

## BOOK REVIEWS

**THE OLDER TESTAMENT: THE SURVIVAL OF THEMES FROM THE ANCIENT ROYAL CULT IN SECTARIAN JUDAISM AND EARLY CHRISTIANITY.** By Margaret Barker. London: SPCK, 1987. Pp. 314. £40.

This volume is an attempt to stand the conventional understanding of biblical religion on its head. Barker is convinced that modern scholarship is guilty of fundamentally misunderstanding the biblical text, and that "this misreading is one that has been forced upon us by those who transmitted the texts" (1). In brief, the ritual and mythology of the old royal cult were suppressed by Deuteronomistic reformers in the exilic period, and consequently are reflected only in a very fragmentary way in the canonical text. The old tradition did not die out, however, but survived especially in the apocalyptic writings and became the basis of early Christianity. The key to understanding this "older testament" is the collection of writings known as *1 Enoch*. The study begins with a fairly lengthy exposition of *Enoch*, which argues that "We assume too easily that it was the apocalyptists who altered the ancient traditions of Israel, with an influx of foreign ideas; exactly the opposite may be nearer the truth" (24). She then argues that Proverbs is not representative of "old wisdom." According to her working model, "There existed in Israel as elsewhere wise men whose interests and skills covered all those listed in Wisd 7:17 ff. and implied by Job 28. This wisdom was the knowledge which the angels brought from heaven to corrupt the earth in the Enochic account" (94). Traces of this older "angel mythology" are then identified in allusions to the Holy One(s) and in First Isaiah. The transition in the religion is discussed with reference to Deuteronomy, Second Isaiah, and the Restoration Era. Further evidence of the survival of the old religion is then found in Third Isaiah, the Menorah, the Eden stories, and Job.

There has been growing appreciation in recent years of the fact that much of the mythology of Israel was excluded from the canonical text by the (especially Deuteronomic) editors, so that allusions such as we find in Gen 6 (the descent of the sons of God) or Isa 24 (the punishment of the host of heaven) are now virtually unintelligible. (See, e.g., the recent essays on *Ancient Israelite Religion*, in honor of Frank Moore Cross [ed. P. D. Miller et al.; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987]). It is also widely agreed that the royal cult was the *Sitz im Leben* for much Israelite mythology. What is really novel about B.'s thesis is its extreme formulation, and the oddity of taking *1 Enoch* as representative of pre-Deuteronomic religion. It is possible that the fuller narratives of *Enoch* are presupposed in passages like Gen 6 and Isa 24, but other possibilities can also be imagined. In any case, there is still much in *1 Enoch* and apocalyptic

literature for which there is no established parallel in Israel before the Hellenistic age. (The judgment of the dead is perhaps the most significant point.) B. allows neither development in the "old religion" nor any foreign influence. Her position would seem to be determined by theological prejudice just as much as that of the scholarly establishment against which she polemicizes. We are also left to wonder where the "new religion" of the Hebrew Bible came from and how it attained its dominance in the canonical text.

Nonetheless, it should be emphasized that there is an element of truth in this book. Ancient Israel had a fuller mythology than Deuteronomic theology suggests, and some elements of it survived in the late non-canonical (and some canonical) literature. Extreme and oversimplified arguments sometimes have the advantage of attracting attention where more balanced presentations do not. If this book stirs some interest in the mythological aspects of Israelite religion, it will have served a useful purpose.

*University of Notre Dame*

JOHN J. COLLINS

**SHARING THE EUCHARISTIC BREAD: THE WITNESS OF THE NEW TESTAMENT.** By Xavier Léon-Dufour, S.J. Translated from the French by Matthew J. O'Connell. New York: Paulist, 1986. Pp. iv + 391. \$12.95.

It would be difficult to name another theological reality that in itself so focuses the fundamental concerns of all the major areas of Christian theology—biblical, dogmatic, liturgical, etc.—as does the Last Supper. In this one event the Lord summed up and embodied his own personal meaning and that of the whole human race. L. studies the various NT accounts of Jesus' final meal in a work that is directed precisely to their meaning for Christian and human life. This he does with command of exegetical methods and the learned insight of a major theologian.

L. asserts two fundamental ideas which he first articulated in the *Supplément* to the *Dictionnaire de la Bible* 25 years previously: First, there exist in the NT accounts two separate traditions: (a) "the cultic," grounding the Eucharistic practice of the Church, and (b) "the farewell discourse," Jesus' historical last will and testament. These two traditions are represented (for the most part but not exclusively) by the Synoptics and the Fourth Gospel respectively. By juxtaposing the two, the NT establishes the vital link between ritual and the rest of Christian life, between worship and the service of others. Secondly, if the texts are read as one might read other accounts about historical events, i.e. as narratives of action and dialogue, a more accurate understanding is possible. For one thing, later history's exaggerated stress on bread and wine as objective presences of Christ is effectively removed. They emerge more clearly

as vehicles of communication, as "symbols," through which the Lord Jesus gives himself to the Father, to the disciples at the meal, and to the rest of humanity of all ages.

L. structures his study of the NT accounts in four parts: (1) A "synchronic" reading of all the accounts together, to determine (a) how the early Christians understood the Eucharist and (b) what evidence of the original event can be uncovered. Jesus stands out strikingly as the primary agent and core reality in the event. (2) A "diachronic," tradition-history reading of the accounts establishes the two strains of "testamentary" and "cultic" traditions. This latter tradition is divisible into the "Antiochene" (Pl, Lk), which L. surmises is the more ancient, and the "Markan" (Mk, Mt). Next, L. provides especially insightful analyses of Jesus' words over the bread and the cup and the call for remembrance, concluding that, although all three sets of sayings may have originated with Jesus himself, only those over the bread can be ascribed to him with any certainty. Here conclusions of recent studies on the OT aspects of memorial and *todah*-sacrifice in the Eucharist are used, especially those of C. Giraud. (3) The individual NT institution accounts and other major NT Eucharistic texts are studied within the overall theologies of each of their respective authors, from Paul to John. (4) "The Overture." In this short section L. draws out what for him are the major truths highlighted in his study, most especially that liturgy is basically a relational, community activity.

Ironically, there appear to be traces in L.'s language of the excessive dichotomy between cult and Christian life that he wants to overcome. E.g., "Cult may be at the heart of the life of brotherhood and sisterhood, but it is not therefore a 'higher' degree of that life or its 'summit'; i.e., it is not above the life of charity but within it as its source of inspiration" (299). Such statements are certainly true of "cult" conceived of as ritualism, but for this reviewer it is difficult to see how true Christian liturgy, as one moment in Christian life, is not at the same time its "summit" or most intense realization.

Here is a clear and admirable translation of a significant and tightly argued work in NT criticism. Essential for liturgists and ecumenists, it is rich in valuable insights for anyone willing to mine its stubborn veins.

*Creighton University, Omaha*

JOHN D. LAURANCE, S.J.

PSYCHOLOGICAL ASPECTS OF PAULINE THEOLOGY. By Gerd Theissen. Translated from the first German edition by John P. Galvin. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987. Pp. xiii + 433. \$34.95.

There was a day when to be accused of psychologizing Paul was one of the gravest exegetical sins a critic could level against you. But thanks to

Theissen's monograph, days of such sin-calling may well be over.

This monograph, which deals almost exclusively with certain passages in Romans and 1-2 Corinthians, is divided into six parts. Part 1 handles the theoretical problems of psychological exegesis: (1) learning theory or religion as socially learned experience and behavior; (2) psychodynamic approach or religion as confrontation with the unconscious; (3) cognitive approach or religion as construction of an interpreted world. In each of the remaining five parts of the study these psychological categories will reappear. Part 2 is entitled "The Secrets of the Heart: The Disclosure of Unconscious Motives through Pauline Theology" and deals with 1 Cor 4:1-5, 14:20-25, and Rom 2:16. Part 3, which is largely concerned with 2 Cor 3:4-4:6, bears the title "The Veil of Moses and the Unconscious Aspects of the Law." Part 4 treats "Law and Sin: Raising the Conflict to Consciousness according to Romans 7:7-23." Part 5, which focuses on 1 Cor 14, is about "Glossolalia—Language of the Unconscious?" Part 6 ends the study: "Wisdom for the Perfect as Higher Consciousness: 1 Corinthians 2:6-16." An extensive index of biblical and nonbiblical passages concludes the monograph.

In his treatment of each part and of each of the major Pauline passages, T. moves through three chapters. After a chapter apiece on text analysis and tradition analysis, he devotes the lion's share of each part to a chapter on psychological analysis. For my part, I found the chapters on text and tradition analysis to be incisive and brimming over with new insights. The chapters on psychological analyses I found generally less helpful because (1) the technical terminology of the psychologies under use was unfamiliar, (2) T. was eclectic in his use of psychological theories, (3) the insights generated only occasionally moved significantly and convincingly beyond those conveyed by the text and tradition analyses. An example, taken from what T. writes about the psychodynamic aspects of 2 Cor 3:4-4:6, may be illustrative of his eclectic approach: "We now formulate our thesis: The veil symbolizes a boundary between consciousness and the unconscious. It is eliminated in Christ. When Christ opens access to the unconscious, the aggressive power of the historical norm comes (negatively) to light, but (positively) Christ as the image of God develops an 'archetypal' power that transforms us. While the exposure of the aggressive norm can be well described with the concepts of Freud's psychoanalysis, categories of Jung's analytic psychology are more appropriate for the investigation of the transforming image" (143).

An instance of a potentially rich insight into the contradiction between Phil 3 and Rom 7 occurs on p. 242: "Only together do Philippians 3 and Romans 7 give an accurate picture. The demonstrative pride in the law of Paul the Pharisee was the formation of a reaction to an unconscious

conflict with the law, in which the law became a factor eliciting anxiety. At the time Paul could not admit to himself his suffering under the law. But when the veil fell from his heart through his encounter with Christ, he recognized the shadow side of his zeal for the law. Romans 7 is the result of a long retrospective bringing into consciousness of a conflict that had once been unconscious."

This is a learned and possibly pathbreaking study. We are in T.'s debt for his learned text and tradition analyses of certain Pauline texts and for arousing our curiosity to see what further paths into Pauline studies might be initiated by psychological studies.

*St. Louis, Mo.*

ROBERT J. KARRIS, O.F.M.

**THE BIBLE WITHOUT THEOLOGY: THE THEOLOGICAL TRADITION AND ALTERNATIVES TO IT.** By Robert A. Oden, Jr. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. ix + 198. \$18.95.

This volume by the head of the department of religion at Dartmouth College is a disjointed collection of five independent studies. The first two are critical and historical summaries of broad areas. Chapter 1 contends that the German tradition of historiography of the 18th and 19th centuries shaped biblical study in two primary ways. First, since every culture was viewed as an organic individual, the religion of Israel could be particularized and absolutized. Second, since authentic historical reconstruction is able to discover the working of God in history, objective biblical work is capable of proving the superiority of biblical religion. Biblical study's captivity has separated it from many other disciplines in the university. Chapter 2 argues that biblical study has tended to separate stories in the Bible sharply from the myths of other cultures. Myth has been exiled from the Bible by definition. If myth is, as the Grimm brothers said, a story about gods, then a monotheistic Bible would have no myths. Such a posture has added to the separation between biblical study and other disciplines within the university.

The next three chapters are concerned to interpret specific texts. Chapter 3 argues that the clothing of Adam and Eve in Gen 3:21 is not an act of divine graciousness, as a line of interpretation coming from the Talmud, Calvin, and Milton contends, but rather a symbol of human status as distinct from that of the divine. This is shown by comparative work. Chapter 4 uses the anthropological insights about how lineage and kinship structures are often used to define group identity to interpret the Jacob cycle in Genesis. This material in Genesis has the same function as elsewhere in other cultures ancient and modern. Chapter 5 claims that sacred prostitution did not actually exist in the Ancient Near East but that, as elsewhere, this was a charge made against a group's neighbors

about sexual matters that served to clarify the boundaries of a people's own sense of self.

The purpose of the collection of five studies is to oppose a thoroughly comparative and anthropological approach to the Bible to one which is historical and emphasizes the individuality of the book and its contents. The motive seems to be that the former method will allow biblical study a place of acceptance in the curriculum of the modern university.

If a historical approach emphasizing individuality is regarded as controlled by apologetic motives, is it not also true that an exclusively comparative method emphasizing what all cultures have in common is likewise determined by philosophical presuppositions and is often apologetic as well? Why must the two approaches be played off against one another as irreconcilable opposites? Why not allow the one to critique the other and benefit from both?

Is it correct to assume that the only way that biblical study can find acceptance in the modern university is for it to use exclusively a comparative and anthropological methodology? Is it correct to assume that if a historical methodology is employed, it must automatically involve importing the idealistic assumptions of 18th- and 19th-century German scholarship? Is it enough to expect biblical texts to give us only the same message that texts from other cultures can give us? If they are religious documents, what is their distinctive religious message? Can an anthropological and comparative method give us this information?

*Wake Forest University*

CHARLES H. TALBERT

**PATROLOGY 4: THE GOLDEN AGE OF LATIN PATRISTIC LITERATURE: FROM THE COUNCIL OF NICEA TO THE COUNCIL OF CHALCEDON.** Edited by Angelo Di Berardino, with an introduction by Johannes Quasten. Translated from the Italian by Placid Solari, O.S.B. Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1986. Pp. xxviii + 667. \$48; \$39.95.

A persistent frustration of patristic scholars and students since 1960 has been the long yearning for the fourth volume of Johannes Quasten's widely acclaimed "manual" of patrology (the first three, original English volumes appeared in 1950, 1953, and 1960, with updating in several European languages in succeeding years). The sheer breadth of the task, together with prolonged illness, kept Quasten from completing the work on his own. Eight scholars of the Patristic Institute in Rome (the Augustinianum) took it upon themselves to finish the research (it is not clear how much Quasten contributed) and publish it in Italian. Nine chapters: Adalbert Hamman, "The Turnabout of the Fourth Century"; Manlio Simonetti, "Hilary of Poitiers and the Arian Crisis in the West"; Maria Grazia Mara, "Ambrose of Milan, Ambrosiaster and Nicetas";

Jean Gribomont, "The Translations. Jerome and Rufinus"; Angelo Di Berardino, "Christian Poetry"; Agostino Trapé, "Saint Augustine"; Vitorino Grossi, "Adversaries and Friends of Augustine"; Hamman, "Writers of Gaul"; Basil Studer, "Italian Writers until Pope Leo the Great." Excellent treatments all, by recognized experts.

First, a clarification. *Patrology 4* is a translation of the Italian *Patrologia 3* (Turin: Marietti, 1978). The difference in numbering stems from the fact that the Italian (and the Spanish) Vol. 2 translated Quasten's English Vols. 2 and 3.

The editors inform us that "While following in its general outlines the methodological criteria of Quasten, the work attempts to see the Fathers in their political and social context and to give more space to the problematics of contemporary patristic research" (Preface). Hence Hamman's informative 32-page introductory chapter, providing a political, geographical, social, ecclesiastical, and doctrinal framework of the fourth century. The format of the following eight chapters will be familiar to those who have used Quasten: a summary life, analysis of writings, select areas of doctrine—interspersed with over 400 bibliographies, many of them quite extensive. In typically Quasten style, there are 55 pages of indexes: OT and NT, ancient writers and their works, more modern authors, Greek words, and subject matter. With the aid of the Spanish translation (*Patrología 3: La edad de oro de la literatura patristica latina* [Madrid: BAC, 1981]) Solari has corrected segments of the bibliography, and he has added some more recent titles.

A work of this nature inevitably limits a translator's personal style. Solari has managed to wed fidelity to the original Italian with a fair felicity of English expression. Not all is perfect, of course. There are inadvertent omissions: on p. 5, line 7, the main verb (*provengono*) has not been translated; on p. 23, line 5, "96" should appear before Leo's "sermons." An occasional misprint in so massive and detailed a volume is forgivable, but it grates on patristic nerves to see the author of chapter 4, Jean Gribomont, consistently misspelled Griboment. More substantively, the Spanish translation added 15 new notices: on Philip the Presbyter, Flavinius Dynamius, Polemius Silvius, Avitus of Braga, Bacharius, Calcidius, Consensus, Olympus, Pastor, Severus of Minorca, Siagrius, Turribius of Astorga, Valerianus of Calahorra, Fortunatianus of Aquileia, and Chromatius of Aquileia. Notices on only the last two have been added in the English version—perhaps because Solari preferred for his own (unexpressed) good reasons to limit himself to Hamman's original chapter 8, "Scrittori della Gallia," rather than extend the chapter, as the Spanish edition did, to "Escritores de las Galias y de la Península Ibérica."

The "Introduction" by Quasten takes up only 12 lines (ten in the Italian), but it has the advantage of permitting the publishers to include on the title page the name of the remarkable patrologist, archeologist, and historian of early liturgy who not only inspired *Patrology* 4 but introduced countless students to the patristic age and personally moved many Americans, myself included, to study intensively a significant area much neglected by Catholics: the relationship between the ancient Church and the classical culture within which Christianity grew once it overleaped the bounds of its birthplace. Solari's laborious achievement will help assure that the Quasten who left this earth on March 10, 1987, just short of 87, will not soon be forgotten in the English-speaking world.

*Georgetown University*

WALTER J. BURGHARDT, S.J.

**MEDIEVAL LITURGY: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE SOURCES.** By Cyrille Vogel. Revised and translated by William Storey and Niels Krogh Rasmussen, O.P. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral, 1986. Pp. xix + 443. \$24.95.

Handbooks and technical introductions do not generally make exciting reading, but the late Cyrille Vogel's guide to Western medieval liturgy is surely an exception to the rule. First published in 1966 by the *Centro italiano di studi medievali* of Spoleto, revised in an edition of 1975, and reprinted in 1981, V.'s masterful synthesis of liturgical documents and development has been translated and thoroughly re-edited and brought up to date (through 1985) by Storey, formerly professor of liturgy and medieval studies, and the late Niels Rasmussen, both of Notre Dame. V., first a student of and then successor to Michel Andrieu at the University of Strasbourg, had two goals in writing this introduction. The first was to acquaint students of general medieval history with the often confusing highways and byways of liturgical manuscripts, their types and filiations. He was convinced that scholars had often left liturgy to the side because of the complexities of liturgical development. The second goal was to provide beginning students in liturgy with an accessible road map to liturgical development in the medieval churches of the West.

This book concentrates mainly on the history of the Roman liturgy but includes excursions on aspects of the Spanish (Visigothic), Milanese (Ambrosian), and Gallican rites. The work falls into four main divisions. After a general introduction which outlines the general history of Western liturgical development and provides an invaluable annotated bibliography of liturgists, collections, manuals, series, and scientific periodicals, the first section deals with the development of the sacramentary up to the appearance of the plenary missal, a book which not only contained the prayers of the presider (as the sacramentary did) but also readings and rubrics. This is the most original section of the English edition, for



Storey and Rasmussen have thoroughly rewritten the complex history of sacramentaries in light of the recent scholarship of Jean Deshusses, who has among other things turned scholarly opinion away from Alcuin of York as the author of the supplement to the Gregorian Sacramentary (*Hadrianum*) to the ninth-century monastic reformer Benedict of Aniane, and who has also demonstrated the importance of the Sacramentary of Trent for the development of the Gregorian Sacramentary tradition as a whole.

The second part of the book deals with the *Ordines Romani*, early equivalents of sets of rubrics for various liturgical services. To my knowledge, this is the first time that a description of this important resource has appeared in English. At the end of this section the translators include a helpful excursus on the origin of the private Mass, with particular attention to the recent research of A. Häussling, who has shown that a major element in this development was the multiplication of altars in the Northern European monastic churches modeled on the statal liturgies of Rome. The third section deals with the history of pontificals, those rituals which were used by bishops.

The final part of the book treats the liturgical year and, in particular, the various lectionaries of the Western rites. Here V. had to depart from concentrating on the Roman rite exclusively because of the complex nature of the lectionary traditions. There is also a brief section on the antiphonaries of the Mass. The translators have added a bibliographical guide to music in the Divine Office in an appendix. The book concludes with charts, a bibliography of Vogel, and two indices, one of which contains the manuscripts referred to in the text.

I can find very little to criticize in this book. On p. 106 the revisers clearly mean to say that the *Gelasianum* (not the *Hadrianum*) separated the temporal and sanctoral cycles of the sacramentary. One wishes that the invaluable notes had been printed at the bottom of the page, since they must be referred to constantly.

In summary, this is an invaluable tool for research into the history of liturgy in the West. It will serve as a reliable guide for medievalists and liturgiologists for years to come. Perhaps the greatest tribute that can be given to the work of the translators is summed up by the appreciative comment on the back cover by Anscar Chupungco: "it may not be a bad idea to have this volume translated back to French."

*Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley*

JOHN F. BALDOVIN, S.J.

**THE SACRIFICE WE OFFER: THE TRIDENTINE DOGMA AND ITS REINTERPRETATION.** By David N. Power. New York: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. xv + 206. \$16.95.

This brief review is confined to the main argument of this thought-provoking book. The underlying concern is the recovery of the more original Eucharistic ecclesiology, that views the Eucharist as the act of the gathered Church, and the presiding minister as embedded in "the sacrifice we offer." In the Catholic tradition during the Middle Ages a new understanding of Eucharistic ecclesiology developed, in which doctrine and practice mutually determined each other. The priest was embedded in the relation universal Church–Eucharist. This short-circuiting of the connection with the locally gathered Eucharistic community went hand in hand with the practice of individual Masses, and the offering of Masses for special intentions (to which was attached a new view of the propitiatory aspect of the Mass).

This theology and practice, unacceptable to the Reformers, was defended by the Council of Trent. The major portion of P.'s work is taken up with the response of Trent to their objections, developed over three sessions (1547–62). In the end, P. concludes that "the main point of all the definitions is that a mass celebrated by a duly ordained priest, under whatever circumstances, is beneficial for those for whom it is offered, and that, through this offering, some grace of remission of sins flows" (128).

P. rightly emphasizes, and explains well, why statements of councils are always open to interpretation, and why the dogma of Trent can and must be interpreted in the modern context. This reviewer agrees with the author's plea for a retrieval in theology and practice that is clearly consistent with the more original Eucharistic ecclesiology. But how should that theology be expressed once the question has been explicitly raised about the role of the presiding minister in the more comprehensive relation Christ–Church–Eucharist?

P. offers no response to this question. The same may be said of the teaching of Pope John Paul II and the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, who emphasize the sacramental identification of the priest with Christ. He is said to act *in persona Christi* in the action of consecration of the elements. P.'s remark that this concept goes beyond dogma seems justified but is perhaps beside the point, since the Roman documents do not make that claim.

What is relevant is an accurate assessment of the limits of what is actually affirmed by the phrase. The concrete problem addressed in the letter of CDF (AAS 75 [1983] 1001–1009), to which P. refers, does not warrant a full systematic explanation of the meaning of *in persona Christi*. But it can be argued that what is said in the carefully worded text can be integrated into Eucharistic ecclesiology that corresponds to what is reflected in classical liturgies. For the rest, CDF can claim the

approved doctrine of Trent for the use of *in persona Christi*. P. himself makes a valuable contribution to the interpretation of the dogma of Trent by showing from the acts that the direction of meaning of the dogma has to be interpreted in the light of the relation between doctrine and Mass practices. This enables him to argue persuasively that the "central issue" was the "priestly offering." Another criterion, derived from the deliberations of the Council itself, is the revisions made in key phrases of projects for the doctrine. In this regard, CDF could refer to the changes from the revised doctrine of 1552, and the first project of 1562, which led to the description of Christ in the final approved doctrine as *eadem . . . hostia . . . idem nunc offerens sacerdotum ministerio*. In the end the direction of meaning is toward the personal aspect: Christ himself offers himself corporeally through the ministry of priests.

*Pontifical Oriental Institute, Rome*      EDWARD J. KILMARTIN, S.J.

SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY: A MODERN PROTESTANT APPROACH. By Kenneth Caughen. Lewiston, N.Y.: Mellen, 1986. Pp. xxvi + 489. \$69.95.

THE LIVING GOD: SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY 1. By Thomas C. Oden. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. xvi + 430. \$29.95.

Comparing these two recent ventures in systematic theology is somewhat like comparing apples and oranges. Caughen's is a single-volume introductory work, while Oden's is the first of a three-volume intermediate-level survey. C. admits to representing a relatively distinct perspective—the nonconservative academic tradition in modern American Protestant theology, while O. hopes to exemplify the main stream of orthodox Christian belief, emphasizing commonalities rather than differences. Finally, C. warmly embraces the modern Western world view and seeks to show how traditional beliefs must be transformed to fit it, while O. considers much of this world view to be antithetical to orthodox Christian faith and seeks to recover this ancient faith.

Actually, it is these differences that make a comparison of these two works so enlightening. By contrast, we can sense more clearly the strengths and weaknesses of these polarized options on how to pursue contemporary Christian theology.

In his survey C. undertakes to introduce the range of Christian thought from what he considers to be the dominant modern Protestant perspective. In the course of his discussion it becomes clear that two fundamental convictions characterize C.'s "modern Protestant perspective." First, theology is seen as reflection upon what Christians believe and experience, rather than upon some supposed objective revelation. Second, it is assumed that traditional beliefs must be reconstructed to meet the challenge of the modern world view. Some "core" of these traditional

beliefs may remain true, but their form of expression must change with time (66).

The strength of C.'s survey is his helpful summary of the major areas in which reconstruction is considered necessary by "modern" Protestants and the variety of such reconstructions proposed. The weaknesses of his survey are the reverse side of this strength. For example, his treatment of traditional doctrinal convictions and of contemporary non-Protestant Christian groups is much too brief. While his treatment of conservative Protestants is a bit longer, it is relegated to excursuses rather than presented in substantive doctrinal discussions, and it often approaches caricature. Finally, his doctrinal summaries betray typical weaknesses and lacunae of classic liberal Protestant theology. Note, e.g., how his doctrine of the Holy Spirit is totally swallowed by ecclesiology.

Such an underdeveloped pneumatology is surely surprising in light of the intense recent Protestant discussion of this area. How can C. pass over it so quickly? I suggest that this is just one of the evidences that he is really providing a summary of the 1960s liberal Protestant theology. Such typically self-confident liberalism is increasingly rare in current Protestant theology. Much more common is a postliberal theological reflection that is increasingly suspicious of modern axioms and determined to renew serious dialogue with the past. It is particularly ironic that C. continues to identify his work with the "Yale school," where this shift has been particularly evident.

Thus, while the book may be a good survey of a particular historical moment in Protestant theology, it should not be considered indicative of the current state of this field.

The "postliberal" mood of contemporary American theology permeates O.'s theological reflections. Indeed, it was the essence of his new *Agenda for Theology* (Harper, 1979). Central to this new agenda is a deep dissatisfaction with the relativism of modern theology and a purposeful return to ancient Christian tradition in search of certainty and identity. That the concerns for certainty and identity are intimately related for O. is quite evident in *The Living God*. He vigorously rejects the prolonged apologetic attempts to prove or test the truth of Christian assertions in light of the modern world view that constitute much of modern theology. He does so, not because he believes Christian faith is indefensible in view of modern science, politics, etc., but because he considers the best defense of Christian faith to be a clear articulation of that faith in its classic form.

This correlates directly with the concern for a sense of identity. O.'s goal is to provide a compend of "orthodox" Christian belief from ancient times through the Reformation. To qualify as orthodox, the belief must

be demonstrated to be congruent with the "apostolic faith" (323). To warrant inclusion in the compend, it must also be central to and shared by the breadth of the Christian tradition, not a passing fad or marginalized position. To demonstrate that the points he makes qualify for inclusion by the above criteria, O. is constantly providing classical citations for his claims. As such, the greatest potential value of his study is its convenient and readable introduction of classical tradition to contemporary Christians—something desperately needed.

O.'s overriding concern to affirm classical Christian belief unfortunately produces some serious limitations to his study. In the first place, he provides very little exposure to areas of diversity among Christian traditions on central beliefs (e.g., the differing Eastern and Western approaches to understanding the Trinity) or to important minority alternatives on debated issues (e.g., whether God exists in the eternal now). These issues are simply not as peripheral as he seems to imply. Likewise, he frequently does not develop sufficiently the historical context and cultural situatedness of traditional credal affirmations. His concern is usually to "put the best face" on traditional claims rather than admit any shortcomings (cf. 113). Finally, he appears to discount the value of all theological developments since the Reformation. References to modern theologians are almost invariably negative. One wonders how the crucial role of tradition can end so abruptly at the 17th century.

In short, O. demonstrates the antithetical presupposition to Caughen: the traditional is always to be preferred to the modern. In the most revealing passage in his book it becomes clear that his "postmodern orthodoxy" is less concerned with retaining the best of modernity in its reappropriation of tradition than with escaping the "repression of modernity" (323).

Ultimately what unites both of these books is their similar response to the trauma of relativism that characterizes contemporary theology: they both approach dualistic (i.e., we're right and they're wrong) affirmations of a supposed privileged segment of Christian tradition. While the expositions of their respective choices are enlightening, they leave us longing for an approach that can take both the values and the situatedness of the *whole* of Christian tradition more seriously.

*Sioux Falls College, S.D.*

RANDY L. MADDOX

**PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY: BUILDING STONES FOR A FUNDAMENTAL THEOLOGY.** By Joseph Ratzinger. Translated from the German by Mary Frances McCarthy, S.N.D. San Francisco: Ignatius, 1987. Pp. 398. \$24.95.

Ratzinger, cardinal prefect of the Sacred Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith and former dean of the theological faculty in Regensburg, offers herein a mixed, sometimes repetitive, collection of 29 entries that R. himself acknowledges as "fragmentary and unfinished" in nature (11). Most are scholarly, but several are pastoral and almost homiletical in content and tone. Since R. ended his career as a working theologian in 1977 when appointed archbishop of Munich, it is not surprising that only three of the pieces were published within the last decade, the most recent in 1981.

The entries cover a wide spectrum of foundational and systematic questions: faith, baptism, Eucharist, church membership, Scripture and tradition, the creeds, salvation history, ecumenism, holy orders, the nature of theology. More pastorally-oriented items touch upon such topics as the catechumenate and the priesthood.

Because the essays differ so much one from the other (some were written as articles for theological journals, others were given as scholarly papers, and still others as talks before audiences of nonspecialists), it is difficult to review the book as a unified whole. Nonetheless, a coherent theological orientation does emerge, one that is perhaps not inconsistent with the perception many have of R. in his present ecclesiastical position.

An emphasis on ontology over history shows up again and again, reinforced even by a footnote added specifically for this volume (190, n. 172). Indeed, R.'s commentary on *Mysterium ecclesiae* (1973) makes no mention at all of the declaration's most significant teaching on the historicity of dogmatic formulations (228-37), and his critique of K. Rahner is written in the same vein (162-71).

R. italicizes apostolic succession and the hierarchical structure of the Church, insisting that "*ecclesia* becomes real at every level only when . . . she is woven into the context of apostolic succession" (296). At root is R.'s concern for certainty in matters of faith (9, 234).

One finds also in these essays a penchant for disjunctive argument: either/or rather than both/and. Thus, we achieve Church unity either through human effort or through the power of the Holy Spirit (121); the mission of the Church is either one of development or one of evangelization (133); the renewal of the Church is either through *aggiornamento* or through *ressourcement* (134); the drama of salvation occurs principally at the level of history or of being (153), the communal or the personal (297); and the Church is to be defined either as People of God or as sacrament (54-55). In each instance R.'s preference is for the latter.

R.'s treatment of theological questions is not always informed by recent biblical scholarship. In one essay, e.g., he concludes that "The ecclesial office of priest can be understood only in relation to the at once exclusive

and inclusive office of Jesus Christ as Mediator" (280) and that "Apostleship is the immediate measure and starting point of the office of presbyter" (281).

Elsewhere R. makes assertions without evidence: e.g., "there is a correspondence between the capacity for sacramental marriage in accordance with the gospel and an openness to virginity" (298). Finally, it is not at all clear where R. would draw the line between theology and philosophy. He says that "philosophical speculation can enter into theological speculation without thereby being destroyed as philosophy," but he does not indicate how (316). What *is* clear is R.'s conviction that today's theology has degenerated first into historicism and then into sociologism, to use his terms.

There are many theologically and pastorally substantive essays in this collection, each of which would repay an investment of time and effort to read, but the text as a whole is marred by frequent editorial asides that are negative, condescending, and even snide, especially toward R.'s fellow theologians (e.g., 28, 101, 180, 316, 324). His epilogue contains an essay on Vatican II and its aftermath that is particularly negative in tone regarding liberation theology, the international journal *Concilium*, national episcopal conferences, and even *Gaudium et spes* (367-93). R. implies that the Church's mainstream has not yet discovered the "real Council" nor fully grasped its "true intention" (391).

The book has no index and the translator has made no effort at all to use sex-inclusive language.

*University of Notre Dame*

RICHARD P. MCBRIEN

EGLISE D'ÉGLISES: L'ECCLÉSIOLOGIE DE COMMUNION. By J.-M.-R. Tillard. Paris: Cerf, 1987. Pp. 415. Fr. 149.

This book by a well-known theologian is devoted to the propositions that, although "rarely mentioned" at Vatican II, *koinonia* holds the key to the ecclesiology of the Council, and that it provides the basis for ecumenical agreements about the nature of the Church and the structure of ministry. T. builds on his previous volume, *L'Eucharistie, pâques de l'église* (1964), and, among others, on the insights of Jérôme Hamer's *L'Eglise est une communion* (1962), and on the *Final Report* of ARCIC 1 (Anglican/Roman Catholic International Commission) of 1981. The book has four long chapters: (1) "The Church of God in the Purpose of God"; (2) "The Church of God as People of God in Communion"; (3) "The Service of the Communion"; (4) "The Visible Communion of the Churches." The first two chapters explain the basic ecclesiology, chiefly from the NT and the texts of Vatican II. The last two draw certain conclusions concerning the ecclesial structure in regard to ministry, and

to the bishops of Germany. The ecumenical implications of the ecclesiology of Vatican II need to be explored, especially in regard to the *subsistit in* with which *Lumen gentium* qualified the relationship of the Church of God with the visible Roman Catholic institution. Historians may find that the picture of the Church of Rome in the past has been somewhat idealized by T., as though the popes and their Roman or Latin supporters had always, or most of the time, been eager to promote a communion of equal churches. But the principles that are expounded here are theologically unimpeachable. Indeed, the diocese of Rome should function as a model for the universal Church. Yet one may ask: Can it do so? There are many loyal Catholics today, including bishops, who would be horrified at the idea of relating not only to the bishop of Rome as the universal primate of a Church of churches but also to the diocese of Rome as the model for all the churches. Yet this is in the logic of an ecclesiology of communion in which the Church in Rome emerges as "presiding in love." As this suggests, a koinonia ecclesiology unveils a principle for the continuing reform of the Church, *semper reformanda*. A structural reform is needed before the Christian communities can be a Church of churches in the full sense of these terms. This book should inspire serious reflection on the demands of such a reform.

*Methodist Theological School, Ohio*

GEORGE H. TAVARD

**THE PAPACY AND THE CHURCH: A STUDY OF PRAXIS AND RECEPTION IN ECUMENICAL PERSPECTIVE.** By J. Robert Dionne. New York: Philosophical Library, 1987. Pp. ix + 524. \$29.95.

Does the ordinary papal magisterium function independently of the Church or is it in some way dependent on the Church for which it speaks? In studying a number of papal teachings in the period from 1846 to 1965, D. makes a strong case that the ordinary papal magisterium on occasion has learned from the rest of the Church. Therefore, he suggests, official Roman Catholic theory on the way authority functions is not fully in harmony with its praxis.

At the beginning of his book, a revision of his doctoral dissertation at the University of Chicago Divinity School, D. identifies two extreme positions on the issue of papal infallibility. "Minimalists," among whom he counts Hans Küng, maintain that any modification or rejection of papal teaching is an argument against papal infallibility itself. "Maximalists" hold that in some circumstances even the ordinary papal magisterium can enjoy the charism of infallibility, as in cases where the teaching of a pope is affirmed by his successors, or by his successors together with the whole episcopacy. The position of the minimalists is compromised by their failure to distinguish between the ordinary and



the extraordinary papal magisterium.

The major portion of the book is devoted to showing that the maximalist position cannot be sustained. To do this, D. examines seven examples of papal teaching which received what he calls different "modalities" of reception. The first two cases, involving papal social teaching and the teaching of Pius XII relating to collegiality, are positive. The other five include Pius IX's apparent inability to find any truth or goodness in non-Christian religions, his condemnation of the proposition that church and state should be separated, and his denial of religious freedom as an objective right; also Pius XII's exclusive identification of the Roman Catholic Church with the Mystical Body of Christ, and the related question of the relationship of non-Catholic Christians to the Church. In these cases the teaching of the ordinary papal magisterium was either modified or reversed by the bishops at the Second Vatican Council, aided by the work of scholars such as Bishop Dupanloup, John Courtney Murray, Valentin Morel, P. Michalon, and Karl Rahner. Through their appropriate criticism, careful scholarship, and "talking back" to the bishop of Rome, they represented a "loyal opposition" which prepared the way for the Council. D. does not use the word "dissent." But by highlighting the work of this critical minority, he shows that the ordinary papal magisterium does not operate independently of the Church.

With his historical analysis done, D. is able to draw out some of the ecclesiological implications of this study. Using terms derived from Ernst Troeltsch, he argues that the Church cannot be understood simply as an institution, exercising authority from the top down. It also exhibits elements of an associative model, which tends to exercise authority from the bottom up. The Church involves "associative elements," i.e. elements of interdependence and *koinōnia*, even on the level of doctrine and dogma. A review of the two Marian dogmas shows this to be true even in the two cases where the extraordinary papal magisterium was exercised, for these definitions were made only after consulting the Church through a polling of the bishops. If the Catholic Church does indeed function not simply as an institution, but also as an association or as a "*koinōnia* on the level of word," then the Church's teachers should consider bringing the Church's theory of papal authority more into accord with its actual practice. Allowing praxis to transform theory in this way could lead beyond the current impasse over authority to an ecumenical breakthrough.

Not all of D.'s examples carry the same weight. Since Pius IX did not explicitly ask the question regarding the presence of truth or goodness in the non-Christian religions, his doctrinal stance must be inferred from

the internal logic of his teachings in a number of pertinent documents. This makes the assertion of a subsequent reversal more tenuous to maintain. D. acknowledges the ambiguity here. His book is densely written and argued. There are more than a hundred pages of endnotes. Tracking papal pronouncements through numerous ecclesiastical documents and versions usually identified by an alphabetical code does not make for easy reading. But the book is well worth the effort. D. is meticulous in defining terms and concepts and provides a very useful glossary of doctrinal terms and notes. He has shown that even if official Catholicism so far has failed to acknowledge it, the teaching of the ordinary papal magisterium has been at times modified or reversed because of the modalities of its reception. D. concludes that the popes have learned from the rest of the Church. The ecclesiological implications of his study are important and no doubt will be developed by others.

*Loyola Marymount University, L.A.*

THOMAS P. RAUSCH, S.J.

**THEOLOGIE UND KIRCHE.** By Walter Kasper. Mainz: Matthias Grünewald, 1987. Pp. 322.

A collection of previously published articles (1980–86) whose common theme is post-Vatican II theological developments. Only the Foreword, which describes Catholic theology's transition from Neo-Scholasticism to a greater openness to modern thought, especially the "turn to the subject," and the chapter "Die Kirche als Ort der Wahrheit" have not been previously published.

As a collection, this book has no single argument or theme which is developed throughout. However, certain themes recur regularly: the decline of Christendom in Europe and the consequences for Catholic practice, instruction, mission, and theology; pluralism, both general cultural and specific Catholic; the confrontation of traditional being/substance metaphysics with modern transcendental, subject metaphysics; the nature of truth and authority; the importance of the anthropocentric and cosmocentric approaches to reality and theology; tradition; ecumenical relations; autonomy as the hallmark of modernity and its acceptability to Catholicism.

Here as elsewhere, K. manifests his customary balanced (*ausgewogen*) approach, captive of neither the old "prison of the Roman school system" (52)—how nice to recall Ratzinger's phrase these days—nor the new barren and featureless steppes of subjectivist secularism. Thus he is able to invoke both Aristotle and Plato, Aquinas and Augustine, Hegel and Schelling, Rahner and von Balthasar, the younger and the older Ratzinger to illuminate and support his theses. In passing, one might note the fittingness of K.'s German for young theologians attempting to learn

that language.

There are some individual points worth pointing out. K. is to be commended for recognizing that passive is not a proper Catholic category (182, 286). He is right on target when he finds Moltmann's attempt to locate human rights in the "Recht Gottes auf dem Menschen" (178) rather than in human nature itself for what it is, i.e. the left-wing version of the old deMaistrean theocratic restorationism, as ill suited to the real modern world as its predecessor. And who cannot share his anxious perception of a reviving "Lehramtsmonopolismus" (267) and of the diastasis between the communion ecclesiology of Vatican II and the *societas inequalis* ecclesiology of the new Code of Canon Law (277-84)?

Most fruitful for future development, especially noteworthy in this anniversary year of "We the People," is K.'s demonstration that the doctrine of creation as the image and likeness of God democratizes the human creaturely representation of God, transferring it from the king to the "common man" (180, 212, 251). This point obviously has relevance for ecclesial as well as secular societal arrangements, and anyone interested in the power of the papacy and its limitations will find here a fertile source of insight.

Less pleasing is Kasper's tendency to acquiesce in the currently faddish kerygma that prosperity means hedonistic abandonment of true human living and inquiry. This may well be more true of the newly prosperous Europe, especially the German *Wirtschaftswunderland*, but it is certainly less so in the U.S.A. K. would have done well, in this and other sections, especially those on human rights, to point out the differences in the French and American revolutions and the subsequent and consequent cultural, societal, and religious differences. One can also wonder whether the world is properly called a "Fremdprophetie" (19). Likewise, is humanity's "tiefste Not" (197) really sin and death? Is not finitude the real problem, and birth into a finite world, with or without sin and death, really the problem? Adam and Eve certainly found it so. Finally, given the massive and proper emphasis on communication as the key category in matters divine and divine-human in Catholic theology, would one not do better to prefer communion and co-operation to obedience in Catholic descriptions of the relationships between the human and divine, even, and especially, in regard to the two wills of Jesus Christ (226-27)?

These are only questions, ones prompted and made worth asking by the high quality of this book in general. In an age when concern threatens to overwhelm even theology, it is a joy to report that some theologians are still interested in philosophy and its importance for theology (33, 100, etc.), in creation as a key theological category (181, 261-68), in the universal saving will of God as the key to all theological truths (180, 207,

249, 253), and analogy (*passim*). K. describes human being as a "verdankte Existenz" (229) and emphasizes "Danksagung" as a key category in both the human being's relationship to God and the Christian's celebration of the great deeds of God. We may also thank K. for a well-reasoned, *ausgewogenes* book.

On p. 34 read *reductio* for *deductio*; p. 178, *Ableitung* for *Abteilung*; p. 72, n. 2, "i" has been omitted eight times in line 4.

*University of San Diego*

ROBERT KRESS

**THEOLOGIK 1: WAHRHEIT DER WELT; 2: WAHRHEIT GOTTES.** By Hans Urs von Balthasar. Einsiedeln: Johannes Verlag, 1985. Pp. xxii + 312; 336.

These two volumes introduce the final part of one of this century's most monumental theological projects. A more recently published third and final volume has brought to completion Hans Urs von Balthasar's incredible trilogy: *Herrlichkeit*, *Theodramatik*, and *Theologik*.

The trilogy is structured according to the scholastic understanding of the transcendental characteristics of being: beauty, goodness, and truth. The aesthetics investigates the analogous relationship between worldly beauty and divine glory and presents a theory of theological perception as an answer to two questions: How can the form of divine love which God reveals to us be recognized in the world in its objective glory and how are we informed and transformed by it? The dramatics focuses on the good of God's self-revelation: the drama of the world's salvation. This involves a reflection on the relationship between human freedom and its ultimate good or end, divine freedom, seen concretely in the person of Jesus Christ. The logic focuses on the truth of the event of God's self-revelation in the incarnation of the Logos and the outpouring of the Holy Spirit. It considers the structure of and relationship between truth and divine truth. It reflects on how divine truth can express itself in created forms and consequently what possibility there is for human beings to speak adequately of the event of God's self-revelation. For B., theological questions concerning God's glory, goodness, and truth imply the ontological question concerning the structure of being. No theology without philosophy.

*Wahrheit der Welt*, unchanged since its original publication in 1947, contains the outlines of the philosophy which undergirds B.'s work. It presents what is called a phenomenology of truth. Its object is truth precisely as a transcendental characteristic of being. What we have here is neither an epistemology nor a linguistic theory, but what might be called an ontology of truth. Unlike Rahner and others, B. does not start with the transcendental structure of the subject but stresses the primacy

of the objective structure of being as it presents itself to a subject in concrete, unified, and intelligible forms. It might be viewed as an attempt to retrieve valid insights of Thomas in light of Heidegger's complaint about the modern forgetfulness of being. We find a synthesis which is far more nuanced than the simple Platonism of which B. is frequently suspected. Trying to avoid both a naive realism and idealism, B. presents a thoroughly symbolic and relational theory of being. The experience of the mystery of the unity of hidden, inner depth expressing itself outwardly is indicative of the "truth" that being, as that which discloses and communicates itself, is not only ever-greater, unbounded fullness but also free or personal mystery. Ultimately, being is the mystery of love. Existence is seen as utterly gratuitous participation in being as God's loving act.

In viewing the world symbolically as a self-expression of God, B. stresses the analogous character of the relationship. Analogous to the real goodness of individual, existent beings precisely as the expression and self-communication of the infinite fullness of being, the real difference between the world and God is seen to be fundamentally positive and good, not negative and tragic. Precisely in its difference from God, the creation is constituted by a real relationship of love with God. Creation has its ultimate truth, goodness, and beauty not in itself but in the Other. Truth is participation: the deepest truth about creation is its real relationship to God. Relation and not substance is the ultimate category of reality. The fact that otherness is of ultimate positive value is grounded finally in the mystery of the Trinity.

This leads us to *Wahrheit Gottes*, the second volume, finally written after an interim of some 40 years. If the first volume is predominantly philosophical and "ana-logical" (from below), the second volume is theological and "kata-logical" (from above) in perspective. B. turns to the Trinity as revealed in the person and mission of Jesus Christ to consider the position of Logos in God. This alone can illumine what it means to speak of God's truth, and the relationship between human logos and divine Logos. B. now develops the connection, already suggested at the end of the first volume, between the Trinitarian difference of persons and the real distinction which characterizes finite being. It is ultimately in the Trinitarian difference of persons that one can understand why love is not antecedent to being but is its highest act, and that real difference is positive and good as the possibility of relation in love.

The final chapter of the book is its heart and consists in a reflection on the incarnation of the Logos. Is *Verbum-caro* self-contradictory? Can the ineffable be uttered? B. first attempts to illumine the biblical meaning and significance of flesh and then, guided chiefly by Bonaventure, devel-

ops an understanding of expression, symbol, and language. This enables him to show how flesh may be understood symbolically as language. It is the "fact" (for faith) that the Word has been made (*factum*) flesh that moves the considerations beyond a purely speculative connection: the Incarnation is the real self-expression of God.

But it is not only that God becomes flesh, but that God becomes sinful flesh. The Incarnation must be seen not only in terms of the positive opposition as *relation* between Creator and creature, but even more radically in light of the negative opposition which constitutes the creature's sinful *contradiction* of the Creator. The logic of the Incarnation reveals that God does not come to save us from flesh and finitude but from sin and death. In Christ God conquers the contradiction of sin while perfecting the opposition of love. B. rejects what he sees as an unreconcilable anthropological and Christological contradiction principle in Luther (*simul justus et peccator*) and turns to the "teaching" of Adrienne von Speyr for a solution. Her writings on the cross and hell, together with her commentary on the Apocalypse, have led B. to some of his most perplexing and peculiar Trinitarian speculations.

In the end, the possibility of an adequate theology or human language about God is exactly the possibility that God could really express God's self in human reality: that God's Word is truly human. B. readily agrees with (the earlier) Rahner that all theology remains forever anthropology, though he continues to reject the reverse thesis also stressed by (the later) Rahner that anthropology is theology.

It seems that B.'s logic does not really seek to answer the question how human flesh can be a language adequate for God to communicate God's self. It proceeds from what B. describes as the "fact" of the Incarnation and enquires about the logic and discourse revealed and required by it. It is the logic of the Incarnation, wherein faith recognizes Christ to be the concrete *analogia entis*, which judges our previous notions about God, human reality, and their relationship and gives theology its only reliable foundation.

God's self-communication is not finished with the incarnate Logos. In fact, the Scriptures tell us that the logic of the Incarnation was misunderstood even by Jesus' closest disciples. It is the proper role of the Spirit to lead men and women into an understanding of the divine logic of the Incarnation, and thus into the fulness of truth. Finally, then, the theological enterprise of the Church, like the original *theologia* of the Incarnation, is the work of the Spirit. This is the subject of the third and final volume, *Geist der Wahrheit*.

One might well be bewildered by the writings of Adrienne von Speyr and skeptical of B.'s estimation thereof, as this admirer of B. is. But on

the whole these books present extraordinary reflections on important theological and philosophical themes. They provide, of course, an important hermeneutical tool for those interested in the work of an important theologian. Of particular value are B.'s retrieval of Thomas' dynamic conception of being, his thoroughly symbolic, communicative, and therefore relational understanding of reality, and his development of the theological significance of *analogia entis* in a Trinitarian context.

*Weston School of Theology, Mass.*

JOHN R. SACHS, S.J.

NATUR ALS GRUNDLAGE DER MORAL: DIE PERSONALE STRUKTUR DES NATURGESETZES BEI THOMAS VON AQUIN: EINE AUSEINANDERSETZUNG MIT AUTONOMER UND TELEOLOGISCHER ETHIK. By Martin Rhonheimer. Innsbruck: Tyrolia, 1987. Pp. 420.

Rhonheimer's stated purpose is to display, and to correct misinterpretations of, two areas of Aquinas' work: (1) the personal structure of natural law and (2) moral "objectivity." The first phase of his undertaking places him in dialogue with autonomous ethics; the second, with teleological ethics. For this discussion he offers the understanding, well substantiated from the texts of Aquinas, of natural law as the "law of practical reason" (89). Practical reasoning is, for R., the ability to draw practical conclusions and discover substantive norms from the underivable first principles of natural law ("do good, avoid evil").

In the first part, R., resisting the false dichotomy between nature and reason, shows a remarkable appreciation of the subtleties and implications of Aquinas' insistence on the truly composite nature of the human being. Holding to that Thomistic understanding, R. submits that natural law, which is the participation of the human being in divine law, must also be characteristic of the entire, composite being. That is, participation in divine law consists both in the natural habit (*synderesis*) of the first principles of practical reasoning and in the inner structure (*Binnenstruktur*, 223) of practical reasoning by which humans discover norms which "incarnate" (264) those principles. R. ultimately disagrees with autonomous ethics, and even with the compromise positions ("theonomous autonomies") of Auer, Böckle, Merks, et al., in favor of an autonomy which *participates* in the *providentia* by which God orders the universe.

R.'s contribution there is significant, in that he has identified natural law with virtue (142), since it is the province of virtue to integrate reason and natural inclinations (which are the "semina virtutum" in the human). R. has also avoided the crass understanding of natural law as "reading off (physical) nature" what ought to be done. It is on the level of virtue, R. avers, and not on the physical-biological level, that the injunctions against artificial contraception in *Humanae vitae* are to be understood,

in that contraception substitutes technical control for the self-control that would be fitting for the virtue of parental responsibility.

In the second part, R. demonstrates successfully that teleologists surreptitiously borrow from moral frameworks to determine "pre-moral" goods. He submits that the true "object" of practical reason is the "actus exterior" (335) in conformity to a moral will, and that the objectivity of morality resides principally in the intention of the agent. Thus he can state that the moral evil of killing an innocent lies chiefly in the corruption of the will of the perpetrator (270). Here his concern to avoid the reductionistically physicalist reading of natural law has caused him to be less sensitive to Aquinas' philosophical realism. In his treatise on the passions (*Sum. theol.* 1-2, 22-48), e.g., Aquinas offers an extensive treatment of how objects outside the self attract the self. That treatise, situated immediately before the discussion of habits and virtues, prepares the reader to understand that virtue is not only the perfection of the individual, but the perfection of her/his interactions with other realities; that the human is not only "fundamental ein *strebendes* Wesen" (249), but also fundamentally someone *being attracted* by the good, and ultimately by God.

R. closes with considerations of contingency in natural law (378 ff.). This otherwise comprehensive treatment of "utrum lex naturae sit una apud omnes" (*Sum. theol.* 1-2, 94, 4) would have been helped if R. had considered that Aquinas, after his discussion of the Hebrew Scriptures, intended to use natural law as a hermeneutical tool explaining why Christians obey the Decalogue but do not adhere to the "ceremonial laws" of Torah.

Overall, an interesting work, especially for its relating natural law and virtue.

Fairfield University, Conn.

G. SIMON HARAK, S.J.

THE CATHOLIC CHURCH IN WORLD POLITICS. By Eric O. Hanson. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University, 1987. Pp. x + 485. \$24.95.

Catholics attentive to the relation between faith and the world of politics will be attracted to this volume. The subject (the role of Catholicism in contemporary domestic and international political change), the author (a distinguished political scientist from Santa Clara University, who has been associated as well with Stanford University's Center for International Security and Arms Control), and, not least, the publisher (Princeton University Press, which has produced a handsome volume), all commend the study for examination. Wide-ranging in his coverage of the post-1945 period of church-state relations, H. concentrates on the (Western and Eastern) European and (North) American situations,



without ignoring the Middle East, Latin America, Asia, and Africa. A salient concern of the author is the possible ecclesial contribution to promoting détente between the superpowers.

The ambitious scope and pioneering methodology of the study, which seeks to make political sense of the apolitical power of the Church as a "transnational actor," promises more, however, than it is able to deliver in the present effort. Future essays in this demanding genre may profit from reflection on several questions which may be prompted by this study in the minds of readers whose understanding of the Church is theological rather than sociological.

From the perspective of traditional patterns of Catholic thought, such as the natural-law tradition in ethics, certain urgent objections to H.'s thesis suggest themselves. The first question concerns the historical accuracy of H.'s claim that the Church is habitually suspicious of the nation-state (54, 74, 352-53). This assertion, unsubstantiated by reference to sources, is left each time unelaborated beyond a single sentence. Historical accuracy requires the recognition that, at the birth of the postimperial nation-state early in 14th-century Europe, it was precisely the papacy, wielding the authority of canon law, that vindicated the claim of the kings of France and Naples to exercise sovereign power independently of the Holy Roman Emperor (cf. Walter Ullmann, "The Development of the Medieval Idea of Sovereignty," *English Historical Review* 250 [1949] 17). This cardinal misconception can easily be corrected in future editions, since it appears to be unrelated to the argument of the book.

The second misinterpretation, however, which is inextricably interwoven with H.'s thesis, will be less easily rectified. For H. defines the Church consistently as an "expressive actor" (4, 5, 8, 15, 339) whose primary mission is to shape political consensus within and among national societies (13, 15, 121, 182, 323, 326, 340-42, 349, 352). If H. had merely claimed that, in addition to the internal task of forming the consciences of its own members, the Church also aspired to share its moral values with the larger society, he would, of course, have been on solid ground. But such an "expressive" task would be legitimate for the Church only so long as it did not involve any compromise of its primary task of interpreting to the faithful themselves the contemporary relevance of the Church's ancient moral tradition. The validity of H.'s identification of church magisterium as a catalyst of social consensus rests, then, on the hypothesis that the claims of conscience are naturally in tune with the latent social consensus of the epoch, which requires only the "expressive" ministry of the Church to mold a sound political platform for action.

It would, of course, be possible to imagine a (sinless) world, as some political scientists tend to do, in which conscience would be merely the harbinger of a still inchoate social consensus. Such, however, is not the historical world in which the Church has found itself enmeshed for the two millennia of its existence. From its earliest experience of persecution, through the more congenial era of medieval Christendom, the Church has, on the contrary, discovered that conscience functions more often as the carefully cultivated capacity to resist the extant social consensus. Unsurprisingly, then, the Church's social teaching, the natural-law tradition, consists of a delicate dialectic between the rights of revolution and of constitution, a doctrine designed precisely to encourage resistance or legal restraint against the malevolence of politicians. The moral magisterium is perhaps in the light of this history more adequately understood as a mechanism to liberate individual conscience from the shackles of the social consensus than as a catalyst to crystallize it. Students of the political history of the Church, such as Carlyle (*A History of Medieval Political Theory in the West*, six volumes), might well judge H.'s hypothesis on the political role of the Church historically indefensible.

How, then, is one to explain the fanciful reconstruction of the Church's political mission offered, without documentation, in the present study? Perhaps once again the wish is father to the history. In the final, constructive chapter of his study, H. reveals his own prescription for relating the Church to politics in the American context. He urges the Church to assume the responsibility to "contribute a set of policies. . . as a model for the reconstitution of a strong Democratic party" (340). For those who might view this breach in the wall between church and state as too blatant, he points to the model of ex-Congressman Reverend Robert Drinan's leadership as head of the Americans for Democratic Action as a possible paradigm (341).

A final doubt about the definitive character of H.'s interpretation of the Church's role in world politics emerges from study of his account of the dynamics of magisterial decision-making during the process of drafting the American bishops' pastoral on peace, which was adopted overwhelmingly in May 1983. H. attributes the outcome to a five-party struggle among the bishops: (1) religious protest (Gumbleton); (2) establishment liberalism (Bernardin); (3) the Polish position (Krol); (4) "Just War Self-Defense. This position predominated in New York, which for a long time was also the Military Vicariate of the American Armed Forces"; and (5) American national anti-Communism (Hannan) (289-93). Predicated on an assumption that only the New York delegation accepted the just-war theory as normative, the analysis will never yield

a genuine understanding of the dynamics of the living magisterium, which in this instance was able to forge a consensus behind a radical doctrine on the morality of deterrence only because the bishops, despite dramatically differing political and even religious temperaments, never imagined that they could bind the faithful to their own instinctive views, pacifist or bellicist, but only to the teaching of the Church, the just-war tradition. On such a basis of metapolitical moral convictions the Church can forge an internal consensus on contentious political-moral problems which may subsequently affect the secular political debate not by shaping its consensus but precisely by challenging it.

*Georgetown University*

FRANCIS X. WINTERS

**CAESAR'S COIN: RELIGION AND POLITICS IN AMERICA.** By Richard P. McBrien. New York: Macmillan, 1987. Pp. x + 294. \$19.95.

McBrien has written a timely and informative book on religion and politics, one that should help Catholics (and others) keep their wits about them when moral and religious questions become issues in local or national politics. There is little in *Caesar's Coin* that is really new, but novelty is not the first virtue of political ethics. M. has restated some basic points of Catholic thought that steer a middle course between legislated piety and secularized politics. The principles have been around for some time. The politics of the 80s suggest that we badly need to be reminded of them.

M.'s thinking about politics rests on some important distinctions in moral theology that have largely been lost in recent controversies. There is, e.g., the distinction between society and state. Not everything that the society values can be enacted into law, and not everything that society requires need be done by the state. There is, most important, the distinction between religion and morality. If the secularists have a hard time keeping that one straight, it is nonetheless very important for the people of faith to know the difference. While churches and religious leaders should not bring matters of faith into politics, it is entirely appropriate for them to enter the society's debate on matters of morality. Remembering these distinctions will go a long way toward achieving the civility that John Courtney Murray thought should characterize public argument in a free society.

Murray is in fact the guiding spirit of the first two parts of *Caesar's Coin*. After some initial definitions and distinctions, M. proceeds to look at some central areas of controversy in American history, using the First Amendment's twin principles of "no establishment" and "free exercise" as a guide. The survey of history is competent and well documented, and sets the stage for thinking about the pluralism of public religion in

America today. The central chapter, appropriately titled "We Hold These Truths," updates Murray's "four conspiracies" by providing a contemporary Catholic viewpoint on Protestant, Jewish, and Catholic participation in public life. Murray's prescriptions for a society that could support moral debate hold up remarkably well, but M. also reminds us how much has changed in the last three decades. The Protestant position is now fragmented between evangelicals and mainstream denominations, the secularists (Murray's fourth "conspiracy") have virtually disappeared, and the Catholics—latecomers and bystanders in Murray's day—are now principal actors. M.'s studies of contemporary issues tend to center on the words and deeds of Governor Cuomo and Cardinals O'Connor and Bernardin. One need not be a Catholic chauvinist to agree that they are indeed the important public voices.

An essay which stated principles and never got to practice would hardly be worthy of the importance of this topic, as M. notes, and he concludes his book with a third section on "Applying the Principles." Unfortunately, it is the least successful part of the book. The chapter on abortion is most disappointing, as it devotes some 28 pages to a narrative of the issue as it ran through the 1984 Presidential campaign, and only four pages to suggestions about how it might be better handled in the future. A concluding chapter covers everything from prayer in schools to gay rights and the bishops' peace pastoral. That is hardly enough time to break new ground on the issues, but it does allow M. to analyze the peace pastoral as a model for public religious argument and to endorse the democratization of both the content of the letter and the process by which it came into being. Those who want more extensive applications of the Murray/McBrien principles will find guidance for further study in the book's ample notes.

*University of Chicago Divinity School*

ROBIN W. LOVIN

**THE CATHOLIC CHALLENGE TO THE AMERICAN ECONOMY: REFLECTIONS ON THE U.S. BISHOPS' PASTORAL LETTER ON CATHOLIC SOCIAL TEACHING AND THE U.S. ECONOMY. WITH THE COMPLETE TEXT OF THE BISHOPS' LETTER.** Edited by Thomas M. Gannon, S.J. New York: Macmillan, 1987. Pp. 338. \$14.95.

**THE CATHOLIC BISHOPS AND THE ECONOMY: A DEBATE.** By Douglass Rasmussen and James Sterba. *Studies in Social Philosophy and Policy* 9. New Brunswick, N.J.: Social Philosophy and Policy Center, 1987. Pp. xiv + 118. \$19.95; \$12.95.

**THE DEEPER MEANING OF ECONOMIC LIFE: CRITICAL ESSAYS ON THE U.S. CATHOLIC BISHOPS' PASTORAL LETTER ON THE ECONOMY.** With a Foreword by Archbishop Rembert Weakland, O.S.B. Edited by

R. Bruce Douglass. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University, 1986. Pp. xxiv + 223. \$19.95; \$10.95.

**GODS, GOODS AND THE COMMON GOOD: ELEVEN PERSPECTIVES ON ECONOMIC JUSTICE IN DIALOGUE WITH THE ROMAN CATHOLIC BISHOPS' PASTORAL LETTER.** Edited by Charles P. Lutz. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1986. Pp. 172.

"The more one reflects" on the two recent pastoral letters of the U.S. bishops (*The Challenge of Peace* and *Economic Justice for All*) "in the light of the debate they have elicited," writes Douglass in *The Deeper Meaning of Economic Life*, "the more it becomes appropriate to think of them as exploratory statements." The recurrence in these four collections of certain key questions about the bishops' theological ethics and social strategy confirms D.'s observation that the bishops, despite their enormous achievements, have only just begun a dialogue on ethics and American public life.

One question concerns the use of Scripture in official social teaching. The biblical portion of *Economic Justice for All* (nos. 30–55) stands as one of the finest presentations of Scripture in contemporary social teaching. From the publication of the first draft, however, commentators have noted the disjunction between the scriptural sources and the human-rights standards the bishops employ in their ethical norms and policy directives (nos. 61–95). While differences in substance and tone were softened in subsequent drafts by an equation of the love command with human solidarity (nos. 63–67), the blunting of scripturally-based moral demands in the minimalist formulas of human rights remains a problem for many.

Uneasy about the bishops' apparent compromise of deeper religious commitments in finding feasible policy solutions, some wonder aloud about the results. "In so far as the bishops have constructed an appeal that rests upon right reason, human dignity and human rights," comments Diane Yeager, "they have not done anything that could not have been done by rational moral philosophy." She adds: "the letter would have been more successful in altering the lot of the poor had it been conceptually more radical" ("Bishops and the Kingdom" in *Deeper Meaning*).

Protestants sympathetic to the Catholic ability to enlist general debate over public policy, however, are not so sure about the effects of scriptural renewal in Catholic ethics. "As Catholic teaching begins to incorporate themes deriving from Scripture . . .," writes Douglass, e.g., "the danger is that Catholics will sacrifice philosophical coherence for scriptural dogmatism from which Protestant thought has so long suffered" ("First Things First" in *Deeper Meaning*). Charles Curran, for his part, defends

the bishops' differentiation between biblical foundations, ethical norms, and policy applications, as well as their intention of mediating the gospel to the secular world ("Relating Religious-Ethical Inquiry to Economic Policy" in *Catholic Challenge*).

Nonetheless, the disjunction between scriptural foundations and public ethics in both the recent pastorals remains problematic. Since the Council, the Catholic social theology has attempted to move away from a narrow natural-law base. Scripture has typically functioned, however, either as a prolegomenon to a contemporary (human rights) natural-law ethic or as an adornment for moral exhortation.

Given the Catholic assertion of the parallel between the scriptural convictions of believers and the conscience of men and women of good will and the Church's long commitment to common moral reasoning, there is little chance Catholics will abandon a "two-source" approach to social ethics. But better integration of biblical materials into Catholic social teaching and moral theology remains a desideratum.

Another issue is confusion over the meaning of the natural-law tradition in current teaching. For some, natural law and natural rights remain incompatible moral systems (Douglass Rasmussen in *Debate*). On this view, talk about human rights must involve rejection of natural obligations and acceptance of atomistic individualism. For others, natural law must involve the assertion of timeless moral norms or, at least, the settled agreement of another time, especially the preconciliar moral theology of Heinrich Pesch and the German school (Henry Briefs in *Deeper Meaning*). It is evident that, despite helpful historical expositions, such as those by Yves Calvez, Charles Curran, and David J. O'Brien (*Catholic Challenge*), moral theologians have much work to do to make the evolution and normative patterns of official Catholic social teaching comprehensible and cogent for a wider intellectual audience.

A third problem is the role of parenesis in the bishops' pastoring. This is the question once again of Scripture and public philosophy taken from the side of social strategy. Several authors, notably Norman Birnbaum ("The Bishops in the Iron Cage" in *Catholic Challenge*) focus on the cleft between the bishops' use of religious language for moral exhortation and their use of liberal-rights terminology for policy evaluation. The use of two types of discourse mirrors the assumption of liberal society that religion serves an expressive function in the private sphere, but has no role in the shaping of public policy. In any coherent ethic, virtue and principle must re-enforce one another. Restraining one's deeper moral commitments can be a recipe for moral and political impotence. "Only strong moral convictions can overcome the barriers of habit, spirit and structure that make our history seem an eternal repetition of harshness,"

writes Birnbaum. "Where the bishops' argument is incomplete is in the connection of moral discourse to political interests and material ones."

Larry Rasmussen ("Going Public: The Churches Roles" in *God, Goods*) makes a similar point. "The (faith-based) normative commitment and the strategic commitment are on different tracks. They may be reconcilable in *thought*. . . . But they are not reconcilable in *practice*, at least unless and until the power issues are faced." How, he asks, "do followers of a radical Jesus concretely address economic powers which are by and large arrayed *against* the gospel as 'good news preached to the poor'?"

I would summarize the underlying theological question this way: Can Catholic social teaching better apply a biblical vision of justice to the modern world without either taking a sectarian turn or becoming far more directly emeshed in politics? The substance of the question belongs to the commentators; the restrictions barring sectarianism and political entanglement are mine. I take it that they reflect the trajectory up to now, at least, of Catholic social teaching generally and especially of Catholicism in America. The rub is to discover whether an ethic which takes Scripture seriously as a source of norms and moral exhortation can escape both horns of the dilemma.

For Catholic moral theology, moreover, the responses of scholars from other fields and religious traditions set at least two tasks. The first is how better to establish a moral agenda based on Scripture without surrendering belief in shared moral reasoning. This remains a task which bishops, their staffs, and scholars need to continue to explore together. The second is more properly a task for moral theologians, i.e. to articulate the development of the principles of Catholic social theology in terms that political philosophers and social scientists can understand. The effort to communicate the substance of Catholic teaching to learned colleagues and to give its formulations systematic intellectual defense will be an important step in making Catholic teaching more plausible to a wider population. It will also contribute to refining Catholic thinking.

Finally, a thumbnail recommendation about each book. *The Catholic Challenge* is the most comprehensive study. It is best suited for extensive classroom use at the college level. *Debate* is more specialized, an exchange between two philosophers on the defensibility of the bishops' general economic program and the key norms of "human dignity" and "the common good." Though the interlocutors' arguments appear somewhat contrived, for Catholic ethicists concerned with the dialogue with secular political philosophy *Debate* makes a useful contribution. To this reviewer, *Deeper Meaning* was the most intellectually satisfying book of the four. It probes fundamental questions of interest to advanced students of ethics, theology, and political science. *God, Goods and the Common Good*,

prepared by Lutherans for a Lutheran church audience, reproduces the bishops' summary statement and provides stimulating think pieces for a general readership. Contributions by pastors and activists key its responses very much to the diversity of views and interests which will be found in any public-education program on the economic pastoral.

*University of Notre Dame*

DREW CHRISTIANSEN, S.J.

**FORMATION OF THE HUMAN HEART: FORMATIVE SPIRITUALITY 3.** By Adrian Van Kaam. New York: Crossroad, 1986. Pp. xx + 406. \$27.50.

Prior to Vatican II, Catholic spiritual writers tended to sniff suspiciously at psychology. With the publication of this third volume of Van Kaam's study of the science of human formation, one can safely conclude that the wedding of psychology and of spirituality has been fully consummated. *Formation of the Human Heart* offers the reader a psychologically updated philosophy and theology of the virtues.

I say a philosophy as well as a theology of the virtues, because the formative spirituality presented rests on very specific anthropological foundations. I find those foundations on the whole sound. V. espouses an organic, holistic, self-transcending, social construct of the human person. His formative spirituality avoids as a consequence the kinds of dualism that have in the past marred more traditional spiritualities. In dualistic spiritualities one conceives of spirit and matter, the inner self and the outside world, the individual and society in ways that make their relationship to one another subsequently unintelligible. V. avoids such dualisms by creating a new technical language for talking about human development, a language he has been developing in the course of his three volumes on formative spirituality. The reader should, then, expect to encounter unusual terms like "pulsions," "pulsations," "form potency," "intraformative," "intradifferentiation," "inter-, inner, and outer spheres." This somewhat esoteric vocabulary contributes to the abstract tone of V.'s style and betrays him on occasion into writing jargon. I refer to sentences like "The disposition of privacy protects this formative integration every time it threatens to become dissonant because of too much contraction within one's intrasphere or too much expansion in one's inter- and outer spheres" or "There is a correlation between the consonant contraction and expansion of our intrasphere and the formation of a personalized functional dimension of the life-form."

As one would expect, the psychologized spirituality presented in this volume lays great stress on psychic wholeness and integration. Throughout V. employs an encouraging, upbeat rhetoric. In the end, however, I found the rhetorical tone a bit too optimistic. I missed sufficient stress on what a more traditional theology would have called "original sin" and



"concupiscence." When properly updated, these terms connote the potentially corrupting presence of social sin: of sins other than those one commits oneself, of institutional sins of exploitation, dehumanization, and oppression. The formative spirituality presented in this volume recognizes a social dimension to spiritual growth; but instead of incorporating into personal formation a systematic critique of deforming and disgraceful social structures, formative spirituality focuses on the cultivation of healthy personal attitudes toward social interaction and social change. In this respect formative spirituality still has some important lessons to learn from liberation theology.

It also has something to learn from a contemporary theology of conversion. Formation spirituality seems to presuppose an automatic openness within the human psyche to what it calls "the formation mystery," or God. Formation spirituality tends in consequence to speak of religious development as the spontaneous unfolding of human potential. I miss in this spirituality a clear differentiation between natural human development (which occurs in abstraction from faith) and graced transformation in faith. I miss a discussion of the need for conversion, the different kinds of conversion, and the ways in which faith transforms and transvalues natural ego processes. Formation spirituality also fails to attend in any explicit way to the role which the charisms play within Christian spirituality. In other words, formation spirituality seems to me to present a somewhat overly psychologized account of human growth that needs more systematic integration with theological perceptions of human development. Nevertheless, those who have experienced an initial conversion will find in this book some wise and useful insights into the kinds of habitual personal attitudes that make for healthy and balanced personal development.

*Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley*

DONALD L. GELPI, S.J.

**SCIENCE AND RELIGION: A CRITICAL SURVEY.** By Holmes Rolston, III. New York: Random House, 1987. Pp. x + 357. \$11.

Rolston, a professor of philosophy at Colorado State University with a solid background in theology and science, has written a monumental work, one deserving of widespread usage by theologians and scientists alike. Carefully organized and beautifully written, it appears to be the fruit of years of reflection by a deeply religious mind fully conversant with the best of modern science and theology.

Science, R. says, is about causes, religion about meaning. But what science studies is not adequately understood itself until placed within a narrative framework. For the emergent universe that scientists study is not a mere sequence, but a story, a suspenseful struggle upward from

matter, through life, mind, culture, and history, to God. Only the narrative mode of meaning can finally capture what is going on in the universe. And this narrative component allows Christian theology to link up in a complementary way with science. The Christian story brings out the historical and redemptive strains of the 20-billion-year-old cosmic journey. The aspects of strife and struggle in the universe are highly congenial to a "cruciform" interpretation of nature. The Christian cross as a "suffering through to something higher" is the most inclusive paradigm not only for history but for the entirety of cosmic evolution.

The phases in the story of cosmic emergence provide the structure of R.'s book: matter, life, mind, culture, and history. Working through both the natural and the social sciences, R. carefully shows the excesses of naturalist reductionism on the one hand, and the failures of supernaturalist and existentialist theology to take science and the cosmos seriously enough on the other. The book excels in its exposition of the explanatory inadequacy of naturalistic interpretations of evolution. At the same time, it avoids building theological conclusions off controversial scientific ideas. In this connection one of the most valuable aspects of R.'s treatment is his sympathetic but restrained discussion of the so-called "anthropic principle." The principle maintains that the eventual evolution of life and consciousness in evolution placed constraints on the initial physical conditions that gave rise to the universe in the first place. R. criticizes the anthropocentrism often put forth by advocates of the anthropic principle, but he agrees that human existence is more intimately connected with the initial cosmological conditions than both naturalism and supernaturalism have supposed.

R.'s book deserves a wide reading. But aspects of it will not go unquestioned by non-Christian readers and perhaps also some Christian theologians, especially Catholics, interested in science and religion. There is a pervasively "evangelical" tone to Rolton's narrative theology of nature. It is always sophisticated, gentle, and nonpolemical, but R.'s fear of history's being swallowed up by cosmology and his edginess about any lapses from historical consciousness into an ahistorical cosmic piety have led him to ignore the sacramental side of nature. R. shows little interest in Catholic theologies of nature, even Teilhard's. He belittles process thought's contributions, even though they are most congenial to his own approach to nature. But the most troubling quality of R.'s erudite Christian interpretation may be his sharp dismissal of the religious cosmologies of the East. After surveying Hinduism, Buddhism, and Taoism in search of a cosmological paradigm with which to interpret the discoveries of modern science, he returns to his historical-narrative biblical model, having salvaged little from the other great religious

traditions. He finds their lack of a historical-narrative sense of the cosmos incompatible with, rather than complementary to, the Christian view. One wonders whether a full discussion of science and religion today can afford to be this exclusivist. R. concedes that his criticisms of Eastern and nonhistorical perspectives need not carry over to the study of comparative religion. He does not disparage their religious significance, and he only questions their ability to provide a cosmological basis sufficiently broad to interpret modern science. But in doing so he fails to consider that the historical paradigm may itself abstract from a great deal of the substance of cosmic reality also. His relentless emphasis on history may in part be the result of his neglect of the Christian "sacramental" model of the cosmos, which may be an important bridge to the East.

These criticisms, which R. is probably prepared to address, should not be taken as diminishing the value of his learned inquiry. The book is truly outstanding and always honestly self-conscious about the perspective from which it is written. One may safely predict that it will deeply enrich discussions of science and religion for many years to come.

*Georgetown University*

JOHN F. HAUGHT

**GOD AND THE NEW BIOLOGY.** By Arthur Peacocke. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1987. Pp. xxi + 197. \$19.95.

P. is a physical biochemist. His personal research interests in DNA gave him a grandstand seat during the heroic days in contemporary biology back in 1953, when Watson and Crick were breaking open the mystery of DNA and mapping the structure of the double helix. But P. is also an Anglican priest, richly versed in the traditions of Christian theology, particularly, of course, in its Anglican form. One hears the accents of Tennant, Raven, and Temple as he works out his thoughts. And, since P. is British, it is natural that he should struggle with the implications of the revolution began by his fellow countryman Charles Darwin. In a post-Darwinian world he must seek to restructure an understanding of God, nature, and the human person.

Over the past ten years P. has authored a variety of articles and papers on the impact of the new biology for a Christian understanding of life. Here he reissues those earlier works but rethought, updated, and unified so that no sutures or stitches reveal a separate origin.

By the new biology P. means, first, Darwin's theory of natural selection as accounting for the origination of species. He includes Mendel's work on genetics and the concept of reproductive advantage. Then, however, came the startling advances of molecular biology as physics and chemistry served more and more to illuminate the study of living structures and processes. The resultant congeries forms the new biology.

This powerful scientific machine confronts the Christian thinker with a variety of noisy questions. First is the insistent temptation of reductionism. Human thought somehow involves a brain, and the brain is a biological-chemical factory, and chemistry is nothing but physics, and physics is nothing but atoms and molecules. How far is this nothing-but-ery to go and how helpful is it?

In ancient Greece, Democritus and Aristotle may be taken to represent two antithetical approaches to an understanding of the real. For Democritus, nature was nothing but atoms and the void. For Aristotle, something else was strenuously demanded that was called upon to constitute the distinctive reality of what was otherwise only a heap of geometrically positioned sand. The standoff continues today.

One form of the Aristotelian contention moves so far as to make the organizing component of a being, the form, almost a thing. Christian thought early picked up on this Greek philosophic hypothesis and elaborated the concept of soul. The construct became intertwined with other components of the Christian vision, although recent biblical scholarship notes that it was unimportant in the preaching of Jesus of Nazareth. Now that philosophic currents under the guidance of the new biology are flowing back more toward Democritus, how does the Christian thinker refashion the religious vision of salvation?

P. faces such problems with an equanimity of spirit one expects from the best of the Anglican tradition. There must be, he feels, a critical realism to Christian thought, which pressures it to accept the theology and science that exist in any age but without idealizing or absolutizing what chances to be at any moment their best contemporary form. His own answer moves in the direction of a panentheistic structuring, together with a refocusing of sacramental thought and inspiration.

P.'s book is addressed primarily to those who are "puzzled and disoriented" by the continuously explosive developments of the biological sciences in their recent fruitful wedding with physics. He speaks to those who want to think about God and nature and the human person, who want to know how there can be an "I" in something which is nothing but a complicated patterning of atoms, a reality called God in a scene dominated by chance occurrences where no player seems to know the lines to speak before the moment itself.

P.'s work is a short but magisterial approach, rich in its contacts with the past, open in its conversation with the present, and unafraid of the unforeseeable developments that must of necessity soon be rushing upon us. It reinforces P.'s position as a major figure in the field of the relations between science and religion.

*Loyola College, Baltimore*

FRANK R. HAIG, S.J.

**THE NEW BIOLOGY: DISCOVERING THE WISDOM IN NATURE.** By Robert Augros and George Stanciu. Boston: New Science Library, 1987. Pp. 274. \$22.50.

Today, when natural science plays a vital and proper role in the theological enterprise, this work by Augros (St. Anselm College) and Stanciu (Magdalen College) can benefit both the theologian and the informed reader. In *The New Story of Science* (cf. *TS* 46 [1985] 576–77), they contended that the “old story” of science, based on Renaissance and Enlightenment materialism, no longer stood the test of science itself. Instead, they insisted, contemporary neurology argues for a spiritual principle within the human person (a soul) and modern physics (especially astrophysics) actually points to a creator God. In this subsequent volume they take up a similar study related to biology. Whereas the “old biology,” analogous to the “old physics,” was highly materialistic and deterministic, A. and S. claim that a new biology is emerging which challenges many of the previous assumptions and theories. This new biology alters not only our perception of nature but also the view of ourselves as human persons and the universe’s relation to God.

As technology and computers more and more mimic nature and the human mind, the old assumption (based on Cartesian philosophy) that nature and human beings are but complex machines would seem to be confirmed. Not so, they declare: the new biology maintains just the opposite. Biology now demonstrates that living organisms differ—not in degree but in kind—from any man-made artifact, such as a computer. After submitting an abundance of compelling evidence (as they do throughout their study), the authors conclude that a living being’s capacity to build its own parts, regenerate itself, transform materials into itself, and its natural action from within “not only distinguish the living being from the machine but also demonstrate its uniqueness amid the whole of nature” (31).

If living organisms differ radically from machines, is the same true between animals and humans? Does not evolution demonstrate that the human person is but a more complex and skilled animal? Again arguing from biological research, A. and S. argue that human beings differ in kind from animals. “Intellectual understanding is not found in any degree in any animal but man. The human capacity to understand the what and the why of things is unique in the animal kingdom” (82).

Three engaging chapters discuss the co-operation, harmony, and origin of species within nature. The Darwinian view is one of “a ruthless struggle between opposing forces” (89). All is “red in tooth and claw.” Only the fit survive. Contemporary studies, contradicting this view, have estab-

lished that co-operation and harmony, not competition, provide the infrastructures of the natural order. Each plant and animal co-operates with others for the good of all. "Nature is not at war, one organism with another. Nature is an alliance founded on cooperation" (129). This new view of nature has direct relevance to any theological understanding of ecology and humanity's stewardship over the world.

While the new biology rejects Darwin's theory of evolution, the authors do not rally behind a fundamentalist creationism. The new biology formulates a fresh theory that is both more scientific and more compatible with the Christian view of God and the human person. This evolutionary theory is founded upon the study of genetics. The authors ask: Where did these genetic codes come from which give rise to new species? They believe that such "intelligible" codes and evolutionary progression could not come from "unintelligent" matter, but point instead to a mind. "Even if it does so by creating chemical mechanisms to carry out the task with autonomy, this artist [mind] will be the ultimate cause of those forms existing in matter. This artist is God, and nature is God's handiwork" (191).

Not everyone will be convinced by such arguments. Nonetheless, the great promise of this book is not just that it refutes the concept of a predestined war within nature, but that it detects no need for an irreconcilable war between science and religion; they can exist in the same environment. Moreover, they can form an alliance beneficial to both. Anyone interested in the relationship between science and religion, evolution, or Christian anthropology should study this work.

Washington, D.C.

THOMAS WEINANDY, O.F.M.CAP.

A THEOLOGY OF ARTISTIC SENSIBILITIES: THE VISUAL ARTS AND THE CHURCH. By John Dillenberger. New York: Crossroad, 1986. Pp. xiv + 280. \$22.50.

Henri Matisse is reported to have answered a query about meaning in one of his paintings, "If I'd known what it meant, madam, I would not have had to paint it." D. raises the question of meaning in art in the Church, an essentially mysterious reality, and attempts an answer with a speed course through the history of church art and a gloss on the last century of theologizing about art in the Church; his concluding "Agenda" contains a very brief plea for better education, especially seminary education. Someone else will "have to paint" it.

The construction of Matisse's chapel for the Dominican Sisters in Vence, a *cause célèbre* at the time because of the religious nonaffiliation of its avowed atheist artist, is mentioned by D. with great affection both because of the quality of the artwork and because of its religious status

according to Tillich's now-beloved dictum about the sacred character of all true art whether its subject matter be religious or not. The Chapelle du Rosaire is, without doubt, a masterpiece of religious architecture. But it also points to a curious fact in today's Church, i.e. that almost all the works D. considers worthy of note in the late 20th century are by artists nurtured in the bosom of Abraham and only by extension in the Body of Christ. The question of having great art done for the Church irrespective of the religious affiliation of the artist is not a new question. It has been answered by Tillich, Matisse, and Couturier; there is another question for today: Why has the Church not produced a community which supports the growth of artists committed to both the Church and to art? D.'s answer: "The artists did not desert the Church; the Church deserted the artists" (213), but he does not touch on this most important question, except peripherally, in his "agenda."

D. states that he came to a twofold conclusion early in his career: "First, the issue of the visual arts and the church has much to do with theological understandings and very little to do with theories of aesthetics. . . . Second, what the visual arts convey cannot be translated totally into other modalities" (xi). This book gives credence to both conclusions. D.'s coverage of all the art that has been used in the history of the Church and his judgment about what is best in the tradition is articulate and impressive; he is a man who has seen much and learned much about both art and religion. When, however, he talks about the present age he indicates a rather meagre appreciation in such phrases as, "Of course, some modern art is poor . . ." (242). It is inexact to use the term "modern art" to describe everything done in the 20th century. And it is inexact to say: "Twentieth-century artists are forming perceptions rather than expressing perceptions already held" (191). There are many works being produced by artists who actually have a prayer life and whose artwork actually reflects and expresses perceptions held by millennia of mystically oriented faithful.

There is a problem in the Church in America which can be seen as too great an inculturation. D. rightly accuses the media-based perceptions of a consumer society for our inability to see or communicate more deeply than on a surface level. He suggests too gently that some headway will be made if theology takes art seriously by adding professional art faculty in the seminary. The problem is far more severe than that.

The 123 illustrations are of minimal use. Some of these black-and-white photos are merely poor representatives of the art that D. praises; but some are unconscionably reductive, such as the one of the Rothko Chapel, or the little black square which represents Ad Reinhardt's great contribution to minimalist spiritualism in painting (plate 96).

Otto's classic *Idea of the Holy* describes the *orgē*, the ugly, mysterious, shuddering quality, the numinous reality, which is essential to much sacred art. This principle is, it seems to me, of tremendous consequence in the study of sacred art—a principle which must not be ignored; it crosses the barriers of sect and continent, time and space, words and pictures. If there is to be an agenda which includes seminary education, the exclusion of this intangible aspect from the course of study would not only be unfortunate; it would allow clerical dilettantes to lament the loss of pretty and valuable art from the church environment as blindly as they now consecrate that same absence as “American practicality.”

D. pithily characterizes the present situation: “A truncated religious ethic believes it helps the poor by modesty without style” (213). He also claims that our artless world represents a sorry new age, one in which “. . . the educated ignorant can now read scripture but not the paintings or stained glass windows; revivals of faith and devotion have come from words not pictures. . .” (43).

I find myself impressed with the knowledge exhibited in this volume, gratified by the recognition of the problem in the thinking of my more verbal colleague, and somewhat hopeless with respect to the immediate future.

*St. Joseph's University, Phila.*

DENNIS McNALLY, S.J.

ONE CHURCH, MANY CULTURES: CHALLENGE OF DIVERSITY. By Joseph P. Fitzpatrick, S.J. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed and Ward, 1987. Pp. 205. \$8.95.

Fitzpatrick, professor emeritus of sociology at Fordham, is an expert on Puerto Rican immigration and Catholicism. His long career as researcher, writer, teacher, and social-justice advocate has exposed him to several fundamental dimensions of Hispanic ministry in the U.S. In this very readable work he provides an introduction to the most pressing issues facing the U.S. Catholic Church in its efforts to respond to the growing Hispanic presence. The book goes a long way in meeting the need for a straightforward discussion of the Hispanic reality here and the complex issues underlying the ongoing evangelization of a group which is quickly becoming the dominant one (at least in numbers) within the U.S. Church.

F. approaches the question of the confrontation of Hispanic cultures and Catholicism with their Anglo-American counterparts in terms of history, the social sciences, and theology. Chapter 1 provides a compact history of, and a theological grounding for, the interaction between church and cultures. F. stresses the formulation of the issues in the primitive Church as reported in the Acts of the Apostles and in the



Pauline letters. Chapter 2 outlines the anthropological concept of culture. Many examples are given of cultural diversity and the implications of such diversity for the inculturation of Christian faith concretely in the lives of people. Chapter 3 deals with two particularly lucid instances of inculturation: (1) the development of the Slavonic Rite by Cyril and Methodius and (2) the controversies around the Chinese Rites.

Chapter 4 explores the unique experience of ethnic Catholic immigrants of the 19th century. This period has been transcended, however, and a new struggle of inculturation has begun: the American Catholic is now part of the mainstream, is as "American as apple pie," and yet a totally new wave of Catholic immigrants is arriving. Chapter 6 outlines the current status of Hispanics within U.S. society and church. F. deals with the diversity of the groups in question and the approaches being taken toward ministry with them. He surfaces key issues such as assimilation and cultural pluralism. The 7th and last chapter summarizes some of the theology currently being done in the area of religion and culture, highlighting important documents of the magisterium on this subject, as well as the thought of European, African, and Asian theologians (Karl Rahner, Justin S. Ukpong, and Aloysius Pieris) on faith and culture.

F. provides a most useful and necessary introduction to Hispanic ministry in the U.S. context. It is the first study of its kind which focuses upon the evangelization of U.S. Hispanics in the light of recent theological and social-science research. He surfaces the critical question regarding the confrontation of a largely middle-class church with a new generation of poor immigrants. The most relevant historical data as well as key aspects of a contemporary theology of inculturation are applied to the Hispanic presence. F. does this with the care of a seasoned writer and social-science researcher. Yet he has produced a work that is readily accessible to novice and veteran alike. He does an excellent job of summarizing a wide range of literature and providing an extensive bibliography for further research and analysis. The issues he raises here are unquestionably central items on the agenda of American Catholicism as it rounds the corner into the 21st century.

*Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley* ALLAN FIGUEROA DECK, S.J.

## SHORTER NOTICES

**WHO WROTE THE BIBLE?** By Richard Elliott Friedman. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1987. Pp. 299.

This book has already received major reviews in *US News and World Report* and *The Wall Street Journal*. Such exposure seems appropriate for an exciting book which presents contemporary biblical research to a literate, nontheological audience. Treating modern OT study as a trail of clues leading to its "authors," F. unravels scholarly hypotheses in graphic style. His anecdotal accounts of research projects at Harvard provide for nonspecialists an entree into the biblical research world; they also demonstrate the value and process of scholarly collaboration.

Many specialists have described the religious and political provenance of J, E, and D; such results do not satisfy F., who tries to identify the very "authors" of these texts. Most intriguing are his theories about the authorship of E and D (Levitical priests from Shiloh), the Deuteronomistic History (Jeremiah and/or Baruch), and P (an Aaronid priest in the time of Hezekiah). Finally, his early dating of P obliges him to separate the P-tradition from the redactor of the entire Pentateuch (Ezra). These proposals, especially those involving Jeremiah as "author" of the Deuteronomistic History as well as the book of Jeremiah, will probably meet significant critical response. One might suggest that several intermediate positions are drawn beyond their logical conclusions.

F.'s strongest points are his methodological assumption that authors retell ancient traditions in language best suited to their eras and his careful comparison of similar traditions, e.g. J and P traditions about the Flood. Those who read theology may find this work

stimulating as well as enjoyable. Its concluding remarks on the nuance and complexity of the resulting characterization of God also recommend it to readers of this journal.

JOHN C. ENDRES, S.J.  
*Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley*

**BEING POOR: A BIBLICAL STUDY.** By Leslie J. Hoppe, O.F.M. *Good News Studies* 20. Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1987. Pp. viii + 191. \$9.95.

A survey and overview of biblical texts which speak of the poor. H. acknowledges that the interpreter's perspectives can color the reading of a text, but is not explicit about his own influences. He shows that poverty or the poor are never idealized in the Bible, and that any notion of spiritual poverty must be joined to the obligations of justice and concern for the poor. The book seems aimed especially at modifying the classical study of the *anawim* by Albert Gelin, who maintained that there is a transition in the Bible from poverty as a social problem to poverty as a religious metaphor.

Dealing mostly with the OT, the nine chapters do not treat passages in great detail, but survey the main thrust of each section of biblical literature: Tetrateuch, Deuteronomy, Former and Latter Prophets, Wisdom Literature, Psalms, Apocalyptic, and the NT. There are brief but helpful presentations of intertestamental and rabbinic literature. The book is simply written and provides introductory background and explanatory footnotes for those without training in biblical studies. The section on the Latter Prophets is especially helpful for reconstructing the historical and social setting of their message.

Because of our contemporary emphasis on the challenges of social jus-

tice, we welcome a book which highlights the constant preoccupation of the Bible with the economically and materially poor. While H. does not center attention on notions such as structural sin or the option for the poor, he lays the foundations for these concepts and offers them as possible applications to the more modest conclusions that he draws.

ANTHONY J. TAMBASCO  
*Georgetown University*

**WHAT ARE THEY SAYING ABOUT MARK?** By Frank J. Matera. New York: Paulist, 1987. Pp. ix + 113. \$4.95.

This volume accomplishes well what it sets out to do: survey and concisely summarize Markan scholarship of the past 25 years, including significant works in German and French as well as in English. As M. has handled his assignment, less is more. He mentions fewer scholars, articles, and books than he might have, but he says enough about those he does mention to make clear their contribution to the ongoing discussion. The five chapters survey opinions on the setting of the Gospel, its Christology, its treatment of the disciples, its composition, and the Gospel as narrative. The order of the chapters is well conceived, and within each chapter positions are set forth clearly and logically. Attention is drawn to divergent positions: Roman or Galilean setting; corrective or Son of God Christology; polemical or pastoral portrait of the disciples; creative author and theologian or conservative redactor. M.'s own positions, which are briefly stated in concluding sections, are "conservative": Mark was written in Rome by a conservative redactor to present Jesus as the messianic Son of God, and the failure of the disciples serves as a pastoral example.

M. has successfully met the double challenge of summarizing the work of others and presenting the work of scholars for a broader audience of

teachers, students, and laypersons. Material that could bore some readers and boggle the minds of others seems likely here to interest and inform nearly all. In addition, M. is evenhanded and fair throughout. Perhaps because of this evenhandedness, the book does not fully communicate the excitement of recent Markan studies. It does, however, present in clear historical perspective the inconclusiveness and open-endedness of Markan research of the last quarter century and position the reader for the next quarter century's work.

ELIZABETH STRUTHERS MALBON  
*Virginia Polytechnic Institute  
and State University, Blacksburg*

**PASSION NARRATIVES AND GOSPEL THEOLOGIES: INTERPRETING THE SYNOPTICS THROUGH THEIR PASSION STORIES.** By Frank J. Matera. New York: Paulist, 1986. Pp. xii + 256. \$12.95.

M. contributes to a growing list of studies on the passion narratives which bring the results of redaction criticism to the nonprofessional. He offers a wealth of good exegesis on the last days of Jesus' earthly life. His emphasis on theological themes particular to each Synoptic Evangelist is especially enlightening and helpful both for preachers and for all who desire a deeper understanding of the Gospels.

There seems, however, to be a certain conflict between his stated intention "to study each passion narrative in terms of the particular evangelist's theology" and the order M. actually follows. Thus he asserts that "the passion must be read as part of Mark's total story" (52); yet he undertakes the study of the passion before considering Mark's story as a whole. M.'s subtitle expresses more accurately the procedure he actually follows: he interprets the Evangelists' theologies in terms of their passion stories. M. first gives an overview of each passion narrative,

then offers a commentary on it, and finally selects four themes from each and shows how they are developed in the remainder of the respective Gospels. If the Gospels as wholes had been studied first, along with their salient themes, the exegesis of the individual passion narratives would have been meaningfully illuminated by their total contexts and there would have been less danger of eisegesis.

There are occasional inaccuracies of detail. E.g., M. confuses the biblical and modern methods of reckoning time (13); he mistranslates *zymes* as "bread" (63); and he speaks of "the hour of darkness" in connection with Luke (190-91), although Luke never employs that expression. But such details do not detract from the general excellence of M.'s study. It deserves to be recommended and read.

ERNEST R. MARTINEZ, S.J.  
*Oakland, Calif.*

**PAUL THE APOSTLE AND HIS CITIES.**  
By Sherman E. Johnson. Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1987. Pp. 186. \$9.95.

Johnson, dean emeritus at the Church Divinity School of the Pacific in Berkeley, seeks to illumine Paul's life and work by combining study of written sources with a view of the geography and history of the regions in which he traveled. After a 15-page introduction, J. discusses Tarsus, Jerusalem and Damascus, Antioch, the beginning of the great adventure, Macedonia, Athens, Corinth, two years of crisis, Paul and the riot in Ephesus, the cities of the Lycus Valley, on the way to Jerusalem, Caesarea Maritima, the voyage to Rome, Jews and Christians in Rome, and the end of Paul's life. Photographs and bibliographies are supplied for each chapter. Two chronological tables and a biblical index are included. The volume contains revised versions of articles originally published in the *Lexington Theological Quarterly*.

The book has a double purpose. The

first is to introduce Paul as a traveler, a pioneer missionary, and a creative religious thinker in the setting of his age and the places where he lived and worked. The second purpose is to make travel to some of the sites of Paul's ministry more meaningful to thoughtful pilgrims and tourists, or even to those who can follow Paul in their imaginations.

The double purpose is achieved rather nicely. Without giving detailed archeological reports or city plans, J. provides enough information to orient the visitor and to give background for an intelligent reading of Paul's letters and the second half of Acts. The impression is clear that J., an experienced and distinguished NT scholar, enjoyed writing these pieces about the geographical and historical context for Paul's good news. On account of its tone and content, the book fits well in a series entitled "Good News Studies."

DANIEL J. HARRINGTON, S.J.  
*Weston School of Theology, Mass.*

**PARTIAL KNOWLEDGE: PHILOSOPHICAL STUDIES IN PAUL.** By Paul W. Gooch. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame, 1987. Pp. vii + 195.

In this set of essays, G. analyzes parts of 1 Corinthians from a philosopher's perspective and with philosophical preoccupations. His task is not to reconstruct Paul's historical situation (although he must do some of that to keep his reading honest) nor to do theology (although at times he comes closer than he might acknowledge). He tries to occupy the messy middle ground of rational inquiry into Paul's religious language. He selects specific passages and asks: "What are the premises here, and what is the logic of argumentation?"

Because the passages he deals with are various, so are the expressions of the philosophical task. His introduction takes as its text Col 2:8, "Beware of philosophy," and asks what Paul

may have meant by this prohibition. G. then tests the possibilities of philosophical inquiry in his essay "Faith, Wisdom and Philosophy (I Cor 1-4)." His final chapter, "Partial Knowledge (I Cor 13)," reflects on the epistemological limits suggested by the Pauline image "through a mirror darkly."

In the essays placed between these programmatic bookends, that dealing with "Disembodied Persons and Pauline Resurrection (I Cor 15)" is at once the most philosophical and provocative. G.'s essays on Paul's use of ethical authorities in 1 Cor 7 and Paul's ethical reasoning in 1 Cor 8-10 are weaker. In the case of 1 Cor 8-10, greater use of contemporary research into the social realities of the Corinthian community (Theissen, Meeks) would have helped. The essay "For and against Accommodation (I Cor 9:19-23)" makes the intrinsic weakness of G.'s method clearer. Excerpting the passage from its rhetorical role as an *exemplum* in the Pauline parenthesis absolutizes and distorts the text. A stronger reading would have resulted from placing this passage within the whole argument of 1 Cor 8-10.

I am not sure that we understand either Paul or philosophy any better because of these essays. What they demonstrate is that at certain points Paul's writing invites and enables such rational inquiry without diminishment of text or thought.

LUKE TIMOTHY JOHNSON  
*Indiana University, Bloomington*

ASCETIC PIETY AND WOMEN'S FAITH: ESSAYS ON LATE ANCIENT CHRISTIANITY. By Elizabeth A. Clark. *Studies in Women and Religion* 20. Lewiston, N.Y.: Mellen, 1986. Pp. xv + 427. \$49.95.

Clark has been one of the more creative forces in feminist and patristic scholarship in the last decade. Through her work of translation and commentary, she has focused scholarly atten-

tion on little-known tributes to women such as the *Life of Olympias*, the *Life of Melania the Younger*, and the *Virgilian Cento* of Faltonia Betitia Proba. The present collection consists of 13 essays, about half of them published previously. C.'s overall agenda is to recover Christian history as women's history. Her judgments are generally balanced and nuanced. The patriarchal and androcentric character of most patristic literature is acknowledged, but the experience of women who found autonomy and respect as equals also is uncovered, especially in ascetic literature.

Among the previously unpublished essays is a pair of Ransom-Butler Lectures, delivered at Wichita State University in 1982. The first, "Devil's Gateway and Bride of Christ," is an excellent overview of patristic attitudes towards women. The second, "Faltonia Betitia Proba and her Virgilian Poem," provides a rare glimpse at the literary activity of a Christian Roman matron in the mid-fourth century. The volume, however, is not entirely devoted to women's issues. E.g., the essay "Vitiating Seeds and Holy Vessels" traces Augustine's interest in the biological transmission of original sin throughout the Pelagian controversy. C. shows that Julian of Eclanum had forced Augustine into a "scientific" discussion of human reproduction for which he was ill-prepared. Two essays on patristic exegesis and asceticism (on Gen 1-3 and the Song of Songs) round out the volume.

This reviewer found only one point with which to take issue. In her opening essay, "The State and Future of Historical Theology: Patristic Studies," C. suggests that the emerging interest in the social world of early Christianity points to a future of "less theology, more history." Such a judgment may be premature. Current attempts to place Christian doctrine within its political, social, and economic contexts ought to lead to a renewal of theological

understanding. The result would be not an elimination of the theology but a truly historical theology.

DAVID G. HUNTER  
*College of St. Thomas, Minn.*

SAINT GREGORY OF NAZIANZUS, THREE POEMS: CONCERNING HIS OWN AFFAIRS, CONCERNING HIMSELF AND THE BISHOPS, CONCERNING HIS OWN LIFE. Translated by Denis Molaise Meehan, O.S.B. *Fathers of the Church* 75. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America, 1987. Pp. xii + 142.

John Henry Newman's description of Gregory of Nazianzus in his *Historical Sketches* sounds very much like the great English cardinal himself: learned, literary, sensitive, saintly, uneasy in church politics. Fortunately for us, both left self-reflective writings on their lives. Gregory, steeped in the Greek classics, sensitive to rhythm and cadences, a polished rhetorician, wrote his reflections *De vita sua* in verse. Their high quality as poetry has been an intimidation to would-be translators; much of the artistry would, of course, be lost in translation. M. has bravely faced the task and produced a creditable translation of three of the autobiographical poems. These works have been rendered in a prose which on its level does justice to the original. In the absence of a critical edition, M. has had to work from the Migne text, but he provides a version which is competent and flowing, with notes which are apt and scholarly. The text is preceded by a 21-page introduction which provides informed and well-documented background. Supplementary notes have been provided by Thomas Halton.

*De vita sua*, as M. reminds us, is "the earliest piece of Christian autobiography we possess." It may have influenced St. Augustine. In any case, Gregory is remarkably candid in his reflections, displaying tender feelings for his

parents and for Basil (who yet comes in for gentle criticism), bitter memories of episcopal enemies over his mistreatment, regrets over his naivete as bishop, delight at his acceptance by Theodosius as the champion of orthodoxy. This is an invaluable document of a fascinating life told in the first person. It provides precious insights into the stormy church politics of the later fourth century, as well as into the tangled motivations of churchmen of every age.

GEORGE C. BERTHOLD  
*Saint Anselm College, N.H.*

CATENAE GRAECAE IN GENESIM ET IN EXODUM 2: COLLECTIO COISLIANIANA IN GENESIM. Edited by Françoise Petit. *Corpus christianorum, series Graeca* 15. Turnhout: Brepols, 1986. Pp. cxix + 308. Fr.b. 5200; 4800.

In 1977 Petit published an edition of catenae on the first two books of the OT (*Catena Graeca in Genesim et Exodum* 1: *Catena Sinaitica* [CCG 2]). The introduction to the present volume is, like the others in this series, primarily concerned with manuscript tradition, but it is especially important here because it shows that this collection, which is related to the one published earlier, also stands on its own, offering both different material and another view of it. A lengthy excursus describes the manuscript and publication tradition of the *Quaestiones in Octateuchum* of Theodoret of Cyrus, with which this catena has a special relationship. Analysis of the authors included in the collection shows that, in keeping with the influence of Theodoret, it is composed from the viewpoint of Antiochene exegesis; and it is indeed interesting, as P. says, to see the thoughts of authors such as Basil of Caesarea and John Chrysostom in the context of this exegetical approach.

Following Theodoret's method, this text is not a commentary on the whole book of Genesis, but offers instead

interpretations of problematic passages. The limitations of space do not allow for extended discussion of the contents, but one example should suffice to show the interest of these texts. One excerpt, attributed to Diodore of Tarsus (67-68), explains that both male and female are created in God's image (Gen 1:26). Why then, the author asks, does Paul say that the man is the image and glory of God, while woman is the glory of man (1 Cor 11:7)? He bases his response, as does Isidore of Pelusium (77-79), on a link between "image" and the power to rule over creation mentioned in the same verse. The woman has power over everything, but has the man as her head; and the man was not made subject to the woman. Paul's statement, therefore, was, according to Diodore, correct. It is important to note that the argument for the equality of male and female is purely theological, whereas the "proof" for the subordination taught by Paul rests on cultural and sociological factors which are confused with theology.

Editing catenae is a highly complicated task, and P. has produced an admirable edition of important texts in an eminently readable and useful form.

GERARD H. ETTLINGER, S.J.  
*Fordham University*

THE THOUGHT OF GREGORY THE GREAT. By G. R. Evans. New York: Cambridge University, 1986. Pp. xi + 164.

A scholar in Fitzwilliam College, Cambridge, Evans pursues her study of Gregory's extensive writings along two lines: a synthesis of his development of theological themes and his effort to strike a balance between the active and contemplative, temporal and spiritual spheres of Christian life. This latter concern, under the title of *consideratio*, serves as the central theme unifying discussion of 15 topics. Concise summaries of Gregory's life and the world of ideas which influenced his thought

provide an introduction to the analytical sections.

Though much of the work examines Gregory's perspectives on such questions as prophecy and miracles, speculative and moral theology, and the ministry of preaching, it was his exegetical method that actually shaped most of his theology. While allowing that his theology on particular topics is scattered throughout his various writings, E. nonetheless believes that "taken as a whole it forms a complete system" (55). That judgment may be somewhat overstated.

Especially noteworthy is E.'s careful examination of the interplay of the claims of the inner (spiritual) and outer (worldly experience) dimensions of *consideratio*. There is considerable insight into the personal tension which Gregory experienced in his role as bishop of Rome and which manifested itself in much of his homiletic and epistolary writing. Sections on his vision of monastic life, the episcopacy, and internal church divisions reveal the consistency of Gregory's fundamental understanding of Christian life. In her conclusion, E. describes his influences on theology and exegesis during the centuries after his death and prior to the rise of the universities.

At times the density of references and very compressed form of exposition (and the sometimes choppy, wooden sentences) may annoy the reader. But this thin volume provides keys to Gregory's thought which specialists will appreciate. An extensive bibliography of primary and secondary sources and an adequate index are included.

DONALD J. GRIMES, C.S.C.  
*King's College, Pa.*

ANSELMIAN EXPLORATIONS: ESSAYS IN PHILOSOPHICAL THEOLOGY. By Thomas V. Morris. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame, 1987. Pp. 264. \$28.95.

These essays written on different occasions explore the "Anselmian" notion of God, i.e. the concept of God as the "greatest possible, or absolutely perfect, being" (2). They are likewise Anselmian in that they presuppose Christian religious experience of God in the form of certain metaphysical intuitions, e.g. that God is omnipotent, omniscient, necessarily good and therefore unable to sin, etc. The task of these essays is to evaluate critically what is meant by these traditional attributes of God in the light of the key conception of God as an absolutely perfect being. As a result, M. spends much of his time in each of the essays dealing with philosophical objections to the attribute in question. In chapter 2, e.g., he deals with the objection that, if God is necessarily good, then God is not a free moral agent, since God must fulfil divine duties toward all creatures. His response is that God, strictly speaking, has no moral duties toward creatures but acts necessarily in accordance with those principles which would express moral duties for a human being. "We understand and anticipate God's activity by analogy with the behavior of a completely good moral agent" (37). Similarly, God's goodness acts as a constraint on divine omnipotence in that God cannot create a world in which evil ultimately triumphs over good. At the same time, argues M., one cannot prove from reason that God is necessarily good but only that, given divine omnipotence and omniscience, God cannot cease to be good once the choice for goodness is made. One's belief in God's necessary goodness, therefore, is based not on reason but on antecedent intuitions with respect to what properties are appropriate for an absolutely perfect being.

The subtlety of M.'s argumentation should by now be clear. Yet, while in admiration of the logical rigor of his thought, I still regret that he did not engage in a more extended debate with

Charles Hartshorne and other process-relational thinkers about the nature of the divine attributes. E.g., in the chapter entitled "God and the World: A Look at Process Theology," he first concedes to H. that "dipolar theism" offers a better understanding of divine immutability than classical theism, but then offers a substantive critique of process-relational metaphysics on two key points of Christian doctrine: God's independence of the created universe and the subjective immortality of the human soul. Since H., too, favors a basically Anselmian approach to the doctrine of God, further discussion of his differences with H. over the other divine attributes (e.g., omnipotence and omniscience) would have been intriguing.

JOSEPH A. BRACKEN, S.J.  
*Xavier University, Cinn.*

PASTOR AND LAITY IN THE THEOLOGY OF JEAN GERSON. By D. Catherine Brown. New York: Cambridge University, 1987. Pp. x + 358. \$54.50.

B. defines her task carefully: to add to the picture of late-medieval religion by presenting the teaching of Gerson on the laity and their pastors. Her two main sources for this are the vernacular sermons and tracts (aimed directly at the laity) and the Latin works for pastors. The picture that emerges is based on an extensive and detailed analysis of what these works reveal of G.'s beliefs and convictions: his theory of preaching, where it fitted in with earlier and contemporary preaching; what he saw as the role of the pastor, his place in the hierarchy (G. staunchly defended the status of the local bishops and pastors); the duties of pastors: education, preaching, and administration of the sacraments.

G.'s views come out on the major questions of his day and ours, e.g. where he stands in relation to nominalist theology, his ideas on God and man, sin, justification, and predestina-



tion. G. gave extensive coverage to sin, and so this receives a long chapter with copious details on the capital sins and how G. discussed these. His mystical views and writings are the subject of another chapter, since G. saw mystical experience as open to all. In the final major treatment the author looks at G.'s views on an often forgotten part of the audience for preachers—women and children—and so discusses his teachings on marriage and on the education and upbringing of children. All of this treatment is bolstered by extensive references to G.'s works and by comparison with comparable preachers and teachers of the late-medieval era. In all, a very exhaustive and informative study which provides a wealth of information on G., his world, how he saw it, and how he tried to reform it.

THOMAS E. MORRISSEY  
State University College  
Fredonia, N.Y.

WILLIAM BATHE, S.J., 1564–1614: A PIONEER IN LINGUISTIC STUDIES. By Séan P. Ó Mathúna. Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 1986. Pp. xiii + 222. \$34.

The many-talented Bathe was an Irish lawyer, student of Oxford, musician, and harpist who won the favor of Queen Elizabeth. He became a Jesuit at Tournai, Belgium, in 1596, and in 1611 became spiritual director of St. Patrick's College, Salamanca, Spain, for Irish students who expected to return to Ireland as diocesan priests. Many were late vocations. Hence Bathe conceived his desire to teach these adults how to get a working knowledge of Latin and Spanish within a few weeks or months, without subjecting them to the years-long curriculum of the schools. He hoped to achieve these same results for missionaries soon to depart to India or other new lands. However, the two methods hitherto used ill served his aims: (1) the "indirect" grammar-translation

method, dragged out for four to six years in the schools, gave accurate understanding of grammar but virtually no fluency, while (2) the "direct" method of simply speaking and reading a new language with some aid from a native brought fluency but poor accuracy. Bathe wanted reasonable fluency and accuracy simultaneously within a few weeks or months. To get this, he published his *Ianua linguarum* in 1611. It consisted of 1300 short sentences which furnished a basic working vocabulary of 5,300 words in Latin and Spanish. Other editions in various languages followed, including one in English, French, and Spanish in London in 1617. The success of his work is attested by the fact that, through modifications by other authors after Bathe's death in 1614, especially Comenius, some 30 editions of his work in many language combinations appeared by 1699. Ó Mathúna's seriously researched volume amply justifies Bathe's worthiness to be included in the Amsterdam Studies in the History of the Linguistic Sciences.

GEORGE E. GANSS, S.J.  
Institute of Jesuit Sources  
St. Louis

OEUVRES SPIRITUELLES 5: LE HÉRAUT. By Gertrude d'Helfta. Edited and translated by Jean-Marie Clément and Bernard de Vregille, S.J. *Sources chrétiennes* 331. Paris: Cerf, 1986. Pp. 345.

*The Divine Herald* is one of several legacies of medieval spirituality left us by the nuns of Helfta. Gertrude's *Exercises* and *Herald of Divine Love* have been edited and translated into French in SC; the present volume completes the edition of her works.

The depth of G.'s spirituality and the profundity of her theological insights can also be read as an expression of the vital intellectual and religious life of the Helfta monastery. Book 5 of the *Herald* is especially rich with in-

sights into the theology and practices of the community, because it is a collection of visions of the last hours of some of the sisters. In G.'s vision of the reception of the soul of Mechthild of Hackeborn, whose *Book of Special Grace* is also part of the Helfta legacy, we find the richest expression of the Eucharistic and nuptial theology of mystical union that characterizes the Helfta community. G.'s visions portray this theology with images of overwhelming splendor and delicacy. In these visions the efficacy of the monastic practices is also rendered visible and richly sensual in images of music, fragrant perfumes, and splendid light.

The *Herald* is commended to its readers by G.'s vision of Christ holding the book close to his heart and promising salvation for those who read it with humility. This book can also be recommended for the insights it offers into the religious life, spirituality, and theology of a vibrant 13th-century women's community.

KAREN JO TORJESEN  
*Claremont Graduate School, Calif.*

CORRESPONDANCE DE FÉNELON 6-7. Critical edition by Jean Orcibal. Geneva: Droz, 1987. Pp. 432, 288. Fr.s. 96, 72.

These volumes of the critical edition of the correspondence of François Salignac de la Mothe treat *Le procès romain des maximes des saints*: i.e., Aug. 3, 1697—May 31, 1698. People interested in this edition should be aware that the first five volumes begun in 1972 in Paris were edited by Klincksieck. Vol. 1 treated Fénelon's family and early years. Vols. 2 and 3 dealt with letters prior to his episcopacy (1670-95). Vols. 4 and 5 record the correspondence from his receiving the bishopric until his exile (1695-97). After these publications the editor changes. Droz has edited these two current volumes and will be responsible for the eighth and ninth.

The even volume numbers present the text of Fénelon's letters from the given period. The odd-numbered volumes present the commentary by Orcibal of the corresponding text. Collaborators in this important enterprise have been Jacques Le Brun and Irénée Noye, both specialists in spiritual literature of the French 17th century.

The present volumes include letters to those who were involved in F.'s defense of Mme. Guyon against Bossuet. The bishop of Meaux at the Conference of Issy (1694-96) had judged the quietist position of Fénelon as heretical. He wrote against this quietist teaching of Mme. Guyon and Fénelon. The *Explication des maximes des saints sur la vie intérieure* (1697) deals point for point with the argumentation of Bossuet. On the basis of F.'s theological positions taken in this publication, Bossuet, through Louis XIV and Pope Innocent XII, obtained the exile to Cambrai of his quietist adversary.

The letters in this volume are both from F. and pertinent ones to him. He writes to those more particularly involved in his process with Rome, e.g. l'abbé de Chanterac, Pope Innocent XII, the cardinals of the Holy Office, and many others. Orcibal has included letters from several individuals that enhance the understanding of the positions of those who were involved in the judging of F. both in France and in Rome. All are presented in chronological order; many are in Latin.

The commentaries are the result of years of erudition and scholarship. This is to be expected of that which is published in collaboration with the Centre National de Recherche Scientifique.

WILLIAM C. MARCEAU, C.S.B.  
*St. John Fisher College*  
*Rochester, N. Y.*

SERVANT OF THE WORD: SELECTED SERMONS OF FRIEDRICH SCHLEIERMACHER. Translated by Dawn DeVries.

Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987. Pp. x + 230. \$14.95.

As the helpful introductory essay points out, S. was acknowledged by his contemporaries to be a preacher of extraordinary ability. Even though the second section of his 31-volume "*Sämmtliche Werke*" consists of hundreds of pages of sermons, scholars have frequently ignored the suggestion of Karl Barth in his 1923/24 Göttingen lectures on S. (cf. *TS* 44 [1983] 512-13) that the sermons provide the most telling illustrations of his thought as a whole. This new translation of a very interesting selection of the sermons may provide impetus to rectify that situation.

The 15 sermons included in the volume are ranked under three rubrics: "The Redeemer," "The Church and the Word," and "The Christian Life," and span S.'s entire career from his time as a student for the ministry in 1789 to the final year of his life as professor at Berlin in 1833.

The title DeVries has chosen for her edition is drawn from S.'s famous 1829 sermon at the graveside of his son (the only entry previously translated) in which he describes his ministerial self-understanding in these terms. The title is provocative precisely because a formidable interpretive tendency has been to understand S. not as a servant but as a manipulator of the Word in his attempt to mediate between Christian tradition and modern culture. The sermons that appear here do much to shatter that stereotypical image and contribute to more recent efforts, especially by B. A. Gerrish, to understand S. within the ecclesiastical tradition he faithfully served. Particularly noteworthy in this respect are the sermons "Teaching the Reformation Faith to Our Children" (1817), "Evangelical Faith and the Law" (1830), and especially "The Effects of Scripture and the Immediate Effects of the Redeemer" (1826).

The text is rendered in very readable English that is faithful to the German original.

JOHN E. THIEL  
*Fairfield University, Conn.*

ELIZABETH SETON: *SELECTED WRITINGS*. Edited by Ellin Kelly and Annabelle Melville. New York: Paulist, 1987. Pp. vi + 377. \$16.95.

This work is a significant Roman Catholic contribution to the series *Sources of American Spirituality*. The introduction, written by Melville, provides a good description of the major lines of Seton's life, especially her spiritual trials, and describes the salient features of her spirituality. The bulk of the work, well edited by Kelly, divides Seton's writings into six major sections covering her youth as an Episcopalian in New York (1798-1803), her trip to Italy (1803-4), the time of spiritual conflict and conversion (1804-5), life in New York (1805-8), the founding of a school in Baltimore (1808-9), and her work as a religious foundress (1809-21). The work makes available for the first time a substantial number of selections from Seton's letters, journals, spiritual reflections, comments on the Scriptures, instructions to the community, and prayers and hymns. Although difficult to read because of Seton's personal, affective, and episodic style, the selections reveal the depth of her spirituality, its focus on confidence in God, the following of Christ, and the simultaneous mixing of joy and pain. The whole work argues for a critical edition of all of Seton's writings and an explanation, unfortunately lacking in this volume, of her spiritual life from a cultural and theological perspective. The volume also includes a helpful identifying list of significant individuals in Seton's life, a critical listing of textual emendations, selected bibliography, and indices of persons and themes. The editors are to be com-

mended for providing an invaluable beginning for future Seton scholars.

JOSEPH P. CHINNICI, O.F.M.  
*Franciscan School of Theology*  
*Berkeley*

IMMANENCE ET TRANSCENDENCE  
CHEZ TEILHARD DE CHARDIN. By Nicole Bonnet. Montreal/Paris: Bellarmin/Cerf, 1987. Pp. 324.

B. has achieved a masterful synthesis and exposition of T.'s world view, based on a careful reading of the primary sources. The approach is philosophical, although specifically religious aspects of T.'s thought, especially his Christology, are by no means ignored. B. convincingly shows how T. successfully integrates an emphasis on immanence (continuity) with a concern for transcendence (discontinuity) at each level of the cosmos: life, humanity, society, the person, point Omega, Christ, and action. By means of the notion of creative transformation, which is in turn intimately linked to his theory of creative union, T. is able to hold together in creative tension both similarities and differences, thus relating the varied realms of the real without invidious dichotomies. In this way T.'s analogical imagination manages to vanquish the inherited dualism with which he waged a lifelong struggle; he is also able to find a path between the blandishments of a naturalistic (or pantheistic) humanism on the one hand and a supranaturalistic version of Christianity on the other. Frequent references to the philosophical tradition and T.'s relationship to representative figures additionally enhance the value of B.'s work.

The background of this study is somewhat obscure. It appears to have originated in a doctoral dissertation, but that is never acknowledged. Bibliographical entries do not extend beyond 1978, and indeed most belong to the 60s and early 70s. The major Teil-

hardian studies from the English-speaking world are virtually ignored. No indices are provided. The author herself holds a recent doctorate from the University of Toulouse and teaches philosophy somewhere in the French school system (no particulars are provided).

The ground covered here is familiar enough by now. What is original and rewarding is the unique interpretive perspective: T.'s passionate need to discover the unity of a thoroughly relational universe in terms of both anticipated continuities (immanence) and surprising novelty (transcendence).

DONALD P. GRAY  
*Manhattan College, N.Y.*

DEADLY SINS AND SAVING VIRTUES.  
By Donald Capps. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987. Pp. vi + 162.

With this short work, C. makes a worthwhile contribution to the ongoing revival of contemporary thinking about virtues and vices. The significance of the work lies in its attempt to chart virtues and vices in sequence according to the eight stages of the life cycle posited by Erik Erikson. At each stage of the life cycle there is a salient vice and virtue: "even as we are disposed toward certain sins at given stages of the life cycle, we are also disposed toward certain virtues" (3).

The book is divided into three parts. The first discusses the traditional seven deadly sins and the traditional sin of melancholy, and relates each of these in detail to the dynamics of one of the stages of the life cycle. This is the most interesting part of the work. The second part discusses the specific virtues which Erikson himself links to each of the stages of the life cycle. These are amplified a bit and the conflict with the corresponding vice is noted and illustrated through the life of a significant biblical figure. The final part, perhaps the least satisfying, seeks

to show how the Bible may serve "as a major resource for assisting individuals and groups in the nurturing of a virtuous orientation to life" (5). In particular, the Beatitudes and the pilgrimage motif can bring a significant element of active faith to help sustain and develop the virtues.

C.'s work strikes one more as a profound meditation than a vigorous proof of his contentions. He points to interesting correlations of life stages, virtues, vices, and beatitudes. Significant questions arise, however, in many areas. E.g., why use Erikson's delineation of the virtues? Is Erikson's framework completely valid? What is the value of the free human act here? Catholic readers will also note a too-ready dismissal of classical reflection on the virtues.

Overall C. offers a very helpful, if initial, reflection on the virtues and vices of the life cycle.

JOHN W. CROSSIN, O.S.F.S.  
*De Sales School of Theology*  
Washington, D.C.

**SACRAMENTAL ETHICS: PASCHAL IDENTITY AND THE CHRISTIAN LIFE.** By Timothy F. Sedgwick. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987. Pp. 118.

Writing from the Anglican tradition, S. argues that the fundamentally paschal character of worship provides a normative vision which both informs and forms the relationships and actions proper to a Christian ethic. Rejecting both intellectualist and voluntarist ethics, he views the Christian moral life neither as a determination of specific rules of conduct nor as a matter of intuitively responding to the will of God. Describing the moral life as a matter of imagination and interpretation, he identifies worship as a mythic and parabolic language which both mediates the paschal event and transforms the worshipers into a paschal community.

In the second half of the book, S. concretely applies this ethic of worship to particular relations: the interpersonal relations of human sexuality, the social sphere of friendship and the obligation to broader service, and the political domain of the use of force.

By grounding his ethics in the root metaphor of Christian faith, the paschal mystery, S. offers an important contribution to the ongoing discussion of the distinctiveness of Christian ethics at the same time that he integrates the sacramental and moral life. The suggestion that the problem of a lack of moral vision in the Church reflects the deeper problem of the lack of a common way of life at the heart of the Christian community indicates that the renewal of ethics is dependent upon the renewal of the faith identity of the community.

Although S.'s thesis is promising, his exposition invites discussion. He does not elaborate on the role of traditional prescriptive moral norms in a primarily descriptive ethic, and the correlation between Ricoeur's analysis of moral evil and the history of penance remains unconvincing. His excellent treatment of eros and agape, however, offers an interesting paradigm for the tension between the particular and the universal demands of ethics.

SUSAN WOOD, S.C.L.  
*Saint Mary College, Kan.*

**UNBORN PERSONS: POPE JOHN PAUL II AND THE ABORTION DEBATE.** By James J. McCartney. New York: Peter Lang, 1987. Pp. ix + 166. \$28.95.

Before his election to the episcopacy and later to the papacy, Karol Wojtyła (Pope John Paul II) was professor of philosophy and chairman of the philosophy department at Poland's Catholic University of Lublin. While Wojtyła devoted much attention to explicating the concept of person, he never systematically applied his understanding of

person to the question of the ontological status of the fetus and abortion. Hence M.'s study: to examine the philosophical, theological, and personal influences that have shaped Wojtyla's understanding of person, and to bring that understanding into dialogue with modern philosophical and theological debates regarding the ontological status of human embryological and fetal life.

According to M., Wojtyla sees the human person as always the subject of both actions and existence, and human life as the increasingly dynamic realization of both that which the person is and that which the person is capable of becoming. For Wojtyla, to insist on one indicator of personhood (e.g., reflective consciousness) is inadequate, not because it is unimportant but because it is incomplete. Consciousness does not establish personhood, but rather mirrors or illuminates the subject who is always more than consciousness can grasp. M. traces Wojtyla's emphasis on such intuitive and affective approaches to truth to the influence of Max Scheler's phenomenology of experience, St. John of the Cross's "love mysticism," and Wojtyla's own deeply held religious faith.

Assuming that a biologically individuated organism is the material prerequisite for a human subject, it seems logical that Wojtyla's understanding of person might not apply from the moment of fertilization, but only after several weeks into a pregnancy, when cellular segmentation has been accomplished. Yet, M. argues, this would not much change the traditional Catholic teaching on abortion, since that teaching is grounded in the impossibility of proving that the conceptus is not a person, in the possibility that it could be an act of murder, and in the conviction that abortion is a deliberate interference in the reproductive process (85). This careful study helps to put

into broader perspective the thinking of the present pope and the abortion debate itself.

JOSEPH A. LA BARGE  
*Bucknell University, Pa.*

NO LADDER TO THE SKY: EDUCATION AND MORALITY. By Gabriel Moran. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. 197. \$17.95.

Ladders help us reach things out of reach. Ladders are associated with success and achievement and with reaching beyond oneself. But M. believes that ladders which encourage moral striving do not help moral education. In *No Ladder to the Sky*, he locates the center of morality in the dignity and goodness of being, not in moral achievements. He counters the striving of goal-and-justice-centered moralities with his understanding of goodness and education. According to M., education is a continuous effort to reshape life's forms with meaning. Educational morality discloses goodness at the center of being.

Taking a historical approach, M. lays a philosophical foundation for his concepts of a morality of goodness and educational morality. Using three criteria to assess moral dilemmas, he asserts that a morality of goodness is responsible, is transnatural, and reconciles the private/public domains of life. He applies the criteria to contemporary problems of ordering life, death, and sexuality. Here he leads us to recognize the narrowness of ladder-climbing moralities based on an ethic of good and an ethic of rights. He also critiques three educational systems of society: preaching, therapy, and classroom instruction.

Educators and moralists will find these theories imaginative and insightful. M. writes skillfully and is comprehensive, instructive, and convincing in his presentation. The private/public criterion most clearly demonstrates

M.'s alternative for assessing moral problems. However, the transnatural criterion is vague in elucidating his concept of goodness. In the concept of a morality of goodness, he respects the dignity of all creation and all being, but perhaps overlooks our sin-tainted human condition.

In *No Ladder to the Sky*, M. removes the ladder of moral education and offers a morality of goodness and educational morality to foster growth in moral integrity.

ELIZABETH WILLEMS, S.S.N.D.  
*Notre Dame Seminary, New Orleans*

**THE EMMAUS REPORT.** By the Anglican Consultative Council. London: Church House, 1987. Pp. 155. \$4.95.

**MANY GIFTS, ONE SPIRIT.** By the Anglican Consultative Council. London: Church House, 1987. Pp. 167. \$4.50.

Every decade the bishops of the 23 autonomous churches of the Anglican Communion come together for the Lambeth Conference. When this global college convenes in 1988, the ecumenical commitments and internal tensions will have theological and pastoral repercussions for the Christian community world-wide. While the Conference does not speak with authority for the member churches of the Communion, it is the only vehicle for pronouncing the mind of the Communion, e.g. on such issues as those raised in the Anglican-Roman Catholic *Final Report*, by the ordination of women to the priesthood and episcopate, or in *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry* of the World Council of Churches. These two small volumes are preparatory material for the Conference.

*The Emmaus Report* is a synthesis of Anglican responses to and reports on dialogues developing during the last decade and before. The book provides an outline of Anglican ecumenical commitments and the general developments in the quest for visible unity.

The understanding of how "full communion" may be understood is of particular importance, since Anglicans reach out for union with Orthodox, Roman Catholics, and Lutherans, but are already participants in union negotiations and united churches around the globe. The diversity and coherence of Anglican responses to ARCIC and BEM is illuminating and will lead other communions, such as the Orthodox and Roman Catholic Churches, to desire an analysis of the diverse responses that have developed in their own churches relative to ecumenical documents of this sort.

The second volume is the record of the Anglican Consultative Council, which meets between Conferences and provides the staff for Anglican communication and common action around the globe. The ecumenical recommendations build on *The Emmaus Report* and point to the possible directions one can expect at Lambeth. Of particular interest in the wider ecumenical discussion is the report on the ordination of women to the priesthood and episcopate, and unity and diversity within the Anglican Communion. The dispersed character of Anglican authority and means by which unity is maintained during times when issues are deeply debated is quite instructive ecclesologically and systematically, as well as for ecumenical purposes. The unity of the Anglican Communion, like the unity of so many world-wide churches, is under severe pressure due not only to the normal cultural diversity of international bodies, but also to the theological seriousness which is brought to the ecumenical movement. For this reason, these carefully-worked-out reports constitute important resources.

JEFFREY GROS, F.S.C.  
*National Council of Churches, N. Y.*

RISKING CHRIST FOR CHRIST'S  
SAKE: TOWARDS AN ECUMENICAL

**THEOLOGY OF PLURALISM.** By M. M. Thomas. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1987. Pp. vii + 122 \$8.95.

The product of T.'s many years of ecumenical activity and theology, this brief, rich reflection focuses on the interconnection between Christianity's interdenominational ecumenism and the "wider" ecumenism of dialogue with non-Christians. After an initial assessment of contemporary pluralism, T. affirms that a firm confession of the ultimacy of Christ challenges us to put "that faith alongside other faiths, and alongside rationality and other human values which we share with them . . . in this process we, as Christians, risk Christ for Christ's sake" (7). Then in two central chapters he discusses the writings of Raimundo Panikkar and T.'s colleague Paul Devanandan (who died in 1962) as representing, respectively, Indian Roman Catholic and Protestant theologies of interreligious dialogue. Both are situated in the context of their churches' modern discussions of religions; responses to their work from within and outside their churches are noted. The question of the relation of the natural and supernatural—regarding issues such as nature/grace, religion/revelation, secular/sacred, ontology/history, religions/Christ, etc.—emerges as fundamental to any theology of dialogue. In T.'s view, Panikkar's "unknown Christ" favors the ontological, universalizing side of the tension, while Devanandan's (and T.'s own) "acknowledged Christ" favors the historical, particularizing side. Finally, T. suggests that Eastern Orthodox perspectives on Christology and ecclesiology may help us to advance beyond the limits of the Catholic-Protestant positions.

This ecumenical work stimulates us to see the dialogue of religions as shedding light on Christian ecumenical issues and as an aid toward Christian unity. Needed to complement it, however, is an equally sensitive and sophis-

ticated treatment of various non-Christian traditions, their theologies of nature/supernature, their "ecumenical" attitudes, and the meaning of these differentiations for that fuller dialogue in which there are no generic "non-Christians" either.

FRANCIS X. CLOONEY, S.J.  
*Boston College*

**UNCIVIL RELIGION: INTERRELIGIOUS HOSTILITY IN AMERICA.** Edited by Robert N. Bellah and Frederick E. Greenspahn. New York: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. x + 235. \$17.95.

This is a collection of ten essays, with a balanced introduction by G. and a somewhat worried conclusion by B., for whom our greater concern today is not from the radical religious right but from what he sees as the threatening triumph of "loosely bounded culture," disastrous both to moral norms and to the religious communities that carry them. Jonathan Sarna and John Murray Cuddihy discuss Jewish-Christian tensions. S.'s focus is on "love used as a conversionist tool"; he is concerned with Jewish-Protestant relationships. C. offers a sharply worded critique of "Jewish secular theodicy" and its assumed moral superiority, rooted in the secularization of the doctrine of Jewish election. Treating Protestant-Catholic tensions, Barbara Welter is dry, detached, and irritating as she studies Maria Monk in 1836 and Paul Blanshard in 1949 as "expressions of serious concern on the part of perfectly rational Americans."

Jay Dolan tends to read 1960s attitudes back into history, and there is the lingering suggestion that Catholics really brought on themselves the unpleasantnesses of the immigrant era. Mark Noll's analysis of the past quarter century is free of the overtones that cloud the two previous essays. His concerns are historical conscienceness and accommodation to American ways and their effect on the Catholic and



Protestant traditions in America. He points rightly to the severe intraconfessional divergences that have made for strange new alliances based more on political or economic convergence than on religion. David O'Brien has a long essay on "Catholic Contentiousness" that leaves little, if any, ground to a middle that still thinks it can make a difference within the system. Other essays deal with Orthodox Jews (Samuel C. Heilman), creationists and evolutionists (George M. Marsden), groups historically marginalized as "cults," and in particular the Latter Day Saints (Lawrence Foster), and the Unification Church, treated sociologically by Anson Shupe. All in all, the volume makes for an interesting potpourri.

JAMES HENNESEY, S.J.  
*Canisius College, Buffalo*

AN INTRODUCTION TO THE CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ASIA. By Francis X. Clark, S.J. *Cardinal Bea Studies* 9. Manila: Bea Institute, 1987. Pp. xii + 150. \$6.

No book in English presents an overall view of the Catholic Church in modern Asia. C. purports to satisfy this absence. This book tries to say too much in too short a space. In so doing, C. reinforces the stereotype that all Asians really are the same. Leaving little for analysis and argument, he relies primarily on anecdotes and quotations. There is nothing on mainland China, a serious flaw.

C. asserts, gratuitously I think, that Christianity potentially has always been an Asian religion and is now, in

fact, indigenously Asian. If Christianity is now an Asian religion, then we need no further discussion about inculturation. Before the imposition of the 18th-century Chinese Rites proscriptions, Christianity might have become an Asian religion. Even after the abrogation of the Rites decrees in 1939, Vatican II, and the FABC statements, one can only modestly assert that Christianity is barely beginning to become a culturally indigenous Asian religion. C. argues, correctly I think, that the Catholic Church in Asia, like its sister local churches throughout the world, must shift its focus from intramural ecclesial concerns toward ministry outward, especially toward the poor and the deprived; however, his argument hobbles along because of scanty evidence and reasons, as well as homiletic overindulgence.

C. believes that Asia can give the Church its spirituality, prayer, religions, and family values, while the Church can give Asian human existence a fuller meaning because of Jesus Christ. The Church also offers a more developed social agenda concerning human rights, a greater stress on the value of the individual and the role of women, and the unity of all human beings regardless of cultural differences. His most substantive theological discussion comes in the first appendix, where he explores the meaning of the word "mission," suggesting that it, like "the People of God," be replaced by "work" and "coworkers."

PETER FLEMING, S.J.  
*Sogang Univ., Seoul, Korea*

## BOOKS RECEIVED

### SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

Arator's *On the Acts of the Apostles*. Ed. R. Schrader. Atlanta: Scholars, 1987. Pp. 104. \$15.95.

Hanson, P. *The People Called*. S.F.:

Harper & Row, 1987 [1986]. Pp. 564. \$18.95.

Heil, J. *Paul's Letter to the Romans: A Reader-Response Commentary*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 195. \$9.95.

Hesse, B. *Lectura super Evangelium*

# Theological Studies

A Quarterly Journal  
Founded 1940

*Editor in Chief*

WALTER J. BURGHARDT, S.J.

*Managing Editor and Book Review Editor*

JOHN R. KEATING, S.J.

*Editorial Consultants*

Raymond E. Brown, S.S.  
Union Theological Seminary, N.Y.C.

Gerard H. Ettliger, S.J.  
Fordham University

Monika Hellwig  
Georgetown University

Edward J. Kilmartin, S.J.  
Boston College

William W. Meissner, S.J.  
Harvard University Medical School

Michael J. Buckley, S.J.  
Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley

Thomas J. Green  
Catholic University of America

John Jay Hughes  
Archdiocese of St. Louis

Joseph T. Lienhard, S.J.  
Marquette University

John W. O'Malley, S.J.  
Weston School of Theology

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES is published in March, June,  
September, and December. Manuscripts should be sent to  
the Editor, book reviews to the Book Review Editor:

Theological Studies  
Georgetown University  
37th & O St. N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20057

# Theological Studies

JUNE 1988  
VOL. 49, NO. 2

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.  
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus  
in the United States*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- Priesthood, Ministry, and Religious Life: Some Historical and Historiographical Considerations**  
*John W. O'Malley, S.J.* ..... 223
- The *Unigenitus* of Clement XI: A Fresh Look at the Issues**  
*Jacques M. Gres-Gayer* ..... 259
- Alive to the Glory of God: A Key Insight in St. Irenaeus**  
*Mary Ann Donovan, S.C.* ..... 283

### CURRENT THEOLOGY

- Hans Urs von Balthasar's Theology of Aesthetic Form**  
*Louis Dupré* ..... 299

### NOTE

- Protection and Promotion of the Right to Food: An Ethical Reflection**  
*William J. Byron, S.J.* ..... 319

### BOOK REVIEWS

- BARKER, M.: The Older Testament** ..... 335
- LÉON-DUFOUR, X.: Sharing the Eucharistic Bread** ..... 336
- THEISSEN, G.: Psychological Aspects of Pauline Theology** ..... 337
- ODEN, R.: The Bible without Theology** ..... 339
- Patrology 4: The Golden Age of Latin Patristic Literature (ed. A. Di Berardino)** ... 340
- VOGEL, C.: Medieval Liturgy** ..... 342
- POWER, D.: The Sacrifice We Offer** ..... 343
- CAUTHEN, K.: Systematic Theology** ..... 345
- ODEN, T.: The Living God: Systematic Theology 1** ..... 345
- RATZINGER, J.: Principles of Catholic Theology** ..... 347

TILLARD, J.: Eglise d'églises . . . . .	349
DIONNE, J.: The Papacy and the Church . . . . .	351
KASPER, W.: Theologie und Kirche . . . . .	353
BALTHASAR, H. VON: Theologik 1-2 . . . . .	355
ROHNHEIMER, M.: Natur als Grundlage der Moral . . . . .	358
HANSON, E.: The Catholic Church in World Politics . . . . .	359
MCBRIEN, R.: Caesar's Coin . . . . .	362
The Catholic Challenge to the American Economy (ed. T. Gannon) . . . . .	363
The Catholic Bishops and the Economy (ed. D. Rasmussen et al.) . . . . .	363
The Deeper Meaning of Economic Life (ed. R. Douglass) . . . . .	363
Gods, Goods, and the Common Good (ed. C. Lutz) . . . . .	364
VAN KAMM, A.: Formation of the Human Heart . . . . .	367
ROLSTON, H.: Science and Religion . . . . .	368
PEACOCKE, A.: God and the New Biology . . . . .	370
AUGROS, R., et al.: The New Biology . . . . .	372
DILLENBERGER, J.: A Theology of Artistic Sensibilities . . . . .	373
FITZPATRICK, J.: One Church, Many Cultures . . . . .	375

SHORTER NOTICES . . . . . 377

FRIEDMAN, R.: Who Wrote the Bible? HOPPE, L.: Being Poor MATERA, F.: What Are They Saying about Mark? MATERA, F.: Passion Narratives and Gospel Theologies JOHNSON, S.: Paul the Apostle and His Cities GOOCHE, P.: Partial Knowledge CLARK, E.: Ascetic Piety and Women's Faith MEEHAN, D. (tr.): Saint Gregory of Nazianzus, Three Poems PETTIT, F. (ed.): Catenae Graecae in Genesim et in Exodum 2 EVANS, G.: The Thought of Gregory the Great MORRIS, T.: Anselmian Explorations BROWN, D.: Pastor and Laity in the Theology of Jean Gerson Ó MATHÚNA, S.: William Bathe, S.J., 1564-1614 D'HELFTA, G.: Oeuvres spirituelles 5: Le héraut ORCIBAL, J. (ed.): Correspondence de Fénelon 6-7 DEVRIES, D. (tr.): Servant of the Word KELLY, E., et al. (ed.): Elizabeth Seton: Selected Writings BONNET, N.: Immanence et transcendance chez Teilhard de Chardin CAPPS, D.: Deadly Sins and Saving Virtues SEDGWICK, T.: Sacramental Ethics MCCARTNEY, J.: Unborn Persons MORAN, G.: No Ladder to the Sky ANGLICAN CONSULTATIVE COUNCIL: The Emmaus Report; Many Gifts, One Spirit THOMAS, M.: Risking Christ for Christ's Sake BELLAH, R., et al. (ed.): Uncivil Religion CLARK, F.: An Introduction to the Catholic Church of Asia	
--	--

BOOKS RECEIVED . . . . . 392

**THEOLOGICAL STUDIES** is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, MD. 21202. Second class postage paid at Baltimore, Md., and at additional mailing offices. **POSTMASTER**, please send address changes to **THEOLOGICAL STUDIES**, 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202.

**YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION:** U.S. individual: \$17; U.S. institutional: \$22; all foreign, including Canada: \$22 U.S. currency. Single copies \$4.50.

**RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS** should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 64002, Baltimore, Md. 21264.

**CHANGES OF ADDRESS** and business correspondence should be sent to Theological Studies, Business Office, 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202.

**MANUSCRIPTS** (normally the ribbon copy or a computer printout of letter-perfect quality and a legible duplicate), together with return postage, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., 20057. Authors should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

**BOOKS FOR REVIEW** should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057.

**BACK ISSUES** are available from the office in Washington, D.C.

## *Presenting This Issue*

Our June 1988 issue stresses history and historical theology in its major articles: on priesthood, on Jansenism, on Irenaeus. In the same vein, the bulletin on Balthasar reveals the Swiss theologian's extraordinary grasp of the past. Without disowning the uses of history, a short ethical reflection on the right to food challenges more directly our contemporary conscience.

**Priesthood, Ministry, and Religious Life: Some Historical and Historiographical Reflections** insists that the historiographical traditions which have determined how we understand the relationships between those three Catholic realities need to be reviewed and revised, for they have failed to take into account the *experience* of the Church; evidence of this problem is graphically supplied by the pertinent decrees of Vatican II. JOHN W. O'MALLEY, S.J., Ph.D. in history from Harvard, is professor of church history at Weston School of Theology, Cambridge, Mass. The area of his special competence is the history of religious culture: the Italian Renaissance, 16th-century church reform, the early Jesuits, Erasmus, the history of preaching. He has recently edited *Catholicism in Early Modern History: A Guide to Research* (St. Louis: Center for Reformation Research, 1988), is editing the *spiritualia* volumes in the series *Collected Works of Erasmus* (Univ. of Toronto), and is preparing a book on the early Jesuits with a grant from the American Council of Learned Societies.

**The *Unigenitus* of Clement XI: A Fresh Look at the Issues** is a thematic reflection on Jansenism, specifically on the meaning of the crisis stimulated by the papal bull. Based on significant recent scholarship, principally the works of L. Ceyssens, J. A. G. Tans, and B. Neveu, the article stresses the high importance of the theological issues and assesses their content. JACQUES GRES-GAYER, with a doctorate in theology from the Institut Catholique de Paris, is assistant professor of early-modern and modern church history at the Catholic University of America, with particular interest in the interrelationship between theology, culture, and politics in early-modern France. His article "Jansenism" appears in the 1988 Supplement to the *New Catholic Encyclopedia*. He is readying a study of the theological pronouncements of the faculty of theology of the University of Paris (1610–1720) in the context of social and political history.

**Alive to the Glory of God** argues from Irenaeus, *Adv. haer.* 4, 20, that his understanding of the human person is subordinate to his understanding of God, who acts consistently to bring us to the life-giving vision. The divine image in our flesh and the similitude in our liberty of action, when graced by the gift of the Spirit, provide the form and

dynamism which will lead to fulness of life in the direct vision of God. MARY ANN DONOVAN, S.C., Ph.D. in historical theology from St. Michael's College at the University of Toronto, is associate professor of historical theology at the Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley/Graduate Theological Union. Her academic specialties are early Christianity, spirituality (religious life in particular), and women's studies. Her article "Insights on History: Irenaeus" appeared in the *Toronto Journal of Theology* 2 (1986) 79-93. Two books are in preparation—one on Irenaeus, the other on women's religious life.

**Hans Urs von Balthasar's Theology of Aesthetic Form**, a critical evaluation of the three translated parts of his seven-volume *Herrlichkeit*, investigates the theological foundation of a Christian aesthetics, its problems, and its historical achievements in literature as well as in theology. The author identifies, among the more serious obstacles raised by modern theology, the separation between nature and grace, and the severance of faith from experience; he criticizes Balthasar's ambivalent attitude toward non-Christian religions, modern exegesis, and mystical movements. LOUIS DUPRÉ, with a doctorate in philosophy from Louvain, is the T. Laurason Riggs Professor in the Philosophy of Religion at Yale. He has done significant research in the intellectual history of the 18th and 19th centuries, especially on Hegel, Marx, and Kierkegaard, on each of whom he has written a monograph.

**Protection and Promotion of the Right to Food: An Ethical Reflection**, noting that human rights take various forms and find expression in several orders of human existence (social, civil, religious, economic, political), argues that the right to food is a human right in the economic order. Theological reflection clarifies the meaning of any human right in any order; it can illuminate the economic right to food and stimulate moral responses in several orders, all focused on the protection and promotion of human dignity—the central theme of Catholic social teaching. WILLIAM J. BYRON, S.J., Ph.D. in economics from the University of Maryland, is president of the Catholic University of America. Areas of his special competence include economic development, social ethics, and educational policy. Recent articles: "Christian Values and Critical Issues," *Journal of Contemporary Health Law and Policy* 3 (spring 1987) 11-21; "Twin Towers: A Philosophy and Theology of Business" (forthcoming in *Journal of Business Ethics*). A book in progress: *Quadrangle Considerations: Essays on Higher Education*.

Twenty-seven recent books are given critical reviews; 27 more are evaluated somewhat more briefly.

Walter J. Burghardt, S.J.  
Editor

- Matthaei (cap. xiv-xvii)*. Warsaw: Akademia Teologii Katolickiej, 1987. Pp. 354.
- Juel, D. *Messianic Exegesis*. Phila.: Fortress, 1988. Pp. 193.
- Lievstad, R. *Jesus in His Own Perspective*. Tr. D. Aune. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1987. Pp. 192.
- Loisy, A. *The Gospel and the Church*. Ed. R. Hoffmann. Buffalo, N.Y.: Prometheus, 1988. Pp. 268. \$20.95.
- Luke, K. *Companion to the Bible 1: Bible in General & Old Testament*. Bangalore: Theological Publications in India, 1987. Pp. 228. \$5.
- MacRae, G., S.J. *Studies in the New Testament and Gnosticism*. Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1987. Pp. 277. \$12.95.
- Smith, M. *Psalms: The Divine Journey*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 85. \$4.95.
- Strandenaes, T. *Principles of Chinese Bible Translation as Exemplified by Mt 5:1-12 and Col 1*. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiskell, 1987. Pp. 166. Sw. kr. 162.
- Sweetland, D. *Our Journey with Jesus: Discipleship according to Mark*. Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1987. Pp. 188. \$7.95.
- Wenham, G. *Genesis 1-15*. Word: Waco, 1987. Pp. liii + 153.
- Zevini, G. *Vangelo secondo Giovanni 2*. Rome: Città Nuova, 1987. Pp. 331. L. 20,000.
- of America, 1987. Pp. 239. \$26.50; \$14.25.
- Gelpi, D. *Grace as Transmuted Experience and Social Process, and Other Essays in North American Theology*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1988. Pp. 210. \$26.25; \$12.75.
- Gilson, E. E. *Thomist Realism and the Critique of Knowledge*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1986. Pp. 215. \$12.95.
- Örsy, L. *The Church: Learning and Teaching*. Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1987. Pp. 172. \$14.95.
- Ray, S. *The Modern Soul: Michael Foucault and the Theological Discourse of Gordon Kaufman and David Tracy*. Phila.: Fortress, 1987. Pp. 206.
- Reumann, J. *Ministries Examined*. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1987. Pp. 271.
- Sabra, G. *Thomas Aquinas' Vision of the Church*. Mainz: Grünewald, 1987. Pp. 208. DM 36.
- St. Thomas Aquinas: Faith, Reason and Theology: Questions i-iv of His Commentary on the De Trinitate of Boethius*. Tr. A. Maurer. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1987. Pp. xxxviii + 127. \$6.50.
- Segundo, J., S.J. *Theology and the Church: A Response to Cardinal Ratzinger and a Warning to the Whole Church*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. 192. \$8.95.
- Snook, L. E. *The Anonymous Christ: Jesus as Savior in Modern Theology*. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1986. Pp. 191.
- Sullivan, J. *Explorations in Christology: The Impact of Process/Relational Thought*. N.Y.: Lang, 1987. Pp. 154. \$28.
- Valadier, P., S.J. *L'Eglise en procès: Catholicisme et société moderne*. Paris: Calmann-Lévy, 1987. Pp. 241. Fr. 120.

## SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY

- Cadorette, C. *From the Heart of the People: The Theology of Gustavo Gutierrez*. Oak Park, Ill.: Meyer-Stone, 1988. Pp. 140. \$14.95.
- Chantraine, G., S.J. *Les laïcs, chrétiens dans le monde*. Paris: Fayard, 1987. Pp. 316. Fr. 85.
- Churches Respond to BEM: Official Responses to the "Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry" Text 4*. Ed. M. Thurian. Geneva: WCC, 1987. Pp. 257. \$17.50.
- D'Costa, G. *John Hick's Theology of Religion*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press

## HISTORICAL

- Athappilly, S. *Glaube und Welt: Eine Studie über das Wohl-Heil-Verhältnis bei Karl Rahner*. Graz: Tech-

- nische Universität, 1987. Pp. 318. ö.S. 192.50.
- Las apariciones marianas en la vida de la Iglesia.* Salamanca: Sociedad Mariológica Española, 1987. Pp. 403.
- Cohen, C. *God's Caress: The Psychology of Puritan Religious Experience.* Oxford: Oxford Univ., 1986. Pp. 310. \$29.95.
- Collon, D. *First Impressions: Cylinder Seals in the Ancient Near East.* Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1988. Pp. 208. \$29.95.
- Descy, S. *Introduction à l'histoire et l'éclésiologie de l'église melkite.* Beirut: Editions St. Paul, 1986. Pp. 126.
- Dickens, A., and J. Tonkin. *The Reformation in Historical Thought.* Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard, 1986. Pp. 443. \$33.50.
- The Early Kabbalah.* Tr. R. Kiener. N.Y.: Paulist, 1986. Pp. 205. \$10.95.
- The Essential Reinhold Niebuhr: Selected Essays and Addresses.* Ed. R. M. Brown. New Haven: Yale, 1986. Pp. xxiv + 264. \$19.95.
- Fragoso, A. *Face of a Church: A Nascent Church of the People in Crateús, Brazil.* Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1987. Pp. 164.
- The Greek Magical Papyri in Translation.* Ed. H. D. Betz. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1986. Pp. liii + 339. \$39.95.
- Harris, R. C. S. *Lewis: The Man and His God.* Wilton, Ct.: Morehouse-Barlow, 1987. Pp. 92. \$5.95.
- The Life of Saint Nikon.* Ed. & tr. D. Sullivan. Brookline, Mass.: Hellenic College, 1987. Pp. 314. \$23.95; \$16.95.
- Kellner, M. *Dogma in Medieval Jewish Thought: From Maimonides to Abravanel.* N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1987. Pp. 310. \$45.
- Manis, A. *Southern Civil Religions in Conflict: Black and White Baptists and Civil Rights, 1947-1957.* Athens: Univ. of Georgia, 1987. Pp. 160. \$22.
- Neuhaus, R. *The Catholic Moment: The Paradox of the Church in the Post-modern World.* S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. 292. \$19.95.
- Rausch, D., and C. Voss. *Protestantism—Its Modern Meaning.* Phila.: Fortress, 1987. Pp. 211.
- St. Cyril of Alexandria: Letters 51-110.* Tr. J. McEnerney. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America, 1987. Pp. 204.
- St. Gregory of Nyssa. Commentary on the Song of Songs.* Tr. C. McCambley, O.C.S.O. Brookline, Mass.: Hellenic College, 1987. Pp. 295. \$22.95; \$14.95.
- Oberman, H. *Die Wirkung der Reformation.* Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 1987. Pp. 57. DM 12.80.
- Van Beeck, F., S.J. *Catholic Identity after Vatican II: Three Types of Faith in the One Church.* Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1986. Pp. 113.
- Visser 't Hooft, W. *Memoirs.* Geneva: WCC, 1987 [1973]. Pp. 379. \$19.90.
- Weltin, E. *Athens and Jerusalem: An Interpretative Essay on Christianity and Classical Culture.* Atlanta: Scholars, 1987. Pp. 257. \$21.95; \$16.95.
- Wingenbach, G. *Broken, Yet Never Sundered: Orthodox Witness and the Ecumenical Movement.* Brookline, Mass.: Holy Cross Orthodox, 1987. Pp. 184. \$12.95.
- Woznicki, A. *The Dignity of Man as a Person: Essays on the Christian Humanism of John Paul II.* S.F.: Society of Christ, 1987. Pp. 170. \$4.95.

#### MORAL, LAW, LITURGY

- A Catholic Bill of Rights.* Ed. L. Swidler and H. O'Brien. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1988. Pp. 187. \$8.95.
- Daily Prayer: The Worship of God.* Prepared by the Office of Worship for the Presbyterian Church (USA). Phila.: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 435. \$12.95.
- Dwyer, J. *Human Sexuality: A Christian View.* Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1987. Pp. 161. \$8.95.
- Frederick, J. *The Future of Liturgical*



- Reform.* Wilton, Ct.: Morehouse-Barlow, 1987. Pp. 82. \$7.95.
- Freppert, L., O.F.M. *The Basis of Morality according to William Ockham.* Chicago: Franciscan Herald, 1988. Pp. 191. \$8.95.
- Harvey, J., O.S.F.S. *The Homosexual Person: New Thinking in Pastoral Care.* S.F.: Ignatius, 1987. Pp. 255. \$13.95.
- Hoose, B. *Proportionalism: The American Debate and Its European Roots.* Washington, D.C.: Georgetown Univ., 1987. Pp. 159. \$22.95; \$10.95.
- Miranda, D., S.V.D. *Pagkamakatao: Reflections on the Theological Virtues in the Philippine Context.* Manila: Divine Word, 1987. Pp. 102.
- Neville, R. *The Puritan Smile: A Look toward Moral Reflection.* Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1987. Pp. 248. \$44.50; \$14.95.
- Noonan, J., Jr. *Bribes.* Berkeley: Univ. of California, 1988 [1984]. Pp. 839. \$14.95.
- Readings in Moral Theology 5: Official Catholic Social Teaching.* Ed. C. Curran and R. McCormick, S.J. N.Y.: Paulist, 1986. Pp. 459. \$9.95.
- Rendtorff, T. *Ethics 1: Basic Elements and Methodology in an Ethical Theology.* Tr. C. Crim. Phila.: Fortress, 1986. Pp. 193. \$19.95.
- Talley, T. *The Origins of the Liturgical Year.* N.Y.: Pueblo, 1986. Pp. 254. \$17.50.
- PASTORAL AND ASCETICAL**
- Belisle, A. *The Wheel of Becoming.* Petersham, Mass.: St. Bede's, 1987. Pp. 87. \$6.95.
- Betten, M. *People of the Passion and Mary M: A Visit with the Magdalene.* Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1988. Pp. 116. \$7.95.
- Boff, L. *Sacraments of Life, Life of the Sacraments.* Tr. J. Drury. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral, 1987. Pp. 92. \$7.95.
- Buckley, C., S.J. *Your Word, O Lord: Meditations for College Students and Anyone Else.* S.F.: Ignatius, 1987. Pp. 299.
- Cunningham, L. *Faith Rediscovered.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 99. \$3.95.
- Droege, T. *Guided Grief Imagery: A Resource for Grief Ministry and Death Education.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 178. \$9.95.
- Dumm, D., O.S.B. *Flowers in the Desert: A Spirituality of the Bible.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 176. \$7.95.
- Fischer, E. *Life in the Afternoon: Good Ways of Growing Older.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 230. \$9.85.
- Formation and Reflection: The Promise of Practical Theology.* Ed. L. Mudge and J. Poling. Phila.: Fortress, 1987. Pp. xxxvi + 164. \$12.95.
- Geissler, F., et al. *Formation et église: Pratiques et réflexion: Actes du colloque européen, mai 1985, Strasbourg.* Paris: Beauchesne, 1987. Pp. 142. Fr. 75.
- Hesch, J. *Clinical Pastoral Care for Hospitalized Children and Their Families.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 194. \$9.95.
- Johnson, B. *To Pray God's Will: Continuing the Journey.* Phila.: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 131. \$7.95.
- Johnson, B. *To Will God's Will: Beginning the Journey.* Phila.: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 126. \$7.95.
- Kelsey, M. *Encounter with God: A Theology of Christian Experience.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1987 [1972]. Pp. 281. \$8.95.
- Lustiger, J. *The Mass.* Tr. R. Balinski. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. 79. \$4.95.
- Padovano, A. *Christmas to Calvary: Life and Memories of Jesus.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 86. \$4.95.
- Rust, R. *Making the Psalms Your Prayer.* Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1988. Pp. 90. \$4.95.
- Speaking of Silence: Christians and Buddhists on the Contemplative Way.* Ed. S. Walker. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 327. \$12.95.
- Spiritual Letters of Jean-Pierre de*

- Caussade*. Tr. K. Muggeridge. Wilton, Ct.: Morehouse-Barlow, 1986. Pp. 148. \$6.95.
- Sullivan, J. *Journey to Freedom: The Path to Self-Esteem for the Priesthood and Religious Life*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 179. \$8.95.
- Taylor, M. *Sharing Prayer: Simple Formats for Small Groups*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1988. Pp. 139. \$5.95.
- Tetlow, J., S.J. *Manna for a Desert of Busyness: Praying Lenten Sunday Scripture*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1988. Pp. 104. \$6.95.
- Van den Beld, A. *Through the Loneliness: A Woman's Spiritual Journey*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 140. \$8.95.
- Van Kaam, A. *Formative Spirituality 4: Scientific Formation*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. xxix + 313. \$29.50.
- Weber, H. *The Way of the Lamb: Christ in the Apocalypse: Lenten Meditations*. Geneva: WCC, 1988. Pp. 58. \$4.95.
- Essays in Philosophy, Politics and Theology*. Edinburgh: Clark, 1987. Pp. 243.
- New Religious Movements and the Churches*. Ed. A. Brockway and J. Rajashekar. Geneva: WCC, 1987. Pp. 201. \$12.50.
- Rahner, K., and P. Lapide. *Encountering Jesus—Encountering Judaism: A Dialogue*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. 111. \$7.95.
- Smiglecius, M. *Commentaria in Organum Aristotelis 1-2*. Warsaw: Akademia Teologii Katolickiej, 1987. Pp. 282 + 271.
- Taylor, Mark C. *Altarity*. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1987. Pp. xxxiv + 371. \$42.50; \$15.95.
- Trajectories in the Study of Religion*. Ed. R. Hart. Scholars: Atlanta, 1987. Pp. 317. \$25.95; \$19.95.
- Wolff, H. *Jesus the Therapist*. Bloomington, Ind.: Meyer-Stone, 1987. Pp. 178. \$12.95.

## PHILOSOPHY, OTHER DISCIPLINES

- Al-Assiouty, S. *Jésus le non-juif*. Paris: Letouzey & Ané, 1987. Pp. 176. Fr. 88.
- Carmody, D., and J. Carmody. *The Story of World Religions*. Mountain View, Cal.: Mayfield, 1988. Pp. 528. \$29.95.
- Chiesa e mobilità umana: Documenti della Santa Sede dal 1883 al 1983*. Ed. G. Tassello and L. Favero. Rome: Centro Studi Emigrazione, 1985. Pp. xlix + 1043. L. 40,000.
- Fishbane, M. *Judaism*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1988. Pp. 149. \$6.95.
- Habermas, J. *The Theory of Communicative Action 2: Lifeworld and System: A Critique of Functionalist Reason*. Tr. T. McCarthy. Boston: Beacon, 1987. Pp. 457. \$37.50.
- Jeffner, A. *Theology and Integration: Four Essays in Philosophical Theology*. Uppsala: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1987. Pp. 73. Sw. kr. 82.
- MacKinnon, D. *Themes in Theology:*

## SPECIAL QUESTIONS

- Alves, R., L. Boff, et al. *Against Machismo: Interviews by Elsa Tamez*. Tr. J. Eagelson. Bloomington, Ind.: Meyer-Stone, 1987. Pp. 150. \$9.95.
- Angelo, P. *Fall to Glory: Theological Reflections on Milton's Epics*. N.Y.: Lang, 1988. Pp. 165. \$36.
- Contemporary Religious Poetry*. Ed. P. Ramsey. N.Y.: Paulist, 1987. Pp. 227. \$9.95.
- Cattell, R. *Beyondism: Religion from Science*. N.Y.: Praeger, 1987. Pp. 336. \$41.95.
- Cullmann, O. *Unity through Diversity*. Tr. M. Boring. Phila.: Fortress, 1988. Pp. 109.
- Ice, M. *Clergy Women and their Worldviews*. N.Y.: Praeger, 1987. Pp. 224. \$37.95.
- Jaki, S. *And on This Rock*. 2nd ed. Manassas, Va.: Trinity Communications, 1987. Pp. 128. \$7.95.
- Murphy, M. *How Catholic Women Have Changed*. Kansas City, Mo.:

- Sheed & Ward, 1987. Pp. 207. \$7.95.
- Noel, D. *Approaching Earth: A Search for the Mythic Significance of the Space Age*. N.Y.: Amity, 1986. Pp. 235. \$12.95.
- Nouwen, H. *Gracias! A Latin American Journal*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987 [1983]. Pp. 188. \$7.95.
- Paul Tillich on Art and Architecture. Ed. J. Dillenberger. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. xxviii + 275. \$24.50.
- Ravitch, D., and C. Finn, Jr. *What Do Our 17-Year Olds Know?* N.Y.: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. 293. \$15.95.
- Religion, Science, and Public Policy*. Ed. F. Birtel. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. 152. \$16.95.
- Renewing the Judeo-Christian Well-springs*. Ed. V. McInnes, O.P. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1987. Pp. 160. \$16.95.
- Rhodes, L. *Co-Creating: A Feminist Vision of Ministry*. Phila.: Westminster, 1987. Pp. 132. \$9.95.
- Sayers, D. *The Mind of the Maker*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987 [1941]. Pp. 229. \$7.95.
- Seegerberg, O., Jr. *The Riddles of Jesus & Answers of Science*. Kinderhook, N.Y.: Reges, 1987. Pp. 265. \$21.95.
- Smith, J. *To Take Place: Toward Theology in Ritual*. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1987. Pp. 183. \$27.50.
- Speckhard, A. *Psycho-social Stress Following Abortion*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1987. Pp. 134. \$7.95.
- Weber, C. *WomanChrist: A New Vision of Feminist Spirituality*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1987. Pp. 178. \$19.95.

THE PERFECT GIFT  
 ACCORDING TO GRADUATION

Please send a one-year subscription to *Theological Studies*, and a card announcing my gift, to the following recipient. I enclose check/money order for the subscription: \$17.00 U.S. \$22.00 Canada and foreign. To prevent error please type or print:

Recipient's Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip \_\_\_\_\_

My name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip \_\_\_\_\_

Mail order to: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, P.O. BOX 64002, BALTIMORE,  
 MD 21264