

BOOK REVIEWS

STANDING AGAIN AT SINAI: JUDAISM FROM A FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE.
By Judith Plaskow. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1990. Pp. xix + 282. \$21.95.

This book is an outstanding contribution to the dual feminist enterprises of recovering women's contributions and transforming the history of humanity from an androcentric one to a human-centered one. Plaskow seizes the traditional image of the people of Israel standing at Sinai and receiving from God the Torah and Mishnah and moves it along to a new wholeness. These pillars of Jewish life are seen as normative. But P.'s analysis of these "normative" materials demonstrates their bias and the resulting deformations in the religious system of Judaism.

She argues that Jewish women's experience is not reflected in this tradition, so half of the Jewish people are not seen when the gathering at Sinai is pictured. Jews have received only half a Torah and half a Mishnah based on this incomplete picture. Yet P.'s experience as a Jewish woman within communities of Jewish women reveals that this description of the Sinai community is incorrect. Women did indeed stand at Sinai, women are in covenant with God, women have had theophanies and are deeply spiritual people. But until women are recognized as contributing to Judaism, the identity and heritage of all Jews is fragmentary and dysfunctional.

P.'s goal is to encourage the process of transforming this deformed Judaism into an inclusive system which will come closer to capturing the mystery of revelation and of God's free choice of covenant relationship with Israel. Claiming the kabbalistic idea of the Torah of fire which is the full and divine Torah, she understands the Torah of paper and ink to be a limited human understanding of God's plan and community which can move toward completeness by becoming more inclusive of the past and present contributions of Jewish women.

P. does not undertake this task lightly or without sensitivity. She moves within the twin contexts of a faith and ethnic identity powerful in the lives of millions and of the feminist quest for recognition of full humanity for women. Most importantly, the question itself is asked within the context of what it proposes to enable: a "repaired" Judaism which reaches both within itself and without to the contemporary feminist movement to journey toward fulfilled identity. She argues that this fulfilled identity is possible, and that Jewish feminists who have come of age in an era strongly influenced by feminism and want to claim their Jewish roots can do so without compromise.

P. thus attempts to do in this book a functional equivalent of what Elisabeth Schüssler-Fiorenza has done in *In Memory of Her*. P. builds on that work and on the works of Jewish feminist scholars. She assumes that her readers know that history is written by the winners and that women seeking to recover and uncover their role in history must look at the underside of history to find the materials with which to write a new history. It is not parallel to men's history, but is a new history which is the narrative of women and men together shaping and naming the realities in which they live.

The book is then a balance of deconstruction and reconstruction. P. rejects the easy answers of ignoring the patriarchal tradition, or of focusing only on the accounts of extraordinary women in an apologetic way. She commits herself and her readers to the difficult task of reading all of the tradition critically for both its biases and its fragmentary clues to the lives of ordinary women. In the reconstructive portions of the book she celebrates the existence of alternate Jewish communities which not only seek to live out this vision of a renewed religion, but which are leaven for change of the whole.

The one weakness is that the book seems to be addressed to several audiences. One is feminists who question the value of remaining in an oppressive system. Another is feminists who want to be able to claim their Jewishness without sacrificing their values. A third is Jews hostile to feminism who may be converted through appeals to Judaism's long-standing commitment to justice or disarmed by focusing on the positive aspects of the feminist enterprise, radical though its program may be in terms of changes required for the new (or in this case renewed) religious system. The audience best served by the book is that of knowledgeable feminists who are aware of the power of imaginative reconstruction (Schüssler-Fiorenza's term) to restore beloved but oppressive systems to liberating potential. They will gain powerful insights into the viability of Judaism as a home for women and men. Feminists hostile to Judaism and Jews hostile to feminists will probably be unmoved by the arguments of the book, impressive as they may find the scholarship and commitment to be. That is their loss.

Rockville United Church, Md.

BARBARA A. CULLOM

JEREMIAH 2: A COMMENTARY ON THE BOOK OF THE PROPHET JEREMIAH CHAPTERS 26-52. By William L. Holladay. Edited by Paul D. Hanson. *Hermeneia*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. xxxi + 543.

The study of the book of Jeremiah has become the touchstone of OT theological and canonical investigations today. Its apparent diversity of

materials and the complex history of its development put into sharp focus most of the relevant questions about the dramatic shift in Israelite religion from preexilic times to the postexilic period. In somewhat simplistic terms, this is the shift from a covenantal theology to a more broadly-based torah theology, and from open-ended religious traditioning to a written canon of sacred literature. Jeremiah stands squarely in the middle of the controversy; his book reflects both his own last stand as a covenantal prophet in the earlier tradition and the redactional and interpretive remolding by the theologians of a new age. The vexing problem that fascinates modern exegetes centers on how much of the process of change can be traced through his book and whether critical examination of its contents will reveal where the real Jeremiah stood. This fascination has led to three major critical commentaries on Jeremiah in the last four years: that of Robert Carroll, that of William McKane and now the concluding volume of Holladay's massive study, perhaps the largest ever attempted in English.

Appearing in the Hermeneia series, H. follows a format set up for use by the scholar more than by the educated layperson. Indeed, the organization into form-critical steps probably hampers the presentation of H.'s ideas more than it helps them, since it cramps the discussion of the literary flow and power of the text in units larger than a chapter or so at a time. Although H. certainly has mastered all the textual and critical questions that need to be dealt with word by word and line by line, his real contributions lie in his ability to put the whole book together. And since the book as a whole has vital importance for getting a perspective on the exile and its effects, H.'s conclusions on the nature of the text, its originality with the prophet and its theological aims will be significant for decades to come.

Volume 1 (1986) covered Jeremiah 1-25; see my review in *Biblical Theology Bulletin* 18 (1988) 35. This second volume not only examines the remaining chapters; it includes the major introduction which H. saved until he had completed the full commentary. Its 95 pages are a gold mine of current Jeremiah scholarship. And in this limited space it will be best to note some of its more important contributions.

(1) H. pulls together what we know about the textual difficulties which are especially acute in Jeremiah. The Greek version is about 1/8 shorter than the standard Hebrew text, which indicates that it stems from a shorter Hebrew original which may have been carried to Egypt by Jewish settlers at an early date. It was translated into Greek (the LXX) after 200 B.C.E. Meanwhile, the Hebrew version in Palestine was expanded over the years largely on the topics of disobedience and punishment but not by the addition of entirely new material. Thus for critical purposes the LXX prototype is usually closer to the original form of the book.

(2) Most scholars have distinguished three types of material: original poetry from Jeremiah, prose narratives by a follower, and prose sermons by a deuteronomistic author. H. prefers the insight of Claus Rietzschel that prose and poetry existed simultaneously and were collected in blocks that were gradually joined together. He finds clues in two factors: (a) the ability to detect the authentic "voice" of Jeremiah with its use of the language of metaphor, surprise, and freshness in its message; (b) the evidence of chap. 36 that Jeremiah wrote his oracles on a scroll that was burned by King Jehoiakim in 601 and that he prepared a second and expanded collection after that. H. argues for a first scroll made up of parts of chaps. 1-7, 24-25 and 25:1-7; the second scroll added further parts of present chaps. 1-6, 7-10 and 25:8-13. He determines that two further major collections were added in 594 and 587; smaller additions were made here and there. Remarkably, almost all of this stems from Jeremiah himself, including the oracles against foreign nations. Thus H. attributes more of the book to the original prophet than any other major commentator today. Except for the narratives of Jeremiah's last days in chaps. 37-44, written by the scribe Baruch, H. attributes only 40 or 50 verses to later redactors. Even if one does not accept all the particulars, this proposed history of the growth of the book is a major accomplishment against which future proposals will have to be measured.

(3) Under the life of Jeremiah, H. puts forth his case that Jeremiah was born in 627, began his preaching in 615, and gathered much of his orations, esp. those in prose, around the septennial public reading of Deuteronomy (Deut 31:9-13) that took place between 615 and 587.

(4) There is a superb survey of the reminiscences of earlier biblical material in Jeremiah. Notable are the strong echoes not just of Hosea, but also of Amos and Isaiah, and of the early Pentateuchal traditions of Genesis and Exodus. Not surprisingly, Jeremiah knew a form of proto-Deuteronomy well, and the language of his prose sermons may have been influenced by the public reading of Deuteronomy at the septennial feast. In turn, the exilic editors of the completed Deuteronomy made use of Jeremiah!

(5) In his message, Jeremiah was the prophet who centered most clearly and consistently on the covenant obligations of Israel. To this he adds the distinctive notes of a call to repentance and of the prophet's role of intercession. In assessing the impact of this message on later Israel, H. does a thorough survey of postexilic literature, but perhaps his chief innovation is analyzing Jeremiah's influence on Ezekiel. This has been long disputed, but H. thinks Ezekiel got his inspiration from hearing Jeremiah in person before being sent off among the exiles to Babylon in 598. Five years later he himself was called to carry on the message. Jeremiah was also well known and used in the Qumran community

literature, and though rarely cited in the NT had his most profound effect there in the very idea of a new covenant.

These are H.'s general conclusions. His vast commentary carefully documents each chapter in detail to back up his arguments. This is not only the largest but also the most challenging and provocative of current studies of Jeremiah. It is an invaluable research tool. It will shape the discussion of much of the ongoing debate on how the exilic experience shaped the theology of a new era—out of which emerged the beginnings of rabbinic Judaism and ultimately of Christianity.

Washington Theological Union, Md. LAWRENCE BOADT, C.S.P.

COMPANION GOD: A CROSS-CULTURAL COMMENTARY ON THE GOSPEL OF MATTHEW. By George T. Montague, S.M. New York: Paulist, 1989. Pp. 330. \$13.95.

So many new directions are being explored and basic assumptions challenged by biblical researchers today that it would be impossible to capture in any one commentary "the best in recent scholarship," as a note on the back cover of this book claims. Nevertheless, this is a substantial volume offering a thoughtful reading of Matthew's gospel by a well-known biblical scholar who recently returned to the States after spending six years in Nepal and India as a Marianist priest directing novices.

A brief preface outlines Montague's basic approach to the gospel through a description of the Matthean community. Situated in Syria in the period following the temple's destruction in 70 C.E., this community was confronted by the Pharisaic leadership within Judaism and experiencing alienation because of the split between church and synagogue. M. also points out the cross-cultural tensions which must have arisen from the growing numbers of Gentile converts joining this early Jewish-Christian community. He sees two opposing groups as dividing the community: the "laxists" who are careless about fulfilling Jesus' ethical demands and the "rigorists" who are impatient with weak and straying members. A final problem for this beleaguered community came in the form of false prophets. All of these perspectives, drawn by M. from the mainstream of Matthean research, find expression in the commentary that follows.

Taking the Gospel of Mark and "Q" as written sources underlying Matthew's text, M. launches into an expansive exposition of the First Gospel based on a five-book structure. These five "books" he titles as follows: "Proclaiming the Kingdom," "Mission in Galilee," "The Gathering Storm," "Preparing for the Passion and the Church," and "Collision

Course and the Final Times." The Infancy Prologues are introduced as "Roots and Shadows Cast Before"; Jesus' Passion and Resurrection forms the climax; and the Great Commission serves as the conclusion.

M. writes in a style that is lucid and engaging, creating an interesting mix of demanding scholarly commentary (*sans* footnotes) and a personal sharing of relevant experiences and anecdotes that put the reader at ease. Following commentary that never fails to illuminate a part of Matthew's gospel, M. often draws up a list of pastoral insights and applications. This emphasis on pastoral implications together with the author's personal reflections should make the book especially useful for homilists.

However, neither the book's attractive title, *Companion God*, nor the promising reference in the subtitle to a cross-cultural perspective are adequately developed or sustained within the commentary. This is due, in no small part, to the traditional commentary format that breaks up the gospel narrative into small, manageable units of text which, in the course of exposition, take on a life and importance of their own. As a result, a sense of the whole is readily lost. M.'s generous sharing of his experiences living in a culture, as he says, "vastly alien to my native America" is always refreshing and very helpful. But, overall, the cross-culture material remains sporadic and incidental rather than transformative and essential. Moreover, the insights of recent sociological analysis by New Testament scholars are not in evidence. A telling example is M.'s novel reference to Joseph's *celibate* fatherhood (18-19).

The entire text of Matthew's gospel is conveniently printed within the commentary but not in a distinguishing type for easy location. The translation used is the RSV, but M. makes expert use of other English translations to amplify and illustrate the rich texture of the original Greek. There are no indices.

Seattle University

KAREN A. BARTA

PAUL THE CONVERT: THE APOSTOLATE AND APOSTASY OF SAUL THE PHARISEE. By Alan F. Segal. New Haven: Yale University, 1990. Pp. xvi + 368. \$29.95.

Segal provides a fresh and stimulating discussion of what has been the hottest topic in Pauline research for the past decade: Paul's attitude and relation to Judaism. This work is not so much a linear argument as it is a collection of (some already published but revised) studies. Under "Paul the Jew" S. treats Paul and Luke, Paul's ecstasy, and conversion in Paul's society. Next under "Paul the Convert" he deals with the consequences of conversion (Paul's exegesis) and Paul's new conversion community among the Gentiles. Finally "Paul the Apostle" treats circumci-

sion and the Noahide laws, Romans 7 and Jewish dietary laws, and the salvation of Israel. An appendix examines Paul's conversion in light of sociological and psychological research. As is the case with most collections, there is some repetition in presentation and unevenness in quality. Nevertheless, the volume stands out as a major treatment of Paul and Judaism and deserves serious consideration.

S. makes important contributions in methodology by using the New Testament as a source for first-century Judaism and by interpreting Paul as part of Jewish history. Moreover, he makes effective use of social-science research on the sociology of conversion and brings it to bear on the case of Paul. Thus he specifies the nature of Paul's conversion as a transformation from Pharisaism to Christianity. Though Paul regarded himself as still within Judaism, his insistence on transformation in Christ for both Jews and Gentiles led to the perception of Pauline Christianity as a new religion. S. would like to agree with Krister Stendahl, John Gager, and Lloyd Gaston that Paul proposed distinct ways to God for Jews and Gentiles. But his reading of Paul will not let him. His approach to Paul's emphasis on conversion to Christ highlights the controversy that surrounded Jews and Gentiles eating together and even marrying in Christian communities. What startled people in the first century according to S. was Paul's claim that saved Jews and Gentiles could form a single community and freely interact. Thus some Jews regarded Paul as an apostate.

Despite the power and ingenuity of S.'s presentation, there are some questionable positions and unconvincing arguments. Though he is on solid ground in assuming that Paul had mystical experience, I am puzzled how he can claim to know about the content of those experiences on the basis of 2 Cor 12:1-9. The so-called God-fearers are an essential element in S.'s reconstruction of first-century life, though A. T. Kraabel (in *Numen* 28 [1981] 113-26) has urged great caution against placing too much historical weight on what may be a Lukan creation. Also doubtful are the antiquity of the distinction imputed to Paul between the ethical and ceremonial aspects of Torah, whether Paul preached the end of the ceremonial laws and gave up adherence to them, and the importance attached to the Noahide commandments for Gentiles by first-century Jews. Intriguing but finally unconvincing to me are S.'s attempts at interpreting 2 Cor 3 as referring to the veiling of the head with the prayer shawl, and Rom 7 as reflecting Paul's struggle with returning to the observance of the Jewish dietary laws.

CHRISTIANISME ET RELIGIONS PAÏENNES DANS LE *CONTRE CELSE* D'ORIGÈNE. By Michel Fédou. *Théologie historique* 81. Paris: Beauchesne, 1988. Pp. 665. Fr. 255.

Fédou's massive and complex study cuts across various levels of historical and theological investigation. The primary historical material involves the non-Christian religions presented by Celsus in his lost work, *The True Logos*, which is available to some extent in Origen's response; the interpretations of Celsus and Origen form the next historical level. F. also touches on numerous aspects of Christian dogmatic theology and finally relates his findings to contemporary work in the history and theology of religion. F. offers a wealth of detail and displays a remarkable power of synthesis. The patristic material is analyzed in and for itself, but is also viewed in a modern context, an approach which is essential if the early church is to be studied and understood, not as a fossilized object, but as part of a living process called tradition that is still flourishing today.

F.'s general purpose is to examine Origen's theological judgment on religious expressions of the pagan world through his apologetical treatise against Celsus. This is not modern paganism, which tends to imply absence of religion; it refers rather to ancient forms of religion that were indeed religious, but were neither Christian nor related to Christianity. Judaism is, therefore, excluded, as are heresies and even Gnosticism, despite the latter's reputed links to non-Christian religion or philosophy.

A key concept in the structure of F.'s book is conflict, which, when applied to the areas of religious beliefs, religious actions, and interpretations, gives rise to the book's three major sections. The conclusion looks at Origen's work against Celsus in the modern context of the history and theology of religion; such an approach raises the issues of religion and reason, revelation and non-Christian religions, and the significance of non-Christian religions in light of Christianity's self-understanding as the true religion.

A description of the first section on the conflict of beliefs will serve to indicate F.'s methodology. He begins by analyzing the beliefs of Greek religion presented by Celsus and opposed by Origen. He concludes that Celsus rejects most of the mythological trappings, while using them against Christianity. Origen not only attempts to defend Christianity, but also tries to show its superiority over Greek religion; his arguments are based on issues of faith and reason, morality, and the general effects that religions have on human beings. F. then discusses doctrines which are crucial to this conflict: the Incarnation, the Passion and Resurrection (of the incarnate God), and the "substance" of the Christ, i.e., the significance of the Greek terms *ousia* and *hypostasis* in the Christian

tradition. Some thoughts on myth and allegory, and on the conflicting hermeneutics employed by Celsus and Origen, close this part. Chapter 2 applies the same methodology to so-called barbarian religions, namely, the religions of Egypt, of Mithra, and of several geographically defined groups.

The conclusion of the first section deals with the conflict between polytheism and monotheism, which develops out of the syncretism found in pagan religions contemporary with early Christianity. F. speaks of a pagan henotheism, which acknowledges a single supreme deity, but also believes in other, subordinate gods, and is, therefore, a form of polytheism; it would reject the divinity of Jesus, and Origen opposes it with a true but trinitarian monotheism, in which a key element is the *Logos*, a concept used in widely different ways by the pagans and by Origen.

Conflict is not limited to beliefs, and so F.'s second section deals with religious practices; this includes places (such as temples), objects (such as images, and their veneration), and the mysteries and other specifically cultic or ritual actions. Conflict is also observed, in parareligious phenomena, between magic and miracles, and divination and prophecy.

F.'s final section deals with the conflict of interpretations and is subdivided into studies of tradition and innovation, religions in history, and the theology of the *Logos*. Crucial here is the Incarnation, through which the true *Logos* offers a revelation that transcends the pagan religions with their understanding of history as fixed and static. Origen's dynamic approach to tradition, history, and religion has been indicated above, and central to it is the true *Logos* of Christianity, not the "true *Logos*" in the title of Celsus's attack on Christianity. In the end Origen's defense of Christianity leads him to a total rejection of polytheism and idolatry and still allows him to find, through the progressive revelation of the *Logos*, some good in the pagan religions he opposes. This leads to contemporary applications and to the final conclusion that Origen's work is relevant today, not as an object of slavish imitation, but through its spirit and through its focus on Christ, the true *Logos*, which is the ultimate source that links it to, and yet transcends, the significant religious expressions of the pagans.

This is a scholarly and extremely interesting study of Origen and his work against Celsus, of the latter's attack on Christianity, of pagan religions, of Christian theology, and especially of the interrelationships among different religious traditions. It shows that Origen did not defend Christianity by simply rejecting paganism; he used reason in defending his faith and emerges as a complex person with a great intellect and a deep faith, who has much to say to people of intellect and faith today.

JESUS DER CHRISTUS IM GLAUBEN DER KIRCHE 2/2: DIE KIRCHE VON KONSTANTINOPEL IM 6. JAHRHUNDERT. By Alois Grillmeier (with the assistance of Theresia Hainthaler). Freiburg-im-Br.: Herder, 1989. Pp. xxv + 588. DM 95.

For most people interested in exploring early Christianity, the sixth century remains an uncharted and forbidding sea. Although abundant evidence on its political and religious intrigues survives, much of it is unpublished, unreliably edited, or difficult of access, and few serious attempts have been made to sort out its details comprehensively. Sixth-century theology, in particular, has attracted few modern students, perhaps because of its abstruse, academic literary dress and its predominantly polemical tone, as well as its sheer unfamiliarity. Yet by any historical standards this was a crucial time in the development of Christianity: the last century in which the ideal of a politically and culturally unified Christian Roman Empire, including the whole Mediterranean basin, could be seriously pursued, and so in a real sense the last century that could lay claim either to a universal classical culture or a universal Christendom.

Grillmeier's massive new account of the Christology of the churches ruled by Constantinople in the sixth century provides at least some of the necessary keys for understanding that age's importance as a time of both synthesis and disintegration. The main preoccupation of Christian preachers and writers during these years was clearly still the reception of the Chalcedonian definition of Christ (451). "Everywhere," writes G., "it was the question of how to understand Christ that still moved the spirits. Before the Arab conquest, the *Orbis christianus* presented itself, with a peculiar consistency, as an *Orbis christologicus*" (4). And since it was the Byzantine part of that world—the part dominated by the Church and court of Constantinople—that set most of the agenda for the reception of Chalcedonian Christology, it was arguably also Constantinople's heavy-handed attempts to impose the Chalcedonian formula on other regions that led to permanent and institutionalized schisms: schisms which, in the seventh century, opened the arms of Christian dissidents to welcome the new Muslim invaders, and which are with us still. Sixth-century Byzantine Christology was of fateful historical importance.

No one is more qualified than G. to chronicle and interpret the subtle twists and turns of post-Chalcedonian Christological debate; the first volume of his history of early Christology, *Christ in Christian Tradition* (1965; rev. Engl. ed. 1975; rev. Germ. ed. 1979), established him as the unchallenged authority in the field. In taking his account into the relatively unstudied centuries beyond Chalcedon, G. has been forced to rely even more than before on first-hand study of original sources, and the result is theological history of almost unparalleled thoroughness of

detail. This second part of his history, dealing with Christology up to the death of Gregory the Great (604), is planned to comprise five stout volumes: 2/1, dealing masterfully with the nature of the sources and the tortured history of the half-century after Chalcedon, appeared in 1985; and three remaining volumes, which are promised "in quick succession" (vii), will deal with Christology in the sixth century in the Churches of Antioch and Jerusalem (including the Armenian, Georgian, East Syrian and Persian Churches), in Alexandria (with Ethiopia and Nubia), and in the Latin West. A projected third part will continue the chronicle down to the end of the eighth century.

G. writes in acute awareness of the importance of sixth-century Christological debates for ecumenical dialogue today. Equally important for the contemporary Church, however, is the fact that the sixth century witnessed the formation of what has been, for Orthodox, Catholics and Protestants alike, the classical understanding of the person of Jesus Christ, in the interpretation of Chalcedonian Christology canonized at the Second Council of Constantinople (553). The real issue behind the debate over Chalcedon was how to conceive the unity of divine and human realities that all confessed in Jesus. Was that unity in some sense on the "natural" level—on the level of "what" Jesus is, his abilities and actions and resources—a unity which inevitably made him a far different *kind* of human being from the rest of us? Or was it a unity of subject alone, an existential unity between the eternal Son of God and a fully normal, "ordinary" human reality which the Son has made his own—a "personal" unity which the objective ontological categories of Greek philosophy always found it hard to grasp and express? Along with these Christological questions came equally central hermeneutical ones: to what extent does fidelity to the tradition of faith in Jesus require the unvarying use of traditional terminology? when does the changing cultural context require the use of new terms, or new definitions of old ones, precisely in order to make continued fidelity to the preached word possible? when and how does theological conservatism become the parent of heresy, rather than a bulwark against it?

G. documents in exhaustive detail the debates produced by these issues in the sixth-century Byzantine Church. In the process, he provides us with what must be regarded as authoritative readings of the participants in those debates: Severus of Antioch, the greatest theoretician of the anti-Chalcedonian Christology based on the earlier "one-nature" language of Cyril of Alexandria; Leontius of Byzantium, the exponent of the period's most "symmetrical" view of Jesus, who built a whole Christological system on the Chalcedonian formula of "one individual subsisting in two natures"; Leontius of Jerusalem, a terminological innovator who

emphasized with new clarity the subjective centering of the human Jesus in the person of the Word; the theologian-emperor Justinian, who used both his erudition and his political power to impose this "neo-Chalcedonian" synthesis on the Christian empire, and failed in the attempt; and a host of lesser figures, incidental skirmishes, and related issues.

Some may find the very abundance of G.'s material overpowering, or his single-minded focus on issues of Christological formulation needlessly repetitious. Sixth-century specialists will probably continue to quibble with some details of his interpretations. I am not entirely convinced, e.g., that even Leontius of Jerusalem uses *enhypostēnai* and its cognates to mean that the humanity of Jesus "subsists in" the concrete person of the Word, even though his understanding of the unity of Christ certainly moves in that direction; and I think more could be said about the originality and importance of Leontius of Byzantium's positive conception of that unity than is said here. Yet these are hardly serious reservations about what is clearly a monument of patristic scholarship. This new volume of Grillmeier's history is unquestionably a dazzling achievement, the kind of work that in its comprehensiveness, its bibliographical riches, and its luminous clarity and balance of interpretation will remain foundational for many decades to come. This German edition is beautifully produced, with astoundingly few misprints (and those mainly in references to non-German bibliography). An English version by Pauline Allen and John Cawte, who provided an excellent translation of vol. 2/1, is promised soon. This is a work that no serious student of Christology or early Byzantine history can consider as anything less than a primary resource for understanding the Christian tradition.

Weston School of Theology

BRIAN E. DALEY, S.J.

IMPERIAL UNITY AND CHRISTIAN DIVISIONS: THE CHURCH 450-680 A.D. By John Meyendorff. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1989. Pp. xv + 402. \$14.95.

Meyendorff has floodlighted a period dark to all but specialists. The volume is not a work of original research but a textbook synthesis by an expert who hopes to achieve a fairer balance between East and West than is normal in most textbooks of church history. He opens with general presentations of empire and church, ecclesiastical structures and spiritual life, following with well-balanced discussions of East and West and the tumultuous course of the Councils of Chalcedon (451) and Constantinople II (553). The divisions opened up by the Monophysite controversy in the East and the growth of the nascent churches of the Germanic West get equal treatment, and the book ends with the Monothelite controversy settled by the Council of Constantinople III (680).

From this careful chronicle of fact emerges the evidence for M.'s thesis: "Since it is impossible to marshal any unquestionably scriptural, or patristic, or conciliar evidence in favor of the fully structured Roman primacy, the form and location of an universal Christian center, whose usefulness and even necessity cannot really be denied, must be a matter of acceptance and 'reception' by the Church" (379). His argument is that during this period there was a shift from the ancient consensual church government to a new "Roman" notion of truth defined at the discretion of the papacy. Leo I's view of papal primacy based on the continuing mystical presence of Peter embodied in successive popes and his "extraordinary and unprecedented" insistence on resolving the Christological controversy at Chalcedon by attempting to impose the theology of his Tome to Flavian marked the rise of unjustified papal pretensions. Leo was in fact not even consistent, for, despite his lofty claims, he appealed to canon 6 of Nicaea to combat the increased power given to the patriarch of Constantinople by canon 28 of Chalcedon. His pretensions had little relation to the pope's actual position of metropolitan of the suburbicarian dioceses of southern Italy and the adjacent islands. The only real adherents to the new papal program were Leo's successors, and even Gregory the Great's view of his own position was closer to the Greek view than to Leo's, while Honorius I (d. 638) sullied the papacy, for he not only "condoned the mistakes of others, but actually coined a heretical formula" in the course of the Monothelite controversy (353).

These new claims of the bishops of Rome were, asserts M., widely opposed or ignored by the emerging churches of the crumbling Western empire and were repeatedly rejected by the East, which continued to insist on the system of patriarchs of whom the pope was first in honor and prestige. Since the Roman papacy was not acceptable as a universal unifying Christian center—something M. admits was much needed amid the doctrinal and disciplinary turmoil of the age—"the empire itself played its centralizing role for centuries, because it had been accepted and 'received,' with reservations and limitations, by the Church as a human, but legitimate instrument of cohesion and unity" (379). Hence the title of the volume.

One may readily agree with M. that the East was more prone to submit to imperial dictation of doctrine and regulation of discipline, but the West, led by the pope, despite references to the "royal and priestly" mind of the emperor and gratitude for imperial support for orthodoxy, repeatedly protested at the excessive price of imperial intervention. Imperial political expediency often led to the distortion or suppression of orthodox doctrine which had to be rectified in councils where the papal view coincided with the deepest beliefs of the East. Even Honorius I, living in

the culturally diminished West, does not seem to be the “heresiarch” of M.’s contentions; J. Pelikan more correctly, I think, says of Honorius: “He did not mean that Christ was an incomplete human being, devoid of a human will, but that as a human being he did not have any action in his body or any will in his soul that could be contrary to the action and will of God, that is, to the action and will of his own divine nature (*Spirit of Eastern Catholicism* 151). Despite M.’s contention that there was no difference between East and West over the place of the emperor in the church, the West was far less “receptive” of imperial control.

No one today, I hope, would attempt to claim that the full theory of papal primacy as defined at Vatican I could be found in the early church. Just as the orthodox theology of two complete natures, divine and human, in Christ united in a hypostatic union was finally clarified only at Chalcedon, so in the West the structure of the church began at this time to emerge around a center of authority which did not dictate at its own discretion but acted as the voice of a united episcopate.

There is a further problem growing out of a statement in M.’s introduction: “if one has doubts as to whether Western Christianity has always used the right philosophy and the right methods to preserve the values of the Christian Gospel, one can find it legitimate to look back into history for an alternate possibility and lost opportunity, especially to Byzantium.” Can this mean that Western Christians are being asked to return to a state-directed church along the lines of Czarist Russian Orthodoxy?

The volume includes a fold-out map and thirty illustrations. For bibliography beyond his ample footnotes M. refers us to Jedin-Dolan’s *Handbook of Church History*. Typography and layout show an improvement over some of this press’s previous editions, though we do get Aquileia, Vienna for Vienne, and Esquilin for Esquiline.

Florence, Italy

LEO DONALD DAVIS, S.J.

ICONS, WINDOWS ON ETERNITY: THEOLOGY AND SPIRITUALITY IN COLOR. Compiled by Gennadios Limouris. Geneva: WCC, 1990. Pp. x + 228.

A collection of essays by 29 individual contributors. The essays are of varying degrees of length, scholarship, literary quality, and historical value. There is no single, clear perspective. The theology and spirituality of icons are underdeveloped. However, the merit of this volume is that it offers the reader an initiatory meeting with some contemporary thinkers in this area. When one has finished reading, one will know something about the iconoclastic controversy, the seventh ecumenical council, the

theology of icons, iconic spirituality, and a variety of personal reflections on the use of icons in liturgy and prayer. It would take a specialist to put each topic into a larger perspective, but a specialist would not need to read this book. Although the insights into iconic theology and spirituality are not developed systematically, but accumulate through repetition, there are, however, significant points made in these areas.

The first several essays raise our consciousness about the importance of the seventh ecumenical council. In fact, the reason for the volume's publication is the World Council of Churches' celebration of that council's 1200th anniversary. There has been a tendency to pay so much attention to the earlier major Christological councils that the seventh council has either been ignored or has been seen simply as a repetition or reaffirmation of earlier ones. A partial historical explanation for this lies in the fact that the war of iconoclasm was of little interest to the West, and even in the East it was very much limited to the patriarchate of Constantinople. The council has been of some interest to historians because of the issue of civil authority, in this case the emperor, playing a role in a church council. It retains a specific significance today for having given the highest official approval to the use of art forms in the church's sacramental life. Especially in a period such as ours, when liturgical art is little more than illustrative, the aesthetic dimension of the Incarnation proclaimed by this council needs to be heard again.

In general, the theology of the icon presented here stays within the parameters established by this Second Council of Nicaea. While claiming that icons are more than merely naturalistic paintings used in the church's worship, this theology sees sacred iconography as sacramental in character, i.e., facilitating a connection between the worshiper and a prototype such as the Trinity, Christ, or the saints. But none of the essays displays an excessive sacramentalism, since icons were seen as functioning analogously to the cross and the book of the Scriptures. Such a balanced position highlights the nature of the early iconoclastic battle as motivated by more than a theological dispute. There were political issues involved. And the negative reaction to the iconic by the Protestant Reformers was impelled primarily by superstitious practices.

A section entitled "Icons: Windows on Eternity" is devoted to spirituality in color. Writers representing the Roman Catholic, Anglican, other Eastern, and non-European traditions all manage to find a place for icons in the spiritualities they represent, with appropriate caveats. One author helpfully observes how the icon operates in terms of the person's relationship with God apart from the received liturgical and sacramental modes. There are no shadows in icons. Iconography represents a change in perspective from naturalistic painting, which achieves depth through

techniques which give the picture the kind of space behind the canvas which draws the viewer's sight into the picture. Icons do not do that. They present a flat surface. The figures are usually seen from a frontal view and often the eyes are enlarged. We do not look at icons. They look at us. They bring the presence of the prototype into our lives. This is their specific spiritual ministry.

There are 16 plates of reproductions of icons, both medieval and modern, including the well-known icon of the Holy Trinity of Meteoras, and Rublev's icon of the Holy Trinity. Little reference is made to these plates in the essays. This book is worth having in a collection on icons. But it is not a book with which to begin or end one's reading.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

JAMES L. EMPEREUR, S.J.

CHRISTIAN SPIRITUALITY 3: POST-REFORMATION AND MODERN. Edited by Louis Dupré and Don E. Saliers in collaboration with John Meyendorff. *World Spirituality*. New York: Crossroad, 1989. Pp. xxvi + 566. \$49.50.

This third and final volume on Christian Spirituality in the Crossroad series on the spiritualities of the world covers the period from the mid-16th century to the present. It is divided into four unequal sections: Roman Catholic spirituality (six chapters with an excursus on biblical hermeneutics since the mid-17th century); Protestant spirituality from the post-Reformation period to the present (eight sections grouped under the headings of Orthodoxy and Pietism, Anglican spirituality, Puritan spirituality, early Methodism, and Afro-American traditions); Orthodox spirituality (five sections giving some attention to both Russian and Greek experience); and contemporary developments (Pentecostalism, Christian feminism, and the ecumenical context).

This volume is both a welcome addition to the growing fund of scholarly resources in the field of spirituality and something of a disappointment. It accomplishes with some distinction a project that is, almost by definition, unmanageable since no single volume can deal adequately with 500 years of experience within three major traditions, each of which is itself composed of numerous strands. Furthermore, attempting to include contemporary developments under the epochal rubric of "modern" is highly problematic.

This volume, like its predecessors, is a collection of articles by eminent scholars who treat assigned aspects of the overall subject according to their own understandings, expertise, and interests. This is both a strength and a weakness. The overall design is thorough, logical, and even-handed and contributes a workable design for dealing with modern spirituality.

However, while some of the articles are outstanding in breadth and depth, others are narrow, idiosyncratic, or even marginal to the field of spirituality.

The section on Protestant spirituality is extraordinarily good. This is a boon to the field because comprehensive resources in this area are scarce. The authors all provide good expository treatments which supply the historical facts, describe the salient features, and draw significant conclusions about the strands of Protestant spirituality which they treat. The article on "Pietism and Enlightenment" by Albert Outler is outstanding. Outler's vast, deep contact with contemporary religious experience shows through not only as erudition but as wisdom seasoning knowledge.

Perhaps the best article is "The Spirituality of Afro-American Traditions" by Theophus Smith. The essay is not only comprehensive, enormously informative, and genuinely creative but the method employed for the exposition, analysis, and constructive criticism of black spirituality from its African roots through slavery and emancipation up to the present is a model for interdisciplinary study in spirituality. Smith's handling of the language is a treat. He writes in a densely complex but clear and graceful style; the notes are extensive and complemented by an excellent bibliography. Smith's article is almost the only one in the book that is not marred by printing errors, which in some cases (e.g., p. 453) are serious.

The section on Roman Catholic spirituality contains an excellent critical essay by John O'Malley on early Jesuit spirituality and a good treatment by Michael Buckley, through representative figures (Francis de Sales, Pierre de Bérulle, and Louis Lallemant), of French spirituality. A major disappointment, however, is Kieran Kavanaugh's article on Carmelite spirituality. One would have expected this well-known authority on the Spanish mystics to have produced a magisterial treatment but the article is unfortunately too cursory to be of much use to the scholar and too overloaded with arcane technical language and unexplained historical allusions to be of much help to the beginner.

The most puzzling, and in some senses disturbing, article is David Tracy's on "Recent Catholic Spirituality." Tracy actually supplies the reader with a fairly extensive, and basically very enlightening, survey of the effects on Catholic practice of modern developments in the area of systematic theology. While this is a useful contribution to the discussion of modern Catholic spirituality since theology is an aspect of religious experience and a moment in the study of such experience, the essay virtually completely overlooks the experiential focus which is the defining characteristic of spirituality. There is no attention, e.g., to the profound

effect of modern psychology (depth, transpersonal, and developmental) on Catholic religious experience as well as on the redefinition of the questions and the development of the categories of analysis and criticism in the field of spirituality. Absent is any attention to the serious effects, for weal and for woe, of developments in the area of liturgy on the corporate and personal prayer life of Catholics. The influence of the widespread experience of Catholics with directed retreats, spiritual direction, renewal movements, Bible study, and personal prayer; the emergence of a genuinely lay spirituality; the age's characteristic problems with the God-image, ecclesiastical authority, kaleidoscopic changes in life-style, and redefinitions of vocational commitment, to highlight only a few of the major concerns in the area of spirituality, are not mentioned. In short, Tracy treats the field of spirituality as it was treated in the 19th century, as a subdivision of dogmatic theology.

The section on Orthodox spirituality contains useful historical articles by Philip Sherrard and Sergei Hackel and a brief explanation of the Orthodox spiritual ideal of deification by John Meyendorff. The other articles in the section would be more useful to specialists in Orthodox history than to the student of spirituality.

In the final section on "Trajectories" are three fine articles. Steven Land's on Pentecostal spirituality and Sally Purvis' on feminist spirituality sort out, in brief compass, very complicated developments supplying the historical and the analytical tools for further research in these areas. Don Saliers' piece, which is really on the ecumenical context within which contemporary Christian spirituality is developing, is a fitting conclusion to the volume.

I am not aware of any other single volume on modern spirituality which is as balanced in its design or as inclusive in its content as this one. It will be useful to students and researchers alike. The unevenness of the volume probably testifies more to the developmental state of the field of spirituality and of collaborative scholarship than to any scholarly weakness among the writers.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

SANDRA M. SCHNEIDERS

REASONABLE ENTHUSIAST: JOHN WESLEY AND THE RISE OF METHODISM. By Henry D. Rack. Philadelphia: Trinity Press International, 1989. Pp. xvi + 656. \$39.95.

The product of a mature career of scholarly endeavor, this critical historical work presents us with the definitive Wesley biography requisite to our scholarly era. Although some of the earliest biographical treatments were heavily negative in flavor, much of the literature that has

appeared since has been laced with large doses of filial piety producing a "Wesley Legend." This tradition has tended to accept uncritically W.'s polemical and apologetic protestations in what became a "single document" reconstruction of events and intentions. While "legendary" biographical treatments have continued to appear, there has been a new approach to the founder of Methodism in the present generation. The names of Vivian Green, Frank Baker and Richard Heitzenrater have engaged the interested public for several decades, and more recently Stephen Gunter can be added to that number. Rack, an English Methodist clergyman and a lecturer on church history at Manchester University, has now produced a landmark for this scholarly movement. What Luke Tyerman was to 19th-century Wesley biographers Rack promises to be for the present scene.

Rack's work is thorough, sometimes to the point of tedium. He traces the context of W.'s development from the broadest to the narrowest scope. W.'s life and thought are displayed against the background of European, English, ecclesiastical, intellectual and social history as well as the particular marks of family and personal evolution. Although this treatment is more satisfactory to a historian than to a psychoanalyst, the questions of psychohistory are not given short shrift. The work is carefully organized in such a way as to leave no stone unturned in the often controverted treatments of W. and Early Methodism.

Rack divides the life into three main parts, breaking it at 1738 and at 1760. The first part is concerned chiefly with his personal development, the second with the development and spread of his movement, and the third chiefly with his struggles to preserve the integrity of his work against threatened destruction from without or within. Rack is in constant and pointed dialogue and sometimes dispute with earlier interpreters. This is extremely valuable to scholars but often makes the work rather heavy going even for the initiated. The first part of the book is basically "narrative" and can be expected to engage the general reader, though even it will prove a challenge; the "analysis" of the last two parts will prove more difficult. Rack speaks of his experience with a popular Wesley biography which convinced him "that John Wesley was actually a real and even interesting human being." It is unlikely that Rack's biography will have a similar impact on the uninitiated. What it is much more likely to do is to render a credible W. possible to critical and historical thinkers who have been disillusioned by partisan and parochial treatments of 18th-century Methodism and its leadership.

Although not a scintillating narrative, Rack's book is a wonder of comprehension and of critical balance. The scope and detail of his treatment are exemplary. He has combed the traditional literature, both

primary and secondary, and has carefully presented the mass of ideas and issues that have been raised or even avoided by previous scholars. He has also judiciously weighed these matters and set forth his critical response to them with clarity and coherence. Even where he has been unable to go beyond the monopoly W.'s own writings frequently hold as primary sources, he subjects them to a no-holds-barred scrutiny which affords W.'s opponents and the objects of his ire a degree of justice and fair play that is unexcelled among Wesley scholars, past or present.

A reflection of Rack's balance is to be seen in the various lights shed upon the title of this work. "Reasonable enthusiasm" is usually construed as indicative of the struggle that went on between religious enthusiasm and rationalism within W. himself, reflecting his combination of Puritan roots with Enlightenment acculturation. There are points at which Rack presents W.'s apologetics as "rationalization" of the Freudian sort—presenting him at best as an inadvertent sophist vindicating what his general assumptions should have caused him to condemn as fanaticism (enthusiasm). The matter is finally brought full circle from the quotation of Alexander Knox on the title page that W. "would have been an enthusiast if he could" but that he could not. W.'s admiration for enthusiasm was unaccompanied by ability to participate in it.

This splendid book is marked by several notable faults. Rack indicated a longer book would have been easier to write, and clearly a longer book would have been easier to read; the engagement is staggering and unremitting. Where other works would have a summary paragraph or even section concluded with a literary characterization of a more popular sort, one here finds a tightly packed summary paragraph ending with a tighter still concluding sentence. The presentation of the book is in a type size and style that is far from easy for "old" eyes. The computer-composed type caused some lines with virtually no spacing between words, which could be particularly confusing for readers for whom English is a second language. I found only one error in matters of fact: J. A. Bengel is referred to as a Moravian (347); both Bengel and Zinzendorf would be startled at this resolution of their long and often bitter controversy.

Regardless of these criticisms, here is a benchmark for the historical biography of W. and the development of early Methodism. The book is far too formidable to provide an introduction of W. to a popular audience, and I suspect its value to scholars will in the end be more as a reference work than as a biographical narrative. As all works, it is dated from its appearance. It will at important points soon be put behind us, but scholars who treat W. will owe a great debt to this outstanding study.

THE PREMIER SEE: A HISTORY OF THE ARCHDIOCESE OF BALTIMORE, 1789–1989. By Thomas W. Spalding. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University, 1989. Pp. ix + 591. \$29.95.

Diocesan histories tend to be provincial; this bicentennial history of the archdiocese of Baltimore is a remarkable exception. As Spalding notes, the premier see's history is unique "in that it is, in great part, a history of the Catholic Church in the United States up to the death of Cardinal James Gibbons in 1921." Indeed, as late as the turbulent years following the Second Vatican Council, the archdiocese of Baltimore continued to be an important part of the Roman Catholic experience in America. This was a consequence partly of its history and location, partly of the extraordinary leadership it enjoyed from John Carroll to Lawrence Shehan. Presiding over the oldest see, that until 1947 had within its borders the nation's capital, the Baltimore prelates early became a chief link between the Holy See and the Church in the U.S.

From its establishment in 1789 the American church had, under John Carroll's hand, a unique character, what S. labels "the Maryland tradition." Unfortunately, S. had to collapse to 14 pages the 150 years of Maryland Catholic experience that preceded Carroll's election as bishop and laid the roots for the tradition. At any rate, Carroll brought to maturity a tradition which included a commitment to the principles of religious freedom, the separation of church and state, ecumenism, lay involvement appropriate to a church within a republic, civic responsibility, and an understanding of the autonomy a national church should have in its relationship with Rome. It was a tradition that encouraged pluralism and experiments. A church that would "blend imperceptibly into the social fabric."

That tradition ebbed and flowed with successive prelates. Carroll himself was responsible for a certain "Europeanization" of the American church, "from a church of simple forms and features and democratic tendencies that were the legacies of the colonial and Revolutionary period, as well as a certain autonomy in its actions and decisions . . . [to one] increasingly baroque in its liturgy, hierarchical in its governance, and ultramontane in its theology" (46). The absolute opposition of his successor, Leonard Neale, to any lay participation in church governance during his brief, absentee administration (he was in his see city only two or three times during his two-year episcopacy) prefigured the demise of any republican polity involving the laity within the American church. Ambrose Maréchal, the third archbishop of Baltimore (1818–1828), won Roman support for corporate sole as the norm of authority and power in the American Catholic community. Indeed, the emigré prelate was responsible for the Holy See's increasing use of Baltimore as its channel to the U.S.

By the middle of the century mass Catholic immigration and the hostilities it engendered in the larger society caused the church to become more defensive, European, authoritarian, and Rome-oriented. The symbiotic relationship between the Holy See and the bishops brought about a steady growth in the power and influence of both. Rome's granting of "prerogative of place" to the archdiocese in 1858 confirmed, S. notes, the implicit recognition of its leadership within the American church. Nor was that recognition based on history alone. As late as 1860 Baltimore, although half the size of New York in Catholic population, still had an edge in churches and priests and far more institutions and religious orders serving the many needs of an immigrant community.

Ironically Martin Spalding (1864–1872), as native a Catholic as one could find, was responsible for the national institutionalization of the ghetto church as well as a continued orientation toward Rome. Under his leadership the Second Plenary Council of Baltimore (1866) provided the *corpus juris* for the American church. He was the first grand episcopal builder in Baltimore. He brought almost as many religious communities to the archdiocese as all his predecessors combined, including the Mill Hill Fathers in 1871 to work with emancipated blacks, which Spalding regarded as "the most *urgent* duty of all" (189). He pressed for the establishment of a Catholic university to provide an intellectual center for Catholic America. His defense of unions was more important to the labor movement, S. contends, than the more publicized one of Cardinal James Gibbons. Although initially an inopportunist, he eventually played a key role in supporting the definition of papal infallibility at the First Vatican Council because he was convinced that it was needed to destroy Gallicanism. Had he lived to 1875, S. observes, the first American cardinal would have been a Baltimore archbishop.

Cardinal James Gibbons (1877–1921) attempted to revive the Maryland tradition but, despite the unparalleled popularity he enjoyed as a Catholic churchman in American society, his efforts failed. His immigrant successor, Michael Curley, boldly strengthened the borders of the Catholic ghetto, especially through his development of the school system, and made Rome the norm for archdiocesan structures and behavior. Then in the 1960s Lawrence Shehan, a native Baltimorean, not only outbuilt Curley but in his own gentle way led the archdiocese back to its roots, in his promotion of liturgical reform, lay involvement in church service and governance, and social justice. His leadership in the Second Vatican Council, especially in espousing the principle of religious liberty, earned him the second red hat in the archdiocese's history. By the 1970s, however, Shehan's influence declined sharply, as a conservative reaction swept through church and state.

But S. has given us more than a history of the Baltimore prelates,

extraordinary (with a few exceptions) as they have been. He has effectively caught the Catholic community in its many dimensions as it evolved from a church of Maryland gentry, servants, and slaves to a collection of polyglot ethnic groups to a maturing middle-class body entering the mainstream of American society. S. is especially good at fitting this story within the larger backdrop of city and state and nation. He has made a major contribution to American Catholic history.

Georgetown University

ROBERT EMMETT CURRAN, S.J.

DEITY AND DOMINATION: IMAGES OF GOD AND THE STATE IN THE NINETEENTH AND TWENTIETH CENTURIES. By David Nicholls. New York: Routledge, 1989. Pp. xiv + 321. \$29.95.

Nicholls sets out to examine the relationship between images of divine and civil government in selected 19th- and 20th-century religious thinkers. The analogy between God and the state, he believes, is at least as productive a source for understanding the connections of religion and politics as is the more frequently considered ethical linkage. He proposes to focus on the history of this dialectical relationship, believing that only when it has been laid out in some detail can we draw any conclusions about *how* ideas of God and the state should be juxtaposed.

In a lengthy and discursive introduction, N. explains some of the terminology he will use and provides a brief overview both of the sweep of the argument and some of the underlying themes. He also explains that the work is written "anticlockwise" (that is, backwards), beginning with the most recent of his chosen sources and working by degrees towards the earlier. He promises a second volume that will do for the 17th and 18th centuries what this work does with more recent times.

In the body of the work N. examines in turn the connections between attachment to the "welfare state" and devotion to a paternalistic God, the correlation between an emphasis on divine sovereignty and the politics of totalitarianism, the democratization of God in the American theopolitical climate, the views of God and the state in the writings of early-19th-century German philosophers, and the interplay of atheism and anarchy in other parts of the 19th-century world. A large number of thinkers are discussed, both the famous and the frankly obscure, but the lengthiest discussions are devoted to William Temple, Karl Barth, Fichte, Schleiermacher, Hegel, Proudhon, and Shelley.

Since from one point of view this book is itself a historical survey of the progress of thought through a 200-year period, it is impossible to give an account of the development of the argument. Indeed, the questionable decision to write anticlockwise subverts the very possibility of identifying any such train of thought in the cunning of historical reason, and such may indeed be N.'s best justification for structuring the work this way.

On the other hand, he asks why we should not "proceed by tracing antecedents" rather than adopt the more normal course of "working toward the present and looking for consequences" (15). Yet the work as it stands at present, while we await the second and somehow earlier volume, maintains each chapter-long discussion in fair isolation from the others, and does not even conform in all respects to the promised anticlockwise approach. If the antecedents are to come last, then surely the atheistic anarchists of the mid-19th century should be considered before the great German idealists against whose political and religious thinking they might rightly be thought to be reacting. Or, to take a different example, the valuable and informative chapter on James, Dewey, Whitehead, Hartshorne and the Chicago School seems to have been written more or less clockwise. Moreover, at no point are the antecedents uncovered in such a way as to make explicit their value in the understanding of what has already been discussed.

A second and perhaps more fruitful way to view this book is as illustrating a thesis rather than developing a line of thought, and from this perspective the historical direction in which it is constructed is hardly relevant. N. undoubtedly has a hypothesis he wishes to test, namely, that images and concepts of God are often drawn from the political arena, but leave the marks of their origins behind and in a later reversal can come to affect political discourse anew. From this second angle, N.'s work provides a wealth of illustration of the dialectical nature of the God/state relationship, though the generality of the hypothesis leads to the suspicion that it might be difficult to verify, still more to disprove. On the other hand, the hypothesis can be stripped down to a principle that is as unlikely to be controverted as it is to be informative, namely, that we are all children of our times, and struggle with our culturally inherited patterns of thought. N. needs to step beyond the generalities, work to establish the connections and to reinforce the various patterns hinted at here and there in his work, particularly in the more synthetic conclusion. His undoubted scholarship would then be of considerable value in examining the really significant underlying issue here, the struggle between culture and eternal truth.

Fairfield University, Conn.

PAUL LAKELAND

ROMANCE AND THE ROCK: NINETEENTH-CENTURY CATHOLICS ON FAITH AND REASON. Edited and introduced by Joseph Fitzer. *Fortress Texts in Modern Theology*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. ix + 386. \$19.95.

Fitzer's anthology is not merely another welcome collection but, surprisingly, the first of its kind. It makes 14 texts of 19th-century Catholic thought available in English, from F.-R. de Chateaubriand in 1802

(excerpts from *The Genius of Christianity*) and Joseph de Maistre to Edouard Le Roy (the article that caused such a stir in 1905, "What Is a Dogma?"). It is furnished with a fairly extensive set of bibliographies in what is still a relatively unexplored period of Catholic religious thought, an introduction of 22 pages, and brief introductions and annotations to the texts. There is no index.

To support coursework within the territory staked out here (Catholic thought between the American/French Revolutions and the First World War), one now disposes of two anthologies in English (the other being Patrick W. Carey's *American Catholic Religious Thought*) and the recent partial interpretations by Gerald McCool (*Nineteenth-Century Scholasticism*) and by T. M. Schoof (*A Survey of Catholic Theology 1800–1970*). These authors carry on past 1914 to the 1950s, but in their 19th-century parts complement and are complemented by F.'s volume. The three American texts chosen by F., e.g., are Orestes Brownson on Lourdes, Peter Kenrick at Vatican I in opposition to papal infallibility, and John Ireland's famous 1889 address on the mission of Catholics in America, all different from the corresponding texts presented by Carey. Likewise, McCool's presentation concentrates on the Jesuit neo-scholastic philosophers Joseph Kleutgen and Matteo Liberatore, while F. chooses Matthias Scheeben to represent (not very typically, perhaps, but happily) the neoscholastic wave of the future. J. S. Drey and J. A. Möhler speak for the romanticist Tübingen school in F.'s volume, while Georg Hermes, Anton Günther and Louis Bautain represent alternative paths shunned in the preparations for and the aftermath of the First Vatican Council, both of whose decrees are reproduced in full. The remaining selection is an Oxford University sermon of John Henry Newman.

In an anthology, what one looks for first of all are representative and exemplary texts, preferably self-contained. Remembering that a canon does not yet exist for this material, one must congratulate F. on having ferreted out significant readings. In terms of representativeness, one might regret that he did not find a suitable text from Félicité de Lamennais as a traditionalist apologete, or from any of the textbooks or treatises in Latin, particularly from the Roman School. But it would be churlish to complain about omissions, in the light of what has been found and included. The texts are quite readable, reflecting careful editing and smooth translations, some the editor's own. (In the bibliography, it would have been well to include, under Neo-Scholasticism and Modernism, the studies by T. H. Sanks, *Authority in the Church*, and Gabriel Daly, *Transcendence and Immanence*.)

F. claims only to provide a sampling of readings in theology, specifically on the theme spelled out in the subtitle, faith and reason. Ultramontane

ecclesiology comes in as well—"the Rock." It is of course the other main topic of Vatican I, which figures here as the pivot of the century and the delimitter of the most characteristic themes. Spokesmen such as de Maistre and Ireland bring in social and political issues, but F. explicitly and at length disclaims any intention to delve into these aspects of 19th-century Catholicism (11). Does he perhaps suspect, despite protestations to the contrary, that the real story of 19th-century Catholic theology lay in its strategic function of defending institutions? The whole phenomenon of "Catholicism," understood as a new configuration of the Roman Catholic Church in post-revolutionary European or American society, is left aside, despite the close connections between its developments and the apologetics and ecclesiology of the churchly writers.

If the selections are excellent, the editorial introduction and commentary leave something to be desired, namely, a persuasive perspective and a certain critical distance. F. seems to identify strongly with the Romantic Catholics while at the same time declaring their approach passé—which of course it is in its precritical forms. He acknowledges the formative or at least emblematic significance of Vatican II in shaping present-day Catholicism. He takes "the Catholicism of 1914" as his standard of 19th-century Catholicism. However, he never adverts to the prevailing view among historians that "the Catholicism of 1914" was under the thrall of integrism and hence can only provide a narrow and distorted view of what Catholicism is, even that richer Catholicism of which this anthology provides substantial glimpses. Nor does he provide any example of integrist writing. A more satisfying introduction would remind readers that the 19th-century contention between, roughly, the Romantic and the Neo-Thomist methods in theology continued into the period after the World Wars. It ended with the crumbling of the Neo-Thomist claim to provide the unitary method (McCool, Schoof) and with a "Romantic" model of the responsibility of theologians making a breakthrough (cf. J. Thiel in *TS* 47 [1986] 589–95). This at least is the perspective I shall suggest to my students as I gratefully recommend this volume to their attention.

Marquette University, Milwaukee

PAUL MISNER

PRIMAUTÉ ET INFALLIBILITÉ DU PONTIFE ROMAIN À VATICAN I ET AUTRES ÉTUDES D'ECCLÉSIOLOGIE. By Gustave Thils. *Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium* 89. Leuven: Peeters, 1989. Pp. xi + 422. Fr. b. 1850.

On one extreme are some theologians who consider the teaching of the First Vatican Council (1869–70) "an infallible mistake"; on the other

extreme are some who seemingly advocate a kind of "creeping infallibility" that effectively dogmatizes all papal pronouncements. In between are many who wonder how the doctrine of Vatican I can possibly be accepted in an ecumenical age. All concerned would do well to examine what the council really said—a task which this volume makes considerably easier.

The first quarter of this book is devoted to a treatment of "the primacy of the Roman pontiff at Vatican I." In the deft manner that has characterized his previous writings on this topic, Thils capably leads his readers through the complicated discussion of the primacy that began in the preconiliar theological commission, continued during the council, and culminated in the promulgation of *Pastor aeternus* on 18 July 1870.

To interpret *Pastor aeternus* correctly, one needs to be aware of the precise doctrines that the council fathers intended to reject; in fact, much of the discussion was in response to such long-dead "adversaries" as Gallicans, Febronians, and Richerists. One also needs to be alert to the council's vocabulary; Thils provides an excellent treatment of such pivotal phrases as "full supreme universal power," "immediate and ordinary jurisdiction," and "truly episcopal power"—terms which were not only hotly debated on the floor of the council but which have continued to be widely misinterpreted.

The second part, which is approximately one-third of the book, focuses on the "particularly allergic" topic of the "infallible magisterium of the Roman pontiff at Vatican I." Much, but not all, of the material in this part replicates material in Thils' *L'Infaillibilité pontificale: Source-conditions-limites* (1968).

The historical treatment of the discussions on infallibility in the preconiliar commissions and on the floor of the council is comparable to the preceding treatment of the primacy; the interpretive part is significantly more detailed. It is worth emphasizing that the infallibility of the Church was not really in question at Vatican I; likewise, it was generally agreed that the Church's infallibility could be exercised by the bishops, both in council or dispersed throughout the world. The crux of the debate was whether the Roman pontiff could exercise the Church's infallibility, and, if so, under what conditions. An important corollary to this discussion was the question of what constituted the "object" of such an exercise of infallibility; there was general agreement that infallibility could be exercised in regard to matters of revelation; but then as now, there was much debate about the extension of infallibility to "truths connected with revelation."

In light of the rejection of infallibility in some quarters and a resurgent infallibilism in others, these first two sections are valuable not only for their detailed explanation of what Vatican I really taught about papal

primacy and infallibility, but also what it did not teach and thus left unsettled.

A baker's dozen of "other studies on ecclesiology" are (re)published in the third part of the book. Some of these studies, such as those on the infallibility of the "ordinary papal magisterium" and "irreformable definitions," directly complement the doctrinal issues raised in the first two parts. Other studies, such as those on the papal service of universal unity and the relationship between clergy and laity, span both Vatican councils. Still others, such as those on the "international year of women," the "instruction on liberation theology," and the recent "profession of faith," address topics of current concern. After the heavy historical-theological analysis of the first two sections, readers may find these interpretive essays a welcome postlude.

Catholic University of America

JOHN T. FORD, C.S.C.

MÉMOIRE SUR L'OCCASION DE MES ÉCRITS. By Henri de Lubac, S.J. Namur: Culture et Vérité, 1989. Pp. 406. Fr.b. 1537.

This highly personal and in many ways deeply moving book went through a number of stages before reaching its present form. Based in part on diaries from the late 40s and early 50s, it was written up in a more substantial way in 1973, then corrected and expanded in 1975. A final chapter was added in 1981. An editor, G. Chatraine, is responsible for the present publication, which, unfortunately, is marred by a number of typographical and other errors.

The book is neither an autobiography nor memoirs in the ordinary sense. The focus is more narrow. It deals with L.'s publications and the occasions that provoked them. As these, however, often included broader ecclesial and secular realities, the narrative touches on a wide range of personalities and issues.

The heart of the story is the rise of the so-called *théologie nouvelle*, especially as it was associated with the Jesuits at Fourvière, and with the widespread and sometimes hysterical attacks on it that culminated in Pius XII's encyclical *Humani generis*. Although L.'s *Surnaturel* of 1946 was at the centre of the debate in the immediate postwar years, the difficulties and suspicions began much earlier. There was a resurgence of *intégrisme* in Rome and France in the mid-thirties. L.'s first publications, including *Catholicisme*, made him the object of a widespread whispering campaign that impugned both his orthodoxy and his sincerity. The very vitality of the Lyon group with its wide range of publications, including the new monograph series *Théologie*, made it appear all the more dangerous.

The book is almost evenly divided between text and notes. Rich in

historical documentation, the latter include letters that L. both sent and received, and excerpts from relevant reviews and articles. There are wonderful comments on, and anecdotes about, many of the leading theological and ecclesiastical figures of the time.

Looking back from a later affair in which he was also involved, that of Teilhard de Chardin, L. makes the claim that, on the whole, rigid and unimaginative theologians have done more harm to truth and the Church than curial bureaucrats. This certainly seems to be one of the lessons of his own experience. R. Garrigou-Lagrange and other Dominicans at the Angelicum and Charles Boyer, S.J., of the Gregorian led the attack on him and his French colleagues. The Roman theologians were reinforced in this, of course, by a chorus of like-minded colleagues in France and elsewhere. From 1950 to 1959 L. and other Jesuits suffered a kind of exile during which they were forbidden to teach or to publish without a special Roman censorship. These controls were imposed by the Jesuit General on the advice of a group of theologians.

During the almost fifteen years that the affair lasted, L. affirms that he never had a single interview on anything substantial with any authority either of the Roman Church or of his own order. Although the Jesuit General accused him on the occasion of *Humani generis* of "pernicious errors on essential points of dogma," these errors were never spelled out. L. was never asked to retract anything, nor did he ever do so. The General even forbade him to defend himself or to respond to the many distortions and manipulations to which his thought was subjected.

The book leaves the reader with little opportunity to rejoice with L. in his rehabilitation during Vatican II. As much as he was enthusiastic for the Council, he soon became pessimistic about its implementation. He was already expressing concern by 1964. In the late 60s and early 70s he spoke of the "self-destruction and internal apostasy of the Church."

Looking back at his own work, L. makes no claims of a philosophic or systematic nature. Much of what he wrote was occasional. It has no obvious cohesion. If there is a theme running through it, it is that of tradition and of its continuing vitality and relevance. It is precisely this, in his judgment, that was being abandoned in the postconciliar period.

The last chapters evoke some of L.'s great Jesuit friends, including H. Bouillard, G. Fessard, Teilhard, and J. Daniélou. He writes appreciatively of them as theologians and thinkers, but also as priests and religious. In every case, he claims that their heritage has largely been abandoned and rejected by progressive elements among the younger French Jesuits. His remarks about the treatment Daniélou received are particularly disturbing. He charges that a campaign of calumny unleashed by his confrères against him was motivated by "fratricidal hatred."

For anyone who began theology in the late 50s and who from the beginning read with excitement and enthusiasm L. and Daniélou, Chenu and Congar, the present book evokes complex emotions. One identifies with L. in his suffering at the hands of *intégristes* of every stripe and rejoices with him in his eventual triumph. It is his attitude during the postconciliar period that is the most difficult to appreciate. That there were difficulties, tension, exaggerations, even serious failings, is beyond doubt. Whatever the precise situation in the Church in France and in the French Jesuit community, however, the depth of L.'s negativity does not seem justified.

St. Michael's College, Toronto

DANIEL DONOVAN

GOD-RELATIONSHIPS WITH AND WITHOUT GOD. By J. Kellenberger. New York: St. Martin's, 1990. Pp. xi + 176. \$39.95.

Kellenberger's work is an exercise in the philosophy of religion that addresses two fundamental issues: morality and plurality. Both are treated within the context of "God-relationships" with and without God. The book falls into two parts. The first, working within a Western theistic framework, approaches morality in light of Kierkegaard's category of individual God-relationships but goes beyond the Dane in drawing lineaments of an ethics of such relationships. K's question is this: What is the appropriate praxis for a believer and how attain deeper understanding of that praxis? Kierkegaard's understanding of the individual's faith-relationship is explored and the agony it faces when perceived individual duties and "universal ethical duties" conflict. Kierkegaard's Abraham is contrasted with Charles Manson, who was inspired to murder. Finally, K. suggests that an ethics of faith-relationships should be grounded in analogy with the ethics of interhuman relationships and differentiates such an ethics from conventional guilt and shame moralities.

In the second section, where his concern is religious diversity, K. examines relationships to God and to "Divine Reality" in "non-Western and non-theistic" religions. K. expands the category "God-relationship" to include relationships to God or Divine Reality distinguishable from faith-relationships and contends that faith-relationships to the same Divine Reality can exist in various religions even if believers hold incompatible conceptions of the Divine. To deal with non-theistic religions that do not relate to Divine Reality in terms of faith, K. invokes the more elusive category of "abiding relationship" defined by praxis, not belief, and perhaps escaping consciousness. This category is not reserved for non-theistic religions. Relationship, then, which transcends clashing religious claims is for K. the key to the intelligibility and authenticity of

all religions and exorcises the arrogance of exclusivism and the imperialism of inclusivism. To show the greater adequacy of his view, K. exposes the inadequacies of other theories: Braithwaite's non-cognitivism, Rahner's implicit faith, Hick and Cantwell Smith's common core, Whittaker's logical indeterminacy. Do the first and last belong here? Is K.'s own view not really part of the other three?

With admirable lucidity K. maps out the intricacies of these issues, and his own approach. Because the two are but loosely tied by K.'s categories of relationship, either part of the book makes for rewarding reading independently of the other. The complexity of the issues, however, drops us into a thicket of difficulties. It seems fair to admit that the duty of a God-relationship can be paradoxical, at odds with conventional ethics. But K. does not clearly arrive at a criteriology to separate a knight of faith from a king of helter-skelter. How discern hyperethical and unethical, heroic and heinous? Is such a criteriology restricted to situational, utilitarian analyses or is there room for deontological considerations? These questions do not surface.

In considering religious plurality, K.'s attempt, similar to Hick's, to locate a common element in all religious, viz. a relationship to the Divine, is beset by two difficulties. First, his distinction between faith-relationships and abiding relationships blurs. K.'s understanding of faith seems at times confined to affirmation (*fides quae*), whereas others could easily accept K.'s abiding relationship, difficult to distinguish from *fides qua*, as integral to their understanding of faith. And can Advaita Hinduism and Theravada Buddhism be understood in terms of relationship without equivocation? K. acknowledges this problem but does not cope with it well. By far the greatest difficulty is this: Is it not at best premature and at worst a misguided, parochial Enlightenment epistemological assumption to think that we can adopt the stance of universal reason, stand outside traditions, understand reports of certain experiences from within as the results of the way their link to the Divine (the noumenal?) is captured in their culturally conditioned categories, then proceed to translate these phenomena without remainder into our categories, even into universal categories? Symbol systems cannot be sniffed out in their pure state much as the muzzled truffle hunter might scent the precious object of its search. It is less theological propositions than symbols that diversify religions. Yet K. allows both truth claims and symbols to recede so much that the traditions ultimately appear contentless, their legitimacy reduced to private, suprahistorical relationships. Pluralism appears illusory. Such an approach seems dead-ended. Relationship to the Divine can only be *in* the messy religious particularities that fire hearts and win minds.

"You have to blow through the narrow end of the shofar if you want to be heard far."

Loyola University, New Orleans

STEPHEN J. DUFFY

THE VOICE FROM THE WHIRLWIND: THE PROBLEM OF EVIL AND THE MODERN WORLD. By Stephen J. Vicchio. Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1989. Pp. vi + 326. \$19.95.

Vicchio's dissertation asks the usual question about God and evil: how can the existence of evil be reconciled with that of an all-good, all-knowing, and all-powerful God? His introduction sets up a three-part standard for judging the adequacy of any philosophical or theological answer: it must be true to the tradition from which the problem originates, logically consistent, and take the individual sufferer seriously.

V. spends most of the work showing how most theodicies fail his test. He sets up three types of theodicies: monistic religions of dissolution, where suffering is dissolved in illusion (Brahmanic Hinduism); religions of solution, where ethical dualism allows freedom of choice and the problem is solved by choosing "the good god" (Zoroastrianism and Platonic thought); and religions of paradox, so named because they attempt in various ways to resolve apparent contradiction between the all-good God and evil (Judaism, Christianity).

Religions of the first two types are quickly dispatched. But in a lengthy analysis, V. argues that the traditional Western theodicies of the third type also fail by his standard. Some of these are the familiar ones: suffering is either warning to the just or deserved punishment for sin (Pentateuch), a byproduct of freedom historically misused (the Fall: Augustine), deprivation of an intrinsic good (Augustine, Grisez), or a logical requirement of finite creation (Leibniz). V. finds merit in teleological theodicies which argue that moral quality often results from evil, or that evil will result in good in a future harmony (John Hick). These need only overcome their failure to be sensitive to the victims of suffering.

V. turns to Job for the beginning of an acceptable teleological theodicy. For V., Yahweh's answer out of the whirlwind shows Job that God has not been testing him or warning him or punishing him for his sins; rather, God is "challenging Job's comprehension of the original governing structure of the universe." Job's "seeing" God (Jb 42:5) is a realization of the mystery of the cosmos: God is creator, sustainer, and owner of Job and the universe. With this realization, Job abandons all philosophical theodicy for an existential relation of obedience and "trust that God does have a teleological view by which evil will be overcome."

In a way unclear to me, Job's realization satisfies V.'s test for a good

theodicy. Nevertheless, V. finds the Christian answer goes well beyond Job. Not only does the Christian share Job's realization and trust, but he also receives the Good News that God has reconciled Himself and humanity in Christ's self-sacrificing love. By sharing in Christ's self-giving, the sufferer also shares in Christ's power to transform his experience of evil into an occasion for good, and to see the future order of possibility of an end to evil. Sharing in Christ's suffering thus enables the sufferer to endure and indeed to transcend suffering. The answer to suffering is again not found in a theoretical theodicy; it is found in an existential relation with Christ, and only in the practical response of sharing in his victory in the battle against evil.

In stressing the deficiencies of all philosophical theodicies in answering the problem of evil, and in opting for the existential encounter with Christ in his kenotic love as the only completely adequate answer, V. is to be commended for his bold stand. Nevertheless, the corpus of his work is disappointing.

V. wages theoretical battles that rival in quality the philosophizing he rejects. But perhaps his greatest weakness is his own apparent logical inconsistencies: (1) He states that religions of solution outside Christianity attempt to solve the problem of evil, yet the problem is peculiarly Judeo-Christian. (2) He argues that a good theodicy must be true to the tradition from which the problem originates, yet rejects non-Christian theodicies in part because they describe a God that is not like the Judeo-Christian God. (3) He finds in Job an acceptable theodicy, yet finds it falls short by Christian standards. (4) He argues that any Christian solution must be faithful to that tradition. But does this not reject without a hearing any creative thinking that might try to improve upon that tradition? (5) He rejects numerous theodicies for being logically inconsistent and even contradictory, only to lead us in the end to his own solution that we are asked to trust is neither.

V.'s book reads like the dissertation that it is, heavily dependent on footnotes and the ideas of others. V. would have done better simply to have developed at greater length his own Christian theodicy, insightful as it is, and not tried to give it universal proportions he found difficult to support.

Saint Joseph's University, Phila.

MARTIN R. TRIPOLE, S.J.

REASON FOR HOPE: THE SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY OF WOLFHART PANNENBERG. By Stanley J. Grenz. New York: Oxford University, 1990. Pp. ix + 279. \$32.50.

For over a decade now Pannenberg has declared his intention of engaging in one of theology's classical tasks by writing a systematic presentation of Christian doctrine centered on God. Designed as a trilogy,

his project is now underway. Volume 1 of *Systematische Theologie* has already been published in German and is currently being translated into English, the other two volumes are in preparation. The major divisions of P.'s systematics are foundational issues such as natural philosophy, history of religion, and revelation, which prepare for the doctrine of God three and one, and the unfolding of the doctrine of God in creation/anthropology, christology, ecclesiology, and eschatology. What makes this project so noteworthy, besides the perennial need of Christian thought to state in ever new contexts the wholeness of its vision, is P.'s consistent conviction that theology must be a public discipline, winning rather than assuming its starting point, and demonstrating the illuminating power of the idea of God over all reality, including and even especially secular reality. The core motif of this systematic theology, then, is the attempt to give reason for the christian hope (1 Pet 3:15), a motif which is no stranger to catholic theology with its insistence on the alliance of faith and reason.

The appearance of Grenz's book is quite timely. It offers a synopsis of the contents of all three volumes of the *Systematische Theologie* and a careful mapping of its major lines of argument. It links the systematics with the methodology P. charted in previous works, and tests for coherence. It tracks P.'s debates with his English-speaking critics and shows how certain positions now subtly shift as a result of the conversation. Grenz describes his overall purpose as descriptive and at this he admirably succeeds, providing the theological community with an introduction and guide to P.'s systematics in print and yet to come.

One of Grenz's sources is obviously the German edition of volume 1 of the systematics, which he quotes in his own translation. While volumes 2 and 3 have yet to appear, their content formed the subject matter of P.'s lectures in Munich in 1987-88, which Grenz attended. These lectures are the other source which he draws upon and, while certain aspects may yet be considerably enhanced when actually worked upon for publication, we have it on P.'s own authority that "the main outline and the general thrust of the argument will remain as it is presented in this book" (Foreword). In fact, while poking good fun at the typical American desire to be always ahead of time, P. states his gratitude to Grenz for the book and affirms, "Concerning the overall synthesis of my theology, it provides a correct picture." We may read with confidence, then, and be guided into a unique synthesis of the Christian faith.

According to Grenz's presentation, while some familiar themes reappear in the systematics, there are new insights aplenty and new contextualizations of former arguments. E.g., P. criticizes the rejection of natural theology in modern protestantism which resulted in its losing its public starting point; he argues for the importance of the history of

religions as the arena where the truth of God is won; he develops a theology of the trinitarian relations as the basis for the unity of God's being and attributes; he employs field theory of natural science to describe the Spirit's presence in creation and human life; he moves beyond a strict 'from below' approach of the earlier christology to incorporate insights from the doctrine of God; he proposes an ecumenical ecclesiology and an ecumenical sacramental spirituality to serve not only the churches but the hope of humanity. All this and much more is typically shaped by a penetrating eschatological orientation.

At the end of each section describing a unit of the systematics, Grenz outlines major issues raised by P.'s synthesis and raises pivotal questions from his critics. The adequacy of the appeal to eschatology to deal with the problem of evil, for example, or the compatibility of human freedom with the idea of God as the power of the future are points already debated which are sure to go another round in the light of their new treatment. Grenz's fine and useful book will serve its purpose of introducing and guiding the reader through P.'s systematic theology long after the three volumes have found their way onto scholarly shelves.

Catholic University of America

ELIZABETH A. JOHNSON

JESUS AND THEOLOGY: CRITIQUE OF A TRADITION. By Jens Glebe-Möller. Translated from the Danish by Thor Hall. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. xi + 196.

This sequel to Glebe-Möller's *A Political Dogmatic* (1987) is an exciting and successful attempt at sketching the lines of a Christology capable of addressing the social and political challenges facing Christianity as well as our world. This volume stands on its own as a needed critique of an often hegemonic Christological status quo found in much contemporary European and North American theology. G. argues that much contemporary theology suffers under the influence of a certain "theological code" that has spiritualized or explained away the central social and political significance of Christianity and the Gospel-message. His main theological point is to develop a trenchant critique of this "theological code" by putting forward a Christology that is socially and politically responsible.

G.'s opening chapters treat questions regarding modern biblical exegesis and biblical Christology, examine questions of spirituality in relation to praxis, and survey Christologies written in non-mainstream contexts (e.g., Black, Asian and Latin American). Chapters five and six constitute two historical "testing-grounds" (Chalcedon and Luther respectively) for G.'s Christology, chapter seven represents a positive statement of his views, and the last chapter tests them in the face of challenges arising from the contemporary "neo-religiosity" of syncretistic "youth religions" and the body consciousness of "new body religions."

The theological core to G.'s critique is found in chap. 2, where he creatively and convincingly elaborates the gospel-praxis of Jesus. G.'s analysis here is heavily indebted to the exegetical work of Fernando Belo, especially *A Materialist Reading of the Gospel of Mark*. G. establishes a threefold typology of Jesus' praxis: Jesus the "actant" engaged in the "hands' praxis," the "feet's praxis" and the "eyes' praxis." Praxis of the hands denotes that Jesus evidenced a high regard for the "material" aspects of life. Two important aspects of Jesus' activities are recognized and retrieved, Jesus' healing the sick and feeding the hungry, both understood in a material or physical sense. The "theological code" that has developed and dominated the Christian centuries has read the praxis of Jesus' hands in a primarily "spiritual" manner.

The praxis of the feet involves two points, of which the first denotes Jesus' "wanderings" in Palestine. The praxis is "geographically" defined. Jesus' travels set a material-cum-theological trajectory for his message which is first delivered in Galilee, then in Judea, and finally in Jerusalem, with a goal to reach the Gentile world. The latter was attained not by Jesus himself, but by his followers. G. argues (with Belo) that the praxis of the feet represents the actions of Jesus as displacing any and all previous "codes" throughout the land (Jewish) and beyond (non-Jewish). The prevailing family, religious and social "codes" are destroyed by Jesus' praxis. Blood no longer defines relationships, but rather, brother- and sisterhood. There is no longer master and slave, male and female. All are unified in a new "code" of solidarity in Christ. Only one fellowship remains—that of the bread of Jesus Christ.

The second point to the praxis of the feet is that Jesus separated himself both from the multitudes who wished to make him their political and religious leader and from his opponents who wished to do him in. G. argues that Jesus' withdrawing from both supporters and opponents demonstrates his perception that what he is about is not to be identified with the established orders of power. Jesus required time apart from the peoples in order to hear the profound reaches of the call he was following. Praxis of the feet, in sum, represents Jesus' action of countering opponents by contradicting their "codes" and by withdrawing into the radical depth of the call from God.

At this point G. states that the first praxis is love, the second is hope, and the third, "the eyes' praxis," is faith. What does G. mean? He writes that "Faith consists in learning from Jesus to break with the prevailing social codes and 'read' his praxis as a salvation of life and body—as feeding of the multitudes, as 'blessing'—which ultimately issues in the emergence of the collective Son of man on earth" (35). Here faith is the theological virtue of transition from Jesus as "actant" to ourselves as "actants," as followers of Jesus carrying on the praxis of hands and feet.

There is no hiatus between faith and action in this praxis of the eyes. Seeing (believing) is doing the love and hope of Jesus.

G. argues that the foregoing reading of the Gospel has not developed in Christian theological tradition or in church praxis. What emerged in the tradition is a "theological code" (Belo calls it "le théologique") which has all but eclipsed the praxis reading of the Gospel. G. sums up the "theological code" in three theses: (1) it reinterprets the necessary but incidental death of Jesus as predestined, (2) it reinterprets the collective and eschatological concept, Son of man, in an individualized manner and applies it exclusively to Jesus, and (3) it reinterprets salvation to designate a future and spiritual reality to the exclusion of present and material realities. G. argues that much of contemporary theology exhibits a break between praxis and theology, a gap between the praxis of Jesus as found in the NT and "correct teaching" ("orthodoxy") as found in the churches. G.'s excellent and challenging Christology aims at redressing this situation.

G.'s first-class work will command the attention of all who are interested in contemporary Christology, contextual theology, or political and liberation theologies devoted and committed to action for justice in our world. It also deserves the attention of Scripture scholars because of G.'s careful examination of biblical exegesis and his own use of current biblical scholarship.

Loyola University, New Orleans

STEPHEN J. SCHÄFER

REASON INFORMED BY FAITH: FOUNDATIONS OF CATHOLIC MORALITY. By Richard M. Gula, S.S. New York: Paulist, 1989. Pp. iv + 334. \$12.95.

The casuistry of the modern moral manuals used in theological faculties up until Vatican II can be critiqued in light of the scientific ideal of reason upon which it was based. In imitation of the mathematician, the casuist solved moral problems by deduction from self-evident principles. Within such a paradigm, natural-law arguments assured a high level of universality and communicability of moral norms. This methodology served the pedagogical role of the manuals within post-Tridentine priestly formation. However, with the dissolution of the Enlightenment's notion of science, the starting point for moral reflection is no longer the autonomy of reason; the principle of moral knowledge is *ratio fide illuminata*.

The mediation of faith and reason is the starting point for Gula's book, and it is brought to bear on a survey of topics in fundamental moral theology. G. covers familiar ground in an easy-to-read style: the nature, task and context of moral theology; the relation of faith and morality;

freedom, sin, and conscience; Scripture, discipleship, natural law, magisterium, the human act, and moral discernment. True to G.'s pedagogical purpose, the text is filled with examples from daily life, literature, Scripture, papal documents, and his trademark diagrams.

G. draws on the epistemological insights of Bernard Lonergan to provide the key for a more nuanced treatment of the relationship between faith and reason. Only a naive theory of revelation would draw normative claims directly from the *fides quae*. The content of faith does not replace moral reason, but informs it by acting as reason's presupposition. "The convictions we have about God form the presuppositions of the moral life" (44). This is not understood in any sectarian way; within the Catholic tradition, those convictions are in harmony with reason (DS 3009). The critical-dialectical relationship between faith and reason also guarantees the communicability of moral norms; though informed by faith, normative statements must be adequate to experience. Guided by a postmodern conception of rationality sensitive to the preconditions of human reason, G. deftly steers a middle course between the Scylla of a purely autonomous ethic and the Charybdis of a sectarian faith ethic.

Secondly, the philosophical turn to the subject has an immediate effect on the understanding of the moral norm. The personalist foundation of the norm legitimized by Vatican II is distinguished from the neo-scholasticism of the manuals. The latter had been under the influence of the legal-canonical categories of Alphonse Ligouri; Christian morality was equated with minimalism. In contrast G. sketches a "personalistic morality of responsibility" (74). Here he unites the early literature on the theory of the fundamental option (Håring) and the recent developments in virtue ethics (Hauerwas). Our individual actions manifest the basic direction of our lives, and conversely, our orientation in life provides the key with which to unlock the meaning of individual actions. Clearly, then, the moral enterprise is not limited to the performance of right actions, but relates to the formation of character. Choices follow from and confirm character. Further, character is nurtured by the narratives and stories of the communities of which we are a part.

Finally, G.'s focus on epistemology and his understanding of the moral norm is carried through in the analysis of the moral act. The tradition reduced the metaphysic of the act to what could be seen. Central to the tradition was the *finis operis*, or what was done. Similar to Lonergan's analysis of the shift from the classical to an historical worldview, what is required is a renewed metaphysic of the act. Under G.'s more personalist categories, the focus shifts to the *finis operantis*, or the purpose of the act. "What" is done must be interpreted in light of "why" it is done. It would be a disastrous misunderstanding of the renewal to equate this analysis with subjectivism or consequentialism. Rather, a more critical

analysis of the act means that the moral meaning of the act is knowable only in light of all the transcending religious and anthropological presuppositions of human reason.

G.'s volume is a valuable addition to fundamental moral reflection. He has produced a contemporary manual. Clearly, his synthesis of the recent renewal of moral theology will benefit any student; it will be particularly helpful for seminarians. But more importantly, this book tackles the central problem of theological epistemology and invites professional moralists to give more attention to how reason informed by faith provides a foundation for a moral methodology.

Kenrick-Glennon Seminary, St. Louis THOMAS R. KOPFENSTEINER

RESPONSIBILITY AND ATONEMENT. By Richard Swinburne. New York: Oxford/Clarendon, 1989. Pp. 213. \$49.95; \$14.95.

Nine years ago, Swinburne completed a trilogy which sought to rationally justify belief in God. Now the philosopher of religion begins a new project and presents the first of four volumes on specific Christian doctrine. If the present work is any indication, the remaining volumes on God, revelation and providence ought to be engrossing.

S. offers us an analysis of the moral relationship between God and humanity. His first part considers the nature of a moral relationship; the second, its theological consequences. The first presumes that some actions are morally good and others morally bad; the second, that there is a God, in fact, the God of the Christians. On these grounds, S. demonstrates the rational considerations of the moral life in a Christian context.

S. begins with a discussion of moral goodness and differentiates such concepts as praise and blame, objective and subjective goodness, goodness of acts and of character, obligation and supererogation, favors and creative acts, etc. The distinctions are clear, accessible, and correct. In particular, S. discusses subjective goodness and badness and rightly argues that the condition of each is not dependent on their objective counterparts. The determination of both depends not on the agent's successes, but on the agent's efforts: "The most praise belongs to the action (or inaction) for which most effort was needed to overcome contrary desire; the most blame belongs to the action (or inaction) which could have been avoided with little effort" (49).

S. goes on to argue that moral responsibility depends on the existence of free will. He deals at length with the consequences for the moral standing of the agent whose actions are subjectively or objectively good or bad. These consequences are respectively merit, guilt, and punishment. S. concludes his first part by describing our human condition which has

as its "strongest desire of all, which influences us to fail to fulfill our obligations," "the desire to rest, sloth." Goodness, therefore, is trying to overcome the desire; badness is succumbing to it. Finally, S. contends that sloth, which is our proneness to objective wrongdoing, is "genetically transmitted."

On the assumption that there is a God who has acted as Christians believe, Part 2 argues that "the moral worth of man is very much lower than it would otherwise be, for he fails to perform obligations which he would not otherwise have; but his prospects for the future are infinitely brighter" (123). He asserts that given God, we have more duties, but that supererogatory acts remain. He rejects absolute tutorialism. S. returns here to the theme of our genetically transmitted slothfulness, examining its relationship to Adam. He describes our redemption and the conditions for our atonement, rather meaningfully suggesting that we avail ourselves of the "ram caught in a thicket." S. depicts life as either an ascent through acts of responsibility, supererogation, and atonement or as a descent in which failing to try we lose all appreciation of the good. Finally S. considers the last things.

The work has some flaws. S. refuses to use inclusive language. The reductionism of the human condition to genetics is disturbing (one wonders which genetic sequence bears our proneness to wrongdoing). The final pages, which consider the future of good pagans, babies, and those of unsettled character, are at times theologically quaint. But the chapter on guilt is the most problematic. Though S. rightly distinguishes subjective guilt from objective guilt, still he argues that objective guilt also makes one "unclean" (74). This section needs greater development. Certainly the theological writings of Thomas Aquinas on excusing the erroneous conscience, of Franz Boeckle on sin, and of Josef Fuchs on the distinction between repentance for sin and regret for unintended wrong action would have helped.

Despite any flaws, this is a compact and cogent work, which generates as many ideas as it does distinctions. It gives access to moral descriptions through rational considerations, which exhibit extraordinary sophistication and care. Rightly it confirms that we can and must overcome those "primitive standards" by which we equate our moral goodness with the objective success of our actions. Moreover, it illustrates the richness of any project which entertains both philosophical and theological reflections. At a time when constructive engagement between moral theology and ethical philosophy is again possible, S. has produced an exemplary work. Not only that, it demonstrates the end of an era in which clarity in moral reflection was only attained by abandoning religious beliefs.

MEDICAL ETHICS: SOURCES OF CATHOLIC TEACHINGS. By Kevin D. O'Rourke, O.P. and Philip Boyle, O.P. St. Louis: Catholic Health Association of the United States, 1989. Pp. iii + 337.

"What does the Church teach?" This question almost invariably surfaces in discussions of biomedical-ethical issues when one of the participants is a Roman Catholic. The questioner, Catholic or non-Catholic, may have a variety of motives: seeking assurance about a personal ethical quandary, testing the speaker's orthodoxy, the limits of permissibility, uncovering the theological roots of one's reasoning or seeking guidance in the cacophonous and relativistic environment of today's ethical discourse. Whatever the motive, the questioner deserves an informed answer.

To respond vaguely, defensively, or to "wing it" on dim recollections of a college course in ethics is a disservice to the Church and the questioner. No Catholic, for want of familiarity with the content of Church teaching, should lose the opportunity to give witness to what faith, Scripture, tradition and the teaching Church can contribute to current ethical concerns or, more important, to the formation of a right conscience about medical-moral matters.

Until now it has been difficult to find the relevant Church statements in one place, as well organized, and well selected as they are in this volume by two of our most distinguished Catholic medical moralists. This compendium makes it possible for Catholics and non-Catholics to have access to what the Church actually teaches on a wide variety of crucial contemporary medical-ethical issues. Excuses for not being informed will henceforth be difficult to find.

O'Rourke and Boyle have chosen fifty-one topics and provided an average of two or three statements for each, drawn from a wide variety of sources: Papal Encyclicals and Allocutions, Papal Commissions, Vatican Council II, Pastoral letters and other statements of Bishops' conferences and Instructions and Declarations of Sacred congregations. These documents, as the authors emphasize, are of varying degrees of authority but they cover most of the crucial issues, from abortion, euthanasia, in vitro fertilization and withdrawing food and fluid, to National Health Insurance, informed consent, pain relief, suffering and right to health care—to name a few. The range of topics should give the lie to Catholics and non-Catholics alike who accuse the Church of being interested only in reproduction, sexuality and the negative admonitions of the Ethical and Religious Directives for Catholic Health Facilities.

The statements are presented without commentary, but happily they are introduced by two invaluable introductory chapters, one devoted to

the values underlying Church teachings and the other to the crucial relationship of those teachings to the formation and operation of individual conscience. Given the misunderstandings about the ethical foundations for the Church's authoritative teaching as well as its application in concrete and particular human decisions, these chapters are an essential propaedeutic to the actual texts.

O. and B. remind us here that the Church derives its teachings from sacred Scripture, tradition and logical reflection. They fix the foundations of Christian medical ethics in the nature of the human person, particularly in the personalism of Pope John Paul II. The Christian concept of the person generates some of the essential characteristics of Christian health-care ethics—its emphasis on both community and subsidiarity, the meanings it gives to illness, death, dying, and suffering, and the place of human sexuality and family within the larger context of the Christian life.

The second introductory chapter is particularly relevant to a proper reading of the actual documents. Here the importance of individual conscience and its formation are concisely set forth. The dependence of the concept of conscience on a theory of the good is clarified. Theories based solely on feelings, divine command, autonomy, law or custom are rejected. The interaction of reason and affect in the operations of conscience is highlighted. The components of conscience, the fallacies to which it is subject and the way it is illuminated by faith are well outlined. Criteria are suggested for assessing the authority to be accorded different kinds of Church documents. Finally, the necessity of internal assent to Church teachings and the delicate issue of when assent might be withheld are sensitively treated.

The range of topics, their timeliness, general reasonableness and firm grounding in Christian values is impressive. These texts belie the dismissal of Church teachings as narrow, negative, monolithic, and conscience-numbing pronouncements out of touch with real-world dilemmas. They show, too, how urgent is the need to update the 1971 Ethical and Religious Directives with the rich resources to be found in more recent teachings.

Catholics should read and keep these statements at hand whether or not they work in Catholic health-care institutions. Not to take advantage of these teachings in forming our consciences and making our decisions is to risk serious error. Our critics and friends outside our faith community should read them too.

Georgetown University

EDMUND D. PELLEGRINO, M.D.

PHILOSOPHICAL FINESSE: STUDIES IN THE ART OF RATIONAL PERSUASION. By Martin Warner. New York: Oxford/Clarendon, 1989. Pp. x + 401. \$64.

Warner's book concerns a problem ubiquitous in 20th-century philosophy. Heirs of Descartes, living in an age of triumph for the physical sciences and theories of logic, we find it hard to believe in the validity of any philosophic endeavor that cannot state conclusions valid according to canons of deductive logic. Yet limiting philosophy to deductive reasoning has radically shrunk the universe of philosophic discourse and exiled many contemporary thinkers to other fields, in which, it is fair to add, many have received a hearing, flourished, and contributed much to our store of insight and knowledge of the human condition.

The rise of rhetoric as theory of argument rather than as the study of decorative tropes is one response to the dilemma of formally flawless vacuousness or formally imperfect conclusions about substantive matter. W.'s philosophical "finesse," a term taken from Pascal, is a mode of argument which incorporates a dialectical testing of first principles, as found in Aristotle's *Rhetoric* and *Topics*, and the achieving of objectivity by a multiplication of perspectives, a technique derived from Nietzsche. The whole is discovered and elaborated in the course of a detailed analysis of relevant texts in eight chapters—the "studies" of the subtitle. Chapter 1 is an introductory discussion of Descartes and "the disposition to geometrize." Chapters 2–3 examine "classical models of rationality": Plato, Aristotle and Cicero. Chapters 5–7 are devoted to Pascal, Hume and Nietzsche; and chap. 8 summarizes under the title "Philosophical Finesse." Finesse results from merging head and heart (a rhetorical commonplace we might note), implying that the absence of heart is the mark of rational deduction, and that heart is thus what has been missing in this century's deductive systems.

The one unusual feature of W.'s approach (in this reviewer's experience at least) can be found in his extended discussion of the Book of Job, in which he emphasizes Job's "integrity," a kind of refusal to relinquish rationality, according to W., that is a feature of Job's insistence on his innocence of sin; and the ultimate recognition at the end that humankind cannot know God's reasons—that is, ultimate premises are rooted in experience and cannot be proven. But that experience yields premises/conclusions as valid as those of deductive systems, and thus they are not irrational.

Because the limiting of rational discourse to matter which can be encompassed by a deductive system has shrunk the realm of philosophy in the first half of our century, the second half has seen desperate efforts to reclaim rationality for the recalcitrant matters that really "matter" to

us. W. cites writers who have addressed the problem by affirming anti-rationality, such as Stanley Fish who, W. tells us, places dialectic on the side of antirationality in his notion of the "self-consuming artifact." Clearly Fish has failed to reclaim reason. Derrida, he points out, has deconstructed texts in a text which can and will be itself deconstructed, canceling its own performance. W. prefers Pascal's "reasons of the heart," which as finesse "complement the demonstrative 'geometric' conception of rationality."

W. offers a most interesting treatment of a perennial philosophic problem, manifesting itself in this century in the commonplace terms "head and heart," "reason and emotion," "fact and value," "cognitive and emotive," etc. However, the discussion is curiously theoretical; i.e., it is hard to see how finesse would work, or indeed does work. If there are serious, learned philosophers addressing questions of moral and/or political significance today, is finesse their method? Ch. Perelman, cited briefly by W., uses judicial (or forensic) rhetoric as a model for rational argument, and the fact that judicial systems *require* judges to render judgment to furnish a non-mathematical-deductive premise appropriate to human affairs; in other words, he offers a methodological tool to replace the inappropriate logical model. R. P. McKeon devised semantic matrices that spoke to the problem of understanding philosophic inquiry and social and political action across barriers of time and culture. W. focuses, rather, on recovering "rational discourse" as a term for designating inquiry into and discussion of human affairs, of what was, for Aristotle, practical rather than theoretic science; thus Pascal's "reasons of the heart."

What emerges is that finesse designates a group of characteristics the individual items of which may be found, e.g., in the approaches of some contemporary philosophers: Castaneda's simplicity of theory, Wisdom's particular reasoning, and others. But most important, W. reiterates, is the "full Nietzschean totality, . . . reason, senses, feeling and will." It would seem, then, that finesse as a way of "doing" philosophy has been engaged in for some time. W. has named it and its ancestry, analyzed its purpose, its capacities and its value.

It seems to me that rhetorical theories of argument are not given their proper due in the book; nevertheless, in deriving his conviction that philosophy can seriously seek truth in areas poorly served by deductive methods, from the rigorous examination of seminal thinkers, W. does philosophy a genuine service.

RELIGIOUS AESTHETICS: A THEOLOGICAL STUDY OF MAKING AND MEANING. By Frank Burch Brown. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University, 1989. Pp. xvi + 225. \$27.50.

Brown's agenda is a large one: he endeavors to demonstrate the intimate relevance of art to religion and of aesthetic analysis to theology. He seeks to enlarge a relatively esoteric discussion of the relationship of religion to the arts—popular and so-called “high” arts—by definitions of art and religion that reveal their interdependence. Although his focus is on the Christian traditions, he also endeavors to offer arguments and methodology that advance “the study of religion in all its forms,” and ultimately, that address “people more generally engaged in thinking about the humanities, culture, religion, and the arts” (xiii). In seeking such a broad audience, B. runs the risk of addressing no one in particular, but the book successfully overcomes that risk, primarily by the dexterous use of many examples from music and the visual arts, examples that are both interesting in themselves and that illustrate his points well.

On the one hand, B. argues against the aesthetic “purism” implicit in the well-known “duck/rabbit” interpretation of religion and art, in which “one can see the figure either as a rabbit (religion) or as a duck (art) but not as both at the same time” (27). On the other hand, in response to attempts to integrate by subordinating religion to art, or art to religion, he formulates with considerable skill “a religious aesthetic, or a theology of art and beauty, that could have the weight of a theological ethic” (29).

The recognition that responsible theology must examine religious art rests on his demonstration that the communication of religious meaning necessarily and irreducibly entails the use of artistic forms, and that “religious meanings conveyed within an aesthetic milieu can never fully be captured apart from that milieu” (76). “Religion may [therefore] have no option but to become in part aesthetic and artistic” because “markedly artistic forms seem best able to affect us in the totality of our being” (102).

The questions with which this thoughtful book deals are not easy ones, e.g. the vexed question of the role of taste in religious art: “Is there such a thing as Christian taste?” Is there a sense in which bad taste entails moral liability or sin? B. handles these and other difficult debates with considerable deftness, humility, and helpfulness. He does so, to his great credit, without collapsing into the very elitist intellectualist stance he questions. He is as critical—not to say judgmental—of the “sin” of the aesthete as that of the philistine and the intolerant; and he is distinctly more judgmental of these than he is of the indiscriminate, whose taste he finds “easiest to forgive” (156).

Although his project is not primarily to examine concretely the social location of particular forms of Christian art, his commitment is to a

“critical pluralism—both in religion and art” (174). He advocates recognition of issues of ethnicity, gender, race, and class: “If we want to follow the modern Protestant theologian Paul Tillich and say that art is an expression of ultimate concern, we must ask whose ultimate concern it expresses” (84). Aware of the divisive as well as the unitive capacities of art, he urges recognition of, and discussion about, “the varieties of religious aesthetic experience” (112 f.).

Throughout the book, B. argues for a “neo-aesthetics” which would include “basic theoretical reflection regarding all aesthetic phenomena, including their modes of significant interrelation with, and mediation of, what is not inherently aesthetic: abstract ideas, useful objects, moral convictions, class conflicts, [and] religious doctrines” (22). He also undertakes to initiate and provide guidelines for such exploration.

Readers whose interest in religion and art tends to the figurative or productive may have difficulty with his philosophical discussions of such matters as Kantian theory of representation; those whose interest lies more in the direction of philosophical theology, art history, or aesthetics may find his agenda so inclusive as to border on the “indiscriminate.” Readers, however, who value perceptive integrative discussion of the practice and theory of religion and art will be benefited by B.’s well-argued suggestion that religion and art must learn to engage in “mutually transformative, dialogical relationship.”

Harvard University Divinity School

MARGARET R. MILES

ON MORAL PERSONHOOD: PHILOSOPHY, LITERATURE, CRITICISM, AND SELF-UNDERSTANDING. By Richard Eldridge. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1989. Pp. xiv + 210. \$27.95.

Building on a heritage handed down from David Hume, most contemporary philosophy and literary criticism seem bent on debasing our humanity by denying the possibility of genuine personhood—a self-conscious volitional “I” capable of self-transcendence. Eldridge finds in the reading of imaginative literature, particularly narrative, a verification of our “sense of dignity or autonomy” even while acknowledging our “sense of our embeddedness in nature and society.” As other recent writers of this camp, e.g. George Steiner (*Real Presences*, 1989), admit, this approach will probably neither attract nor convince those otherwise inclined. This qualification notwithstanding, this is a splendid defense of our uniquely human capacity for moral self-determination—of spirit in the world, as Karl Rahner called it.

E. starts by neatly summarizing the philosophical rejection of autonomy from the 18th century to the present, suggesting that in the narrative shaping of personal experience one can find cogent and persuasive

examples of the possibility of reconciling autonomy with embeddedness. Texts become, in effect, what Lonerganian transcendental philosophy would call opportunities for self-appropriation. Next E. attempts to modify the strict and generally unacceptable Kantian autonomy with a Hegelian sense of the relationship between the individual and the community. Thus we neither stand alone shaping our own destiny nor are we, on the other hand, swallowed up by the impersonal totality of nature or society. Thus, "we can attain moral consciousness only as we see our personhood and its demands reflected to us in the lives of others that are recounted to us in narrative art, while our collective responses themselves determine narrative art's relevant and proper exemplars" (60).

E. then demonstrates how five major literary texts can serve the function just articulated. Two of them are novels, Conrad's *Lord Jim* and Jane Austen's *Pride and Prejudice*. The other three are Wordsworth's *The Prelude*, a verse narrative, and his lyric "Resolution and Independence," and finally Coleridge's "Frost at Midnight," also a lyric. E. is on surer ground and more convincing in his treatment of the two novels than he is with the Romantic texts, which he uses largely, I would suspect, because he correctly sees in Romantic thought of this type a kinship with "the transcendental psychology presupposed in Kantian moral theory" (66).

The treatment of *Lord Jim* as an example of "The Achievement of Autonomy" is an impressive analysis of the novel and an impressive study of the various moral stances humans take. Rejecting unacceptable moral stances, Conrad shows how Jim and Marlow (the internal narrator) grow in moral self-awareness. They become persons by learning to accept others as persons, not ends. With Jim, of course, this is finally achieved through a dramatic gesture of self-surrender and consequent death. How can this be achieved by ordinary persons engaged in ongoing activity?

This question is dealt with in the treatment of Wordsworth and Coleridge, two short chapters which are by contrast somewhat disappointing. The readings are less convincing and the critical context is somewhat deficient. Faced with mechanism and the Humean doctrine that a person is merely a bundle of impressions, these two writers promoted personal continuity and genuine self-expression in ongoing activity. The subject of much of Wordsworth's poetry, especially *The Prelude*, is a narrative account of growth into moral personhood by establishing the continuity of past and present and continuous development through engagement with others, the community. One must ask, however, whether in the light of Wordsworth's instinctive reclusiveness and what E. himself describes as his "overweening egoism and self-confidence" his value is diminished as an exemplar of the individual

relating to society. There is, as E. further admits, an elitism latent in Wordsworth's egalitarian project. Possible, but for the few.

The very brief treatment of Coleridge's "Frost at Midnight" is puzzling. The poem is a lyric and not a narrative. Its subject is more familial and filial love and as such is misread "for the possibilities it offers for resisting moral skepticism" (128); and neither the mood, setting, nor language suggest a speaker insecure in his relationship with either nature or society.

When he returns to fiction, *Pride and Prejudice*, E.'s argument again becomes strong. He reads the novel as a study in characters whose normal behavior is shaped largely if not exclusively by external factors, except for the two central lovers, who grope tentatively through courtship to a resolution that respects both the ideal of autonomy and reality of social embeddedness. Rejecting a romantic idea of marriage as two autonomous individuals uniting without mutual concession (or the total submission of one), E. sees in Liz and Darcy a healthy, self-enriching dialogue of giving and taking of criticism which contributes to mutual moral growth and thus in marriage the demands of both individual and society are reconciled.

The above criticisms of E.'s treatment of Wordsworth and Coleridge notwithstanding, this is a splendid book. It is well argued, informative, and thought-provoking.

College of the Holy Cross, Worcester, Mass. PHILIP C. RULE, S.J.

SHORTER NOTICES

EZEKIEL. By Joseph Blenkinsopp. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1990. Pp. 242. \$19.95.

The goal of the Interpretation Series is to present "the integrated result of historical and theological work with the biblical text" for those who "teach, preach, and study the Bible in the community of faith." Blenkinsopp's exposition of Ezekiel meets that goal well. He presents solid overviews that give a feeling for the ebb and flow of individual chapters and larger units within the book. He focuses mainly on the final form of the text, while clearly mentioning which verses are usually attributed to disciples or later editors. He brings

us, as far as possible, into the mind and heart of the prophet. Frequently he makes us pay attention to theological dimensions that we might dislike and, on our own, ignore.

B. also raises theological questions for our own era. He is sensitive to Ezekiel's insights into the meaning and force of sin, and into our modern lack of reflection on the same. He focuses on verses such as 36:22 and 38:23, both of which make the point that God fights sin because it is against His own glory and holiness. Do we consider sin this way, or do we merely experience guilt over failing to live up to commandments? Many other passages

touch on the topic of sin. We could reflect about the process of repentance outlined in 6:8-10; is it still accurate and useful now? We may be struck by the gap that exists between our own optimism about forgiveness and the stern view in chap. 9. Can we appreciate Ezekiel's detailed profiling in 18:4-9 of what it means to be morally responsible? Can we appreciate the thinking that led to the harsh image of 20:25, or are we less sensitive to what sin means?

B. also poses comprehensive overviews of larger blocks, such as chaps. 6-7. Here Ezekiel proclaimed a message of great punishment and judgment from God. Do modern Jewish and Christian readers really catch the intensity of the prophet's words? Or do we unconsciously attribute such intensity to a florid literary style or a world-denying type of spirituality? B. asks us to reconsider. Ezekiel was shaken by the destruction of Jerusalem and the exile. Are we immune to such national upheavals? Serious students of history must grant that we are not. B. well concludes, "The question . . . is whether we can summon the moral resources to live responsibly in a world that can no longer be taken for granted." Here is a clear and engaging commentary by a scholar who is also willing to risk sharing his theological ideas and his faith with his readers.

WILLIAM T. MILLER, S.J.
Gonzaga University, Spokane

CHANNELS OF PROPHECY: THE SOCIAL DYNAMICS OF PROPHETIC ACTIVITY. By Thomas W. Overholt. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. xii + 193. \$19.95.

Juxtaposing the dynamics of classical Hebrew prophecy with that of late-19th-century American Indian Ghost Dance movements might seem of questionable value, but by applying a comparative methodology to these and par-

allel phenomena, Overholt is able to place prophecy, divination, and other manifestations of mediating the divine to the human within a broad common history, and to generate an insightful set of canons by which to critique them.

His opening chapters examine Israel's prophets (especially Jeremiah) and compare them with American Indian charismatic figures, especially the western Nevada Paiute Wovoka in light of what O. sees as the common "specific components that we would expect to find in any given example of prophetic activity": revelation, proclamation based on the revelation, audience reaction, feedback from the prophet to the source of the revelation, additional revelations, additional proclamations, and supernatural confirmations. One or more of these components may be modified or even absent, but the general pattern cuts across manifestations of prophecy where- and whenever. In addition, some prophets have disciples, i.e. "one or more followers who serve as intermediaries between them and some segment of their audience." O. places special emphasis on the role of audience reaction or feedback in subsequent modifications of the prophet's message.

Discussing prophecy and divination, O. proposes that divination is really a by-form of prophecy and follows the same canons, and shows that attitudes toward divination in Israel were not much different from those in other cultures of the time. His subsequent efforts to explain or to explain away the "end of prophecy" in postexilic Israel are disappointing. O.'s final chapter, which deals with such contemporary news items as the "channeling" of Shirley MacLaine and *The Vision* of David Wilkerson, is rather odd, and does not really fit with the rest of the book or its theses.

WILLIAM J. FULCO, S.J.
Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

THE CHURCH'S BIBLE: ITS CONTEMPORARY AUTHORITY. By Darrell Jodock. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. xi + 173.

Jodock tries to break the current deadlock on biblical authority with a new theory, which he grounds in the history of existing approaches. The historical chapters provide "postmodern" readers with a schema of six "modern" approaches to biblical authority. *Rationalism* and *dynamic humanism* attack biblical authority and are not Christian. *Supernaturalists* insist on the past and continued occurrence of inbreaking miracles. *Evangelicists* emphasize the inner experience of awakening as verifying the Scriptures. *Ecclesial developmentalism* grounds biblical authority on Scripture's role in the historical continuity of the Christian community. *Analogical developmentalism* bases biblical authority "on the similarity between the biblical message and the way things happen in the world as a whole."

Without religious consensus, the Bible's helpfulness is what demonstrates its authority. The Bible has authority because it can mediate God's presence and provide the language of faith for communities that acknowledge it. J. distinguishes kerygmatic from confessional and ethical functions of Scripture, and limits authority primarily to kerygmatic proclamation. Many parties would find this too restrictive.

J. recommends that the Bible be *re-contextualized*. Through historical criticism, he reconstructs the original context. Then he tries to imagine a contemporary setting like the (hypothetical) original setting to forestall misapplication of biblical data and commands. The weakness in this approach is the hypothetical nature of these historical reconstructions.

Moreover, the Protestant deadlock over biblical authority cannot be broken by stereotyping one of the parties.

J. seems to have excluded one side of current controversies a priori, especially in using the "religious right" as a foil. For this Catholic reviewer as well, J. has not articulated a fully satisfactory contemporary theory of biblical authority, but he has laid some helpful foundations for one.

WILLIAM S. KURZ, S.J.

Marquette University, Milwaukee.

THE EMERGENCE OF THE LAITY IN THE EARLY CHURCH. By Alexandre Faivre. Translated from the French by David Smith. New York: Paulist, 1990. Pp. iii + 242. \$11.95.

Faivre's survey of the first six Christian centuries falls into three parts. The first argues the absence of a clergy-laity distinction in the first and second centuries. Thus 1 Peter is typical of the NT when it regards the *kleros*, God's chosen lot, as constituted by the entire community. Clement of Rome was the first to use the term *laikos*, but within a context of OT imagery, and both Justin and Irenaeus stressed the dignity of all Christians. Part 2 focuses on the decisive third century. Tertullian, Clement of Alexandria, and Origen witness to a two-part church while the *Apostolic Tradition* and *Didascalia* detail the division and roles of clergy and laity; Cyprian's church is invoked to exemplify how they functioned. Part 3 details the initial ambiguity of the emperor's ecclesial status wrought by Constantine's conversion, traces the reorganization of ministries into stages in a clerical career in which reduction to the lay state served as punishment, invokes figures like Lactantius and Paulinus of Nola on the issue of religion and culture, and reviews the clericalization of the monastic movement and the latter's triumph in defining the clergy.

At each stage F. highlights the place of women. He regards the injunction of silence upon them in the pastoral epis-

tles as the beginning of segregation in the church, argues that they were included among neither laity nor clergy in the third century, and suggests that the institution of deaconesses in that century was an effort to neutralize the order of widows. F.'s contention that in the NT period women performed ministerial functions without receiving the corresponding title or status needs review in light of more recent research.

The effort to synopsize at a semi-popular level research on a very broad range of topics gives this survey an occasionally disjointed character, yet the data it offers are invaluable for grasping what is contingent in current ecclesiastical arrangements. Most interesting is F.'s suggestion that economic factors lay at the origin of the clergy-laity distinction. The text offers footnotes to an introduction which has somehow been omitted.

WILLIAM P. LOEWE

Catholic University of America

ORDINATION RITES OF THE ANCIENT CHURCHES OF EAST AND WEST. By Paul F. Bradshaw. New York: Pueblo, 1990. Pp. xi + 288. \$17.50.

Bradshaw's book fills a significant gap in the study of ordained ministry. The prayers and rites of ordination have often gone unnoticed in the history and theology of Christian ministry. Moreover, this is the first time, to my knowledge, that the ordination rites of both East and West have been collected in English translation.

The book consists of two parts. The first is an extended introductory commentary on the rites and their sources in church orders and prayer books. The second contains the texts themselves. B. deals extensively with the offices of bishop, presbyter, deacon, and deaconess and rather more briefly with the minor orders. One of his greatest merits is the sophistication with which he deals with the complex sources, especially the *Apostolic Tradition* ascribed

to Hippolytus. Of great usefulness as well is B.'s treatment of untranslated secondary literature on the rites, especially the discussions of B. Botte and P.-M. Gy.

The best chapter of the introductory part is the comparative analysis of the structure of the rites. B. distinguishes carefully between the two major aspects of the ancient rites: election of the candidate and prayer over the candidate, demonstrating persuasively the gradual displacement of the former as the most significant element in the rite. With great clarity he shows how, in the West, the gesture of the imposition of the hand was detached from the accompanying prayer. He also provides appended synoptic charts showing the interrelation between the various Eastern ordination prayers, thus aiding Western readers often unfamiliar with the vagaries of the Eastern Christian traditions.

In short B. provides not only a valuable tool for the study of the history and theology of ordained ministry but also an excellent model for the comparative study of liturgy.

JOHN F. BALDOVIN, S.J.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

ST. EPHREM THE SYRIAN: HYMNS ON PARADISE. Introduction and translation by Sebastian Brock. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1990. Pp. 249.

This second major English translation within a year of the works of the fourth-century Ephrem the Syrian is highly welcome. For although E.'s reputation as a theologian and a poet has been extolled throughout the centuries, very few of his works have been readily available in English until now. This volume translates his 15 metric hymns on Paradise and his prose commentary on Genesis 2-3. It also contains a rather lengthy and very fine scholarly introduction discussing Ephrem's life, his theological vision of Paradise and his use of poetry to express his theolog-

ical insights. All of the hymns are preceded by brief summaries and are well documented.

I have found Brock's translation (based on E. Beck's critical edition) to be accurate, close to the original Syriac, and flowing smoothly in elegant English. It portrays well why E. is so esteemed as a gifted poet who can weave together metric verses that inspire our hearts as they inform our minds. I dare say that most readers will readily admit that E.'s poetic approach is by far a much more pleasant and effective way to experience and understand patristic thought than what they generally encounter in the prose works of the Fathers. For, as Brock notes, E.'s hymns exude both a freshness and immediacy that we can still appreciate in our own day.

I unreservedly recommend this edition for libraries, scholars, and those seeking to catch a rewarding glimpse of the spirit and thought of a religious, poetic genius.

FREDERICK G. MCLEOD, S.J.
Saint Louis University

MYSTAGOGY: A THEOLOGY OF LITURGY IN THE PATRISTIC AGE. By Enrico Mazza. Translated from the Italian by Matthew J. O'Connell. New York: Pueblo, 1989. Pp. xii + 228. \$14.50.

The most basic task implicit in Christian theology in every culture is to do justice at once both to Christ's divinity and his humanity. Recent Christology has clearly related the human, developmental significance of the pre-Easter Jesus to the fundamental Gospel message. The challenge remains to explain how the Christ event at one point in history is able to have divine saving value for humanity of all ages.

In this study of the great fourth-century mystagogies, Mazza argues convincingly that early Christianity, beginning in the NT itself, saw a saving presence of Christ throughout history, both before and after his Incarnation.

In fact, for M., any true Christian understanding of human activity in this world must necessarily involve one in "typology": that biblical and liturgical method of interpretation which is based upon the objective correspondence existing among the several phases of salvation history because of the universal presence and saving efficacy of Christ in his Paschal Mystery. True mystagogy, therefore, is not simply a method of catechetical instruction, but liturgical theology: a typology of the sacraments.

Studying in order the mystagogical catecheses of Ambrose of Milan, Theodore of Mopsuestia, John Chrysostom, and finally Cyril of Jerusalem (which he holds to be written most probably by John of Jerusalem), M. shows how and why a gradual progression took place, through these writers and into later history, from a theology of the participation of liturgical types in the greater reality of Christ, to one of "exaggerated realism," the absolute identification of *sacramentum* with the *res sacramenti*.

The scholarly analysis M. gives of such terms as *mysterium*, *figura*, *homoioma* and *mimesis* in these fourth-century authors lays a solid groundwork for his overall thesis. The work fills a vital gap in liturgical theology, and is recommended primarily to liturgical scholars, especially as a textbook for graduate courses in liturgy.

JOHN D. LAURANCE, S.J.
Creighton University, Omaha

THE SAXON SAVIOR: THE TRANSFORMATION OF THE GOSPEL IN THE NINTH-CENTURY HELIAND. By G. Ronald Murphy, S.J. New York: Oxford University, 1989. Pp. xii + 129. \$24.95.

Students of Germanic literature who come to the Old Saxon course are immediately taken by the vigor and spirit of the *Heliand* in contrast with Otfrid's Old High German *Krist* and even the

Old English religious epics. The poet has retold the gospel account in a style and form comparable to that of St. Mark, though in a Germanic setting.

Murphy provides a concise commentary on the "culturally transformed Gospel." Jesus is presented as a Germanic Lord, with a retinue in which Peter is chief. In M.'s interpretation the poet attempts to displace the Germanic gods by demonstrating the superiority of Jesus. Subtle touches, such as the dove settling on Jesus's shoulders after the baptism, recall the ravens on Wodan's shoulders, so that in M.'s interpretation Jesus is the new "Lord of the Runes." As in this passage, the Gospel is not falsified, possibly by substituting a more powerful bird for the dove, but its message is presented forcefully in terms that will replace the old religion by Christianity.

Similarly, doctrines that may have seemed foreign or even repellant to the Saxon audience, such as the recommendations for humility in the Beatitudes, are not glossed over. Yet at the end Jesus is presented as a "warrior leader" who through his resurrection returns triumphantly "to his own people," giving the Saxons consolation and hope of eventual victory after their disastrous defeat by the Franks under Charlemagne. By M.'s interpretation the poet in this way cleverly related the triumphant return of Jesus with a possible revival of Saxon power, achieving a powerful impact on his audience.

M. intends to provide another important contribution to contemporary understanding and appreciation of the *Heliand* in a new translation. We congratulate him for producing a work comparable to that of the poet—not archaizing, but in the fluid style of E. V. Rieu's translation of the *Odyssey* and the Gospel of St. Mark, coupled with the accuracy of Felix Genzmer's German translation.

WINFRED P. LEHMANN
University of Texas at Austin

CORRESPONDANCE DE FÉNELON 10-11: DANS LA RETRAITE, JUIN 1699-DÉCEMBRE 1702. Commentaire de Jean Orcibal avec la collaboration de Jacques Le Brun et Irénée Noye. Geneva: Droz, 1989. Pp. 303 + 332. Fr. 170

These most recently published volumes in this series include the correspondence of the Bishop of Cambrai from June 1, 1699 to Dec. 28, 1702 (vol. 10) and the commentary of Orcibal on these letters (vol. 11). The years 1699-1702 follow Fénelon's election to the Académie Française, his consecration as archbishop of Cambrai, and the "Explication des Articles d'Issy." Madame Guyon has already been imprisoned at Vincennes. Fénelon has written and published the "Explication des maximes des saints sur la vie intérieure."

This series of letters gives O. the occasion to establish a daily chronology of the activities and events of this very important period (11:273-92). To establish this table of events, the texts of the letters themselves and the commentaries demanded the minute research of veritably thousands of documents. For those who already know the admirable historical-research qualities of O., this is typical.

His most recently published volumes include letters 614 to 889. They are written both by and to the Archbishop of Cambrai. Several are from and to members of the French clergy such as M. Tronson, superior general of the Sulpicians, and, of course, P. de la Chaise. The correspondence with Rome at this time involved many cardinals such as Colleredo, Paolucci and Gabrielli. One of the Latin letters of the archbishop of Cambrai to the reigning pontiff Clement XI (March 8, 1701) pertains more directly to Fénelon's teachings on the nature of the pure love of God. He defends himself well against the condemnations of Louis XIV and Bishop Bossuet. The sympathetic attitude of Clement XI as well as many of

the Roman hierarchy is expressed in a papal letter of June 14, 1701.

A comprehensive index makes cross reference very practical. Scholars who have worked with any of the previous nine volumes in this collection will find the same level of scholarship and erudition present in these latest additions. An excellent series.

WILLIAM C. MARCEAU, C.S.B.
St. John Fisher College, N.Y.

THE THEOLOGY OF ELECTRICITY: ON THE ENCOUNTER AND EXPLANATION OF THEOLOGY AND SCIENCE IN THE 17TH AND 18TH CENTURIES. By Ernst Benz. Edited and with an introduction by Dennis Stillings. Translated from the German by Wolfgang Taraba. *Princeton Theological Monograph Series* 19. Allison Park, Pennsylvania: Pickwick Publications, 1989. Pp. xix + 104. \$12.

Magic, science, and religion are a tightly wrapped ball of sticky wire whose untangling has exercised thinkers for centuries. Consider the discoveries in the 17th and 18th century of the phenomena of electricity and magnetism and the differing approaches taken by the rationalist Benjamin Franklin and the bizarre theatrics of Franz Anton Mesmer (1734–1815), one of the doubtful influences on Sigmund Freud. "Animal magnetism," a term from the Jesuit Athanasius Kircher (1602–1687) that persists into our own times, is an example of the murky world where electricity and religion meet. On the reasoned and balanced side are devices like the pacemaker. On the controversial side would be electroshock therapy. Beyond the pale of acceptability would be modern uses of magnetism as a medical treatment.

B. treats a set of theologians who studied the discoveries in electricity and magnetism and looked for insights into theology and metaphysical psychology from the new directions science was taking in the 17th and 18th

centuries. Unfortunately, the examples he develops most thoroughly, Oetinger, Fricker, and Divisch, support the wisdom of the theologians who have withdrawn from theological speculation on science. His "electrical theologians" worked on the fringes of acceptable theology as we would nowadays consider it and really just a bit over the edge into the ridiculous.

The most fascinating part of B.'s study is his account of the interactions of Franklin and Mesmer. Franklin was a rationalist, a cautious skeptic. Yet he knew as much about electricity as anyone alive in his day and had performed innovative and personally dangerous experiments on atmospheric phenomena. Naturally, he was interested in the seemingly scientific application of magnetic concepts to medicine by Mesmer. At the request of the King of France he with a group of noted French scientists examined Mesmer's methods and claims. Their final judgment was harshly negative. Mesmer's weird approaches did not impress them. However science and theology are to mix, Mesmer's was not the road nor were the attempts of the other "electrical theologians." B. provides interesting data on how not to do theology in our day.

FRANK R. HAIG, S.J.
Loyola College, Baltimore

PHILIPPINE DUCHESNE: A WOMAN WITH THE POOR. Catherine M. Mooney, R.S.C.J. New York: Paulist, 1990. Pp. xv + 259. \$12.95.

An excellent study of a recently canonized immigrant-American frontier religious woman. Eschewing hagiography, Mooney places Philippine Duchesne's story in the context of a multicultural society in which single-minded apostolic aims involving the education of women or welfare concerns often caused misunderstanding. In particular, M. successfully reveals the depths of the struggles felt by this

pioneering Religious of the Sacred Heart in her aims to establish her Society for the sake of the poor in the newly-organized church of St. Louis. As a result, the reader draws close to the "suffering Philippine," begins to understand the psychological drawbacks imposed by both church and society, and appreciates both the working of grace within this self-deprecating woman and the scope of the incredible achievements she wrought.

Several techniques employed by M. strengthen the monograph. Her work is carefully documented; her characterization of Mother Duchesne is unembellished, thus convincing; her clear explanation of the history of canonization helps one understand why Philippine does belong among the company of saints. M. also provides examples of, and insight into, the kinds of institutional problems that confronted and discouraged Duchesne. As she points out, however, Philippine persevered—surely the mark of sanctity.

During her lifetime she was already perceived by church leaders as "worthy of canonization." In her senior years, moreover, she was allowed to share her life with the Potawatomi Indians, who also recognized her as "the woman-who-prays-always." As M. ably proves, Mother Duchesne did "race with giant strides." Thus, she remained "a force for communion and compassion" in the raucous frontier environment. We are grateful to M. for providing this approach to the life of a heroic woman.

DOLORES LIPTAK, R.S.M.

*Catholic Archival & Hist. Services
Silver Spring, Md.*

COLORADO CATHOLICISM AND THE ARCHDIOCESE OF DENVER, 1857-1989. By Thomas J. Noel. Denver: University Press of Colorado, 1989. Pp. xii + 468.

This volume focuses on the role of the clergy, particularly bishops, in the evolution of the church in Colorado, from the founding of the first parish in

Conejos to the present. Although neglecting the laity, it correctly highlights contributions made by women from over thirty religious orders and congregations (including Mother Cabrini) who have shaped the state's religious history since the 1860s. Its sources are chiefly secondary and not footnoted; data obtained in oral interviews enliven the account of the administrations of recent bishops for whom archival sources are unavailable. The final third of the book contains brief one- or two-page histories of the parishes of the archdiocese.

Although largely narrative local history, the study implies that Colorado's Catholic community has been typical of others in the U.S. Its leaders have tended to be traditionalists rather than innovators, who sought to recreate in Colorado the familiar church and practices of their places of origin. Thus, the state's first bishop, Joseph P. Machebeuf, and his fellow French priests struggled to adapt European and American traditions to the demands of the Western mining frontier. Like most turn-of-the-century church leaders, Nicholas C. Matz, his successor, wrestled with the challenge of building parochial schools while calming divisive ethnic tensions that pitted both clergy and laity against one another. The boosterism and brick-and-mortar Catholicism that was the norm in the pre-Vatican II American church found its representative in the episcopacy of Urban V. Vehr (1931-1967). His successor, James V. Casey, like many church leaders in the 1970s, closed and consolidated schools that his predecessors had opened. With its struggle to adapt to a rapidly changing world, Colorado Catholicism remains today a microcosm of the American church at large.

Some readers will be disappointed that N. has concentrated solely on local events rather than applying his skills and expertise in Western history to an interpretive analysis that places Colo-

rado Catholicism in a broad national context. Asked to write a popular history, the author concedes that "those wanting Colorado's Catholic experience tied to national and international trends will not find that here." Nicely written and beautifully illustrated with many well-chosen photographs, the volume will appeal to persons seeking a useful preliminary survey of Colorado's largest denomination.

GERALD MCKEVITT, S.J.
Santa Clara University, Calif.

DIETRICH BONHOEFFER—HIS SIGNIFICANCE FOR NORTH AMERICANS. By Larry Rasmussen with Renate Bethge. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. x + 198. \$12.95.

Rasmussen presents various aspects of Bonhoeffer's theological legacy pertaining to society, church renewal, and new paths for the future. He also places B. in dialogue with Reinhold Niebuhr, Karl Barth, Dan Berrigan, Irving Greenberg and others to sharpen his own critical focus on the unholy alliance of self-congratulatory religion with a morally obtuse nationalism that is so characteristic of civil religion in America.

R. shows how B.'s courageous expression of "true patriotism" can goad North Americans to accept responsibility not only for their vaunted cultural wealth but also for the victims of their cultural crimes. With Berrigan, R. raises the issue of responsible Christian resistance to those crimes. According to R., this resistance to evil in the "world-come-of-age" must be inspired by a theology of the cross as it aims at securing both justice and freedom for those "least members" of society who are most hurt by abuses of civil power. Worship in this perspective must be an expression of faith and not deviate into the pomposity and pap of slick civil religion. Here R. invokes the moral insights of Niebuhr and Barth to push North Americans to a greater sense of

their vocation to be morally sensitive citizens willing to engage in radical critique of society while witnessing, in a "community of the cross," to their faith in Christ before an unwilling world. Along the way to this vision of an "indigenous theology of the cross," R. offers original insights into B.'s methodology. R. also permits the reader to join a Jewish-Christian dialogue in which Irving Greenberg, Bonhoeffer, and R. himself engage in stimulating conversation on the dialectic of political power and reverence for God's presence.

This study is enhanced by the addition of Renate Bethge's informative essay on the significance of B.'s family in the development of his theology. Bethge, B.'s niece, and a witness to his heroic stand against Nazism, establishes the biographical context needed for a fuller appreciation of those ethical reflections that are interwoven by R. into this unique, and valuable book.

GEFFREY B. KELLY
La Salle University, Phila.

ART, ARCHITECTURE, AND LITURGICAL REFORM: THE LITURGICAL ARTS SOCIETY (1928-1972). By Susan J. White. New York: Pueblo, 1990. Pp. xi + 249. \$17.50.

In its original form, this work was submitted to the Department of Theology at Notre Dame University as partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Ph.D. in liturgical studies. The book reads like a doctoral dissertation: it is carefully researched, clearly written, and well documented but often matter-of-fact and consequently somewhat dull. A first part sets out the history of the Liturgical Arts Society, an organization of both lay and clerical people who originally were concerned with the quality of art objects used in public worship but who gradually developed an understanding of the modern liturgical movement and were able to contextualize their artistic concerns

within an appropriate liturgical framework. The society's medium of communication was the quarterly journal *Liturgical Arts*, but its driving force was the commitment and dogged perseverance of Maurice Lavanoux, who edited the periodical from 1937 until it ceased publication in 1972.

Part 2, more interesting by far, sets out the theological and liturgical principles which directed the society's efforts to promote a style of liturgical art and architecture which rejected the 19th- and early-20th-century nostalgia for Gothic forms and clearly espoused the evolution of forms that were living and contemporary, provided they expressed a truly Catholic spirit. The thrust was shaped above all by the enlightened efforts of Maurice Lavanoux.

One suspects that this volume could have been much more interesting if it had been focused on the life, personality and professional work of Lavanoux rather than on the Liturgical Arts Society. It was Lavanoux and the journal he edited for so many years, rather than the society itself, which did so much to improve the state of liturgical art and architecture in this country. The demise of the periodical, followed shortly by Lavanoux's own death, left the church in this country without a critical voice both championing the efforts of competent professional artists and architects working for the church and denouncing the inferior kitsch which churchmen regularly purchased from liturgical catalogs. W.'s work is a good reminder to contemporary liturgists of our need at the present time for another Maurice Lavanoux and an honest, challenging journal of opinion like *Liturgical Arts*.

R. KEVIN SEASOLTZ, O.S.B.
St. John's University, Minn.

A thematically arranged collection of Hick's most important writings. Editor Badham provides a lucid and informative introductory essay that both treats the themes of the book and offers a biographical sketch of Hick's theological development. Hick's ten essays, all previously published, span a thirty-year history. They cover religious epistemology, death and eternal life, the theodicy problem, and the philosophy of religious pluralism.

This is a very helpful book. It is a concise, readable text that will acquaint those who are unfamiliar with Hick's work with the major themes of his corpus. For those already familiar with his thought it will serve as a convenient resource of his central themes. The essays are well chosen to represent Hick's central concerns and contributions. The one regrettable omission from the volume is Hick's article on God as necessary being, which is among his most important philosophical pieces and essential to his apologetic for religious belief.

The selected articles are sufficiently substantive to engage the reader with Hick's thinking on a number of theological issues. Hick's work, though often controversial, has attracted a great deal of attention. While he writes in a consistently clear style, unfortunately sometimes his thought is misrepresented or badly misinterpreted. This volume should go a long way to prevent such occurrences. To either agree or disagree with his ideas one must first have an accurate account of those ideas. Here Hick's work speaks for itself without the encumbrance of lengthy commentary or criticism.

CHESTER GILLIS
Georgetown University

A JOHN HICK READER. Edited by Paul Badham. Philadelphia: Trinity Press International, 1990. Pp. viii + 200. \$14.95.

LA VIOLENCE: NÉCESSITÉ OU LIBERTÉ? By Edouard Herr. Namur: Culture et Vérité, 1990. Pp. 141. Fr. b. 780.

Herr seeks to answer the title question by investigating four "levels" in

the discussion on violence, represented by four authors. An inadequacy in one author leads him to study the next. Thus K. Lorenz' biological reductionism leads him to E. Fromm, whose psychology is weak in its extrapolation from the individual to society. J. Galtung's social analysis does not take into account the internal relationship between economic equality and personal liberty, for which H. suggests a more developed sense of fraternity. R. Girard's "scapegoating" and the sacralization of community violence forgets that Jesus came to reconcile us primarily to God, and then to each other.

Through his critiques, H. argues that violence is not a necessity on any level; he resists each author's reductionistic or deterministic tendencies. Instead, the human is characterized by liberty (individual self-determination). With Blondel, H. states that action "launches" us into interrelationships, where we discover we also have a "task." Violence is a misuse of that interrelational task (regarding self as all-powerful) or of individual liberty (regarding self as completely powerless). And both are rooted in the struggle with finitude (death). H. closes by looking to Christ as liberator from the fear of death, which is the root of all violence.

H.'s best work is done in his clear and fair presentation of those authors' views, and in his insightful critical analysis of their positions, corroborated by citing other authorities in the field. Though he repudiates "autocréation," H. sometimes falters in accounting for human solidarity because of his presuppositional commitments to liberty as individual self-determination, and to Blondel's action theory. But the human is essentially a "social animal," and action itself is first empowered by the donation of others. Still, a welcome statement against the determinism of violence.

G. SIMON HARAK, S.J.
Fairfield University

GOD THE ECONOMIST: THE DOCTRINE OF GOD. By M. Douglas Meeks. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. xiii + 257.

Meeks, a theologian, not an economist, intends to help the church "deal more faithfully and responsibly with its commission to economic justice," and to "lead theologians and economists to think in each others' presence." Political categories like kingdom and lord are well established in the theological vocabulary. Meeks claims that "according to the faith shaped by the biblical traditions, the metaphor *Economist* is a decisive and fully appropriate way of describing the character and work of God." He suggests that retrieval of the metaphor should help "in overcoming the church's paralysis in bringing its faith to bear on economic life in our time."

M. employs "pre-modern" understandings of economist and economy, understandings which he believes have been "repressed" by economists from Adam Smith down to the present day. His understandings of a "true economist" is expressed in Genesis 45:5b, 7 as Joseph tells his brothers: "God sent me before you to preserve life And God sent me before you to preserve for you a remnant on earth, and to keep alive for you many survivors." Hence the work of the economist is "preserving, keeping alive."

It is going to take a lot of work to get potential participants in any exchange between theologians and economists comfortable with the notion of God as economist. In these pages, the economic reflections reflect a Marxist critique of market economies. The theology is one of hope. But the categories clash and the argumentation is insufficiently clear to lead me to expect much progress in the dialogue the author wants to promote.

WILLIAM J. BYRON, S.J.
Catholic University of America

FIFTH ECUMENICAL CONSULTATION BETWEEN THEOLOGIANS OF THE ORIENTAL ORTHODOX CHURCHES AND THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH. Vienna: Pro Oriente, 1989. Pp. 224.

This volume in the important series of conversations with the Indian, Syrian, Coptic, Armenian, and Ethiopian churches, separated from other Christians since 451, is of interest to liturgical, ecclesiological, and canonical scholars as well as ecumenists. The quality of the previous articles in this series, and of the essays contained in this volume, is uneven because of the diverse resources available within these churches and the sensitivity of their Roman Catholic partner in the dialogue. However, even those essays which do not display the ecumenical maturity of the majority are useful in revealing where some of these churches are theologically and sociologically.

The essays include evaluations of the reception of the past four consultations in the churches and summaries of the previous work. While the formal responses from the church bodies have been rather modest, the ability of these texts to provide a basis for common declarations between Popes Paul VI and John Paul II and various Oriental Orthodox Patriarchs shows an amazing degree of reception at that specific level. The book helpfully provides the agreed statements and common declarations over the last decades. The theological bases for the unique Roman Catholic intercommunion declaration with the Syrian patriarch of Antioch has to be seen in the light of these technically unofficial conversations.

The specialized essays in liturgy, ecclesiology, primacy, and future prospects are valuable sources in their own right. The reforms necessary in Roman Catholicism are clear, but also the difficulties among these churches—in full communion, but with a diversity of heritage and ecumenical contexts—become clear in reading the notes of the

conversations. While the theological dialogue is not as substantive as some of the natristic and christological interchange of earlier volumes, its concreteness and specificity indicate the maturity and hopefulness of these conversations. If the christological issues of Chalcedon are resolved, and common understanding of conciliar fellowship and sacramental unity are in sight, then the churches are no longer able to avoid the gospel imperative to give liturgical and eventual communal/judicial expression to these convictions, whatever internal reforms may be necessary.

JEFFREY GROS, F.S.C.
N.C.C.C., N.Y.

HEALTH AND MEDICINE IN THE EASTERN ORTHODOX TRADITION. By Stanley Samuel Harakas. New York: Crossroad, 1990. Pp. xii + 190. \$19.95.

This latest addition to the *Health/Medicine and the Faith Tradition Series* is intended as a resource book for those within the Orthodox tradition and a learning opportunity for those outside it. Part 1 summarizes Orthodox faith, highlighting its respect for tradition and the Fathers of the Church. Part 2 reflects on well-being and illness from the distinctive Orthodox wholistic perspective, interpreting illness as an opportunity for spiritual growth and suffering as a test of discipleship.

Part 3, the best section, is an excellent presentation of the Orthodox view of caring and curing, particularly spiritual healing available from the saints, the liturgy, and holy unction. Part 4 focuses Orthodox beliefs and values on life-passages and contemporary ethical dilemmas.

For this Roman Catholic reviewer, the Orthodox tradition balances Latin perspectives and contributes yet another dimension for understanding the larger Christian picture. Harakas succeeds in presenting the Orthodox tradition from a sympathetic, "native"

point of view. Sometimes he seems defensive. At other times he is mildly critical of Western cultural perspectives, e.g. Kubler-Ross's views on dying.

But the Orthodox "faith" perspective itself reflects general Middle-Eastern cultural viewpoints: community rather than individual orientation, staunch belief in the spirit world and spiritual healing, and many other points. A reader sensitive to the challenges of cross-cultural analysis and comparisons notes that this volume, like others in the series, does not fully measure up to the program outlined in the introductory volume, *Health/Medicine and the Faith Traditions* (1982), especially the suggestions of philosopher-physician H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr. (163-182). An appendix in subsequent editions or a new, concluding volume to the series could address that shortcoming.

JOHN J. PILCH
Catonsville, Md.

THE CONDEMNATIONS OF THE REFORMATION ERA: DO THEY STILL DIVIDE? Edited by Karl Lehmann and Wolfhart Pannenberg. Translated from the German by Margaret Kohl. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990. Pp. v + 214. \$19.95.

Many theologians and ecumenists maintain that the condemnations Protestants and Roman Catholics hurled at each other in the 16th century no longer apply because of historical developments and recent ecumenical progress. But until this judgment becomes the binding judgment of the churches involved, these mutual condemnations remain a major obstacle to their reconciliation.

Recognizing this, the Joint Ecumenical Commission set up in Germany in 1981 entrusted the task of "ironing out the past" to the Ecumenical Study Group, a group first convened in 1946. Consisting of over thirty Catholic, Lu-

theran and Reformed theologians, the Study Group worked from 1981 to 1985, reducing the 16th-century questions to three main areas: justification, sacraments (especially the Lord's Supper), and ministry. By careful historical analysis the theologians were able to show that the condemnations were often based on misunderstandings of the opposing positions, and that what frequently appear to be contradictory concepts are really different ways of addressing the same concerns. While some real differences remain, they were not seen as church-dividing. The entire study was presented to the German Episcopal Conference and the Council of the Evangelical Church in Germany in 1986.

The book, edited by the two directors of the Study Group, includes the texts, a Final Report written by the Joint Ecumenical Commission, and supporting documentation. Its discussion of the various questions related to justification, sacraments, and ministry is extensive and thorough. Particularly helpful is its treatment of transubstantiation and of Protestant theology and practice regarding the nondominical sacraments. Surprisingly, it does not make much use of the U.S. Lutheran-Roman Catholic Dialogue. But with its frequent citations from Trent and the Protestant confessional documents and the doctrinal and liturgical history present in the endnotes, the book makes an excellent reference.

THOMAS P. RAUSCH, S.J.
Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

PROTESTANT WORSHIP: TRADITIONS IN TRANSITION. By James F. White. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1989. Pp. 251. \$15.95.

Questions of liturgical change continue to touch raw nerves because they quite quickly become anguished questions of identity. White's study is thus an important contribution, because he reminds us that Protestantism's "pe-

cular vocation" has been "to adapt Christian worship in terms of peoples as their social contexts and very beings change" (215). Long before "indigenization" and "acculturation" became hot items on the current theological and liturgical agenda, those worship traditions rooted in the Reformation of the 16th century attempted to shape ritual action and speech according to the needs of Christian people.

White argues that explorations of Lutheran, Reformed, Anglican, etc., or "protestant" worship have often employed categories and methods derived principally from Roman Catholic liturgical scholarship. The result is usually a portrayal of a worship tradition or expression in which it is markedly difficult to recognize oneself or one's community, especially if that tradition happens to be one's own.

White's concern, however, is to describe adequately "what actually happens" in the worship expressions and experiences of those Protestant traditions that are both critique and reconceptualization of the liturgical life of late-medieval Europe. To engage in such description requires, according to White, a set of categories which a majority of liturgical scholars have not often employed. These are people ("the primary liturgical document," White states), piety, time, place, prayer, preaching, and music.

The traditions examined in this book are Lutheran, Reformed, Anabaptist, Anglican, Separatist and Puritan, Quaker, Methodist, Frontier, and Pentecostal. White focuses on the central elements and ethos of each tradition in order to give the reader a particular sensibility for better appreciating what happens in those worshipping communities called "protestant." An interesting way to gauge whether White has been successful in his assessment of Protestant worship might be to ask a variety of folk whose traditions these

are whether he has indeed captured their "genius" or "ethos."

MICHAEL B. AUNE

*Pacific Lutheran Theol. Seminary
Berkeley*

SEX, RACE AND GOD: CHRISTIAN FEMINISM IN BLACK AND WHITE. By Susan Thistlethwaite. New York: Crossroad, 1989. Pp. vii + 184. \$19.95.

As white feminism seeks to confront and challenge patriarchy in Western society, Thistlethwaite notes, it must also recognize and respond to the differences which exist and persist between black and white women. Reflecting on the contention of Audre Lorde that "the master's tools will never dismantle the master's house," T. raises two questions: "What happens in white feminism if we begin to give up *all* the master's tools and not just some? What happens when the *differences* between black and white women become the starting point for white feminist theology?"

These questions are explored in chapters dealing with the issues of sex, class, and race from an admittedly white feminist perspective but one which also attempts honestly to bring to the forefront and interact with the perspective of black women as revealed in their critical literature.

The differences that exist as a result of the quite different histories of black and white women, both oppressed because of their sex but black women additionally because of their race, are brought out well especially in the chapter on "The Self and Sin." Here, T. states that "the desire (of white women) to bond with black women under an *undifferentiated* label of 'sisterhood' " is sin originating from a disrespect for boundaries which emerge from the necessarily different lives that black and white women live in today's society. This failure to respect boundaries arises from the incorrect and in-

valid assumption that white women of a certain class can speak for all women and forms the basis of the black critique of feminism.

T. does an excellent job in challenging white feminists while presenting a clear analysis of where black women in the struggle are coming from. Additionally, she provides a possible outline of how black and white women, recognizing their differences, can work together to present a joint challenge to the patriarchal system which limits all women.

DIANA L. HAYES
Georgetown University

HOLY WARS: THE RISE OF ISLAMIC FUNDAMENTALISM. By Dilip Hiro. New York: Routledge, 1989. Pp. xiv + 334. \$14.95.

Dilip Hiro, a Pakistani journalist, has produced a thoroughly documented historical and political study of the phenomenon of Islamic fundamentalism. Beginning with the era of Mohammed and his early followers, H. shows how the struggles of the first generation of Muslims sowed the seeds for future conflict over the course and

quality of Islamic religion. Revivalism and reform are frequent occurrences throughout Muslim history, though the particular nature of any given fundamentalist outbreak is clearly highly determined by cultural and historical circumstances. H. treats in detail several modern examples, including the Muslim Brotherhood in Egypt and Syria, the Saudi Arabian state, and, of course, Khomeini's Iran.

This book might prove valuable for college courses on Islam or fundamentalism. As a descriptive study, H.'s treatment does not probe in depth into the theological, sociological, or psychological aspects of fundamentalism; indeed, the term is never clearly defined and is used rather loosely as a synonym for reform and revivalism. This kind of approach has annoyed scholars who accuse journalists of careless terminology in describing fundamentalism; nevertheless, one cannot read H.'s work without realizing that the phenomenon, elusive as it is to define, is one of the most powerful social forces at work in our times.

PATRICK M. ARNOLD, S.J.
University of San Diego

BOOKS RECEIVED

SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

Apocalyptic Literature. Ed. M. Reddish. Nashville: Abingdon, 1990. Pp. 320. \$24.95.

Aviezer, N. *In the Beginning: Biblical Creation and Sciences.* Hoboken, N.J.: KTAV, 1990. Pp. 138. \$15.95.

The Bible as Rhetoric. Ed. W. Warner. N.Y.: Routledge, 1990. Pp. 236. \$15.95.

Collins, A. *Is Mark's Gospel a Life of Jesus?* Milwaukee: Marquette Univ., 1990. Pp. 77.

Ellingsen, M. *The Integrity of Biblical Narrative.* Minneapolis: Fortress,

1990. Pp. 128.

Gielen, M. *Tradition und Theologie neutestamentlicher Haustafelethik.* Frankfurt/M.: Hain, 1990. Pp. 600. DM 138.

Hamm, D. *The Beatitudes in Context.* Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1990. Pp. 120. \$5.95.

Hebrew Bible or Old Testament? Ed. R. Brooks and J. Collins. Notre Dame, Ind.: Notre Dame Univ., 1990. Pp. 242. \$22.95.

Howard, G. *Paul: Crisis in Galatia.* N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1990. 2nd ed. Pp. 114. \$39.50.

Kaut, T. *Befreier und befreites Volk.*

Theological Studies

DECEMBER 1990
VOL. 51, NO. 4

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus
in the United States*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Theology and Culture at Mid-Century: The Example of
Henri de Lubac
Joseph A. Komonchak 579
- Reflections on the Moral Status of the Pre-Embryo
Thomas A. Shannon and Allan B. Wolter, O.F.M. 603
- Do We Want a Christian Economics? The U.S. Bishops'
Pastoral Letter
Richard C. Bayer 627
- The Recovery of Theology as a Practical Discipline
Randy L. Maddox 650
- The Function of the Trinity in Moltmann's Ecological
Doctrine of Creation
Paul D. Molnar 673
- "Only Something Good Can Be Evil": The Genesis of
Augustine's Secular Ambivalence
Frederick H. Russell 698
- Newman, Conversion, and Ecumenism
Avery Dulles, S.J. 717

BOOK REVIEWS

- PLASKOW, J.: *Standing Again at Sinai* 732
- HOLLADAY, W.: *Jeremiah 2* 733
- MONTAGUE, G.: *Companion God* 736
- SEGAL, A.: *Paul the Convert* 737
- FÉDOU, M.: *Christianisme et religions paennes dans le Contre Celse d'Origène* 739
- GRILLMEIER, A.: *Jesus der Christus im Glauben der Kirche 2/2* 741
- MEYENDORFF, J.: *Imperial Unity and Christian Divisions* 743
- Icons, Windows on Eternity* (ed. G. Limouris) 745

Christian Spirituality 3 (ed. L. Dupré and D. Saliers)	747
RACK, H.: Reasonable Enthusiast	749
SPALDING, T.: The Premier See	752
NICHOLLS, D.: Deity and Domination	754
Romance and the Rock (ed. J. Fitzer)	755
THILS, G.: Primauté et infaillibilité du pontife romain à Vatican I	757
LUBAC, H. DE: Mémoire sur l'occasion de mes écrits	759
KELLENBERGER, J.: God-Relationships with and without God	761
VICCHIO, S.: The Voice from the Whirlwind	763
GRENZ, S.: Reason for Hope	764
GLEBE-MOLLER, J.: Jesus and Theology	766
GULA, R.: Reason Informed by Faith	768
SWINBURNE, R.: Responsibility and Atonement	770
O'ROURKE, K., and P. BOYLE: Medical Ethics	772
WARNER, M.: Philosophical Finesse	774
BROWN, F.: Religious Aesthetics	776
ELDRIDGE, R.: On Moral Personhood	777

SHORTER NOTICES 779

BLENKINSOPP, J.: Ezechiel	OVERHOLT, T.: Channels of Prophecy	JODDOCK, D.: The Church's Bible
FAIVRE, A.: The Emergence of the Laity	BRADSHAW, P.: Ordination Rites of the Ancient Churches	BROCK, S. (tr.): St. Ephrem the Syrian
MAZZA, E.: Mystagogy	MURPHY, G.: The Saxon Savior	ORCIBAL, J. (ed.): Correspondence de Fénelon 10-11
BENZ, E.: The Theology of Electricity	MOONEY, C.: Philippine Duchesne	NOEL, T.: Colorado Catholicism
RASMUSSEN, L.: Dietrich Bonhoeffer	WHITE, S.: Art, Architecture, and Liturgical Reform	BADHAM, P. (ed.): A John Hick Reader
HERR, E.: La violence	MEEKS, M.: God the Economist	Fifth Ecumenical Consultation between Orthodox and Roman Theologians
HARAKAS, S.: Health and Medicine in the Eastern Orthodox Tradition	LEHMANN, K., and W. PANNENBERG (ed.): The Condemnations of the Reformation Era	WHITE, J.: Protestant Worship
THISTLETHWAITE, S.: Sex, Race, and God	HIRO, D.: Holy Wars	

BOOKS RECEIVED 793

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, MD, 21202-3993. Second class postage paid at Baltimore, MD, and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER, please send address changes to THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, 428 East Preston St., Baltimore, MD 21202-3993.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION 1991: U.S. individual: \$18; U.S. institutional: \$25; all foreign, including Canada: \$25 U.S. currency.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 64002, Baltimore, MD 21264-0002.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS and all correspondence dealing with subscriptions should be sent to Theological Studies, Business Office, 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, MD 21202-3993.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy or a computer printout of letter-perfect quality and a legible duplicate), together with return postage, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02167. Author should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057.

BACK ISSUES are available from Theological Studies, P.O. Box 1029, Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057. Single copies prepaid: \$5 in U.S.; \$6 outside U.S.

Presenting This Issue

The December 1990 issue, my last as editor in chief, features seven articles, dealing respectively with theology and culture at mid-century, the moral status of the pre-embryo, the problem of a Christian economics, theology as a practical discipline, the Trinity and creation, Augustine on sin and evil, and Newman on ecumenism and conversion.

Theology and Culture at Mid-Century: The Example of Henri de Lubac offers an unusual contribution to the theological background of Vatican II by exploring the early work of one of the prominent theologians accused of fostering "*la nouvelle théologie*" in the late 1940s. The thesis is that underlying the controversy over the supernatural lay basic questions about the relationship between the Church and modern culture. JOSEPH A. KOMONCHAK, Ph.D. from Union Theological Seminary in New York City, teaches theology in the department of religion and religious education at the Catholic University of America. His special competence lies in ecclesiology and in the history and theology of Vatican II. Chief editor of *The New Dictionary of Theology*, he is preparing a translation of, and critical introduction to, the doctrinal schemata prepared for Vatican II.

Reflections on the Moral Status of the Pre-Embryo reviews the scientific literature to help determine when the early human embryo becomes an individual, a single entity, and analyzes claim to personhood in the light of these findings. THOMAS A. SHANNON, Ph.D. from Boston University, is professor of religion and social ethics in the department of humanities at the Worcester Polytechnic Institute, with particular interest in bioethics and moral theology. ALLAN WOLTER, O.F.M., Ph.D. from the Catholic University of America of which he is professor emeritus, is a research associate within the UCLA Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, with expertise in philosophy of science, contemporary Anglo-American philosophy, and medieval philosophy.

Do We Want a Christian Economics? The U.S. Bishops' Pastoral Letter examines the economic assumptions in the letter and offers a critique in light of contemporary economic thinking. RICHARD C. BAYER, Ph.D. from Berkeley's Graduate Theological Union, focuses his research on social and economic ethics. His article "An Empirical Application of *A Theory of Justice*" appeared in the November issue of the *International Social Science Journal*.

The Recovery of Theology as a Practical Discipline is an effort to retrieve an understanding and practice of theological activity that is more integrally related to Christian life and witness. RANDY L. MADDOX, Ph.D. from Emory University, is associate professor of religion and

philosophy at Sioux Falls College in South Dakota, with special interest in theological method and doctrinal theology. Scholars Press published his *Towards an Ecumenical Fundamental Theology* in 1984.

The Function of the Trinity in Moltmann's Ecological Doctrine of Creation argues (1) that Moltmann's panentheistic principles compel him to compromise his own perception of God's freedom implied in the traditional doctrines of creation and the Trinity, and (2) that this leads him ultimately to the modalism he criticizes in Rahner and Barth and to the tritheism rejected by the tradition. PAUL D. MOLNAR, Ph.D. from Fordham, is associate professor of theology at St. John's University, Jamaica, N.Y., with particular interest in Trinitarian theology, revelation, and theological method.

"Only Something Good Can Be Evil": The Genesis of Augustine's Secular Ambivalence argues that the saint's ambivalence toward human secular life was fashioned in his early anti-Manichean polemic and remained to inform all his later thought about existence in this world. FREDERICK H. RUSSELL, Ph.D. from Johns Hopkins, is associate professor of history at Rutgers University in Newark, N.J., with especial competence in medieval political theology and canon law.

Newman, Conversion, and Ecumenism reveals Newman, as a Catholic, convinced that the Roman communion was the only true Church, but respecting the portions of Catholic truth present in other communities, including the Anglican. He believed that faith could coexist with faulty doctrine and that good faith should not be upset. Thus in some ways he was a precursor of 20th-century ecumenism. AVERY DULLES, S.J., S.T.D. from Rome's Gregorian University, is Laurence J. McGinley Professor of Religion and Society at Fordham University.

I leave *Theological Studies* with warm memories ranging over 44 years: profound gratitude to hundreds of authors and reviewers whose research and evaluation have graced these pages, to the managing editors and book-review editors whose competence and concern have played an inestimable role in shaping the journal's international reputation, and to scores of skilled associates at the Waverly Press, our printers since 1942. I have every reason to believe that my successor, Robert J. Daly, S.J., will be blessed with similar co-operation.

Kindly note the important information on the inside front cover of this issue.

Walter J. Burghardt, S.J.
Editor

- Frankfurt/M.: Hain, 1990. Pp. 350. DM 88.
- Meier, J. *The Mission of Christ and His Church*. Wilmington, Del.: Glazier, 1990. Pp. 327. \$17.95.
- McDermott, J. *La sofferenza umana nella Bibbia*. Rome: Dehoniane, 1990. Pp. 200. L. 18,000.
- Mercer Dictionary of the Bible*. Ed. W. Mills et al. Macon, Ga.: Mercer Univ., 1990. Pp. 987. \$55; \$27.50.
- Panimolle, S. *La libertà cristiana*. Città del Vaticano: Libreria Vaticana, 1988. Pp. 227. L. 20,000.
- Reid, J. *Jesus: God's Emptiness, God's Fullness*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 145. \$7.95.
- Tamez, E. *The Scandalous Message of James*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1990. Pp. 102. \$8.95.
- Teubal, S. *Hagar the Egyptian*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1990. Pp. 226. \$29.95; \$19.95.
- The Unpublished Poetry of Charles Wesley 2: Hymns and Poems on Holy Scripture*. Ed. S. Kimbrough and O. Beckerlegge. Nashville: Kingswood, 1990. Pp. 476. \$19.95.
- Wahlde, U. von. *The Johannine Commandments*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 294. \$13.95.
- White, R. *Luke's Case for Christianity*. Wilton, Conn.: Morehouse, 1987. Pp. 112. \$6.95.
- Wyschogrod, M. *The Body of Faith*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1989 [1983]. Pp. 265. \$14.95.
- Candelaria, M. *Popular Religion and Liberation*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1990. Pp. 194. \$39.50; \$12.95.
- Christianity through Non-Christian Eyes*. Ed. P. Griffiths. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990. Pp. 286. \$29.95; \$14.95.
- Cobb, J., Jr. *The Structure of Christian Existence*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1990. Pp. 160. \$11.75.
- La doctrine de la révélation divine de saint Thomas d'Aquin*. Ed. L. Elders. Città del Vaticano: Pont. Accademia S. Tommaso, 1990. Pp. 278. L. 30,000.
- Ferm, D. *Contemporary American Theologies*. Rev. ed. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1990 [1981]. Pp. 184. \$14.95.
- Fessard, G. *Hegel: Le christianisme et l'histoire*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1990. Pp. 320. Fr. 195.
- Finger, T. *Christian Theology 2*: Scottsdale, Pa.: Herald, 1989. Pp. 544. \$29.95.
- God, Values, and Empiricism*. Ed. W. Peden and L. Axel. Macon, Ga.: Mercer Univ., 1990. Pp. 252. \$31.95.
- Hastings, A. *The Theology of a Protestant Catholic*. Phila.: Trinity International, 1990. Pp. 213. \$19.95.
- Haught, J. *What Is Religion?* N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 273. \$10.95.
- Jones, W. *Theological Worlds*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1989. Pp. 240. \$16.95.
- Ladaria, L. *La cristologia de Hilario de Poitiers*. Rome: Pont. Univ. Gregoriana, 1989. Pp. 322. L. 45,500.
- Lee, C., and T. Hand. *A Taste of Water: Christianity through Taoist-Buddhist Eyes*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 224. \$9.95.
- Lift Every Voice: Constructing Christian Theologies from the Underside*. Ed. S. Thistlethwaite and M. Engel. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1990. Pp. 329. \$15.95.
- Lonergan Workshop 8*. Ed. F. Lawrence. Atlanta: Scholars, 1990. Pp. 278.

SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY

- Areplackal, J. *Spirit and Ministries*. Bangalore, India: Dharmaram, 1990. Pp. 350. \$14.95.
- Balthasar, H. von. *The Glory of the Lord 7: The New Covenant*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1989. Pp. 371. \$35.
- Balthasar, H. von. *Theodrama 2: Dramatis personae: Man in God*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1990. Pp. 437. \$35.
- Boer, H. *An Ember Still Glowing*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990. Pp. 187. \$14.95.

- Mitchell, R. *The Only Way: The Road to Happiness*. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic, 1989. Pp. 201. \$24.95.
- Parr, R. *Process Person Presence*. Chicago: Thomas More, 1990. Pp. 240. \$11.95.
- Pelikan, J. *The Melody of Theology*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ., 1990 [1988] Pp. 274. \$10.95.
- Rae, E., and B. Marie-Daly. *Created in Her Image*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1990. Pp. 157. \$18.95.
- Swidler, L., et al. *Death or Dialogue?* Phila.: Trinity International, 1990. Pp. 151. \$15.95.
- Theology at the End of the Century*. Ed. R. Scharlemann. Charlottesville, Va.: Univ. of Virginia, 1990. Pp. 160. \$28.50.
- Young, P. *Feminist Theology/Christian Theology*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990. Pp. 132.
- HISTORICAL**
- Brockman, J. *Romero*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1989. Pp. 284. \$9.95.
- Casaldàliga, P. *In Pursuit of the Kingdom*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990. Pp. 254. \$10.95.
- Caulfield, C. *Only a Beginning: The Passionists in China, 1921-1931*. Union City, N.J.: Passionist, 1990. Pp. 296. \$14.95.
- Duggan, P. *The Assumption Dogma*. Dayton, Ohio.: Univ. of Dayton, 1989. Pp. 235.
- Faith and Order 1985-1989*. Ed. T. Best. Geneva: WCC, 1990. Pp. 317.
- Grant, R. *Jesus after the Gospels*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1990. Pp. 132. \$14.95.
- Grave, S. *Conscience in Newman's Thought*. New York: Oxford/Clarendon, 1989. Pp. 191. \$39.95.
- Greer, R. *The Fear of Freedom*. University Park; Pa.: Penn State Univ., 1989. Pp. 211. \$24.95.
- Hans Urs von Balthasar: Gestalt und Werk*. Ed. K. Lehmann and W. Kasper. Cologne, Germany: Communio, 1989. Pp. 359.
- Hauptmann, P. *Pierre-Joseph Proudhon: Sa vie et sa pensée 1-2*. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1988. Pp. 444 + 447. Fr. 250 + 250.
- Henry Suso: The Exemplar, with Two German Sermons*. Tr. F. Tobin. N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 416. \$16.95.
- Hindu-Christian Dialogue*. Ed. H. Coward. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990. Pp. 281. \$29.95; \$14.95.
- Ignatianisch: Eigenart und Methode der Gesellschaft Jesu*. Ed. M. Sievernich and G. Switek. Freiburg: Herder, 1990. Pp. 704. DM 79.
- John Calvin and the Church*. Ed. T. George. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1990. Pp. 276. \$14.95.
- Jorstad, E. *Holding Fast/Pressing On: Religion in America in the 1980s*. N.Y.: Praeger, 1990. Pp. 211. \$45; \$14.95.
- Kierkegaard, S. *Early Polemical Writings*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Univ., 1990. Pp. 314. \$39.50.
- Levy, P. *The Frontiers of Paradise: A Study of Monks and Monasteries*. N.Y.: Paragon, 1990 [1987]. Pp. 224. \$10.95.
- Lubac, H. de. *Christian Resistance to Anti-Semitism*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1990. Pp. 261. \$15.95.
- Madec, G., et al. "*De libero arbitrio*" di Agostino d'Ipbona. Palermo: Augustinus, 1990. Pp. 84. L. 15,000.
- Mission 2009*. Ed. J. Rausch. Atlanta: Glenmary Research Center, 1990. Pp. 150. \$10.
- The Pastor: Readings from the Patristic Period*. Ed. P. Culbertson and A. Shippee. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990. Pp. 237.
- Patristic Heritage*. Ed. N. Shaifer and M. Porter. Tappan. N.Y.: Shepherd, 1990. Pp. 236. \$14.95.
- Pearson, B. *Gnosticism, Judaism, and Egyptian Christianity*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990. Pp. 228.
- Pizzani, U., et al. "*De musica*" di Agostino d'Ipbona. Palermo: Augustinus, 1990. Pp. 86. L. 16,000.
- Poppi, A. *La filosofia nello Studio fran-*

- cescano del Santo a Padova*. Padua: Centro Studi Antoniani, 1989. Pp. 282. L. 35,000.
- Reading the Past in Late Antiquity*. Ed. G. Clarke. Sydney: Australian National Univ., 1990. Pp. 370.
- Roberson, R. G. *The Eastern Christian Churches*. 3rd ed. Rome: Pont. Inst. Studiorum Orientalium, 1990. Pp. 129.
- Saint Augustine: Soliloquies and Immortality of the Soul*. Tr. Gerard Watson. Warminster, Eng.: Aris & Phillips, 1990. Pp. 213. \$12.95.
- Soren Kierkegaard: The Concept of Irony with Continual Reference to Socrates and Notes of Schelling's Berlin Lectures*. Ed. H. Hong and E. Hong. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Univ., 1990. Pp. 634. \$65.
- Soren Kierkegaard: For Self-Examination, Judge for Yourself!* Ed. H. Hong and E. Hong. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Univ., 1990. Pp. 296. \$29.95.
- Sours, M. *Bahá'u'lláh's Tablet to the Christians*. Oxford: Oneworld, 1990. Pp. 212. \$22.95; \$13.95.
- Sparr, A. *To Promote, Defend, and Redeem: The Catholic Literary Revival, 1920-1960*. N.Y.: Greenwood, 1990. Pp. 221. \$39.95.
- To Confess the Faith Today*. Ed. J. Stotts and J. Douglass. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1990. Pp. 144. \$4.95.
- Troeltsch, E. *Religion et histoire*. Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1990. Pp. 312.
- Vermeil, E. *La pensée religieuse de Troeltsch*. Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1990. Pp. 104.
- Clemons, J. *What Does the Bible Say about Suicide?* Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990. Pp. 126.
- Drinan, R. *Stories from the American Soul*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1990. Pp. 176. \$14.95.
- Equal Separation*. Ed. P. Weber. N.Y.: Greenwood, 1990. Pp. 200. \$39.95.
- Gift of Life*. Ed. E. Pellegrino et al. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown Univ., 1990. Pp. 210. \$19.95.
- Gutiérrez, G. *The Truth Shall Make You Free*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990. Pp. 204. \$29.95; \$12.95.
- Hazelett, R., and D. Turner. *Benevolent Living*. Pasadena, Calif.: Hope, 1990. Pp. 429. \$19.95.
- Introduction to Christian Ethics: A Reader*. Ed. R. Hamel and K. Himes. N.Y.: Paulist, 1989. Pp. 597. \$14.95.
- Lewis, H. *A Question of Values*. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1990. Pp. 282. \$17.95.
- Maritain, J. *Moral Philosophy*. Albany, N.Y.: Magi, 1990. Pp. 216.
- Meeting of Redemptorist Moralists (Aylmer, Quebec, 26-30 June, 1989): Acts*. Rome: Alphonsiana, 1989. Pp. 175. \$16.
- Naturrecht im ethischen Diskurs*. Ed. M. Heimbach-Steins. Münster: Aschendorff, 1990. Pp. 112.
- O'Connell, T. *Principles for a Catholic Morality*. Rev. ed. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1990. Pp. 302. \$14.95.
- O'Keefe, M. *What Are They Saying about Social Sin?* N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 118. \$5.95.
- Rowthorn, A. *Caring for Creation*. Wilton, Conn.: Morehouse, 1989. Pp. 163. \$11.95.
- Vidal, M. *Moral de actitudes 1: Moral fundamental*. 6th ed. Madrid: PS Editorial, 1990. Pp. 902. Ptas. 3,800.

MORALITY AND LAW

- Bard, M. *Shadow Women: Homeless Women's Survival Stories*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 218. \$9.95.
- Catholic Perspectives on Medical Morals*. Ed. E. Pellegrino et al. Dordrecht, Netherlands: Kluwer Academic, 1989. Pp. 307.

PASTORAL, SPIRITUAL, AND LITURGICAL

- Armstrong, R. *Christianity and Change*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 242. \$16.95.
- Cantalamesa, R. *Life in the Lordship of Christ*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed &

- Ward, 1990. Pp. 284. \$14.95.
- Carroll, D. *Spiritual Parenting*. N.Y.: Paragon, 1990. Pp. 389. \$12.95.
- Chesto, K. *Risking Hope*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 113. \$7.95.
- A Classified Bibliography on the East Syrian Liturgy*. Ed. P. Yousif. Rome: St. Thomas Christian Fellowship, 1990. Pp. 155. \$18.
- Colson, C. *The God of Stones and Spiders*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1990. Pp. 221. \$8.95.
- Dobbels, W. *An Epistle of Comfort*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 123. \$7.95.
- DeBlassie, P. *Deep Prayer*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1990. Pp. 154. \$14.95.
- Divorce and Remarriage*. Ed. W. Roberts. Kansas City, Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 159. \$13.95.
- Doohan, L. *Leisure: A Spiritual Need*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria, 1990. Pp. 100. \$4.95.
- Edwards, O. *Matins, Lauds and Vespers for St David's Day*. Rochester, N.Y.: Boydell & Brewer, 1990. Pp. 224. \$67.
- Hardy, L. *The Fabric of This World*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990. Pp. 213. \$12.95.
- Hater, R. *News That Is Good*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria, 1990. Pp. 149. \$5.95.
- Henry, C. *Toward a Recovery of Christian Belief*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1990. Pp. 126. \$7.95.
- Kaam, A. van. *The Music of Eternity*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria, 1990. Pp. 117. \$5.95.
- A New Phoebe*. Ed. V. Ratigan and A. Swidler. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 111. \$7.95.
- Olasky, S., and M. Olasky. *More Than Kindness*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1990. Pp. 219. \$9.95.
- O'Neill, M. *God Hears the Cry of the Poor*. Rome: Pont. Univ. Gregoriana, 1990. Pp. 320.
- Ramshaw, G. *Richer Fare for the Christian People*. N.Y.: Pueblo, 1990. Pp. 245. \$18.50.
- Rediger, G. *Ministry & Sexuality*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990. Pp. 156.
- Sample, T. *U.S. Lifestyles and Mainline Churches*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1990. Pp. 180. \$12.95.
- Sofield, L., et al. *Design for Wholeness*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria, 1990. Pp. 148. \$6.95.
- Stevens, E. *Spiritual Technologies*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 167. \$9.95.
- Sullivan, F. *All Eyes and Blind*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 220. \$14.95.
- Talley, T. *Worship: Reforming Tradition*. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral, 1990. Pp. 155. \$11.95.
- Time and Community*. Ed. J. Alexander. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral, 1990. Pp. 338. \$34.95.
- We Celebrate*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria, 1990. Pp. 159. \$8.95.
- Valles, C. *Models of Faith*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1990. Pp. 176. \$9.95.
- Wicks, R. *Self-Ministry through Self-Understanding*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1990 [1983]. Pp. 112. \$8.95.

SPECIAL QUESTIONS

- Bennett, B. *An Anatomy of Revelation*. Wilton, Conn.: Morehouse, 1990. Pp. 118. \$8.95.
- Catholicisme hier, aujourd'hui, demain: Religieuse (Vie)-Résurrection*. Ed. G. Mathon et al. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1990. Col. 769-1024. Fr. 152.
- Colson, C. *Kingdoms in Conflict*. N.Y.: Harper & Row, 1990 [1987]. Pp. 623. \$5.95.
- Duch, R. *Successful Parish Leadership*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1990. Pp. 214. \$12.95.
- Feuerstein, G. *Encyclopedic Dictionary of Yoga*. N.Y.: Paragon House, 1990. Pp. 430. \$24.95.
- Fox, E. *Power through Constructive Thinking*. N.Y.: Harper & Row, 1990 [1932]. Pp. 288. \$4.95.
- Gong, J.-T. *Truth, Faith, and Life*. Chicago: Adams, 1990. Pp. 138.

- Grossmann, R. *The Fourth Way*. Bloomington: Indiana Univ., 1990. Pp. 311. \$35.
- Harper's Encyclopedia of Religious Education*. Ed. I. Cully and K. Cully. S.F.: Harper & Row, 1990. Pp. 717. \$34.95.
- Hernández, F. *These Tools: Essays on Group Dynamics*. N.Y.: Vantage, 1990. Pp. 40. \$7.95.
- The Living God: A Catechism for the Christian Faith* 1-2. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1989. Pp. 445. \$24.95 (set).
- MacGregor, G. *Dictionary of Religion and Philosophy*. N.Y.: Paragon, 1989. Pp. 696. \$35.
- Miller, D. *Hells & Holy Ghosts*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1989. Pp. 240. \$15.95.
- Nash, R. *The Closing of the American Heart*. Richardson, Tex.: Probe, 1990. Pp. 235. \$14.95.
- Peacock, R. *A Brief History of Eternity*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1990. Pp. 160. \$7.95.
- Randall, W. *Foundation of the Creation*. N.Y.: Vantage, 1990. Pp. 206. \$12.50.
- Researching Modern Evangelicalism: A Guide to the Holdings of the Billy Graham Center*. Ed. R. Shuster et al. N.Y.: Greenwood, 1990. Pp. 353. \$55.
- Tulku, T. *Knowledge of Time and Space*. Berkeley, Calif.: Dharma, 1990 [1977]. Pp. 517. \$14.95.

STATEMENT OF OWNERSHIP, MANAGEMENT, AND CIRCULATION

(Required by 39 U.S.C. 3685)

1. Title of publication: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES; Publication no.: 00405639
2. Date of filing: October 1, 1990
3. Frequency of issue: Quarterly
4. Location of office of publication: 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
5. Location of headquarters: 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
6. Publisher: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES INC., 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
 Editor: Walter J. Burghardt, S.J., Georgetown University, 37th and O St., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20057
 Managing Editor: John R. Keating, S.J., Georgetown University, 37th and O St., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20057
7. Owner: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES INC., a Maryland Corporation, non-profit, non-stock, 428 E. Preston St., Baltimore, Md. 21202
8. Known bondholders, mortgagees, and other security holders owning or holding 1 percent or more of total amount of bonds, mortgages or other securities: None
10. a) Total no. copies printed: Avg. 6450; single issue nearest to filing date 6363
 b) Paid circulation to subscribers: Avg. 5445*; single issue nearest to filing date 5366**
 c) Total paid circulation: Avg. 5445; single issue nearest to filing date 5366
 d) Free distribution: Avg. 52; single issue nearest to filing date 51
 e) Total distribution: Avg. 5497; single issue nearest to filing date 5417
 f) Copies not distributed: Avg. 953; single issue nearest to filing date 946
 g) Total: Avg. 6450; single issue nearest to filing date 6363
11. I certify that the statements by me above are correct and complete: (s) John R. Keating, S.J., Managing Editor
 * 235 copies are mailed by other means. ** 234 copies are mailed by other means.

Theological Studies

VOLUME 51

1990

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus
in the United States*

Theological Studies

A Quarterly Journal
Founded 1940

Editor in Chief

WALTER J. BURGHARDT, S.J.

Managing Editor and Book Review Editor

JOHN R. KEATING, S.J.

Editorial Consultants

Raymond E. Brown, S.S.
St. Patrick Seminary, Calif.

Gerard H. Ettliger, S.J.
St. John's University, N.Y.C.

Monika Hellwig
Georgetown University

Edward J. Kilmartin, S.J.
Boston College

William W. Meissner, S.J.
Harvard University Medical School

Michael J. Buckley, S.J.
University of Notre Dame

Thomas J. Green
Catholic University of America

John Jay Hughes
Archdiocese of St. Louis

Joseph T. Lienhard, S.J.
Fordham University

John W. O'Malley, S.J.
Weston School of Theology

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES is published in March, June, September, and December. Manuscripts should be sent to the Editor, book reviews to the Book Review Editor:

Theological Studies
Georgetown University
37th & O St. N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20057

INDEX TO VOLUME 51

AUTHORS

BAYER, R. C. Do We Want a Christian Economics? The U.S. Bishops' Pastoral Letter	627
BUCKLEY, M. J., S.J. Religion and Science: Paul Davies and John Paul II	310
CAHILL, L. S. Feminist Ethics	49
CHRISTIANSEN, A., S.J. Ecology, Justice, and Development	64
CLOONEY, F. X., S.J. Vedānta, Theology, and Modernity: A Case Study in Theology's New Conversation with the World's Religions	268
COFFEY, D. The Holy Spirit as the Mutual Love of the Father and the Son	193
COSTIGAN, R. F., S.J. The Consensus of the Church: Differing Classical Views	25
DULLES, A., S.J. From Images to Truth: Newman on Revelation and Faith	252
DULLES, A., S.J. Newman, Conversion, and Ecumenism	717
DULLES, A., S.J. Newman on Infallibility	434
HART, M. D. Reconciliation of Body and Soul: Gregory of Nyssa's Deeper Theology of Marriage	450
HINZE, B. E. Narrative Contexts, Doctrinal Reform	417
KAUFMAN, P. I. Augustine, Evil, and Donatism: Sin and Sanctity before the Pelagian Controversy	115
KOMONCHAK, J. A. Theology and Culture at Mid-Century: The Example of Henri de Lubac	579
LANGAN, J., S.J. The Ethics of Business	81
MADDOX, R. L. The Recovery of Theology as a Practical Discipline	650
MEIER, J. P. The Historical Jesus: Rethinking Some Concepts	3
MELCHIN, K. R. Revisionists, Deontologists, and the Structure of Moral Understanding	389
MOLNAR, P. D. The Function of the Trinity in Moltmann's Ecological Doctrine of Creation	673

MOONEY, C. F., S.J. Cybernation, Responsibility, and Providential Design	286
OMANSON, R. L. Dynamic-Equivalence Translations Reconsidered	497
RUSSELL, F. H. "Only Something Good Can Be Evil": The Genesis of Augustine's Secular Ambivalence	698
SHANNON, T. A., and A. B. WOLTER, O.F.M. Reflections on the Moral Status of the Pre-Embryo	603
SPOHN, W. C., S.J. Parable and Narrative in Christian Ethics	100
WALSH, J. P. M., S.J. Dynamic or Formal Equivalence? A Response	505
WISEMAN, J. A., O.S.B. "To Be God with God": The Autotheistic Sayings of the Mystics	230
WOLTER, A. B., O.F.M., and T. A. SHANNON. Reflections on the Moral Status of the Pre-Embryo	603
WOOD, S., S.C.L. The Sacramentality of Episcopal Consecration	479

ARTICLES

The Consensus of the Church: Differing Classical Views. <i>R. F. Costigan, S.J.</i>	25
Cybernation, Responsibility, and Providential Design. <i>C F Mooney, S.J.</i>	286
Do We Want a Christian Economics? The U.S. Bishops' Pastoral Letter. <i>R. C Bayer</i>	627
From Images to Truth: Newman on Revelation and Faith. <i>A. Dulles, S.J.</i>	252
The Function of the Trinity in Moltmann's Ecological Doctrine of Creation. <i>P. D. Molnar</i>	673
The Historical Jesus: Rethinking Some Concepts. <i>J. P Meier</i>	3
The Holy Spirit as the Mutual Love of the Father and the Son. <i>D. Coffey</i>	193
Narrative Contexts, Doctrinal Reform. <i>B. E Hinze</i>	417
Newman, Conversion, and Ecumenism. <i>A. Dulles, S.J.</i>	717
Newman on Infallibility. <i>A. Dulles, S.J.</i>	434

- "Only Something Good Can Be Evil":
The Genesis of Augustine's Secular
Ambivalence. *F. H. Russell* 698
- Reconciliation of Body and Soul: Greg-
ory of Nyssa's Deeper Theology of
Marriage. *M. D. Hart* 450
- The Recovery of Theology as a Practical
Discipline. *R. L. Maddox* 650
- Reflections on the Moral Status of the
Pre-Embryo. *T. A. Shannon* and *A.
B. Wolter, O.F.M.* 603
- Revisionists, Deontologists, and the
Structure of Moral Understanding. *K.
R. Melchin* 389
- The Sacramentality of Episcopal Con-
secration. *S. Wood, S.C.L.* 479
- Theology and Culture at Mid-Century:
The Example of Henri de Lubac. *J.
A. Komonchak* 579
- "To Be God with God": The Autotheis-
tic Sayings of the Mystics. *J. A.
Wiseman, O.S.B.* 230
- Vedānta, Theology, and Modernity: A
Case Study in Theology's New Con-
versation with the World's Religions.
F. X. Clooney, S.J. 268
- CURRENT THEOLOGY**
- Notes on Moral Theology: 1989. *L. S.
Cahill, A. Christiansen, S.J., J. Lan-
gan, S.J., W. C. Spohn, S.J.* 49
- NOTES**
- Augustine, Evil, and Donatism: Sin and
Sanctity before the Pelagian Contro-
versy. *P. I. Kaufman* 115
- Dynamic-Equivalence Translations Re-
considered. *R. L. Omanson* 497
- Dynamic or Formal Equivalence? A Re-
sponse. *J. P. M. Walsh, S.J.* 505
- Religion and Science: Paul Davies and
John Paul II. *M. J. Buckley, S.J.* 310
- BOOK REVIEWS**
- ALLEN, D. Christian Belief in a Post-
modern World (*J. H. Wright*) 520
- American Catholic Women (ed. *K. Ken-
nelly*) (*P. Byrne*) 155
- ANDERSON, F. I., and D. N. FREEDMAN.
Amos (*W. Brueggemann*) 325
- ARBUCKLE, G. A., S.M. Out of Chaos
(*P. T. Giordano*) 357
- ATTRIDGE, H. W. A Commentary on
the Epistle to the Hebrews (*R. E.
Brown*) 332
- AZEVEDO, M., S.J. Vocation for Mission
(*P. T. Giordano*) 357
- BARTON, J. Oracles of God (*R. J.
Clifford*) 326
- BLACK, C. C. The Disciples according
to Mark (*W. R. Herzog II*) 513
- BOFF, L. Trinity and Society (*R. T.
Sears*) 143
- BOUCHARD, L. D. Tragic Method and
Tragic Theology (*I. Makarushka*) 363
- BROOKE, C. N. L. The Medieval Idea of
Marriage (*T. Mackin*) 535
- BROWN, F. B. Religious Aesthetics (*M.
R. Miles*) 776
- Building Unity (ed. *J. A. Burgess* and *J.
Gros*) (*J. T. Ford*) 355
- BUNNENBERG, J. Lebendige Treue zum
Ursprung (*W. Henn*) 545
- BURTCHAELL, J. T. The Giving and
Taking of Life (*E. C. Vacek*) 549
- BUTLER, J. Awash in a Sea of Faith (*E.
G. Ernst*) 543
- CARROLL, M. P. Catholic Cults and De-
votions (*W. W. Meissner*) 148
- CASHDOLLAR, C. D. The Transforma-
tion of Theology, 1830-1890 (*J. C.
Livingston*) 158
- CHINNICI, J. P., O.F.M. Living Stones
(*E. McKeown*) 343
- Christian Spirituality 3 (ed. *L. Dupré*
and *D. E. Saliers*) (*S. M.
Schneiders*) 747
- COOTE, R. B., and D. R. ORD. The
Bible's First History (*J. C. Endres*) 509
- Cross and Sword: An Eyewitness His-
tory of Christianity in Latin America
(ed. *H. M. Goodpasture*) (*E. S.
Sweeney*) 540
- DAVIS, C. F. The Evidential Force of
Religious Experience (*J. A.
Colombo*) 519
- The Desires of the Human Heart (ed.
V. Gregson) (*D. L. Gelpi*) 348
- DUBAY T. Fire Within (*S. Payne*) 539
- ELDRIDGE, R. On Moral Personhood
(*P. C. Rule*) 777

- ERNST, N. *Die Tiefe des Seins* (*J. C. Dwyer*) 162
- FÉDOU, M. *Christianisme et religions paennes dan le Contre Celse d'Origène* (*G. H. Ettliger*) 739
- FISHER, S. *Revelatory Positivism?* (*R. W. Palmer*) 160
- FOGARTY, G. P. *American Catholic Biblical Scholarship* (*J. T. Ellis*) 157
- FREYNE, S. *Galilee, Jesus, and the Gospels* (*J. Topel*) 130
- GLEBE-MÓLLER, J. *Jesus and Theology* (*S J Schäfer*) 766
- GONZALEZ, J. L. *Faith and Wealth* (*L. T Johnson*) 517
- GRABER, G. C., and D. C. THOMASMA. *Theory and Practice in Medical Ethics* (*D. P. Sulmasy*) 167
- GRANFIELD, D. *The Inner Experience of Law* (*L. Orsy*) 359
- GRENZ, S. J. *Reason for Hope* (*E. A. Johnson*) 764
- GRILLMEIER, A. *Jesus der Christus im Glauben der Kirche 2/2* (*B. E. Daley*) 741
- GULA, R. M., S.S. *Reason Informed by Faith* (*T. R. Kopfensteiner*) 768
- GUNTER, W. S. *The Limits of 'Love Divine'* (*J. D. Nelson*) 341
- HAINES, R. M. *Ecclesia Anglicana* (*T. E Morrissey*) 532
- HALL, D. J. *Thinking the Faith* (*R. L. Maddox*) 166
- HANSON, R. P. C. *The Search for the Christian Doctrine of God* (*J T Lienhard*) 334
- HERBERT, M. *Iona, Kells, and Derry* (*J. McLaughlin*) 337
- HICK, J. *An Interpretation of Religion* (*T W Tilley*) 137
- A History of Twelfth-Century Western Philosophy* (ed. P. Dronke) (*D F. Duclow*) 134
- HODGSON, P. *God in History* (*C. O'Regan*) 142
- HOFFMAN, L. *The Art of Public Prayer* (*J L. Empereur*) 147
- HOLLADAY, W. L. *Jeremiah 2* (*L. Boadt*) 733
- Icons, Windows on Eternity* (ed. G. Limouris) (*J L. Empereur*) 745
- KASPER, W. *Theology and Church* (*L. Orsy*) 527
- Keeping the Faith* (ed. G. Wainwright) (*H. J. Ryan*) 347
- KELLENBERGER, J. *God-Relationships with and without God* (*S. J. Duffy*) 761
- LIPSEY, R. *An Art of Our Own* (*T. E. Dempsey*) 364
- LUBAC, H., DE. *Mémoire sur l'occasion de mes écrits* (*D. Donovan*) 759
- MCCORMICK, R. A., S.J. *The Critical Calling* (*J. Gaffney*) 547
- MCELROY, R. W. *The Search for an American Public Theology* (*J. L. Hooper*) 164
- MERRIEL, D. J. *To the Image of the Trinity* (*D. B. Burrell*) 524
- MEYENDORFF, J. *Imperial Unity and Christian Divisions* (*L. D. Davis*) 743
- MOESSNER, D. P. *Lord of the Banquet* (*D. Hamm*) 515
- MONTAGUE, G. *Companion God* (*K. A. Barta*) 736
- MYERS, C. *Binding the Strong Man* (*E. Struthers Malbon*) 330
- NESSAN, C. L. *Orthopraxis or Heresy* (*M J Schuck*) 551
- The New Testament and Its Modern Interpreters* (ed. E. J. Epp and G. W. MacRae) (*R. J. Dillon*) 510
- NICHOLLS, D. *Deity and Domination* (*P Lakeland*) 754
- NICHOLS, A., O.P. *Yves Congar* (*W V. Dych*) 350
- NODDINGS, N. *Women and Evil* (*K. Lebacqz*) 361
- O'BRIEN, D. *Public Catholicism* (*R. J. Wister*) 153
- ODEN, T. C. *Pastoral Counsel* (*R. L. Kinast*) 552
- O'ROURKE, K. D., O.P., and P. Boyle, O.P. *Medical Ethics* (*E. D. Pellegrino*) 772
- PAILIN, D. A. *God and the Processes of Reality* (*J A. Bracken*) 354
- Patterns of Episcopal Leadership* (ed. G. P. Fogarty) (*P. W. Carey*) 345
- PELIKAN, J. *Christian Doctrine and Modern Culture (since 1700)* (*D. K. McKim*) 339
- Physics, Philosophy and Theology* (ed.

R. J. Russell et al.) (<i>J. F. Haught</i>)	151	WHYTE, B. Unfinished Encounter (<i>P. Fleming</i>)	170
PLASKOW, J. Standing Again at Sinai (<i>B. A. Cullom</i>)	732	SHORTER NOTICES	
POLK, D. P. On the Way to God (<i>T. Peters</i>)	352	BENZ, E. The Theology of Electricity (<i>F. R. Haig</i>)	785
POLZIN, R. Samuel and the Deuteronomist (<i>F. L. Moriarty</i>)	127	BEST, E. Paul and His Converts (<i>B. Fiore</i>)	368
RACK, H. D. Reasonable Enthusiast (<i>J. D. Nelson</i>)	749	BIRNBAUM, D. God and Evil (<i>S. Bevans</i>)	374
Romance and the Rock (ed. J. Fitzer) (<i>P. Misner</i>)	755	BLENKINSOPP, J. Ezekiel (<i>W. T. Miller</i>)	779
SALDARINI, A. J. Pharisees, Scribes and Sadducees in Palestinian Society (<i>R. A. Wild</i>)	128	Blessed Are the Peacemakers (ed. A. J. Tambasco) (<i>L. T. Johnson</i>)	173
SCHELD, S. Media salutis (<i>F. Posset</i>)	537	BOWE, B. E. A Church in Crisis (<i>C. Osiek</i>)	175
SCHWARTZ, R. M. Servant Leaders of the People of God (<i>R. Kress</i>)	530	BRADSHAW, P. F. Ordination Rites of the Ancient Churches of East and West (<i>J. F. Baldwin</i>)	782
SCOTT, B. B. Hear Then the Parable (<i>J. R. Donahue</i>)	328	CHAZAN, R. Dagers of Faith (<i>J. T. Paulikowski</i>)	176
SEGAL, A. F. Paul the Convert (<i>D. J. Harrington</i>)	737	CLEMENTS, R. E. Jeremiah (<i>M. D. Guinan</i>)	172
SESBOUÉ, B. Jésus-Christ l'unique médiateur (<i>J. L. Heft</i>)	526	The Condemnations of the Reformation Era (ed. K. Lehmann and W. Pan-nenberg) (<i>T. P. Rausch</i>)	791
SPALDING, T. W. The Premier See (<i>R. E. Curran</i>)	752	COOPER, D. D. Thomas Merton's Art of Denial (<i>T. M. King</i>)	178
STOCK, A. The Method and Message of Mark (<i>F. Connolly-Weinert</i>)	132	Correspondance de Fénelon 10-11 (ed. J. Orchibal et al.) (<i>W. C. Marceau</i>)	784
SWANSON, R. N. Church and Society in Later Medieval England (<i>T. E. Morrissey</i>)	532	Cosmos as Creation (ed. T. Peters) (<i>F. R. Haig</i>)	568
SWINBURNE, R. Responsibility and Atonement (<i>J. F. Keenan</i>)	770	CROCKETT, W. R. Eucharist (<i>S. Wood</i>)	377
TANNER, K. God and Creation in Christian Theology (<i>J. E. Thiel</i>)	140	DETWEILER, R. Breaking the Fall (<i>E. J. Ingebretsen</i>)	560
THILS, G. Primauté et infaillibilité du pontife romain à Vatican I (<i>J. T. Ford</i>)	757	DICK, J. A. The Malines Conversations Revisited (<i>H. J. Ryan</i>)	564
TORRANCE, T. F. The Trinitarian Faith (<i>J. A. Bracken</i>)	522	Le dossier du Donatisme 2 (ed. J.-L. Maier) (<i>R. B. Eno</i>)	559
VAN BEECK, F. J., S.J. God Encountered I (<i>R. P. Imbelli</i>)	145	DUSSEL, E. Ethics and Community (<i>A. F. McGovern</i>)	183
VEMPENY, I., S.J. Krsna and Christ (<i>F. X. Clooney</i>)	554	Ephrem the Syrian: Hymns (tr. K. E. McVey) (<i>F. G. McLeod</i>)	558
VICCHIO, S. J. The Voice from the Whirlwind (<i>M. R. Tripole</i>)	763	Ephrem the Syrian: Hymns on Paradise (tr. S. Brock) (<i>F. G. McLeod</i>)	782
WARNER, M. Philosophical Finesse (<i>Z. K. McKeon</i>)	774	FAIVRE, A. The Emergence of the Laity in the Early Church (<i>W. P. Loewe</i>)	781
WEBER, E.-H. Le Christ selon saint Thomas d'Aquin (<i>R. Cessario</i>)	135	Fifth Ecumenical Consultation between Theologians of the Oriental Orthodox Churches and the Roman Catholic Church (<i>J. Gros</i>)	790
WEBB, E. Philosophers of Consciousness (<i>M. Westphal</i>)	150		

- FITZMYER, J. A., S.J. *Luke the Theologian (C. H. Talbert)* 367
- FLUKER, W. E. *They Looked for a City (J. H. Evans)* 178
- The Galileo Affair (ed. M. A. Finocchiaro) (*M. F. McCarthy*) 177
- GAMMIE, J. G. *Holiness in Israel (A. L. Laffey)* 366
- GARRETT, S. R. *The Demise of the Devil (A. C. Mitchell)* 557
- GIBSON, G. M. *The Theater of Devotion (J. F. R. Day)* 562
- GODLOVE, T. F. *Religion, Interpretation, and Diversity of Belief (J. Reuscher)* 567
- GRÈS-GAYER, J. *Paris-Cantorbéry (1717-1720) (G. H. Tavard)* 563
- GRIFFIN, D. R. *God and Religion in the Postmodern World (R P Scharlemann)* 181
- GRITSCH, E. W. *Thomas Muntzer (F. Posset)* 371
- HALLETT, G. L. *Christian Neighbor-Love (S. J. Pope)* 183
- HARAKAS, S. S. *Health and Medicine in the Eastern Orthodox Tradition (J. J. Pulch)* 790
- HASTINGS, A. *African Catholicism (J. C. McKenna)* 570
- HAYES, Z., O.F.M. *Visions of a Future (B. T. Viviano)* 569
- HENNELLY, A., S.J. *Theology for a Liberating Church (J. Zimbelman)* 379
- HERR, E. *La violence (G. S. Harak)* 788
- HIRO, D. *Holy Wars (P. M. Arnold)* 793
- HOGAN, J. P. *Collingwood and Theological Hermeneutics (J. A. Colombo)* 177
- Interreligious Dialogue (ed. M. D. Bryant and F. Flinn) (*C. Hallisey*) 374
- JODDOCK, D. *The Church's Bible (W. S. Kurz)* 781
- A John Hick Reader (ed. P. Badham) (*C. Gillis*) 788
- KELLY, A. *The Trinity of Love (B. Finan)* 180
- KING, T. M., S.J. *Enchantments (J. A. Wiseman)* 567
- KÖNIG, A. *The Eclipse of Christ in Eschatology (Z. Hayes)* 377
- LEFEBURE, L. D. *Toward a Contemporary Wisdom Christology (R. Masson)* 376
- LEITH, J. H. *John Calvin's Doctrine of the Christian Life (A. J. Griffioen)* 176
- LESNICK, D. R. *Preaching in Medieval Florence (T. E. Morrissey)* 371
- The Letters of St. Cyprian of Carthage 3-4 (tr. G. W. Clarke) (*M. A. Fahey*) 175
- LEVI, W. *From Alms to Liberation (J. P. Hogan)* 184
- LUZBETAK, L. J. *The Church and Cultures (M. H. Kelleher)* 185
- MAZZA, E. *Mystagogy (J. D. Laurance)* 783
- MCDANIEL, J. B. *Of God and Pelicans (M. E. Ross)* 568
- MCKNIGHT, E. V. *Post-Modern Use of the Bible (M.-E. Rosenblatt)* 174
- MCMAHON, R. *Augustine's Prayerful Ascent (R. J. O'Connell)* 559
- MEEKS, M. D. *God the Economist (W. J. Byron)* 789
- MESTERS, C. *Defenseless Flower (M. L. Cook)* 557
- MILLER, J. W. *Biblical Faith and Fathering (P. M. Arnold)* 556
- MILLER, R. H. *Dialogue and Disagreement (D. J. Moore)* 564
- MIN, A. K. *Dialectic of Salvation (A. J. Tambasco)* 184
- MOONEY, C. M., R.S.C.J. *Philippine Duchesne (D. Liptak)* 785
- MOORE, G. *Believing in God (D. J. Casey)* 373
- MOXNES, H. *The Economy of the Kingdom (D. Hamm)* 172
- MURPHY, G. R., S.J. *The Saxon Savior (W. P. Lehmann)* 783
- NAUD, A. *Le magistère incertain (L. Orsy)* 181
- NEUSNER, J. *Invitation to Midrash (A. J. Saldarini)* 173
- NIETO, J. C. *San Juan de la Cruz (M. E. Giles)* 372
- NOEL, T. J. *Colorado Catholicism and the Archdiocese of Denver, 1857-1989 (G. McKeutt)* 786
- NOLAN, M. L., and S. NOLAN. *Christian Pilgrimage in Modern Western Europe (G. P. Evans)* 565
- NOVAK, D. *Jewish-Christian Dialogue (D. J. Harrington)*
- OSBORNE, K. B., O.F.M. *Priesthood (L.*

<i>Orsy</i>	378	(<i>J T Pawlikowski</i>)	369
Our Naming of God (ed. C. E. Braaten) (<i>T. W. Tilley</i>)	565	SOBRINO, J. Spirituality of Liberation (<i>P. E. Ritt</i>)	379
OVERHOLT, T. W. Channels of Proph- ecy (<i>W. J. Fulco</i>)	780	SPINK, K. A Sense of the Sacred (<i>D</i> <i>Toolan</i>)	179
The Papacy and the Church in the United States (ed. B. Cooke) (<i>D J.</i> <i>Grimes</i>)	378	STAFFNER, H., S.J. Jesus Christ and the Hindu Community (<i>J. D. Redington</i>)	570
The Praxis of Christian Experience (ed. R. J. Schreiter and M. C. Hilker) (<i>P.</i> <i>Churico</i>)	180	THISTLETHWAITE, S. Sex, Race, and God (<i>D. L. Hayes</i>)	792
Preaching in the Patristic Age (ed. D. G. Hunter) (<i>E. C. Muller</i>)	561	THURSTON, B. B. The Widows (<i>J. Hea-</i> <i>ney-Hunter</i>)	368
RAGEN, B. A. A Wreck on the Road to Damascus (<i>G. T. Cobb</i>)	380	WAHLDE, U. C. VON. The Earliest Ver- sion of John's Gospel (<i>P Perkins</i>)	558
RASMUSSEN, L. Dietrich Bonhoeffer (<i>G. B. Kelly</i>)	787	WATTS, F., and M. WILLIAMS. The Psy- chology of Religious Knowing (<i>W J.</i> <i>Sneck</i>)	566
RICHARDS, G. Towards a Theology of Religions (<i>P. J. Griffiths</i>)	373	WESTERMANN, C. The Living Psalms (<i>M. D. Gunan</i>)	366
Robert Bellarmine: Spiritual Writings (tr. J. P. Donnelly and R. J. Teske) (<i>M. W. Maher</i>)	563	WHITE, J. F. Protestant Worship (<i>M</i> <i>B Aune</i>)	791
SALY, J. Dante's <i>Paradiso</i> (<i>L M La</i> <i>Favia</i>)	561	WHITE, S. J. Art, Architecture, and Li- turgical Reform (<i>R. K. Seasoltz</i>)	787
SCASE, W. Piers Plowman and the New Anti-Clericalism (<i>O. B. Hardson, Jr</i>)	370	WILL, J. E. A Christology of Peace (<i>M</i> <i>L Cook</i>)	375
SCHMEMANN, A. The Eucharist (<i>J D</i> <i>Laurance</i>)	182	WREN, B. What Language Shall I Bor- row? (<i>J S Nelson</i>)	375
SCHRECKENBERG, H. Die christlichen Adversus-Judaeos-Texte (11-13 Jh.)		ZAHAROPOULOS, D. A. Theodore of Mopsuestia on the Bible (<i>C E</i> <i>Rabinowitz</i>)	369