

BOOK REVIEWS

SOMATIC COMPREHENSION OF UNITY: THE CHURCH IN EPHESUS. By Kōshi Usami, S.J. Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1983. Pp. xii + 219. \$18.

This book represents the final results of a dissertation done by the author under the direction of F. Lentzen-Deis, S.J., for the Gregorian University. The Letter to the Ephesians is read by Usami as a Japanese Christian. According to him, this letter with its description of a Hellenistic urban society provides a model for Christian life even today. U.'s aim is to describe the particular quality and nature of the unity of the Ephesian Church, where there was tension between older Christians and newcomers. These two groups, represented by "you" and "we," cannot simply be reduced to Gentiles and Jewish Christians. The unity called for in the letter is not static but dynamic; the text itself witnesses a movement of unification and integration of the new Christians into the "old but new" community of Christ.

U. proposes for the letter a literary genre, "Christagological" literature, which for him is "mystagogical." Thus the author of the letter introduces the Ephesians into a deeper comprehension of the divine mystery of God's will and sets forth instructions, admonitions, and ways of proceeding which are meant to encourage and help new Christians along the way to becoming full members of the Body of Christ. In view of its cosmic dimension and scope, this process of deepening the unity is not individual but communal. U.'s determination of this literary genre is based on an analysis of texts, especially Eph 1:3-14 and its function within the letter, and also on a study of the author's language, style, and purpose.

According to U., the author of the letter provides a new description of the unity of the Church in terms of a "somatic" comprehension. Through the use of the image of body, he explains and develops his perception in order to express the dynamic character of the Christian community in relation to both its members and its surroundings. U.'s book consists of five chapters, the last of which is a summary and a practical application for Christians. There are also an extended bibliography and indices of biblical and other ancient sources, of Greek words and of authors.

U. and his mentor are to be congratulated on the attempt to reveal a hermeneutic of Ephesians understandable to Asian Christians too. Normally one would not have attempted this in a doctoral dissertation. More importantly, U. has in large part succeeded in his attempt. He has done a thorough study of the first four chapters of the letter and explained their evidence in a defensible manner. His book proves interesting and challenging reading.

However, U.'s interpretation is not without difficulties. He too easily accepts the questionable textual reading "at Ephesus" (Eph 1:1) and builds some of his arguments on this reading. Moreover, "you" and "we" could, despite U.'s contention, just as reasonably refer respectively to the community addressed and to the author of the letter and those with him, or to a combination of both of these, as to different groups within the community addressed. But this correction would not destroy the main point U. is making. Also, U. in his image of body appears reluctant to include uniformity of doctrine; I doubt that this is faithful to the text. A few times the concern for Asian peoples' world views seems to have influenced the precision of the interpretation.

St. Louis University

ROBERT F. O'TOOLE, S.J.

IN MEMORY OF HER: A FEMINIST THEOLOGICAL RECONSTRUCTION OF CHRISTIAN ORIGINS. By Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza. New York: Crossroad, 1983. Pp. xxv + 351. \$19.50.

The subtitle accurately describes the purpose and scope of this book, which concentrates on the NT text but also includes considerations from early patristic and Gnostic writings. It consists of three parts: (1) the problem of overcoming the customary androcentric interpretation of both the NT and the history of the apostolic Church; the method of discovering a legitimate and effective feminist hermeneutic; (2) the results of such a feminist hermeneutic in discovering and describing that the Gospels do portray a historical Jesus who preached and founded a discipleship of equals among women and men, even if only briefly; (3) the (re)patriarchalization of Jesus' disciples in the patriarchalization and genderization of church, ministry, and office. An epilogue on "The Ekklesia of Women" completes the book. Unfortunately, there is no index of topics, names, biblical texts—very desirable in a book such as this.

Above all, the book is interesting as an example of what might be called "A Hermeneutics of Reception," according to the scholastic axiom *Quidquid recipitur ad modum recipientis recipitur*. By this I mean that, although the material is generally available to any scholar, it is the precise character of the author which enables a new and challenging interpretation such as this book's. Different questions enable different readings. On this count alone, this book—and others by women theologians, whether they understand themselves as explicitly "feminist" or not—perform an irreplaceable service. Likewise, on this count, one need not agree with every interpretation or position in order to recognize the value of the contribution. Fortunately in the present case, the expertise of the author provides for material as well as formal value.

Some questions can be asked, of course. Does such a reconstruction avoid the difficulties inherent in any canon-within-the-canon or middle/heart of the Gospel approach? Can any reconstruction of the "historical Jesus" bear the weight of the reconstruction and of the reconstructor's purpose? When various interpretations (or reconstructions) of any given text are legitimate, how does one establish the priority of a particular interpretation? If one cannot establish such priority, how much does the preferred interpretation actually "prove"? This is important for the feminist interpretation of texts such as Mk 12:18-27, Lk 13:10-17. These are, of course, questions not only for this book and any other feminist reconstruction, but in regard to all biblical interpretation. For reconstructions, however, they may be of special import.

In regard to the Household Code of Ephesians 5:21-33, I wonder whether sufficient weight is given to verse 21, which calls on all Christians to be subject to one another, so that, however male-dominational the subsequent verses are/appear, the patriarchal paradigm has nevertheless been nullified. I do not find the proposed "Ekklesia of Women" on target, except as an explicitly acknowledged temporary strategy, and even then I would have to wonder. As a defense against the accusation of "reverse sexism," the author wonders whether we also speak of "reverse colonialism" and "reverse imperialism" (347). Perhaps we do not, but that would have more to do with a certain prevalent liberal, leftist ideology and its preferential rhetorical option than with the actual state of affairs. In perhaps her only concession to certain excesses of various but especially Latin American liberation theologies, she excessively inflates the Exodus "event" and deflates the Eden "myth," especially insofar as these are directly confronted. Where there is a greater proclamation of the "Discipleship of Equals" than in Genesis' Eden properly interpreted, I know not. In any case, are not Eden and Exodus complementary rather than contrasting, to say nothing of contrary or contradictory?

The author does very well in pointing out that some patriarchalist statements may very well neither declare true doctrine nor describe empirical factuality, but rather be androcentric prescriptions. In view of an article that appeared in the *Wall Street Journal* just as I was completing this review and that described the booming business in "submissive" Filipino brides for American men, I wonder whether "wishful thinking/hoping" might not be a better term than even prescription. Very much to the point and to be welcomed unconditionally is the author's insistence on the legitimacy of women's aspiration to power. There might be those, of course, who are still entangled completely in the Greek transcendentals and who do not appreciate the Hebrew transcendental of "power," and who are consequently upset by such talk of power, but I would consider this their problem and not Schüssler Fior-

enza's. For anyone, however, within the Judeo-Christian tradition, power can only be regarded as a Godlike attribute, liable, of course, like any created reality, to abuse. But *abusus non tollit usum* is a time-honored Catholic principle. As long as women are disempowered, the promise of Eden will be compromised, within and without the Church.

This book will have a very wide audience, deservedly.

Catholic University of America

ROBERT KRESS

THE WESTMINSTER DICTIONARY OF CHRISTIAN THEOLOGY. Edited by Alan Richardson and John Bowden. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1983. Pp. 624. \$24.95.

This is an expanded and substantially revised edition of *A Dictionary of Christian Theology* edited by Richardson and first published in 1969. Bowden, who had worked closely with him on the original version, undertook the present edition after R.'s death. The main differences are: a much larger and more ecumenical list of contributors; an evident sensitivity to other traditions and the history of religions; inclusion of many more topics, especially those concerned with contemporary movements and positions in theology; and a more consistently and rigorously theological perspective throughout the volume.

The *Dictionary* entries are concerned with theological topics, not with names of theologians or events, nor with the ecclesiastical denominations and structures, though all of these are, of course, brought into the elucidation of the theological topics. The approach is accurately described on the dust jacket: "... includes schools of thought and controversies and events crucial in the development of doctrine, as well as vocabulary and questions of perennial significance in theology. Entries are structured to provide the origins of expressions; their significance in Christian theological history; differing views on the meaning of terms and issues; descriptions of the contemporary relevance of the items; a brief bibliography giving classical sources for the origins and discussions of the terms."

It is this attention to historical development and to the etymological and contextual meaning of the terms that makes the new edition particularly serviceable as a ready reference. It is written to be understood by students of theology at all stages of sophistication, and will be useful to professional theologians as a memory aid and for introductory information on topics outside their own specialization.

The approximately 160 contributing authors are deliberately selected among Catholic, Orthodox, Anglican, and Protestant scholars. There is a consistent policy of representing schools and positions by those who are sympathetic to them. The authors are mainly British and North

American, with a scattering of others where appropriate. Some are well known, some almost unknown, but all appear to be well chosen for their particular contributions.

On the whole, the authors have fulfilled the declared purpose very satisfactorily in their essays, but one might register a certain disappointment in some of the bibliographies, which seem to be less than critical in their selection. This is a perennial problem for editors and authors of encyclopedias and dictionaries, and becomes more acute at a time of lively exchange of thought and exuberant publishing such as the present. Yet one hopes that in future editions there might be stricter criteria to separate the classic from the "trendy," because this is something that students cannot easily do for themselves in using a reference book. An author, e.g., who cites his own book as the main contribution in the field might be coaxed to share with us what were the main sources he used for that book.

An especially helpful feature is the selection, length, and content of the longer articles and the general pattern on which they are organized. This pattern generally begins with a definition of terms used, a brief explanation of issues at stake, and an identification of the sociohistorical, denominational, or philosophical context in which the term or issue is to be understood. It then develops the topic through its historical unfolding, often dialectically in terms of positions and publications of various parties to a dispute or discussion. In this way, even a rather untutored reader can move into technical and specialized subject matter with growing understanding.

For its declared purpose, this book can be recommended with enthusiasm. As compared, e.g., with the one-volume Rahner-Vorgrimler theological dictionary, it is seriously ecumenical, uses plainer language and does not suffer from the difficulties of translation, has longer entries on important topics, and is well printed. For use with undergraduate students, this volume needs to be supplemented with the forthcoming companion volume, *Who's Who in Theology*, and with a good dictionary of church history. Otherwise students will be discouraged by mention of names and events not explained within the volume.

Georgetown University

MONIKA K. HELLWIG

GOD AND SKEPTICISM: A STUDY IN SKEPTICISM AND FIDEISM. By Terence Penelhum. Boston: Reidel, 1983. Pp. xiv + 186. \$34.95.

In the final revisions of his *Dialogues concerning Natural Religion*, David Hume interpolated the classic endorsement of skeptically-based fideism into Philo's final speech: "To be a philosophical sceptic is . . . the first and most essential step towards being a sound, believing Christian."

P., professor of philosophy in the University of Calgary, examines the reasons for using skeptical arguments to support or make room for Christian faith. He finds those arguments sorely wanting.

P. first distinguishes forms of skepticism. Pyrrhonian skeptics remain neutral about dogmatists' claims to know the Real. They achieve ataraxia by abandoning metaphysical debates and living in conformity with appearances as the naive live. Academic skeptics deny that anyone can surely distinguish the Real. They live according to the probabilities they find in appearances.

P. then examines parallel fideist strategies. Conformist fideism, associated with Erasmus, Montaigne, and Bayle, finds no way to resolve dogmatic disputes and counsels conformity with the established religious traditions to find peace of mind. P. shows that the price for such quietude is self-deception. Evangelical fideisms, such as Pascal's or Kierkegaard's, use skeptical strategies to show that reason cannot ground or cause faith in God. Either one must make the Pascalian wager and begin to practice those disciplines ("holy water and masses") which break down the barriers one has constructed against God, or one must make the Kierkegaardian leap into faith and submit one's reason to the purifying acceptance of the Absolute Paradox which makes room for faith, i.e., submission to God in discipleship.

P. shows that fideistic acceptance of skeptical strategies misses the point. If, as fideists claim, "our corruption keeps us from God, this does not show any philosophical argument for God to be unsound" (95). Even a sound theistic argument could not convince a corrupt mind. Further, fideists' accepting skeptical strategies is self-defeating; for skepticism undermines "the claim that what keeps men from God is their own perversity, by suggesting there is another cause—their intellectual incapacity" (101).

The philosophical points are brought home in P.'s discussion of contemporary conformist fideists, e.g., D. Z. Phillips, and evangelical fideists, e.g., Alvin Plantinga. Phillips is criticized for his narrow range of exemplars of faith which sustains his antirepresentative account of religion. Plantinga's work exemplifies a form of a sound argument, i.e., a permissive Parity argument, viz., if all must make some fundamental intellectual commitments which cannot be justified without circularity, then someone who holds a religious commitment as a fundamental intellectual commitment is as rational as someone who does not (given that both have coherent and supported belief structures).

This is a model essay in philosophy of religion: lucid, provocative, and convincing. Discussions of secondary issues—the role of the will in belief, the legitimacy of some forms of natural theology given the Parity position (*pace* Phillips and Plantinga)—are nuanced and balanced. A final chapter

sketches a view of the nature of faith, reflecting primarily on Aquinas. Should P. fill out this sketch in as readable and enjoyable a text as the present one, we would be gifted indeed.

St. Michael's College, Vermont

TERRENCE W. TILLEY

YESTERDAY AND TODAY: A STUDY OF CONTINUITIES IN CHRISTOLOGY. By Colin E. Gunton. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1983. Pp. xi + 228. \$7.95.

The author, a lecturer in systematic theology at King's College, London, has written an apologetic against those many voices which say that the cultural context is so changed that it is impossible to maintain continuity with classical Christology and at the same time speak to one's contemporaries intelligibly. The scope of his argument is ambitious. Beginning with a critical discussion of the not so clear distinction between Christology done "from above" and "from below," he finds flaws in both approaches. For example, taking the approach of Karl Rahner, whom he sees exemplifying the "from below" approach, G. finds a weakness in Rahner's "dependence upon an anthropology which, far from removing the dangers of ancient anthropology, reproduces them in another form, by creating a gulf between the New Testament picture of Jesus and forms of human self-assessment drawing heavily on existentialist and other modern traditions" (15). Pannenberg, another example of a "from below" approach, fails by reducing Christology to soteriology and Jesus to a divinized man. G. thinks that "from below" approaches, rather than function inductively as they claim, usually impose their frameworks on the content. G. distinguishes two Christologies "from above," one in which the concept of God is heavily determined by philosophical considerations (Type A), and the other in which the manner of reasoning is determined by theological considerations (Type B). Although both approaches are needed, G. states that there is much that modern Christology "from below" has in common with Platonic approaches to knowledge. At the end of the chapter, one of his fundamental contentions is stated: if "ancient thought tended to abstract Jesus Christ from history by eternalizing him . . . modern thought tends to abstract him from eternity by making his temporality absolute" (53).

The fourth chapter, devoted to the place of NT historical research, concludes that much of this scholarly work has been vitiated by a dualism which assumes that the divine (Christ of faith) and the human (Jesus of history), the eternal and the temporal, are mutually exclusive. The fifth chapter argues that "post-Kantian dualism is to our time what the axiom of impassibility was to that of the Fathers" (97). Our difficulty, which tends to be a dualism from below (our world is thought to be self-

sufficient), is, contends G., that of finding in human events anything more than the working out of principles immanent within the universe. For there to be orthodox Christology, such dualism must be overcome; for in the God-man both eternity and time exist in one historical figure.

Chapters six and seven constitute "the heart of the book" and represent "the breaking of new ground" (x). Since we conceive of space as absolute, the Incarnation seems to be an intervention by God from outside. A partial solution to this way of conceiving space is found by G. in a book about music (Zuckerland, *Sound and Symbol*) which explains that tones interpenetrate in space and create musical chords. Turning from space to time, music allows us to perceive time not as that during which things decay (Aristotle) but as that in which the timeless and the transient flow together. Drawing upon the insight of Polanyi, G. holds for a less rigid relationship between words and things, and stress on the metaphor of "indwelling" rather than contemplation and sight (Plato). Words are not mirrors of reality but the means by which we participate in reality. We do this best "convivially," in a group seeking the same end. The biblical expressions of both St. Paul and St. John tell us that our relationship with Christ becomes real only in a community by the agency of the Holy Spirit. If we indwell the traditional Christological languages rather than examine them critically from a distance, G. contends that their relative validity remains, even for our contemporaries. The final chapter, provoked by recent debates in England about the relationship of Christology to politics, explains that an imperial Constantinian Christ will not be overcome by substituting a "deabsolutized" historical Jesus. G. is confident that a proper conception of the divinity of Jesus leads not to an apolitical Jesus but to one which reveals the absolute precisely through the contingency and vulnerability of the human—hardly the route traveled by Cardinal Wolsey or Camillo Torres (199).

It is difficult to evaluate such a book. In relatively few pages G. has touched on a wide variety of issues, criticized Rahner and Hegel, Origen and Schleiermacher, drawn epistemological insights from the philosophy of science and the nature of music, challenged the relativizing tendencies of "liberal Protestant and Marxist Catholic" (198) Christologies, and through all of this has maintained that there are deep continuities from the age of the Fathers to our own. This allows G. to conclude that the tradition need not be jettisoned but rethought in such a way that the dualistic assumptions that have plagued both the Fathers and contemporary theologians are overcome. It should be obvious that had the author taken on less he may have done it more cogently. There is no evidence of familiarity with even one major liberation theologian. Nevertheless, this is an important work, more for what it attempts than for what it

achieves: the reclamation of traditional Christology in a way that sheds light on contemporary questions. For those scholars well acquainted with the history of Christology, this study will be most valuable.

University of Dayton

JAMES HEFT, S.M.

JUSTIFICATION: AN ECUMENICAL STUDY. By George Tavard. New York: Paulist, 1983. Pp. 137. \$7.95.

In this intriguing short treatise Tavard, a Catholic participant in numerous ecumenical discussions, argues that Luther's basic teachings on justification should be judged as a legitimate exposition of the central Catholic tradition and as a promising basis for overcoming the divisions of the Reformation.

T. builds his argument by means of an interpretive history of the doctrine of justification. As a starting point, he isolates what he considers to be Paul's crucial insight into justification: that all human religious systems must be broken down before divine justice can be communicated. He then traces the various compromises of this insight in the early Church, especially by Pelagius. Against this setting, Augustine is presented as a recovery of Paul's crucial insight. Unfortunately, medieval scholasticism did not remain true to Augustine, and Pelagian tendencies arose again.

In the midst of the medieval mixture of varying degrees of Pelagianism, Luther's stress on justification by faith alone and on Christian life as *simul justus et peccator* was a clarion call for a return to the radical theology of Paul and Augustine. However, Luther suffered a fate similar to that of his predecessors. On the one hand, Catholic theologians have typically misunderstood Luther's theology because they overlooked its primarily personal and religious focus. On the other hand, Luther's radical doctrine of justification was compromised by Lutheran scholasticism, by Calvin's doctrine of the third use of the law, and particularly by Wesley's understanding of sanctification. Against this background T. advances his thesis that the only hope for overcoming the divisions of the Reformation is if Protestants and Catholics alike reconstruct their theology of justification in keeping with Luther's principle of justification *sola fide* (110).

How are this claim and T.'s project as a whole to be assessed? T. has shown convincingly that there are precedents in Scripture and the Catholic tradition for Luther's understanding of justification, even when construed in its most radical sense. However, it can be questioned whether this radical reading of Scripture, tradition, and Luther in particular is one-sided to the point of distortion.

It is very significant that T. consistently chooses to defend the doctrine

of justification *by faith* rather than that of justification *by grace through faith*. The emphasis of the biblical doctrine of justification by grace through faith is that our acceptance by God is always an unmerited gift based on Christ's death and resurrection. We can lay no prior claim to it, only accept it with gratitude. In and through such acceptance the Holy Spirit brings a transformation of our total existence that involves the death of our old nature and new life as God's children.

T. would not totally deny any of this, but his emphasis is different. He stands in the tradition of the mystics, who are deeply sensitive to the continuing presence of sin in the lives of justified persons. Thus he prefers to speak of justification *by faith* as an emphatic expression of the alien character of Christian righteousness: we are justified even though we are not just. The problem with this is that, in an extreme form, it unduly downplays the transformative power of the Holy Spirit (i.e., sanctification) in the lives of the justified. Talk of such transformation is seen as a denial of the *sola fide* (i.e., not in reality?) character of our righteousness (see his direct contrast of obedience and faith, p. 52).

T.'s particular perspective has an extreme effect on his interpretive history of the doctrine of justification. He neutralizes Paul's clearest discussion of sanctification in the Christian life by relegating it to Paul's "immature" phase (which raises numerous questions about the function of canon). He almost completely overlooks the close tie in Luther between the discussion of the forensic nature of justification and emphasis on the place of death and new life in Christian existence (cf. Gerhard Forde, *Justification by Faith: A Matter of Death and Life* [Fortress, 1982]). Perhaps most surprisingly, for a professor at a Methodist seminary, his reading of Wesley lacks any mention of the crucial role of prevenient grace, which is the basis of Wesley's deep appreciation (contrary to T.'s suggestion) of the purely gratuitous nature of justification.

In light of such considerations, I would argue, against T., that the hope for a truly biblical, traditional, *and* Lutheran basis for overcoming the divisions of the Reformation lies in a deeper appreciation of the crucial tie between justification and sanctification in Christian existence rather than in the monarchy of justification. At the same time, I would express my deep appreciation to Tavard for an insightful and vigorous discussion of a doctrine that is all too often neglected in the contemporary setting.

Sioux Falls College, S. Dakota

RANDY L. MADDOX

DIE EINSETZUNG DER SAKRAMENTE DURCH CHRISTUS: EINE UNTERSUCHUNG ZUR SACRAMENTENTHEOLOGIE DER FRÜHSCHOLASTIK VON ANSELM VON LAON BIS ZU WILHELM VON AUXERRE. By Wendelin Knoch. Münster: Aschendorff, 1983. Pp. x + 434. DM 128.

This *Habilitationsschrift*, accepted by the Catholic Faculty of the University of Bonn in 1980, investigates the history of the integration of the *institutio a Christo* theme into early scholasticism's systematic theology of the sacraments. Its point of departure is in the schools of Anselm of Laon, Hugo of St. Victor, and Peter Abelard. Numerous unedited treatises on the sacraments are included in the discussion along with the better-known edited texts of the period. The textual analysis terminates with the *Summa aurea* of William of Auxerre, composed between 1215–29.

K. identifies typical problems within sacramental theology which challenged these theologians and shows the importance of the institution question for their final resolution. Correspondingly, he sheds light on how the treatment of institution provides a key to individual theologians' grasp of the theology of sacraments. This volume cannot be described as a *summa* of early scholastic sacramental theology but, because of the angle from which the sources are approached, it furnishes an excellent introduction to almost all aspects of that synthesis. A consistently good use is made of secondary literature, and a balanced judgment is displayed in the evaluation of the previous scholarly interpretation of the primary sources which are analyzed. Many of K.'s findings are already known; however, nowhere has the important theme of this thesis received such a thorough treatment.

The significance of early scholasticism's contribution to a modern discussion of the institution of the sacraments need hardly be stressed. In that period of creative theology a development took place which did not occur in a continuous temporal sequence. But in the end the whole process resulted in a synthesis which unified an original variety of sacraments by integrating Church, as organ of salvation, into Christology within the scope of a universal salvation history. This secured the depth of the doctrine of sacraments expressed in *institutio a Christo*: a concept which necessarily emerges from the total perspective. Here sacraments are explained as originating in the divine plan of salvation (the Pauline mystery). They receive their precise determination in the stages of Christ's life and attain their purpose in the Church. They are high points of the saving revelation of God and of the Church's experience of salvation in Christ through the Spirit. This synthesis provides a differentiated approach to the patristic liturgical theology, which so accents the grounding of baptism and Eucharist in the passion of Christ that elements of verbal and personal institution by Christ are merged into a unity. It was required of the 11th and 12th centuries to provide a credible explanation of the pastoral-liturgical practice of the Church, the primary source of theological reflection on sacraments. It is needed today to help to overcome the last vestiges of a narrow concept of institution which is

the inheritance of an equally narrow Reformation and Counter Reformation sacramental theology.

Pontifical Oriental Institute, Rome EDWARD J. KILMARTIN, S.J.

PROPHECY IN EARLY CHRISTIANITY AND THE ANCIENT MEDITERRANEAN WORLD. By David E. Aune. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1983. Pp. xii + 522. \$29.95.

This book provides the first comprehensive coverage in English of Christian prophecy seen against the appropriate background of the ancient Mediterranean world in general and its dominant Greco-Roman culture. In several respects Aune's work is comparable *mutatis mutandis* to Johannes Lindblom's *Prophecy in Ancient Israel*. The author devotes two chapters to Greco-Roman prophecy, treating the form and function of Greco-Roman oracles as well as oracular places and persons. Two further chapters are devoted to prophecy in ancient Israel and early Judaism.

The character of early Christian prophecy is discussed in considerable detail, with emphasis on the prophecies of Jesus in relation to his prophetic role, the form and content of early Christian prophecy, and the Christian prophets themselves. The basic forms of early Christian prophetic speech are, perhaps overarbitrarily, divided into six classes: oracles of assurance, prescriptive oracles, announcements of judgment, announcements of salvation, legitimation oracles, and eschatological theophany oracles. After expatiating on these classes of prophetic utterance, A. adds some interesting and sometimes provocative thoughts on the style of Christian prophetic speech. More could be added to the section on the poetic form of oracles, but here and elsewhere A. evinces that the two-part structure in oracles was a widespread phenomenon throughout the ancient world. Perhaps the least common oracular form in early Christianity was that which was composed in antithetic parallelism, but A. presents six instances among the genuine Montanist oracles which do exhibit this kind of parallelism. A better-known example, also cited by A., is the oracle to be found in Rev 13:9-10.

The rather negative conclusions of A.'s research are particularly significant. He avers that nearly all of the different kinds of early Christian prophetic utterance are so similar to other forms of Christian discourse as to be virtually indistinguishable from them. "There is," he maintains, "no such thing as a distinctively characteristic form of Christian prophetic discourse that is recognizable apart from the presence of formal framing devices" (338). Furthermore, A. insists, since there are no stylistic or generic characteristics which are typical of Christian prophetic diction, it is usually impossible to determine whether or not a given text

is oracular in origin. A. adds that what specifically distinguished Christian prophetic utterance was the supernatural origin claimed for it rather than its content or form. However, if one bears in mind that other Church leaders of the first and second centuries were also claiming to speak with divine authority, and that during the second century many of the Christian prophets were in fact dissidents, it becomes clear how the office of Christian prophet gradually became dysfunctional and redundant as the hierarchical structure of the Church, and especially the monepiscopal diocesan form of organization, became established as the norm. It is safe to say—and A. practically says it—that the Christian prophets were never integrated into the formal organizational structure of the early churches, or regarded as administrative functionaries. The difficult question whether early Christians in general regarded themselves as *potential* prophets is left undecided; the available evidence is inconclusive. A. does not regard charismatic exegesis as part of prophecy (against E. E. Ellis et al.); he sees it as being closer to divination, and relegates the subject to an appendix.

Most of the text of this book was completed in mid-1979, and subsequent publications, such as M. Eugene Boring's *Sayings of the Risen Jesus: Christian Prophecy in the Synoptic Tradition*, are not taken into consideration. Despite this fact and the several controversial positions which he adopts, A.'s work is a solid and valuable addition to the growing literature on Christian prophecy.

Union Theological Seminary, N.Y.C.

DAVID GREENWOOD

THE MIND OF ST. BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX. By G. R. Evans, Oxford: Clarendon/Oxford University, 1983. Pp. xv + 239. \$35.

Evans, whose prolific writings have placed her in the forefront of a new generation of study of a large expanse of medieval intellectual life, particularly of the century encompassing Anselm and Alan of Lille, has now given us a sensitive and imaginative reading of the mind of St. Bernard. In many ways this present book complements the edition of the works of Bernard completed by J. Leclercq, C. H. Talbot, and H. Rochais in 1978. Evans has immersed herself in Bernard's writings, and from them has drawn an analysis of Bernard's thought less schematized and systematic than that of Gilson, and less concerned with spirituality than Leclercq, but for all that more attuned to the impact of event and context on idea, and to the workings of B.'s mind, especially his attempt to deal with paradox, contradiction, and the new learning. B. is presented as a "problem-solver," attempting to reconcile such conflicts as that between his own preference for contemplation and the hectic worldly demands from which he never turned.

The first of four chapters is on B. as soldier of Christ. While this goes over much known material, sometimes at the level of intelligent popularization, and sometimes does not refer to the most appropriate bibliography, it does survey the 12th-century discussion of the various states of religious life. B.'s attitudes toward the Rule of St. Benedict, the Templars, and the Crusades are described.

Chapter 2, "Bernard the Preacher," begins with a partly speculative sketch of B.'s early years and education. As throughout the book, many writers beside B. are discussed to develop context. Particularly instructive comparisons are made between Anselm and Bernard. Although topics like the history and B.'s idea of the senses of Scripture are discussed rather superficially and impressionistically, his preaching is considered from many points of view. The roles of William of St. Thierry and the sermons on the Song of Songs in the development of B.'s thinking are very well drawn.

The third chapter considers B. as defender of the faith and theologian. For once, in a book which sometimes drowns its main subject in comparative comment, the general reader might have profited from a more precise placement of B.'s ideas on intentionality in moral action and *cooperatio* between human free will and divine grace within the history of theology. Yet B.'s considerable ability as a simplifier of theological questions is drawn very well. Especially in the description of the trial of Gilbert of Poitiers, Evans ties her customary clarity of exposition to a thorough examination of what theologically was at issue.

The final chapter is devoted to *De consideratione* and B.'s doctrine of the Church. His principal theme, the paradox of the pope as the "lowly-hearted lord of the world" (205), is explained clearly. The book ends with a Conclusion on Bernard's success in both thinking through and embodying the paradoxes of his religion and age—above all, the union of mystical ascent with a life of activity. Man, as Christ, is a *copula* "reconciling the irreconcilable" (222).

University of Utah

GLENN W. OLSEN

ACTA CUSANA: QUELLEN ZUR LEBENSGESCHICHTE DES NIKOLAUS VON KUES. Edited by Erich Meuthen and Hermann Hallauer 1/1: 1401—May 17, 1437; 1/2: May 17, 1437—December 31, 1450. Edited by Erich Meuthen. Hamburg: Meiner, 1976, 1983. Pp. xvi + 199; vi + 201–667. DM 180, 320.

When the Heidelberg Academy of Sciences first undertook the edition of Nicholas of Cusa's works over 50 years ago, it understandably planned to include his "letters." Several of these had long been recognized to be of extraordinary importance for the history of conciliarism, the Bohemian

ultraquist controversy, and late-medieval mysticism. As work on the edition progressed and as Cusanus research uncovered more and more archival and literary material, it became obvious that the category "letters" was simply not comprehensive enough to encompass the multifarious documentation that related to the life and work of this 15th-century genius. The term "acta" seemed more appropriate for a collection of letters, documentary references, official reports, rescripts, petitions, legal briefs, marginalia, and notices of every kind—not only those which were from Nicholas' own hand but also those which intersected his own activity or were tangential to it. Plans now foresee three volumes of acta, each in three installments. While not strictly considered part of the *Opera omnia*, they are clearly parallel and complementary volumes.

These first two installments are simply astonishing in the wealth of material they assemble, in the brilliance of their critical precision, and in the flawless accuracy of their presentation. If any fault can be suggested, it is in the almost tediously overwhelming mass of everyday "administrivia." But even in this respect the volumes would seem to be unique in the completeness of their documentation of the life of a late-medieval personality. There are 962+ numbered, chronologically arranged entries ranging from a few lines in length to the over-40-page *Summa dictorum* of June 1442, here presented in a complete and fresh critical edition. A number is assigned in the chronology for every work and treatise in the *Opera omnia*, including each of the *Sermones*. We are thus enabled to get a sense of the *Sitz im Leben* of each of Nicholas' treatises, as well as a close-up view of the man himself, warts and all. The "real" Nicholas is not only the contemplative idealist of the *De docta ignorantia* or even the conciliarist reformer of the *De concordantia catholica*. He is also the cagey benefice hustler and the aggressive advocate portrayed in the acta. But all this "hard" evidence presented by the acta should not, simply by reason of its sheer mass and incontrovertible facticity, be an obstacle to the more important task of interpretation, as it unfortunately so often has been in the case of Cusanus. Rather, it should provide perspective and a much-needed dimension of realism.

La Salle University, Phila.

JAMES E. BIECHLER

RHETORIC AND REFORM: ERASMUS' CIVIL DISPUTE WITH LUTHER. By Marjorie O'Rourke Boyle. Cambridge: Harvard University, 1983. Pp. 215. \$24.

Along the shelf of recent works on Erasmus as a biblical, humanistic theologian, one finds his controversy with Luther ordinarily presented as one further chapter in the history of theological anthropology. B. approaches the dispute in the wake of her work on the doctrinal and

linguistic suppositions of Erasmus' theology (*Erasmus on Language and Method in Theology*, 1977) and study of his convictions about Christ's inspiring influence on the pre-Christian classics (*Christening Pagan Mysteries*, 1981). She now sets out to analyze the rhetoric of the Erasmus-Luther exchange. As a consequence, *Rhetoric and Reform* deals with questions of literary genre, methods of persuasion, criteria of truth, and appropriate styles of discourse. Such a perspective, however, does not leave us on the outer surface of a literary clash between opposed doctrines. Instead, it leads to a profound discussion of opposed epistemologies and divergent understandings of the theologian's relation to both Church and society.

Erasmus chose for his *Diatribē sive collatio* on free choice the rhetorical genre of *deliberative* exposition. Thus he does not argue a case, as in juridical rhetoric, nor does he engage in praise and blame, as in the epideictic genre. Hoping to entice Luther to modify his dogmatic assertiveness, Erasmus follows the conventions of a form whose aim is service of the common good by first arguing both sides of a question of moral import and then turning for resolution to a consensus about what is more advantageous in the given situation. But Luther refused the Erasmian overture of civility by responding in the juridical genre, using forensic rhetoric in *De servo arbitrio*, in imitation of God's accusatory address in the forum of conscience. Whereas Erasmus sought to imitate the Spirit's temperate, persuasive affability, Luther followed a Spirit who accuses and convicts. For Erasmus, the issue was related to a complex social context, and so one had to adapt the message carefully to the prevalent situation of believers. But for Luther in 1525, there was but one context, that of our inevitably self-righteous estimate of ourselves, and here the Word makes no accommodations. Furthermore, Luther subverted the Erasmian criterion of consensus by propounding the dualism of an utterly manifest Scripture and an invisible community of genuine believers.

For Erasmus, free choice was a central part of our co-operation with God's mystery of redemption. Still, his reticent "scepticism" was appropriate, both as a contrived attempt to win Luther over and as a method of dealing with the spectrum of views on how freedom and grace interact. Sad to say, the vast majority have agreed with Luther's defamatory allegations that Erasmus was devious and irresolute—lacking the firm spine of doctrinal clarity. The truth is that Erasmus had an acute sense of the line dividing the realms of certainty and probable opinion.

B. argues that Luther's epistemology was Stoic, and so he sensed himself compelled by the force of a manifest presentation, a "kataleptic impression," which dissipates the miserable darkness of uncertainty. Luther's option for dogmatism and for juridical rhetoric conformed to the compelling force of the case he could argue with clear biblical evidence

(*claritas Scripturae*). At this juncture, B. studies Luther's accounts of his wrestling with Romans 1:17 to find the origins of his certainty. However, rhetorical analysis of these accounts could raise doubt about their value as autobiography. A more promising seedbed of Luther's certainty lies in his theology of sacramental absolution around 1518, when a kind of "kataleptic impression" became central in his instructions on faith. Absolution is, for Luther, the paradigmatic gospel word, and from it he found both certainty for believers and a remarkable *claritas* in Scripture. Luther's subsequent development toward an excessively invisible church was a new departure, occasioned by Roman incompetence in dealing with him and by Johann Eck's badgering argumentation at Leipzig in 1519.

The final chapter of B.'s exposition of the Erasmus-Luther exchange concerns the value of the consensus over the centuries in favor of free choice in response to grace. Responding to *De servo arbitrio*, Erasmus accused Luther of a Gnostic subjectivism because of his opposition to that consensus. To back up his allegation, Erasmus brought out his 1526 edition of Irenaeus, who contended against second-century Gnostics that truth is found by agreeing to the teaching propounded openly in the apostolic churches. B. offers ten pages on this charge by Erasmus, but then briefly asserts that the imputation was faulty (151). Justice requires that more be said here, to show just how un-Gnostic Luther was. His creeds, catechisms, and constant sacramental focus more than refute Erasmus' bit of theological name-calling. This is a fine, sensitive book on Erasmus, but it leaves some less compelling impressions through its treatment of Luther.

Gregorian University, Rome

JARED WICKS, S.J.

COENA DOMINI 1: DIE ABENDMAHLSLITURGIE DER REFORMATIONSKIRCHEN IM 16./17. JAHRHUNDERT. Edited by Irmgard Pahl. *Spicilegium Friburgense* 29. Fribourg, Swit.: Universitätsverlag, 1983. Pp. xvii + 611.

This collection is the second of a four-part series. *Præx eucharistica* (1969) offered examples of ancient Greek and Latin Eucharistic prayers. This volume contains orders of the Lord's Supper of Reformation churches of the 16th and 17th centuries. Important texts dependent on these orders are added, as well as exhortations, songs, and rubrics. Original languages are used and German translations are provided for less current ones. No doubt this splendid contribution to scientific liturgical studies will prove to be an indispensable handbook for scholars.

The readers of this journal will be particularly interested in a comparative study of the theologies of the Lord's Supper expressed in these church orders. Despite various nuances this common outlook seems to

emerge: (1) The gift of the Lord's Supper is forgiveness of sins made possible by the gift of Christ himself; or, more precisely, a sealing of forgiveness for the believer. This understanding explains the prominence given to the introductory penitential service. (2) As a ritual action, the Lord's Supper promises, contains, places in power, and communicates the spiritual legacy (*testamentum*) of Jesus. (3) The spiritual efficacy is conditioned by the ritually expressed act of faith of believers. (4) This spiritual sacrifice of praise and thanksgiving is an offering in which believers lean on Christ with faith in his *testamentum* and so come before God in prayer. (5) In this spiritual sacrifice the believer accepts the gift, and this implies a self-offering, i.e., the giving of oneself to Christ present in word and sacrament through belief in him. Thereby the common priesthood of all believers is exercised. (6) The gift of the Lord's Supper demands acceptance, not return. Reception and return, and so sacrament and sacrificial offering of the gift, Christ himself, are contradictory concepts (Luther, Calvin, Zwingli). This accounts for the omission of the classical anamnesis-offering.

One observation on this theology must suffice. The characteristic omission of the anamnesis-offering in Reformation Eucharistic prayers is based on a highly rationalized theology of justification by faith and a defective notion of gift. On the contrary, a more profound theology of the old Church needed the anamnesis-offering, which follows the narrative of institution of the Eucharist, to express the conviction that the gift *in usu* remains always God's gift. From this point of view this prayer is the most profound liturgical expression of the biblical dogma of justification by faith.

Pontifical Oriental Institute, Rome

EDWARD J. KILMARTIN, S.J.

THE CONCEPT OF *GLAUBENSLEHRE*: ERNST TROELTSCH AND THE THEOLOGICAL HERITAGE OF SCHLEIERMACHER. By Walter E. Wyman. Chico, Cl: Scholars, 1983. Pp. xx + 255. \$14.95.

In this thoroughly investigated and well-written book, W. defends the theological viability of Troeltsch's posthumously published lectures on *Glaubenslehre* from the years 1911-12. These lectures have met largely negative criticism since they appeared in 1925, as their first reviewers and subsequent commentators have found the historical method they advance to result in the dissolution of Christian dogmatics. W. considers this objection pointless since the dissolution of traditional dogmatics was precisely T.'s intention. According to W., T. understood his lectures on *Glaubenslehre* as a revisionist project in which the supernaturalist claims of Protestant Orthodox and Ritschlian dogmatics were eclipsed by a theological method based on the philosophy of religion and executed with

a keen appreciation for the uncompromising extent of historical relativity. W. sees T., at least in this respect, as Schleiermacher's legitimate theological heir.

W. departs from the customary paths of Troeltsch interpretation by devoting his entire monograph to T.'s contributions as a systematic or doctrinal theologian. By his own admission, he is more interested in the method than the content of the *Glaubenslehre*; for in the methodological presuppositions and structure of the work he finds T. far more committed theologically and even ecclesiastically to the Christian tradition than his critics have usually assumed.

W. offers a convincing dialectical interpretation of T.'s philosophical and theological commitments in the project of *Glaubenslehre*, which portrays its method as an "uneasy synthesis" of its two sources, metaphysics and history. As a postcritical reflection on faith, the *Glaubenslehre* requires that theological statements be accommodated to modern knowledge (96). Perhaps the most distinctive traits of T.'s work are its search for foundations in an idealist metaphysics and its efforts even to validate the experiential basis of theological reflection and expression through a philosophical analysis of personal decision for—in more traditional language, conversion to—the truth claims of the Christian tradition. W. argues that the *Glaubenslehre* checks this explicitly philosophical criterion of theological authenticity with a historical one. The *Glaubenslehre* requires that theological statements draw their content from the life of historical faith, both present and past, and that these experiential moments in the tradition be captured through the effective execution of a theology of consciousness and a historical theology respectively. Though W. insists on understanding T.'s theological project in terms of the dual criteria of metaphysics and history, he concludes that the balance T. effects between these norms in the *Glaubenslehre* remains precarious and tilts, perhaps even decisively, to the side of metaphysics. In spite of this recognition, W. maintains throughout his study that T., if not himself a confessional theologian, constructed an academic theology that was attuned to confessional concerns and committed to the promulgation of the tradition's integrity.

This last point helps to focus W.'s situation of T. in the theological heritage of Schleiermacher. The principal difference between S. and T. is that S. understood himself as a confessional theologian and, while appreciative of the need to revise the dogmatic tradition in light of the principles of scientific intelligibility, never subordinated the responsibility of speaking for the Church to the demands of the critical spirit. It is difficult to imagine S. venturing a program as formidable and unecclesiastical as the intentional dissolution of traditional dogmatics. If T. does

legitimately stand in the theological heritage of S., he does so, as W. carefully qualifies, only formally (185), in his dedication to the general type of theological revisionism that S. initiated a century earlier.

Fairfield University

JOHN E. THIEL

GANDHI'S RELIGIOUS THOUGHT. By Margaret Chatterjee. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1983. Pp. xiv + 194. \$19.95.

In this fascinating volume Chatterjee, an Oxford-educated Indian philosopher who teaches at Delhi University, offers us a solid, comprehensive study of Gandhi's wisdom, his moral and spiritual vision of a new humanity based on concrete action for the sake of the oppressed. Following a somewhat informal method rather than an analytic conceptual approach, she identifies the essential structures in his thought which were incarnated in his life and action.

Rooted in the Indian tradition, which includes Hinduism, Jainism, Buddhism, Islam, Christianity, and Sikhism, but modifying elements of this tradition in light of the pressing needs of his people, Gandhi united his religious and cultural background with the truths of the gospel, especially those of the Beatitudes. Indeed, he was profoundly moved by the Sermon on the Mount, and the image of the crucified Christ enduring his suffering so impressed him that it became the inspiration of his lifelong commitment to nonviolence.

Gandhi had a propensity for pluralism, believing, like the Jains, that all the religious traditions, philosophical systems, and world views were only fragments of the overarching Truth, partial perspectives on the one, infinite Reality whose mystery is inexhaustible in its depth. He had little patience for theological disputes, or a world-denying spirituality that turned its back on the sufferings of the poor, the exploited, and those in bondage to a political power or a social system, particularly the victims of the degrading class notion of "untouchability."

C. F. Andrews, a close friend of his, put his finger on it when in a letter to Tagore he said that Gandhi was "a saint of action rather than of contemplation." It was not that Gandhi was antagonistic towards India's contemplative ideal, but that he had no time for an exclusively contemplative life while millions of his countrymen existed in miserable, really subhuman conditions, and tied to a colonial power. He was too busy trying to heal their wounds and transforming, from within, the system that kept them in their deplorable condition.

In a certain sense Gandhi is a peculiarly modern saint in the form his mission assumed in the Indian context, a context in which there was no cultural support for the moral insight that we are responsible for others, that we are obligated, in true religion, to bear the burdens of those who

need us. Gandhi's message, embodied in his life and example, is very Christian, and in this sense he is not so much modern as timeless. His vision is that of compassion and selfless service to humanity. It is the pursuit of the love of God in the love of man, of all people. Caring is the essence of his life, and this is the test of truth in all the situations of life. God invites us to care, to respond in the events of human existence.

This care, compassion, or divine love that he exemplified actually distinguishes Gandhi's way from that of Marxism. In Marxism, generally, there is no compassion, no sense of empathy for those who suffer, only an anger and hatred. The poor then become the excuse for violence and revolution, without the revolutionaries taking responsibility for their actions and for the process. Gandhi did both. He did not believe that control of the state was necessary to bring about a classless society. His was a personalist's vision in the midst of community. He steeped himself in the process of struggle and took responsibility for the moral education of those who oppress others or otherwise practice injustice. In other words, he loved them.

He rarely theorized alone, but tested his insights existentially. Nor was he satisfied with thinking and writing about change while others implemented it. Rather, he bore the brunt of his methods in the very world he hoped to change.

Gandhi was far ahead of the dialogue movement that seeks the convergence of world religions. He knew that dialogue and encounter were not enough, that the real challenge is to work together on common tasks: promoting peace, a caring, just society, and the freedom of all people. Personal liberation is not the goal, for it can only be realized when all achieve liberation; otherwise it can be selfish. The real goal is reconciliation, and this is the work that spiritual leaders, thinkers, scholars, etc. should pursue. In this task—his constant focus, proceeding from a recollected heart—Gandhi experienced his efforts as united with the divine power, and this power as bringing them to fruition. Chatterjee communicates Gandhi's vision, and she succeeds in showing its relevance in our time.

New Boston, N.H.

WAYNE TEASDALE

JACQUES MARITAIN AND THE FRENCH CATHOLIC INTELLECTUALS. By Bernard Doering. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1983. Pp. 268. \$22.95.

Charles Péguy described the disaster of "dechristianization" in this century as a failure in mysticism. This intuition of Péguy's comes close to what I think Doering wishes to say about Maritain's vision of society and, in particular, how it influenced the Catholic literary revival in

France of the 20th century. Spanning the years from Maritain's conversion to Catholicism in 1905 to his death in 1973, D. gives us an interesting picture of his life. He portrays him as a man whose basic comprehension with regard to society and politics was determined—like that of Péguy's (who is mentioned in D.'s book as the master of Maritain)—by his Christian metaphysics and his commitment to Catholicism. Accordingly, it was only in this context that Maritain understood the "proper relation between religion and politics." So D. is trying to establish one essential point about Maritain: "his metaphysics was the indispensable foundation of his politics and social humanism; and without the former, the latter would disappear."

D. starts out with a rather dismissive account of the years when Maritain was involved in the *Action française*, and maintains that the "Peace and Equilibrium" which followed upon Maritain's conversion "were shattered in 1926 by the crisis" of the *Action française*. The reason for this is explained as follows: "[Maritain] imprudently and naively let his political orientation be formed by his conservative spiritual director, Father Clérissac." For, according to D., it was only after Maritain's repudiation of *Action française* that he took "a definite public stand on certain political events," without ever abandoning "the heights of pure speculation." Then he goes on to discuss how this new perspective decided Maritain's approach to the victims of the Spanish Civil War, his defense of the Jews against the anti-Semitic attacks of the 30's and 40's, and his endless battle for the survival of democratic institutions during the Second World War. D. concludes with a general, though moving, depiction of Maritain's last years: first, as ambassador to the Vatican; second, as professor at Princeton; third, as a contemplative in his hermitage at Toulouse, where he ended his days as a member of the Little Brothers of Jesus.

D. has rendered an important service in bringing together all this information about Maritain's life and his relationship with the other Catholic writers of the period. However, I must confess that he rarely goes beyond the anecdotal in the treatment of his sources. Indeed, one has the distinct impression of being offered a surfeit of correspondence between Maritain and these writers (bespeaking often the exaggerated sensitivity of academics, whose friendships are always at stake at the slightest difference of opinion uttered among them) without any critical analysis of their theological and philosophical content. Consequently, do not expect from this book any new development in our understanding of such a movement as Modernism, e.g., or even, for that matter, of Thomism itself.

Nevertheless, D.'s book achieves what it purports to provide: a very

engaging description of "one of the most striking phenomena of twentieth-century French letters," the Catholic Literary Revival. It makes for pleasant reading. And—if I may apply here Péguy's intuition—it leaves me more with the memory of Maritain the mystic than Maritain the philosopher.

University of Notre Dame

E. GERARD CARROLL

LE MERVEILLEUX ACCORD DE L'HOMME ET DE DIEU: ETUDE DE L'ANALOGIE DE L'ÊTRE CHEZ HANS URS VON BALTHASAR. By Georges de Schrijver. Leuven: Leuven University, 1983. Pp. 344. FB 1500.

Including recent secondary literature and alluding to the new system *Theodramatik*, the volume begins as another study of *analogia entis*, but the reader is happy to see that the book eventually addresses the full thought of Balthasar. S.'s book has four parts. The first finds in the early work on German romanticism a negative, philosophical propaedeutic for revelation and grace, i.e., a need for the cross of Christ which concretizes the kenosis of Schelling and the pain of Nietzsche. The second part explores Balthasar's theory of analogy in comparison with the theology of Karl Barth, as both theologians find an insufficiency in creation and a necessary focus in Christ. With the third part we turn to older sources—three Church Fathers, Origen, Gregory of Nyssa, and Maximus the Confessor, all of whom are theoretical mystics of the Incarnation. With the fourth section we reach another preliminary influence, i.e., Erich Przywara. The contrast of Balthasar to his Jesuit confrere and to Karl Barth encourages S. to take us on to the center of Balthasar's thought, the revelation of glory in the cross, and to thought-forms running through this theology: the Areopagite, the Rhenish Dominican theologians, and Adrienne von Speyr. Finally, we turn once more to the "theological aesthetics and dramaturgy" of those several systems of Balthasar.

S. offers us the dense richness of Balthasar in a clear and vivid French style. We come to understand how much B.'s work owes to certain Greek theologians, and we see the similarities to and differences from Barth and that other obscure engineer of analogy, Przywara. Some also will see the limitations of B.'s reading of past sources and his unsatisfactory resolution of profound metaphysical issues in trite metaphors, e.g., "virgin" and "marriage."

It was Catholic theology ("some of our best theologians . . . Schlegel, Baader, Goerres, Moehler, Staudenmaier") and aesthetics which led the young Balthasar to the German romantics. Although that early work no longer holds interest for him, we must observe not only the similarities between Schelling's massive systems and B., but also his somewhat inaccurate view of the later Schelling, emphasizing a tragic dimension of Schelling's middle works and overlooking the kenosis of the last system.

S.'s presentation of the "elliptical" thought of Przywara is probably among the best summaries of that thinker. If Barth needed the analogy of creation and of human participation for a continuing Christian theological drama, Przywara's analogy, developing secondary causality and *geistig* spirituality, needed the flesh and blood of Christ.

Is the cross the central word of Balthasar's analogy? Does it differ from Barth only in its wider metaphysical (but not social) context? In one trenchant passage Balthasar says that Jesus died because of the unspecified "sin" which kills him but also because the Father abandons him; his "death by love . . . includes the entire Trinity" (*Theodramatik* 3, 466). This kind of theology reflects the Christian metaphysics of Greek Fathers and of German post-Kantian philosophers; its achievement is to give flesh and blood through images and insights. From the point of view of speculative theology, however, it seems not only divinely severe but stuck, offering syntheses of Origen and Barth but no single new perspective for a world which changed drastically after 1945.

The limits of Balthasar appear clearly in his ecclesiology (in the broadest sense), as he fails to ask how a dramatics of grace reaches out into both ecclesial ministry and social transformation. S. concludes his book with a similar observation. "Balthasar avoids the debate concerning the serious problems of today . . . as humanity is confronted with the evolution of technology and the spirit of secularization. . . . And if one wishes to give to these problems an adequate response for today, it is not enough to turn to the vocabulary of neoplatonic aesthetics or of classical drama. One must answer in one's own language sensitive to the issues of human society and social critique" (332 f.).

I am a reader, not a master, of literature on Balthasar, but this book—in format, maturity, and insight—must be numbered among the best presentations of this contemporary theologian; its narrative is itself a voyage into Christian speculation. Precisely because of S.'s delicate framing, we see the rarified atmosphere of this theology's beauty—inspiring but frozen, like a work of art.

University of Notre Dame

THOMAS F. O'MEARA, O.P.

THE USE OF THE BIBLE IN CHRISTIAN ETHICS: A CONSTRUCTIVE ESSAY. By Thomas W. Ogletree. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1983. Pp. xviii + 220. \$19.95.

Ogletree, the recent president of the Society of Christian Ethics, has produced a valuable essay. Attempting neither a comprehensive biblical ethics nor a contemporary Christian ethics, O. draws together conclusions from each discipline. This "fusion of horizons" yields some curious results. On the one hand, a contemporary ethics of producing good is discovered to have no biblical foundation, while the ethics of command-

ments or of self-perfection is upheld. On the other hand, the biblical books are shown to conflict on major ethical issues such as love and law and to be unconcerned about changing world structures.

O. tends to concede J. Sanders' point that the NT has little to teach concerning concrete decisions of present-day life. What the Bible teaches is eschatology as a horizon of understanding. O. claims that attempts to find God's eternal wisdom, whether in the Bible or in natural structures, must be resisted lest history be frozen. The Bible must be given a "fresh interpretation." And the structures of this creation are part of the old age, which must be dialectically revised by the redemption.

Three long chapters on the OT, the Synoptics, and Paul present the Bible's challenge to present moral understanding. O. concentrates not on the narratives or on wisdom of Israel, but on the legal and prophetic traditions. He finds social solidarity founded on particular institutions and supported by laws. When these institutions failed, an eschatological solution arose which envisioned a future fulfilment even as it counseled patience in an ethic of survival.

O. examines the Synoptics' view of the law in the eschatological age. Mark emphasizes the moral law over ceremonial law; Luke, who is the most conservative, argues that the Church is Israel faithful in observance of the law; Matthew also insists on the authority of the Jewish law, but awkwardly re-evaluates the law in light of love. The Synoptics do not offer sociopolitical reflection; still, their various insights on forgiveness, shared property, and nonviolence offer suggestions to our imagination.

Paul stresses God's promise of unconditional commitment over the law of Moses. Hence law has only the status of a contingent divine response to sin. Paul insists on humility before God, readiness to suffer, and a self-giving love. Paul derives parenetic injunctions from prior relations to God and community; he legitimates cultural pluralism and he opens all rules to change.

O. proposes a dialectical eschatology in which the new age is already coming to be in Christian communities. These communities, living out the call to discipleship under Jesus, are separate from an evil world. Christians should be primarily concerned about community life. They can accommodate themselves to the world and perhaps work to shape policy, as long as they remain free from the world's evil. Deontological rules for community order are necessary but need historical critique. Perfectionist calls for virtue are important, but only in the context of a relation to God and others. Both of these form parts of what O. calls "historical contextualism."

This book does not focus on how to use the Bible in doing ethics, but rather on some crucial themes which ethics must consider. O. approaches

the Bible as a book that is helpful to contemporary Christians, though such an approach tends to obscure the Bible's authority. The selection of one set of biblical books and themes to the neglect of others could be questioned. Thus, the relation of eschatology to creation needs further examination; the person of Christ, not to mention the loving activity of God, also deserves more attention.

Weston School of Theology, Mass.

EDWARD VACEK, S.J.

FUNDAMENTALS OF ETHICS. By John Finnis. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University, 1983. Pp. x + 163. \$17.95; \$8.95 paper.

This work was originally presented in 1982 at Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., as six Carroll Lectures. The organization and content of the material bear a noticeable similarity with Finnis' earlier and more elaborate volume, *Natural Law and Natural Rights* (Oxford, 1980; cf. James Schall's review, *TS* 42 [1981] 160-62). Whereas the 1980 volume related the natural-law tradition to a wide range of issues in ethics, political philosophy, and jurisprudence, this volume applies the same tradition to more professedly ethical and methodological concerns. As F. puts it, objectivity and skepticism, and utilitarianism/consequentialism/proportionalism are "the two academic methodological issues which dominate contemporary ethical theorizing" and are the "two issues which form the academic themes of this book" (10).

F. insists that the foundation of ethics is necessarily more than "invented categories" (Mackie, Hobbes, Hume) or "contingent human attitudes" (Foot). For F., ethics is rooted in those human goods which are the components of all human flourishing or perfection: life, knowledge, play, aesthetic experience, sociability (friendship), practical reasonableness, and religion. Among these goods F. argues that "all are equally fundamental, that there is no single, objective hierarchy of basic human goods" (51). They are, in short, incommensurable.

"Everything in ethics," F. insists, "depends on the distinction between the good as experienced and the good as intelligible" (42). Goodness as intelligible is inadequate. Thus Lonergan's "good of order" (the good of co-operation that secures the realization of desires) is faulted as too empiricist. For F., goodness cannot be grounded simply in the satisfaction of the desires that a person happens to have; goodness lies rather in the perfection "attained, realized and participated in—the perfections which are understood first in practical reason's grasp that 'X' (knowledge, life, friendship) is a good to be pursued" (44).

Because these goods are necessary for human flourishing and are universally accessible through reason, F. rejects radical skepticism as

unjustified and self-refuting. Because each human good is equally and irreducibly basic, he rejects all forms of proportionalism (including many efforts by such as Richard McCormick, Bruno Schüller, and Alan Donagan) as illegitimate and incoherent rationalizations of moral reasoning.

This book will surely continue and extend the discussion begun by F.'s earlier work and possibly carry that debate to a deeper level. However, problems and questions remain. How should one deal with situations which are dilemmatic precisely because goods conflict with each other, e.g., the good of knowledge in tension with the good of friendship? Is it practically possible to insist on the incommensurability of human goods and avoid any hierarchical ranking? Is knowledge, e.g., really no more or less objectively higher (at least in certain situations) than, say, aesthetic experience or play? And even if knowledge is a basic human good, are all forms of knowledge equally valuable? Must every choice against a particular value (e.g., life) always entail a rejection of the larger general value? Can all forms of utilitarianism and consequentialism be reduced without remainder to morally illegitimate forms of proportionalism? How truly self-evident are all of F.'s basic goods? Many quite reasonable people will undoubtedly challenge his inclusion of religion within that category.

For persons familiar with F.'s earlier work, this book will serve as an extension and application of his ideas. Those for whom this book is a first introduction will find it worth while (though not absolutely necessary) to explore the more elaborate explanations of basic concepts available in *Natural Law and Natural Rights*. Aside from F.'s distracting penchant for parenthetical phrases, which abound in almost every paragraph (sometimes with parentheses within parentheses), this work should be accessible to all readers of this journal.

Bucknell University, Pa.

JOSEPH A. LA BARGE

THE WAY OF THE LORD JESUS 1: CHRISTIAN MORAL PRINCIPLES. By Germain Grisez. Chicago: Franciscan Herald, 1983. Pp. xxxvi + 971. \$35.

This is a monumental work. It is Grisez's response to the request of the fathers of Vatican II for a renewal of moral theology. Everyone familiar with the history of moral theology will be aware of the criticisms that have been leveled at the manuals published prior to Vatican II. While many of the faults pointed out, if not justified, could be explained by the limited purpose these manuals served, they did lead to a limited view of the moral life, and particularly the Christian moral life. Grisez proposes to give a more comprehensive and inspirational picture of this life.

The approach G. takes to undergirding the moral life differs from the ordinary manual approach. He sees moral norms as related to human goods rather than the traditional natural law. These are the goods which fulfil the human being and are of various kinds. What is "bad" is a privation of this goodness. G. states that there are seven categories of basic human goods. His first moral principle is that one should aim at integral human fulfilment, choose what is compatible with that fulfilment, and avoid what is incompatible.

Corresponding to this first principle and the seven categories of human goods are eight modes of responsibilities, which in turn correspond to the eight Beatitudes. In general, each excludes a way of acting which is inconsistent with a will toward integral human fulfilment. G. relates these modes to the virtues, which are aspects of the whole personality integrated by good commitments. These commitments are choices made in accord with the first principle of morality and the modes of responsibility. The modes of responsibility are intermediate principles midway between the first principle and the completely specific norms that direct particular choices.

G. rules out proportionalism as a method of moral judgment. Besides other reasons, he does not feel that the kind of measuring of goods it calls for is possible. He also feels that it instrumentalizes human goods, reducing them to simple means, thus removing any distinction between the *bonum honestum* and the *bonum utile*.

G. admits that people do not ordinarily derive their norms from his modes of responsibility, but he shows how they can be so derived, and he maintains that some of these norms are absolute. He then goes on to the subjects usually presented in fundamental moral theology: law, doubts of conscience, sin, distinction of sin, grave and slight sin, etc. He gives much more attention to original sin than was found in the ordinary moral manual of the past. More thorough treatments of this subject were generally reserved to treatises on systematic theology. He is not pleased with the identification of original sin with "sin in the world."

G. opts for equiprobabilism as an indirect method of solving doubts. This comes to the reader as a surprise, since probabilism has generally been accepted as a legitimate method of solving doubts. But the difference between probabilism and equiprobabilism may be largely theoretical, since it may be impossible to make a judgment of equiprobability. He does not show any great enthusiasm for the recent trend toward tracing the distinction between mortal and venial sin to a fundamental moral option. While he admits a fundamental option of faith, he has many difficulties with a fundamental moral option.

The treatise moves from sin to redemption and from there to the

supernatural life. It is G.'s opinion that there is a specific Christian moral response. The first principle on which this response is based is the principle of Christian love. This is detailed in the eight Beatitudes, which correspond with the eight modes of responsibility. He does not go into more specific moral norms, but these presumably will be taken care of in subsequent volumes.

The goal of the Christian response is human fulfilment in Christ and includes more than a life of the Beatitudes. It calls for prayer, both private and liturgical, and the sacramental life. G. deals specifically with the first four sacraments. He sees fulfilment in Christ as something which begins in this life and is completed in the next. The Christian moral life is consequently not seen as a means to an end but more as a beginning.

G. then presents the Church as custodian of the truth of Christ not only in its infallible teaching but also in its authentic teaching. His final chapter is on dissent from Church teaching, particularly its moral teaching. He gives a rather thorough account of the dissent that has occurred in the American Church since the publication of *Humanae vitae* and subjects it to a careful critical analysis. Since it is obviously a subject on which he feels very strongly, his treatment is not as dispassionate as might be desirable.

The book is meticulously organized and follows a question-answer method. This makes it convenient for reference. It also contains very helpful summaries at the end of each chapter. G. makes generous use of appendices to go into greater detail on specific points than the text would call for or advise. These deal with such questions as pluralism, the notion of the common good, principle of double effect, symbolic aspect of the sacraments, etc. They add considerably to the value of the text.

The book will make an excellent book of reference for those studying moral theology. The thoroughness of the work may make it difficult for beginners unless they have the guidance of a very competent teacher. Although the reader may find G.'s underlying metaethics somewhat dense and complicated, it does have a coherence that gives it plausibility. The reader may not agree with all of G.'s positions, but he will always find them well thought out and defended. A genuine contribution to current moral theology.

Loyola University of Chicago

JOHN R. CONNERY, S.J.

THE PEACEABLE KINGDOM: A PRIMER IN CHRISTIAN ETHICS. By Stanley Hauerwas. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1983. Pp. xxvi + 179. \$17.95; \$7.95 paper.

For the past decade, the writings of Hauerwas have persistently and vigorously pressed the claim that Christian moral life and its reflective counterpart, Christian ethics, take their fundamental shape from convictions Christians hold to be true about the life and the preaching, the death and the resurrection, of Jesus. *The Peaceable Kingdom* now presses that claim along lines that urge the centrality of nonviolence for the kingdom which Jesus both heralds and, in his own person, makes definitively present. This claim is developed in the context of themes that readers of H.'s other writings will find familiar: the contrast between the Church and the world; the centrality of narrative, tradition, and memory for shaping the vision and the life of Christians in their community; and the importance of the life of the virtues, particularly those of patience and hope, for displaying the distinctive character of Christian existence.

H.'s case for the centrality of nonviolence becomes particularly persuasive, in my judgment, because of the links it has to the characterization of Christian life that he has frequently made: training in how to see the world truthfully. By stressing that Christian life involves training to see, H. has provided a way to affirm, or to reaffirm, imagination as a capacity ordered to truth. By stressing that Christian life involves a training to see, H. has also provided a way to affirm, or to reaffirm, spirituality and asceticism as central elements to Christian moral life. As I understand the case H. makes for nonviolence, imagination and spirituality each play an important role. Imagination plays an important role inasmuch as the peaceableness that Christians are called to display must challenge the ways we all have come to expect ourselves and others to deal with violence and the threat of violence. Hauerwas puts the matter thus: "... the problem with these attempts to commit the Christian to limited use of violence is that they too often distort the character of our alternatives. . . . Moreover, when violence is justified in principle as a necessary strategy for securing justice, it stills the imaginative search for nonviolent ways of resistance to injustice" (114). This link to imagination lends strength to the case for the centrality of nonviolence by shifting the argumentative ground away from the question of the extent to which the nonviolent can also be "realistic," particularly when there is need to protect the innocent from harm. H.'s argument suggests, instead, that nonviolence is nothing less than a call to expand our vision of what is real—and thus of what can be done—on the basis of the new possibilities for peace that have been founded on the life, cross, and resurrection of Jesus Christ.

H. insists, as he has done in his earlier writings, that the first place in which the peace of God's kingdom needs display is in the Church's own life. His development of this theme makes manifest a connection that

links nonviolence intrinsically to spirituality; one's life can be shaped in accord with nonviolence only in the context of a community that enables and encourages the constant practice of the renunciation of self as the appropriate acknowledgment that all that is good comes to us not by right but as gift.

There are elements of H.'s case that others will find detracting from the persuasive power of the two I have noted. The chief of these might be the studied refusal to develop some kind of normative account of society for use in the decision-making of the Church; yet this refusal is itself of a piece with H.'s overall vision of theology and ethics—an enterprise that starts not with the abstractions of social theory or of metaphysics but with the concrete fulfilment, in the person of Jesus, of God's promise to be our peace.

Marquette University

PHILIP J. ROSSI, S.J.

PASTORAL LETTERS OF THE UNITED STATES CATHOLIC BISHOPS 1792-1983 1: 1792-1940; 2: 1941-1961; 3: 1962-1974; 4: 1975-1983. Edited by Hugh J. Nolan. Washington, D.C.: United States Catholic Conference, 1984. Pp. 487, 271, 525, 616. \$75.

The Catholic historian Hugh Nolan has put together a valuable, though incomplete, collection of episcopal letters and statements published between 1792 and 1983. Nolan was understandably in a bind with respect to the many statements issued by the NCCB/USCC (1966-83). In prefaces he announced his decision to include pastoral letters, statements, and resolutions of all the bishops and statements made by the President of the NCCB/USCC, and the Administrative Board or Committee. In fact, N. included four statements of the USCC's Committee on Social Development and World Peace but omitted—without any consistent reason—at least nine by that significant USCC body. N. also failed even to indicate all the USCC Congressional testimony, statements by the Executive Committee, the General Secretary, and other officials. It takes 23 pages just to list the titles of the material on foreign policy and domestic policy. It is extremely important to be aware of all these statements in order to form an accurate picture of what the bishops as a group have been doing between 1966 and 1983.

It is interesting to note that the bishops have issued almost 30% more pages of statements and letters since the founding of the NCCB/USCC in 1966 than between 1792 and 1966. That figure does not even include all the material omitted by Nolan. The NCCB/USCC has published very important pastoral letters on the Church (1967), on the family and human life (1968), Catholic education (1972), on Mary (1973), and on

the moral life (1976). The bishops have also put out significant statements on abortion, the laity, Catholic religious education, Catholic higher education, ecumenism, and medical ethics. Still, the major focus of the NCCB/USCC has been social justice.

In his foreword to Volume 4, Cardinal Bernardin says that social justice is the most frequently addressed subject between 1975 and 1983. N. and I agree with this assessment. Bernardin and Nolan, however, write about social-justice statements as though they were above political partisanship. They are only partially right. Some statements on social justice, either entirely or in part, avoid partisan politics and lay out Catholic social doctrine in such a manner as to be truly educational. Many of these statements are not above partisanship because the bishops take sides on matters of personal political judgment or preferences where Catholics might legitimately make other moral choices. The U.S. bishops do admit their advocacy of political opinion in *The Challenge of Peace*, the 1983 pastoral on peace. Most of the other political statements issued between 1966 and 1980 contain no such caveat. Consequently, the Catholic faithful consulting Volumes 3 and 4 of N.'s *Pastoral Letters* will be hard pressed to distinguish authoritative episcopal teaching from the expression of personal political preferences.

Not only are the majority of statements on social-justice issues, but the USCC/NCCB bishops tend to separate evangelization from the pursuit of justice. In fact, their quest for justice has become an activity parallel to evangelization instead of an integral part of it. While the bishops are certainly committed to evangelization, they do not say that it is the most effective means for the hierarchical Church to seek justice. Instead, the USCC/NCCB has stressed the quest for justice through policy statements. With the stress on proposing their own policy initiatives, the bishops have largely failed to communicate the very rich tradition of Catholic social doctrine to Catholics—not to mention non-Catholics. The bishops' almost exclusive focus on policy issues since 1977 is especially unfortunate given the many pressing internal problems of the Church, e.g., the problems of the seminaries, families, youth, religious education, and moral theology.

The bishops could respond to my observation about the focus of the NCCB/USCC that social justice is part of Catholic doctrine. They are right in that Pius XI formally introduced the concept into Catholic social thought in his 1931 encyclical *Quadragesimo anno*. Pius XI, however, did not understand social justice as directing bishops to see the taking of policy positions as their best contribution to the political and social order. Pius XI said: "it is the very essence of social justice to demand from each individual all that is necessary for the common good." The restoration

and perfection of the social order on the basis of social justice and social charity require primarily the correction of morals or the practice of virtue. Social justice or the common good will, of course, require citizens to use law as a means of correcting evil and disposing people to act decently.

The pastoral letters and statements of the pre-USCC/NCCB bishops from 1792 to 1966 reveal a totally different approach. With the notable exception of the 1919 "Program of Social Reconstruction," the American hierarchy, in their formal letters and statements, all but avoided making specific policy statements. The pre-NCCB/USCC bishops stressed the great political and social benefits which accrue to a nation if religion remains strong and education to virtue takes place in the family and in school. The bishops, in short, believed with de Tocqueville that religion properly practiced is the first of our political institutions.

One can hope that the Nolan publication will prompt the bishops, theologians, and other thoughtful citizens to take a hard look at social justice and the omissions in episcopal teaching. In my judgment, there is no theological justification for the great stress on policy issues in the episcopal statements of the USCC/NCCB. The Catholic laity can and should focus on working for a more just society through the policy process. If Catholic bishops do not focus on doctrine (including Catholic social doctrine) and virtue, the Church and society both suffer.

University of Scranton

J. BRIAN BENESTAD

MINISTRY. By Joseph T. Lienhard, S.J. Wilmington: Glazier, 1984. Pp. 183. \$12.95; \$7.95 paper.

THE GOSPEL AND ITS PROCLAMATION. By Robert D. Sider. Wilmington: Glazier, 1983. Pp. 236. \$12.95; \$8.95 paper.

The appearance of these two volumes of the 20-volume *Message of the Fathers* series is an event comparable to the start of the *Ante-Nicene Library* and, like it, will mark a major advance in patristics. Isolating and making readily available in up-to-date translations patristic thought on major issues, the series, as Thomas Halton, its general editor, indicates, will constitute a comprehensive mosaic of patristic thought and endeavor.

Both volumes demonstrate that the series is no mere set of anthologies. Both are topical investigations in which the Fathers are allowed to speak for themselves while the individual editors, by judicious selection, grouping, and commentary, guide the reader through the implications and complexities of the issues. Variety in format has been permitted and is illustrated by the two volumes.

Sider and Lienhard concur on the necessity of relating the NT ante-

cedents to the patristic message. Subsequent editors will, I hope, follow this approach or even broaden it. S. has opted for a format in which a running commentary accompanies his selections, which range from the Apostolic Fathers to the fifth century, representing 35 works by 18 authors. Focusing attention on "audience, context, and development," he divides the material into proclamation to the Jews, the Gentiles, and the faithful (the last divided into learners and believers). His translations are all new. In each category he carefully delineates the literary-rhetorical forms, noting that for the first two categories the dialogue form is the most effective. Each chapter has a concluding bibliography with a brief critique for each entry, for a total of 35 works. Of the 216 pages making up the body of the text, approximately 125 are excerpts from the Fathers and 91 are commentary. The balance is good.

L. has opted for a format restricting his commentary to an initial chapter of ten pages plus a brief introductory note to each excerpt. Points made in the commentary are cross-referenced to the excerpts. His selections cover 157 pages divided topically: early development, the Church in the East, the Church in the West. Represented are 18 works, 17 authors (ten in new translations, eight in existing ones). There is a concluding bibliography of 24 entries. Comparison with S.'s volume makes the commentary seem overly terse, and one regrets that L. did not walk a bit further with us and produce a volume of comparable size.

Inevitably, every reader familiar with the field will bring his own list of desiderata of authors and works, and experience some disappointment. Putting aside my personal regrets, it does seem that the monastic writers should have figured in both works, as unique proclaimers of the gospel (as Peter Brown has steadily made clear of late), holders of a ministerial role from the sociological aspect. Under proclamation, excerpts from the liturgy proper would have been appropriate. Considering the stress S. places on continuity and variety in development in his conclusion and the considerable current interest in orthodoxy and heresy (e.g., the reissue of Bauer's book), more than one excerpt on that topic could also be desired (182-83). L. pointedly raises the distinction between ministry as attitude and ministry as office or function in his introduction, but then concentrates in his commentary on an institutional approach. While his excerpts illustrate the tension (and at times contradictions) arising from the two aspects, further discussion would have been appreciated. In S.'s discussion of *Hermas*, it might have been better to have written "He wrote visions" than "He received visions" (202).

While every work has some limitations, both these volumes demonstrate that the series is off to a good start. Michael Glazier has again shown himself a publisher with vision and initiative. For all libraries and patristic scholars, the series is a must. Particular volumes will be a must

for students in a variety of cross disciplines (theology, Scripture, history, sociology, philosophy), and even the general reader will probably find an interest in more than one volume. The price range makes both series and individual volumes easily available and is a credit to the publisher.

Charlottesville, Va.

JOHN T. CUMMINGS

RELIGIOUS ETHICS AND PASTORAL CARE. By Don S. Browning. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1983. Pp. 128. \$5.95.

LIFE CYCLE THEORY AND PASTORAL CARE. By Donald Capps. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1983. Pp. 127. \$5.95.

A ROMAN CATHOLIC THEOLOGY OF PASTORAL CARE. By Regis A. Duffy, O.F.M. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1983. Pp. 128. \$5.95.

With these books, Fortress Press initiates a series of ecumenical investigations into the interrelationship of theology and pastoral care under the general editorship of Don Browning. Each volume deserves commendation on its own merits, but it is most fitting to consider the three books in light of the goals of the series, which are to "(1) retrieve the theological and ethical foundations of the Judaeo-Christian tradition for pastoral care, (2) develop lines of communication between pastoral theology and other disciplines of theology, (3) create an ecumenical dialogue on pastoral care, and (4) do this in such a way as to affirm, yet go beyond, the recent preoccupation of pastoral care with secular psychotherapy and the other social sciences" (from the series Foreword).

Browning's contribution specifies how a pastoral person might do the kind of practical moral reasoning called for in his 1976 book *The Moral Context of Pastoral Care*. Here B.'s conversation partner is religious ethics, and his purpose is to differentiate the tasks of pastoral care from those of secular therapies. The point of differentiation is the moral context which the pastoral agent represents by virtue of identification with a religious and ecclesial context which should be acknowledged in the context of caring. Actually, B.'s *Moral Context* makes clearer than does this volume how the point of view which he espouses is indeed rooted in the Judeo-Christian tradition, specifically in the Jewish tradition of practical moral rationality. The five levels of moral thinking which B. proposes here seem very complicated; their basic usefulness appears to be for an analyst like B. rather than as a working structure in the life of a pastor and/or congregation.

Duffy's contribution from the Roman Catholic perspective is based on a retrieval of the ancient practice of the catechumenate as a model for pastoral care which evokes a response of committed action from the recipients of care, no matter what their situation. The catechumenate as

practiced in the early Church was not an induction into a passive Christianity, but initiation into a discipleship characterized by living after the example of Christ. Commitment modeled by those already baptized evoked commitment as a response from those about to be baptized. D.'s application of this practice to contemporary care of the sick, youth ministry, and care for the elderly goes beyond conceiving pastoral care as providing service for passive recipients and offers a model of care as calling forth service from those ministered to for the sake of the larger community of faith. The principal theological conversation partners for D. are sacramental theology and critical theory. At times his perspective is so thoroughly sacramental that its ecumenical impact may be in doubt. However, his insight into evoking committed response has great potential for drawing any church beyond the limitations in pastoral-care models derived solely from the human sciences.

Capps's contribution develops the resonance between the vision of moral order in Erikson's life-cycle theory and Wisdom tradition, especially in the Book of Proverbs. C.'s intention in developing this resonance is to provide greater depth for pastoral care by making it more directly responsive to the central challenge of the contemporary period, which he identifies as the maintenance of moral order in individual lives and societal institutions. C.'s work presents Erikson's thought in such a way that the underlying moral dimensions are clearly articulated. Still, C.'s book is somewhat unsatisfying in that the biblical conversation partner is left somewhat undeveloped (at least in comparison to Browning and Duffy), so that it is not clear how the dialogue between Erikson and Wisdom tradition leads pastoral care beyond the limits of Erikson's therapeutic vision. Indeed, C.'s presentation of Erikson is so thorough and sympathetic that the transcending moral perspective emerges from within Erikson's own system and method. More importantly, the notion that pastoral care is/should be directed toward helping troubled persons establish and maintain order seems a questionable goal, in light of the prophetic and eschatological strands of Christian theology as well as the biblical witness of the Book of Job. C. himself disclaims the link between maintaining order and adjustment counseling (14), but the weight of his presentation does not sustain that disclaimer.

Finally, some general comments about the series. The ecumenical focus is exciting and potentially creative for both theology and pastoral care. All the Christian churches have rich traditions of caring, and the churches and their members will benefit from this kind of ecumenical dialogue. Further, the dialogue should enrich the churches' understandings of their mission as churches-in-the-world whose every action (even the most personal acts of caring) is a public action of Christian witness in a

pluralistic and technological society. This prospect of enriching theological appreciation of the social nature of ecclesial life promises to do more than anything else toward transcending the perceived preoccupation with secular therapies and the social sciences. This sensitivity is evident in all three books—particularly in Browning's—yet these hints need to be developed more consistently and thematically for the full power of the insight to be released in both ecumenical theology and pastoral care.

Washington Theological Union

MICHAEL J. MCGINNISS, F.S.C.

FORMATIVE SPIRITUALITY 1: FUNDAMENTAL FORMATION. By Adrian van Kaam. New York: Crossroad, 1983, Pp. xxi + 330. \$24.50.

This is the first of a projected four-volume series on the science of foundational formation or formative spirituality by the man who has given the science its greatest development and articulation through his prolific writing and the founding of the Institute of Formative Spirituality at Duquesne University. The whole series "aims to initiate the reader not only into a new science but also into a way of thinking that is as old as humanity, though perhaps new for many today" (xvii). This first volume is a "consideration of the main presuppositions, structures, and dynamics" of this foundational or universal spirituality of human formation. The three following volumes will investigate the different traditions of human formation with their variety of different attitudes or dispositions, the methodology of this new science, and, finally, the Christian tradition of human formation as articulated in the light of this science of foundational human formation.

Since it attempts to grapple with some serious issues in our contemporary world, the value of this book for many can far outweigh the difficulty encountered in reading it. The rapidity and the pervasiveness of change in the world and in the Church over the past 20 years, together with a very understandable reaction, rather rebellious at times, against many past patterns and practices of life have created a challenging confusion for most of us. Reaction to a seeming impersonal past focused great attention on personalism, increased the popularity of selfist psychologies, and introduced into the sensitivity of many a subtle selfishness (at times, not very subtle). A concern in life for *my* gifts, *my* needs, *my* satisfaction, and *my* development seems reasonable enough, but when it becomes (maybe unconsciously) paramount and ultimate, then the dynamics of healthy human formation and important decisions about critical issues of our world are impeded and corrupted.

This confusion and reaction to the past make the search for new visions and programs in various areas of human formation—especially if

the search assumes a frenzied and frenetic tone—a matter for great care and serious reflection. A world of modernity, at times so “psyched” with the sensual, the sudden, and the shifting and so snide about the profound, the patient, and “the dearest freshness deep down things,” often confuses career and vocation and identifies people in what they do rather than in who they are and continue to become. This modern world rarely has time for careful reflection and assessment for future human formation.

As more and more people are coming to realize the need to stop a bit and catch our balance, van Kaam’s book can serve a valuable purpose. The development of a science of human formation, so foundational as to have a validity for all peoples of all times and all places, can provide insight at a time of confusing search for new visions, forms, and programs of formation. The development of a healthy sense of every person’s transcendent potency, as carefully distinguished from a “transcendentalistic,” excessively autonomous tendency, will motivate both consonant, unself-centered human formation and reverently respectful humanized culture. The careful development of the difference between functional and transcendent spiritual identity can call us to a depth within ourselves and to a sensitivity to the mystery of formation at work within our universe, so as to help us rediscover the lively, responsible sense of fidelity in lifelong commitments. These services which this volume (and whole series) can render are anything but slight.

The book develops logically. Opening chapters formulating a descriptive definition of the science, its basic assumptions, and its presuppositions lead to the important chapter on the basic dynamics of this foundational approach to human formation. Because it is the spiritual, transcendent dimension that makes formation distinctively human (hence foundational human formation is really a matter of “formative spirit-uality”), the transcendent, spiritual dimension is not only the most important but has the chief role of integrating with itself the other three dimensions of human formation: the sociohistorical context, the vital, biophysical-reactive aspect, and the functional, organizing, managing, ordering, controlling responsive aspect. After chapters explaining each of these last three formational dimensions, we come to the heart of the book in its lengthy treatment of the transcendent, spiritual dimension of human beings and the mystery of formation that energizes formation on all levels of the universe. This mystery of formation inspires dialogically in a human person a foundational decision of abandonment that makes possible reverential respect, awe, adoration, equanimity, and equilibrium in the face of the whole formative process. The inherent aspiration in human persons for a union of consonance, love, and likeness with the mystery of formation as a whole is satisfied through this responsive

attitude of abandonment lived daily in the whole of formative life. The book closes with a chapter of overview on the foundational theory of human formation, and appendices that position this new science within the classification of all sciences and attempt to chart the science in various synthetic ways.

This new science is neither simply spiritual theology nor just psychology. Though van Kamm's approach to human formation is very dynamic and dialogical on and among all levels of reality, as restricted to pre-Christian awareness (212) it is not explicitly religious. For this reason the reader must recognize that "spiritual" refers to the transcendent, distinctively human dimension of formation, and does not have its usual religious significance. For these reasons, the book can be helpful not only for formation directors in religious congregations, nor just for psychological counselors and therapists, but for anyone seriously interested in fundamental human development.

One final caution. Most of the difficulty in reading this book stems from the whole new language system used in the expression of this new science. It is a whole new use of words and, as in each issue of *Studies in Formative Spirituality*, there is a special glossary at the end. The section (32-36) that justifies this new terminology makes it seem plausible enough. Finally, readers with professional interest in this new science will have to judge how plausible and successful the new terminology is. V. also speaks of the need for a secondary popular language besides the technical scientific (36). In this light, I found the many common examples used throughout very enlightening of the science's new technical terminology. I hope that V. will both exercise great care with terminology lest jargonese conceal his intention, and develop knowledgeable practitioners who can share his wealth of insight in a more popular language, because his development of this new science can render a valuable service for all of us.

St. Joseph's University, Phila.

GEORGE ASCHENBRENNER, S.J.

BEYOND OBJECTIVISM AND RELATIVISM: SCIENCE, HERMENEUTICS, AND PRAXIS. By Richard J. Bernstein. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 1983. Pp. xxii + 284. \$8.95.

The professor of philosophy in Haverford College not only explains how the currents of conversation are flowing in contemporary philosophy, but also contributes substantially to that conversation. His controversial book is at least very useful, at most very important.

B.'s thesis is that the "thesis" of philosophical objectivism (with its concern for the foundations of knowledge, its commitment to an objective, ahistorical matrix as the criterion of truth, and its dread of skepticism)

and its "antithesis" in relativism (with its holistic view of the web of belief, its denial of any ahistorical referent against which our competing claims can be measured, and its belief in the irreducible multiplicity of our conceptual frameworks and forms of life) are being taken up into a new synthesis beyond the objectivist-relativist conflict which is fed by the Cartesian anxiety for absolute certainty. This new synthesis is inchoately emerging in the concerns revealed in the work of some postempiricist and postidealist philosophers, especially Thomas S. Kuhn, Paul Feyerabend (philosophers of science), Richard Rorty (American deconstructionist metaphilosopher), Hans-Georg Gadamer (hermeneuticist), Jürgen Habermas (theorist of communicative action), and the late Hannah Arendt (provocative political philosopher of action and judgment, praxis and phronesis). Yet the conditions for realizing this new stage are not merely intellectual. They are also practical and political, for we must create those communities of dialogue in which the *eros* and the *agon* of conversation can flourish.

B.'s method is a very sophisticated pragmatic analysis. He looks for those differences which make a real difference *in practice* to see where the key issues are. Hence, in his discussion of the philosophy of science, he brilliantly unpacks the concepts of incommensurability (especially of scientific paradigms), incompatibility, and incomparability (especially of concepts). These must be distinguished, and lumping them together, as most have done, has obscured the contributions of Kuhn and Feyerabend. Yet some will find B.'s analysis reductive, especially when he finds a similar vision for dialogical community in Rorty (whose "nonposition" is radically relativist—some would say nihilist) and Habermas (whose notion of the ideal speech situation is clearly objectivist). While B. avoids portraying everyone as "saying the same thing in different words," his claim that a new synthesis may be emerging is controversial. B.'s irenic pragmatism may obscure theoretical incompatibilities. Yet, if philosophers sustain their conversation, they may reconcile those differences, thus vindicating B.'s pragmatic focus on the praxis of dialogue.

B.'s prose is quite readable. His exposition of the views of his subjects is clear and fair. While this text is beyond an undergraduate, anyone interested in the topics or persons mentioned above or in a sophisticated introduction to the present debates in philosophy will find B.'s book stimulating and illuminating. Whether this book has any direct relevance to Christian philosophical theology, I cannot say. But as the subjects discussed have been frequent dialogue partners for philosophical theologians, B. may provide some hints for ways to reconcile various divergent theological positions, especially in political and liberation theology.

St. Michael's College, Vt.

TERRENCE W. TILLEY

SHORTER NOTICES

COMMENTARY ON THE GOSPEL OF SAINT LUKE. By Saint Cyril of Alexandria. Translated by R. Payne Smith. Astoria, L.I.C., N.Y.: Studion, 1983. Pp. xvi + 620. \$35.

This handsomely printed book reproduces R. Payne Smith's English translation of a Syriac version of Cyril's commentary on the Lucan Gospel. In 1858 he had published the Syriac text discovered in manuscripts obtained shortly before from Egypt and preserved in the British Museum; in the following year he published this English translation of the Syriac version, *A Commentary upon the Gospel according to St Luke* (Oxford: University Press, 1859). Only three sermons and some fragments of the commentary had previously survived in the original Greek (PG 77, 1009-16, 1039-50; PG 72, 475-90); other Syriac fragments had been collected by Card. A. Mai, *Nova patrum bibliotheca* (10 vols.; Rome: Council for the Spread of the Christian Name, 1904-1905) 1. After Payne Smith's work further Greek and Syriac fragments came to light. A critical edition of the first part of the Syriac text was eventually prepared by J.-B. Chabot in 1912 (*S. Cyrilli commentarii in Lucam* 1 [CSCO 70/Syr. 27; Louvain: Durbecq, 1954 reprint]). Like other patristic commentaries, Cyril's commentary on Luke consisted of 156 short homilies. Those translated in this volume number 153, beginning with Jesus' birth (chap. 2) and ending with his burial (chap. 23). To these Payne Smith prefixed an initial homily on some verses of chap. 1 (from Mai's texts) and added a homily on chap. 24; throughout he added paragraphs from Mai's text, when his own Syriac text was defective.

The homilies were delivered extemporaneously, as Homily 3 makes clear. Cyril repetitiously used favorite biblical texts, quoted from the Greek OT

from memory or occasionally used the Theodotionic Greek version, and often introduced into the comments on Luke wording from the Matthean Gospel. To a modern reader Cyril's commentary appears at once spiritual, rhetorical, allegorical, and eisegetical: God's "arm" in Mary's Magnificat (1:51) becomes "the Word born of her" and the scattered "proud" are "the wicked demons who with their prince fell through pride," as well as the Greek sages and the Jews who would not believe. In general, however, the commentary is "written in a tone of moderation . . . far from the baleful atmosphere of controversy" (30) in which Cyril had been caught up with Nestorius. Reddish-brown type singles out the Lucan quotations in the headings, and 27 modern illustrations, imitating eleventh/twelfth-century iconographic illuminations of Byzantine manuscripts, enhance the translation. There is an introductory essay, "The Function of Tradition in the Ancient Church," by G. Florovsky, reproduced from the *Holy Cross Orthodox Theological Review* 9 (1963-64) 181-200.

JOSEPH A. FITZMYER, S.J.
Catholic University of America

FAITH AND RATIONALITY: REASON AND BELIEF IN GOD. Edited by Alvin Plantinga and Nicholas Wolterstorff. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1983. Pp. 321. \$22.95; \$11.95 paper.

This work contains six essays. They are the outgrowth of a yearlong project by the Calvin (College) Center for Christian Studies on the theme "Toward a Reformed View of Faith and Reason." They are responding to the evidentialists' contention that belief in God is irrational. The first three essayists (Plantinga, Alston, and Wolterstorff) substantiate how believing in God can be, even when done without

evidence, an entirely right and therefore rational use of reason—provided one possesses no adequate reason to cease believing. They also highlight how rationality is always situational and applies not merely to what but how one believes.

Mavrodes questions the reluctance of Reformed thinkers to engage in positive apologetics. He observes that a believer desires to know whether his or her belief, even if sincerely held, is really true. Since a person seems disposed to believe particularly in accordance with evidence, then presenting arguments with evidential force is a legitimate approach. Marsden delves into why evangelical scholarship collapsed over the past century. He attributes it to an uncritical acceptance of the scientific methodology without probing its assumptions. Finally, Holwerda dissects and critiques Pannenberg's attempt to elaborate a rational basis for faith. While sympathetic, he rejects P.'s central thesis that reason can demonstrate the truth of faith.

The essays are exceptionally well written, clear, and stimulating. They explicate what it means to be rational in general and to hold a rational belief in particular. While preferring to situate and discuss rationality more in the wider context of faith as a total person act, I have found that the essays complement each other well and expose how there is no "neutral" epistemology. A believer ought to "justify" his or her faith on the basis of common sense and data derived from revelation. For those interested in the vexing but crucial issue of how reason relates to faith, this is a probative and illuminating study.

FREDERICK G. MCLEOD, S.J.
St. Louis University

THE MEDIATION OF CHRIST. By Thomas F. Torrance. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1983. Pp. 108. \$6.95.

Our error, says T., is a tendency

toward analytical or dichotomous thought. In its place he prefers internally relational or holistic thought. This volume presents his holistic and evangelical Christology.

The first two chapters argue that Israel and Christ can only be understood together as ongoing partners in God's covenantal plan of revelation and reconciliation. Chapter 3 argues for a Nicene view of Jesus as the God-man who assumed our human nature and salvifically transformed it. Incarnation and atonement are identical. The final chapter claims that the actions of our worship are not our own free acts but rather the deeds of Christ. Notes and index are absent.

Theological liberals, fundamentalists, and liberationists (T.'s opponents) will find nothing interesting here. Indeed, despite repeated (and odd) allusions to contemporary physics, the Holocaust, and the modern State of Israel, scarcely any idea later than the patristic period is presented. T.'s Nicene substance ontology is untenable, as is his belief that human nature is a distinct assumable entity. His depiction of Jesus as the uncreated personalizing person, and of us as created personalized persons, constitutes a denial of Jesus' humanity. Within a doctetic anthropology of worship T. replaces our faith, decisions, and prayers with Christ's. (Why then should we bother?) His comments on Jews and Judaism are patronizing. T. imperialistically opposes religious pluralism, claiming allegiance to Jesus alone as the sole way to God's presence and favor. His views that Jerusalem fell as a result of the Crucifixion, that anti-Semitism is a Gentile revolt against God, that Christianity (not Judaism) created the idea of personhood, and that liberal Christologies end in heresy just won't wash. This book creates more problems than it solves.

ROBERT P. TUCKER
Yankton College

ST. MARTIN AND HIS HAGIOGRAPHER: HISTORY AND MIRACLE IN SULPICIOUS SEVERUS. By Clare Stancliffe. New York: Clarendon/Oxford University, 1983. Pp. xiv + 396. \$45.

The title provokes an immediate positive response from the reader. It is a commonplace in Martinian studies to say that the Saint and Sulpicius Severus, author of the *Vita Martini* and other relevant primary sources, cannot be separated; having said that, the investigator goes on to complain about Sulpicius' unreliability, his literary excesses, his belief in miracles. S. acknowledges that Sulpicius was a hagiographer, not a 19th-century rationalist biographer, and she respectfully treats him like one. She does not eschew the historian's attempt to get behind the hagiographical motifs, but she does so carefully, even cautiously. S. accepts that Martin did some things which earned him a reputation as a thaumaturge; more importantly, she accepts that we moderns may never decipher the exact nature of those things.

Following the pattern of R. P. C. Hanson's *Saint Patrick* (1968) and Henry Chadwick's *Priscillian of Avila* (1976), S. works to re-create the historical and literary environments of Martin and Sulpicius. In that respect the book is a success. Paradoxically, the reader gets a clear picture of the uncertainty of the situation: the difficulty of establishing a chronology for Martin, the ambiguous nature of his relation to the other Gallic bishops (especially in the Priscillianist affair), and the merits of Sulpicius as a historian, e.g., his rather sober treatment of the Israelite *gesta* in the OT (179–80). In general, S. awards him high marks for reliability, given the literary conventions of his day, and she contends that a cautious approach to his *Martiniana* and the light application of some anthropological methods will result in "A Saint Grounded in Reality" (title of chap. 22).

If any of this sounds reminiscent of recent NT studies, it should. Indeed, all that is now left is for some early 21st-century Schweitzer to write *The Quest of the Historical Martin*.

J. F. T. KELLY
John Carroll University
Cleveland

THE HOLY SPIRIT. By J. Patout Burns, S.J., and Gerald M. Fagin, S.J. Wilmington: Glazier, 1984. Pp. 240. \$12.95; \$8.95 paper.

PREACHING THE WORD. By Thomas K. Carroll. Wilmington: Glazier, 1984. Pp. 222. \$12.95; \$8.95 paper.

SOCIAL THOUGHT. By Peter C. Phan. Wilmington: Glazier, 1984. Pp. 268. \$12.95; \$8.95.

These are among the first volumes of a series, *Message of the Fathers of the Church*, that is projected to 22 volumes, to be completed by late 1985. The series is conceived as "semipopular," which means that it eschews an extensive bibliography and all but the most necessary notes. Instead it concentrates on translations of topic-related patristic texts, with a minimum of introduction and commentary.

The volume on the Holy Spirit brings together texts that have not been assembled before in English, however familiar some of them may be. This is a valuable collection, but the reader misses here, as to a lesser degree in the other two volumes, some representation from the Syriac writers, and in particular from Ephrem, who has a pneumatology, even if it is expressed in imagistic rather than systematic fashion. The volume concludes with an essay on the development of the doctrine of the Spirit. Surprisingly, there is no bibliography of contemporary works on patristic theology of the Spirit, although a number of these could have been cited.

The second of these volumes contains a helpful selection of texts in an area that would ordinarily be neglected

in such a semipopular series. It is devoted to preaching and provides examples of both homiletic and exegetical theory and homiletic styles, concluding with Gregory the Great and the "decline" of patristic preaching. Presumably the 14th volume in the series, on teaching authority in the early Church, will touch upon the problem of who had the right to exercise the preaching office.

The third volume deals with social thought—or rather with two aspects of social thought: poverty and wealth and, to a lesser extent, slavery. Other volumes have to do with the status of women and with war and military service. The area of poverty and wealth in the Fathers is one that has been much mined of late (cf., e.g., Charles Avila, *Ownership: Early Christian Teaching* [Maryknoll: Orbis, 1983]), and it is useful to have a good collection of the classical texts.

It should be noted that these books do not have indexes, which cuts down somewhat on their effectiveness. This lack is not really made up for by the tables of contents, since they, and particularly the one in the volume on preaching, are not especially indicative.

BONIFACE RAMSEY, O.P.
Dominican House of Studies
Washington, D.C.

WOMEN IN THE EARLY CHURCH. By Elizabeth A. Clark. Wilmington: Glazier, 1983. Pp. 260. \$12.95; \$8.95.

THE EARLY FATHERS ON WAR AND MILITARY SERVICE. By Louis J. Swift. Wilmington: Glazier, 1983. Pp. 164. \$12.95; \$7.95.

The titles of these two volumes may be one of the best arguments in favor of a return to the patristic age as one avenue of approach to contemporary religious questions. These works, like others in the series *Message of the Fathers of the Church*, have certain characteristics in common: scholarly authors/editors, representative selec-

tions, provocative analysis of and reflections on the texts, helpful suggestions for further readings. The choice of material and the quality of translation make the early Christian authors accessible to a wide variety of readers in a manner not previously available in English.

Women in the Early Church is timely, although it is not the first contribution to a consideration of what the Church Fathers have said about women. Happily, Clark presents a more comprehensive survey of early Christian documents than those usually cited in contemporary writings on the subject. However, the introduction does seem to reveal, on the part of the author/editor, a certain presumption of primarily negative statements and attitudes in the patristic texts. An investigation of the manner in which the Church Fathers made use of classical rhetorical devices such as the diatribe still remains to be done. Also, Clark's insistence on the exclusion of women from Church ministries, while exact in some respects, is incomplete without the insights provided by a work such as Quasten's *Music and Worship in Pagan and Christian Antiquity* (National Association of Pastoral Musicians, 1983). Aside from these two points, the volume must be recognized for the significance of its contribution to a critical discussion.

While a student or disciple of the Fathers will find rich inspiration in the patristic texts in Clark's book, the volume by Swift has another value-dimension. Here the citations from early writers are utilized rather as demonstrations or points of departure for a presentation of the development in early Christianity of attitudes and postures regarding nonviolence, military service, participation in war, and the criteria for determining a "just war." In this work the patristic texts seem to play a more secondary role than those in the Clark volume. Suggestions for further reading recommended by Swift

promise an excellent introduction to a topic of vital importance to Christians today.

AGNES CUNNINGHAM, S.S.C.M.
St. Mary of the Lake Seminary
Mundelein, Ill.

DAS TRADITIONSVERSTÄNDNIS IN DER CONFESSIO AUGUSTANA UND IN DER CONFUTATIO. By Bernhard Dittich. Leipzig: St. Benno, 1983. Pp. xxiii + 227. DDR 22.50 M.

This Erfurt dissertation analyzes assiduously the Lutheran and Catholic formulations exchanged at the 1530 Diet of Augsburg. At that time the topic "tradition" was largely implicit in particular attempts to prove or disprove points of doctrine or church practice. Development after 1530 brought the distinctions we know in the treatment of tradition: dogmatic/disciplinary, written/oral, apostolic/postapostolic. Therefore D. studies mainly the argumentative methods of the two sides in order to retrieve their understandings and evaluations of tradition. Several articles of the Augsburg Confession attribute importance to early-Church expressions of the faith by councils, in creeds, and even in disciplinary canons. Mainly these serve to show that the reforms just introduced in Lutheran territories are in fact restorations of original ideals, from which the medieval Church had fallen. The imperial Confutation uses the Fathers more extensively, principally to show that later forms of doctrine and practice have weighty precedents. The *confutatores* understood the charge of historical decline from the gospel and sought to show that things have not changed substantially. Elsewhere in the Confutation elements of tradition make up an ecclesial hermeneutic of the original Word of God. Still, the Catholics did assemble Scripture proofs in a notable effort to join issue on ground accepted by the opponents. Substantively, the critical opposition at Augsburg con-

cerned church authority. The Lutherans would limit its competency to preaching and sacraments, while ruling out power to make laws binding on believers. The Catholics asserted that ecclesiastical decisions are guided by the Spirit and so oblige in conscience. Other Reformation documents would espouse more radical views, e.g., a solitary *sacra Scriptura sui ipsius interpretes*, while some Catholics would hold that oral transmissions were needed to supplement biblical revelation. But the moderate formulations of 1530 expressed enough common conviction that today our dialogues can extend notably the area of consensus.

JARED WICKS, S.J.
Gregorian University, Rome

PROTESTANT REFORMERS IN ELIZABETHAN OXFORD. By C. M. Dent. New York: Oxford University, 1983. Pp. x + 262. \$37.50.

When Elizabeth I came to power in 1558, both Oxford and Cambridge Universities were centers of Catholic sentiment. Over her long reign the two universities gradually became bastions of moderate Puritanism. This development has now been traced in two recent monographs, both strongly indebted to Patrick Collinson: Dent's book here under review and Peter Lake's *Moderate Puritanism and the Elizabethan Church* (New York: Cambridge University, 1982). Lake's book tells the more interesting story, because Cambridge saw the confrontation of strong personalities such as Thomas Cartwright, William Whitaker, and Peter Baro as spokesmen for contrasting theologies. D.'s account of Oxford lacks strong central characters—the most important is the stolid John Reynolds—and the advancement of Protestantism there was by slow accretion. D.'s book closes with a quotation from the historian H. A. L. Fisher: "one intellectual excitement has been denied me. Men wiser and more learned than

I have discerned in history a plot, a rhythm, a predetermined pattern. I can only see one emergency following upon another, as wave follows on wave. . . . I am not sure whether this quotation is a statement of principle by D. or a confession of failure. Certainly a reluctance to force interpretation on the evidence is commendable, but here the resulting book is less than the sum of its parts. Caution leads D. to deliberately avoid the term "Puritan," but there is no satisfactory substitute term for the movement being described. Often D. speaks of "advanced Protestants" and describes their teaching as "godly," but such terminology seems even more equivocal than "Puritan."

Still D.'s monograph has obvious strengths. It is based on a great deal of digging in manuscript sources and long-forgotten books of sermons and divinity. The material is well organized and clearly written. There is a wealth of information about the theological differences among and within the Oxford colleges; especially interesting is the case study of conflict in Magdalen College, 1575-89. We learn how Oxford served to a limited degree as a seminary and a haven for the English Church and how the benefice system affected university finances. The main themes and contents of preaching at Oxford are dissected for us. Dent reinforces previous research that shows how English Protestantism depended not merely on John Calvin but also on other Continental theologians such as Bullinger, Daneau, Junius, Vermigli, Ursinus, and Zanchi. Finally, there is new information on the strength and limits of the influence that crown, courtiers, and Canterbury exercised at Oxford. For this wealth of detail we should be grateful.

JOHN PATRICK DONNELLY, S.J.
Marquette University

ON BEING REFORMED: DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS AND COM-

MON MISUNDERSTANDINGS. By I. John Hesselink. Ann Arbor, Mich.: Servant, 1983. Pp. vii + 159. \$6.95.

The focus of this study on common misunderstandings of the Reformed tradition allows the author to state the misapprehension and then develop the proper understanding. This method has the advantage of "dramatic conflict" which a straightforward exposition of essentials of the Reformed faith would not possess. The reader is challenged to correct misunderstandings and supported in those views which are sound.

However, the reader who has never shared a particular misunderstanding, e.g., "That the word 'Reformed' refers primarily to denominations which bear that name, especially those of Dutch origin" (chap. 1), may not read such sections with the care they deserve. Another inherent difficulty of this approach is that the focus on common misunderstandings can subtly distort the discussion of distinctive characteristics. That is to say, the "quality" of the misunderstanding has a profound influence on the explanation which is required to correct it.

Fortunately, H. has utilized the attractive features of this format and avoided those which are problematic. With an engaging personal touch, he describes his experience in the Reformed community as a way of accounting for the perspective he offers. His criteria for evaluation and judgment are the theology of John "Calvin and the classical Reformed confessions of the sixteenth century, especially those in my own [Dutch] tradition" (3). Some such criteria are unavoidable, and this one is widely accepted, but it is also endlessly debatable. For example, what is the precise relation between being Reformed and being a Calvinist? And what is the precise relation of Calvinism to the theology of John Calvin? And what precisely is the theology of Calvin?

H. takes an inclusive and irenic approach to these questions. He has studied with extraordinary sympathy and appreciation those who stand on the far right and the far left of the Reformed tradition. He claims that the Reformed position represents a middle way in Christianity (x), being neither liberal nor fundamentalist, and one may say that this book represents a middle way within the Reformed community. H. has a first-rate theological mind. He is also a gracious Christian gentleman. He seems never to have met a Christian theologian whom he cannot like and to whom he will not be generous even when he must finally disagree.

H. confesses the necessity of being "blunt, brief, and simple" (3), but he is unfailingly kind, clear, sensible, and solid. If, as Karl Holl says, "The Calvinist knows *what* he believes and why he believes it" (106), this book makes a substantial contribution to that end. In addition, the notes deserve careful reading and the annotated bibliography contains splendid resources for further reading.

CHARLES PARTEE

Pittsburgh Theological Seminary

THE THEOLOGY OF GRACE AND THE AMERICAN MIND: A REPRESENTATION OF CATHOLIC DOCTRINE. By Daniel Liderbach. New York: Mellen 1983. Pp. 158. \$39.95.

Beginning with the premise that God's love is time-bound and mediated within the framework of a particular culture, L. attempts a re-presentation of the Catholic doctrine of grace for the contemporary North American mind. He begins with a historical survey of grace (chap. 1) and presents the dialectical relationship that the explanation of grace interdepends upon the anthropology used. Hence, for today, an anthropology is needed. L. suggests the anthropology of Karl Rahner (chap. 2), which does not separate matter and spirit. R.'s supernatural existential em-

phasizes God's gracing of human experience. Then, drawing upon a psychology of the value of human experience, L. uses Carl Rogers' "becoming a person" through the transformative power of self-affirmation in love (chap. 3). Finally, through the pragmatic context of American thought expressed through the father of pragmatism, C. S. Peirce, L. demonstrates that the empirical mind is open to belief. Very similar to the thought of modern science, Peirce holds to an empiricism with a twist: induction and deduction do not constitute the only access to reality; belief also is a possibility. Peirce's concern for the meaning of thought and action moving towards truth holds open to the American today the role of grace, which transforms human experience. Human experience becomes transformed in love, which is the sign of grace, without losing the gratuity of grace itself.

While one can applaud the strong thought about the individual in Rahner and Rogers creatively connected with Peirce, one might suggest that the equally strong American social dimension (e.g., Josiah Royce) needs attention. Written for the "adequately educated" person, this book is a creative attempt to inculcate the doctrine of grace in a contemporary American mentality. Along with other topics, such attempts are long overdue.

J. J. MUELLER, S.J.
St. Louis University

VOEGELIN AND THE THEOLOGIAN: TEN STUDIES IN INTERPRETATION. Edited by William M. Thompson and John Kirby. New York: Mellen, 1983. Pp. 377. \$44.95.

Thomas Altizer has written of Eric Voegelin that "he remains our only major thinker who has attempted to realize a union of classical and Biblical thinking, and if only for that reason it is not possible to give his work a theological identity in any accepted ...

sense." In other words, Voegelin's work resists being "positioned."

Ten authors here go in search of V.'s theological identity: William Thompson, John Kirby, Kenneth Keulman, Lyn Clapham, John Carmody, Pheme Perkins, Barry Cooper, Larry Schmidt, Frederick Lawrence, and Eugene Webb. Although most of the essays are expository in nature, some break new interpretive ground. Among the latter are Carmody's "Noetic Differentiation: Religious Implications"; "Gnosis and the Life of the Spirit: The Price of Pneumatic Order" by Perkins; Webb's "Faith, Truth, and Persuasion"; and "Voegelin on Jesus Christ" by Thompson.

Carmody contends that V.'s philosophical theology—or theological philosophy—leads to the "repristinization of contemplation." He comes to specific, and controversial, conclusions about the implications of V.'s analysis of the interpenetration of philosophy and revelation for life and practice in the Church. Regrettably, he appears to have misunderstood V.'s distinction between "universal" and "ecumenic" humanity when he refers to the "divine constitution of *ecumenic* humanity" (167). His sentence should read "universal" instead of "ecumenic" humanity for reasons I have explained in my *Political Philosophy and the Open Society* 88–104. Thompson gives a balanced appraisal of V.'s Christology, especially as it relates to the question of the "historical Jesus." Perkins, a specialist in Gnosticism, finds V.'s treatment of Gnosticism "both exciting and dismaying." She insists that "ancient gnosis . . . did not exhibit the radical perversions of the spirit" that V. associates with modern extremist ideological thinking. She also attacks V.'s "caricature" of Hegel. Webb's brief essay on V.'s understanding of faith in the sense of Heb 11:1–3 should lead readers to his fine book on Voegelin.

Overall, I find this a useful volume

for the specialist on V. and a helpful introduction for readers who want to know more about him. A reply from V. himself would have made the volume all the more valuable.

DANTE GERMINO
University of Virginia

LINGUISTIC ECUMENISM: A BARTHIAN ROAD BACK FROM BABEL. By William J. Ellos, S.J. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1983. Pp. v + 109. \$20; \$8.75 paper.

This little book has an appealing title, and the subtitle sounds promising, but unfortunately the expectations aroused by title and subtitle are not fulfilled.

E. begins with the point that theology need not be bound by scholastic categories but should "put the Word of God in modern terms which the contemporary minds find helpful and intelligent." In contrast to the theological rigidity of the past, E. appeals for a recognition of "the dialectically pragmatic mysterious aspect of the situation."

The inspiration he draws from Karl Barth for this purpose is the notion of the Word of God, which was the key theme of the first volume of the *Church Dogmatics*. Aside from that phrase, however, the influence of Barth's theological thought is not at all evident in this book. Indeed, the chapter headed "Barthian Methodology" has practically nothing in common with Barth and reflects little or no real grasp of Barth's theological method. For example, E. praises the "brilliant breakthrough" of Braithwaite, whose position on theological language—viz., that it is not intended as a description of the way things are, but only as an expression of my determination to behave in a certain way—is radically different from Barth's. Again, in discussing the idea of merit, E. writes: "A more Barthian reflection on this would be to

point up merit as being much more a sort of concept that would be connected and understood in terms of man's cooperation with God." Not only is that a fair sample of E.'s prolix style, but the reader is left wondering why he chose to apply the "Barthian" label to his own musings.

In short, while a proposal for "linguistic ecumenism" sounds like a good idea, and while the theology of Barth might well contribute toward that end, this book is a disappointment on both counts.

RUSSELL W. PALMER
Univ. of Nebraska at Omaha

KARL RAHNER IM GESPRÄCH 2: 1978-1982. Edited by Paul Imhof and Hubert Biallowons. Munich: Kösel, 1983. Pp. 319. DM 34.

Volume 1, published in 1982, contained 38 newspaper, radio, and television interviews given by Rahner from 1964-77. This companion volume contains 36 more such interviews. As with Vol. 1, this book illustrates how R. comes to life in an interview forum and how powerful his spoken theology is. The nuanced, simple, clear, and everyday language of these theological conversations shows another side of Rahner: not only the theologian, but also the man, the Christian, the priest, and the Jesuit. They offer the easiest, most succinct, and most readable approach to this great theologian.

These interviews provide an excellent synthesis of his opinions on a vast array of theological questions and vividly illustrate R.'s key focal points as well as his own theological development. Not only do they exhibit an astonishing theological acumen—an ability to distinguish Christian essentials from ecclesial, social, and political variables—but they also highlight R.'s pastoral sensitivities. He can speak to the so-called person on the street. He knows intimately the problems of being a human person in this age so tempted to unbelief and despair. Although R.

refuses to answer personal questions—especially about his own spiritual life—several interviews are rich in autobiographical material.

Although R. underscores the social-political ramifications of the radical unity of love of God and of neighbor, he rejects both a "Jesusism" and a purely humanistic ("horizontal") political or liberation theology. The problem for R. is the one not enough people take seriously: God's existence, the blessed outcome of all history (despite appearances), and eternal life. He views priests primarily as "gurus of the love of God," not as social workers, armed revolutionaries, or politicians.

Especially noteworthy are his balanced reflections on Küng, his emphasis upon greater freedom for regional churches, and his opinion that there are no *theological* obstacles to a real, organizational, social unity of the different churches. Both volumes should be translated as quickly as possible.

HARVEY D. EGAN, S.J.
Boston College

MENSCHHEITSGESCHICHTE UND HEILSERFAHRUNG: DIE THEOLOGIE VON EDWARD SCHILLEBEECKX ALS METHODISCH REFLEKTIERTE SOTERIOLOGIE. By Tadahiko Iwashima. Düsseldorf: Patmos, 1982. Pp. 416. DM 48.

This 1981-82 Münster dissertation is the most comprehensive scholarly account of Schillebeeckx' thought that has appeared. As the subtitle indicates, I. sees soteriology as the pervading concern which holds S.'s thought together more than any single metaphysical system (although I. gives Thomistic epistemology its due).

I. surveys S.'s books, collections of essays, and major articles translated out of Dutch. After two introductory chapters placing S.'s thought in its theological context and treating of his earlier thought, he turns to S.'s methodological preoccupations of the late 1960's, which most observers would agree marked a major turn in his

thought. Three chapters on S.'s Christology and soteriology follow, emphasizing the category of experience. A closing chapter poses a number of critical questions.

I.'s account is lucidly written; it is especially good on S.'s soteriology, the major theme of the book. He rightly sees human history and experience as central to S.'s preoccupation. His bibliography of major secondary literature on S. is a welcome addition. All in all, the book provides a very good survey and interpretation of S.'s thought up to 1980.

The book could have been strengthened somewhat by knowledge of some of S.'s untranslated articles, particularly those in *Kultuurleven*. This would have blunted I.'s criticism about the somewhat abstract treatment of the particularities of human experience and history, as well as shown more of the continuing development of S.'s thought in the 1970's. Perhaps because of the dissertation genre, he makes S.'s intellectual development seem more tidy and uniform than it actually is. But this notwithstanding, it is a valuable book.

ROBERT J. SCHREITER
Catholic Theological Union
Chicago

CATHOLIC BISHOPS: A MEMOIR.
By John Tracy Ellis. Wilmington: Glazier, 1983. Pp. 182. \$10.95.

Widely esteemed by his colleagues and students as the *doyen* of American Catholic historians, E. draws on both his professional expertise and his personal experience in this memoir, which presents his recollections and assessment of bishops of prominence in the American Church since 1930. While readily acknowledging the limitations which are associated with personal remembrance, E. nonetheless clearly strives for that level of objectivity to which the professional historian aspires. More often than not, his judgment is restrained and balanced, frank

yet tempered by keen insight into both personalities and the historical contexts in which the bishops exercised their ministry.

E. makes no claim to complete coverage of the influential prelates of the past fifty years. Rather, he focuses on those whose personal acquaintance affords more than a superficial basis for comment. Through his lengthy association with the Catholic University of America, he is able to provide an insider's view of the succession of bishop-rectors and such trustees as William Cardinal O'Connell. Archbishop Michael Curley of Baltimore-Washington, fellow professor Fulton J. Sheen, and Cardinal Spellman of New York are given particular attention. But the list of those drawing less extensive comment includes bishops from Minnesota and California, Texas and the Midwest, as well as Cardinals Ritter, McIntyre, Cushing, and Wright. These personal portraits provide much insight into the life of the American Church during more than fifty years. The memoir concludes with reflections on the succession of apostolic delegates (Cicognani, Vagnozzi, Jadot), Archbishop Cardinale (E.'s longtime friend and nuncio to Belgium), and the man dubbed *facile princeps*, Archbishop Paul Hallinan of Atlanta. Though E. seems mildly reluctant to dwell on the weaknesses of his subjects or his own less-than-pleasant experience with some of them, such episodes are recounted where they foster a better understanding or a more complete picture.

E.'s contribution here lies in the instructive insight he shares regarding churchmen whose life and work affected the development of Catholicism in America. Students of the Church in the U.S. will benefit both from the information he presents and the skill with which he forthrightly sketches these recollections.

DONALD J. GRIMES, C.S.C.
King's College, Pa.

THE BODY OF FAITH: JUDAISM AS CORPOREAL ELECTION. By Michael Wyschogrod. New York: Seabury, 1983. Pp. xviii + 265. \$24.95.

The subtitle will immediately draw the attention of the Christian theologian. It would seem to be moving Judaism towards a form of incarnationism, something that would certainly provide grist for the Christian-Jewish dialogue. But this is not the main thrust of the book, which on the whole remains a work dealing with intra-Jewish issues from an enlightened Orthodox perspective. Saying this in no way implies that the Christian reader will not profit greatly from W.'s creative reflections on the meaning of Jewish identity in the contemporary world. He has extensive interreligious experience and it shows even when he is essentially trying to carve out a meaningful path for Jewish existence today. At times W. makes explicit connections and dissociations between his view of Jewish Orthodoxy and Christianity.

The first three chapters deal with humanity's limited ability to know God, with Israel's election as that has been played out through the centuries, and with the personality of God. Some key points W. makes are that the Hebrew God is very much a "this-worldly" God, that Jewish theology arises out of the existence of the Jewish people, that all theology must be based in an embodied rationality, and that rabbinic Judaism set Israel on a nonsacramental and nonhistorical track that needs major correction today. In chap. 4, "Created Being," W. makes a point central to his whole interpretation: "We have attempted to reverse the depersonalization of *Hashem* that philosophic thought has imposed on Judaism." He then goes on to analyze the implications of Heidegger (whom he strongly criticizes for his endorsement of Nazism) and Kant from a Jewish perspective. His final chapters lay out his views of what Judaism needs to be today. The

land and cult (including sacrifice) are key elements in any Jewish self-definition. Judaism must free itself from the excessively ethical self-definition which Enlightenment-oriented Jews have given it during the last century.

While Christians and Jews will have different interests in this volume, it can prove stimulating for both and for a mutual exchange between them. W.'s claims of Jesus' fundamentally nonpolitical stance and of Christianity's ahistorical orientation may well be challenged, as well as his generally sharp distinction between the ethos of Judaism and Christianity. But good Christian-Jewish interchange can result from such challenges. This is especially the case with his contention, on the one hand, that Jewish corporeal election and Christian incarnational notions are quite distinct, while at the same time maintaining that "*Hashem's* identification with Israel, his indwelling in Israel, is so intimate that Israel's sin does not leave *Hashem* untouched."

JOHN T. PAWLIKOWSKI, O.S.M.
Catholic Theological Union
Chicago

THE WESTMINSTER DICTIONARY OF CHRISTIAN SPIRITUALITY. Edited by Gordon S. Wakefield. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1983. Pp. xvi + 400. \$20.95.

This handbook to the study of Christian spirituality is the product of ecumenical collaboration by an international team of more than 150 scholars, including, among others, Anglicans, Roman Catholics, Baptists, Presbyterians, Quakers, Methodists, and Lutherans. Its purpose is "to give direct access to the whole development and present state" (v) of the field of Christian spirituality. As one would expect, the articles are models of conciseness and compression. At the same time, they are accurate and up to date. The first and last entries of this volume indicate its vast scope: "Abandon" (in

the sense of de Caussade) and "Zen," respectively. Between them are over 350 entries concerning individuals, terms, and types. We find, e.g., Dietrich Bonhoeffer between Bonaventure and Charles Borromeo, George Fox between Charles de Foucauld and Francis of Assisi, and John XXIII between John of the Cross and Dr. Johnson. Accidie is discussed alongside abnormal and psychophysical phenomena, the *devotio moderna* alongside the devil, and retreats alongside *regula fidei*. More than 40 different types of spirituality are explored: from Jewish, Greek, and Coptic to American, Asian, and African; from Benedictine, Franciscan, and Carmelite to Feminine, Radical, and Black; from Orthodox, Roman Catholic, and Anglican to Moravian, Quaker, and Baptist. If a common thread can be found connecting these disparate entries, it is the emphasis of many entries on prayer. Entries are cross-referenced and followed by select bibliographies.

This reference work is attractively printed and reasonably priced. No church, college, university, or seminary library should be without it. For the student of Christian spirituality, it is an indispensable vade mecum.

JOSEPH CHORPENNING, O.S.F.S.
Allentown College, Pa.

CHRISTIAN SPIRITUALITY. By Wolfhart Pannenberg. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1983. Pp. 115. \$8.95.

In five chapters P. deals with several theological issues in Christian spirituality. The first three chapters reproduce the Taylor lectures given at Yale Divinity School in 1977. P. begins with a damaging overview of traditional Protestant pietism with its emphasis upon guilt and sin. Identifying the origin of this self-focused awareness in Western medieval spirituality, P. exposes its excessive individualism and its masochistic, self-aggressive tendencies. Self-acceptance and the early

Christian experience of joy and freedom fail to find expression in traditional Reformation spirituality.

The second and third chapters attempt to provide a reconstruction of Christian spirituality. P. points toward the centrality of the Eucharist as the most profound symbol of community, not only among Christians themselves but also in relationship to the world. Eucharistic communion in Christ attaches us to the mission of Christ: service toward others. Thus spirituality relates the Christian to political reality. For the most part, the third chapter constitutes a critical assessment of the theology of liberation on two counts: its failure to articulate a concept of justice and its lack of an appraisal of Marxist economic theory in relationship to Christian faith.

P.'s fourth and fifth chapters seem to have an adjunct relationship to the rest of the book. He reflects on the phenomenon of secularization as the milieu of God's absence in which the person has come to assume the function of divine providence. P. suggests that secular culture no longer provides a secure image of the future and therefore God's apparent absence signals a problem within secular culture rather than an indication of the end of Christianity. The final chapter offers a congenial dialogue between Buddhism and Lutheranism on the search for authentic selfhood. P. indicates several points of convergence and attempts to bridge divergence through a positive evaluation of Buddhist themes.

JOHN F. RUSSELL, O.CARM.
Immaculate Conception
Seminary, N.J.

JESUS AS MOTHER: STUDIES IN THE SPIRITUALITY OF THE HIGH MIDDLE AGES. By Caroline Walker Bynum. Berkeley: University of California, 1983. Pp. xiv + 279. \$28.50.

The methodology employed in this collection of five essays (four were pre-

viously published but are substantially rewritten here) is as important as its content. B.'s method seeks to occupy "a middle ground between the older history of doctrine or mystical theology, which has exhaustively catalogued medieval theories of purgation and contemplation, and the newer stress on the changing social context of religious movements" (6). B. proceeds by closely examining key images and words which religious people of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries used to present their theories about the soul's journey to God and then situating these images and words in the experience of the individuals or groups that produced them. This enables B. to answer a number of questions about the spirituality of the High Middle Ages: How were the regular canons and the monks similar? How did they differ? (chap. 1); What was the Cistercian conception of community? (chap. 2); Did the twelfth century discover the individual? (chap. 3); Why was the use of explicit and elaborate maternal imagery to describe God and Christ so popular with twelfth-century Cistercian monks? (chap. 4); Why was there a flowering of female mysticism in the thirteenth century? Why did it have the particular characteristics that it did? (chap. 5). The answers B. offers explore neglected areas as well as analyze and challenge the assumptions and generalizations of earlier scholarship.

The most provocative essay is "Jesus As Mother and Abbot As Mother." However, that on "Women Mystics in the Thirteenth Century," which argues that female mystical experience was a substitute for, but not a contradiction of, male sacerdotal power, is particularly timely in light of the current debate over the ordination of women.

Jesus As Mother is a meticulous and seminal work of scholarship. It should be on the shelf of every student of the history of Christian spirituality.

JOSEPH CHORPENNING, O.S.F.S.
Allentown College, Pa.

MONASTERY: PRAYER, WORK, COMMUNITY. By M. Basil Pennington, O.C.S.O., with photographs by Nicolas Sapiéha. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1983. Pp. 128. \$22.50.

This book, beautifully produced by Scala in Florence and published in the U.S., is a coffee-table book with 56 color photographs representing earlier and contemporary monasticism—primarily the more fully contemplative tradition. After two poems by Thomas Merton and a letter from Merton written as a message of contemplatives to the world, the text contains a brief chapter on monasticism from the beginnings to the high medieval period (8 pp.); a chapter on prayer, work, and community (24 pp.); and one on monasticism in the modern and specifically contemporary period (8 pp.). The book is completed by a chronology of outstanding dates and events in the history of monasticism and by suggestions for further reading on a variety of monastic topics.

The beautiful photographs and the text do represent in some measure the scope of monasticism—ancient, medieval, modern, Catholic, Orthodox, Anglican, Protestant, and Coptic. Among the references it makes to contemporary experimentations in monasticism, I was happy to see mention of Lavra Netofa, Israel, of which Ya'aqov Willebrands and my brother, Toma Farrelly, were cofounders almost twenty years ago. But from the perspective of an urban Benedictine abbey, I was a little taken aback when I read that "The influence of the *Rule* came to its fullest flowering in the Cistercian reform" (36). I would consider the Cistercian reform *one* of the full flowerings of the *Rule* of St. Benedict. And I think that monastic history and the present monastic reality would be better represented by more recognition than P. provides of Benedictine integrations of a contemplative life and an apostolate.

JOHN FARRELLY, O.S.B.
St. Anselm's Abbey, Wash., D.C.

A LIFE OF PROMISE: POVERTY, CHASTITY, OBEDIENCE. By Francis Moloney, S.D.B. Wilmington: Glazier, 1984. Pp. 175. \$8.95.

The author writes: "Precisely because our reflections are 'biblical,' they are necessarily frighteningly idealistic, touching us at our deepest level and questioning us where we would prefer not to be questioned." In a scholarly reappraisal of what he would refer to as the evangelical "imperatives," M. indeed gives an exacting account of the biblical basis for poverty, chastity, and obedience, and examines them within the context of "the radical nature of the Faith required from anyone who wishes to embrace the 'perfection' which is to be found uniquely in the following of Jesus." He regards these evangelical imperatives as "part of the vocation to 'perfection' of all the baptised" (see *Lumen gentium* 40).

Accordingly, working on the basic premise of Paul's theological notion of shared life "in Christ" (Gal 3:27-28; Col 3:10), M. sees poverty fundamentally as a sharing of the life of Christ within the community—a "radical sharing of all that we are and all that we have"; chastity ("the manner in which one lives one's sexuality") as an evangelical imperative for all Christians, married or celibate, to follow the chaste Jesus of Nazareth—"a universal vocation to a wholeness of life and love"; and obedience ("the most radically demanding of all the evangelical imperatives") as "a total commitment of the believer to the following of Jesus of Nazareth," who responded radically to the call of his Father.

Undoubtedly, no one can question this radicalism in the commitment of the Christian and the religious to the following of Jesus of Nazareth. However, in his investigation of "the authentic biblical background to the Christian and Religious life," M. leaves little room for a more nuanced understanding of the complexities of the Christian vocation and, making no ad-

equates provision for this, thereby risks oversimplifying the very radicalism he speaks of. But the book achieves what it set out to do: being "frighteningly idealistic," it touches us at our deepest level and questions us "where we would prefer not to be questioned." This book must be read.

E. GERARD CARROLL
University of Notre Dame

CONVERSIONS: THE CHRISTIAN EXPERIENCE. Edited by Hugh T. Kerr and John M. Mulder. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1983. Pp. xx + 265. \$12.95.

A collection of fifty accounts of conversion experiences, arranged chronologically, spanning two thousand years of Christian history, from Paul's dramatic experience on the road to Damascus to Charles Colson's personal acceptance of Jesus Christ. Between the experiences of Paul and Colson one finds those of, among others, Augustine, Ignatius of Loyola, Teresa of Avila, John Calvin, George Fox, John Wesley, Elizabeth Bayley Seton, Cardinal Newman, Leo Tolstoy, Albert Schweitzer, Dorothy Day, and Malcolm Muggeridge.

The anthology proper is preceded by a brief introduction which succinctly discusses in turn the following topics: the definition of "conversion"; conversion in the OT and NT: the theological, psychological, and sociological aspects of conversion; themes common to Christian conversion accounts; and the rationale for the present collection. Each account is introduced by a short preface which situates it and its author in context. At the outset the editors indicate that most of the accounts included in this book are examples of dramatic and clearly identifiable conversion experiences rather than of life-long conversions because the latter "cannot be easily summarized or described" (xiii). But this distinction is too neat. As Peter Brown points out in his classic biography of Augustine, in the *Confessions* the Bishop of Hippo

challenges the assumption that conversion is a complete break with and abandonment of the past (Berkeley: Univ. of California, 1967, 177-78). Conversion, then, may be both an experience at a particular moment and a lifelong struggle to integrate that experience into one's identity and lifestyle.

Conversions might be profitably used by a wide variety of readers, including homilists, religious educators, and lay persons.

JOSEPH CHORPENNING, O.S.F.S.

Allentown College, Pa.

FROM IMAGE TO LIKENESS: A JUNGIAN PATH IN THE GOSPEL JOURNEY. By W. Harold Grant, Magdala Thompson, and Thomas E. Clarke. New York: Paulist, 1983. Pp. v + 249. \$8.95.

With a down-to-earth clarity that comes from a wide experience of using the Jungian typology in workshop/retreats, the authors offer a fresh outlook that integrates a spiritual-theological interpretation with a developmental perspective. The patristic model of human development from created "image" through sinful distortion to redeemed "likeness" governs their overall approach. To this they add three qualifying models: the Jungian types (introvert/extrovert, sensate, thinking, feeling, intuition) correlated with biblical/theological themes, an original developmental interpretation of how each type matures, and a threefold framework within which to situate human development: solitude, friendship, societal. They invite the reader to learn by doing, providing clarifying examples and helpful exercises for each of the four functions.

The book is primarily aimed at anyone interested in human spiritual growth. It is clear and readable for the beginner, but it also has original aspects that professional therapists or theologians will find stimulating. The developmental interpretation (by

H. Grant) of Jung's typology is original and persuasive, and an appendix of descriptions of type development is provided at the end. Theologians will appreciate the various perspectives on God that could affect the conversion foundational to theological method. God for the sensate is presented as "silent presence," as "wise orderer" for the thinker, "creator of beauty" for the intuitive, and "intimate, joyous companion" for the feeler. Other facets of Christian life are similarly nuanced—individual, liturgical, Christological, sin and grace, social—suggesting novel perspectives on almost every aspect of Christian theology. Thus, even though the book is primarily for the educated layman, it will also be important for the spiritual director, therapist, or theologian interested in integrating Jungian psychology with theology and Christian life.

ROBERT T. SEARS, S.J.

Loyola University, Chicago

THAT STRANGE DIVINE SEA: REFLECTIONS ON BEING A CATHOLIC. By Christopher Derrick. San Francisco: Ignatius, 1983. Pp. 189. \$8.95.

D. offers here "nothing more than one man's reflections upon his own experience of 'being a Catholic'" (7). Armed with literary references and altruistic stories, D. encourages his reader to reconsider the challenge of faith in a world beset by tensions, fears, and conflicts.

In chap. 1, "The Raw Human Condition," D. portrays the contemporary Christian as trying to tread water in a sea of perennial questions such as death, suffering, despair, sin, and pain. D. maintains that our contemporary world view avoids confronting these issues by responding to them through a "semantic interlude," i.e., "by evasion and pretense, people are enabled to forget their real condition" (52). Consequently, faith is frequently deemed irrelevant. D. expounds at great length

on the semantic concepts of "church," "Christian," and "Catholicism," which have been culturally and historically nuanced, and calls for greater clarity and precision in using these terms. In chap. 2, "Our Homeland's Embassy," D. employs the image of a citizen's journey in a foreign land and his yearning to reach his final destination, his homeland, to speak of an individual's life-journey through the Catholic Church, the ultimate end of which is a participation in the Resurrection. D.'s concept of "church," however, is exclusively hierarchical; he lacks an understanding and appreciation of the Church as the "people of God." In the final chapter, "The Third Answer," D. discusses some distinctive characteristics of Catholicism, e.g., Marian devotion and the saints; however, he also raises some points of interest to all concerned with man's "raw human condition," e.g., truth, the gift of faith, ecumenism, eschatology, suffering, and pain. D. sees these points as converging in the paschal mystery, which is the ultimate gift and expression of hope.

D.'s literary style is verbose and often complicated. Nevertheless, the reader will find the effort expended in working through D.'s reflection to be richly rewarded.

MARK S. MEALEY, O.S.F.S.
Reston, Va.

IS GOD A CREATIONIST? THE RELIGIOUS CASE AGAINST CREATION-SCIENCE. Edited by Roland Mushat Frye. New York: Scribners, 1983. Pp. viii + 205. \$15.95.

After the series of recent court decisions which will prevent offering creation science as an alternative to evolution in U.S. public-school science texts and courses, some members of the scientific community think that the issue is closed. Others are convinced that over fifty million fundamentalist Christians will continue to teach their children some form of creation science

in the home. This will continue to cause misunderstandings and alienation between school boards and teachers. F.'s collection of essays is designed to clarify and define the religious issues in the educational controversy by means of eleven essays, five by scientists (E. Osborn, R. Berry, D. Young, A. Gray, and O. Gingerich) interspersed with six from the theology side (L. Gilkey, B. Vawter, C. Hyers, John Paul II, N. Sarna, and B. Anderson). The selection satisfies the objective of clarifying the central understandings of divine creation within the mainstreams of biblical religion. F. includes his own introductory historical overview of the creationist movement and closing epilogue with a plea for the old two books of God-approach advanced by Francis Bacon.

Worthy of note from the science side is inclusion of an edited version of Asa Gray's lectures at Yale Divinity School, first published in 1880, and a 1982 essay by Owen Gingerich. They come a century apart but manifest in common both scientific understanding and a confident Christian perception. Their vision is worth the price of the book. It is unfortunate in this context that F. did not include often overlooked insights from another leading scientist for his time, e.g., in the "Letter to the Grand Duchess Christina" (1615) by Galileo Galilei. Nahum Sarna's "Understanding Creation in Genesis" and Bernhard Anderson's "The Earth Is the Lord's: An Essay on the Biblical Doctrine of Creation" are noteworthy for insightful interpretations of the Hebrew accounts and of the whole biblical doctrine of creation respectively. The collection would be valuable for an inquiring general reader.

JAMES F. SALMON, S.J.
Wheeling College

RELIGIOUS FOLK ART IN AMERICA: REFLECTIONS OF FAITH. By Kurt C. Dewhurst, Betty MacDowell, and Marsha MacDowell. New York: Dut-

ton, 1983. Pp. 163 + 200 black and white illustrations. \$29.95; \$16.95 paper.

Religious Folk Art in America defies the traditional boundaries of a "special exhibition catalogue." Although its genesis was an exhibition sponsored by the Museum of American Folk Art, it is the provocative essays which distinguish this text. Accessible to the nonspecialist as well as the specialist, the book offers a rare perspective on American religious art. Its three major sections include discussions of the origins of American religious folk art, the growth and expansion of nineteenth- and twentieth-century American religious life, and the religious iconography of American folk culture.

What will prove of interest in this text and its ensuing influence on research falls into three categories: first, the relationship between American folk art and the development (or reflection) of special-interest groups such as women, blacks, evangelicals, sectarian movements; second, the relationship, if any, between the concept of American religious folk art and an American civil religion; third, the relationship, if any, between the obvious and traditional religious iconography in American religious folk art and the nontraditional religious imagery in twentieth-century American fine art.

The unstated but undercurrent questions arising in one's reading of this text become: Was there a specific "American folk religion" which corresponds to this American religious folk art? Is this folk religion distinctive from or part of mainstream American religious traditions or American civil religion? Does modern American religious folk art somehow represent an attempt to produce a traditional religious icon in the contemporary American secularized cultural experience?

The authors are to be congratulated on this fine contribution to scholarship and for a creative exhibition (sadly, on

view only in New York City). With its profuse illustrations and excellent bibliographies, this text serves as both a fine resource and an impetus for further scholarly inquiry.

DIANE APOSTOLOS-CAPPADONA
George Washington Univ., D.C.

BOOKS RECEIVED

SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

- Alden, R. L. *Proverbs*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1984. Pp. 222.
- Bruce, F. F. *Philippians*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 154. \$7.95.
- Carr, G. L. *The Song of Solomon*. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 1984. Pp. 175. \$6.95.
- Cochrane, C. C. *The Gospel according to Genesis*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1984. Pp. 88. \$5.95.
- Cedar, P. A. *James, 1, 2 Peter, Jude*. Waco: Word, 1984. Pp. 262. \$19.95.
- Davids, P. H. *James*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 132. \$7.95.
- Graffy, A. *A Prophet Confronts His People*. Rome: Biblical Institute, 1984. Pp. 148. \$17.
- Grelot, P. *Evangelies et tradition apostolique*. Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 197. Fr. 75.
- Hagner, D. A. *Hebrews*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 267. \$9.95.
- Hillers, D. R. *Micah*. Phila.: Fortress, 1984. Pp. 116.
- Hurtado, L. W. *Mark*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 291. \$9.95.
- Kaiser, W. C. *Malachi*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1984. Pp. 171. \$6.95.
- Longenecker, R. N. *New Testament Social Ethics for Today*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1984. Pp. 108. \$5.95.
- Meyers, E. M., and J. E. Strange. *Les rabbins et les premiers chrétiens*. Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 232. Fr. 115.
- Michaels, J. R. *John*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 364. \$9.95.
- Mohrlang, R. *Matthew and Paul*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1984. Pp. 242. \$34.50.

Theological Studies

DECEMBER 1984

VOL. 45, NO. 4

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus
in the United States*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- The Frequency of Mass in the Latin Church ca. 400
Daniel Callam, C.S.B. 613
- On Relative Equality: Catholic Egalitarianism after Vatican II
Drew Christiansen, S.J. 651
- General Absolution: New Law, Old Traditions, Some Questions
Ladislav Orsy, S.J. 676

NOTES

- Class Struggle and the Magisterium: A New Note
Gregory Baum 690
- Infallibility in the Ecclesiology of Peter Richard Kenrick
Paul K. Hennessy, C.F.C. 702
- Medicaid and Abortion
Richard A. McCormick, S.J. 715
- Philosophy of Science and Religion: Three Approaches
Terrence W. Tilley 722

BOOK REVIEWS

- USAMI, K., S.J.: Somatic Comprehension of Unity 728
- FIorenza, E. S.: In Memory of Her 729
- The Westminster Dictionary of Christian Theology (ed. A. Richardson and J. Bowden) 731
- PENELHUM, T.: God and Skepticism 732
- GUNTON, C. E.: Yesterday and Today 734
- TAVARD, G.: Justification 736
- KNOCH, W.: Die Einsetzung der Sakramente durch Christus 737
- AUNE, D. E.: Prophecy in Early Christianity and the Ancient Mediterranean World 739
- EVANS, G. R.: The Mind of St. Bernard of Clairvaux 740
- Acta Cusana 1/1-2 (ed. E. Meuthen and H. Hallauer) 741

BOYLE, M. O.: Rhetoric and Reform	742
Coena Domini 1 (ed. I. Pahl)	744
WYMAN, W. E.: The Concept of <i>Glaubenslehre</i>	745
CHATTERJEE, M.: Gandhi's Religious Thought	747
DOERING, B.: Jacques Maritain and the French Catholic Intellectuals	748
SCHRIJVER, G. DE: Le merveilleux accord de l'homme et de Dieu	750
OGLETTREE, T. W.: The Use of the Bible in Christian Ethics	751
FINNIS, J.: Fundamentals of Ethics	753
GRISEZ, G.: The Way of the Lord 1	754
HAUERWAS, S.: The Peaceable Kingdom	756
Pastoral Letters of the United States Catholic Bishops 1792-1983 (ed. H. J. Nolan)	758
LIENHARD, J. T., S.J.: Ministry	760
SIDER, R. D.: The Gospel and Its Proclamation	760
BROWNING, D. S.: Religious Ethics and Pastoral Care	762
CAPPS, D.: Life Cycle Theory and Pastoral Care	762
DUFFY, R. S., O.F.M.: A Roman Catholic Theology of Pastoral Care	762
VAN KAAM, A.: Formative Spirituality 1	764
BERNSTEIN, R. J.: Beyond Objectivism and Relativism	766

SHORTER NOTICES 768

CYRIL OF ALEXANDRIA: Commentary on the Gospel of Saint Luke PLANTINGA, A., and N. WOLTERSTORFF (ed.): Faith and Rationality TORRANCE, T. F.: The Mediation of Christ STANCLIFFE, C.: St. Martin and His Hagiographer BURNS, J. P., and G. M. FAGIN: The Holy Spirit CARROLL, T. K.: Preaching the Word PHAN, P. C.: Social Thought CLARK, E. A.: Women in the Early Church SWIFT, L. J.: The Early Fathers on War and Military Service DITTRICH, B.: Das Traditionsverständnis in der Confessio Augustana und in der Confutatio DENT, C. M.: Protestant Reformers in Elizabethan Oxford HESSELINK, I. J.: On Being Reformed LIDEBACH, D.: The Theology of Grace and the American Mind THOMPSON, W. M., and J. KIRBY (ed.): Voegelin and the Theologian ELLOS, W. J.: Linguistic Ecumenism IMHOF, P., and H. BIALLOWONS (ed.): Karl Rahner im Gespräch 2 IWASHIMA, T.: Menschheitsgeschichte und Heilserfahrung ELLIS, J. T.: Catholic Bishops WYSCHOGROD, M.: The Body of Faith WAKEFIELD, G. S. (ed.): The Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality PANNENBERG, W.: Christian Spirituality BYNUM, C. W.: Jesus As Mother PENNINGTON, B.: Monastery MOLONEY, F.: A Life of Promise KERR, H. T., and J. M. MULDER (ed.): Conversions GRANT, W. H., et al.: From Image to Likeness DERRICK, C.: That Strange Divine Sea FRYE, R. M. (ed.): Is God a Creationist? DEWHURST, K. C., et al.: Religious Folk Art in America

BOOKS RECEIVED 784

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES (ISSN 0040-5639) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202. Second class postage paid at Baltimore, Md., and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER, please send address changes to THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION: U.S. \$12.00; Canada and foreign \$15.00. Single copies \$4.50.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 64002, Baltimore, Md. 21264.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS and business correspondence should be sent to Theological Studies, Business Office, 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy and a legible xerox), together with return postage, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., 20057. Authors should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057.

BACK ISSUES are available from the office in Washington, D.C.

Presenting This Issue

The December 1984 issue, which rounds out *TS*'s 45th volume, is a splendid blend of the historical, the systematic, and the pastoral, at times within the same essay. Three articles and four notes precede 27 book reviews and 29 shorter notices.

The Frequency of Mass in the Latin Church ca. 400 argues that the writings of the Latin Fathers indicate that Mass began to be said daily towards the year 400 among the clergy who were influenced by the monastic movement; among lay monks the custom of private Communion on aliturgical days continued; in Africa there may have been daily Mass from the time of Cyprian. DANIEL CALLAM, C.S.B., D.Phil. from Oxford, is associate professor at St. Thomas More College in the University of Saskatchewan and editor of the monthly *Canadian Catholic Review*. His special competence lies in Latin patristics. *TS* readers will remember his article on "Clerical Continence in the Fourth Century" (March 1980). He is currently engaged in researching the idea of ritual purity in papal writings to the year 604.

On Relative Equality: Catholic Egalitarianism after Vatican II contends that Catholic social teaching took a radically egalitarian turn over the past two decades due to two theological developments: the "signs of the times" method and the retrieval of the patristic idea of human solidarity. The normative principle that best expresses the official Catholic view of justice is relative equality, the principle that national wealth should be repeatedly redistributed to provide an inclusive quality of life for all. DREW CHRISTIANSEN, S.J., Ph.D. in religious studies from Yale (1982), is assistant professor of social ethics in the Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley, director of the Center for Ethics and Social Policy at Berkeley's Graduate Theological Union, and currently visiting assistant professor of Christian ethics at Notre Dame. His areas of special competence are social, geriatric, and theological ethics. He has written much on care of the aged and is preparing a book on the ethics of caregiving to the elderly, as well as a series of articles on the challenge of Catholic social teaching to the American political tradition. For several years he served as book editor for *TS*; he was special editor for *TS*'s issues on genetics (1972) and population (1974).

General Absolution: New Law, Old Traditions, Some Questions explains the new Code's norms on general absolution, summarizes the varied and rich history of the process of forgiveness, contrasts the new norms with the old traditions, and raises questions on how the norms could be further developed in fidelity to the traditions. LADISLAS ORSY, S.J., a graduate in civil law from the Oxford University School of Law, with a doctorate in canon law from Rome's Gregorian University, is particularly interested in the interpretation and evaluation of the new

canonical legislation from a theological viewpoint. He is presently readying a commentary on the canon law of marriage.

Class Struggle and the Magisterium: A New Note argues that Catholicism's official teaching, under the impact of the Latin American Church, has adopted a theory of preferential solidarity, which promotes the co-operation, in a joint struggle for justice, of the oppressed sectors of society, supported by the solidarity of all who love justice. While this theory has a certain similarity with the Marxist theory of class struggle, the article shows how the Catholic theory differs from the Marxist in several significant respects. GREGORY BAUM, D.Th. from Fribourg (Switz.), professor of theology and religious studies at St. Michael's College in the University of Toronto, specializes in issues of church and society, of theology and sociology. Recent publications include a commentary on Pope John Paul's *Laborem exercens* and (with D. Cameron) a volume on *Ethics and Economics*.

Infallibility in the Ecclesiology of Peter Richard Kenrick argues that the American leader of the opposition to a declaration of papal infallibility at Vatican I articulated theological notions on scriptural interpretation, the historicity of tradition, and episcopal collegiality that are more common now than they were in the 19th century; the article attempts to show the plausibility of Kenrick's presentations. PAUL K. HENNESSY, C.F.C., Ph.D. in theology from the Catholic University of America, professor of religious studies at Iona College, New Rochelle, N.Y., focuses his research on ecclesiology, especially in the 19th-century American Church.

Medicaid and Abortion challenges a recent criticism of those who oppose Medicaid funding of abortion on three grounds: the critic's understanding of co-operation, his understanding of the status of the Church's teaching as infallible, and his ecclesiology. RICHARD A. MCCORMICK, S.J., S.T.D. from the Gregorian and professor of Christian ethics at Georgetown University's Kennedy Institute of Ethics, authored TS's valuable "Notes on Moral Theology" from 1965 to 1984. With the 1985 Notes, he will begin a co-operative venture with Lisa Cahill, David Hollenbach, and John Langan.

Philosophy of Science and Religion: Three Approaches surveys three representative attempts to provide integrated accounts of the relations between religion and science, and evaluates the arguments offered in support of each view. TERRENCE W. TILLEY, Ph.D. from the Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, is assistant professor of religious studies at St. Michael's College, Winooski, Vt. Of special interest to him is philosophical theology, especially Anglo-American philosophy of religion. His *Talking of God* appeared in 1978; early 1985 should see publication of *A Christian Narrative Theology* (Glazier).

Walter J. Burghardt, S.J.
Editor

Palmer, E. F. *1 and 2 Thessalonians*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 88. \$6.95.

Refoulé, F. "... *Et ainsi tout Israël sera sauvé*" (Romains 11,25-32). Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 292. Fr. 133.

Sabourin, L., S.J. *The Gospel according to St. Matthew*. 2 vols. Bombay: St. Paul, 1982. Pp. 945. \$13.50.

Smith, R. L. *Micah-Malachi*. Waco: Word, 1984. Pp. 358. \$18.95.

Trible, P. *Texts of Terror*. Phila.: Fortress, 1984. Pp. 128.

DOCTRINAL THEOLOGY

Baptism and Eucharist. Ed. M. Thurian and G. Wainwright. Grand Rapids/Geneva: Eerdmans/World Council of Churches, 1984. Pp. 258. \$11.95.

Barth, K. *Esquisse d'une dogmatique*. Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 254. Fr. 59.

Catholicisme: Hier, aujourd'hui, demain 45: Oriocourt-Panthéisme. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1984. Col. 257-512.

Different Theologies, Common Responsibility (Concilium 171). Ed. C. Geffré et al. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1984. Pp. 100. \$7.45.

Foy, F. A., O.F.M., and R. M. Avato. *A Concise Guide to the Catholic Church*. Huntington, Ind.: Our Sunday Visitor, 1984. Pp. 158. \$6.95.

Jantzen, G. *God's World, God's Body*. Phila.: Westminster, 1984. Pp. 173. \$10.95.

Kraml, H. *Die Rede von Gott*. Innsbruck: Tyrolia, 1984. Pp. 181. DM 38.

Niemann, F.-J. *Jesus als Glaubensgrund in der Fundamentaltheologie der Neuzeit*. Innsbruck: Tyrolia, 1983. Pp. 488. DM 96.

The Roots of Our Common Faith. Ed. H.-G. Link. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1984. Pp. 134. \$6.95.

La théologie a l'épreuve de la vérité. Ed. M. Michel. Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 301. Fr. 149.

Varone, F. *Ce Dieu censé aimer la*

souffrance. Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 245. Fr. 98.

HISTORICAL

Bressolette, C. *Le pouvoir dans la société et dans l'église*. Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 211. Fr. 99.

Christians and the Many Faces of Marxism. Ed. W. Stumme. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1984. Pp. 159. \$8.95.

Desseaux, J. *Twenty Centuries of Ecumenism*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 103. \$4.95.

The Essential Steiner. Ed. R. S. McDermott. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 450. \$10.95.

The Facts on File Dictionary of Religions. Ed. J. R. Hinnells. N.Y.: Facts on File, 1984. Pp. 550. \$24.95.

Finks, P. D. *The Radical Vision of Saul Alinsky*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 305. \$9.95.

Gilbert, P. *Dire l'Ineffable: Lecture du "Monologion" de S. Anselme*. Paris: Lethielleux, 1984. Pp. 304. Fr. 170.

González, J. L. *The Story of Christianity 1: The Early Church to the Dawn of the Reformation*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 429. \$12.95.

Hausman, N. *Nietzsche. Thérèse de Lisieux*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1984. Pp. 213. Fr. 78.

Hellman, J. *Simone Weil*. Phila.: Fortress, 1984. Pp. 111. \$6.95.

Katalog gedruckter deutschsprachiger katholischer Predigtsammlungen 1. Ed. W. Welzig. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1984. Pp. 683.

Langford, T. A. *Wesleyan Theology*. Durham: Labyrinth, 1984. Pp. 309. \$24.95; \$14.95 paper.

Martorell, J. *Mysterium Christi (León Magno)*. Valencia: Facultad de Teología, 1983. Pp. 143.

Morris, D. *Beatitude Saints*. Huntington, Ind.: Our Sunday Visitor, 1984. Pp. 95. \$4.95.

Needleman, J. *The New Religions*.

- N.Y.: Crossroad, 1984 [1970]. Pp. 243.
- L'Oeuvre latine de Maître Eckhart 1: Commentaire de la Genèse.* Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 694. Fr. 326.
- Ormsby, E. L. *Theodicy in Islamic Thought.* Princeton: Princeton Univ., 1984. Pp. 309. \$30.
- Peli, P. *Soloveitchik on Repentance.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 320. \$11.95.
- Peter of Waltham. *Remediarium conversorum.* Ed. J. Gildea, O.S.A. Villanova: Villanova Univ., 1984. Pp. 492. \$25.
- The Schillebeeckx Case.* Ed. T. Schoof, O.P. N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 158. \$7.95.
- Stoffel, O. *Die katholischen Missionsgesellschaften.* Immensee: Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft, 1984. Pp. 283. SFr. 36.
- Sykes, S. *The Identity of Christianity.* Phila.: Fortress, 1984. Pp. 349. \$21.95.
- Verbraken, P.-P. *Les premiers siècles chrétiens.* Paris: Cerf, 1984. Pp. 220. Fr. 63.
- Zani, A. *La cristologia di Ippolito.* Brescia: Morcelliana, 1984. Pp. 727. L. 35,000.
- MORAL, LAW, LITURGY**
- Burtchaell, J. T. *Rachel Weeping: The Case against Abortion.* San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984 [1982]. Pp. 381. \$10.95.
- Curran, C. E. *Critical Concerns in Moral Theology.* Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1984. Pp. 264. \$16.95.
- Le droit.* Ed. J. Greisch. Paris: Beauchesne, 1984. Pp. 204. Fr. 120.
- Politik und Ethik der Abschreckung.* Ed. F. Böckle and G. Krell. Mainz: Grünewald, 1984. Pp. 256. DM 29.50.
- PASTORAL AND ASCETICAL**
- Anderson, H. *The Family and Pastoral Care.* Phila.: Fortress, 1984. Pp. 128. \$5.95.
- Berry, K., O.S.F. *Beyond Broken Dreams.* Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1984. Pp. 62. \$3.50.
- Conversion and the Catechumenate.* Ed. R. Duggan. N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 165. \$7.95.
- Goudzwaard, B. *Idols of Our Time.* Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 1984. Pp. 115. \$4.95.
- Hamlon, J. S. *A Call to Families.* Collegeville, Minn.: Human Life Center, 1984. Pp. 127. \$4.95.
- Hong, E. *Forgiveness Is a Work as Well as a Grace.* Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1984. Pp. 125. \$5.50.
- Living with Apocalypse: Spiritual Resources for Social Compassion.* San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 202. \$14.95.
- Luis de León. *The Names of Christ.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 385.
- McQuilkin, R. *The Great Omission.* Grand Rapids: Baker, 1984. Pp. 103. \$4.95.
- Mellon, C. *Chrétiens devant la guerre et la paix.* Paris: Centurion, 1984. Pp. 215. Fr. 88.
- Les mouvements religieux aujourd'hui.* Ed. J.-P. Rouleau and J. Zylberberg. Montreal: Bellarmin, 1984. Pp. 382. \$18.
- Neal, M. A., S.N.D. de Namur. *Catholic Sisters in Transition.* Wilmington: Glazier, 1984. Pp. 173. \$7.95.
- Oden, T. C. *Care of Souls in the Classic Tradition.* Phila.: Fortress, 1984. Pp. 128. \$5.95.
- Pastva, M. L. *The Catholic Youth Retreat Book.* Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1984. Pp. 87. \$7.95.
- Quaker Spirituality.* Ed. D. V. Steere. N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 334. \$12.95; \$9.95 paper.
- Rahner, K. *Is Christian Life Possible Today?* Denville, N.J.: Dimension, 1984. Pp. 140. \$6.95.
- Roberge, G., S.J. *A Little Way to God.* Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1984. Pp. 151. \$6.
- Roberts, B. *The Experience of No-Self.* Boulder: Shambhala, 1984 [1982]. Pp. 204. \$8.95.
- Savary, L. M., et al. *Dreams and Spir-*

itual Growth. N.Y.: Paulist, 1984. Pp. 241. \$8.95.

Sider, R. J. *Rich Christians in an Age of Hunger*. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 1984. Pp. 261. \$6.95.

Teilhard de Chardin, P. *On Love and Happiness*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 100. \$9.95.

PHILOSOPHY

Actualité d'Eric Weil. Ed. E. Naert. Paris: Beauchesne, 1984. Pp. 427. Fr. 195.

Buber, M. *I and Thou*. N.Y.: Scribners, 1984 [1958]. Pp. 137. \$3.95.

Cheng, H. *Empty Logic: Mādhyamika Buddhism from Chinese Sources*. N.Y.: Philosophical Library, 1984. Pp. 220. \$17.95.

Wippel, J. F. *Metaphysical Themes in Thomas Aquinas*. Wash., D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America, 1984. Pp. 293. \$31.95.

SPECIAL QUESTIONS

Barbour, J. D. *Tragedy as a Critique of Virtue*. Chico, Cal.: Scholars, 1984.

Pp. 202. \$20.95; \$13.95 paper.

Bausch, W. J. *Storytelling*. Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1984. Pp. 232. \$7.95.

Christian Feminism. Ed. J. L. Weidman. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. Pp. 196. \$12.95.

Local Ecumenism. Ed. A. Birmelé. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1984. Pp. 37. \$3.50.

Schall, J. V. *The Politics of Heaven and Hell*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1984. Pp. 341. \$23.50; \$12.75 paper.

Soelle, D. *The Strength of the Weak: Toward a Christian Feminist Identity*. Phila.: Westminster, 1984. Pp. 184. \$9.95.

Theology and Technology. Ed. C. Mittham and J. Grote. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1984. Pp. 523. \$32.50; \$19.25 paper.

Wealth and Poverty. Ed. R. G. Clouse. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 1984. Pp. 228. \$5.95.

Woschita, K. M. *De homine: Existenzweisen*. Graz: Styria, 1984. Pp. 390. DM 55.

STATEMENT OF OWNERSHIP, MANAGEMENT, AND CIRCULATION

(Required by 39 U.S.C. 3685)

1. Title of publication: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES; Publication no.: 00405639
2. Date of filing: October 1, 1984
3. Frequency of issue: Quarterly
4. Location of office of publication: 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
5. Location of headquarters: 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
6. Publisher: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES INC., 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
Editor: Walter J. Burghardt, S.J., Georgetown University, 37th and O St., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20057
Managing Editor: Joseph N. Tylenda, S.J., Georgetown University, 37th and O St., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20057
7. Owner: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES INC., a Maryland Corporation, non-profit, non-stock, 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
8. Known bondholders, mortgagees, and other security holders owning or holding 1 percent or more of total amount of bonds, mortgages or other securities: None
10. a) Total no. copies printed: Avg. 6875; single issue nearest to filing date 6500
b) Paid circulation to subscribers: Avg. 6124; single issue nearest to filing date 5998
c) Total paid circulation: Avg. 6124; single issue nearest to filing date 5998
d) Free distribution: Avg. 47; single issue nearest to filing date 69
e) Total distribution: Avg. 6171; single issue nearest to filing date 6067
f) Copies not distributed: Avg. 704; single issue nearest to filing date 433
g) Total: Avg. 6875; single issue nearest to filing date 6500
11. I certify that the statements by me above are correct and complete: (s) Joseph N. Tylenda, S.J., Managing Editor

INDEX TO VOLUME 45

AUTHORS

BAUM, G. Class Struggle and the Magisterium: A New Note	690
BOROWITZ, E. B. The Autonomous Self and the Commanding Community	34
BURGHARDT, W. J., S.J. Literature of Christian Antiquity: 1979-1983	275
CAHILL, P. J. Theological Education: Its Fragmentation and Unity	334
CALLAM, D., C.S.B. The Frequency of Mass in the Latin Church ca. 400	613
CHRISTIANSEN, D., S.J. On Relative Equality: Catholic Egalitarianism after Vatican II	651
COFFEY, D. The "Incarnation" of the Holy Spirit in Christ	466
DULLES, A., S.J. Faith, Church, and God: Insights from Michael Polanyi	537
DUNNE, T., S.J. Trinity and History	139
FITZMYER, J. A., S.J. The Ascension of Christ and Pentecost	409
HENNESEY, J., S.J. Grasping the Tradition: Reflections of a Church Historian	153
HENNESSY, P. K., C.F.C. Infallibility in the Ecclesiology of Peter Richard Kenrick	702
HILL, W. J., O.P. The Historicity of God.	320
JOHNSON, E. A., C.S.J. The Incomprehensibility of God and the Image of God Male and Female	441
KILMARTIN, E. J., S.J. The Active Role of Christ and the Holy Spirit in the Sanctification of the Eucharistic Elements	225
LEE, B. J., S.M. The Two Process Theologies	307
MCCORMICK, R. A., S.J. Medicaid and Abortion	715
MCCORMICK, R. A., S.J. Notes on Moral Theology: 1983	80
MUELLER, J. J., S.J. Appreciative Awareness: The Feeling-Dimension in Religious Experience	57
ORSY, L., S.J. General Absolution: New Law, Old Traditions, Some	

Questions	676
SANKS, T. H., S.J. Education for Ministry since Vatican II	481
TAUER, C. A. The Tradition of Probabilism and the Moral Status of the Early Embryo	3
THORNHILL, J., S.M. Is Religion the Enemy of Faith?	254
TILLEY, T. W. Philosophy of Science and Religion: Three Approaches	722
UKPONG, J. S. The Emergence of African Theologies	501
WINTERS, F. X., S.J. After Tension, Détente: A Continuing Chronicle of European Episcopal Views on Nuclear Deterrence	343

ARTICLES

The Active Role of Christ and the Holy Spirit in the Sanctification of the Eucharistic Elements. <i>E. J. Kilmartin, S.J.</i>	225
Appreciative Awareness: The Feeling-Dimension in Religious Experience. <i>J. J. Mueller, S.J.</i>	57
The Ascension of Christ and Pentecost. <i>J. A. Fitzmyer, S.J.</i>	409
The Autonomous Self and the Commanding Community. <i>E. B. Borowitz</i>	34
Education for Ministry since Vatican II. <i>T. H. Sanks, S.J.</i>	481
The Frequency of Mass in the Latin Church ca. 400. <i>D. Callam, C.S.B.</i>	613
General Absolution: New Law, Old Traditions, Some Questions. <i>L. Orsy, S.J.</i>	676
The "Incarnation" of the Holy Spirit in Christ. <i>D. Coffey</i>	466
The Incomprehensibility of God and the Image of God Male and Female. <i>E. A. Johnson, C.S.J.</i>	441
Is Religion the Enemy of Faith? <i>J. Thornhill, S.M.</i>	254
On Relative Equality: Catholic Egalitarianism after Vatican II. <i>D. Christiansen, S.J.</i>	651
The Tradition of Probabilism and the	

- Moral Status of the Early Embryo. *C. A. Tauer* 3

CURRENT THEOLOGY

- The Emergence of African Theologies. *J. S. Ukpog* 501
 Literature of Christian Antiquity: 1979–1983. *W. J. Burghardt, S.J.* 275
 Notes on Moral Theology: 1983. *R. A. McCormick, S.J.* 80

NOTES

- After Tension, Détente: A Continuing Chronicle of European Episcopal Views on Nuclear Deterrence. *F. X. Winters, S.J.* 343
 Class Struggle and the Magisterium: A New Note. *G. Baum* 690
 Faith, Church, and God: Insights from Michael Polanyi. *A. Dulles, S.J.* 537
 Grasping the Tradition: Reflections of a Church Historian. *J. Hennessy, S.J.* 153
 The Historicity of God. *W. J. Hill, O.P.* 320
 Infallibility in the Ecclesiology of Peter Richard Kenrick. *P. K. Hennessy, C.F.C.* 702
 Medicaid and Abortion. *R. A. McCormick, S.J.* 715
 Philosophy of Science and Religion. *T. W. Tilley* 722
 Theological Education: Its Fragmentation and Unity. *P. J. Cahill* 334
 Trinity and History. *T. Dunne, S.J.* 139
 The Two Process Theologies. *B. J. Lee, S.M.* 307

BOOK REVIEWS

- Abortion and the Status of the Fetus (ed. W. B. Bondeson et al.) (*J. R. Connery*) 190
 Acta Cusana 1/1–2 (ed. E. Meuthen and H. Hallauer) . . . (*J. E. Buechler*) 741
 AGUS, J. B. The Jewish Quest (*J. T. Pawlikowski*) 576
 AUNE, D. E. Prophecy in Early Christianity and the Ancient Mediterranean World (*D. Greenwood*) 739
 AYERS, R. H. Judaism and Christianity

- (*J. T. Pawlikowski*) 576
 BALTHASAR, H. URS VON. The Glory of the Lord: A Theological Aesthetics 1 (*T. F. O'Meara*) 365
 BAUR, F., O.F.M. Life in Abundance (*G. Aschenbrenner*) 581
 BELL, R. M., and D. WEINSTEIN. Saints and Society (*J. F. Chorprenning*) 370
 Beneficence and Health Care (ed. E. E. Shelp) (*J. J. Doyle*) 197
 BERNSTEIN, R. J. Beyond Objectivism and Relativism (*T. W. Tilley*) 766
 BOCHET, I. Saint Augustin et le désir de Dieu (*R. J. O'Connell*) 176
 The Book of the Goddess Past and Present (ed. C. Olson) (*J. O'Brien*) 588
 BORNKAMM, H. Luther in Mid-Career 1521–1530 (*C. E. Maxcey*) 568
 BOYLE, M. O. Rhetoric and Reform (*J. Wicks*) 742
 BROWN, R. E., and J. P. MEIER. Antioch and Rome (*D. G. Hunter*) 354
 BROWNING, D. S. Religious Ethics and Pastoral Care (*M. J. McGinniss*) 762
 CAHN, W. Romanesque Bible Illumination (*J. R. Keating*) 551
 CAPPS, D. Life Cycle Theory and Pastoral Care (*M. J. McGinniss*) 762
 CAREY, P. An Immigrant Bishop (*J. P. Chunnuci*) 375
 CHADWICK, O. Newman (*J. T. Ford*) 184
 A Challenge to Love (ed. R. Nugent) (*J. R. Connery*) 199
 CHATTERJEE, M. Gandhi's Religious Thought (*W. Teasdale*) 747
 CHILDRESS, J. F. Moral Responsibility in Conflicts (*F. X. Winters*) 386
 CLARKE, P. A Free Church in a Free Society (*J. P. Chunnuci*) 375
 Coena Domini 1 (ed. I. Pahl) (*E. J. Kilmartin*) 744
 COLLINS, J. J. Between Athens and Jerusalem (*D. J. Harrington*) 175
 CONGAR, Y. Martin Luther, sa foi, sa réforme (*J. F. McCue*) 179
 COOKE, B. Sacraments and Sacramentality (*P. M. Croke*) 168
 CULPEPPER, R. A. The Anatomy of the Fourth Gospel (*P. Perkins*) 165
 CURRAN, C. E. American Catholic Social Ethics (*J. J. Conlin*) 380

DOERING, B. Jacques Maritain and the French Catholic Intellectuals (<i>E. G. Carroll</i>)	748	Health/Medicine and the Faith Traditions (ed. M. E. Marty and K. L. Vaux) (<i>J. J. Doyle</i>)	197
DUBARLE, A.-M., O.P. Le péché originel (<i>J. Farrelly</i>)	166	HELLWIG, M. K. Jesus: The Compassion of God (<i>J. P. Galvin</i>)	564
DUFFY, R. S., O.F.M. A Roman Catholic Theology of Pastoral Care (<i>M. J. McGinniss</i>)	762	HUGHES, P. E. Christian Ethics in Secular Society (<i>P. J. Rossi</i>)	379
DULLES, A., S.J. Models of Revelation (<i>W. M. Thompson</i>)	357	Human Rights in Religious Traditions (ed. A. Swidler) (<i>M. E. Crahan</i>)	201
DUPRÉ, L. Marx's Social Critique of Culture (<i>M. J. Kerlin</i>)	587	Israel Exploration Journal Reader (ed. H. M. Orlinsky) (<i>F. L. Moriarty</i>)	164
ELEEN, L. The Illustration of the Pauline Epistles in French and English Bibles of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries (<i>J. R. Keating</i>)	356	Jewish and Christian Self-Definition 3 (ed. B. F. Meyer and E. P. Sanders) (<i>J. T. Lienhard</i>)	174
ELLUL, J. Living Faith (<i>F. G. McLeod</i>)	359	JÜNGEL, E. God as the Mystery of the World (<i>J. Farrelly</i>)	561
Episcopale munus (ed. P. Delhaye and L. Elders) (<i>J. T. Ford</i>)	169	KAUFMAN, P. I. Augustinian Piety and Catholic Reform (<i>W. C. Marceau</i>)	567
EVANS, G. R. The Mind of St. Bernard of Clairvaux (<i>G. W. Olsen</i>)	740	KNOCH, W. Die Einsetzung der Sakramente durch Christus (<i>E. J. Kilmartin</i>)	737
The Existence and Nature of God (ed. A. J. Freddoso) (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	560	LANGFORD, T. A. Practical Divinity (<i>L. I. Sweet</i>)	172
FINNIS, J. Fundamentals of Ethics (<i>J. A. La Barge</i>)	753	LAPIDE, P. The Resurrection of Jesus (<i>P. Perkins</i>)	555
FIorenza, E. S. In Memory of Her (<i>R. Kress</i>)	729	LÉCUYER, J. Le sacrement de l'ordination (<i>E. J. Kilmartin</i>)	363
FOGARTY, G. P., S.J. The Vatican and the American Hierarchy from 1870 to 1965 (<i>J. P. Gaffey</i>)	185	LIENHARD, J. T., S.J. Ministry (<i>J. T. Cummings</i>)	760
FUCHS, J., S.J. Personal Responsibility and Christian Morality (<i>P. S. Keane</i>)	189	LINDARS, B., S.S.F. Jesus Son of Man (<i>J. M. Reese</i>)	353
GEFFRÉ, C. Le christianisme au risque de l'interprétation (<i>J. Laporte</i>)	367	LOUTH, A. Discerning the Mystery (<i>W. M. Thompson</i>)	558
GRISEZ, G. The Way of the Lord Jesus 1 (<i>J. R. Connery</i>)	754	MACKIE, J. L. The Miracle of Theism (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	360
GRITSCH, E. W. Luther—God's Court Jester (<i>D. K. McKim</i>)	570	MACQUARRIE, J. In Search of Humanity (<i>T. German</i>)	364
GUNTON, C. E. Yesterday and Today (<i>J. Heft</i>)	734	MARTIN, B. John Henry Newman (<i>J. T. Ford</i>)	184
HALEWOOD, W. H. Six Subjects of Reformation Art (<i>T. O'Meara</i>)	571	MEAGHER, J. C. Five Gospels (<i>C. Bernas</i>)	352
HALLETT, G. L. Christian Moral Reasoning (<i>E. Vacek</i>)	187	MEIER, J. P., and R. E. BROWN. Antioch and Rome (<i>D. G. Hunter</i>)	354
HARRAN, M. J. Luther on Conversion (<i>J. Wicks</i>)	180	MILLER, M., C.S.B. What Are They Saying about Papal Primacy? (<i>D. J. Grimes</i>)	369
HAUERWAS, S. The Peaceable Kingdom (<i>P. J. Rossi</i>)	756	MOLLENKOTT, V. R. The Divine Feminine (<i>J. O'Brien</i>)	588
HAUGHT, J. F. The Cosmic Adventure (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	722	NEUSCH, M. The Sources of Modern Atheism (<i>M. J. Buckley</i>)	361
		Nicolai de Cusa opera omnia 16 (ed.	

R. Haubst and M. Bodewig (<i>J.E. Biechler</i>)	178	SMITH, S. G. The Argument to the Other (<i>R. W. Palmer</i>)	376
Nicolai de Cusa opera omnia 17 (ed. R. Haubst and H. Schnarr) (<i>J. E. Biechler</i>)	178	STUHLMUELLER, C., C.P., and D. SEN- OIR, C.P. The Biblical Foundations of Mission (<i>W. G. Thompson</i>)	552
O'COLLINS, G. Interpreting Jesus (<i>G. M. Fagin</i>)	563	TAVARD, G. Justification (<i>R. L. Maddox</i>)	736
OGLETREE, T. W. The Use of the Bible in Christian Ethics (<i>E. Vacek</i>)	751	TAVARD, G. H., A.A. A Theology for Ministry (<i>D. J. Grimes</i>)	566
O'MEARA, T. F., O.P. Theology of Min- istry (<i>M. J. McGinniss</i>)	383	THEKKEDATH, J. History of Christian- ity in India 2 (<i>J. Pereira</i>)	373
Pastoral Counseling (ed. B. K. Estadt et al.) (<i>R. L. Kinast</i>)	193	TILLARD, J. M. R., O.P. The Bishop of Rome (<i>D. J. Grimes</i>)	369
Pastoral Letters of the United States Catholic Bishops 1791-1983 (ed. H. J. Nolan) (<i>J. B. Benestad</i>)	758	TORRANCE, T. F. Transformation and Convergence in the Frame of Knowl- edge (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	722
Pastoral Hermeneutics and Ministry (ed. D. F. Beisswenger and D. Mc- Carty) (<i>M. J. McGinniss</i>)	195	Tracing the Spirit (ed. J. E. Hug, S.J.) (<i>M. J. McGinniss</i>)	585
PENELHUM, T. God and Skepticism (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	732	USAMI, K., S.J. Somatic Comprehen- sion of Unity (<i>R. F. O'Toole</i>)	728
PEUKERT, H. Science, Religion and the Quest for Purpose (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	722	VAN KAAM, A. Formative Spirituality 1 (<i>G. Aschenbrenner</i>)	764
Pope John Paul II and the Family (ed. M. J. Wrenn) (<i>J. B. Benestad</i>)	198	WACHOLDER, B. Z. The Dawn of Qum- ran (<i>J. A. Fitzmyer</i>)	556
PRICE, L. The Plan of St Gall in Brief (<i>J. F. T. Kelly</i>)	371	WEINSTEIN, D., and R. M. BELL. Saints and Society (<i>J. F. Chorpennig</i>)	370
RAHNER, K., S.J. Schriften zur Theo- logie 15 (<i>H. D. Egan</i>)	378	The Westminster Dictionary of Chris- tian Theology (ed. A. Richardson and J. Bowden) (<i>M. K. Hellwig</i>)	731
Revisions (ed. S. Hauerwas and A. MacIntyre) (<i>G. Grisez</i>)	579	WICKS, J., S.J. Luther and His Spiritual Legacy (<i>D. K. McKim</i>)	570
ROSSI, P. J., S.J. Together toward Hope (<i>W. J. Woods</i>)	578	WINLING, R. La théologie contempo- raine (1945-1980) (<i>G. H. Tavard</i>)	171
ROWELL, G. The Vision Glorious (<i>J. T. Ford</i>)	574	WITEK, J. W., S.J. Controversial Ideas in China and in Europe (<i>A. Chan</i>)	182
SCHRIJVER, G. DE. Le merveilleux ac- cord de l'homme et de Dieu (<i>T. F. O'Meara</i>)	750	WYMAN, W. E. The Concept of <i>Glau- benslehre</i> (<i>J. E. Thuel</i>)	745
SENIOR, D., C.P., and C. STUHL- MUELLER, C.P. The Biblical Founda- tions of Mission (<i>W. G. Thomp- son</i>)	552	ZIMMERLI, W. Ezekiel 2 (Chaps. 25-48) (<i>F. L. Moriarty</i>)	554
SHELTON, C. M., S.J. Adolescent Spir- ituality (<i>W. J. Sneek</i>)	583		
SIDER, R. D. The Gospel and Its Proc- lamation (<i>J. T. Cummings</i>)	760		
SIEVERNICH, M., S.J. Schuld und Sunde in der Theologie der Gegenwart (<i>F. S. Florenza</i>)	382		
SMITH, R. H. Easter Gospels (<i>P. Perkins</i>)	555		

SHORTER NOTICES

ARCHER, G. L., and G. CHIRICHIGNO. Old Testament Quotations in the New Testament (<i>J. A. Fitzmyer</i>)	591
BAVAREL, M. New Communities, New Ministries (<i>J. P. Hogan</i>)	602
BEGGIANI, S. J. Early Syriac Theology with Special Reference to the Maro- nite Tradition (<i>F. G. McLeod</i>)	206
Biblical Studies (ed. L. Boadt, C.S.P., H. Croner, and L. Klenicki)	402

BOROWITZ, E. B. Choices in Modern Jewish Thought (<i>J. T. Paulikowski</i>)	600	A Documentary History of Religion in America since 1865 (ed. E. S. Gausstad) (<i>J. Hennesey</i>)	394
BRADY, J. M., S.J. A Philosopher's Search for the Infinite (<i>E. Vacek</i>)	604	Ecumenical Perspectives on Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry (ed. M. Thurian) (<i>J. Gros</i>)	389
BROWN, F. B. Transfiguration (<i>P. C. Rule</i>)	391	Eerdmans' Handbook to Christianity in America (ed. M. A. Noll et al.) (<i>J. Hennesey</i>)	393
BROWN, R. E., S.S. Recent Discoveries and the Biblical World (<i>F. L. Moriarty</i>)	590	ELLIS, J. T. Catholic Bishops (<i>D. J. Grimes</i>)	777
BURNS, J. P., S.J., and G. M. FAGIN, S.J. The Holy Spirit (<i>B. Ramsey</i>)	770	ELLOS, W. J., S.J. Linguistic Ecumenism (<i>R. W. Palmer</i>)	775
BYNUM, C. W. Jesus As Mother (<i>J. F. Chorpennig</i>)	779	The Evangelical and Oxford Movements (ed. E. Jay) (<i>J. R. Griffin</i>)	394
CARROLL, T. K. Preaching the Word (<i>B. Ramsey</i>)	770	EVANS, G. R. Augustine on Evil (<i>W. C. Marceau</i>)	207
The Causes of World Hunger (ed. W. Byron) (<i>J. V. Blewett</i>)	217	FAGIN, G. M., S.J., and J. P. BURNS, S.J. The Holy Spirit (<i>B. Ramsey</i>)	770
CHIRICHIGNO, G., and G. L. ARCHER. Old Testament Quotations in the New Testament (<i>J. A. Fitzmyer</i>)	591	Faith and Rationality (ed. A. Plantinga and N. Wolterstorff) (<i>F. G. McLeod</i>)	768
Christian Mission—Jewish Mission (ed. M. A. Cohen and H. Croner)	402	FOX, M., O.P. Original Blessing (<i>D. Luderbach</i>)	400
CLARK, E. A. Women in the Early Church (<i>A. Cunningham</i>)	771	FRANTZEN, A. J. The Literature of Penance in Anglo-Saxon England (<i>C. D. Wright</i>)	208
COLLINS, P. W. More Than Meets the Eye (<i>G. S. Worgul</i>)	399	GAY, V. P. Reading Freud (<i>J. B. Cortés</i>)	598
Convergence (ed. P. Maroky) (<i>T. M. King</i>)	397	GRANT, W. H., et al. From Image to Likeness (<i>R. T. Sears</i>)	782
Conversions (ed. H. T. Kerr and J. M. Mulder) (<i>J. F. Chorpennig</i>)	781	GRELOT, P. Eglises et ministères (<i>R. J. Schreuter</i>)	204
COOPER, E., and A. RUF, O.P. Grundkurs Sexualmoral 1 (<i>E. Vacek</i>)	212	GRIFFITHS, B. The Cosmic Revelation (<i>W. Teasdale</i>)	400
CYRIL OF ALEXANDRIA. Commentary on the Gospel of Saint Luke (<i>J. A. Fitzmyer</i>)	768	GROESCHEL, B. J. Spiritual Passages (<i>R. Bondi</i>)	214
D'AMICO, J. F. Renaissance Humanism in Papal Rome (<i>J. W. O'Malley</i>)	596	GRUENLER, R. G. The Inexhaustible God (<i>P. E. Devenish</i>)	593
DAVIS, S. T. Logic and the Nature of God (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	593	GUSMER, C. W. And You Visited Me (<i>T. A. Krosnicki</i>)	595
DENT, C. M. Protestant Reformers in Elizabethan Oxford (<i>J. P. Donnelly</i>)	772	HAMMOND, G. The Making of the English Bible (<i>L. Boadt</i>)	387
DERR, T. S. Barriers to Ecumenism (<i>J. Gros</i>)	216	HANSON, R. P. C. The Life and Writings of the Historical Saint Patrick (<i>R. T. Meyer</i>)	208
DERRICK, C. That Strange Divine Sea (<i>M. S. Mealey</i>)	782	HARAKAS, S. S. Toward Transfigured Life (<i>R. Slesinski</i>)	212
DEWHURST, K. C., et al. Religious Folk Art in America (<i>D. Apostolos-Cappadona</i>)	783	HESELINK, I. J. On Being Reformed (<i>C. Pardee</i>)	773
DITTRICH, B. Das Traditionsverständnis in der Confessio Augustana und in der Confutatio (<i>J. Wicks</i>)	772	HINCHLIFF, P. Holiness and Politics (<i>S. J. Grenz</i>)	602

HOLIFIELD, E. B. A History of Pastoral Care in America (<i>D. F. Kelly</i>)	601	O'NEILL, C., O.P. Sacramental Realism (<i>B. Cooke</i>)	206
HOLLENBACH, D., S.J. Nuclear Ethics (<i>W. V. O'Brien</i>)	214	Origen: Homilies on Genesis and Exodus (tr. R. E. Heine) (<i>G. H. Ettlinger</i>)	392
HUGHES, J. J. Proclaiming the Good News (<i>W. J. Burghardt</i>)	216	PANNENBERG, W. Christian Spirituality (<i>J. F. Russell</i>)	779
Inventaire des Archives Vincent Lebbe (ed. C. Soetens) (<i>J. W. Witek</i>)	209	PAWLIKOWSKI, J. T., O.S.M. Christ in the Light of the Christian-Jewish Dialogue	402
Is God a Creationist? (ed. R. M. Frye) (<i>J. F. Salmon</i>)	783	PENNINGTON, B., O.C.S.O. Monastery (<i>J. Farrelly</i>)	780
Issues in the Jewish-Christian Dialogue (ed. H. Croner and L. Klenicki)	402	PHAN, P. C. Social Thought (<i>B. Ramsey</i>)	770
IWASHIMA, T. Menschheitsgeschichte und Heilserfahrung (<i>R. J. Schreiter</i>)	776	Practical Theology (ed. D. S. Browning) (<i>R. L. Kinast</i>)	213
Karl Rahner im Gespräch 2 (ed P. Imhof and H. Biallowons) (<i>H. D. Egan</i>)	776	The Princeton Theology 1812-1921 (ed. M. A. Noll) (<i>D. K. McKim</i>)	209
KOTTUKAPALLY, J. The Hope We Share (<i>M. J. Kerlin</i>)	397	PRUTER, K., and J. G. MELTON. The Old Catholic Sourcebook (<i>J. N. Tylanda</i>)	211
KRAFT, R. W. A Reason To Hope (<i>T. M King</i>)	395	RATNASEKARA, L. Christianity and the World Religions (<i>F. R. Podgorski</i>)	595
LIDERBACH, D. The Theology of Grace and the American Mind (<i>J. J Mueller</i>)	774	Recueil des Archives Vincent Lebbe. Pour l'église chinoise 1 (ed. C. Soetens) (<i>J W Witek</i>)	209
LUBAC, H. DE. The Motherhood of the Church (<i>J. Heft</i>)	204	RUF, A., O.P., and E. COOPER. Grundkurs Sexualmoral 1 (<i>E. Vacek</i>)	212
MALL, D. In Good Conscience (<i>J. R. Connery</i>)	398	SAMMON, S. D., F.M.S. Growing Pains in Ministry (<i>R. L. Kinast</i>)	601
MARTOS, J. The Catholic Sacraments (<i>P. Croke</i>)	390	SCHILLEBEECKX, E. God among Us (<i>R. J Schreiter</i>)	205
The Martyred Christian (ed. J. W. Brown) (<i>G. B. Kelly</i>)	599	SCHILLEBEECKX, E. God Is New Each Moment (<i>R. J Schreiter</i>)	205
MELTON, J. G., and K. PRUTER. The Old Catholic Sourcebook (<i>J. -N. Tylanda</i>)	211	SCHMIDT, W. H. The Faith of the Old Testament (<i>F. L. Moriarty</i>)	203
MOLONEY, F., S.D.B. A Life of Promise (<i>E. G Carroll</i>)	781	SHANNON, T. What Are They Saying about Peace and War? (<i>J B Benestad</i>)	401
MOLTMANN, J. The Power of the Powerless (<i>M R. Tripole</i>)	603	SLOYAN, G. S.. Jesus in Focus (<i>A. J. Tambasco</i>)	594
MOONEY, C. F., S.J. Inequality and the American Conscience (<i>E. H. Convey</i>)	217	STANCLIFFE, C. St. Martin and His Hagiographer (<i>J. F T Kelly</i>)	770
Moral Development Foundations (ed. D. M. Joy) (<i>J W. Crossin</i>)	211	STANMEYER, W. A. Clear and Present Danger (<i>P. M. J. Stravinskias</i>)	401
MORAN, G. Religious Education Development (<i>J. W. Crossin</i>)	215	STEELE, T. J., S.J. Works and Days (<i>E. J. Burrus</i>)	210
MURPHY-O'CONNOR, J. St. Paul's Corinth (<i>J. A. Fitzmyer</i>)	388	SWIFT, L. J. The Early Fathers on War and Military Service (<i>A. Cunningham</i>)	771
NELSON, J. B. Between Two Gardens (<i>W. C McFadden</i>)	398	TAMBASCO, A. J. In the Days of Jesus	
O'CONNOR, L. F. Religion in the American Novel (<i>P. C. Rule</i>)	604		

(<i>L. J. Topel</i>)	594	M. Thompson and J. Kirby) (<i>D. Germino</i>)	774
Teilhard and the Unity of Knowledge (ed. T. M. King, S.J., and J. F. Salmon, S.J.) (<i>F. R. Haig</i>)	396	WAGNER, H. Einführung in die Fundamentaltheologie (<i>F. S. Fiorenza</i>)	203
TETLOW, E. M. and L. M. Partners in Service (<i>T. Mackin</i>)	390	WALLACE, D. D. Puritans and Predestination (<i>D. K. McKim</i>)	597
THOMAS, D. M. Christian Marriage (<i>P. Croke</i>)	390	WELCH, J., O.C.A.R.M. Spiritual Pilgrims (<i>H. R. Duhn</i>)	598
THOMPSON, W. G. The Gospel for Your Whole Life (<i>P. Perkins</i>)	592	WESTLEY, F. The Complex Forms of the Religious Life (<i>J. A. Coleman</i>)	600
TORRANCE, T. F. The Mediation of Christ (<i>R. P. Tucker</i>)	769	The Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality (ed. G. S. Wakefield) (<i>J. F. Chorpennung</i>)	778
TYSON, J. B. The New Testament and Early Christianity (<i>G. A. Russo</i>)	592	WICKS, J., S.J. Cajetan und die Anfänge der Reformation (<i>P. Misner</i>)	597
VARACALLI, J. A. Toward the Establishment of Liberal Catholicism in America (<i>T. M. Steeman</i>)	395	WOHLMUTH, J. Verstandigung in der Kirche (<i>T. E. Morrissey</i>)	392
VAWTER, B., C.M. Job and Jonah (<i>C. Bernas</i>)	388	WYSCHOGRD, M. The Body of Faith (<i>J. T. Pawlikowski</i>)	778
Voegelin and the Theologian (ed. W.			