

# THEOLOGICAL *Studies*

---

VOLUME 20

September 1959

NUMBER 3

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.,  
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus  
in the United States*

WOODSTOCK COLLEGE

ST. MARY'S COLLEGE

WEST BADEN COLLEGE

ST. MARY OF THE LAKE

ALMA COLLEGE

WESTON COLLEGE

© THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, INC. 1959

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- Complacency and Concern in the Thought of St. Thomas  
*Frederick E. Crowe, S.J.*..... 343
- The "Truth Drug" in Criminal Investigation  
*Charles E. Sheedy, C.S.C.*..... 396

### NOTES

- Cullmann's New Testament Christology: An Appraisal  
*David M. Stanley, S.J.*..... 409
- St. Augustine and the Recent Excavations of the Christian Monu-  
ments of Hippo  
*Thomas W. Phelan*..... 422
- Isidoriana  
*Robert E. McNally, S.J.*..... 432

BOOK REVIEWS.....	443
DANIÉLOU, J., S.J.: <i>The Lord of History: Reflections on the Inner Meaning of History</i> (tr. N. Abercrombie)	
BOUYER, L.: <i>The Meaning of Sacred Scripture</i> (tr. M. P. Ryan)	
RUDOLPH, W.: <i>Jeremia</i>	
MILIK, J. T.: <i>Ten Years of Discovery in the Wilderness of Judaea</i> (tr. J. Strugnell)	
CHEVALLIER, M.-A.: <i>L'Esprit et le messie dans le bas-judaïsme et le Nouveau Testament</i>	
ROBINSON, J. M.: <i>A New Quest of the Historical Jesus</i>	
DUPONT, J., O.S.B.: <i>Les béatitudes: Le problème littéraire; Les deux versions du sermon sur la montagne et des béatitudes</i>	
ELTESTER, F.-W.: <i>Eikon im Neuen Testament</i>	
<i>St. Methodius: The Symposium: A Treatise on Chastity</i> (tr.-ed. H. Musurillo, S.J.)	
CLARK, M. T., R.S.C.J.: <i>Augustine, Philosopher of Freedom: A Study in Comparative Philosophy</i>	
CANIVET, P., S.J.: <i>Histoire d'une entreprise apologétique au V<sup>e</sup> siècle</i>	
<i>Magni Aurelii Cassiodori Expositio psalmodum</i> (ed. M. Adriaen)	
<i>Problemas de actualidad sobre la sucesión apostólica y otros estudios</i>	
WEIGEL, G., S.J.: <i>Faith and Understanding in America</i>	
<i>The Parish: From Theology to Practice</i> (ed. H. Rahner, S.J.)	
VANN, G., O.P.: <i>The Paradise Tree: On Living the Symbols of the Church</i>	
BOUYER, L.: <i>The Cistercian Heritage</i> (tr. E. A. Livingstone)	
RODRIGO, L., S.J.: <i>Tractatus de conscientia morali, pars altera: Theoria de conscientia moralis reflexa</i>	
BOUSCAREN, T. L., S.J., and J. I. O'CONNOR, S.J.: <i>Canon Law Digest 4</i>	
DUNN, W. K.: <i>What Happened to Religious Education? The Decline of Religious Teaching in the Public Elementary School 1776-1861</i>	
SHORTER NOTICES.....	480
BOOKS RECEIVED.....	496



Published in March, June, September, and December at Mt. Royal and Guilford Avenues, Baltimore 2, Md. Second-class postage paid at Baltimore, Md. Indexed in *Bibliographie der fremdsprachigen Zeitschriftenliteratur*, *Catholic Periodical Index*, and *The Guide to Catholic Literature*.

Yearly subscription: United States, \$5.00; Canada and foreign, \$5.50. Single copy, \$1.25. *Cum permissu Superiorum*.

Office of the Editor, Business Office, and Book Review Editor: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, Woodstock, Md.

## BOOK REVIEWS

**THE LORD OF HISTORY: REFLECTIONS ON THE INNER MEANING OF HISTORY.** By Jean Daniélou, S.J. Translated by Nigel Abercrombie. London: Longmans; Chicago: Regnery, 1958. Pp. viii + 375. \$5.00.

The products of the prolific pen of Père Jean Daniélou, S.J., are becoming increasingly available these days in satisfactory English translations, but whether the translators will ever catch up with the French savant remains a matter of conjecture. In any case, we may be grateful to the joint publishers and to Nigel Abercrombie for the present volume, a translation of *Essai sur le mystère de l'histoire* (1953).

The volume is a collection of Père Daniélou's thoughts, some previously presented elsewhere in lecture or written form, on a subject of deep fascination to himself and to many other contemporary thinkers, particularly, one has the impression, since World War II. As the subtitle, which paraphrases the title of the original, tends to indicate, we are here concerned with the theology of history. In the sense that all the pieces presented are the work of one man bearing more or less proximately on the same subject, *The Lord of History* may be said to be unified. But the reader who is seeking a carefully elaborated synthesis, with a logical progression and development of ideas leading to a final unifying conclusion, will shortly come to realize that for such unity he had better look elsewhere. But by then it will be too late, for the richness, indeed prodigality, of thought of these essays of D. will have made it very difficult to put the book down. The richness we must allow the reader to find for himself, contenting ourselves with providing some idea of the contents of the volume and with directing attention to what the reviewer regards as the key to the book.

After an Introduction of some twenty pages, to which we shall return, D. divides his book into three major sections, designated in the original edition (but not in the translation) as *Les problèmes*, *Les mystères*, and *Les décisions*. Part 1 contains such chapters as "Sacred and Profane History," "Christianity and Cultures," "Exile and Hospitality," "A Biblical Interpretation of Modern History," "The History of Religions and the History of Salvation." This part is basically concerned with the history of salvation in relation to other histories, as, for example, of civilization, of religions, etc. Part 2 emphasizes certain characteristics of the history of salvation: "Magnalia Dei," "Christology and History" (in which the dogma of Chalcedon on the two natures of Christ is pressed brilliantly into service), "The Banquet of the Poor," etc. Part 3 is made up of six spiritual reflections, almost sermons, on such subjects as "Poverty," "Sincerity," "Zeal,"

"Hope." With these should be linked the beautiful pages on hospitality found in Part 1 (pp. 64-71), surely among the finest written on this virtue.

It is the persuasion of this reviewer that a careful consideration of the material provided in the substantial Introduction will serve to heighten one's appreciation and grasp of the rest of the book. We spoke above of a certain lack of unity. In connection with this it may be said that one has, often enough, the impression in reading the book that a scholar of wide reading and profound Christian insight, having little time to recast in a synthesized whole his thoughts on the subject of the theology of history, decided to publish his material more or less in whatever state he first produced it. To make up, though, for the understandable lack of coherence resulting from such a process, he gives us an Introduction designed to serve as a frame of reference into which the discrete elements of the rest of the book should be set.

The Christian view of history, D. tells us, has three characteristics. The first is opposition to the Greek view, in which the divine consisted in the unmoved eternal order of ideas. "The opposition is fundamental between this conception and the Christian belief in a unique, irrevocable value belonging to the historical Incarnation. In the Epistle to the Hebrews, Christ is said to have entered 'once' . . . into the holy place, that is, when he ascended into God's heaven: something was then irrevocably gained. Nothing can ever again divide human nature from the Divinity; there is no possibility of a relapse; mankind is essentially saved. All that remains is the business of extending to the individual members of the species that which has been secured for all humanity. The event, then, has finally effected a qualitative change at a given moment in time, so that things can never be the same again" (p. 2). The second characteristic is the conviction that the relationship between nature cults, the Old Testament, and the New Testament is one of successive stages of development. The third and "final characteristic of the Christian outlook on history is its eschatological quality; the idea of an end . . . is of capital importance in the system, from three distinct points of view. First, history is not conceived as an indefinite progress, but as finite in scope; it is a determinate, circumscribed design, called by the Fathers of the Church the cosmic week, which is to be followed by the eighth day, representing the life of the world to come. Secondly, Christianity is itself the term of development: Christ professedly comes 'late in time', and inaugurates the stage that will not pass away. So there is nothing beyond Christianity. It is indeed . . . the last thing. And it is the everlasting juvenescence of the world, which makes everything else obsolete. Thirdly, the end of history has already taken place, because the incarnation

and ascension of Christ fulfil its purpose. . . . The whole life of the Church is characterized by this constant eschatological reference. . . . The sacraments are types and pledges of eternal rewards. . . . The holy Eucharist is specifically both the nourishment of wayfarers and an anticipation of the eschatological banquet. The whole Christian position is determined by the expectation of the Second Coming: but there is no knowing just when it will be. . . . God keeps the secret of that day and hour of the Second Coming. Nevertheless it is always imminent, and the Christian attitude of mind intrinsically depends upon the expectation of it, just as the Christian outlook on history is defined in terms of it" (pp. 6 ff.). Thus D. places himself quite definitely among the proponents of the eschatological, as against the Incarnational, theory of history.

Christianity, D. warns us in Part 1, is not to be identified definitively with any one culture in which it has been or is presently embodied. Particularly in the first two chapters, "Sacred and Profane History" and "Christianity and Cultures," do we have this notion developed, so strongly indeed that they give a missiological cast to much of what follows.

Really, one does not read a book of this sort without being stimulated to all sorts of strong reactions, positive and negative. If for no other reason—and there are many other reasons—*The Lord of History* should be fitted into the busiest reading schedule. We may end prosaically with the remark that the twenty-one-page Index is a welcome addition to the English edition, and with an expression of wonder that in these enlightened days the translator should have found it necessary to make the French *Jahveh* appear *passim* as the impossible "Jehovah."

West Baden College

JOSEPH J. DEVAULT, S.J.

THE MEANING OF SACRED SCRIPTURE. By Louis Bouyer. Translated by Mary Perkins Ryan. *Liturgical Studies* 5. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1958. Pp. xii + 258. \$4.75.

In a series of popular essays on biblical theology Père Bouyer traces the plan of salvation through the *OT* to its execution in the *NT*. The style and character of the essays is largely determined by the fact that they were delivered as a series of lectures at the University of Notre Dame. This may be chiefly responsible for the defect which made the book somewhat disappointing to this reviewer. It covers too much territory for its size, and it is stretched so thin that it fails to achieve depth. Hence the title is slightly misleading. I found the chapters on the *NT* more satisfactory than the chapters on the *OT*. In particular, the reader can be grateful for B.'s dis-

cussion of biblical mysticism and for his emphasis on the importance of extrabiblical Jewish material in tracing the origins of *NT* patterns of thought and language. A chapter on the Psalms as the prayer of the Church opens a consideration of the true inner unity of the two Testaments. Unfortunately, this fruitful theme is merely sketched and not developed.

The translation is good and generally escapes Gallicisms, except in the transcription of some proper names, such as Ourim and Thoummim. The editor's note on these names at the end of the book comes too late. A whole page of errata seems to this reviewer to be a fairly complete listing. The bibliographical references are few, in accordance with the popular character of the work. Most of these are to French literature, as one would expect; but there seems to be no reason why the translator should have retained references to translations into French of books which were written in other languages. The original of such books is usually more accessible here than translations into French.

With these reservations, the book can be recommended as a stimulating discussion of a number of important themes. Exegetically and critically it is based upon profound erudition and thorough acquaintance with contemporary studies.

*West Baden College*

JOHN L. MCKENZIE, S.J.

JEREMIA. By Wilhelm Rudolph. *Handbuch zum Alten Testament* 12. 2nd ed.; Tübingen: Mohr, 1958. Pp. xxvi + 309. DM 22.50 (paper) and DM 26.— (cloth).

Rudolph's commentary has for more than a decade been standard and indispensable in the interpretation of Jeremiah. This revised edition will make it even more so; for though the author has not substantially altered any of his positions, he has evidently rethought them all thoroughly, and he has missed little if any of the recent literature bearing on his subject.

R.'s distribution of the material of Jer follows his modification of Mowinckel's three-source theory: the authentic words of Jeremiah, the narrative material about the prophet composed by Baruch, and the supplementation—usually based on authentic Jeremianic words—which is the work of the Deuteronomist school. He shares the now common view that the prophet, initially favorable to the Deuteronomic reform (thus explaining his relative silence during Josiah's time), ultimately lost faith in it as superficial and insufficient (pp. 73 f.). This view, which seems reasonable to the reviewer, would tend to suggest that we do not yet have a wholly satisfactory explanation for the "Deuteronomic" material in Jer ("source C").

Why should the Deuteronomist school have chosen for extensive redaction precisely that prophet whose view of history differed so widely from their own? If, as R. points out (p. 48, note 1, on 7:1-15), *ex hypothesi* the Deuteronomists were writing at a time when Jeremiah's prophecy against the Temple had been all too literally fulfilled, and they were concerned lest a similar fate should befall the second Temple, still, in adopting the prophet's message as their own with its implicit repudiation of the reform, they certainly acted differently from the Deuteronomists of the Book of Kings. The relation of Jer to Dt may be subtler than one of redaction, as the older critics believed. R. himself (p. 15, on 2:4-13) rejects any merely mechanical segregation of material on the score of "Deuteronomic style": it is arbitrary to restrict Jeremiah to any single meter, and both Jer and Dt depend on the style of Hosea.

The author's ability to deal with problems concisely and to arrive at sensible conclusions is much to be admired. For example, one can only agree with his statement (p. 47, note 1) that the *Kurzvers* theory is as yet far from demonstration, and that on the criteria used by Georg Fohrer and others almost any prose text can be read rhythmically and divided into strophes. He issues a warning, not always heeded by Protestant authors, against "protestantizing" the prophetic attitude towards cult religion (p. 53, on 7:22). He has no hesitation about ascribing various of the prose sections of Jer, such as chap. 24, to "source A" (p. 145). His courteous and generous treatment of de Bondt's opinion against his interpretation of 13:1-11 is a model of objective scholarship (p. 87).

In countless minor ways the commentary shows how it has benefited from R.'s patient revision. The newly published supplement to the Babylonian Chronicle permits him now to date 12:7-13, 14-17 to the time 601/600 B.C., before Nebuchadnezzar's definitive invasion of Palestine (p. 81). Though he still has no solution of his own, he is now willing to follow Bruno in reading 31:22 *n'qabbā r'sōbab g'birā*: "the rejected one again becomes mistress." It is surprising to find him referring to the hypothesis (which, of course, he rejects) of "the enemy from the north" (= the Scythians) as "die landläufige Anschauung" held by "heute die meisten Exegeten" (p. 44). It is the reviewer's impression that it would be hard to find any exegete who would sustain this view today—as, indeed, R.'s own notes indicate.

The distinguished series of which this commentary is a part has been further improved by this revision. No serious student of Jer can afford to leave it out of account.

*St. Thomas Seminary, Denver, Colo.*

BRUCE VAWTER, C.M.

TEN YEARS OF DISCOVERY IN THE WILDERNESS OF JUDAEA. By Jozef T. Milik. Translated by J. Strugnell. *Studies in Biblical Theology* 26. Naperville, Ill.: Alec R. Allenson, 1959. Pp. 160 + 25 photographic reproductions. \$2.50.

During a recent series of lectures on the Dead Sea Scrolls at Goucher College, Frank M. Cross, Jr., was asked by one of the audience to name the best book available on the Scrolls. With characteristic modesty the author of *The Ancient Library of Qumran and Modern Biblical Studies* spontaneously replied, "*Ten Years of Discovery in the Wilderness of Judaea* by J. T. Milik." I would not try to say which of these two books is better, since both of them are in a class by themselves, undoubtedly the best syntheses on the Scrolls that have appeared in any language.

The author of *Ten Years of Discovery* is Jozef T. Milik, a priest of the diocese of Warsaw, a refugee-scholar now working in Jerusalem and entrusted with the publication of the largest lot of Qumrân Cave IV fragments. His competence and acquaintance with the material about which he writes are beyond question. The present English edition was prepared by another member of the Jerusalem Scroll team, the brilliant young Englishman, John Strugnell. Though based on the French edition, *Dix ans de découvertes dans le Désert de Juda*, it is not a mere translation, for it offers an expanded and in very many places a completely rewritten text. Milik's preface informs us that Strugnell "discussed the revision sentence by sentence with me, and these discussions often led to more extensive changes in the book" (p. 7). Having been in Jerusalem at the time of this revision, I can attest to the care with which every point was discussed by the author and his *advocatus diaboli*. A paragraph was often rewritten only after long debate and is thus the result of the competence of both Milik and Strugnell. For this reason the English edition clearly surpasses in value the French (and, a fortiori, the Italian) edition.

The English version retains the original framework of five chapters: (1) The Story of the Discoveries; (2) The Qumrân Library; (3) History of the Essenes; (4) Essene Organization and Teachings; (5) The Discoveries in the Judean Wilderness and Their Importance. Milik's views on these subjects are fundamentally unchanged, and the reader is referred to R. E. Murphy's summary of the French edition (*THEOLOGICAL STUDIES* 18 [1957] 605-6). The difference in the two editions lies in the additional reasons often given for his views and in the more carefully worked out or nuanced arguments now proposed. In chapter 3 we find the most significant reworking of material, for the data of the French Appendix have now been incorporated into the main text and a detailed reconstruction of the history of the



Essenes has been attempted. Milik stresses that "it is only with some hesitation that we have offered this outline of Essene history" (p. 98). Yet it is a reconstruction that is based on every shred of evidence—archeology, paleography, numismatics, study of the ancient sources about the Essenes and of the Qumrân texts themselves—that cannot lightly be dismissed in the present state of our knowledge about the Scrolls. One cannot help but notice the great similarity between Milik's reconstruction and that of Cross. They are both led by the same evidence to establish the beginnings of the Qumrân sect *ca.* 150 B.C. Though they do not agree in the identification of the Wicked Priest (for Milik it is Jonathan, for Cross it is Simon), their conclusions definitely exclude Alexander Jannaeus or any of his successors. Milik's reconstruction, moreover, has the advantage in distinguishing various phases of Essene history and different types of Essenes, and thus permits one to explain the differences that exist in the Qumrân documents (e.g., between the *Rule of the Community* and the *Damascus Document*).

We turn now to a few details. Whereas the French edition ascribed the "Similitudes" of Enoch (chaps. 37–71) to "un judéo-chrétien du second siècle de notre ère" (p. 31), the English now says that they "are probably to be considered the work of a Jew or a Jewish Christian of the first or second century A.D." (p. 33). The same statement is now made for the Greek text of the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* (p. 34), which Milik had previously ascribed to "un judéo-chrétien du second siècle, ayant sous les yeux l'un ou l'autre Testament déjà existant" (p. 32). But how can this new position be squared with the statement at the end of the same paragraph: "Other elements bear a Christian stamp, and since they cannot easily be considered as interpolations, they suggest a Christian rather than a Jewish origin for the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*" (p. 35)? This is somewhat baffling; it is known that Milik sides with de Jonge's conclusions about the *Testaments*, but this whole question is far from settled. The recent article of M. Philonenko, in *Revue d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses* 38 (1958) 309–43, and its promised continuation, must be considered seriously in this connection.

If references to the *Damascus Document* have often been confusing up to now, due to the two prevailing modes of numbering (Schechter's sane method following the pages and lines of the MSS; Charles' arbitrary division into chapters), the new material from Cave IV, about which we are informed in chapter 2 and in the additional note on pp. 151–52, will only create more confusion. But this time it is inevitable. The 4Q exemplars are different and longer, giving additional material that must precede, be inserted into, and even appended to the Cairo text. According to the new

data, pp. XV and XVI of the Cairo MS directly preceded page IX. "The original order of the work was as follows: Opening columns (4Q; missing in Cairo manuscript), CD I-VIII (and a text parallel to *fin.* XIX-XX), missing part (partly preserved in 4Q), XV-XVI, IX-XIV, final columns (4Q: penal code, and liturgy for the feast of the Renewal of the Covenant)" (p. 152). The footnote on p. 60 informs us that "there is no evidence from Cave IV that the sect knew the B recension of the *Damascus Document*." Yet in the résumé just quoted from p. 152 and in the same footnote on p. 60 we are told that a few fragments from 4Q belong to the otherwise lost end of the first part of the Damascus Document "and contain a text substantially the same as that in the B recension." Some clarifying distinction is obviously needed here, because the statements in the book regarding MS B of the Cairo text border on double talk.

The treatment of the Two Messiahs now merits careful restudy on the basis of some new information supplied on pp. 123-28. At the end of the section on the Calendar and the Feasts of the Essenes, Milik refuses to accept the Jaubert thesis that the Last Supper was celebrated by Jesus as the Essene Passover on the Tuesday evening in Holy Week. In this he finds himself in the good company of some reputable *NT* scholars; cf. P. Benoit, in *Revue biblique* 65 (1958) 590-94; J. Jeremias, in *Journal of Theological Studies*, n.s. 10 (1959) 131-33; P. Gaechter, in *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie* 80 (1958) 555-61; J. Blinzler, in *Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft* 49 (1958) 238-51.

A few minor details need correction or further nuances. P. 21: Is it not inaccurate to say that the texts were written on "leather scrolls"? Leather is *tanned* skin, and according to J. B. Poole, the leather expert from the University of Leeds who was in Jerusalem last year, the fragments are not of tanned skins. This seems to be admitted on p. 151, "... the untanned skins used for manuscripts." P. 44: While *Historia naturalis* might be better word-order according to the normal canons of Latin style, Pliny himself called the book *Naturalis historia*. Pp. 59, 63: Is it accurate to call Mat-thias "Maccabaeus"? Was not this epithet first used of his son Judas? P. 68: Is it not tendentious to equate 'bywonym with Ebionites? P. 74: What is the evidence for saying that the Righteous Teacher composed the *Hôdâyôt*? Every passage from these psalms quoted in the book could just as easily refer to the common experience of any member of the sect. P. 80: A paragraph should have been inserted at the end of the discussion on the Righteous Teacher about the difficult text in *CD* 6:10 ff., sometimes appealed to in support of the alleged resurrection of this figure. The remarks on p. 126 about it are all too brief and cryptic. P. 112: Is it correct to call the *official*

Jewish calendar "orthodox"? The Essenes would not have agreed. Pp. 121, 122, 125: The interpretation of *IQH* 3:1-18 presupposed here is far from certain; why is not this psalm, like so many others, merely a thanksgiving for deliverance from afflictions (which happen to be compared to a woman's travail)?

The book is unfortunately marred by numerous typographical errors (I counted over sixty-five) and inconsistent spellings. It should have been more carefully proofread. *Indignor quandoque bonus dormitat Homerus.*

The reading of this book will certainly be profitable to all who undertake it. There is no doubt of the excellent quality of the study here presented. Milik's preface states: "Although the result [of the revision] is slightly more technical than was the French original, my intention is still to give a popular treatment of the subject." Though popular in intent, the book contains much that the Scroll expert can learn. In fact, it is not the book to be given to someone who desires to make his first acquaintance with the Scrolls. *Qui potest capere, capiat.*

Woodstock College

JOSEPH A. FITZMYER, S.J.

L'ESPRIT ET LE MESSIE DANS LE BAS-JUDAÏSME ET LE NOUVEAU TESTAMENT. By Max-Alain Chevallier. *Etudes d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses* 49. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1958. Pp. 154. 800 fr.

What was the relation between the Spirit and Jesus the Messiah? How can one account for the fact that the Synoptics describe the role of the Spirit at the beginning of Jesus' ministry (infancy narratives, baptism, temptations) and yet Jesus Himself during His ministry makes no reference to the Spirit in these Gospels? In an attempt to answer these and other pertinent questions about the relation of the Spirit to Jesus the Messiah, C. has undertaken a detailed study of the Spirit and the Messiah in the *OT*, in intertestamental literature, and in the Synoptics.

His monograph presents a thorough examination of the main *OT* texts in which the beginnings of the Spirit-Messiah relationship are to be found and traces it in its various manifestations in the literature of late Judaism and in the *NT*. The study reveals a wide acquaintance with the most pertinent literature on the subject—with one important exception (see below)—and is characterized by methodical presentation and great clarity.

The book is divided into four parts: (1) Jewish Messianic Tradition; (2) The Gift of the Spirit to the Messiah, Jesus of Nazareth; (3) The Spirit and the Messiah, the Risen Jesus; (4) The Spirit and the Messiah in the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* and in Qumrân Literature.

Part 1: There existed in late Judaism a Messianic tradition which had its roots in Is 11:1-10 and Ps 2. The linking of these passages can be found in the Odes of Solomon, Enoch, Sibylline Oracles. A secondary source of the tradition is the second Servant-Song (Is 49:1-9). In this study C. depends particularly on the investigations of the Scandinavian school which established the relation of Is 11, Ps 2, and Dt-Is to Jewish Messianic expectations, and appeals especially to the work of H. Ringgren (*ZAW* 44 [1952] 120-47). The Messianic tradition derived from Is 11, Ps 2, and Is 49 can be traced in Palestinian Judaism in Ben Sira (47:11,22; 48:24-25,10), as well as in Hellenistic Judaism. Curiously enough, the LXX of Num 24:7,17 substitutes *anthrōpos* for "seed" in a promise of fecundity and triumph and thus transfers the verse to the Messianic plane; the dependence here on Is 11:1a is clear. Further Hellenistic evidence of this tradition is found in the Sibylline Oracles (3.97 ff.) and in Philo (*De praemiis et poenis* 15-16, a commentary on Lev 26:6-8 into which the themes of Is 11 and Ps 2 are woven and where Num 24:17 LXX is quoted). In contrast to this live Messianic tradition stands the silence of the ancient rabbis on the subject of the Messiah. All the evidence of this tradition shows that it was not a heterogeneous collection of disparate elements, as is often maintained, but that it had a common nucleus in which Is 11:1-10 played the biggest part; with it was regularly associated Ps 2 and often enough also Is 49:1-9 in Palestinian Judaism or Num 24:7,17 in Hellenistic Judaism. To the question, how this tradition was transmitted, C. replies with oral transmission of the type postulated by C. H. Dodd (*According to the Scriptures: The Substructure of New Testament Theology*, London, 1952); this he prefers to the hypothesis of *testimonia* or a florilegium of OT texts.

Part 2: The gift of the Spirit to Jesus the Messiah. Jesus was a scribe who inherited the Jewish Messianic tradition and interpreted it, associating with the "Chosen Servant" motif of Is 49 that of the "Son of Man." But the later teachers of the primitive Church were also "scribes," who noted how He realized the Messianic promises and how the Davidic traits of Is 11 and Ps 2 were verified in Him; they emphasized His title of "Son of God" and applied to the *Kyrios* still other "prophecies." Whereas the gift of the Spirit to the Messiah was an unstable element in the Jewish tradition, we find the Synoptic scribes applying it to Jesus the Messiah. This gift appears in the preaching of the Baptist, announcing the coming of one who would baptize "with the wind and with fire" (Mt 3:11; Lk 3:16). C. follows Eisler, Goguel, Barrett, and Kraeling in the view that *pneuma* here means "wind." The punitive baptism "of wind and fire" was the original form of John's preaching, derived from the Messianic tradition of late Judaism. The

Evangelists were responsible for the Christian transformation of his message, by adding *hagiō*. It appears even more clearly in the baptism of Jesus by John, in the temptation accounts, and in the Nazareth episode (Lk 4:16 ff.). In all cases the *NT* theologoumena regarded the baptismal gift of the Spirit as the Messianic anointing of Christ. Hence, though Jesus never speaks of the Spirit within Him in the Synoptics, these same writings reproduce the theologoumena of the early Church: from the beginning Jesus was endowed with the Spirit in His capacity as Messiah.

Part 3: The relation of the Spirit to the Risen Messiah. Paul inserts into the *praescriptio* of Romans a scrap of the primitive kerygma, which contrasts two phases of Jesus' existence: *kata sarka . . . kata pneuma hagiōsynēs* (Rom 1:3-4). Comparing the opposition of *sarx* and *pneuma* in 1 Tim 3:16 and 1 Pet 3:18, C. finds Jesus constituted here as Son of God in power with a decisive participation of the Holy Spirit. The Spirit is given by God to *qualify* the Messiah; even the *Christ* exalted at the right hand of the Father is related to the Spirit, on whom He as *Kyrios* no longer depends, but with whom He is associated. In this the stream of Messianic tradition derived from Is 11 and Ps 2 is interrupted by primitive Christian teaching. Moreover, the *OT* effusion of the Spirit in the last days is associated in the *NT* with the Messiah (Acts 2, where Jl 2:28-32 is quoted). Those who believe in Jesus the Messiah will in turn receive on an individual basis through the baptism of repentance the Messianic benefits, the Spirit and adoptive sonship (2 Cor 1:21).

Part 4: The relation of the Spirit to the Messiah in the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* and the Qumrān literature. De Jonge has recently shown that the alleged Christian interpolations cannot be separated from the whole, and that since they are Christian, the whole is fundamentally a Christian work. Two texts of the *Testaments* which are derived from the Jewish tradition are *Test. Levi* 18:2-14 and *Test. Judah* 24. But they are prophecies *ex eventu* of the coming of Jesus the Messiah as the fulfilment of the Scriptures; their dependence on the baptism accounts of the Synoptics is considered by C. to be clear. Furthermore, there are several passages in the Qumrān literature (especially *IQSb* 5:20; *CD* 2:11-12; *IQS* 4:20-21) that reflect the same tradition. The relation of these texts to the *Testaments* has often been pointed out, and they too are preferably to be regarded as Christian.

There is no doubt that C. has written a stimulating book. We cannot discuss in detail all the points that are involved in the above summary. The major defect in the book is the author's untenable position that the Qumrān literature is Christian. Even though we disagree with him on this

score, we must admit that much of the investigation of the earlier chapters is nonetheless valid. It is to be regretted that the Qumrân evidence on this interesting topic was not put in its proper light. On p. 115 he speaks of "two fundamental theses" regarding the identification of the Qumrân sect: (a) that it is Essene; (b) that it is Jewish Christian. The latter opinion, which C. prefers, is derived from J. L. Teicher, who wrote a veritable spate of articles on the Ebionites of the Scrolls and their pre-Pauline type of Christianity in the *Journal of Jewish Studies* between 1951 and 1954 (see THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 16 [1955] 335 ff.)—until, that is, a successor was found for him as editor of the *Journal*! To call Teicher's position one of the "two fundamental theses" held today by scholars, "pour ne citer que les opinions les plus raisonnables," is misleading nonsense. Besides C., Teicher holds the thesis; and just as the U.S.A. has its Zeitlin, France its del Medico, so England has its Teicher. It is even more regrettable that the otherwise solid work found in this book had to be diverted by the Teicherian thesis that rides roughshod over the evidence from archeology, paleography, and the external and internal literary criticism generally admitted today by sound Qumrân scholarship. On pp. 136-38 C. tries to pooh-pooh the evidence of archeology and paleography, once again in dependence on Teicher; let him read the remarks of P. de Vaux in *Revue biblique* 66 (1959) 87-110.

C.'s book appeared in 1958, but it is obvious that he has not kept abreast of recent literature on the Scrolls. In this field this is a serious defect, especially if it touches the major trend of one's work. On p. 2 we are told: "... nous avons pu achever, pendant l'hiver et l'été 1955, une recherche longtemps suspendue." In the last few years opinions on the Scrolls that were once tenable have often become obsolete; as of 1954-55 there may have been some reason for an initial skepticism vis-à-vis the archeological and paleographical results of Qumrân investigation. However, the general lines of those results are now clear and have been so for some time; they clearly exclude the possibility of the Scrolls being Christian products. In a book published in 1958 and using Qumrân literature for an important part of its thesis, it is surprising to find 1954 as the latest date in the bibliography (pp. 147-48); through the book there are a few rare titles dated 1955.

To show how this defect colors C.'s reasoning, we take the question of the "4Q Testimonia" text. He rejects it as evidence that florilegia existed in pre-Christian times and prefers to it the oral transmission of the Messianic tradition. His information about "4Q Testimonia" comes only from a brief notice given by J. T. Milik in *Revue biblique* 60 (1953) 290-91 and a note in G. Vermès, *Les manuscrits du Désert de Juda* (Paris, 1954) p. 29. He says: "Il est fâcheux que ce fragment n'ait pas encore été publié. On aimerait

savoir comment les textes sont disposés sur le feuillet" (p. 47). But it was published by J. M. Allegro in the *Journal of Biblical Literature* 75 (1956) 182-87, together with a photographic reproduction. It is written in the Hasmonaean script, which dates it *ca.* 100 B.C. (see J. T. Milik, *Ten Years of Discovery in the Wilderness of Judaea* [Naperville, 1959] pp. 124, 135). Consequently, it is unreasonable to say in a book published in 1958: "tant qu'un échantillon incontestable de *Testimonia* palestiniens n'aura pas été identifié, l'existence de tels recueils est seulement imaginaire." See *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES* 18 (1957) 513-37.

The question of the *testimonia* affects admittedly a minor part of the book, but it is indicative of C.'s approach to the Qumrân literature in general. However, despite the untenable position of the Christian origin of the Qumrân texts, there is much in the book that provides food for thought. Used with the requisite qualifications, it will serve as a useful tool for further study of the problem of the relation of the Spirit and the Messiah in late Judaism and the New Testament. The last word has not yet been said on the basis of the available evidence.

Woodstock College

JOSEPH A. FITZMYER, S.J.

A NEW QUEST OF THE HISTORICAL JESUS. By James M. Robinson. *Studies in Biblical Theology* 25. Naperville, Ill.: Allenson, 1959. Pp. 128. \$2.25.

In the post-Bultmannian phase of postwar German theology, outstanding pupils of Bultmann are carrying out a critical revision of his position, from which a theological synthesis of the future will grow. The first part of this program to get under way is with regard to the problem of the historical Jesus. The proposal of a new quest of the historical Jesus has extended into traditionally conservative circles, has received support from the Barthian side, and has been aided by Bultmann himself. The present work is presented as a contribution to the new quest both by a clarification of its nature and by an active participation in the work of the new quest at a few significant points.

Bultmann's Form-Critical research tended to confirm the view that the quest of the historical Jesus is impossible, and his existential theology carried through the thesis that such a quest is illegitimate. It is here that the critical restudy of his position by his pupils, Käsemann, Fuchs, Bornkamm, and others, begins.

The real cause behind the end of the original quest is to be found in a series of basic shifts taking place in *NT* scholarship at the opening of the

century. These shifts taken together formed a decisive cleft between nineteenth- and twentieth-century scholarship and indicated the impossibility and illegitimacy of the quest of the historical Jesus.

The possibility of the original quest resided primarily in its view of the oldest sources as the same kind of objective, positivistic historiography which the nineteenth century itself aspired to write. The basic reorientation consisted in the discovery that the Gospels are the devotional literature of the primitive Church rather than the products of scholarship. Thus the function which the tradition about Jesus performed in the life and worship of the Church came to be recognized as the organizing principle in the formation of the individual stories and sayings and in the formation of the Gospels themselves. History survived only as kerygma. It is this insight, R. argues, which reversed our understanding of the scholar's situation with regard to the relation of factual detail and theological interpretation in the Gospels. If the nineteenth century presupposed the detailed historicity of the Synoptic Gospels except where "doctrinal tampering" was so obvious as to be inescapable, the twentieth century presupposes the kerygmatic nature of the Gospels and feels confident in asserting the historicity of its details only where their origin cannot be explained in terms of the life of the Church. In the nineteenth century the burden of proof lay upon the scholar who saw theological interpolations in historical sources; in the twentieth century the burden of proof lies upon the scholar who sees objective, factual source material in the primitive Church's book of common worship.

The considerations that led to the view that the old quest was impossible can be summarized in the discovery of the kerygma at the center of the Gospels. Kerygma came gradually to be recognized as the center not only of the Gospels but also of primitive Christianity itself. It has increasingly come to replace the theological centrality of the historical Jesus in leading theological systems of our day.

The possibility of the new quest lies in the radically different understanding of history and of human existence which distinguishes the present from the quest which ended in failure. R. insists that we have come to recognize that the objective, factual level upon which the nineteenth century operated is only one dimension of history, and that a whole new dimension in the facts, a deeper and more central plane of meaning, had been largely bypassed. The dimension in which man actually exists, his "world," the stance or outlook from which he acts, his understanding of his existence behind what he does, the way he meets his basic problems and the answer his life implies to the human dilemma, the significance he had as the environment of those who knew him, the continuing history his life produces, the



possibility of existence which his life presents to me as an alternative—such matters as these have become central in an attempt to understand history. The historian's task is seen to consist in understanding the deep-lying intentions of the past, by involving one's selfhood in an encounter in which one's own intentions and views of existence are put in question and perhaps altered or even radically reversed.

A new quest must be undertaken because the kerygma claims to mediate an existential encounter with a historical person, Jesus, who can also be encountered through the mediation of modern historiography. A new quest cannot verify the truth of the kerygma, that this person actually lived out of transcendence and actually makes transcendence available to me in my historical existence. But it can test whether this kerygmatic understanding of Jesus' existence corresponds to the understanding of existence implicit in Jesus' history, as encountered through modern historiography. If the kerygma's identification of *its* understanding of existence with *Jesus'* existence is valid, then this kerygmatic understanding of existence should become apparent as the result of modern historical research upon Jesus. For such research has as a legitimate goal the clarification of an understanding of existence occurring in history, as a possible understanding of my existence. Hence the purpose of a new quest of the historical Jesus would be to test the validity of the kerygma's identification of *its* understanding of existence with *Jesus'* existence.

R. has performed an invaluable service in setting this urgent problem in the framework of a developed historical method. Serious questions remain with regard to the notion of history and historical method, the character of the Gospel tradition, the nature of the primitive Church, and its connection with Jesus of Nazareth. The portrait of Jesus which seems to delineate Christ as a Heideggerian existentialist will raise many questions on the modernization of Jesus of Nazareth. These questions do not take away the value of this work, which maintains the high standards of the other contributions to this series.

*Woodstock College*

VINCENT T. O'KEEFE, S.J.

LES BÉATITUDES: LE PROBLÈME LITTÉRAIRE; LES DEUX VERSIONS DU SERMON SUR LA MONTAGNE ET DES BÉATITUDES. By Dom Jacques Dupont. 2nd ed.; Bruges: Abbaye de Saint-André; Louvain: Nauwelaerts, 1958. Pp. 387.

The new edition of *Les béatitudes* will appear in three volumes, of which this is the first. It deals with the subject of the first part of the single-

volume first edition: the second volume will treat the material of the second part of that edition: *Le message doctrinal*. The cadre of the Sermon on the Mount, to which pp. 19–41 of the first edition were devoted, will be, together with other matters pertinent to the Beatitudes, the subject of the third volume. The present work is divided into two parts, the first dealing with the Sermon in Luke and in Matthew (pp. 43–204), the second with the two versions of the Beatitudes (pp. 207–345).

In the Introduction, where one finds some splendid observations on the various stages in the formation of a Gospel text, and on the *actualisation* of the words of Jesus by the apostolic tradition and by the Evangelists, D. points out that his work is one of *Redaktionsgeschichte*, attempting to determine the methods of composition used by the Evangelists and thus to distinguish the material due to their editing from the basic text(s) on which they worked. While recognizing its importance, he has not concerned himself with the *Formgeschichte* which lies behind the basic documentation: "Our research concerns the redaction of the Gospels and their immediate sources; we have not attempted to discover the remote prehistory of the formulas in the life of the first-century Christian communities" (p. 33). Before subjecting the two versions of the Beatitudes to this sort of examination, D. makes a much fuller study in this edition than he did in the first, of the two recensions of the Sermon. This detailed analysis of texts of the Sermon which were treated only briefly in the previous work is one of the most valuable parts of the new edition; cf., e.g., the "Analyse littéraire du discours de Matthieu" (1st ed., pp. 57–66; this ed., pp. 130–75). The connection of the Beatitudes and the Sermon makes it probable that the conclusions about the basic documentation and the Evangelists' literary procedures reached by this study of the recensions of the Sermon can be applied fruitfully in the analysis of the two versions of the Beatitudes.

While the new edition is the result of a thorough appraisal of the positions taken in the first, one is not surprised to find that in the majority of cases the fuller examination of the texts here undertaken has only confirmed and given more solid basis to the positions advanced in the earlier study. One of the more important changes concerns the Sermon material proper to Luke. Formerly D. proposed that its presence in that context was due to the literary activity of the Evangelist (1st ed., p. 45); now he inclines to the view that it was already in the document which served as Luke's basic text (pp. 58 f.). This would seem to weaken the position which D. had taken on the "Woes" in Luke's version, and he admits that one must proceed cautiously before affirming that the Woes are an addition made by Luke to the basic text. Yet because of other indications of Luke's literary

procedures, among them the fact that although generally faithful to his sources, "he nonetheless at times takes liberties that may seem astonishing" (p. 306), D. maintains his view that more probably the Woes were added by Luke—a view which, without being certain, "furnishes the simplest answer to the problem raised by the presence of the Woes in the Sermon" (p. 342).

In the Preface, D. speaks of those professors who have given the first edition to their students as a means of initiation to the study of the Gospels. Not the least merit of the new edition is that it is even better suited to that purpose, and one can indeed congratulate those whose introduction to the texts is made through a work so admirably conceived and executed in the finest traditions of Louvain scholarship.

*St. Joseph's Seminary, Dunwoodie, N.Y.*

MYLES M. BOURKE

EIKON IM NEUEN TESTAMENT. By Friedrich-Wilhelm Eltester. *Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft* 23. Berlin: Töpelmann, 1958. Pp. xvi + 166. DM 28.—

Lest anyone should think that the study of a *NT* word in Kittel's *Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Neuen Testament*, careful and thorough as it usually is, precludes any further study of such a word, the monograph of Eltester witnesses to the contrary. Whereas the contribution of Kittel, von Rad, and Kleinknecht in *TWNT* 2 covered pp. 378–96, Eltester devotes 166 pages to the subject of *eikōn* in the *NT*. As a matter of fact, 129 of these pages are devoted to a study of the word *eikōn* in the Hellenistic milieu of the *NT*; only on p. 130 does he begin to treat of its use in the *NT*.

The first part of the monograph studies *eikōn* in its etymology and its usage in classical (Plato), Hellenistic (Plutarch, Maximus of Tyre, Hermetic literature, Plotinus), Jewish Hellenistic (the LXX and Philo), and *NT* Greek. It traces the evolution of its meaning in the Hellenistic period from "image" or "copy" (*Abbild*) to that of "form" or "appearance" (*Bild, Aussehen, Gestalt*), finally to that of "model" or "prototype" (*Vorbild*). The same meanings are found in the LXX and Philo, showing that they are dependent on current Hellenistic usage. Moreover, they appear also in the *NT*. As *Abbild* we have the "image" of God in 1 Cor 11:7; 2 Cor 4:4; Col 1:15; 3:10; Caesar's figure on a coin in Mt 22:20; Mk 12:16; Lk 20:24; an idol in Ap 13:14–15; 14:9,11; 15:2; 16:2; 19:20; 20:24. As *Gestalt* we find the word in the sense of "form" in Rom 1:23; 8:29; 1 Cor 15:49; 2 Cor 3:18; Heb 10:1; but in some cases "form" even acquires the nuance of *Wesen* (2 Cor 3:18; Rom 8:29), so that it may also pass over into the mean-

ing of *Vorbild*, as in Heb 10:1. Hence, Eltester concludes that the use of *eikōn* in the *NT* corresponds to that current in Hellenism (p. 25).

But in order to understand the *NT* statements in particular of Christ as the image of God (2 Cor 4:4; Col 1:15) and of man as the image of God (1 Cor 11:7; Col 3:10), Eltester in the second and longest part of his study (pp. 28–129) investigates the “cosmological” and “anthropological” meanings of *eikōn* outside the *NT*. Scholars have often related the description of Christ as *eikōn* to the Hellenistic designation of the *kosmos* as the *eikōn* of God. The cosmological meaning of *eikōn* is alone found in Plato, in the sense of *Abbild*. But a study of texts from Philo, Plutarch, Numenius of Apamea, the Hermetic literature, and Plotinus reveals a shift in meaning. The Platonic idea of *eikōn* as *Abbild* is modified by the introduction of emanationist theories into the Platonic tradition. This is responsible for the idea that the copy (*Abbild*) enjoys some sort of “substantial participation” in the prototype (*Vorbild*), that it is brought forth from the prototype, and that it is an effective representation of the prototype. Concretely this shift in meaning manifested itself in two main ways: (a) the Platonic notion of the sense world as the *eikōn* of the intelligible world is the logical forerunner of Plutarch’s idea that the world is the *eikōn* of God, and of the idea found in the Hermetic literature that cosmic man is the *eikōn*; (b) the Platonic notion of the sun as the *eikōn* of the Good prepares the way for Plutarch’s solar theology, the sun as the *eikōn* of God, and for the Jewish Hellenistic notion of Sophia as *eikōn* (Wis 7:26). In Philo’s Logos we find the two notions of cosmic man and Sophia united, and it too is regarded as the *eikōn* of God.

Three different manifestations of the anthropological meaning of *eikōn* can be discerned. Man as a direct copy (*Abbild*) of God has its roots in the *OT* (Gn 1:26–27; 5:1; 9:6); for late Judaism this likeness was found in man’s dominion over creation (Sir 17:3), whereas Hellenistic Judaism, speculating under the influence of Greek philosophy, sought that likeness in a metaphysical gift, *aphtharsia* (Wis 2:23). But this notion of man as a direct copy of God was also current among the Greeks; Lucian (*Pro. imag.* 28) ascribes the statement to Plato, *eikona theou ton anthrōpon einai*; Diogenes of Sinope is supposed to have said *tous agathous andras theōn eikonas einai* (Diog. Laert. 6.2,51). But with Philo and the Hermetic literature we find another manifestation of the anthropological meaning: man is the indirect copy of God. For Philo he is the *eikōn* of the Logos, for Gn 1:27 says that God made man *kat’ eikona theou*—the *eikōn* being the Logos. In the Hermetic literature man is the copy of the cosmos. This idea probably influenced some of the later rabbis, who taught that man was

a copy of Adam. The third manifestation of this meaning is found in the Mandaean writings: there is an eschatological possibility for man to become the *eikōn* of God.

In the last part Eltester applies the results of his study to the four *NT* passages. Christ as the *eikōn theou* in 2 Cor 4:4 is the revealer of God in view of faith ("die Offenbarung und Repräsentation Gottes," p. 133). The roots of this expression are to be sought in the Hellenistic Jewish speculation about Sophia as the *eikōn* of God (Wis 7:26; see also Heb 1:3) and through this stream still more remotely in the Hellenistic ideas of *eikōn*. While the cosmological meaning is found only in the background of 2 Cor 4:4, it comes to the fore in Col 1:15. Here Christ is the *eikōn tou theou* in His creative role. Once again the *eikōn* notion is dependent on Alexandrian speculation about *sophia* and *anthrōpos*. In both of these passages the connection with the cosmological meaning of *eikōn* in Hellenism is undeniable. In 1 Cor 11:3-7 we find both Hellenistic and Jewish ideas of *eikōn* joined. In the Jewish stream we find the anthropological notion stressed, but the cosmological relation of Hellenism is present there just as much. In Col 3:10 the *eikōn* designates the redeemed existence of the Christian. It appears to be a Christian interpretation of the eschatological possibility of the Christian becoming an *eikōn* of God. Thus all these ideas are ultimately traceable to Hellenistic notions of *eikōn*.

This dissertation was written under the direction of R. Bultmann—a fact that should explain the overemphasis on the influence of Hellenism on the *NT* displayed in this study. There is no doubt that Eltester has constructed a very methodical and logically presented study of *eikōn* in the *NT* milieu. But I find it very difficult to convince myself that his explanation is true to life, *wie es eigentlich gewesen ist*. To study the usage of *eikōn* in writers such as Plato, Plutarch, Philo, Hermetic literature, Numenius of Apamea, the LXX, Plotinus, and the Mandaean-Gnostic writings obviously has value for the history of ideas. But what the pertinence of Plotinus' notion of *eikōn* is to that of the *NT* is slightly mystifying. The same must be said, a fortiori, of the resurrected ghost of Mandaean-Gnostic influence on the *NT*. Eltester tries to save his thesis by appealing to a methodological principle: if idea *A* in a chronologically late text can be shown to be the logical presupposition of idea *B* in an earlier text, we are justified in positing the chronological anteriority of idea *A* as well, provided that a genetic connection between *A* and *B* exists, no influence of *B* on *A* can be shown, and *B* is explained through *A* (pp. 101-2). A priori, this principle sounds good, but what proof is there that it corresponds to historical reality? Granted that the Judaism manifest in the Qumrân literature is at

times overlaid in its influence on the *NT* writings, it is nevertheless a salutary corrective to studies such as this one, emphasizing to an extreme the Hellenistic elements, an emphasis so characteristic of a bygone generation. One must remember that even the expressions of philosophers find their way at times into ordinary everyday language but do not always retain the nuance of their philosophical origin. Numerous are the Greek words of the *NT* that have a content heavily influenced or almost wholly derived from the *OT* or the Jewish world. While certain parts of Eltester's monograph can certainly be used with profit, we feel that the thesis as a whole is strained beyond the evidence. It does not live up to the tradition of monographs published in the *Beihefte zur ZNW*, so ably directed by the uncle of the author, Prof. Dr. Walther Eltester.

Woodstock College

JOSEPH A. FITZMYER, S.J.

ST. METHODIUS: THE SYMPOSIUM: A TREATISE ON CHASTITY. Translated and annotated by Herbert Musurillo, S.J. *Ancient Christian Writers* 27. Westminster, Md.: Newman; London: Longmans, Green, 1958. Pp. vi + 249. \$3.25.

Worthy of the internal value of the *Symposium* itself, as well as of the high standard of scholarship set by the *Ancient Christian Writers* series, is this translation of the *Treatise on Chastity* by St. Methodius of Olympus. It is the work of Herbert Musurillo, S.J., whose ability as a translator and whose competence in dealing with the patrological phase of early Christian literature are here once more ably demonstrated.

To this late-third-century churchman, Methodius, the details of whose life and environment remain shadowy, the notion of chastity had a signification much wider than what was covered by the virtue of continence. It embodied a complete theology—what we would dignify today with the term “a system.” Intent upon supplying an educational medium for a group of ascetically-minded women, Methodius describes chastity as a complete dedication of the person to Christ, as He is conceived in the existential setting of Catholic teaching. Thus this experiment with the form of a Platonic dialogue turns out to be a manual of Christian doctrine. In subject matter, it covers the Fall and the atonement, sin, the mysteries of marriage and childbirth, the Second Coming and the final reign of Christ, as well as the mystical ascent of the soul towards absorption in God.

What is exceptional about this treatise is the breadth of its author's vision of the Christian message and the tremendously vivid ascetical tradition that it embodies. Methodius uses his training in the Platonic tra-

dition to skilfully combine the secular culture of his age with the theological legacy of St. Paul. It is the virtue of the translator that he reflects this double tradition, turning his author's thought into smooth, easily running English, and giving the reader a feeling of immediacy despite the gap of sixteen centuries separating our civilizations.

In his introduction Musurillo makes a useful contribution to the control of the manuscript tradition. He bases his own translation on a text shortly to appear in the *Sources chrétiennes*. He enhances his version with excellent philological and historical notes. Nor does he hesitate to make emendations in readings as well as to offer justification for his own understanding of particular passages over against the work of his predecessors.

Of the many problems dealt with in the notes, those having to do with the millenarianism of Methodius are presently the most intriguing. Musurillo utilizes Fr. Dölger's remarks postulating a "theology of Asia Minor" as background for his author's eschatology. This subject has now been further explored by J. Daniélou in his *Théologie du judéo-christianisme* (Tournai, 1958) pp. 358-59. D. believes that Methodius was attempting to save the millenarist theology he inherited from Papias and Irenaeus by further spiritualizing it. He has even discovered a passage in the *Sibylline Oracles* (8, 145-49) which is almost identical with the thought of Methodius, further indicating how widespread was the peril in the development of the Church's true understanding of the revelation regarding the Last Things.

As exposed by this excellent translation of his theological thought, Methodius of Olympus ceases to be the shadowy figure of the patristic manuals; he stands before us as an eminent theologian and master of the spiritual life. Musurillo deserves fullest commendation for having provided us with this distinct contribution to theological scholarship as well as to the enrichment of our spiritual armory in English.

Rome, Italy

FRANCIS X. MURPHY, C.S.S.R.

AUGUSTINE, PHILOSOPHER OF FREEDOM: A STUDY IN COMPARATIVE PHILOSOPHY. By Mary T. Clark, R.S.C.J. New York: Desclée, 1958. Pp. 273. \$4.50.

The classic Augustinian distinction between *liberum arbitrium* and *libertas* forms the central motif of this serious and well-written volume. After examining Plato, Aristotle, and Plotinus (chaps. 1-3), the author turns to the *De libero arbitrio*, early dialogues, and *Confessions* (chaps. 4-6). Then the genesis of the Saint's theology of freedom is studied, and implications for his philosophy of freedom drawn (chaps. 7-8). A formal comparison

of Augustine and Plotinus concludes this central section (chap. 9). The remaining pages are devoted to the notion of freedom after Augustine, in Anselm, Aquinas, and twentieth-century philosophers, especially the existentialists, Maritain, and Blondel (chaps. 10–12). The conclusion synthesizes the contribution of Augustine and evokes its perennial worth (chap. 13). There is a valuable bibliography (somewhat incomplete for the last four years), an index of references to works of Augustine, and an index of proper names. Reading is facilitated by numerous citations given in both English and Latin.

Mother Clark claims no great originality for her positions, especially where these touch on Augustine's theology. She maintains that the primary interest of Augustine was in Christian liberty, the right use of free will, not in the power of free choice; that, nevertheless, the necessity of grace for fallen man to achieve true *libertas* in no way compromised the perseverance of *liberum arbitrium*; that Anselm, Aquinas, and Blondel faithfully prolong the Augustinian tradition.

For theologians the chapters of primary interest are 7 and 8, where the discussion of Christian liberty involves the celebrated questions on predestination, grace, and free will. Here the philosopher prudently allows herself to be guided by students of Augustine's theology of grace. The results are not uniformly happy. For all the enduring value of Portalié's monumental *DTC* article, it would appear to be too preoccupied with refuting Calvinist and Jansenist claims to Augustinian legitimacy to do full justice to history and the texts (an example might be Augustine's interpretation of 1 Tim 2:1–6). On the other hand, Guy de Broglie's interpretation of the embarrassing distinction between *auxilium quo* and *auxilium sine quo non*, which is also adopted by Mother Clark, is at least a plausible effort at faithful exegesis. In any case, these are not key points in a study which is primarily philosophical. The author has had the benefit of the courses and personal counsel of Paul Henry; this contributes much to her excellent handling of Augustine and Plotinus.

Particularly in view of its being the first full treatment of the subject in English, the volume has value both for its careful contrasting of Augustine and Plotinus and for its relatively brief but provocative confrontation of the Saint's philosophy of liberty with the views of modern philosophers. Add the final note that the scholarship here exhibited is rendered more attractive by being so manifestly, like that of its great subject, a labor of love.



HISTOIRE D'UNE ENTREPRISE APOLOGÉTIQUE AU V<sup>e</sup> SIÈCLE. By Pierre Canivet, S.J. Paris: Bloud et Gay, 1958. Pp. xxiv + 384.

Theodoret, Bishop of Cyrus (423–ca. 458), is remembered by the Church historian as a theologian sympathetic to Nestorius whose recantation at the Council of Chalcedon on Oct. 26, 451, brought reinstatement in his bishopric (H. M. Diepen, *Les trois chapitres au concile de Chalcedoine* [Oosterhout, 1953] 75–90), yet whose writings prior to Chalcedon fell under censure in 553 at the Second Council of Constantinople (E. Amann, "Trois-Chapitres, Affaire des," *DTC* 15 [1950] 1868–1924). Berthold Altaner (*Patrologie*, 5th ed. [1958] p. 296) places Theodoret among "den fruchtbarsten Schriftstellern" of the Greek Church, a judgment borne out by an examination of the man's works (*PG* 80–84). Recent years have seen renewed interest in his writings. Yvan Azéma has translated Theodoret's *De providentia* (Paris, 1954) and has edited the first fifty-two of his extant letters (*Sources chrétiennes* 40; Paris, 1955). Under the name of *Thérapeutique des maladies héliéniques*, a new edition of Theodoret's *Graecarum affectionum curatio* has been prepared by Pierre Canivet, S.J. (2 vols.; *Sources chrétiennes* 57; Paris, 1958).

It is to this new edition of the *Curatio*, "supposée connue du lecteur" (p. vi), that Père Canivet joins his *Histoire d'une entreprise apologétique* as a companion volume. Here, in the *Histoire*, he makes clear that Theodoret's treatise, though markedly different from the threefold apology of Clement of Alexandria and from Cyril of Alexandria's *Contra Julianum*, nonetheless belongs to the tradition of Christian apologies (pp. 110–25). The *Curatio* is dated during Theodoret's monastic life at Nicerte, between 419–23 A.D., while its reference to the persecution of the Persian monarch Bahram V is noted (pp. 17–21). Making good use of George Haddad, *Aspects of Social Life in Antioch in the Hellenistic-Roman Period* (Chicago, 1949), as well as primary material, the author depicts at length the religious and social Antioch which Theodoret knew, wherein a dominant Christianity was still hedged round by many pagan survivals (pp. 3–41). While the Judeo-Christian controversy of the fifth century is sufficiently delineated (pp. 42–79), greater emphasis is given the pagan-Christian conflict and the doctrinal positions held by the rival ways of life (pp. 80–110).

The second part of this study (pp. 129–253) shows the importance citations from pagan writers assume in Theodoret's polemic and calls attention to whatever is erroneous or tendentious in his use thereof. The heart of this section (pp. 170–253, plus the appended *Tableaux de concordances*) is a minute examination of the 360 quotations which provide the framework

of the apology. Anyone who has had to rely upon Schulze's text of the *Curatio* (PG 83, 783-1152) will recognize the significance of this new research, which thus supplies the basis for Canivet's concluding section, "La culture profane de Theodoret" (pp. 257-332). Herein, the extent of Theodoret's debt to Eusebius' *Praeparatio evangelica* and to Aetios' *Placita* is demonstrated, while his possible, or even probable, dependence upon Clement of Alexandria, Plutarch, and a florilegium formed from Plato is suggested. Certain judgments are proposed in evaluation of the true extent of Theodoret's historical, scientific, and philosophical information (pp. 291-315), and a description is offered of how he went about gathering his citations, namely, assembling them beforehand (in a collection known as a *hypomnēma*) without reference to any specific section of his projected apology. Later, when the treatise was composed, Theodoret seems not to have checked his citations against the context whence they had been taken originally.

This reviewer fully concedes the value of Canivet's study for the specialist in Christian antiquity. But he feels it could have been made more meaningful to the nonspecialist had it not presupposed an acquaintance with the text of the *Curatio*. Place could certainly have been found for presenting in ordered fashion not only the themes of *Curatio* 3, on spirits, and *Curatio* 8, the defense of the cult of martyrs (pp. 101-9), but for the other ten sections of the apology as well. Had this been attempted, the general reader could have derived from this book alone an adequate understanding of Theodoret's treatise. Now, unfortunately, he must have constantly at hand either one of the older editions of the *Curatio* (Migne, Raeder, Festa) or Canivet's text in *Sources chrétiennes* 57.

*Immaculate Conception Seminary,  
Darlington, N.J.*

HENRY G. J. BECK

MAGNI AURELI CASSIODORI EXPOSITIO PSALMORUM. Edited by M. Adriaen. 2 vols. *Corpus christianorum, ser. lat.* 97-98. Turnhout: Brepols, 1958. Pp. xx + 1361.

With the possible exception of St. Augustine, Cassiodorus is the only Latin Father who wrote a complete commentary on the entire Psalter. This vast work, known as the *Expositio psalmorum*, was completed about 538 and is the last great literary gift of antiquity to the Middle Ages. Its influence was considerable indeed, touching on all spheres of medieval life, especially the exegesis of the Psalms and the interpretation of liturgical texts.

The new edition of this celebrated commentary which M. Adriaen has

made will certainly retire both the *editio princeps* of 1491 and the edition of J. Garetius of 1679, reprinted by Migne (*PL* 70) in 1865, from the field of scholarship. This new edition is based on a comparison of seven of the oldest and best members of the manuscript tradition. It correlates the new text with that of Garetius, compares Cassiodorus' text of the Psalms with the various current Latin versions, and supplies reference to the sources which Cassiodorus used in his work. The edition is further enriched with useful indices, a list of the medieval writers who cited the *Expositio*, and a list of the principal manuscripts of the work.

A.'s critical edition is indeed an advance over the older editions, but it is not definitive, since the work involved in the preparation of the final edition of the *Expositio* exceeds the present state of Cassiodorian scholarship. The learned editor is aware of all this. The principal deficiencies of A.'s method are that it does not rest on a critical examination of the entire manuscript tradition and of all the external citations, and does not make full use of the more recent Cassiodorian studies, especially the philological research. A fuller analysis of the underlying sources would have made the work more valuable. Commendable in this scholarly achievement are the author's honesty and courage, his humility, and his awareness of delicate problems that still await solution.

Woodstock College

ROBERT E. McNALLY, S.J.

PROBLEMAS DE ACTUALIDAD SOBRE LA SUCESIÓN APOSTÓLICA Y OTROS ESTUDIOS. XVI Semana Española de Teología. Madrid: Instituto Francisco Suarez, 1957. Pp. xviii + 584.

This monumental work on the apostolic succession of the hierarchy is a composite of nine essays originally given as lectures under the auspices of the Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas. Three shorter pieces on "other topics" fill out the volume.

The introductory essay by Antonio Javierre describes the examination of conscience going on in Protestant circles over the need and function of an ecclesiastical hierarchy. He sees the Protestant denial of a historic episcopacy, culminating in the Roman Pontiff, as part of the larger theory which places man in direct communication with God. Human mediation in this hypothesis may be useful but is not essential and, by Reformation standards, finds no guarantee in Scripture.

Bernardino Marina's short chapter gives a fine summary of the probative value of apostolicity as a note of the Church. Salaverri's survey of the

apostolic succession in Scripture and tradition also dips into a few critics like Barth and Bultmann, but without analyzing their thought.

To the question, whether it is possible to have a true apostolic succession independent of the primacy founded on Peter, Iturrioz answers in the negative and adds a corollary thesis on the Church's necessity for salvation. "Outside the Church," he says, "there is no salvation, no grace, and no life." Pertaining to the Church invisibly, or *in voto*, "implies an implicit recognition of this Church and therefore indirectly submission to the Church's head, who is the Roman Pontiff."

Manuel Miralles quotes at length from his fellow Dominican, Juan de Torquemada, to sustain the proposition that the cardinalate is *de jure divino*. "By divine institution, after the papacy the status of cardinals belongs to the hierarchy of the Church." And again, "as the episcopacy succeeds the apostles in their office of bishops, so the college of cardinals succeeds the apostles in their function of assisting Peter before they were scattered throughout the world." A preliminary chapter on the bishops as successors of the apostles explains how the episcopal dignity is immediately from God as an order, but its jurisdiction derives from the Holy See. Cullmann's theory of "independent churches" in apostolic times is really a Protestant rationalization after scuttling the papacy.

The complicated question of orders and jurisdiction follows the lines of Journet's *Eglise du Verbe incarné*, with added clarification of one point that deserves emphasis. Orta and Alonso stress the fact that ecclesiastical jurisdiction is something more than external authority. It is rooted, they explain, in the character of orders, and ultimately derived from the apostles, whose universal jurisdiction flowed from their priesthood. This points up the basic error of sectarian theology, which conceives religious authority as a human creation, with no bearing on sacramental ordination or historical dependence on the apostles and finally on Christ Himself.

Frs. Gerald Kelly and John Connery are quoted or paraphrased several times in a lengthy chapter (among the *otros estudios*) on the morality of transplanting human organs. But after reviewing the current writing on the subject, José Saiz concludes on a critical note. He admits that those who favor transplantation, whether of a unique organ or one of a pair of organs, offer good theoretical arguments. "Personally I am not convinced by the evidence, however. I believe that man's physical being is uniquely ordained to God, and that the mutilation required for transplanting is an action contrary to the immanent teleology of the excised organ. Consequently it is illicit" (p. 532).

The final chapter on "Revelations of God" is very valuable. Baldomero

Duque, rector of the seminary at Avila, analyzes the four levels of our knowledge of God—natural, revealed, mystical, and beatific—as graded manifestations of divine love. He believes that natural mysticism is quite possible, as a more intense and personalized knowledge of the Absolute. Faith in revealed mysteries is the great test of the Christian religion. Mystical experiences, no matter how elevated or sustained, differ from the insight of faith only in degree. In speaking of the beatific vision, while raising it to the highest conceivable union of the soul with the Trinity, care should be had about describing it as a quasi-information of the soul by God.

*Problemas* is recommended as a good example of contemporary Spanish scholarship which offers valuable insights in conservative theological speculation. Detailed references to a wide range of literature make the volume an excellent source work on the apostolic succession. Even a summary index would have been helpful.

*West Baden College*

JOHN A. HARDON, S.J.

FAITH AND UNDERSTANDING IN AMERICA. By Gustave Weigel, S.J. New York: Macmillan, 1959. Pp. 170. \$3.75.

Essays written with no intention to publish them as a volume do not always make the best material for a book. This has often been remarked, and it is again true in this case. Taken singly, the essays are all interesting and deserve to be studied. As a book, they form a somewhat disconnected sequence. Authorship is not a univocal concept: the author is not the author of the book in the sense in which he is the author of its contents.

Two general topics divide the subject matter of this collection. Chapters 1 to 5 cover various aspects of Catholicism in relation to modern, especially American, society; chapters 6 to 9 deal with the relationship of Catholicism to modern, especially American, Protestantism. Both themes have been familiar to Fr. Weigel for a long time. He has been at the forefront of the drive for increasing communications between Catholic and non-Catholic intellectuals. He is also one of our few American theologians who are fully conversant with Protestant theology and concerns and who have carefully followed the development of the ecumenical movement. The recurrent controversy on Catholic intellectuals adds an edge to W.'s vocation as an interpreter of Catholicism to Americans and of America to Catholics. Following Pope John XXIII's call for an intensive study of ecumenism and his announcement of a council that will consider the question, our growing concern with Christian unity renders W.'s survey of Protestantism particularly topical.

I would especially recommend chapter 5: "Introduction to American

Catholicism." It may be an impertinent remark to say that an introduction is hardly introductory unless it is placed at the beginning of a book; yet I would have liked to read it as chapter 1. I find that it provides a fair assessment of some dominant features of American Catholicism and that it contains a timely warning not to mistake mere quantity for quality. I wonder, however, if W. is not a little overoptimistic as regards the spiritual value of American Catholicism. From the fact that American society is religiously pluralistic, it does not really follow that "the American Catholic has explicitly chosen to be a Catholic" (p. 73). Sociological pressure in favor of the Church does not exist on a national scale, and Catholics are indeed free to leave the Church and remain acceptable as Americans. Yet sociological pressure can also be inbred inside of the separate strains that contribute to the American people, so that not only an Italian in Italy, but also an Irishman in Boston, has Catholicism "thrust upon him by a culture" (p. 73). Pressure is none the less efficient for being the result of a minority culture.

"Protestant Theological Positions Today" (chap. 7) and "Protestantism as a Catholic Concern" (chap. 8) deserve to be carefully read. They throw light on some aspects of modern Protestant thought. Yet readers should bear in mind that these are peripheral and that the core of Protestant thought remains more orthodox and traditional than the extreme examples of liberalism that are surveyed in most of these pages. On one point I would like to register dissent. The expression "Anglo-Catholic" should not be used to designate such a Low-Church Anglican position as that of Dr. Norman Pittenger (p. 127). The Anglo-Catholic tradition in its great representatives has a far more substantial content.

*New York, N.Y.*

GEORGE H. TAVARD, A.A.

**THE PARISH: FROM THEOLOGY TO PRACTICE.** Edited by Hugo Rahner, S.J. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. vi + 142. \$2.75.

All who love the Church and are actively interested in her life among men are indebted to Hugo Rahner, S.J., for editing this symposium. Professors of the theological faculty of the celebrated Canisianum in Innsbruck and other qualified scholars give us the valued fruits of their research and zeal in a short but compact volume.

Although the parish in the United States is not the immediate object of the authors' analysis and experience, their conclusions will be for the American clergy and laity a source of enlightenment and inspiration. Our practical, efficient approach to the parish and to parish life needs this scientific theological examination of the history, nature, and finality of the parish. The absence of solid theological background can result in blindness

and inefficiency even in the apparently successful administration of our numerous and far-flung parishes. This volume will point up many aspects of parish life we may be tempted to neglect.

These essays are not always easy reading. Patient reflection on the conclusions of the learned authors is rewarding. It is suggested that after all the studies have been examined, the reader return to the first treatise, "Pope Pius XII and the Parish." Otherwise he may be confused by the many opinions expressed, at times in rather involved language and unusual terminology. Pius XII emphasized that everywhere and at all times the firm foundation of the life power of the Church remains the direct and orderly care given to souls by the zealous priest engaged in parish work. The pastor of souls will be brought back to essentials when he reads Pius underlining the fact that the center of the parish community is "not even the school" but the parish church and in it the tabernacle, the confessional, and the pulpit. The living members of the parish are primarily recognizable by their presence at the Lord's table in Holy Communion.

Reference is made (p. 70) to the view of St. Thomas that the activities of the parish apostolate prepare the Christian community for the celebration of the Eucharist. This is true even for the highly complex pastoral work of a large city parish today. "It is obviously not meant in the sense in which youth work, for example, is sometimes viewed, as if the priest must play football and softball with the kids to get them to come to a general communion. But it does mean that all instructions and preaching, all care for children and youth, all charitable work, all specialized pastoral work, all efforts toward Catholic education and culture, all public communications efforts can fulfill this preparatory function and have this preparatory character only if they dedicate themselves to leading the faithful to that outlook on life; to the attitude of faith, hope and charity, and to that sentiment of gratitude to the revealing and redeeming God which, like a mighty stream, bursts forth from all hearts in the common celebration of the Sunday Eucharist, and brings to God 'all honor and glory.' "

When understood and assimilated by priest and seminarian, the dignity, importance, and excellence of essential priestly service in the parish will be once again effectively appreciated.

*Old Saint Peter's, New York*

JOHN S. MIDDLETON

**THE PARADISE TREE: ON LIVING THE SYMBOLS OF THE CHURCH.** By Gerald Vann, O.P. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1959. Pp. 320. \$4.00.

The author has set himself the ambitious task of following the "pattern" of myth, symbol, and *mysterion* through the life of, and in, Christ, through

the commandments of the *OT*, and through the seven sacraments. This takes up the first third of the book, while the rest is a loosely strung and largely devotional commentary on the Mass in five chapters. Fr. Vann tries to show that myth, fairy tale, and the ancient mysteries have not only the true "pattern" of the historical redemption but are the unconscious yearning to be fulfilled in Jesus Christ and the Church. In all the diligently quoted sources he omits the father of them all, Dom Odo Casel, who is not even mentioned, while Campbell, Jung, and Eliade share his pages with Rahner and Jungmann. Unfortunately, the promised search for the "pattern" is not carried through, and in the second part the only reminder of the plan is the frequent use of the term "pattern," while the headings of the chapters are on two occasions not indicative of their contents (cf. pp. 129 and 164). The commentary on the Mass is often anything but that (e.g., p. 202, where the author admits that he writes on poverty, chastity, and obedience when his purpose is the explanation of the five prayers after *Unde et memores*).

A great many new approaches to moral and dogmatic problems, quite original and with a great deal of insight, are buried in a mass of hastily edited conferences. The symbolism of the baptismal water as the "salty sea" collapses by the mere fact that baptismal water is not salted (p. 44), nor is the "teacher of righteousness" (p. 77) a correct translation of Melchizedek (King of Justice). The *arcosolia* in the catacombs are definitely not suitable for the celebration of Mass and never were (p. 146). Nor is the best explanation why the water is blessed before being mixed at the Offertory, that it is an "imperfect, even leprous substance" (Jung). Would it not be better to look for another, less Manichean, explanation? While the quotations from Jungmann are numerous, V. seems unacquainted with the great scholar's reform suggestions.

V. bypasses the Creed completely, subordinates the Introit to the apologia at the beginning of the Mass (p. 146), has the *Orate fratres* on the same level of importance as the *Gratias agamus* (p. 136), acidly speaks of "wrong liturgical-reform thinking" (p. 141) where all the scholars hold the opposite view, and shows in many ways that he is a great original thinker in certain fields but is not too familiar with current liturgical reforms and the spade-work that preceded and accompanies them. On p. 66 he accepts the *Fehlentwicklung* of the Commingling as a true "symbol" of the resurrection. On p. 168 he seems unaware that the lessons for the feasts of St. Joseph were revised. To call the showing of the Host a "Manifestation" of God may please Jung but seems to be a strange piece of theology: it plays havoc with the term "manifestation" and manages to disregard or at least to



strip the history of the Elevations of all its complexity (p. 191). The reader would like to see the moral asides in book form and a consistent treatment of the avowed thesis of the book.

*St. Joseph's Church, Wurtsboro, N.Y.*

H. A. REINHOLD

THE CISTERCIAN HERITAGE. By Louis Bouyer. Translated by Elizabeth A. Livingstone. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xvi + 207. \$4.95.

Père Bouyer's *La spiritualité de Cîteaux* (first ed.; Paris: Flammarion, 1955—not available to this reviewer) is here brought to English-speaking readers. The translator acknowledges her debt to the distinguished Oratorian author for his supplying her with additional material originally collected for a new edition of the French version. She also frequently acknowledges her indebtedness to Geoffrey Webb and Adrian Walker for their extensive English translations, published and unpublished, from the works of these early Cistercians. References to modern English translations of medieval works have been substituted for French ones throughout the volume. Thus the work is a careful, scholarly, re-presentation in English of the French edition. It should find an interested public, not only for the intrinsic worth of its ideas, but also because "the Cistercian order is the only major religious order which can be deemed the product of an Anglo-Saxon mind" (p. v).

In addition to the translator's preface and the author's introduction, eight chapters comprise the work: an essay on the origins of Cistercian spirituality, two chapters on St. Bernard, two on William of St. Thierry, and one each on Aelred of Rievaulx and Isaac of Stella, half a chapter on Guerric of Igny, and half a chapter of summing up.

The study is largely based on B.'s examination and reading of the literary remains of these early Cistercians. His work, particularly as it concerns William, Aelred, Isaac, and Guerric, is partly summary and partly evaluation. With St. Bernard, of course, he has much in the way of previously published study to go on, although, as he notes, the definitive study of St. Bernard is yet to be made (p. 14). The purpose of the work, as it concerns Aelred, etc., is "that this rapid journey of discovery should at least persuade many students to apply themselves to these practically unknown treasures of medieval spirituality. Their rediscovery will show us a spiritual Middle Ages which we have barely suspected, and once more brings to our own questions, not ready-made answers, but what is for us perhaps the most inspiring of the experiments undertaken by Christianity when it was in the full fervour of renewal" (p. 14).

These early Cistercian writers, outstanding for their originality and productivity (p. xi), have a special contemporary pertinence, the author feels. There is a striking parallel, B. says, between the problems of Cîteaux and our own times. Is this a hackneyed approach on the author's part? Seemingly not. One cannot but agree with him when he points out that the "Incarnational Christianity" of today, a "spirituality of impassioned adherence to the world," is not so far removed from the notions of Christian chivalry developed at the time of St. Bernard—expression "of a prodigious effort to 'Christianize' what at that time stood for the world. On the other hand, the unexpected reaction which drove so many Christian knights, such as Bernard or Aelred, to break with this ideal and to leave the world in search of an apparently unworldly solitude—does this still not find a parallel in our own day?" (p. xiii).

The author also mentions the fear that some have that institutional monasticism, as it has developed, is again today (if it has not always been) by no means the smallest obstacle to what monasticism ought to be (p. xv).

Insight shown so early in the book allows one to proceed with confidence to the body of the matter, where, as the evidence of B.'s keen perception accumulates, one's hopes are not disappointed. For instance, the study of Bernard's psychological development (chap. 2) in the light of current theories about psychological development in general and Bernard's in particular shows one that B.'s claim to be providing merely an introduction to these men is altogether too modest.

*West Baden College*

EARL A. WEIS, S.J.

TRACTATUS DE CONSCIENTIA MORALI, PARS ALTERA: THEORIA DE CONSCIENTIA MORALI REFLEXA. By Lucius Rodrigo, S.J. *Praelectiones theologico-morales Comillenses*, ser. 1, tom. 4. Santander: Sal Terrae, 1956. Pp. xxvii + 900.

Having expounded in the first volume of this treatise all the general theory of conscience (cf. THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 16 [1955] 637-39), Fr. Rodrigo devotes the second exclusively to the special question of a system or method for arriving at a practical judgment of licit conduct in cases of speculatively insoluble doubt. It was evident in advance that R. would espouse the system of probabilism. But the present work is much more than another conventional apology for that system. It might almost be called an encyclopedia of probabilism. It is encyclopedic in the completeness with which it records all the numerous genera and species of opinion

which have existed in the matter, in the thoroughness with which it reports and evaluates the theoretic bases of the other systems and their objections to probabilism, and in the detail with which it lists and examines questions of concrete application. It is encyclopedic, too, in the sense that it will serve less as a book to be read through than as a reference work, to be consulted with a view to particular problems of history, theory, or application. The index is suitable to such usage.

If one may be permitted some liberty with the author's own divisions, the structure of the book might be described as tripartite: concepts (chap. 1), theories (chaps. 2-5), and applications (chaps. 6-8). But in any particular part there is a great deal both of the speculative and of the practical. Thus, in expounding the notions of opinion and probability, R. offers some principles for the evaluation of extrinsic probability (nn. 302 ff.). Among other things, he does a service in emphasizing that it is not constituted by a mere catalogue of names, even good ones, who are found to subscribe a certain opinion; but there may be room for debate on the precise extent of personal elaboration or contribution necessary before an author can be counted with a view to that effect. It is also well observed (though, again, the point is not new) that there is no such thing as an extrinsically probable opinion which has no intrinsic probability. And, in the course of establishing the notion and thesis of probabilism, it is stressed—as it frequently must be stressed—that only a solidly and certainly probable opinion in favor of liberty, one which creates a grave doubt of obligation, obviates the temerity otherwise present in an act which may be objectively contrary to law. The probabilist cannot properly be sympathetic toward opinions to which he merely “would not dare to deny all probability”—or other expressions of the sort.

It is, in fact, on the point of grave uncertainty—the uncertainty of the obligation directly in question and the uncertainty of the obligation derived from the principles of prudence or possession—that R. aptly orientates his whole thesis. The probability of the opinion for liberty is relevant only to the extent that it renders an obligation uncertain. Nor does R. dwell very extensively on the basic proposition that a dubious law does not bind. There is no serious contention that it does bind by any force of its own. In R.'s approach, therefore, the justification of probabilism consists mainly in demonstrating that the subsidiary principles of the more rigorous systems, the principles of prudence and of possession, are themselves seriously doubtful in their application to the carefully delineated area of conduct for which probabilism is invoked. In this way, too, he is able to show that the practical conclusion of liceity derived from probabilism can be proxi-

mately certain, as required, though the system itself be theoretically only probable (nn. 1294 ff., 1370), and to claim that even the nonprobabilist should in all logic accept probabilism in practice (nn. 1315, 2257)—unless he can believe his own system to be certain beyond all serious doubt.

For R., therefore, modern probabilism might rather be termed “moralis incertitudinismus” (n. 1730). But in this connection may it not be disputed whether a unique probability is indeed equivalent, as R. frequently affirms, to moral certitude (cf. nn. 244–47, 1224–25, etc.)? Thus, in a case of a mixed doubt, negative on the side of liberty, positive on the side of obligation, R. will maintain that the obligation, as the sole probable position, is morally certain (e.g., nn. 1668, 1684). It will bind, says R., not because it is probable, but because it is *solely* probable; because the probability of one side alone entails the improbability of the other (n. 1667). Yet in the light of his own approach to the thesis it should make little difference whether an obligation is uncertain because there are arguments against it, or because the motives for affirming it are insufficient to engender certitude. Indeed, at one point R. seems to acknowledge this (n. 247). The question might not have much practical moment generally, but when the principle is applied sometimes to convert directly into moral certitude various traditional presumptions, more necessary as norms of judicial action than serviceable as sources of knowledge (cf. nn. 1675 ff.), it becomes important whether the foundation is really adequate to support these conclusions.

The historical section is thorough and excellent. Neither St. Thomas nor St. Alphonsus is represented as a probabilist. Quite the contrary in both cases. R. makes much, and rightly, of the vast difference between modern probabilism and the older systems of Medina, Suárez, Vásquez, etc., which are so loosely grouped together under the same name without really having been in agreement either among themselves or, still less, with what we call “probabilism” today. It may be largely academic now that for Medina and Suárez freedom to follow the less probable proposition meant a proposition less probable to oneself and supposed that it was more probable in the view of others, whereas in cases of equal or negative doubt the matter was resolved by appeal not to the principle of *lex dubia*, but to that of the more secure (Medina) or of possession (Suárez). At least the germ of the modern system was present in their premises. But it follows that when it comes to lining up authorities on the applicability of probabilism to some particular problem, e.g., the doubtful cessation or doubtful fulfilment of an obligation, one cannot properly cite Suárez, for instance, on either

side, for Suárez simply never tried to define the modes and limits of probabilism in the present sense of the word (cf. n. 1599).

While R., happily, does not claim canon 15 of the Code of Canon Law ("Leges in dubio iuris non urgent . . .") as a proof or confirmation of the moral system of probabilism, it is unfortunate, I believe, that he should designate the principle of the canon by the title "probabilismus juridicus." Apart from the question of the term's acceptability to nonprobabilists, there are so many differences between the idea of the canon and the idea of moral probabilism that the word can scarcely serve as a genus. R. does indeed point out these differences himself. The most basic one, which might well be decisive, is that moral probabilism is a method of forming the conscience, which is not the purpose of the canon at all.

In the course of the last three chapters R. considers, with characteristic originality and acumen, the traditional problems of the application of probabilism: in negative doubts and doubts of fact (to both of which, incidentally, he *does* apply the system), in questions of the validity of an obligation or of its satisfaction, in probable violations of justice or other virtues, in dangers of formal sin, and so on, with each problem broken down into the minutest variations in which it may occur. Indeed, one can easily get lost at times in the multiplicity of subdivisions and shades of distinction, particularly since long abstract analyses are frequently unrelieved by a single illustration.

It is evident that R. has devoted an extraordinary amount of thought and labor to the composition of this book. The result is an important contribution to the science of moral theology, an orderly, exhaustive, competent, and convincing treatment of a very fundamental matter. And lest anyone fear or charge that probabilism is even ascetically inferior to the more rigid systems of morality, the author observes (n. 1482) that to extend the area of freedom is not to diminish but precisely to enlarge subjectively the opportunities of Christian perfection. The point is worthy of emphasis in our day.

*Woodstock College*

JOHN J. REED, S.J.

CANON LAW DIGEST 4. By T. Lincoln Bouscaren, S.J., and James I. O'Connor, S.J. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1958. Pp. xi + 529. \$7.50.

Further words of praise for a series so widely used and thoroughly appreciated as is the *Canon Law Digest* are difficult to find and quite possibly superfluous. Suffice it to say that the present volume continues to maintain the high standard set in the previous volumes and adds to their usefulness

by including cumulative indices for all four volumes, both general and chronological.

The present volume contains summaries of several interesting matrimonial cases involving impotence, disparity of cult, insincere *cautiones*, schizophrenia, hypothetical and "implicit" exclusion of indissolubility, *vis et metus*, grave fear as cause of simulated consent, proxy marriages, nonrevocation of conditional consent, and assistance at marriages, including the problem of the delegation of a Latin Rite pastor to assist at the marriage of an Oriental. It also contains the rule on affinity contracted in infidelity, the elimination of the qualifying clause in can. 2319, § 1, 1°, and two cases in which the *privilegium fidei* was applied to dissolve nonsacramental marriages contracted with a dispensation from disparity of cult. In addition, it contains a very useful list of courts of appeal for cases heard in first instance in metropolitan tribunals, as well as cases on wrongful rejection of the bill of complaint, the way to handle new grounds of nullity on appeal, the permitting of appellant's parents to substitute for him in the event of his death, and the capacity of a plaintiff to attack the marriage in spite of an agreement to prevent conception or destroy the fetus.

With regard to clergy and religious, the volume contains documents on chaplains, whether of ships or of emigrants, the Apostolate of the Sea, vocations to the secular clergy, the Pontifical Work for Vocations, the thorough examination of candidates for orders, readmission to the seminary of a student once dismissed, the priest workers, and the Military Vicariate in the United States. There are also documents on religious obligated to military service and religious as military chaplains. Further documents give principles and statutes for those called to states of perfection, the vocation of teaching in lay institutes of men, the institute "Regina Mundi," the government of religious women, the external work of monastic nuns, the cloister of nuns, and the adaptation of minor papal cloister.

Liturgical documents in the volume include simplification of the rubrics and answers to questions thereon, the restored liturgical order of Holy Week, the use of English in conferring certain sacraments, use of popular hymns in the vernacular at Mass, custody of the Blessed Sacrament, so-called "Community Masses," and the subjection of all liturgical developments to the vigilance of the bishops.

The new rules with regard to fasting are also contained in this volume, as well as the new limits on alienation, and many other documents of interest.

While this partial description of the contents of the volume does not

do it justice, it should indicate to those not yet familiar with the series its great worth.

*St. Joseph's Seminary,  
Grand Rapids, Mich.*

THOMAS O. MARTIN

WHAT HAPPENED TO RELIGIOUS EDUCATION? THE DECLINE OF RELIGIOUS TEACHING IN THE PUBLIC ELEMENTARY SCHOOL 1776-1861. By William Kailer Dunn. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1958. Pp. xv + 346.

This excellent study is not just another historical survey of the change in the character of the American public school from colonial days to our own. Its merit derives not only from considerable original research but more from the clearly documented evidence refuting false explanations of this change. Presented as a condensation and a partial reworking of a doctrinal thesis originally written at Johns Hopkins University, it is scholarly but not pedantic or tedious. The present title is more attractive but less exact than the original thesis: *The Decline of the Teaching of Religion in the American Public Elementary School in the States Originally the Thirteen Colonies, 1776-1861*. The problem proposed is the concept of religious instruction in public education as confronted with the dilemma proposed by the "seeming conflict" of two traditions, namely, the legal tradition of separation of Church and state and the social tradition that somehow the school must inculcate "the religious elements traditionally underlying our morality and our institutions." The dilemma has not been resolved by the "nonsectarian" solution developed in the second quarter of the last century. The secularistic explanation of the exclusion of religion is historically untenable, as presented in the McCollum case ("jealous watchfulness against fusion of secular and religious activities by government. . . especially through its education agencies") or by secular-minded educators ("the educational counterpart of the political divorce of church and state was the exclusion of religion from the public school curriculum"). Neither the Church-State prohibition of the First Amendment nor the secular mentality caused the decline of doctrinal religion. Increasing emphasis on material and secular values and the transfer of control from religious groups to the state had some influence. Centralized state control shaped its direction, for the author thinks it probable that under local control there would have been less decline of religious influence. But the decisive factor was the idea that the teaching of "sectarian" doctrines violated the rights of conscience and the free exercise of religion as embodied in the second section of the First Amendment—not the idea that the state had no duty

to inculcate religion in education. The development of the conflict of the two traditions is presented in detail, and the ultimate acceptance of the "nonsectarian" solution by most Protestants, even those who preferred parochial schools and doctrinal instruction, is understood in the light of the Protestant character of such nonsectarian religious influence and its conformity with their biblical rule of faith and private interpretation, whereas the Catholic solution must be parochial schools to safeguard the faith of Catholic children.

Fr. Dunn is always calm and fair in his presentation of the evidence and his judgments. There emerge clearly, however, the prevalence and bitterness of the liberal, unorthodox mentality, its antagonism toward church and private schools (as in Horace Mann), the anti-Catholic prejudice more virulent than today. The three viewpoints appear: the secular just developing, the nonsectarian, and the doctrinal. We see, too, that strange phenomenon of American educational history—which still amazes the intelligent European when confronted with American educational policy and the idea of religious liberty—the inability to accept a pluralistic solution that recognizes the rights of all. When Horace Mann complained that a man suffered a "double wrong" when obliged by law to support a school which taught a religion that by divine law he could not accept and hence he must send his child to another school and pay double, it apparently never occurred to him that the man who could not by divine law accept Mann's nonsectarian religion enforced by human law suffered the same injustice. An adequate solution to the problem presented in this work will only be found when justice prevails.

*St. Joseph's Rectory, Tiffin, Ohio*

RICHARD J. GABEL

## SHORTER NOTICES

**BIBLIOGRAPHIE BIBLIQUE.** By Les Facultés de Théologie et de Philosophie de la Compagnie de Jésus. Montreal: Editions de l'Immaculée-Conception, 1958. Pp. xix + 398. \$3.50.

A narrowly limited but very useful bibliography of Catholic biblical writings from 1920-57 in French, English, and Latin, with four main sections: Introduction à la Bible; L'Ancien Testament; Le Nouveau Testament; Les thèmes bibliques. Intended for all who study the Bible from an exegetical, theological, ascetical, or pastoral standpoint, the bibliography offers more than 9000 references, grouped under 1100 headings and subheadings; it is offset-printed on pages of various colors to facilitate reference. While far from exhaustive, since it is limited to selected



books and to twenty-eight Catholic periodicals in the three languages mentioned, its usefulness should not be lightly dismissed. Instructors in college theology will undoubtedly derive much profit from it. Though it is always easy to say what should have been included, one cannot help but wonder what reason there might have been (if any, other than the limitation of bulk) in excluding the writings of our German, Spanish, and Italian colleagues. It should be noted, however, that the titles listed are not *all* representative of the best of Catholic scholarship in the biblical field. A good number of the contributions were written under the cloud of reaction against Modernism. But even they will have their value from the standpoint of historical exegesis.

*Woodstock College*

*Joseph A. Fitzmyer, S.J.*

ISRAEL ET LES NATIONS. By R. Martin-Achard. *Cahiers théologiques* 42. Neuchâtel: Delachaux & Niestlé, 1959. Pp. 77. 4.50 fr.s. This excellent monograph raises the following question: Did Israel's mission to the pagan nations consist in converting them to the faith of Israel by missionary activity in the strict sense? The answer is in the negative. Israel's task was not to engage in active evangelization but, by her very existence as the people of God, to act as a mediator between Yahweh and the nations. The conversion of the nations, through God's grace, pertains to the last days, the eschatological era of the Church when missionary evangelization would begin with the Good News that the divine plan had now been accomplished. In other words, Israel lived at a moment in the history of salvation, and her responsibility was proportioned to this period of preparation. Missionary activity, as we understand the word, belongs to the last chapter of sacred history. Considerable attention is devoted to Second Isaiah's missionary perspective, followed by shorter studies of six *OT* passages, all of them emphasizing Israel's responsibility as a witness, before the nations, to the grandeur and mercy of God. Finally, a study of Is 2:2-4 summarizes the thought of the *OT* on the missionary role of the chosen people, with a forward glance to the ingathering of the nations to the City of God. A selective bibliography, including Catholic works, directs the reader to all the pertinent literature on this fascinating problem of Israel's place in the divine plan of salvation for all men.

*Weston College*

*Frederick L. Moriarty, S.J.*

DAS GEBET DES HERRN AUS DER VERKÜNDIGUNG JESU ERLÄUTERT. By Heinz Schurmann. Freiburg: Herder, 1958. Pp. 143. The axiom *lex orandi, lex credendi* governs S.'s exegesis of the Our Father. When Jesus taught His disciples to pray, He expressed concisely the essential doctrine of

His preaching. The preaching of Jesus on the Kingdom, preserved in the Synoptic Gospels, is the key to the proper understanding of the Our Father. S. thinks the shorter Lucan formula represents the original Aramaic prayer of Jesus better than the Matthaean form. The additions of Mt were made in the interests of liturgical usage. The Our Father is the prayer Jesus taught His disciples, i.e., those who had left everything to follow Him. The petition for the bread "necessary" to sustain life today, taken literally, is the prayer of those who, like the disciples, make no provision for the future because in the interests of the Kingdom they have abandoned everything and no longer work for their sustenance. The Lucan prayer for bread each succeeding day is the form the petition takes on the lips of those who, while not abandoning all material pursuits, do seek first the Kingdom of God. The Our Father, S. stresses throughout, is the prayer of Christians who believe firmly in and ardently yearn for the glorious Parousia of the Lord. God's Kingdom comes, His name is hallowed, when the Lord Jesus returns on the clouds of heaven to complete and seal the divine victory over evil. The "temptation," the danger from which the Christian begs to be preserved, is the evil characteristic of the "last days," loss of faith, apostasy from Jesus. Written in a clear, simple style, this little book is a model of popular exegesis. It is indeed "living theology" that will promote genuine piety. The copious notes evidence the author's solid scholarship. A translation into English would be a genuine service.

*Passionist Monastery, Union City, N.J.*

*Richard Kugelman, C.P.*

THE CHRISTIAN APPROACH TO THE BIBLE. By Célestin Charlier, O.S.B. Translated by Hubert J. Richards and Brendan Peters. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. 299. \$4.00. The original is entitled *La lecture chrétienne de la Bible*. Among the growing number of books written to help the Christian read, understand, and appreciate the Bible, this volume ranks among the best. It gives both information and orientation. The pertinent background information deals with the biblical languages, literary composition, geography, and history. The orientation begins in the first chapter, in which are outlined and evaluated the various approaches to Scripture that have appeared in history. C.'s own conclusions appear gradually in the course of the book, especially in "The Christian Interpretation." The key to his approach is that the Bible is theandric on many levels, for it is the living Word of God. Especially to be recommended is chapter 6, "The Word of God," in which C. explains in some detail how the cyclic themes of the Bible both logically and historically lead to Christ, are transformed in Christ, and have full meaning only in terms of Christ. The most recent (6th)

French edition contains bibliographical suggestions at the close of each chapter and an index at the end. Their inclusion in future English editions is recommended.

*Woodstock College*

*John S. Nelson, S.J.*

THE ESSENCE OF THE BIBLE. By Paul Claudel. Translated by Wade Baskin. New York: Philosophical Library, 1957. Pp. 120. \$3.00. A collection of C.'s final essays on Scripture. The French title, *J'aime la Bible*, better explains their nature: C.'s personal tribute of praise, gratitude, and enthusiasm for the Bible. These varied essays fall into two categories: reflex essays on C.'s own approach to Scripture, and its direct application to such topics as the prophetic spirit, our Lady, and the nature of evil. In the reflex essays, overwhelming emphasis is put on the spiritual sense of Scripture. He sharply attacks stress on the literal sense, especially when explained in detail with the aid of linguistics, archeology, comparative religion, etc. C.'s extreme language and views may have some value as a corrective to making Scripture sterile, but they are hardly in keeping with current Catholic biblical thought on the priority of the literal sense. In the second category of essays, C. is far from his best. Here and there we find a rewarding flash of his poetic insight, but the whole is clouded by rhetoric that is unclear or repetitious.

*Woodstock College*

*John S. Nelson, S.J.*

THE SENTENCES OF SEXTUS. Edited by Henry Chadwick. *Texts and Studies*, Second Series 5. Cambridge: University Press, 1959. Pp. xii + 194. \$5.50. The fifth in a series of splendid monographs published under the general editorship of the eminent Scripture scholar, C. H. Dodd. The core of the work is a critical edition of the collection of aphorisms which circulated in the early Church under the name of Sextus. Chadwick has enriched this text with an edition of the Latin version made by Rufinus, the later Greek appendices, and the somewhat cognate collections called *The Sayings of the Pythagoreans* and *Aphorisms of Clitarchus*; he has also given us a very searching critical commentary, together with a number of fine essays on the general problems connected with the history and doctrine of the period. The Sextine collection was a group of sayings dealing primarily with moral and spiritual perfection; and the text, as known by Origen, Rufinus, the early monks, and many other writers, was an anonymous Christian compilation which leaned heavily on previous pagan sources. The collection spread throughout the Christian world and developed by constant accretion; and it was the enlarged, fifth-century edition that was translated

into Syriac and Armenian. C.'s work in early Christianity has always been flawless, and the present volume is a remarkable scholarly achievement. For it he has had to sift hundreds of contemporary sources, pagan, Jewish, and Christian; he shows a sure touch in textual problems, and both his doctrinal and historical analyses reflect care and penetration. Thus the work will be indispensable for all students of the early Church, especially for the area of early Christian morality and asceticism. It is another witness of the consistently high standard of Cambridge patristic scholarship.

*Bellarmino College, Plattsburgh, N.Y.*

*Herbert Musurillo, S.J.*

THE NEW TESTAMENT TEXT OF ST. AMBROSE. By R. W. Muncey. *Texts and Studies*, Second Series 4. New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. lxxviii + 120. \$6.00. This careful and scholarly work is a true contribution to patristic and scriptural study. From the MS evidence and the published text of the Ambrosian corpus in the Vienna and Migne editions, M. has brought forth a reconstruction of the *NT* as used by Ambrose. The Introduction is most valuable, for it is a careful study of the relationship of Ambrose's text of the *NT* in relation to the Vulgate and to the various MS families of the *NT*. Part of the worth of such a study is that it helps to establish the age of some of the MS tradition. Some evidence is also adduced to show the Greek MSS implied by the Latin text used by Ambrose. There is also a brief study of the Ambrosian syntax and of the vocabulary peculiarities—Grecisms and Africanisms—evidenced in the Latin text of Ambrose's *NT*. MSS for nine of Ambrose's works are cited in the critical apparatus, for there are some important variants to be found in these. Unfortunately, there is no discussion of the Ambrosian MSS; the reader is referred to the introductory section of the Vienna corpus edition. This is a minor criticism, for the serious student will have this edition available to him. However, it does seem that some brief study could have been included so as to have everything handy in one place. This would not have greatly increased the size of this slim volume.

*Xavier University, Cincinnati*

*Orrin T. Wheeler, S.J.*

SELECTED EASTER SERMONS OF SAINT AUGUSTINE. Introduction, text of thirty sermons, notes, and commentary by Philip T. Weller. St. Louis: Herder, 1959. Pp. vii + 329. \$4.95. St. Augustine here preaches on the paschal candle, the meaning of the Easter vigil, the Eucharist, Christ the Lamb and Lion, the Alleluia, the Creed, the Lord's Prayer, etc. The translations are excellent (Fr. Weller is well known for his version of the Roman Ritual). The Introduction is a vivid and documented account of the

liturgy of the Easter vigil in the Saint's time, especially in Africa. The extensive notes are scholarly in character, with references to other sermons of Augustine and to modern research. There is a useful index. As devotional reading, stimulus and example for the preacher, a primary source for the theology of Easter, a revelation of Augustine at his homiletic and pastoral peak, this volume is heartily recommended.

*Woodstock College*

*Thomas E. Clarke, S.J.*

**KATHOLISCHE DOGMATIK NACH DEN GRUNDSÄTZEN DES HEILIGEN THOMAS**  
 2. By Franz Diekamp. 11th and 12th rev. ed. by Klaudius Jüssen. Münster: Aschendorff, 1959. Pp. 614. DM 27.— Diekamp's theological textbooks are of the "solid" variety, with briefly formulated theses that are "proved" by appeal to ecclesiastical documents, passages from Scripture, and a few patristic quotations. Frequently a speculative discussion, based on St. Thomas, imparts some understanding of the issue. The second volume treats of creation, Christology, soteriology, Mariology, and grace. The editor's contributions are evident mostly in the question of the formation of the first man's body and in new developments in Mariology. Professors of theology will derive very little enlightenment from the book. Seminarians able to read German may occasionally find clarifying explanations. References to contemporary theological works are numerous and well selected, although the editor seems to have used them most sparingly in his revision. The physical derivation of Eve's body from Adam's is presented as certain doctrine. Christ's resurrection is not regarded as essential to His redemptive work. Mary is refused any active part in objective redemption. The Mary-Church analogy follows the line proposed by H. Köster and O. Semmelroth. In the controversy on efficacious grace the Bañez tradition is favored. Perhaps the best feature of the volume is the discussion of adversaries; perhaps the worst is the poverty of explanation concerning reasons why a thesis is treated, and the almost total lack of indication about its position and importance in theology.

*St. Mary's College, Kansas*

*Cyril Vollert, S.J.*

**CATHOLICISM: A STUDY OF DOGMA IN RELATION TO THE CORPORATE DESTINY OF MANKIND.** By Henri de Lubac, S.J. Translated by Lancelot C. Sheppard. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1958. Pp. xiv + 283. \$4.00. The reprinting of this English translation twenty years after the original French first appeared deserves notice for two reasons: (1) these twenty years have been marked by a strong growth in social awareness on all levels of life in the Church; (2) the book has remained timely because of its wealth of docu-

mentation from every generation of the Church's history. The mass of citation often slows the reading, but it has a sure cumulative effect in affirming and reinforcing the main theme of the book: the key dogmas of the Church, and the main stream of tradition explaining and interpreting them, are essentially social and not individualistic.

Woodstock College

John S. Nelson, S.J.

PECCATO E CASTIGO NELLA TEOLOGIA CATTOLICA CONTEMPORANEA. By Eraldo Quarello, S.D.B. Turin: Società Editrice Internazionale, 1958. Pp. 116. L. 600. Originally published as articles in *Salesianum* 20 (1958) 164-208, 291-351; details and synthesizes the arguments of post-World War I theologians for and against the existence of an extrinsic (or strictly "inflicted") vindicative punishment for sin. An introduction points up the importance of the question for divers dogmas; the trend in recent biblical studies on expiation and "justice" to deny the presence of the concept of vindicative punishment in Scripture; the contribution of the magisterium, especially of Pius XII, in modern times to the data of the problem. Four chapters then study the positions on vindicative punishment in relation to sin in its four aspects of violation of order, violation of divine law, offence of God, and aversion from God. Q. concludes that his study's chief fruit is to show difficulties in the theological arguments for the classical doctrine of *poena vindicativa extrinseca*. Perhaps the real difficulty, however, is the unclarity, in some sectors of modern theology, on the *violatio et restitutio ordinis* doctrine, combined with excessive literalism in the application to divine action of the terms "intrinsic" and "extrinsic"; a further factor in the unpopularity of the doctrine of vindicative punishment may be the one-sidedness of certain interpretations of "justice" in *OT* and *NT*, contributing to (and mirroring?) the facile catchword contrasts between justice and love, the juridical and the ontological, phenomenology (or even "existentialism") and essentialism, Greek and Semite categories of thought, "personalism" and "scholasticism."

Woodstock College

M. J. O'Connell, S.J.

THE BRIDE. By Daniel Berrigan, S.J. New York: Macmillan, 1959. Pp. 142. \$3.50. The author, a Lamont Poetry Prize Winner of 1957, explores successfully in thirteen essays many of the challenging aspects of the Church. B. manifests unusually rich insights and frequently calls to mind de Lubac's *Splendor of the Church*. The relationship between faith and history, the person and the Church, and the meaning of the temporal are set forth with theological surety and poetic insight. Starting with the unique

call of Israel, he underscores the fulfilment brought to human life by the advent of Christ. The entire book traces the drama of God's action upon history and integrates into this many themes: Christian humanism, the role of action, suffering, and prayer in the Christian community. The final chapter analyzes luminously the role of the saint in the Body of Christ. A richly rewarding book; if one has any reserve, it will be concerning the excessively dense, overimaged style, which tends to needless obscurity.

*Fordham University*

*Robert W. Gleason, S.J.*

DAS REICH GOTTES IN DER KATECHETISCHEN UNTERWEISUNG: EINE HISTORISCHE UND SYSTEMATISCHE UNTERSUCHUNG. By Theodor Filthaut. *Untersuchungen zur Theologie der Seelsorge* 12. Freiburg: Herder, 1958. Pp. 224. DM 12.50.

Develops in detail the theme of the Kingdom of God as found in the catechetical writings of Bernard Galura, Bishop of Brixen (d. 1856), and Johann Baptist von Hirscher (d. 1865). He establishes the link between its appearance in the catechisms of Wicelius, Holding, Canisius, and Trent, the development of the idea by Galura and Hirscher, and its central position in modern papal teaching, theology, and catechetics. For Hirscher, F. analyzes chiefly the Catechism of the Diocese of Rottenburg (1947) and that of the German dioceses (1955). First, however, he goes into the contributions of the numerous nineteenth-century catechisms and "Bible histories" in detail. His starting point among the moderns is von Felbiger, who in his catechism of 1783 defined the Kingdom of God only as eternal blessedness. Scherer (1630) had seen in the concept the Church, the life of grace, and the life of heaven. This threefold meaning gained such support over the next two centuries that F. easily makes a case for it as the master idea of all religious instruction and preaching. F.'s concluding sections are evaluations of the modern spirit, which is careful to make Christ central but as the way to the Father, thus avoiding any tendency to "Panchristismus" (Jungmann's phrase). F. conducts a search for the term "Kingdom of God" in Scripture, the Fathers, the Reformers, and modern theologians. As with any isolation of a single idea, a slight sense of imbalance is conveyed. Yet F.'s conclusions are so well-balanced theologically as to make the reader trust him when he proposes certain catechetical imperatives.

*The Catholic University of America*

*Gerard S. Sloyan*

THE MASS: CHRISTIANS AROUND THE ALTAR. By the Community of Saint-Séverin. Translated by Margaret Clark. Chicago: Fides, 1958. Pp. 155. \$3.25. OUR MASS EXPLAINED: FROM THE VIEWPOINTS OF HISTORY, THEOLOGY, PIETY. By Msgr. Chevrot. Translated by P. Holland-Smith. College-

ville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1958. Pp. 241. \$3.75. IN REMEMBRANCE OF ME: THE PRAYER OF THE CHURCH AND THE SACRAMENTS. By A. G. Martimort. Translated by Dom Aldhelm Dean. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1958. Pp. 217. \$3.25.

We have the French to thank for all three of these recent popular studies on the liturgy. A team of diocesan priests shares with us the fruits of its study and labor over the past decade to carry out a mission from Cardinal Suhard to revitalize the parish of Saint-Séverin. The liturgy was the prime target, with the resulting collection of essays apparently adapted from sermons on the Mass. The style is direct and simple. Part 1 highlights the main stages of the Mass; Part 2 studies some of its more particular, neglected aspects. The encouragement given to unauthorized variations in the rubrics (subsequently corrected by Cardinal Feltin) is understandably disturbing; but such minor blemishes do not obscure the large themes of community, worship, thanksgiving, sacrificial meal, union with Christ, which are always at the center of focus. C.'s book is altogether different in scope as in method of development. Covering the entire Mass in detail, he offers a happy blend of scholarship, doctrine, and inspiration rarely found in so-called popular works on the liturgy. His approach evidently comes from the realization that piety without dogma verges on sentimentalism, and that both piety and dogma need the support of sound liturgical history if the Mass rites are to become meaningful. Scholars may be disappointed at the uneven use of references and at the failure to cite more recent studies in their fields. However, the points to which they could take exception are few indeed and scarcely deserve mention in view of the author's prospective audience. The book merits high recommendation for layman, parish priest, and seminarian alike. Martimort, whose name is familiar to contemporary liturgists, affords another example of scholarship put to the service of the popular liturgical revival. A more elementary study than C.'s, it is no less biblical and patristic in inspiration. A few basic ideas about the Paschal Mystery, the Christian assembly, and the sacramental principle set the foundation for a developed study of each of the sacraments in the heart of the book. Succinct summaries at the end of each chapter make such a manual ideal for classroom and study-group use. For this reason it is unfortunate that the Challoner paper edition is not made available to American readers.

*Woodstock College*

*Joseph G. Murray, S.J.*

LITURGISCHES JAHRBUCH 7 (1957), 8 (1958). Edited by Liturgisches Institut. Münster: Aschendorff, 1957, 1958. Pp. 256, 256. DM 16.50.

Almost all the essays in these two volumes deal with current liturgical problems. Worthy of special compliment are three articles on the Easter



Vigil: "Osterlied auf das Wasser," by J. Pascher; "Die Benedictio fontis in der Osternacht," by E. Stommel; and "Exsultemus et laetetur in ea," by F. Kolbe. These three short pieces are an excellent, informative, pointed treatment of one of the high points of the Catholic liturgy. The two volumes, well conceived in form and content, are recommended to the liturgist.

*Woodstock College*

*Robert E. McNally, S.J.*

ARCHIV FÜR LITURGIEWISSENSCHAFT 5/2. Edited by Hilarius Emonds, O.S.B. Regensburg: Pustet, 1958. Pp. 572. The principal article in this number of the *Archiv* is devoted to a study of the sacrament of baptism in the Epistle to the Romans. This learned essay by V. Warnach, O.S.B., with its complete bibliography is a valuable survey of recent theological and liturgical literature on the Pauline doctrine of baptism. The *Literaturbericht* (200 pages), the work of twenty-three distinguished collaborators, is a remarkable critical evaluation of current liturgical scholarship.

*Woodstock College*

*Robert E. McNally, S.J.*

THE MATRIMONIAL IMPEDIMENT OF IMPOTENCE: OCCLUSION OF SPERMATIC DUCTS AND VAGINISMUS. A HISTORICAL SYNOPSIS AND A COMMENTARY. By Peter L. Frattin. *Catholic Univ. of America Canon Law Studies* 381. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1958. Pp. x + 117. \$2.00. The *Canon Law Studies* of the Catholic University are, for the most part, of real service in their field. Even those which show no originality usually offer a useful compilation of all important opinions on the topic in question. Unfortunately, such cannot be said of the present number, the more unfortunately in that the subject is one of special interest today to all moralists and canonists. Not only does the author offer nothing new, but even in reviewing and weighing current opinions, and trying to defend the Gasparri thesis which demanded *semen elaboratum in testiculis*, he is guilty of many inconsistencies, of accepting contradictory testimony, of constantly begging the question, and of being woefully deficient in his bibliography, especially on the opinion contrary to his thesis. Even the material preparation of the dissertation leaves much to be desired; the book is full of typographical errors and incorrect or clumsy English.

*Alma College*

*Joseph J. Farragher, S.J.*

THE PROVISIONS OF THE DECREE *Spiritus sancti munera*: THE LAW FOR THE EXTRAORDINARY MINISTER OF CONFIRMATION. By Henry J. Dziadosz. *Catholic Univ. of America Canon Law Studies* 397. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1958. Pp. xii + 228. In the usual pattern of Catholic University's *Canon Law Studies* (brief historical sketch

followed by canonical commentary), D. presents a careful study of the chief canonical problems surrounding the administration of confirmation by a priest acting as extraordinary minister under the terms of *Spiritus sancti munera* and related documents. The commentary on the decree considers the legal nature of the decree itself, norms governing its interpretation, the priests designated as extraordinary ministers, and the conditions of valid and lawful administration. D.'s theory on the nature of the power conceded priests to confirm leads him to conclude that canon 209 is inapplicable to the doubts concerning some of the provisions of the decree. Of peculiar interest is a *formula brevissima* for emergency use (pp. 139-40), approved by the Holy Office in a private response to the Bishop of Norwich.

*Weston College*

*Maurice B. Walsh, S.J.*

PAROCHIAL RELATIONS AND CO-OPERATION OF THE RELIGIOUS AND THE SECULAR CLERGY. By David O'Connor, M.S.S.S.T. *Catholic Univ. of America Canon Law Studies* 401. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1958. Pp. xiv + 195. \$2.00.

The Third Plenary Council of Baltimore attested that it joyfully and gratefully affirmed and proclaimed that between the secular clergy and the many religious orders there existed a holy spirit of concord and harmony. Moreover, the Council predicted that this brotherly agreement and cooperation would remain so forever. The book under review examines the history and the law of parochial relations and cooperation between the religious and secular clergy. It amply brings out that the wonderful concord and harmony between the two branches of the clergy in the United States has not always been found elsewhere. The fault for such disharmony at times is to be laid at the door of the secular clergy; at other times, at the door of the religious. In the canonical commentary O'C. considers the juridical relationship of clerical religious houses with neighboring parishes, parish life and the sacerdotal ministry of priests of clerical religious houses, the obligation of clerical religious to give parochial assistance, and the temporal remuneration for such assistance. Quite a few of the references to *AAS* are not reliable because of errors in citing the date of a document or the year or volume of *AAS*; e.g., p. 89, note 30; p. 113, note 95; etc. The wrong canon is cited on p. 128, note 10, and on p. 48 *timoratis conscientiiis* is mistakenly translated "tender consciousness."

*West Baden College*

*James I. O'Connor, S.J.*

HISTORIC PROTESTANTISM AND PREDESTINATION. By Harry Buis. Philadelphia: Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Co., 1958. Pp. x + 142. \$2.75. Though written primarily for members of the Reformed and Presbyterian Churches, the present volume is a valuable summary of tradi-

tional Protestant teaching on predestination. The author assumes as a hypothesis, and then sets out to prove, that the Calvinistic doctrine is biblical. His argumentation combines quotations from Luther and Calvin and a re-interpretation of Augustine in the light of Reformation theology. To support his thesis, B. has a chapter on "The Common Heritage," in which Anselm, Peter Lombard, and Aquinas are offered as progenitors of Calvin. Duns Scotus, however, was the outstanding "Pelagian" of the Middle Ages. His emphasis on the "merit of the fit" shifted the deciding factor back to God's foreknowledge of an individual's worthiness. "From the time of Duns Scotus onward, the Roman Catholic conception of grace was superficial" (pp. 21-22). Three merits commend this volume to Catholic readers: it offers a compact analysis, based on numerous quotations, of traditional Calvinism, which is evidently more alive than many people might suppose; it shows a quiet oblivion of the tragic consequences of denying human freedom that makes the Protestant mind more intelligible as Christian subjectivism; and for those who wonder how Calvinists rationalize their doctrine, it gives many samples of avoiding the issue by misrepresenting the opposition. The only alternative to Calvinism, according to B., is to leave the choice of human destiny "entirely in man's power."

*West Baden College*

*John A. Hardon, S.J.*

CATHOLIQUES ET PROTESTANTS: UN PROJET DE SOLIDARITÉ CHRÉTIENNE. By Oscar Cullmann. Neuchâtel: Delachaux & Niestlé, 1958. Pp. 70.

Part of the series *L'Actualité protestante*, this brochure is written in the same spirit of concessive Protestantism as Cullmann's earlier works, *Christ et le temps* and *Saint Pierre*. His theme is an answer to the question posed at the beginning: What does the *NT* say about the Church's unity? There were certainly differences in membership among the early Christians: Hellenists and Hebrews, Petrine, Joannine, and Pauline emphases. "But these divergences did not lead to schism. On the contrary, they constituted the Church's ecumenical riches which ever remained one." If we would know how united the Church ought to be, we have only to read what St. Paul has to say about the Mystical Body. "Since the Church is the Body of Christ, schism is not only a scandal; it is a contradiction and impossibility. While it is God's will that there should be a difference of graces, it cannot be His will to have many churches separated one from the other by mutual exclusion" (pp. 15-16). C. goes beyond stating the case for Christian unity. He offers practical measures in the direction of realizing the Gospel ideal. To encourage Protestants, he notes the change in attitude among Catholic churchmen even at the highest levels. A typical item is the fact that the term "heretic" has been replaced in many circles by the milder "separated brother" when referring

to Protestants. In view of the changed atmosphere, C. proposes a renewed effort by Catholics and Protestants to discuss their respective differences in private colloquies; and to finance these and similar projects, he suggests that Catholics make contributions to assist Protestants and the latter to do the same for Catholics. He feels that this single gesture of good will would go far to melt the prejudice and bias that mainly separate the two religious cultures. If there were more writers of the Cullmann type, the prospects for the ecumenical movement would be most encouraging.

*West Baden College*

*John A. Hardon, S.J.*

**TWENTY CENTURIES OF CHRISTIANITY: A CONCISE HISTORY.** By Paul Hutchinson and Winfred E. Garrison. New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1959. Pp. xiv + 306. \$6.00. Two former editors of the *Christian Century* have arrived at the present dimensions of this popular history by expanding an article by Hutchinson in "The World's Great Religions" series in *Life*. All but the first quarter of the book is from the pen of Garrison, now aged 85, who became partner to the project only after Hutchinson's death in 1956. The long journalistic experience and highly-skilled literary craftsmanship of both are put to good account in a lucid, smartly-phrased narrative which easily sustains interest by distributing the right proportion of minor incidents and personal details (drawn too frequently from the realm of legend) to vary the broad lines which inevitably fill most of the composition. The score for reliability is less uniform. In addition to a modest scattering of factual errors, there are questionable interpretations of larger issues, such as the medieval papal outlook on Church-State relations. The pervading tone is remarkably irenic. In an area bristling with controversy the authors have extended themselves in an attempt "to be as objective as possible—from a Protestant point of view" (p. vi). But their Protestantism is not obtrusive, even in their treatment, a surprisingly brief one, of the Reformation era. Nor have they succumbed to the urge to highlight individual and institutional shortcomings in the Catholic Church. More on display is a rather sceptical mentality, particularly in Hutchinson's contribution when he discusses the beginnings of Christianity, the great heresies (reduced too much to the level of political intrigues), and the impact of the new religion on the Roman Empire: "After Constantine there is not much that is not humiliating" (p. 57). Approximately equal space is allotted the ancient, medieval, and modern periods; but after the first period the spotlight focuses on the West, with Orthodox schismatics left in the shadow. The four-page bibliography, more notable for its omissions than its inclusions, recommends almost exclusively works in English by non-Catholics.

*Weston College*

*John F. Broderick, S.J.*

**BENEDICTINISM THROUGH THE CENTURIES.** By Stephanus Hilpisch, O.S.B. Translated by Leonard J. Doyle. Collegeville, Minn.: St. John's Abbey Press, 1958. Pp. viii + 172. \$3.00. **HISTORY OF BENEDICTINE NUNS.** By Stephanus Hilpisch, O.S.B. Translated by Sister M. Joanne Muggli, O.S.B. Edited by Leonard J. Doyle. Collegeville, Minn.: St. John's Abbey Press, 1958. Pp. vii + 122. \$3.00. These are outlines of Benedictine history. In the volume on the first order, the development of the religious life prior to St. Benedict is also sketched, while the second volume recounts the history of Benedictine nuns against the background of the general history of religious women. Given the central position of Benedictinism in the history of the religious life in the West, these reliable works are of importance to all religious and are the best works in English on their subject matter. In each volume the story of the order in North America receives special treatment. There is a chapter on the Cistercians and even one on Anglican Benedictines. Useful bibliographies are added as well as good indexes.

*Woodstock College*

*E. A. Ryan, S.J.*

**THE MOVEMENT OF WORLD REVOLUTION.** By Christopher Dawson. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1959. Pp. 179. \$3.00. D. gives us perspective and insight into the massive currents of conflict in cultures, civilizations, and religions by analyzing the modern phenomena of social upheaval and ineluctable change in their historical origins and genetic development. The struggle of the Eastern nations towards self-identity places them in a bewildering paradox. The revolutionary spirit of the West came to them through colonization programs and missionary expansion; the education of the leaders in Western ideas stimulated the scrutiny of old forms of political, economic, and social life. As the nations of the East emerge, they react strongly to Western dominance, while attempting to make their own the Western ideologies of political and economic life. The secularization process consequent upon the acceptance of Western techniques is in violent conflict with the religious spirit that permeates Eastern social life. Yet the breakdown of older, traditional forms in the Eastern nations offers the West a unique challenge and opportunity. If the West contributes only the secularization of culture, she will have failed, or at least done little more than the Communist enterprise. If the West brings the riches of Christianity, she will have hopes of meeting the challenge of the age; for religion alone can give permanent direction to culture, as D. has shown so well in previous books.

*Woodstock College*

*Carroll Bourq, S.J.*

**CHRISTIAN HUMANISM.** By Louis Bouyer. Translated by A. V. Littledale. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1959. Pp. 110. \$1.50. A warning against two extremes in the attitude of the Christian towards the things of this world: (1) excessive optimism in evaluating and cultivating natural human development; (2) excessive pessimism in overstressing the dangers of the natural and the need for a rigorous check on human freedom by authority. The first tendency can lead to a new resurgence of modernism and naturalism within the Church. The second can lead to an equally pernicious, though apparently more safe and orthodox, resurgence of integrism and authoritarianism. The latter trend is well analyzed with its paradoxical combination of overconfidence in the powers of natural reason, manifested by its overemphasis on the rational aspect of faith, and its distrust of human freedom, especially in the area of intellectual inquiry, manifested by its habitual tendency to appeal to authority to settle by fiat from above all disputed questions. The development of this sound theme, however, contributes very little that is new or particularly illuminating. It appears to this reviewer as little more than an eloquent insistence on the obvious, which could well have been condensed into a terse article rather than extended to book length. Though few names are mentioned, it is obviously also an occasional piece, referring frequently and with no little heat to extreme positions or statements by "a certain theologian," etc. Though significant as a timely protest against extremism and an appeal for Christian balance, this is not one of the author's more important works.

*Fordham University*

*W. Norris Clarke, S.J.*

**THE CATHOLIC THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY OF AMERICA: PROCEEDINGS OF THE THIRTEENTH ANNUAL CONVENTION.** Yonkers, N.Y.: St. Joseph's Seminary, 1958. Pp. 231. \$3.50. The presidential address, "The Challenge to Theology," by John F. X. Sweeney, S.J., pointed up the present theological picture in this fiftieth year of the coming of age of the Church in America. Especially noted were the advances made in Catholic biblical scholarship and the challenge "to present the Catholic faith in language and thought patterns intelligible to a world whose cultural atmosphere tends to reduce to medieval folklore such Christian truths as man's divine origin, his elevation to grace, and his fall from God's favor." In the convention's general sessions papers were read by Robert Masterson, O.P., on "The Sacramental Grace of Penance," Francis Gilligan on "Moral Aspects of Segregation in Education," and David Stanley, S.J., on "The Concept of Biblical Inspiration." Presented in the elective seminars were: "Evaluation of the Traditional Seminary Course in Apologetics," by Edward Hogan,

S.S.; "A Course in the Positive Theology of the Incarnation," by Celestine Luke Salm, F.S.C.; "Moral Aspects of Pharmaceutical Fertility Control," by John J. Lynch, S.J.; and "Nature and Effects of Spiritual Communion," by Francis Costa, S.S.S. Finally, Owen Bennett, O.F.M.Conv., and John Connery, S.J., presented a panel discussion on "The Role of Prudence in the Right to Censor in Literature and Art."

**THE CEREMONIES OF THE ROMAN RITE DESCRIBED.** By Adrian Fortescue and J. B. O'Connell. 10th ed.; Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. 428. \$7.50. This latest edition of Fortescue-O'Connell offers a completely revised, up-to-date reference book on matters liturgical, containing all such ceremonies as may occur in a parish church, the rules for some pontifical functions, and directions for the administration of the sacraments. All the latest rubrical changes have been incorporated into the text. The following new sections have been added: Dialogue Mass (according to the September, 1958 Instruction of the Sacred Congregation of Rites); Rules for the Laity at Mass; A Table of the Episcopal Indulgence at High Mass; The Papal Blessing; Civil Dignitaries at Mass; A Table for Pontifical Mass at the Throne and at a Faldstool; Baptism Administered by a Bishop; A Table for the Reception of a Convert; Reconciliation of a Dying Non-Catholic; Marriage Blessed by a Bishop; Blessing for a Silver or Golden Marriage Anniversary; A Table for Pontifical Absolution of the Dead; A Service on the Occasion of the Death of a Non-Catholic Personage. There is a special supplement, "The Ceremonies of the Ritual in the U.S.A.," by Frederick R. McManus. As in previous editions, the plans, charts, and diagrams for all the important liturgical functions are complete and clear.

**THE LITTLE BREVIARY.** Edited by Th. Stallaert, C.S.S.R. Adapted and translated by the Benedictine Nuns of Stanbrook Abbey. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1959. Pp. xxiii + 1691 + [245] + 32\*. \$15.00. **THE DIVINE OFFICE.** Edited by Hildebrand Fleischmann, O.S.B. Adapted and translated by Edward E. Malone, O.S.B. New York: Herder and Herder, 1959. Pp. xxxi + 661. \$5.25. *The Little Breviary*, an adaptation from the Dutch, more closely resembles the *Breviarium romanum* in structure than any of the four English short breviaries available. Simplification takes the form of (1) a division of all of the longer Psalms, (2) an abbreviation of Matins to one nocturn with three abridged lessons, and (3) a reduction of hymns to three stanzas. 109 Psalms are used. Knox Scripture translations, orations from the "Knox" missal, beautiful typography and binding are noteworthy features. Translations of hymns are generally poor. *The Divine Office*, a German adap-

tation, is considerably smaller in size; its simplifications are also more radical: (1) the major hours have three Psalms, the minor hours one Psalm; (2) Matins has one nocturn with one lesson; (3) the number of saints' feasts has been reduced with a corresponding emphasis on seasonal offices; (4) a second set of Psalms at all the hours and a second lesson at Matins provide for a longer office or for an alternate cycle in the regular office. 129 Psalms are thus employed. It differs little from our own American breviary published over a decade ago by the Collegeville Benedictines.

**PROBLEMS IN THE LITURGY.** By Gerard Montague. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. 451. \$5.50. These problems have been selected from among the questions discussed in the pages of the *Irish Ecclesiastical Review* during the past fifteen years. They are grouped according to six sections: Mass, Blessed Sacrament, Sacraments and Sacramentals, Liturgical Year, Church Buildings and Furnishings, Indulgences. Emphasis has been placed on practical rubrical cases, and the answers given quote the Church documents referred to. A detailed index makes this collection valuable for reference.

#### BOOKS RECEIVED

[All books received are listed here whether they are reviewed or not]

##### *Scriptural Studies*

Ahlström, G. W. *Psalm 89: Eine Liturgie aus dem Ritual des leidenden Königs*. Translated by Hans-Karl Hacker and Rudolf Zeitler. Lund: Håkan Ohlsson, 1959. Pp. 228.

*La Bible de Jérusalem*. 2nd rev. ed. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1958. The following fascicles have been received: *Nombres* (Cazelles; 157 pp.); *Josué* (Abel—Du Buit; 111 pp.); *Judith, Esther* (Barucq; 137 pp.); *Actes des apôtres* (Dupont; 221 pp.); *Épîtres aux Galates, aux Romains* (Lyonnet; 139 pp.); *Épîtres aux Corinthiens* (3rd ed.; Osty; 121 pp.).

Cerfaux, L. *The Church in the Theology of St. Paul*. Translated by Geoffrey Webb and Adrian Walker. New York: Herder and Herder, 1959. Pp. 419. \$6.50.

Cerfaux, Lucien. *Christ in the Theology of St. Paul*. Translated by Geoffrey Webb and Adrian Walker. New York: Herder and Herder, 1959. Pp. 560. \$7.80.

Gibson, John M. *Soldiers of the Word: The Story of the American Bible Society*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1958. Pp. 304. \$3.75.



- Gooding, D. W. *The Account of the Tabernacle: Translation and Textual Problems of the Greek Exodus*. Texts and Studies, Second Series. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. xi + 114. \$4.00.
- The Gospel according to Saint Mark*. Introduction and commentary by C. E. B. Cranfield. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. xiii + 476.
- Gottwald, Norman K. *A Light to the Nations: An Introduction to the Old Testament*. New York: Harper, 1959. Pp. xxiv + 614. \$6.50.
- Hastings, C., V. Rochford, and A. Jones. *Pattern of Scripture*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1959. Pp. 96. \$.75.
- Internationale Zeitschriftenschau für Bibelwissenschaft und Grenzgebiete 5* (1956-1957) nos. 1-2. Düsseldorf: Patmos, 1959. Pp. xii + 265. DM 38.—
- Jomier, Jacques, O.P. *Bible et Coran*. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959. Pp. 148. 480 fr.
- Mariani, Bonaventura, O.F.M. *Introductio in libros sacros Veteris Testamenti*. Rome: Herder, 1958. Pp. xv + 646.
- Pagano, S., O.M.I. *Chronological Table of the Books of the Old Testament*. Ottawa: University Seminary, 1959. Pp. 10.
- Pagano, S., O.M.I. *Tableau chronologique des livres de l'Ancien Testament*. Ottawa: Séminaire Universitaire, 1959. Pp. 10.
- Schoeps, Hans-Joachim. *Paulus: Die Theologie des Apostels im Lichte der jüdischen Religionsgeschichte*. Tübingen: Mohr, 1959. Pp. xii + 324. DM 28.— (paper), 32.50 (cloth).
- Spicq, C., O.P. *Agapè dans le Nouveau Testament: Analyse des textes 2*. Paris: Gabalda, 1959. Pp. 408. 3400 fr.
- Vawter, B., C.M. *The Bible in the Church*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1959. Pp. 95. \$.75.
- Wilckens, Ulrich. *Weisheit und Torheit: Eine exegetisch-religionsgeschichtliche Untersuchung zu I Kor. 1 und 2*. Tübingen: Mohr, 1959. Pp. 290. DM 28.70.

#### *Doctrinal Theology*

- Bacocchi, J. de, S.M. *La vie sacramentaire de l'église*. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959. Pp. 236. 660 fr.
- Berrigan, Daniel, S.J. *The Bride: Essays in the Church*. New York: Macmillan, 1959. Pp. 142. \$3.50.
- Bocxe, Winfried, O.E.S.A. *Introduction to the Teaching of the Italian Augustinians of the 18th Century on the Nature of Actual Grace*. Héverlé-Louvain: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1958. Pp. 99.
- The Catholic Theological Society of America: Proceedings of the Thirteenth*

- Annual Convention*. Yonkers: St. Joseph's Seminary, 1958. Pp. xxxi + 231. \$3.50.
- Evangelisches Kirchenlexikon*, fasc. 36-37, 38-39. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1959. Cols. 1025-1280, 1281-1536. DM 9.60 each.
- God Speaks: Themes of Theology*. Translated and edited by Bernard Murchland, C.S.C. Notre Dame, Ind.: Fides, 1959. Pp. vi + 250. \$3.95.
- Hernandez, Angel Santos, S.J. *Iglesias de oriente: Puntos específicos de su teología*. Santander: Sal Terrae, 1959. Pp. 541. 85 ptas.
- Leclercq, Jean. *L'Idée de la royauté du Christ au moyen âge*. Unam sanctam 32. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959. Pp. 238. 1500 fr.
- Lennerz, H., S.J. *De beata Virgine: Tractatus dogmaticus*. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1957.
- Linden, James V., S.J. *The Catholic Church Invites You*. St. Louis: Herder, 1959. Pp. ix + 118. \$2.50.
- Luyten, Norbert M., Adolf Portmann, Karl Jaspers, and Karl Barth. *Immortalité*. Texts translated by Hélène Naef. Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, 1958. Pp. 71. 4 fr.s.
- Marduel, F. *Le pardon de Dieu: Pour un meilleur usage du sacrement de pénitence*. Le Puy: Xavier Mappus, 1958. Pp. 165. 660 fr.s.
- Marian Studies 10: Proceedings of the Tenth National Convention of the Mariological Society of America*. Paterson, N.J.: Mariological Society of America, 1959. Pp. 197. \$2.50.
- Muldoon, Thomas. *Theologiae dogmaticae praelectiones 3: De Deo creante et elevante*. Rome: Catholic Book Agency, 1959. Pp. xvi + 418.
- Murphy, John L. *The Notion of Tradition in John Driedo*. Milwaukee: Seraphic Press, 1959. Pp. xiv + 321. \$3.00.
- Orbe, Antonio, S.J. *Hacia la primera teología de la procesión del Verbo: Estudios Valentinianos 1/1-2*. Analecta Gregoriana 99. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1958. Pp. xx + 512, 821. \$10.00.
- Schmaus, M. *Katholische Dogmatik 4/2: Von den letzten Dingen*. Munich: Max Hueber, 1959. Pp. xix + 747. DM 26.—
- Tanquerey, Ad. *A Manual of Dogmatic Theology*. 2 vols. Translated by John J. Byrnes. New York: Desclée, 1959. Pp. xix + 436, xv + 462. \$9.75 set.
- Thurian, Max. *Marriage and Celibacy*. London: SCM Press, 1959. (U.S. distributor: Allenson: Naperville, Ill.) Pp. 126. \$1.75.
- Wetter, Friedrich. *Die Lehre Benedikts XII vom intensiven Wachstum der Gottesschau*. Analecta Gregoriana 92. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1958. Pp. viii + 236. L. 2000.

*Moral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions*

- The Acatistos Hymn: Hymn of Praise to the Mother of God.* Greek text, translation, and introduction by G. G. Meersseman, O.P. Fribourg: University Press, 1958. Pp. 77.
- Bégin, Raymond F. *Natural Law and Positive Law.* Catholic Univ. of America Canon Law Studies 393. Washington: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1959. Pp. xii + 177. \$2.00.
- Bennett, Austin P. *The Jurisdiction of the Archbishop of Canterbury: An Historico-Juridical Study.* Analecta Gregoriana 98. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1958. Pp. viii + 201. \$3.50.
- Cox, Ronald J. *A Study of the Juridic Status of Laymen in the Writing of the Medieval Canonists.* Catholic Univ. of America Canon Law Studies 395. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1959. Pp. x + 106. \$2.00.
- The Divine Office.* Edited by Hildebrand Fleischmann, O.S.B. Adapted and translated by Edward E. Malone, O.S.B. New York: Herder and Herder, 1959. Pp. xxxi + 661. \$5.25.
- Jungmann, Joseph A., S.J. *The Mass of the Roman Rite: Its Origins and Development.* Translated by Francis A. Brunner, C.S.S.R. New rev. and abridged ed. New York: Benziger, 1959. Pp. 567. \$10.00.
- Konus, William J. *Dictionary of the New Latin Psalter of Pope Pius XII.* Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1959. Pp. xi + 132. \$2.75.
- The Little Breviary.* Edited by Th. Stallaert, C.S.S.R. Adapted and translated by the Benedictine Nuns of Stanbrook Abbey. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1959. Pp. xxiii + 1691 + [245] + 32\*. \$15.00.
- Montague, Gerard. *Problems in the Liturgy.* Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. xvi + 451. \$5.50.
- Our Parish Prays and Sings: Dialog Mass, Hymns, Chants.* Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1959. Pp. 169. \$30.
- Pietrzyk, Stanley. *A Practical Formulary in Accordance with the Code of Canon Law.* 2nd rev. ed. Rome: Catholic Book Agency, 1959. Pp. xiii + 278.
- Schulte, P. Raphael, O.S.B. *Die Messe als Opfer der Kirche: Die Lehre frühmittelalterlicher Autoren über das eucharistische Opfer.* Liturgiewissenschaftliche Quellen und Forschungen 35. Münster: Aschendorff, 1959. Pp. xv + 198. DM 17.80.
- Sulloway, A. W. *Birth Control and Catholic Doctrine.* Boston: Beacon Press, 1959. Pp. xxiii + 257. \$3.95.
- Tierney, Brian. *Medieval Poor Law: A Sketch of Canonical Theory and Its*

- Application in England.* Berkeley, Calif.: Univ. of California Press, 1959. Pp. x + 169. \$4.00.
- Van den Bosch, J., O.S.C. *Capa Basilica Monasterium et le culte de saint Martin de Tours: Etude lexicologique et sémasiologique.* Latinitas christianorum primaeva 13. Nijmegen: Dekker & van de Veegt, 1959. Pp. xv + 166. Fl. 8.90.

*History and Biography, Patristics*

- Balsavich, Marion, O.S.B. *The Witness of St. Gregory the Great to the Place of Christ in Prayer.* Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. xxiv + 136.
- Egaña, Antonio de, S.J. *La teoría del regio vicariato español en Indias.* Analecta Gregoriana 95. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1958. Pp. xix + 315. \$5.00.
- Gill, Joseph, S.J. *The Council of Florence.* Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. xviii + 453. \$8.50.
- Guitton, Georges, S.J. *Le Père de la Chaize, confesseur de Louis XIV.* 2 vols. Paris: Beauchesne, 1959. Pp. 278, 287.
- Koren, Henry J., C.S.Sp. *The Spiritans: A History of the Congregation of the Holy Ghost.* Duquesne Studies, Spiritan Series 1. Pittsburgh: Duquesne Univ., 1958. Pp. xxix + 641. \$6.40.
- The Life of St. Thomas Aquinas: Biographical Documents.* Translated and edited by Kenelm Foster, O.P. Baltimore: Helicon Press, 1959. Pp. xii + 172. \$5.50.
- Patrologiae cursus completus*, ed. J.-P. Migne: *Series latina, Supplementum*, ed. Adalbertus Hamman, O.F.M. Vol. 1\*, 1\*\*, 1\*\*\*. Paris: Garnier, 1958. Pp. 1339.
- Regula Pauli et Stephani: Edició crítica i comentari.* Edited by J. Evangelista M. Vilanova, O.S.B. Scripta et documenta 11. Abadía de Montserrat: Publicaciones del Monasterio de Montserrat, 1959. Pp. 238.
- Selected Easter Sermons of Saint Augustine.* Introduction, notes, and commentary by Philip T. Weller. St. Louis: Herder, 1959. Pp. vii + 329. \$4.95.
- The Sentences of Sextus: A Contribution to the History of Early Christian Ethics.* Edited by Henry Chadwick. Texts and Studies, New Series 5. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. xii + 194. \$5.50.
- Von Campenhausen, Hans. *The Fathers of the Greek Church.* Translated by Stanley Godman. New York: Pantheon, 1959. Pp. 170. \$3.95.
- Pastoral and Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature*
- Apostolic Life.* Translated by Ronald Halstead. Religious Life Series 10. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958. Pp. vii + 206. \$3.75.
- Carpentier, René, S.J. *Life in the City of God: An Introduction to the Re-*

- ligious Life*. Translated by John Joyce, S.J. New York: Benziger, 1959. Pp. xvi + 192. \$3.75.
- Challoner, Richard. *A Daily Thought, Compiled from Richard Challoner's Meditations*. Edited by V. Guazzelli. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1959. Pp. 185. \$1.95.
- Desplanques, F., S.J. *Christ at Every Crossroad*. Translated by G. R. Serve. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1959. Pp. vii + 125. \$2.75.
- Gleason, Robert W., S.J. *Christ and the Christian*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1959. Pp. 179. \$3.00.
- Guardini, Romano. *Prayers from Theology*. Translated by Richard Newnham. New York: Herder and Herder, 1959. Pp. 62.
- Ignatius [Saint]. *Journal spirituel*. Translation and commentary by Maurice Giuliani, S.J. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1959. Pp. 145.
- Ignatius [Saint]. *Lettres*. Translation and commentary by Gervais Dumeige, S.J. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1959. Pp. 527.
- Jongen, H., S.M.M. *Look, the Madonna Is Weeping*. Bay Shore, N.Y.: Montfort Publ., 1959. Pp. xii + 158. \$3.00.
- LeBlond, J. M., G. Didier, R. Marlé, G. Salet, and H. Rondet, S.J. *Le coeur de Christ et le désordre du monde*. Le Puy: Xavier Mappus, 1958. Pp. 190. 750 fr.
- Lot-Borodine, Myrrha. *Un maître de la spiritualité byzantine au xiv<sup>e</sup> siècle: Nicolas Cabasilas*. Paris: Editions de l'Orante, 1958. Pp. xiii + 196.
- Nemec, Ludvik. *The Infant of Prague: The Story of the Holy Image and the History of the Devotion*. New York: Benziger, 1959. Pp. xv + 304. \$5.95.
- Neubert, Emil, S.M. *Life of Union with Mary*. Translated by Sylvester P. Juergens, S.M. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1959. Pp. xii + 255. \$4.95.
- Orcibal, Jean. *La rencontre du Carmel thérésien avec les mystiques du nord*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1959. Pp. 247.
- Schnitzler, Theodor. *The Mass in Meditation 1*. Translated by Rudolph Kraus. St. Louis: Herder, 1959. Pp. ix + 247. \$4.50.
- Truhlar, Carolus V., S.J. *Structura theologica vitae spiritualis*. Collectanea spiritualia 7. Rome: Gregorian Univ. Press, 1958. Pp. 219. L. 1300.
- Weikl, Ludwig, S.J. "Stir Up the Fire": *Considerations on the Priesthood*. Translated by Isabel and Florence McHugh. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1958. Pp. xvii + 233. \$4.50.
- Zundel, Maurice. *In Search of the Unknown God*. Translated by Margaret Clark. New York: Herder and Herder, 1959. Pp. 195. \$3.50.

#### *Philosophical Questions*

- Breton, Stanislas. *Approches phénoménologiques de l'idée d'être*. Paris: E. Vitte, 1959. Pp. 254.

- Collins, James. *God in Modern Philosophy*. Chicago: Regnery, 1959. Pp. xii + 476. \$6.50.
- Copleston, Frederick, S.J. *A History of Philosophy 5: Hobbes to Hume*. Bellarmine Series 16. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1959. Pp. ix + 440. \$4.75.
- De la connaissance de Dieu*. Recherches de philosophie 3-4. Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1959. Pp. 410. 2700 fr.
- Hayen, André, S.J. *La communication de l'être d'après saint Thomas d'Aquin*. Museum Lessianum, section philosophique. Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1959. Pp. 355. 246 fr.b.
- Hirschberger, Johannes. *The History of Philosophy 2*. Translated by A. N. Fuerst. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1959. Pp. viii + 752. \$9.50.
- Holloway, Maurice, S.J. *An Introduction to Natural Theology*. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1959. Pp. xxv + 492. \$4.00.
- Reith, Herman, C.S.C. *The Metaphysics of St. Thomas Aquinas*. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1958. Pp. xvii + 403. \$7.00.
- Smith, Vincent Edward. *The General Science of Nature*. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1958. Pp. xiii + 400. \$7.00.

#### *Special Questions*

- Congar, Yves M.-J., O.P. *Si vous êtes mes témoins*. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959. Pp. 127. 570 fr.
- Cranz, F. Edward. *An Essay on the Development of Luther's Thought on Justice, Law, and Society*. Harvard Theological Studies 19. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. xviii + 197.
- Documents épiscopaux de son Excellence Monseigneur Kerkhofs Evêque de Liège concernant les faits de Banneux Notre-Dame*. Liège: Dessain, 1959. Pp. 234.
- Ehrhardt, Arnold A. T. *Politische Metaphysik von Solon bis Augustin 1: Die Gottesstadt der Griechen und Römer; 2: Die christliche Revolution*. Tübingen, Mohr, 1959. Pp. x + 323, ix + 307. DM 65.—
- Les faits de Banneux Notre-Dame*. By J. Beyer, R. Carpentier, J. Heuschen, R. Leys, A. Meunier, A. Minon, W. Onclin, G. Philips, and I. Van Houtryve. Liège: Dessain, 1959. Pp. 263.
- Géraud, Joseph. *Itinéraire médico-psychologique de la vocation*. Paris: Xavier Mappus, 1959. Pp. 94.
- Heschel, Abraham J. *Between God and Man: An Interpretation of Judaism. From the Writings of Abraham J. Heschel*. Selected, edited, and introduced by Fritz A. Rothschild. New York: Harper, 1959. Pp. 279. \$5.00.

- Holland, L. Virginia. *Counterpoint: Kenneth Burke and Aristotle's Theories of Rhetoric*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1959. Pp. xv + 128. \$3.75.
- The Image of Man: A Review of Politics Reader*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 1959. Pp. vi + 451. \$6.00.
- Lynch, William, S.J. *The Image Industries*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1959. Pp. 159. \$3.50.
- Notre-Dame de Banneux*. By L. F. Kerkhofs. Tournai: Casterman, 1954. Pp. xvii + 204 + 61.
- Ong, Walter J., S.J. *American Catholic Crossroads: Religious-Secular Encounters in the Modern World*. New York: Macmillan, 1959. Pp. xi + 160. \$3.50.
- Rougier, Louis. *La religion astrale des Pythagoriciens*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1959. Pp. 112. 540 fr.
- Runes, Dagobert D. *A Dictionary of Thought: From My Writings and from My Readings*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1959. Pp. 152. \$5.00.
- Valensin, Auguste, S.J. *Joy in the Faith*. Translated by Alastair Guinan. New York: Desclée, 1959. Pp. 435. \$4.00.