

## BOOK REVIEWS

**THE PEOPLE CALLED: THE GROWTH OF COMMUNITY IN THE BIBLE.**  
By Paul D. Hanson. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1986. Pp. xii + 564.  
\$24.95.

This book elaborates upon a beautiful insight of T. S. Eliot, expressed in the couplet:

"There is no life that is not in community,  
And no community not lived in praise of God."

In pursuing this rich theme throughout the story of God's grace-filled dealing with ancient Israel and with the new community of faith which proclaimed "Jesus is Lord," Hanson of Harvard has given us an attractive interpretive principle for bonding OT and NT. And the quest for a unifying structural principle has been realized without falling into the trap of stressing the uniqueness of Christianity to the point of overlooking its roots in the ancient heritage or, conversely, of emphasizing continuity to the point of obscuring the radical newness of Christianity. A delicate balance must be preserved, I believe, between the traditional and the creative; H. has done this and, perhaps more importantly, has established a trajectory from the biblical ideal of community to our contemporary concerns. To put this in his concluding words: "If we open our eyes to the community of faith that took shape in biblical times, the way in which we look on the communities of faith of which we are a part will be radically transformed" (546). From Abraham to the present as well as to the indeterminate future we are a people called.

The great theological syntheses of Eichrodt and von Rad come to mind, but H. is not offering us a theology of the OT on such a grand scale. He aims at something less, and more. On a narrower gauge he selects one theme, that of community, as a unifying thread guiding his treatment of the biblical writings. This community is defined by a triad: righteousness, compassion, and worship. These three elements, of course, are not static; they undergo lively development as Israel responded to a God who was perceived as active in her history. Yahweh was a righteous God who had created order out of chaos and then bound a people to Himself in a covenant marked by a burning concern for the rights of its members. Decalogue and Holiness Code are concrete examples.

But legislation is not enough. A standard of justice must be tempered by the warmth of compassion which reaches out to the weak, the poor, and the marginalized, offering them a share in God's peace. Finally, H. shows how the righteousness and compassion of God become vibrantly

alive in Israel's worship. In the cultic celebration of Yahweh's gracious acts the community transformed the potentially disruptive tension between the first two qualities into a generative force capable of molding a people into an agent of God's purpose in this world (74).

But the vision of a people called does not stop with the OT. In chaps. 13 and 14 the classical triadic pattern is reaffirmed in the response of Jesus to what he interpreted as the new initiative of God in establishing the kingdom. A final chapter reflects upon the abiding value of recapturing a faith-inspired vision of community which worships a righteous and compassionate God. In passing let me note that anyone studying the recent pastoral letter of the U.S. bishops on the economy will find here illuminating biblical material under the headings of "righteousness," "compassion," and "peace." I regret that my praise of this remarkably rich and well-indexed synthesis cannot be unqualified. In my review copy I have marked in red over 160 typographical errors, a distressing departure from the high standards we have come to expect from Harper & Row.

*Gonzaga University, Spokane*

FREDERICK L. MORIARTY, S.J.

**THE NEW TESTAMENT IN ITS LITERARY ENVIRONMENT.** By David E. Aune. *Library of Early Christianity* 8. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 260. \$22.95.

Aune, professor of religious studies at Saint Xavier College, Chicago, contributes to a series edited by Wayne Meeks that attempts to locate early Christianity in its larger cultural and religious environment. A's purpose is to compare the literary genres and forms found in the NT with those of the literary cultures of the ancient Mediterranean world. By literary genre A. means a group of texts with a configuration of literary features involving form, content, and function. Such social conventions provide contextual meaning for the smaller units of language and text they enclose. The original significance that a literary text had for both author and reader is tied to the genre of the text, so that the meaning of the part is dependent on the meaning of the whole. If this is so, then this book should contribute significantly to the understanding of the NT writings.

Four major literary types are found in the NT: gospels, acts, letters, and apocalypse. "They obviously correspond to ancient biographical, historical, epistolary, and apocalyptic literature" (13). Two chapters argue that the canonical Gospels constitute a distinctive type of ancient biography combining Hellenistic form and function with Jewish content. In this A. joins a growing group of scholars on both sides of the Atlantic. When he defines biography as "a discrete prose narrative devoted exclu-

## BOOK REVIEWS

**THE PEOPLE CALLED: THE GROWTH OF COMMUNITY IN THE BIBLE.**  
By Paul D. Hanson. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1986. Pp. xii + 564.  
\$24.95.

This book elaborates upon a beautiful insight of T. S. Eliot, expressed in the couplet:

"There is no life that is not in community,  
And no community not lived in praise of God."

In pursuing this rich theme throughout the story of God's grace-filled dealing with ancient Israel and with the new community of faith which proclaimed "Jesus is Lord," Hanson of Harvard has given us an attractive interpretive principle for bonding OT and NT. And the quest for a unifying structural principle has been realized without falling into the trap of stressing the uniqueness of Christianity to the point of overlooking its roots in the ancient heritage or, conversely, of emphasizing continuity to the point of obscuring the radical newness of Christianity. A delicate balance must be preserved, I believe, between the traditional and the creative; H. has done this and, perhaps more importantly, has established a trajectory from the biblical ideal of community to our contemporary concerns. To put this in his concluding words: "If we open our eyes to the community of faith that took shape in biblical times, the way in which we look on the communities of faith of which we are a part will be radically transformed" (546). From Abraham to the present as well as to the indeterminate future we are a people called.

The great theological syntheses of Eichrodt and von Rad come to mind, but H. is not offering us a theology of the OT on such a grand scale. He aims at something less, and more. On a narrower gauge he selects one theme, that of community, as a unifying thread guiding his treatment of the biblical writings. This community is defined by a triad: righteousness, compassion, and worship. These three elements, of course, are not static; they undergo lively development as Israel responded to a God who was perceived as active in her history. Yahweh was a righteous God who had created order out of chaos and then bound a people to Himself in a covenant marked by a burning concern for the rights of its members. Decalogue and Holiness Code are concrete examples.

But legislation is not enough. A standard of justice must be tempered by the warmth of compassion which reaches out to the weak, the poor, and the marginalized, offering them a share in God's peace. Finally, H. shows how the righteousness and compassion of God become vibrantly

alive in Israel's worship. In the cultic celebration of Yahweh's gracious acts the community transformed the potentially disruptive tension between the first two qualities into a generative force capable of molding a people into an agent of God's purpose in this world (74).

But the vision of a people called does not stop with the OT. In chaps. 13 and 14 the classical triadic pattern is reaffirmed in the response of Jesus to what he interpreted as the new initiative of God in establishing the kingdom. A final chapter reflects upon the abiding value of recapturing a faith-inspired vision of community which worships a righteous and compassionate God. In passing let me note that anyone studying the recent pastoral letter of the U.S. bishops on the economy will find here illuminating biblical material under the headings of "righteousness," "compassion," and "peace." I regret that my praise of this remarkably rich and well-indexed synthesis cannot be unqualified. In my review copy I have marked in red over 160 typographical errors, a distressing departure from the high standards we have come to expect from Harper & Row.

*Gonzaga University, Spokane*

FREDERICK L. MORIARTY, S.J.

**THE NEW TESTAMENT IN ITS LITERARY ENVIRONMENT.** By David E. Aune. *Library of Early Christianity* 8. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 260. \$22.95.

Aune, professor of religious studies at Saint Xavier College, Chicago, contributes to a series edited by Wayne Meeks that attempts to locate early Christianity in its larger cultural and religious environment. A's purpose is to compare the literary genres and forms found in the NT with those of the literary cultures of the ancient Mediterranean world. By literary genre A. means a group of texts with a configuration of literary features involving form, content, and function. Such social conventions provide contextual meaning for the smaller units of language and text they enclose. The original significance that a literary text had for both author and reader is tied to the genre of the text, so that the meaning of the part is dependent on the meaning of the whole. If this is so, then this book should contribute significantly to the understanding of the NT writings.

Four major literary types are found in the NT: gospels, acts, letters, and apocalypse. "They obviously correspond to ancient biographical, historical, epistolary, and apocalyptic literature" (13). Two chapters argue that the canonical Gospels constitute a distinctive type of ancient biography combining Hellenistic form and function with Jewish content. In this A. joins a growing group of scholars on both sides of the Atlantic. When he defines biography as "a discrete prose narrative devoted exclu-



sively to the portrayal of the whole life of a particular individual perceived as historical" (29), he is wrong on at least two counts. (1) Not all ancient biographies are prose narratives. Some are dialogues (e.g., Satyrus, *Life of Euripides*; Palladius' *Dialogue on the Life of Chrysostom*). (2) Not all biographies treat the whole life of the hero. Some begin with the hero's mature life (e.g., Nepos, "Miltiades," "Aristides"); others may begin with the subject's birth and stop before his death (e.g., Nicolaus of Damascus, *Life of Augustus*, which ends with Augustus' entrance into the Civil War).

Two additional chapters contend that Luke-Acts is a popular general history, a narration of the important historical experiences of a single national group from their origin to the recent past, like Polybius, Diodorus Siculus, or Josephus, *Antiquities*. A. concedes that Luke taken by itself belongs to biography and also acknowledges that no historical work is exactly like Luke-Acts. Let the reader compare Luke-Acts with Diogenes Laertius' *Life of Epicurus* and with Polybius and see if general history fits better than the life of a founder followed by a narrative of his successors.

Two chapters are likewise given to a comparison of early Christian letters with those of the Hellenistic world and the Ancient Near East. The Christian letters are rightly seen to be closer to the former than the latter. The final chapter locates the Revelation to John in the ancient apocalyptic genre, recognizing that compositions similar to Jewish apocalypses were found also in Persia and Egypt. Although written without footnotes, each chapter has at its conclusion a brief bibliography to facilitate further study. Brief indices of subjects and biblical passages come at the end.

This volume collects a vast amount of information between two covers. Even when one disagrees with its interpretative judgments, one can be thankful for the labor lying behind its pages. When all is said and done, of what value is this volume for our understanding of the NT? Like all studies of background, these generic studies' contribution is indirect. Do not expect a revolution in interpretation to result from genre criticism.

Wake Forest University, N.C.

CHARLES H. TALBERT

**MORAL EXHORTATION: A GRECO-ROMAN SOURCEBOOK.** By Abraham J. Malherbe. *Library of Early Christianity* 4. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1986. Pp. 178. \$18.95.

**LETTER WRITING IN GRECO-ROMAN ANTIQUITY.** By Stanley K. Stowers. *Library of Early Christianity* 5. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1986. Pp. 188. \$18.95.

Rather than attempting to explain the social phenomena of early Christianity according to sociological theory or the canons of social

organization, the *Library of Early Christianity* aims at describing the world of early Christians as they perceived and experienced it. These two volumes share that common perspective of social history with their companion volumes in the series. They are both source books on different but not completely unrelated topics of Greco-Roman antiquity relating to the NT.

Malherbe's volume gives a superb introduction to Greco-Roman moral exhortation in seven chapters. It has many fine features, the product of M.'s scholarly expertise and years of practical experience in teaching courses at Yale on the Hellenistic moralists. The Greco-Roman sources are carefully selected, giving the reader access to texts formerly not easily available. Several authors like Hierocles, Maximus of Tyre, and Pseudo-Demetrius are translated by M. himself. Brief introductions accompany the texts, so that they are clearly understood by specialist and nonspecialist alike.

The book is thoughtfully organized to guide the reader through the moral world of early Christians. It examines the social setting of moral instruction, the person of the moral teacher, the methods and means of moral instruction, the styles of exhortation, literary and rhetorical conventions, and the conventional subjects treated by moral teachers.

An exceptional feature of this book is the way it sheds light on moral exhortation in the NT. M. is not content simply to list verbal parallels between Greco-Roman and NT authors. In fact, there is very little analysis of NT texts. Rather, M. describes the contours and contexts of Greco-Roman moral exhortation as a comparative base for understanding how moral traditions and styles of exhortation may have been adopted, and adapted, by NT authors. He invites the reader to re-examine pertinent NT texts in a new light.

Stowers' volume provides a short course in the fascinating art of communication by letter in the ancient Greco-Roman world. Its aim is to go beyond previous studies, which emphasized the form and content of ancient letters, by paying close attention to the variety of types available to Greco-Roman letter writers and their functions for the letters' recipients.

The book is divided into two parts, one giving brief but adequate chapters on aspects of ancient epistolary theory, the other containing a wealth of letter examples grouped under the 13 most important types. Each chapter of this part provides a brief introduction to the features of the letter type under consideration. This is followed by a short discussion relating that type, or some of its elements, to NT letters where relevant. The bulk of the chapter is made up of a generous sampling of Greco-Roman letters fitting the type, all in English translation. Some additional examples are listed at the end of each chapter.

In addition to gathering a mine of information on ancient letter writing, S. renders an invaluable service to students of NT letters. By stressing the classification and function of ancient letters, S. helps the reader to understand early Christian letters as Greco-Roman letters. As a result, some aspects of NT letters seem less strange and peculiar when seen in relation to other letters contemporaneous with them. But S. does not want to suggest that early Christian letters are reducible to Greco-Roman letters. His approach also highlights what is distinctive about NT letters. He enriches our appreciation of those NT authors, for whom the letter was an important missionary tool.

Here are two marvelous volumes which expand our knowledge of the world of early Christianity. As source books, they put their readers in touch with information essential for a full appreciation of the NT. As studies of how those sources relate to early Christianity, they bring the NT to life by locating it firmly in the Greco-Roman world.

Georgetown University

ALAN C. MITCHELL, S.J.

**THE FIRST COMING: HOW THE KINGDOM OF GOD BECAME CHRISTIANITY.** By Thomas Sheehan. New York: Random House, 1986. Pp. xii + 287. \$18.95.

Sheehan, professor of philosophy at Loyola University in Chicago, is the editor of *Heidegger: The Man and the Thinker*. Some years ago his wide-ranging review of Hans Küng's *Eternal Life?* in the *New York Review of Books* (June 14, 1984) evoked considerable criticism of the conclusions S. drew from his reading of contemporary exegetes and systematic theologians. In *The First Coming* he elaborates in more detail his understanding of the historical Jesus and of the transition between Jesus' preaching of the kingdom of God and the emergence of Christian faith in the period after Jesus' crucifixion. While frequently presenting his historical judgments in apodictic language, S. explicitly classifies his reconstruction as no more than one possible interpretation of the pertinent texts.

After an introductory overview of modern research on the historical Jesus, S. examines "How Jesus Lived and Died." He depicts Jesus as a prophetic figure, who used apocalyptic imagery without being an apocalypticist. Though profoundly influenced by John the Baptist, Jesus proclaimed God's saving presence, in sharp contrast with John's emphasis on judgment. As preached by Jesus, the kingdom of God meant God's incarnation, not as understood in later Christological dogma, but in the sense "that God, as God, had *identified himself without remainder with his people*" (60) in such a way "that henceforth and forever God was present only in and as one's neighbor" (61). Jesus' preaching thus not

only has strong ethical implications, but is in fact reducible to its ethical dimension. Since S. understands God's identification with His people in an absolute sense (not in the sense of close association with a group or a cause), he is able to speak of "the abdication of 'God' in favor of his hidden presence among human beings" (62) and assert that Jesus' preaching "marked the death of religion and religion's God and heralded the beginning of the postreligious experience" (61-62). Despite passages which suggest that this presence of God dates from the time of Jesus, S.'s basic position is that the kingdom of God has been a reality from the start of human history; long obscured by religion, it has simply been brought to light afresh through Jesus' word. The presence of the kingdom is thus completely independent of Jesus, whose preaching lacked any self-referential content or implications. Nonetheless, Jesus' life led his disciples to identify him as the eschatological prophet, and the eventual rejection of his message caused the Sanhedrin to condemn him, presumably on the charge of contempt of authority, and the Romans to crucify him as a messianic pretender.

Against this background, S. studies the origin of Christianity under the heading "How Jesus Was Raised from the Dead." In his judgment, our access reaches only to the claims of the first Christian believers; references to the Resurrection do not describe an event pertaining to Jesus, but seek rather to express the experience of the disciples, especially of Simon, after Jesus' death. Attributing much significance to the tradition of Simon's denial and repentance, S. maintains that Simon's sin consisted in personalizing his hope for the kingdom in Jesus, not in the "petty lie of denying that he knew Jesus" (p. 122). Subsequently Simon renewed his former insight into the true nature of the kingdom as independent of Jesus, and this "re-vision *was* the Easter experience, the rebirth of what Jesus had preached" (124). A fatal step was taken, however, when Simon articulated his convictions in terms which referred to Jesus' person; through this reifying of Jesus' word, Simon "continued his denial of Jesus by creating Christianity" (125), which is built on this initial retreat from Jesus' message. While S. finds great theological value in a reconstructed pre-Markan legend of a visit to Jesus' tomb (interpreted as an invitation to believe regardless of the state of the grave), he judges that, on the whole, the mythical NT elaborations of the Easter message focus improperly on the figure of Jesus rather than the nature of the kingdom. In contrast to these trajectories, it is necessary to acknowledge the absence of Jesus and the utter futility of any search for him. The proper attitude is to recognize that Jesus is ultimately dispensable, and to appropriate his message of God's presence as equivalent to God's disappearance into His people.

The following treatment of "How Jesus Became God" outlines what S.

conceives as a gradual apotheosis of Jesus from crucified prophet to divine ruler of the cosmos. A first step, still within the horizon of Judaism, required a qualitative leap of faith to move beyond the earliest disciples' classification of Jesus as God's eschatological prophet by identifying him as the future Son of man and apocalyptic judge. A second stage, largely occasioned by delay of the Parousia, advanced further to confess Jesus as the reigning Lord and Christ, the functional equivalent of God. Finally, this process climaxed in the attribution to Jesus of ontological divinity as pre-existent Son of God. The course of subsequent Christology was thus clearly marked. In S.'s judgment, all such developments lie rooted in the initial error of identifying Jesus with the kingdom he proclaimed.

A brief conclusion entitled "Recovering the Kingdom" recapitulates S.'s position that Christianity has distorted the message of Jesus by hypostatizing the kingdom, abandoning Jesus' radical sense of time, and re-establishing religion. In contrast to the Christian tradition, S. proposes retrieving the gospel of God's kingdom by rejecting Christology in favor of what he considers the content of Jesus' own word: "Grace is and always has been everywhere. The task is to make it so" (227).

Although S.'s subtitle is reminiscent of Alfred Loisy's dictum that "Jesus foretold the kingdom, and it was the Church that came" (*The Gospel and the Church* [Philadelphia: Fortress, 1976] 166), the systematic thrust of his thought is closer to David Friedrich Strauss in its denial of intrinsic significance to Jesus and in its proximity to Strauss's judgment that "humanity is the union of the two natures—God become man" (*The Life of Jesus Critically Examined* [Philadelphia: Fortress, 1972] 780). The liberties taken in the citation of biblical texts ("*ho huios tou anthropou*" as "I" [Mt 11:19] on p. 58; "*Pater*" as "*Abba*" [Lk 11:2] on p. 60; "Simon" rather than "Peter" in Lk 22:61 [p. 121]) weaken confidence in the author's concern for accurate exegesis. While the account of Simon's failure, conversion, and inept expression of his decisive insight is highly implausible, the chief weaknesses of the work are its nontheistic interpretation of Jesus' message, its failure to appreciate Jesus' personal significance for his own preaching, and its underestimation of the importance of identifying Jesus as the eschatological prophet. In sum, *The First Coming* is an engagingly written misconstrual of the message of Jesus and the origin of Christian faith.

Catholic University of America

JOHN P. GALVIN

THE SCIENCE OF THEOLOGY. By Gillian R. Evans, Alister E. McGrath, and Allan D. Galloway. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1986. Pp. xii + 364. \$14.95.

ON THEOLOGY. By Schubert M. Ogden. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1986. Pp. xii + 160. \$19.95.

**THE LOGIC OF THEOLOGY: A BRIEF ACCOUNT OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN BASIC CONCEPTS IN THEOLOGY.** By Dietrich Ritschl. Translated by John Bowden. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987. Pp. xxvi + 310. \$24.95.

These three books are reviewed together because in one way or another they all propose to deal with theological method. Yet the approach in each case is quite different: e.g., through a careful study of the history of theology, through analysis of specific methodological questions, or finally in virtue of a broad overview of the field of systematic theology. As will be made clear below, both strengths and weaknesses attach to each approach.

Paul Avis, general editor of a new series entitled *The History of Christian Theology*, notes that the first volume (*The Science of Theology*) "unfolds the Church's changing understanding of the discipline of theology from the dawn of the Christian era to the present day" (vi). Of the three coauthors, Evans covers the patristic and medieval periods of Christian theology; McGrath, the period from the Reformation to the Enlightenment; Galloway, the 19th and 20th centuries. The focus in all three subdivisions is on individual theologians and their works rather than on theological themes as such. As a result, the book is certainly a useful one-volume reference work for the life and work of celebrated theologians, but there is not much specific discussion of theological method as such. Likewise, from the Reformation onwards, the focus is clearly on Protestant rather than Roman Catholic theologians. Galloway comments that Roman Catholic theology in the 19th and 20th centuries was "backward-looking, inward-looking and, at least in its public expression, disciplined within an inch of its life" (349). While this may well be true, it seems somewhat parochial to omit any reference to the Tübingen school of Catholic theology in the 19th century and to discuss at length only the work of Karl Rahner in the 20th century, with only passing reference to Hans Küng and Hans Urs von Balthasar and no mention at all of Bernard Lonergan, Edward Schillebeeckx, et al.

Quite a different picture is presented by Ogden in *On Theology*. First of all, his focus is clearly on theological method; secondly, he exhibits an impressive knowledge of contemporary Roman Catholic theology. In fact, insofar as he sets forth a claim for the necessity of a metaphysical foundation for theology, he equivalently bypasses traditional confessional approaches to theology in favor of a new line of demarcation between those who see the need of a philosophical underpinning for theology and those who for whatever reason do not. Within the latter camp, e.g., would be Protestants who follow Karl Barth in the latter's suspicion of "natural theology" and Roman Catholics like Francis Fiorenza who are wary of

"foundationalism" in theology. In any event, O.'s position is clear. He grounds Christian revelation in an "original revelation" which is in principle available to all human beings everywhere: "In sum, *what* Christian revelation reveals to us is nothing new, since such truths as it makes explicit must already be known to us implicitly in every moment of our existence. But *that* this revelation occurs does reveal something new to us in that, as itself event, it is the occurrence in our history of the transcendent event of God's love" (43). Put another way, every human being has (or at least should have) a basic faith in the trustworthiness of life in this world; this existential faith in life's trustworthiness is a necessary presupposition of any specifically Christian theology. Accordingly, one need not be a believer in order to do Christian theology, since it is enough to be interested in the religious questions for which Christian theology provides specific answers. Throughout his eight chapters, O.'s focus is thus on a rational grasp of the truth claims of Christian theology. On the other hand, his analysis of theological method is clearly predicated upon an antecedent metaphysics. If one were to question some of those metaphysical presuppositions (e.g., the belief in an original revelation available to all human beings everywhere or the even more fundamental belief that the existence of God can be established by reason alone), then O.'s further remarks on theological method lose some of their cogency. In other words, given such a closely-reasoned style of argumentation, one cannot so readily "pick and choose" among the points made but rather feels drawn to accept or reject the system of thought in its entirety.

Exactly the opposite impression is given by a close reading of *The Logic of Theology*. Ritschl, former professor of systematic theology at the University of Heidelberg, provides an overview of what he himself suggests would be best handled in a multivolume systematic theology. The book is divided into three parts, in the first of which he explores the "territory" of theology, e.g. philosophical presuppositions about the nature of reality embedded in Scripture, the function of regulative statements or "implicit axioms" within theological language, and the role of worship in "verifying" talk about God. Part 2 sets forth R.'s theory in four areas of theology (ecclesiology, God [or, more specifically, Trinity], Christology, and theological anthropology). Part 3 applies this theory to Christian life and worship in a variety of ways. While R.'s work is very insightful on a wide range of issues, it was difficult for me to get a unified sense of the whole even after a second reading. Unquestionably, R.'s method of presentation is partly responsible. He divides each chapter into sets of theses, for which he provides explanatory paragraphs of varying lengths followed by discussion of related literature on the subject in question. But the end result is often to state a position rather than

argue it, and sometimes even the statement of the position is either too brief or too vague to be helpful to anyone but presumably an expert in the field. This is in no way to underestimate the breadth of R.'s erudition, but simply to suggest that his work would gain in persuasiveness if it were more sharply focused and thus less encyclopedic in scope.

No consensus position on theological method, therefore, seems to emerge from the comparison of these three books. O. and R., to be sure, both admit their dependence on Schleiermacher for the division of the content of theology into three broad areas: historical/exegetical, theoretical/systematic, and practical. But their further understanding of those contents differs considerably. R., e.g., adopts a cultural/linguistic approach to systematics; O. favors a more traditional metaphysical approach. The authors of *The Science of Theology* content themselves with noting broad shifts in theological methodology from one historical epoch to another (e.g., from medieval scholasticism to Reformation theology). Yet all three books provide matter for reflection in coming to a personal standpoint on method in theology.

*Xavier University, Cinn.*

JOSEPH A. BRACKEN, S.J.

ESSAYS IN PHENOMENOLOGICAL THEOLOGY. Edited by Steven W. Laycock and James G. Hart. Albany: State University of New York, 1986. Pp. x + 219. \$39.50; \$12.95 paper.

VATICAN II AND PHENOMENOLOGY: REFLECTIONS ON THE LIFE-WORLD OF THE CHURCH. by John F. Kobler. Dordrecht: Martinus Nijhoff, 1985. Pp. xvi + 257.

Because the life of the Roman Catholic Church today is marked by its conversation with the issues and approaches of modernity and because of the impact of various modern philosophical schools upon theologians during and after Vatican II, the relationship to theology and church of a major school of philosophy, e.g. phenomenology, attracts attention. These books are concerned with the movement of phenomenology and two different meanings of theology.

The first work, a collection of nine essays, is not, however, despite the title, concerned with "theology" as the extensive and pluriform enterprise of Christian theology understands the word. Some of the essays are concerned with an exposition of Husserl's thought; some with Hegel, a predecessor; one with Duméry, a follower. Over half of the essays intend to develop what they call "phenomenological theology," and the opening essay by one of the editors undertakes to explain what that "inchoate discipline, laboring to articulate its own methods and subject matter" (1) might be. Husserl observed in a conversation with a Benedictine nun, a friend, that he "must eliminate God from . . . scientific existence in order



to pave the way to God for humans who do not have . . . the certainty of faith through the church" (2). A phenomenological approach to the divine can be found in philosophers prior to Husserl: in Augustine, in Lao-tzu, in Plotinus. Here, even if both subject and method are novel and so unclear, the reader learns that phenomenological theology is to be distinguished from "either a 'positive' theology, with its assumption of textual or traditional authoritarianism, or a speculative-natural theology, with its procedures of deductive and inductive derivation" (5). The authors of these essays describe "speculative theology" as either, in Aristotle's sense, the concluding section of metaphysics or, according to philosophy after Descartes, theodicy. Phenomenological theology seems to have as its goal arriving at (or close to) God without the inferences of deductive science, without a mathematical or syllogistic logic (approaches which, in fact, prove rather threadbare and do not significantly influence believers or nonbelievers). This theology will avoid, too, the "fallacious circularity" (6) of approaching God through faith or church. What then is the approach, and whence the material, whether in ideas or realities, for this phenomenological approach? The approach is the contemplative laying-bare and bracketing of phenomenology ("reductive-eidetic-reconstructive techniques") while the subject matter is "the Divine (*theos*), in that web of intuitively articulable necessities in which phenomena are caught" (5).

Three essays look at Christian theological topics: Trinity, Holy Spirit, creation. Iso Kern, knowledgeable in Christian and Asian theologies, through a philosophy of description (eschewing that theology which is metaphysics struggling to be scientific) views a triad of nature, sociality, and self. These are fundamental dimensions of human life, and this triad grounds human life as well as human transcendence towards the divine. An essay on the Holy Spirit (in fact, a reflection more upon the post-Augustinian theology of the Trinity than upon the teachings about the *pneuma* of Jesus in the NT) finds that word or idea to be explicable as the link within and with the divine: the Spirit binds all to the center. Kern's essay is the best introduction to and example of what the volume intends; it is also the most informed in terms of Christian theology.

Theologians, as the term is widely used, are those who reflect from within cultural and philosophical thought-forms upon a faith. They would not recognize themselves as deductive metaphysicians proving things about God or as devotees involved with the circular and authoritarian texts. Christian theology is speculative in that it is reflective and creative; it neither repeats inspired texts nor discovers new proofs. Theology interprets, articulates, exemplifies, and highlights a faith in a historical revelation of a particular culture and moment expressed infrequently in philosophy. Christian theology is neither philosophical proofs nor a positivist arrangement of texts. Its central belief is not a facet of God's

being but both the assertion and some description of God's anthropology, the "reign of God."

As philosophers, the authors do not wish to be theologians of faith and church, and so the areas which would be most interesting to theologians, the contribution to theology from past and future on the part of phenomenology, the preparatory and expository service of the approach and analysis of this philosophical direction to the burning issues of the self-interpretation of Christianity today, are not treated. The authors' work of offering an alternative to a philosophical theology which would become a technology of proofs is valuable. The insights and results of the essays, where they treat the area of religion (a word generally avoided), remain within a transcendental anthropology and are insights into human and social life which become signals of structure, ground, and possibly transcendence. Traditionally in Christian theology this approach produced what were known as arguments *ex convenientia*, capable of illuminating what was held of God and humanity by faith: pointers but not projects.

The second book lies far removed from the first. Kobler intends to survey the relationship of Husserl's ideas and disciples to the Second Vatican Council. The work is thoroughly uncritical: it lacks any attempt at evaluation or discerning relative importance; the context of quotations and the examination of real and supposed influence are lacking. The enterprise is too grand and the style is rambling; the most valuable contributions are the quotations and the footnotes.

Nonetheless, in its goal, its collection of data, and its charting of ideas and people the book is valuable. Even if many of the connections between this family of philosophers and the concrete texts of Vatican II are unconvincing, the book, in lieu of anything better, is a contribution to the history of theology in this century and to the background for the productive dynamic of the Council.

The opening four chapters are weak, for their presentation of Husserl is undistinguished and their interpretation of John XXIII is exaggerated. What the remainder of the book does show—from the debates and text of the Council—is an emerging new approach to the world, to the human person, to language. Within the Council, rather rapidly, theology began to be done in a different way than in neo-scholasticism. The acceptance of the self as world-creating as well as the transcendental horizon of life and objects in the sense of Hegel or Heidegger are important. New ways of looking at history, language, and praxis can be detected. K.'s method of data-collecting leaves the reader without precise evaluations of the relationship of Vatican II to phenomenology. Nevertheless, connections establish some influence. It remains to research more precisely how and where that influence really took place. Subtly—through French theologians with their own rich diversity and sources, and through German

theologians not without insights gained from Heidegger—the conciliar documents in their various drafts assumed a new theological tonality, one which ended the neo-scholastic monopoly and introduced a new era. This volume is a stimulus and a resource for more meticulous work documenting the history, reaching from Kant to the Extraordinary Synod, of how Roman Catholicism learns to speak to and through modernity.

*University of Notre Dame*

THOMAS O'MEARA, O.P.

**THEOLOGY AND THE PROBLEM OF EVIL.** By Kenneth Surin. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986. Pp. xii + 180. \$9.95.

The editor of *Modern Theology* has written an important and provocative exploration and critique of strategies used by modern and contemporary philosophers and theologians writing "theodicy."

Influenced by Ricoeur, Foucault, and neo-Marxist literary and social theories, S. brings out the symbolic content and theological implications of theodacists' claims, unearths the hidden (and false) presupposition that a unified tradition of theodical writing seeks to solve a single problem of evil, and reveals how theodacists' explanations can be structured by their own material and ideal interests and socioeconomic locations. S. distinguishes theoretical theodicies (Alvin Plantinga, Richard Swinburne, John Hick, process theology) from practical theodicies (P. T. Forsyth, Dorothee Soelle, Jürgen Moltmann). The former are blighted *inter alia* by an abstract view of evil which effectively silences the voices of the suffering. Moltmann's and Soelle's works are flawed by reading a theology of the cross into the Holocaust, and Forsyth's by a priori making the crucifixion more morally vicious than any other possible sinful act. S. concludes by calling for theodicy to be done in the context of dogmatic (not fundamental) theology, written in the "logical space" occupied by victims and their narratives, focused in the realities of the Incarnation and atonement, and centered in the praxes that form the Christian life.

I applaud S.'s trenchant refusal to explain suffering away (the Karamazovs and Elie Wiesel speak loudly in S.'s text) and his exhortation of writers who "obscure or efface the lived experience of . . . victims" (xi) by "redeeming" evil in the eschaton. His book should be read for its religious passion and theological honesty. Nonetheless, he makes some dubious moves.

S. neglects to distinguish both the structures of argument in, and the audiences for, theodicies and defenses. The former try to explain to anyone why God allows evil. The latter try to show to those who claim that religious belief is incoherent that one can believe that God is omniscient, omnipotent, and omnibenevolent, and that there is genuine evil in the world. Defenses do not, as he thinks, commit their proponents

to "Enlightenment theism," which S. rejects along with W. Kasper, D. Z. Phillips, and T. Jennings. Nor does using Plantinga's defense commit one to viewing God as a "deistic Demiurge" (76). Collapsing theodicies and defenses leads to such unwarranted inferences.

S. seems to think that the only real problem of evil is the suffering of victims and that theodicians ignore it. Surely that is *one* of the problems of evil—but is it the only one Christians can legitimately address? Why write as if philosophers who professionally defend the coherence of Christian beliefs do not religiously seek to alleviate suffering? From the valid insight that one's material/ideal interests structure one's writings, S. seemingly infers that what one writes reveals all one's material and ideal interests. But as people do more than write, inferring that theoreticians ignore suffering has an inadequate basis.

S. collapses second-order theological/philosophical and first-order religious issues when discussing others. Yet he distinguishes them in his own brief sketch of a "proper" strategy for "theodicy." Consistency is needed on this issue.

Unlike many theodicians, S. never provides opiating consolations or forgets that suffering (and its alleviation) is essentially social. Yet I am not persuaded that a paradoxical and mysterious *theologia crucis* based in a revelational positivism (142, 154–55) is sufficient to resolve theoretical problems suffering raises; or that prayer (146), penance, and conversion (147) and a praxis of messianic trust (151) are sufficient to resolve practical problems of suffering.

*St. Michael's College, Vt.*

TERRENCE W. TILLEY

**THE SAME JESUS: A CONTEMPORARY CHRISTOLOGY.** By Daniel A. Helminiak. Chicago: Loyola University, 1986. Pp. xxiii + 337. \$15.95.

The title of Helminiak's book sets its tone and defines its purpose. H. sets out "to present a contemporary understanding of Jesus Christ which is still in accord with traditional teaching about Jesus" (125).

In the first section H. introduces important methodological and epistemological considerations that are the foundation of his Christological synthesis. He first presents the development of the historical-critical method of biblical interpretation as the major source of the contemporary shift in understanding about Jesus. Then, using Lonergan's cognitional theory, he discusses the meaning of Christology as an application of the human knowing process. Since Jesus and reflection about Jesus are distinct, Christology can develop. In describing contemporary Christology, H. contends that both Christology "from above" and Christology "from below" are kerygmatic statements, not systematic statements. Both

approaches proclaim the word through story and cannot be interpreted literally.

H. next attempts to "retrieve the tradition" by summarizing the conclusions of contemporary biblical scholarship on Jesus in the NT and tracing the Christological development of Nicaea and the later councils. Nicaea clarified Christian doctrine and represented a differentiation of consciousness, a shift from the functional thinking of the NT to ontological thinking, a shift from images to systematically formulated propositions. H. is critical of much of contemporary Christology as obscuring and even rejecting this shift by reducing all thinking to functional.

In the last three chapters H. offers his own Christological synthesis, a new paradigm of "Jesus, the Human True to Himself." H. strongly affirms the divine identity of Jesus but emphasizes just as strongly his humanity. For H., the Eternal Son of God became a human being. He no longer acted through his divinity but only through his humanity. He did not cease to be God but he surrendered his divine prerogatives and limited himself to acting humanly. By being faithful to his divine identity, the human Jesus gave historical expression to who he is eternally in God and became divinized in his resurrection. His humanity shared certain qualities proper to divinity. Because of Jesus' divinization, there is a real possibility of divinization for all humans. From this perspective H. discusses at length the consciousness, knowledge, and freedom of Jesus. Finally, H. elaborates a soteriology of reconciliation and divinization that founds our redemption in Jesus' loving fidelity and the saving work of the Holy Spirit.

H. succeeds in presenting an insightful Christological synthesis with a sound epistemological foundation that reconciles contemporary scholarship and concerns with traditional belief about Jesus. He also succeeds in articulating a creative soteriology that is integral to his Christology.

Several questions remain, however. First, it is fundamental to H.'s synthesis that while on earth the Eternal Word gave up his divine powers and acted through his human nature as the sole principle of activity. Jesus no longer acted through his divine nature. But this explanation does not seem the only possible interpretation of Chalcedon. Rather, it seems to empty the divine nature of any meaning or efficacy in the life of Jesus. Though H. explicitly states that the divinity remains intact, it is not clear what this means in Jesus' lived experience.

Secondly, H.'s soteriology does not adequately address the integral role of Christ's divinity in the process of redemption. In moving beyond the classical theories of atonement and satisfaction and emphasizing the divinization of Christ's humanity, H. leaves a tenuous connection between Christ's divinity and salvation.

*The Same Jesus* would be a demanding and challenging text for undergraduates, but it is clearly written with numerous helpful summaries. The endnotes offer the scholarly reader a nuanced discussion of the more complex issues.

Loyola University, N.O.

GERALD M. FAGIN, S.J.

MIRACLES DE JÉSUS ET THÉOLOGIE DU MIRACLE. By René Latourelle, S.J. *Recherches*, n.s. 8. Montreal/Paris: Bellarmin/Cerf, 1986. Pp. 393. Can. \$12.

This work, by the former dean of the faculty of theology and current professor in the same faculty at the Pontifical Gregorian University, is the culmination of the author's 15 years of research and writing on criteria for historicity and on the miracles of Jesus. Already in *Greg* 54 (1973) L. had applied historical methodology to the miracles; and in *L'Accès à Jésus par les évangiles* L. had presented the criteria for historicity in a systematic way as one avenue for arriving at the historical Jesus. Now L. has expanded the criteria for historicity and has applied them rigorously to each of the miracle accounts in the four Gospels. This exegesis becomes then the necessary groundwork for a theological understanding of the miracles of Jesus within the entire economy of salvation and for personal appropriation of their significance.

Following the lead given by *Dei verbum*, L. identifies the miracles as external signs performed by Jesus (who is the sign of salvation par excellence) and appreciates them as an integral part of Jesus' person, message, and identity as the revealer of the Father. L. applauds those exegetes who over the years have collected and applied historical criteria to the *logia* of Jesus; he now states that a similar task must be undertaken for the *gesta* of Jesus because the miracles demonstrate that the redemption of the human race through Jesus has already begun; failure to affirm the historicity of the miracles would transform Christianity into a mere gnosis.

The major middle section of the book is a systematic application to all of the miracle accounts of the criteria for historicity: multiple attestation; discontinuity; conformity; the style of Jesus; internal intelligibility; shifting interpretation of a basic event; and necessary explanation. L. examines each layer of the transmission of the Gospels and through strict use of the criteria concludes in favor of the historicity of the basic event. He does not fail to put forward various arguments against historicity and cautiously and methodically considers their merits. He is not blind to the possibility that some details of some of the miracle accounts were later additions. This is especially clear in the account of the Gerasene demoniac; he claims that the rush of possessed pigs into the sea was a later

invention by Judeo-Christians who sought suitable receptacles for the disembodied spirits.

The final third of the book is dedicated to more general issues: the classifications and motifs of the miracles; the function of miracles for each Evangelist; the Catholic notion of miracle as it has appeared from the patristic age to recent magisterial pronouncements; the sign value of miracles; and the individual task of discerning the meaning of miracles in one's own life. The inspiration for much of L.'s theological understanding of miracles is Maurice Blondel, who revived the view that miracles are not only prodigious events of nature but are especially signs directed to the whole person who is called to response by God.

There is much of value in this book. While its presentation of the criteria for historicity is not novel, its application to all of the miracle accounts is a major achievement; now the task is to apply them to other *cruces evangeliorum*, perhaps to the postresurrection appearances of Jesus. Further, it situates the miracles within the history of salvation and as consistent with Jesus' message of the reign of God among us; the miracles have a *revelatory* function in that they inform the human race of God's power and love, and hence an exclusive focus on their juridical function (i.e., that they serve as evidence of Jesus' divinity) would impoverish them. Finally, L. raises the meaning of the miracles from the levels of historical and exegetical curiosity to the level of personal appropriation; believers already approached the *logia* of Jesus as sources of prayer and reflection; now they are called to approach the *gesta* of Jesus in the same way.

Two final comments. This book is neither pure exegesis nor pure theological reflection; it is both, and the exegesis is the preparation for the theological reflection. Hence those who yearn for pure exegesis (and much can be learned from this book from a purely exegetical outlook) should proceed directly to the middle section. Finally, non-Catholics should note that this book unashamedly discusses the theology of miracles from the Catholic tradition.

Georgetown University

LEO H. MADDEN

THE OFFICE OF PETER AND THE STRUCTURE OF THE CHURCH. By Hans Urs von Balthasar. Translated from the German by Andrée Emery. San Francisco: Ignatius, 1986. Pp. 358. \$12.95.

In 1974, largely in reaction to exaggerated criticism of the papacy on the part of Catholics, the distinguished Swiss theologian Hans Urs von Balthasar published *Der antirömische Affekt* (Freiburg: Herder), with the goals of diagnosing a pervasive "anti-Roman attitude" in the history of Christianity and indicating how the Petrine office is an essential com-

ponent of the Church's concrete nature. The work under review is an English version of most of this book; B.'s caustic four-page epilogue on "The Condemnation of the Grand Inquisitor" has been omitted without explanation.

A brief introduction stresses B.'s incarnational view of the Church, notes the historical reality of opposition to Rome, and outlines his proposal for integrating the papacy into the full ecclesial constellation. B. then analyzes recent critiques of the papacy from the right and the left, with particular focus on developments in the aftermath of Vatican II and *Humanae vitae* and on rejection of Paul VI's *Ostpolitik*. While some specific objections to papal conduct may be valid, critics typically suffer from abstract conceptions of the Church, often linked to romantic illusions about its origins and impractical visions of its current possibilities. Attributing many historical problems to unhealthy involvement of the popes in political affairs, B. credits Vatican II and Paul VI with significant steps toward establishing the proper ecclesial equilibrium.

Against this background B. presents his own ecclesiology. The Church derives from Christ, the personal concretization of the triune God, who lived on earth in a specific historical constellation which included John the Baptist, Mary, the Twelve (especially Peter and John), and Paul. In keeping with its origin, the Church must retain a firm eschatological orientation and be conformed relentlessly to the mystery of the cross. The Church can be understood only when seen in Trinitarian and Christological perspective and when the permanent significance of the original Christological constellation, largely ignored in the Catholic dogmatic tradition, is clearly recognized; sociological approaches to its nature can never prove adequate. In this work B. does not attempt to develop a full ecclesiology, but concentrates on the roles of Mary and of Peter and John (in the context of the Twelve) as real symbols which established constant dimensions of the Church's existence.

Fundamental to the Church is its all-embracing Marian (feminine) dimension of complete receptivity to God's will, embodied concretely in Mary and continued throughout the Church's history. Less foundational, but equally part of the Church's nature, is the (masculine) principle of office, established by Christ to exercise pastoral leadership, especially to safeguard the Church's unity in fidelity to its Lord. Within the official pole, distinct factors are represented by Peter (the highest concentration of office) and John (love; the link between Peter and Mary); B. devotes to their interplay an extended theological meditation inspired by the Fourth Gospel, especially Jn 21. Since both officeholders and other Christians are sinners, exercise of church office will inevitably result in conflict, but the "impossible" burden of office is made bearable, like Christian existence in general, by God's grace. A final section accents the "eccentric" (centered outside of itself) nature of church office, and



appeals for development of a more comprehensive ecclesiology and for integration of the Petrine office into the whole of the Church.

B.'s insistence on approaching the Petrine office with constant reference to Christ, to the requirements of a concrete ecclesiological realism, and to the high demands imposed on all Christians for adherence to the standards of the gospel and the mystery of the cross is a significant reminder to the contemporary Church. Equally valuable are his awareness of the limitations of the papacy (and of church office in general), his alertness to past deficiencies, and his refusal to isolate the Petrine office from other aspects of the Church. Serious questions remain about his specific understanding of the ecclesial constellation (the distinction of masculine and feminine principles; the conception of Marian, Petrine, Johannine, and Pauline dimensions); it is not clear that these ideas, which at times appear idiosyncratic and arbitrary, rest on grounds more objective than personal intuition. The sharp tone of portions of the book, though provoked by the literature to which B. is responding, is likely to reduce his chances of receiving a dispassionate hearing. But B.'s theology of the papacy warrants serious attention.

The importance of B.'s theology makes it all the more regrettable that severe defects in the translation make it impossible to obtain a precise account of his thought from this publication and expose the author to criticism for positions which he does not hold. Only a few of the more than 100 errors I have noted can be listed here. B.'s observations on the development of structure in the early Church (15-16), the factual connection of succession to Peter with the bishop of Rome (52, n. 52), the dating of "Early Catholicism" (73), the need to integrate dogmatic definitions into a greater whole (125), the connection between Jesus' choice of the Twelve and his relationship to his mother (138), the relationship of the Church's motherhood to church office (196, 206), the way in which the papacy achieves proper balance with other factors in the Church (229), appropriate papal procedure in establishing policies (314), and the relationship of ancient Rome to Christianity (335) have all been distorted. A passage from Augustine is ascribed to Tertullian (178, n. 87), and a work of Przywara to B. (328, n. 27). Comments about Jesus are applied to Peter (153). In several places, there are gratuitous insertions (e.g., "seemingly" [330; in a section on *Humanae vitae*]) and omissions (e.g., a sentence critical of Legaut [112, n. 69]). "Kirche" is translated as "baptism" (174) and as "Rome" (283, n. 108), "paternalistisch" as "ancestral" (210), "Amt" as "church" (235), "Apostel" as "pope" (249), "leiblicher Bruder" (of Jesus) as "blood relative" (309). But I was particularly intrigued to find "antimännlich" rendered as "feminist" (43).

**CHURCHES RESPOND TO BEM: OFFICIAL RESPONSES TO THE "BAPTISM, EUCHARIST AND MINISTRY" TEXT 2-3.** Edited by Max Thurian. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1986, 1987. Pp. viii + 348. \$16.50, 16.90.

**FAITH AND RENEWAL: COMMISSION ON FAITH AND ORDER, STAVANGER, 1986.** Edited by Thomas F. Best. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1986. Pp. vii + 256. \$12.50.

**CATHOLIC PERSPECTIVES ON BAPTISM, EUCHARIST AND MINISTRY.** Edited by Michael A. Fahey. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1986. Pp. xiv + 190. \$24.50; \$11.75 paper.

**WHO IN THE WORLD? A STUDY OF MINISTRY.** Dover, N.H.: Eedeo-Nadeo Standing Comm., 1986. Pp. 60.

The past two decades have been regarded as an era of ecumenical good feelings, but a trip for the heart or pleasant attitudes are not enough; the present documentation indicates the direction taken by the head once the heart has been touched.

At Lima in 1982, the World Council of Churches embarked on a major effort in the multilateral conversations, tackling the weighty matters of baptism, Eucharist, and ministry. Volumes 2 and 3 noted here contain the official responses of the various member bodies of the World Council of Churches, to which the Roman Catholic Church does not belong for a variety of reasons. Catholic representation does exist, however, on the all-important Faith and Order Commission. Reactions to BEM clearly demonstrate how far the ecumenical journey has taken us, as well as the distance yet to be traveled.

Although Roman Catholicism does not have a formal voice, its position is generally well reflected by the several Eastern Orthodox interventions. The Russian reaction views the agreed statements thus: "Not sufficient for pursuing now the question of restoration of the eucharistic communion and koinonia between the churches," but "a step towards greater catholicity" and a "promising path." Cardinal Jan Willebrands would probably concur in that judgment. The Bulgarian Orthodox questioned the dual categories of "infant baptism" and "believers' baptism" as though there were two kinds of baptism, with infant baptism not corresponding to believers' baptism, an objection also voiced by the Lutheran Church of Australia. The connection between original sin and baptism was raised by the Anglican Church of Canada and the American Lutheran Church, and implicitly noted by the Lutheran Church of Australia, which missed the mention of baptism as a "means of grace." The Protestant Episcopal Church of the U.S.A. was joined by the ALC in expressing concern that the statement "does not sufficiently stress baptism as God's own saving act," while Anglicans of Canada were interested in a "gender-free form" for baptism.

The description of the Eucharist as the central act of Christian worship was problematical for the United Methodist Church of Central and Southern Europe. At the other end of the spectrum, the Russian Orthodox called for clearer language on the who and how of the Eucharist, a point highlighted by the Church of Norway, which specifically asked how the member bodies see the Real Presence being effected: the epiklesis? the words of institution? the total Eucharistic prayer? In very probing style the Presbyterian Church in Canada asked: "Does an umbrella term such as 'real presence' indicate meaningful consensus or does it simply conceal radical differences which are not being honestly expressed?" Equally penetrating is the Bulgarian Orthodox query: All well and good for frequent Communion, but what about the sacrament of penance? Similarly, the ALC observes that the "forgiveness of sin is absent" from the Eucharistic discussion, and the LC of Australia wonders about the one-dimensional view of the paschal mystery (namely, the Resurrection alone) which is presented in regard to an understanding of what is commemorated in the Eucharist.

Reaction to the ministry document is particularly strong, with the Orthodox Churches consistently questioning the ordination of women and the apostolic succession and calling for a clear definition of the ministerial priesthood. The fact that holy orders is nowhere precisely spoken of as a sacrament is cause for concern for the Bulgarian Orthodox, while the ALC just as strongly asserts that "we take exception . . . to a three-fold order." Interestingly, PECUSA asks how any serious reflection on order in the Church can take place without reference to the Petrine ministry.

Catholics may not see the totality of the deposit of faith in these documents, but an appreciation is essential for the other perspective. Undoubtedly, many "separated brethren" had significant difficulties with these attempts at consensus, most notably the United Methodist Church of Central and Southern Europe, which view all this as "too sacramentalist," and the Seventh Day Adventists, who could not help but consider the ministerial statement as "too Catholic in intent." The reader will notice, however, a tendency in the responses which might well indicate the more profitable dialogues in which to engage in the immediate future, at least if organic unity is a goal.

Volume 3 has a splendid introduction by the late Orthodox theologian Nikos Nissiotis, in which he identifies three issues "skirted" by BEM, matters which can cut both ways: how sacramental churches should regard nonsacramental churches; the status of the Petrine office; the apparently irresolvable matter of the ordination of women. If the ecumenical movement is to progress, can the hard questions be avoided?

*Catholic Perspectives* was commissioned by the Catholic Theological

Society of America to offer summaries and reactions to the Lima papers. At times the volume is less than helpful in advancing ecumenical progress, since it often gives the impression of a desire to dialogue with the magisterium rather than with the various churches and ecclesial communities. Since the contributors note that they represent neither the Catholic Church nor the Catholic theological community at large, one is led to ask: If that is so, *cui bono*? An outstanding exception is Edward Kilmartin's evaluation of the Eucharist document.

*Who in the World?* is not directly related to the multilateral documentation; rather, it serves as a barometer for the bilateral conversations between Rome and Canterbury in the United States. This study of ministry contains the results of questionnaires responded to by 89 Episcopalian and 94 Roman Catholic ecumenical officers, revealing "a consensus of astonishing dimension and great significance." In spite of the consensus, important divergences between Roman Catholics and Anglicans surface as to what constitute "minor" or more serious problems. Even though the ecumenical officers may not reflect the grass roots, J. T. Ford reminds the ecumenists of their prophetic obligation to stress to all "that the ecumenical pilgrimage is not an optional side-trip, but an integral part of their Christian vocation."

*Faith and Renewal* rounds out this ecumenical potpourri with the official record of Faith and Order's 1985 meeting at Stavanger, Norway, in which the Commission reviewed BEM's reception by the member churches. As such, it is an important series of papers of an introspective or self-reflective nature. Not at all self-congratulatory, they are objective, honest, and realistic assessments. Also included are areas other than BEM for future exploration and evaluation, especially for united/uniting churches. Thomas Hopko's presentation is extremely insightful, setting the tone for the long road ahead with a spirituality to undergird the arduous process: "We are dealing here with words. This is our peculiar calling and craft. Theological words are always words of confession; words 'adequate' and 'proper' to God, born of prayer, adoration, service and sacrifice in imitation of Christ and empowered by his Spirit. They are words which God himself provides for his people, for his glorification, and for theirs. May the Lord give us his words, anointed and inspired, as we now take up our task."

*St. John's University, N.Y.*

PETER M. J. STRAVINSKAS

**EUCHARIST AND OFFERING.** By Kenneth Stevenson. New York: Pueblo, 1987. Pp. xiii + 327. \$17.50.

Sacrificial language is found in the earliest references to Eucharist, and in both East and West sacrifice is a major theme for 1500 years.

Still, considerable theological debate, acrimony, and division mark the use and interpretation of Eucharistic sacrifice. Theological inquiry since the Reformation has widened the gap and solidified the distance between opposing positions. Recent softening of this polarization comes not so much by way of theological inquiry but from fresh biblical exegesis and careful retrieval of the Church's prayer tradition. This work investigates every major liturgical tradition from the NT to the present. Stevenson's masterful analysis of sacrificial themes in the *ecclesia orans* offers fresh insight, and a firm groundwork for future convergence. Since liturgical inquiry must respect the integrity of the act of worship, S. correctly considers sacrifice under the larger ritual category of offering. Story, gift, and response are the criteria used to focus on sacrifice: story provides the context of Eucharist, gift describes the material, and response expresses the action.

The work is primarily a textual analysis of a rich and varied tradition. S. proves a most helpful guide through the labyrinthine paths of each liturgical family. For the early Church he concludes that offering was imprecisely expressed, but understood to be an important metaphor in Eucharistic spirituality. As the liturgical tradition flowers into its classical shape in the East, sacrificial language increases in frequency and specificity. The Greek, Coptic, Syriac, and Armenian anaphoras contain everything from gift offering to sacrificial Christology, "total" anamnesis of the Christ event, and the juxtaposition of living sacrifice, memorial sacrifice, and sacrifice of praise. In the West the Mozarabic tradition connects the offering of gifts with intercessions, and in the Gallican tradition story develops sacrifice. In the Roman canon offering dominates, bringing together gift and response, while story diminishes. In Europe during the Middle Ages the priest privatizes the Eucharistic prayer. The preanaphoral prayers become anticipatory, offering "this spiritual and bloodless sacrifice." With allegorical interpretation story loses its verbal dynamic, becoming a mental exercise that necessitates a deeper connection between presence and offering. The East retains a balance of story, gift, and response, with sacrifice present throughout. Luther turns his attention to the bread and wine, placing gift offering within a solemn and testimonial meal stripped of sacrificial language, but Eucharistic hymnody bears a strong Christological character and themes of self-offering. Zwingli locates story, gift, and response in the preached word, and solemn eating loses its Eucharistic reference. The 1552 Book of Common Prayer focuses on eating and drinking, with emphasis on self-offering. The rediscovery of and fascination with the Syrian liturgy expanded by Dix's presentation of the fourfold character of the Eucharistic act mark the beginning of recent Eucharistic reform.

A reintroduction of story, gift, and response as the context for sacrifice has become normative.

From this analysis S. concludes that the deep structure of the anaphora remains thanksgiving (story) and supplication (response), and the attitude to this structure is gift offering, made explicit in certain traditions. The surface structure of presenting the gifts has been performed and interpreted variously down through the ages. S. handles with respect and insight the total act of worship in the Middle Ages and Reformation periods, demonstrating the shifting locus of sacrificial themes from text to gesture, hymnody, and interior reflection. He is satisfied with a less specific analysis of the early Church. Recent scholarship suggests that the tradition of *todah* and that of *berakah* are at the heart of the development of Eucharistic worship. Both are patient of specific sacrificial interpretations. While the use of story, gift, and response serves the analysis well, I am uncomfortable with the equation between thanksgiving and story. Just as Talley has demonstrated that there is a difference between thanksgiving and blessing, I feel that we should be attentive to the difference between thanksgiving and story. Overall, S. presents a consistent and coherent analysis of the role of sacrifice in Eucharistic worship. This work, then, deserves to be recognized for what it is: true liturgical theology, an analysis driven primarily by the heritage of the Church at worship. As such, its place is alongside any biblical or systematic inquiry into Eucharistic sacrifice. A major work which contributes significantly to both theological inquiry and liturgical studies.

*Spring Hill College, Mobile*

EMMANUEL J. CUTRONE

**THE EUCHARISTIC PRAYERS OF THE ROMAN RITE.** By Enrico Mazza. Translated from the Italian by Matthew J. O'Connell. New York: Pueblo, 1986. Pp. xxxi + 376. \$19.50.

It is almost 20 years since the Roman rite was enriched by the addition of three new Eucharistic prayers (1968). Since then five more prayers—two for reconciliation, three for children's Masses—have been added on a somewhat experimental basis (1974). Although theoretically they are the high point of the liturgy, in all that time little has been written for English-language readers to help in their intelligent, active celebration: for the most part, only the brief essays found in L. Sheppard's (ed.) *The New Liturgy* (1970), L. Soubigou's *A Commentary on the Prefaces and the Eucharistic Prayers of the Roman Missal* (1970), and more recently R. Moloney's *Our Eucharistic Prayers in Worship, Preaching & Study* (1985). Consequently, this English translation of Mazza's *Le odierne preghiere eucharistiche* (Bologna, 1984) is sorely needed.

Taking up a central concern of the book, F. R. McManus introduces

this edition by reflecting on the problems of translating liturgical texts. Since they are expressions of the Church's faith and a source of theology only as included in the actual worship of the Church, Mazza is thoroughly aware of the vital relationship between regularly celebrated vernacular translations and the Latin *editio typica* of the prayers. In fact, the priority of the celebrated text prompts him to conclude that "creativity based on a model" [the Latin original] must be allowed not only for episcopal conferences, but to each minister who presides over a liturgy" (248).

In the Introduction M. states his intended method: (1) investigate the textual origins in ancient anaphoras of the current prayers; (2) understand, both from a historical point of view and from current practice, the theology at work in the prayers; (3) finally, trace the roots of this theology in the biblical sources on which each prayer is based (xxx).

Chapter 1 deals with the theological dynamic and symbolic functioning of the Eucharistic prayer and its origin and development as literary genre. Succeeding chapters treat the Preface, the Roman Canon, the second, third, and fourth Eucharistic prayers, the anaphoras of reconciliation and of the Swiss Synod, the anaphoras for Masses with children, and, finally, M. articulates a "Theology of the Anaphora." The beautiful English translation of the extremely rich Swiss Synod anaphora reminds one of the need for better Eucharistic prayers in English.

In the first chapter M. recapitulates the studies of J. P. Audet in light of T. Talley's criticisms, and then agrees with C. Giraudo's thesis: the Eucharistic prayer originates in, and reflects the basic structure of, the OT *Todah* sacrifice prayer, a prayer which typically proclaims both the wonders of God in His saving deeds and the worshipers' corresponding unworthiness. The later Jewish *berakah* prayer form ("Blessed are You . . .") represents a particular development of *Todah*. In the *Birkat ha-Mazon* (the "cup of blessing" prayer used in first-century Jewish meals) the *Berakah* becomes the raw material out of which the Church's Eucharistic prayer is fashioned (*Didache* 10). M. ends the chapter insightfully commenting on concelebration and advocating a silent concelebration (29-35).

Throughout the book M. deals with various theological dimensions found in all Eucharistic worship as he treats each prayer individually. For example, in discussing the Roman Canon he admirably explains the meaning of the Mass as sacrifice (60), the absolute interdependence of all "grades" and members of the Church in the Eucharistic celebration (63, 76), and the importance of recapturing the patristic notion of Eucharist as the imitation of Christ (69-70). In fact, this latter theme proves to be the organizing nexus of the whole work (210), one which answers the question whether there is a "moment of consecration" (268), and one which M. summarizes in his final sentence: "Briefly, our bread

and wine too are the mystery of the body and blood of Jesus because our Eucharist is an imitation (mimesis) of the Last Supper, an anamnesis-parable-sacrament of the Lord's death and resurrection" (280). Among other topics, M. treats the relationship of liturgy to Christian life (138, 141), and the Eucharist as both sacrament of faith (159-60) and eschatological participation in the heavenly liturgy (163-64).

Occasionally M. appears unduly reluctant to express any negative criticism. For example, although his theology (69, 172, 325 n. 2) necessitates his agreeing with those who regret the intrusion of the "consecratory epiclesis" (e.g., A. Kavanagh, R. Albertine), M. only mildly observes in regard to the first two Eucharistic prayers for children: "The elimination of the 'first' epiclesis solves in a felicitous way the problems of having a single anaphora with two epicleses (one of which is there for reasons which appeal solely to theologians)" (240). He even seems briefly to countenance the practice of Mass stipends, but then quickly eschews it (67-68). Furthermore, one must wonder (along with M. Schaefer) why M. neglects to comment anywhere on the content and the function of the acclamations which have become part of the Eucharistic prayers. Finally, it is a disservice to the author and an inconvenience to the reader that this English edition removes the notes, so integral to the argument, from the bottom of each page to the end of the book.

In spite of whatever particular disagreements one might have with M.'s positions, his overall achievement here constitutes a major event in contemporary liturgical studies—indeed, a worthy modern-day supplement to J. A. Jungmann's *Missarum solemnity*. Brilliantly translated, the work is a compendium of Eucharistic theology. Highly recommended to theologians; indispensable for presiders; useful as a text in liturgical spirituality; valuable for anyone interested in Christian liturgy.

Creighton University, Omaha

JOHN D. LAURANCE, S.J.

**THE RECONCILING COMMUNITY: THE RITE OF PENANCE.** By James Dallen. *The Reformed Rites of the Catholic Church* 3. New York: Pueblo, 1986. Pp. xiv + 446. \$17.50.

We have come to expect excellence in Pueblo Publishing Company's series on the reformed rites of the sacraments; and Dallen's study of reconciliation/penance more than meets expectations. I know of nothing that equals it in providing the understandings that can serve as guidelines for our present celebration of reconciliation liturgies.

Actually, the book is two books, the one a carefully crafted history of the Church's attitudes towards and dealings with penance and reconciliation, the second a study of the genesis of the reformed rite and an analysis of its directives. Wisely, the two are published as one volume,



for the history indicates the broader shift in Catholic practice of penance and reconciliation within which the ritual revision is occurring.

D.'s description of the sacrament's historical evolution flows so coherently that one scarcely notices the way in which his treatment makes sense of a tangled skein of evidences. In part this happens because he is not hemmed in by the purpose of finding historical justifications for post-Tridentine practice. It is also the result of his obvious control of the best scholarship available, scholarship which he not only knows but has been able to utilize with balanced historical and theological judgment.

What his historical section makes clear is the broader view and more flexible practice of penance and reconciliation in earlier centuries of Christianity—actually up to modern times and the post-Tridentine discipline. Without putting it in those terms, D. points to the fact that the sacramentality of reconciliation in the Church's life has not been confined to the ritual moment but has been a wider process of dealing with human sinfulness. His treatment indicates also the extent to which the more ecclesial approach of earlier centuries gradually gave way to the highly individualistic practice of confession which almost everyone took for granted prior to Vatican II.

As he moves into the second portion of the book, D. begins by describing the shift in orientation that occurred at Vatican II and the process of producing the new rite in the years after the Council. While this description is interesting in itself, it also situates the revised rite within the conflicting currents of post-Vatican II Church development and thus provides the background needed to assess the tensions we are presently experiencing in using the reformed rites.

D. goes on to discuss the theological understanding of penance and reconciliation that flows from recent shifts in Christian soteriology. Methodologically it is interesting to observe the value of D.'s approach: he theologizes not only out of detailed acquaintance with history but specifically out of his familiarity with research into the Church's liturgical practice. Yet he does not reflect exclusively upon ritual; rather, he works from the broader sacramental ministry of reconciliation as it has been exercised within the whole Christian community. *Lex orandi, lex credendi* takes on concrete theological meaning. If any proof were needed, this book reflects the maturity and theological relevance of North American liturgical scholarship.

All this might indicate that D.'s study is an erudite volume intended solely for academic circles. Such is not the case. In particular, the final two chapters deal, carefully but practically, with implementation of the reformed rites. D. appraises positively the achievements and directions of the revised rites, but he is not uncritically enthusiastic. For one thing, he indicates—rightly—that the new reconciliation ritual does not match

the revised ritual for adult initiation in demanding a more adequate ecclesiology and restructured Christian communities. He recognizes the role of Church law as it guides liturgical practice, but he is clear that liturgy itself is a law more fundamental than positive Church legislation.

*The Reconciling Community* is a book to read carefully, to reflect upon, to be guided by, and to be grateful for.

*Holy Cross College, Worcester, Mass.*

BERNARD COOKE

SAINT AUGUSTIN ET LA BIBLE. Edited by Anne-Marie la Bonnardière. *Bible de tous les temps* 3. Paris: Beauchesne, 1986. Pp. 462. Fr. 270.

In 1986-87 we celebrate the 16th centenary of the conversion and baptism of Augustine at 32 years of age. This event has already been marked by many books, articles, conferences, etc. on this outstanding doctor of the Church. Among these is the third volume of *Bible de tous les temps*, which treats uniquely in this volume Augustine's use of the Bible. Anne-Marie la Bonnardière designed, directed, and edited this undertaking. Her work at the CNRS and the *Ecole pratique des hautes études* qualifies her eminently to produce an edition of the highest quality of scholarship in this area. In reality, the principal concentration of this unusual woman has always been on Augustinian research. Though the large majority of the articles in this volume are from her hand, she did collaborate with several other internationally-known Augustinian scholars such as the Belgian Albert Verwilghen and the Dutch Augustinian Luc Verheijen, whose work on the Rule of Augustine is known throughout the world.

Six major subjects are treated. The writers show the biblical work of Augustine in relation to liturgy, prayer, correspondence, preaching, the *City of God*, and the Bible as a mirror of Christian ethics.

In an initial chapter, the "Biblical Initiation of Augustine," Elisabeth Paoli-Lafaye recalls the reading by A. in 373 of the *Hortensius* of Cicero. This is, of course, written of in the *Confessions* (3, 4, 7) by Augustine himself. He shows that his initial efforts to plumb the depths of the Bible produced very little wisdom in him. His was a slow, spiritual advancement that led to the deeper and richer meanings of the "veiled mysteries" of Scripture.

A.'s earliest efforts at scriptural exegesis are revealed for examination in his sermons. These indicate that he normally summarized the particular event of the Gospel of which he was speaking. He did not analyze the text in the many ways this is done today: there was no literary analysis, no research in the context of the event, no study of the structure. Rather, Augustine, as well as other third- and fourth-century Fathers of the Church, sought how the factual event recorded by the Evangelists

had some literal, particular significance: What were its theological implications? What was its pastoral value? An example of this is given by B. in section 7 on the calming of the storm as recorded in the Synoptic Gospels.

The importance of A.'s exegesis of the Psalms has long been self-evident. But further in her section on prayer, B. states very succinctly: "Les Psaumes sont la nappe souterraine qui ne cesse d'irriguer la prière d'Augustin" (159). In the section "Bible et prière," Verheijen treats the subject of prayer in the Rule of Augustine. Much used by a great variety of monastic communities, the Rule declares: "When you pray God by psalms and hymns, let live in your heart what is formulated on your lips." Augustine's *Enarationes in psalmos* clarifies well this point in the Rule.

The discovery by Joannes Divjak of 29 letters of A. has raised the extant correspondence to 300 letters. Very few of these documents do not contain biblical allusions or citations. In fact, the object of many of these writings is to discuss a very particular biblical theme or subject. Since these letters are from the beginning of the fifth century and therefore before the Councils of Ephesus or of Chalcedon, fundamental questions are treated, such as who Jesus Christ is and the nature of the resurrection he promises. Many of these questions are of Porphyrian inspiration.

Madeleine Moreau treats *De doctrina christiana*. She shows that this work was not only destined as a guide to the early preachers of the Church's doctrine, but was a pedagogical masterpiece. It shows the presence of Scripture and its relationship to all the other works in the Augustinian corpus. The work manifests his profound use of Scripture as a preacher, theologian, polemicist, and spiritual counselor. It is this writing that develops a great deal of what is very much in vogue among literary critics today: the notions of tropes and signs.

According to B. in her essay on "The Bible in the City of God," A.'s primary note is one of prophecy. He is not addressing the Christians of the African Church, nor the followers of Mani, Donatus, Pelagius, or Julian of Eclanum. He writes rather for those who are faithful to Cicero, Varro, Porphyry, and others. He recounts for them the realizations and the prophecies of the OT and the coming of Jesus Christ, the one and universal way of salvation. This unique event is actualized from century after century by the Church, the City of God and the Body of Christ, which guarantees the realization of the eschatological prophecies that announce the growth of the City of God into the eternal Jerusalem. Many scriptural texts serve A. in this work that he neither cites nor comments on elsewhere.

A second characteristic of biblical documentation in the *City of God*

resides in its exegetical value. Many have remarked that this work was written at the summit of A.'s career. At this moment he has mastered his methods of exegesis and his inspirational sources. He has accepted the importance of the Hebrew writings, as well as the methods of St. Jerome, as shown in *Questions on Genesis* and the commentaries on Ecclesiasticus, Daniel, and Malachi. The *City of God* presents an exceptional scriptural exegete of Africa's fourth century.

B.'s treatment of "La cité terrestre d'après H. I. Marrou" is extremely good. All interested in A. know the key works of this man. Verwilghen's chapter dealing with "Jésus, source de l'humilité chrétienne" is well worth the reader's particular attention.

Excellent scholarship; typically flawless presentation by Beauchesne; eminently recommended for every level of Augustinian reader.

St. John Fisher College  
Rochester, N.Y.

WILLIAM C. MARCEAU, C.S.B.

**FLESH AS TRANSFORMATION SYMBOL IN THE THEOLOGY OF ANSELM OF CANTERBURY: HISTORICAL AND TRANSPERSONAL PERSPECTIVES.** By James Gollnick. Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin Mellen, 1985. Pp. 224. \$59.95.

It is rare that one finds so exemplary a work in historical theology as G.'s meticulous study, in all the writings of Anselm, of *caro*, *corpus*, and *concupiscentia*. In English all three of these terms designate "flesh." Directed by Herbert Richardson and Eugene Fairweather of the University of Toronto, G. shows sound judgment in handling the host of textual and interpretative problems which have beset Anselm scholarship during the last 50 years. Far from detracting from G.'s achievement, G.'s prudent following of his mentors' advice has assured this younger scholar at the University of Toronto a position of prominence shared by his senior colleagues in the task of recovering the historical Anselm.

G. places Anselm in his monastic and liturgical *Sitz im Leben* and sensitively reconstructs the thought of a contemplative who is so important a link in the movement of monastic theology towards the emergence of scholasticism. With great skill G. reviews the Barth-Gilson debate which colored Anselm studies for decades. He is thoroughly familiar with contemporary interpreters of Anselm: Toner, Lohmeyer, Rondet, Nédoncelle, Roques, and Evans. G. correctly judges that it is in the major studies of Anselm by Pouchet, Kohlenberger, and Hopkins that "flesh," so vital a theme for Anselm's theological system, has been overlooked. G.'s work corrects this oversight and in so doing luminously reveals Eucharist at the very core of Anselm's theological system.

The heart of G.'s work is his employment of "motif research," which goes beyond the methodology of McIntyre and Hopkins and develops

that of Pouchet and Kohlenberger. He accepts the value of what McIntyre and Hopkins have done to uncover a discursive level in Anselm's theological system. He also acknowledges what Pouchet and Kohlenberger have discovered as a motif level in Anselm's system. His contribution is to underscore the intellectual unity of these two levels. He shows how the two levels interpenetrate into a symbolic system which gives coherence and unity to the whole of Anselm's thought.

G. applies this extension of methodology in a careful word-study of *caro*, *corpus*, and *concupiscentia* based on the Schmitt critical edition of Anselm. The result is a limpid exposition of how the Eucharistic flesh of Christ transforms the flesh of humankind. Flesh is thus revealed as the basic common term within the unfolding of all salvation history, linking its events together as the history of the transformation of the flesh. Put another way, the transformation of human beings through the flesh moves from the originally righteous flesh through the corruption of the flesh at the fall of Adam to the restoration of justice to flesh from the flesh of Christ. G. shows how flesh has an important systematic function for Anselm in relating Christian doctrines to one another: God, creation, angels, free will, grace, original sin, Incarnation, virgin birth, redemption, and resurrection. Flesh was created with original justice. Flesh distinguished men from angels. Flesh joined all human beings to Adam. Flesh was corrupted in Adam. Flesh was assumed by the Second Person of the Blessed Trinity whereby Christ became our brother, though escaping its corruption in the Virgin Birth. Flesh permitted the God-man to offer his death as atonement for Adam's sin. Flesh was raised from death in Christ's resurrection. Human beings are incorporated into the glorious, risen condition of flesh through the sacraments, especially the Eucharist.

G.'s work is excellent.

Loyola-Marymount University, L.A.

HERBERT J. RYAN, S.J.

ARCHBISHOP JOHN STRATFORD: POLITICAL REVOLUTIONARY AND CHAMPION OF THE LIBERTIES OF THE ENGLISH CHURCH CA. 1275/80-1348. By Roy Martin Haines. *Studies and Texts* 76. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1986. Pp. xviii + 587. \$45.

Just as there is some confusion and uncertainty about Stratford's origins and family, who he was and where he fitted in, so there is ambiguity and ambivalence about the man, his career and achievements, and how he should be interpreted. The subtitle of this book makes a claim for one way of viewing him and his actions which differs from earlier and other perspectives. It is perhaps the view that S. himself hoped to leave for posterity.

After a solid early career as a legal counsel, S. was suddenly and

unexpectedly thrust into the limelight when nominated as bishop of Winchester by Pope John XXII in 1323. This precipitated criticism and a crisis in relations with the king until Edward II gave his consent. But even as bishop of Winchester, S. later admitted that his constant involvement in temporal affairs absorbed the greater part of his time. This grew into a greater problem when he became archbishop of Canterbury in 1333 while already serving as royal chancellor. Two tensions therefore marked his life and career: anxiety to assume and carry out ecclesiastical duties while the king's business left little time for him to do so. As primate, his relations with other bishops was often a source of difficulties as factions formed on both ecclesiastical policy and the relationship with events in England and especially with the king and his court. One view of S. as careerist would point to his advancement of family interests: a brother and a nephew became bishops. S. had an active role in the long crisis in England during the latter part of Edward II's reign, the king's conflicts with barons, his ultimate overthrow by Queen Isabella and Mortimer, the ousting of this faction and the accession of Edward III. He had to face the problems generated by Edward III's early ambitions and grandiose designs (which led to the Hundred Years' War) on one side and by the political and fiscal realities of England, Scotland, and France in those decades. It was a difficult time to be a prominent churchman, especially if one were (and most English churchmen were at this time) deeply and publicly involved in the political affairs of the day. A colleague, Bishop Stapeldon of Exeter, died at the hands of a lynch mob, while a predecessor at Canterbury had to flee for his life.

Haines gives explicit detail on S.'s participation in the major events of this critical era and attempts to evaluate and judge his complicity in some events and responsibility in others. I am not sure that any final judgement has been or can be achieved. How much of our view is colored by the prejudices and interests of the chroniclers? To what degree did S. try to exonerate himself from charges and influence the interpretation of the events in which he was more or less involved? How much did his opponents then (other bishops, the king) and later historians view S. from the perspective of a predetermined agenda? Clearly, S. liked to compare his career and treatment with that of his great predecessor, Thomas Becket; just as clearly, politics in England, the condition of the Avignon papacy, the economic situation, and the reality of church-state relations across Europe make such a comparison hazardous. Haines looks in summary at the interpretations given of his subject especially over the past century: lawyer-statesman, resister of papal provision abuses, friend of parliamentary government, a man from an age of meaner moral stature, self-seeker, upholder or leader of the Lancastrian party, always the friend of the king but not a timeserver, leader of opposition. S. in the end

appears as a man of talent who had received a good training and wanted a successful career; but was he not more than merely a careerist? What credit should he receive for the removal process of Edward II and for the defense of ecclesiastical liberty and parliamentary privilege against the demands of Edward III? This careful study of the man and his career has shed light on the possible answers to these questions.

*State University College  
Fredonia, N.Y.*

THOMÁS E. MORRISSEY

**THE LANGUAGE AND LOGIC OF THE BIBLE: THE ROAD TO REFORMATION.** By G. R. Evans. Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1985. Pp. xxiv + 192. \$32.50.

This volume is the second to be issued under the same title by the productive student of medieval exegesis and theology G. R. Evans. The first volume (1984) examined the topic through the end of the 12th century; its sequel samples scholarly study of the Bible in the late medieval centuries, with occasional dips into the Reformation, Protestant and Catholic, of the 16th century.

In both volumes E. demonstrates an impressive grasp of primary sources, but it is difficult, especially in the second volume, to define exactly what the book is about. It is not a history of exegesis; nor is it a summary of the debates over biblical authority. The work does, however, stand clearly in the tradition of her teacher Beryl Smalley, and the unusual title of the volumes provides an additional clue. E. is interested primarily in the language of the Bible and in the effects which the study of that language had upon the development of theological argument in the Late Middle Ages.

Hence readers of the second volume are advised not to spend much time on the first part, which deals with biblical authority, although E. acknowledges the nuances of *sola scriptura* and of the private judgment of Scripture for the Reformers. After reiterating, in Part 2, the importance of the literal sense for late-medieval exegesis, E. embarks on a technical discussion of the ways in which medieval grammar and logic were used to elucidate the text of Scripture. In Part 3 that discussion is expanded to cover textual criticism and translation by the humanists, commentaries and lectures on Scripture by the exegetes, the use of scriptural proofs by the logicians, and the shaping of sermons by the preachers. E.'s heart seems to be in these practical uses of grammar and logic, and the most useful material is contained in the longest chapter, entitled "Questions" (106-43), which covers the various ways in which logical terms and arguments were applied to Scripture.

The basis for much of that discussion is the *Logica* of John Wyclif,

E.'s favorite among the medieval authors, many of them English, whom she cites. The helpful biographical notes which she provides on some of these scholars are unfortunately limited to prominent figures alone. Her restricted use of secondary sources, while laudable in one regard, betrays a certain narrowness of perspective, especially on the study of the Bible in the Reformation. The 16th century is represented, for the most part, by Luther, Calvin, Melanchthon, and Bellarmine; but only Calvin is quoted extensively from his commentaries. Luther's *Table Talk* is more frequently cited than his exegesis, and the best studies on his hermeneutics are not mentioned.

As a result, the volume is, as E. realizes, only a pointer to the changes in biblical study that occurred in the 16th century. Her general conclusion on that subject is direct and insightful: "the essential difference between the sixteenth-century view and that of the late mediaeval centuries is the bringing together again of speculative theology and exegesis, which had become separated for purposes of study into two parallel tracks in the late twelfth century" (158-59). Luther and Calvin would not have used the word "speculative," but they would have agreed that their theology was essentially the exposition of Scripture. As a whole, E.'s book enables one to see how the tracks of exegesis and scholastic theology diverged in the Late Middle Ages, while it also supplies a close-up view of the ties that logic provided between the two. How those tracks converged again in the 16th century still awaits a deft and comprehensive treatment.

*Lutheran Theological Seminary, Phila.*

SCOTT H. HENDRIX

**LOLLARD THEMES IN THE REFORMATION THEOLOGY OF WILLIAM TYNDALE.** By Donald Dean Smeeton. *Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies* 6. Kirksville, Mo.: Sixteenth Century Journal Publishers, 1986. Pp. 285. \$30.

This is an important study for posing a reconsideration of some long-held ideas about Tyndale. Smeeton explores T.'s relation to Lollardy, a pre-Reformation English heresy which looked to John Wyclif as its *doctor evangelicus*. Lollardy was a protest movement against the Catholic Church that positively stressed the practice of virtues and the spiritual qualities of faith. It was more a set of attitudes than carefully-crafted doctrines.

Smeeton contends that the Lollard influence on T. has been downplayed. Traditionally, T. is seen as gaining his theological impetus from Luther or Erasmus. But closer study of T.'s underlying theological assumptions shows significant differences from Luther. S. contends that these assumptions have close connection to ideas of Lollards in the 15th



and early 16th centuries. To show this, he traces T.'s biography to show his potential for contact with Lollardy, as well as examining the major theological themes of his writings.

Smeeton argues that T. made his most creative theological contribution in the area of soteriology. Here he stood apart from Luther, Erasmus, and Zwingli. He also stood beyond the views of Wyclif and his followers. Unlike Luther, T. saw no conflict between the teachings of Paul and the Epistle of James on the issue of faith and works. Like the earlier Lollards, he appreciated the book of James and went on to stress in his soteriology that love and works flowed from a right understanding of salvation. T. also stressed the need for Christians to obey the law of God and broadened the idea of covenant to serve as a unifying force to tie together his views on election, faith, works, law, and promise. The covenant, also called "testament" or "appointment," had the effect of a contractual agreement where humans promise moral obedience and ethical behavior in response to the covenant promises of God. In this, along with his elaboration of the work of the Holy Spirit, T was a pioneer. Yet, says Smeeton, these points can be understood as "logical extensions of, not independence from, the dissenters in England before him. Tyndale's contribution was his ability to embrace the traditional criticism and to integrate it with the powerful forces of the Renaissance and the German Reformation."

Smeeton identifies five factors to show why it took 150 years of the Lollards' message before T.'s message began to be heard: the new height of English anticlericalism; the economic expansion of the sheep and cloth industry, which positively affected those to whom the Lollards appealed; the intellectual revolution, which began to produce a literate laity; the technological advance of the printing press and cheap paper for the spread of ideas; and the growth of English nationalism, with crown support for church reform to help pave the way for the new form of faith. These developments helped make T.'s message welcome in England.

As Smeeton points out, in his vocabulary and clarity of communication T. continued what he had begun through his Bible translation. He "spoke to the hearts of his readers, confirming the convinced and convicting the cautious. To use an analogy characteristic of Tyndale's language, one might say that what Wyclif planted, the Lollards tended, but the harvest awaited Tyndale's labor in the field." From Smeeton's fine volume we can see more clearly how the preparation and themes for T.'s labors had begun to develop in those who came before him.

*University of Dubuque Theological Seminary*    DONALD K. MCKIM

LOUIS WILLIAM DUBOURG: BISHOP OF LOUISIANA AND THE FLORIDAS, BISHOP OF MONTAUBAN, AND ARCHBISHOP OF BESANÇON, 1766-

1833. By Annabelle M. Melville. 2 vols. Chicago: Loyola University, 1986. Pp. xvi + 1065. \$34.96.

In the Roman Catholic Church in the United States in the early-nineteenth century, French émigrés played a disproportionately large role. Perhaps never have so few had such influence in shaping the institutional matrix and culture of the American Catholic community. Some became bishops: Ambrose Maréchal, Jean Lefebvre de Cheverus, Benedict Joseph Flaget, John Dubois, Louis William DuBourg; others, pre-eminently the Sulpicians, dominated seminary education; still others, such as Philippine Duchesne, introduced religious communities of men and women that would become major shapers of Catholic society in America.

Born in Saint-Domingue, where his family had made its fortune in coffee, D. was sent to Bordeaux at the age of three after the death of his mother. His classical studies eventually brought him to Saint-Sulpice in Paris, where he quickly fell under the influence of Jacques-André Emery, the superior general of the Society. Ordained in 1790, D. was put in charge of a boarding school at Issy, from which he was forced to flee in August 1792, five days before a raiding party murdered four of his seminarian instructors.

Spain was D.'s first refuge, but growing restrictions, due to the Spanish suspicion of heterodoxy among the French clergy, led to his impromptu decision to go to America. Within a year of his arrival at Baltimore in 1794, he was chosen president of Georgetown College. He immediately set out to make the three-year-old institution the best in the country. He broadened the curriculum, greatly increased the number of non-Catholic students, strengthened the faculty, but gradually alienated himself from the ex-Jesuits who controlled Georgetown. The directors found him too prodigal in his finances and too French-oriented in his selection of faculty. When they began to hedge his powers in, he resigned in 1798.

In Baltimore D. wasted no time in pursuing his educational dreams. St. Mary's College, which he founded in 1799, quickly outdistanced Georgetown in students and faculty and prestige. He also conceived the idea of beginning Mount St. Mary's Seminary and College in the Monocacy valley of Maryland. He was also involved in the formation of Mother Seton's community and served as its first superior. But, as Melville notes, for all of D.'s vision in promoting the Church's mission in America and his magnetism in attracting persons to pursue it, his temperament made him a poor collaborator. Mother Seton and the Sulpicians knew that all too well in Maryland; Joseph Rosati and others later experienced it in Louisiana. Moreover, wherever D. went, he left behind a trail of debts, a monument to grand plans half realized. Baltimore was no exception,

where Jefferson's embargo and the subsequent War of 1812 produced a financial crisis for the overextended resources of St. Mary's.

By that time D. was in New Orleans, first as administrator and then bishop (1815). Creole Catholicism with its supple morality and virulent trusteeism was an alien world to him. Moreover, he had the responsibility of implementing the new separation of church and state that followed the acquisition of Louisiana by the United States. Within a few months D. was insisting to Carroll that "I am not the man capable of bearing such a burthen" (291). When he suspended a priest for living openly with a woman, the city rose in protest. D. compromised, but continuing difficulties persuaded him to locate his seat up the Mississippi in St. Louis (his see was the largest in the history of the U.S., embracing not only the entire Louisiana Territory, but also Illinois and Mississippi).

St. Louis, a frontier town, proved much better ground for D.'s missionary aspirations. A European trip in 1815 secured both missionaries and funds. The Vincentians agreed to send priests and seminarians for a seminary in the Barrens. In Paris D. persuaded Philippine Duchesne to lead a group of Religious of the Sacred Heart to begin a school in Florissant. His fundraising in France was a factor in the beginning of the Society for the Propagation of the Faith. To evangelize the Indians on the Missouri and the Upper Mississippi, he secured funds from the government and Belgian missionaries from the Society of Jesus. The Jesuits, most eminently Pierre De Smet, not only carried the gospel to the Indians but took over the college which DeBourg had begun in St. Louis.

In 1823 D. once again attempted to make New Orleans his permanent residence. Within three years he resigned his see. Persistent problems over the rights of trustees, a sagging economy which made impossible the institutional expansion D. thrived on, and the mortification of commissioning as fundraiser for the diocese and grooming as his successor an Italian immigrant who turned out to be a rogue, all convinced him that he had lost the respect of his clergy and people.

Within the year Charles X named him bishop of Montauban. It was a second wind for his episcopal career. For the next six years he energetically reorganized and revitalized the diocese through the reform of clerical education and the promotion of missions. Although Montauban was a center of Bourbon loyalty, D. himself artfully made his peace with the Orleanist regime after the July Revolution of 1830. He was much more sensitive to the prerogatives of even a constitutional monarch than he was to those of laity and clergy in a free church in a free society. His reward was the archdiocese of Besançon in 1833.

Melville, who previously has written biographies of John Carroll,

Elizabeth Ann Seton, and Cheverus, spent the last decade reconstructing D.'s life and times over two continents. Despite the loss of D.'s episcopal papers in New Orleans (apparently during the Civil War), she has woven a meticulous, revealing account of this man who may well have had the most influence of all that remarkable generation of French émigrés.

*Georgetown University*

ROBERT EMMETT CURRAN, S.J.

**THE CUNNING OF MODERN RELIGIOUS THOUGHT.** By David S. Pacini. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987. Pp. x + 165.

Although the title of his book plays on a Hegelian image, Pacini eschews the famous allusion to historical purposiveness in the pursuit of rational ends, understanding the "cunning" of modern religious thought instead as what he takes to be the ironic circumstance of modern and supposedly "secular" thought's resting on assumptions that are distinctively and even classically religious. In the course of this volume's five essays, which P. sees not as the organic presentation of a developing argument but as the insistent reiteration of his thesis from several angles, he avers that what is "radical in modern Western thought . . . is not so much its opposition to Christianity and religion as its use of a religious frame of reference to undermine one tradition in favor of another—even if the other tradition did not enjoy immediate acknowledgment" (58).

P. locates this unacknowledged frame of reference in the classical notion of self-preservation, a concept which achieved philosophical coherence in the Stoic doctrine of *oikeiōsis*, a relational understanding of the self's situation in the world defined by the reality of consciousness and its abiding concern for self-maintenance in the face of social and natural forces. The concept of self-preservation, P. asserts, was imbued with religious meaning by Augustine in his theoretical examination of self-awareness (56), and in its modern form this "Augustinianism" presided over the destruction of Thomistic metaphysics and the support it lent to the sociopolitical order of the late-medieval period. In this way the concept of self-preservation, put to the service of a religious vision of reality, defined the intellectual assumptions of the modern age.

P. understands "the modern," and unconsciously religious, tradition to be defined by the political philosophy of liberalism. The various forms of social-contract theory, especially in the work of Hobbes, Rousseau, and Kant, made much of the category of self-preservation, first as an instinctual drive and gradually as a rational inclination that served as the personal grounding for a modern doctrine of individual rights. It is the influence of the category of self-preservation on the modern notion of the individual in society that P. sees as definitive of the religious propensities of modern thought.

Although religious in its basis, modern thought has been lured from its original principles not only by its forgetfulness of its foundations but also by its distortion of the essential conception of self-preservation in both its classical and modern forms. The rise of what P. calls the narcissistic self and its theological expression in nationalistic civil religion forsook the legitimate responsibility of the individual to the social order and celebrated egoism to the point of its own unwarranted aggrandizement and concomitant selfish exhaustion. P. commends a remembrance of the traditional orientation of the individual toward wider social concerns in the project of political liberalism. He expects that a rehabilitation of the legitimately modern and classically Augustinian appreciation for the virtue of self-preservation will lead to an ordered community in which the authenticity of individual rights is informed by the social sensitivities of a cultural theology rightly suspicious of the egoistic pretensions of the modern self.

While there are some respects in which P.'s thesis is interesting, persistent ambiguities in the categories he employs and in the logical connections between them prevent the success of his book. Most deficient is P.'s ascription of a religious aura to the concept of self-preservation. He justifies the religiosity of this notion exclusively by an unacknowledged comparison between this Stoic category and Otto's characterization of religious experience as *mysterium tremendum et fascinans*. He maintains that the "otherness of self-preservation is wholly other—not as an external transcendent being but as an internal force that is different from the individual" (5). Implicit in P.'s argument is the hopeful assumption that the dialectical encounter with the "otherness" of self-preservation in the modern age carries with it the possibility of its recognizing its authentic religiosity. In this respect self-preservation is a salvational principle, a "means for overcoming alienated history . . . by which humans are transformed into communities" (6) and reminiscent of Otto's phenomenology of religious reconciliation. The passages quoted here represent virtually the only formal, and obviously scant, efforts on the part of the author to validate the religious grounding of the controlling principle of his book. For these reasons alone the reviewer must judge P.'s thesis to be reductionistic in the extreme.

Also worthy of mention is P.'s curious attempt to justify the historical mediation of this "religious" principle to the modern age via Augustine. Even if one assumes that the Stoic notion of self-preservation can be correctly described as religious in character, one would be hard pressed to claim, as does P., that this category constitutes the essential framework of Augustine's thought—a claim asserted in less than two pages of his text and without any scholarly justification. Having made this claim, P. accounts for the lines of influence from Augustine to the modern period

in terms that are dizzyingly simplistic. The classical theological outlook informing modern rights theories, P. states, "recapitulates an Augustinian-inspired faith; Grotius, Hobbes, Locke, and Rousseau acquired it through the partial taint of Calvinism, Marx through the religious sentiments of Moses Hess, and Leo [XIII] through its persistent echoes in the corridors of Catholicism" (81).

Finally, mention must be made of the odd blending of historical detail and applicative generalization in this book. Though he avoids the careful study of Augustine that his argument demands, P. attends to historical and intellectual detail in the work of thinkers like Hobbes, Rousseau, and Kant with perspicuity and clarity. The constructive application of this spadework, however, is often made with less care, perhaps because, as already noted, the categories integral to this application are basically flawed. This is particularly in evidence in the last long essay, "Metamorphosing Narcissus' Mirror," which makes up the final third of the book. Here P. explores the postmodern betrayal of the social conscience implicit in classical and modern conceptions of individuality and urges the contemporary recovery of modern thought's authentic religious spirit. His analysis is hampered, however, by the employment of a strangely stylized and always ambiguous taxonomy which turns its attention alternately to different modern concrescences of the myth of Narcissus. As the reader is presented with vague representations of intellectual stances bearing the labels "autonomous Narcissus" (inheritors of the Enlightenment project of freedom), "Narcissus of illusionless reality" (Nietzsche), and "Narcissus of civic accommodation" (Freud), measured scholarly judgment is lost in a diagnostic blur in which metaphor becomes a substitute for careful distinction, and the many subtleties of modern thought part of a vision too unfocused to lend itself to critical assessment.

*Fairfield University, Conn.*

JOHN E. THIEL

**THE PATIENT AS PARTNER: A THEORY OF HUMAN-EXPERIMENTATION ETHICS.** By Robert M. Veatch. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University, 1987. Pp. xiv + 241. \$27.50.

Nazi wartime experimentation on concentration-camp prisoners and later American medical-research excesses at Tuskegee, the Jewish Chronic Disease Hospital, Willowbrook, and elsewhere resulted in an aroused public opinion and eventually led to governmental regulation and the beginnings of internal professional reform of research procedures. The consequence in recent years has been a major shift away from excluding the research subject from the decision-making process toward a greater recognition of the dignity and rights of the research subject.

From being thought of as merely "research material," individuals at long last were being dealt with as true partners in the research enterprise.

This new shift means that it is no longer thought sufficient to ask whether in the opinion of the researcher the benefits of the proposed research outweigh the anticipated risks; the new questions include the manner of recruiting research subjects, the participation of the research subject in project design, concern about the kinds of information the research subject needs or wants to know so as to give adequate consent, the role and make-up of the Institutional Review Boards (IRBs), and the confidentiality to be maintained throughout the entire project and afterwards.

V. is particularly well qualified to discuss these and related issues surrounding human experimentation. Currently professor of medical ethics at the Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University, V. has for several decades been intimately involved in developing an "ethics of research," as well as having been a participant in extensive clinical and IRB activities. Although written over a 12-year period (three chapters are entirely new, while 16 are slightly edited versions of articles published between 1971-83), *The Patient as Partner* is in no way dated and offers an expert analysis of both theory and practice.

V. examines the three principles of beneficence, autonomy (self-determination), and justice and their interrelationship in a research setting; he points out the inadequacies of the beneficence principle standing alone, as well as the dangers of the social-benefit or consequentialist approach so widely invoked to justify much medical research. Autonomy balanced by justice constitutes for V. the fundamental principles. Along the way V. offers perceptive discussions of the government's role in regulating the medical decisions of citizens as well as its obligation to restrain overly-zealous researchers; the special care needed when dealing with disadvantaged groups (children, the mentally incompetent, prisoners, fetuses, and clinic populations); how best to determine what the "reasonable person" would want to be told in consenting to be a research subject; and the protection of privacy in the use of research records. Theory is brought down to earth in critiques of case studies involving "experimental pregnancies," contraceptive research on teen-agers, research on brain-dead children, cancer chemotherapy, and radiation research.

The "patient as partner" approach will not, V. acknowledges, do away with all problems nor solve all ethical dilemmas. But surely such an approach, if implemented as V. suggests, will make research less dehumanizing and manipulative than it has so often been in the past; it will no longer be research on human objects but research for and with human

subjects. Current concern for AIDS victims is once again highlighting the human-experimentation issue as still-experimental drugs are being sought after as a "last chance" for the desperate victims. One hopes that the wisdom found in V.'s book will guide those caught up in this drama, researchers and victims alike.

*King's College, Wilkes-Barre, Pa.*

JAMES J. DOYLE, C.S.C.

**BY NO EXTRAORDINARY MEANS: THE CHOICE TO FORGO LIFE-SUSTAINING FOOD AND WATER.** Edited by Joanne Lynn, M.D. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University, 1986. Pp. xiv + 272. \$25.

In the introduction to this collection of 27 essays on the appropriateness of withholding and withdrawing artificially-administered nutritional and hydrational support, Lynn states that the aim of the text is to collect the best of current thought, offer reflections on previously unpublished aspects of the issue, provide authoritative source material for consideration, and offer guidance to those in decision-making roles. Judged against its own criteria, L. presents a valuable text dealing with a difficult issue. The essays offered are technical enough to keep the interest of the professional, though always readable. The text is not, as one might expect, a collection of pro and con articles arguing both sides of the issue, leaving the reader to sort out a position. There is a thorough discussion of the question of whether or not nutritional and hydrational support ought to be considered as medical intervention. Further, the implications of each position presented, both for the immediate present and for the future, for particular cases as well as within the context of general policy, are clearly articulated. The result is not a position paper but an integrated and balanced presentation for consideration and insights for decision-making.

L. divides the essays into five sections, the first having to do with the issue of nutritional and hydrational support itself. This section sets the legal and medical parameters of the discussion within the proper context, thus offering a solid foundation for what follows. The second section is an attempt to offer an ethical response to the issue. It is here that I will comment most specifically. The section begins, appropriately, with a reprint of the 1983 Lynn and Childress article that has become almost a standard text on the subject. Perhaps the best essay of this section is offered by Childress. Framing his discussion on benefit and autonomy, he offers valuable insights toward understanding the value of such life-support relative to the person in need. He gives a critique of what he calls "sentimental utilitarianism," which makes the sentimental or symbolic meaning of feeding, a powerful factor in this discussion, the predominant ethical category. This has the effect of nourishing the symbol,



sometimes even at the expense of the person. Instead, he suggests that "the physician may have an obligation to a patient to care for him or her, but the content of that obligation of care should be shaped by the patient's needs and preferences." Carson's following essay on the symbolic significance of feeding complements Childress' reflections.

After that, however, it is downhill. Bayer's presentation of the Catholic perspective is disappointing. Beginning with his own syllabus of errors against which the Church must speak, he presents an essay which is at the same time doctrinaire in presentation and ambivalent in some of its conclusions. He argues that for treatment to be the benefit of which Childress spoke so well, it must not merely prolong life but prolong it "substantially." Such a definition of benefit is too narrow within the Catholic tradition. Häring (1973) has written that we miss the point if we see time as a necessary complement to life. Bayer makes no reference to Kelly's (1951) notion that benefit must be "remedial," nor to McFadden's (1954) understanding of medical intervention as a temporary procedure intended to bring about a benefit which is "enjoyable" for a prolonged period of time. Also missing is reference to a "proportionate benefit" as articulated in the *Declaration on Euthanasia* (1980). Clearly, the amount of time a person's life may be prolonged is not the absolute factor in deciding the appropriateness of withholding or withdrawing medical treatment within the Catholic tradition.

The weakness of this essay is particularly unfortunate in view of the fact that the paradigm of the book, *In re Conroy*, involves a Roman Catholic, as have many other difficult and highly publicized cases involving life-sustaining treatment. As a result, this perspective has played an important role in the formation of public policy, and needs to be understood for an appreciation of possible ethical resolutions.

The section continues with an interesting, though not especially helpful, essay from the Jewish perspective, and an unpersuasive essay opposing withholding and withdrawal. The final essay by Brock, however, is well done, giving a presentation of the confusion of language and issues such as killing/allowing to die, cause of death, and ordinary/extraordinary, which often accompanies discussions on this topic.

The third section, though brief, gives a presentation of the legal implications involved in this issue, illustrating the role the courts have played. The fourth section deals with such special considerations as the care of the elderly and newborns, questions of competency, and issues surrounding the care-giver. This section is especially insightful. Particularly interesting are Cranford's reflections on the nature of nourishing. Meilaender offers here the best opposing view in the work.

The final section, a study of *In re Conroy*, provides an excellent reflection on the merits and detractions of this case from the legal,

ethical, and procedural point of view. This section balances the brevity of the legal discussion in section 3, and will certainly add to one's respect for the delicate role of the law in facilitating such difficult decisions.

In all, L. has put together a well-integrated collection of readable and insightful essays on a difficult and sobering topic. Anyone interested in pursuing the question of nutritional and hydrational life-support will find the text a valuable resource.

*University of Massachusetts, Amherst*

JOHN TUOHEY

**DYNAMICS IN PASTORING.** By Jacob Firet. Translated from the 1982 Dutch edition by John Vriend. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1986. Pp. xiv + 319. \$24.95.

This is a welcome translation of a standard text which gives U.S. readers a glimpse of pastoral theology done in European style. This means, first of all, that the discipline is called practical theology (in a different sense from the recent use of that term by North American theologians), and its task and legitimacy as a theological discipline are established at the outset rather than being presumed.

What follows is a careful, erudite, demanding exposition of the pastoral role. This type of writing is rarely found among U.S. pastoral theologians (Thomas Oden's *Pastoral Theology* is a recent exception). F.'s understanding of the pastoral role is deeply rooted in the Word of God, which makes its appearance and works its effect through the pastor. The exposition of this theology is rich, captivating, and at times mystical.

F. selects three modes of pastoral activity to develop his theology: kerygma, didache, and paraklesis. Each is expounded in a thorough and insightful way. "This one process takes place in three modes: in other words, three 'measures' define the field of pastoral role-fulfillment: kerygma, didache, and paraklesis. In the kerygma the word occurs as proclamation of the Kingdom of God: salvation is presented in the here-and-now, the 'dubiousness' (German *Fragwürdigkeit*) of the person to whom the proclamation comes is overcome, he becomes the person he is intended to be, and he receives new life. In the didache the word occurs as the voice which points out the way, and the person called to the Kingdom is guided on the way of the new life and initiated into discipleship. In the paraklesis the word occurs as personal address with a view to the contingent situation—the 'now-and-thusness' of a person—to lead him out of sin and suffering, to orient his life to salvation, to help him to assume his place in the circle of the Kingdom and the church which is called to manifest that Kingdom" (82).

When he turns his attention to the dynamics of the pastoral role, F. comes to the heart of his contribution. Actually there are three dynamic

moments in pastoring: the hermeneutic, the agogic, and the spiritual. F. concentrates on the agogic, a quaint term which points to a change-oriented force that arises between adults and is inherent in God's coming to people in the Word. From this perspective F. spends most of the book describing the mysterious dynamics which occur when one adult in a pastoral role tries to nurture another adult (equihuman address) through the medium of God's coming in the Word.

Among U.S. pastoral theologians this dynamic process is usually articulated with the help of developmental psychologists and illustrated with plenty of case material (e.g., Donald Capps). Occasionally the insights of process philosophy are used for the same purpose (e.g., Gordon Jackson). Readers familiar with such approaches will track F. with profit, hearing the same insights expressed in more explicit religious vocabulary than U.S. authors are accustomed to using.

The end result is more of a variation on a theme than a new composition. The novel terms (agogic, equihuman, paraklesis) are not likely to replace or clarify the pastoral jargon of the U.S., but the overall vision and value which F. offers reaffirm the pastoral consensus in this country. More than that, he helps a reader see the deeper, inherent theological meaning of that consensus. Most of all, he manages to let God make an appearance through the words.

This is not a book for casual reading by overworked pastoral ministers. It could be a textbook if pastoral theology were taught in academic fashion in the U.S. It is a valuable resource for pastoral theologians who want to assess their work in a fresh but compatible way. It is a useful rebuttal to those who think there is no theology in pastoral theology and no substance in the dynamics of pastoring.

*Washington Theological Union*

ROBERT L. KINAST

**CHURCHES IN STRUGGLE: LIBERATION THEOLOGIES AND SOCIAL CHANGE IN NORTH AMERICA.** Edited by William K. Tabb. New York: Monthly Review, 1986. Pp. xix + 331. \$11.

Tabb is a professor of political economy, based in New York City, and with broad experience as a consultant and social analyst for Protestant and Catholic organizations and communities throughout the nation. At a time when so much attention has been focused on the somewhat tardy entrance of conservative churches into the political arena, he has brought together an excellent collection of studies analyzing the increasingly important political force of the progressive churches or the religious left. His preferred term for the reflections of the latter group is "transformative theologies," but he acknowledges that "liberation theology" is now so generally accepted that he will employ that designation in the book.

At any rate, both of these terms "encompass all those theologies that have in common a commitment to do justice and transform social reality as a fulfilment of the biblical message." An acknowledged goal of the work is to stimulate a dialogue between the progressive religious community and the secular left, since at the present juncture of U.S. history both sides have much to gain from such an exchange. T. goes even further with the intriguing assertion that liberation theology's vision of Christianity, and not communism, is the specter that now haunts the principalities and powers of the modern world.

The book is divided into five sections, which works well even though there is considerable overlap in the material. The first part, on the theologies of liberation (Latin American, black, feminist, and Jewish), includes articles by such well-known authors as Robert McAfee Brown, Rosemary Ruether, James Cone, and Elisabeth Schüssler-Fiorenza. The North American churches and their indigenous theology of liberation, as well as conservative resistance to it, comprise the second section, with articles by Beverly Harrison, Gregory Baum, and Normal Gottwald among others. Part 3, on the relation of Marxism and religion, includes the familiar names of Phillip Berryman, Dorothee Sölle, Paul Sweezy, and Cornel West. The fourth section (on theology rooted in community) and the fifth (on political activism and the mission of the Church) include the writings of Tabb himself, Gayraud Wilmore, and Sheila Collins.

It would be an impossible task to summarize the 26 articles, but mention of some of the ideas that impressed me may be helpful in understanding the general approach of the book. T.'s own contribution is concerned with the recent pastoral of the U.S. Catholic bishops on the economy and bears the stimulating title "The Shoulds and the Excluded Whys," with the bishops providing the "shoulds," yet failing to uncover the "whys." Thus, T.'s sympathetic but blunt critique points out that the bishops do not challenge the structural evils which are in such sharp contrast to their social principles, because they never ask *why* things are the way they are (causal systemic analysis) and therefore never address the key question of what economic system would allow their principles to be put into practice. Thus, T. believes, their critique and goals are admirable, while the methods for achieving the goals are totally inadequate.

Another interesting essay, by Baum, discusses the contradictory stances in the Catholic Church today which result from excessive preoccupation with a logic of maintenance, which then overwhelms the logic of mission or purpose, distorting the normal organizational dialectic. Ruether rightly points out that in liberation theology Marxism is at best a subsidiary tool of social analysis and that this theology "in recent years

has tended to use fewer and fewer of the catchwords of European Marxism in favor of a critical language drawn from the prophetic tradition of the Bible and from Latin America's own historical experience." Harrison's tantalizingly brief essay on a new theological ethic calls for a hermeneutic of radical justice as the precondition for such an ethic. Since Christian theologians who claim to challenge cultural myths have not achieved a genuinely critical stance toward economic interests, she continues, economic justice must be at the center of the agenda for the Christian moral imagination. In a similar vein, West finds hope in the progressive potential of religion "in that religious impulses are one of the few resources for a moral and political commitment beyond the self in the capitalist culture of consumption."

Finally, in only a few places has attention been given in this volume to the *positive* contribution liberation theology can make to Marxist and socialist praxis. For example, the psychiatrist Joel Kovel points to the deficiency of Marxism regarding the spiritual dimension of life—the esthetic, the tragic, the moral, the sacred—and calls upon liberation theology to fill this void. But in general the book is sadly lacking in creative ideas along this line, which I would consider to be an absolutely crucial element of any fruitful dialogue in the future. I would hope that another collection could respond to this need in the not too distant future.

Fordham University

ALFRED T. HENNELLY, S.J.

**THEOLOGY AND RELIGIOUS PLURALISM: THE CHALLENGE OF OTHER RELIGIONS.** By Gavin D'Costa. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986. Pp. 155. \$39.95.

*Theology and Religious Pluralism* is a worthwhile addition to the growing body of literature seeking to describe the possibilities of the relationship between Christianity and other religions. Its strength lies first of all in D'C.'s decision to organize his treatment of the many current opinions on this topic by focusing on important figures representative of three main "camps" in the debate: John Hick represents the pluralist paradigm ("other religions are equally salvific paths to the one God"); Hendrik Kraemer, the exclusivist paradigm ("other religions are marked by humankind's fundamental sinfulness and are therefore erroneous"); and Karl Rahner, the inclusivist paradigm, which "affirms the salvific presence of God in non-Christian religions while still maintaining that Christ is the definitive and authoritative revelation of God." D'C. ably places the three in context, presents their major arguments, and then offers a careful and critical evaluation of each, making many sensible

and perceptive observations which reveal how well he has thought these matters through. While noting strengths and shortcomings in all three, he favors Rahner's position as best holding together two basic axioms: God wills universal salvation, and salvation is "through God in Christ in his Church." In a final chapter D'C. turns to the practical implications of the inclusivist paradigm and distinguishes issues pertaining to "dialogue between people" (person to person) from those pertaining to "institutional dialogue" (between official representatives of different faith communities); he offers observations (based in part on personal experience) on the qualities and methods of both. The book thus commendably and succinctly achieves its goals and is a good place to begin for anyone wishing to understand the essentials of the current debate.

Because this is such a worthy book, however, I wish to raise some further questions. In my view, the book would have been more interesting if D'C. had reflected on the nature of the project which his book exemplifies, the somewhat abstract, potentially endless debate about what the (generic) "non-Christian religions" can mean for Christians. This debate remains in many ways an exercise within the confines of the Christian tradition, by and for Christian thinkers, and it almost always spells itself out according to some variation on the same three paradigms described in the book; the "inclusivist" paradigm then often looks more reasonable, even if simply as a kind of compromise between two extremes. Although it is unquestionable that our attitude toward non-Christians and non-Christian religions must grow out of our understanding of Christian revelation—and therefore has a necessarily *a priori* element—can we really decide what Hinduism and Buddhism might mean for us before a Hindu or Buddhist is allowed to speak (and neither does in this kind of book)? One might argue, too, that the question of "theology and religious pluralism" should be differentiated into questions of many particular encounters, which should be evaluated according to the specific nature and history of the encountering partners. Regarding Hinduism, e.g., a visit to a South Indian village where goddesses are worshiped surely raises very different questions than does the study of nondualist Vedantic texts or a reading of the autobiography of Gandhi—and it does not seem to me that such differences are merely incidental to theological reflection. Finally, one might usefully call into question the presupposition that the word "religions" identifies discrete, objective realities—"Hinduism," "Buddhism," "Christianity"—which are to be related in one of several fashions. "Religion" is perhaps a reification rooted in certain developments in European intellectual history, one which does not sit easily even with the Christian community's own self-understanding, and one which neglects how the vast multilevel (economic, political, cultural) interaction of people of different faiths in today's world presents us with

a richer and more complex reality than that of "multiple religions." Here, too, some attention to how people of other cultures have dealt with "pluralism" in their own religious discourses would make clearer what exactly books like this are doing and not doing. D'C. raises some of these points at least when considering the pluralist paradigm, but does not, in my view, give sufficient attention to how they affect not simply the strengths of one or another position but also the very procedure of articulating and evaluating the positions.

In any case, I raise these questions only because D'C. so ably handles his material and thereby stimulates such further reflection.

*Boston College*

FRANCIS X. CLOONEY, S.J.

## SHORTER NOTICES

**THE BIBLICAL HERITAGE IN MODERN CATHOLIC SCHOLARSHIP.** Edited by John J. Collins and John Dominic Crossan. Wilmington, Del.: Michael Glazier, 1986. Pp. 264. \$12.95.

**THE PATH OF WISDOM: BIBLICAL INVESTIGATIONS.** By Bruce Vawter, C.M. Wilmington, Del.: Michael Glazier, 1986. Pp. 326. \$12.95.

At his death on Dec. 1, 1986, in the initial months of a retirement which promised further significant publications, Vawter was a major figure in the world of biblical scholarship. Also, from the early stages of the biblical renewal within Catholicism until his death, through his extensive publications and innumerable lectures and workshops, he was a leader in the effort to mediate to clergy and laity of all denominations both the renewed importance of Scripture, emerging from Vatican II, and insights of technical biblical scholarship. These two volumes, published shortly before his death, are now a tribute to his life and accomplishments.

*The Biblical Heritage*, presented to Vawter on his 65th birthday, collects ten essays by leading scholars on the principal directions in biblical scholarship over the last quarter century. While in the general format of "surveys

of research," the essays are not simply catalogs of books and movements but creative engagement with the most important aspects of biblical research, with hints of a future agenda. After an especially interesting essay on OT theology (J. J. Collins) follow essays on Pentateuchal study (by the late D. McCarthy), on the prophets (C. Stuhlmueller), the Writings (R. Murphy), the Synoptic Gospels (D. Harrington), Pauline literature (R. Karris), and Johannine literature (P. Perkins). An exception to the style and content adopted in the other essays is Crossan's "Jesus and the Gospel," which continues his earlier work on the aphorisms of Jesus. The book concludes with a lively survey, "Catholic Biblical Scholarship 1955-1980," by J. L. McKenzie, and with a challenging and appreciative look at this scholarship from a Protestant perspective (W. Harrelson).

*The Path of Wisdom* presents the best tribute to a scholar—a collection of Vawter's own principal articles over the past three decades. In our present context of overspecialized and often narrow interests, the range of topics (OT, NT, biblical theology) and the care with which important issues are studied are a model of scholarship in

service of a community of believers. Among the 20 studies, especially noteworthy are "The Bible in the Roman Catholic Church," "Prophecy and the Redactional Question," "Prov. 8:22: Wisdom and Creation," "Intimations of Immortality in the Old Testament," "Are the Gospels Anti-Semitic?" and "Divorce and the New Testament." Since these essays were originally published in a wide variety of journals and monographs, this collection is especially welcome and should be part of every library. It is also indispensable for anyone who wants to engage biblical scholarship at its best and who wants to chart the course of scholarship over the past 30 years. For many topics of perennial importance to both exegesis and church life, no better starting point can be found than this collection. Unfortunately, neither work contains a complete bibliography of Vawter's works.

JOHN R. DONAHUE, SJ.  
*Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley*

THE INTERNATIONAL STANDARD BIBLE ENCYCLOPEDIA 3: K-P. Edited by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1986. Pp. xix + 1060. \$37.50.

The first two volumes of this "fully revised, illustrated" third edition of a renowned biblical dictionary have already been reviewed (see *TS* 42 [1981] 135-36; 44 [1983] 168-69). All the good things that were said about *ISBE* in those reviews have to be repeated here. The thrust of the interpretation of biblical *realia*, names, terms, and topics remains the same, viz., that of an evangelical conservatism that holds in esteem a "high level of biblical scholarship." The emphasis is clearly that of the Reformed Church tradition, with its accent on biblical data rather than on tradition. Important articles of considerable length in this volume are devoted to "Keys, Power of the" (by the editor, G. W. Bromiley), "Law in the

OT" (by R. K. Harrison), "Law in the NT" (by J. H. Gerstner), "Lord's Supper" (by R. S. Wallace), "Luke, Gospel according to" (by E. E. Ellis), "Mark, Gospel according to" (by R. P. Martin), "Matthew, Gospel according to" (by D. A. Hagner), "Palestine" (by W. S. LaSor), "Paul the Apostle" (by F. F. Bruce), "Pentateuch" (by E. E. Carpenter), "Person of Christ" (by C. Brown), "Peter" (by R. P. Martin), "Priests and Levites" (by W. O. McCready), "Psalms" (by N. H. Ridderbos and P. C. Craigie), and "Pseudepigrapha" (by G. E. Ladd). There are, of course, many other important articles; those mentioned reveal that not all articles have been written by biblical scholars, but many are contributions of systemic theologians and archeologists. Catholic users of *ISBE* will have to tolerate the pointed references at times to Catholic interpretations—or what are alleged to be such. The volume contains much information that is reliable and informative for the study of the Bible.

JOSEPH A. FITZMYER, S.J.  
*Catholic University of America*

THE HEBREW BIBLE IN LITERARY CRITICISM. Compiled and edited by Alex Preminger and Edward L. Greenstein. New York: Ungar, 1986. Pp. 619. \$65.

The editors have consciously tried to gather as wide a spectrum of literary comments on various aspects of the Hebrew Bible (including the deuterocanonical books of the Greek canon) as they could. Because it is usually much more difficult to get hold of the older sources than contemporary ones, they have stressed excerpts from early Jewish and Christian writers wherever possible. They have also attempted to provide a broad cross section of selections from languages other than English, so that many excerpts appear in English for the first time in this volume. The nature of the materials ranges across what we would today call literary ap-



preciation of biblical texts, rhetorical criticism, and formal literary analysis. It is not concerned with historical-critical methodologies.

The volume is divided into four parts that reflect the major concerns of literary approaches. Part 1 deals with general appreciation of the Bible as literature among world literatures and the history of translation as a literary art. Part 2 treats specific literary conventions and features, including prosody, word play, repetition, humor, meter, diction, parallelism, and plot. Some topics receive four or five comments, others ten or more, depending on how much reflection has gone on through the centuries. A category such as "rhetoric" has been discussed since Roman times, while "point of view" has come into its own only recently. Part 3 gathers literary analyses of significant individual passages in the Scriptures. This section takes up about 60% of the collection and, of course, puts all the literary theories to the test in concrete examples. Part 4 is a short appendix containing similar remarks on passages from the deuterocanonical books. The volume ends with an index of all the authorities cited.

Its strength is its comprehensiveness; there is no collection quite like it available today. Its weakness is that it accepts whatever is available on each topic, so that there is real unevenness in the quality and value of the contributions. A thorough scanning of the entire collection will nevertheless help readers of the Bible gain a much richer appreciation of the Bible's literary treasure that has so often been overlooked in search of its "message."

LAWRENCE BOADT, C.S.P.

*Washington Theological Union, Md.*

**THEOLOGY OF THE PSALMS.** By Hans-Joachim Kraus. Translated by Keith Crim. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1986. Pp. 235. \$24.95.

Kraus needs no introduction to stu-

dents of Psalms. He has demonstrated mastery of the form and tradition criticism of the Psalter in his widely read two-volume commentary in BK (first ed. 1961). His *Worship in Israel: A Cultic History of the OT* (first German ed. 1962) has defined the major questions for a generation. This volume (German ed. 1979) develops the commentary's 16-page "theology of the Psalms" and discussions of the *Ziel* of each psalm.

K.'s starting point is the well-known statement of Gerhard von Rad that, whereas the Hexateuch and Deuteronomist (and Chronicler) preserve the traditions surrounding the two great interventions of God for Israel (how Israel became the people of Yahweh and the choice of David and his throne), the Psalms preserve Israel's response to God. K. qualifies von Rad by emphasizing divine initiative: the Psalms are not a human work alone but are as fully theological as the other complexes of tradition in that the subject matter is both God and Israel. The table of contents flows from this starting point: the God of Israel; the people of God; the sanctuary and its worship (showing the emphasis K. puts on the place Jerusalem); the king; the enemy powers; the individual in the presence of God (really a theological anthropology); the Psalms in the NT. K. is careful to avoid writing a history of the religion of the Psalter or explaining the world of the Psalmists simply by referring to other biblical and Ancient Near Eastern data. He avoids also what he terms Gunkel's error: evaluating the content of the Psalms by modern formalist standards. His is a theology, an attempt to focus on God and Israel in their encounter and fellowship, a process that is effected by God.

This is a fine book, marked by fine syntheses, managing to keep a theological perspective in dialogue with critical scholarship. The chapter on the NT use of the Psalms is the best this reviewer has seen, successfully making

the NT context part of a biblical theology. K., having himself contributed to the discussion of many of the major issues, readily and fairly engages controversial issues. The book is beautifully produced and well translated.

The reviewer has one major question. The book seems designed to help Christian audiences deepen their appreciation of the Psalms as theological expressions of worship. Yet the questions it discusses, often in technical detail, are the questions of scholars, not those of the general reader. English-speaking readers at least may find it occasionally difficult to situate the discussion.

RICHARD J. CLIFFORD, S.J.  
*Weston School of Theology, Mass.*

Q: THE SAYINGS OF JESUS. By Ivan Havener, O.S.B. Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1985. Pp. 176. \$8.95.

This study has two distinct parts. Part 1 is a detailed introduction to the lost Q: its date, originating community, theology. What is Q? It is postulated as "a substantial document that tells of the preaching and teaching of Jesus and that interprets the meaning of his person in a way that is significantly different from the portrayals of Jesus in the biblical Gospels" (18). I say "postulated," because H. never proves its existence. Like the majority of NT critics, he assumes that it underlies similarities common to Matthew and Luke.

Part 2 is a translation of the second edition "of the fragments of the final redaction of Q as proposed by Athanasius Polag" in 1982, but without the critical apparatus (19). The reconstruction is followed by four clarifying appendices, including Marcan passages parallel to Q, a select bibliography, and three indices.

H. makes a good case for the existence and contents of Q as originating in the oracles of itinerant Christian prophets. He is clear and balanced in portraying problems connected with at-

tempts to recover its literary genre, and in organizing current critical opinion on a whole range of related questions. This adaptation was prepared for students of early Christianity who lack the ability to use a Greek synopsis of the Synoptic Gospels.

The major part of H.'s introduction is devoted to explaining the theology of the community that produced Q. The document had no Passion narrative. It pictured Jesus fulfilling his role as redeemer "in his revealing of God's reign and of the way to share in that kingdom" (71).

JAMES M. REESE, O.S.F.S.  
*St. John's University, N.Y.*

REVELATION IN THE FOURTH GOSPEL: NARRATIVE MODE AND THEOLOGICAL CLAIM. By Gail R. O'Day. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1986. Pp. xii + 143.

This very readable revision of the author's dissertation contributes to contemporary analyses of the literary characteristics of NT narrative. O'D.'s thesis is that only in sharing the process of understanding Jesus' identity through the ironies and metaphors as they are unfolded in the narrative can we appreciate what "revelation" means in the Fourth Gospel. None of the reductionist modes of treating revelation as dogmatic content, mythic redeemer figure, or existential encounter with the word of God fit the dynamic of the Gospel. This view is supported by a clear account of "irony" in both ancient and modern rhetoric; a detailed exposition of the Samaritan woman's story in Jn 4; and some less clearly integrated remarks on Jn 6:25-35, 16:25-33, and the trial before Pilate. Though the book promises more for a theology of revelation than it delivers, the treatment of the literary dynamic of Johannine narrative is very accessible to beginning students.

PHEME PERKINS  
*Boston College*

**RECKONING WITH ROMANS: A CONTEMPORARY READING OF PAUL'S GOSPEL.** By Brendan Byrne, S.J. Wilmington, Del.: Michael Glazier, 1986. Pp. 229. \$12.95.

The Epistle to the Romans is arguably the book most in need of commentary in the NT and, despite the endless number of commentaries on it, a new one is always welcome, provided it is solid in content and accessible in form to the educated Christian. B.'s is such, at least for the first half of Romans, the remaining chapters occupying only 33 pages. This is regrettable particularly for chapters 9-11 on the fate of Israel, which to many exegetes are at the very heart of the epistle.

Nevertheless, the first eight chapters are admirably elucidated: first, by B.'s own schematized translation of the Greek text, where the outline adopted does shed light on the meaning of the verses and their relation to each other; secondly, by B.'s careful exegesis of the meaning, not of each individual verse but of each section taken as a whole, where the riches of Paul's gospel are displayed to advantage; thirdly, by a reflection appended to each major section. These reflections are particularly successful in keeping to the forefront the principal lines of the complex argument Paul elaborates. Their value is not as evident, however, when B. substitutes for them what he calls "parables" from modern times. These are more by way of illustrative examples and, to this reviewer at least, they do not so much "limp" as halt the argument in its track.

At the end of each chapter B. adds a judiciously selected bibliography. In a concluding chapter he sums up the theological content by means of the once-again-fashionable device of theses. In them the vision that emerges from a "close reading" of the text of the epistle is enucleated. Moreover, as an added and very welcome bonus, there is a subject index to the many perceptively

elucidated theological themes in Romans. The book certainly does "render a difficult text more accessible for personal appropriation."

STANLEY B. MARROW  
*Weston School of Theology, Mass.*

**PAUL AND HIS MESSAGE FOR LIFE'S JOURNEY.** By William G. Thompson, S.J. New York: Paulist, 1986. Pp. vii + 151. \$9.95.

The aim of this study book for adults is to make Paul "more accessible to us" so as to "inform and influence how we live as Christians" (144, 2). The ultimate concern is to "pray with Paul's letters." To these ends there are sections on Paul and his letters (7-43), his message (45-107), and praying (109-37), plus an appendix on "Paul and Women" (145-51), in part to justify inclusive language in our prayers (113). The presentations are succinct and nontechnical, without footnotes, but specific recent scholars are acknowledged as influences (vii). Throughout, reflective questions are posed, illustrations and case studies utilized, and (though aware of the dangers) an epilogue provided on Paul and current theories of adult development, like James Fowler's (139-44); here apocalyptic and conversion may be too easily transmuted into transitions and transformation.

From similar endeavors with the Gospels and with "story" theology (2-3), T. tries hard to make the letters fit this current vogue. We have references to Paul's calling, and his theology can be strung together as "God's plan of action for the world." But is there not a thematic, propositional character to the epistles which reminds us that the Gospels too, though clad often in dramatic scenes, are really "Christology in picture form" or admonitions on discipleship that are dramatized to confront us with a theme? The pages on "tracing the Spirit" (100-106) are especially

good. The sketch of *Heilsgeschichte* (73-85) seems to leave out the future aspect of the Adam-to-come. Perhaps too much is made of "covenant"—e.g., in presenting justification as an effect of the cross (97-98)—after it has been suggested Paul "slighted the covenant" (79-80). A negative seems to have dropped out on p. 31: "Paul did regularly baptize" (cf. 1 Cor 1:14-15). But the book helps encourage dialogue with Paul and the *simul* of "power in apparent weakness" (3, 75, 141-43).

JOHN REUMANN  
*Lutheran Theological Seminary  
Philadelphia*

FROM DARKNESS TO LIGHT: ASPECTS OF CONVERSION IN THE NEW TESTAMENT. By Beverly Roberts Gaventa. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1986. Pp. xvi + 160.

In recent years "conversion" has been a central concern for biblical scholars (Stendahl, Tobin), for developmental psychologists (Fowler, Conn), for spiritual directors (Dunne), and for philosophical theologians (Loneragan). Language about conversion is also commonplace in contemporary America. Many talk about "Damascus Road experiences," and pastors are learning how to care for "born-again" members of their parishes.

This book contributes significantly to the discussion by looking at aspects of conversion in the NT. It explores the texts that gave rise to contemporary conversion language (Paul), narratives about conversion (Luke-Acts), and images of transformation (John, 1 Peter). Its goal is to listen to what conversion meant in first-century Christianity and to compare that with contemporary understandings of being "born again." It accomplishes that goal extremely well with a clear method and a careful analysis of key NT texts.

Any author must be clear about his or her definition of conversion. G. names three types: alternation, pendulum-like conversion, transformation.

Alternation is change that grows out of an individual's past behavior, the logical consequence of previous choices. Pendulum-like conversion involves rejecting past convictions and affiliations so as to affirm new commitments and a new identity. Transformation happens when a new way of perceiving forces a radical reinterpretation in which the past is not rejected but reconstrued as part of a new understanding of God and the world. With these distinctions, more fluid than hard and fast, Gaventa constructs the hermeneutical tool for the dialogue between NT texts and contemporary experience.

In this dialogue G. asks mainline churches whether they have fully explored the value of conversion, and she challenges evangelical communities to look at broader dimensions of the conversion experience. She urges all to reflect on how conversion is an act of God's initiative, as well as on how it calls for a real, even radical, change of life. Anyone interested in the topic will want to read this book with care.

WILLIAM G. THOMPSON, S.J.  
*Loyola University, Chicago*

ÉCRITS APOCRYPHES SUR LES APÔTRES: TRADUCTION DE L'ÉDITION ARMÉNIENNE DE VENISE 1: PIERRE, PAUL, ANDRÉ, JACQUES, JEAN. By Louis Leloir. *Corpus christianorum, series apocryphorum* 3. Turnhout: Brepols, 1986. Pp. xxx + 418. Fr.B. 4500.

This volume contains a French translation, from Armenian, of apocryphal writings pertaining to apostles; the original text, edited and published by Chérubin Tchérakian in 1904, was based on a group of manuscripts in the Mechitarist library in Venice. Since they do exist in other manuscripts, a critical edition, though already begun, will not be completed for many years; to make them immediately available, therefore, the editors of this series on the apocrypha decided to publish simply a French translation. The collec-

tion comprises acts (of Peter, Paul, John, Andrew), martyrdoms (of Peter, Paul, Andrew), accounts (of James and his brother John), an apocalypse (of Paul), a letter (of Pseudo-Dionysius to Timothy), and a fragment of an itinerary (of Paul's trip to Rome). Introductions discuss the manuscript evidence and the historical and literary background and setting of these works. Almost all exist in other versions (mostly in Greek, but also in Latin, or in one or another Oriental language); the following, however, have no equivalents and seem, therefore, to witness directly to the Armenian tradition: *The Martyrdom of Peter and Paul* (I.c; pp. 55-63); *The History of the Apostle James* (III; 267-88); *The History of James and John* (IV.k; 408-16).

These texts do not, for the most part, contain strikingly new material, but they display enough variants from their counterparts in other languages to offer insight into the mind of the Armenian Church that produced them. Thus, the *Acts of Andrew and Matthias among the Cannibals* seems to think (#1) that it is just as wicked to eat animal flesh as human flesh. *The History of the Apostle James* relates (#24) how an angel carried the head of the martyred apostle to James, the brother of the Lord; *The History of James and John* (#3) has the head delivered to the mother of the Lord (accompanied by the other James and John the Evangelist), and links this event with the later erection, over the head, of a great church, where there was a monastery and a place where Armenian Christians gathered. Despite the lack of texts in the original language, this volume does provide a useful entrée to the Armenian tradition of apocryphal literature.

GERARD H. ETTLINGER  
Fordham University

THE PREACHING OF THE FRIARS: SERMONS DIFFUSED FROM PARIS BEFORE 1300. By D. L. d'Avray. New York: Clarendon/Oxford University,

1985. Pp. xi + 315. \$49.95.

This volume gives an excellent introduction and methodology for studying the popular sermon as a source, both what we can learn about these sermons and from them. The author synthesizes revisions of earlier opinion and new research as he makes important points and then explores in depth the evidence for and implications of each idea: e.g., while regular popular preaching was old by the 13th century, the closing of the gap between the preacher and preaching aids was new and Paris was central to this. The creation of aids and handbooks for popular preaching went back as far as the long tradition of preaching itself. But the earlier Middle Ages saw a new problem: the lack of Latin in many clerics.

At Paris many educated laity were found in the audience, but preaching also reached beyond the urban and commercial classes by a system of itinerant preachers who reached out to the rural areas. This brought the developments of Paris to quite disparate areas and so adaptation and interpretation had to be done for different districts and audiences. The rise of scholasticism at Paris and its role as center for diffusion of model sermons were related, but this relation needs to be evaluated and interpreted, since these sermons reflect many milieus. The friars were a key element in the creation and diffusion of the sermon collections but not the only people involved. The rise of the university meant both centralization of training and a large number of clerics learned in theology and Scripture but also versed in oral skills from school and hence apt for transferring to preaching. Yet the new graduates were far more likely to gravitate to administrative posts in church and state, while various movements and appeals (Waldesians, Innocent III, apostolic life, etc.) all stressed the need to preach to the masses. This led to the production of "pocketbooks" for the preacher which in schematic form out-

lined sermon topics for liturgical seasons and feasts.

The study and interpretation of these aids is a complex and burgeoning field. The model collection would be in Latin and yet the sermon when given would very likely be in the vernacular; collections survive from Assisi and Paris, but the study of this field is just starting. D'Avray has chosen the friars at Paris down to 1300 as a clearly limited and yet substantial topic since so much of the surviving literature derived from them in the form of exempla, distinctions on biblical texts, summas on vices and virtues, florilegia, etc. He explores the questions about the preparation of the sermons for different audiences and the flexibility required for this, the function of the collections, and how they were produced and multiplied. It suffices to say that for future scholars interested in oral culture, popular religion and life, and medieval society in general and for an understanding of the Church in relation to the society in which it found itself, this book is a major contribution. All will learn from it and find new questions and leads for further reflection and research.

THOMAS E. MORRISSEY  
*State University College*  
*Fredonia, N.Y.*

ST. ALBAN'S COLLEGE, VALLADOLID: FOUR CENTURIES OF ENGLISH CATHOLIC PRESENCE IN SPAIN. By Michael E. Williams. New York: St. Martin's, 1987. Pp. xiv + 288. \$35.

W.'s book is much more than a history of a seminary: it is the story, at times exciting, of an institution that for four centuries housed in the heart of Castille an English clerical community that with its rector played at times a significant, if minor, role in Anglo-Spanish relations. Like other English seminaries in the Iberian peninsula, Madrid, Seville, and Lisbon, it was founded for the training of priests for

the English mission in the days of religious persecution; but, unlike them, it survives and flourishes today, thanks mainly to the brilliant administration of a remarkable rector, Msgr. Edwin Henson, who ruled despotically from 1925 to his death in 1961.

In the reign of Elizabeth I, students on their way to Spain came under suspicion of being English spies; in the Peninsular War they were put under pressure by the guerillas to collect arms from the local depot to fight the French. When the Civil War broke out, a number left to join the nationalist forces; in World War II, Henson was engaged in clandestine activity on behalf of the Allies to keep Franco out of hostilities.

The seminary was directed by the Society of Jesus until the expulsion of the Jesuits from Spain in 1766, when it was handed over to the secular clergy, in whose hands it has remained to this day. It is a balanced, well-researched, and entertaining book, with an even wider scope than its subtitle suggests.

PHILIP CARAMAN, S.J.  
*Bridge House, Dulverton, Somerset*  
*England*

SAINTE JEANNE DE CHANTAL: CORRESPONDANCE 1: 1605-1621. By Marie Patricia Burns, V.S.M. Paris: Cerf, 1986. Pp. 736. Fr. 195.

Sr. Marie Patricia Burns, archivist of the Annecy Visitation, has produced the first of six volumes of a critical edition of the correspondence of St. Jeanne de Chantal. Too often lost in the shadow of St. Francis de Sales, St. Jeanne (1572-1641) merits being known for herself. Ardent and zealous, she has a personality of her own.

This first volume brings to us 435 letters, of which 50 have never been published. Actually, this edition will include some 2600 letters when it is finished. The last edition of St. Jeanne's letters in 1874-79 presented only 2000 of her communications. Un-

fortunately, that eight-volume work was often faulty and incomplete. This new, critical edition presents a woman who kept several people busy writing her thoughts to various people at different times. Of course, St. Augustine comes to mind in such a case. The reader becomes aware of an exceptional woman. Wife, mother, religious, and foundress of the Visitation, this unusual person of varying vocations had the gift of preserving her interior life in extremely different situations.

B.'s colossal task of 20 years includes the identification of those with whom St. Jeanne corresponded, as well as events and individuals of whom she writes in her letters. An abundant biographical chronology precedes the actual edition of the missives. The general introduction is done by André Ravier, S.J., well known for his Salesian publications and particularly for his editing of the letters of Francis de Sales (1980). A few tables are presented at the end of the volume indicating different monastic foundations between 1606-21. Included are the names of the bishops where monasteries were established, Jesuit rectors in nearby houses, initial Visitation superiors, and a glossary. There will be a general onomastic index in the sixth volume when completed.

B. presented this volume to Pope John Paul II on the occasion of his visit to the tombs of Francis de Sales and Jeanne de Chantal at Annecy in October 1986. Surely this critical edition will make of *cette grande inconnue* a much better known and understood writer and saint of the 17th century.

WILLIAM C. MARCEAU, C.S.B.  
St. John Fisher College, N.Y.

**THE HOUSEHOLD OF FAITH: ROMAN CATHOLIC DEVOTIONS IN MID-NINETEENTH CENTURY AMERICA.** By Ann Taves. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1986. Pp. x + 197. \$17.95.

This is a brief monograph, with 133

pages of text, complete with the inevitable tables of the new social history. There are ample notes and a substantial bibliography. Appendices list prayer books published in the United States between 1770-1880, the frequency of their appearance, and the devotions found in them. Concentration is on extralitururgical devotion. The book is a useful addition to the growing number of studies of the religion of Catholics, as opposed to the studies on the institutionalization of Catholicism which dominated ages gone by. Still, T. sets up a bit of a straw person by suggesting that, apart from Jay Dolan's work, there has been no break with that pattern. Among others who have been examining Catholic devotionism are Joseph Chinnici, whom T. cites as a consultant, and Thomas Wangler, with his excellent essay in the collection *Catholic Boston*.

There are some small errors. Kerby Miller's research has brought into question the assumption (7) that Irish immigrants were automatically English-speaking. West Hoboken, N.J., is not the same as Hoboken, and one would search the mile-square city in vain for the now-closed St. Michael's Monastery (66, 68); it was in Union City. The bishop of Natchez (83) was William Henry Elder, not William Henry. Thomas A. Becker (116) was bishop of Wilmington. I do not quite understand the sentence on p. 124 which begins: "For the Romanized Catholic, the parish church was the center of that Catholic space..." What was the center of Catholic space for other Catholics? And what does it have to do with "Romanization"?

As T. says, the source material available tells more about what lay people were taught than it does about the way they responded. This has long been recognized as a major difficulty in doing this kind of social history. She then goes on (viii) to argue that the kind of devotions promoted among

Catholics were of such a nature as to further alienate them from mainstream United States culture and to exacerbate religious tensions between them and those of other religious traditions. Perhaps so. I would prefer to see the phenomenon more as a reflection of the fact that Catholics in the U.S. so often saw themselves in the 19th century as varying offshoots of parent European branches of Catholicism. Very little in the devotionism catalogued here was really indigenous to this country.

JAMES HENNESEY, S.J.  
*Canisius College, Buffalo*

**BRITAIN AND THE VATICAN DURING THE SECOND WORLD WAR.** By Owen Chadwick. Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1986. Pp. ix + 332.

Newspaper stories occasioned by this book's publication suggested that it rebutted criticisms of Pius XII's wartime record. Much of the substantive information contained here has long been available elsewhere. What C. has rather done is to pose once more in the context of that information the conundrum of "the use in war of moral condemnation." This time the story is told through the eyes of D'Arcy Godolphin Osborne, British minister to the Holy See from 1936-47, who spent four and a half of the war years living in Vatican City.

Osborne knew his popes. Pius XI he found "a very human and likeable old man, though a shade longwinded and set in his opinions," and he reported to London with approval the increasingly anti-Nazi sentiments of that Pope's final years. Neither Osborne nor Chadwick are among those who suggest base motives for Pius XII's wartime "silences," but, while he sympathized with the complexity of the problems facing the Pope, the British diplomat pointed out that issues were at stake that did not "admit of neutrality," and he advised Pius that he underestimated his

moral authority and the reluctant respect in which the Germans held him.

There are any number of interesting insights into life in wartime Rome and on the ways in which various of the warring governments perceived the papacy. Jewish deportations and mounting evidence for the Nazi decision for a "final solution" are discussed, as are problems connected with "area" or "saturation" bombing and other issues arising from conduct of hostilities on both sides. A long section supplements from Osborne's vantage point our knowledge of the connection of the Pope and of his aide, the Jesuit Robert Leiber, with the German generals' plot in 1939-40 to oust Hitler.

JAMES HENNESEY  
*Canisius College, Buffalo*

**KARL BARTH: A THEOLOGICAL LEGACY.** By Eberhard Jüngel. Translated from the German by Garrett E. Paul. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1986. Pp. 168. \$13.95.

A celebration of Barth's theological contribution by one of his students who is a theologian of stature in his own right. It reminds us how fruitful B.'s theology can be for current theological work.

The book contains five pieces of different length, beginning with Jüngel's tribute to B. at the time of his death. A 30-page sketch of "Barth's Life and Work" (an expanded treatment of material originally written as an encyclopedia entry) is an excellent introduction, especially for those unfamiliar with B. An illuminating essay on "Gospel and Law" explains B.'s view of the relation between theology and ethics. There is also a fine exposition of B.'s Christological anthropology ("The Royal Man").

Such a description of its contents perhaps makes this volume seem like a miscellaneous assortment, but, taken together, these essays constitute a bril-



liant account of the key themes of B.'s thought. Those familiar with B. will benefit from it as a refresher course, given the author's sure grasp of B.'s intentions and his gift for communicating B.'s meaning without simply repeating his language.

One of the most celebrated disputes in recent Barth scholarship concerns the influence of B.'s socialism on his theology. Marquardt, e.g., claims that B.'s theology is basically an expression of socialist praxis and must be read accordingly. Without minimizing B.'s early socialist involvements or the continuing political significance of his theology, Jüngel nevertheless makes a telling case against Marquardt's excesses. He shows that "for Barth, the political is surely a predicate of theology, but theology is never a predicate of the political" (104). J.'s extended essay on "Barth's Theological Beginnings" is a balanced and convincing discussion of these issues.

In his introduction J. states that "the study and discussion of Barth's writings has always been, for me, an occasion for joy." We can be grateful for a book like this, which enables us to enter into that joy.

RUSSELL W. PALMER  
*Univ. of Nebraska at Omaha*

**SYMBOL AND EMPOWERMENT: PAUL TILlich's POST-THEISTIC SYSTEM.** By Richard Grigg. Macon, Ga.: Mercer University, 1985. Pp. xv + 151. \$14.50.

This is a valuable study that breaks new ground both in our understanding of Tillich's theology and in our appreciation of its continued relevance. G.'s thesis is that the phenomenon of empowerment—what in religious terms is called the experience of grace—plays a central role in T.'s ontology and constitutes, for T., the experiential basis of our awareness of being-itself. In this judgment I completely concur.

Armed with this insight, G. provides

a systematic account of T.'s ontology, his theory of symbolism, and his hermeneutical method of correlation. More specifically, G. accomplishes several things. First, he shows how T.'s critics have almost universally misunderstood his theory of symbolism by supposing that T. regards symbolic language as providing information or facts about being-itself when T. is challenging that very assumption (since being-itself is not one being among others) by suggesting that symbolic language instead functions so as to re-present to us the presence and power of being-itself. Second, G. takes up the residual problem of the evaluation of a symbol's truth, and suggests that T.'s implicit (though not unproblematic) criterion is a symbol's ability to enable an individual to overcome existential estrangement, i.e. a symbol's ability to mediate the liberating phenomenon of empowerment. Third, G. cogently demonstrates that T.'s famous "method of correlation" is in fact a dual method consisting of an acknowledged apologetic correlation and an implicit "hermeneutical" correlation.

Moreover, G. demonstrates how these elements of T.'s thought combine so as to produce a comprehensive theory of religion in both its linguistic and ontological dimensions where the differences among world religions can be viewed in terms of their being alternative symbolic representations of one and the same "ultimate reality" that is universally experienced as the source of human empowerment. Indeed, it may well be the last chapter, "Symbol, Empowerment, and the World Religions," that proves to be of greatest interest in this book; for G.'s ultimate constructive concern is to show that T.'s "post-theistic system" is one of the richest sources available for undertaking the comparative interpretation of different religious traditions by providing a conceptually rich and ontologi-

cally rooted point of common reference. This book is thus especially recommended to those interested in the comparative philosophy of religion.

ROBERT F. SCUKA  
*Georgetown University*

**THE CHURCH STRUGGLE IN SOUTH AFRICA.** By John W. de Gruchy. 2nd ed. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1986. Pp. xv + 290. \$10.95.

**THE VOICE OF BLACK THEOLOGY IN SOUTH AFRICA.** By Louise Kretzschmar. Johannesburg: Raven, 1986. Pp. xiii + 136. \$10.95. Distributed by Ohio University Press.

*The Church Struggle in South Africa* is essentially a republication of de G.'s widely acclaimed text originally published in 1979. It traces the churches' relation to apartheid from the historical roots of the settler church through the Afrikaner and English churches down to the ongoing black-consciousness movement and protests. As Alan Paton's Foreword indicates, de G.'s work captures well the tension-laden dialectic: divine/human institution; church-in-Christ/church-in-society; church-of-Christ/church-of-the-nation, and black Christian/white Christian. Rather than attempt a rewrite, de G. has chosen to leave the text unaltered. He has added a postscript which responds to the major criticisms raised at the time of publication: the Marxist critique, black consciousness and black theology, the problem of violence. The republication of this sensitive and scholarly work provides a helpful tool for sober analysis at a time when hope for peaceful change in South Africa has all but died.

K.'s small book pursues three broad themes: the relationship between Christianity and African religions; black theology as black consciousness; and black theology as liberation theology. In a nontechnical style K. moves from early examples of African Christian protest against discrimination,

such as Jabavu, Matthews, and Luthuli, to the current development of South African black theology and its interaction with North American black theology and Latin American liberation theology. Her treatment of white theological responses to both apartheid ideology and black theology is lucid and helpful.

JOHN P. HOGAN  
*Catholic Relief Services  
Port-au-Prince, Haiti*

**PARVITAS MATERIAE IN SEXTO IN CONTEMPORARY CATHOLIC THOUGHT.** By Patrick J. Boyle, S.J. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1987. Pp. viii + 124. \$21.50; \$9.25 paper.

One of the most neglected areas of moral theology is its own history. This dissertation, in spite of its gangly and repetitious style, clarifies through historical research a contemporary issue.

B. shows that traditionally ethicists taught that all sexual sins were intrinsically objectively grave. Thus, even without any intention of intercourse, consent to sexual pleasure evoked by, e.g., smelling a rose, glancing at a woman's arm, or kissing was judged mortally sinful. Because dissent on this issue by theologians, particularly the Jesuits, was threatened with excommunication, there was very little public disagreement. Still, prior to 1975 the magisterium never clearly defined that there is no smallness of matter in sexual sins. Around the same time, paradoxically, Catholic moral theologians began to reject this doctrine.

In the decades before Vatican II the manualists universally held there was no "parvity of matter." They reasoned that the smallest venereal pleasure is already of necessity the first step to full indulgence. If permitted outside of marriage, such pleasure would threaten the procreation of the human race and fewer persons would marry. The renewal of moral theology after Vatican II rejected these views by shifting from

an act-centered analysis to a person-centered moral theory. More aware of history, individual development, and fundamental freedom, many contemporary theologians now allow for parity of matter.

On the pastoral level, B. claims that ordinary Catholics have difficulty making the transition from the teaching that sexual pleasure before marriage is sordid, selfish, and seriously evil to the teaching that after marriage it is a beautiful and unique source of love's perfection.

EDWARD COLLINS VACEK, S.J.  
*Weston School of Theology, Mass.*

**RELIGION AND AMERICAN PUBLIC LIFE.** Edited by Robin W. Lovin. New York: Paulist, 1986. Pp. vi + 181. \$8.95.

Over a period of several years the Project on Religion and American Public Life at the Divinity School of the University of Chicago has been sponsoring conferences, colloquia, and forums addressing the correlation between a critical understanding of religion and a critical theory of American public life. L., the co-ordinator of this Chicago Project, has gathered here seven of its best essays. Usually, symposia collections such as this contain at least one spotty essay. There are none here. Each represents a very thoughtful, informed contribution to the topic of a public church in a renewed American public life. But then, how could one really go wrong in asking Richard Bernstein, Chris Gamwell, Robin Lovin, Martin Marty, Douglas Sturm, and David Tracy to speak to this issue?

Again, it is sometimes hard to find the unifying conceptualization in such symposia. Here, however, there is no danger of diffusion of focus, in part because so many of the authors of the essays, close colleagues at the Divinity School, speak out of a shared tradition of "Chicago" discourse. The subthemes include pluralism, American individ-

ualism, the eclipse of public life, and a commitment to an authentic notion of the public church (i.e., not basing the legitimately public claims of religion on revelational warrant).

Since all the essays are excellent, it is somewhat unfair to focus on two for comment. Gamwell's discussion of the First Amendment represents perhaps the most original interpretation of its meaning since John Courtney Murray's (and is arguably superior to Murray's reading). G. contends, with Murray, that the First Amendment implies that the government may not have totally comprehensive purposes. Moreover, he argues, "I hold that the first amendment can mean nothing other than the recognition of human fallibility and the commitment to public assessment of religious claims." The second of these claims will be anathema to the many theologians who reject Vatican I's affirmation that authentic religious truth is, in some form, accessible to reason. For G., however, this accessibility "is a necessary condition for affirming in a coherent manner both the possibility of authentic religion and its disestablishment." Douglas Sturm's essay represents a comprehensive distillation of Sturm's important foundational thinking on the meaning of public life. One of America's best social ethicists, he is at his best here analyzing why there is an absence of public life in America and the appropriate ground, meaning, and principles for a renewed public life. I, for one, will use this very readable volume as a text in courses on religion and American politics.

JOHN A. COLEMAN, S.J.  
*Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley*

**PROTESTANT SPIRITUAL TRADITIONS.** Edited by Frank C. Senn. New York: Paulist, 1986. Pp. vi + 273. \$9.95.

Senn has drawn together seven essays of remarkably even (and generally high) quality to produce an introduc-

tory historical survey of Protestant spirituality as represented in the Lutheran, Reformed, Anabaptist, Anglican, Puritan, Pietist, and Methodist traditions. The collection follows that roughly chronological order to stress the indebtedness of later traditions to earlier ones, but each essay takes care to present the peculiar genius of the tradition it represents.

As S. hopes in an all-too-brief introduction, combining these historical treatments shows a much greater degree of diversity within Protestant spirituality than we usually admit, and emphasizes that these traditions protested not just Rome but also each other: they represent sensitive and keenly-felt disagreements about human nature, the Church, and the experience of God. Perhaps ironically, these essays also show Protestant spirituality to be receptive to "Catholic" notions of regular prayer, spiritual disciplines, mystical contemplation, and the importance of the Lord's Supper as a sign of Christian communion and even a means of grace. The essays also stress that at least in their inception these traditions are far less individualistic than we might suppose, with the love of God and neighbor manifested in behavior as well as belief. In addition, from Luther's lament "Why does God pick on me?" to Wesley's question to would-be preachers "Do you drink water? Why not? . . . When will you begin again?", we get a very human picture of these spiritual forebears.

Three qualifications. First, the book would have benefited from a more extensive overall commentary on the critical appropriation of these traditions today. Some authors touch on this, but a critical "afterword" would have helped. Second, outside of brief comments in the Anglican and Methodist essays, these essays give us a religious awareness rooted squarely in white Euro-American culture. Explicit attention to nonwhite, non-Western spirit-

uality would enrich our understanding of the Protestant heritage. Finally, other than the Virgin Mary, Phoebe Palmer, and Evelyn Underhill, one would think from this collection that Protestant spirituality is an exclusively male enterprise—an impression reinforced by the generally uncritical presentation of patriarchal family structures as paradigms of divine-human relations. Perhaps a second edition can correct these omissions and strengthen an otherwise useful collection.

RICHARD BONDI

*Candler School of Theology  
Emory University, Atlanta*

**NO OTHER LIGHT: POINTS OF CONVERGENCE IN PSYCHOLOGY AND SPIRITUALITY.** By Mary Wolff-Salin. New York: Crossroad, 1986. Pp. xi + 234. \$15.95.

Ours is an era where interest is burgeoning in interdisciplinary and cross-disciplinary approaches to age-old questions and tomorrow's problems. Double majors for college undergraduates, consultation teams in marketing, multispecialty representation in hospital treatment planning all testify to the contemporary quest to break through the necessary boundaries and focused parameters of a single viewpoint. Hence, W-S.'s *No Other Light* makes a timely appearance. Well versed in the complexities of Jung's psychology and John of the Cross's spirituality, she provides an integrated perspective on themes common to both writers such as "the structure of the human psyche," "work," "solitude, discretion, virtue," "spiritual guide or therapist," "peace"—to name just a few of her chapter titles and topics treated. A thorough and profound grasp of the inner vision of her two teachers expressed in an enjoyably readable style makes W-S.'s book an important contribution to the ongoing dialogue between the traditions of sacred and secular wisdom.

W-S. provides special assistance to those chary of Jung's heterodox religious views by demonstrating concretely how many of his insights can nourish genuine human and spiritual growth. A useful appendix entitled "The Problem of Evil and God: Reflections on Jung's *Answer to Job*" proves her awareness of the controversy swirling around some of Jung's theological opinions.

The warp of Jungian depth psychology and the weft of Sanjuanist mysticism are skilfully woven into a tapestry whose subject is "human fulfilment as involving the painful death of our ordinary ego-consciousness into a consciousness whose subject is incomparably wider and deeper than the ego" (from Sebastian Moore's Foreword).

WILLIAM J. SNECK, S.J.  
Loyola College, Baltimore

**WOMEN'S PSYCHE, WOMEN'S SPIRIT: THE REALITY OF RELATIONSHIPS.** By Mary Lou Randour. New York: Columbia University, 1987. Pp. xiv + 239. \$25.

This study in women's psychology and spirituality exemplifies an important contemporary genre of religious works by and about women. In this genre women's experience is taken as the point of departure for religious understanding and theological interpretation, and the psychological dimension of that experience is understood in terms of interpersonal relationships. As parallels, one thinks of psychologist Carol Gilligan's *In A Different Voice* or of theologian Rosemary Ruether's *Women-Church and Women & Religion in America* (edited with Rosemary Skinner Keller). The strength of Randour's contribution is her heavy reliance on first-person accounts by 94 women, who responded in writing to the author's request to tell of a significant spiritual experience (Part 1: Women Speaking of Relationships) or

permitted themselves to be taped (Part 2: Portraits of Six Women).

R., drawing on object-relations theory, explores the ways in which images of self and of the divine are formed and revised in the context of important interpersonal relationships. Often her subjects tell of experiences with parents and family or close friends; a special focal point of spiritual crisis and transformed understanding is contact with the death or threat of death of a loved one. Even women who recount a solitary experience as crucial are described as working from "internalize[d] aspects of significant others" (3). A working thesis of R. is the now familiar feminist critique of the traditional Christian conception of sin as self-assertion, i.e. that it is inadequate for women's spirituality, since women are often socialized to excessive self-denial. R. also adopts Robert J. Lifton's proposal that persons achieve a sense of immortality via "a symbolizing process around death," through which they realize "participation in a larger human process" (77). This makes belief in an illusory literal immortality unnecessary.

Although all these theses are in themselves worth consideration—relationship as the foundation of women's experience, sin as inadequate self-definition, "immortality" as a symbolic response to death—they sometimes seem to get in the way of the voices which speak through the pages of R.'s faithful transcriptions. Women who explicitly define themselves in other terms come across as psycho-spiritually inadequate, or are reinterpreted so that they fit into the paradigm. Although I realize that experiential accounts must be mediated by an organizing paradigm for a scholarly study to take shape, I cannot help wishing that the "return to women's experience" had been allowed more room to challenge R.'s preconceptions as well as those of traditional Judaism and Christianity. Still, she

treats all her subjects with a great deal of empathy and respect, and provides fruitful access to a spirituality whose witnesses have too long been silent.

LISA SOWLE CAHILL  
*Boston College*

**HOPKINS, THE SELF, AND GOD.** By Walter J. Ong, S.J. Toronto: University of Toronto, 1986. Pp. x + 180. \$20.

In these 1981 Alexander Lectures of the University of Toronto, literature and theology intersect. Focusing on Gerard Manley Hopkins' strong sense of self and of uniqueness, Ong studies Hopkins as both Victorian and modern writer, and as ascetical and dogmatic "theologian" of original cast.

In his poems, letters, and spiritual writings H. reflects deeply on "I," "me," and "self": "My selfbeing, my consciousness and feeling of myself, that taste of myself, of *I* and *me* above and in all things . . . is more distinctive than the taste of ale or alum, more distinctive than the smell of walnutleaf or camphor, and is incommunicable by any means to another man." Thus, more than other Victorians, H. develops a consciousness of self and of "particularity" and describes each particular—self or tree—with detailed specificity. Further, he opens new depths in Ignatian asceticism and expresses theology in terms of articulate self-awareness. Finally, his preoccupation with self and consciousness is modern, as is his ease with science and contemporary thought.

In treating H. as Victorian, Ong sees him as "a prime exhibit in the history of consciousness" and situates him relative to European philosophy, history of literature, and structuralist and deconstructionist criticism; the chapter is brilliant. On Ignatian asceticism, Ong explains Ignatius well but is less text-oriented. On theology, Ong originally and successfully discusses Scotus as theologian rather than philosopher of *haecceitas*, and treats H. as a theologi-

cal writer whose theology grows out of personal musings. On modernism (in the literary sense), Ong deals with self-consciousness and personalism but says little about other characteristics of this literary movement which included such figures as Eliot, Pound, Yeats, Faulkner, and Joyce.

*Hopkins, the Self, and God* is an important book for Hopkins studies and perhaps for the history of theologies based on self and on consciousness. (Ong interestingly contrasts H. with Augustine's self-perception in the *Confessions*.) I will never again so casually read the words "I," "me," and "self" in H.'s poems. And Ong deserves four specific praises: for working so closely with H.'s text, for taking his thought quite seriously, for showing the integration of his thought, and for establishing the depth and originality of his consciousness of self.

JOSEPH J. FEENEY, S.J.  
*Saint Joseph's University, Phila.*

**THE PIPE AND CHRIST: A CHRISTIAN-SIOUX DIALOGUE.** By William Stolzman, S.J. Chamberlain, S.D.: Tipi, 1986. Pp. v + 222. \$7.95.

This unusual, indeed unique, book is an exercise in both dialogue and comparative religion, written only after more than a half dozen years of regular interaction between Lakota medicine persons and mission workers. S. is a veteran of more than 20 years of missionary work and study among the Rosebud Sioux; he is fluent in the Lakota language and has been deeply tutored in the mysteries of the tribal religion and spirituality. This affords him a familiarity with contemporary-traditional Sioux life allowed to very few outsiders.

S.'s methodology is significant, its inception being not as data-gathering but as an exercise to establish understanding where very little has hitherto flourished: the area of tribal religion. Only with the agreement of his dialogue

partners was this manuscript published.

The methodology in both dialogue and writing is analogical, engaging in a phenomenology describing elements in traditional Lakota religion and in Roman Catholic Christianity as "in some ways similar and in some ways different." It may be more precise to call the method a "homology" after M. Eliade, since S. seeks to understand how each symbology fulfils an equivalent function.

Naturally, many questions remain in such a mystery-shrouded exercise, not the least of which relates to the use of comparisons. One would wish, e.g., a further development of the phenome-

nology that might examine the "differentiations of consciousness" that occur between primal religious experience and the more "reflective" Western world views. The comparisons here seem at times a bit facile. Again, S. at times departs from his method to enter into pastoral exhortations that startle the scholar. The traditional Indian, however, would not be startled, and it is such that S. has had in mind throughout.

This book deserves a place among contemporary data on native religion and spirituality.

CARL F. STARKLOFF, S.J.

Regis College

Toronto School of Theology

## BOOKS RECEIVED

### SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

Allen, L. C. *Word Biblical Themes: Psalms*. Waco, Tex.: Word, 1987. Pp. 139.

Beasley-Murray, G. R. *John*. Waco: Word, 1987. Pp. xcii + 441.

Beker, J. C. *Suffering and Hope: The Biblical Vision and the Human Predicament*. Phila.: Fortress, 1987. Pp. 94.

Bovon, F. *L'Oeuvre de Luc: Etudes d'exégèse et de théologie*. Paris: Cerf, 1987. Pp. 276. Fr. 145.

Burr, W. H. *Self-Contradictions of the Bible*. Buffalo: Prometheus, 1987 [1860]. Pp. 96. \$13.95.

Enermalm-Ogawa, A. *Un langage de prière juif en grec: Le témoignage des deux premiers livres des Maccabées*. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiskell, 1987. Pp. 157. Sw. kr. 120.

Hawthorne, G. F. *Word Biblical Themes: Philippians*. Waco, Tex.: Word, 1987. Pp. 118.

Holmgren, F. C. *Israel Alive Again: A Commentary on the Books of Ezra and Nehemiah*. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1987. Pp. 162. \$9.95.

McCurley, F. R., and J. Reumann. *Witness of the Word: A Biblical Theology of the Gospel*. Phila.: Fortress, 1986. Pp. xxvi + 500.

Meyers, C. L., and E. M. Myers. *Haggai, Zechariah 1-8*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1987. Pp. xcv + 478. \$20.00.

Minnerath, R. *Jésus et le pouvoir*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1987. Pp. 213. Fr. 150.

Moloney, F. J., S.D.B. *The Living Voice of the Gospel: The Gospels Today*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. xii + 252. \$8.95.

Pesch, R. *Paulus kämpft um sein Apostolat*. Freiburg im Br.: Herder, 1987. Pp. 192. DM 10.90.

Plümacher, E. *Identitätsverlust und Identitätsgewinn: Studien zum Verhältnis von kaiserzeitlicher Stadt und frühem Christentum*. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag des Erziehungsvereins, 1987. Pp. 125.

Prickett, S. *Words and the Word: Language, Poetics, and Biblical Interpretation*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1986. Pp. 305. \$39.50.

Rohr, R., and J. Martos. *The Great Themes of Scripture: Old Testament*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger,

# Theological Studies

DECEMBER 1987

VOL. 48, NO. 4

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.  
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus  
in the United States*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- The Ministry of Disciples: Historical Reflections on the Role of  
Religious Priests  
*Brian E. Daley, S.J.* . . . . . 605
- Mary Magdalene as Major Witness to Jesus' Resurrection  
*Gerald O'Collins, S.J. and Daniel Kendall, S.J.* . . . . . 631
- Counterterror Deterrence/Defense and Just-War Doctrine  
*William V. O'Brien* . . . . . 647

### CURRENT THEOLOGY

- Catholic Theology and the Study of Religion in South Asia:  
Widening the Context for Theological Reflection  
*Francis X. Clooney, S.J.*  
*Paul J. Griffiths*  
*Charles Hallisey*  
*James Laine* . . . . . 677

### NOTES

- War and Peace in American Catholic Thought: A Heritage  
Abandoned?  
*David Hollenbach, S.J.* . . . . . 711
- The Vatican Statement on Homosexuality  
*Gerald D. Coleman, S.S.* . . . . . 727

### BOOK REVIEWS

- HANSON, P. D.: The People Called . . . . . 735
- AUNE, D. E.: The New Testament in Its Literary Environment . . . . . 736
- MALHERBE, A. J.: Moral Exhortation: A Greco-Roman Sourcebook . . . . . 737
- STOWERS, S. K.: Letter Writing in Greco-Roman Antiquity . . . . . 737
- SHEEHAN, T.: The First Coming . . . . . 739
- EVANS, G. R.: The Science of Theology . . . . . 741
- OGDEN, S. M.: On Theology . . . . . 741
- RITSCHL, D.: The Logic of Theology . . . . . 742
- Essays in Phenomenological Theology (ed. S. Laycock and J. Hart) . . . . . 744
- KOBLER, J. F.: Vatican II and Phenomenology . . . . . 744
- SURIN, K.: Theology and the Problem of Evil . . . . . 747
- HELMINIAK, D. A.: The Same Jesus: A Contemporary Christology . . . . . 748
- LATOURELLE, R.: Miracles de Jésus et théologie du miracle . . . . . 750



BALTHASAR, H. U. von: The Office of Peter and the Structure of the Church	751
Churches Respond to BEM 2-3 (ed. M. Thurian)	754
Faith and Renewal (ed. T. F. Best)	754
Catholic Perspectives on Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry (ed. M. A. Fahey)	754
Who in the World? A Study of Ministry	754
STEVENSON, K.: Eucharist and Offering	756
MAZZA, E.: The Eucharistic Prayers of the Roman Rite	758
DALLEN, J.: The Reconciling Community: The Rite of Penance	760
Saint Augustin et la Bible (ed. A.-M. la Bonnardière)	762
GOLLNICK, J.: <i>Flesh</i> as Transformation Symbol in the Theology of Anselm	764
HAINES, R. M.: Archbishop John Stratford	765
EVANS, G. R.: The Language and Logic of the Bible	767
SMEETON, D. D.: Lollard Themes in the Reformation Theology of Tyndale	768
MELVILLE, A. M.: Louis William Dubourg	769
PACINI, D. S.: The Cunning of Modern Religious Thought	772
VEATCH, R. M.: The Patient as Partner	774
By No Extraordinary Means (ed. J. Lynn)	776
FIRET, J.: Dynamics in Pastoring	778
Churches in Struggle (ed. W. K. Tabb)	779
D'COSTA, G.: Theology and Religious Pluralism	781

## SHORTER NOTICES ..... 783

COLLINS, J. J., and J. D. CROSSAN (ed.): The Biblical Heritage in Modern Catholic Scholarship VAWTER, B.: The Path of Wisdom BROMILEY, G. W.: The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia 3: K-P PREMINGER, A., and E. L. GREENSTEIN (ed.): The Hebrew Bible in Literary Criticism KRAUS, H.-J.: Theology of the Psalms HAVENER, I.: Q: The Sayings of Jesus O'DAY, G. R.: Revelation in the Fourth Gospel BYRNE, B.: Reckoning with Romans THOMPSON, W. G.: Paul and His Message for Life's Journey GAVENTA, B. R.: From Darkness to Light LELOIR, L.: *Ecrits apocryphes sur les apôtres* D'AVRAY, D. L.: The Preaching of the Friars WILLIAMS, M. E.: St. Alban's College, Valladolid BURNS, M. P.: Sainte Jeanne de Chantal: Correspondance TAVES, A.: The Household of Faith CHADWICK, O.: Britain and the Vatican during the Second World War JÜNGEL, E.: Karl Barth: A Theological Legacy GRIGG, R.: Symbol and Empowerment DEGRUCHY, J. W.: The Church Struggle in South Africa KRETZSCHMAR, L.: The Voice of Black Theology in South Africa BOYLE, P. J.: *Parvitas materiae in sexto* in Contemporary Catholic Thought LOVIN, R. W. (ed.): Religion and American Public Life SENN, F. C. (ed.): Protestant Spiritual Traditions WOLFF-SALIN, M.: No Other Light RANDOUR, M. L.: Women's Psyche, Women's Spirit ONG, W. J.: Hopkins, the Self, and God STOLZMAN, W.: The Pipe and Christ: A Christian-Sioux Dialogue

## BOOKS RECEIVED ..... 799

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES (ISSN 0040-5639) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202. Second class postage paid at Baltimore, Md., and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER, please send address changes to THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION: U.S. \$14.00; Canada and foreign \$17.00. Single copies \$4.50.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 64002, Baltimore, Md. 21264.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS and business correspondence should be sent to Theological Studies, Business Office, 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy and a legible xerox), together with return postage, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., 20057. Authors should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057.

BACK ISSUES are available from the office in Washington, D.C.

Our December 1987 issue features three articles (religious priests, Mary Magdalene as witness to Jesus' resurrection, counterterror deterrence), a bulletin (religion in South Asia), and two notes (George Weigel's *Tranquillitas Ordinis* and a response to a *TS* article on the Vatican document on homosexuality).

**The Ministry of Disciples: Historical Reflections on the Role of Religious Priests** argues that (1) throughout church history there has been a tension between the institutionalized forms of Christian discipleship we call "religious life" and formally recognized church office or ordained ministry; (2) yet there has also been much fruitful interaction between both roles; (3) the value of ordained religious for today's Church lies in keeping both aspects of their life in a balanced and productive relationship. BRIAN E. DALEY, S.J., D.Phil. from Oxford, is associate professor of historical theology at Weston School of Theology, Cambridge, Mass. Especially competent in patristic theology, he has authored the fascicle on patristic eschatology in the Herder Handbuch der Dogmengeschichte, to appear soon in English as *The Hope of the Early Church* (Cambridge).

**Mary Magdalene as Major Witness to Jesus' Resurrection** notes that, according to Matthew and John, Mary Magdalene was the first to whom the risen Lord appeared, and aims at striking a balance between those who maximize and those who minimize her significance as witness to Jesus' resurrection. GERALD O'COLLINS, S.J., Ph.D. from Cambridge University, is dean of the faculty of theology at the Gregorian University (Rome), with special interest in fundamental theology and Christology. His most recent book is *Jesus Risen* (Paulist, 1987). DANIEL KENDALL, S.J., with a licentiate in Scripture from Rome's Biblical Institute and a doctorate in theology from the Gregorian, is associate professor of theology at the University of San Francisco, with particular competence in the Pauline letters and Christology.

**Counterterror Deterrence/Defense and Just-War Doctrine**, noting that modern just-war scholars have concentrated on nuclear issues, neglecting low-intensity conflicts involving revolutionary war and terrorism, attempts to demonstrate the relevance of just-war doctrine to counterterror deterrence/defense, drawing on examples from recent Israeli and U.S. practice which seem to reflect increased influence of the doctrine. WILLIAM V. O'BRIEN, Ph.D. from Georgetown University, is professor of government there, concentrating on, e.g., the international law of war, modern just-war doctrine, and the theory and practice of limited war. His "Just-War Doctrine in a Nuclear Context" appeared in *TS*'s June 1983 issue. He has recently coedited, with John Langan, S.J., *The Nuclear Dilemma and the Just War Tradition* (Lexington Books, 1986).

**Catholic Theology and the Study of Religion in South Asia: Widening the Context for Theological Reflection**, by focusing on four key books, introduces some major themes of particular theological interest: the development of Hinduism in the intersection of pan-Indian and local traditions; the knowability of God in Hindu rational theology; a reappraisal of the value of theological anthropology in the light of Buddhist notions of the human person; the usefulness/limitations of certain anthropological/history-of-religions categories in organizing information about religion. FRANCIS X. CLOONEY, S.J., Ph.D. from the University of Chicago, is assistant professor of theology at Boston College; PAUL GRIFFITHS, Ph.D. from the University of Wisconsin at Madison, is assistant professor of theology at Notre Dame; CHARLES HALLISEY, Ph.D. from the University of Chicago, is instructor in theology at Loyola University of Chicago; JAMES LAINE, Th.D. from Harvard Divinity School, is assistant professor of religious studies at Macalester College, St. Paul, Minn. All four have done extensive scholarly research in Indian religions.

**War and Peace in American Catholic Thought: A Heritage Abandoned?** analyzes and responds to George Weigel's recent book *Tranquillitas Ordinis*. It argues that Weigel's contention that mainstream American Catholic thought has forsaken the great tradition of Catholic thought on war and peace is erroneous, and presents an alternative theological, political, and ethical perspective on the current church debates on war and peace. DAVID HOLLENBACH, S.J., Ph.D. in religious ethics from Yale, is associate professor of moral theology at Weston School of Theology, Cambridge, Mass., and during 1987 a visiting scholar within the Woodstock Theological Center located at Georgetown University. In 1983 the Paulist Press published his *Nuclear Ethics: A Christian Moral Argument*; he coauthored *TS's* "Notes on Moral Theology" in 1985 and 1986.

**The Vatican Statement on Homosexuality** attempts to demonstrate, in response to a June 1987 article in *TS*, that in the magisterium's teaching on homosexuality and homosexual acts two major points need further study: the scriptural materials and the meaning of "an objective disorder." GERALD D. COLEMAN, S.S., Ph.D. from the University of St. Michael's College, Toronto, is president/rector and professor of moral theology at St. Patrick's Seminary, Menlo Park, Calif. He has published extensively on sexual and medical ethics.

An uncommonly strong contribution to theological scholarship has been *TS's* careful attention to recent publications. In harmony with this tradition, the December issue reviews 33 books and gives shorter notices to 26 more.

*Walter J. Burghardt, S.J.*  
Editor

1987. Pp. xi + 131. \$5.95.  
 Watts, J. D. W. *Isaiah 34-66*. Waco, Tex.: Word, 1987. Pp. 385.  
 Williams, R. R. *Let Each Gospel Speak for Itself*. Mystic: Twenty-third, 1987. Pp. 136. \$7.95.

#### SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY

- Balthasar, H. U. von. *Truth Is Symphonic: Aspects of Christian Pluralism*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1987. Pp. 192. \$9.95.  
 Berryman, P. *Liberation Theology*. Minneapolis: Meyer-Stone, 1987. Pp. 231. \$6.95.  
*Commitment to Partnership: Explorations of the Theology of Marriage*. Ed. W. P. Roberts. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 184. \$9.95.  
 Cypser, C. E. *Taking Off the Patriarchal Glasses*. N.Y.: Vantage, 1987. Pp. 237. \$14.95.  
*Death and Immortality in the Religions of the World*. Ed. P. and L. Badham. N.Y.: Paragon, 1987. Pp. 238. \$12.95.  
 Geldbach, E. *Ökumene in Gegensätzen*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1987. Pp. 230.  
 Harpur, T. *For Christ's Sake*. Boston: Beacon, 1987. Pp. 142. \$17.95; \$8.95 paper.  
 Lee, P. J. *Against the Protestant Gnostics*. N.Y.: Oxford, 1987. Pp. 347. \$27.95.  
 Mitra, K. *Catholicism-Hinduism: Vedantic Investigation of Raimundo Panikkar's Attempt at Bridge Building*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1987. Pp. 157. \$23; \$11.75 paper.  
 Pittenger, N. *Freed to Love: A Process Interpretation of Redemption*. Wilton, Conn.: Morehouse-Barlow, 1987. Pp. 129. \$8.95.  
 Ruether, R. R. *Contemporary Roman Catholicism: Crises and Challenges*. Kansas City: Sheed & Ward, 1987. Pp. 81. \$5.95.  
*The Schillebeeckx Reader*. Ed. R. Schreiter. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987 [1984]. Pp. 334. \$16.95 paper.

Takenaka, M. *God Is Rice: Asian Culture and Christian Faith*. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1987. Pp. 83. \$4.95.

Ullrich, L. *Kirche in nichtchristlicher Welt*. Leipzig: St. Benno, 1986. Pp. 76. DM 7.80.

Van Roo, W., S.J. *Telling about God 3: Understanding*. Rome: Pont. Univ. Gregoriana, 1987. Pp. xiii + 351. L. 45,000.

*Welcome, Holy Spirit: A Study of Charismatic Renewal in the Church*. Ed. L. Christenson. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1987. Pp. 432. \$16.95.

Wieman, H. N. *Science Serving Faith*. Atlanta: Scholars, 1987. Pp. 191. \$19.95; \$14.95 paper.

*Women of Faith in Dialogue*. Ed. V. R. Mollenkott. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. 195. \$9.95.

#### HISTORICAL

Chadwick, O. *From Bossuet to Newman*. 2nd ed. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1987 [1957]. Pp. 254. \$44.50; \$14.95 paper.

*The Collected Works of Edith Stein 2: Essays on Woman*. Wash., D.C.: ICS, 1987. Pp. 290. \$7.95.

*La generazione del Concilio: Tra cronaca e storia*. Ed. R. Bindi and A. Moscatelli. Rome: An. Veritas, 1986. Pp. 117.

Gilles, A. E. *The People of Anguish: The Story behind the Reformation*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1987. Pp. 194. \$7.95.

G. K. Chesterton: *Collected Works 4: Family, Society, Politics*. Ed. J. V. Schall, S.J. S.F.: Ignatius, 1987. Pp. 442. \$29.95; \$17.95 paper.

G. K. Chesterton: *Collected Works 28: The Illustrated London News 1908-1910*. Ed. L. J. Clipper. S.F.: Ignatius, 1987. Pp. 668. \$29.95; \$19.95 paper.

*Katalog gedruckter deutschsprachiger katholischer Predigtsammlungen 2*. Ed. W. Welzig. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1987. Pp. 920.

Maurice Zundel: *Un réalisme mystique*. By R. Arnaldez et al. Paris: Beauchesne, 1987. Pp. xvi + 379.

Mojzes, P. *Church and State in Postwar Eastern Europe*. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood, 1987. Pp. 109. \$35.

Newman, J. H. *Parochial and Plain Sermons*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1987. Pp. 1753. \$49.

*Rassegna di letteratura Tomistica 20: Letteratura dell'anno 1984*. Naples: Editrice Domenicana Italiana, 1987. Pp. 451. L. 50,000.

Straus, B. R. *The Catholic Church*. N.Y.: Hippocrene, 1987. Pp. 209. \$14.95.

Sundaram, V. L., S.J. *A Great Indian Jesuit: Fr. Jerome D'Souza*. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1986. Pp. xxiv + 382. \$11.00; \$9.50 paper.

Weiss, E. *City in the Woods: The Life and Design of an American Camp Meeting on Martha's Vineyard*. N.Y.: Oxford, 1987. Pp. 167. \$22.50.

#### MORAL, LAW, LITURGY

Buttrick, D. *Homiletic: Moves and Structures*. Phila.: Fortress, 1987. Pp. 498.

Desan, W. *The Planetary Man 1-2*. Wash., D.C.: Georgetown Univ., 1987. Pp. 380. \$12.95.

Desan, W. *Let the Future Come: Perspectives for a Planetary Peace*. Wash., D.C.: Georgetown Univ., 1987. Pp. 164. \$17.95; \$9.95 paper.

Elliot, C. *Comfortable Compassion? Poverty, Power and the Church*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 194. \$7.95.

*Handbook for the Common Lectionary*. Ed. P. C. Bower. Phila.: Geneva, 1987. Pp. 287. \$10.95.

Michel, V., O.S.B. *The Social Question: Essays on Capitalism and Christianity*. Collegeville, Minn.: St. John's University, 1987. Pp. 87. \$3.50.

Moore, J. F. *Sexuality and Marriage: A Christian Foundation for Making Responsible Choices*. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1987. Pp. 155. \$8.95.

*Morality and Ethics in Early Christianity*. Ed. J. L. Womer. Phila.: Fortress, 1987. Pp. 135.

Rahman, F. *Health and Medicine in the Islamic Tradition*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. 149. \$18.95.

Wink, W. *Violence and Nonviolence in South Africa: Jesus' Third Way*. Phila.: New Society, 1987. Pp. 98. \$24.95; \$6.95 paper.

#### PASTORAL AND ASCETICAL

Bacik, J. J. *The Gracious Mystery: Finding God in Ordinary Experience*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1987. Pp. 141. \$5.95.

Berryman, R. *Burning Bush and Broken Bread: Implications of a Communicating God*. Wilton, Conn.: Morehouse-Barlow, 1987. Pp. 103. \$7.95.

Cox, M. *Handbook of Christian Spirituality*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1985. Pp. 288. \$14.95.

Cunningham, L. S. *The Catholic Faith*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. v + 184. \$4.95.

DeGruchy, John W. *Theology and Ministry in Context and Crisis: A South African Perspective*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1987. Pp. 183. \$9.95.

DeMello, A., S.J. *One Minute Wisdom*. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1985. Pp. xiv + 240.

DeSiano, Frank P., C.S.P. *Presenting the Catholic Faith: A Modern Catechism for Inquirers*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. vi + 153. \$3.95.

Dubitsky, C. M. *The Kingdom of God: Challenge for Today's Christians*. Kansas City: Sheed & Ward, 1987. Pp. xi + 236. \$7.95.

Finley, M. *Catholic Spiritual Classics*. Kansas City: Sheed & Ward, 1987. Pp. 71. \$4.95.

Gallagher, J. *Voices of Strength and Hope for a Friend with AIDS*. Kansas City: Sheed & Ward, 1987. Pp. 53. \$2.95.

Lake, F. *Clinical Theology: A Theological and Psychological Basis to Clinical*

- Pastoral Care*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987 [1966]. Pp. 245. \$18.95.
- Mahedy, W., and C. Carstens. *Starting on Monday: Christian Living in the Workplace*. N.Y.: Ballantine, 1987. Pp. 165. \$11.95.
- McCloskey, P. *When You Are Angry with God*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 119. \$4.95.
- Padovani, M. H. *Healing Wounded Emotions: Overcoming Life's Hurts*. Mystic: Twenty-third, 1987. Pp. 113. \$6.95.
- Punshon, J. *Encounter with Silence: Reflections from the Quaker Tradition*. Richmond, Ind.: Friends United, 1987. Pp. 131. \$6.95.
- Risky Business: Brotherhood in American Culture*. Romeoville, Ill.: Christian Brothers Conference, 1986. Pp. 182. \$7.00.
- Rossetti, S. J. *I Am Awake: Discovering Prayer*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 101. \$3.95.
- Schillebeeckx, E. *The Church with a Human Face: A New and Expanded Theology of Ministry*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987 [1985]. Pp. xii + 308. \$11.95 paper.
- Valles, C. G., S.J. *The Art of Choosing*. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1986. Pp. viii + 135.
- When Children Suffer: A Sourcebook for Ministry with Children in Crisis*. Ed. A. D. Lester. Phila.: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 210. \$14.95.
- PHILOSOPHY, OTHER DISCIPLINES**
- Augros, R., and G. Stanciu. *The New Biology*. Boston: New Science Library, 1987. Pp. 275. \$22.50.
- Bateson, G., and M. C. Bateson. *Angels Fear: Toward an Epistemology of the Sacred*. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1987. Pp. xii + 224. \$18.95.
- Bird, G. *William James*. N.Y.: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987. Pp. 221. \$39.95.
- Border Regions of Faith: An Anthology of Religion and Social Change*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1987. Pp. 528.
- Heidegger, M. *Nietzsche 3: The Will to Power as Knowledge and as Metaphysics*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. 286. \$20.95.
- Ketcham, C. B. *The Influence of Existentialism on Ingmar Bergman*. Lewiston, N.Y.: Mellen, 1987. Pp. 381. \$59.95.
- Larson, M. A. *New Thought Religion: A Philosophy for Health, Happiness and Prosperity*. N.Y.: Philosophical Library, 1987 [1985]. Pp. 378. \$16.95; \$9.95 paper.
- Maturana, H. R., and F. J. Varela. *The Tree of Knowledge: The Biological Roots of Human Understanding*. Boston: New Science Library, 1987. Pp. 263. \$24.95.
- Melchin, K. R. *History, Ethics and Emergent Probability: Ethics, Society and History in the Work of Bernard Lonergan*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1987. Pp. xiv + 281. \$29.50; \$15.75 paper.
- Movements and Issues in World Religions: Religion, Ideology, and Politics*. Ed. C. Wei-hsun Fu and G. E. Spiegler. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood, 1987. Pp. 570. \$75.
- Nieli, R. *Wittgenstein: From Mysticism to Ordinary Language*. Albany: SUNY, 1987. Pp. 261. \$39.50; \$12.95 paper.
- Sexual Archetypes, East and West*. Ed. B. Gupta. N.Y.: Paragon, 1987. Pp. xiv + 233. \$22.95; \$12.95 paper.
- Speaking of Faith: Global Perspectives on Women, Religion & Social Change*. Ed. R. R. Ruether. Santa Cruz, Cal.: New Society, 1987. Pp. 296. \$9.95.
- Tropea, G. *Religion, Ideology and Heidegger's Concept of Falling*. Atlanta: Scholars, 1987. Pp. xviii + 241. \$18.95; \$13.95 paper.
- Women in the World's Religions: Past and Present*. Ed. U. King. N.Y.: Paragon, 1987. Pp. 261. \$22.95; \$12.95.
- SPECIAL QUESTIONS**
- Art as Religious Studies*. Ed. D. Adams & D. Apostolos-Cappadona. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. viii + 247.

- \$17.95.
- Fore, W. F. *Television and Religion: The Shaping of Faith, Values, and Culture*. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1987. Pp. 219.
- Girzone, J. F. *Joshua: A Parable for Today*. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1987 [1983]. Pp. 271. \$6.95 paper.
- Hopewell, J. F. *Congregation: Stories and Structures*. Phila.: Fortress, 1987. Pp. 219.
- Ital, G. *The Master, the Monks, and I: A Western Woman's Experience of Zen*. Great Britain: Crucible, 1987. Pp. 284. \$12.95.
- Oden, T. C. *Becoming a Minister*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. 192. \$17.95.
- Russell, L. M. *Household of Freedom: Authority in Feminist Theology*. Phila.: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 116. \$8.95.
- Sweetser, T., S.J., and C. W. Holden. *Leadership in a Successful Parish*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. xv + 203. \$9.95.
- Van Buren, P. M. *Discerning the Way*. S.F.: Harper and Row, 1987 [1980]. Pp. vii + 207. \$10.95 paper.
- Van Buren, P. M. *A Christian Theology of the People of Israel*. S.F.: Harper and Row, 1987 [1983]. \$10.95 paper.
- Wehr, D. S. *Jung & Feminism: Liberating Archetypes*. Boston: Beacon, 1987. Pp. xii + 148. \$17.95.

### THE PERFECT GIFT For '88

For the first time, you can give a gift that will last a lifetime. The perfect gift for '88 is a one-year subscription to *Theological Studies*, and a card announcing my gift, to these recipients. I enclose check/money order for each subscription: \$14.00 U.S. \$17.00 Canada and foreign. To prevent error please type or print:

(1) Recipient's Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip \_\_\_\_\_

(2) Recipient's Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip \_\_\_\_\_

My name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip \_\_\_\_\_

THIS FORM IS *NOT* FOR RENEWALS

Mail order to: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, P.O. BOX 64002, BALTIMORE, MD 21264

# Theological Studies

A Quarterly Journal  
Founded 1940

*Editor in Chief*

**WALTER J. BURGHARDT, S.J.**

*Managing Editor and Book Review Editor*

**JOHN R. KEATING, S.J.**

*Editorial Consultants*

**Raymond E. Brown, S.S.**  
Union Theological Seminary, N.Y.C.

**Gerard H. Ettliger, S.J.**  
Fordham University

**Monika Hellwig**  
Georgetown University

**Edward J. Kilmartin, S.J.**  
Boston College

**William W. Meissner, S.J.**  
Harvard University Medical School

**Michael J. Buckley, S.J.**  
Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley

**Thomas J. Green**  
Catholic University of America

**John Jay Hughes**  
Archdiocese of St. Louis

**Joseph T. Lienhard, S.J.**  
Marquette University

**John W. O'Malley**  
Weston School of Theology

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES is published in March, June,  
September, and December. Manuscripts should be sent to  
the Editor, book reviews to the Book Review Editor:

**Theological Studies**  
**Georgetown University**  
**37th & O St. N.W.**  
**Washington, D.C. 20057**



## INDEX TO VOLUME 48

### AUTHORS

CAHILL, L. S., et al. Notes on Moral Theology: 1986	87	on Moral Theology: 1986	87
CLOONEY, F. X., S.J., et al. Catholic Theology and the Study of Religion in South Asia: Widening the Context for Theological Reflection	677	MCKIM, D. K. Recent Lutheran Studies	499
COLEMAN, G. D., S.S. The Vatican Statement on Homosexuality	727	MEYER, B. F. Paul and the Resurrection of the Dead	157
DALEY, B. E., S.J. The Ministry of Disciples: Historical Reflections on the Role of Religious Priests	605	MOLONEY, R., S.J. African Christianity	505
GRIFFIN, L. The Integration of Spiritual and Temporal: Contemporary Roman Catholic Church-State Theory	225	MURPHY, C. M. The Church and Culture since Vatican II: On the Analogy of Faith and Art	317
GRIFFITHS, P. J., et al. Catholic Theology and the Study of Religion in South Asia: Widening the Context for Theological Reflection	677	NILSON, J. Doing Theology by Heart: John S. Dunne's Theological Method	65
HALLISEY, C., et al. Catholic Theology and the Study of Religion in South Asia: Widening the Context for Theological Reflection	677	O'BRIEN, W. J. Counterterrorism Deterrence/Defense and Just-War Doctrine	647
HENN, W., O.F.M.CAP. The Hierarchy of Truths Twenty Years Later	439	O'COLLINS, G., S.J., and D. KENDALL, S.J. Mary Magdalene as Major Witness to Jesus' Resurrection	631
HOLLENBACH, D., S.J. War and Peace in American Catholic Thought: A Heritage Abandoned?	711	ORSY, L., S.J. Magisterium: Assent and Dissent	473
HUNTER, D. G. Resistance to the Virginal Ideal in Late-Fourth-Century Rome: The Case of Jovinian	45	QUINLAN, M. The Ethics of Nuclear Deterrence: A Critical Comment on the Pastoral Letter of the U.S. Catholic Bishops	3
KENDALL, D., S.J., AND G. O'COLLINS, S.J. Mary Magdalene as Major Witness to Jesus' Resurrection	631	SCUKA, R. F. Whither Christianity? Charles Davis and the Future of Christian Religion	527
LAINE, J., et al. Catholic Theology and the Study of Religion in South Asia: Widening the Context for Theological Reflection	677	SMITH, M. S. God Male and Female in the Old Testament: Yahweh and His "asherah"	333
LANGAN, J., S.J., et al. Notes on Moral Theology: 1986	87	SPOHN, W. C., S.J., et al. Notes on Moral Theology: 1986	87
LIENHARD, J. T., S.J. The "Arian" Controversy: Some Categories Reconsidered	415	WILLIAMS, B., O.P. Homosexuality: The New Vatican Statement	259
MARTIN, J. H., O.P. The Injustice of Not Ordaining Women: A Problem for Medieval Theologians	303	WINTERS, F. X., S.J. The Pastoral on Peace: A Response to Sir Michael Quinlan	517
MCCORMICK, R. A., S.J., et al. Notes		WOOD, S., S.C.L. The Marriage of Baptized Nonbelievers: Faith, Contract, and Sacrament	279
		WRIGHT, J. H., S.J. The Church: Community of the Holy Spirit	25

### ARTICLES

- The "Arian" Controversy: Some Categories Reconsidered. *J. T. Lienhard*,

- S. J.* 415 Recent Lutheran Studies. *D. K McKim* 499
- The Church and Culture since Vatican II: On the Analogy of Faith and Art. *C. M. Murphy* 317
- The Church: Community of the Holy Spirit. *J. H. Wright, S.J.* 25
- Counterterror Deterrence/Defense and Just-War Doctrine. *W. J. O'Brien* 647
- Doing Theology by Heart: John S. Dunne's Theological Method. *J. Nilson* 65
- The Ethics of Nuclear Deterrence: A Critical Comment on the Pastoral Letter of the U.S. Catholic Bishops. *M. Quinlan* 3
- The Hierarchy of Truths Twenty Years Later. *W. Henn, O.F.M.Cap.* 439
- Homosexuality: The New Vatican Statement. *B. Williams, O.P.* 259
- The Injustice of Not Ordaining Women: A Problem for Medieval Theologians. *J. H. Martin, O.P.* 303
- The Integration of Spiritual and Temporal: Contemporary Roman Catholic Church-State Theory. *L. Griffin* 225
- Magisterium: Assent and Dissent. *L. Orsy, S.J.* 473
- The Marriage of Baptized Nonbelievers: Faith, Contract, and Sacrament. *S. Wood, S.C.L.* 279
- Mary Magdalene as Major Witness to Jesus' Resurrection. *G. O'Collins, S.J., and D. Kendall, S.J.* 631
- The Ministry of Disciples: Historical Reflections on the Role of Religious Priests. *B. E. Daley, S.J.* 605
- Resistance to the Virginal Ideal in Late-Fourth-Century Rome: The Case of Jovinian. *D. G. Hunter* 45
- CURRENT THEOLOGY**
- African Christology. *R. Moloney, S.J.* 505
- Catholic Theology and the Study of Religion in South Asia: Widening the Context for Theological Reflection. *F. X. Clooney, S.J., P. J. Griffiths, C. Hallisey, and J. Laine* 677
- Notes on Moral Theology: 1986. *R. A. McCormick, S.J., L. S. Cahill, W. C. Spohn, S.J., and J. Langan, S.J.* 87
- NOTES**
- God Male and Female in the Old Testament: Yahweh and His "asherah." *M. S. Smith* 333
- The Pastoral on Peace: A Response to Sir Michael Quinlan. *F. X. Winters, S.J.* 517
- Paul and the Resurrection of the Dead. *B. F. Meyer* 157
- War and Peace in American Catholic Thought: A Heritage Abandoned? *D. Hollenbach, S.J.* 711
- Whither Christianity? Charles Davis and the Future of Christian Religion. *R. F. Scuka* 527
- The Vatican Statement on Homosexuality. *G. D. Coleman, S.S.* 727
- BOOK REVIEWS**
- DE ANDIA, Y. *Homo vivens: Incorruptibilité et divinisation de l'homme selon Irénée de Lyon* (*M. A. Donovan*) 557
- AUNE, D. E. *The New Testament in Its Literary Environment* (*C. H. Talbert*) 736
- BALTHASAR, H. U. VON. *The Glory of the Lord: A Theological Aesthetics 3* (*W. M. Thompson*) 574
- BALTHASAR, H. U. VON. *The Office of Peter and the Structure of the Church* (*J. P. Galvin*) 751
- BECKWITH, R. *The Old Testament Canon of the New Testament Church and Its Background in Early Judaism* (*R. J. Clifford*) 159
- BETZ, H. D. *2 Corinthians 8 and 9* (*R. E. Brown*) 164
- The Bible in the Medieval World: Essays in Memory of Beryl Smalley (ed. K. Walsh and D. Wood) (*J. F. Kelly*) 179
- BRANDENBURGER, E. *Markus 13 und die Apokalyptik* (*J. M. McDermott*) 348
- BRETON, S. *Deux mystiques de l'excès: J.-J. Surin et Maître Eckhart* (*D. F. Duclow*) 185

# INDEX TO VOLUME 48

- BUDZISZEWSKI, J. The Resurrection of Nature: Political Theory and the Human Character (*J. W. Crossin*) 570
- By No Extraordinary Means: The Choice to Forgo Life-sustaining Food and Water (ed. J. Lynn) (*J. Tuohy*) 776
- CARMODY, D. L. The Double Cross: Ordination, Abortion, and Catholic Feminism (*L. S. Cahill*) 555
- CARROLL, M. P. The Cult of the Virgin Mary: Psychological Origins (*W. W. Meissner*) 362
- CARROLL, R. P. Jeremiah: A Commentary (*W. Brueggemann*) 343
- Catholic Perspectives on Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry (ed. M. A. Fahey) (*P. M. J. Stravinskis*) 754
- Christianity and Capitalism: Perspectives on Religion, Liberalism and the Economy (ed. B. Grelle and D. A. Kreuger) (*P. J. Rossi*) 388
- Churches in Struggle: Liberation Theologies and Social Change in North America (ed. W. K. Tabb) (*A. T. Hennelly*) 779
- Churches Respond to BEM: Official Responses to the "Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry" Text 2-3 (ed. M. Thurian) (*P. M. J. Stravinskis*) 754
- COLLETT, B. Italian Benedictine Scholars and the Reformation: The Congregation of Santa Giustina of Padua (*P. F. Grendler*) 377
- COMBLIN, J. Antropologia cristiana (*J. Gros*) 359
- COSTE, R. L'Eglise et les défis du monde: La dynamique de Vatican II (*G. H. Tavard*) 551
- COURTH, F. Trinitat in der Scholastik (*T. Reist*) 560
- CUNNINGHAM, L. The Catholic Experience (*B. Cooke*) 382
- CURRAN, C. E. Faithful Dissent (*R. Schreier*) 368
- DALLEN, J. The Reconciling Community: The Rite of Penance (*B. Cooke*) 760
- D'COSTA, G. Theology and Religious Pluralism (*F. X. Clooney*) 781
- DEAN, W. American Religious Empiricism (*B. L. Lee*) 354
- Discipleship in the New Testament (ed. F. F. Segovia) (*D. Goldsmith*) 350
- DODDS, M. J., O.P. The Unchanging Love of God: A Study of the Teaching of St. Thomas Aquinas on Divine Immutability (*J. A. Bracken*) 356
- DULLES, A., S.J. The Catholicity of the Church (*F. J. van Beeck*) 171
- Duns Scotus on the Will and Morality (ed. A. B. Wolter) (*G. J. Etzkorn*) 180
- ELLIS, J. The Russian Orthodox Church: A Contemporary History (*J. Meyendorff*) 565
- Essays in Phenomenological Theology (ed. S. W. Laycock and J. G. Hart) (*T. O'Meara*) 744
- EVANS, G. R. The Language and Logic of the Bible: The Road to Reformation (*S. H. Hendrix*) 767
- EVANS, G. R., et al. The Science of Theology (*J. A. Bracken*) 741
- Evolution and Creation (ed. E. McMullin) (*J. F. Haught*) 168
- Faith and Renewal: Commission on Faith and Order, Stavanger, 1986 (ed. T. F. Best) (*P. M. J. Stravinskis*) 754
- FIRET, J. Dynamics in Pastoring (*R. L. Kinast*) 778
- FONTINELL, E. Self, God, and Immortality: A Jamesian Investigation (*R. J. Roth*) 548
- FRAIGNEAU-JULIEN, B. Les sens spirituels et la vision de Dieu selon Syméon le nouveau théologien (*G. H. Ettlinger*) 558
- Glaube in winterlicher Zeit: Gespräch mit Karl Rahner aus den letzten Lebensjahren (ed. P. Imhof and H. Biallowons) (*H. D. Egan*) 196
- GOLLNICK, J. *Flesh as Transformation* Symbol in the Theology of Anselm of Canterbury (*H. J. Ryan*) 764
- GRANT, R. M. Gods and the One God (*M. Slusser*) 173
- GREER, R. A. Broken Lights and Mended Lives: Theology and Common Life in the Early Church (*J. T. Lienhard*) 374
- GUSTAFSON, R. F. Leo Tolstoy, Resi-

- dent and Stranger: A Study in Fiction and Theology (*P. C. Rule*) 575
- HADDAD, R. La trinité divine chez les théologiens arabes (750-1050) (*S. H. Griffith*) 176
- HAINES, R. M. Archbishop John Stratford (*T. E. Morrissey*) 765
- HANSON, P. D. The People Called: The Growth of Community in the Bible (*F. L. Moriarty*) 735
- HAPPEL, S., and J. J. WALTER. Conversion and Discipleship: A Christian Foundation for Ethics and Doctrine (*G. L. Hallett*) 386
- HEFT, J., S.M. John XXII and Papal Teaching Authority (*J. M. McDermott*) 564
- HEINZ, H. Trinitarische Begegnungen bei Bonaventura (*T. Reist*) 560
- HEINZ, J. Justification and Merit: Luther vs. Catholicism (*J. F. McCue*) 550
- HELMINIAK, D. A. The Same Jesus: A Contemporary Christology (*G. M. Fagin*) 748
- Hubert Jedin: Lebensbericht (ed. K. Reppen) (*C. J. Peter*) 195
- HUSSEY, J. M. The Orthodox Church in the Byzantine Empire (*J. Meyendorff*) 375
- JENNINGS, T. W., JR. Beyond Theism: A Grammar of God-Language (*T. W. Tilley*) 167
- KAMEN, H. Inquisition and Society in Spain in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries (*J. F. Chorprenning*) 379
- Karl Rahner in Dialogue: Conversations and Interviews 1965-1982 (ed. P. Imhof and H. Biallowons) (*R. Kress*) 380
- KERR, F. Theology after Wittgenstein (*J. M. Dittberner*) 543
- KIRKPATRICK, F. G. Community: A Trinity of Models (*J. A. Bracken*) 199
- KOBLE, J. F. Vatican II and Phenomenology (*T. O'Meara*) 744
- KUGEL, J. L., and R. A. GREER. Early Biblical Interpretation (*R. L. Wilken*) 538
- KUNG, H., et al. Christianity and the World Religions (*B. J. Verkamp*) 577
- LAFONT, G., O.S.B. Dieu, le temps et l'être (*J. Farrelly*) 545
- LANGSTON, D. C. God's Willing Knowledge: The Influence of Scotus' Analysis of Omniscience (*A. B. Wolter*) 182
- LATOURELLE, R. Miracles de Jésus et théologie du miracle (*L. H. Madden*) 750
- LEECH, K. Experiencing God: Theology as Spirituality (*D. L. Gelpi*) 201
- LIBANIO, J. B., and M. C. BINGEMER. Escatologia cristiana (*J. Gros*) 359
- LUEDEMANN, G. Paul, Apostle to the Gentiles: Studies in Chronology (*J. A. Fitzmyer*) 160
- Magistri Guillelmi Altissiodorensis Summa aurea, Liber tertius, Liber quartus (ed. J. Ribailier) (*G. Gál*) 175
- MALHERBE, A. J. Moral Exhortation: A Greco-Roman Sourcebook (*A. C. Mitchell*) 737
- MAZZA, E. The Eucharistic Prayers of the Roman Rite (*J. D. Lurance*) 758
- MCCLENDON, J. W. Ethics: Systematic Theology 1 (*P. J. Rossi*) 567
- MEEKS, W. A. The Moral World of the First Christians (*L. T. Johnson*) 541
- MELVILLE, A. M. Louis William Du Bourg (*R. E. Curran*) 769
- MEYER, B. F. The Early Christians: Their World Mission & Self-Discovery (*S. B. Marrow*) 540
- MILLER, J. W., and J. H. HUGHES. A History of Ancient Israel and Judah (*F. L. Moriarty*) 341
- MOONEY, C. F. Public Virtue: Law and the Social Character of Religion (*J. A. Coleman*) 569
- MORRIS, T. V. The Logic of God Incarnate (*P. F. Lakeland*) 547
- MÜLLER, G. L. Gemeinschaft und Verehrung der Heiligen: Geschichtlich-systematische Grundlegung der Hagiologie (*R. Kress*) 361
- NICHOLSON, E. W. God and His People: Covenant and Theology in the Old Testament (*K. G. O'Connell*) 342
- OESTERREICHER, J. M. The New Encounter between Christians and Jews (*J. P. Hogan*) 383

- OGDEN, S. M. On Theology (*J. A. Bracken*) 741
- ORSY, L. Marriage in Canon Law: Text and Comments/Reflections and Questions (*J. F. Martin*) 372
- PACINI, D. S. The Cunning of Modern Religious Thought (*J. E. Thiel*) 772
- PAGÉ, J.-G. La source: Au coeur de la foi en Jésus Christ (*G. Mansini*) 170
- POHIER, J. God—in Fragments (*R. J. Schreuter*) 165
- PROUDFOOT, W. Religious Experience (*C. D. Hardwick*) 352
- RITSCHL, D. The Logic of Theology (*J. A. Bracken*) 742
- RUETHER, R. R. Women-Church: Theology and Practice of Feminist Liturgical Communities (*L. S. Cahill*) 554
- RULLA, L. M., S.J. Anthropology of the Christian Vocation 1: Interdisciplinary Bases (*J. M. McDermott*) 553
- RUSSELL, P. A. Lay Theology in the Reformation: Popular Pamphleteers in Southwest Germany, 1521–1525 (*J. P. Donnelly*) 188
- Saint Augustin et la Bible (ed. A.-M. la Bonnardière) (*W. C. Marceau*) 762
- SCHMITT, P. La réforme catholique: Le combat de Maldonat (1534–1583) (*J. E. Bruns*) 192
- SCHULZ, H.-J. The Byzantine Liturgy: Symbolic Structure and Faith Expression (*E. J. Kilmartin*) 370
- SEGAL, A. F. Rebecca's Children: Judaism and Christianity in the Roman World (*R. F. O'Toole*) 347
- SHEEHAN, T. The First Coming: How the Kingdom of God Became Christianity (*J. P. Galvin*) 739
- Shepherds Speak: American Bishops Confront the Social and Moral Issues That Challenge Christians Today (ed. D. M. Corrado and J. F. Hinchey) (*J. Hughes*) 367
- Le Siècle des lumières et la Bible (ed. Y. Belaval and D. Bourel) (*G. H. Tavard*) 562
- SMEETON, D. D. Lollard Themes in the Reformation Theology of William Tyndale (*D. K. McKim*) 768
- STANLEY, D. M., S.J. "I Encountered God!" The Spiritual Exercises with the Gospel of Saint John (*J. R. Keating*) 572
- STEPHENS, W. P. The Theology of Huldrych Zwingli (*D. K. McKim*) 187
- STEVENSON, K. Eucharist and Offering (*E. J. Cutrone*) 756
- STOWERS, S. K. Letter Writing in Greco-Roman Antiquity (*A. C. Mitchell*) 737
- STUHLMACHER, P. Reconciliation, Law & Righteousness (*R. J. Karris*) 538
- SURIN, K. Theology and the Problem of Evil (*T. W. Tilley*) 747
- SWINBURNE, R. The Evolution of the Soul (*C. J. Peter*) 358
- TAYLOR, M. God Is Love: A Study in the Theology of Karl Rahner (*H. D. Egan*) 198
- Theology and Bioethics: Exploring the Foundations and Frontiers (ed. E. E. Shelp) (*J. J. Paris*) 202
- Twenty Years of Jewish-Catholic Relations (ed. E. J. Fisher et al.) (*J. P. Hogan*) 383
- VAN OSS, A. C. Catholic Colonialism: A Parish History of Guatemala, 1524–1821 (*E. J. Burrus*) 194
- Vatican II Revisited by Those Who Were There (ed. A. Stacpoole) (*J. J. Hughes*) 365
- VEATCH, R. M. The Patient as Partner: A Theory of Human-Experimentation Ethics (*J. J. Doyle*) 774
- VORGRIMLER, H. Understanding Karl Rahner: An Introduction to His Life and Thought (*R. Kress*) 380
- Who in the World: A Study of Ministry (Edeco-Nadeo Standing Comm.) (*P. M. J. Stravinskas*) 754
- WILHELMSSEN, E. Cognition and Communication in John of the Cross (*S. Payne*) 190
- WOGAMAN, J. P. Economics and Ethics: A Christian Inquiry (*P. J. Rossi*) 388
- Women and Religion in America: A Documentary History 3: 1900–1968 (ed. R. R. Ruether and R. S. Keller) (*L. S. Cahill*) 554

## SHORTER NOTICES

- ANDERSON, H. The Family and Pastoral Care (*M J McGinniss*) 218
- ANONYMI AUCTORIS *Theognosiae* (saec. ix/x) Dissertatio contra Iudaeos (ed. M. Hostens) (*W. J. Burghardt*) 400
- AUTHORITY, COMMUNITY AND CONFLICT (ed. M. Kolbenschlag) (*S Wood*) 396
- BARTH, K. Witness to the Word: A Commentary on John 1 (*R W Palmer*) 392
- THE BIBLICAL HERITAGE IN MODERN CATHOLIC SCHOLARSHIP (ed. J. J. Collins and J. D. Crossan) (*J. R. Donahue*) 783
- BOGLIOLO, L. La filosofia cristiana: Il problema, la storia, la struttura (*S Bevans*) 393
- BOSSHARD, S. N. Erschafft die Welt sich selbst? (*P. J. Cahill*) 393
- BOUYER, L. Newman's Vision of Faith (*J T. Ford*) 591
- BOYLE, P. J., S.J. Parvitas materiae in sexto in Contemporary Catholic Thought (*E. C. Vacek*) 794
- BROCKELMAN, P. Time and Self: Phenomenological Explorations (*R. F. Scuka*) 207
- BROWN, N. Christians in a Pluralist Society (*J. J. Conlon*) 596
- BULTMANN, Retrospect and Prospect: The Centenary Symposium at Wellesley (ed. E. C. Hobbs) (*R. F. Scuka*) 593
- BURNS, M. P., V.S.M. Sainte Jeanne de Chantal: Correspondance 1: 1605-1621 (*W. C. Marceau*) 790
- BYRNE, B., S.J. Reckoning with Romans: A Contemporary Reading of Paul's Gospel (*S B. Marrow*) 787
- CALLAN, T. Forgetting the Root: The Emergence of Christianity from Judaism (*D. J. Harrington*) 580
- CATHOLIC BOSTON: STUDIES IN RELIGION AND COMMUNITY (ed. R. E. Sullivan and J. M. O'Toole) (*J P Chinnici*) 213
- CHADWICK, H. Augustine (*W. C. Marceau*) 587
- CHADWICK, O. Britain and the Vatican during the Second World War (*J. Hennessey*) 792
- CHILTON, B. Targumic Approaches to the Gospels (*D. J. Harrington*) 581
- THE CHURCH RENEWED: THE DOCUMENTS OF VATICAN II RECONSIDERED (ed. G. P. Schner) (*R. F. Costigan*) 584
- FROM CLOISTER TO CLASSROOM: MONASTIC AND SCHOLASTIC APPROACHES TO TRUTH (ed. E. R. Elder) (*W. R. Ribando*) 588
- THE CODE OF CANON LAW: A TEXT AND COMMENTARY (ed. J. A. Coriden et al.) (*L Orsy*) 218
- COLLINS, R. F. Christian Morality: Biblical Foundations (*A. J. Tambasco*) 594
- CONSTANTELOS, D. J. Issues and Dialogues in the Orthodox Church since World War Two (*G. C Papademetriou*) 403
- CRAIGIE, P. C. The Old Testament: Its Background, Growth, and Content (*F L. Moriarty*) 580
- D'AVRAY, D. L. The Preaching of the Friars: Sermons Diffused from Paris before 1300 (*T E. Morrissey*) 789
- DEGRUCHY, J. W. The Church Struggle in South Africa (*J P. Hogan*) 794
- ECRITS APOCRYPHES SUR LES APÔTRES: Traduction de l'édition arménienne de Venise 1 (tr. L. Leloir) (*G H Ettlinger*) 788
- EDWARDS, D. What Are They Saying about Salvation? (*G. Mansini*) 395
- THE ETHICS OF BELIEF DEBATE (ed. G. D. McCarthy) (*T W Tilley*) 216
- FENHAGEN, J. C. Invitation to Holiness (*W J Sneek*) 404
- FISCHER, K. Gotteserfahrung: Mystagogie in der Theologie Karl Rahners und in der Theologie der Befreiung (*H. D. Egan*) 594
- FOUREZ, G. Good News for the World (*J. P. Hogan*) 404
- FUJITA, N. S. A Crack in the Jar: What Ancient Documents Tell Us about the New Testament (*L. J Topel*) 390
- GAVENTA, B. R. From Darkness to Light: Aspects of Conversion in the New Testament (*W. G. Thompson*) 788
- GOERGEN, D. J. A Theology of Jesus 1: The Mission and Ministry of Jesus (*J P Galvin*) 584

GRIGG, R. Symbol and Empowerment: Paul Tillich's Post-theistic System ( <i>R. F. Scuka</i> )	793	Vorgeschichte des Donatismus ( <i>R. B. Eno</i> )	586
A Guide to Contemporary Hermeneutics (ed. K. McKim) ( <i>R. L. Maddox</i> )	582	The Life of Bishop Wilfrid by Eddius Stephanus (ed. B. Colgrave) ( <i>J. F. Kelly</i> )	399
GULA, R. M., S.S. What Are They Saying about Euthanasia? ( <i>V. M. Burns</i> )	405	LYON, K. B. Toward a Practical Theology of Aging ( <i>M. J. McGinniss</i> )	219
HALL, D. J. Imaging God: Dominion as Stewardship ( <i>W. Brueggemann</i> )	405	Maria e la chiesa oggi: Atti del 5° Simposio Mariologico Internazionale (ed. S. M. Meo) ( <i>E. R. Carroll</i> )	209
HANIGAN, J. P. As I Have Loved You: The Challenge of Christian Ethics ( <i>P. S. Keane</i> )	217	MARKISH, S. Erasmus and the Jews ( <i>M. R. O'Connell</i> )	401
HAUGHEY, J. C. The Holy Use of Money: Personal Finances in Light of Christian Faith ( <i>A. J. Tambasco</i> )	595	MARROW, S. B. Paul, His Letters and His Theology ( <i>R. J. Karris</i> )	204
HAUGHT, J. F. What Is God? How To Think about the Divine ( <i>D. J. Casey</i> )	394	MCCARTHY, D. J., S.J. Institution and Narrative: Collected Essays ( <i>F. L. Moriarty</i> )	204
HAVENER, I., O.S.B. Q: The Sayings of Jesus ( <i>J. M. Reese</i> )	786	MACGAFFEY, W. Religion and Society in Central Africa: The baKongo of Lower Zaire ( <i>J. M. Murphy</i> )	597
The Hebrew Bible in Literary Criticism (ed. A. Preminger and E. L. Greenstein) ( <i>L. Boadt</i> )	784	MCGRATH, A. The Making of Modern German Christology: From the Enlightenment to Pannenberg ( <i>J. E. Thiel</i> )	592
HOUSLEY, N. The Avignon Papacy and the Crusades, 1305-1378 ( <i>T. E. Morrissey</i> )	589	Migne et le renouveau des études patristiques: Actes du Colloque de Saint-Flour, 7-8 juillet 1975 (ed. A. Mandouze and J. Fouilheron) ( <i>M. A. Fahey</i> )	590
The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia 3: K-P (ed. G. W. Bromiley) ( <i>J. A. Fitzmyer</i> )	784	MORRIS, K. E. Bonhoeffer's Ethic of Discipleship: A Study in Social Psychology, Political Thought, and Religion ( <i>J. D. Godsey</i> )	214
John Ruusbroec: The Spiritual Espousals and Other Works (tr. J. A. Wiseman) ( <i>D. F. Duclow</i> )	211	MURPHY, F. X., C.S.S.R. The Christian Way of Life ( <i>D. Callam</i> )	586
JUNGEL, E. Karl Barth: A Theological Legacy ( <i>R. W. Palmer</i> )	792	The New Westminster Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship (ed. J. G. Davies) ( <i>E. J. Kilmartin</i> )	397
KAUFMAN, P. I. The "Polytyque Church": Religion and Early Tudor Political Culture, 1485-1516 ( <i>T. E. Morrissey</i> )	590	O'CONNELL, R. J. Imagination and Metaphysics in St. Augustine ( <i>W. C. Marceau</i> )	399
KELLY, J. F. Why Is There a New Testament? ( <i>D. J. Grimes</i> )	390	O'DAY, G. R. Revelation in the Fourth Gospel ( <i>P. Perkins</i> )	786
Knowing Religiously (ed. L. S. Rouner) ( <i>P. E. Devenish</i> )	205	ONG, W. J., S.J. Hopkins, the Self, and God ( <i>J. J. Feeney</i> )	798
KRAUS, H.-J. Theology of the Psalms ( <i>R. J. Clifford</i> )	785	Orthodox Perspectives on Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry (ed. G. Limouris and N. M. Vapos) ( <i>J. Gros</i> )	208
KRETZSCHMAR, L. The Voice of Black Theology in South Africa ( <i>J. P. Hogan</i> )	794	OVERFIELD, J. H. Humanism and Scholasticism in Late Medieval Germany	
KRIEGBAUM, B., S.J. Kirche der Traditoren oder Kirche der Martyrer: Die			

( <i>T. E. Morrissey</i> )	212	tion in Twelfth Century Europe ( <i>T. E. Morrissey</i> )	210
PELIKAN, J. The Mystery of Continuity: Memory and Eternity in the Thought of Saint Augustine ( <i>E. TeSelle</i> )	588	STOLZMAN, W., S.J. The Pipe and Christ: A Christian-Sioux Dialogue ( <i>C. F. Starkloff</i> )	798
PLANAS, R. Liberation Theology: The Political Expression of Religion ( <i>A. T. Hennelly</i> )	596	TAFI, R., S.J. The Liturgy of the Hours in East and West: The Origins of the Divine Office and Its Meaning for Today ( <i>A. B. Henderson</i> )	398
PLEVNIK, J. What Are They Saying about Paul? ( <i>J. Reumann</i> )	582	TAVES, A. The Household of Faith: Roman Catholic Devotions in Mid-Nineteenth-Century America ( <i>J. Hennesey</i> )	791
PORTIER, W. L. Isaac Hecker and the First Vatican Council ( <i>P. K. Hennessy</i> )	401	TETE, P., S.J. A Missionary Social Worker in India: J. B. Hoffmann, the Chota Nagpur Tenancy Act and the Catholic Co-operatives 1893-1928 ( <i>W. A. Cook</i> )	213
PREUS, M. C. Eloquence and Ignorance in Augustine's <i>On the Nature and Origin of the Soul</i> ( <i>R. J. O'Connell</i> )	210	THEISEN, J. P., O.S.B. Community and Disunity: Symbols of Grace and Sin ( <i>B. O. McDermott</i> )	207
Questions of Special Urgency (ed. J. A. Dwyer) ( <i>J. A. Coleman</i> )	402	THOMPSON, W. G., S.J. Paul and His Message for Life's Journey ( <i>J. Reumann</i> )	787
RAMSHAW-SCHMIDT, G. Christ in Sacred Speech: The Meaning of Liturgical Language ( <i>S. Wood</i> )	397	TRETHOWAN, L., O.S.B. Process Theology and the Christian Tradition: An Essay in Post-Vatican II Thinking ( <i>J. M. McDermott</i> )	206
RANDOUR, M. L. Women's Psyche, Women's Spirit: The Reality of Relationships ( <i>L. S. Cahill</i> )	797	UNDERWOOD, R. L., Empathy and Confrontation in Pastoral Care ( <i>M. J. McGinniss</i> )	219
Rationality, Religious Belief, and Moral Commitment: New Essays in the Philosophy of Religion (ed. R. Audi and W. J. Wainwright) ( <i>T. W. Tilley</i> )	204	URBAN, L. A Short History of Christian Thought ( <i>J. Heft</i> )	585
RAUSCH, T. P. The Roots of the Catholic Tradition ( <i>D. J. Grimes</i> )	398	Vatican II and Its Documents: An American Reappraisal (ed. T. E. O'Connell) ( <i>D. J. Grimes</i> )	215
REIST, T., O.F.M.CONV. Saint Bonaventure as a Biblical Commentator ( <i>R. P. Descharnais</i> )	211	VAWTER, B., C.M. The Path of Wisdom: Biblical Investigations ( <i>J. R. Donahue</i> )	783
Religion and American Public Life (ed. R. W. Lovin) ( <i>J. A. Coleman</i> )	795	The Westminster Dictionary of Christian Ethics (ed. J. F. Childress and J. Macquarrie) ( <i>J. W. Crossin</i> )	215
Religious Imagination (ed. J. P. Mackey) ( <i>R. Schreiter</i> )	583	WILLIAMS, M. E. St. Alban's College, Valladolid: Four Centuries of English Catholic Presence in Spain ( <i>P. Caraman</i> )	790
RYNNE, X. John Paul's Extraordinary Synod: A Collegial Achievement ( <i>J. J. Hughes</i> )	210	WOLFF-SALIN, M. No Other Light: Points of Convergence in Psychology and Spirituality ( <i>W. J. Sneek</i> )	796
Sayings Parallels: A Workbook for the Jesus Tradition (ed. J. D. Crossan) ( <i>W. S. Kurz</i> )	391	WOODS, R., O.P. Eckhart's Way ( <i>D. F. Duclow</i> )	400
SCHÜLLER, B., S.J. Wholly Human: Essays on the Theory and Language of Morality ( <i>G. Grisez</i> )	216		
SENN, F. C. Protestant Spiritual Traditions ( <i>R. Bondi</i> )	795		
SIMUNDSON, D. J. The Message of Job: A Theological Commentary ( <i>D. J. Harrington</i> )	389		
STIEFEL, T. The Intellectual Revolu-			