957. Pp. xi + 308. \$4.00.

This collection of fourteen studies is already enjoying a deserved second printing. Its value lies in the fact that it offers English-language readers a cross section of serious studies on rather specific topics of value for an appreciation of the now celebrated Dead Sea Scrolls as background material for the New Testament, by scholars from both Europe and America. Catholic as well as Protestant writers, and one who is Jewish, are represented; and whether the articles were originally published in English or are now translated, they have usually undergone extensive revision to make them

timely as of the appearance of the collection. The scope includes no article originally appearing in a Romance language (Fr. Vogt's Latin can hardly be counted for that). Detailed footnotes and good indices occupy the last sixty-four pages of the volume.

The editor's opening essay, "An Introduction and a Perspective," represents in part a plea for a particular type of *NT* exegesis, in opposition to which the reviewer would adopt unhesitatingly the "naive" approach which credits the individual Evangelists with having a known story to tell, and telling it; this at least spares one the contortions of using individual episodes and sayings in the Gospels counter to their actual context and in view of a supposed community motivation, manufactured *ad hoc* by the modern student. One limitation on the direct usefulness of the book for the readers of *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES* is that the *NT* discussion in a number of the essays has underlying postulates of that kind. Another, which shows up also in Stendahl's essay, is that several of the writers have swallowed Dupont-Sommer's and Allegro's perfervid imaginings of a Qumrân "martyred Messiah." The subordinate question, of a community represented as giving birth to a messiah through its "birth pangs" of suffering, in one of the Thanksgiving Hymns of the Qumrân sectarians, would never have arisen except in the light of Apocalypse 12; only the obscurity of the language of the Qumrân text makes the equation possible—and in the Qumrân context nothing can make it plausible, though it is cheerfully accepted by Stendahl and Brownlee here, as well as by others elsewhere.

Cullmann's essay on the significance of the Qumrân texts for research into the beginnings of Christianity does its author no particular credit; to equate the Qumrân people with any kind of "Hellenists" is labored nonsense; and the paper is saved only by the negative judgment at the end which contrasts the position of Jesus in Christianity with that of the "teacher of righteousness" among the Essenes in a properly sober perspective.

Brownlee's study on John the Baptist meanders; and it again alleges the utterly untenable reading "I have anointed" for the first published document from Qumrân (1QIs^a) at Is 52:14 as supposedly "messianic." The reading itself has been refuted in print (there is a conclusive parallel from the same document at Is 49:7) several times since 1951. K. G. Kuhn writes on "The Two Messiahs of Aaron and Israel," on "The Lord's Supper and the Communal Meal at Qumran," and on "New Light on Temptation, Sin and Flesh in the New Testament." On the second topic, "The material which has now become available through the findings of the Qumrân texts has led us to reconsider the vast and entangled problem of the sacred meal practices of the church." This is a logic-chopping exercise in the rewriting

of the *NT*, and neither the Qumrân position nor the Christian Eucharist is kept properly in focus. The third study is mainly an explanation of "temptation" in the *NT* in terms of the eschatological warfare against the flesh and the spiritual evil which works with and through it, in which the Christian is, as a "son of light," engaged, with analogies from Qumrân.

E. Vogt's article on Lk 2:14 ("men of good will") and K. Schubert's on the Sermon on the Mount are followed by studies relating Acts (S. Johnson) and the constitution of the primitive Church (Bo Reicke) to the Qumrân texts. There ensue studies by W. D. Davies on flesh and the spirit in Paul and in the scrolls; by R. Brown on the Johannine Gospel and Epistles and Qumrân; by J. Fitzmyer on Qumrân and the Ebionites; and by N. Glazer on Hillel the Elder's teaching as possibly predicated on conscious reference to the sect.

The reviewer has chosen to be specific about points with which he feels bound to differ. This is because he is persuaded that the book as a whole raises the right questions, performs a necessary service, and will not be replaced by any thoroughgoing synthesis for a long while yet. It should therefore be consulted by all those to whom either public clamor or the intrinsic interest of the material makes the scrolls significant.

*American School of Oriental Research,
Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan*

PATRICK W. SKEHAN

LA DIDACHE: INSTRUCTIONS DES APÔTRES. By Jean-Paul Audet, O.P. Paris: Gabalda, 1958. Pp. xvi + 498.

Père Audet's work is more than a significant contribution to the thorny problem of the *Didache*; it furnishes insights into the life of the primitive Church which are as unexpected as they are exciting. A pale picture is all we can give here, by extracting salient features from each of the three parts of this voluminous work: (1) an introduction of more than two hundred pages, which treats thoroughly the text's transmission, composition, and sources; (2) an edition, with a French translation; and (3) a long commentary, whose suggestions on every level reveal A.'s remarkably rich store of knowledge.

All the interpretations of the *Didache*, from the most enthusiastic to the most sceptical, have been governed by a common postulate: the unconditional acceptance of the long title of Codex Hierosolymitanus 54 (H) discovered by Bryennios in 1883: *Didachē kuriou dia tōn apostolōn tois ethnesin*. In this context the *Didache* had to be regarded as professedly an epitome of doctrine received from Christ and transmitted by the Apostles to Gentile converts. Some believed they had found in the *Didache* a genuine

production of the mid-second century and looked for literary borrowings from the Gospels, the *Epistle of Barnabas*, and the *Shepherd of Hermas*; others saw only a piece of archaizing fiction dating from the third century and projecting into the past a completely fanciful ideal, in harmony with the pretentious title. A.'s peremptory boldness lies in his rejection of this accepted postulate of *Didache* criticism. A detailed study of the text's transmission has led to the restoration of the primitive title: simply *Didachai tōn apostolōn*. Internal criticism reveals that the contents correspond in fact to this title. There is question not of a "doctrine" (*didachē*) attributed to the Twelve, but more modestly of simple, homely "instructions" (*didachai*). Their literary genre is intelligible only in terms of the practices of the Apostolic Age, where the *didaskein* serves as necessary counterpart and indispensable complement of the *kērygma*. A complex literary genre, where sheer exhortation blends at will with disciplinary prescriptions and with practical details of organization. Subordinated to the gospel and in conformity with it, the "*didachē* of the apostles" intends merely to determine, on the practical level, the way to be followed. As for the "apostles," they are not the Twelve but the itinerant missionaries mentioned in 11, 3-6, radiating round the mother church and making known her thought and her practices.

There is no trace in the *Didache* of an influence exercised by the *Epistle of Barnabas* or the *Shepherd of Hermas*. Impossible, too, to espy a literary influence of our Gospels: oral tradition and the sociological milieu are enough to account for the features that are common to the New Testament and the *Didache*.

A whole series of convergent signs suggest a date earlier than the second century. The work would have been composed between 50 and 70, with its place of origin probably Syria, perhaps Antioch itself. It is not difficult to calculate the high significance of this fact for our knowledge of the Apostolic Age, the formation of the New Testament, and primitive Christian institutions.

A.'s edition of the text, the first genuinely critical edition, offers significant changes. It dissipates without violence most of the difficulties that have consistently arisen from the reading of this much-abused text. A separate edition is a desideratum.

It is hardly possible to catalogue the contents of the commentary, which comprises almost 250 compact pages; we shall merely take up some items of more obvious interest. One of these is intimately linked to the history of the primitive Christian community. The third part of the Two Ways embodied in the *Didache* is an instruction to the poor, which is customarily

aligned with the abstracts in Acts on the communization of property. Now the Two Ways would be of Jewish origin and would attest the existence, prior to Christianity, of a brotherhood of the poor animated by the hope of an inheritance to come, with a manner of life already determined by rules and customs. This being so, the Church would not have created a new institution wide-open to difficulties and destined for defeat; it would simply have provided a new inspiration (a realized messianism) for an old institution. The decisive cleavage would have been caused not by inexperience but by the profound changes which in Palestine accompanied the calamities of the century's close.

With reference to the eucharistic liturgy reported by the *Didache*, A. points out that the primitive eucharist reflects an attitude considerably different from our own. *Eucharistein* does not mean merely "to give thanks." What it translates is rather a "blessing," whose origins are discoverable in the Old Testament, where it is linked to praise far more than to thanksgiving. It is the blessing which is associated with the proclamation of the divine Name, which springs spontaneously from wonderment in the face of the *mirabilia Dei*. It is this kind of wonderment, not gratitude for favors received, that is quickened by the eucharistic anamnesis. The former is more gratuitous, more authentically religious. And it harmonizes better with the piety of Israel, which believed more or less explicitly that there was greater religious value in wonderment than in gratitude.

It is understandable, therefore, that in the totality of the "eucharist-blessing" the "proclamation of the death of the Lord [*tou kuriou*: the risen Lord, not simply Jesus] until He comes" (1 Cor 11:26) is primarily the anamnesis of the Lord's death and resurrection, foundation of man's hope for His return, the only one of the *mirabilia Dei* which is still to come if the whole of God's primitive plan is indeed to be consummated. In this way, surely, we penetrate the attitudes which in the beginning led to the designation of "the first day of the week" (cf. the accounts of the resurrection, e.g., Mt 28:1) as "the Lord's day" (*Did.* 14, 1), and then to renew thereon the "breaking of bread" and the "eucharist." The designation of the day and the liturgical expression of common joy and common hope in salvation coincide perfectly.

Prolonging these perspectives, A. studies closely the primitive liturgical forms of the eucharist as attested by the *Didache*. In particular, he distinguishes the "breaking of bread," practiced by the Judeo-Christians and pointing towards the hope of a terminal assembling, from the "agape," evolved among the Gentiles and inspired rather by the commandment of love. The views which A. develops here and which are supported by findings

in very different fields of research and even in archeology are a precious contribution to the history of the liturgy.

This rapid survey may give some insight into the astonishing richness of A.'s commentary. In point of fact, though he says much, he suggests even more. Only a deep and living knowledge of Scripture, of Jewish tradition, and of the general cultural situation of the early centuries of the Christian era could have made possible this immersion of the *Didache* into a mentality and into attitudes of which we too often have no more than a rough image, deformed by our own ways of thinking. A. possesses a remarkable feeling for history, a rare gift for recapturing complex, shifting situations to which the written document bears but a dull, indolent witness. The fruits are here for all to see: a monument of literary criticism, but besides a masterpiece of delicate understanding.

Innsbruck, Austria

GAËTAN DAoust, S.J.

THE PHILOSOPHY OF CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA. By E. F. Osborn. *Texts and Studies*, New Series 3. Cambridge University Press, 1957. Pp. xi + 206. 30s.

Ever since the great modern pioneering work of Bigg and Tollinton, English patristic scholarship has maintained unabated interest in the work of Clement of Alexandria. If one may be permitted to generalize, much of the work has taken its general approach from Tollinton's open sympathy with Alexandrian Christianity; and now at last we have a brilliant monograph in the spirit of the masters by the young Australian scholar, E. F. Osborn. He sees the whole problem of Clement's thought and personality as a great riddle: for as we come to Clement's work, it seems at first sight like a collection of scattered notes without unity, full of sudden digressions and apparent lacunae; and the great doctrine of Christian gnosis, which promises so much, seems on analysis to break up into obscure and perplexing fragments of unproven hypotheses. But, for Osborn, the answer to the riddle is that Clement is creating a new Christian synthesis in his own original way, and that, though his statements may seem scattered and eclectic, his "answers to philosophical questions are illuminating and to the point" (p. 13). What there is of obscurity and disorder Osborn explains by comparing Clement to Kierkegaard (pp. 9-10). It is, indeed, an illuminating comparison, even though one might feel that there is a vast difference between the studied paradoxes of Kierkegaard and the slipshod inconsistencies of Clement. Another feature of Clement's style which Osborn discusses is his constant use of symbolism, by which "Clement declares the importance of complicated hidden connections between ideas and between things. He

points the way to a new synthesis which lays constant emphasis on variety and plurality in unity" (p. 11).

Once the groundwork has been laid, Osborn develops his discussion of Clement's philosophy by focusing attention on two patterns: the antithesis of the one-many, and the problem of the transcendent and the immanent. It is this twofold pattern that he sees recurring in Clement's treatment of the Trinity, of the attributes of God, of the immanence of God in the world, of faith as transcendent knowledge, and of the Church as the climax of all human belief. In Osborn's view, Clement realized the impossibility of reconciling the problem of the One and the many, the transcendent and the immanent, outside of the revelation of Christianity—in that "mystery of the union of the Father with the Son and the unity of all things in the Son" (p. 178). In other words, Clement found the resolution of all his philosophical perplexities in the Christian gnosis, which is the knowledge of God and the world through Christ.

Perhaps the weakest part of the book is the discussion of Clement's debt to earlier writers. The sections on Aristotle (pp. 100-102) and the Stoics (pp. 102-7) are perhaps not as clearly articulated as one would expect; and the summary of Plotinus' doctrine of the *hypostaseis* is somewhat inadequate (pp. 23-24). Osborn's attempt to refute Völker's position, on Clement's uneasy debt to Philo of Alexandria in the area of negative theology (pp. 184-86), is courageous but unconvincing. Indeed, Osborn's constant attempt to present Clement's thought as a new synthesis only serves, to my mind at least, to draw attention to the fact that Clement was, for all his good intentions, an Alexandrian pedant who had absorbed many ill-digested particles of earlier philosophic tradition. The wonder is that there was not more patent contradiction. For like the "Sicilian bee" whom he so admired (*Strom.* 1, 11), Clement too drew profusely "from the flowers of the apostolic and prophetic meadow"; so much so, in fact, that we shall never fully be able to estimate his literary debt to Pantaenus and to many unnamed Christian apologists who undoubtedly preceded him. Clement's doctrine, therefore, would seem to represent the work rather of an entire school than of an individual thinker. And hence one has the impression that the unique synthesis which Osborn sees in Clement is rather the result of his own perceptive and unifying approach. But all of these points are of the sort one could reserve for friendly discussion. The book is very well planned, and the many topics discussed are divided under three headings: on God as Creator and Saviour; on goodness in God and in His creatures; on truth, knowledge, faith, and symbolism. There are three interesting appendices with supplementary discussions, and full indices. With its wide scope and original point of view—T. S. Eliot, James Joyce, and A. A. Milne

re all felt to be relevant—the book is surely one of the most refreshing and germinal studies on Alexandrian theology to appear in the last decade. Whether or not we can follow the author all the way, all will surely agree that the riddle of Clement has been presented most attractively, with an answer that is both compelling and profound.

Bellarmino College, Plattsburgh, N.Y.

HERBERT MUSURILLO, S.J.

THE IMAGE OF GOD IN MAN ACCORDING TO CYRIL OF ALEXANDRIA. By Walter J. Burghardt, S.J. *Studies in Christian Antiquity* 14. Woodstock, Md.: Woodstock College Press, 1957. Pp. xvi + 194. \$3.00.

The image of God, a theme of cardinal importance in patristics, has been of late years the subject of many monographs. The present study, concerned with Cyril of Alexandria, here takes a position of first rank. The theme had, of course, already been alluded to in the studies of Cyril made by du Manoir, Mahé, Weigl, and Gross, but until now it had never had an entire work consecrated to it—a work, moreover, which gave this theme its full importance. This has now been done, and done excellently. The chief merits of the book, in our opinion, are its clarity, its conciseness, and its erudition, the wealth of scholarship not only in regard to the very extensive work of Cyril, sometimes quite difficult to read, but also in regard to all the literature which concerns him as well as all the Fathers who had any influence on him.

B. examines first the notions of "image" and "likeness," and establishes that for Cyril they do not differ in content, as they do when used by Irenaeus or by Gregory of Nyssa. This property of "image" is a spiritual reality of many facets, but it does not apply to the body; here Cyril has not the same view as, in some sense, the Bible. Then follows a description of the characteristic qualities of the image: first, those rooted in human nature as such (rationality, freedom, responsibility); secondly, those which have been superadded to human nature, an entirely gratuitous movement of the divine generosity (sanctification, incorruptibility, adoption as a son of God). A chapter on sin describes how the former characteristics have been enfeebled but not suppressed by the Fall, whereas the latter were lost but have been recovered in Christ, as is shown in the last, culminating chapter. Very interesting is the chapter on Cyril's "theology of woman." This theology is stamped by an incontestable misogyny, but it is valuable for understanding the strange assertions of Cyril—champion nonetheless of the Theotokos—concerning Mary's weakness at the foot of the cross and her doubts as to the divinity of her Son.

Each chapter includes an instructive comparison of Cyril's opinion with

those of his predecessors, particularly the Alexandrian tradition. This comparison brings out at once the underlying agreement among the Fathers (probably from the fact that some Fathers were well acquainted with the writings of other Fathers) as well as their divergences; e.g., on the subject of original sin, which is treated more profoundly by Cyril than by others, although he enters less into detail on certain questions than will be done in the West. Another example is the distinction between the manner in which the Holy Spirit is present in the elect of the Old Testament and in those of the New. A third example, among others, concerns the character of *homoiōsis* of the Spirit in relation to the Son.

The reading of B.'s book may be rendered a little less easy by its predominantly analytic character, but the value thence derived is eminently practical: there is an excellent selection of Cyrillan texts. The work contains, moreover, a number of judicious formulations, as when the author observes that the opposition between the terms "received" and "not received" is not the equivalent, in Cyril's terminology, of the distinction we make between "supernatural" and "natural." Contrary to B.'s opinion, we do not think that the position dating the *Epistle to Diognetus* to the second century is in any way strengthened by the hypothesis of P. Andriessen, who sees in the *Epistle* the lost *Apology* of Quadratus (cf. p. 16, n. 26). Carefully composed indices render the consultation of the work very easy.

Louvain, Belgium

ROGER LEYS, S.J.

PROBLEMI E ORIENTAMENTI DI TEOLOGIA DOMMATICATA 2. A cura della Pontificia Facoltà Teologica di Milano. Milan: Marzorati, 1957. Pp. xviii + 1106.

Where the first volume of this collection of theological essays was largely devoted to questions concerning the nature and functions of dogmatic theology in general and of particular aspects of fundamental theology (cf. THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 19 [1958] 102-5), this second and final volume presents a series of papers on dogmatic subjects of specifically contemporary interest and importance. The authors are for the most part internationally recognized experts in their respective fields. And while the purpose of the collection is to present such problems to the well-educated Catholic laity and to seminarians, there is no doubt that the priest and the professional theologian will find much here to interest them and to stimulate their zeal.

After an introductory essay on the problem of God in contemporary thought (C. Fabro), there is a survey, by E. Galbiati, of recent work on the nature of biblical inspiration, with applications to the Genesis account of the origin of man and the universe. Present-day trends in the theological

analysis of original sin form the subject of a balanced and judicious paper by M. Flick, S.J., followed by the somewhat lengthy review by the Franciscan, Jean-François Bonnefoy, of recent controversies on the significance of the primacy of Christ in the ordered finality of the cosmos.

In a paper of over a hundred pages Giulio Oggioni, of the Milan Theological Faculty, sets forth the history of the doctrine of the redemption and concludes with a brief survey of present-day theological explanation of this basic Christian truth. This is followed by a study of the controversies about the human psychology of Christ, by one of the participants in the discussions, Msgr. Pietro Parente, Archbishop of Perugia, and an examination of the doctrine of the Mystical Body of Christ by E. Mura. In a splendidly succinct account Costantino Oggioni, of Milan, reviews the more important Mariological questions of today: our Lady's place as Mediatrix, the Mary-Church analogy, the spiritual maternity and the queenship of the Mother of God. Mary's bodily Assumption and the question of her death in the light of *Munificentissimus Deus* are treated by Ferdinando Maggioni.

The problems connected with the concept of the supernatural as these have arisen in our times are admirably summarized by Giuseppe Colombo, and Paul Galtier of the Gregorian University in Rome writes on contemporary Catholic theories in regard to grace and the indwelling of the Holy Spirit. Two essays are devoted to problems concerning supernatural faith, the first, by Roger Aubert of Louvain, giving an over-all view of the problems, the second, by Giovanni Battista Guzzetti of Milan, discussing the necessity of supernatural faith for salvation and the repercussions of this doctrine on Catholic missionary activity, with a further exposition of questions relating to the loss of faith and its causes.

Four articles are concerned with sacramental theology: the relationship between the pagan mysteries and Christian sacraments is studied by Luigi Allevi; recent problems concerning baptism and confirmation are treated briefly by the Saulchoir Dominican, T. Camelot; the various theories on the nature of the Sacrifice of the Mass form the subject of A. Piolanti's contribution, and the history and theology of penance are examined by Dom Augustine Mayer of the Anselmo in Rome.

There are two studies of Christian eschatology, the first being a general survey of the place and significance of eschatology in the Christian framework of thought, by M. Schmaus, the second, by F. Ceuppens, O.P., on a number of exegetical problems in the field of eschatology. The final paper treats of some of the problems that arise from contemporary interest in the theological aspects of mysticism. This is the work of Gabriele di S. Maria Maddalena, O.C.D.

All in all, the collection attains a high degree of excellence. Not all the

authors reach that plane of completely serene objectivity one hopes for in such survey articles. But where sides are taken on controversial points the positions rejected are almost always set forth honestly and clearly and the reasons for the rejection are given with simplicity and modesty. The extensive bibliographies accompanying each essay are of great value. The Milan Theological Faculty is to be congratulated on the completion of a remarkably good presentation of twentieth-century Catholic theological thinking, and the publishers on the truly excellent format in which the two volumes appear.

Woodstock College

JOHN F. SWEENEY, S.J.

VIE MORALE ET TRINITÉ SAINTE. By C. Spicq, O.P. *Lectio divina* 19. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1957. Pp. 89.

This brief work, so clear in its perspective and so rich in doctrinal content, could only be the result of years of research and of a long series of other articles and books—a conclusion readily proved by a glance at the numerous contributions of S. to biblical learning over the past three decades, culminating in his most recent work on *agapē* in the New Testament.

In his first chapter, "Why a Revealed Moral?", S. shows conclusively that the dark picture of pagan morality described by St. Paul (Rom 1:18-32) by no means exceeds the condemnation of classical authors such as Hesiod, Herodotus, Simonides, Plato, Socrates, Epicurus, Euripides, and others. He also brings out the inadequacy of the human mind in the present historical order to elaborate universally applicable principles of morality and to cope with the final cause of morality, man's destiny. He shows equally the lack of moral force to observe even the imperfect morality worked out by the sages of pagan antiquity. Thus the need of a revealed moral doctrine.

The second chapter, "The Divine Initiative," demonstrates forcefully that the moral life and salvation of men depend ultimately, not on their efforts, but on the transcendent love of a triune God; there can be no room for a moral of rugged individualism, when morality itself, in a supernatural order, must be the gift of a God whose infinite happiness consists in a loving communion of three divine Persons. Precisely because the fall of mankind in Adam is total, profound, incurable from the standpoint of any or all human initiative (since it is a fall from Trinitarian life given with utter gratuity to the human race in Adam), God has intervened to show forth His true nature, which is infinite goodness shared equally by three divine Persons. Although God can always draw good from evil, the work of salvation must not be conceived as a device of divine wisdom designed to repair

a disaster which happened, as it were, accidentally; rather it is the efficacious execution of a will which is sovereignly merciful and which always retains the entire initiative in all of its interventions in men's lives. God's plan of salvation conceived this prodigious fact: that He should allow all men to be "united in disobedience, in order that He might show forth His mercy to all" (Rom 11:32) and that "where sin had abounded, grace might abound still more" (Rom 5:20).

The third chapter, "In Christ Jesus," separates truly Christian morality from a purely natural morality, as a prolongation, an extension, a fulfilment of the life of Christ in His members. Our Lord's fulness of life flows over into the souls of His followers to such an extent that the "rule of life" of a Christian consists in conforming his thought and his conduct to the perfect model, Christ. Each Christian is called to be associated with the glory of the Son of God. This imitation of Christ St. Paul calls the accomplishment of "the law of Christ" (Gal 6:2). This Christian morality is, and can only be, however, a result of the union of our very being and life with Christ: one lives, thinks, and loves according to what one is. Little by little, "the life of Jesus is made manifest in us" (2 Cor 5:10).

The fourth chapter, "By the Holy Spirit," shows how the primordial love of the Father, made manifest and palpable in Christ Jesus, is brought to perfection by the Pentecostal gift of the Holy Spirit, the bond of union between Father and Son. The secret of Christian morality is the charity of the Blessed Trinity, urging each Christian to a fuller participation of Christ's charity and, by accepting the gift of His Spirit, to put on, as it were, His charity, His sentiments. This fraternal charity is filled with tenderness (Rom 12:10; 1 Th 4:9) and teaches us the secret of forgetting self to search out the good and happiness of our neighbor (1 Cor 13:5; 10:24, 33), namely, whatever will help our neighbor toward salvation, and particularly those who most need help (1 Th 5:14; 1 Cor 8:9; 9:22). Christian charity always seeks to harmonize its own reactions with those of the members of Christ, particularly with those who are most removed from us in various tastes and modes of thought (Rom 12:16); thus it is that Christian charity "edifies," i.e., builds up each individual soul and the entire Church of Christ (1 Cor 8:1 ff.).

S. here points out the abyss separating genuine Christian morality from that of the Jewish contemporaries of the *NT*, a fact strikingly confirmed by recent literature on the Dead Sea Scrolls. The legalism of Jewish morality tried to foresee the maximum of possible "cases" which might confront the righteous man, and to determine for him his reaction; the result was to ensnare men in a thicket so bristling with precepts and prohibitions that

they became suffocated. Furthermore, the very multiplicity and complexity of laws were such that they could be known only by a so-called elite of intellectuals transformed into casuists.

In the entire history of moral, Paul occupies a prominent position by his proclamation of the abolition of the Law. He knew from the prophet Jeremiah that God in the messianic era would replace the juridical code engraven on tablets of stone by a law written in the hearts of the elect and making known to them the exact will of God (Heb 8:10, 11). The Apostle substitutes the interior inspiration of the Holy Spirit for the rigidly obligatory and purely external observance of the letter of the Law (2 Cor 3:3). The Spirit illumines the conscience of Christians (Rom 8:16; 9:1). Christian virtue and moral living, then, are no longer merely an exact obedience to a general law prescribed for all; rather their measure and norm is purity of intention (Acts 23:1; 2 Cor 4:2; 2 Tim 1:3). The true Christian does not act primarily under constraint through the fear of sanctions, but because of the demands of conscience in loving response to the call of Trinitarian love (Rom 8:5). Conscience itself, inspired and enlightened by the Spirit, judges whether any particular action corresponds to God's salvific will; it is soiled if it acts against the inspiration of the Spirit (Tit 1:15; Heb 9:14; 10:2, 22). One is never authorized to act without having consulted this interior judge of our thoughts and of the most delicate orientations of our heart; to conduct oneself otherwise, even in full material conformity with the Law, is to sin (Rom 14:23).

Perhaps here, in his consideration of the Pauline doctrine that man through Christian justification is freed from the servitude of the Law, S. makes his most valuable contribution to the renewal of moral theology and of its influence on Christian life. In this insistence he is not alone. Other outstanding exegetes in the past few years have proposed the same doctrine with equal insistence; among these might be mentioned S. Lyonnet and G. Salet. It is perfectly true that Christian morality must insist on the observance of natural law, that it must develop solutions to new moral problems arising from the crises of the atomic age, from advances in medical science, psychotherapy, depth psychology, etc., but the power to observe any law, whether revealed or natural, can never proceed from knowledge of the law and of its obligation, however perfect, but only from a spirit of faith and charity already possessed in baptism and poured into our hearts by the Spirit of God "who is given unto us" (Rom 5:5). The desired renewal of moral theology, then, comes down to this: even more important than an exact knowledge of objective law for any Christian is the realization that the end of all law is charity (1 Tim 1:5); that all valid laws express the

plan of infinite wisdom pointing out the true and only path toward the possession of God, whose revealed Word defines Himself as charity (1 Jn 4:7); that moral living which is in accord with God's will can never consist in mere external observance of law and can never be effectively carried out except in our grace-inspired response to the outpourings of Trinitarian life and love, the unique source and only goal of all Christian morality.

Weston College

PHILIP J. DONNELLY, S.J.

CHRISTUS VICTOR MORTIS. Preface by E. Dhanis, S.J. Rome: Gregorian University, 1958. Pp. 384.

As the fruit of the third Theological Week held at the Gregorian University in Rome in the fall of 1957, some of the more important conferences given on that occasion have been made available in book form. Ten of the fourteen papers are by professors of the University, the others by invited scholars; the languages used are Italian, French, English, Spanish, and Latin. All the contributions are in the best tradition of Roman scholarship, and together they constitute a highly satisfactory survey of the many facets of our Lord's triumph over death.

The resurrection is examined from the viewpoint of both dogmatic and biblical theology, as well as under its critical and apologetic aspects, and there are further articles on the liturgical and ascetical implications of this fundamental Christian belief. The first article is an exposition of the Catholic doctrine on the resurrection of all men; as its author, L. Ciappi, O.P., remarks, it need cause no surprise that this dogma of the final resurrection of all should set the keynote for the rest. If Christ's victory over death enjoys a priority not only in time but in intrinsic dignity and perfection when compared to the analogous victory of mankind, nonetheless the two are but so many aspects of the one common victory, that of the Mystical Body of which Christ is the Head and we the members. On the vexed question of the possibility of the human body remaining in the resurrection numerically identical with the body of this earthly existence, the author proposes a return to the teaching of St. Thomas' later years. This doctrine rests on the principle that the risen man will be identical with the man who was subjected to the dissolution of the grave, so long as in the resurrection the essentials of human nature are in his case numerically the same as before. The identity of the human soul in its natural immortality is clear. The identity of the material part of the risen man is to be explained by the fact that the prime matter retains in potency the very dimensions it possessed when originally informed by the soul; these same dimensions are once again actuated in the resurrec-

tion by the power of God, since they remained in the matter in obediential potency. Hence, "having the same matter, the same dimensions, with the same soul, there will rise the same man, and not another" (St. Thomas, *Opusc.* 52, 7). Other papers in this dogmatic section deal with "Cristo glorioso, revelador del Padre," by J. Alfaro, S.J., and the "Consummation of the Universe in Christ," by J. H. Wright, S.J. We shall speak shortly of W. A. Van Roo's discussion of the nature of the causal influence of Christ's resurrection in man's redemption.

St. Paul's teaching on this soteriological value of our Saviour's resurrection is the subject of the first article under the heading of biblical theology. Here S. Lyonnet, S.J., argues cogently against the tendency of many theological manuals to restrict the dogmatic study of the redemption merely to the meritorious and satisfactory values of Christ's human activity in behalf of men. Where the mysterious but real efficient causality here involved is slighted, no completely satisfying picture of the salvific efficacy of the resurrection can be drawn; certainly such a picture is deficient in one of the elements in the redemptive process most strongly emphasized by St. Paul. "As tradition has insisted, it is indeed by His death that Christ reunited us to God, but only in so far as this death is the supreme act of love and therefore in essence a triumph over death: *regnavit a ligno Deus*. But if we prescind from the resurrection, there is the danger that Christ's death will never appear as a victory, but at best as the payment of a debt. This is why Scripture and the Fathers and St. Thomas as well refused to construct their synthesis of the redemption exclusively on the basis of meritorious causality; St. Thomas centered his thought around the instrumental causality of Christ's humanity; Scripture offers the more imaginative picture of man returning to God: in either case the death and resurrection of Christ remain very closely associated. Thus we easily understand how St. Paul could say that Christ 'was delivered up for our offences, and rose again for our justification' (Rom. 4,25)." In this same category of biblical theology Teodorico da Castel S. Pietro, O.F.M., exposes the doctrine of Christ's heavenly priesthood as this is found in the Epistle to the Hebrews; Msgr. S. Garafolo analyzes Oscar Cullmann's theory on the "intermediate eschatology" of St. Paul, and in his essay, "Caput influit sensum et motum," S. Tromp, S.J., interprets Col 2:19 and Eph 4:16 in the light of Catholic tradition.

If we accept Lyonnet's evaluation of the importance of the efficient instrumental causality of the risen Christ in mankind's redemption, how precisely are we to understand this causality? This is a theological problem. By way of answer to it W. A. Van Roo, S.J., suggests a most interesting application to the resurrection of a theory of instrumental causality where

the instrument in question belongs to the genus of signs. The theory itself has been elaborated by the author in his recently published book, *De sacramentis in genere* (Rome, 1957). Where the created instrument used by God is an external sign, indicative of God's will and manifesting this will, "there is full freedom from the conditions of matter. Acting by intellect and will, God can produce effects which are distant or future in relation to the external sign." And further, "God can produce any effect by an efficacious sign of His will. Since the divine power extends to all possible effects, even to the production of grace, God can produce grace by the sign that manifests His will." Hence the conclusion: the resurrection of Christ as an event in history is not only the exemplar of our justification and of our ultimate risen life, but also "instrumental efficient cause of our grace and future glory; for it is the consummation of the mystery of redemption in Christ the Head, the efficacious sign of the Divine Salvific Will. By it God has shown forth Christ's victory. By it God shows and effects the grace and glory of those who through Christ and in Christ will receive His gift." And a similar instrumental causality regarding the justification and final glorification of all the saved is exercised by the risen humanity of our Lord so that both the resurrection as historical event and the risen humanity of Christ in glory exercise a true efficient as well as exemplary causal influence in regard to our justification in this life and our resurrection in glory in the next.

The apologetic aspects of the resurrection are discussed in three articles: the Marcan account of the burial of Jesus is the subject of an enlightening study by E. Dhanis, S.J.; K. Prümm, S.J., writes on the death and resurrection of the gods in Hellenistic legend; and V. Marcozzi, S.J., analyzes the more striking medico-psychological problems which arise from the death and resurrection of Christ. Three liturgico-ascetical articles close the volume: the liturgical use of the Paschal mysteries is the subject of an article by H. Schmidt, S.J.; A. Raes, S.J., examines the Byzantine liturgical tradition concerning the resurrection; and the spiritual life is presented as man's progressive participation in Christ's resurrection by Luis M. Mendizábal, S.J.

This collection of essays is a major contribution to the theology of the resurrection. The authors are widely acknowledged as competent scholars in their respective fields, but by and large their findings are here presented in a discursive form that should prove eminently intelligible to the educated reader. One cannot help but remark, however, that of the four modern languages here used as vehicles of theological thought, it is English that fares least well. Transliteration of the technically accepted Latin words familiar to the Scholastic theologian is far from being the answer to the problem of

presenting our Catholic theology to contemporary English-speaking audiences.

Woodstock College

JOHN F. SWEENEY, S.J.

OUR LIFE OF GRACE. By F. Cuttaz. Translated by Angeline Bouchard. Chicago: Fides, 1958. Pp. viii + 327. \$6.95.

Canon Cuttaz gives us a positive study of sanctifying grace, professing that practical knowledge keeps one from sin. Quite logically he starts out with final causality, which he labels "formal effects of grace": seed of glory and resurrection, participation in the nature of God, supernatural sonship, justification. Then he deals with effects which he says are distinct from grace but derived from it: the dwelling of God in the soul, infused virtues, actual grace, the gifts of the Holy Spirit. In the third part he considers the effects of grace that stem from our prayers and good works. The professional theologian might raise his eyebrows at the division.

C. is of the sound opinion that "Most theology books give too little space to sanctifying grace . . . while filling many pages with controversies on actual grace" (p. 7). This work should certainly attain its aim in helping to multiply the elite in all groups of the faithful. We must, however, point out a number of confusing, if not erroneous, statements. A few examples: "God gives help more liberally to the just who belong not merely to the soul of the Church, but to her 'body'" (p. 192). "Grace . . . subsists in heaven" (pp. 36 and 167). Concerning good works meriting actual graces: "He is free to resist them or to accept them. If he accepts them, they become efficacious"; then in the next paragraph: "It is probable that some works merit efficacious grace" (p. 277). Some of the inaccuracies may be the fault of the translator and editor, such as the quotation from Trent which must read "the justified person truly merits by the works he performs" rather than "the person justified by the good works he performs" (p. 28). Another grave mistake which is obviously a translator's or printer's blunder: "faith and hope which can exist without form with sins that are directly opposed to them" (p. 180) should read "not directly opposed," as it does on p. 205. Translating *simpliciter* as "simply" may, perhaps, be tolerated; but could not and should not someone keep "the reason is because" (p. 302) from getting into print?

C. touches upon profound and beautiful truths without fully digesting them, as when he writes: "Not only is Christ's sonship the final and exemplary cause of our sonship, it is also its efficient cause" (p. 90). C., however, does not draw out the full implications of this Christocentricity in the entire supernatural order. On pp. 140 and 156 there are references to the presence

of Christ crucified in the Christian. But C. states: "It is not the humanity of Jesus that is in us through grace . . . it is only his divinity distinct from his Eucharistic presence in us through Communion." We must avoid pan-christism, but is it not possible that through the sacramental characters and through grace the humanity, factually inseparable from the divinity, is in some way present in a different manner than in the Eucharist?

On the question of the requirements for merit C. seems to waver; cf. pp. 239, 256, 260, 285. We could not expect a good theologian to know, much less give, all the answers. We should not expect one theologian to know all the problems. What we do expect is that the theologian does not pretend to be giving a definite answer when he cannot. For the most part C. proves himself a good theologian in this work.

*Assumption Seminary,
Chaska, Minn.*

JUNIPER CUMMINGS, O.F.M. CONV.

DIE TAUFGE: EINE GENETISCHE ERKLÄRUNG DER TAUFLITURGIE. By Alois Stenzel, S.J. Innsbruck: Felizian Rauch, 1958. Pp. 320. \$6.20.

To reconstruct the early liturgy of baptism from the broken pieces that survive is quite as hazardous an undertaking as the reconstruction of the body of primitive man from a jawbone and a few bits of skull, and there are the same problems of forgery to be met with; liturgists have their own Pilt-down specimens. Fr. Stenzel has gallantly tried to give a reconstruction of the early baptism liturgy by examining all the evidence that has come down to us and then to use his reconstruction to make suggestions for the adaptation of the modern liturgy to make it more conformable to its ancient pattern. He has not, however, escaped all the hazards. He disagrees with Jungmann's dating of the start of an organized catechumenate to the time of Justin and wants to postpone it to about 170, following in this Capelle and Harnack. But Harnack went on the assumption that the Church began as a *tabula rasa* and that the earliest Christians passed their time in a spirit-inspired free-for-all, after which various fixed elements of organization began to appear, the coming into existence of which had to be proved in each case. Capelle followed him, content to dismiss Justin's words about the candidates for baptism being invited to fast and pray as devoid of all institutional reference. What is more, he failed to find any fault in Harnack's treatment of Marcion's comment on Gal 6:6, where (according to Jerome, who cites Marcion; *PL* 26, 429) Marcion found authority for catechumens and faithful praying together. How anyone, unless hypnotized by Harnack, could fail to see in this passage evidence for the separation of catechumens and faith-

ful in the Church *before* Marcion broke away, passes the understanding of this reviewer. And if the catechumens prayed as a separate body, then they had some kind of corporate existence even in the early years of the second century. The evidence about baptisteries, which S. does not consider, points in the same direction. Melito uses the word for baptistery in his homily on baptism (a document not mentioned by S.), and as the *Acts of Paul* (written in the same part of the world a little before the time of Melito) show Paul taking Artemulla to the seashore for baptism, one may infer that the baptistery as a separate place came into use in Asia Minor just about the middle of the second century—an inference that the archeological discoveries at Dura-Europos would support. Where baptisteries are in use, it is safe to say that the catechumenate is an established institution. After all, there was some warrant for it among the practices of the Jews, especially the people of Qumrân, though S. steers clear of all Jewish analogies.

On the origins of the baptismal formula, he is content to follow de Puniet in holding that the interrogations serve as formula until the fourth century in the East and until a later time in the West, though he is very wide of the truth in saying that the first evidence of the form, "I baptize you in the name of the Father, etc.," in the West comes from the eighth century; this is four centuries too late, as the formula is found in the work of the pseudo-Vigilius, *De trinitate*, a work that belongs to the fourth century. This evidence, along with that of the new homilies of John Chrysostom on baptism and with the *Catecheses* of Theodore of Mopsuestia, provides some reason for thinking that Christians everywhere had been getting used to the formula for some time before that, to say the least. The variation between the descriptive formula of the East and the assertive one of the West might also suggest that the prototype of the two varieties was earlier still. On p. 48 S. uses an inverted form of this argument in a very curious way. Because Justin makes no distinction between the ritual of Rome and that of Ephesus or Palestine in his account of baptism, he infers that there was then no uniformity and in fact no "rituelle Verfestigung." This is rather like Gilbert's famous line: "Have you a strawberry mark on the right arm? No? Then you are my long-lost brother." All in all, the collection of evidence in this work is good, but the use made of it shows some weaknesses. The publishers in their handout say that the book has 334 pages, but inspection of two copies shows that only 320 have been printed; yet there is no sign of a chapter having been left out. One might with advantage have been added to examine more carefully the meaning of *epiklēsis* in connexion with the baptismal formula, starting from the debate that took place on this point between Tyrer and Connolly in Volume 25 of the *Journal of Theological Studies*; one text in particular of

Gregory of Nyssa (*Or. catech.* 33) makes a clear distinction between *epiklêsis* and *pistis* in the act of baptism.

London, England

J. H. CREHAN, S.J.

LE SACERDOCE DANS LE MYSTÈRE DU CHRIST. By Joseph Lécuyer, C.S.Sp. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1957. Pp. 412.

Père Lécuyer develops the initiative of Martimort and Thornton in relating the life of the Christian to the life of Christ. It is this analogy, exposed especially by Thornton to clarify the relation of confirmation to baptism and here greatly expanded and enriched by scriptural and patristic evidence, which gives unity to L.'s work.

There is a resemblance and dependence, L. maintains, between, on the one hand, the Incarnation in which Christ is anointed by the Holy Spirit as priest and His baptism which illustrates His vocation to be the paschal sacrifice and, on the other hand, the baptism of the Christian who is thereby reborn of the Spirit and initiated into the paschal mystery. At the same time, the Christian is anointed to share the common priesthood of the Body of Christ and so enabled to offer the paschal Victim. This original unction is not only priestly but also royal and prophetic. In a second unction, given after His baptism by John, Jesus is anointed by the Holy Spirit as prophet for His battle with Satan and for the apostolate of preaching. This unction is related to confirmation, in which the Holy Spirit anoints the Christian as prophet so that he may fight Satan and bear witness. Confirmation depends also on the coming of the Holy Spirit at Pentecost upon all who were gathered together in the Cenacle with the Apostles.

L. carries the analogy further by relating the priesthood of the second rank first of all to the anointing of Christ as priest in the Incarnation and then to the actual conferral of the power of the priesthood on the Apostles on the evening of the resurrection. This was essentially the power to forgive sins and included, above all, the power to offer the paschal sacrifice. Here L. agrees with those who hold that at the Last Supper the Apostles were constituted priests in much the same juridical fashion as the pope today names a bishop who is to be consecrated later. The episcopal priesthood is related to Christ's anointing by the Spirit as prophet after His baptism and also to Christ's sending His Spirit upon the Apostles at Pentecost. Thus Christ gave them the charism of being His official witnesses and sent them in turn as His Apostles to give His Spirit to others.

L. distinguishes two aspects of the sacrifice and of the priesthood of Jesus. The first aspect corresponds to the ancient sacrifice for sins, the sacrifice of

expiation, and is related to the paschal mystery for which Jesus was anointed as priest at the Incarnation and for the offering of which in the Eucharist, in different ways, the priesthood of the faithful and the priesthood of the second rank were instituted. The second aspect corresponds to the sacrifice of the covenant by which God established Israel as His people and gave it His law. Pentecost, the fulfilment of that covenant in the giving of the New Law, essentially the Spirit, and in the establishing of a new Israel, was prefigured in the descent of the Spirit on Jesus and is today realized in all Christians through confirmation and in a special way in the sacrament of orders which confers the episcopal priesthood.

Easter and Pentecost with their corresponding degrees of the sacrament of orders are related to two distinct groups of sacraments. Simple priests are the ordinary ministers of those sacraments which destroy sin, namely, baptism, penance, the Eucharist, and extreme unction, while bishops are the ordinary ministers of those sacraments which confer a particular mission to be accomplished in the Church, namely, confirmation and holy orders. Moreover, bishops have a power over the Eucharist which is superior to that of their collaborators; they also provide simple priests with the matter proper to the sacraments of penance and holy orders, namely, blessed oil and Christians submitted to their jurisdiction.

It is in the unity of the episcopal body which has a head and which acts as a whole that the bishops exercise their chief office as teachers. Simple priests collaborate with their bishops not only in the offering of sacrifice, which is the essence of their priesthood, but they are also made capable by the grace of ordination of being associated with the bishop, in the degree to which he calls them, in his pastoral mission.

In an exegetical study of the unction of Christ which appeared in *Nouvelle revue théologique* after, but not in connection with, the publication of L.'s book, Père de la Potterie came to conclusions which warrant a reconsideration of the scriptural bases of some aspects of L.'s concordism. While for the Fathers, de la Potterie says, the titles of priest, king, and prophet describe a manner of being, with the result that the unction of Christ must be connected with His human nature from the moment of the hypostatic union, the New Testament connects a unique unction with the work of salvation in its historic development, with the inauguration at Christ's baptism of His ministry and function as prophet. For the biblical writers, Christ became the "perfected" High Priest and Lord of the heavenly kingdom beginning with His exaltation to the right hand of the Father. Indeed, according to L., the Fathers are divided on the existence of a twofold unction.

Even if some of L.'s assertions should prove to constitute a too facile concordism, he has made an important contribution to theology, liturgy, and the ecumenical movement.

College of New Rochelle, N.Y.

JOHN J. QUINN

ETUDES SUR LE SACREMENT DE L'ORDRE. *Lex orandi* 22. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1957. Pp. 446.

This collection of fourteen papers read at a meeting of the Centre de Pastorale Liturgique, apparently in 1955 at Vanves, has a preface by the Bishop of Coutances, but there is no indication of the presence of an editor of the collection. After six of the papers, a stenographer's report of the discussion is given and there are signs that a copy of this has been submitted to the reader of the paper for his further comments, but no reason is given why the discussion, if any, which followed the other papers is not reported. There are other mysteries on the editorial side of the book; one of the papers has been published elsewhere, as the text of pp. 77-90 has already appeared in the *Revue des sciences religieuses* 29 (1955) 250-61, but the writer, J. Schmitt, who is dealing with Palestinian priesthoods (the Temple and Qumrân) and the early Christian hierarchy, has here added to his former article a few paragraphs, in one of which he is able to state that conclusions which he called conjectural in 1955 are now certain. Even the immense spate of writing about Qumrân can hardly have led to so quick a change, and one would like to have had more evidence of what had led the writer to make this change. There is no index, not even of Scripture passages.

Two papers, by Dom B. Botte of Mont César (Louvain), concern the early ordination prayers and his theory of the collegiate character of both the episcopate and of the order of priests. Most of these texts derive from the *Traditio apostolica* of Hippolytus, and Dom Botte takes this work as a prototype of the ordination prayers in the West as well as in those Eastern Churches which have preserved its text in their Coptic, Arabic, or Ethiopic speech. It is true that there is a Latin version of the work, which Dom Botte is inclined to overvalue, but the problem that is raised in the discussion following his paper can hardly be solved on the assumptions that he makes. Briefly, the problem is that of the source of the typology drawn from the Aaronic priesthood. The Western prayers have it fully developed, but it is not in the *Traditio*. The institution by Moses of the seventy elders there occupies the whole picture, and there is no mention of the sons of Aaron, Eleazar, and Ithamas. Dom Botte says that the Aaronic

typology is much less developed in his sources, apart from the Western Sacramentaries, but he does not say that in Hippolytus it is not present at all. The problem has been noticed and well discussed by John Bligh, S.J., in his *Ordination to the Priesthood* (London and New York, 1956, pp. 16-18), a work that is not mentioned by the contributors to this symposium. After Heb 7:11 one might think that there would never be any question of bringing in the Aaronic priesthood as a type of Christian ordination, as Canon Martimort well claims in the discussion here reported, and Dom Botte's answer seems to be quite beside the point. Why mention Aaron when Melchisedech is not named? Why does the sacrificial side of a priest's duties come to notice so slowly in antiquity? These are questions that might have been dealt with in a work of this character, but they are not raised.

Another paper by Dom Botte deals with the collegiate character of priesthood and episcopate. There is great play with the word *ordo* in its civil use for such bodies as the *ordo equester*, but if Dom Botte had taken account of such phrases as *ordo publicanorum* and *ordo libertinorum* he could hardly have argued that linguistic use alone made it clear that the bishop acts as a member of a corporate body. The taxgatherer may have had to comply with certain rules before he was admitted as a *publicanus*, but in his taxgathering he was not consciously acting as the member of a corporate body which comprised all *publicani*. He had his own partners, but their contract was not one which involved all taxgatherers everywhere. For the consecration of a bishop it is true that the *Traditio apostolica* speaks of several bishops acting, but Dom Botte does not discuss the equally important text from the *Apostolic Canons* which allowed consecration by a single bishop in time of persecution. Here it was required that afterwards "many other holy bishops should give him warrant (*psēphos*), permitting this office to him," but this is rather the ratifying of an election than the completing of a consecration. Nor is there any discussion in this connection of the phrase of Cyprian that bishops are so united in the one episcopate that "a singulis in solidum pars tenetur." M. Bévenot, S.J., has recently done something to elucidate that phrase, and the French symposiasts might have done well to consider it more closely.

J. Lécuyer, C.S.Sp., has a most interesting paper on the link between Pentecost and priesthood. Severianus of Gabala is cited for the view that the placing of the book of the Scriptures on the head of the bishop is to imitate the parted tongues of fire. If account is taken of the many places in the tradition where the blessing of the Apostles by Christ (with imposition of hands, in the Jewish manner of blessing) at His ascension is held to be

an ordination to the episcopate, and when it is further considered that early tradition did not always separate the ascension and Pentecost as we do now, but sometimes celebrated them on the same day, it is clear that Lécuyer's thesis gains in probability. There is a paper on the Council of Trent and its decrees about the priesthood, but the writer, Père Duval, O.P., does not notice that Salmeron at Trent had defended the view that ascension blessing and Pentecostal descent of the Spirit were two parts of the one sacrament of order. Other papers deal with canonical and pastoral aspects of the priesthood, and the whole volume shows a lively interest in the theology of the sacrament of orders from every point of view.

London, England

J. H. CREHAN, S.J.

THE MASS AND LITURGICAL REFORM. By John L. Murphy. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1956. Pp. xii + 340. \$5.95.

It is hard not to be enthusiastic about this book. The first impression given to the reader is only strengthened each time he picks it up: that it is an excellent piece of work and deserves a wide reading public. It deals with a difficult and delicate subject, and yet Fr. Murphy succeeds in treating that subject with all the problems and the misgivings that arise from it with rare tact and discretion. No one could reasonably take offense at what he says, yet he leaves nothing unsaid that is demanded by a thorough discussion of the whole important matter of liturgical reform. This is the age of liturgical reform and it is being discussed in all its phases throughout the Church—particularly in Europe and the missionary countries. It is the particular merit of this book that it makes available to Catholics of the United States everything that has been suggested in these other countries and shows the reason for the suggestions that have been made.

M.'s aim is not to win people to his point of view but merely to discuss the problems arising from the whole question of liturgical reform. His book is, then, not a tract or a polemic but a serious and scholarly presentation of the subject. As a result he does not launch into a series of haphazard suggestions to eliminate this or introduce that; if he had, the book would be much shorter but it would also be much less effective. For it is not enough to set down plans or programs for change even when the change is an improvement. You must lay the groundwork by a solid study of the liturgy itself—what it is and what it is meant to do—before you can make suggestions calculated to make the liturgy do its work more effectively. Hence the first chapters, embracing a good ninety-one pages, are on the liturgy itself; on faith and the liturgy; on liturgy and religious

instruction; on liturgy as an experience. The last mentioned is one of the best chapters—if not the best—in the book. It shows what the liturgy is meant to do so well and so convincingly that the way is prepared for all that follows.

After reading these chapters, the reader is in a much better position to understand why the liturgy needs to be reformed and what principles must ever preside over any true reform. M. insists rightly that the liturgy is primarily pastoral: it looks to the needs of the people and must be in fact as well as in theory the expression of the worship of the community of the redeemed. Hence in all the chapters that deal directly with reform the aim of M. and of those whom he quotes so extensively is nothing less than to make the Mass come to life as the living worship of the living Church. In pursuing this aim he has wisely traced the history of the Mass-rite itself, for in no other way can we hope to grasp what is truly traditional in its development and consequently what must be insisted upon in any fruitful reform. It is never a matter of returning to the past for the past's sake but is always a matter of preserving (or reviving) those elements which must always make up authentic Christian worship: the abundant use of the Scriptures, the full participation of the whole community, the active leadership of the priesthood in the celebration of the sacred mysteries.

Only in such a complete vision of the liturgy can the thorny question of the vernacular have any real validity; for unless it is considered in relation to the whole nature of the liturgy itself, discussions about the vernacular must degenerate into unseemly wrangling in which the real purpose of the liturgy itself is lost to view. M. shows great wisdom in leaving the question of the vernacular to the end and thereby makes by far the most convincing case for it that this reviewer has ever read; he achieves this by placing this discussion in the setting in which it belongs. Even at that, all will not be convinced by his arguments nor see their force, but at least no one can deny that the case for the vernacular is well presented and in the only way that it can be properly presented at all. For the only worthwhile argument for the vernacular is that it is a corollary of the very nature of the liturgy itself. Whether it would be opportune or desirable or possible is another question altogether; about that men can and will argue for a long time.

This reviewer has only one real stricture to make, and that is not upon anything that M. says himself. In his chapter on suggested reforms he makes much of Abbot Durst's scheme for the revision of the Canon. There is hardly enough space to go into a discussion of all the weaknesses

in Durst's position, but it will be enough to say that in recommending changes from the present tense to the future in some parts of the Canon and the elimination of certain words in others he does not take into account that the Canon is the *one* prayer that expresses what the Church is doing all during the time she is offering sacrifice to God. That sacrifice begins with the dialogue of the Preface; during the course of this prayer sacrifice and thanksgiving are offered to God. The actual consecration takes place in an instant, but there is not enough time to express all that is done—hence the need of a longer prayer. Yet all the parts of that one prayer only develop and explain what we do at the consecration; they deal with what is being done here and now, not with what will be done or with what has been done.

St. Mary's Seminary, Baltimore, Md.

WILLIAM O'SHEA

LITURGISCHE ERNEUERUNG IN DER WELTMISSION. By Johannes Hofinger, S.J., and Joseph Kellner, S.J. Innsbruck: Tyrolia Verlag, 1957. Pp. 455.

This is a collective work composed principally by the above-named authors, to which Paul Brunner, S.J., and Johannes Seffer, S.J., have made appreciable contributions. The objective of the authors is to show how the liturgy must be the center of pastoral activity. After an enlightened discussion of the missionary value of the worship of the Church, the authors take up different themes concerning the celebration of Mass, the dialogue Mass, catechetical instruction about the Mass, the use of Scripture at Mass, the importance of Psalms in worship, and the catechetical value of the celebration of feastdays. Another section follows, treating of the function and manner of celebration of worship without a priest, a frequent occurrence in missionary lands, concluding with five examples of the arrangement of this type of worship for specific feasts. Kellner then discusses the place and value of music in missionary worship, a chapter which is by far the most excellent in the book. In a chapter on the ritual of the sacraments the authors discuss the suitability of some of our Western rites in Eastern lands and urge toward a wider use of symbols and customs better appreciated by peoples in missionary lands possessing a culture quite distinct from our own. Finally, Hofinger explains the many liturgical desiderata which missionaries have been laying before the Apostolic See.

While discussing early worship in missionary environs, H. makes the claim that in the first centuries Christians received whatever religious knowledge they possessed from the worship of the Church exclusively. Although H. says he fears no exaggeration here, I am afraid it is precisely

that, for many of the reports that have come down to us from earliest times clearly show that special instructions were imparted to the catechumens. Both Cyprian and Hippolytus speak of special classes and teachers for the neophytes. Hence—and other historical instances could be brought forth—the first centuries do not offer us “irrefutable proof that it is basically possible to impart the necessary religious knowledge through worship *alone*” (pp. 26–27).

Specialists will also have some reservations regarding K.'s suggestions for rearranging the Eucharistic celebration. While the name “Secret” may not be an altogether appropriate title for the prayer before the Preface of the Mass, neither is “Postoblatio,” for the Offertory is certainly not the oblation of the Mass (p. 94, note 22). We would also hesitate in accepting the recommendation that we insert an adaptation of the *Oratio fidelium* within the Offertory (p. 104). The traditional place for such a universal impetratory prayer is at the end of the Foremass, and such a place suits it well, for the reading service builds up to a natural climax in prayer.

But in H.'s treatment of worship without a priest we find a really astounding statement. He says that such worship is genuinely liturgical: “Es handelt sich hier um wirkliche Liturgie, wenigstens in dem Sinn und Rang, als man auch das Stundengebet der Nonnen als Liturgie bezeichnet und gelten lässt” (p. 216). His reason for claiming this: we have here the worship of a Christian community which is ordered by the Church and performed in her name. We certainly have present the worship of a Christian community, but it is not ordered by the Church, if we understand here the Supreme Head of the Church “who *alone* enjoys the right to recognize and establish any practice of divine worship, to introduce and approve new rites, etc.” (*Mediator Dei*, America Press edition, § 58). That the Holy Father is speaking specifically of liturgical rites here is clear from his own footnote reference to canon 1257: “Unius Apostolicae Sedis est tum sacram ordinare liturgiam, tum liturgicos approbare libros.” Without such papal institution of a rite as liturgical, the rite simply is not liturgical. Neither can it be argued that the local ordinary has the power to establish a liturgical practice; his only right in matters liturgical is “carefully to watch over the exact observance of the prescriptions of the sacred canons” (*Mediator Dei*, § 58). And the reference which H. makes to solemnly professed nuns who recite a truly liturgical prayer when they chant the divine office is to no avail, for they have been given an explicit deputation for this liturgical act by Rome (*ibid.*, § 142).

To continue to make such assertions is simply to deceive oneself and

others and to attribute to acts of purely private piety, even though performed by a group in a sacred place, a value and efficacy which simply contradict the mind of the Church. Fortunately, the exaggerations noted in the chapters written by H. are in no wise necessary for the support of his principal theses. And the book, these items apart, is a valuable contribution to missiology and the place a sound liturgical life should have in the missionary endeavor of the Church.

The Catholic University of America

JOHN H. MILLER, C.S.C.

GESCHICHTE DES KONZILS VON TRIENT 2: DIE ERSTE TRIENTER TAGUNGS-PERIODE (1545-47). By Hubert Jedin. Freiburg: Herder, 1957. Pp. x + 550. DM 38.—

The first volume of this history, which had been preceded by an excellent study of the historiography of the Council of Trent, appeared in 1949 and described the struggle which preceded the Council. The second volume begins with the opening of the Council on December 13, 1545 and ends with the departure, on March 12, 1547, of the legates from Trent for Bologna in the Papal States, whither the Council had been transferred. The first eleven chapters of the present work treat, in chronological order, the work of the Council in the spheres of dogma and reform. Chap. 12 treats of life at Trent, with emphasis on the liturgical and economic aspects. Chap. 13 investigates some of the more important aspects of the Council: among others, attendance, freedom of speech, influence of the legates and of the Powers. There follows a chapter of thirty pages on the value of the sources and of preceding studies on this part of the Council. The notes which indicate the sources of this personal synthesis are relegated to the end of the book and occupy more than eighty pages in small type.

In his judgment of the histories of Sarpi and Pallavicini (pp. 441 ff.), Jedin makes clear his claims. Because he did not possess all the sources, Sarpi thought himself obligated even to invent documents to bolster his theories. Whatever may be said of his literary and diplomatic gifts, Sarpi is unreliable, nay worthless, as an historian. Pallavicini was much better equipped as far as the sources go. J. points out that, although Ranke criticized both Sarpi and Pallavicini, he followed the latter in all essential matters. Since, however, we have all of Pallavicini's sources and more, and since Pallavicini's purpose was apologetical as well as historical, J. rightly concludes that to study his position in detail would not be worth the effort. It is well known that all subsequent historians up to the publication of the acts of the Council have relied on Sarpi and Pallavicini. J.'s work is

the first, therefore, to give a general study of the Council based on the documents. The works of Richard and Michel in Hefele-Leclercq's *Histoire des conciles* were not written with this purpose. They still retain their value, especially Michel's work.

J.'s studies have enabled him to master a very difficult and complex subject. His synthesis is clear and well conducted. His judgments are sober and well balanced. It is to be hoped that he will have the time to complete his great work. Doubtless this volume, like its predecessor, will soon appear in an English translation.

Woodstock College

E. A. RYAN, S.J.

ONE IN CHRIST. By K. E. Skydsgaard. Translated from the Danish by Axel C. Kildegaard. Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1957. Pp. iv + 220.

This book has significance for Catholics and non-Catholics alike. Its author is a distinguished Lutheran professor of theology at the University of Copenhagen and a leader in Danish ecumenism. The translator is Dr. Axel Kildegaard, head of the Grand View Theological Seminary of the American Evangelical Lutheran Church in Des Moines, Iowa. The little opus is a publication of lectures given at the People's University of Copenhagen and is therefore something less than a scientific expression of theology. As a preparation for ecumenical dialogue, the work wishes to compare Roman Catholic positions on basic Christian questions with those of the Evangelical Lutheran Churches. The following themes are ventilated: Scripture and tradition; ecclesiology; faith and grace; sacraments and worship; saints and Mariology.

What makes the study significant for Catholics is its authoritative presentation of Lutheran doctrine as it is now. Professors of Catholic theology will find S.'s rapid but clear exposition of Lutheran fundamentals up to date and genuine. The book is significant for non-Catholics because the author presents Catholic doctrine with sympathy, without distortion, and with over-all accuracy. This is much to say for one book. For a Catholic, S.'s essay at presenting Catholic doctrine produces two reactions. First of all, S. strives mightily to be fair and kindly. Secondly, he has read widely in Catholic theology and has grasped its rationale. A carping critic could find things to correct, but they are accidental rather than substantial. Some strange expressions show up in the translation of S.'s Danish work. What is obviously "concupiscence" in Catholic terminology comes out as "greed" (p. 120). The Thomistic *potentia oboedientialis* is strangely rendered in English as "potential of obedience" (p. 133).

Although S. would hardly be pressed by Catholic concerns in Denmark, yet his own reading of Catholic theologians makes him somewhat apologetic in presenting Lutheran doctrine, with which he is, of course, in agreement. A theologian of the Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod would certainly understand Luther somewhat differently than Skydsgaard, who is neo-conservative rather than of any shade of fundamentalism—his ecumenical preoccupations make him highly conscious of the “yes” and “no” involved in Catholic-Lutheran conversation, but his message is winsomely irenic.

Catholic theologians who must deal with the concepts of faith, grace, righteousness, and original sin, will greatly profit by reading Skydsgaard's summary presentation of these terms according to one modern Lutheran formulation. It is here, however, that the Catholic will be puzzled. Skydsgaard refuses to deal with these matters ontologically and finds that Catholics are untrue to the Scriptures because of their ontologizing. He also refuses to legalize the ideas. One wonders what is left. Skydsgaard explains the whole matter on the explicit premise that it is beyond logic and centered in an obscure existentialist experience. The result is a warm description but hardly a lucid doctrine.

Woodstock College

GUSTAVE WEIGEL, S.J.

DU CATHOLICISME ROMAIN: APPROCHE ET INTERPRÉTATION. By Roger Mehl. *Cahiers théologiques* 40. Neuchâtel: Delachaux & Niestlé, 1957. Pp. 94.

With books and articles on every aspect of ecumenism constantly flowing from the pens of scholars, Catholic and non-Catholic, it would be hazardous to assign a place and rank to any one among the contemporary contributions to the growing literature. It may, however, be wondered whether any other faces up more honestly to the problems involved in the encounter and dialogue of Catholics with non-Catholics than this brief essay by Prof. Mehl of the University of Strasbourg.

Between the opening chapter in which he sketches the state of the ecumenical dialogue (or, more precisely, the Catholic attitude towards it) and the very brief conclusion, M. states succinctly and forcefully the basic divergences between the Catholic Church and the Reform on the subjects of Scripture and tradition, the “power” (I should say the very nature) of the Church, the Petrine primacy, the value of “works” and the allied problems of Mariology.

M.'s presentation of Catholic teaching is in general soundly based on the

official pronouncements of the Church, rounded out often enough by clarifications proposed by able modern Catholic theologians. This is not to say that the reviewer is satisfied that M. has always grasped the real significance of what he has very accurately cited. And if in most sections of his work this failure to grasp will be understandably attributed by a Catholic reviewer to the presuppositions of M. himself, it does seem that in the section on Mariology Catholic presentations must shoulder part of the blame. I suppose that there are few areas of Catholic teaching to which the sincere non-Catholic theologian may more easily bring an inbred repugnance; there are certainly few, if any, where he is expected to pick his way so constantly over the less familiar or at least less congenial terrain of tradition. If to these handicaps—in some sense neither of our making nor of his—we add unnecessarily any others, the modern Protestant theologian has a quite justifiable grievance. And it may be that we do unwittingly add to the complexity, if we intertwine too closely our primary task of finding and tracing in tradition an individual prerogative of our Lady (the Assumption, for instance) or some principle of her prerogatives (the assimilation to her divine Son) with some secondary task (discovering, for instance, in a human psychological need the “necessity” for some prerogative). This grievance will be sharpened, and what M. speaks of as the “*réaction de gêne profonde*” will mount if he feels that the psychological factors adduced tend inevitably to dislodge the God-Man from a centrality in Christian life and thought which is rightly His.

In the earlier chapters on Scripture and the Church M. makes us realize anew the gulf that separates the Catholic and the Protestant mentality. The Catholic finds it all but inconceivable that Christ should have left His followers grouped first under the authority of a designated body of living men and then for all the rest of the Christian era under the authority of a collection of books, even divinely inspired ones; the Protestant finds it derogatory to the majesty of the Word of God that it should be interpreted authoritatively, even with divine assistance, by any group of men. The common ground here appears to both author and reviewer frighteningly small.

No single sentence of M.'s treatment of the Church brings out more vividly his view of her than that in which he denies her the title “mother” (“*elle n'est pas mère au sens où elle donnerait la vie*”). One may hope that he had the grace to wince as he drew his learned pencil through the expression *mater ecclesia*, an expression that has for centuries risen easily and instinctively to the lips of distinguished Christian men and women (or, to put it in Catholic terms, to the lips of her greatest sons and daughters).

For M. the Church does not beget, foster, and nurture the Christian; rather she "services" him. And in the last analysis it is a servicing without which he can maintain himself. Putting aside any other misgivings we may have with this notion of the Church and her place in the scheme of human salvation, it leaves the impression that there is scarcely a compelling reason to desire ecumenical unity. A mother must be one; service-units can be many.

The chapter on the Petrine primacy and the allied question of a succession in that primacy leans heavily on Oscar Cullmann's *Petrus*, even though M. is not completely in sympathy with every point in Cullmann's synthesis. Given, however, the substantial accord between him and Cullmann, the chapter would have gained from some consideration of the Catholic critique of that synthesis, made among others by Journet and Karrer (*Um die Einheit der Christen*).

The tone of the present work is courteous throughout, even when M. is pointedly critical of the notion that men are subjects of grace and not merely its object, or when he sternly warns that the present trend in Catholic Mariology must culminate in a doctrine that will undermine orthodox Christianity. While it is not clear to the reviewer for how large a segment of Protestantism M. is the spokesman, it is clear that that segment is at once learned, dedicated, and convinced. And to the extent that he has recalled to us how deep is the cleavage between Catholicity and at least an important section of the Reform, he has done us all a service.

West Baden College

STEPHEN E. DONLON, S.J.

LA THÉOLOGIE DE L'HISTOIRE CHEZ REINHOLD NIEBUHR. By Georgette Paul Vignaux. *Bibliothèque théologique*. Neuchâtel and Paris: Delachaux & Niestlé, 1957. Pp. 210. 8.50 fr.s.

One of the most striking aspects of Reinhold Niebuhr's great intellectual endowment is his ability to employ theology as a source of light from which to illumine contemporary problems. He himself has pointed out more than once the constant backward and forward motion of his thought: with the problems derived from an analysis of society he returns to investigate the resources of faith, and then tests the value of the theological response he has worked out to those problems by a renewed experience of society. It is within the tensions of that dual motion that V. will attempt to work out her analysis of Niebuhr's theology of history. Her aim is to attempt to grasp the internal coherence of his thought, to analyze both his "theological" and his "historical" themes, not that she might offer a criticism

of them as such, but in order to discover and evaluate the nature of the relation which unites them in a theology of history.

V. is well aware that the task she has set herself will necessarily involve her in a great deal of what could be styled "mere exposition," but it was really the only course for her to follow. Niebuhr himself has explicitly rejected the notion of a philosophy of history, insisting, especially since 1949, that only a theology of history can solve the problems which history presents. Since he never has given an explicit definition of what precisely he means by a theology of history, one can only arrive at such a definition by considering what he has had to say in his analysis of man, of society, of politics, and how he has related this analysis to his faith. Such a task will be best accomplished by offering a detailed study of his books. V. accomplishes this summary of Niebuhr's themes with real brilliance. In so doing she has not merely fulfilled a necessary condition for the accomplishment of her main goal, but has provided the French-reading public with a splendid résumé of Niebuhr's thought. Nor is this summary a mere analysis of his published works. It is also a most perceptive commentary of the various phases of his thought and the evolution on various levels of the famous Niebuhrian themes.

It is only to be expected, then, that V. will depend heavily on Niebuhr's two volumes, *The Nature and Destiny of Man*. In 1939, when he became the fifth American invited to give the Gifford Lectures, he chose that title for his lectures and incorporated into them his thinking on anthropology and sociology and the outlines of his theology of history, outlines which he later expanded in subsequent lectureships and published under the title *Faith and History*. Although it is in these volumes that one finds the bulk of his mature thought, in order to understand it fully one must go back to Niebuhr's early days as a young pastor in Detroit. It was in that city, just beginning the growth which was to make it the automotive capital of the world, that Niebuhr's optimistic Protestant liberalism received its first shock. It was there that his prophetic fires were first kindled, and there too that he first learned to feed them with theological fuel. Detroit focused his attention on the relation between religion and the problems created by an industrial society. His bitter resentment at social wrong led him to an analysis of the wrongdoers, from sociology to anthropology. He became convinced of the need for a political orientation which is more radical and religious convictions which are more conservative. Later his emphasis would shift to a consideration of the present world culture and religion, and thus he would be led to the elaboration of his theology of history. Thus does V. trace Niebuhr's intellectual evolution.

The central illumination of the life of Niebuhr is the permanence of evil on the individual and the social level. That concept explains the pessimism of which he has been so often accused and which he has acknowledged, and it also conditions his thinking in the brighter aspects by which he has attempted to relieve that pessimism, such as his concept of love, mutual and sacrificial, and the Christ as the norm of history. It underlies Niebuhr's preoccupation with, and solution to, his lifelong query: how can a Christian act as such both on the individual and on the social level without being either a hypocrite or a fool? It is the keystone of his theology of history.

One of the most striking things about that theology of history is its contemporaneousness. He wishes to establish a relevance, a congruence, between faith and our historical existence. That is what earns him so attentive a hearing. Despite his prominence in the world of theology, he has always refused to consider himself a theologian, and his choice and treatment of theological themes are decidedly arbitrary.

V. believes that Reinhold Niebuhr's theology of history may be defined as a reflection on our culture. Based on faith, it wishes to lay down the details of life neither for individuals nor for society. He is prevented by the basic convictions of his thought from even attempting anything such as the great historical syntheses of an Augustine or a Bossuet. He would undoubtedly judge his own synthesis as plausible but not necessary. He wishes to suggest orientations which in their turn will promote reflection. And reflection will lead to the formation of value-judgments in the speculative order and to action in the practical order, action which will inevitably but not necessarily be corrupted by sin. That action will take the form of a conscious participation in history. Thus, a theology of history is a theology of history in the making and is itself made by that history. It seeks only to interpret from the transcendent standpoint of faith circumstances which are endlessly changing. And a later generation will need another theology of history, one which will correspond to its needs as it will be their product.

It is unfortunate that V. was unable to make use of the recent volume on Niebuhr in the *Library of Living Theology* series. She does refer to the book in a footnote, but apparently it was not published soon enough to enable her to make real use of the work. The essays by Niebuhr himself with which that volume begins and ends would have been particularly helpful. One of the finest tributes, however, to the excellence of her work is the fact that one can find so little which would need correction or modification, despite the fact that she was unavoidably prevented from having

access to the vast amount of erudition brought to bear on Niebuhr's thought by himself and other scholars in the Kegley-Bretall volume.

Weston College

EDWARD R. CALLAHAN, S.J.

ART ET LIBERTÉ SPIRITUELLE. By Marie-Alain Couturier, O.P. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 165.

Fr. Couturier, himself a painter and friend of painters, was France's entrepreneur of contemporary art ("in modestly abstract and semi-abstract styles"; *Time*, July 21, 1958). He died in 1954, and this edition is a selection of his essays on art and notes on miscellaneous subjects written in France, Montreal, New York, and Newport between 1937 and 1945.

These articles represent the evolution of his convictions and advocacy of modern painting, sculpture, and architecture freed from the chains of "naturalism and objectivity" for churches. "Evolution" is the word, because he reverses his field in the two essays on Picasso: "Sur Picasso et l'art chrétien" and "Picasso et les catholiques." He had said in the first that abstract art, which had no reference to the natural world, could hardly have reference to the supernatural world and therefore was not adaptable to religious purposes. In the second essay, written some years later, he repudiates this view as superficial and holds that naturalistic art, distracting us by carnal and sensuous external appearances (Raphael and Rubens), was actually antireligious, whereas abstract art freed us and led us intuitively to purely spiritual realms, provided it had a "religious quality." It is easy to agree with his strictures on archeological, excessively naturalistic, dead and dreadful ecclesiastical art, and to deplore the separation of Church and the art and artists of our times.

C. did far more than propound theories. He personally persuaded modern painters, architects, and stained-glass designers to work for the Church. What Abbé Suger was to Gothic, C. was to contemporary styles. His influence is a fact, and "modern" has spread over the world. The church at Assy (windows by Rouault) and Matisse's Chapel in the Dominican Chapel at Vence have pioneered a period, just as Abbé Suger's Cathedral of St. Denis set the pattern for the great cathedrals of the Isle-de-France, England, Germany, Spain, and Fifth Avenue. (One might question the special *vertu* of Matisse's delineation of the features of St. Dominic on the white tiles at Vence as an empty ovoid, an egg?)

In fairly recent years we have had a Gothic *revival*, Renaissance *revival*, Romanesque, Greek, and Byzantine *revivals*. This ardent, progressive, and spiritual Dominican was heart and soul for a (could we say?)

vival or arrival of a contemporary style, in tune with our times. Wittily, and sometimes sharply, he flays ecclesiastics and laity for condemning and eschewing what they do not understand and clinging to the St. Sulpice and Barclay Street safe mediocrities. He grieves that the Church, which was always à *l'avant-garde* of the great epochs of art, is, in the modern world, *passée à l'arrière-garde*.

However, this book will leave many sceptical and unconvinced—perhaps only those who were born too soon and reared in other “traditions.” Can one who sincerely reveres Michelangelo, Fra Angelico, and Giotto turn in stride to Matisse, Braque, and Leger? Spiritual liberty certainly gives to the artist the right to paint, build, and carve as he chooses. Does it not give the concomitant right for us to like it or not?

Other essays in this volume of special interest are: “La route royale de l’art” (pessimistic), “Greco, la mystique” (in which Theotocopuli’s reputation for pure mysticism is somewhat tarnished), and “Note sur l’abstraction.” This book is challenging, provocative, and as convincing a plea for contemporary art in Catholic usage as you will find in the usually obfuscating and bad-tempered apologetics of its votaries and interpreters.

College of the Holy Cross, Worcester, Mass.

J. GERARD MEARS, S.J.

THERAPEIA: PLATO’S CONCEPTION OF PHILOSOPHY. By Robert E. Cushman. Chapel Hill: Univ. of North Carolina Press, 1958. Pp. xxii + 322. \$6.00.

Dr. Cushman’s scholarly analysis of Plato’s epistemology and metaphysics is a refreshing change from the past century’s post-Kantian anti-metaphysical and Hegelian idealistic interpretations and the more recent anti-totalitarian caricatures of Fite, Crossman, Winspear, Popper, and others. C.’s comprehensive and detailed exposition is based on a close analysis and skilful collation of all the pertinent texts that are widely scattered throughout the dialogues. He has tried to disengage and emphasize what he considers the most salient elements in the philosophy of Plato; only the unscholarly reader will find his attempt to justify his interpretation by repeated references to the text of the dialogues unduly repetitious or redundant.

C. rightly centers his interpretation of Plato on the cardinal fact that Plato’s philosophy is before all else axiological. Plato has been heralded as the originator of the metaphysic of intelligible essences, that furnish the structure and intelligibility for the transient things of Becoming, but this metaphysic itself is intelligible only when it is viewed in the light of the absolute priority and transcendence of the principle of the Good. Plato

conceived philosophy, the love of wisdom, as primarily a way of salvation from the inherent contradictions of human existence. Most mortals, symbolized by the prisoners in the cave, are dominated by sensuous interests, because, yielding to their baser *eros*, they mistake the shadows for the substance, Becoming for Being. Hence their value-preference, their interest-in-context, is "turned upside down." This ordinary human condition of "an inverted and, hence, perverted estimate of Value and Being" can be cured only by a radical conversion of the entire soul—not just of the intellect, but of the whole person—even though this entails the recognition that there is a large element of "subjectivity" in knowledge. Hence philosophy for Plato, far from being a disinterested theoretical exercise of the intellect, is essentially a therapy requiring a change in one's basic ethos or character. Ignorance is an evil affection of the soul that can be cured only by the soul's recognition of the superior value of its higher *eros*, its con-natural orientation to the Good. Knowledge of true Being requires a new moral disposition, "the possession and habit of the Good." The chief instrument of this *therapeia* is dialectic, the maieutic art of Socrates; for "knowledge" in contrast with "true opinion" is necessarily a societal attainment. Just how dialectic can effect this conversion of the soul is, as C. points out, by no means clear in Plato; for dialectic "at one and the same time is designed to induce and yet itself presupposes a suitable condition of character." Here we are confronted by the baffling Socratic paradox that knowledge is virtue. "Virtue is quite as much the condition of knowledge as it is also true, and better known, that knowledge is the condition of virtue." "It is at this point, perhaps," C. aptly remarks, "that the philosophy of Plato, great as it is both in its diagnosis of the human plight and in its scheme of *therapeia*, looks beyond itself to a larger conception of divine grace."

The awareness or recognition by the soul of its higher *eros* or appetency for absolute Being depends on its ultimate value-preference and, according to C., is in this sense "decisional" in character. C. readily admits that neither Plato nor, for that matter, even Aristotle ever attained an understanding of "free will" or "self-determination." Yet his emphasis on this "decisional" role of the human will as a precondition of the soul's conversion seems to attribute to Plato a notion of intentionality and even moral responsibility that would be anachronistic. Despite his admitted voluntarism and recognition of the importance of the affective in knowledge, Plato is no less necessitarian and fatalistic than any other Greek philosopher. What determines the value-preference of the soul Plato does not say.

One of the most valuable parts of C.'s study is his explanation of what

Plato meant by "true opinion." Because of the soul's a priori orientation to Being as its essential Good, the self-evidence of knowledge is really a re-cognition. "True opinion" is opinion because it is concerned with the sensible but it is true because it is the recognition of the essential form given in the sensible. Yet it is only when the form is intuitively apprehended in the light of the Good following dialectic or the "causal reasoning" which manifests its "logos" that true opinion becomes genuine knowledge. It is heartening to find C. stoutly maintaining, in keeping with Shorey's masterly thesis, *The Unity of Plato's Thought*, that conceptualism is not the culmination of Plato's epistemological development and "that this interpretation, no doubt of time-worn respectability, if not entirely false, is an over-simplification." While admitting with Stenzel that in the *Theaetetus*, *Parmenides*, *Sophist*, and *Politicus* Plato exhibits a marked interest in the status and nature of empirical knowledge, C. rightly denies that this is an altogether new interest and points out that Stenzel's conceptualistic view is postulated on the gratuitous assumption of Zeller and Natorp that Plato in the *Phaedo* and *Republic* held a complete dichotomization of the intelligible and sensible worlds. "As the case stands, however, the likelier interpretation is otherwise, and concepts are regulative for knowledge of things precisely because they are, as it were, the epistemic correlatives of the still immutable Forms."

C. argues that the aim of the *Theaetetus* is to expose the inadequacy of "unmitigated empiricism," whose assumption which he adopts for the sake of argument is that the mind is a *tabula rasa*. Hence the dialogue examines only the nature of opinion or knowledge of Becoming, not of Being. It is not surprising, therefore, that it reaches only a negative conclusion. When Plato in the *Theaetetus* proposes the hypothesis of the logos-concept, "true opinion accompanied by rational explanation," he is not equating this with perfect knowledge or wisdom but only with science or *dianoia*, which, however propaedeutic to wisdom, is itself only hypothetical.

As C. indicates, the basic difference between Plato's and Aristotle's approach to reality is that "Aristotle will have nothing to do with a *a priori* apprehension of Being such as Plato held to be possessed unawares by the man of 'true opinion'," and that, whereas Aristotle's *tabula rasa* "is emptied of all conative features and is axiologically disinterested," for Plato "intelligence is inherently axiological." Hence Aristotle divorced ethics from metaphysics by radically distinguishing theoretical and practical reason, while for Plato, in the words of A. E. Taylor, "the two spheres are inseparable." C. concedes that Aristotle did not deny "the reality of the Forms";

for "the universal is really *in* the particular substance which is perceived." But what can the "reality of the Forms" possibly mean, once their transcendence is denied? In view of this denial Aristotle's admission of their so-called "immanence" can only be explained conceptualistically.

For Aristotle the highest form of knowledge was apodictic scientific knowledge, which Plato viewed as inherently hypothetical because its premises are assumed without metaphysical justification. C. points out the ambiguity surrounding Aristotle's derivation of first principles and concludes that "induction is itself what Aristotle elsewhere calls an intuitive act of *nous*." We prefer the view, in keeping with W. Jaeger's theory of Aristotelian development, that the intuitive grasp of first principles represents the Stagirite's early Platonic doctrine, while the belief that the postulates of science are obtained inductively marked a later positivistic evolution of his thinking. Aristotle thus paved the way for the eventual modern replacement of metaphysics, Platonic wisdom, by Baconian experimental science.

In the course of reading C.'s book one becomes increasingly aware of the inherent virtualities of the pagan "divine philosopher" for the Christian wisdom of St. Augustine, who moderated his extreme realism into the exemplarism of traditional Scholasticism and who insisted on the moral *ascesis* leading to the "purified mind" that is necessary for the understanding of divine truth. In this connection C. betrays a professional Protestant bias (he is Professor of Systematic Theology and Philosophical Theology in the Divinity School of Duke University) when he arbitrarily concludes that "Christian thought . . . found an ally in Plato: specifically, in his conception of the contingent, decisive, and non-demonstrative nature of knowledge of things Divine." Such a conclusion would certainly have rendered aghast the early Greek Fathers of the Church. C. also misunderstands the position of Thomism as regards the primacy of Platonic wisdom. It is true that St. Thomas identified wisdom with knowledge of the first cause. But this First Cause was not that of Aristotle but the Absolute Good of Plato. C. seems quite unaware of the fact that St. Thomas' Aristotelianism was radically amended by the Christian Platonism of St. Augustine. He should also be more cautious when writing of the "God" of Aristotle and in referring to the Greek use of the word "divine." For the Greeks the words "god" and "divine" had none of our modern religious or theological connotation but merely denoted what is permanent and immortal.

SHORTER NOTICES

GÉOGRAPHIE DE LA TERRE SAINTE. By M. du Buit, O.P. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 237 + 18 maps. This companion-volume to Albright's *Penguin Archeology* (French edition) and de Vaux's work on OT institutions stresses the relation of the biblical background to its sociology. A place is reserved for the NT setting and for the needs of today's pilgrims, but the author frankly sees geography as more naturally linked with OT study. The first part deals with physical geography: relief, climate, soils, flora and fauna, demography, areas. The second part, historical geography, treats the roads of the patriarchs, the Twelve Tribes and their neighbors, the kingdom of David and its divisions, Judea in the Persian and Roman empires. The onomastic index is long and informative. The maps are quite original and stress the accessibility of the uplands.

Pontifical Biblical Institute, Jerusalem

Robert North, S.J.

HOLY PAGANS OF THE OLD TESTAMENT. By Jean Daniélou, S.J. Translated by Felix Faber. Baltimore: Helicon Press, 1958. An American edition of the English translation of *Les saints "païens" de l'Ancien Testament* (Paris, 1956). The title may suggest a scriptural study, but D. is interested rather in the theory of cosmic religion and cosmic revelation which he expounded in *God and the Ways of Knowing* (New York, 1957). To illustrate his conception, D. discusses Abel, Henoch, Daniel, Job, Melchisedec, Lot, and the Queen of Saba. D. champions the thesis of a universal, partial divine revelation which is not natural, though achieved in "nature," human conscience and intelligence.

Woodstock College

Gustave Weigel, S.J.

SAINT PAUL: GUIDE DE PENSÉE ET DE VIE. By Louis Soubigou. Paris: Lethielleux, 1957. Pp. 173. 600 fr. The former Vice-Rector of the Catholic University of Angers has brought out in book form a series of lectures on the Apostle to the Gentiles which were originally given to a lay audience in Rio de Janeiro and afterwards delivered to groups of priests, seminarians, and nuns. Intended as an introduction to the thought of St. Paul, the work is divided into the following chapters: The Mystery of Christ; The Entrance into the Church; Christian Life; Eschatology; The Witness of Paul. Bibliographical notes are held to a minimum, and the name of L. Cerfaux, an excellent authority, appears frequently. Perhaps references to the *Bible de Jérusalem* could have been added. The sections on Pauline asceticism, spiritual liberty, and the character of the Apostle will probably have the widest appeal.

Weston College

J. J. Collins, S.J.

THE TESTIMONY OF THE PATRISTIC AGE CONCERNING MARY'S DEATH. By Walter J. Burghardt, S.J. *Woodstock Papers* 2. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1957. Pp. vii + 59. \$.95. Erudition, scholarship, critical judgment, and a remarkable gift for conciseness characterize this brochure, perhaps the best treatment of a very intricate theme that has been published. From his investigation of the Fathers and ecclesiastical writers before Ephesus, the *transitus Mariae* literature, the feast of the Dormition, Greek homiletic literature, Western witnesses from Ephesus to Bede, and the tradition of the Virgin's tomb, B. draws the following conclusions. (1) From the evidence of the Patristic Age there emerges a widespread conviction of the early Church that our Lady died a natural death. (2) This conviction, especially between the fifth and eighth centuries, was shared by hierarchy and faithful, preached by theologians, publicly affirmed in the liturgy. (3) There is no comparable conviction to offset it; for in dissent we find only individuals, not a tradition. (4) Much of the evidence, however, from its very nature—sporadic comments before Ephesus, apocrypha obscure in origin and impalpable in weight, a feast still hidden in history—is too fragile to sustain an apodictic conclusion on the theological significance of this conviction. (5) The conviction, nevertheless, is there; more than that, the consistency of its liturgical expression and the uniformity of its homiletic articulation warrant the conclusion that it was conscious, abiding, and informed. B., of course, would be the first to concede that the problem of our Lady's death is by no means settled. But in the opinion of this reviewer, no attempt in the future to prove or insinuate a proof from testimony of the Patristic Age that Mary did not die will merit the attention of serious scholars unless it takes into account B.'s conclusions, based as they are on superb scholarship and on an extremely competent and impartial judgment.

Weston College

Philip J. Donnelly, S.J.

JOHN OF THE GOLDEN MOUTH. By Bruno H. Vandenberghe, O.P. Translated by the author. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. vii + 91. Despite the amount and scope of existing literature on Chrysostom, too little is in English and less of that suits the general reader. Hence we welcome V.'s paper-backed introduction of the most eloquent of Church Fathers to the English-reading public. V.'s slender volume comprises nine essays which find loose-knit unity in that they all concern Chrysostom, showing various facets rather than the organic growth of John's dross-purged personality, which dominated fourth-century Antioch and Constantinople. V. portrays Chrysostom against his background of time and place. The essays on his education and audience are excellently conceived; the affair of the emperor's

statues and the fall of Eutropios are told with a nice dramatic touch; the influence of St. Paul on Chrysostom is put in proper perspective. V. uses Chrysostom's own words in his portrayal, but even a general reader would like a parenthetical citation of the loci translated. V.'s schoolish command of English renders his version of both Dutch and Greek troublesomely inept.

Xavier University, Cincinnati

Paul W. Harkins

DOGOMATIC THEOLOGY 2: CHRIST'S CHURCH. By G. Van Noort. Translated and revised by John J. Castelot, S.S., and William R. Murphy, S.S. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1957. Pp. xxviii + 430. \$7.00. It seems safe to predict that the generally favorable comment which greeted the first volume of this English version of Van Noort's original Latin series of textbooks will be repeated with the appearance of this second volume. We have here something more than a mere translation; this is a complete revision of the original with adaptations and additions that bring the book satisfactorily up to date. The work is divided into two almost equal sections, the first viewing the Church "from outside," the apologetic approach, studying it under the aspects of its founding, its nature, its properties and "marks," and the unique verification of these in the Roman Catholic Church; the second examining the Catholic Church from the dogmatic viewpoint under the headings: the Mystical Body of Christ, the members of the Church, the Roman Pontiff, the bishops, and the Church-State relationship. The proportions are roughly those of Van Noort; one suspects that an original work today would place a considerably larger emphasis on the dogmatic section of the study. Especially noteworthy are some of the principal parts either completely new or thoroughly revised by the translators. In the apologetic section the survey of the dissident oriental Churches is almost entirely new; in the dogmatic part the chapter on the Church as the Mystical Body is the original work of the translators, as is a special appendix on the Petrine text of Matthew. In addition, the chapter on Church-State relations is more than a mere enlargement of the brief treatment of the point in the original. This is a new study of this difficult question, which brings together much of the material of very recent theological discussion and controversy on the subject. The basic principles deriving from the official teaching of the Church itself are set forth briefly and clearly; this exposition is followed by a judicious treatment of two allied problems: the position of non-Catholics in a "Catholic" state, where the Catholic approach is illustrated by excerpts from the Constitution of Eire, and the position of Catholics in the contemporary religiously pluralistic society. The footnotes and bibliographical

material have been adapted to the needs of English-speaking readers; they are reasonably complete and take account of the more significant contemporary trends in ecclesiology.

Woodstock College

John F. Sweeney, S.J.

PIETRO: FONDAMENTO E PASTORE PERENNE DELLA CHIESA. By Gaetano Corti. Turin: Marietti, 1957. Pp. 81. L.600. A combination of three studies on the general subject of the primacy, intended to meet certain current needs arising from the ecumenical movement. However, running through the study is the common theme of regarding the primacy in what C. describes as "a mystico-personalistic concept." By this he means that "for the first ten or twelve centuries of Christian tradition, the most common title for designating the Pope was not Vicar of Christ but Vicar of Peter," suggesting that the primacy was conceived as a moral continuum between Simon Peter and his successors in the Roman See. On the basis of this tradition, C. answers Oscar Cullmann's critique by pointing out that Cullmann missed or misinterpreted the transmission of primatial power from Peter to his followers in the papacy. Preconceiving the primacy as essentially a juridico-institutional entity and nothing more, Cullmann wrongly concluded that it died with Peter. C. then examines the *NT* to show that only a "mystico-personalist" idea of supreme visible authority in the Church adequately explains the I-Thou relationship between Christ and Peter described in the Gospels. In fact, C. feels that unless this concept is admitted it would be hard to postulate (without the hindsight of tradition) a continuation of Peter's unique position in the Church after his death. Finally, to establish his thesis, C. analyzes the sermons and letters of Leo I as an example of patristic tradition. Out of more than fifty citations, he rests his case on the well-known text: "Manet ergo dispositio veritatis et beatus Petrus, in accepta fortitudine petrae perseverans, suscepta gubernacula ecclesiae non reliquit." This study should be translated into English. It offers a key to the solution of a difficult problem which current Protestant apologists are raising.

West Baden College

John A. Hardon, S.J.

MAGISTERO INFALLIBILE DEL PAPA NELLA TEOLOGIA DI GIOVANNI DA TORQUEMADA. By Pacifico Massi. Turin: Marietti, 1957. Pp. 176 + iv. L.1300. John of Torquemada (1388-1468), uncle of the Grand Inquisitor, was the Dominican theologian and cardinal whose writings on the primacy and papal infallibility are a milestone in the history of ecclesiology. As Master of the Sacred Palace and theologian of Eugene IV at the Council

of Basle (1432), Torquemada elaborated the doctrine of papal superiority to a general council and, according to Massi, laid the groundwork for all subsequent anti-conciliarism. The present volume is a thoroughly documented analysis of Torquemada's arguments in favor of personal papal infallibility, as developed in all his extant writings but especially in the *Summa de ecclesia*. M. believes Torquemada was the first Scholastic theologian to bring out the full implications of the Petrine text (Mt 16:18-19) to prove papal infallibility. However, his main argument from Scripture rests on the prayer of Christ that Peter's faith would not fail him (Lk 22:32). In five chapters and with several hundred citations, M. covers all the aspects of his subject that might be of interest to anyone teaching *De ecclesia*: patristic interpretation of classic Scripture passages; evidence from theological reason for the need of papal infallibility; answers to the stock objections of the conciliarists; the conditions, subject, object, and effects of infallibility; relation of the pope to a general council; possibility and consequences of a pope in heresy, schism, or depraved morals; and the influence of Torquemada on later theologians, notably Bellarmine, and eventual emergence of his thought in the Vatican Council.

West Baden College

John A. Hardon, S.J.

VRAIE ET FAUSSE TOLÉRANCE. By Albert Hartmann, S.J. Translated by A. Besnard. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 291. A translation of *Toleranz und christlicher Glaube* (Frankfurt, 1955). In consequence of the events of the past twenty-five years, speculation about "tolerance" has increased, often in the form of conversations among Catholics and between Catholic and non-Catholic groups. The present work is an outgrowth of such discussions, in which Prof. Hartmann, of the Jesuit Collegium Maximum in Frankfurt am Main, has taken a prominent part. It is a comprehensive study of tolerance from the standpoint of Catholic theology, entering thoroughly into all its aspects, from an analysis of the concept to its implications when applied to private and public relations between Catholics and those of dissenting views. H. maintains that tolerance is necessary for social order, particularly today; not the relativistic, indifferentist tolerance, traceable to the rationalism of the Enlightenment, but rather as charity bound to truth, summarized in St. Paul's "doing the truth in love" (Eph 4:15). He treats with insight the problems of conscience involving tolerance (e.g., mixed marriage, public schools) and defends Catholic cooperation in social and political life and the current liberal-Catholic views on Church-State relations (against the "Spanish" theory of the "Catholic state"). A richly detailed, well documented handbook, unhesitatingly

recommended, despite one's occasional disagreement, especially with the stand on Church-State relations.

Georgetown University

John Songster, S.J.

DOCUMENTOS INÉDITOS TRIDENTINOS SOBRE LA JUSTIFICACIÓN: EDICIÓN CRÍTICA Y ESTUDIOS INTRODUCTORIOS. Edited by Jesús Olazarán, S.J. *Estudios Onienses*, Series 1, 6. Madrid: Fax, 1957. Pp. 384. Recent years have seen a growing effort to make available to scholars much of the great mass of unpublished material concerning the proceedings and the historical and theological background of Trent. Critical editions of source material of all kinds, even letters and diaries, have been put at the disposal of the learned world. The task of evaluating the work of the Council, of assessing its true significance and enduring values, has thus been greatly facilitated. The collection of hitherto unpublished documents presented in this volume of *Estudios Onienses* will take its place among the scholarly adjuncts in this field. The critical texts of the original Latin documents are in each case preceded by a succinctly illuminating introduction in Spanish by the editor, setting the material in its proper place within the framework of the conciliar discussions on Christian justification. All are concerned with the traditional Catholic teaching on the nature of this justification, and in particular with the troubling question of man's certainty with regard to his own justification. This particular problem confronted the Council owing to the fact that, in the preliminary form of the proposed decree on justification presented for the consideration of the Council in late July, 1546, canon 18 condemned the doctrine of the Reformers according to which the justified man not only could know with certainty the fact of his predestination and justification, but was also under obligation to believe this. Not a few at the Council were convinced that the older Scholastics had favored this teaching, or at least had maintained the possibility that the justified could attain such certainty. Many were in consequence reluctant to accept a blanket condemnation of the Reformers' position. Clearly this was a problem the discussion of which would inevitably involve a thorough examination of the whole traditional Catholic doctrine on the nature of Christian justification and of man's internal response to the divine initiative. The documents here presented in definitive form illustrate the course of this study both in the formal sessions of the Council and in various preliminary meetings of different groups of theologians to whom a large part of the preparatory work was entrusted. The world of scholarship owes a debt of gratitude to the editor for having undertaken the demanding task of verifying the authen-

ticity of the documents and for the careful and scrupulous objectivity with which he edited the texts.

Woodstock College

John F. Sweeney, S.J.

DE ORDINE 1: DE INSTITUTIONE. By Emmanuel Doronzo, O.M.I. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1957. Pp. 962 + [41]. \$19.00. Those familiar with Doronzo's earlier works on the sacraments will expect his treatise on orders to reach the same monumental proportions. The first volume, which considers but three articles of a single chapter, is an earnest that their expectations will be fulfilled. The articles or questions, developed over some 900 pages, are: (1) Whether the strictly hierarchical and priestly power of orders is of divine institution; (2) whether this power is conferred by a sacramental rite of dominical institution; (3) whether the sacramental rite of orders extends to the grades of bishop, presbyter, and deacon. This last question raises the as yet unresolved problem of the identity of the presbyter-bishops of Acts and the office of the *presbyter* or *episkopos*, terms used interchangeably in the letters of Paul. D. rejects as less probable the view, first advanced by Petavius and modified by Batiffol, that the term *presbyter* as an hierarchical expression refers to a bishop. D. rejects as well the more common view of present-day Scripture scholars that the term *episkopos* as well as *presbyter* refers to a simple priest. He regards as more probable the traditional view that the term *presbyter* at times refers to a simple priest and at times, as in Acts 20:28, to a bishop. A useful feature of the present volume is the richness of citation not only from traditional sources but from the writings of contemporary scholars, Catholic and non-Catholic. This usefulness would have been advanced had D. deemed it expedient to include passages from the best of German authors. The work of German scholarship is not ignored, however, either in the numerous indices or in the text itself.

Woodstock College

Paul F. Palmer, S.J.

DICIONNAIRE DE THÉOLOGIE CATHOLIQUE: TABLES GÉNÉRALES (ESSENCE—FIDÈLE). Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1957. The process of unearthing the treasures of wisdom and knowledge hidden in the French *Dictionary of Theology* continues to be made easier with the publication of each succeeding section of the complete index to all the published volumes. As in previous sections, supplementary notes are added here wherever change and progress in the various fields of theological science seem to demand added information. Thus, in this fascicle no less than twelve columns are devoted to the recent expansion of our knowledge of the Essenes

in their relation to Qumrân and to early Christianity; this includes some four columns of added bibliography. There is a completely new study in eleven columns of Catholic theology in the United States by Joseph C. Fenton. Under the heading "Eucharist" seven columns are devoted to an appendix on the Eucharistic tenets of the dissident Oriental Churches, while a study of more than fifteen columns brings up to date the many questions posed in recent years regarding the four Gospels. In addition to many biographical inserts, shorter notes include those on the concelebration of Mass, euthanasia, the books of Exodus and Ezechiel, and extreme unction in the Oriental Churches. In all cases where questions of canon law were touched on in the original articles, the prescriptions of the Code are inserted and explained, together with whatever authoritative interpretations have been given. It is difficult to see what more, short of a completely new edition, could possibly be done to keep the original publication the invaluable reference work it proved itself to be from its beginnings.

Woodstock College

John F. Sweeney, S.J.

DICTIONNAIRE DE SPIRITUALITÉ. Fascicle 24: DOROTHÉE DE MONTAU—DUVERGIER DE HAURANNE. Paris: Beauchesne, 1957. Fascicle 24 completes Volume 3 of the *Dictionnaire de spiritualité*. Just a glance at the list of articles contained in the 1884 columns of this third volume—as well as at the names of the scholarly collaborators—is sufficient to indicate the valuable contribution which this publication is making to spiritual theology. Some of the more important articles in this volume are: "Démon" (86 cols.), "Denys l'Aréopagite (Le pseudo-)" (174 cols.), "Dépouillement" (46 cols.), "Dieu (Connaissance mystique)" (47 cols.), "Direction spirituelle" (212 cols.), "Discernement des esprits" (69 cols.), "Divinisation" (88 cols.), and "Dons du Saint-Esprit" (62 cols.). In this present fascicle the more important articles are: "Douceur," "Douleurs (Notre-Dame des Sept-)," "Dulcedo, Dulcedo Dei," and "Duns Scot." A brief word may be said about a few of these articles. (1) The passion of Jesus is mirrored in the compassion of Mary. Over the years devotion to this compassion of the Blessed Mother has developed into the Devotion to the Seven Sorrows. Both the theology of this devotion, as well as its history—especially from the thirteenth century to the present—are treated in the article "Notre-Dame des Sept-Douleurs." A point which might have been developed more is the intimate relation of this devotion to many of the more central doctrines of Mariology—a valid indication of its spiritual value. (2) In the article "Douceur," Fr. Mennessier, O.P., explains the notion of meekness as it appears in the Bible, in the writings of Augustine, Chrysostom, and especially St. Thomas.

The point is well made that meekness is something very virile, for it supposes control over the instinct of aggression. Also, its importance is not to be limited to the interior and contemplative life; it has an important place in the apostolic life. (3) Christian spirituality has always given a prominent place to the idea of *dulcedo*. In Latin spiritual literature the key words used to express this concept are *dulcis* and *suavis*. But the interpretation of the precise meaning of these words is a delicate task. Sometimes *dulcedo* corresponds to what is called consolation, sometimes to the mystical experience of the presence of God in the soul, and even at times to God Himself, as if it were an attribute expressing His benevolence and goodness to creatures. The article "Dulcedo, Dulcedo Dei" attempts to determine how these terms entered the Christian language and what are the principal meanings which they have acquired.

Weston College

Thomas G. O'Callaghan, S.J.

L'ART DE PRIER. By Martial Lekeux, O.F.M. Paris: Lethielleux, 1957. Pp. 292. The title suggests a treatise on prayer, and there is no subtitle. Nevertheless, what L. is attempting, without advising the reader, is the complete restoration of one's spiritual background in order that a perfect prayer-life may flourish. The result is a mine of practical advice on various aspects of the interior life, scattered here and there within a mold of chapters whose headings keep the reader aware of the subject-title. Unfortunately, L. has not included an alphabetical index which would open this material to the inquiring reader. For a director of souls, the abundant practical suggestions throughout will be very acceptable. But for one whose interest is centered wholly on prayer, this work may prove disappointing: it is needlessly diffuse, diverges unnecessarily from common terminology, may easily produce in the patient reader, particularly in its earlier half, a mounting sense of hopelessness as he follows down one path after another into roadblock after roadblock, without ever coming to an appreciation of achievement. To the reviewer, the frequently recurring "objections" from an imaginary pupil seem much more than a literary device; they represent a very definite state of mind from the reader's viewpoint, and they do not disappear either as quickly or as completely as the author answers them; rather they tend to produce a growing depression which could be unfortunate. Had L. separated the material treating of spiritual reorientation from the doctrine on prayer, both elements would have benefited: the first by becoming more accessible, the second by being freed from distracting observations which belong elsewhere.

Woodstock College

F. X. Peirce, S.J.

THE THREE DEGREES: A STUDY OF CHRISTIAN MYSTICISM. By Conrad Pepler, O.P. St. Louis: Herder, 1958. Pp. 256. \$3.50. A series of occasional papers, composed over the years with characteristic urbanity and insight by the former editor of *The Life of the Spirit*, are here reissued under a somewhat misleading heading. P. himself remarks rather disarmingly that "any unity this book possesses is due" to the lady "who always typed the MSS and corrected the proofs." Apparently this consisted in her suggesting the title and subtitle, for when one proceeds beyond these the unity disappears. This, I know, must seem the merest ill-tempered caviling on the reviewer's part, but it is out of his genuine disappointment that he speaks. P. is eminently qualified to give us "A Study of Christian Mysticism" and it is a large pity that he has simply not bothered to. Yet, this having been said, one must go further and rejoice that such things as his "The Basis of St. Thomas' Mysticism" and "What is Mysticism?" have by means of this volume been made more generally available.

Jesuit Seminary, Toronto

Elmer O'Brien, S.J.

RUYSBROECK L'ADMIRABLE ET SON ÉCOLE. By Francis Hermans. *Textes pour l'histoire sacrée.* Paris: Fayard, 1958. Pp. xiv + 240. 850 fr. The high quality of the series edited by Daniel-Rops is maintained with the Abbé Hermans' minor labor of love on the greatest of the medieval Flemish mystics and certain of his followers. To some readers there may well appear to be an awkward disproportion between H.'s prefatory remarks (131 pages) and the selections from Ruysbroeck (48 pages) they are meant to introduce. But Ruysbroeck, undeniably one of the most fascinating of mystical theologians, is just as undeniably one of the most difficult. Most, therefore, will be grateful for such extended aid to proper understanding, compounded of personal insight and much of the best of recent scholarship, which H. has thought fit to provide. In a concluding section he gives the first fruits of his own extended researches on the Groenendael school of mysticism with historical and doctrinal introductions to, and brief snippets from, the writings of John Van Leeuwen, Godfrey Van Wevel, John of Schoonhoven, Denis the Carthusian, and Henry Herp.

Jesuit Seminary, Toronto

Elmer O'Brien, S.J.

SUMMA OF THE CHRISTIAN LIFE: SELECTED TEXTS FROM THE WRITINGS OF VENERABLE LOUIS OF GRANADA, O.P. Vol. 3. Translated and adapted by Jordan Aumann, O.P. St. Louis: Herder, 1958. Pp. vii + 372. \$4.75. Fr. Aumann's happy idea of compiling, in English, an anthology from the

ascetical writings of his great sixteenth-century Spanish confrere is here brought to a singularly felicitous conclusion. His skill in adapting the individual selections and his eminent good sense in choosing to arrange them according to the broad doctrinal pattern of St. Thomas' *Summa* have resulted in a smoothness and consistency of exposition hardly to be expected in a composite work of this kind. As presented (and here compiler is at one with the original author) the material is less conducive to study than it is to savorous, down-to-earth meditation—an enterprise in which Venerable Louis is an especially gracious and reliable guide. Three “books” make up the present volume: “Christ, Our Redeemer,” “The Sacraments,” and “The Last Things.”

Jesuit Seminary, Toronto

Elmer O'Brien, S.J.

THE GREAT WEEK: AN EXPLANATION OF THE LITURGY OF HOLY WEEK. By Dame Aemiliana Löhr. Translated by D. T. H. Bridgehouse. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xii + 211. \$2.75. LES MYSTÈRES

DE LA PÂQUE. By Dame Aemiliana Löhr. Translated by a Dominican nun of Unterlinden. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 267. *Die Heilige*

Woche is neither liturgical commentary nor theological exposition nor meditation book; yet it is all of these. It is neither poetry nor art nor music; yet it is all of these. This strikes one as less surprising when one recalls the broad knowledge of biblical and sacramental theology, of the Fathers, of the liturgies of East and West—all enriched by her own personal reflection—which this disciple of Odo Casel brings to her work. From the night office of Palm Sunday until the Mass of the Easter Vigil, when the *Pascha Domini* is consummated, we are swept up by her exposition into the wondrous unity of God's saving action in time with its fulfilment and completion in the *mysterium Christi*, now become the *mysterium ecclesiae*, pledge of the Church's own final “passing over” in the Parousia. The mind that is open to the symbolic dimension in Scripture will be less apt to find fault with the repeated use of type and symbolism which weaves together her exposition of office and Mass liturgies; for these, in a true sense, are the keys to the treasures locked up in the Church's liturgy. “A deeper understanding of the Holy Week Liturgy,” remarks Dom Ralph Russell in the Foreword, “will go far to remedy one of the great weaknesses of modern spirituality: that we have almost ceased to feed upon symbols.” This “deeper understanding” L. has indeed given us in what may well be remembered as one of the most significant books to appear in our century on the liturgy of Holy Week.

Woodstock College

Joseph G. Murray, S.J.

SAINTS OF THE MISSAL. By Benedict Baur, O.S.B. Translated by Raymond Meyerpeter, O.S.B. 2 vols. St. Louis: Herder, 1958. Pp. 283, 267. \$3.95. To those familiar with B.'s three-volume *The Light of the World*, this new contribution to liturgical and ascetical literature needs no introduction. In his former work B. treated the temporal cycle and provided meditations on the various parts of the Sunday Masses, so arranged that a meditation is supplied for each day of the week. The present volumes complete B.'s project and provide brief studies of the saints whose feasts are celebrated in the Roman Missal. Viewed as biographies these sketches are vivid, lifelike accounts of the salient events in the saints' lives; historical settings are well described; a decided atmosphere of reality is achieved. From an ascetical point of view, B. deftly, more by insinuation than by direct application, suggests practical ways in which the reader can imitate the spirituality of the saint of the day. Considered dogmatically, these volumes deserve commendation; for, in the manner of the liturgy itself, B.'s vignettes imperceptibly inculcate central dogmas, e.g., with reference to divine grace, the Mystical Body, the Mass and the Eucharist. Liturgically speaking, B.'s books should be an excellent help to the devout Catholic who faithfully uses his missal but often finds liturgical texts rather meaningless and disconnected. B. shows the reason behind the choice of Introit, Gradual, etc., by explaining how the text refers to some virtue for which the saint was especially noted or to some event in his life. The fittingness of the Epistles and Gospels is also well demonstrated. In brief, the use of B.'s meditations will make the liturgy a more living and meaningful teacher of Christian perfection.

Mundelein, Illinois

William G. Topmoeller, S.J.

CHURCH HISTORY 1: CHRISTIAN ANTIQUITY. By Karl Bihlmeyer and Hermann Tüchle. Translated by Victor E. Mills, O.F.M. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xiii + 437. \$8.50. This translation of the thirteenth edition of the well-known Bihlmeyer-Tüchle *Kirchengeschichte* is deeply appreciated by all American professors of Church history. The work, one of the truly outstanding textbooks in this field, presents in translation a treatment of Church history which makes accessible to the English-speaking world the best elements of German Catholic scholarship. In a certain sense it has value even for the specialist. The subject of Vol. 1, which is divided into two parts, is the history of the Church from its origins to Constantine (313) and from Constantine to the Council in Trullo (692); it includes sections on theology, literature, liturgy, and learning. The work, however, is deficient in two respects, important enough to be noted. First,

the original, at least in some sections, is in need of serious revision. For example, since the appearance of the thirteenth edition in 1952, there have been discoveries in biblical archeology and research in Scripture which throw new light on the interpretation of the historical background of the New Testament and on the origins of the Christian religion. One can no longer discuss "Judaism before Christ and its Messianic Expectation" without also discussing the newly found Dead Sea Scrolls. Second, the translator has neglected to vitalize the bibliography with new entries, especially the Introduction, which presents bibliography and sources of Church history and the auxiliary sciences. In an historical work this is inexcusable, since the historian in a sense lives on what he reads. Further, a book translated presumably for those who do not read German should give more prominence to works written in English. A thorough revision of the bibliography would help to bring the book up to date and give the translation a certain originality and distinction of its own.

Woodstock College

Robert E. McNally, S.J.

THE MORMONS. By Thomas F. O'Dea. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 195'. Pp. xii + 289. A romantic glow surrounds the history and reality of the Mormon church. The story of the group is colorful and, in the judgment of many, bizarre. However, few outside Utah realize the vitality and earnestness of this community, which today has more adherents outside Utah than in it. The missionary drive in the church is strong and the efforts of the missionaries all over the world have been notably successful. In Utah the Mormon church is an omnipresent and inescapable reality. No one there can ignore it and no one does. Prof. O'Dea, Fordham sociologist and keen observer of social situations, visited Utah and fell under the fascination of the Mormon fact. The result of his experience is the present book, a clear, sympathetic, and objective presentation of Mormon existence. O'Dea gives a synthetic glimpse of the early history of the Mormons, the Church of the Latter Day Saints. He describes the source books of Mormon belief and gives a synthesis of Mormon doctrine as these books propose it. He then deals with the social structure of Utah Mormonism and ends with a consideration of the sociological crises which face the church today. All is vividly written and gives the impression of solidity and validity. For the theologian the most important chapter is the one dealing with Mormon doctrine: a difficult theme, because Mormon doctrine from the beginning was always changing and it is still changing. This change is consistent with the first principle of Mormonism, whereby revelation never ceases. By revelation polygamy was introduced and by revelation it ended. In principle

there is no contradiction in the change. For a scholar, however, this produces a deep problem. He tries to form a unified system of thought for the whole teaching, and yet this may not be altogether possible. O'Dea has essayed the task and his presentation is brilliant. This reader's first reaction was that it was splendid—but will the Mormons accept it? Yet a leading Mormon intellectual has told this writer that he is most willing to accept it. One cannot help but feel, however, that the present molding of Mormon belief as offered in Lowell L. Bennion's text for Mormon seminaries (which are not training schools for the clergy but only religion courses for high school students) will not dovetail with O'Dea's synthesis. Polytheism in Mormonism is perhaps on the way out. If it is, then a new synthesis will be needed in the near future.

Woodstock College

Gustave Weigel, S.J.

CHRISTIAN THOUGHT AND ACTION: THE ROLE OF CATHOLICISM IN OUR TIME. By Dom Aelred Graham. New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1958. Pp. xiv + 241. \$5.00.

In this collection of his varied labors of the past twenty years, G. has attempted an examination of the often neglected deeper elements of Catholic belief, the elements most satisfying to Catholics and most attractive to non-Catholics. These themes include a sustaining philosophy of life, a realistic and attainable mysticism, and an all-embracing compassion, arranged with constant reference to G.'s central message that the life of love is the only one that makes sense. The book is rather loosely organized into four parts: some basic principles of Catholic thought, observations on the life of the individual and the life of society, and an inquiry into the meaning of religious experience. G. writes with insight and intelligence and is equally at home with St. Thomas or Kierkegaard, with mystical experience or modern politics.

Woodstock College

A. Hennelly, S.J.

LE DILEMME DU CONCOURS DIVIN: PRIMAT DE L'ESSENCE OU PRIMAT DE L'EXISTENCE? By Louis Rasolo, S.J. *Analecta Gregoriana* 80. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1956. Pp. 134. \$2.75.

Like any book on the subject of the divine cooperation with the actions of creatures, there is a great deal which is familiar about R.'s work. The theory he proposes is faithful to the original insight of Molina with regard to the indifference of the divine concurrence; it differs from Molina in maintaining a premotion. Hence, R.'s theory pertains to the school of Neo-Molinism. Although the exposition of the various theories follows traditional lines, a real contribution has been made in chaps. 2 and 3. In chap. 2, R. analyzes the causality

of secondary causes. He points out that a secondary cause must produce something proper to itself, or there is no true sense in which it can be called a cause. R. then maintains that the only thing which the creature can produce proper to itself is the determination, for the being is produced by God and by the creature as the instrument of the divine action. The theory of physical predetermination, which demands that the determination come from God, would thus destroy all true causality on the part of creatures. In chap. 3, R. attempts to show that the theory of physical predetermination gives the primacy in action to essence, while the theory of indifferent concurrence gives it to existence. Essence in being is the source of determination and derives, not from the divine will or action, but from the divine exemplary causality. Existence is the source of the being and derives from the divine efficient causality. Hence, the Bannezians, insisting that the determination in the order of action must come from God, in the fear that otherwise the divine dominion will be destroyed, have placed the primacy of the divine action in the order of essence. The Molinists, insisting that the divine action is the source of being, while the creature's action is the source of the determination, have given the primacy of the divine action to the order of existence. In terms of modern Thomistic exegesis, it is clear which would be preferred. It is the unfortunate fate of any book on concurrence that it will never draw universal approbation. The Bannezians will certainly not approve R.'s theories; many Neo-Molinists will also disagree at various points, although approving of his general conclusions. R., however, is to be complimented for adding to the literature on this subject a vigorous and clear analysis of action in metaphysical terms.

Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y.

Ralph O. Dates, S.J.

DÉSIR NATUREL ET BÉATITUDE CHEZ SAINT THOMAS. By Venant Cauchy. *Philosophie et problèmes contemporains*. Montreal: Fides, 1958. Pp. 126. \$2.50. This work enlarges upon the author's "A Defense of Natural Ethics," which appeared in the *Proceedings of the American Catholic Philosophical Association* 29 (1955) 206-18. Cauchy contends that St. Thomas' doctrine of a natural desire for the beatific vision is subject to great misunderstanding when considered apart from its thirteenth-century background. The Arabs then taught that man was incapable of contemplating the divine essence. St. Thomas attempted to show that man's nature is absolutely capable of seeing God in Himself. There is no natural desire for supernatural happiness in nature considered in itself. In a supernatural context, however, in which man has been de facto elevated to the supernatural order and destined to the beatific vision as his end, the natural

(that is, necessary) inclination towards happiness in general becomes implicitly a natural (that is, necessary) tendency towards the beatific vision. Our natural desire for happiness is directed, *même à notre insu*, towards God, for in Him alone can we find perfect happiness (p. 52). This interpretation ignores the part played by knowledge in St. Thomas' teaching on natural desire. So long as the intellect does not see the necessary connection between happiness and the vision of God, there can be no natural desire for the latter *as our beatitude*. For C., if our intellect naturally tends towards a knowledge of the divine essence, our will must also necessarily incline towards this vision *as beatifying* (p. 54). He confuses the natural desire of the intellect for truth with the natural desire of the will for happiness, perfection, and ultimate end. It is significant that C. has not succeeded in citing a single sentence in which St. Thomas speaks of a natural desire for the *beatific* vision. He is also apparently of the belief that the ultimate end of infants who die unbaptized is a state of purely natural happiness (p. 103). Does this mean that they were never destined for the beatific vision as their ultimate end?

New York City

William R. O'Connor

LA FOI PHILOSOPHIQUE CHEZ JASPERS ET SAINT THOMAS D'AQUIN. By Bernard Welte. Translated from the German by Marc Zemb. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1958. Pp. 282. 1200 fr. A French translation of an article contributed by Fr. Welte to the second volume of *Symposion*, published in Freiburg im Breisgau. In it W. compares the thought of modern existentialism, as represented by Karl Jaspers, with that of medieval Scholasticism, as represented by Aquinas, with regard to the transcendence whereby human thought rises above the conceptual molds imposed upon it by this-worldly being to the Being which is the foundation of all being and all understanding. One third of the book is devoted to Jaspers and two thirds to Thomas. This proportion is maintained in order to show that, despite the differences in perspective and formulation, the thought of the contemporary philosopher of existence can throw light on the very problems which occupied the medieval mind. If we are to pass from the narrow scientific concerns which inner-worldly reality imposes on us to the realm of eternal Being which is the concern of supernatural faith, there must be on the philosophical level a transcendence which can be described only symbolically, precisely because it is beyond our power of conceptualization. In this movement, the thought of Jaspers is in many respects found wanting, but at the same time it is presented as throwing light on that surge of the human spirit beyond mere narrow reason, which is represented by St. Thomas' movement toward God. Though the effort involves forcing Thomas into

somewhat unfamiliar molds, it is well worth serious consideration by both philosophers and theologians.

Fordham University

Quentin Lauer, S.J.

THÉORIE DE L'ASSENTIMENT. By Antonio Rosmini. Translated with an introduction and notes by Marie-Louise Roure. *Problèmes et doctrines* 12. Paris: Vitte, 1956. Pp. 210. A French translation of the first book of Rosmini's *Logica*, originally entitled *Degli assensi*. The Introduction, which may well be the most worthwhile element in the book, locates the Rosminian theory of assent in the totality of his epistemological thought. The significance of his reflections lies in his recognition that the will plays a dynamic role in the act of judgment. This basic insight is analyzed and expanded in the body of the book.

Woodstock College

Gustave Weigel, S.J.

ELEVEN YEARS OF BIBLE BIBLIOGRAPHY. Edited by H. H. Rowley. Indian Hills, Colorado: Falcon's Wing Press, 1957. Pp. vii + 804. \$7.50. Since 1946, the British Society for Old Testament Study has been publishing *Book List* annually under the editorship of H. H. Rowley. These valuable little pamphlets contained brief to moderate-length reviews of a wide range of books in the *OT* and allied fields. Since some of the previous numbers have been out of print, it is particularly useful to have these eleven years of surveys gathered in a single volume. There is a complete index of authors.

RICHARD OF ST. VICTOR: SELECTED WRITINGS ON CONTEMPLATION. Translated and edited by Clare Kirchberger. *Classics of the Contemplative Life* 5. New York: Harper, 1957. Pp. 269. \$3.75. An important addition to the growing library of ascetical theology. Richard was among the first theologians to attempt a synthesis of mystical theology and influenced greatly the subsequent development of this study in both the Eastern and Western Church. Of special significance is his psychological insight into the difficulties which beset the higher levels of prayer, a contribution which opened the way to a more intelligent guidance of mystics. K.'s lengthy introduction treats the sources of his thought and his relationship to the theological currents of his time. The major part of the translation comprises portions of the *Benjamin minor* and *Benjamin major*, with shorter extracts from Richard's lesser works.

LOURDES 1858: TÉMOINS DE L'ÉVÉNEMENT. By Leonard Cros, S.J. Edited by M. Olphe-Galliard, S.J. Paris: Lethielleux, 1957. Pp. 366. 1575 fr. Twenty years after the apparitions at Lourdes, the bishop of Tarbes ap-

pointed Fr. Leonard Cros, S.J., to head a special canonical inquiry. Its purpose: to provide historians of the Lourdes apparitions with a reliable source of testimony from first-hand witnesses. C., a hard-working inquirer, personally interviewed more than two hundred contemporaries of Bernadette. In the present volume, Fr. Olphe-Galliard, S.J., Director of the *Revue d'ascétique et de mystique*, has shortened the list to forty-seven. Bernadette appears mainly in the testimony of her contemporaries, but there is a letter of C. at the end of the volume giving an invaluable record of his own conversation with her. This book will provide a wealth of background detail for those interested in this great *événement*.

BOOKS RECEIVED

[All books received are listed here whether they are reviewed or not]

Scriptural Studies

- Auvray, P., et al. *Introduction à la Bible*. Edited by A. Robert and A. Feuillet. Vol. 1: *Introduction générale, Ancien Testament*. Tournai: Desclée, 1957. Pp. xxv + 880.
- Congar, Yves M.-J., O.P. *Le mystère du temple ou L'Economie de la présence de Dieu à sa créature de la Genèse à l'Apocalypse*. *Lectio divina* 22. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 345. 990 fr.
- Dillersberger, Joseph. *The Gospel of Saint Luke*. Translated from the German. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xiii + 558. \$5.75.
- Dupont, Jacques. *Les béatitudes: Le problème littéraire—les deux versions du sermon sur la montagne et des béatitudes*. Rev. ed.; Louvain: Nauwelaerts, 1958. Pp. 387.
- Eltester, Friedrich-Wilhelm. *Eikon im Neuen Testament*. Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft 23. Berlin: Töpelmann, 1958. Pp. xvi + 166. DM 28.—
- Gaechter, Paul, S.J. *Petrus und seine Zeit: Neutestamentliche Studien*. Innsbruck: Tyrolia Verlag, 1958. Pp. 458. DM 22.—
- Galot, Jean, S.J. *Marie dans l'évangile*. *Museum Lessianum, section théologique* 53. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1958. Pp. 204. 110 fr.b.
- Parrot, André. *Babylon and the Old Testament*. Translated by B. E. Hooke. *Studies in Biblical Archaeology* 8. New York: Philosophical Library, 1958. Pp. 166. \$2.75.
- Parrot, André. *Samaria: The Capital of the Kingdom of Israel*. Translated by S. H. Hooke. *Studies in Biblical Archaeology* 7. New York: Philosophical Library, 1958. Pp. 141. \$2.75.
- Von Ugarit nach Qumran: Beiträge zur alttestamentlichen und altorientalischen*

Forschung. Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft 77. Berlin: Töpelmann, 1958. Pp. 303. DM 40.—

Doctrinal Theology

- Alfaro, J., et al. *Christus victor mortis*. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1958. Pp. 324. \$2.20.
- Dougherty, Kenneth, S.A. *Ecclesia est theandrica ad instar Jesu Christi*. Rome: Catholic Book Agency, 1957. Pp. 127.
- Fenton, Joseph C. *The Catholic Church and Salvation in the Light of Recent Pronouncements by the Holy See*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xi + 190. \$3.25.
- Fraigneau-Julien, B., P.S.S. *L'Eglise et le caractère sacramentel selon M.-J. Scheeben*. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1958. Pp. 292. 1350 fr.
- Lubac, Henri de, S.J. *Catholicism: A Study of Dogma in Relation to the Corporate Destiny of Mankind*. 2nd impression. Translated by Lancelot C. Sheppard. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1958. Pp. xiv + 283. \$4.00.
- McAuliffe, Clarence, S.J. *Sacramental Theology: A Textbook for Advanced Students*. St. Louis: Herder, 1958. Pp. xxix + 457. \$6.00.

Moral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions

- Education and the Liturgy: 18th North American Liturgical Week, St. John's Abbey, Collegeville, Minnesota*. Elsberry, Mo.: Liturgical Conference, 1958. Pp. vi + 198. \$2.00.
- Ford, John C., S.J., and Kelly, Gerald, S.J. *Contemporary Moral Theology 1: Questions in Fundamental Moral Theology*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. vi + 368. \$4.50.
- Lefebvre, Gaspar, O.S.B. *L'Esprit de Dieu dans la sainte liturgie*. Paris: Fayard, 1958. Pp. 125. 350 fr.
- Parole de Dieu et liturgie*. Le Congrès de Strasbourg (3^e Congrès National du Centre de Pastorale Liturgique). Lex orandi 25. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 387.
- Schwarz, Rudolf. *The Church Incarnate: The Sacred Function of Christian Architecture*. Translated by Cynthia Harris. Chicago: Regnery, 1958. Pp. ix + 231. \$7.50.
- Winniger, Paul. *Vers un renouveau du diaconat*. Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1958. Pp. 216. 69 fr.b.

History and Biography, Patristics

- Athanase d'Alexandrie. *Apologie à l'Empereur Constance. Apologie pour sa fuite*. Introduction, text, translation, and notes by Jan-M. Szymusiak, S.J. Sources chrétiennes 56. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 192.

- St. Augustine. *On Christian Doctrine*. Translated by D. W. Robertson, Jr. The Library of Liberal Arts 80. New York: Liberal Arts Press, 1958. Pp. xxii + 169. \$.95.
- Cascante Dávila, Juan M. *Doctrina Mariana de S. Ildefonso de Toledo*. Colectanea San Paciano, serie teológica 5. Barcelona: Editorial Casulleras, 1958. Pp. 351.
- Defensoris Locogiacensis monachi Liber scintillarum*. Edited by H. M. Rochais, O.S.B. Corpus christianorum, ser. lat. 117/1. Turnhout: Brepols, 1957. Pp. xxxi + 307.
- Donovan, Richard B., C.S.B. *The Liturgical Drama in Mediaeval Spain*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1958. Pp. vii + 229. \$.50.
- Dunn, William K. *What Happened to Religious Education? The Decline of Religious Teaching in the Public Elementary School, 1776-1861*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1958. Pp. xv + 346. \$.50.
- Fabbri, Enrique, S.J. "Agua y Espiritu": *Investigación histórica sobre el Cristo vivificante y el bautismo del Señor en los primeros Padres prenicenos*. Excerpta ex dissertatione. Buenos Aires, 1956. Pp. 64.
- Fackovec, William, S.M. *Lourdes Publications in French in the Clugnet Collection*. Marian Library Study 4. Dayton: Univ. of Dayton, 1958. Pp. 71. \$1.00.
- Lefherz, Friedhelm. *Studien zu Gregor von Nazianz: Mythologie, Überlieferung, Scholiasten*. Bonn: Rheinische Friedrich Wilhelms-Universität, 1958. Copies from author, Düsseldorf-Wersten, Richrather-Strasse 9. Pp. 311. DM 4.50.
- Lepp, Ignace. *From Karl Marx to Jesus Christ*. Translated from the French. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1958. Pp. xii + 212. \$3.75.
- Mâle, Emile. *The Gothic Image: Religious Art in France of the Thirteenth Century*. Translated by Dora Nussey. New York: Harper, 1958. Pp. xv + 415. \$1.95.
- Nicolaus Steno and His Indices*. Edited by Gustav Scherz. Acta historica scientiarum naturalium et medicinalium 15. Copenhagen: Munksgaard, 1958. Pp. 314.
- The Summa contra haereticos Ascribed to Praepositinus of Cremona*. Edited by Joseph N. Garvin, C.S.C., and James A. Corbett. Publications in Mediaeval Studies 15. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 1958. Pp. lviii + 302. \$7.50.
- Versfeld, Marthinus. *A Guide to "The City of God."* New York: Sheed & Ward, 1958. Pp. xii + 141. \$3.00.

Pastoral and Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature

- Adam, August. *The Primacy of Love*. Translated by Elizabeth C. Noonan. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. viii + 217. \$3.25.
- Dictionnaire de spiritualité*. Fasc. 25: *Eadmer—Eglise*. Edited by Charles Baumgartner, S.J., and M. Olphe-Galliard, S.J. Paris: Beauchesne, 1958.
- Killgallon, James, and Weber, Gerard. *Life in Christ: Instructions in the Catholic Faith*. Chicago: Life in Christ, 1958. Pp. 286. \$1.00.
- Libermann, F. M. P. *Commentaire de Saint Jean*. Texts selected by L. Vogel, C.S.Sp. Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1958. Pp. 320. 162 fr.b.
- Pepler, Conrad, O.P. *The English Religious Heritage*. St. Louis: Herder, 1958. Pp. vii + 444. \$4.95.
- Perrin, J. M., O.P. *Christian Perfection and Married Life*. Translated by P. D. Gilbert. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xii + 92. \$1.95.
- Rahner, Karl, S.J. *Happiness through Prayer*. Translated from the German. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. 109. \$1.50.
- Proceedings of the 1957 Sisters' Institute of Spirituality*. Edited by Joseph E. Haley, C.S.C. Notre Dame, Ind.: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 1958. Pp. xi + 387.
- Truhlar, Carolus V., S.J. *Antinomiae vitae spiritualis*. Collectanea spiritualia 4. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1958. Pp. 281. \$3.00.
- Williamson, Hugh R. *The Challenge of Bernadette*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xiii + 101. \$1.95.

Philosophical Questions

- Bréhier, Emile. *The Philosophy of Plotinus*. Translated by Joseph Thomas. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1958. Pp. vii + 205. \$4.50.
- Buber, Martin. *I and Thou*. 2nd ed. Translated by Ronald G. Smith. New York: Scribner's, 1958. Pp. xii + 137. \$1.75.
- Cerfaux, L., et al. *Qu'est-ce que vouloir?* Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 144.
- Cooney, Timothy. *Ultimate Desires*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1958. Pp. 100. \$2.75.
- Drake, Henry L. *The People's Plato*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1958. Pp. xxiii + 633. \$7.50.
- Higgins, Thomas J., S.J. *Man as Man: The Science and Art of Ethics*. Rev. ed. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1958. Pp. xiii + 585. \$4.50.
- Salit, Charles R. *Man in Search of Immortality*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1958. Pp. 185. \$3.50.

Varangot, Oscar A., S.J. *Analogía de atribución intrínseca y analogía del ente según Santo Tomás*. Excerpta ex dissertatione. Buenos Aires, 1957. Pp. 57.

Special Questions

Dempsey, P. J. R. *Freud, psychanalyse et catholicisme*. Translated from the English by Françoise Héron de Villefosse. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 139.

Folia: Studies in the Christian Perpetuation of the Classics 10, no. 2. Worcester, Mass.: Holy Cross College, n.d. Pp. 93.

Fox, Ruth M. *Dante Lights the Way*. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1958. Pp. xix + 370. \$4.95.

Hartmann, Albert, S.J. *Vraie et fausse tolérance*. Translated by A. Besnard. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. Pp. 289.

Islam: Muḥammad and His Religion. Edited by Arthur Jeffery. The Library of Religion 6. New York: Liberal Arts Press, 1958. Pp. xviii + 252. \$1.75.

Valiant Heralds of Truth: Pius XII and the Arts of Communication. Compiled with a commentary by Vincent A. Yzermans. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. vii + 201. \$3.75.

Ward, Leo R., C.S.C. *New Life in Catholic Schools*. St. Louis: Herder, 1958. Pp. 198. \$3.95.

Warfield, Benjamin B. *Perfectionism*. Edited by Samuel G. Craig. Philadelphia: Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Co., 1958. Pp. xii + 464. \$4.95.

INDICES FOR VOLUME 19

AUTHORS

BURGHARDT, W. J., S.J., The Second Edition of the <i>Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche</i>	572
CARMODY, J., S.J., An American Use of the Prone	228
CLARKE, T. E., S.J., St. Augustine and Cosmic Redemption	133
CONNERY, J. R., S.J., Notes on Moral Theology	533
CONNERY, J. R., S.J., Steady Dating among Adolescents	73
CREHAN, J., S.J., The Seven Orders of Christ	81
DAILEY, R. H., S.J., The Baptism of Unconscious Dying Persons: The Problem of Intention	374
DE LETTER, P., S.J., Grace, Incorporation, Inhabitation	1
DYER, G. J., Limbo: A Theological Evaluation	32
FITZMYER, J. A., S.J., "Peace upon Earth among Men of His Good Will" (Lk 2:14)	225
HARKINS, P. W., The Text Tradition of Chrysostom's Commentary on John	404
LYNCH, J. J., S.J., Notes on Moral Theology	165
MCKENZIE, J. L., S.J., Annotations on the Christology of Theodore of Mopsuestia	345
M McNALLY, R. E., S.J., The "tres linguae sacrae" in Early Irish Bible Exegesis	395
O'BRIEN, E., S.J., Ascetical and Mystical Theology, 1956-1957	50, 199
PALMER, P. F., S.J., The Purpose of Anointing the Sick: A Reappraisal	309
REED, J. J., S.J., Permission to Read Prohibited Books	586
STEPHENSON, A. A., S.J., The Development and Immutability of Christian Doctrine	481

ARTICLES

Annotations on the Christology of Theodore of Mopsuestia. J. L. McKenzie, S.J.	345
The Baptism of Unconscious Dying Persons: The Problem of Intention. R. H. Dailey, S.J.	374
The Development and Immutability of Christian Doctrine. A. A. Stephenson, S.J.	481
Grace, Incorporation, Inhabitation. P. De Letter, S.J.	1
Limbo: A Theological Evaluation. G. J. Dyer	32
The Purpose of Anointing the Sick: A Reappraisal. P. F. Palmer, S.J.	309
St. Augustine and Cosmic Redemption. T. E. Clarke, S.J.	133

CURRENT THEOLOGY

Ascetical and Mystical Theology, 1956-1957. E. O'Brien, S.J.....	50, 199
Notes on Moral Theology. J. R. Connery, S.J.....	533
Notes on Moral Theology. J. J. Lynch, S.J.....	165

NOTES

An American Use of the Prone. J. Carmody, S.J.....	228
“Peace upon Earth among Men of His Good Will” (Lk 2:14). J. A. Fitzmyer, S.J.....	225
Permission to Read Prohibited Books. J. J. Reed, S.J.....	586
The Second Edition of the <i>Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche</i> . W. J. Burghardt, S.J.....	572
The Seven Orders of Christ. J. Crehan, S.J.....	81
Steady Dating among Adolescents. J. R. Connery, S.J.....	73
The Text Tradition of Chrysostom’s Commentary on John. P. W. Harkins.....	404
The “tres linguae sacrae” in Early Irish Bible Exegesis. R. E. McNally, S.J.....	395

BOOK REVIEWS

Adam, K., <i>The Christ of Faith: The Christology of the Church</i> (tr. J. Crick) (T. E. Clarke, S.J.).....	263
Arintero, J. G., O.P., <i>Stages in Prayer</i> (5th ed.; tr. K. Pond) (D. Hurst, O.S.B.).....	446
Arnaldez, R., <i>Grammaire et théologie chez Ibn Hazm de Cordoue: Essai sur la structure et les conditions de la pensée musulmane</i> (J. A. Devenny, S.J.).....	439
Baumstark, A., <i>Comparative Liturgy</i> (rev. B. Botte; ed. F. L. Cross) (G. Ellard, S.J.).....	448
Belloli, L., <i>La teologia dell’Assunzione corporea di Maria ss. dalla definizione dogmatica dell’Immacolata Concezione alla fine del secolo XIX</i> (J. F. Sweeney, S.J.).....	112
Berkouwer, G. C., <i>The Conflict with Rome</i> (tr. D. H. Freeman) (J. L. Monks, S.J.).....	453
Boismard, M.-E., O.P., <i>Du baptême à Cana: Jean 1, 19-2, 11</i> (M. M. Bourke).....	97
Bultmann, R., <i>The Presence of Eternity: History and Eschatology</i> (V. T. O’Keefe, S.J.).....	258
Burghardt, W. J., S.J., <i>The Image of God in Man according to Cyril of Alexandria</i> (R. Leys, S.J.).....	615

Callan, L., R.S.C.J., <i>Philippine Duchesne: Frontier Missionary of the Sacred Heart</i> (E. A. Ryan, S.J.).....	280
Cazeneuve, J., <i>Les rites et la condition humaine d'après des documents ethnographiques</i> (J. F. Ewing, S.J.).....	596
<i>Christus victor mortis</i> (J. F. Sweeney, S.J.).....	621
Clark, F., S.J., <i>Anglican Orders and Defect of Intention</i> (H. R. Williamson).....	267
Clemens, A. H., <i>Marriage and the Family: An Integrated Approach for Catholics</i> (J. I. O'Connor, S.J.).....	114
Coleburt, R., <i>An Introduction to Western Philosophy</i> (J. I. Conway, S.J.)	456
Connelly, J., <i>Hymns of the Roman Liturgy</i> (A. Guinan).....	272
Couturier, M.-A., O.P., <i>Art et liberté spirituelle</i> (J. G. Mears, S.J.).....	642
Cross, R. D., <i>The Emergence of Liberal Catholicism in America</i> (J. T. Ellis).....	237
Cushman, R. E., <i>Therapeia: Plato's Conception of Philosophy</i> (J. I. Conway, S.J.).....	643
Cuttaz, F., <i>Our Life of Grace</i> (tr. A. Bouchard) (J. Cummings, O.F.M. Conv.).....	624
Daniélou, J., S.J., <i>God and the Ways of Knowing</i> (tr. W. Roberts) (T. E. Clarke, S.J.).....	248
Dansette, A., <i>Destin du catholicisme français, 1926-1956</i> (G. H. Tavard, A.A.).....	451
Dehau, P. T., O.P., <i>Eve and Mary</i> (tr. Dominican Nuns of the Perpetual Rosary of La Crosse, Wis.) (N. M. Flanagan, O.S.M.).....	422
De Vries, J., <i>Altgermanische Religionsgeschichte 2: Die Götter, Vorstellungen über den Kosmos, Der Untergang des Heidentums</i> (H. J. Bihler, S.J.).....	94
<i>La Didachè: Instructions des apôtres</i> (ed.-tr. J.-P. Audet, O.P.) (G. Daoust, S.J.).....	610
Doyle, C. H., <i>Guidance in Spiritual Direction</i> (D. Hurst, O.S.B.).....	446
Dubarle, A.-M., O.P., <i>Le péché originel dans l'écriture</i> (J. L. McKenzie, S.J.).....	425
Eliade, M., <i>Patterns in Comparative Religion</i> (tr. R. Sheed) (H. J. Bihler, S.J.).....	597
Ellis, E. E., <i>Paul's Use of the Old Testament</i> (T. A. Collins, O.P.).....	249
<i>Etudes sur le sacrement de l'ordre</i> (J. H. Crehan, S.J.).....	629
<i>Evangelisches Kirchenlexikon: Kirchlich-theologisches Handwörterbuch</i> , fasc. 8-23 (ed. H. Brunotte and O. Weber) (R. E. McNally, S.J.)...	261
<i>Faith and Ethics: The Theology of H. Richard Niebuhr</i> (ed. P. Ramsey) (J. A. Hardon, S.J.).....	118

<i>La formation des évangiles: Problème synoptique et Formgeschichte</i> (V. T. O'Keefe, S.J.)	417
Grabowski, S. J., <i>The Church: An Introduction to the Theology of Saint Augustine</i> (J. Quinlan)	432
Harte, T. J., <i>Papal Social Principles: A Guide and Digest</i> (C. A. Eller, S.J.)	282
Hayen, A., S.J., <i>La communication de l'être d'après s. Thomas d'Aquin 1: La métaphysique d'un théologien</i> (J. S. Dunne, C.S.C.)	442
Hofinger, J., S.J., <i>The Art of Teaching Christian Doctrine: The Good News and Its Proclamation</i> (G. S. Sloyan)	274
Hofinger, J., S.J., and J. Kellner, S.J., <i>Liturgische Erneuerung in der Weltmission</i> (J. H. Miller, C.S.C.)	633
Jáki, S., O.S.B., <i>Les tendances nouvelles de l'ecclésiologie</i> (S. E. Donlon, S.J.)	105
Jaubert, A., <i>La date de la Cène: Calendrier biblique et liturgie chrétienne</i> (G. W. MacRae, S.J.)	418
Jedin, H., <i>Geschichte des Konzils von Trient 2: Die erste Trienter Tagungsperiode (1545-47)</i> (E. A. Ryan, S.J.)	635
John of the Angels, <i>Conquest of the Kingdom of God</i> (tr. C. J. Crowley) (D. J. M. Callahan, S.J.)	444
Journet, C., <i>La messe: Présence du sacrifice de la croix</i> (E. R. Callahan, S.J.)	107
Jungmann, J. A., <i>Public Worship: A Survey</i> (tr. C. Howell) (G. Ellard, S.J.)	447
Kantorowicz, E. H., <i>The King's Two Bodies: A Study in Medieval Political Theology</i> (H. A. Rommen)	435
Kik, J. M., <i>Ecumenism and the Evangelical</i> (T. Cranny, S.A.)	454
Lang, A. P., S.V.D., <i>Leo der Grosse und die Texte des Altgelasianums</i> (J. H. Miller, C.S.C.)	271
Lécuyer, J., C.S.Sp., <i>Le sacerdoce dans le mystère du Christ</i> (J. J. Quinn)	627
Lyonnet, S., S.J., <i>De peccato et redemptione</i> (M. M. Bourke)	424
McAvoy, T. T., C.S.C., <i>The Great Crisis in American Catholic History, 1895-1900</i> (J. T. Ellis)	237
McLaughlin, P. J., <i>The Church and Modern Science</i> (P. J. McCarthy, S.J.)	120
<i>Mariology 2</i> (ed. J. B. Carol, O.F.M.) (W. G. Most)	109
Marx, P., O.S.B., <i>Virgil Michel and the Liturgical Movement</i> (J. J. O'Sullivan)	117
Mascall, E. L., <i>Via Media: An Essay in Theological Synthesis</i> (P. J. Donnelly, S.J.) 427

Mehl, R., <i>Du catholicisme romain: Approche et interprétation</i> (S. E. Donlon, S.J.)	637
Miegge, G., <i>L'Évangile et le mythe dans la pensée de Rudolf Bultmann</i> (tr. H. Naef) (V. T. O'Keefe, S.J.)	604
Molari, C., <i>De Christi ratione essendi et operandi</i> (J. Cummings, O.F.M.Conv.)	264
Mounier, E., <i>The Character of Man</i> (tr. C. Rowland) (R. A. di Nardo)	283
Murphy, J. L., <i>The Mass and Liturgical Reform</i> (W. O'Shea)	631
<i>La nouvelle Eve</i> 2; 3 (ed. Société Française d'Études Mariales) (J. F. Sweeney, S.J.)	110
Orbe, A., S.J., <i>Los primeros herejes ante la persecución</i> (M. J. Donnelly, S.J.)	269
Osborn, E. F., <i>The Philosophy of Clement of Alexandria</i> (H. Musurillo, S.J.)	613
O'Shea, W. J., S.S., <i>The Worship of the Church: A Companion to Liturgical Studies</i> (W. J. Leonard, S.J.)	450
Pancheri, F. S., O.F.M.Conv., <i>Il pensiero teologico di M. J. Scheeben</i> (C. Vollert, S.J.)	278
Pearce, F. X., S.J., <i>Ponder Slowly</i> (T. G. O'Callaghan, S.J.)	445
Pelagius I, <i>Pelagi I Papae Epistulae quae supersunt</i> (ed. P. M. Gassó, O.S.B., and C. M. Battle, O.S.B.) (R. E. McNally, S.J.)	270
Pépin, J., <i>Mythe et allégorie: Les origines grecques et les contestations judéo-chrétiennes</i> (B. Vawter, C.M.)	601
Plotinus, <i>The Enneads</i> (tr. S. MacKenna; rev. B. S. Page) (T. A. Wassmer, S.J.)	429
<i>Problemi e orientamenti di teologia dommatica</i> 1; 2 (ed. Pontificia Facoltà Teologica di Milano) (J. F. Sweeney, S.J.)	102, 616
Ravasi, L. R., C.P., <i>De vocatione religiosa et sacerdotali</i> (R. F. Smith, S.J.)	276
<i>La règle de la guerre des fils de lumière contre les fils de ténèbres</i> 1 (ed.-tr. J. Carmignac) (J. A. Fitzmyer, S.J.)	606
Reid, J. K. S., <i>The Authority of Scripture</i> (R. E. Brown, S.S.)	413
<i>The Scrolls and the New Testament</i> (ed. K. Stendahl) (P. W. Skehan)	608
Skydsgaard, K. E., <i>One in Christ</i> (tr. A. C. Kildegaard) (G. Weigel, S.J.)	636
Spicq, C., O.P., <i>Agapè dans le Nouveau Testament: Analyse des textes</i> 1 (J. DeVault, S.J.)	599
Spicq, C., O.P., <i>Vie morale et Trinité sainte</i> (P. J. Donnelly, S.J.)	618
Staudinger, J., S.J., <i>Die Bergpredigt</i> (R. Kugelman, C.P.)	256
Steinmann, J., <i>Saint Jérôme</i> (F. X. Murphy, C.S.S.R.)	432
Stenzel, A., S.J., <i>Die Taufe: Eine genetische Erklärung der Taufliturgie</i> (J. H. Crehan, S.J.)	625

Stuiber, A., <i>Refrigerium interim: Die Vorstellungen des Zwischenzustand und die frühchristliche Grabeskunst</i> (A. C. Rush, C.SS.R.)	99
Thomas, J. H., <i>Subjectivity and Paradox: A Study of Kierkegaard</i> (J. Collins)	286
Trocme, E., <i>Le "Livre des actes" et l'histoire</i> (D. M. Stanley, S.J.)	254
Trusen, W., <i>Um die Reform und Einheit der Kirche: Zum Leben und Werk Georg Witzels</i> (J. F. Broderick, S.J.)	260
Van Roo, W., S.J., <i>De sacramentis in genere</i> (W. Le Saint, S.J.)	265
Vaux, R. de, O.P., <i>Les institutions de l'Ancien Testament 1</i> (F. L. Moriarty, S.J.)	415
Vignaux, G. P., <i>La théologie de l'histoire chez Reinhold Niebuhr</i> (E. R. Callahan, S.J.)	639
<i>The Word of Salvation. 3: The Gospel according to St. Luke</i> , by A. Valensin, S.J., and J. Huby, S.J. 4: <i>The Gospel according to St. John</i> , by A. Durand, S.J. (tr. J. J. Heenan, S.J.) (C. P. Ceroke, O.Carm.)	252
Wright, G. E., and R. H. Fuller, <i>The Book of the Acts of God: Christian Scholarship Interprets the Bible</i> (J. J. DeVault, S.J.)	419
Wulfstan, <i>The Homilies of Wulfstan</i> (ed. D. Bethurum) (G. Kernan, S.J.)	438
Zimmerman, A. F., S.V.D., <i>Overpopulation: A Study of Papal Teachings on the Problem with Special Reference to Japan</i> (R. T. Rush, S.J.)	116

SHORTER NOTICES

Abbo, J. A., and J. Hannan, <i>The Sacred Canons</i> (2 vols.; rev. ed.) (M. B. Walsh, S.J.)	296
Ancelet-Hustache, J., <i>Master Eckhart and the Rhineland Mystics</i> (W. J. Bosch, S.J.)	464
<i>Archiv für Liturgiewissenschaft</i> 5/1 (ed. H. Emonds, O.S.B.) (R. E. McNally, S.J.)	295
Augustine, <i>Saint Augustine on the Two Cities: Selections from the City of God</i> (ed. F. W. Strothmann)	470
Barth, K., <i>Christ and Adam: Man and Humanity in Romans 5</i> (tr. T. A. Smail) (T. E. Clarke, S.J.)	462
Baur, B., O.S.B., <i>Saints of the Missal</i> (2 vols.; tr. R. Meyerpeter, O.S.B.) (W. G. Topmoeller, S.J.)	658
Benedictines of Stanbrook, <i>In a Great Tradition</i> (H. R. Burns, S.J.)	294
Bernard, R., S.J., <i>L'Espérance</i>	300
Bihlmeyer, K., and H. Tüchle, <i>Church History 1: Christian Antiquity</i> (tr. V. E. Mills, O.F.M.) (R. E. McNally, S.J.)	658
Blond, L., <i>La maison professe des Jésuites de la rue Saint-Antoine à Paris</i>	301

Buber, M., <i>Moshe</i> (2nd ed.; tr. A. Kohn) (J. J. McNeill, S.J.)	458
Buis, H., <i>The Doctrine of Eternal Punishment</i> (P. J. Donnelly, S.J.)	464
Burghardt, W. J., S.J., <i>The Testimony of the Patristic Age concerning Mary's Death</i> (P. J. Donnelly, S.J.)	648
Calvin, J., <i>John Calvin on the Christian Faith: Selections from the Institutes, Commentaries, and Tracts</i> (ed. J. T. McNeill)	473
Carnell, E. J., <i>Christian Commitment: An Apologetic</i> (E. I. Van Antwerp, S.S.)	460
Catholic College Teachers of Sacred Doctrine, Society of, <i>Proceedings of the Third Annual Meeting</i>	472
Catholic Theological Society of America, <i>Proceedings of the Twelfth Annual Convention</i>	472
Cauchy, V., <i>Désir naturel et béatitude chez saint Thomas</i> (W. R. O'Connor)	661
Corti, G., <i>Pietro fondamento e pastore perenne della chiesa</i> (J. A. Hardon, S.J.)	650
Cros, L., S.J., <i>Lourdes 1858: Témoins de l'événement</i> (ed. M. Olphe-Galliard, S.J.)	663
Daniélou, J., S.J., <i>Holy Pagans of the Old Testament</i> (tr. F. Faber) (G. Weigel, S.J.)	647
<i>Dictionnaire de spiritualité</i> , fasc. 24: <i>Dorothée de Montau—Duvergier de Hauranne</i> (T. G. O'Callaghan, S.J.)	654
<i>Dictionnaire de théologie catholique: Tables générales (Essence—Fidèle)</i> (J. F. Sweeney, S.J.)	653
Diekamp, F., <i>Katholische Dogmatik nach den Grundsätzen des heiligen Thomas 1</i> (12th & 13th rev. ed. by K. Jussen)	299
<i>Documentos inéditos Tridentinos sobre la justificación: Edición crítica y estudios introductorios</i> (ed. J. Olazarán, S.J.) (J. F. Sweeney, S.J.)	652
Doronzo, E., O.M.I., <i>De ordine 1: De institutione</i> (P. F. Palmer, S.J.)	653
Du Buit, M., O.P., <i>Géographie de la Terre Sainte</i> (R. North, S.J.)	647
<i>Eleven Years of Bible Bibliography</i> (ed. H. H. Rowley)	663
Evans, I., O.P., <i>One in Christ</i>	299
Faber, F. W., <i>Spiritual Conferences</i> (D. J. M. Callahan, S.J.)	465
Genevois, M.-A., O.P., <i>Le mariage selon le dessein de Dieu</i> (J. M. Egan, O.P.)	463
Graham, A., O.S.B., <i>Christian Thought and Action: The Role of Catholicism in Our Time</i> (A. Hennelly, S.J.)	660
Grandmaison, L. de, S.J., <i>La personne de Jésus et ses témoins</i>	299
Grant, F. C., <i>Ancient Roman Religion</i>	126
<i>Griechisch-deutsches Wörterbuch zu den Schriften des Neuen Testaments</i>	

<i>und der ubrigen urchristlichen Literatur</i> , fasc. 1-2 (rev. ed ; W. Bauer) (J. J. Collins, S.J.)	121
Hartmann, A., S.J., <i>Vraie et fausse tolérance</i> (tr. A. Besnard) (J. Songster, S.J.)	651
Hawkins, D. J. B., <i>Crucial Problems of Modern Philosophy</i> (J. T. Clark, S.J.)	469
Hermans, F., <i>Ruysbroeck l'Admirable et son école</i> (E. O'Brien, S.J.)	656
<i>Homélie pascales 3: Une homélie anatolienne sur la date de Pâques en l'an 387</i> (ed -tr. F. Floëri and P. Nautin) (W. J. Burghardt, S.J.)	289
<i>Internationale Zeitschriftensschau für Bibelwissenschaft und Grenzgebiete</i> 4 (1955-1956) nos. 1-2 (ed. F. Stier) (G. S. Glanzman, S.J.)	121
Jedin, H., <i>A History of the Council of Trent</i> 1 (tr. E. Graf, O.S.B.) (R. G. Kelly, S.J.)	293
Jeremias, J., <i>Jesus' Promise to the Nations</i> (tr. S. H. Hooke)	470
Journet, C., <i>Théologie de l'église</i> (F. X. Lawlor, S.J.)	461
Kenney, F. J., S.M., <i>Mary's Spiritual Maternity according to Modern Writers</i> (E. D. O'Connor, C.S.C.)	292
Knox, R., <i>The Priestly Life: A Retreat</i>	473
Korolevsky, C., <i>Living Languages in Catholic Worship</i> (tr. D. Attwater) (J. G. Murray, S.J.)	123
Kugler, J. J., S.D.B., <i>A Commentary on a Short Breviary</i>	474
Lebreton, J., S.J., <i>The Life and Teaching of Jesus Christ Our Lord</i>	469
Lekeux, M., O.F.M., <i>L'Art de prier</i> (F. X. Peirce, S.J.)	655
Leo the Great, <i>Sermons</i> 2 (ed.-tr. R. Dolle) (W. J. Burghardt, S.J.)	459
Little, V. G., <i>The Sacrifice of Praise</i> (P. L. Cioffi, S.J.)	466
Lohr, A., O.S.B., <i>The Great Week: An Explanation of the Liturgy of Holy Week</i> (tr. D. T. H. Bridgehouse) (J. G. Murray, S.J.)	657
Lohr, A., O.S.B., <i>Les mystères de la Pâque</i> (tr. a Dominican nun of Unterlinden) (J. G. Murray, S.J.)	657
López-Dóriga y Oller, E., S.J., <i>San Pedro y el Romano Pontífice</i> (E. V. McClear, S.J.)	290
Louis of Granada, [Venerable], O.P., <i>Summa of the Christian Life</i> 3 (ed.-tr. J. Aumann, O.P.) (E. O'Brien, S.J.)	656
McArdle, [Sister] Mary Aurelia, S.M., <i>California's Pioneer Sister of Mercy: Mother Mary Baptist Russell (1829-1898)</i> (E. A. Ryan, S.J.)	293
<i>Marian Studies</i> 9 (1958)	471
Maritain, J., <i>On the Philosophy of History</i> (ed. J. E. Evans) (J. M. Somerville, S.J.)	298
Markham, J. J., <i>The Sacred Congregation of Seminaries and Universities of Studies</i> (L. H. Larkin, S.J.)	122

Marrou, H., <i>Saint Augustine and His Influence through the Ages</i> (tr. P. Hepburne-Scott) (J. W. Healey, S.J.)	459
Massi, P., <i>Magistero infallibile del papa nella teologia di Giovanni da Torquemada</i> (J. A. Hardon, S.J.)	650
Morgan, [Sister] Mary Evangelist, S.M., <i>Mercy, Generation to Generation: History of the First Century of the Sisters of Mercy, Diocese of Sacramento, California</i> (E. A. Ryan, S.J.)	293
Mulert, H., <i>Konfessionskunde: Die christlichen Kirchen und Sekten heute</i> (3rd rev. ed. by E. Schott and K. Onasch)	302
Neill, T. P., and R. H. Schmandt, <i>History of the Catholic Church</i> (E. A. Ryan, S.J.)	292
<i>A New Eusebius: Documents Illustrative of the History of the Church to A.D. 337</i> (ed. J. Stevenson)	300
Newman, J. H., <i>Letters of John Henry Newman</i> (ed. D. Stanford and M. Spark) (J. M. Culkin, S.J.)	468
O'Dea, T. F., <i>The Mormons</i> (G. Weigel, S.J.)	659
Origen, <i>The Song of Songs: Commentary and Homilies</i> (ed.-tr. R. P. Lawson)	298
Parsch, P., <i>The Church's Year of Grace 1: Advent to Candlemas</i> (tr. W. G. Heidt, O.S.B.) (J. G. Murray, S.J.)	124
Parsch, P., <i>The Liturgy of the Mass</i> (3rd ed.; ed.-tr. H. E. Winstone)	474
Paul, [Saint], <i>Epître aux Romains</i> (ed.-tr. J. Huby, S.J.; rev. S. Lyonnet, S.J.) (G. W. MacRae, S.J.)	288
Pepler, C., O.P., <i>The Three Degrees: A Study of Christian Mysticism</i> (E. O'Brien, S.J.)	656
Percheron, M., <i>Buddha and Buddhism</i> (tr. E. Stapleton) (D. Maruca, S.J.)	468
Perego, A., S.J., <i>L'Etica della situazione</i> (C. J. Fuerst, S.J.)	467
Philo of Alexandria, <i>La migration d'Abraham</i> (ed.-tr. R. Cadiou)	126
Prummer, D. M., O.P., <i>Handbook of Moral Theology</i> (6th ed.; American ed. J. G. Nolan; tr. G. W. Shelton) (J. J. Farraher, S.J.)	295
Putz, L. J., C.S.C., <i>The Modern Apostle</i> (J. G. Murray, S.J.)	125
Quinn, [Sister] M. B., O.S.F., <i>Give Me Souls: A Life of Raphael Cardinal Merry del Val</i> (E. A. Ryan, S.J.)	467
Rasolo, L., S.J., <i>Le dilemme du concours divin: Primat de l'essence ou primat de l'existence?</i> (R. O. Dates, S.J.)	660
Reinhold, H. A., <i>The American Parish and the Roman Liturgy</i> (J. G. Murray, S.J.)	466
Richard of St. Victor, <i>Selected Writings on Contemplation</i> (ed.-tr. C. Kirchberger)	663

Robo, E., <i>Two Portraits of St. Teresa of Lisieux</i> (rev. ed.) (R. W. Sams, S.J.)	124
Rosmini, A., <i>Théorie de l'assentiment</i> (ed.-tr. M.-L. Roure) (G. Weigel, S.J.)	663
Scheeben, M. J., <i>Handbuch der katholischen Dogmatik 6: Gnadenlehre</i> (3rd ed. by H. Schauf) (C. Vollert, S.J.)	462
Setién, J. M., <i>Naturaleza jurídica del estado de perfección en los institutos seculares</i>	301
Soubigou, L., <i>Saint Paul: Guide de pensée et de vie</i> (J. J. Collins, S.J.)	647
Staab, G. J., O.F.M.Cap., <i>The Dignity of Man in Modern Papal Doctrine: Leo XIII to Pius XII (1878-1955)</i> (R. Puentevella, S.J.)	125
Symeon the New Theologian, <i>Chapitres théologiques, gnostiques et pratiques</i> (ed.-tr. J. Darrouzès, A.A.) (W. J. Burghardt, S.J.)	460
Tertullian, <i>Traité de la prescription contre les hérétiques</i> (ed. R. F. Refoulé; tr. P. de Labriolle) (A. Hennelly, S.J.)	288
Tertullian, <i>The Treatise against Hermogenes</i> (ed.-tr. J. H. Waszink)	470
Thomas Aquinas, <i>Summa contra gentiles 4</i> (tr. R. Bernier and F. Kerouanton) (W. J. Hill, O.P.)	290
Tisserant, E., <i>Eastern Christianity in India: A History of the Syro-Malabar Church from the Earliest Time to the Present Day</i> (tr. E. R. Hambye, S.J.) (D. Maruca, S.J.)	122
Todd, J. M., <i>Catholicism and the Ecumenical Movement</i> (J. A. Hardon, S.J.)	296
Tresmontant, C., <i>Saint Paul and the Mystery of Christ</i> (tr. D. Attwater) (J. G. Murray, S.J.)	458
Tyszkiewicz, S., <i>Tserkov Bogocheloveka</i> (J. D. Shenkel, S.J.)	461
Vandenberghé, B. H., O.P., <i>John of the Golden Mouth</i> (P. W. Harkins)	648
Vann, G., O.P., and P. K. Meagher, O.P., <i>The Temptations of Christ</i> (W. J. Burghardt, S.J.)	465
Van Noort, G., <i>Dogmatic Theology 2: Christ's Church</i> (ed.-tr. J. J. Castelot, S.S., and W. R. Murphy, S.S.) (J. F. Sweeney, S.J.)	649
Vogel, A. A., <i>Reality, Reason, and Religion</i> (R. O. Dates, S.J.)	297
Volk, H., <i>Christus und Maria</i> (2nd ed.) (G. W. Shea)	291
Volk, H., <i>Schöpfungsglaube und Entwicklung</i> (2nd ed.)	470
Weigel, G., S.J., <i>A Catholic Primer on the Ecumenical Movement</i> (J. A. Hardon, S.J.)	296
Welte, B., <i>La foi philosophique chez Jaspers et saint Thomas d'Aquin</i> (tr. M. Zemb) (Q. Lauer, S.J.)	662
Williams, Margaret, R.S.C.J., <i>The Sacred Heart in the Life of the Church</i> (P. V. Osterle, S.J.)	291
Williamson, H. R., <i>The Beginning of the English Reformation</i>	300
Xiberta, B. M., O.Carm., <i>Enchiridion de Verbo incarnato</i>	471