

BOOK REVIEWS

THE WORD OF GOD: APPROACHES TO THE MYSTERY OF THE SACRED SCRIPTURES. By Georges Auzou. Translated by Josefa Thornton. St. Louis: Herder, 1960. Pp. viii + 255. \$4.75.

The number of popular books which are intended to interest the general reader in the Bible and to help him read it intelligently seems to grow daily. Although it is five years since the French original of M. Auzou's book appeared, its merits justify its addition to the existing collection in English, which is still not as large as it ought to be. A. intends his book as an aid to the reading of the Bible; a second volume will serve directly as a guide to reading, while this first volume presents the generalities which the ambitious reader should know. The book opens with "Preliminary Reflections," which are followed by two major parts, "Faith in the Sacred Scriptures" and "The Language of God."

The preliminary reflections set the Bible in its place in the Church and show the need of faith in him who approaches it. A. tells the reader that it is possible to read the Bible with profit and outlines the method to be followed. "Faith in the Scriptures" reviews the origins of the biblical books and sets forth the belief in inspiration in the *NT* and the Fathers. The modern doctrine of inspiration is summarized. The history of interpretation is sketched from the Fathers to the contemporary biblical movement. The transmission of the text and modern translations are treated, with special attention to the place of the Vulgate in the Church.

"The Language of God" takes up Hebrew thought patterns, some of the characteristic idioms of the biblical languages, and the forms of biblical poetry. A chapter entitled "Faces of the Bible" enumerates and describes the principal literary forms of the Bible and illustrates its deceptive familiarity by showing how some key biblical words can scarcely be translated into modern languages. "The Biblical Universe and its Meaning" elaborates some of the basic theological ideas of the Bible.

This is evidently a large package for such a small book, and the matter is spread rather thin at times. This seems to happen especially in the first part, where a vast amount of data must be compressed. One hesitates to quarrel, however, with an author's selection of material unless he has omitted something so vital that his presentation is distorted. A. never does this; at the same time, I suspect that his readers will get an idea of inspiration which is simplified excessively. It is only fair to A. to note that the contemporary discussion of this problem which has appeared since 1956 was not available to him when he wrote the book. The review of medieval exegesis depends ex-

clusively on Spicq, which is good; if in addition the work of Beryl Smalley had been used, it would be better. The discussion of patristic exegesis, with particular reference to the question of typology and allegorism, is too brief to be satisfactory. One does not like to quarrel with an author for not taking a position on such a controversial question, but his readers may expect him to. The problem of the *sensus plenior* is omitted; apparently A. does not believe it is a useful exegetical tool, a position with which this reviewer takes no issue. But A. can be assured that others will take issue.

The second part of the book is stronger than the first, and the general reader can scarcely fail to broaden his understanding of the background of the Bible. This section can be recommended with almost no complaint except that one would like to have more of it. A. understands and loves the Bible, and the understanding and love are often transparent in these pages; the personal attachment of the author to the word of God will, I imagine, move his readers to study the Bible as much as anything he says. And A. does mean "study"; he takes the Bible seriously, and he flatters his reader that he takes it seriously too. He makes the understanding of the Bible possible, but he does not promise that it is effortless.

A few errors in detail in the original or in translation were noticed. The stele of Hammurabi does not represent him receiving the law but the ring and the rod, the insignia of sovereignty (p. 44). Nor does the text of the laws anywhere claim that the laws are revealed (*ibid.*). Codex D is described as "the actual type of the arranged text," which is meaningless; by a conjectural restoration of the original (which is not available) I suggest that we read here that Codex D in its present form is a redactional text. *Alliance* is regularly translated "alliance" instead of "covenant." Otherwise the translation is remarkably free of Gallicisms.

Loyola University, Chicago

JOHN L. MCKENZIE, S.J.

MYTH AND REALITY IN THE OLD TESTAMENT. By Brevard S. Childs. *Studies in Biblical Theology* 27. Naperville, Ill.: Allenson, 1960. Pp. 112. \$2.00.

Rejecting what he calls the "broad" and "narrow" definitions of myth, of which the best known proponents are Bultmann and Gunkel respectively, Dr. Childs accepts the phenomenological definition. Myth is a form by which the existing structure of reality is understood, a tale of divine action in primeval time which established the present world-order. The maintenance of that order is due to the ritual actualization of the myth. The conflict of the OT with myth is exemplified by six passages: Gn 1:1-2; 3:1-5; 6:1-4; Ex 4:24-26; Is 11:6-9; 14:12-21. On the basis of his examination of those texts,

C. concludes that in dealing with mythical elements which had been taken into Israelite tradition, the *OT* authors utilized them to express their own understanding of reality, and in so doing they showed that sometimes they were in complete control of the mythical elements, sometimes they had assimilated them only imperfectly, at other times those elements were used as no more than symbol or illustration. C. then discusses the Hebrew concepts of time and space, and compares them with those of mythical thought. While questioning the view of Cullmann *et al.* that biblical time is linear, as opposed to the cyclical time of myth in which there is constant recurrence of the same events, and insisting that the Hebrews were concerned with the quality of time rather than with temporal succession, C. allows that the *Urzeit-Endzeit* pattern of the *OT*, which it shares with mythical thought, is radically different from that of myth, because the biblical *Endzeit* is not a mere return to *Urzeit* but involves an element of newness, so that the former, while partly the same as the latter, is yet profoundly different. "The reality which the myth wishes to maintain is understood by the Old Testament as part of the 'old age' and therefore transitory" (p. 83). Similarly in regard to the concept of space: the *OT* portrayal of Jerusalem has something in common with the mythical idea of space. In myth, space is distinguished by its quality, sacred space is filled with primeval power and is a copy of the primeval world structure, spaces which are similar are essentially identical. In the *OT*, Jerusalem is sacred because of its content, it is the "navel of the earth" (Ez 38:12), it is the copy of the heavens, it is the same as Eden. Yet the *OT* has broken the mythical pattern by placing the holiness of Jerusalem not in its identity with the primeval world structure but in its choice by Yahweh at the time of David. Moreover, Jerusalem and Eden, while compared, are not simply identified. What will appear in the *Endzeit* will be the new Jerusalem, not the old nor yet the primeval Eden. Finally, C. proposes the view that the reality expressed both in the concrete historical experiences of Israel as well as in the sagas, legends, and "broken myths" which the *OT* uses to express Israel's understanding of her existence is the "new Israel." By that he means obedient Israel, which was formed within the historical life of the Hebrew people (p. 103). The criterion by which the reality can be judged is Jesus Christ, who as "the truly obedient man . . . is the new existence in its fullest and most concrete form" (p. 104).

This interesting book, in which so much is well said, raises several questions. Does the phenomenological definition of myth cover all the instances of myth which C. gives? Specifically, is it applicable to Ex 4:24-26? The "aspect of world reality" which that text seeks to explain is infant circumcision, but, as C. admits, the event which is used to explain it is not some

primeval act but an event of the life of Moses. C. says that there the myth has been transformed into a saga (p. 63), but was it ever a myth as he defines that term? On the other hand, the text falls into one of the categories of myth accepted by Bultmann (cf. "Zum Problem der Entmythologisierung," *Kerygma und Mythos* 2 [Hamburg, 1952] 182, n. 2). What seems desirable is a definition of myth broader than any of those discussed by C.

It seems, too, that one must have reservations about C.'s treatment of biblical time. Granted that the *OT* is concerned with the quality of time, is linear time really a category which is foreign to the Bible? Can Cullmann's linear history be rightly called "a modern abstraction of time expressed in terms of space" (p. 75)? Conversely, the example of Hebrew usage which C. gives as evidence of the difference between Hebrew and "modern" thought on time (the past is what is ahead; the future is what follows) seems to involve a concept of time quite as "spatial" as Cullmann's. And in any case it is by no means distinctively Hebrew but quite "modern," as even Thorlief Boman has pointed out (cf. *Hebrew Thought Compared with Greek*, tr. J. Moreau [London, 1960] 149). In C.'s explanation of the way in which biblical time differs from mythical it is not at all clear that the *OT* does not know linear time. If there is something new in the *Endzeit* which makes it different from the *Urzeit*, and this lies in the future, can it be held that the *OT* does not conceive time as a line along which one progresses to a goal? But whatever the validity of these objections, C.'s work is a valuable contribution to a distinguished series.

St. Joseph's Seminary, Dunwoodie, N.Y.

MYLES M. BOURKE

LE PSAUTIER SELON JÉRÉMIE. By Pierre E. Bonnard. *Lectio divina* 26. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 281. 13.50 NF.

Scarcely anyone doubts the great influence of Jeremiah on the postexilic books of the Bible. M. Bonnard has set himself to a much more precise affirmation of the nature and extent of this influence in the book of Psalms. He has traced the influence of the book of Jeremiah in thirty-three Psalms; it is important to notice that it is the influence of the book of Jeremiah rather than of Jeremiah. In twenty-one of the Psalms the influence is an influence of spirit derived from the "confessions" of Jeremiah; in twelve others the influence is more purely literary. Besides these, B. finds that there are parallels to Jeremiah in thirty-one other passages of the Psalter.

B.'s method is to find parallels in vocabulary and in theme, and in the more intangible elements of spirit and feeling. From the data which he assembles he identifies the group of psalmists whom he calls disciples of Jere-

As a by-product of B.'s study, there is the thesis of the postexilic date of the Psalms in question. For most of these Psalms a postexilic date has been suggested by most critics, and there is no single Psalm which raises serious doubts. But it must be noticed here that most of the Psalms in question are Psalms of personal lamentation. The style of this *Gattung*, the most common in the Psalter, is fairly stable and is not of recent origin. There can be little doubt that Jeremiah himself often spoke in the style of the personal lamentation, which he did not create.

B. has produced a serious study of a great and significant spiritual movement in the religious history of Judaism which was an important step towards the *NT*. With some reservations in detail, the reader will be rewarded by a deeper insight into the causes and the effects of this movement.

Loyola University, Chicago

JOHN L. MCKENZIE, S.J.

SEVEN BOOKS OF WISDOM. By Roland E. Murphy, O.Carm. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1960. Pp. viii + 163. \$3.75.

This book surveys the wisdom literature of the *OT*. It is a "companion volume" to the CCD translation of the *OT* books traditionally classified as sapiential. To one who would read these books intelligently and fruitfully it offers the historical, literary, and exegetical conclusions of scientific study in a popular fashion.

Because most of the sapiential books are written in poetry, a preliminary chapter studies the devices that make Hebrew poetry, namely, parallelism and the literary form known as *mashal*.

The survey of Proverbs stresses the anthological character of the book, selects different proverbs to delimit the spirit and the teaching of the collections, and suggests the correct method of reading proverbs, singly and reflectively.

The cautious title to the presentation on the Psalms, "An Approach to the Psalms," indicates the limited nature of this survey. The analysis of the Psalms outlines the different literary types within the Psalter to help the reader understand the background, the life setting, in which the Psalms were born. The problem of relishing the content of the Psalter, it is suggested, will find a natural solution if they are prayed in the light of the *OT* ideas and beliefs of which the Psalms are a cross section.

Job is studied in its twofold stage of transmission. The original story in the prose of the prologue and epilogue became the framework for the poetic cycle of speeches which interrupt them. The literary problem of the distribution of the discourses, the method of Oriental argumentation, the traditional

Hebrew ideas behind the argumentation, and the relation of the speeches to one another are all discussed to throw light on the author's method of handling the traditional view of suffering as correlative with sin. The intention of the author is not defined. It is believed that he questioned the traditional view of suffering, although he did not reject it outright because he had nothing precise to replace it.

The Canticle of Canticles is presented as a collection of several songs. All the songs express the same mood. They sing of the love between the lover and his beloved. Their true background is a series of scenes taken from real life; they are wedding songs sung among the Israelites. As such, the primary objective of Ct is to defend and praise marital love as something noble and holy. The poems are expressed in prose form to help the beginner appreciate the now obscure imagery of the language of love among the Orientals. The deeper meaning attached to Ct as expressing the love between Yahweh and His people, Christ and His Church, is studied against its *OT* and *NT* background.

The history of the text and the origin of Sirach are traced. The autobiographical references are brought together to define the function of Israel's scribes. Themes from the book are selected for analysis to illustrate the compendious and anthological method. The long "Praise of the Fathers" is studied against its background to clarify its objectives and method.

The peculiar characteristics that make Qoheleth difficult to comprehend are set down and explained succinctly: the looseness of thought, the limited truth of some proverbs and the tentative character of others, the experimental approach. These features are shown to be at work in a number of the developments of thought selected from the book.

Wisdom is addressed to the kings of the earth. An interesting case is made in favor of understanding "kings" as referring to all Jews. The midrashic elements of the book are illustrated. The problem of belief in immortality in the *OT* is indicated, and the contribution of Wisdom in clarifying the belief is said to consist in this, that Wisdom specifies immortality as consisting in "union with God" in the future life. The parallel with Qumran belief on the same matter is indicated.

A final chapter indicates the complex nature of wisdom and discusses more in detail the texts which personify wisdom. The personification is considered to rest on a literary level. This is an attempt to portray the communication of divine wisdom to the world. The texts do not reveal but prepare for the revelation of the complete communication of divine wisdom in the Son of God. The history of the wisdom movement in Israel is sketched

and related to the better-known texts of wisdom among other Oriental nations.

The book is what it claims to be: a companion volume to a good translation of the wisdom books. The survey of the different books sets them in their proper background, outlines the teaching and method of each, and will give the reader those insights into theology intended by the sages of Israel.

*St. Charles Seminary
Cathagena, Ohio*

ROBERT T. SIEBENECK, C.P.P.S.

THE RESURRECTION: A BIBLICAL STUDY. By F. X. Durrwell, C.S.S.R. Translated by Rosemary Sheed. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1960. Pp. xxvi + 371. \$6.00.

When the first French edition of this important study of Christ's resurrection as a mystery of salvation appeared in 1950, it was received with enthusiasm by almost all the European reviewers. It has since run through several editions. The present, competent translation was made from the second French edition.

The author has attempted a synthesis of the *NT* data concerning the resurrection of Christ. In view of the tendency of theologians who have written treatises on *De Deo redemptore* to neglect the redemptive aspects of Christ's resurrection, this volume should be welcome, since it fills a long-felt need and does so in a thorough and solid manner. Each *NT* author in turn is called upon to give his testimony to the place of Christ's resurrection in the economy of salvation.

Chap. 1 shows how Christ's resurrection was regarded as possessing a salvific character by the Synoptic Evangelists, by the apostolic preachers, by John, Paul, Hebrews, and the author of 1 Peter. Chap. 2 delineates the redemptive function of Christ's resurrection in relation with His Incarnation and His death. The third chapter discusses Christ's resurrection as an outpouring of the Holy Spirit: in what sense Christ can be said to have been raised by the Spirit, and how His sacred humanity was transformed by the Spirit. The next two chapters define the effects of the resurrection in Christ Himself and in the birth of the Church.

Chap. 6 describes the nature of the new risen life of the Church in the risen Christ, with its various characteristics. Chap. 7 sets out the relationship between Christ's resurrection and His Parousia and its effects upon humanity. Chap. 8 enumerates the various means through which the paschal mystery is communicated: the apostles, the sacraments of baptism and the

Eucharist, faith, Christian effort, especially Christian suffering and Christian death. A final chapter is devoted to the consummation of the mystery of the resurrection in heaven.

This skeletal outline does scant justice to D.'s scholarship or to his eminently satisfactory method of investigation, which has resulted in a first-class monograph in *NT* biblical theology. However, even such a summary statement should provide some small hint of the riches which the book contains. It is the present reviewer's conviction, based upon several years' acquaintanceship with the French edition, that this theology of the resurrection cannot be recommended too highly.

Our special thanks are owing to Rosemary Sheed for giving the English-reading public an opportunity to profit by the fruits of D.'s work. And it is a great pleasure to reassure those who pick up this translation that the original has been faithfully rendered into idiomatic English. One can only wish that other important foreign books, which are appearing in such quantity these days in English versions, were as ably and readably translated as is this present volume.

Fr. Charles Davis, so well known to the readers of the *Clergy Review*, has written the Introduction to this English edition. Within the short compass of seven pages he has, in a masterly way, restored Christ's resurrection to its rightful place in Christian soteriology.

Regis College, Toronto

D. M. STANLEY, S.J.

LORDSHIP AND DISCIPLESHIP. By Eduard Schweizer. *Studies in Biblical Theology* 28. Naperville, Ill.: Allenson, 1960. Pp. 136. \$2.25.

For his starting point, Schweizer has chosen the notion of the "righteous one" as it was current in later Judaism. The righteous one voluntarily accepts humiliation by suffering and death in obedience to God. This suffering is very valuable as atonement for one's own sins or as vicarious atonement for those of others. As his reward, the righteous one is exalted by God, secretly here on earth, specially in the world to come. There he is seated in glory and acts as a judge and executioner. This exaltation can also be pictured physically as an assumption from the earth, as an ascent to heaven.

The starting point of all confession is Jesus Himself, His earthly life which ended in a humiliating death, and His resurrection which the Church understood as His exaltation to God. S. traces the development of this humiliation and exaltation in the *NT* books. He emphasizes the basic unity of the Christian belief, while he shows how it was proclaimed differently according to the

needs of different audiences, Jewish and Hellenistic. In the end, he concludes that we must do likewise: proclaim the gospel in our own terms.

Jesus calls disciples to follow Him about, sharing in His earthly lot of suffering and humiliation. With Him the disciples look forward to deliverance from the old world and entry into the kingdom of God. By sharing in His obedience, by which He voluntarily accepts His suffering, they share also in the promise of exaltation which He has received. Christ's death puts an end to this following Him about. But in Him the final, eschatological fulfilment of Israel's hope has been reached. The eschatological Israel is in Him. This is expressed by the figures of "vine" and "body" in John and in Paul. Jesus is now identified with His disciples. After His resurrection, the disciples emphasize the suffering of Christ and His exaltation to glory as decisive elements in His career. Thus Christ's death becomes a death "for us," a vicarious suffering.

In the exaltation of Jesus and its consequent "Lordship," there is continued the relationship of Master to disciple which Christ had towards His followers while He was on earth. Christ is Lord of His disciples. He is also Lord over their persecutors, and He guards and protects His disciples. His ultimate victory will be at the Parousia. The Jews considered that everything God has planned for the salvation of His people had long been present in heaven. This thinking is now applied to Jesus, and He becomes pre-existent. In Him God Himself meets us. The Church insists that He who was equal to God humbled Himself in order to call us and to take us with Him on His way. Everything depends on this.

Discipleship of Jesus is a gift of God. In the hope of sharing in the exaltation of Christ, the disciples now share in His earthly way of suffering. It now becomes apparent that glorification, oneness with the Father, can be experienced in the midst of suffering, just as Christ experienced it. This demands the disciple's faith. Faith in what happened in Christ's body brings inclusion in that body. Only through faith can the disciple know who Jesus is and experience His sharing in the glory of God. The disciple's witness while he walks in the way of Christ can bring others to participation in glory through suffering.

In tone, the book is essentially reverent. S. is sincerely engaged in the search for the relevance of Christian discipleship for modern man. The impression remains, however, that S. has constructed a system of redemption (for that is what this book really has done) by choosing from the *NT* what he needs to prove positions already taken. S. traces the development of lordship and discipleship through successive stages. But he isolates these stages

and makes them give him what he wants by downgrading passages which do not fit his presuppositions (cf. pp. 34, 36, 39, 50, 69, 94), or he simply considers texts which have a fuller content as belonging to later stages in the development (as Mk 10:45 on p. 50; Mk 14:62 on p. 39). Thus he manipulates the texts to prove his points.

There has been development of Christian doctrine, of course, but for S. this takes place by way of the community's own creative additions to the basically historical facts and not in the progressive realization by the early Church of what was given to it by God. S.'s view of the Church does not allow of official witnesses who would protect the deposit of faith from creative additions, so the development he outlines is possible for him. For a Catholic, the use of the analogy of faith as an exegetical tool would be an aid in avoiding the pitfall.

Lying behind S.'s work are some traditionally Protestant positions: Christ is not divine in the ontological sense; man cannot merit; there is no visible, organized Church. Joined to these positions are elements from recent exegetical thought: the concern to make Christianity relevant to fearful, aimless modern man; the attempt to disengage the gospel message from the clothing given it by earlier generations.

In the course of his work S. provides a number of exegetical insights, particularly into the concept of the "righteous one." But the book is more valuable for its picture of what Christ means to the contemporary non-Catholic theologian who seeks to make Jesus meaningful for men of this age.

St. Paul's College, Washington, D.C.

NEIL J. McELENNEY, C.S.P.

PAULINE MYSTICISM: CHRIST IN THE MYSTICAL TEACHING OF ST. PAUL. By Alfred Wikenhauser. Translated by Joseph Cunningham. New York: Herder and Herder, 1960. Pp. 256.

Some eighty years ago Heinrich Denifle lamented that "mysticism" could claim the dubious honor of being the vaguest and most poorly defined term in all theology. And the intervening years have not entirely eliminated that reproach. Wikenhauser does not avoid the difficulty; after briefly discussing it, he lays down his own definition. By the word he understands "that form of spirituality which strives after (or experiences) an immediate contact (or union) of the soul with God." The volume then studies the forms of expression by which Paul states this relation, the nature of the union, the means by which it is realized, and finally the specifically Christian character of Pauline mysticism.

In the first section W. concentrates on three phrases: "in Christ," "of

Christ," and "Christ in us." The first classical treatment of the subject came from A. Deissmann, *Die neutestamentliche Formel "in Christo Jesu"* (1892). He counted in the Pauline corpus 164 instances of this expression or its equivalent and concluded that in every case the words bear the meaning of closest union with Christ. W. disagrees but holds that a mystical sense underlies most of the instances.

The nature of this union is examined, and the phrase "in Christ" is found not to have a local or spatial meaning but rather a dynamic one. The faithful are experiencing a continuous outpouring of heavenly powers by Christ triumphant. They live entirely in this sphere of supernatural influences. They are therefore penetrated and surrounded by Christ.

Next comes the consideration of the means for effecting this union. This is not faith, for faith in this context signifies a total commitment to God, and faith does not effect the union. It is only by baptism that one is in Christ. As a result, all Christians are "in Christ," i.e., subject to His influence, whether they are conscious of it or not. Here arises the question of reconciling texts apparently contradictory: the imperatives and indicatives. They are told to put on the Lord Jesus Christ (Rom 13:14), and yet all who have been baptized in Christ have put on Christ (Gal 3:27). In this one detects the depth of Paul's understanding, in which he stresses the necessity for the Christian of striving after ever greater assimilation to Christ. And he who has given himself completely to the influence of Christ is a mystic in the highest sense. A concession is made to those who dislike applying the term "mystics" to all Christians. W. says that some prefer the term "fellowship with Christ," and he has no objection to that terminology.

In a final chapter W. clearly distinguishes Pauline mysticism from that of Oriental religions. Two distinctive features are mentioned: Paul carefully preserves the distinction between the person of Christ and the mystic, and in the Oriental religions one does not find an insistence upon striving for ethical conduct.

The work is intended primarily for specialists and contains an extended history of interpretation which may discourage the average reader by the list of unfamiliar names. It would be a pity if one were to turn away from the riches here contained. The presentation benefits not only the theologian but also one who wishes solid biblical spirituality.

Reviews of the second German edition (on which this translation was made) were generally favorable, as can be seen from the summary in *New Testament Abstracts* 2 (1957) 178r-79r, although P. Gaechter objected that W.'s idea of a dynamic union with Christ did not explain mysticism; for

every creature exists in dynamic union with the Creator without any mystical union having been effected.

An interesting advance was made in the problem by Fritz Neugebauer in *New Testament Studies* 4 (1957-58) 124-38, especially pp. 134-36. Confining his research to seven epistles which he considers authentic beyond doubt, the author finds that "in Christ" signifies what the Christians already are—the indicative—while "in the Lord" signifies what they ought to be—the imperative. Thus, Christians are one in Christ, but they ought to think the same in the Lord (Phil 4:2). The defect in previous studies has been to concentrate on the sense of the preposition "in" without giving sufficient attention to the theological content of "Christ," "Lord," and "Spirit." This latter term, "in the Spirit," represents the state of a mature Christian, of one who has reconciled in himself the indicative and the imperative.

Weston College

JOHN J. COLLINS, S.J.

THE TREASURE OF THE COPPER SCROLL: THE OPENING AND DECIPHERMENT OF THE MOST MYSTERIOUS OF THE DEAD SEA SCROLLS, A UNIQUE INVENTORY OF BURIED TREASURE. By John Marco Allegro. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1960. Pp. 191. \$4.95.

In the hope of finding further caves with manuscripts like those of Qumrān Cave 1, various archeological institutions in Jordanian Jerusalem mounted an expedition in March, 1952, to scour the cliffs which run parallel to the NW shore of the Dead Sea. The cliffs were explored for a distance of eight kilometers, and some 260 caves were searched, but ironically enough two of the most important caves to come to light so far were missed in that search, Cave 4 and Cave 11. However, one of the discoveries was Cave 3, which yielded among other fragments two sections of a copper scroll, which Allegro publishes here.

It will be recalled that the two parts of the scroll lay for a while in the Palestine Archaeological Museum in Jerusalem and that Prof. K. G. Kuhn, now of Heidelberg University, succeeded in reading some of the characters which showed through the dented reverse side of the outer layer of copper. He brilliantly concluded that it had to do with buried treasure (see *Revue biblique* 61 [1954] 193-205). This conclusion was confirmed when the copper scroll was finally cut open. A.'s book opens with the fascinating story of the discovery and the opening of the scroll by sawing it into twenty-three vertical sections in the College of Technology, Manchester, England, during the winter of 1955-56. Allegro was the only scroll scholar on the spot when the cutting was done, and he at once attempted the decipherment and transla-

tion of it. In June, 1956, the contents of the scroll were announced to the world from the Jerusalem scroll team, based on the provisional translation of J. T. Milik. It did indeed tell of buried treasure, listing quantities of gold and silver and precious vessels of incense and ointment and revealing where they could be found. The places of hiding were all located either in the Jordan valley, in the plateau and desert of Judah, in Jerusalem and its environs, or on sacred mountains.

A.'s book offers a hand-copied facsimile of the scroll, transcription (in Latin characters!), translation with notes, and several essays discussing the nature of the treasure, its hidings, and the hiding places.

The Foreword informs us that A. "was invited in the summer of 1957 to publish the text by the then Director of Antiquities of the Hashemite Kingdom of the Jordan, Dr. Ghuraibi. This invitation has since been renewed by his successors, Mr. Said Durra and Dr. 'Awni Dajani." This modest statement, however, conceals a conflict over the priority of right to publish the text. For J. T. Milik, who was the first to publish a translation of the copper scroll in French, prefaces it with the statement: "The three institutions which had conducted the exploration of the Qumrân cliff from the 10th to the 29th of March, 1952, the American School of Oriental Research in Jerusalem, the Palestine Archaeological Museum, and the Ecole Biblique et Archéologique of Jerusalem, entrusted me with the publication of this intriguing document" (*Revue biblique* 66 [1959] 322; cf. the statement of Prof. W. L. Reed, Director of the American School that year, in the *Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research* 135 [1954] 10, n. 4). This regrettable conflict of scroll scholars is now resulting in two independent publications of the same document: A.'s chatty discussion of it in the present volume (by which he will achieve the purpose of having his name connected with the scroll), and Milik's official presentation of it in Vol. 3 of the main series, *Discoveries in the Judaean Desert*, now being printed by the Clarendon Press, Oxford. An English translation, prepared by Milik, has also appeared in the *Annual of the Department of Antiquities of Jordan* 4-5 (1960) 137-55.

Milik's annotated French translation of the scroll appeared first in the *Revue biblique*, and a comparison of the work of the two scholars leaves no doubt that Milik's is more sound and serious. As usual, the edition of A. is fanciful and abounds in unfounded hypotheses. There are many problems connected with the decipherment, translation, and identification of this text, and it will undoubtedly be many years after the appearance of Milik's *editio princeps* before they are solved. But it must be pointed out that many of A.'s solutions are simply wrong. As an instance of the differences in translation which exist between his version and Milik's we cite the following:

In the sepulchral monument in the third course of stones:—light bars of gold.

Dans le monument funéraire de Ben-Rabbah le Šališien: 100 lingots d'or.

Here A. has failed to read a cipher for 100 correctly and comes up with the word *zll*, "light," in a form which is grammatically impossible. Moreover, A. reads as one word *bndbk*, "in the course of stones," which Milik deciphers as *bn-Rbh*, "Ben-Rabbah," adding in a footnote: "Toutefois, la dernière lettre du patronyme n'est certainement pas un *kaph* final" (p. 323).

This last problem brings up the difficulty which faces the reviewer of this book at the present time. Milik obviously published his French translation without photographs, facsimiles, or Hebrew transcription in an effort to offset the Allegro interpretation of the scroll. In the Allegro volume we have a facsimile of the scroll, made by M. Durra, the son of the former Director of Antiquities in Jordan, and not by A. himself. Unfortunately, aside from a few general pictures of the opened scroll, suitable photographs of the columns have not been included so that one might check the accuracy of the hand copy given. For this we must await the *editio princeps* in the Oxford publication. At present it is impossible to say who is reading line 5 correctly, A. with his *bndbk* or Milik with *bnrbh*. But the probabilities lie with Milik against A.

But the discrepancies affect not only the reading and translation of the text, but especially the identification of places mentioned in it and the general character of the document itself. Once again, one example must suffice. In I.1 we read of the "Vale of Achor."

ALLEGRO'S NOTE

Cf. It. 18; Jos 7^{24, 26} 15⁷ Hos 2¹⁷ Isa 65¹⁰; identified with mod. *Buqei'a* by M. Noth *ZDPV* 71 (1955) 42f.; cf. Cross and Milik, *BASOR* 142 (1956) 17 = *Solitudo Ruba* (*Vita Euthymii* PG 114, c. 620; Dalman *SSW* 95; *MRP* 12). . . . (p. 134)

MILIK'S NOTE (abbreviated)

. . . n'est pas la 'Vallée de Trouble' de l'époque du Fer, moderne el-Buqei'ah au sud-ouest de Jéricho, entre W. Mukellik et W. en-Nâr (M. Noth, *ZDPV.*, LXXI, 1955, pp. 42-55; F. M. Cross, Jr., et J. T. Milik, *BASOR.*, 142, avril 1956, pp. 5-17), mais une vallée que les traditions juive et chrétienne plaçaient au nord-est de Jéricho. . . . Il ne peut s'agir que de large Wady Nuwei'imah (pp. 331-32)

This reviewer is at present inclined to agree with Milik against Allegro.

Ever since the news broke that the scroll contained an account of buried

treasure, scholars have tended to regard it as a text belonging to the genre of Jewish folklore of the Roman period. Milik still persists in this opinion. He was seconded by many others (W. F. Albright, quoted in the *New York Times*, June 1, 1956, p. 21; S. Mowinckel, *Journal of Biblical Literature* 76 [1957] 261 ff.). But A. now pleads for the "realistic nature of the treasure concerned here" (p. 58). "It is a record of . . . deposits of sacred material, tithe and tithe vessels, as well as silver and gold and precious vessels, sanctified by dedication or actual use in God's service. The copper scroll and its copy (or copies) were intended to tell the Jewish survivors of the war then raging [with the Romans] where this sacred material lay buried, so that if any should be found, it would never be desecrated by profane use" (p. 62). And in his summary he says: "The copper scroll, then, is an inventory of sacred treasure hidden away by Zealots most probably during the spring of 68 A.D. The treasure, which comprises dedicated produce and its containers as well as gold and silver in coin and bullion, comes mostly from the Jerusalem Temple, but may also include the fruits of raids made upon settlements in the Judean desert, among them the Essene monastery of Qumrân" (p. 130).

But this interpretation of the character of the scroll is quite questionable. A. himself is aware of similar accounts of buried treasure, referring to some on pp. 56-58. Faced with such parallels, the scholar who would try to establish the "realistic nature" of the treasure would have the *onus probandi*. For this we look in vain in his account; all we get is "This seems to me . . ." (p. 62).

The hiding of the treasure and the composition of the scroll by Zealots in the spring of 68 A.D. also needs some proof. It has against it the fact that the script used in the text, if we can trust the facsimile, is really not like the abundant copies now known to us from the Qumrân caves. Milik (*op. cit.*, p. 322) prefers to date the scroll about 100 A.D., between the two revolts against the Romans. In this he is supported by W. F. Albright, who "is inclined to date [it] somewhere between cir. 70 and cir. 133 A.D." (*Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research* 159 [1960] 38). Moreover, even though the copper scroll was discovered in a cave of the Qumrân area, its connection with the Essene sect which inhabited that area up until 68 A.D. is not evident and still awaits proof.

We do not want to terminate this review without calling attention to one curious place name which has turned up in the document and which has some pertinence for Jn 5:3, "a pool called in Hebrew Bethesda, which has five porticoes." Though the NT MS tradition fluctuates about the spelling of the proper name, the two best spellings have always been recognized to be Bethesda and Bethzatha, with perhaps a little better evidence for the former. Bethesda was usually explained as "house of mercy," from *bêt hesdâ*. Its five

porticoes have been explained by the excavations on the property of the White Fathers at St. Anne's Church in Jerusalem; it was a double pool, more or less trapezoidal in shape, with the fifth portico dividing the pool in two, running perpendicular to the parallel sides. The copper scroll now tells us of treasure buried "at Beth Ešdatain, in the pool, there where one enters its small basin: a jar of aromatic *l'h* and [?]." From this it would seem that we have the Semitic form of Bethesda and a reference to the double pool itself; see Milik, *op. cit.*, p. 347. J. Jeremias has accepted this identification (see *Expository Times* 71 [1959-60] 227-28). A. admits the possibility of it but prefers another identification (p. 166).

A. writes well and the thesis which he presents is well formulated. It is unfortunate, however, that his amassing of etymological data is not more carefully assessed and that he is too prone to mingle with it hypotheses based more on fancy than on fact.

Woodstock College

JOSEPH A. FITZMYER, S.J.

NATURA UND DISPOSITIO: UNTERSUCHUNG ZUM NATURBEGRIFF UND ZUR DENKFORM TERTULLIANS. By Stephan Otto. *Münchener theologische Studien* 2, 19. Munich: Hueber, 1960. Pp. xxiii + 222. DM 18.—

With the exception of perhaps some half-dozen treatises, the critical text of Tertullian is now established, thanks in large measure to the efforts of such dedicated Dutch scholars as Borleffs, Waszink, Diercks, etc. The work of constructing a synthesis of Tertullian's thought, however, has hardly been begun. D'Alès' *La théologie de Tertullien*, though useful enough in its way and day, is hardly more than a synopsis of the contents of Tertullian's various treatises and is now long out of date. One may hope that the multiplication of such careful and competent analyses as the present study will prepare the way for the larger work of synthesis which remains to be done.

Dr. Otto has undertaken to give us an exact account of the meaning of the words *natura* and *dispositio* in Tertullian. In doing this he studies these concepts in the context of controversies and systems of thought which were current at the time Tertullian wrote, relates them to larger aspects of his theology, particularly to his views on the divine economy, and traces their influence in the later history of Christian dogma. O. is of the opinion that de Lubac, in the historical section of his *Surnaturel*, did not sufficiently attend to the problem of nature as this problem is treated in patristic theology before Augustine. The involvement of nature in the economy of salvation is a leading theme of Tertullian—as it is also of Irenaeus—and it is this subject which O. investigates most thoroughly in his study.

The book falls into two main divisions. In the first, O. examines the concept of *natura* in Tertullian. Though Tertullian never formally defines the term, it is clear that for him nature means the rational order of creation; *naturale* is the equivalent of *rationale*. Tertullian evolves his teaching on nature and the natural within the framework of Stoicism. The rationalistic monism of this system, however, is substantially modified by Tertullian's Christian belief in creation, while the Stoic ideal of *recte vivere* as meaning *secundum naturam vivere* becomes, in Tertullian's view of virtue and morality, the much higher ideal expressed in the words *incedere secundum lineamenta Christi*.

Quite the best section of this first part of the book is O.'s detailed examination of Tertullian's views on man's natural knowledge of God. This question is seen as part of the larger problem of truth in general and man's apprehension of truth, both natural and Christian. Tertullian considers that human nature is ordered to a knowledge of God and, ultimately, to faith in God. A mere natural knowledge of God and of truth may serve as the conclusion of a pagan's search, but for the believing Christian such knowledge is false. Faith is the proper final goal of man's cognitional nature. The problem of knowing truth and of knowing God are seen as problems which are involved in the problem of salvation-history, just as salvation-history is itself part of the divine economy. O. insists that Tertullian's views on man's knowledge of God have been seriously misunderstood by earlier writers (notably by Gasser at the Vatican Council) who failed to determine from Tertullian's own writings just what he meant by *natura* and *naturale*. In defect of such investigations it was inevitable that they should find in Tertullian a distinction between *cognitio naturalis Dei* and *cognitio supernaturalis* which is not truly representative of his thought.

In the second half of his book O. takes up the important concept of *dispositio* or *dispensatio*, the Greek *oikonomia*. This concept reveals Tertullian's basic theological orientation, and it is studied in relation to his views on an amazingly large number of other subjects: creation, redemption, man as the image and likeness of God, the cyclical versus the linear concept of time, evolution, the Logos, the natural and the supernatural. The analysis of Tertullian's teaching on the Logos is especially interesting and perceptive. The influence of Stoicism is evident in Tertullian's concept of *dispositio* through the Logos, yet his view of the Logos is not merely cosmological, as is that of Stoicism. Rather, the economy in which the Logos is unfolded is an economy of salvation; history is salvation-history, not just creation-history. Redemption is the continuation of a process which begins in world history with creation, and which goes back to the first unfolding of the divine substance in a

Trinity of Persons. The Incarnation is the culminating point in time of the divine economy. The plan of the world and the plan of salvation go together, and both are Christocentric.

The book suffers from a lack of unity, which is the result, at least in part, of an embarrassment of riches. One feels that there are too many statements of intent in the book, too many summaries and conclusions, and at the same time too little effort to relate the results obtained with the purposes stated. The purposes, however, are serious and the conclusions important. It is to be hoped that the book will receive the careful attention of scholars which it deserves.

West Baden College

WILLIAM P. LE SAINT, S.J.

THE CHRISTIAN PHILOSOPHY OF SAINT AUGUSTINE. By Etienne Gilson. Translated by L. E. M. Lynch. New York: Random House, 1960. Pp. xii + 398. \$7.50.

A GUIDE TO THE THOUGHT OF SAINT AUGUSTINE. By Eugène Portalié, S.J. Translated by Ralph J. Bastian, S.J. Chicago: Regnery, 1960. Pp. xxxvii + 428. \$6.50.

It was appropriate that these two major works, familiar for decades to students of St. Augustine, should appear almost simultaneously in English versions. Together with other recent translations (Guardini, Marrou) and some excellent original work in English (O'Meara), they serve to relieve a regrettable penury of first-class material in English. In their new dress they are an invitation to comparison and retrospect.

One is more impressed with the differences between them than with their similarities. P.'s essay first appeared (in the first volume of the *Dictionnaire de théologie catholique*) in 1902, G.'s in 1929 (with a second, revised edition, from which the present translation was made, in 1943; a third edition in 1949 apparently contained no significant further revisions). P. wrote in an atmosphere conditioned by rationalism (Harnack is the modern author whose name receives the most entries in the index to the present translation) and by the prodromes of the Modernist crisis, during which P. was to achieve prominence on the Catholic side before his death in 1909. G.'s volume, especially in its later edition, originated from a setting much freer from apologetic preoccupations and had the advantage of decades of further Augustinian research. P.'s essay, though personal in some respects, had to be tailored to fit a mold; G. was free to choose his own genre. P. was priest, religious, theologian, G. a layman and historian of philosophy. P.'s task was that of encyclopedia contributors generally: to impart information, to formu-

late acquired results, and to provide his readers with a basic chart which would diminish the likelihood of their getting lost on the vast sea of Augustine's writings and centuries of Augustinian tradition. G. was the historian of medieval thought who had experienced at first hand how much the Middle Ages, including St. Thomas, owed to Augustine, and who felt the need of a more thorough study of the stream at its source. If he also was offering a map for beginners, it was one that was both more demanding and more rewarding. P. was forced to be more comprehensive, less profound, less analytic. He had to list positions, give them a fair hearing, then say what he himself thought. He could do no more than outline his arguments, and could not amass and exegete texts in their support. G.'s basic method was to proceed by patient analysis of texts, copiously cited in Latin, with only an occasional and genial joust with those from whom he differed. P.'s achievement was one of completeness, organization, clarity, informativeness, stimulus; G.'s was that of initiating his readers into a familiarity with Augustine through a well-ordered and constantly nuanced pondering of expertly selected and skillfully interwoven passages. Both achievements were notable, and no scholar has been able to ignore either.

All of which might make the desirability of English translations seem obvious. But there are two intervening questions. Are the works designed for or at least suited to those who cannot read French? And are they still significant today, decades after their first appearance, or have they been replaced or superseded? The first question must be answered affirmatively in each case. Not only the professional, but the educated layman interested (as he should be) in the towering figure of Augustine, can profit greatly from both of these studies. The second question can also be affirmatively answered, unhesitatingly as far as G. is concerned. Nothing else quite like his volume exists, and since, as a meditation of texts, it achieves a relative independence of progress in research and is rich in insights, it will probably never be completely out of date. More hesitance is needed in the case of P. Not only much of its factual data, e.g., dating of works, but in some measure its perspectives, are now seen to be incorrect or inadequate. However, it has not, as a matter of fact, been replaced, least of all in English. For a single, comprehensive study from a theological point of view, nothing else can be recommended. Nor is the essay without valuable personal insights. In addition there are a number of classic Augustinian *quaestiones disputatae* on which P.'s is one of the prominent views, e.g., illumination, grace, and predestination, and many an undergraduate and seminarian will henceforth be grateful that he can consult this view in his own language.

There remains to say something of the present translations, with their

introductions, notes, and bibliographies. Fr. Bastian and his associates decided to present P.'s text as written, without supplementary or corrective footnotes. A seventeen-page introduction by Vernon J. Bourke, besides offering a brief sketch of Portalié, surveys some leading trends and publications of the past half century. This is supplemented by a select bibliography, which includes all the works cited by Portalié and other significant works which have since appeared. At least one other reviewer (Denis Faul, in *Furrow* 12 [1961] 137-38) has already signalized some of the shortcomings of introduction and bibliography (chronology, titles, and editions not successfully brought up to date), as well as the omission of corrective footnotes. The present reviewer would add that the *DTC* itself, in its *Tables générales*, provides an invaluable analytic index to the treatment given Augustine in all its volumes. Also, in speaking of recent work on Augustine's sources, the introduction should have mentioned Altaner's many articles on Augustine's acquaintance with individual Greek Fathers. The translation itself, judging from a sample examined, is well done, and the work is attractively presented in four parts totaling eighteen chapters, with analytical and proper-name indexes. Notes are placed at the end of the volume.

M. Gilson's work is well (and rather freely) translated. He himself contributes a brief foreword which replaces, without referring to, the even briefer preface of the original. Many readers would have appreciated some comments on how the researches of recent years have modified, if at all, his position on some key questions. The lengthy bibliography of the 1943 edition is reproduced, with the omission (not mentioned) of many titles and of G.'s own annotations and topical arrangement; it is brought up to date by the addition of numerous books and articles.

Woodstock College

THOMAS E. CLARKE, S.J.

THE RULE FOR NUNS OF ST. CAESARIUS OF ARLES: A TRANSLATION WITH A CRITICAL INTRODUCTION. By Mother Maria Caritas McCarthy, S.H.C.J. *Studies in Mediaeval History*, New Series 16. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1960. Pp. viii + 230. \$3.75.

A doctoral dissertation which keeps to its subject, which says admirably all that should be said, and which avoids nonpertinent pedantries is a joy to review. This solid study is the work of the recently appointed Instructor in History at Rosemont College; it reflects credit both upon her and upon her institution.

The text translated is that established by Dom Morin in *Florilegium patristicum* 34 (1933) and reproduced in 1942 in his *S. Caesarii opera omnia*

2, 101-24. Since the Latin is in general acceptance, Mother Caritas restricts her remarks on the state of the text (pp. 31-48) to a survey of the MSS and to a consideration of the style and wording of the *Rule*. The English translation is even, while a check of six random chapters shows it to be accurate. It employs the happy device of indicating by brackets the sources whence Caesarius drew his regulations. It is the Introduction (pp. 1-169), however, which forms the chief portion of the work. In orderly fashion it treats the setting, analysis, sources, and influence of the *Rule for Nuns*.

In the chapter entitled "Setting" (pp. 1-30), no one will question the space given Caesarius or that devoted to the status of convent life during the fifth and sixth centuries. Should the pages attending to the archeology of Arles be thought too detailed, the reader need only be reminded that the multiplied studies of Fernand Benoit, with their contention that the sixth-century Cathedral of Arles stood on what is now the Place de la République on the site of St. Trophime's, require discussion. Mother Caritas' rejection of Benoit's thesis in favor of the view that the Basilica of St. Stephen, which adjoined the nuns' convent at the site of the present Asile de s. Césaire in the southeast corner of the city walls, was Caesarius' cathedral seems sound to this reviewer, who has himself argued similarly.

A careful investigation of the cursus followed by the religious at the Divine Office appears in the section treating the analysis of the *Rule* (pp. 49-87). Here, too, the reader discovers the perceptive insights of a modern nun as to the values of cenobitic life. Yet it is in the unraveling of the sources of the *Rule* (pp. 88-153) that the undertaking found its most serious challenge. There is question not simply of the interrelationship of Caesarius' *Nuns' Rule* and his *Rule for Monks*, but of the ties of the former with the Lerins tradition (which involves the problem of the much-debated *Regula magistri*) and with the *Rule of St. Augustine*. With what attention these points have been sifted is shown by the recognition (p. 97) that a citation from the *Visio Pauli* appears as Scripture both in the *Nuns' Rule* and in the *Master*. To the selected bibliography on the *Regula magistri* may now be added studies published since Mother Caritas' book went to press: Gregorio Penco, *S. Benedicti Regula* (Florence, 1958) pp. xix-xxxi, and O. J. Zimmermann, "An Unsolved Problem: *The Rule of St. Benedict and The Rule of the Master*," *American Benedictine Review* 10 (1959) 86-106. Adherence (pp. 108, 113-14) to Dom Lambot's view that the Augustinian *Regula secunda* rather than the *Regula sororum* influenced Caesarius may be commended, as may the suggestion (pp. 93-94) that the *Nuns' Rule* is possibly indebted to the Gallican Eusebius. Through the kindness of Prof. Giet of Strasbourg, this reviewer has been privileged to study the unpublished dissertation of

the late Abbé Jean Leroy, *L'Oeuvre oratoire de s. Fauste de Riez: La Collection gallicane dite d'Eusèbe d'Emèse: Etude et texte critique* (2 vols.; Strasbourg, 1954). Both the Abbé and Prof. E. Griffe ("Les sermons de Fauste de Riez: La 'Collectio Gallicana' du Pseudo-Eusèbe," *Bulletin de littérature ecclésiastique* 61 [1960] 27-38) take the position "que ce *corpus* est l'oeuvre d'un auteur unique et que cet auteur ne peut être que Fauste de Riez."

The short chapter on the influence of the *Rule* (pp. 154-61) notes Dom Vandenbroucke's observation that the *Rule of St. Benedict*, in the section not common to the *Regula magistri*, may show some dependence upon Caesarius' *Rule for Nuns*. Still, Mother Caritas manifests caution: "the *Rule for Nuns*," she says, "had little direct influence beyond Merovingian Gaul." Even so, the inherent excellence of this *Rule* quite merits the scholarly concern it has here received.

Immaculate Conception Seminary
Darlington, N.J.

HENRY G. J. BECK

LE MIRACLE, SIGNE DE SALUT. By Louis Monden, S.J. *Museum Lessianum, section théologique* 54. Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1960. Pp. 328. 210 fr.

Miracles are very commonly discussed these days, and just as commonly misunderstood. Fr. Monden's work will help dispel much of the misunderstanding, for he has taken the miracle out of its restrictive use in apologetics and restored it to its rightful place in positive theology.

Originally printed in Flemish in 1958, this text has been updated and republished by the author in French, at the request of the renowned Bishop L. J. Suenens, who has added a few prefatory words. M. has divided the volume into halves. The first, and more valuable, considers the theology of the miracle. A miracle is a sign, intimately connected with revelation. This "sign aspect" is not merely in the eyes of the witness of the prodigy, a "mere act of human reason subsequent to the divine intervention, but it is the very sign-act of God intervening in nature to show us our salvation" (p. 42). It is not necessarily in the act itself, but can be manifested "in the person who performs the prodigy, in the religious circumstances surrounding the act, or in the very nature of the act itself" (p. 68). Yet, "since the image is necessarily foreign to and inadequate for a reality which escapes all presentation, this confers a polyvalence and a certain ambiguity which only the choice of man can penetrate" (p. 82); as a result, the miracle "acts primarily in a context of faith, where confidence in God is rock-solid" (p. 93). A miracle, then, is not some resounding prodigy to be used as a club to force conviction; it has its effect in the first instance upon the believer, where it "illuminates and nourishes the desire to know God; it deepens faith, hope, and

charity. And this function has two aspects: one towards the Incarnation, the other eschatological" (p. 97).

The second half of the work concerns the apologetical use of miracles. M. sums it up thus: "In the Catholic Church, and in it alone, we meet with facts called 'major miracles.' In their examination the positive sciences render valuable services; but the definitive judgment remains the decision of each responsible person. Finally, faced with the facts viewed in the context in which they occurred, no alternative is left to a religious man who is faithful to critical thinking than this: to recognize them as authentic divine signs and to open his heart to the message of the living God that they transmit to him" (p. 309).

In attempting to make this work definitive, M. has quoted extensively from sources as varied as councils and Mrs. Eddy. The bibliographical material alone would make the book essential for any forthcoming study in this field. He discusses the miracles of Christ and their theological implications, excludes from the category of major miracles many prodigies of ancient and modern days, treats even of *Father Malachy's Miracle* and dismisses it as not a miracle. This very eclecticism is at times distracting; for example, while treating of the intimate connection between true miracles and the revealing action of God, he simply refers to Christ's walking on the water as a problem in this context.

The work stands out as a valuable contribution towards a re-establishment of a theology of miracles. M. makes us see again the Johannine distinction between the mere physical seeing of prodigies, and the understanding—the "knowing" in the biblical sense—of the prodigy as a sign of a development in salvation-history. We understand miracles better after reading this book; we can see a little better why the miracles of Christ had a different effect upon the apostles (Jn 2:11) than upon the Pharisees (Lk 11:15). And we understand better why there are miracles today; for as "the miracles of Christ were signs of His redemptive presence among us, similarly the miracles in the Church are the visible sign of the firm presence of the Saviour who promised His Church "I shall be with you all days, even until the end of time."

St. Mary's Seminary, Baltimore

EUGENE I. VAN ANTWERP, S.S.

BEWUSSTSEIN UND WISSEN CHRISTI: EINE DOGMATISCHE STUDIE. By Engelbert Gutwenger, S.J. Innsbruck: Rauch, 1960. Pp. 200. S 96 [= \$3.70].

This latest contribution to the lively contemporary discussion of the psychological unity of Christ is distinctive in that it attempts a more thorough correlation of this problem with the older ones concerning the

human knowledge, freedom, and suffering of the God-man. The author is Professor of Fundamental Theology at the University of Innsbruck.

The first part is devoted to our Lord's human consciousness of His divinity. The first two chapters evaluate the leading opinions (Galtier, Parente, Xiberta, Diepen). The third chapter examines the "I-statements" of Jesus and concludes that they always designate His Person, hence His divine subsistence, never a merely psychological and created ego. The present reviewer found this basic chapter unconvincing. In arguing merely from the personal character of different classes of predicates to the absence of a psychological ego, G. seems to be moving from premise in logic to conclusion in psychology without adequate demonstration of the validity of the process. The next two chapters, by an application to Christ of the results of an analysis of ordinary men's experience of the self, bring us G.'s solution, which is not easy to grasp and even more difficult to summarize. The ego-experience of Christ on which His "I-statements" are built forms a harmonious unity, at once human (on the basis of a human "act-center") and divine (because of the Word who has assumed the human nature). But what precisely is it that finds expression in the "I" uttered by Christ? Not merely, G. answers, the human "act-center" (for it is not divinized by the hypostatic union), nor the Word alone (who is distinct from the human "act-center"). We must rather see the ego-experience of the human soul of Christ constituted by the experience-unity consisting of the human "act-center," the Word, the hypostatic imbeddedness of the human "act-center" in the Person of the Word, and the state of independence and distinction from all others which is part of the data of consciousness.

The second part turns to the older questions concerning the threefold human knowledge of Christ. It contains a few excellent historical surveys as well as some sharp critiques of the more common presentations, which, G. feels, are prone to accept a three-level stacking of the different kinds of human knowledge in the Saviour. His own solution has much in common with that of R. Haubst (see *Theologische Quartalschrift* 137 [1957] 385-412) and contains the following principal points. (1) With St. Bonaventure and the Franciscan tradition, Christ's knowledge, in the immediate vision of God, of all created actuals, past, present, and future, is affirmed to be of itself habitual, not actual. (2) This opinion, while it does not contradict the traditional doctrine of a relative omniscience in the human mind of Christ, still does better justice to the ignorance of Christ spoken of in the Gospel; in His earthly existence He never had actual human knowledge of the Day of Judgment, though He had habitual knowledge of it in His immediate vision

of all things in God. (3) The common conception of infused knowledge, present with habitual perfection from the beginning, embarrasses the humanity of Christ with a functionless ornament and is to be rejected. (4) However, there remains the necessity of a supernatural enlightenment, whose role is to transpose the knowledge of vision to the sphere of the conceptual and communicable, and to integrate such knowledge with the human experience of Christ.

With the main lines of his theory of the human knowledge of Christ drawn, G. turns in the third part to indicate its harmony with the exigencies of the human consciousness of divinity as established in the first part, and with the capacity for suffering and free choice enjoyed by Christ in His humanity. The first of these tasks is effected, G. feels, by insisting that our Lord's immediate vision of God was not a purely objective knowledge (here he differs from Galtier) but a conscious taking possession of the divine subject of the act. Jesus' human awareness of being the Son of God is thus an extension of the condition of hypostatic union to the peak of His human understanding as actuated in the vision of God. The key to reconciling the immediate vision with the fact of suffering and human freedom is, for G., to distinguish between the structure of such vision as had by Christ and as had by the blessed. In the latter the vision is beatific, bringing connatural love and joy. In Christ in His earthly life it was otherwise, for the condition of the subject of vision determines under what aspect God is seen. Were God to disclose Himself immediately to the damned, for example, this vision would be, because of their self-chosen state of alienation, a cause of extreme anguish. In somewhat the same fashion, the freely-embraced condition of kenosis of the Word Incarnate during His time of pilgrimage meant that in the garden and on the cross God appeared to Him not as beatifying but as offended and demanding satisfaction.

The final chapter, the longest in the book, is strikingly original in intent: to see if the psychic data regarding the conscious life of Jesus may not offer an inductive way, alternative to the traditionally deductive and metaphysical approach, for investigating the character of the hypostatic union. In other words, what must the hypostatic union be, in order to explain the essential psychic experience of Christ? Unfortunately, most of the chapter is given over to a historical and speculative treatment of the concept of person in its Christological implications; this is interesting enough in itself but yields little fruit for the author's declared purpose. The psychic and ontological are never clearly synthesized. In the historical development considerable attention is given to St. Thomas, who is interpreted, with O. Schweizer, as

holding a "pure union" theory, and, with M. D. Koster, as finding the unity of Christ in the unity of His divine personal existence, without prejudice, however, to a secondary, created existence.

This lengthy description of the contents of this rich work will have suggested that we have here a serious and comprehensive attempt at a unified theory on the inner life of Christ. Besides the essential positions noted above, G. has occasion to express some other interesting opinions. He suggests, for example, that by accepting a distinctive structure of divine consciousness proper to each of the Persons of the Trinity, and by insisting that the axiomatic community of divine operations *ad extra* does not extend to the quasi-formal influence of the Son on His humanity, we may find a basis for affirming a precisely filial quality in His human consciousness of divine personality. He also feels that it may be possible, without detriment to the divine perfection, to predicate a real, transcendental (or better, structural) relation of God to His creation, and a certain modification of the divine being by virtue of the free decree of creation. These examples will indicate that the author has, with due caution, done more than merely repeat well-used formulas in his attempt to throw light on a difficult complexus of problems. If no extensive critique is here offered, it is chiefly because certain parts of the work, especially those dealing with the analysis of consciousness, are still obscure to the present reviewer. It would seem that the second part is essentially coherent, overcomes difficulties which beset the more common conceptions of the human knowledge of Christ, and can stand independently of the first and third parts. These would appear to call for more clarification and amplification before they can be fruitfully judged. One might also ask if the analysis of the data of the Gospels, on which the author places great stress, takes sufficient account of the distance between the concerns of the inspired authors and those of the participants in the current discussion. In any case, G. has made a substantial contribution, especially by bringing together, like the proverbial scribe, new things and old.

Woodstock College

THOMAS E. CLARKE, S.J.

L'IDÉE DE LA ROYAUTÉ DU CHRIST AU MOYEN ÂGE. By Jean Leclercq, O.S.B. *Unam sanctam* 29. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959. Pp. 238. 1500 fr.

Dom Jean Leclercq is one of the most prolific and capable writers on monasticism in the Middle Ages. The present work fills in a chapter of the history of theology which is of considerable significance even today. It is largely made up of previously published articles and forms a dossier rather than a synthesis. It claims to be neither complete nor definitive. The period

studied runs from the beginning of the thirteenth century to the middle of the fifteenth. The problem of the Kingship of Christ had considerable repercussion on the medieval struggle between pope and emperor. The author's endeavor is to trace the doctrine rather in the quiet, steady manifestations of the ordinary magisterium than in the exaggerations of political utterance.

One of the difficulties in studying the medieval texts is to distinguish the essential principles of the tradition of the Church from the contingent ecclesiastical reactions of the times. The present work helps to make clear that such concrete and transitory realizations, which clothed the *christianitas* of those times, do not touch the immutable and eternal essence of the Church. The author is quite successful in separating the really traditional elements from the ephemeral aspects of the struggle for power.

The section on John of Paris is particularly worth while. It presents him as the first theologian to pose the question of the Kingship of Christ with the necessary precision for the orientation of the correct evolution of the doctrine. He showed how, even if Christ possessed temporal power, it does not follow that it has passed to the Church. He showed that the anointing of kings does not confer their power upon them nor does it modify intrinsically the nature of the power. It merely points out and manifests the man upon whom the power which comes from God is conferred by the people. L. considers that John of Paris goes beyond but does not betray the thought of Thomas Aquinas.

In the fourteenth century the development of the doctrine of the Kingship of Christ is remarkable for the exaggerated conclusions drawn by the contending parties from perfectly good premises, once the nature of the conclusion was decided beforehand by *parti pris*. Any weapon of logic, or rather illogic, which came to hand was used to reach the predetermined conclusion. Often both premises are irreproachable but both the *consequens* and the *consequentia* are ridiculously wide of the mark.

One of the benefits of this study is the illustration it affords of the law of the evolution of dogma, so often observed and lately singled out by Albert Mitterer, that the emergence of a dogma frequently owes much to the remorseless processes of historical fact. Only in retrospect, for example, can we see clearly how adventitious was the acquisition by the popes of temporal power over the *christianitas* after the collapse of the Roman Empire. It took all the long struggles of the Middle Ages and modern times right down to the loss of the Papal States in 1870 and the Vatican City settlement of 1929 to bring out in stark clarity the essentials of the Church's claims.

It may be allowed to express the hope that the increasing attention being paid to the teaching of John of Paris, so well presented by Dom Leclercq in

this and his other works, will eventually bear fruit as an important contribution to the clear, solid, eternally valid set of principles on the relationship between the spiritual and temporal powers.

Holy Redeemer College
Windsor, Ontario

GERARD OWENS, C.S.S.R.

AFTER NINE HUNDRED YEARS: THE BACKGROUND OF THE SCHISM BETWEEN THE EASTERN AND WESTERN CHURCHES. By Yves Congar, O.P. New York: Fordham Univ. Press, 1959. Pp. viii + 150. \$4.50.

In 1954, *Collection Irénikon* of the Chevetogne Abbey in Belgium published as a special offering a two-volume work called 1054-1954: *L'Eglise et les églises*. If not the most significant contribution to the collection, Fr. Congar's essay, *Neuf cent ans après*, was certainly among the more significant pieces. The Russian Center at Fordham University asked C. to expand the article somewhat, and the Superior of the Center, Paul Mailleux, S.J., had it translated into English. He also added a preface to the work. The result is the present volume.

The thesis of C. is that schism between East and West is not a simple, monolithic event. It did not begin with Caerularius nor did it become definitive by reason of his action. In a sense, it is not even yet a *fait accompli*. What is a fact is that the two Churches live in *accepted* estrangement, neither being deeply concerned with the life and work of the other. It is the acceptance of the estrangement rather than the estrangement itself which is significant. Actual estrangement often took place between East and West from the fourth century onwards, but it was not accepted as an abiding condition.

The author moves rapidly through history in a schematic way, as he himself says. He shows in outline the political, cultural, and ecclesiological dimensions of the estrangement. The chapter on the different ecclesiologies in East and West is highly valuable. C. sustains the position that East and West agree in substance on the nature of the Church. It is the mystical union between Christ and the believers. The Church through sacramental symbols sanctifies the faithful and makes them one in divine mystery. But accidentally the two Churches differed in their attitude to the totality of the mystery. The East was more prone to identify the Church with the local worshipping congregation which was empirically tangible, while the West conceived the Church in terms of its ecumenical unity maintained by a polity of central control. The primacy of old Rome was always recognized in the East, but it was not conceived as a Jurisdictional power of the bishop of

Rome. Rome was venerable as the church of Peter and Paul, center and symbol of the orthodox faith and life. Whatever earthly jurisdiction the heavenly Church needed, it was more or less in the power of the emperor.

C. in his final chapter indicates the road toward the overcoming of the estrangement. First, preparatory studies are needed which will explore the real content of the trite slogans of division. In the past such investigation has shown that the shibboleths were not really divisive. From such study understanding will come forth. Understanding will make mutual charity actual and dynamic.

Perhaps the noblest sentences in the book are the following: "Now, it is well known that, in accordance with one's feelings, one either looks for and finds a basis of agreement, or, on the other hand, tends to push differences into formal oppositions and thus soon contrasts become contraries. A mind entirely set on resistance and opposition does not *want* union; it not only does not seek or see the means, it does not even believe in the possibility of union and in fact does not even want that possibility" (p. 78). We have come to expect good things from C. This book comes up to expectations.

Woodstock College

GUSTAVE WEIGEL, S.J.

THE ENCOUNTER OF RELIGIONS: A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE WEST AND THE ORIENT, WITH AN ESSAY ON THE PRAYER OF JESUS. By Jacques-Albert Cottat. Translated by Pierre de Fontnouvelle with Evis McGrew. New York: Desclée, 1960. Pp. 159. \$3.50.

CHRISTIAN YOGA, By J.-M. Déchanet, O.S.B. Translated by Roland Hindmarsh. New York: Harper, 1960. Pp. vi + 196. \$3.75.

The two volumes here under review show a concern for encounter, though in quite diverse ways, with other religious traditions; and both conclude with a consideration of the prayer of Jesus, so familiar to the Byzantine Hesychast tradition, as it were an example of encounter already made between West and East. These volumes provide us with a guidepost and an instance of such encounter.

D.'s volume sprang from personal need and experience: the need of a monk to find that interior silence in which contemplation may grow, and the experience of finding it in an adaptation of the simplest of the Indian yogas. This need all of us have experienced or at least recognized in varying degrees. D. was particularly sensitive to it by reason of his long years of study of the twelfth-century Cistercian, William of St. Thierry, in whom there is constant reference to the needful harmony of sense, reason, and spirit in our ascent to God. How practically do we promote such harmony in ourselves?

For most of us the answer would be expressed in some such wise as this: Get enough sleep, enough exercise, proper diet, be regular in your physical presence at appointed duties, and the rest is a mental discipline of habits of attention. Yet, "In the East there exists a large group of thoroughly tested techniques that could be termed the way or path of silence. From distant times, sages in India have been teaching men to keep mastery over their thoughts, to control their psychic being, and to establish themselves in an atmosphere of relaxation and profound peace, far from everything 'noising' in man and around him; and all this has been achieved by means of a series of physical disciplines. Might we, of the West, not be able to profit from this authentic experience of theirs, and, keeping in mind the differences in temperament, culture and especially faith, might we not make use of their methods to find again the way to God—to a God from whom our civilization and technology, our habits and all the noise surrounding our daily routines have already cut us off, and threaten to divorce us irrevocably?" (p. 23).

It was this that D. first did in his own experience and in the present book proposes for the benefit of others. It was first necessary to distinguish the authentic traditions of yoga from that profane yoga of physical culturalists which currently has somewhat of a vogue in the West, then to dissociate the yogic techniques from their philosophical-religious matrix, in which they first grew and were perfected, in order to enmesh them in the universe of a creating and incarnate God. Then there follow descriptions (and line drawings) of the exercises and postures of repose, the discipline of breathing, and the accompanying mental discipline. Then silent meditation. The book is written with a sober enthusiasm, on the basis of the author's experience, full of practical advice and insistent on the constant orientation of the whole to prayer. By way of conclusion there are the solidly commendatory remarks of Fr. Régamey, of the review *Vie spirituelle*. We have here an instance of encounter, to be recognized above all by imitation.

What D. tries to make practically available to Western Christians, Dr. Cuttat regards as the great lesson of the Orient. He refers "to the exceptional powers of concentration of the Hindu contemplative. A product of the immemorial tradition of *Yoga*, concentration, i.e. mastery over the soul's natural tendency toward dispersion, has encouraged an unprecedented development of contemplative interiority" (p. 36). It is this contemplative interiority which, as a lodestone, draws Westerners, who have lost the silence of their interiority in the noise of technology and urbanization.

Yet this Hindu contemplative interiority is set in a metaphysical complex which is at variance with the Christian tradition, marked by the transcendence of the personal God of the Hebrews, who irrupted definitively into

history in the person of His Son, Jesus Christ. What, then, are the conditions of an encounter between these traditions, that will permit their real meeting without distortion of the true? In facing this question C. shows great acumen. The philosophical position from which he moves would seem to be somewhat personalist-phenomenological (cf. pp. 36, 146 f.); and rightly so in this matter. For if one should start from an essentialist position, it is difficult to do more than compare divergent concepts, already sundered from their matrix in the historically real. Yet, when one undertakes an encounter, it is first of all of persons, then of the traditions of which they are the bearers.

C. here sharply sets himself apart from those students of comparative religion who, on the one hand, would study the various religious traditions from without (*ab extra*), for the resultant study could not attain to the root of religion; or who, on the other hand, postulate the equivalence of all religions, for this presupposes that the student could occupy some extra-cosmical metaphysical locus (a place outside the Creator-creature polarity) from which to judge that all traditions equally lead to God. It remains, then, that in this matter of the encounter of religions each participant must be utterly faithful to his own particular religious tradition. In the meeting with the other there is not a question of tolerance, which often implies a certain disdain for the tolerated, but of a greater interiority and of love. Grace supposes nature; the Word of God enlightens every man that comes into the world. What, then, is the experience of the Hindu ascetic who disinterestedly strives for and attains what he calls nirvana? (cf. pp. 68 f., 36) It is worth noting that the approach here preconized is substantially the same as that expounded for the Christian ecumenical dialogue by the late Dom Clement Lialine in his article "On the Irenic Method" (*Eastern Churches Quarterly*, 1939) and by the Protestant theologian J. J. von Allmen (*Verbum caro*, 1960).

This interiorization is not, so to speak, a diaphanization of the historical and the concrete. On the contrary, for the Christian these have a supreme value, in that the Son of God took flesh from a Jewish maiden. Yet the heart of that enfleshment is the mystery of the encounter of the God of Abraham, of Isaac, and of Jacob, who is a burning fire, with the frailty of man, and so of each single man. The marked tendency to interiority of the East is joined with a sense of the Absolute, of the Sacred, as impersonal. The realization that the Absolute, the Sacred, is Person is proper to the Christian West. This came to us in our experience of Christ Jesus, perfect God, perfect man. Paul Henry has recently illustrated in an exquisite lecture the philosophical and theological repercussions of this revelation on St. Augustine's notion of person (*St. Augustine on Personality* [New York, 1960]). The major contrast,

antinomy, that C.'s considerations bring to light is that of interiority and transcendency. "For these antinomies to be fruitful, it is essential to distinguish without separating, so as to unite without confusing. This ability is a legacy of the hypostatic union" (p. 67). Such, far too baldly, is the structure of this essay. It must be read to appreciate the proper movement of the author's thought, the fulness of his reading, and the firmness of his rejection of any syncretism or "tolerantism."

The "Essay on the Prayer of Jesus" has a fuller and more significant title in its proper place: "The Hesychast Method of Prayer and Its Spiritual Significance in the Borderland between East and West." C. first lays the groundwork for his considerations in a section called "Analogy-Participation, the Metaphysical Basis of Hesychast Deification." In this he is largely dependent on Vladimir Lossky. What is discussed pertains to what others call philosophical anthropology, a matter central in Russian philosophy and in Western authors such as Guardini and Pieper. There follow two sections, one on the first phase of *theōsis*, which is ecstasy or "isolation" through interiorization; the other, on the second phase of *theōsis*, "received identity," which is the properly Christian component of Hesychasm. In a fourth section, after a summary of the conclusions from the preceding pages, he deals with the dangers and limits of the Hesychast method. The balance is distinctly favorable; for in Hesychasm he finds the "first attempt to integrate in God-made-Man all the essential features worn throughout the world by man's striving toward God," chiefly the interiority of the East and the absolute transcendency proper to the Judeo-Christian West. Hesychasm, then, is the way to follow "when, for the first time in history, East and West interpenetrate over the whole surface of the earth" (p. 153).

What is to be thought of this construction and of this recommendation? Clearly in so few pages all cannot have been said; much that has been said is based on secondary sources. For me, the fundamental difficulty lies in the use of the word Hesychasm. The title indicates that it stands for a method of prayer. Since the advent in the West of *The Way of a Russian Pilgrim*, there have doubtless been many who have adopted in varying degrees the prayer of Jesus, without thereby adopting the doctrinal complex in which it was first nurtured. There is nothing surprising in this. Hausherr has given many examples of the migration of spiritual doctrine from one theological allegiance to another ("Dogme et spiritualité," *RAM* 28 [1947] 3-37). But C.'s chapters of explanation are a synthetic exposition, largely indebted to Lossky, of Byzantine doctrine on deification. To what does Hesychasm refer? To the method of prayer or to such an elaborated doctrine? Of Lossky

C. is rightly critical (p. 141) when the former affirms that "the way of imitation of Christ is never practised in the spiritual life of the Eastern Church." But it would have been far more apt, on C.'s part, to refer to Hausherr's *ex professo* treatment of this matter (*Mélanges Cavallera* [Toulouse, 1948] pp. 231-59) than to a few lines of the *Dictionnaire de spiritualité*. Never once does C. face the problem of the relations of the Hesychast method of prayer, of the Palamite theology, and of the whole Byzantine theological tradition. He assumes they are of a piece; and, in a way, they are, but surely not so as to be interchangeable one with the other. I would suggest that C. has not sufficiently recognized the unilateral, even confessional, aspects of Lossky's exposition (cf. my review of L.'s *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church* in *Eastern Churches Quarterly* 12 [Autumn, 1958] 305-11). Is this to say that C.'s conclusion is without foundation? I do not think so; but the conclusion bears rather on the Byzantine tradition than on the Hesychast method of prayer. If the conclusion were truly to bear on the Hesychast method of prayer as such, a procedure after the manner of Déchanet with yoga would be indicated. Some six years ago there came into my hands a little study, *The Quintessence of Hinduism*, by H. U. Mascarenhas, Principal of the St. Sebastian Goan High School, Bombay. The Preface begins with these words: "It is not by mere accident that orthodox Hinduism has been studied in this little book from the orthodox Catholic point of view and that the net result has been a vindication of the meaning of *Catholic Hindu*." This priest was familiar only with the Latin theological tradition; it was obvious, however, throughout that had he been able to refer to the Byzantine tradition his "net result" would have been far more easily manifest. It would be of general advantage, then, if among Catholics the Byzantine theological tradition were to be greatly enhanced and practised.

Above all, these essays, in our days of a growing world community, show us the way of a world-wide encounter that would enable us Christians to be truly as wide as the Word and as utterly faithful as He. Mircea Eliade closes his recently translated book on the encounter between contemporary faiths and archaic realities (*Myths, Dreams and Mysteries* [Harper, 1960] pp. 244 f.) with this Hassidic apologue. The poor Rabbi Eisik of Cracow had a dream, in fact he dreamed three times that he should go to Prague and there find a great treasure. He decided to go. There, loitering at the bridge leading to the palace, he met a kind captain of the guards. The Rabbi explained himself. The captain laughed; he too had had a dream, but who would believe in such things? The dream had told him to go to Cracow to the house of Rabbi Eisik, son of Jelek; there in a neglected bin behind the stove he would

find a treasure. The Rabbi smiled and bowed with thanks. Back in his house at Cracow he found the treasure and was freed from difficulties for the rest of his days.

In meeting the other, in going beyond our own frontiers, we come to our own proper fullness.

St. Meinrad Archabbey
St. Meinrad, Indiana

POLYCARP SHERWOOD, O.S.B.

THE CHURCHES AND THE CHURCH: A STUDY OF ECUMENISM. By Bernard Leeming, S.J. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. x + 340. \$6.50.

Dr. W. A. Visser 't Hooft, General Secretary of the World Council of Churches, has written that "Roman Catholic writers, practically without exception, concentrate all their attention on issues of faith and order." He saw a disadvantage in this concentration: "the Roman Catholic ecumenists do not see the ecumenical movement as a whole and do not appreciate sufficiently that in the World Council matters of faith and order are discussed in the framework of a wider ecumenical process." Such a stricture cannot be urged against Bernard Leeming and his book, the outgrowth of the Lauriston Lectures at Edinburgh in 1957. To a rare spiritual sensibility and an impressive range of research, he brings an acute understanding of the complexities of the ecumenical movement: there are nearly as many citations from the *International Review of the Missions* as from the *Ecumenical Review*.

The book records the history of the movement for unity, arising first out of the needs of the missionary enterprise and fostered by an agonizing realization, in the face of denominational division, that Christ wills that His Church be one. The principal institutionalized forms of the movement are the World Council of Churches and the International Missionary Council, whose projected integration L. discusses with astuteness. The theological developments within the ecumenical community are surveyed as the superficial "doctrines divide, action unites" heritage of the Life and Work tradition is sloughed off, giving way to a preoccupation with the central question, "What is the Church?" Is it an abstraction or an entity, an idea (in the Platonic sense) or a fact in the historical order with a continuity in time? Is it the single verbal cover for the sum total of Christians, or is it a concrete society of restricted membership with definite jurisdiction and authority, or is it an inchoate group awaiting future events (whether beyond human history or in time) before defining itself adequately? The World Council is a forum for ecumenical discussions. L. sympathetically recounts the strains and stresses involved in confronting this central question and indicates the ambiguities

of the emerging agreement. Separate chapters survey the attitude of the ecumenical community toward Catholicism and that of the Catholic Church toward the ecumenical movement—material that should offer our separated brethren new insights helpful for an understanding even of their own organizational problems. The Catholic principles relative to ecumenicism are set forth in a final chapter with clarity and comprehensiveness. Appendices provide useful documentation, including the 1950 Toronto Declaration of the Central Committee essaying a description of the World Council and the Holy Office Instruction of 1950.

The book carries an imprimatur dated Dec. 28, 1959. It was not possible for the author to include, therefore, his own experiences as an observer at the Faith and Order Commission's meeting at St. Andrew's, Scotland, last summer, where the Central Committee agreed to propose a Trinitarian formula for inclusion in the World Council's basis. More surprising is the absence of mention of the Catholic Commission on Ecumenical Questions, and even of the name of its secretary, Msgr. J. G. M. Willebrands, now assisting Cardinal Bea in the coming Vatican Council's Secretariat for Relations with Non-Catholics. It is noteworthy that the author is actively sympathetic to the Church of South India scheme and the proposed merger of the Anglican and Presbyterian Churches in Great Britain. He displays no fear that basic theological considerations may be short-circuited in the interest of organizational unity, seeming persuaded that there is an approximate theological consensus among these non-Catholic groups and that after common action based upon general agreement in a wide belief people will be able to grasp many specific truths which in separation they cannot grasp.

Although L.'s major focus is inevitably on British concerns, his book will be immensely useful for all Christians.

Institute of Social Order
St. Louis, Mo.

EDWARD DUFF, S.J.

REVOLUTION AND PAPACY, 1769–1846. By E. E. Y. Hales. Garden City, N.Y.: Hanover House, 1960. Pp. 320. \$4.50.

This is a well-written and interesting book. Although its theme is the relation of the papacy to the several revolutions that agitated Europe between 1789 and 1846, the author justifies his starting with the pontificate of Clement XIV on the score that "that Pope's suppression of the Jesuits may be taken, as Ranke took it, to mark the first major retreat of the papacy before the Enlightenment which preceded the Revolution" (p. 7). To provide a setting for his study, Hales analyzes the climate of opinion in 1769, with

particular attention to the status of religion both in and out of the Church. In active opposition to the papacy were deism, naturalism, rationalism, those opposed to the Jesuits, Gallicanism, Jansenism, Josephism, and Febronianism; and some members of this unholy confederation indulged in criticism of the papacy as an institution, as well as its practices, claims, and tenets.

After a brief account of the conclave that elected Clement XIV, and the steps that led to the suppression of the Jesuits, H. comments on the paradox that the non-Catholic sovereigns of Prussia and Russia opposed the papal decree and patronized the Jesuits in their respective realms. Under Pius VI papal anxiety grew over the hostility of the French Assembly revealed in the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, and the gradual penetration of revolution ideas into Italy and Rome itself, prelude to the deportation of Pius to Valence as prisoner. The real crisis, however, came under Pius VII in the issue of the Concordat, and incontrovertible proofs of Napoleon's double-dealing. For after Consalvi had agreed to one version of that document, a changed version was presented to him for his signature; and when the Concordat was officially published in France, Napoleon arbitrarily and unilaterally appended the Seventy-seven Organic Articles as part of the Concordat. This duplicity continued in the incident of Napoleon's coronation, his introduction of a new catechism and new feasts for France, his encroachments on papal territory, the occupation of Rome and abolition of the Papal States, and the arrest and imprisonment of Pius VII and of Cardinal Paca, the papal Secretary of State. While the Pope was critically ill and was deprived of counselors, and even of paper and pen so as to preclude all correspondence, Napoleon utilized Cardinal Fesch and some subservient cardinals and prelates to effect his purposes; and he compounded his perfidy by publishing as another concordat some proposals of a mere provisional character which the beleaguered Pontiff had agreed to as a basis for negotiations. Only Waterloo ended Napoleon's persecution of his helpless hostage.

At the Congress of Vienna, Consalvi, now restored to office as papal Secretary of State, strove for full restoration of the Papal States and recognition of the independence and neutrality of the Pope and his territory. Success in achieving the first of these objectives, as H. points out, would involve the papacy in a host of problems of a purely political character. Should reconstruction be in accord with the wishes of the standpat conservatives who demanded a return to the *status quo ante* or of the progressives who wanted changes compatible with the times? H. insists that the problem of the civil government of the Papal States was never solved, and that it proved a mill-

stone around the neck of the Popes. In confirmation he cites the sharp criticism of Archbishop Mastai-Ferretti, the future Pius IX, of the bureaucracy, fiscal policy, accounting, courts, police, military, reliance on French and Austrian arms, and the preoccupation of ecclesiastics with purely secular matters.

Nevertheless, Gregory XVI acted on the conviction that the Papal States differed in character from the ordinary civil polities and that they must be preserved intact in area and jurisdiction. Hence his support of legitimist sovereigns and governments; for if he approved democratic movements, for example in Belgium and Poland, such approval would eventually encourage similar movements in the Papal States, with consequent infringement on the pope's rights and powers.

In this book a number of facts stand out: the perfidy and tyranny of Napoleon, in contrast to the heroism and steadfastness of Pius VI and Pius VII; the ability and loyalty of Cardinals Consalvi and Paca, in contrast to the disloyalty and subservience of Cardinal Fesch and other ecclesiastics. While little that is altogether new is added to our knowledge by this study, it is nevertheless a very satisfactory résumé of events and appraisal of characters. One senses that the author is thoroughly conversant with the period, the subject, and the persons, and writes with ease and authority. Footnotes are adequate, and four appendixes serve as guides for reference. An excellent map, one easy to read, helps the reader to follow developments. Though it is mentioned, we believe that H. minimizes the fact that in so many cases political liberalism was associated, even identified, with not only religious liberalism but also utter indifference to religion and complete disbelief. A very minor error of fact is that August 7, the date of the papal restoration of the Society of Jesus, is not the feast of St. Ignatius, founder of the Jesuits, but the octave of that feast.

West Baden College

CHARLES H. METZGER, S.J.

FUNDAMENTALS OF THE LITURGY. By John H. Miller, C.S.C. Notre Dame, Ind.: Fides, 1960, Pp. xvii + 531. \$6.00.

It must be very difficult to write a book which covers the whole subject of liturgy, for there are so many ways of approaching it. Theological, biblical, historical, juridic, ascetic, and even artistic aspects must all be considered; each must be set forth in due proportion and in a connected manner; theory and practice must go hand in hand; discussion must range over the whole field of the Mass, the sacraments, the Office, the liturgical year, and the

sacramentals. A daunting task indeed. We must be grateful to Fr. Miller for having had the courage to attempt it, and congratulate him on the success wherewith he has accomplished it.

Different people, of course, will measure M.'s success according to different criteria. Some may think that he has given too much attention to historical and juridic aspects, and not enough to the theological and biblical. Personally, I think his judgment of the balance required is about right in view of the avowed purpose of his book: to "lay a solid foundation for the seminarian, the religious and the lay apostle who is learning the tools of his sacred trade." He is, perhaps, unduly optimistic if he thinks that many lay apostles will seriously study a book so ample; but among seminarians and religious—indeed, among priests of all kinds who are not specialists—he ought to have a great following. For their purposes his book could hardly be bettered. Even those who are now specialists, or who hope to specialize in the future, would find the book of value, for specialization always carries with it the danger of limited vision. This book gives a very wide survey of the whole field, and it is a survey that is by no means superficial, for it is based on extensive reading. One gets the impression that M.'s scholarship is very thorough, absolutely sound, and completely up-to-date. He writes in good style and in an interesting way, and he constantly shows concern for the pastoral value of the liturgy, rather than for knowledge just for its own sake. When presenting facts (which he does with admirable clarity), he seldom omits to add some comment, however short, which shows their bearing on the apostolate. He assesses them, if only by a sentence or a qualifying clause, as being helps or hindrances to men in their approach to God.

M. is well up in all the "questions of the day" and expounds clearly not only the precise point at issue but also the main arguments adduced in support of conflicting views. This he does very fairly, and when he lets the reader see which view he himself favors, he does so with moderation and with courtesy towards opponents.

He gives useful guidance when he exposes some misunderstandings which are by no means uncommon. As an example, take the explanations sometimes to be found in devotional books and popular articles about the Offertory of the Mass. Not infrequently this is interpreted as an actual offering of gifts to God. M. rightly points out that this is not so. Even when the prayers speak of offering to God, their phrases are to be understood as having an anticipatory sense. They do not constitute the real offering but only look forward to that offering which takes place at the consecration. Moreover, "it is not bread and wine which are sacrificed, but the Body and Blood of Christ." The essence of the offertory rite is not offering; it is the making ready of the

remote matter for sacrifice, the setting upon the altar of the material elements destined to be used in sacrifice. There is danger in laying much emphasis on merely incidental prayers which "in some cases have led to a blurring of the essential lines of the rite and to error as to its true nature. Specifically, the prayers recited by the celebrant as he raises the bread and wine, prayers originally intended only for him and no one else, have led some to think that the Church is truly offering at this moment. But we cannot say more than that the Church is here preparing for the real offering, both by arranging the remote matter on the altar, and by instilling sentiments of self-offering into the hearts of those who participate" (p. 269).

The history of the Divine Office is extraordinarily complicated, and I am inclined to think that M. has attempted to pack rather too much of it into his chapter on the subject. A number of the details he gives would be in place in some other book dealing *ex professo* with the Office alone, but here they make his chapter into difficult reading. However, interest returns when he comes to discuss projected reforms. He sees the main cause of our present troubles in past attempts to compromise between papal, episcopal, parochial, and monastic worship. The remedy, therefore, must lie in a frank and bold recognition that secular priests are not monks. The rhythm and the proportion of prayer and work in the two states of life is quite different, and this should be reflected in a form of Office truly suited to each. In arguing thus, M. has, in fact, enunciated a principle which surely ought to apply throughout the entire field of liturgy. How many pastoral problems would be solved if we had, for use in parishes, a really simple and crystal-clear basic Mass-form to which embellishments could be added for monasteries and cathedrals, but for them alone!

The book ends with a bibliography which is ample, and yet not so enormous as to be frightening; and the index, as tested by a few "spot searches," seems to work well and lead one with the minimum of trouble to the information sought.

St. Gabriel's, Birmingham, England

CLIFFORD HOWELL, S.J.

LITURGISCHES ERBE UND PASTORALE GEGENWART. By J. A. Jungmann, S.J. Innsbruck: Tyrolia, 1960. Pp. 560.

This is a collection of J.'s conferences and studies previously published in various periodicals. Conclusions of more recent scholarship have been added, and often, to avoid repetition, the original text has been abbreviated. Five of these studies have already been made available to the American public.

The first essay has to do with the influence of the anti-Arian struggle on the reconstruction of religious culture in the Early Middle Ages. The con-

trast between the early- and late-medieval Church is obvious. On the one hand, we have communal participation in the liturgy, a closeness of the faithful to the unfolding ritual of the altar, a liturgical feast always dominated by the paschal theme, Christian art of an eschatological tone; on the other hand, we see a people deprived of participation and fed with allegorical interpretations of the ritual, a Christmas cycle competing with the paschal, and an art turning its attention away from the salvation-history perspective to a merely historical representation, putting the crucified in the place of the glorified Christ, imprinting on everything the age's speculative theological bent. The differences can be multiplied. The cause? According to J., it was basically the West's anti-Arian Christology.

In another study on the character of the weekly cycle, J. claims that its formation ran in a somewhat parallel way to that of the annual cycle. However, unlike the paschal redemptive theme, the Christmas themes never did succeed in implanting themselves in the weekly cycle. Weekdays dedicated to the Persons of the Trinity, Mary, and the saints can be found already in the tenth century, while towards the end of the Middle Ages concern for personal salvation and sanctification comes to the foreground and dictates the themes.

Several sections deal with aspects of the Divine Office. His conclusions in summary form: J. feels that the old Easter Vigil type of night hour did not form the basis for the formation of Matins; rather it was the ancient custom of praying privately at night in the home which was eventually raised to the dignity of public prayer. Psalmody in the Office he considers only as an introduction, while the rest, beginning with the capitulum, is the chief part of the hours. He expresses the hope that in the future reform of the breviary the readings will once more be given the predominance they once had over the psalmody.

Other studies are concerned with the theme of the post-Epiphany Sundays, watching at the Lord's tomb as the origin of the Forty Hours devotion, the presence of penitential themes in some of the Pentecost weekday Masses, J. Pascher's thesis that the basic form of the Mass is the meal-symbol, the history and meaning behind the practice of the fermentum in the Roman Mass, the fundamental idea behind the veneration of the Sacred Heart in the Church's prayer, and several interesting pastoral topics.

We cannot hope to appraise all the riches of this book here; it is far too diverse. But we are grateful that the wealth which was once scattered is now assembled in one volume.

LA LOI DU CHRIST: THÉOLOGIE MORALE À L'INTENTION DES PRÊTRES ET DES LAÏCS 3: LA VIE EN COMMUNION FRATERNELLE. By Bernhard Häring, C.S.S.R. Tournai: Desclée, 1959. Pp. 773.

This volume completes the French translation of what has already become a classic essay in the recasting of moral theology. The general characteristics of the work have been discussed in *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES* 21 (1960) 157-59.

The originality and general excellence of Häring's innovations should not be permitted to obscure the very appreciable contributions made by his French Redemptorist translators—or better, revisers—F. Bourdeau, A. Danet, and L. Vereecke. In the preface to the present volume, the author acknowledges and approves their initiatives, and indicates that the fifth German edition has profited from revisions introduced by them in this French translation.

The first two volumes covered general moral, the theological virtues, and the virtue of religion. The third covers fraternal charity and the commandments of the second tablet of the decalogue—presented, in German, as so many areas for the service of love, and in the French as so many areas for exchange and communion among men. This slight change of viewpoint is typical of the ways in which the revisers have made the material of the commandments more evidently relevant to the life of love. But at the same time they have obscured in this volume a principal characteristic of Häring's book: the emphasis upon the call of Christ and the response of the disciple in responsible action. The relative dimming of this perspective was the price of greater clarity, smoothness, and naturalness.

Again, the French revisers have abandoned the decalogue order—one of the devices that echoed Häring's theme of call-answer, command-response. They have thereby made possible a more dramatic and effective presentation of what, in their revision, has become the most distinctive chapter of this volume. Häring's work had concluded with the traditional material of the eighth commandment, augmented by a treatment—generally lacking in non-German works—of the sense of honor. The revisers have moved the treatise up front and further augmented it. The result is a chapter which at once serves as a bridge between the duties directly of charity and the various more corporeal "mediations" of charity, and at the same time calls attention to several ethical questions too often overlooked or insufficiently emphasized. This chapter, "Spiritual Exchanges—Communion in Truth and Beauty," subdivides into three parts: (1) Truth-veracity-faithfulness; (2) Beauty-art-honor; (3) The media of diffusion and communion of persons in truth and beauty. The appropriateness to a systematic moral theology of the materials that are new in this chapter is beyond question—especially the

fundamental questions of pursuit of knowledge and regard for beauty. And it is the careful consideration of these fundamental questions that lifts the more practical discussion of entertainment media and communications media above the level of scandal and occasions of sin.

In the introduction of these and other unfamiliar subjects, and in the general plan of the work, an excellent sense of proportion is manifest. This is not always true of the casuistry, which is sometimes surprisingly detailed but at others omits such important topics as taxation, military service, and the "pessary case." Occasionally, basic theoretical questions get lost sight of and a casuistic answer is given, based on contemporary incomplete scientific data; for instance, Can overpopulation be a reason for periodic continence (pp. 469-70)? May some form of psychosurgery be justified simply as an analgesic (pp. 348-49)?

H.'s readiness not only to experiment and recast his own work, but to admit others to a share in his experiment, gives us reason to expect that this work will occupy an ever more important place in the education of priests and laity.

Menninger Foundation, Topeka, Kansas

ROBERT J. KELLY, S.J.

MORALITY AND MODERN WARFARE: THE STATE OF THE QUESTION. Edited by William J. Nagle. Baltimore: Helicon, 1960. Pp. 168. \$3.95.

ATOMARE KAMPFMITTEL UND CHRISTLICHE ETHIK: DISKUSSIONSBEITRÄGE DEUTSCHER KATHOLIKEN. By Rudolf Fleischmann *et al.* Munich: Kösel, 1960. Pp. 196.

In matters moral a danger exists of trying to thrust reality into a pre-fabricated mold. A set of moral rules, constructed to govern an earlier situation, is applied uncritically to a present one that is similar. Such a tactical error would obviously be made were one to invoke, when ICBMs are first detected fifteen minutes away, the rule: recourse to the sword is justified only after all peaceful means, notably arbitration, have failed. The true moralist constantly re-examines the applicability of his tools to the task at hand. Further, the more noble the human values involved, the more intense is the effort expended. The more complex the situation and the more social its impact, the more urgent is a multilateral approach by a plurality of minds.

Such a situation is modern warfare. It presents mankind with an unprecedented possibility: the extinction of the race. Never before has man had it in his power to extinguish his kind from the face of the earth. Even the alternative of limited warfare waged with weapons of restricted lethal effect

offers the prospect of the destruction of whole cities and their people. It is with both these dreadful possibilities that these two books come to grips. Neither presumes to be a definitive solution of this dilemma of mankind. Each is modestly content to be just a participant in the public debate on nuclear warfare.

Morality and Modern Warfare is a symposium. Eight experts speak their minds, each in the area of his particular competence. The political scientist, moral theologians, the military analyst, the sociologist, the atomic authority and the jurist, all take articulate part. All are Catholics. Though speaking from divergent viewpoints and backgrounds, certain undisputed conclusions emerge from their discussion: technological progress has rushed ahead heedless of the purposes it must serve, military planning has ignored the very values it is supposed to preserve, moral analysis must re-examine the changing situation, and ultimately war itself must be outlawed by international authority. Each contributor to the symposium is conversant with what the others have written. For this measure of unity, difficult in the panel-of-experts form of book, the editor deserves credit. He has made available for the first time a collaborative Catholic contribution to the public discussion. The work is suited alike to the general reader and to the fashioners of public policy. An excellent, detailed bibliography enhances the volume.

Atomare Kampfmittel opens with a scientific exposition of the nature and effects of nuclear weapons; it is an interpretation, intelligible to the layman, of the physical and biological facts of atomic fission harnessed for war. Upon this empiric substratum nine authorities in philosophy, theology, and law build their theories, weighing the evidence for and against nuclear rearmament and warfare. All come to the conclusion, with differing nuance and degree of certainty, that it is unethical. Indeed, the book was conceived by the publisher as an answer to certain participants in the current German debate among Catholics on this subject. These spokesmen advocate an end to public discussion and a consensus of the people with the declared Bundestag policy on atomic rearmament. The service of the publisher to informed and viable democracy is evident. Though born from this polemic matrix, the volume achieves an unexpected degree of detachment and objectivity.

To compare the two works one might use a cliché: the American publication is long on fact, short on theory, while the German is the opposite. This would express an element of truth but would err by oversimplification. It is fairer to say that the two complement each other. *Modern Warfare* is rich in the details pertinent to the political, military, and technological areas. The facts, their implications, the respective purposes in each of

these areas must be painstakingly searched out and reported as an indispensable preliminary to any discussion of public policy regarding nuclear war. Otherwise policy courts the risk of unreality. This broad empiric base is somewhat lacking in *Atomare Kampfmittel*. Yet the latter book does present the sheer physics and biology with a thoroughness not found in its American counterpart.

The complementarity exists too on the theoretical level. The German work is more philosophical and theological. At least, a greater portion of the book stays on this plane. For example, the thought of Heidegger and Jaspers is blended into the traditional philosophico-theological treatment. Subjected to a more critical scrutiny is the requirement that the values realized by war be proportionate to the values sacrificed. The choice is not simply between a nation's liberty and culture on the one hand and Communist domination and loss of freedom on the other. Even under the Red heel some freedom to live and love remains with a hope of ultimate amelioration. Witness Poland. This is not to imply that *Modern Warfare* is devoid of depth. Indeed, it gives an interpretation of the teaching of Pius XII such as is not to be found in the German work.

Finally, the two books differ sharply on a question of fact prerequisite to moral judgment. Can nuclear warfare be limited? The predominant German answer is a reasoned *nein*. Though weapons be reduced in potency, what assurance is there that the number of atomic bombs hurled in war, the targets they are dropped upon, and the long-range fall-out can be effectually contained within political and moral limits? The nature of fissionable matter and the obliteration bombing of World War II point to a negative conclusion. The American view, though not a monolithic one, sees a defeatist attitude behind this answer. To hold that nuclear war cannot be limited is to hold determinism in the political arena. Man is still free and possessed of reason. Let us be on with the urgent task of convincing him of the absolute necessity of limitation. Both views are legitimate and deserve a hearing.

Each of these books is evidence of articulate Catholic expression of opinion, long overdue, on a problem that clamors for solution. The question needs more light of the same brilliance that these two works shed.

Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y.

ROBERT H. SPRINGER, S.J.

NORTHERN PARISH: A SOCIOLOGICAL AND PASTORAL STUDY. By Joseph B. Schuyler, S.J. Chicago: Loyola Univ. Press, 1960. Pp. xxi + 360. \$8.00.

Every book deserves to be reviewed within the context of the author's stated goals. In *Northern Parish*, Fr. Schuyler has rewritten his doctoral

dissertation for sociologists and for priests and laity active in the apostolate, admitting that the former are frequently novices in pastoral matters and the latter usually somewhat impatient with the social-science approach—no small understatement of the situation. For these reasons S. has risked criticism from both categories of readers. But at the same time both audiences may profit from this publication.

Some of the first six chapters of the original dissertation have been condensed into footnotes in the first part of the book and merit the attention of social scientists. S. should also be commended for his extensive use of colored figures and numerous tables. Preparation of parishioners for the study, efforts to train the census takers, and their apparent diligence were outstanding and will prove fruitful for future researchers.

But some sociologists will question certain aspects of the methodology. Objective sociological research into any kind of human behavior will reveal some bright spots and some dark spots. It should not concentrate on either but describe and analyze both as part of the investigation. This is most easily done if complete anonymity prevails. Yet the actual name of the northern parish is cited. This could prove embarrassing to the author, the subjects of the study, and particularly to the pastor who helped finance it. Whether such a criticism is justified or not in this case can be known only to the author and those immediately involved in the research.

Some, but not all, of the findings are based upon three hundred questionnaires. One thousand persons promised to return these; less than a third did. While S. believes that these are representative, social scientists will point out that these three hundred had something in common, i.e., they voluntarily returned questionnaires, which the other seven hundred lacked. Again, whether or not this marred the findings must remain unanswered.

The entire field of parish sociology in the United States is still in the pioneering stage, and this study does represent some advances. For example, the thoroughly detailed description and analysis of such matters as the demographic structure of the parish, occupations, incomes, and educational backgrounds of parish members, and a comparison between them and non-Catholics within the geographical limits of the parish is far more meaningful than such a comparison of Americans generally, or even with residents of New York City. The non-Catholic reader will gain insights into the subculture of American Catholicism via the chapters on parish priests and the Mass and the sacraments.

Furthermore, Appendix 1 offers a basis for comparing *Northern Parish* with other investigations of this type. It is, of course, to be regretted that the nature of the studies does not make entirely adequate comparisons of

data fully possible. This is certainly a point which future researchers should note. Multiplication of parish studies will prove futile unless they are patterned after previous studies, albeit some new features may be incorporated. Parish sociology will come of age only when there are many studies of different kinds of parishes susceptible to comparison or contrast. There are an index and a bibliography.

University of Notre Dame

JOHN J. KANE

SOUL AND PSYCHE: AN ENQUIRY INTO THE RELATIONSHIP OF PSYCHIATRY AND RELIGION. By Victor White, O.P. New York: Harper, 1960. Pp. 312. \$5.00.

Victor White, Dominican and erstwhile professor of theology at Blackfriars, Oxford, died a short time after the publication of this, his third book. Known widely through the publication of *God and the Unconscious* and *God the Unknown*, the author was one of the leading clerical exponents of Jungian psychology and was an occasional lecturer at the C. G. Jung Institute of Analytical Psychology in Zurich, Switzerland. W. was not an entirely uncritical devotee of Jungian doctrine, and of late years it became apparent that there was a rift between professor and pupil. The core of the present volume is the Cadbury Lectures delivered at the University of Birmingham in 1959.

The thesis of the present work, briefly stated, is that the soul and psyche are one and that "it is difficult for religious believers . . . to think of the soul as excluding the sphere covered also by contemporary psychology." It was precisely in the psyche, he says, that Jung and his followers claimed to discover, if not religion, then the basic raw material of religion and its indispensable function—religion *in statu nascendi*. "So far from dividing soul from psyche some Jungians will hold that their effectual separation . . . today is at the root, not only of the decay of religion as an effective social and psychological force, but also much of our mental distress" (p. 12). If the personality is to be divided between two separate spheres of influence—soul, which is the business of theology, and psyche, the domain of the therapist—then each must surrender any claim to deal with the whole human being or any concern of total personality integration.

The early portions of the book examine the common ground of religion and psychiatry and are concerned with buttressing the author's main thesis. He takes active issue with Zilboorg, whom he quotes as stating among other things that "the psychic apparatus is not the soul and the soul is not the psyche." This thesis, the author believes, "can hardly fail

to spread alarm and despondency in concrete practice and, though it may make the analyst's problems a bit easier, it will make the patient's burden heavier." W. feels strongly about all of this, and through the body of the book, eight appendices, and forty-six pages of notes he assembles his data and pursues his thesis. To attempt to get all of this within the confines of a short review, however, is an impossible task. If you are impatient with reviewers who make statements like this, then try, if you please, to get together the chapters, "Trinity and Quaternity," "The Feminine Image in Christianity," "The Integration of Evil," and then relate them to the main thesis.

There is no doubt at all about the fact that this is one well-reasoned Jungian way of conceiving the relation between soul and psyche, and it is also a valiant effort to defend the unity of man. Many American psychiatrists will disagree with it, however, and will lean to Fr. Gustave Weigel's concept that the "psyche is not the pneuma of the theologians, but only a detectable apparatus in the conscious and unconscious behavior of man. Pneuma is the soul, the spirit, the transcendence reaching element in man," etc.

Have no doubt about the excellence of the work. It should be widely read, but the problems it points up make evident the great need in this country for a "House of Studies" attached to a large Catholic university, in which outstanding theologians, psychologists, psychiatrists, philosophers, anthropologists, etc., from all over would meet in regular conclave in order to study serious problems, like those in question, and the numerous others which are sure to face us in what Pope Pius XII called "the remarkable springtime which lies before man."

The Institute of Living
Hartford, Conn.

FRANCIS J. BRACELAND

THE SCHOOL BUS LAW: A CASE STUDY IN EDUCATION, RELIGION, AND POLITICS. By Theodore Powell. Middletown, Conn.: Wesleyan Univ. Press, 1960. Pp. xi + 334. \$5.00.

In this volume, germane to the study of religion, education, and politics in contemporary America, a public information consultant to the Connecticut State Board of Education has presented a detailed and interesting analysis of the 1957 legislative struggle in his state over bus transportation for private-school pupils.

People all over the country learned in May, 1957, that the Connecticut Assembly had passed, by the margin of a single tie-breaking vote by the

Speaker of the House, a law allowing the towns which provided transportation for public-school pupils to do the same, if they chose, for children attending private, nonprofit schools. Comparatively few outside the state would know of the struggle that had gone on in several towns in earlier months. Nor would many be aware of the conflicting interests, pressures, and open crusading of political and religious groups which affected the final result. With care and precision Mr. Powell has assembled the story. He has used legislative documents, newspaper accounts, and editorials, and even reported what he learned from a large number of personal interviews with participants in the struggle on both the town and state-wide level. There emerges a valuable study of recent Americana vital to the three fields mentioned above.

Though it was formally a legal and political thing, the author sees the bus case as a religious conflict, specifically a Catholic-Protestant battle. At times he seems to editorialize to the effect that religion, or better, men of religion, are out of place in political struggles. He does not want to admit that there are occasions when opinions and activities in the political sphere tangle with rights of conscience and, say, the parental duties of a citizen who happens to be a church member as well. If intervention by men of religion in such cases be branded interference in politics, one should remark that it is rather high-level politics. Moreover, the secular politicians have not always proved themselves capable of handling such problems particularly well.

P.'s editorializing runs throughout the book. There is no quarrel with this as such, since a case study needs evaluation as well as presentation. One senses a sincere effort on his part to be objective in his comments. One may not agree with his every deduction. An example of this latter would be his handling of a public statement by the Catholic bishops of Connecticut and an almost simultaneous pronouncement by the Greater Hartford (Protestant) Council of Churches. Each statement made reference to the decisions of the Supreme Court of the United States on the constitutionality of bus transportation at public expense for parochial-school pupils. Both the bishops and the Council seem to have gone somewhat beyond the meaning of the Court, even though in different directions. P. points this out. Yet he himself then proceeds to overreach his mark by implying that both groups drew their conclusions with deliberate and malicious forethought. "If the devil can quote Scripture for his purposes," observes P., "cannot clergymen quote Supreme Court opinions for theirs?" (p. 220).

Quite interesting are P.'s reflections on the attitudes and activities of

religious leaders involved in the struggle. He observes that both Catholics and Protestants decided their policies and moves and then called on their respective constituents to support them. He thinks it would have been more democratic to have first ascertained the wishes of the people and then led them in their fight. Secondly, he is of the opinion that those clergymen of both sides who used an irenic rather than a bellicose strategy in putting forth their views did more good and less harm for the causes they espoused. He suggests to men of religion that there is more victory-potential in honey than in vinegar. Thirdly, he laments what appeared to him to be an immediate declaration of war by both Catholic and Protestant leaders, without either side ever making an attempt to sit down at the conference table with the opposition to try to find a meeting of minds and a peaceful solution.

To this reviewer there is here much food for meditation, especially in the last point. In these days of increasing search for peace and understanding, what might be accomplished by a more irenic spirit, by dialogue, in the thorn patch of American Church-State relations? The Sovereign Pontiff has set an example in similar, if not parallel, instances and shown that a Christian spirit of charity need not be suspect of weakness or naïveté regarding possible evil intentions of the "enemy." Though the Catholic Church has achieved much in hard-fought battles of the past, are there not other ways of achieving even more?

College of Notre Dame of Maryland

WILLIAM KAILER DUNN

SHORTER NOTICES

A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF BIBLE STUDY FOR THEOLOGICAL STUDENTS. By J. F. Armstrong *et al.*, under the chairmanship of B. M. Metzger. *Princeton Seminary Pamphlets* 1. 2nd rev. ed.; Princeton: Princeton Theological Seminary, 1960. Pp. 107. \$1.00. "Destined primarily for regular use by theological students and ministers," this compact and inexpensive bibliography offers a good listing of books on Scripture in English under the general headings: The Whole Bible, The Old Testament, The New Testament, Linguistic Aids to Exegesis. Only in the last section are titles admitted in other languages. Each group is further broken down into pertinent subdivisions (e.g., according to the individual books of the *OT* and *NT*). This revision of the bibliography, which originally appeared in 1948, has added sections covering Bibliographical Aids, History of Biblical Scholarship, Dead Sea Scrolls, New Testament Ethics. In the revised listings not

only have new titles been added, but references to older works now superseded have been omitted. The bibliography is intended to be "selective in character, . . . representative of the best in Biblical scholarship." It should certainly prove to be a handy listing of books on the Bible for instructors in college-religion courses, even though the compilers disclaim the destiny of it for "graduate work and research purposes"; it is a good place to begin. However, the bibliography is quite lean on Catholic entries, containing only some thirty. Surely J. T. Milik's *Ten Years of Discovery in the Wilderness of Judaea*, A. Wikenhauser's *New Testament Introduction*, L. Cerfaux' *Christ in the Theology of St. Paul*, and F. Prat's *The Theology of St. Paul* are at least as representative of the best in biblical scholarship as some of the titles listed.

Woodstock College

Joseph A. Fitzmyer, S.J.

THE WORD OF LIFE: ESSAYS ON THE BIBLE. Dublin: Gill, 1959. Pp. viii + 123. 8/6d. Essays which first appeared in the *Furrow* during 1957. The authors are Irish priests engaged in educational work. Of the twelve contributors, five are Scripture professors in major seminaries and one holds the chair of Oriental languages in University College, Dublin; five teach theology or religion in seminaries or colleges and one is a diocesan inspector of schools. The essays on "The Word of God in Human Speech," "The Guardian of the Word—the Church," "The World of the Bible," "The Bible in Perspective," and "The Dead Sea Scrolls" constitute a layman's general introduction to the Bible—good examples of *haute vulgarisation*. In my opinion, Kevin Symth, S.J., is too categorical in his denial of any "direct influence" of the Dead Sea Scrolls "even on the vocabulary of the N.T." and of any parallels between the Qumrân practices and Christianity. The essays on "Group Study of the Bible," "Teaching the Bible in School," "The Old Testament and Our Youth," and "The Bible, Book of Devotion" will interest priests concerned with the pastoral problem of getting our Catholic people to read the Scriptures.

Passionist Monastery, Union City, N.J.

Richard Kugelman, C.P.

THE FOUR GOSPELS: AN HISTORICAL INTRODUCTION. By Lucien Cerfaux. Translated by Patrick Hepburne-Scott. Westminster, Md.: Newman; London: Darton, Longman & Todd Ltd., 1960. Pp. xxii + 145. \$3.00. Teachers of college theology will be grateful to the publishers for providing a readable English version of Msgr. Cerfaux' very useful little study of the Gospels, which appeared in French under the title *La voix vivante de l'évangile*. L. Johnston has provided a brief preface to this edition. The translation is smooth and fairly accurate (p. 6, l. 29: omit "The" before "tradition"; p. 12,

ll. 19, 22: read "sentence" for "phrase"; p. 15, l. 26: read "useless" for "unnecessary"; p. 51, l. 26: read "theory" for "story"; p. 62, l. 29: read "omission" for "mission"). The first chapter deals with the oral tradition preceding the written Gospels and with a very brief review of unacceptable hypotheses by rationalist critics. The next four chapters discuss Mt, Mk, Lk, and Jn: the literary characteristics of each, an analytical plan, an excellent discussion of the Evangelist's message, summaries of non-Catholic criticism touching each Gospel. Chap. 6 gives a useful review of the fortunes of the four Gospels in the second century, when the Church, giving them a place of honor above the *OT* prophets, understands them as four presentations of the one Gospel of Jesus Christ, or as the fourfold Gospel, which replaces the early, oral tradition. Chap. 7 discusses divagations from the fourfold Gospel: apocryphal gospels, notable textual variations in the canonical Gospels, and the *Agrapha*, sayings of Jesus not included in the inspired Gospel texts. A final chapter sketches succinctly the influence of the Gospels upon the liturgical, ascetical, and intellectual life of the Church in the second century. As an introduction to a fruitful understanding of the most sacred books in the *NT* canon, C.'s work is a masterpiece.

State University of Iowa, Iowa City

D. M. Stanley, S.J.

LA RÉVÉLATION PROGRESSIVE DES PERSONNES DIVINES. By Jean Isaac, O.P. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 211. 8.40 NF. I.'s twelve conferences are a study of progressive revelation in the proper sense. Without appealing to hints and adumbrations, he attempts to show how certain key biblical words and concepts—God, Father, Son, word, wisdom, etc.—which originate in the *OT* have become the words in which Christian truths are enunciated. This way of exposition is best calculated to convey to the modern Christian the true meaning of the words which are commonplace in his cult and his speech. I.'s exposition is fortified by an abundant quotation and explanation of biblical texts. His awareness of development is seen in his adoption of the position that Mary did not realize the divinity of Jesus at first. In a few other positions I. has spoken less felicitously. Jn 8:59 cannot be construed as a claim that Jesus is Yahweh (p. 51). The *NT* does not present Jesus as Yahweh, or as the Father, or as God; it presents Him as the Son of God, as I. has pointed out in preceding chapters. The identification of the "evil spirit" (1 S 19:9) and the "lying spirit" (1 K 22:22) as personal demons (pp. 158–59) is out of harmony with Hebrew thought patterns, and I. forgets that these evil spirits are said to come from Yahweh. The translation of the phrase "in the spirit" in the *NT* as "inwardly" is not "a piece of misplaced piety" (p. 164) but is founded on a study of Greek

idiom. I.'s attempt to make the thought of the Johannine writings prior to the thought of the Pauline writings (p. 174) runs into serious objections based on a comparison of the two collections, which he does not discuss. These reservations are few and unimportant. The book is a clear and well-organized compendium of the development of biblical doctrine and should be extremely useful.

Loyola University, Chicago

John L. McKenzie, S.J.

LES PAROLES D'ADIEUX DU SEIGNEUR. By G.-M. Behler, O.P. *Lectio divina* 27. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 281. 12 NF. One of the fruits of the modern biblical movement ought to be a new and superior devotional exposition of the Bible. B.'s work is a good example of what can be expected. His subject is the farewell discourse of Jn 13-17. The author, whose scholarly career was unfortunately halted by illness early in life, is profoundly erudite; his book is not formally a learned exposition, but the exposition rests upon sound scholarship. The origin of the discourse, e.g., is attributed to "the redactional hypothesis." The line-by-line commentary which B. employs is not calculated to produce a unified work and a single impression, and the book suffers somewhat as a consequence. Effectively, it is a series of essays or meditations inspired chiefly by B.'s conferences to a community of contemplatives. Each of the meditations is charming. B. makes extensive use of well-chosen quotations from the Fathers, particularly Augustine, from Thomas Aquinas, and from such modern writers as Braun. The book illustrates the positive results of biblical scholarship which are so often demanded by the public; it shows that the restraints imposed by criticism upon biblical interpretation are not restraints upon the spiritual understanding of the Bible, in the proper sense of the word.

Loyola University, Chicago

John L. McKenzie, S.J.

DER PROZESS JESU. By Josef Blinzler. 3rd rev. ed.; Regensburg: Pustet, 1960. Pp. 375. DM 18.—(cloth), 15.50 (paper). This enlarged edition enhances the worth of a book that was acclaimed at its publication in 1951 as the most complete and competent study of the trial of Jesus produced by modern biblical scholarship. While the English translation published in 1959 revised and enlarged the second German edition, this third edition contains much new material not found in the English version. There is a chapter on the burial of Jesus and five new excursuses: the servants of the Sanhedrin, the chronology of Pilate, the role of Herod Antipas in the condemnation of Jesus, the meaning of *ekathisen* in Jn 19:13, and a discussion of the burial narrative of Mark. The bibliography has been brought up to date and the book's usefulness has been greatly increased by the addition of a *Stellen-*

register listing references to the Bible, Jewish and Christian Apocrypha, Qumrân literature, etc. B. is already on record as an opponent of the authenticity of the Turin Shroud (e.g., *Das Turiner Grablinnen und die Wissenschaft*). The new chapter on the burial, while never mentioning the Shroud of Turin, brings out strongly the difficulties encountered in the Gospel narratives, especially John, by defenders of the Turin cloth.

Passionist Monastery, Union City, N.J.

Richard Kugelman, C.P.

THE SPIRITUAL TEACHING OF THE NEW TESTAMENT. By Jules Lebreton, S.J. Translated by James E. Whalen. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 382. \$5.50.

The issuance of this valued volume makes a notable addition to the corpus of spiritual writing presently available in English. A perceptive synthesis of biblical and dogmatic theology, L.'s work delineates with clarity and force what he styles "the imperious gentleness of the New Law." In his effort to relate spiritual doctrine, as derived from the NT, to historical development, L. has succeeded admirably. Using ancient sources and texts from the Fathers and ecclesiastical writers, especially Irenaeus, he points out the internal unity and consistent development of the Church's spiritual doctrine; by alluding to the early heresies and their almost cyclic reappearance in spiritual matters, he indicates the corresponding danger of rootless incontinuity in ascetical teaching. Amplification and explanation of NT texts are drawn most aptly not only from John of the Cross and Francis de Sales, but also from Søren Kirkegaard. The presentation of piety, derived directly from Scripture and dogma, re-enforced by the teaching of the Fathers and doctors, and located in historical context, affords a secure introduction to spirituality; the excellent footnotes will easily draw the more advanced reader to a wider range of pertinent readings from classical spiritual writers. NT exegesis has rapidly developed since the first publication of this volume in 1947; a future revision might note variants on, and some qualifications of, L.'s interpretations; still, the elements of his scriptural synthesis of spirituality are founded on a congeries of texts, and only rarely on one. A more lengthy explanation, or note, to clarify L.'s citation of P. Rousselot's comment on Augustine's *De spiritu et littera* (p. 193) regarding the assent to grace, would perhaps be apposite. The range and solidity of L.'s presentation commends his work highly; the fine translation (made on the fourteenth French edition) makes it easier to recommend.

Shadowbrook, Lenox, Mass.

William J. Burke, S.J.

DIE ESSENER IN DER WISSENSCHAFTLICHEN DISKUSSION VOM AUSGANG DES 18. BIS ZUM BEGINN DES 20. JAHRHUNDERTS: EINE WISSENSCHAFTSGESCHICHTLICHE STUDIE. By Siegfried Wagner. *Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für*

die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft 79; Berlin: Töpelmann, 1960. Pp. xii + 284. DM 36.—

The discovery of the Dead Sea Scrolls in 1947 was the occasion for a renewal of interest in the Jewish sect called Essene, which is mentioned by Josephus along with the Pharisees and Sadducees as one of the *treis philosophiai* in late Judaism. The Essenes had been previously known to us through the writings of Josephus, Philo, Pliny the Elder, and Hippolytus (and other authors who depended on these). Attempts had always been made by scholars to find out more about the Essenes and to relate them to the rest of Judaism as well as to Christianity or John the Baptist. The variety of such attempts was great. The present monograph is a survey of these interpretations of the Essenes, remarkable in its almost exhaustive coverage and full bibliography which alone takes up thirty-four pages of fine print and is divided into three sections: presentations of the Essenes before 1800; since 1800; scientific historical sketches. The four main parts deal with the treatment of the sect in the time of the *Aufklärung* (1780–1830), the subsequent sober and bias-free evaluation of the sources relating to the sect (1830–1880), the discussion of the sources at the end of the nineteenth century, and finally the Essene problem in the twentieth century. The monograph began as a doctoral dissertation presented to the University of Erlangen in 1957, entitled *Die Essenerforschung im 19. Jahrhundert*. The investigation is not confined to what was written on the Essenes alone but includes discussions of the Therapeutae, a related group in Egypt. The monograph will have great utility in putting the identification of the Qumrân sect in its proper focus. W. admits that the identification of it as Essene is “unter den Forschern fast allgemein angenommen.” Yet it has its difficulties; but some of these at least are the relics of views once held, and W.’s work will give the needed perspective to judge the problem properly.

Woodstock College

Joseph A. Fitzmyer, S.J.

LE TRAVAIL SELON SAINT JEAN CHRYSOSTOME. By Lucien Daloz. *Theologie, pastorale et spiritualité, Recherches et synthèses* 4. Paris: Lethielleux, 1959. Pp. ix + 183.

Chrysostom never taught a systematic theology of work. Yet D. has collected the pertinent texts and shown two ideas to be dominant: (1) man as the image of God is the basis for C.’s teaching on work; (2) the difference between work (*ergasia*) and labor (*ponos*) is not substantial but accidental and corresponds to the exigencies of an order in which redemption became necessary. With regard to work (*ergasia*), C. taught that its end was to form man in wisdom (just as God’s wisdom is made manifest in His “works” of creation and providence); consequently, man would have had to work whether Adam sinned or not. Given Adam’s fall, work became labor

(*ponos*), in order to provide man with a remedy for, and a deterrent from, sin. Technology, in an almost twentieth-century sense, is a result of this labor. Several other noteworthy considerations in this volume are: work and human relations, and work according to other Antiochene writers. One surprising conclusion emerges: according to the evidence assembled, there is nothing specifically Christian about C.'s theology of work; it is presented in terms of the Fall but receives no new dimension because of the Incarnation.

Woodstock College

Richard E. Doyle, S.J.

SAINT AUGUSTINE ON THE PSALMS 1: PSALMS 1-29. Translated and annotated by Dame Scholastica Hebgin and Dame Felicitas Corrigan. *Ancient Christian Writers* 29. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. vi + 354. \$4.50.

The only previous complete English translation of A.'s commentaries on the Psalms, in the Oxford Library of the Fathers, was finished in 1857. The present version was made from the *Corpus christianorum* (1956) presentation of the Maurist edition and will run, according to present proportions, to about nine volumes. This vast scope may help to explain the disappointing absence of the extensive textual notes which distinguish previous *ACW* volumes; the translators confine themselves to scriptural references and an occasional brief annotation. The general and relatively brief introduction, the simple reproduction, with slight changes, of the chronological list of the *CC* edition, and the extremely slim bibliography, confirm the impression that the task has been conceived almost exclusively as one of translation. And the translation, happily, is excellent, capturing with freedom, fidelity, and dignity the ardent and informal charm of the original. There are indexes, scriptural and general.

Woodstock College

Thomas E. Clarke, S.J.

LA TEORÍA DEL PROGRESO DOGMÁTICO EN LOS TEÓLOGOS DE LA ESCUELA DE SALAMANCA. By Cándido Pozo, S.J. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1959. Pp. xviii + 269.

A new collection, *Bibliotheca theologica Hispana*, to consist of two sections embracing respectively studies and texts, is promisingly inaugurated by this volume, which presents the history of the contribution made by the Dominican school of Salamanca to the solution of the delicate problem of dogmatic development. The theologians of this school were the first to state the problem explicitly and to elaborate the various solutions that subsequently came to be regarded as classical. Among the important issues brought up during the controversy were the nature of papal infallibility, the value of patristic evidence, the connection between Scripture and tradition, and the terminol-

ogy of theological censures. But the nucleus of the discussion concerned the relations between divine faith and theological conclusions. P.'s point of departure is Francis de Vitoria, founder of the school of Salamanca in 1526; his study ends with the death of John of St. Thomas in 1644. Between these two outstanding figures come such notable theologians as Soto, Cano, Sotomayor, Medina, and Bafiez, plus ten authors of more modest stature. P.'s chief merit is his careful investigation of unpublished sources. His lengthy examination of MSS enables him to go far beyond, and repeatedly to correct, some of the positions maintained by Marín Sola, particularly the latter's contention that Molina's denial of the definability of theological conclusions as dogmas of faith affronted traditional teaching. A. Lang had earlier shown the lack of any opinion favorable to the definability of theological conclusions during the Middle Ages, on the ground that during that period the question had not yet been raised. P. brings out the fact that when the problem was first formulated reflectively in the sixteenth century, all the solutions which later became more sharply delineated appeared almost simultaneously. He concludes that none of them has a claim to be called traditional. In any case, the solutions offered by the Salamanca school to the problem of dogmatic progress are historically significant and must be recognized as such.

St. Mary's College, Kansas

Cyril Vollert, S.J.

THE VATICAN COUNCIL'S TEACHING ON THE EVOLUTION OF DOGMA: A STUDY IN NINETEENTH CENTURY THEOLOGY. By Mark G. McGrath, C.S.C. Santiago, Chile. Pp. 134. No publishing house or date is indicated for this dissertation, submitted for the doctorate in theology at the Angelicum in Rome in 1953. It was published some time after that; mention of the year 1957 occurs in the Preface. The author's purpose is not to examine the positions of Catholic theologians on doctrinal development, but rather to study the first explicit pronouncement made on the subject by the teaching Church. This declaration was issued by the Vatican Council and deserves more recognition than it has received. The problem is capably investigated within the context of the issues that surround it. Consequently, slight attention is paid to Möhler and Newman, whose ideas evoked no official reaction in Rome. On the other hand, the theories of such theologians as de Lamennais, Hermes, Günther, and Döllinger are analyzed in detail; these authors erred in various ways, and in condemning their systems Rome marked out the confines of orthodoxy in the evolution of dogma. Apart from the aberrations cultivated by fideism, traditionalism, rationalism, and semirationalism which the Church had to combat, the question is inherently

important in the century that witnessed dogmatic progress culminating in the solemn definitions of the Immaculate Conception and papal infallibility. The teaching of the Vatican Council is not very extensive in this domain and is rather negative in its formulation. Yet it also conveys positive doctrine, to the extent that in its repudiation of errors it prescribes the boundaries within which any Catholic hypothesis must abide. Hence, the Council did not settle the question; but by teaching exactly what dogma is, it fixed the limits for all theories, past or present or future, that have been or may be proposed.

St. Mary's College, Kansas

Cyril Vollert, S.J.

WHAT IS AN ECUMENICAL COUNCIL? By Thoralf T. Thielen. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. xix + 185. \$2.95. Intended for the layman as a brief introduction to the theology of an ecumenical council; achieves its purpose admirably. T. is not concerned here with a detailed history of the councils but solely with the theological principles concerning them, such as are generally contained in theological manuals. T. has managed to bring this teaching down to the level of the intelligent layman without sacrificing accuracy in any way. In addition, he does a fine job of outlining the manner in which the Church became increasingly conscious of the meaning of an ecumenical council through the centuries and gradually expressed this understanding of faith in the more precise theological terms we now use. As he discusses such notions as formal and material convocation, T. also draws freely upon the history of past councils which exemplifies this distinction and shows how the Church, in formulating her more explicit doctrine, must reflect back upon what did happen in order to state what must happen. The volume includes a bibliography, a thorough index, and a glossary of special terms associated with this topic.

Catholic University of America

John L. Murphy

THE MYSTERY OF GOD'S GRACE. By J.-H. Nicolas, O.P. Dubuque: Priory Press, 1960. Pp. x + 102. \$1.25. An explanation of grace which follows closely the order and doctrine of *Sum. theol.* 1-2, qq. 109-14, with such additions, e.g., on the formal effects of sanctifying grace, as are not treated by St. Thomas in this part of the *Summa*. The work may provide a helpful review for those already acquainted with the technicalities of Scholastic discussions of grace; it will hardly appeal to others, even the well-educated. Its extensive concern with the metaphysics of the divine motion and indwelling and its failure in part to escape a mere repetition of St. Thomas hinder it from fully achieving its lofty purpose, to illuminate

the mysterious new reality which lies at the heart of Christian morality. At the risk of an invidious comparison it may be said that Charles Journet's recent book on the same theme (see THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 21 [1960] 501), which has also been translated (*The Meaning of Grace* [New York: Kenedy, 1960]), has been more successful in adapting the Catholic and Thomistic doctrine of grace to the capacities of a modern audience.

Woodstock College

Thomas E. Clarke, S.J.

COURT TRAITÉ DE THÉOLOGIE MARIALE. By René Laurentin. Paris: Lethielleux, 1959. Pp. 170. 9.75 fr. Laurentin's ever-growing reading public will hail this completely-revised fourth edition of his history-of-dogma approach to Mariology. It has an interesting polyglot publishing story: the first edition, 1953, appeared in French; the second, a revision in 1954, appeared in English only, as *Queen of Heaven: A Short Treatise on Marian Theology*, in Dublin, 1956, in New York, 1957. The third edition, revised as of mid-1955, appeared in Italian and German. The new fourth edition adds considerable material, e.g., on the first chapters of Luke, as well as much more on John, on *virginitas in partu*, and on the Immaculate Conception, with good use of the studies done for the centenary of the definition. The section on dogmatic development from 431 to 1050 has grown from two to twelve pages. There are also new appendices: on our Lady in the OT, on the term *theotokos*, on the apocryphal infancy narratives, and on the first Marian feast. Contrary to the view of some others, this reviewer regrets the dropping of the useful "Table rectificative des pièces mariales inauthentiques ou discutées contenues dans les deux Patrologies de Migne," which made up pp. 119-73 of the first edition and was omitted in the English translation. L. shows his customary but still astonishing familiarity with recent writings, incorporating them into the text with full references. An eight-page selective bibliography is placed at the end, along with a brief lexicon of theological terms, as well as scriptural, author, and subject indexes. Will not some enterprising American publisher encourage the indefatigable Laurentin to give us a fifth edition in English, enriched with a matching English bibliography?

Catholic University of America

Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm.

THE MASS: A LITURGICAL COMMENTARY. By A. Croegaert. Translated by J. Holland Smith. 2 vols. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1958, 1960. Pp. ix + 251, ix + 311. \$4.75 each. For priests who desire a deeper knowledge of the meaning and history of the rites and prayers of the Mass but have not the leisure or resources to search for it in many books and periodicals. To satisfy them, C. took up the parts of the Mass in the order

in which they occur and traced their origin and development, pointing out their theological and liturgical significance as well. Vol. 1 treats the Mass of the Catechumens, Vol. 2 the Mass of the Faithful. The data accumulated by C.'s careful research is included in the work to a point sufficient both to establish his competence and to satisfy the reader's desire for information. Seldom is the quantity of historical detail excessive, i.e., more than the reader actually finds helpful. The theological explanation of the rites would have been more effective at times had it been briefer and more to the point. This is the case, e.g., in the chapters of Vol. 2 dealing with the question, who offers the Mass? Occasionally, practical suggestions are proposed which do not seem particularly relevant. These are but minor failings. Each chapter is carefully divided, and each division carries its own heading, which is included in the Table of Contents—a fortunate arrangement, because the work does not invite long, continuous reading. It will be most appreciated as one which can be easily consulted as need or desire arise.

St. Mary's College, Kansas

Everett A. Diederich, S.J.

THE SOLESMES METHOD. By Dom Joseph Gajard, O.S.B. Translated by Cecile Gabain. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1960. Pp. 86. No one who has spent but the briefest time in the formal study of the liturgical music of the Catholic Church is unaware of the vast and beneficial influence of Solesmes on this discipline, especially in the field of plain chant. This volume, written by no less an authority than the present choirmaster of Solesmes, is a welcome addition to the somewhat meager supply of reliable literature in the field of plain chant. Although only eighty-six pages in length, this work is not one to be read by an amateur in one sitting. Chapters on the rules of rhythmical technique and those on the more practical rules of style will require both reflection and use in performance before they can be fully appreciated. This book would be a practical gift for anyone associated in any way with liturgical music.

Woodstock College

Joseph M. Hamernick, S.J.

MORALS AND MAN. By Gerald Vann, O.P. 2nd ed.; New York: Sheed & Ward, 1960. Pp. 223. \$3.50. An elaboration of papers read some years ago before the Aquinas Societies of London and Leicester, and of articles contributed to such periodicals as *Blackfriars* and the *Month*. It was first published in book form in 1937 under the title *Morals Making Man*. No substantial revision has been made of that edition. Part 1 synthesizes the basic moral philosophy of St. Thomas: the end of man, human freedom, the

moral order. This is contrasted with the utilitarian and hedonist ethical positions. The data of reason is briefly supplemented by that of revelation. In this part of the book a measure of depth is achieved. Part 2 makes the application of the above theory to a broad range of topics: humanism, private property, automation, divorce, childbearing, the liturgy, education, etc. Given such varied subject matter, no adequate development can be expected. We find rather a series of comments on the sociopolitical scene intended for a quite literate audience. Unfortunately, extensive and lengthy citations from other authors mar this section. In some chapters there is little of Vann and much of Maritain, Gilson, Helen Waddell, and others. V. takes a positive approach, has little of casuistry, and clearly distinguishes morals from legalism. His style is rich in literary allusion and delightfully departs from the technical language of textbook and learned tome. Though this book is not the fruit of original research, it is far from mere popularization.

Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y.

Robert H. Springer, S.J.

INTRODUCTION AUX SCIENCES JURIDIQUES. By Léo Pelland, C.R. Montreal: Editions Bellarmin, 1960. Pp. 604. \$15.00. Best described, perhaps, as a treatise on political philosophy in the light of Thomistic principles and papal pronouncements, with special reference to the Canadian form and institutions of state, and extended to embrace the existence, structure, and external relations of the Catholic Church. There are three sections: an epistemological introduction, with attention to the juridical implications of various theories; a second section on law, right, and justice in general; and the third and largest on the particular forms of juridical order as expressed in the Church, the civil society, and (briefly) the international sphere. With items on so vast an area of thought and action—and on subjects so disparate as the notion of common good, the purely penal law, the relations of Church and state, freedom of worship, the right of suffrage, the right to work, the just price, the universal, diocesan, and parochial organization of the Catholic Church, the conditions of a just war, the justification of the death penalty, and the composition of the Canadian judicial system—the book's utility consists more in its encyclopedic inclusiveness of matter and orthodoxy of doctrine than in profundity of treatment or novelty of concept. One limitation, from the viewpoint of the realistic lawyer, is the fact that, while actual juridical practice has long been dominated by one or another voluntaristic approach, P. (faithful to his Thomistic premises) is rigidly committed to the primacy of the rational element in law, with a consequent underemphasis of the function of choice and election which figure so prominently and

inevitably in forming and administering the complex social order of today. The ample index is conducive to the encyclopedic usefulness of the work, and an extensive critical bibliography is provided.

Woodstock College

John J. Reed, S.J.

AN INTRODUCTION TO A CATHOLIC CATECHISM. Edited by Hubert Fischer. New York: Herder and Herder, 1960. Pp. xiv + 169. The publication in America of the German Catechism (1957) helped to stimulate fresh interest in religious education. In the slim volume under review the authors share some of the insights which vitalize the pages of their catechism. The brief orientation of Clifford Howell, S.J., and Franz Schreibmayr's essay, "Main Theological Themes of the Catechism," give rich evidence of the kerygmatic emphases which are our heritage from apostolic and patristic times. God's invitation to share Trinitarian life through Christ evokes from grateful man the glad response of liturgical worship and the faith-commitment of the observing of God's will from the highest motives of charity. Alois Heller's "Introducing the Catechism to Catechists" is provocative for its forceful apologetic justifying departure from so-called "traditional" approaches which are historically post-Reformation, profoundly conditioned by the polemics of that era. He deplores indifference to the catechetical task too frequently encountered among the German clergy, as well as the meager training of many catechists who reject the new catechism not from any ill will but from fear "that they will not be able to cope with the new things they expect to find within its pages, whether in method or in theological content" (p. 106). Hubert Fischer's chapter on lesson-format is illuminating for a fair critique of the catechism's methodology, but Klemens Tilmann's more specific proposals, though highly suggestive, may require careful adaptation by experienced American practitioners. National differences also crop up in the essay of interpretation which analyzes the catechism's richly symbolic drawings by Albert Burkart. One regret is the failure in this English edition to specify the age group envisioned by the German authors. American teachers might well be cautious in seeking grade levels psychologically suited to the German catechism, but they could not go wrong in harvesting here some precious universals of catechetical wisdom.

Fordham University

Vincent M. Novak, S.J.

ENGLISH RELIGIOUS DISSENT. By Erik Routley. Cambridge: University Press. 1960. Pp. vi + 214. \$3.75. The author of this short survey of historical English "nonconformity" is a former tutor in ecclesiastical history at

Mansfield College, a theological faculty for Congregationalist, or Free Church, ministers at Oxford. His aim is to explain to the general reader the way "dissent" became an institution in English religious life. Here dissent is defined with only a catch-all phrase: "a responsible minority opinion." His book begins with a short and poorly organized chapter surveying thirteen centuries of dissenting thought in the British Isles prior to the Reformation. There follow four important chapters on the growth of nonconformity during the reign of Elizabeth and then the rise of the Independents' movement from 1693 until the death of Cromwell. The later phases of the story are less dramatic. It is a curious sidelight that during the Whig ascendancy the toleration won by the nonconformists after the "Glorious Revolution" would have been suppressed except for the death of Queen Anne. "The death of this exceedingly commonplace monarch was the most dramatic episode of her reign." Under the Hanoverians the dissenters came into an increasing respectability, and the inspirational preaching of John Wesley gave to many of them a new orientation in their theological outlook. The study concludes with two chapters on the more modern trends among the Free Church adherents and the present-day status of the various conflicting currents within the non-Anglican Protestants. The task R. set himself is a formidable one, and if he is not successful it is largely because of the elusive character of his subject: "Dissent is an untidy, inconsistent affair." Dissenters have tended historically to be emotional and even cantankerous about their beliefs. The rational basis for their opposition to an official church is rarely clear. Readers of Knox's *Enthusiasm* will be traveling over familiar ground, yet R. offers some new insights into the positive content of dissenters' theology. Two criticisms should be made. First, the more recent studies on this subject seem to have made little impression on this analysis: Dickens' study of Henrician Lollardy in Yorkshire, Knappen's analysis of Tudor Puritanism, Haller's studies on the Puritan left wing, and Leland Carlson's studies of Browne and Penry are but a few of the more notable omissions. Their findings would have qualified some of R.'s pertinent conclusions. Second, R. forgets several illuminating parallels in the history of an equally "English" and equally "responsible" minority, the Catholic recusants. Their criticism of the Anglican position and their own inner quest of sanctity had an inevitable effect on the history of all sections of the "opposition" to the Established Church.

Fordham University

Albert J. Loomie, S.J.

BASILIO ROZANOV E LA SUA CONCEZIONE RELIGIOSA. By Paolo Leskovec, S.J. *Orientalia christiana analecta* 151. Rome: Pontifical Institute of Oriental

Studies, 1958. Pp. xi + 238. L. 2500. Mirsky says that Rozanov was the greatest Russian writer of his generation—very high praise for an author who wrote in the time of Tolstoy, Soloviev, Leontiev, and Gorky. L. points out that Rozanov's power as a writer lies in the originality of his style, which pours forth ideas in a vibrant personal expression of emotional sentiments and intuitive perceptions. Most of Rozanov's writings were concerned with religious problems; these are analyzed in this book. They cover such subjects as the Russian Church, the Catholic Church, Christianity, Protestantism, liberty, authority, infallibility, and above all matrimony. The problem of matrimony was basic to him, because the Russian Church would not grant a divorce from his first marriage, so his second union remained a source of anxiety. That is probably the reason why he concocted his fantastic phallicism as a new religion. His writings manifest a paradoxical character, now praising, now excoriating the same subject. At one moment he is in rhapsodies over the mystical and esthetic blessings of the Russian Church, soon he is attacking clergy and hierarchy for their nationalistic and juridical outlook. He runs the gamut of accusations against the Catholic Church, but also sees Catholicism as the correct interpretation of Christianity. These apparent contradictions seem to flow from an inherent conflict, the ancient one between the law of the mind and the law of the members, and this latter law dominated Rozanov. Many of his judgments were valid. Indeed, it is quite interesting to see the intuitive, mystical type of Russian mind, of which the Slavophile ecclesiologists are so enamored, reveal the fallacies in their theories and confirm the doctrine of the papacy on the basis of revelation. His own life, however, was estranged from Christ—another of those tortured wrestlers with Christ, but one who seems at death to have ended up at His feet.

Weston College

James L. Monks, S.J.

IGLESIAS DE ORIENTE: PUNTOS ESPECÍFICOS DE SU TEOLOGÍA. By Angel Santos Hernández, S.J. Santander: Sal Terrae, 1959. Pp. 541. 85 ptas. H., of the Pontifical University of Comillas, Spain, has written a manual for the undergraduate course of Oriental theology. It is not just another manual; it is a very good one. He has not changed the order of materials set up by Mauricio Gordillo, S.J., in 1937, which was also kept by Nicholas Ladomerszky in 1953. Like the previous authors, he depends greatly on the work of Martin Jugie, A.A.; but S. has added much which he derived from other and more recent sources. The result is as complete a book as can be desired for an introductory course on Oriental Christian thought and history. A very attractive feature is the ecumenical spirit manifested. H. is

friendly to the Churches he describes and adds a supplement on the ecumenical movement, for which he supplies a handy bibliography. The book is more than adequate for H.'s purposes. We must not expect a work of originality, because that cannot be the scope of such an enterprise. Because of clear synthesis, good order, rational division, and adequate indices, it has succeeded in achieving H.'s aim. There are, inevitably, little defects; several will strike the American reader. It is stated (p. 492) that Edmund Walsh, S.J., "contemporaneamente" is working with Orientals. In the past he did, but he has been dead for some years, and he stopped his work with the Near East Relief over twelve years ago. Nor was the work of Walsh's organization in any true sense ecumenical. Ecumenical work is being done now, not by the Russian Institute "of" Fordham, but by the Russian Center *at* Fordham. Nor should the activities of the Benedictines at St. Procopius Monastery, Lisle, Illinois, be overlooked. In like manner it is stated (p. 105) that the Archpriest George Florovsky is at St. Vladimir's Seminary in New York. He has not been associated with that institution for some years and is actually a professor at Harvard.

Woodstock College

Gustave Weigel, S.J.

RELIGIOUS REVOLUTION IN THE PHILIPPINES: THE LIFE AND CHURCH OF GREGORIO AGLIPAY, 1860-1960. Vol. 1: 1860-1940. By Pedro S. de Achútegui, S.J., and Miguel Bernad, S.J. Manila: Ateneo de Manila, 1960. Pp. xvi + 580. 15 pesos (cloth), 8 pesos (paper). In the scarcity of scholarly studies of Philippine Church history—a lack reflected in the meager and often highly inaccurate accounts of the standard general histories of the Church and of the missions—, the present book deserves a hearty welcome from historians. It studies the life of Fr. Gregorio Aglipay and the history of the *Iglesia Filipina Independiente* or Aglipayan Church up to its founder's death. This schism, closely connected with the Philippine Revolution against Spain and largely motivated by resentment at the subordination of the Filipino clergy to Spanish friars, separated almost a quarter of Filipino Catholics and a sizable number of priests from the Church, and though considerably weakened, still exists today. The investigations of the authors into Philippine ecclesiastical records, those of the Philippine Revolutionary Government, the Vatican Archives, and other important documentary collections in the Philippines and abroad, combined with personal interviews with prominent Aglipayans and associates of Aglipay, and a thorough study of Aglipayan literature, give the highest authority to the work. It is no discredit to the authors to note that much still remains vague concerning the early origins of the movement and its relation to the Revolutionary

leaders; for they have greatly increased our knowledge of this period, establishing many of the important facts with documentary evidence and exploding numerous myths surrounding the sect. Though one may occasionally differ on points of interpretation concerning the historical background of the movement, this work is a major contribution, and those interested in Philippine history, ecclesiastical or secular, will eagerly await the second volume with its extensive documentary appendix.

Georgetown University

John N. Schumacher, S.J.

LES TÉMOINS DE JÉHOVAH: ESSAI CRITIQUE D'HISTOIRE ET DE DOCTRINE. By Gérard Hébert, S.J. Montreal: Editions Bellarmin, 1960. Pp. 341. A religious organization which distributes well over 140,000,000 books, pamphlets, and periodicals annually in over fifty languages in all parts of the world merits the serious study which H. has given us in this clear, orderly book about the Jehovah's Witnesses. Although H. calls it a preliminary study, a simple description of its contents is enough to indicate the thoroughness with which he has done his work. The text, divided between a study of the history of the Witnesses and their teaching, is documented with 662 footnotes, most of them from primary sources. There are twenty-eight pages of annotated bibliography, listing the literature of the Witnesses themselves, scholarly studies about them, writings by Catholics and others, and legal documents and studies which concern the many court cases in which they have been involved. The Appendix contains a few important documents and statistical tables; a four-page index of all Scripture citations and a fifteen-page alphabetical general index completes the book. Each of the sixty or so sections of the book is prefaced by a few lines summarizing its contents. The teachings of the Witnesses are examined in the light of Scripture, and special attention is paid to those parts which clash with Catholic teaching. This will make the book particularly welcome to Catholic readers but should not lessen its value for others, since it is the Catholic Church and Catholic teaching which are the principal target of the Witnesses' aggressive campaign of publishing and preaching. A popular edition has been published which omits the footnotes, bibliography, and appendices. At present no comparable book exists in English; perhaps the book of William J. Whalen, due to appear in 1962, will fill that gap.

Alma College

Daniel J. O'Hanlon, S.J.

GOD, MAN, AND SATAN: PATTERNS OF CHRISTIAN THOUGHT AND LIFE IN PARADISE LOST, PILGRIM'S PROGRESS, AND THE GREAT THEOLOGIANs. By Ronald Mushat Frye. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Univ. Press, 1960.

Pp. x + 184. \$3.75. It is a good thing, as C. S. Lewis said some years back, to take Milton's theology seriously. This goes for Bunyan too, and it is with some hope that one begins F.'s study. At the start of this examination of two great books F. renounces an "objectified approach" which would demand that we treat the two works as "closed, finished, and fossilized." He attempts rather to interrelate them with the "insights of the renascence of Christian thought," which he conceives of as the work of the last half century and as due mainly to the efforts of Karl Barth, Reinhold Niebuhr, and John and Donald Baillie. Quotations from their works sprinkle these pages, as do snippets from Kierkegaard, Tillich, Schweitzer, and de Rougemont, and from earlier theologians, Luther, Calvin, Cocceius, and Cranmer. Occasionally Augustine is heard from, Pascal, Aquinas, and once St. Francis de Sales. The task of interrelating theology and the literary works is carried out by summarizing sections of the epic and the novel and then citing from (mostly modern) Protestant theologians passages which agree (more or less) with them. What is revealed in this "dialectal exchange" is far from astonishing. It seems that there is a rough correspondence between the main lines of traditional (and modern) Protestant theology and the theology manifest in the two seventeenth-century masterpieces. Faith is "not an assent to propositions" either in Milton or Bunyan or in classical Protestant teaching; good works are valueless for salvation; man is saved by the imputed merits of his Redeemer, and so on. On the other hand, very little is said of divergences. The question of Milton's Arianism is fobbed off in an unsatisfactory footnote; his "mortalism" is regarded as nothing unusual; his curious notions about angels are not mentioned. *God, Man, and Satan* is disappointing as a contribution either to literary or to theological scholarship. The brevity of the theological quotations (often from secondary sources) is exasperating. The relevance of these quotations to the literary texts is frequently most general and sometimes imperceptible. One eventually concludes that "to develop an understanding meaningful to twentieth-century man" means to take documents written in a less indefinite era than ours and reduce them gradually to abstraction, ambiguity, and fog. If twentieth-century man finds it possible to nourish his devotion by reading seventeenth-century literature in this way, we need not begrudge him it. However, to take a passage in *Paradise Lost* (10, 630-37: wherein Milton tells how the Messiah at the end of time shall hurl Sin and Death through Chaos so that they plug up forever the mouth of Hell) as "a dramatic image of the Last Judgement totally devoid of the rather gruesome melodrama with which Michaelangelo has treated the same subject" will disconcert any

reader who considers human beings of considerable importance both in literature and in theology.

St. Andrew-on-Hudson, Poughkeepsie, N.Y.

Edwin D. Cuffe, S.J.

READINGS IN ANCIENT AND MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY. Edited by James Collins. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. vii + 340. \$2.50. Sixth volume in a new series of paperbacks, Newman Press College Reading Series. It is intended to provide supplementary reading for college students taking an introductory course in ancient and medieval philosophy. For this reason, selection and arrangement of material has been made in accordance with the organization and treatment found in the standard textbooks in use in Catholic colleges, particularly Copleston, Owens, Brady, and Gilson. The readings consist of excerpts from the works of the philosophers themselves and selections from the books and articles of contemporary Catholic and non-Catholic commentators. The editor, with the assistance of William Wade, S.J., has made a thorough, judicious selection of materials. The selections from the philosophers represent not only a broad variety of philosophical viewpoints but also a variety of forms of philosophical expression: the dialogue, the letter, the meditation, the medieval question. Though one may regret the absence of selections from Plato, Aristotle, Augustine, and Thomas, C.'s reason for omitting them, the ready availability of a number of satisfactory anthologies, would seem to justify their omission. Among the secondary sources are selections from a number of the leading non-Catholic scholars of our day: Jaeger, Cornford, Osborn, Wolfson, etc. The greater number of selections, however, come from Catholic authors. There are excerpts from the well-known works of Gilson, Maritain, Armstrong, Bourke, and Pegis. However, no small part of the book's merit lies in the reproduction of a series of articles by representative American and Canadian scholars, less well known outside of professional circles, whose shrewd and apt choice gives evidence of C.'s familiarity with the development of North American Catholic scholarship during the last two decades. The reader will not only become aware of the magnificent progress of American Catholic scholarship in ancient and medieval philosophy, but he will also make the acquaintance of some of the principal professional reviews in which this scholarship has found expression: *New Scholasticism*, *Modern Schoolman*, *Mediaeval Studies*, and *Review of Metaphysics*. Inevitably, the individual selections must be brief; and at times articles chosen from scholarly reviews can be demanding reading for a student with scanty background in philosophy; but C. has provided each section with a

clearly written introduction, locating the selections in their context and preparing the student for his encounter with them.

Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y.

Gerald A. McCool, S.J.

TECHNOLOGY AND CHRISTIAN CULTURE. Edited by Robert Paul Mohan. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1960. Pp. 144. \$3.95. The temptation to blame the problems of the modern world on the machine has been one that the Christian intellectual has traditionally found seductive. It is a temptation which the rather pedestrian symposium contained in this volume has not completely avoided. One hesitates to disagree with such noted scholars as Dietrich von Hildebrand and Rudolph Allers, but one is forced to observe that their jeremiads against the machine seem somewhat dated. Fortunately, Thomas P. Neill saves the volume from being totally negative by quoting Pius XII's comment: "The Church . . . asks the faithful to see in the astounding progress of science the realization of the plan of God, who has entrusted to man the discovery and exploitation of the wealth of the universe" (Letter to the Forty-third Session of the *Semaines sociales de France*). It seems to occur but rarely to the critics of technology that the failure is not of the men who make machines but of the men who are supposed to equip their fellow men with the vision and courage to use the machines properly. If the scientist has failed his fellows, he has not done so nearly to the extent that the philosopher, the theologian, the politician, and the clergyman have failed. Fr. Francis Connell's concluding paper is instructive, but one hopes that Christianity has something more to offer to a world worried over the uses of technology than casuistry—however necessary that art may be. Not a few readers will find Fr. Connell's suggestion that Christians may engage in research in bacteriological warfare somewhat chilling.

Christ the King Rectory, Chicago

Andrew M. Greeley

MELANCHTHON. By Robert Stupperich. *Sammlung Göschen* 1190. Berlin: De Gruyter, 1960. Pp. 139. DM 3.60. For the four-hundredth anniversary (April 19, 1960) of M.'s death, S. presents a brief but comprehensive picture of M.'s life and theology, following it with a survey of the present state of Melanchthon studies (pp. 128-35). There is no apparatus of footnotes, but the historical and scientific accuracy of the work is assured by S.'s previous studies and by the fact that he is the editor of a six-volume student's edition of M.'s works (selection). *Multum in parvo*.

THE SCHOOL EXAMINED: ITS AIM AND CONTENT. By Vincent Edward Smith. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1960. Pp. xii + 300. \$5.75. An outline of

an educational program based on principles which S. derives from his readings in Aristotle, St. Thomas, and their commentators. It is similar in scope, in content, and in style to *The Arts of Learning and Communication*, by Benedict Ashley, O.P., with the exception that S. explicitly treats of all levels of schooling. On the grounds of his view of the Aristotelian-Thomistic position, S. opposes those various students of esthetics, sociology, mathematics, and physical science who regard their fields as embracing speculative areas. Though S.'s view of Thomism may strike some observers as severely limited, there is no doubt that if his program could be applied in the actual work of education, it would merit the highest praise. One's final assessment of this book, then, must be made only in the light of its practical relevance to our current educational needs.

BOOKS RECEIVED

[All books received are listed here whether they are reviewed or not]

Scriptural Studies

- Armstrong, J. F., et al. *A Bibliography of Bible Study*. Princeton Seminary Pamphlets 1. 2nd rev. ed. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Theological Seminary, 1960. Pp. 107. \$1.00 (paper).
- Auzou, Georges. *The Word of God: Approaches to the Mystery of the Sacred Scriptures*. Translated by Josefa Thornton. St. Louis: Herder, 1960. Pp. 255. \$4.75.
- The Book of Deuteronomy* 1 and 2. Commentary by George S. Glanzman, S.J. Pamphlet Bible Series 9 and 10. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 79, 96. \$.75 each.
- The Book of Exodus* 2. Commentary by Roland E. Murphy, O.Carm. Pamphlet Bible Series 5. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 96. \$.75.
- The Book of Genesis* 1 and 2. Commentary by Ignatius Hunt, O.S.B. Pamphlet Bible Series 2 and 3. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 96 each. \$.75 each.
- The Book of Josue*. Commentary by Joseph De Vault, S.J. Pamphlet Bible Series 11. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 96. \$.75.
- The Book of Judges*. Commentary by Philip J. King. Pamphlet Bible Series 12. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 96. \$.75.
- The Book of Numbers* 1 and 2. Commentary by Frederick L. Moriarty, S.J. Pamphlet Bible Series 7 and 8. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 96, 80. \$.75 each.

- The Book of Proverbs*. Commentary by J. Terence Forestell, C.S.B. Pamphlet Bible Series 37. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 96. \$.75.
- Butler, Christopher, O.S.B. *The Church and The Bible*. Baltimore: Helicon, 1961. Pp. 111. \$2.95.
- Cerfaux, Lucien. *The Four Gospels: An Historical Introduction*. Translated by Patrick Hepburne-Scott. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 145. \$3.00.
- Cody, Aelred, O.S.B. *Heavenly Sanctuary and Liturgy in the Epistle to the Hebrews*. St. Meinrad, Ind.: Grail, 1960. Pp. xiii + 227. \$5.00 (paper).
- Conzelmann, Hans. *The Theology of Saint Luke*. Translated by Geoffrey Buswell. New York: Harper, 1961. Pp. 255. \$5.00.
- Gärtner, Bertil. *The Theology of the Gospel according to Thomas*. Translated by Eric J. Sharpe. New York: Harper, 1961. Pp. 286. \$5.00.
- Hermann, Ingo. *Kyrios und Pneuma: Studien zur Christologie der paulinischen Hauptbriefe*. Studien zum Alten und Neuen Testament 2. Munich: Kösel, 1961. Pp. 155. DM 19.80.
- Johnson, Sherman E. *The Gospel according to St. Mark*. Harper's New Testament Commentaries. New York: Harper, 1961. Pp. 279. \$5.00.
- Johnston, Leonard. *Witnesses to God*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 174. \$3.50.
- The Law Given through Moses: Introduction to the Pentateuch*. By Neil J. McEleney, C.S.P. Pamphlet Bible Series 1. New York: Paulist Press, 1960. Pp. 32. \$.75.
- Steinmann, J. *Le livre de la consolation d'Israël et les prophètes du retour de l'exil*. Lectio divina 28. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 316. 15.30 fr.
- Wagner, Siegfried. *Die Essener in der wissenschaftlichen Diskussion*. BZAW 79. Berlin: Töpelmann, 1960. Pp. xi + 284.
- Winter, Paul. *On the Trial of Jesus*. Studia Judaica 1. Berlin: De Gruyter, 1961. Pp. 216. DM 22.—
- The Word of Life: Essays on the Bible*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 123. \$1.75 (paper).

Doctrinal Theology

- Chiffot, Th.-G., O.P. *Approches d'une théologie de l'histoire*. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 132. 6.30 fr.
- Clark, Francis, S.J. *Eucharistic Sacrifice and the Reformation*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1961. Pp. 582. \$7.50.
- Jeanne d'Arc, Soeur, et al. *Au seuil de la théologie* 1. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 448. 18 fr.
- Diepen, H.-M. *La théologie de l'Emmanuel*. Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1960. Pp. xvi + 324. 195 fr.

- Grandmaison, Léonce de, S.J. *Jesus Christ*. Translated by Basil Whelan, O.S.B. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 266. \$4.50.
- Hanley, Philip L., O.P. *The Life of the Mystical Body: The Church, Grace, and the Sacraments*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1961. Pp. 378. \$4.95.
- Hernández, Angel Santos, S.J. *Salvación y paganismo: El problema teológico de la salvación de los infieles*. Bibliotheca Comillensis. Santander: Sal Terrae, 1960. Pp. 756.
- Honings, Boniface, O.C.D. *Caritas en zonde bij Sint Thomas*. Extract from *Bijdragen* 21 (1960). Maastricht, 1960. Pp. 43.
- Die Kirche und ihre Ämter und Stünde*. Edited by Wilhelm Corsten, Augustinus Frotz, and Peter Linden. Festgabe Joseph Kardinal Frings. Cologne: Bachem, 1960. Pp. 701. DM 70.50.
- Le Guillou, M.-J. *Mission et unité: Les exigences de la communion*. 2 vols. Unam sanctam 33, 34. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 296, 336. 27 fr. each.
- Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche 5: Hannover bis Karlerios*. Edited by Josef Höfer and Karl Rahner, S.J. New York: Herder, 1960. Pp. 12* + cols. 1384. \$22.50 (cloth), \$24.75 (half leather).
- La maternité spirituelle de Marie 1*. Edited by H. du Manoir, S.J. *Etudes mariales* 16 (1959). Paris: Lethielleux, 1960. Pp. 159. 16.00 fr.
- Perrin, Joseph-Marie, O.P. *Le mystère de la charité*. Bruges: Desclée de Brouwer, 1960. Pp. 536. 210 fr.
- Plus, Raoul, S.J. *Baptism and Confirmation*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 100. \$1.25.
- Ripley, Francis J. *One Christ, One Church*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 112. \$.90 (paper).
- Schillebeeckx, E. H., O.P. *Le Christ, sacrement de la rencontre de Dieu*. Translated from the Dutch by A. Kerkvoorde, O.S.B. *Lex orandi* 31. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 272. 10.50 fr.
- Sheerin, John B., C.S.P. *The Sacrament of Freedom*. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1961. Pp. 166. \$3.50.
- Thils, Gustave. *La "théologie oecuménique": Notion, formes, démarches*. Bibliotheca Ephemeridum theologicarum Lovaniensium 16. Louvain: Warny, 1960. Pp. 82.

History and Biography, Patristics

- Amédée de Lausanne. *Huit homélies mariales*. Introduction and notes by G. Bavaud; text by J. Deshusses, O.S.B.; translation by A. Dumas, O.S.B. *Sources chrétiennes* 72. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 242. 15 fr.
- Augereau, Joseph. *Jeanne Absolu: Une mystique du grand siècle*. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 264. 10.50 fr.

- Bardy, Gustave, and Pierre Périchon, S.J. *Eusèbe de Césarée: Histoire ecclésiastique 4: Introduction et index*. Sources chrétiennes 73. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 336. 24 fr.
- Bergamo, Peter de. *In opera sancti Thomae Aquinatis index seu tabula aurea*. Rome: Editiones Paulinae, 1961. Pp. 1250.
- Daniélou, Jean, S.J. *From Shadows to Reality: Studies in the Biblical Typology of the Fathers*. Translated by Wulstan Hibberd, O.S.B. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1961. Pp. 296. \$5.50.
- Gorman, John C., S.M. *William of Newburgh's Explanatio sacri epithalamii in matrem sponsi*. Spicilegium Friburgense 6. Fribourg: University Press, 1960. Pp. 369. DM 28.—
- Kittler, Glenn D. *The White Fathers*. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 318. \$.95 (paper).
- Les leçons d'un contemplatif: Le Traité de l'oraison d'Evagre le Pontique*. Introduction, translation, and commentary by I. Hausherr, S.J. Paris: Beauchesne, 1960. Pp. 200. 9.90 fr.
- Maier, Jean-Louis. *Les missions divines selon saint Augustin*. Paradosis 16. Fribourg: Editions Univ., 1960. Pp. x + 226. DM 18.—
- Morrall, John B. *Gerson and the Great Schism*. Manchester: University Press, 1960. Pp. 132. 25s.
- Nédoncelle, M., R. Aubert, et al. *L'Ecclésiologie au XIX^e siècle*. Unam sanctam 35. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 396. 21.90 fr.
- Origène. *Homélies sur Josué*. Introduction, text, translation, and notes by Annie Jaubert. Sources chrétiennes 71. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 520. 30 fr.
- Patrologiae cursus completus, series latina: Supplementum II*, II***. Edited by Adalbert Hamman, O.F.M. Paris: Garnier, 1960. Pp. 747.
- Phelan, Gerald B. *The Wisdom of St. Anselm*. Wimmer Lecture 3. Latrobe, Pa.: Archabbey Press, 1961. Pp. 52. \$2.50.
- Sykes, Norman. *Man as Churchman*. Wiles Lectures, 1959. New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1961. Pp. 203. \$4.00.
- Talbot, Francis, S.J. *Saint among Savages*. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 522. \$1.45 (paper).
- Walgrave, J.-H., O.P. *Newman the Theologian*. Translated by A. V. Little-dale. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1960. Pp. 378. \$8.50.
- Watkin, E. I. *The Church in Council*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 227. \$3.95.

Moral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions

- Abbo, John A., and Jerome D. Hannan. *The Sacred Canons 1: Canons 1-869; 2: Canons 870-2414*. 2nd rev. ed. St. Louis: Herder, 1960. Pp. 871, 936. \$19.00.

- Davis, Charles. *Liturgy and Doctrine*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 123. \$2.50.
- Frömmigkeit*. Edited by T. Bogler, O.S.B. Liturgie und Mönchtum 27. Maria Laach: Ars liturgica, 1960. Pp. 159.
- Getlein, Frank, and Harold C. Gardiner, S.J. *Movies, Morals, and Art*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 179. \$3.50.
- Goldbrunner, Josef. *Life in Accordance with God's Commandments*. Teaching the Catholic Catechism 3. New York: Herder and Herder, 1960. Pp. 122. \$1.65.
- Hawkins, D. J. B. *Man and Morals*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 104. \$3.00.
- Kuttner, Stephan G. *Harmony from Dissonance: An Interpretation of Medieval Canon Law*. Wimmer Lecture 10. Latrobe, Pa.: Archabbey Press, 1961. Pp. 64. \$2.50.
- Liesel, Nicholas. *Eastern Catholic Liturgies*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. xx + 168. 114 plates. \$4.95.
- Lottin, Odon, O.S.B. *Etudes de morale: Histoire et doctrine*. Gembloux: Duculot, 1961. Pp. 365. 385 fr.
- McManus, Frederick R. *Handbook for the New Rubrics*. Baltimore: Helicon, 1961. Pp. 203. \$4.50.
- Rahner, Hugo, S.J., ed. *La paroisse: De la théologie à la pratique*. Translated by M. Barth, O.P. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1961. Pp. 158. 5.10 fr.
- Regatillo, Edward F., S.J. *Jus sacramentarium*. 3rd. ed. Bibliotheca Comilensis. Santander: Sal Terrae, 1960. Pp. xi + 963. 140 ptas. (cloth), 120 ptas. (paper).
- Scanlan, Kevin, S.M.A. *Ordination and the Canonical Status of Clerics in Societies without Vows*. Rome: Angelicum, 1960. Pp. 159.
- Schlegel, Desmond, O.S.B. *Hearing Confessions*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 32. \$.75 (paper).
- Vismans, Th. A., O.P., and Lucas Brinkhoff, O.F.M. *Critical Bibliography of Liturgical Literature*. Translated by R. W. Fitzpatrick and C. Howell, S.J. Bibliographia ad usum seminariorum E 1. Nijmegen: Association of Seminary and Monastery Librarians, 1960. Pp. 80. \$1.75.
- Pastoral and Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature*
- Balirach, Jesus Martínez, S.J. *Lecciones esquemáticas de espiritualidad*. Santander: Sal Terrae, 1960. Pp. 430.
- Biser, Eugen. *The Light of the Lamb*. Translated by William Kramer, C.P.P.S. Chicago: Regnery, 1961. Pp. 111. \$2.95.
- Crawley-Boevey, Mateo, SS.CC. *Father Mateo Speaks to Priests on Priestly Perfection*. Translated by Francis Larkin, SS.CC. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 258. \$3.75.

- Duffey, Felix D., C.S.C. *With Anxious Care*. St. Louis: Herder, 1961. Pp. 125. \$2.75.
- Gleason, R. W., S.J. *To Live Is Christ*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1960. Pp. 180. \$3.00.
- Guardini, Romano. *Psaumes et fêtes*. Translated by M. Cé. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1961. Pp. 280. 6.90 fr.
- Iparraguirre, Ignatius, S.J. *How to Give a Retreat*. Translated by Angelo Benedetti, S.J. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1960. Pp. 188. \$1.75 (paper).
- St. John of the Cross. *Spiritual Canticle*. Translated, edited, and introduced by E. Allison Peers. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 520. \$1.45 (paper).
- Kinsella, Nivard, O.C.S.O. *Unprofitable Servants: Conferences on Humility*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1961. Pp. 105. \$3.00.
- Liguori, St. Alphonsus. *The Way of St. Alphonsus Liguori*. Presented by Barry Ulanov. New York: Kenedy, 1961. Pp. xv + 367. \$4.95.
- McNamara, William, O.C.D. *Manual for Retreat Masters*. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1960. Pp. 94. \$1.50 (paper).
- Ripley, Francis J. *A Priest Forever*. Westminster, Md.: Newman, 1961. Pp. 233. \$3.95.
- Salliège, Jules Cardinal. *Ecrits spirituels*. Presented by G.-M. Garrone, Archbishop of Toulouse. Paris: Grasset, 1960. Pp. 326. 9.30 fr.
- Sanson, Henri, S.J. *Pratique des sacrements*. Le Puy: Xavier Mappus, 1960. Pp. 216. 8.40 fr.
- Sattler, Henry V., C.S.S.R. *Together in Christ: A Preparation for Marriage*. Twelve pamphlets and teaching manual. Washington, D.C.: Family Life Bureau, N.C.W.C., 1960. \$3.50.
- Vann, Gerald, O.P. *The Divine Pity: A Study in the Social Implications of the Beatitudes*. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 189. \$.75 (paper).
- Van Zeller, Hubert, O.S.B. *Approach to Calvary*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 128. \$2.95.
- Van Zeller, Hubert, O.S.B. *We Die Standing Up*. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 160. \$.65 (paper).

Philosophical Questions

- Delanglade, Jean, S.J. *Le problème de Dieu*. Paris: Aubier, 1960. Pp. 270.
- Ferré, Frederick. *Language, Logic, and God*. New York: Harper, 1960. Pp. 184. \$3.50.
- Gilson, Etienne. *Reason and Revelation in the Middle Ages*. New York: Scribner, 1961. Pp. 114. \$1.25 (paper).

- Kimpel, Ben. *Principles of Moral Philosophy*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1960. Pp. 234. \$3.75.
- Maritain, Jacques. *Man's Approach to God*. Wimmer Lecture 5. Latrobe, Pa.: Archabbey Press, 1961. Pp. 53. \$2.50.
- O'Brien, Thomas C., O.P. *Metaphysics and the Existence of God*. Washington, D.C.: Thomist Press, 1960. Pp. 269. \$3.50.
- Scheler, Max. *On the Eternal in Man*. Translated by Bernard Noble. New York: Harper, 1961. Pp. 480. \$10.00.

Special Questions

- Brady, Charles A. *Stage of Fools: A Novel of St. Thomas More*. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 351. \$.95 (paper).
- Cahiers d'études biologiques 6-7: Les origines de l'homme*. Paris: Lethielleux, 1960. Pp. 204.
- Collins, J. B. *Confraternity Teacher's Guide*. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1960. Pp. 458. \$2.95 (paper).
- Combes, André. *Dieu et le bonheur du chrétien*. Paris: Editions du Cèdre, 1961. Pp. 95.
- Dover, K. J. *Greek Word Order*. New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1961. Pp. xiii + 72. \$3.00.
- Fuerst, Clement J., S.J. *Normae scriptis edendis in disciplinis ecclesiasticis*. Rome: Gregorian Univ., 1961. Pp. 105. L. 800.
- King, N. Q. "There's such Divinity doth hedge a King": *Studies in Ruler Cult and the Religion of Sacral Monarchy in Some Late Fourth Century Byzantine Monuments*. Edinburgh: Nelson, 1960. Pp. 34. 7 plates.
- Livres catholiques 1955-1958*. Paris: Lethielleux, 1960. Pp. 159. 6.00 fr.
- Macquarrie, John. *The Scope of Demythologizing: Bullmann and His Critics*. New York: Harper, 1961. Pp. 255. \$4.50.
- Maritain, Raïssa. *The Memoirs of Raïssa Maritain: We Have Been Friends Together, Adventures in Grace*. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 392. \$1.25 (paper).
- Michaud, Henri. *Jésus selon le Coran*. Cahiers théologiques 46. Neuchâtel: Delachaux et Niestlé, 1960. Pp. 100. 5.50 fr.
- Religious Education through CCD: The Proceedings of the Workshop Conducted at the Catholic University of America, June 10 to 21, 1960*. Edited by Joseph B. Collins. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1961. Pp. 164. \$2.50 (paper).
- Samson, Joseph. *Les sept psaumes de la pénitence*. Edition A: Complete score with organ accompaniment. Edition B: Polyphonic score for a choir of

four mixed voices. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 48 each. 6.60 fr., 5.70 fr.

Sint, Josef A. *Pseudonymität im Altertum*. Commentationes Aenipontanae 15. Innsbruck: Wagner, 1960. Pp. 170. öS 130.

Stern, Karl. *The Third Revolution*. New York: Doubleday, 1961. Pp. 199. \$.75 (paper).

Tillich, Paul. *The Shaking of the Foundations*. New York: Scribner, 1961. Pp. 186. \$1.25 (paper).

Truchet, Jacques. *La prédication de Bossuet: Etude des thèmes*. 2 vols. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 369, 346. 29.70 fr.

Umen, Samuel. *The Nature of Judaism*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1960. Pp. 152. \$3.75.

White, Helen C. *Prayer and Poetry*. Wimmer Lecture 8. Latrobe, Pa.: Archabbey Press, 1961. Pp. 59. \$2.50.

Wills, Garry. *Chesterton: Man and Mask*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961. Pp. 243. \$4.50.