

authorities, S. observes that this reliance on civil force undermined the centrality of Christ's law of love. Eventually religious authorities lost focus by treating the goals of order and repression of the lawless as being of prime importance (45).

S. then maps out the uneven and contentious development of law in the Western world and its occasionally rancorous relationship with religious authorities. By underscoring particular historical events as emblematic of what he ultimately sees as Christianity's critical disengagement with matters of law, and especially with criminal punishment, S. advances his argument that we "must remember, finally, that judgment, law, and the desire to inflict pain simply are not the way of Jesus" (172).

There is much to praise in the book's historical approach, which rightly avers that our ethical categories emerge as we reflect on concrete events in our shared past. Because the narrative arc of this work draws from particular incidents in Western Christianity, its sound conclusions carry the weight of the examples on which the author draws. S. indicates that were Christians faithful to their tradition, they would surely subject oppressive government action to withering criticism.

Where the book falls short is in its attempt to do too much. Some places in the text would have benefitted from a closer read of contemporary commentators. For example, S. seems to hint that freedom of conscience really emerged in Suárez, ignoring Aquinas's defense of the primacy of conscience in his *Commentary on the Sentences of Peter Lombard* (91). The characterization of the Investiture Controversy as effectively ushering in the rise of states and secularism surely tracks Harold Berman's thesis, but in the light of Brian Tierney's research, that seems a stretch. Further, the book ignores social ethics rooted in statements of national bishops' conferences and lay Catholic groups protesting prison conditions. The book is a valuable addition to this area of scholarship, but it leaves room for much more work on this important topic.

Marquette University, Milwaukee

GREGORY J. O'MEARA, S.J.

SCANDAL: THE CATHOLIC CHURCH AND PUBLIC LIFE. By Angela Senander. Introduction by James A. Coriden. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical, 2012. Pp. xvi + 134. \$14.95.

In this brief but helpful book, Senander uses "scandal" as a touchstone to analyze Catholic engagement in public life. Drawing a sharp contrast between a Vatican II approach and the approach of many lay Catholic groups and bishops today, S. presents a compelling argument for the church to return to a posture of engagement, "mov[ing] beyond the scandal of sin . . . [to] challenge the scandal of poverty and injustice" (103).

The book proceeds carefully, beginning with a definition of scandal drawn from Aquinas: any act (whether wrong or perceived as wrong) by which “an agent is creating an obstacle that could tempt a person to sin” (16). S. notes that all subsequent moral theology builds on Aquinas, using “scandal” in diverse ways to talk about many things: failures of the church to embody Christian faith and the failures of ordinary Christians to live their faith, as well as poverty, racism, sexism, injustice, dissent, the practices of Catholic hospitals, the votes of Catholic politicians, the speakers invited to Catholic universities, and, of course, clergy sexual abuse. In many of these areas, S. provides accurate overviews of how the term “scandal” has been applied in official Catholic teaching and Catholic moral theology.

S.’s thorough discussion leads her to three important conclusions that raise questions about current Catholic appropriation of “scandal.” First, she shows that scandal is, in some sense, unavoidable (98–99). Jesus scandalized his followers with his radical teachings. Elements of Christian theology continue to shock and present obstacles to faith for many today. Both the church as institution and ordinary Christian believers will inevitably fall short. We cannot and should not expect purity or a cost-free discipleship. Second, the church currently emphasizes scandal as dissent from doctrine, particularly doctrine understood as involving “God’s dominion” (i.e., teachings on sexuality, the sacredness of human life, and women’s ordination [80–82]), but it fails to bring attention to the scandals of poverty, racism, sexism, and war (67–74). Third, the current worry about dissent as scandal overlooks development in Catholic teaching and the role of dissenting theologians such as John Courtney Murray in aiding the church (63–65). According to S., the church needs to humbly acknowledge its sometimes-scandalous past and its ongoing need for conversion.

This last point seems especially important. S. is at her best when making a case for openness to dialogue within the church (82–84). While church authorities worry about confusion that will result if a law or speaker or practice contradicts Catholic teaching on a certain set of issues, many of the faithful are scandalized by some of the teachings in question (e.g., same-sex marriage and women’s ordination). Even more basically, they are scandalized by a church that does not tolerate dissent. They are embarrassed to belong to a church that is so compromised by its own lack of integrity (e.g., due to the sexual abuse scandals) that it cannot speak effectively about the truly scandalous realities of social injustice. Without change in this area, many more Catholics will walk away.

In sum, S. laments, “The spirit of cooperation, collaboration, and dialogical engagement from Vatican II has declined. Where there used to be more focus on God’s activity in the world, there is now greater focus on sin in the world. As the world looks at the church, the scandal of sin within the church obscures the proclamation of the Good News” (97). In light of

the case presented, S.'s call for moving back to a Vatican II-style openness to the world seems justified. Her plea for humility and dialogue is echoed by others writing about Catholic public engagement, including Charles Curran, Cathleen Kaveny, Bridget Burke-Ravizza, Paul Wadell, and David Hollenbach. Though one might argue that Vatican II's openness to the world was accompanied by worries that necessitated, then and now, prophetic words about scandal, S. is surely right that some modulation is due. The virtue of hope requires Christians to risk engagement and, instead of focusing so intently on cooperation with evil, look for unexpected ways in which people of good will choose cooperation with good (99).

College professors and lay Catholic groups seeking a way to encourage conversation about Catholic participation in public life, the need for respectful dialogue about divisive issues, and the place of dissent in a pilgrim church would do well to turn to this clearly written, hopeful book.

St. Louis University

JULIE HANLON RUBIO

THE MORAL DYNAMICS OF ECONOMIC LIFE: AN EXTENSION AND CRITIQUE OF *CARITAS IN VERITATE*. Edited by Daniel K. Finn. New York: Oxford University, 2012. Pp. xxii + 166. Pp. xv + 678. \$99; \$29.95.

Finn promises that “page for page, there are simply more good and interesting ideas than appear in most books written by a single author” (6). While that promise is a bit overstated, I did find the book engaging, and an important contribution to the growing conversation between Catholic social thought and contemporary social science, especially economics. That is the focus of the True Wealth of Nations project of the Institute for Advanced Catholic Studies, which, with the Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace, sponsored the symposium in 2009 that formed the basis of this collection. However, rather than simply reprint the conference papers, F. created ten thematic chapters quoting appropriate contributions by the two-dozen participants. I will later comment on how well that approach works.

The authors bring depth and a wide variety of experience to their discussion of *Caritas in veritate*, and reading these pages often gives new insight into the meanings in the encyclical itself. However, the aim of the symposium was to explore extensions and criticisms of the document, so examples of each will best give the flavor of this small volume.

The authors celebrate Benedict's fresh articulation of the role of gratuity and reciprocity as the graced ground on which truly human economic activity stands, especially markets and business, but they find it unfortunate that his examples are all special cases, “social enterprises” such as the Focolare movement (77). Instead, Michael Naughton and others call for a more expansive application of the logic of gift to mainstream business