

BOOK REVIEWS

EXODUS. By Terence E. Fretheim. *Interpretation Commentary for Teaching and Preaching*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. xii + 321. \$21.95.

The Interpretation Commentaries aim at presenting not historical-critical exegesis or homiletic helps, but “a third kind of resource,” offering “the integrated result of historical and theological work with the biblical text” for the purposes especially of teachers and preachers.

F. takes the canonical text of Exodus as it stands and explicates it section by section. His theological point of view, expounded in his previous works, is clearly marked in this one. He sees “creation theology” at the heart of Exodus as we have it; redemption themes are to be understood in function of this creation theology. In bringing Israel out of bondage God overcomes the chaotic, life-threatening power of Egypt and restores the cosmic order of creation, not only in the exodus itself but especially in giving Israel its laws at Sinai and in establishing the tabernacle.

F. pays special attention throughout to the depiction of God. God “adjusts to new developments”; the human situation affects God’s possibilities; God is responsive to human need and human initiative; God respects human freedom and accommodates himself to human agency; indeed the order of creation is designed in such a way that humans are to be alert to, and to avail themselves of, the resources it contains; “God chooses to share the decision-making process with the human partner”; and so on.

The way of proceeding chosen for this series can lead to a certain plodding quality in the exposition, which however F.’s lively style mostly avoids. The notes-and-comments format of the Anchor Bible at least allows attention to particular words and images and their echoes in other texts; but though constrained by the method of the series, so that he has to treat specific items *obiter*, tucking them as it were into his exposition, F. offers many satisfying exegetical insights. Especially rewarding is his treatment of the hardening of Pharaoh’s heart; the liturgical patterning of chapters 1–15 (working out from W. L. Moran’s insight that the lament form underlies the early chapters of Exodus); the role of covenant law in Israel’s life; the decalogue and other laws in Exodus 20–23; and the apostasy and covenant “renewal” in 32–34. F. highlights magisterially the echoes of “creation” in Genesis that one hears in Exodus. Most of these are of course from the Priestly Source, but F.’s canonical approach does not allow a treatment

of P as such. Indeed, the richness of theological imagination found in the various traditions that are woven together to form Exodus is hardly addressed: the final redactor's perspective is what is in focus.

One might question the use of the "chaos/cosmos" typology in the understanding of creation: it has a 19th-century ring. Many of F.'s concerns—transcendence/immanence, freedom/obedience, divine sovereignty/human agency—seem to some extent to be imported from the realm of systematic theology; whether the biblical text is intended to correspond to these concerns, or whether they come from a rather different thought world, would make for an interesting discussion. Finally, readers should be aware of the ambiguity of the expression "creation theology": the term means very different things in different theological circles.

F. seems to adopt the practice of avoiding personal pronouns for God, which leads to awkward constructions. The eight times pronouns do occur, however, it turns out that God is "he" after all.

Georgetown University

J. P. M. WALSH, S.J.

BIBLICAL CRITICISM IN CRISIS? THE IMPACT OF THE CANONICAL APPROACH ON OLD TESTAMENT STUDIES. By Mark G. Brett. Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1991. Pp. xiv + 237. \$44.50.

The title of this book is somewhat misleading. It is not an analysis of the current state of biblical studies, nor even of the impact thereon of the "canonical approach" advocated by B. S. Childs. Rather it is an analysis of Childs's own approach and an attempt to offer some friendly amendments to it. Brett is critical of Childs's totalitarian tendency to disallow all methods but his own; he points out that scholars have various "interpretative interests" which are not necessarily in conflict with each other, and advocates a more pluralist approach. While tracing the development of Childs's work from his early monographs to his huge Introductions, the main issue B. singles out concerns the relevance of historical background for biblical interpretation. A chapter entitled "Has Childs fallen into Gabler's ditch?" attempts to put this issue in context by providing a brief sketch of the development of biblical criticism in 19th-century Germany. B. contends that historical particularity is not a self-evident requirement, and that Childs cannot be faulted for not having a stronger historical interest. At a later point B. suggests that "a comparison with Gadamer's philosophy provides the most charitable way of understanding the hermeneutics of the canonical approach" (146), while admitting that there are significant differences between Childs and Gabler. In his final chapter he suggests that the work of Lindbeck, Frei, and Thiemann represents "the closest theological ally of the canonical approach" (164).

B. exhibits wide reading, not only in biblical criticism but also in 19th-century German intellectual history and contemporary literary theory; but there are some fundamental problems with his attempt to rehabilitate the canonical approach. Childs has explicitly rejected attempts to link his approach to those of Gadamer or Lindbeck, which he considers too humanistic. The canonical approach is rooted in Barthian theology and stands or falls on its attribution of the canonical text to the Holy Spirit. To give up all talk of revelation, as B. suggests (164), would be to remove the *raison d'être* of the canonical approach. If Gadamer's approach is superior, why persist in talking about the canonical approach at all? It is a defect in B.'s analysis of Childs that he never probes the theological roots of the canonical approach, or pursues the question of what constitutes *theological* interpretation.

B.'s sympathy for the canonical approach seems to arise from the fact that it focuses on the final form of the text and avoids much hypothetical study of backgrounds. He cites Gadamer and Karl Popper to show that some texts can and do "speak for themselves." The authorities cited, however, scarcely prove the point. Texts may take on meanings that their authors never envisaged, but these meanings still depend on the context and intentions of the interpreters. At most, B. shows that there is much support for synchronic interpretation in various strands of contemporary thought. Whether such interpretation is in any way preferable to traditional historical criticism, is another matter. B.'s concluding remarks, on the theological value of "final form study," are the weakest part of the book. He argues that historical criticism creates a gap between expert biblical interpreters and the laity, by requiring subtle reconstructions behind the text (165), and that an egalitarian ecclesiology would take the final form of Scripture as its starting point. This argument might carry some weight as a pastoral strategy, but the difficulty of understanding an ancient text cannot be so easily avoided.

University of Chicago

JOHN J. COLLINS

THE LORDSHIP OF CHRIST: ERNST KÄSEMANN'S INTERPRETATION OF PAUL'S THEOLOGY. By David Way. New York: Oxford/Clarendon, 1991. Pp. xiv + 336. \$79.

Based on a doctoral dissertation directed by Robert Morgan and accepted by the University of Oxford in 1987, this volume argues that the "lordship of Christ" sums up Käsemann's interpretation of Paul's theology and serves to relate the individual themes to the doctrinal center of justification.

After situating K.'s interpretation of Paul's theology in its theolog-

ical (the Reformation heritage) and historical-critical (from F. C. Baur to R. Bultmann) contexts, Way shows how K.'s dissertation *Leib und Leib Christi* (1933) and various essays published before 1950 contributed elements toward the "lordship of Christ" construct. Next he sketches K.'s growing interest after 1960 in the apocalyptic background to Paul's theology and his use of "apocalyptic" to understand God, Christ, the world, and Christian life. Then he focuses on the themes of God's righteousness and the justification of the ungodly as the center of K.'s interpretation of Paul. Finally he explains how these central themes carried through in K.'s understanding of Paul's ecclesiology and ethics.

Way concludes that the lordship of Christ theme makes for a remarkable consistency in K.'s interpretation of Paul's theology across five decades, even if K. did change his mind about the center of Paul's theology and its history-of-religions background. He observes that K. tried to bring together two divergent traditions: the historical-critical exegesis of mid- to late-19th-century German Protestantism (Baur, Lüdemann, the history-of-religions school), and the tradition of an explicitly theological interpretation drawing on Lutheran and Reformed perspectives (especially Barth, Schlatter, and Bultmann). Thus Way states: "Käsemann puts forward a view of Paul which is basically indebted to Barth and offers a 'correction' of Bultmann. As an interpreter of the New Testament, he gives his views better (though not unflawed) historical and exegetical foundations than Barth did, and integrates the results of nineteenth-century research on the church and sacraments which the latter ignored. By doing so, Käsemann pointed (with Schweitzer) to the apocalyptic background of Paul and the New Testament, and thus to an important part of their Jewish background" (286).

The crowning achievement of K.'s scholarly career was his commentary on Romans (1973). It is by no means an easy book to read in either German or English (1980). It contains no introduction, and freely mixes literary, historical, and theological comments; it presupposes ideas developed in articles and monographs. Way has provided that rich commentary with a reliable and thorough prolegomenon, companion, and critique all at once. Though he approaches K.'s work in something of a chronological order, the volume is a theological dialogue rather than a biography. Way is fair and generally sympathetic to K.'s views. Yet he can also achieve enough distance to situate these views historically and point out their inadequacies and inconsistencies where necessary. His final judgment is that K.'s work on Paul and especially on Romans is "historically informed, theological exegesis" (286)—more theology with Paul (Pauline theology) than the theology

of Paul. This combination of historical and theological interpretation is both K.'s genius and (to some) his fatal flaw.

Weston School of Theology

DANIEL J. HARRINGTON, S.J.

NEW TESTAMENT APOCRYPHA 1: GOSPELS AND RELATED WRITINGS. Revised edition. By Wilhelm Schneemelcher. English translation edited by R. McL. Wilson. Cambridge: James Clarke; and Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. iii + 560. \$29.95.

During the twentieth century the *Neutestamentliche Apokryphen in deutscher Übersetzung*, first published in 1904 by Edgar Hennecke, has been the vademecum of theologians and biblical scholars. When its third edition appeared in 1959 under the editorship of W. Schneemelcher, of the University of Bonn, its value was recognized, and it was soon translated into English in two volumes (1963, 1965). Hennecke had died in 1951, and the fifth German edition, substantially revised, appeared under the name of Schneemelcher alone in 1987 and 1989. R. McL. Wilson, of the University of St. Andrews, Scotland, who had cared for the first English version, now presents an English form of the first volume, based on the sixth, slightly corrected edition of the German original.

S.'s new form is not a mere updating of introductions and bibliographies after roughly thirty years of study of these important apocryphal writings, but includes new material as well. Though the bulk of the texts that appeared in earlier editions has been retained, it has at times been rearranged and expanded, mostly by the addition of apocryphal Gospels that had come to light in the Nag Hammadi library. Thus what had appeared in the first English edition under the heading "Isolated Sayings of the Lord," especially Oxyrhynchus Papyri 1, 654, 655, now appears under "The Coptic Gospel of Thomas," since those papyrus fragments represent an early Greek form of the same Gospel. It was only after the first publication of the Coptic text of this Gospel that one realized that they represented an earlier form of it. The Coptic Gospel of Thomas had appeared in the first English edition in an appendix, along with a precis of the Gospel of Truth. Both of these (in full form) are now incorporated into the body of the book itself in their proper locations. Other instances of rearrangements include the Strasbourg Coptic Papyrus, which now becomes part of Fragments of Unknown Gospels.

The added texts include the Gospel of Philip, the Book of Thomas the Contender, the Dialogue of the Savior, the First and Second Apocalypses of James, the Letter of Peter to Philip, and the full text of the Apocryphon of James. These are all texts that came to light in the

discovery of the Nag Hammadi library. Their titles reveal that they are not all "gospels" in the strict sense, but then the subtitle of this volume is "Gospels and Related Writings," and so they are to be understood as falling in the latter category. The surprise is the inclusion in an appendix to the section "Fragments of Unknown Gospels" of "The 'Secret Gospel' of Mark," which Morton Smith once published, having claimed to have discovered it in a book of the Greek Orthodox monastery of Mar Saba. But the editor (H. Merkel) is careful to note that the text of this document "to this day has not been accessible to anyone else" (106), and that "any conclusions relating to the historical Jesus are not possible" (107); "M. Smith's conclusions [on this last point] have been rejected by practically all critics" (109). One still wonders whether Smith has not perpetrated a scholarly hoax, since no one else has ever seen the document.

In any case, one is fortunate to have this revised edition of S.'s work in English dress. The general introduction has been radically rewritten and improved, and the introductions to individual Gospels have been slightly revised where needed. More extensive bibliographies, including many more recent items but also some older important material, have been incorporated. The notes that usually appeared at the bottom of the page have been gathered together at the end of individual sections, making use of them less convenient. Overall, however, this is a welcome production, and we are indebted to both S. and Wilson for it.

This volume will be of value not only to biblical scholars, but also to theologians, for it makes accessible a good English translation of such texts as the "Protevangelium of James," which is the source of the tradition about the names of the parents of Mary, the mother of Jesus, her presentation in the Temple, and her marriage to Joseph, who had children by a previous marriage; it is thus an important text for the tradition about her perpetual virginity. Or again, of the "Testimonium Flavianum," Josephus's witness to Jesus, "a wise man, if indeed one may call him a man," and a brief up-to-date account of the problems surrounding its authenticity and/or interpolation. Similarly, the "Coptic Gospel of Thomas" preserves a number of the sayings and parables of Jesus, of which we know from the canonical Gospels, in a form that scholars have at times judged to be more primitive than those of the canonical texts. Whether that judgment is wholly accurate or not, the testimony that this Coptic Gospel bears to the growth and development of the gospel tradition is important and has to be taken into account in any theological discussion of that tradition.

CHRISTIAN INITIATION AND BAPTISM IN THE HOLY SPIRIT: EVIDENCE FROM THE FIRST EIGHT CENTURIES. By Kilian McDonnell and George T. Montague. Collegeville: Glazier/Liturgical, 1991. Pp. xiv + 354. \$12.95.

McDonnell and Montague have collaborated on a careful and significant study of the theme of Christian initiation and its relation to "baptism in the Spirit." Montague explores the NT material, and McDonnell treats selected representatives from the first eight centuries, ranging from Tertullian in North Africa, through Cyril of Jerusalem, to the later Syrian monastic tradition. Both then sum up their conclusions in a succinct and pastorally suggestive final chapter.

The contemporary pentecostal or charismatic movement, probably the fastest growing group of Christians in the world today, forms the background for their investigation. M. and M., who are sympathetic participants in the movement, see it as a major challenge and opportunity for the wider Church. In their capacity as scholarly interpreters, they tend to the view that what contemporary charismatics commonly term "baptism in the Spirit" was, in effect, integral to the understanding of initiation in the early Church. "Water baptism in the name of Jesus" and the "gift of the Holy Spirit" together represent constitutive and normative elements of the early Church's understanding and practice of initiation. Christian initiation is irreducibly initiation into life in the Spirit of Jesus Christ.

No doubt there are variables and unknowns: e.g., whether hands were always imposed or anointing always employed. However, among the constants, to which the NT and early Patristic age witness, are an experiential-affective reception of the Spirit and an expectant anticipation of charismatic manifestations. Indeed, a major contribution of the study is the insight it provides into the place and understanding of charisms in the early Church and the gradual diminishing of expectation that sets in later, as exemplified in the case of Chrysostom.

Whatever the part played by anti-Montanist caution and ecclesiastical centralization, an interesting hypothesis of the authors also attributes the decline of experiential and charismatic expectation to the progressive failure to view Christian initiation in light of Jesus' own baptism and its well-nigh exclusive reference to the death/resurrection symbolism. As a result the charismatic ministry, consequent upon the baptism of the Lord, comes less to the fore. Inevitably seeds are sown whereby baptism in the Spirit becomes marginal to a process of initiation understood in an almost exclusively Christological fashion.

This study is scholarly, but its pastoral concern and relevance are patent. It offers building stones and encouragement to develop an ecclesiology of communion and, ultimately, a Spirit Christology and ec-

clesiology. Clearly M. and M. do not countenance the substitution of a one-sided Christology by an equally one-sided pneumatology. Rather, with Congar, they seek to do justice to the two inseparable missions of Word and Spirit. They affirm: "Both Jesus and the Spirit occupy the center but in different ways. In oversimplified terms Jesus is at the center as the 'what' of the gospel, the Spirit as the 'how'."

Without pretending to offer specific pastoral strategies, they enunciate a principle we do well to ponder: "The range of reception is often related to the range of expectations." If baptism in the Spirit is truly integral to Christian initiation, this conclusion cannot remain merely a theological dictum, but must be embodied in a substantive catechesis. Such a persuasion does not entail that one concentrate uniquely on the more "spectacular" charisms; nor does it involve any deprecating of the institutional element of the Church. But it attests that the charismatic is crucial to the survival and growth of the Church and its capacity to engage in transformative service for the sake of the world. "Baptism in the Holy Spirit," they affirm, "does not belong to private piety, but . . . to the public official liturgy of the Church." Despite a certain repetitiveness in the treatment of the patristic material, they have impressively made their case.

Boston College

ROBERT P. IMBELLI

PRESBYTERON KREITTON: DER ALTERSBEWEIS DER JÜDISCHEN UND CHRISTLICHEN APOLOGETEN UND SEINE VORGESCHICHTE. By Peter Pilhofer. *Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament*. Tübingen: Mohr (Siebeck), 1990. Pp. xv + 339. DM 78.

Christian apologetic literature flourished in the second century in response to the higher scientific culture of the day, which demanded proof and evidence before assent could be given (e.g., Galen). The apologists tried to supply this for Christianity, using, among others, the proof from prophecy, which is of biblical origin, and the proof from antiquity, which is a not uncommon form of argument in classical literature. The proof from antiquity consists of the following axioms: (1) whatever is old is good; (2) what is older is better (the formula of Timaios of Locri, which gives the present study its title; the reverse is also true); (3) whatever is new is bad; (4) what is newer is worse.

The proof from antiquity is not a form of argument invented by Jewish and Christian apologists, and it is not limited to the sphere of religion. Thus it behooved Pilhofer in this painstaking revision of his doctoral dissertation to explore the prehistory of this argument in Greek and Latin, as well as in Hellenistic Jewish literature. The investigation into its historical roots goes far to demonstrate that the

ancient reader of an early Christian apology would find nothing problematic in the reasoning.

P. begins with a general treatment of the attitude of the ancient Greeks towards the theme "old versus new." Throughout Greek literature "new" has a pejorative connotation, as in the *Clouds* of Aristophanes, where the "new" culture allows a son to thrash his father. In contrast to the present age there was but a limited idea of progress; many authors noted the tension between technical progress and moral regress. Hecataeus of Miletus provides the two presuppositions for a proof from antiquity as Jews and Christians used it: reverence for an old tradition, and the localization of this tradition in Egypt. The significance of Herodotus for the argument from antiquity lies in his gallant attempt to derive much of Greek culture and religion from Egypt. The evidence of Aristophanes reveals that the argument was used in everyday life.

Later Greek literature contains certain material presuppositions for the proof from antiquity as it appears in Jewish and Christian apologetic. E.g., Lucian and Diogenes Laertius discuss the possibility that philosophy originated among the barbarians. Egypt is viewed as the training ground of all philosophers. In Rome there was great respect and reverence for the *mos maiorum*—that stubborn conservatism which made Romans even more receptive than Greeks to the proof from antiquity.

A chapter on Hellenistic Judaism begins by comparing the different responses of Jews and Romans to Hellenism. The decisive distinction is that Jews made no material concessions to Greek mythology in their literature, although the argument from antiquity is used, in an offensive posture, to the effect that the Greeks are dependent on the Jews.

P.'s final chapters are devoted to the Christian apologists of the second century. Ironically, the earliest Christian apology, the *Kerygma Petri*, asserts the superiority of Christianity on the basis of it being the new way to worship God, whereas Jewish apologetic tried to prove the antiquity of Judaism. Aristides and the *Epistle to Diognetus* follow in the tradition of the *Kerygma Petri* in asserting the newness of Christianity.

Justin Martyr is credited with introducing the conception that the Christian religion is much older than Greek culture. Justin is preoccupied with vindicating the antiquity of the Christian religion, which is older than the sources in which it is found. The assertion of the great age of the OT prophets is thus an integral part of his defense. Both Greek philosophy and mythology are later degenerations from the ancient prophets. Justin's pupil, Tatian, is the first Christian apologist to make a systematic presentation of the proof from antiquity. A strong

contrast appears in Athenagoras, who does not formally use the proof but finds ample evidence in Platonism. Theophilus and Tertullian follow in the steps of Justin, whereas Minucius Felix stands closer to the *Kerygma Petri* and *Diognetus* in asserting the newness of the Christian religion and its discontinuity with earlier manifestations of piety.

In the conclusion to this thorough investigation, P. discusses the theological legitimacy of the argument from antiquity. Unfortunately, the proof from antiquity partakes of the ambiguity of apologetic argumentation in general, which accepts the presuppositions of the opponent—in this case the belief that older is necessarily better. It is “putting new wine into old bottles” (Mark 2:22), and necessarily distorts the newness of the revelation. This is an insightful book on a pivotal line of thought in early Christianity. It provides a wealth of information on a difficult subject not available elsewhere.

Boston College

MARGARET A. SCHATKIN

JERUSALEM AND BABYLON: A STUDY INTO AUGUSTINE'S *CITY OF GOD* AND THE SOURCES OF HIS DOCTRINE OF THE TWO CITIES. By Johannes van Oort. *Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae*. Leiden: Brill, 1991. Pp. xi + 427. \$103.

This English translation of Van Oort's doctoral dissertation, which was directed by Gilles Quispel at the University of Utrecht, advances a bold and, indeed, somewhat controversial thesis. Although he in no way denies the apologetic character of Augustine's masterpiece, O. defines the *City of God* as primarily a catechetical work.

The method used to arrive at this conclusion has been frequently applied by scholars to the Augustinian corpus with varying degrees of effectiveness. Essentially, O. compares Augustine to Augustine, using one work as a guide to the structure and logic of another. In this case, the *Catechizing of the Uninstructed* is the norm for analyzing the catechetical qualities of the later *City of God*. Basing his conclusions on careful and complete research, O. finds striking similarities between the two works in both form and content. The model catechesis of the earlier work is elaborated and expanded in the *City of God*. In both, Augustine begins with the inquiry of those who are to be instructed, which is then followed by the *narratio* or history of salvation and the *exhortatio* or practical application of the narrative. In both, the six ages of history are metaphorically described as a history of two dichotomous cities culminating in the ultimate goal of love, blessedness, and peace.

O. supports his thesis with further evidence. First, he cites two letters of Augustine to Firmus, only recently subject to serious scrutiny,

the one published by Lambot in 1939 and the other by Divjak in 1981. The letters show that Augustine recommended his *City of God* to the catechumen (not the presbyter) Firmus and requested that it be circulated among others seeking instruction. Second, O. points out that Augustine himself was a catechumen during his youth. His mother, Monica, was a Christian who instructed her son in the faith. His pagan father, Patricius, was baptized toward the end of his life. His common law wife and his son, Adeodatus, were also Christian. Augustine, raised in a Christian environment, had personal experience of the catechumenate. The model catechesis of his writings may to some extent have been based upon his own conversion experience.

The catechetical character of the *City of God* necessarily leads O. to search for the sources of Augustine's doctrine in a catechetical context. He investigates four possible sources extensively: Manichaeism; contemporary philosophy (Platonism, Stoicism, and Philo); Tyconius; and early Christian, Jewish, and Jewish-Christian traditions. Although he recognizes the impossibility of specifying one single source to the exclusion of others, O. opts for the early Christian tradition, particularly its "archaic Jewish-Christian element," as the principal source of Augustine's two cities. The *Shepherd of Hermas*, a Jewish-Christian writing translated into Latin at an early date and circulated in the West, makes use of the metaphor of two antithetical cities, while the *Didache* and the *Epistle of Barnabas* present the teaching of the two ways. The *Pseudo-Clementines* develop a catechesis based upon the two ways, two spirits, and two kingdoms. Similar approaches may be found elsewhere in Jewish and Christian literature prior to Augustine. Any affinity between Augustine's two cities and comparable concepts in Manichaeism and the writings of Tyconius are explained as indications of a common Jewish-Christian heritage. Contemporary philosophical notions of two worlds or two cities do not exhibit the absolute antithesis essential to Augustine's approach. Although Augustine often cites the Scriptures, O. maintains that the doctrine of the two cities did not develop out of direct exegesis of specific Old or New Testament passages. Instead, Augustine subsequently developed a biblical basis for the concept of two antithetical cities, which he had already inherited from the ancient catechetical tradition of the Church.

O.'s title epitomizes his conclusion. Two antithetical societies have faced each other from creation and will continue to face each other until the end of the world. One belongs to God and the other to the devil. Identifying these two metaphorical cities as Jerusalem and Babylon ultimately points to the Jewish origin of the concept, which was handed down in the catechetical tradition of the Church and immortalized in Augustine's *City of God*.

O.'s forcefully argued thesis raises two broader historical questions with significant theological ramifications. First, to what extent did Augustine's *City of God* in particular and the apologetic literature of the early Church in general find audiences inside rather than outside the Christian community? Second, to what extent did the African Church in particular and Western Christianity in general grow explicitly from indigenous Jewish or Jewish-Christian roots? Acceptance of O.'s conclusions may require some sober historical and theological re-assessment.

Saint Louis University

KENNETH B. STEINHAUSER

TOWARD A DEFINITION OF ANTISEMITISM. By Gavin I. Langmuir. Berkeley: University of California, 1991. Pp. x + 427. \$45.

There is no post-Holocaust inquiry more critical for Christian self-understanding than the nature of the relationship between the anti-Judaism of theological pronouncement and the antisemitism of racist denunciation and murder. This collection of studies by a distinguished Stanford University historian is a major contribution to that self-understanding. These primarily historical studies, most of which have appeared previously in scattered journals, are the foundation for Langmuir's more theoretical statement in *History, Religion and Antisemitism* and for his forthcoming *Antisemitism in Christendom* which will address a more general audience.

These nuanced analyses subvert the consoling claim that Nazi racist antisemitism is totally unrelated to the Christian experience. The first millennium of Christianity created a theological doctrine of anti-Judaism which was reflected in the weak legal status accorded Jews and in the strong popular disdain reserved for them. From the 11th to the 13th centuries, however, there developed in northern Europe a concomitant Christian antisemitism, an attitude and activity toward Jews which exhibited the kind of irrational hostility which Hitler expressed in our times. This medieval antisemitism asserted that Jews were guilty of such crimes as the ritual murder of Christian youth, the desecration of hosts, and the poisoning of wells. In addition to their place in the Christian theological imagination, Jews found themselves accused of deeds that were fantasies, unsupported by any evidence.

L. is at his scholarly best in tracking down the historical origin of these fantasies. The sources for this preracist antisemitism are multiple. There was the Christianization of the Germanic tribes which made Europe more self-conscious in its Christian identity and more distant from the memory of Roman religious pluralism, which had not placed disagreement in belief on the horizon of aberrant conduct. There were

new directions in Christian piety which placed greater emphasis on the Gospels and the suffering of Jesus and, thus, greater stress on those who were held responsible for that suffering. Then there were the Crusades and the widespread sentiments and resentments which were born with them: on the geographical map of menacing, unbelieving forces standing outside of fortress Christianity, the Jewish presence in Europe represented a singular affront to the vision of a secure, triumphant Christianity.

The decisive factor, however, was a new relation to reason and experience. As medieval faith entered into deeper conversation with reason, new sensitivities toward logic and empirical knowledge developed which, in turn, generated disturbing doubts among Christians about the reasonableness of what they believed, whether the beliefs pertained to the significance of Christendom, e.g., or to such fundamentals as the divinity of Christ and the meaning of the Eucharist. Fantasies about Jewish crimes emerged as a response to these repressed doubts and, from one perspective, fashioned Jews into distorted witnesses to Christian conviction: only that witness could account for their eagerness to torture Christ in the profanation of defenseless hosts and to continue his crucifixion and death in the ritual murder of his innocent followers. More absolutely, the Jew had become a perverse enemy. If Christianity was so clearly true on the level of reason and so evidently triumphant on the empirical, historical level, what could possibly account for the Jew's refusal to accept Christianity?

Cluny's Abbot Peter the Venerable (c. 1092–1156) took a decisive step in L.'s judgment. Jewish disbelief proved that the Jew lacked far more than the spiritual understanding of the Scriptures which earlier Christians had charged; the Jew lacked the power of reasoning itself and, therefore, was subhuman. The Jew deserves an inferior status because of a degraded nature: "Jews were not inferior because they did not believe and killed Christ; they disbelieved and killed Christ because of their essentially inferior nature that was also manifested in their clannishness, avarice, and cowardice" (348).

The transformation of Jews from historical actors into fantastic agents who become the constant prey of chimerical claims defines the concept of antisemitism toward which L. has worked. It is neither a form of traditional Christian anti-Judaism nor essentially tied to modern racism, and yet L.'s notion of antisemitism places both of these into a broader perspective which distinguishes them but also relates them. Although Christendom's medieval antisemitism frequently exploded into massacres and expulsions, it was more often content to nurture the abiding hatred and steady mistreatment which Peter the Venerable advocated: "God wishes them [the Jews], not to be killed, but to be

preserved in a life worse than death, like Cain the fratricide, for greater torment and greater ignominy" (201).

Current religious efforts to overcome this hatred will be in debt to L.'s important volume. He shows us that we are no longer able to examine our own Christian history and its attitudes toward Jews through any strictly theological stained glass which would aim to filter out the glare of our age's fires.

Boston College

JAMES BERNAUER, S.J.

RAISON D'ÉTAT, RAISON DE DIEU: POLITIQUE ET MYSTIQUE CHEZ JEANNE DE FRANCE. By Jean-François Drèze. Paris: Beauchesne, 1991. Pp. 328. Fr. 195.

Originally a doctoral thesis for the University of Paris, this book is a welcome addition to the bibliography of a little-known saint. Jeanne de France, also known as Jeanne de Valois (1464–1505), daughter of king Louis XI, became nominally queen when her cousin-husband, the duke of Orleans, to whom she had been married when she was 12 years old, succeeded her brother Charles VIII on the throne and became Louis XII. Herself a cripple and hunchback, Jeanne, like all the king's daughters, was a pawn on her father's diplomatic chessboard. She was married for "reasons of state": believing Jeanne to be sterile, the pious and tortuous Louis XI wanted to make sure the house of Orleans would die out, the duke having no heir. But Jeanne's husband loathed and avoided her, spending the night with her only on direct orders from the king. He tried (in vain) to have the marriage annulled while he was duke. After he became king, however, the union was dissolved by Alexander VI for non-consummation, though the statements of the two persons concerned were somewhat ambiguous.

Jeanne never really lived with her husband. Yet she strenuously defended the validity of her marriage as a true sacrament ("raison de Dieu"). Meanwhile, she lived her own inner life in God's intimacy. Since the age of seven she kept the memory of words heard in a prophetic vision (another aspect of "raison de Dieu") to the effect that she would, before dying, found a new order devoted to the Holy Virgin. Having been made duchess of Berry by her ex-husband, she personally administered the duchy, where she attempted to reform the Church by reforming the religious orders. She used her position and relations to establish the Order of the Virgin Mary ("les Annonciades"). The rule of 1502 organized the life of its members on participation in the ten virtues of Mary that she identified in the New Testament. A revised rule was approved by Leo X in 1517. Jeanne was beatified in 1642, and canonized in 1950 by Pius XII.

Jeanne's spirituality and her mystical experiences are known only through the writings of her confessor-director, the Franciscan Observant Gilbert Nicolas. Drèze skillfully traces back its sources to the reforming zeal of the *devotio moderna*, the *Imitation of Christ*, and the Brothers of the Common Life. But Jeanne interpreted this movement in a Marian sense that was unusual for her time and anticipated some of the later insights of St. Jean Eudes and St. Margaret-Mary: Jeanne had a vision of the hearts of Jesus and Mary and found her own heart taken over by the heart of Christ.

The political and the mystical constantly mix in this complex and fascinating story. The Calabrian St. Francis de Paola is a trusted adviser of Louis XI and of Charles VIII, whom he converts to a holy life. Louis XII receives friendly letters from Alexander VI, whose unsavory son, Cesar Borgia (a cardinal, then laicized and made duke of Valence by his father), acts as legate in France. Louis XII, however, wages a disastrous war against Alexander's successor, Julius II. Living in a network of hard politics and often superstitious piety, Jeanne is not naive: she gives shelter in her palace at Bourges to Cesar Borgia's abandoned wife and child.

Drèze has skillfully analyzed the politics and the spirituality of Jeanne de France. In 320 "annexes," actually extended footnotes, he provides an amazing wealth of somewhat unorganized material. (Some of these annexes have no apparent connection with the text that refers to them, and annexe 306 is missing.) At times, he becomes less than critical. Ignoring the standard Quaracchi edition of St. Bonaventure, he cites two pseudo-Bonaventurian works as authentic (annexes 166, 182). He endorses the peculiar notion that Jeanne became a saint because she belonged to a *beata stirps*, already sanctified by St. Louis IX (king: 1226–1270) and by a series of holy women (134–36). The discussion of the Immaculate Conception, to which Jeanne was devoted, favors the "immaculist" side, making too little of the "maculist" opposition, which reacted against the sometimes exuberant promotion of the doctrine.

The book is marred by numerous misprints. The reader's grasp of complex family ties is assisted by several genealogical trees. An appendix contains three letters of Pope Alexander VI to Louis XII. There is an exhaustive bibliography, but no index.

Assumption Center, Brighton, Mass.

GEORGE H. TAVARD

THE LONG ARGUMENT: ENGLISH PURITANISM AND THE SHAPING OF NEW ENGLAND CULTURE, 1570–1700. By Stephen Foster. Chapel Hill, N.C.: University of North Carolina, 1991. Pp. xx + 395. \$39.95.

Historians have approached the New England Puritans from a wide variety of perspectives; yet nearly all scholars suggest that the arrival of the first settlers aboard the *Arbella* in 1629 marked a sharp line of demarcation in the history of the Puritan movement: the story of New England Puritanism—and the “Americanization” of English culture and institutions—begins on the shores of Massachusetts. Adopting a transatlantic perspective, Foster here breaks with this convention, reminding us that “American history begins before America,” and that the Atlantic migration was merely one event “set somewhere in the middle of an extended story (xii, x).”

By adding “the first sixty years” of Puritanism “back into the American story (287),” F. reveals a number of unresolved tensions which, once set into motion in England, continued to influence Puritanism in America to the turn of the 18th century and beyond. The “Argument” of F.’s title refers not to any particular issue or set of issues, but to the continuing narrative of a Puritan movement fraught with ambiguities and contradictions over 130 years of development. Nonetheless, one longstanding problem regarding the relationship of Puritanism to the larger nation stands out as central to F.’s analysis: the tensions between inclusive church membership and purity, “the duality between the insular and the comprehensive that had always been at the heart of the movement” (27). The Puritans’ efforts to resolve this relationship over the course of a century resulted in continuous adaptation and accommodation in both England and America, and accounted for much of the movement’s responsiveness and vitality.

English Puritans first began to wrestle with these issues in the 16th century, and their varying conclusions would prove crucial in shaping institutional and cultural development in New England. F. skillfully describes, e.g., how the debate over sectarianism and inclusiveness that divided English radicals and moderates influenced the evolving theory and practice of New England’s Congregational polity and the related system of “practical divinity,” or the “means” by which churchgoers might seek salvation. Similarly, Laudian repression, which destroyed a delicate coalition between English radicals and moderates, set in motion a chain of events that tilted New England institutions in the direction of sectarianism. The persecuted migrants of the later 1630s infused New England churches with such religious intensity, F. argues, that ministers paid relatively little heed to the needs of the small numbers of “weak” Christians in their flocks. This overemphasis upon sectarianism resulted in a lack of “practical divinity” or “means” in Massachusetts, contributing in no small measure to the second generation’s crisis in church membership and the consequent formulation of the Halfway Covenant, through which ministers attempted to shift

the balance back toward comprehensiveness. F. offers a particularly insightful discussion of the bitter struggles over membership requirements during the second half of the 17th century, describing them not as evidence of "declension" or secularization, but merely as the continuation of debates over issues that had divided Puritans for generations.

Late in the 17th century, English intervention in New England forced American Puritans to close ranks, to set aside their squabbles over membership, and to seek means of achieving unity. Faced with the loss of their charter, ministers turned Congregationalism into a national church that became central to their identity as a new Israel. At the same time, ministers instituted new practices such as the covenant renewal and multiple levels of membership to bring more followers into the church. The ministers' skill in adaptation and accommodation resulted in their thorough domination of New England culture until the Great Awakening, which, F. asserts, finally "ruptured" the Puritan movement through its creation of permanent clerical factions, church schisms, and its dismissal of ecclesiastical ordinances and private duties in favor of mass revivals and emphasis upon the sermon.

Throughout, F. utilizes his unique approach to New England Puritanism to uncover fresh insights that are lost in previous analyses that foreshorten the context of New England developments to internal factors and therefore become inbred. F. also displays an impressive command of primary and secondary sources, including sermons, diaries, tracts, and letters. He has examined no particular set of sources systematically, however, and he therefore relies heavily upon anecdotal evidence and interpretation. While most of his interpretations are persuasive, some point to areas in need of further research. Central to F.'s argument concerning the absence of "means" in New England, e.g., is his claim that churches generally ignored "Halfway" members and "rarely" subjected them to church discipline, an important conclusion the accuracy of which is difficult to assess in the absence of a sustained, comprehensive examination of local church records. Similarly, for all the fresh observations that emerge from F.'s transatlantic approach, some events in New England were more heavily influenced by indigenous tensions than he suggests.

These sorts of quibbles aside, F. has produced a splendid study. Rich in complexity, innovative in approach, it represents a major contribution to the literature of Puritan studies.

Oklahoma State University, Stillwater

JAMES F. COOPER, JR.

SOCIAL CATHOLICISM IN EUROPE: FROM THE ONSET OF INDUSTRIALIZATION TO THE FIRST WORLD WAR. By Paul Misner. New York: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. x + 362. \$29.95.

The "social Catholicism" Misner surveys in this excellent book is the effort of Catholics individually and of Catholicism institutionally to deal with the massive economic changes and problems of the 19th and early 20th centuries. Surely not by accident its publication date is 1991, the 100th anniversary of *Rerum novarum*, the encyclical of Leo XIII on the condition of labor. Although it enters the story well past the mid-point in terms of pages, the encyclical is the thematic heart of M.'s book. The early chapters build towards it, and the last four show the conflicting and inconsistent responses to it through the pontificate of Pius X.

M. focuses on the five countries (France, Germany, Austria, Italy and Belgium) in which Catholics developed a distinctive approach to the economic problems of the period. The English-speaking world is usually just over the horizon. He starts with the collapse of the traditional rural economy around the time of the French Revolution and with the rise of the great industrial centers. While he does not propose to write a general economic history, he does provide enough material here to make comprehensible the Catholic reaction to the new order with all of its power and problems. For good reason, thoughtful Catholics almost invariably associated the problems with a practical and philosophical liberalism which cut the links of people with one another, which undermined religion, and which fostered class antagonism. Since this liberalism (again practical and philosophical) served almost as the ideology of the age, the Catholic effort to confront dislocation, poverty, anomie, anarchy, and so on most frequently assumed a countercultural character otherwise familiar in the intransigent approach of the 19th century popes to modernity at large.

But one should note immediately that social Catholicism did not spring from papal or episcopal initiative, and that it did not have a univocal form. The first story M. tells is that of Adam Müller (1779–1829), a product of romanticism and a convert to Catholicism, whose *Elements of Statecraft* were an intentional alternative to Adam Smith's *Wealth of Nations*. It was here that the German equivalent of "human capital" (*geistiges Kapital*) first appeared. At least a hundred other tales reveal the diversity and at times the contrariety among the social Catholics. Just a few examples. There is Bishop Wilhelm Von Ketteler (1811–77), who opposed the definition of papal infallibility at Vatican I, but whose distinct path between liberalism and socialism would remain influential in the encyclicals from 1891 to 1991. There is Léon Harmel (1829–1915), who went from the paternalism of the "Christian

factory" to a broad acceptance of Christian democracy at the turn of the century. There are Albert de Mun (1841–1914) and René de la Tour du Pin (1834–1924) developing the concept of the *Oeuvre des Cercles Catholiques d'Ouvriers* in an Aachen prisoner-of-war camp after the Franco-Prussian War. There is Matteo Liberatore (1810–91) incorporating the Thomistic stress on the human person into his several drafts of *Rerum novarum* for Leo XIII. There are Romolo Murri (1870–1944) and Luigi Sturzo (1871–1959) developing the democratic opening of the same pope with very different results. The last major stories are those of Marc Sangnier (1873–1950) having his autonomous lay movement, *Le Sillon*, condemned under Pius X as social modernism and the Jesuit Gustave Desbuquois (1869–1959) combining an ultramontane theology of papal authority with an insistence on looking honestly at the social and economic realm.

Some critics have lamented that social Catholicism was a movement developing throughout M.'s period slowly and only among a minority. Yet I am struck in reading this book by the genius and the energy of so many of the people he presents. If the movement had a thread of unity it was the claim to have within it an understanding of community which recognized the dignity and rights of human beings and which had the strengths of liberalism and socialism without their dangers. M. concludes his insightful epilogue with the reflections of another Jesuit Heinrich Pesch (1854–1926) on solidarity, an idea which developed among Catholics throughout the 19th century and which remains distinguishing and influential.

M. promises us another book which will cover the 20th century until Vatican II. This sequel must surely have Pius XI and *Quadragesimo anno* as its central point, and it must tell of the failure in the fascist era of at least some versions of Catholic solidarism/corporatism. I myself would hope that M. continues well past Vatican II. The council did mark the divide between two types of Catholicism, but the issues and the possibilities moving the social Catholics and the popes from Gregory XVI until John Paul II have undergone dramatic changes between 1989 and now. Perhaps these changes demand a third volume whose central point will be clear only with the passage of time.

La Salle University, Philadelphia

MICHAEL J. KERLIN

LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL: RACIAL REFORM AND THE SOCIAL GOSPEL (1877–1925). By Ronald C. White, Jr. New York: Harper & Row, 1990. Pp. xxiv + 309. \$35.

Conventional wisdom has it that the Social Gospel did little for the cause of racial equality in America. Coinciding as it did with one of the high tides of white racism, the Social Gospel movement paid more

attention to the problems of white workingmen and urban immigrants, and its leaders often passively accepted prejudices against African Americans, where they did not actively promote them. Unlike Abolitionism before and the Civil Rights Movement after, the Social Gospel is not well known for mobilizing religious energy to solve the problems of race.

White's study shows that the historical reality was considerably more complex than this widely accepted picture. There was, in fact, much activity among concerned white religious leaders directed toward improving relations between the races, and it took place against a backdrop of rapid change in the African American community's own understanding of itself. While many of the expressions of concern at the end of the last century would today be rejected as paternalistic, and others speak for flawed programs that eventually failed, what becomes clear when these events are taken in context is that many American religious leaders during the half century covered by the study grasped the seriousness of the racial divisions that were taking shape in the country and tried to do something about them.

The first of W.'s three principal sections deals with the "retreat from reconstruction" in the last quarter of the 19th century. He shows how white support for racial equality generally wavered in the face of legislation, local ordinances, and court decisions that culminated in the concept of "separate but equal" formulated in *Plessy v. Ferguson* (1895), but he also notes the exceptions to that trend. In the second section, closely focussed on the decade from 1898–1908, W. traces the split between Booker T. Washington and W. E. B. DuBois over the means to African American empowerment and traces the reaction of white religious leadership to both sides of that argument. The final section traces the founding of the NAACP and the Urban League, along with the development of new ecumenical ventures toward improved race relations.

What W. helps us to see above all is the rapid change in American society and in race relations during this period. Such changes make simple generalizations about the Social Gospel or its leaders untenable. Often, single events or speeches make a religious leader look racist or resistant to change. Later years may produce a quite different impression. One significant example exemplifies the more general point: "The story of the Social Gospel and Race is a story of change. Nowhere is this more true than in the pilgrimage of Washington Gladden. In the 1880s Gladden opposed efforts to protect black voting rights in Ohio. But a series of experiences along the missionary education bridge nearly two decades later led him into involvement in racial reform at both the local and national levels" (130).

Indeed, what is most surprising about W.'s book is the discovery of

how many of the well-known white leaders of the Social Gospel were extensively and publicly involved in the pursuit of civil rights and better conditions for African Americans. Charles M. Sheldon, e.g., is known mostly for his Social Gospel novel, *In His Steps*. But Sheldon spent more than a decade in ministry with the African Americans of Topeka, Kansas, and wrote also another novel based on those experiences. One wonders whether the general inattention to these activities among historians is not a more important manifestation of racism than many of those of which the Social Gospel movement itself was supposedly guilty. In any case, W. has given us a balanced and readable introduction to a legacy which should be far better known.

Drew University

ROBIN W. LOVIN

MODERN AMERICAN RELIGION 2: THE NOISE OF CONFLICT, 1919–1941. By Martin E. Marty. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1991. Pp. xiv + 464. \$27.50.

Volume 2 in a projected 4-volume magisterial series summing up the conclusions reached by Marty during a decades-long career as observer, analyst, and chronicler of the American religious experience. The work is marked, as one would expect, by an urbane writing style and demonstrates the encyclopedic, and, one feels, also very personal knowledge of his subject that is characteristic of M. He picks up the tale in the time of President Warren G. Harding and ends just as the U.S. is preparing to enter the Second World War. A recurring question emphasizes the theme: "Will America remain Protestant and Anglo-Saxon?" As the period opens, there is an accepted, if not official, national religion, inherited from those who made the Revolution and the nation. It is embedded in a culture where prominent Protestant preachers and theologians move easily in the company of financiers, business leaders, and presidents of the country's leading universities.

But there is an underside to the religious picture stemming from that complacent, self-satisfied society. Its complexion was diversified. There were those descendants of the "original stock" who were frightened by the diversity that confronted them, whether it was expressed in the "Red Scare" of the early twenties, or the "Yellow Peril" of virtually nonexistent Asian immigrants, or the "mongrelization" they saw as the result of immigration from southern and eastern Europe. African-Americans were asserting a new identity. Many had moved north. And there were the Jews and the Catholics who did not fit into neat categories stemming from a nostalgia for village-green America.

Issues were many: biblical inerrancy, evolution, pacifism, social problems and the role or non-role of the churches in their amelioration,

what to do about the rising power of the labor unions. Theologically, American Protestantism had by the 1920s and 1930s long been divided into warring factions of fundamentalists and modernist/liberals. There was conflict between denominations, but even more within denominations. Other approaches developed: the European import of neo-orthodoxy and the homegrown Christian realism of Reinhold Niebuhr and others.

M.'s thesis is that American Protestantism was torn apart during this era in "one of the major incidents of American religious history," the conflict between the heretofore dominant Anglo-Saxon Protestant "original stock" and "everyone else." The tearing apart was, as he shows, as much internal to the original stock as it was external. There is a good survey of some of the consequences of the Great Depression, with interesting excursions on both Father Divine and Father Coughlin, and the role in it all of the Federal Council of Churches is explored. Rather than a substantive treatment of Roman Catholicism, the nation's largest denomination for some decades by the time of the story, there is an episodic introduction of that topic, more as a foil for the main story line. M. also uses the interesting device of letting contemporary French visitors to the U.S. describe their coreligionists here. While the tale closes with World War II under way and the U.S. about to enter the conflict, M. provides an italicized afternote of some pages that gives us a foretaste of what is to come in the next volume.

Canisius College, Buffalo, N.Y.

JAMES HENNESEY, S.J.

THE GLORY OF THE LORD: A THEOLOGICAL AESTHETICS 5: THE REALM OF METAPHYSICS IN THE MODERN AGE. By Hans Urs von Balthasar. Translated from the German by Oliver Davies et al. San Francisco: Ignatius, 1991. Pp. 666. \$40.

Von Balthasar here illustrates his mastery of modern philosophy, literature, and spirituality. This volume, like the earlier one on metaphysics in antiquity, aims, in characteristic Balthasarian fashion, at an adequate perspective on the role of the analogy of being in the service of the analogy of faith. Divine "Glory" is mediated through human "Being," and thus the exploration of "Being" forms an indispensable if subordinate role in B.'s overall project. The German edition, by making the study of metaphysics the first part of Volume 3, while "theology" occupies the second part of the *same* volume, illustrates, better than the English numbering of the volumes, how "form" and "content" always intertwine in B. A distinctive feature here is B.'s turning to the modern spirituals and literary authors for metaphysical guidance.

In the wake of the extreme formalizing of Being by nominalism, in which Being tends to become a univocal concept erasing the ontological distinction between God and humanity, what choices remain? The spirituals from Eckhart to Loyola to the French of the *Grand Siècle* are drawn toward spiritualities whose core is self-abandonment. This "metaphysics of the saints" attests to the Divine Glory in its transcendence, but the world seems unnoticed. This lack of balance can even foster two deviations: "mystical" introspection, or ascetical activism. And the pervasive "split" of spirituality from theology promotes a "subjective" rather than "objective" mysticism (a suggestive distinction).

Cusa, the Renaissance, Goethe, and Heidegger (here ranged with the poets) seek or foster a second option: the attempted anchoring of theology in a reappropriation of antiquity. Here the "Being" of the world is varyingly rediscovered, but Divine Glory seems diminished. The danger now is one of confusing beauty with Glory, form with a God who explodes form even while shining through it. Divine Glory and the beautiful historical form are not separate, but they are distinct. This insight, which B. credits to Barth, becomes increasingly pronounced from volume 4 on. The third approach of idealism/philosophy of spirit more or less transposes mystical interiority into philosophical interiority. Not *Gelassenheit* but the human *Geist* becomes the new key to reality. Again, the splendor of Being through which Divine Glory might radiate is eclipsed, and the potential sacramentality of matter derails into materialism.

Suggesting that it is the Christian's task to witness to the site of Glory in metaphysics, B. briefly but brilliantly sketches a "fourfold distinction" within Being: the wonder of its existence, its inexhaustibility, its lack of self-explicability (the distinction between Being and existents requires a conscious ground giving form to the latter), and thus the distinction between God and world. The "ontological distinction" between Being and existents points to this further, fourth distinction between God and world. In other words, the "fourth distinction" is the "mystery of creation," a mystery intimated by Plato and Plotinus, but only decisively disclosed in biblical revelation (Volumes 6–7, or 3/2 in the German). "Glory" in the sense of God's revelation can shine through Being precisely because Being itself is "poor" or non-subsistent. Being's poverty can become the instrument of "evangelical poverty," and thus of a "rich fullness" as well. Ultimately, then, only love can be Being's custodian, because only God can preserve its "miraculous and glorious character."

This reviewer cannot begin to communicate a sense of the intricately sensitive portraits of the various principals covered. The fascinating

study of the "Christian fools" (Angela of Foligno, Philip Neri, etc.), the appreciation of Loyola's balance (perhaps alone among the spirituals, according to B.), B.'s obvious liking for Goethe and yet his critical restraint with respect to him, the persuasive analysis of Heidegger—all of these particularly impressed this reader (although I would include several others in the "balanced" company of Loyola among the mystics). B. also suggests fruitful connections with non-Christian religions, illustrating his often not appreciated knowledge of this realm of thought.

A work with the range of this one will bring its dissenters, certainly on issues of detail and even perhaps on the overall thesis. My general posture was one of "teachability" in the presence of this awesome example of skilled interpretation. Regarding the "detail" first, I suspect, surprisingly enough, that B.'s analysis of the spirituals will bring more questions than his corresponding soundings (which seem widely shared) of the poets and philosophers. Concentrating on the often "implied" metaphysics of the saints perhaps skews the interpretation, not surfacing the biblical and ecclesial correctives to the possible subjectivism that B. thinks he finds among many of them. The portrait of Francis de Sales seems especially harsh in this regard, and the view of the French perhaps reflects too much reliance on impressions suggested by Bremond. But I think B. raises substantive concerns here which possess sufficient plausibility to merit careful consideration.

The key issue, however, is the role of metaphysics in a theological aesthetics, and on this score B. is most suggestive. Not only does B. suggest how metaphysics has an essential role to play in theology. He also hints at how current metaphysics might well overcome intellectual titanism through witnessing to Being's "poverty," and overcome metaphysical scepticism/relativism through witnessing to the mystery of creation. B. shows us how to opt for an "advent-like" metaphysics.

There are some printing errors ("meditation" for what should be "mediation" [*Vermittlung*] most commonly [249–449, page headings]). Perhaps only two sentences do not read correctly, but these are probably printing errors as well. The translation reads quite well and accurately, as far as I could tell from regular referrals to the German.

Duquesne University

WILLIAM M. THOMPSON

THE TIMELESSNESS OF GOD. By John C. Yates. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1990. Pp. viii + 360. \$49.

This book, originally Yates' dissertation, presents an intriguing and wide-ranging defense of the doctrine of divine eternity. Y. sets out to show that the affirmation of divine eternity is not only philosophically

coherent but also indispensable for conceiving God in a way that does justice to Christian belief and worship.

Y. shows that eternity must not be mistaken for mere timelessness; in classical usage it refers, in Boethius' words, to God's "complete possession all at once of illimitable life" (31). According to this line of thought, God transcends time yet is present, in the single "now" of eternity, to all temporal being. Thus eternity is "the highest life conceivable to the human intellect" (35).

In affirming the divine eternity, however, one is forced to face what Y. calls the "two-world problem." It has a vertical aspect: How can an atemporal God be related to temporal creatures? After inquiring into the nature of time and examining contemporary efforts to solve the problem of time and eternity, Y. introduces the notion of God as "a timeless cause of temporal effects" (131). His position incorporates the view, for which he finds support in Aquinas, that the exercise of efficient causality does not logically require any change, and hence any passage of time, in the agent itself. On this basis Y. denies that the act of creating and preserving the finite, temporal universe (an act which includes the Word's becoming flesh) implies that God is in time. Is this position inimical to our belief in a personal God? Quite the contrary: God's "relationship of undiluted supergenerosity" (184) to the created universe is possible precisely because God is eternally present to all being as the source of its existence.

The horizontal aspect of the two-worlds problem has to do with God's relation to past, present, and future. The key difficulty here is explaining why God's atemporal knowledge and causation of human acts does not undermine our freedom. Y. maintains that an eternal being has no foreknowledge of temporal events: "[W]hat God knows is events-in-their-occurring" (238); and the necessity resulting from such knowledge is conditional, not absolute, and hence compatible with contingency and freedom. Furthermore, even the fact that God timelessly causes all our acts does not negate our freedom, for whenever we exercise our choice God causes only the occurrence of the act of choosing; it is left to us to determine what the choice will be.

Y. underscores the importance of the doctrine of eternity for a "religiously adequate," as opposed to a "religiously available," view of God (302): if we cannot affirm God's eternity, he argues, we cannot affirm coherently the certitude of providence and the plenitude of divine perfection.

Y. has given us a book brimming with insight. Its greatest strength—a strength which sets it apart from much that has been written on the subject of God in recent years—is Y.'s insistence on the need to situate the question about the divine eternity in a comprehen-

sive metaphysical context. He painstakingly assembles the various components of his synthesis, confronting difficult objections fairly and patiently, trying to trace differences to their roots, letting the demands of the question at hand set the pace of his argument. All this hard work pays off: Y. succeeds in putting a good deal of flesh on the bones of that dusty fossil, "classical theism," and in so doing reveals that the classical view of God possesses a richness and explanatory power rarely appreciated by its detractors. On occasion Y.'s account is less nuanced than it might be (e.g. his rendition of Aquinas' view of efficient causality, or the meaning he assigns to the term "presence" in describing God's relation to temporal beings), and in a number of instances the attention Y. gives to competing points of view tends to impede a clear presentation of the inner logic of his own position. In addition, the typographical errors and erratic punctuation which occur on almost every page of the text are distracting to the point of irritation. Despite these flaws, Y.'s book is a model of the kind of serious, comprehensive reflection that will best serve our ongoing efforts to discover how we ought to conceive of the God who creates and redeems us.

Boston College

MICHAEL STEBBINS

THE EVILS OF THEODICY. By Terrence W. Tilley. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University, 1991. Pp. xii + 279. \$29.95; \$15.95.

Tilley has earned a niche among the best practitioners of philosophical theology and philosophy of religion. This insightful and rigorous work, one of the best in its field in recent years, is one more piece of evidence. Not itself a theodicy, it analyzes the genesis of theodicy in the Enlightenment, what theodicy has been attempting (to explain the compatibility of theism with suffering or to demonstrate its plausibility, given the presence of evil), and what evils theodicy spawned in their defense of God's goodness in face of the evils that savage us. T. is in choro with other antitheodicyists, e.g., Phillips, Surin, Hauerwas.

T.'s deconstruction is triple-tiered. Working with Anglo-American analytical philosophy and adapting the work of Austin and Searle, T. lays a groundwork in an intricate speech-act theory that he maps out with rare lucidity to evaluate the types of linguistic acts performed in religious contexts. He then employs his performance theory of language to reread classic texts dealing with the mystery of evil: the Book of Job, Augustine's *Enchiridion*, Boethius' *Consolation of Philosophy*, Hume's *Dialogues*, and Eliot's *Adam Bede*. Speech-act theory brings new eyes that see the true genius and power of these texts as communicative actions addressing diverse problems in diverse contexts for diverse purposes. The discourse of theodicy has ignored the varied

rhetorical strategies and logics enacted in these texts and too facilely reduced them to one kind of speech act, assertives. Attention to the illocutionary forces at work in these classics avoids over- and under-reading and affords fresh, immensely illuminating readings. Voices silenced speak again.

Finally, the heart of the matter: T. argues that theodicy as a praxis of assertive declaration must be abandoned. Far from being a solution, it creates its own evils. Theodicy misportrays and effaces evil by rendering it an abstraction, warps traditional texts, mutes voices of insight and healing, and reinforces the Enlightenment's problem, the alleged incoherence of belief in an all-powerful, all-good God (not the trinitarian God of Christianity) with genuine evil. Not addressed to specific people who suffer and sin, and deaf to the screams of the marginalized, theodicy is at home in the academy, dispassionately addressing detached intellects with a theoretical problem and rewriting history as if classic texts on God and evil were commensurable with and contributory to the Enlightenment problematic. Amalgams (e.g. Irenaeus, Augustinian theodicy) are mined from texts with no regard for their illocutionary force and put in service of theodicy. But none of the works T. analyzes was propounding a rationalistic Enlightenment theodicy. Nor was Aquinas or Luther, for whom evil was not a single problem but a variety of anomalies in a vast system.

Worst of all, theodicy with its twin strategy of effacement (genuine evil is not evil) and containment (evil is either moral or natural and part of God's plan) is a demonic, performative discourse. It creates and sustains a world where systemic injustice, which brings evil out of good, is ignored, practices that can overcome evil are obscured, and a door is opened to critiques of religion as narcotic. Our world becomes what discourse says it is, hence the ethical import of speech acts. How counter this destructive practice? By interruptive actions that acknowledge that no talk of suffering can be adequate or free of contradiction, nor any "solutions," benign or bloody, final. The only remotely adequate response (not solution) is a solidarity with victims that seeks to change the world by recognizing the myriad masks of evil and countering them through retrieving traditions theodicy effaces and exposing theodicy's terminal aporias and its illusions of totalizing final answers. Not argument, but only suffering servants can create a world that is not too wicked for God to be good.

Such a provocative work cannot but generate questions. Does T.'s speech-act theory give due weight to the sociopolitical interests of speakers and hearers? Is meaning not as much a function of interest as of action? What shape should a theological approach to evil assume? Is T.'s definition of theodicy too tightly drawn? Is the speech action of the

Enchiridion so radically different from Augustine's approach to issues of sin and grace in other texts that much of what it asserts is asserted as only "possibly true"? Can the *Enchiridion* be read in isolation from Augustine's anti-Manichaean and anti-Pelagian works? Are all amalgamations (admittedly a tricky business) otiose at best and destructive at worst? Can diverse communicative actions be so easily separated out? Is speech act theory the sole counteraction to the silencing of an author? And hermeneutically, should concern with an author's action be as monopolizing as it seems to be in speech act theory?

T.'s thoughtful and skillfully crafted work significantly advances the conversation. Anyone seriously addressing the banality of evil and the anomaly of goodness will find here rich fare.

Loyola University, New Orleans

STEPHEN J. DUFFY

THE CALL TO PERSONHOOD: A CHRISTIAN THEORY OF THE INDIVIDUAL IN SOCIAL RELATIONSHIPS. By Alistair I. McFadyen. New York: Cambridge University, 1990. Pp. xii + 327. \$49.50; \$14.95.

As its title suggests, this is an effort to construct a Christian theological anthropology that takes account of recent work on the significance of social relationships for personal identity. More specifically, McFadyen locates himself in the debate between collectivist and individualist accounts of personal identity: "This raises the question of whether there might be a third option, steering something of a mid-course between individualism and collectivism, which can do justice to personal freedom and autonomy whilst simultaneously acknowledging the role of social relations and institutions. Can the question of what it means to be a person be answered more adequately by the construction of a different kind of conceptuality? This book is an attempt to construct such a third option" (5).

Although M. draws heavily on the work of social philosophers and psychologists, together with his own experiences as a psychiatric nurse, his central concerns and problematics are set by the theological tradition exemplified by Barth, Moltmann, and Pannenberg. Accordingly, he begins with theological reflections on the nature of personhood as manifested in God's communication and our response, in the doctrine of the Trinity and in the creation of the human person as male and female. It is in this context that he first puts forward his central thesis, that "subjectivity [is to be taken] as a form of response sedimented from a history of communication . . . Individuality refers to the capacity to be an autonomous center of action and communication, to be a separate and independent individual . . . [T]his capacity is not relationally pure but is sedimented through relations in which one is

intended and addressed as an autonomous subject of communication by God and others" (23).

He then goes on to support and draw out the implications of this basic insight in the context of social psychology and philosophy, arguing that individuals can only attain a full, centered, and autonomous personhood by entering into an undistorted relationship of dialogue with Christ, in and through a genuine response to the address of other persons. Only in this way, he argues, can the individual be freed from the self-assertive need to maintain one's personal center in the face of the potential manipulations of others. Hence, those who are transformed in Christ "claim no rights as inalienably their own. Such rights as they do have exist only in concrete relation with others for whom those rights are maintained" (152). In the following chapters, M. applies this account of personal transformation in Christ to issues raised by our experiences of ethical resistance and life within the Church, the political community, and the institutions that structure our lives.

The value of this book lies in its detailed exploration of the implications for theology of an important current in contemporary thought. At the same time, M. is sometimes too quick to resolve the hard questions raised by his arguments, at least in this reviewer's opinion. E.g., he simply dismisses the classical account of God's unity, as that was related to the doctrine of the Trinity, as being "pathological" (25)—so much for centuries of strenuous philosophical work! And he responds to the anticipated charge that his analysis implies social determinacy by arguing that he allows for personal uniqueness, which is true but not to the point (103–09). More troubling, for this reviewer, is his assertion that one of the marks of transformation in Christ is a willingness to let go of all claims of self-love. While this claim is deeply grounded in the Christian tradition, especially in the Reformed tradition out of which M. writes, it is not unproblematic on theological grounds, and, as recent feminist work has argued, it is peculiarly subject to abuse as a way of maintaining the existing power relations in society.

However, these reservations should not be taken to suggest that this book is without value. To the contrary, it is a mark of the relevance of M.'s work to contemporary theology that it raises so many important issues. His book deserves to be widely read and incorporated into current debates on theological anthropology, the doctrine of the Triune God, and the implications of contemporary philosophy and the social sciences for theology.

University of Notre Dame

JEAN PORTER

PUNISHMENT AND MODERN SOCIETY: A STUDY IN SOCIAL THEORY. By David Garland. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1990. Pp. 312. \$29.95.

Here is a very serious and innovative work about the sociological theory of punishment. Consistently high in the level of its scholarship, almost encyclopedic in scope, Garland's volume demands careful study rather than casual reading.

G. suggests that one major problem with punishment is that it is a deeply social issue which has been converted into a technical task for specialist institutions. Looking at the analyses of punishment by Durkheim, Foucault, Weber, Elias, and Spierenburg, he points out that punishment has more than one meaning, "that it is in fact a complex set of interlinked processes and institutions, rather than a uniform object or event."

Explaining the Durkheimian notion of the *conscience collective* and its relation to the moral order, G. suggests that punishment may be both the cause and the effect of social solidarity. The criminal has defiled something sacred, and a communal reaction of outrage follows in the form of punishment. In the critique of this position, G. posits that punishment may not be the visible symbol and faithful expression that Durkheim suggests, because of the fact of the fragmented nature of society.

The work of Rusche and Kirchheimer takes a radically different position. In this scheme of things, economics determines everything else. The social value of human life is fixed by the labor market and the demography of population growth. G. states that this economics-determines-punishment thesis is a materialist reductionism. The Russian jurist E. B. Pashukanis, writing about punishment as an ideology of class control, emphasizes the notion that criminal law is an instrument used by the elite or ruling class to control the lower class. It is "an instrument of class domination and occasionally 'class terror.'"

Through three chapters G. considers the work of Foucault and his concepts of power, knowledge, and the body. The major focus is the system's use of power and knowledge to control through bodily punishments. Foucault builds on Weber's sociology in the areas of rationalization, professionalization, and bureaucratization. In this framework the person becomes an object to be catalogued and processed by the system. The rationalization of punishment means that "decisions have been made with an administrative logic, rather than a legal or judicial one."

G. discusses the question of culture and cultural forms in the context of contemporary sensibilities. What will be tolerated by society and what will not? Which punishments are considered civilized and humane, and which are not? G. proposes that there is a dialogue between

cultural norms, and that the religious and other humanitarian cultural forms have been an important part of this interaction with penal practices. The cultural model, as it is expressed in the works of Norbert Elias and Pieter Spierenburg, stresses the theme of the civilizing process and society's changing sensibilities, i.e. manners, control of emotions, and sensitivity to others. This sensitivity is a strong cultural force in the potential changing of the face of punishment from cruel and unusual to humane and civilized.

Theory allows us to think about long-standing problems and institutions in new ways, and ideally this allows us to act in new and enlightened ways. G. proposes that when we think and talk about punishment, we should seriously consider "a more multidimensional framework, in order to improve analysis and deepen understanding."

G. provides the reader with cautionary distinctions, so that at each critical step of the argument we may be forewarned. The first instance is a disarming distinction between exposition and critique, so that the reader may disagree but still learn from the book. Another, is G.'s caveat: "I will be making interpretative statements which are backed by illustrative example rather than by solid evidence, and . . . my theoretical arguments will outrun the available data." And, in a third place, G. says that he will be using the explanatory power of pluralism without falling into the logical absurdities of eclecticism." Finally, there is a warning against the use of reductionism in the analysis of punishment.

The overall impact of this book on this reviewer is one of fatigue, surprise, and admiration. Fatigue, because of the nature of theory itself, which makes for rather slow and tedious reading. Surprise, because G. goes to the heart of the problem with punishment, both past and present. Admiration, because this work is a vast undertaking, which is thorough in its research, consistent in its logic, and even in its presentation.

Though this reviewer still retains a bit of scepticism about the ability of G.'s multiple or synthesis model to change society's perception of punishment or to trickle down to some reasonable and humane practice, yet I find more than a little merit in his thesis. On the whole there was slight ground for serious disagreement or dispute, and something to learn or relearn in almost every chapter.

Seattle University

MICHAEL KELLIHER, S.J.

HUMANAE VITAE: A GENERATION LATER. By Janet E. Smith. Washington: Catholic University of America, 1991. Pp. xvii + 425. \$42.95; \$17.95.

As we approach the 25th anniversary of *Humanae vitae*, Smith quite valuably locates the current *status quaestionis* of the debate that has raged ever since the encyclical was issued. For those who wish to be updated on the arguments, for those who have tended to listen to only one side of the debate, and even for those who have been participants in the discussion, her careful and fair book will be very valuable.

To begin at the end, her four appendices are quite useful. She provides a new translation, taken from the Latin and not, as usual, from the Italian. She holds that the Latin better connects the encyclical with past moral theology, a point that is congenial to her "traditionalist" approach. She also provides a helpful commentary in which she cites the texts indicated in the encyclical's footnotes. She gives a brief analysis of certain additions to *Gaudium et spes* which, she thinks, moved the document towards condemning contraception. And, in a fourth appendix, she ably critiques arguments made by Grisez, Boyle, Finnis, and May. It is a mark of her fairness that she argues at length against those whose thought she finds closest to her own.

The book opens with a brief survey of the controversy that preceded the encyclical. Though this reviewer thinks that S. skips too quickly over the history of the Church's thinking about sexuality, she nicely situates the document in its immediate context. S. uses *Casti connubii* and *Gaudium et spes* to develop a noble view of marriage. Her interpretations of church documents here and throughout are instructive, if not always convincing. She rightly insists that procreative activity ought to be seen within the context of marriage, a point often made but usually not carried out as well as she does. Though at the outset S. says that she will do a philosophical, not a theological analysis, her book is thoroughly theological.

Her most philosophical chapters, which are the heart of the book, are the least satisfying to this reviewer. She offers six arguments against contraception. Two of these she finds inadequate, and she discusses them chiefly because, she thinks, critics of the encyclical have focused on these, found them wanting, and thus unfairly dismissed the encyclical. She presents four other arguments, three of which she supports: in brief, it is wrong (1) to impede the procreative power of sexual actions, (2) to impede actions that assist God in God's creative act, and (3) to destroy the power of sexual acts to represent total self-giving. Though she insists that the methods of natural family planning, not to mention the practice of celibacy, escape these evils, it is not always clear how they do so. Though she insists that her position is not biologicistic or naturalistic, this also does not seem thoroughly carried out. Though she gives an account of the activity of God and of the meaning of total self-giving love, she does not seem adequately to respond to the

objections that have been raised against using these ideas in the birth-control debate.

S. argues that most of the chief debaters, both friends and foes of the ban on contraceptives, have at important points forgotten or distorted the tradition. She devotes two chapters responding to those who have argued that the encyclical was based on false or antiquated theological and philosophical premises. Examining the work of Curran and Häring, as well as those who advocate "proportionalism," she raises old and new questions about the imprecision, inadequacy, or even disastrous implications of the claims made by these authors. She notes that both sides of the debate have learned much from each other. Indeed, both sides can learn much from her demand for exact and fair thinking.

After briefly indicating some scriptural supports, S. concentrates on the theological concept of *munus*, which she translates as an honorable office, gift, and mission. With this concept, she ably highlights the vocational aspect of marriage, something that can easily get lost in the debate over the "means" of regulating procreation. S. also develops what she thinks is the proper activity of conscience for a Catholic who accepts the Church that "claims to teach for Christ."

Finally, she presents an excellent analysis of Wojtyla/John Paul II's views. Indeed, his personalistic philosophy pervades her whole book. She finds in his thought the proper blend of traditional arguments and personalism. His emphasis on self-mastery and self-gift provide, she thinks, what is needed in the contemporary world. S. concludes that John Paul "has offered a rich source of insights for those attempting to understand why contraception is immoral and a powerful challenge to those who think it is not." The same may be said for her book.

Weston School of Theology

EDWARD COLLINS VACEK, S.J.

LAW AND MORALITY IN ISRAEL'S WAR WITH THE PLO. By William V. O'Brien. New York: Routledge, 1991. Pp. ix + 342. \$45; \$15.95.

PLO and Israeli terrorist and counterterrorist attacks since 1965 have recurred so frequently as to be tantamount to a "continuing war" for more than a quarter of a century. The face-to-face meetings between Tel Aviv and the Palestinians which began in late 1990, and to which the PLO is only an *éminence grise* rather than a formal party, give no assurance that the war is or can be permanently ended.

O'Brien makes it clear at the outset that his purpose is to "describe Israel's war with the PLO and to discuss the legal and moral issues raised by its conduct," with particular reference to the fundamental requirement that use of the military instrument must be justified by

true military necessity and limited by principles of humanity that serve to mitigate the suffering and destruction of war. In his research he consulted Israeli but not Palestinian sources and experts. We should remember that Western scholars have access to officials of a democratically organized government such as Israel. It is not possible to gain access to comparably authoritative spokesmen for the PLO with its dozen or more affiliated or ideologically sympathetic terrorist organizations based in at least four different states—some of which have long been locked in a virtual state of civil war with one another over leadership and tactics.

O'Brien, a leading authority on the international law of war and one of the most eminent Catholic theorists of the just-war doctrine, provides the most meticulous and thoughtful legal-ethical analysis of the Israeli-PLO conflict yet produced. He proceeds from the plausible assumption that the PLO's principal strategy is to engage not in conventional military hostilities (a virtual impossibility for a nonstate entity with no fixed territorial base) but as exclusively as possible in terror, which by definition is illegal and immoral, and that Israel's strategy is essentially a counterterrorist one.

More than three-fourths of the work is devoted to O.'s forte, legal and moral analysis. Israel is invariably criticized for violating the norms of the international law of war, but those norms pertain almost exclusively to war between sovereign states, not to terrorism. This holds for both war-decision law (*jus ad bellum*) and to war-conduct law (*jus in bello*). O. interprets the former as not limiting self-defense to passively reacting to antecedent attacks but as also permitting preemptive or anticipatory attacks in the case of the clear and present dangers implicit in a continuing terrorist war. War-conduct law, he says, is based primarily on legitimate military necessity and humanity (and to a minor extent on some surviving vestiges of chivalry). Both international law and just-war doctrine emphasize the principles of proportion and discrimination or noncombatant immunity as the main restraints on belligerent conduct. (These have been stressed frequently by modern Popes, the Fathers of the Second Vatican Council, the American, French and German Bishops, most Catholic and some Protestant theologians, and many political and legal theorists.) Unfortunately, as O. points out, in a war with terrorists the major incentive for observing the laws of war, the prospect of reciprocity for restrained behavior, is totally lacking.

O. brings to his task comprehensiveness, expert knowledge, penetrating logic and intellectual subtlety. These qualities are evident, e.g., when he explains the difference between international law and the just-war doctrine on the issue of separating or intermixing *jus ad*

bellum and jus in bello. Along with the U.S. Department of State, he discounts the U.N. Security Council practice of refusing to condemn PLO national liberation terror while condemning Israel's retaliatory measures as manifestly unfair and often political and/or economic in motivation. The Security Council's resolutions have usually been based upon a consensus among most legal writers in distinguishing self-defense from reprisals, justifying the former as protective and proscribing the latter as punitive. O. regards such a consensus as woefully inadequate as applied to all countermeasures taken by Israel "in the context of a protracted war of national liberation, not simply in response to a few scattered terrorist incidents." He contends persuasively that this is unrealistic because it denies the element of deterrence in self-defense and is based on a faulty model of the world political-legal system, one which assumes that the U.N. Charter makes available to its members effective collective-security machinery. He concludes that Israel's strategy and most of its countermeasures against state-sources of PLO terrorism and the *intifada* can be justified on grounds of military necessity under international law as reinforced by just war doctrine.

Given the results of the Persian Gulf War and the collapse of Soviet communism, Israel and the PLO may overcome their "worst case" fears concerning each other's future goals (which are described aptly in the book) and work out a viable compromise. If so, O. shows what they will have had to overcome, and how Israel's strategy, viewed in its total context, will have contributed to the outcome.

St. Joseph's University, Philadelphia

JAMES E. DOUGHERTY

THE NEW DICTIONARY OF SACRAMENTAL WORSHIP. Edited by Peter E. Fink, S.J. Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 1990. Pp. 1352. \$69.50.

This companion volume to *The New Dictionary of Theology* (Glazier, 1987) proposes to "serve the ongoing task of liturgical reform and renewal" set forth by Vatican II, doing so not only in the Catholic Church, but within all the "sacramental churches," East and West, influenced by the council. Although the primary focus is on the revised Roman Catholic liturgical texts and most articles are written by Catholics, the contributors and the concerns studied include those from other churches as well. In fact, the *Dictionary* represents more or less the current state of scholarship within the liturgical academic community in North America, particularly the North American Academy of Liturgy, an ecumenical society to which most of the contributors belong.

Entitled a "dictionary," the book is actually a short encyclopedia of

selected topics in "sacramental worship." Given that contributors are chosen only from "sacramental churches" (no Baptist, Mennonite or other free-church representatives are included), "sacramental worship" here suggests that word-dominant worship is somehow less than sacramental. This nomenclature, however, is puzzling. Insofar as Christian worship is an expression of faith, and faith is a gift, it is God who ultimately acts in worship, making the liturgy of any Christian church sacramental. Paradoxically the book also lacks contributors from the highly ritual Orthodox churches of the English-speaking world.

The title phrase "sacramental worship" may also indicate how in fact the seven sacraments of the Catholic Church form the centerpiece of the book and how they are seen primarily as actions by which the Church worships God, i.e. sacraments *of* the Church, not just sacraments *in* the Church. However, it is this same ecclesial grounding that makes doing a study of Christian liturgy which is both truly theological *and* fully ecumenical—no matter how praiseworthy—such a Sisyphean task. One evidence of the problem is found within the titles for the seven major divisions of the book: The Worshipping Church, The Heritage of the Church, The Sacramental Life of the Church, The Church at Prayer, The Church and the Arts, The Reflecting Church, and The Pastoral Mission of the Church. Here, and often elsewhere throughout the work, "church" as applied to the acting subject of the liturgy is used either generically or ambiguously, pointing to no concrete church in particular. However, in order to act as fundamental sacrament of Christ, any given church must exist in a sacramental, concrete way not only during, but also before and after the liturgical event (*diakonia* and *martyria* as well as *leitourgia*). Consequently, if the worshipping sacramental church studied in a particular article is not specified and restricted to a given institutional church, like the Catholic Church or the Lutheran Church, it cannot be found. Apart from baptism, there are no sacramental expressions that are mutually accepted and shared by all Christian churches throughout the world, and so there exists no concrete community on a practicing sacramental level ("church") among *all* baptized Christians.

Since the major focus of the book is on the sacraments, its central division is "The Sacramental Life of the Church." Here separate studies are presented on the history, theology, and celebration of each of the seven sacraments. Thus, the subdivision on baptism as part of initiation, e.g., includes 13 articles which investigate its theology, roots in Scripture, history, ecclesial nature, symbols, formulae, relationship to original sin, use of exorcism, ministers, modes of administering, proper times, bestowal on infants and place given to parents in

infant baptism. This lineup of topics is one example of how throughout the *Dictionary* theological history and theory are brought to bear upon the pastoral concerns and life of the churches. Many articles on the sacraments are not only reliable but invaluable up-to-date summaries of scholarship on their given subject matters. A few, however, are weakened by suspect theological reasoning, as, e.g., the way in which some articles seem to envision the particular liturgical assembly absolutely, as the only ecclesial agent of Christian liturgy, and the way some authors from Protestant traditions allow past doctrinal polemics to guide interpretations of Catholic liturgical history and piety. Given that a major audience for the book is the working clergy, it is also regrettable that such brief attention is paid to the specific topics of "Bishop," "Priest," and "Deacon." Indeed, in the consideration of various aspects of liturgical celebrations throughout the book, appreciation for the essential sacramental symbolism of the ordained presiding minister is almost nonexistent.

Areas of church life associated with worship through the sacraments are discussed in the remaining categories. Some entries in these areas, although valuable on other counts, fail to give solid theological foundation for their basic presuppositions. The article "Images of God in Liturgy," e.g., conveys an understanding of the liturgy basically as an instrument for inculcating correct thinking ("It is frustrating for liturgists to know that despite their care in planning, people are getting unintended messages" [514]). "Liturgical Drama" ultimately blurs the crucial difference between Christian liturgical drama and theatrical drama. And "Liturgical Dance" is finally unable, given the corporate nature of Christian liturgy, to give solid theological grounds for the performance of solo dances during the liturgy.

Especially well treated are questions on art and architecture, canon law, catechetics, Jewish worship, liturgical theology, the liturgical year, music, preaching, symbolism, and the relationships of liturgy to culture and popular piety. Among the most noteworthy here are "Liturgical Calendar," "Popular Devotions," "Symbol," and "Theology of the Word."

The *Dictionary*, in spite of its flaws, stands as an important landmark in the history of liturgical renewal in North America and the British Isles. Although readers might wish for fuller bibliographies, fewer *errata*, and headers on each page to identify the topics below, the editor's achievement is nevertheless truly remarkable. This book should be on the desk of anyone responsible for the teaching or celebration of Christian liturgy. It far outshines any comparable work in English on the market today.

WORSHIP: CULTURE AND THEOLOGY. By David N. Power, O.M.I. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral, 1990. Pp. xii + 283. \$11.95.

This collection of 16 essays, all but one published previously since 1973, treats the relationship between Christian worship and the variety of cultures in which it must live. The essays move back and forth between issues of method and particular illustrative examples.

The Second Vatican Council affirmed the principle of inculturation in the future development of Roman Catholic worship but, as this volume indicates, that direction set a quarter of a century ago has itself raised a number of complex questions as to how inculturation is properly achieved.

Any ritual act must be studied in its past, with special attention to the effect had on the ritual in its evolutionary journey through various cultural expressions. Sometimes the new cultural expression clarified the rite; sometimes it limited and obscured its true function. The inherited ritual must eventually come into dialogue with contemporary culture in the sensitive effort to see that the best of both are honored in the latest stage of expression. Today special attention needs to be paid to secular rituals as we find them in contemporary society and their congruence or incongruence with the symbol system of Christian ritual.

In several chapters Power illustrates his methodological concerns by tracing given forms of worship through the centuries to their encounter with contemporary secular and religious culture. He treats the development of ritual blessings, of the calendar of the saints, the sacramentalization of penance and rites for healing the sick. These chapters are particularly helpful in focusing an otherwise necessarily complex methodology.

P. raises provocative questions about current liturgical practice. Among them is the relationship between key moments in the human life cycle and the celebration of Christian sacraments. Can Christian liturgical ministry support key moments in the life cycle (birth, maturity, marriage, and death) without compromising the faith commitment necessary in a true sacramental celebration? P. emphasizes the need for careful study of ritual yearnings deep in the human spirit which call for expression at the key moments of the life cycle. By appreciating the potential openness to God expressed in these yearnings, the key moments could well be celebrated in the presence of the Lord without insisting on a full sacramental intention. This is especially true in marriage where appropriate secular and religious symbolism could well satisfy the occasion and at least point in the direction of sacramental meaning.

The only essay in this volume which had not been published before is a fascinating study on the role of lament in worship. While the

Hebrew Psalms often cry out to God, in protest at what is seen as God's failure, Christian worship does not ordinarily go that far. That may well prevent Christian worshippers from going up against God in a way which will lead to a breakthrough in our image of God, discovering God's power anew in a deeper sense of awe at the divine majesty. Our worship must allow us to become "disoriented" in order that we might become "reoriented."

As these examples illustrate, P.'s volume draws one into stimulating exploration under the guidance of one who continues to ask questions about theological method and pastoral practice in the area of worship. The book requires careful reading and, at times, rereading but the results are well worth it. P. leaves us enlightened but with an awareness of areas to be developed by continuing interdisciplinary research and reflection.

Xavier University, Cincinnati

J. LEO KLEIN, S.J.

ENCOUNTERING MARY: FROM LA SALETTE TO MEDJUGORJE. By Sandra L. Zimdars-Swartz. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University, 1991. Pp. xv + 342. \$24.95.

Both Sandra Zimdars-Swartz and her husband, Paul, presented papers in the English-language section of the International Mariological Congress held at Kevelaer, West Germany, in September 1987. Hers was: "The Virgin Mary and the End of Time." That apocalyptic theme looms large in this excellent book. With a background in medieval popular religion, Z., the author of a major study on Joachim of Fiore, visited Lourdes in the fall of 1982. She thought her interest in popular religion might "be enhanced by an encounter with modern medievalism: a thriving pilgrimage site dedicated to the Virgin and renowned for its healing powers." Beyond her expectations she "found Lourdes compelling in its own right," especially in the peace experienced by suffering people.

This book is a phenomenological study of a select number of Marian apparitions. Some have achieved both universal fame and church approval; others have not so far received ecclesial recommendation in spite of worldwide renown. Still others have been discouraged by church authorities. "From personal to public" is the dynamic of the book. "Personal" refers to the initial experience of the seers, "public" to the expanding concern of devotees and pilgrims, and also to the involvement of church authorities, all the way up to the popes.

Chapter 1 gives the basic stories of La Salette (1846), Lourdes (1858), and Fatima (1917). A chapter entitled "Personal Crises of Health, Public Crises of Faith," is devoted to San Damiano and Mama

Rosa Quattrini (1964–81), with some tie-in to Padre Pio (d. 1968). The provocative title of the chapter on Garabandal poses the question: “Can the Testimonies of Thousands be Wrong?” Z. subsequently notes apropos of Garabandal that devotion springing from visions can go well beyond the initial experience and the ongoing lives of the seers. Of the Garabandal seers of June–July 1961, three are married and living in the U.S., the fourth, Mari Cruz, is married in Spain and has retracted her initial testimony.

Part 2 is the “public” part of the book: “Apparitions as Public Knowledge.” It concerns the expansion and dissemination of the original messages associated with an apparition. What caught public fancy and led to closer church investigation were claims of “secrets.” Chapter 6 is “The Drama of Secrets in post-World War II Apparitions,” and one section is “Secrets and the Negotiation of Authority.” Distinct treatment are given to La Salette and Fatima as well.

Z. explicitly steers clear of parapsychology. Nor is her work “devotional” in any ordinary sense, although it is surely respectful. Her concluding summary, “The Fundamentals of Modern Apparition World Views,” offers perceptive reflections on the apocalyptic ideology that creeps into originally simpler messages of prayer and penance. “History as divine plan” and “history as conspiracy” are further considerations, with the Necedah, Wisconsin events (Mary Ann Van Hoof, d. 1984) as a particular instance. The references to “psychic energy” (270) as also to the meaning of “paranormal” require further explanation, admittedly beyond the purview of this book.

The note of suffering that struck Z. at Lourdes recurs at the end of her study as an element of explanation and consolation (e.g. union with Christ, reparation to the Immaculate Heart of Mary, etc.). The outstanding appendix offers suggestions for further reading and study in English and other languages. The vast field of apparitions has given rise to such an enormous flood of publications that the careful work that went into this book deserves a resounding salute. The researches of such scholars as Laurentin (Lourdes), Stern (La Salette), Alonso (Fatima, although many of his volumes remain to be published), Taves, Kselman, Christian, and many others have been used.

The praise Z. gives to one of the titles she recommends (“free from any significant positive or negative bias”) applies as well to her own work. Yet Z.’s compassion is evident, not least of all in a sentence which echoes R. Laurentin’s criticism of the manner in which church authorities handled San Damiano: “One would hope . . . that they and everyone else who is called upon to make judgments about such a symbol as an encounter with the Virgin Mary, because of their concern for those who believe they have had such encounters, might find ways

to take the experiences that have coalesced into this symbol more seriously, even when they cannot accept the encounter itself as a religious or theological truth" (270).

Loyola University of Chicago

EAMON R. CARROLL, O.CARM.

RELIGION IN PSYCHODYNAMIC PERSPECTIVE: THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF PAUL W. PRUYSER. Edited by H. N. Malony and B. Spilka. New York: Oxford University, 1991. Pp. x + 233. \$29.95.

This small volume, which offers a collection of previously published papers by Pruyser is a welcome addition to the literature on psychoanalysis and religion. P. would have to be ranked among the major contributors to the dialogue between religion and psychology in our time. Before his untimely death in 1987, he was professor of psychiatry and senior psychologist at the Menninger Clinic and was largely responsible for the influential training program for pastoral counselors there. The interface between psychology and religion was an area of special interest for him, and his approach was primarily rooted in psychoanalysis. This collection will take its place along with his *Dynamic Psychology of Religion* and *Between Belief and Unbelief* as an important source for understanding his unique contribution to the understanding of this controversial but essential dimension of the human experience.

The selections are drawn from the mid-60s to nearly the time of P.'s death. The editors add an introduction and a final summary statement. The sampling provides a good overview of the themes and issues that characterize P.'s thinking. Certain essays are gems that repay careful reading and study, and may well be on their way to classic status. The discussion of the "seamy side" of religious beliefs is a provocative and thoughtful statement regarding the role of pathology in some forms of religious commitment. The chapter on narcissism alone is worth the price of admission—a penetrating diagnostic tour de force that would richly reward anyone who takes the time to absorb its wisdom. I also found the treatment of the psychological roots of belief and the essay on the role of the imagination in religion to be profoundly meaningful.

Perhaps the most characteristic theme in P.'s writings is his development of Winnicott's genial insight into transitional experience and the realm of illusion in religious thought. His thinking regarding the "illusionistic sphere," contrasting it with the realms of external and internal experience, is most forcefully developed in his essay on belief. As P. observes, "Illusion is neither hallucination or delusion (both of which are spawned by the autistic mind), nor is it straightforward sense perception (as produced by the external world of nature and the

things man has made from natural resources). Illusion includes mystery: since it is beyond the merely subjective and the merely objective, it has a special object relationship endowed with many surplus values about whose legitimacy one cannot bicker in terms derived from either the subjective or the objective" (166).

P.'s writing displays that fine balance between faithful commitment and skeptical scrutiny that must be the hallmark of the psychologist of religion. It is a disposition of mind that allows one to enter the sphere of illusion without being seduced by the Scylla of dogmatic rigidity or trapped in the Charybdis of rational iconoclasm. Entering the dark caverns of religion requires a blend of belief and unbelief, of trust and distrust, of conformity and skepticism, of immersion and distance, that will allow one to live in the illusory without being absorbed in it and mistaking it for the absolute and the real. It is not clear from these essays that P. himself could maintain that Odyssean balance to the very end, but he tried, and his effort gave us much from which we can learn about our own struggles to penetrate the mystery of the human religious mind.

Boston College

W. W. MEISSNER, S.J., M.D.

IN THE WAY: A STUDY OF CHRISTIAN MISSIONARY ENDEAVOURS. By Kenelm Burridge. Vancouver: University of British Columbia, 1991. Pp. 307. \$Can 39.95.

Burridge analyzes the work of Christian missionaries from an anthropological perspective. Missionaries are not relics from the past; they are active in the world today and their numbers continue to increase. Anthropologists and missionaries have often regarded one another suspiciously. When anthropologists come to a culture in order to analyze it objectively on its own terms, they become uncomfortable when they find a Christian missionary already there preaching a religion which is not indigenous to the culture. Missionaries are frequently uncomfortable with anthropologists because they write negatively about missionaries. Anthropologists frequently perceive missionaries as the residue of a discredited colonial past, or even as new cultural imperialists. While anthropologists might agree that perfecting oneself is laudable, they perceive missionary efforts to perfect others as presumptuous. Missionaries are simply "in the way," an obstacle; B. plays on Jesus' saying, "I am the way, the truth and the life. No one comes to the Father except through me" (John 14:6).

B. neither denigrates missionaries for being in the way, nor does he extol them. Acknowledging their successes and failures, he simply examines a nearly 2000-year-old phenomenon. Missionaries have

made it their business to be part of other people's business as they have gone about transforming and critiquing cultures. They place themselves in the way in order to show the Way. On this premise B. constructs his argument, his methodology, and draws his conclusions. While standing apart from a culture's given moral order, the missionary evangelizes, dialogues with, and gives pastoral care in order to transcend the given moral order by offering a more complete moral order based upon the life and mission of Jesus Christ. Whatever their personal qualities and whatever they do, missionaries innovate. By the very nature of their mission they subvert the foundations of indigenous cultural structures, and they do so by persuading people to change their attitudes toward their own culture.

As an anthropological term for Christian faith, B. employs *metaculture*, but he does not mean by that that Christianity is an ideology which can be intellectually and institutionally rationalized into a closed system. The Christian way of life he calls the Christian systemic, although he points out that Christianity is not a cultural system. Within the Christian systemic there occurs a dialectical movement between the devotional and the affirmative. By "devotional" B. means the explicitly spiritual, moral, ascetical, and ritual aspects which result from conversion, whereas "affirmative" refers to Christianity's engagement with a culture's social order. Christianity affirms a culture in order to make it more congruent with the devotional aspect.

Once the devotional-affirmative dialectic begins, serious problems arise. What missionaries work for is a set of complementary relationships between the devotional and the affirmative. When one affirms a culture's values, while at the same time trying to change them, the results are ambiguous, contradictory, paradoxical, and ironic. The dialectical tension between the devotional and the affirmative also produces doubts, skepticism, bewildering choices, and moral dilemmas. Faced with the devotional-affirmative dialectic, one can either hide behind the devotional, or leap into the culture and become culturally saturated, or remain a missionary.

As Christianity's distinctive mark, B. singles out its universality whose basis he finds in the Scriptures and throughout the history of mission. Universality is precisely that which makes Christianity countercultural, because every culture is by nature parochial and tends toward an exaggerated nationalism. Universality is also a sign of growth. Further, it touches the very purpose of mission, which is the establishment of a local church in communion with other local churches. Missionaries soon discover that cultural blood is thicker than baptismal water, and yet every culture is by nature open to the

transcendent because every culture asks: Who or what am I? Where do we come from? Where are we going? Thus, the seed of the devotional-affirmative dialectic lies within culture itself and is a sign of hope.

On the anthropological side B.'s book is a tough read. His language is uncommonly dense and idiosyncratic, which only clouds his argument and methodology. He writes more clearly when he does theology and when he reports his own findings from interviews with missionaries. One could also have wished that B. had placed more emphasis upon what missionaries learn from the cultures in which they are engaged. The value of his book lies in its clear delineation of who missionaries are and what they do, and thus it is a major contribution to inculturation studies.

Sogang University, Seoul, Korea

PETER FLEMING, S.J.

SHORTER NOTICES

THE HARPER CONCISE ATLAS OF THE BIBLE. Edited by James B. Pritchard. New York: HarperCollins, 1991. Pp. 151. \$30.

This beautifully produced volume is derived from *The Times Atlas of the Bible* and condenses the work of its many contributors to produce a compact treasure for the serious reader of the Bible. The maps and illustrations are abundant and helpful, although the recessive projections of many maps and the occasional clutter of multiple lines for successive itineraries or borders may prove initially confusing. While such projections make distance scales inadvisable for the maps, an index of distances between principal biblical sites appears at the end of the volume alongside the more conventional indices of people and gods, biblical references, and geographical elements in the maps. There is also a selected bibliography for further reading about geographical, archaeological, and historical topics.

After an introduction and a brief discussion of chronology (on grey-edged pages, like the concluding reference materials), the volume is ar-

ranged under historical headings (each with two to ten brief topical units), nine in the purple-edged Old Testament section, two in the gold-edged section for the Intertestamental period, and the final two in the blue-edged New Testament section. The headings (often with descriptive phrases or biblical citations) appear in the right-hand colored edging, and the unit titles are similarly on the left pages. This format and the fact that individual topical units are designed to stand alone make the volume an effectively accessible reference work for the nonspecialist.

While there are gratifyingly few topographical errors, a couple deserve comment. On page 41, the captions for figures 1 and 2 have been exchanged; on page 54, in the caption for figure 2, "Solomon's" mysteriously occurs in a sentence about the plan of neo-Hittite Zincirli. Furthermore, Tell el-Hesi is oddly absent from the inset map of EB cities in figure 1, page 12. Such isolated points aside, this fine, moderately priced volume can be strongly recommended.

KEVIN G. O'CONNELL, S.J.
Le Moyne College, Syracuse

THE TREE OF LIFE: AN EXPLORATION OF BIBLICAL WISDOM LITERATURE. By Roland E. Murphy, O.Carm. *Anchor Bible Reference Library.* New York: Doubleday, 1990. Pp. xi + 194. \$27.50.

Murphy here offers us a scholarly but readable assessment of Israel's wisdom literature, including Ben Sira (Sirach) and the Wisdom of Solomon. During the past forty years this literature has received the critical attention and theological evaluation which made up for the relative neglect during the first half of our century. It is the very proliferation of this scholarly output which called for a work such as M.'s

While all agree that the wisdom literature grew out of an intense search for meaning in a complex and rapidly changing world, there is still plenty of room for disagreement on many other facets of wisdom thinking. We have not even solved the circumstances out of which this literature emerged (home? school? tribal ethos?)—not to mention the unresolved tensions which exist in more challenging works like Job and Qoheleth.

A long career of teaching and writing, with special emphasis on the topic of Hebrew wisdom, qualifies M. in a special way as a guide through this fascinating but sometimes puzzling output of a people wrestling with the ambiguities of experience within the framework of their Yahwist faith. Against any attempt to marginalize wisdom thinking in favor of the salvation-history approach to the OT, M. proposes a compelling model of divine revelation as an articulated faith experience growing out of vital encounters with a world created by God. An appendix covers briefly and cautiously nonbiblical wisdom literature from Egypt, Mesopotamia, and Greece. The selected and annotated bibliography, along with an index, enhance the value of this small,

flawlessly printed, and very useful reference work.

FRED L. MORIARTY, S.J.
Gonzaga University, Spokane

DISINHERITING THE JEWS: ABRAHAM IN EARLY CHRISTIAN CONTROVERSY. By Jeffrey S. Siker. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 296. \$18.95.

The person of Abraham looms large on the horizon of Israelite and Jewish thought, as one would expect of a tradition that venerates its origins. His example is important to the Christian community as well. Therefore, a study of Abraham in the NT and other early Christian literature is a welcome contribution. Siker's work is thoroughly revised from a doctoral dissertation at Princeton Theological Seminary. The reader will find ample documentation of all the points investigated. A bibliography and indices of ancient sources, modern authors, and subjects facilitate the study of topics and themes.

After a very brief sketch of themes relating to Abraham in Jewish literature of the Second Temple period, S. studies the place that Paul gives to the patriarch in the letters to the Galatians, Romans, and 2 Corinthians. He discusses the setting for each epistle and avoids conflating the evidence. He concludes that "Paul appeals to Abraham primarily to ground the inclusion of the Gentiles in Christ in the promises God made to Abraham" (47–48). "Jewish Traditions Revised" is the title for his investigation of Abraham in Matthew, Hebrews, and James, grouped as "writings of second-generation Jewish Christians" (77), followed by a chapter on Luke-Acts. The two-source theory of Synoptic criticism is accepted uncritically, and no effort is made to discern elements of the tradition that may be traced back to Jesus. John 8:31–59 would have profited from a sketch of the themes that

link this "unit" to the entire Gospel, especially the way in which figures from the biblical past are said to bear witness to Christ.

"Spiritualizing and Gnosticizing Abraham in the Second Century" is the title for a discussion of fifteen documents dated to the period 100–150 C.E. A short section, "Abraham in Liturgical Use," points to a study that should have been made of *Jewish* texts that are an important background to the NT. Justin Martyr's *Dialogue with Trypho* is assessed to show that Abraham is considered to be "the father of Christians alone." The text is analyzed in detail but little attention is given to the general setting of the Jewish-Christian debate after Hadrian crushed the Bar Kokhba revolt.

The conclusion: "Whereas Jewish Christians initiated the use of Abraham in controversy with Judaism to argue for Gentile inclusion, Gentile Christians essentially concluded the use of Abraham in controversy with Judaism by arguing for Jewish exclusion" (193). This is a significant study of one facet of the complex trajectory of Jewish-Christian relations in the formative period of Christianity.

LAWRENCE E. FRIZZELL
Seton Hall University, N.J.

THE SOCIAL SETTING OF THE MINISTRY AS REFLECTED IN THE WRITINGS OF HERMAS, CLEMENT AND IGNATIUS. By Harry O. Maier. Waterloo, Ont.: Wilfrid Laurier University, 1991. Pp. viii + 230. \$25.

Maier's Oxford dissertation extends the recent use of social-scientific methods and categories in NT studies to subapostolic literature. The analysis is preceded by chapters on methodology and terms, on the household in the ancient world, and on research in house churches in the Pauline letters. M. argues that the hypothesis of a house-church setting adds a valu-

able social dimension to the discussion of ministry and office in Hermas, Clement, and Ignatius, and supplements the excessively theological character of previous scholarship. Basic to the hypothesis is the assertion that relative wealth and social stature positioned household patrons to become the natural leaders of the churches after the death of apostolic founders.

M.'s uses sociological ideal types and models as heuristic devices, especially Berger and Luckmann's models of institutionalization and legitimation, Max Weber's ideal type of charisma, and Bryan Wilson's studies of modern sectarian movements. In Hermas M. finds a deep concern for purity and for the separation of the community from the world, an anxiety provoked by the relative wealth of patrons of house churches. Hermas' well-known preoccupation with post-baptismal sin and second repentance primarily reflects his concern for social control in the face of the divisive and corrupting influences of wealth and worldly connection. In Clement the models of institutionalization and legitimation are used to shed light on Clement's intervention in the schism at Corinth. In Ignatius the ideal type of charismatic authority is invoked to explain the authority with which Ignatius speaks to the churches of Asia Minor.

M.'s analysis tends to confirm "Catholic" views of ministry, over against the German Protestant (e.g. H. von Campenhausen) preference for a (presumed) Pauline pneumatic model of ministry. The reviewer found the treatment of legitimation in Clement the most interesting and illuminating, though it may not require the house-church hypothesis. M.'s laudable caution sometimes leads to a rhetorically and logically unsatisfying accumulation of hypotheticals. The chapter on Ignatius

suffered from this, and seemed to yield little that was new and persuasive. But overall, an imaginative and stimulating application of new methods to old problems.

MICHAEL HOLLERICH
Santa Clara University

JEWES AND CHRISTIANS: THE MYTH OF A COMMON TRADITION. By Jacob Neusner. London/Philadelphia: SCM/Trinity International, 1991. Pp. xi + 159. \$14.95

This collection of essays and addresses analyzes Judaism and Christianity as normative systems which, contrary to the usual view, are completely distinct and do not share a common foundation or tradition. In so arguing Neusner seeks to have Judaism accepted as a unique religion with its own independent identity and dignity equal to that of Christianity. He argues from the classical syntheses of Christianity and Judaism, i.e. the conciliar period and the Babylonian Talmud.

N.'s analysis ignores Judaism and Christianity as lived religions which have shared many practices and traditions over the centuries and which were only partly distinct in the first couple of centuries. Despite his groundbreaking work in the origins of rabbinic Judaism, with Harnack he argues that from the beginning Jesus founded a new religion and was not a Jewish reformer. He treats Jesus and early Christianity as a religion fundamentally different from Judaism (by which he means rabbinic Judaism). This essentialist definition of Christianity may be defensible in the fourth century, but it is unsupported in the first. A key misunderstanding of sectarianism (18) leads N. incorrectly to exclude the possibility that early Christianity's claim to authenticity could take place within Judaism. The variety within Judaism is quickly reduced to a normative sys-

tem which excludes Christianity. This claim is understandable in systematic theology, but it is inaccurate history.

N. is correct that we cannot give up who we are and claim to be one. But to counter the Christian threat to Jewish identity, he has returned to a singular, canonical, unhistorical, mythic Judaism, a Judaism which he deconstructed through his historical work. In addition, he underestimates the danger of stressing the otherness of Judaism. Though he would like Christians to treat Judaism at a distance, as they do Buddhism, in fact Christianity and classical Judaism share many traditions, a crucial period of formative history (the first two centuries) and a mutual struggle for self-definition. If we do not understand and accept our continuing and substantial relations with one another, we will end up hating and reviling one another because we share so much and are so close. This relationship as well as our independent identities must be faced and accepted, if Jews and Christians are to understand and accept one another.

ANTHONY J. SALDARINI
Boston College

OUR IDEA OF GOD: AN INTRODUCTION TO PHILOSOPHICAL THEOLOGY. By Thomas V. Morris. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1991. Pp. 192.

Despite his subtitle, Morris does not focus here on "the rationality of religious belief, the nature of faith, and the cogency of arguments for the existence of God." He promises to explore these issues in another book, but in this one, he concentrates "on some purely conceptual issues": on "how we think about, or conceive of, God."

M. relies heavily on what he calls "perfect being theology"—something that derives from Anselm's "basic

idea" that God is "*the greatest possible being, an individual exhibiting maximal perfection,*" a being "with the greatest possible array of compossible great-making properties" (35). All who wish to practice "perfect being theology" must of course "consult their value intuitions about what basic properties are great-making properties" (39). By doing so himself, M. articulates and defends a conception of God as "thoroughly benevolent" and "utterly invulnerable to evil," as perfect in power and in knowledge, as the eternal Creator, existing "necessarily" and with "ontological independence" in "all possible worlds."

This book is not for everyone. Some will neither be satisfied with the way M. grounds the practice of "perfect being theology" nor able to share his array of "value intuitions." For them the book could seem a largely vain dialectical exercise. But there are many rewards for readers more sympathetically disposed, or for those at least willing to suspend an initial disbelief. Obvious on every page are M.'s enthusiasm, intimate familiarity with current philosophy of religion, and uncanny skill at reducing great masses of daunting material to order and (relative) clarity. If only for this, M. deserves a wide and grateful audience.

R. K. TACELLI, S.J.
Boston College

THE SANCTUS IN THE EUCHARISTIC PRAYER. By Bryan D. Spinks. New York: Cambridge University, 1991. Pp. xiii + 260. \$49.50.

Spinks here provides monographic treatment of a highly specific topic. Despite its seeming narrowness, it offers ample food for thought. After an introduction which gives a status quaestionis on theories concerning the origin of the Sanctus in the eucharistic prayer, S. studies the background of the Sanctus in the Old Testament, Jewish rabbinic and mystical

traditions, and early Christian documents; the Sanctus in the East Syrian and Syro-Byzantine traditions, the Egyptian and Western traditions, and its possible origins in the eucharistic prayer; and developments until the Reformation, prayers in the Reformation rites and their successors to 1960, and selected contemporary prayers.

S. has a marvelous command of the prayer tradition and marshals it well in the service of the topic. In fact, in reviewing the literature on the eucharistic prayer and the role of the Sanctus within it, he offers his own interpretation of the origins of the eucharistic prayer, shying away from theories which seem to posit some single, original prayer, and suggesting several prayers from diverse communities as the starting point. S. offers some intriguing reflections on the place of the Sanctus in the Reformation tradition, focussing on the theme of unworthiness and justification. Also noteworthy are his concluding reflections on the theology of creation and its relation to contemporary science, trinitarian theology and its rare presence in contemporary eucharistic prayers, and the fascinating suggestion to conclude particular kinds of eucharistic prayers with the Sanctus.

The book is well edited and written with clarity and a dash of humor. To include a quibble, the treatment of the Western eucharistic tradition seems comparatively thin.

MICHAEL G. WITCZAK
St. Francis Seminary, Wisconsin

AN ANTHOLOGY OF CHRISTIAN MYSTICISM. By Harvey Egan, S.J. Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 1991. Pp. xxv + 680. \$34.95.

A renowned spiritual theologian, Egan describes his book as the product of a "30-year love affair with the Christian mystics" (x). This anthology offers an excellent selection of texts from 55 significant figures in

the Christian mystical tradition from Origen to Karl Rahner. Each group of texts from a single author is preceded by introductions that are informative and, in the main, reliable. (One point that bears correction: Teresa of Ávila's autobiography covers the period 1515–65, i.e. the first 50 years, not the first 20 years, of her life [437]. The first part of the *Life* covers the period from Teresa's birth to some time after her second conversion in the mid-1550s, i.e. approximately her first 40 years.)

The anthology proper is introduced by two essays: the first defines Christian mysticism and provides a brief history of the word "mysticism"; the second discusses mysticism in the Old and New Testament. This collection of texts is very reader-friendly. In order to assist the reader through 2,000 years of Christian spirituality, E. provides a list of 13 questions with which the reader may approach these texts. The book is rounded off with a complete index.

Comparison of Egan's anthology with Dupré's and Wiseman's *Light from Light: An Anthology of Christian Mysticism* (see *TS* 50 [1989] 613–14) is inevitable. E.'s is clearly superior. Although the quality of the introductions of these collections is comparable, the greater volume and variety of authors in E.'s anthology (55 as compared to 25) makes his more useful, particularly as a textbook for courses in Christian spirituality in colleges, seminaries, and schools of theology. E. includes major authors that Dupré and Wiseman do not: Cassian, Thomas à Kempis, Osuna, Francis de Sales, Chardin, Rahner. Teachers of survey courses in the history of spirituality have been hard put to find a single book that could serve as a text. While the Dupré/Wiseman anthology provides some assistance, E. fills this need more satisfactorily, although the

price seems somewhat steep for a paperback.

JOSEPH F. CHORPENNING, O.S.F.S.
St. Joseph's University
Philadelphia

FROM SIGNS TO DESIGN: ENVIRONMENTAL PROCESS AND REFORM IN EARLY RENAISSANCE ROME. By Charles Burroughs. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT, 1990. Pp. xii + 344. \$45.

Not long after the death of Nicholas V in 1455, his propagandist Gianozzo Manetti wrote an account of the pope's deathbed audience with his cardinals. The dying pontiff justified his grand Roman building projects as a didactic extension of his teaching office: "When beliefs founded on the teachings of learned men are constantly, even daily confirmed and corroborated by the spectacle of great buildings—think of them as perpetual monuments or eternal testimonies, as if made by God himself—then they are permanently impressed on those who see such buildings." Manetti's chronicle remains one of the foundational texts in renaissance urban theory, a clear statement of the iconic power of architecture to transmit ideology.

Burroughs here moves away from the traditional analyses of Nicholas V's architectural expression of papal ideology, which was most ably laid out in Westfall's magisterial *In This Most Perfect Paradise: Alberti, Nicholas V, and the Invention of Conscious Urban Planning in Rome* (1974). B.'s approach, as his title suggests, is "from below," reading the ordinary world of the built environment, rather than the rhetoric of monuments and master plans. B. focuses on the figure of the pope's major domo and building superintendent Nello da Bologna to sketch a nuanced vision of Nicholas' planning strategies. Nello not only oversaw the Jubilee of 1450 and civic liturgies like the coronation

of Frederick III, but rebuilt Rome's ports, streets, and piazzas, rationalized the urban grid, extended papal influence in baronial neighborhoods, and marked key sites with papal signage. By concentrating on builders like Nello and working architects like Bernardo Rossellino rather than the theoretician Alberti (whose level of involvement with Nicholas' court is much disputed), B. presents a realistic view of renaissance urban process.

The work is admirably researched, but it suffers from the want of an editor who could have drawn together a collection of overwritten essays into a unified volume.

THOMAS M. LUCAS, S.J.
Washington, D.C.

MARTIN LUTHER: THEOLOGY AND REVOLUTION. By Gerhard Brendler. Translated from the German by Claude R. Forster, Jr. New York: Oxford University, 1991. Pp. 383. \$29.95.

It is something of a mystery why this book was translated. When it was first published in the German Democratic Republic in 1983, it gained some justified attention because it was the first extended treatment of Luther by a state-approved Marxist historian who took Luther seriously as a theologian. (Ironically, Forster's introduction to the translation presents a more doctrinaire portrait than Brendler's own account!) East German church historians such as Helmar Junghans, the dean of GDR Luther scholars, greeted the Brendler volume with some enthusiasm since it eased their own attempts to present Luther as primarily a theologian and pastor and not simply as either a lackey of the princes or a mouthpiece for emergent bourgeois capitalism.

Still, although B. takes Luther's theology seriously, he misunderstands Luther at a number of points such as the relation between faith

and reason and hence the relationships between law and gospel and between justification and loving service towards one's neighbor. And occasionally the old views resurface within this revisionist biography. E.g., the chapter on the Peasants' War is entitled "With the Civil Authority Against Riot: The Victory of Class Instinct Over the Good Intentions of Faith," and a rather simple-minded class analysis replaces a more nuanced presentation of this complicated uprising. One of B.'s true strengths—his understanding of economic and social conditions—is obscured by the requirements of an orthodox account of the "Early Bourgeois Revolution."

In sum, this is a respectable study of Luther done from a relatively enlightened Marxist perspective, but its value lies principally in its own history within the communist East German state that is no more. Nothing dates a book more than a prescribed ideological approach that has fallen from favor.

MARK U. EDWARDS, JR.
Harvard University

THE ANGLICAN TRADITION: A HANDBOOK OF SOURCES. Edited by G. R. Evans and J. Robert Wright. London/Minneapolis: SPCK/Fortress, 1991. Pp. xx + 620. \$29.95.

What is the Anglican tradition of Christianity? With the insight gained from years of research, teaching and ecumenical dialogue Evans and Wright exemplify through the presentation of seminally important texts what the living tradition of Anglicanism actually is.

The texts are grouped in chronological order. Each of the first three chapters covers about five centuries, and the selected texts represent an Anglican view of the roots and development of the Catholic tradition. Each of the six remaining chapters

deals with a period of about a century beginning with the era of the English Reformation. The fifth chapter documents the century-long struggle of Anglicanism with Presbyterianism, and the sixth, the Church of England's self-definition prior to its massive missionary effort of the late 18th and 19th centuries which the documents of chapter seven illustrate. The texts of the eighth chapter trace the origins and growth of the Anglican Communion through the period of the Lambeth Conferences from 1867 to 1967. The last chapter presents liturgical, ecumenical, and pastoral texts of worldwide, contemporary Anglicanism.

The texts and the editors' introductory comments to them are an invaluable resource to help a serious student of Christianity understand what Anglicanism is. This book will be essential reading in courses in ecumenical theology and modern church history.

HERBERT J. RYAN, S.J.

Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

TRACTATES AND SERMONS. By Richard Hooker. Edited by Laetitia Yeandle and Egil Grisliis. *Folger Library Edition of the Works of Richard Hooker*. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap/Harvard University, 1990. Pp. xl + 926. \$100.

This volume makes it clear why the distinguished Elizabethan churchman who wrote *Of the Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity*, rightly honored as defender of the Prayer Book and monarchy, merits respect as a preacher as well. Notwithstanding that Puritan opponents charged that Hooker "preacheth but now and then," and only ten of his sermons (compared to 96 of Lancelot Andrewes and 160 of John Donne) survive, the rich volume at hand is of the calibre of literature which Francis Bacon said should be "chewed and digested."

Whether essentially oral (sermons) or intended for private reading (tractates) H.'s pronouncements were carefully attended. Extant sermons date from the period after H. had acceded in 1584 to the Mastership of the Temple. Walter Travers, an ardent Puritan, had hoped for that post, but he had to settle for that of afternoon lecturer. In the resulting controversy, mornings spoke Canterbury and afternoons spoke Geneva. The focus was no longer on surplice, tippet and ceremonials; it pointed to matters of justification, faith, and predestination. Erudite and able, H. attacked Geneva with reason, and Rome with sufficiency of Scripture, thereby earning the censure of those who, misunderstanding his breadth and perception, mistook him for a *trimmer*. H.'s vast knowledge, his lucid prose, and his stunning insight mark him as more than the defender of an institution: H. is an architect of religious thought which transcends conventional boundaries.

The present volume evidences the meticulous attention H. deserves. Special thanks are due P. E. Forte for the essay "Hooker as Preacher," to Laetitia Yeandle for the impeccable presentation of the texts, and to Egil Grisliis for his wise and Hookeresque commentary—particularly with regard to the matter on justification.

STUART C. HENRY
Duke University

LEIBNIZ KORRESPONDIERT MIT CHINA: DER BRIEFWECHSEL MIT DEN JESUITENMISSIONAREN (1689–1714). Edited by Rita Widmaier. Frankfurt/Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1990. Pp. xv + 332. DM 120.

A precursor of the ecumenical movement of today, Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz, was deeply interested in fostering the work of the Jesuits in China during the late 17th and early 18th centuries. This collection of 70

letters, some of them published for the first time, begins with his conversation with Claudio Filippo Grimaldi in Rome. When the latter returned to China to become the director of the Bureau of Astronomy in Peking, L. continued to send him questions about Chinese civilization. These centered on Chinese history and geography, the origin of the Chinese language and its differences from other languages such as Korean, Japanese, and Manchu, the customs of the people, the literature and poetry of the Chinese, etc.

After Grimaldi's death, L. continued such correspondence with the French Jesuits in China, e.g., Joachim Bouvet, Claude de Visdelou, and with the mission procurator in Paris, Antoine de Verjus, among others. Perhaps the best known exchange was that of Bouvet who pointed out the parallels of the diagrams of the *Yijing* (Book of Changes) to the data on binary arithmetic which L. had discovered. L. considered his system to be a new confirmation of the Christian religion and one that would be useful in finding the key to the Chinese writing system, which, in turn, would open the door to a universal language and philosophy.

The editor's erudite essay at the end of the collection succinctly weaves together the disparate topics in these letters. Several errors about the historical background appear, e.g. in the biographical account of Giovanni Laureati (11), and in the identification of Charles Maigrot as a Jesuit (268), despite accurate earlier statements about him as an opponent of the Jesuits; but otherwise the editing of this correspondence is nearly flawless. A noteworthy contribution towards appreciating L. and his intellectual discourse with the Jesuits about China.

JOHN W. WITEK, S.J.
Georgetown University

JAPAN'S ENCOUNTER WITH CHRISTIANITY: THE CATHOLIC MISSION IN PRE-MODERN JAPAN. By Neil S. Fujita. New York: Paulist, 1991. Pp. viii + 294. \$13.95.

Fujita's preface quotes Alessandro Valignano who visited Japan three times between 1579 and 1603 as Visitor General of the Jesuit missionaries. He wrote that the Japanese "have rites and ceremonies so different from those of other nations that it seems that they deliberately try to be unlike any other people. The things they do in this respect are beyond imagining and it may truly be said that Japan is a world the reverse of Europe."

The Spanish, Portuguese, and Italian Jesuits were not prepared to accept the Japanese concept of *Shinkoku* (the country of gods) where any religious, philosophical, and ethical notions could be amalgamated; if not, it would be refused violently. That is what happened to Christianity, which preached a transcendent God and a Pope in Rome, both of whom could demand loyalty beyond that ordinarily given to the Emperor, Shogun, or Daimyo, and a respect beyond that given to Shinto and Buddhism. Both in the premodern Japan and again in modern Japan, the Japanese felt they had nothing really to learn from the West in spiritual matters; Western knowledge was the exception then and now.

F.'s epilogue asks the salient question: What prevents Japan from accepting Christianity? I believe F. is right in describing the swamp-like mentality of the Japanese, for whom a "peaceful coexistence" of all religions is possible. Furthermore, the Japanese would rather feel and intuit (*kimochi*) God rather than be able to define and theologize about God in the scholastic way of the West. But a mystery remains. Some Japanese were willing to die for the Christian faith, while some Jesuits apostasized

from the very faith they brought to Japan. In contact between Christianity and Japan, there is no room for an insular mentality or for watering down. What is needed is genuine dialogue. The result will be an enrichment of one's own faith and an appreciation of a different religious tradition for all who are real seekers after Truth.

BENJAMIN L. WREN, S.J.
Loyola University, New Orleans

MISSION TO RURAL AMERICA: THE STORY OF W. HOWARD BISHOP, FOUNDER OF GLENMARY. By Christopher J. Kaufmann. New York: Paulist, 1991. Pp. x + 298. \$16.95.

In earlier efforts, Kauffman, editor of the *U.S. Catholic Historian*, turned his considerable historical skills to such subjects as the Knights of Columbus and the Sulpicians in America. He has now produced an able biography of a little-known figure in recent American Catholic history, W. Howard Bishop, founder of the Glenmary community. K.'s study admirably situates Bishop (1885–1953) within the wider movements of the American Church, beginning with his early years in the Baltimore archdiocese of James Cardinal Gibbons.

Bishop's early life did not represent the typical vocation of his era. Educated in public schools, and with two Harvard years behind him, young Howard was not ordained until the age of thirty. A city boy who warmed quickly to pastoral ministry in rural Maryland, Howard gathered statistics on those areas of the country, especially the South, without priests and Catholic presence, and began to plan for a society of home missionaries as a parallel to the international work of the Maryknoll Society. Invited to the Archdiocese of Cincinnati in 1937, Bishop there formally began the great work that would come to in-

clude the Glenmary Home Mission Sisters as well.

Even though the life of Bishop lacks, in truth, high drama, K. tells the story briskly. The text opens a window on authority conflicts of the early foundation, especially those resulting from a kind of proto-feminism of the 1940s. A concluding chapter sketches the course of Glenmary in the postconciliar years. In the process, the development of theological and sociological perspectives on missions and conversions is gingerly traced.

CLYDE F. CREWS
Bellarmino College, Louisville

TRADITION AND THE CRITICAL SPIRIT: CATHOLIC MODERNIST WRITINGS. By George Tyrrell. Selected and introduced by James C. Livingston. *Fortress Texts in Modern Theology*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. xl + 205.

George Tyrrell (1861–1909) has long been considered one of the most significant writers associated with the Modernist movement in the Catholic Church. Livingston has carefully selected and organized a collection of Tyrrell's essays seeking "to bring some of Tyrrell's essential, but often not easily accessible, essays to the attention of a wider audience of scholars who are interested in modern religious thought and contemporary theology." For the most part, the selected writings are from Tyrrell's Modernist period which L. dates from the publication of "The Relation of Theology to Devotion" in November of 1899. Tyrrell himself would hold that much of his later writings on revelation, theology, dogma and authority was contained here "as it were in brief compendium or analytical index."

L. prepares and focuses the reader with a very helpful introduction to

the selected texts. Tyrrell did not present his ideas in a systematic way, for his usual method of communication was the essay and review. Although Tyrrell writes clearly and forcefully, his subtle and complex thought does require careful reading. L.'s excellent summary of Tyrrell's religious thought provides a helpful and even indispensable guide to the reading of the texts. A select bibliography provides direction for further study of Tyrrell.

The selected texts are grouped around the following chapter headings: Letters of Counsel and Meditation; Religion; Revelation and Theology; Faith, Development and Theology; The Relation of Theology to Devotion; Science, History and the Truth of Belief; The Church and Authority; Criticism and Christology; and God, Evil and Eschatology. This volume with its introduction and carefully organized selections is a helpful addition to the studies concerning Tyrrell and the Modernist movement in the Catholic Church.

CHARLES J. HEALEY, S.J.

Pope John XXIII Seminary, Mass.

THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE THEOLOGY OF KARL BARTH. By John Thompson. *Princeton Theology Monographs*. Allison Park, Pa.: Pickwick, 1991. Pp. 211. \$24.

This small work joins those of other contemporary Barth scholars—Thomas Torrance, Geoffrey Bromiley, George Hunsinger—as a contribution to the renewed interest in the giant of 20th-century Protestant thought. Thompson's work is distinguished by its focus on the little-investigated pneumatological aspect of Barth's thought. However, it ranges well beyond that, constituting a fine introduction to Barth's theology and what his position might be in current debates.

Barth's understanding of the Spirit

begins from within the third mission in the divine economy, in which "the Spirit is God in us, opening up our lives to know his Word in Jesus Christ and bringing that effectively to us" (25). This aspect of the "work of redemption" reflects the inner-trinitarian relationships in which the Spirit is the mutual bond of Father and Son, thus proceeding from both *ad intra* as well as *ad extra*. T. also takes up Barth's discussion of the work of the Spirit in the creation, Incarnation, Resurrection, Holy Scripture, virgin birth, the Church, Christian life and consummation. Of special interest is T.'s effort (unsuccessful, in my opinion) to defend Barth against the criticism that the Spirit's application of the benefits of Christ to individuals is to give the knowledge and experience of salvation but not to convey it.

T. carries on a running argument with a spate of contemporary theologians, challenging Philip Rosato's overemphasis on Barth's pneumatology, current critiques of the *filioque*, Cullmann on baptism, Moltmann on the social Trinity, and von Balthasar on the role of saints. T. does less than justice to the positions of Moltmann and von Balthasar.

The Karl Barth boomlet has something to do with the growing awareness that contemporary theology has acceded too quickly to reigning cultural premises. While we must challenge Barth's "No!" to any point of contact for the gospel in human experience, we can never forget the telling witness of the Barmen declaration to the "one Word we have to hear and trust and obey in life and in death," expressing the strength of Barth's theology in the face of the isms of the hour. T. here reminds us of the part the Spirit plays in calling us to this "christological concentration."

GABRIEL FACKRE

Andover Newton Theol. School

ENCOUNTER ON THE NARROW RIDGE: A LIFE OF MARTIN BUBER. By Maurice Friedman. New York: Paragon House, 1991. Pp. xi + 496. \$31.95.

Once again Friedman demonstrates unique ability to make Buber come alive for the reader as he weaves together the life and thought of this great Jewish thinker. He argues that the authentic truth of Buber's writings can only be grasped in relation to the events of Buber's life. He underscores the actual presence of Buber to the persons and situations of his time because it is this presence which illuminates his writings.

This volume is not intended simply as a synopsis of F.'s classic three-volume study, *Martin Buber's Life and Work*. F. gives greater emphasis here to the events of Buber's life, the fruit of his research in the last several years. F. has added many intimate details of Buber's family life, of his relationship with his wife, Paula, and their children and grandchildren, with his pupils, with many academic, literary, and political luminaries, and the close companionship of Naamah Beer-Hoffman in the closing years of his life. The result is a far deeper insight into the person of Buber. F.'s concluding summary expresses well the importance of this work as well as the lasting place of Buber himself: in an era when we seem to have lost our understanding of humanity, Buber presents us again with an authentic image of the human; and when our relationship with God seems threatened with destruction, Buber points us anew to the meeting with the eternal Thou.

An obvious weakness of this study is the absence of the standard critical apparatus. Instead of specific references through footnotes or endnotes, F. merely lists relevant sources for each chapter, as in his three-volume work. Although F. defends this prac-

tice as a way of avoiding distractions for the reader, he would render his many admirers a great service if he would restore the proper critical apparatus in future editions of his otherwise enormously helpful volumes on Buber.

DONALD J. MOORE, S.J.
Fordham University

THE BALANCE OF CONSCIOUSNESS: ERIC VOEGELIN'S POLITICAL THEORY. By Kenneth Keulman. University Park, Pa.: Pennsylvania State University, 1990. Pp. xx + 194. \$28.50.

Keulman has written an exceptionally lucid and sane introduction to the work of Voegelin. He situates Voegelin's work on the contemporary scene of intellectual history, overviews its genesis and development, elaborates its central insights, sets it in dialogue with others, and subtly but powerfully argues for its relevance to contemporary political living. Voegelin's principal work, the five-volume *Order and History* (1956-1987), underwent a significant conceptual transformation between the third volume (1957) and the fourth (1974). Much of K.'s book is devoted to exploring the theory of consciousness emergent in the later work and its significance for Voegelin's political theory.

The concern driving Voegelin's work was the rise of modern totalitarianism. He postulated its roots in misguided political theory. To verify this he turned to a historical study of ancient civilizations where he discerned the operation of symbolizing consciousness at work simultaneously constituting political realities in history and forging the conceptual tools for subsequent political theory and practice. Contrary to the supposition of positivist science, Voegelin finds human consciousness to be ineluctably religious, seeking to express political ideals within the widest horizons of ultimacy. But while ultimacy ev-

erywhere exerts its pull upon consciousness, concrete historical finitude introduces its own exigency into the structure of mind, making of consciousness a "tension" or "metaxy" whose balance must be preserved for healthy political living to prevail over "gnosticism." In K.'s view, to live out this "balance of consciousness" is the challenge issued by Voegelin (152-53).

The book works well as an introduction to Voegelin and as a resource for those familiar with his writing. K. shows an intimate familiarity with his subject, a clarity of philosophical understanding, and a calm, measured writing style which permits controlled entry into the turbulent but extremely rich world of one of the great philosophers of our age.

KENNETH R. MELCHIN

Saint Paul University, Ottawa

CREATION AND SCIENTIFIC CREATIVITY: A STUDY IN THE THOUGHT OF S. L. JAKI. By Paul Haffner. Front Royal, Va.: Christendom, 1991. Pp. 205. \$8.95.

Stanley Jaki, a Benedictine scholar with doctorates in both theology and physics, has been a prolific and spirited contributor to the dialogue between science and theology for twenty-five years. His carefully documented studies linking science, history, philosophy, and theology have been and are a formidable challenge to those who would engage him in debate, as many do. He takes no prisoners in making strong arguments and attacking opponents of his views, but he also makes many telling points.

Haffner's book is a very readable version of a doctoral dissertation which portrays the contribution of Jaki to a "deeper understanding of the relationship between Christian faith in God the Creator and modern science." Jaki's work is indeed worthy of careful study, because few if any

can match his breadth of scholarship and his ability to handle science, history, philosophy, and theology with equal facility. H. has summarized Jaki's major ideas quite well, but he is so uncritical that not once does he disagree with his subject. Thus the reader finds oneself agreeing or disagreeing with Jaki, not with H.

After reviewing impressive biographical data, H. presents Jaki's analysis of the inherent incompleteness of science which points to the need for nonscientific (and complementary) methods in the quest to understand the cosmos and man himself. He then summarizes Jaki's massive historical evidence (based heavily on, but going beyond Duhem) for how and why science emerged from the Christian Middle Ages and not from seven other great cultures. The reason: the Christian doctrine of creation *ex nihilo* and *ab initio*. The contingency of the universe, the correlative of creation, is also crucial in Jaki's thought. His ideas on human nature and the development of ethical values include strong critiques of evolutionism, artificial intelligence, and extraterrestrial life.

H. responds to the critics of Jaki and his work, while noting those who have commented favorably on both. He closes with a chapter on Jaki's loyalty to the Church and the magisterium, and includes a complete and impressive list of Jaki's publications.

CHARLES L. CURRIE, S.J.

*St. Joseph's University
Philadelphia*

DOING FAITHJUSTICE: AN INTRODUCTION TO CATHOLIC SOCIAL THOUGHT. By Fred Kammer, S.J. New York: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 246. \$12.95.

This is not a how-to book but a why-to book. Beginning with biblical testimony, Kammer highlights the themes which motivate and shape

faithjustice. From the Jewish Scriptures comes a belief in the goodness of creation, stewardship, and community concretized by the celebration of the jubilee year and the role played by the poor. From the Christian Scriptures come the message and example of Jesus which bind his followers into a Spirit-filled communion of passionate action.

The centerpiece of the book is a summary of thirteen key documents which frame modern Catholic social thought. For each document K. sketches the historical setting, summarizes the content, and lifts out one or two key ideas which define the document's contribution. He then turns to a discussion of two themes which "shape much of the late twentieth-century Roman Catholic reflection upon *Faithjustice*." These themes are (1) standing with the poor and (2) moving from charity to justice. K. concludes with a description of seven sources which "provide a framework for hopefulness" and a Parish Social Ministry Inventory for self evaluation.

As an introduction *Faithjustice* is clear, succinct, and accurate. It provides an informative guide through the multiplicity and complexity of modern Catholic social teaching and avoids the pitfalls of oversimplification or sweeping indictment. K.'s appeal is to both the head and the heart, and he has managed to maintain a balanced presentation while advocating firmly for faithjustice. His credibility (for those who don't know him) is enhanced by biographical anecdotes which preface each chapter. The impact of these incidents might have been strengthened if they had been referred to more often in the content of each chapter. On the other hand, *doing* faithjustice means that readers must take their own action, and K. has ably explained why.

ROBERT L. KINAST

*Center for Theological Reflection
Madeira Beach, Fla.*

LINES IN THE SAND: JUSTICE AND THE GULF WAR. By Alan Geyer and Barbara G. Green. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 187. \$11.95.

To reveal the moral ambiguity of the Gulf War, Geyer and Green have provided a book of remarkable breadth and clarity. They first discuss the moral relevance of just-war theory. Successive chapters use the criteria of just-war theory not directly to argue the war's morality or immorality, but as a framework for a rich narrative of the war. Under "Just Cause" they consider the colonialist background of the Middle East, its economic value to the West, and the historical roots of the Iraq-Kuwait conflict. They later examine U.S. complicity in the conflicts of the Middle East. There they are unafraid to call our attention to the U.S. support of Israel while "Israeli policies became more intransigent and the cause of the Palestinians became more desperate" (56).

Under "Just Intent" they carefully cull six objectives from the plethora of "public and not-so-public" statements and examine each, finding there "one more example of . . . moral dualism" (86). "Last Resort" shows how the U.S. thwarted successive Arab, European, and Russian attempts at a negotiated peace. "Legitimate Authority" reveals the administration's maneuvers, and the psychological duress behind the votes in the U.N. and Congress for "necessary means," while "Prospects of Success" points to long-term negative consequences of the war to show that "the very canons of success were proving to be misconceived" (125).

G. and G. close with a chapter on "Just Peace," which concretely requires a strengthening of U.N. peace-keeping powers. Philosophically, they call for a reinforcement of the presupposition against war. Theologically, they call for a just peace based on "lovingkindness," since true "justice

is grounded in the love and mercy of God" (173). Though sometimes weakened by attributing equal evidentiary force to all sources, this is an informative and highly recommended ethical study of the Gulf War.

G. SIMON HARAK, S.J.
Fairfield University, Conn.

A HINDU PERSPECTIVE ON THE PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGION. By Arvind Sharma. New York: St. Martin's, 1991. Pp. ix + 180.

Sharma addresses a very promising, yet demanding topic; and he does so in a vivid and pleasantly readable way. His order of inquiry follows that of John Hick's *Philosophy of Religion* (3d ed.), the work he relies on perhaps too exclusively for questions of Western philosophy of religion. Thus his first two chapters deal with "Grounds for Belief, and Disbelief, in God" respectively. Next come "Hindu Theodicies: The Problem of Evil" and "Christian Views of Revelation in a Hindu Context," followed by "Religious Language" and "The Problem of Falsification and Verification." The final three chapters treat "Human Destiny: Immortality and Resurrection," "Karma and Reincarnation," and "The Truth-Claims of Different Religions."

As a survey of new viewpoints and content which Hindu philosophy can offer Western philosophy of religion, S.'s treatment is very good. But in

most cases S. does not give rigorous, full treatment to the questions raised. Thus, on the positive side, e.g., S. shows helpfully how Hindu thought avoids the religion-*vs.*-science problem by holding that "revelation applies only in the suprasensuous realm" (42). And S. uses all the great English-writing Hindu philosophers of the 20th century in explaining his points. Examples on the negative side: S. sometimes cites theistic Hindu contributions to a question as afterthoughts by comparison with Nyaya and Advaita Vedanta viewpoints, whereas (1) the vast majority of Hindus are theistic, and (2) Western philosophy of religion is dealing mainly with theism-based questions. All the same, S. must be commended for showing the important contributions of the nontheistic or barely theistic perspectives. Secondly on the minus side, S. concludes his book, on the important subject of truth claims, by relying heavily on passages from Pratima Bowes which S. himself recognizes to be significantly flawed, yet gives insufficient excuse for (161).

In sum: this book goes some distance toward fulfilling a recognized need, and has a number of fruitful new ideas. Within the limits mentioned, S.'s work is quite useful—most notably for undergraduate collections.

JAMES D. REDINGTON, S.J.
Georgetown University

BOOKS RECEIVED

SCRIPTURE STUDIES

Bal, M. *Death & Dissymmetry: The Politics of Coherence in the Book of Judges*. Univ. of Chicago, 1989. Pp. 312. \$49.95; \$16.95.

Beasley-Murray, G. *Gospel of Life*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 131.

Biblical Hermeneutics in Historical

Perspective. Ed. M. Burrows and P. Rorem. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991. Pp. 367. \$24.95.

Breck, J. *Spirit of Truth*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1991. Pp. 188. \$10.95.

Brown, C. *No Longer Be Silent*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 240. \$17.95.

Duggan, M. *The Consuming Fire*.

Theological Studies

JUNE 1992
VOL. 53, NO. 2

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus
in the United States*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

“Sacred and Inviolable”: <i>Rerum Novarum</i> and Natural Rights <i>Ernest L. Fortin, A.A.</i>	203
Lonergan and Feminism <i>Cynthia S. W. Crysdale</i>	234
The Case for Spirit Christology <i>Roger Haight, S.J.</i>	257
Aboriginal Cultures and the Christ <i>Carl F. Starkloff, S.J.</i>	288
Teilhard de Chardin: Ontogenesis vs. Ontology <i>Carol Jean Vale, S.S.J.</i>	313

BOOK REVIEWS

FRETHEIM, T.: <i>Exodus</i>	338
BRETT, M.: <i>Biblical Criticism in Crisis?</i>	339
WAY, D.: <i>The Lordship of Christ</i>	340
SCHNEEMELCHER, W.: <i>New Testament Apocrypha 1</i>	342
MCDONNELL, K., and G. MONTAGUE: <i>Christian Initiation and Baptism in the Spirit</i>	344
PILHOFER, P.: <i>Presbyteron Kreitton</i>	345
VAN OORT, J.: <i>Jerusalem and Babylon</i>	347
LANGMUIR, G.: <i>Toward a Definition of Antisemitism</i>	349
DRÈZE, J.-F.: <i>Raison d'état, raison de Dieu</i>	351
FOSTER, S.: <i>The Long Argument</i>	352
MISNER, P.: <i>Social Catholicism in Europe</i>	355
WHITE, R., JR.: <i>Liberty and Justice for All</i>	356
MARTY, M.: <i>Modern American Religion 2</i>	358
BALTHASAR, H. VON: <i>The Glory of the Lord: A Theological Aesthetics 5</i>	359
YATES, J.: <i>The Timelessness of God</i>	361
TILLEY, T.: <i>The Evils of Theodicy</i>	363
MCFADYEN, A.: <i>The Call to Personhood</i>	365
GARLAND, D.: <i>Punishment and Modern Society</i>	367

SMITH, J.: <i>Humanae Vitae: A Generation Later</i>	368
O'BRIEN, W.: <i>Law and Morality in Israel's War with the PLO</i>	370
<i>The New Dictionary of Sacramental Worship</i> (ed. P. Fink)	372
POWER, D.: <i>Worship</i>	375
ZIMDARS-SWARTZ, S.: <i>Encountering Mary</i>	376
<i>Religion in Psychodynamic Perspective</i> (ed. H. Malony and B. Spilka)	378
BURRIDGE, K.: <i>In the Way</i>	379

SHORTER NOTICES

381

PRITCHARD, J.: <i>The Harper Concise Atlas of the Bible</i>	MURPHY, R.: <i>The Tree of Life</i>
SIKER, J.: <i>Disinheriting the Jews</i>	MAIER, H.: <i>Social Setting of Ministry in the Writings of Hermas, Clement and Ignatius</i>
MORRIS, T.: <i>Our Idea of God</i>	SPINKS, B.: <i>The Sanctus in the Eucharistic Prayer</i>
EGAN, H.: <i>An Anthology of Christian Mysticism</i>	BURROUGHS, C.: <i>From Signs to Design</i>
BRENDLER, G.: <i>Martin Luther</i>	EVANS, G., and J. WRIGHT (ed.): <i>The Anglican Tradition</i>
HOOKER, R.: <i>Tractates and Sermons</i>	WIDMAIER, A. (ed.): <i>Leibniz korrespondiert mit China</i>
FUJITA, N.: <i>Japan's Encounter with Christianity</i>	KAUFMANN, C.: <i>Mission to Rural America</i>
TYRRELL, G.: <i>Tradition and the Critical Spirit</i>	THOMPSON, J.: <i>The Holy Spirit in the Theology of Karl Barth</i>
FRIEDMAN, M.: <i>Encounter on the Narrow Ridge</i>	KEULMAN, K.: <i>The Balance of Consciousness</i>
HAFFNER, P.: <i>Creation and Scientific Creativity</i>	KAMMER, F.: <i>Doing Faithjustice</i>
GEYER, A., and B. GREEN: <i>Lines in the Sand</i>	SHARMA, A.: <i>A Hindu Perspective on the Philosophy of Religion</i>

BOOKS RECEIVED

395

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES (ISSN 0040-5639) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057. Second class postage paid at Washington, DC and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER, please send address changes to THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION 1992: U.S. individual: \$18; U.S. institutional: \$25; foreign individual: \$25 U.S. currency; foreign institutional: \$30 U.S. currency.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS and all correspondence dealing with subscriptions should be sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy or a computer printout of letter-perfect quality and a legible duplicate), TOGETHER WITH RETURN POSTAGE, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02167, USA. Author should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, 37 and O. Sts., N.W., Washington, DC 20057, USA.

BACK ISSUES are available from Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057, USA. Single copies prepaid: \$6 in U.S.; \$8 outside U.S.

FOR REPRINTS AND EARLIER ISSUES IN MICROFORM (35mm. and fiche), contact University Microfilms, Inc., 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1356, USA; phone (313) 761-4700.

Presenting This Issue

Our June issue features a study of the idea of the sacredness of private property in Leo XIII's *Rerum novarum*, an analysis of the relative absence of feminist theologians from Lonergan studies, two Christological explorations, one on Spirit Christology and the other on the salvific relationship between Christ and native cultures, and, finally, a comparison of the metaphysics of Teilhard de Chardin with that of Aquinas, Bonaventure, and Eckhart.

"Sacred and Inviolable": *Rerum Novarum* and Natural Rights argues that this encyclical's stress on the sacredness of private property and natural rights betrays the influence of some more recent social themes, and that these are not as easily reconcilable with the dominant Thomistic inspiration of Leo XIII's theology as the encyclical assumes. ERNEST L. FORTIN, A.A., has a doctorate in letters from the University of Paris and is professor of theology at Boston College. His *Dantes göttliche Komödie als Utopie* (Munich, 1991) appeared recently. He is currently working on the second edition of his *Medieval Political Philosophy, a Sourcebook*, on an English edition of Thomas Aquinas's *Commentary on the Politics of Aristotle*, and on *Dante and the Politics of Christendom*.

Lonergan and Feminism: Problems and Prospects finds a serious lack of engagement between Lonergan's work and feminist theologians, proposes that this may be due to the problems perceived by feminists when they approach Lonergan's thought, and suggests avenues of fruitful inquiry which should be mutually beneficial to feminists and Lonergan scholars alike. CYNTHIA S. W. CRYSDALE, Ph.D. from the University of St. Michael's College, Toronto, and assistant professor in the Department of Religion and Religious Education at the Catholic University of America, has recently published articles on Lonergan's method, on feminist ethics, and on moral and faith development in journals such as *Horizons*, *The Irish Theological Quarterly*, and *Eglise et Théologie*. She is currently editing an anthology of articles on Lonergan and Feminism.

The Case for Spirit Christology represents in a positive and constructive way some of the arguments for interpreting the divinity of Jesus in terms of the scriptural symbol "God as Spirit." ROGER HAIGHT, S.J., Ph.D. from the University of Chicago, is professor of historical and systematic theology at the Weston School of Theology in Cambridge, Mass. He recently published *Dynamics of Theology* (Paulist, 1990) and is focusing his current research in the area of Christology and ecclesiology.

Aboriginal Cultures and the Christ, following the example of Bartolomé de las Casas in his deep concern for just relations with "New World" peoples, pursues the question of the salvific relationship be-

tween Christ and native cultures. The central "case study" took place during a dozen years of pastoral work, mostly with people of the Arapaho tribe in Wyoming. CARL F. STARKLOFF, S.J., Ph.D. from the University of Ottawa and D.Th. from St. Paul University, is professor of pastoral and systematic theology at Regis College, Toronto School of Theology. His recent articles, "Keepers of Tradition: The Symbol Power of Indigenous Ministry" (*Kerygma*), "Ecclesiology as Praxis" (*Pastoral Sciences*), and "Beyond the Melting Pot," in D. Gelpi, ed., *Beyond Individualism* (Notre Dame, 1989), indicate the thrust of his current research into syncretism and inculturation and into inculturation examined in the light of Goertz's "cultural systems."

Teilhard de Chardin: Ontogenesis vs. Ontology compares and contrasts the metaphysics implicit in the writings of Teilhard de Chardin with that of Thomas Aquinas, Bonaventure, and Meister Eckhart, and explores the differences between Teilhardian ontogenesis and classical ontology. CAROL JEAN VALE, S.S.J., Ph.D. in historical theology from Fordham University, is currently chair of the department of religious studies, coordinator of the Graduate Program in Holistic Spirituality and Spiritual Direction, and president-to-be at Chestnut Hill College, Philadelphia, Pa. In addition to her ongoing research into the philosophical and theological ramifications of Teilhard's thought, she is also working on the crisis and challenge of Catholic higher education.

Since January of this year, the printing and distribution of *TS*, as well as the management of our subscription service, have been assumed by The Sheridan Press of Hanover, Pennsylvania. This arrangement promises our readers higher quality for the same low prices. During conversion to a new computer system, some duplication occurred in our billing and mailing. If you have experienced problems with your subscription, or if you wish to notify us of a change of address, our subscription manager, Lori Hess, will be happy to hear from you. Please write to her at The Sheridan Press, 450 Fame Avenue, Hanover, PA 17331; or give her a call at 1-800-352-2210.

Robert J. Daly, S.J.
Editor

- S.F.: Ignatius, 1991. Pp. 671. \$29.95.
- Edwards, J. *Romans*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1992. Pp. 395.
- Eliade, M. *Essential Sacred Writings from around the World*. S.F.: HarperSanFrancisco, 1992 [1967]. Pp. 645. \$17.
- Eriksson, L. "Come, Children, Listen to Me!" Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1991. Pp. 216. Sw. kr. 164.
- Fewell, D. *Circle of Sovereignty*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1991 [1988]. Pp. 159.
- Fiorenza, E. *Revelation*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 150.
- Georgi, D. *Theocracy*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 112.
- Gillman, F. *Women Who Knew Paul*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 95. \$6.95.
- Gottesvolk*. Ed. A. Meinhold and R. Lutt. Stuttgart: Evangelische, 1991. Pp. 246. DM 69.
- Grassi, J. *Loaves and Fishes*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1991. Pp. 104. \$6.95.
- Heil, J. *The Death and Resurrection of Jesus*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 126. \$9.95.
- Herron, R. *Mark's Account of Peter's Denial of Jesus*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1991. Pp. 212. \$43.50; \$24.50.
- Kysar, R. *Called to Care*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 165.
- "Lasst eure Lampen brennen!" Ed. C. P. März. Leipzig: Benno, 1991. Pp. 127. DM 49.
- Kolarcik, M. *The Ambiguity of Death in the Book of Wisdom 1-6*. Rome: Pont. Bibl. Inst., 1991. Pp. 208. L. 34,500.
- Lehrerin der Gerechtigkeit*. Ed. G. Hentschel and E. Zenger. Leipzig: Benno, 1990. Pp. 183. DM 49.
- Mabee, C. *Reading Sacred Texts through American Eyes*. Macon, Ga.: Mercer Univ., 1991. Pp. 128. \$24.95; \$16.95.
- Martin, R. *Ephesians, Colossians, and Philemon*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 156. \$17.95.
- Mausser, U. *The Gospel of Peace*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 189. \$16.95.
- Metzger, B., et al. *The Making of the New Revised Standard Version of the Bible*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991. Pp. 92. \$7.95.
- Milgrom, J. *Leviticus 1-16*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1991. Pp. 1136. \$42.
- O'Grady, J. *Disciples and Leaders*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 137. \$9.95.
- Pauline Theology* 1. Ed. J. Bassler. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 238.
- Pilch, J. *Introducing the Cultural Context of the New Testament*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 254. \$14.95.
- Pittner, B. *Studien zum lukanischen Sondergut*. Leipzig: Benno, 1991. Pp. 163. DM 49.
- Scott, M. *Picking the "Right" Bible Study Program*. Chicago, Ill.: ACTA, 1992. Pp. 248. \$14.95.
- Shelton, J. *Mighty in Word and Deed*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 196.
- Smelik, K. *Writings from Ancient Israel*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 206. \$19.95.
- Smith, D. *First, Second, and Third John*. Louisville, Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 166. \$17.95.
- Smith, P. *WomanStory*. Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1992. Pp. 112. \$7.95.
- Theissen, G. *The Open Door*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 191.
- Throntveit, M. *Ezra-Nehemiah*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 123. \$16.95.
- Wall, R. *Revelation*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 295.
- Westermann, C. *Basic Forms of Prophetic Speech*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991 [1967]. Pp. 240. \$18.95.
- Westermann, C. *Prophetic Oracles of Salvation in the Old Testament*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 283. \$18.95.

White, H. *Narration and Discourse in the Book of Genesis*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1991. Pp. 312. \$49.50.

SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY

Aspekte eines christlichen Menschenbildes. Ed. L. Ullrich. Leipzig: Benno, 1991. Pp. 123. DM 32.

Balthasar, H. Urs von. *The Theology of Henry de Lubac*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1991. Pp. 127. \$9.95.

Baudler, G. *God and Violence*. Springfield, Ill.: Templegate, 1992. Pp. 368. \$19.95.

Boff, L. *Faith on the Edge*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 212. \$16.95.

Bread and Breath: Essays in Honour of Samuel Rayan, S.J. Ed. T. John. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1991. Pp. 336. \$12; \$10.

Calvin, J. *Instruction in Faith (1537)*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 93. \$8.95.

Carter, B. *Unity in Diversity*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1991. Pp. 102. \$29.50.

Cook, M. *The Open Circle*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 130.

Cut Loose Your Stammering Tongue. Ed. D. Hopkins and G. Cummings. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 168. \$13.95.

Death and Afterlife. Ed. H. Obayashi, N.Y.: Praeger, 1991. Pp. 240. \$49.95; \$17.95.

Dickson, K. *Uncompleted Mission*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 177.

Edwards, D. *Jesus and the Cosmos*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 116. \$6.95.

Faces of Jesus in Africa. Ed. R. Schreiter. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990. Pp. 181. \$16.95.

Foundations of Theological Study. Ed. R. Viladesau and M. Massa. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 319. \$14.95.

Gandhi on Christianity. Ed. R. Ellsberg. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 117. \$10.95.

Goergen, D. *The Jesus of Christian*

History. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 287. \$14.95.

Griffin, D. *Evil Revisited*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1991. Pp. 277. \$19.95.

Gutiérrez, G. *The God of Life*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 214. \$13.95.

Harrington, W. *The Tears of God*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 70. \$4.95.

Haynes, S. *Prospects for Post-Holocaust Theology*. Atlanta: Scholars, 1991. Pp. 309. \$29.95; \$19.95.

Interpréter: Hommage amical à Claude Geffré. Ed. J.-P. Jossua and N.-J. Séd. Paris: Cerf, 1992. Pp. 328. Fr. 180.

Introduction to Jewish-Christian Relations. Ed. M. Shermis and A. Zannoni. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 275. \$13.95.

Johnson, E. *Consider Jesus*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 149. \$14.95; \$9.95.

Kierkegaard, S. *Practice in Christianity*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Univ., 1991. Pp. 416. \$49.50; \$14.95.

Mackin, T. *The Marital Sacrament*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1989. Pp. 701. \$24.95.

Manigne, J.-P. *Les figures du temps*. Paris: Cerf, 1991. Pp. 174. Fr. 127.

McGlasson, P. *Jesus and Judas: Biblical Exegesis in Barth*. Atlanta, Ga.: Scholars, 1991. Pp. 160. \$24.95; \$14.95.

Muto, S. *Womanspirit*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. 179. \$15.95.

Neville, R. A. *Theology Primer*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1991. Pp. 221. \$39.50; \$12.95.

O'Collins, G., and M. Venturini. *Believing*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 178. \$8.95.

Odell-Scott, D. *A Post-Patriarchal Christology*. Atlanta: Scholars, 1991. Pp. 262. \$29.95; \$19.95.

Stylianopoulos, T. *The Good News of Christ*. Brookline, Mass.: Holy Cross Orthodox, 1991. Pp. 232. \$14.95.

- Tekippe, T. *Theology: Love's Question*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1992. Pp. 147. \$34.50; \$17.50.
- Torisu, Y. *Gott und Welt in der Gotteslehre des Irenäus von Lyon*. Nettetal: Steyler, 1991. Pp. 268. DM 54.80.
- Troeltsch, E. *The Christian Faith*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 310.
- Voices from Jerusalem*. Ed. D. Burrell and Y. Landau. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 176. \$9.95.
- Yagi, S., and L. Swidler. *A Bridge to Buddhist-Christian Dialogue*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1990. Pp. 152. \$9.95.
- Yannaras, C. *Elements of Faith*. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1991. Pp. 167. \$24.95.
- HISTORICAL**
- Andrea de Santo Victore. *Expositio in Ezechielem*. (Corpus christianorum continuatio mediaevalis 53E.) Turnhout: Brepols, 1991. Pp. lxxxv + 202. Fr.b. 3,500.
- Andrea de Santo Victore. *Expositiones Historicae in Libros Salomonis*. Ed. R. Berndt. (Corpus christianorum continuatio mediaevalis 53B.) Turnhout: Brepols, 1991. Pp. xxvi + 149. Fr.b. 2,200.
- Anglo-Saxon Litanies of the Saints*. Ed. M. Lapidge. London: Boydell & Brewer, 1991. Pp. 328. \$50.
- Balduino de Forda. *Sermones de commendatione Fidei*. Ed. D. Bell. (Corpus christianorum continuatio mediaevalis 99.) Turnhout: Brepols, 1991. Pp. xlii + 502.
- Bria, I. *The Sense of Ecumenical Tradition*. Geneva: WCC, 1991. Pp. 128. \$9.95.
- Burns, R. *Roman Catholicism Yesterday and Today*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1992. Pp. 258. \$11.95.
- Bussche, J. *Ignatius (George) Spencer Passionist (1799-1864)*. Leuven: Leuven Univ., 1991. Pp. 256. Fr.b. 1500.
- Carmody, D., and J. Carmody. *Catholic Spirituality and the History of Religions*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 179. \$12.95.
- Correia-Alfonso, J. *The Ignatian Vision of India*. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1991. Pp. 87. \$2.
- Curtis, A., et al. *Dates with Destiny*. Tarrytown, N.Y.: Revell, 1991. Pp. 208.
- Dhotel, J.-C. *Who Are You, Ignatius of Loyola?* Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1991. Pp. 118. \$4.
- Eliade, M., and I. Couliano. *The Eliade Guide to World Religions*. S.F.: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991. Pp. 302. \$22.95.
- Garde, J. *Old English Poetry in Medieval Christian Perspective*. Suffolk, U.K.: St. Edmundsbury, 1991. Pp. 232. \$68.
- Hamman, A.-G. *Etudes patristiques*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1991. Pp. 474. Fr. 150.
- Hans Urs von Balthasar*. Ed. D. Schindler. S.F.: Ignatius, 1991. Pp. 305. \$14.95.
- John Wesley's Sermons*. Ed. A. Outler and R. Heitzenrater. Nashville: Abingdon, 1991 [1984]. Pp. 496. \$19.95.
- Lippy, C., et al. *Christianity Comes to the Americas*. N.Y.: Paragon House, 1992. Pp. 400. \$29.95.
- McDonough, P. *Men Astutely Trained*. N.Y.: Free Press, 1992. Pp. 616. \$24.95.
- The Millennium*. Ed. A. Leong. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1990. Pp. 177. \$12.95.
- Nardone, R. *The Story of the Christian Year*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 192. \$9.95.
- Neusner, J. *Symbol and Theology in Early Judaism*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 242.
- O'Grady, D. *Caesar, Christ, and Constantine*. Huntington, Ind.: Our Sunday Visitor, 1991. Pp. 180. \$7.95.
- Outler, A. *John Wesley's Sermons*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1991. Pp. 96. \$7.95.

- Radberti, P. *Expositio in Psalmum xlv.* (Corpus christianorum continuatio mediaevalis 94). Turnhout: Brepols, 1991. Pp. xiv + 125. Fr.b. 1,750.
- Schreiner, S. *The Theater of His Glory.* Durham, N.C.: Labyrinth, 1991. Pp. 164.
- Strong, J. *The Legend and Cult of Upagupta.* Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Univ., 1992. \$45.
- Watt, D. *A Transforming Faith.* New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers Univ., 1991. Pp. 213. \$32; \$12.95.
- Watts, J. *God, Harlem U.S.A.: The Father Divine Story.* Berkeley: Univ. of California, 1992. Pp. 249. \$30.
- Wesche, K. *On the Person of Christ.* Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1991. Pp. 203. \$14.95.
- Wilson, I. *Holy Faces, Secret Places.* N.Y.: Doubleday, 1991. Pp. 238. \$26.
- MORALITY AND LAW**
- Buddhist Ethics and Modern Society.* Ed. C. Fu and S. Wawrytko. N.Y.: Greenwood, 1991. Pp. 472. \$55.
- Campbell, D., et al. *Theological Education and Moral Formation.* Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1992. Pp. 235. \$18.95.
- Conn, J. *Catholic Universities in the United States and Ecclesiastical Authority.* Rome: Pont. Gregorian Univ., 1991. Pp. 346. L. 45,000.
- Eller, C. *Conscientious Objectors and the Second World War.* N.Y.: Praeger, 1991. Pp. 218. \$39.95.
- Erickson, J. *The Challenge of Our Past.* Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1991. Pp. 174. \$10.95.
- Fenn, R. *The Secularization of Sin.* Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 199. \$14.95.
- Grisez, G., and R. Shaw. *Fulfillment in Christ.* Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1991. Pp. 456. \$17.95.
- Hauerwas, S. *After Christendom?* Nashville: Abingdon, 1991. Pp. 192. \$12.95.
- Lohr, G. *Gott-Gebote-Ideale.* Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1991. Pp. 127.
- Lynch, E. *Religion and Politics in Latin America.* N.Y.: Praeger, 1991. Pp. 200. \$42.95.
- Maguire, D., and A. Fagnoli. *On Moral Grounds.* N.Y.: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. 196. \$21.95.
- Maximiano, J. *The Signs of the Times and the Social Doctrine of the Church.* Manila: Our Lady of Guadalupe, 1991. Pp. 298.
- Nash, J. *Loving Nature.* Nashville: Abingdon, 1991. Pp. 246. \$16.95.
- Poling, J. *The Abuse of Power.* Nashville: Abingdon, 1991. Pp. 224. \$15.95.
- Proclaiming Justice & Peace.* Ed. M. Walsh and B. Davies. Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1991. Pp. 522. \$29.95.
- Schuck, M. *That They Be One.* Washington, D.C.: Georgetown Univ., 1991. Pp. 224. \$25.95; \$14.95.
- Thiede, C. *Bischöfe—kollegial für Europa.* Münster: Aschendorff, 1991. Pp. 268.
- Traer, R. *Faith in Human Rights.* Washington, D.C.: Georgetown Univ., 1991. Pp. 240.
- PASTORAL, SPIRITUAL,
AND LITURGICAL**
- Anchorite Spirituality: Ancrene Wisse and Associated Works.* Ed. A. Savage and N. Watson. N.Y.: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 487. \$22.95.
- Areoplackal, J. *Spirit and Ministries.* Bangalore: Dharmaram, 1990. Pp. 350. \$14.95.
- Arzubialde, S. *Ejercicios Espirituales de S. Ignacio.* Bilbao: Mensajero/Sal Terrae, 1991. Pp. 904.
- Balthasar, H. Urs von. *Unless You Become Like This Child.* S.F.: Ignatius, 1991. Pp. 75. \$7.95.
- Becoming a Creative Local Church.* Ed. P. Hartin et al. Pietermaritzburg, S.A.: Cluster, 1991. Pp. 320. \$15.
- Boff, L. *New Evangelization.* Mary-

- knoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 128. \$13.95.
- Callahan, A. *Spiritual Guides for Today*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 176. \$11.95.
- Cantalamessa, R. *Jesus Christ, the Holy One of God*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1991. Pp. 166. \$6.95.
- Carroll, J. *As One with Authority*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 225. \$14.95.
- Deitering, C. *I Am a Pilgrim Child*. Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1992. Pp. 80. \$7.95.
- Ferder, F., and J. Heagle. *Your Sexual Self*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1992. Pp. 175. \$7.95.
- Fiand, B. *Where Two or Three Are Gathered*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 108. \$9.95.
- Flood, E. *Everybody's Prayerbook*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1991. Pp. 106. \$7.95.
- Fountain of Life*. Ed. G. Austin. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral, 1991. Pp. 249. \$24.95.
- Froehle, V. *Called Into Her Presence*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1992. Pp. 133. \$9.95.
- German Mystical Writings*. Ed. K. Campbell. N.Y.: Continuum, 1991. Pp. 269. \$27.50; \$12.95.
- Gillet, L. *Serve the Lord with Gladness*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1990. Pp. 108. \$6.95.
- Grabner, K. *Focus Your Day*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1992. Pp. 352. \$7.95.
- Grindel, J. *Whither the U.S. Church?* Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 216. \$16.95.
- Hoffman, V. *The Codependent Church*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. 204. \$12.95.
- Jackson, O. *Dignity and Solidarity*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1992. Pp. 522. \$19.95.
- Jennings, T., Jr. *Loyalty to God*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1992. Pp. 238. \$18.95.
- Johnston, W. *Letters to Contem-
platives*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 112. \$9.95.
- Kannookadan, P. *The East Syrian Lectionary*. Rome: St. Thomas Christian Fellowship, 1991. Pp. 215.
- Kilcourse, G. *Double Belonging*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 179. \$11.95.
- Kilmartin, E. *Culture and the Praying Church*. Ottawa: Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops, 1990. Pp. 125.
- Laplace, J. *Prayer according to the Scriptures*. Dublin: Veritas, 1991. Pp. 85. \$7.95.
- Living No Longer for Ourselves*. Ed. K. Hughes and M. Francis. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1991. Pp. 207. \$12.95.
- Magdalen, Sr. *Children in the Church Today*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary, 1991. Pp. 103. \$6.95.
- McElvaney, W. *Winds of Grace, Ways of Faith*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 139. \$11.95.
- Mello, A. de. *Call to Love*. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1991. Pp. 97. \$4.
- Ministry with Young Adults*. Ed. J. Garber. Elgin, Ill.: FaithQuest, 1992. Pp. 111. \$7.95.
- Minutoli, A. *Medjugorje*. Medford, N.Y.: Morning Star, 1991. Pp. 189. \$8.95.
- Miguel, P. *Le vocabulaire de l'expérience spirituelle*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1989. Pp. 205. Fr. 195.
- Nugent, R., and J. Gramick. *Building Bridges*. Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1992. Pp. 218. \$9.95.
- Ramey, R., and B. Johnson. *Living the Christian Life*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 181. \$12.95.
- Rice, H. *Reformed Spirituality*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 224. \$14.95.
- Saussy, C. *God Images and Self Esteem*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 183. \$9.95.