

BOOK REVIEWS

DEUTERONOMY 1–11: A NEW TRANSLATION WITH INTRODUCTION AND COMMENTARY. By Moshe Weinfeld. Anchor Bible. New York: Doubleday, 1991. Pp. xiv + 458. \$34.

This is the first volume of a must-buy commentary, written by a leader in Deuteronomic scholarship. The translation succeeds in using contemporary English, in providing straightforward and accurate translation, and in rendering some of the rhetorical feel of the original. It is regrettable that gender neutrality was not attempted.

The commentary follows each translated pericope in three sections: textual notes, notes, and comment. All critical methods are used, but the dominant approach consists of an exhaustive and detailed comparison of the words, phrases, literary forms, and ideas of Deuteronomy with those of relevant texts within the Bible, with texts of the Ancient Near East, with classical Greek texts, and with rabbinic and New Testament texts. As this approach is consistent, the divisions between the three sections are not clearly drawn or rigid. The “textual notes” deal with discussion of textual variants, but also very amply with the meaning of individual words. The “notes” tend to deal rather with phrases. The “comment” tends to focus on extensive parallels with Tetrateuchal or other texts, and on comparisons of literary forms, or of general ideas. It is interesting to note that Weinfeld considers, not only earlier texts upon which Deuteronomy may have depended, but also later texts which may depend on Deuteronomy. E.g., commenting on Dt 8:3 (“in order to teach you that man does not live by bread alone, but lives on everything that YHWH decrees”), W. shows that the teaching of this text is found in the manna traditions, but also in the synoptic accounts of the temptations of Jesus. He does not state the hermeneutical principles which lead him in this direction. Finally, he makes telling use of the results of Israeli archeology over the past decades, particularly regarding historical geography.

The volume begins with a complete Introduction, treating literary-critical, legal, historical and theological questions, and an extensive bibliography. Treatment of texts and versions is reserved for the Introduction to the second volume. There are useful historical theses, complete, precise, often original, concerning, e.g., the relations of Deuteronomy to the religious traditions of Gilgal, to the Shechemite covenant tradition, to the prophets and refugees from the Northern Kingdom, to Assyrian covenant practices and legal concepts, to the Shaphan family at Mizpah, and to the tradition of Synagogue worship.

Comparison to the Greek amphictyony is resurrected, not as model of the twelve tribes, but as parallel to Shechemite covenant traditions of curses and blessings and foundation ceremonies.

A most valuable contribution is the lucid characterization of Deuteronomic law versus both Tetrateuchal law and Priestly law. Another section presents Deuteronomy as a "turning point" in Israel's religious history, inspired by a desacralizing and humanizing ideal. Thus God no longer dwells in material objects or places, but only his name is placed there; the Ark contains only stone tablets, and it is no longer brought into battle; sin is removed by confession and prayer, not by sacrifice; ritual is generally deemphasized, while slaughter and blood are made secular; firstlings are not automatically sacred; the Paschal sacrifice is made communal. While one must agree with most of these observations, the point should be made that Deuteronomy was not precisely a "turning point" in religious history, since Israel in fact carried on by adopting the priestly literature, canonizing the Pentateuch, and writing Chronicles.

There is little to criticize in this book, but I would note two regrets. First, W. has chosen to overlook the current scholarly revolution regarding the sources of the Tetrateuch, and proceeds as though Wellhausen were still in charge. Second, in depicting the background and horizon of the book, he chooses to think of it as written roughly during the time of Hezekiah-Josiah. He is aware, of course, of successive stages in the writing. He recognizes, e.g., that chapter 4 is postexilic. And yet he constantly cites it as though it were a regular part of the general discussion. In effect, the events and horizons of two centuries tend to become fused into a single interpretative context or image, an image which is fully appropriate to Josiah alone. One loses the interpretative context of the fall and the exile. One forgets that Josiah's sense of expansive patriotism was based on the gradual collapse of Assur with the breathing space that gave him for a very few years. And one forgets that the rosy political outlook of Hezekiah had been based only on the population explosion in Judah due to the collapse of the Northern Kingdom, and that this was accompanied by the continuing menace of Assyrian armies.

Thus, when discussing the "ban" concept, which imposes eradication of the Canaanites (and demands specially careful treatment in our day), W. explains that it was "abstract," and never put in practice at a national level. This may be all that can be said, if chapter 7 was written in an historical context where Josiah's militia were occupying northern cities, and Josiah was seriously planning conquest across the Jordan. But if the context was really one where the armies either of Assur or Babylon surround Jerusalem, or even where Jerusalem has

fallen, then one must understand the “ban” as a profession of faith in the transcendent might of God, rather than as a law for the king or instruction to the troops.

Concordia University, Montreal

SEAN MCEVENUE

THE SONG OF SONGS. By Roland E. Murphy, O.Carm. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990. Hermeneia. Pp. xxiii + 237. \$21.95.

Even from early Rabbinic times, more has been written about the interpretation of the Song of Songs in proportion to its modest eight chapters than perhaps about any other book of the Old Testament. The questions that have challenged commentators are complex. Is the book a disparate collection of love poetry or does it have an intrinsic unity? And if so, what is its literary form—a drama? an epithalamium? What was its *Sitz im Leben*? Did it arise from a rural “Bedouin” context, or from a more sophisticated urban setting, or perhaps even from Canaanite fertility rites? Or is it a bit of all of these? What about its obvious and intense sexual imagery: Is this simply a paean to human love or must it be allegorized as Yahweh’s covenant relationship with Israel (or later: Christ’s union with the Church) or a symbol of God’s mystical union with the soul (as in the “spiritual marriage” of Teresa of Avila and John of the Cross)? Besides these broader hermeneutic problems are the more mundane ones of grammatical oddities, rare vocabulary, and misunderstood allusions.

All of these questions were addressed in Marvin Pope’s controversial (it has been called everything from a tour de force of erudition to an exercise in very bad taste) and massive (743 pages of small print) 1977 study for the Anchor Bible series. And yet monographs on the Song continue to appear, ranging from fresh translations using innovative structures, such as Marcia Falk’s *Love Lyrics from the Bible: The Song of Songs* (1990), to specialized considerations, such as the feminist reading, “Love’s Lyrics Redeemed,” in Phyllis Trible’s *God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality* (1978).

Do we need yet another commentary on our shelf? Probably we do. Pope’s volume, while a gold mine of information for the researcher, was in many respects a myriad of trees without a forest, and rarely gave the reader the means to choose among the many opinions Pope enumerated on any one point: one was often overwhelmed with masses of raw, sometimes irrelevant data. Murphy’s commentary is, by contrast, a model of clarity and concision, an easy-to-follow road map through the centuries of Songs scholarship.

For each topic of inquiry, M. gives a brief history of the relevant scholarship with a sprinkling of illustrative quotations, and then criti-

cally evaluates the options. In the section "History of Interpretation," M. traces the emergence of early Christian allegorization from the early Jewish, and demonstrates that even as early as Origen the interpretation of Songs was a reflection of contemporary anthropological understandings. This remains true even in present-day discussions where the anthropological concerns focus on the sexual, and therefore the more literal sense of the text. M. notes that this approach to the text, at least as a broad agreement of scholars from whatever confessional background, is a recent phenomenon. Even among Catholics, who have long resisted this trend and have preferred to talk about the Song's "parabolic character, prophetic spirit and anthological style, the tide has also turned . . . toward a fuller appreciation of the Song's literal sense."

Because of the renewed emphasis on recovering the literal sense of the text, M. examines the various ancient bodies of literature—Egyptian, Sumero-Babylonian and Canaanite—which have been adduced as possible thematic and literary influences on Songs. He finds that although many have looked to Egyptian sources for the most promising parallels, actually little if any direct influence can be detected. Sumerian love poetry, on the other hand, has striking similarities, especially in the dialogic structure it frequently employs, and even more in its figures of speech, its use of sexual euphemisms, and its obvious delight in double-entendre devices.

M.'s translation manages to preserve many of these features, a task that has bedeviled many of his predecessors. Pope's translations, e.g., in an effort to preserve the hard-to-translate erotic elements in the double meanings, frequently are more clever than poetic. M. preserves the lushness without destroying the poetic subtlety. Where an appropriate turn of the English seems impossible to find, M.'s notes on the text, conveniently placed on the pages facing the translation, clearly explain the connotations and ambiguities of the Hebrew text.

The splendid layout of the book, a characteristic of the Hermeneia series, enables M. to make full use of his forty years of research on this biblical text without drowning the reader in it. The meat of the text occupies the upper register of each page of introduction and commentary, with all excursuses and technical data relegated to the bottom half—easily accessible, without hopelessly complicating the primary text as often happens in the Anchor Bible.

Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

WILLIAM J. FULCO, S.J.

**THE GOSPELS IN CONTEXT: SOCIAL AND POLITICAL HISTORY IN THE SYN-
OPTIC TRADITION.** By Gerd Theissen. Translated from the German by
Linda M. Maloney. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. xvi + 320. \$29.95.

Seventy years ago, R. Bultmann, M. Dibelius, and K. L. Schmidt employed the methodology of Form Criticism to investigate the history of the synoptic tradition. Focusing upon the text, they sought to uncover different layers of tradition in order to determine its history. In his latest work, Theissen continues this investigation of the history of the synoptic tradition. In contrast to the classical form critics, however, he employs the tools of social and political analysis to correlate texts with historical data thereby localizing and dating segments of the tradition. The result is a refreshing investigation which outlines three stages in its growth.

In the first part, T. investigates a number of smaller units within the tradition: the saying about the shaken reed (Matt 11:7); sayings about Israel and the Gentiles; the account of the Syrophenician woman; the legend of John the Baptizer's death; miracles and apophthegms. In each instance, he correlates the particular saying or story with the social and political history of Palestine. He concludes that the first and earliest stage of the synoptic tradition originated in Galilee. More importantly, he argues that this early tradition was transmitted by popular segments of the general public as well as by radical itinerant disciples.

The second part of T.'s volume is the heart of his work. Here he examines two of the larger units of the tradition, the eschatological discourse of Mark 13 and the Passion Narrative, and concludes that both were written in or around Jerusalem within a decade of Jesus' death. More specifically, T. maintains that the material which underlies Mark 13 was occasioned by the crisis of 39–41, when Gaius Caligula attempted to erect a statue of himself in the temple of Jerusalem. This, according to T., is the "abomination of desolation" mentioned in Mark 13:14. T. is more cautious about dating the Passion Narrative, but he thinks that it probably arose during the same period. The second stage in the growth of the synoptic tradition, therefore, occurred in or around Jerusalem during the Caligula crisis.

In his third part, T. discusses the final stage of the synoptic tradition: the formation of the Synoptic Gospels. He begins with a discussion of the Sayings Source ("Q") which was probably written in Palestine between the years 40 and 55. An analysis of the temptation narrative in Q convinces him that the Sayings Source was written with the "temptation" recently posed by the Caligula crisis still in view. As for the Synoptic Gospels, T. contends that all were written outside of Palestine after the destruction of the temple. On the basis of social and political analysis, he concludes that the Gospel of Mark was written in southern Syria shortly after the temple's destruction (70 A.D.) and, in part, as a response to that great event. The Gospel of Matthew betrays

a perspective which looks at Palestine from the east and was probably composed somewhere in the interior of Syria. Finally, the Gospel of Luke reveals a western perspective, at a greater distance from Palestine, but T. does not offer a concrete location. Matthew and Luke, moreover, write at a time more distant from the events of the Jewish War than Mark does.

On balance, T. has produced a well-documented volume which offers a three-stage hypothesis of the development of the synoptic tradition: the growth of smaller units in Galilee transmitted by itinerant disciples and the general public; the growth of larger units in the Jerusalem community during the Caligula crisis; and the formation of the Gospels outside of Palestine in the aftermath of the temple's destruction. Most importantly, he suggests that the events of the Caligula crisis had a greater influence upon the growth of the gospel tradition than is usually thought. Finally, he has reopened the question of the provenance and date of Mark's Gospel.

But is the Caligula crisis at the origin of traditions as diverse as the Markan apocalypse, the Passion Narrative, and the Sayings Source? While this crisis provides an interesting *Sitz im Leben* for the earliest version of the Markan apocalypse, it is not as compelling a background for the Passion Narrative and the Sayings Source. T.'s correlation of Jesus' Temptation with the temptation to worship Caligula, e.g., is more ingenious than convincing. All said, however, he has produced a valuable volume that challenges scholars to rethink the history of the synoptic tradition.

Catholic University of America

FRANK J. MATERA

THEOLOGICAL ETHICS OF THE NEW TESTAMENT. By Eduard Lohse. Translated from the German by M. Eugene Boring. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. viii + 236.

Lohse, formerly professor of New Testament at Göttingen and now Lutheran bishop of Hannover, is not a specialist in New Testament ethics, as are Wolfgang Schrage and Rudolph Schnackenburg, who also authored books on NT ethics in the 1980s. But he has issued this survey to help contemporary Christians live their lives "in a manner worthy of the gospel of Christ" (Phil 1:27).

The professional NT ethicists proceed in historical order to develop the ethics of Jesus, of the early church tradition, and of the biblical authors, but L. thinks this method misses "the extensive common character of Christian instruction and the systematic motifs that determined the development of that ethical content." L. wants to highlight the Christian presuppositions and principal systematic motifs which

form the framework in which the individual ethical thought patterns can be seen.

The opening chapters give the backgrounds of these ethical traditions and investigate their Christological grounding. Subsequent chapters present systematic motifs: the kingship of God, the new righteousness, the Synoptics' directions for the everyday life of Christians, the new creation, the worldliness of faith (the Pauline school), law and commandment, and endurance in suffering.

L.'s final chapter reflects on the conflicts between various motifs in the life of Christians, and finds the love commandment, equality of the sexes, the equal duty of masters and slaves to the commandment of love, work as vocation, attitude to possessions, and obedience to governmental authority as dominant themes of the NT ethic. The essence of Christian ethics is not found in a plan for the transformation of the world, but in the modeling before the world of the meaning of following Christ. Even the love commandment is not a way to find salvation but an expression of what God's will requires. The gift (*Gabe*) of new life represents an assignment (*Aufgabe*) for the Christian disciple to live out.

The theological motif underlying the ethics seems to be justification by faith. By pressing this motif throughout the work, L. uncovers sharp insights that flow from his life-long personal living out of the NT message.

Some problems: L. understands the kingdom only apocalyptically, so that questions of everyday existence stand under the perspective of the *coming* reign of God. Thus the beatitudes *as promise* form the indicative out of which the Sermon's imperatives flow. This perspective does not do justice to the *already* of Paul's eschatology, and it offers inadequate grounding for a new Christian ethic. Further, L.'s emphasis on the gratuity of justification by faith does not allow him to see the role of human graced agency in the flourishing of the Reign of God.

Further, L. works out less adequately than do Schrage and Schnackenburg the relationship of reason and faith. This makes it more difficult for him to show why use of the hellenistic catalogues of virtues and vices and the *Haustafeln* is Christian. Although L. insists properly on the worldliness of faith, his retention of the Lutheran doctrine of the two Kingdoms and lack of a theology of creation make Christian collaboration with secular power mostly pragmatic, and ultimately deprives the gospel of much of its power to transform the world. Finally L. makes no use of the social-science or liberation perspectives which could help us understand the reasons for the positions taken at the origin or in the development of a NT ethics.

In short, L.'s book is not as helpful for this journal's readers as are

those of Schrage and Schnackenburg; it seems too diffuse and condensed for the general American reader for whom the translation is intended.

Seattle University

JOHN TOPEL, S.J.

THE FOUNDATIONS OF MYSTICISM: ORIGINS TO THE FIFTH CENTURY. By Bernard McGinn. *The Presence of God: A History of Western Christian Mysticism*. New York: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. xxii + 494. \$39.50.

This first volume of McGinn's projected four-volume synoptic work is the most important book in decades for the contemporary understanding of the Western Christian mystical tradition. The 78-page Appendix, a survey of modern theories of mysticism, and the 100 pages of meaty footnotes are alone almost worth the price of purchase.

M. underscores the contextual roots and both the linguistic and the theoretical shaping of Christian mysticism. Thus, the mystical text (not "experience") and its place in the tradition is his primary focus. He argues cogently that Christianity contained mystical elements from its origins but that the first great tradition of explicit mysticism saw light when Origen's theoretical exposition found institutional embodiment in fourth-century monasticism. To M., the mystical element in Christianity is that part of its beliefs and practices that concerns the preparation for, the consciousness of, and the reaction to what can be described as the immediate or direct presence of God.

In the brilliant and provocative first chapter, M. suggests that late Second Temple Judaism provided the matrix for Christian mysticism through its protomystical ascents to the vision of God found in the apocalypses, the movement to a canon of sacred texts, and the tools and techniques requisite to keep this movement alive. He rightly maintains that neglecting the Jewish roots of Christian mysticism and viewing it as a purely Greek phenomenon misconstrues an important part of its history.

M. locates the second major component in the background of the Christian mystical tradition in the Greek contemplative ideal: the soul's restlessness until it possesses God via contemplation, which results from an ascending purification and culminates in both knowledge, love, and loving joy in the soul. He ably demonstrates that the role of Neoplatonism in Christian mysticism—its genuine *preparatio evangelii*—is far more complex, nuanced, and positive than the hostile Continental Protestant scholars of this century have allowed. However, to my mind, the distinction and relationship between Greek eros and Christian agape is unclear.

For M., the early church Fathers knew that Jesus Christ is the

ultimate appearance of the saving God, with whom one can have direct contact only through the community and its sacred life. Thus, Christologically interpreted and sacramentally lived Scripture provided the exegetical context of early Christian mysticism. M. soundly indicates that Christian martyrdom, conceived as the highest imitation of Christ and the perfection of the soul's desire to separate from earthly things enabled by the Christ-Bridegroom erotically elevating the soul, can be understood as a form of Christian mysticism.

The superb section on Origen depicts him as Christianity's greatest exegete and as a protomonastic because of his emphasis upon asceticism and virginity. Always a church teacher, Origen understood and experienced exegesis as a process in which religious experience, especially mystical experience, is realized in the act of making the biblical language at its deepest and incommunicable level into the soul's language. To Origen, ecstasy meant sudden and new insights into scriptural revelation, not ravishment.

M. argues solidly that Western mysticism began in the fourth-century monasticism fostered in large part by bishops who emphasized asceticism and virginity. It almost alone provided the context for the knowledge of Scripture and the life of prayer and penance requisite for direct contact with the God present in Jesus Christ. In fact, the power of Western mysticism comes from its deliberate eroticizing of the relation between the human virgin and the divine Bridegroom, as if absorption of the erotic element into the spiritual dimension becomes more forceful the more it negates all deliberate external expression.

I would agree with M. that no mystic just practiced mysticism and that no one is just a mystic. I also share his views that Continental Protestantism's rejection of the mystical tradition as Greek-infested Christianity cannot be justified and that the Anglo-American interne-cine debate has largely reduced mysticism to a philosophical abstraction. However, I would maintain that Christ's resurrection appearance to Paul (1 Cor 9:1, 15:8) and not his apocalyptic ascents (2 Cor 12:1-6) grounds his apostolic authority. M. has surprising little to say about Jesus' special God-consciousness. I share M. preference for "consciousness" rather than "experience" in defining mysticism, but the precise meaning of the terms "direct," "immediate," and especially "presence" still remains to be worked out.

M. writes: "If historical determination that someone has actually enjoyed such experiences is the only criterion for who is a mystic, then there can be no proven mystics. . . . But if the effect of someone's writings about how the soul is to seek the divine presence in this life becomes the test, then Origen might be called the Christian mystic *par excellence*" (130). Has M. conceded too much to historicism? I concur

that past studies placed too much emphasis on autobiographical texts to determine who were mystics. Nonetheless, I submit that the human mind's critical dynamism forces the question: "Is this mystical text from a mystic?" Has M. *almost* reduced Christian mysticism to a literary form? If "commitment is often subservient to method" as M. maintains, I would suggest that a theological discernment of spirits can often answer the legitimate question: "Did a mystic write this mystical text?"

I share M.'s concern that past Catholic approaches to mysticism tended to overemphasize secondary mystical phenomena. But they are now often ignored. Moreover, God's immediate and *transforming* presence cannot be distinguished clearly from the extraordinary mystical phenomena that punctuated the lives of many Christian mystics. M. correctly notes that numerous mystics distinguish between mystical absorption and "actual" love. But I would add that for various mystics (even for someone as "activistic" as Teilhard de Chardin), contemplative absorption is experienced as genuine *apostolic* love of and service to and for the Church and world.

I find it odd that M. sees in Maréchal but not in Lonergan (whose cognitional theory is clearly superior) "considerable promise" for a contemporary mystical theology. (I respectfully submit that a critically grounded theory of "connaturality" is required.) I concur that the Spanish mystics have seemingly set the agenda for the study of mysticism and that it is time to give the church Fathers and the earlier tradition their due. However, from our vantage point can either be fully appreciated except in terms of the *one* Christian mystical tradition?

M.'s synoptic view, his grasp of historical detail, and his theological sophistication, probing questions, and pellucid writing have produced this provocative and controversial volume, controversial because of the many sensitive areas he touches. But no one will be able to write on Christian mysticism without taking this extraordinary book into account. If the forthcoming volumes possess its quality, M. will have written the most important synoptic, single-authored, presentation of the Western mystical tradition in any language in this century.

Boston College

HARVEY D. EGAN, S.J.

PERCEIVING GOD: THE EPISTEMOLOGY OF RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE. By William P. Alston. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University, 1991. Pp. xiv + 320. \$36.95.

The elegant and comprehensive argument in this book is the definitive version of a position Alston has been developing over the past

decade. It is arguably the most important investigation of the epistemology of mysticism from a sophisticated analytical-pragmatic perspective since James's *Varieties*.

A.'s thesis is "that CMP [Christian Mystical Practice] is rationally engaged in since it is a socially established doxastic practice that is not demonstrably unreliable or otherwise disqualified for rational acceptance" (194). He begins by analyzing mystics' reports and arguing that there are no sound arguments against the mystics' claim that they directly perceive God or even against the more common believers' 'mystical' claims that they perceive God in various ways. Mystical beliefs, like perceptual beliefs, are based on experiences plus associated background beliefs: just as my belief, that what appears to me as yellow is yellow, requires not only an experience but the ability to use background color concepts, so a mystic's belief, that what appears to her as God is God, requires not only an experience but the ability to use background theological concepts. Background beliefs are ingredients in, but neither bases for nor interpretations of, perceptual and mystical experience.

The question is whether mystical practice renders mystical beliefs rationally justified. A. argues that if beliefs are formed in a reliable practice, they are *prima facie* justified and, crucially, that only circular arguments can be found to show the reliability of either the common practice of forming perceptual beliefs (PP) or CMP. Moreover, each practice has a system of "overrides" or "checks" for weeding out unjustified beliefs when doubts about them arise (e.g., as I am justified in believing what appears yellow to me is yellow unless the room is bathed in yellow light, I have jaundice, etc., the mystic is justified in believing what appears to her as God is God unless the devil counterfeits the experience, the mystic is hallucinating, etc.). Arguments to show that participating in CMP is less rational than participating in PP either apply a double standard or engage in epistemic imperialism (applying standards from one practice willy-nilly to another). Because mystical practices in different religious traditions have different background beliefs and over-rider systems they are irreducibly different, not a single practice with multiple variations; this shows *en passant* why the argument between postliberals and revisionists about the place of experience in fundamental Christian theology is confused.

After undermining arguments which seek to show CMP unreliable, especially one that would disqualify CMP because PP is universal and CMP is not, A. addresses the sticky problem of religious pluralism. He concludes that, although the multiplicity of mystical practices renders CMP epistemically weaker than PP, if there are no "external reasons for supposing that one of the competing practices is more accurate than

my own, the only rational course for me is to sit tight with the practice of which I am a master and which serves me so well in guiding my activity in the world" (274). One can reasonably hope and perhaps even work for a time when "inter-practice contradictions will be sorted out" (7). A final chapter sketches the place of experience and CMP in the grounds for Christian belief.

I have analyzed an earlier version of A.'s position ("Reformed Epistemology in a Jamesian Perspective," *Horizons* 19/1); most points made there apply *mutatis mutandis* to this definitive version. A. recognizes that religious pluralism epistemically weakens the testimony of CMP and beliefs based on such testimony (279–84), but his etiolated account of testimony, alas, does not finally warrant conclusions stronger than James's concerning the transmissibility of epistemic warrant. Nonetheless, A. illumines the real issues in this area by noting that the varied and contradictory testimony from the traditions is analogous to some secular cases. I would now add that A. may prove too much: his account seems to render practices of seeing flying saucers (296–97) or of receiving messages from the numerous apparitions of Mary and the saints as rational as mainstream CMP.

A.'s clear argumentation and nuanced analysis make this "must reading" for fundamental theologians and philosophers of religion. The text is long, but not tedious; examples, analogies, and road-map summaries abound. Like other "reformed epistemologists" indebted to Thomas Reid, it is unclear whom A. expects to convince with his argument, but along the way he clarifies many issues in religious epistemology. A. certainly shows that there is no good epistemic reason for an individual to *give up* CMP; but he does not show that there are good epistemic reasons to *take up* CMP rather than another religious practice or to make one's home in one religious tradition rather than another.

Florida State University, Tallahassee

TERRENCE W. TILLEY

TIME AND ETERNITY. By Brian Leftow. Cornell Studies in the Philosophy of Religion. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University, 1991. Pp. xiv + 378. \$42.95.

After making some working assumptions dependent on the modal structure of reality, Leftow develops his position through a discussion of the possibility of the timeless and the logic of eternity, arriving at the conclusion that a timeless being does not exist earlier, later than, or at the same time as anything. It has a peculiar sort of omnipresence to time. It exists "at eternity," a "time" though it has no temporal properties. Eternity entails absolutely necessary existence and absolute uniqueness.

L. develops what this means concretely by exploring the thought of Augustine, Boethius, and Anselm. He agrees with Augustine that the eternal is more real than the temporal. He studies Boethius, critically evaluating the interpretations of Elinore Stump and Norman Kretzmann. He considers eternity as a kind of duration, rooted in divine simplicity, making possible divine foreknowledge through a kind of eternal-temporal simultaneity. L. discovers a special richness in Anselm, who posits eternity as a supertemporal dimension, in which both eternal and temporal entities exist at once, without eternal-temporal simultaneity. He explores this in a theory of time and eternity, and looks at some possible implications for timelessness, freedom, and foreknowledge, suggesting a theory of divine foreknowledge that owes much to Molina and the analogy of the author creating characters in a story.

After this venture into the history of ideas, L. presents his own position more directly, giving the case for God's timelessness, and showing how this does not deprive God of personhood, since it is compatible with "His living, being personal, having knowledge and will, being free, [and] responding to creatures."

L. finally considers some special problems about divine knowledge. He suggests there may be propositions which a perfect knower cannot know, because of some implied characteristic about the one who knows them. In particular, knowing change in an experiential way may not be possible even to one who is omniscient, though He may know in other ways what change is like. Finally, L. responds to objections that would make a timeless God inaccessible to religious experience. He concludes that the transcendent God of the philosophers, who is the source of all that is, does not stand in opposition to the believers' living Lord.

Though I read this work with much interest, I find the method of philosophizing somewhat uncongenial, i.e., one that explores every hypothesis against the background of all possible universes. I prefer a method that begins with the universe that is, the one given in immediate experience with all that that includes, and then seeks what that necessarily implies.

Though the book has many delightful and attractive features, one real shortcoming, it seems to this reviewer, is the failure to present a theory of divine action and knowledge that will establish the relationship between time and eternity, and thereby solve many related problems: divine foreknowledge and human freedom, the nature of divine omnipresence and omniscience, etc. At one point L. acknowledges that he knows no such theory. I tried to present one in the pages of this journal in September 1977; but he seems unaware of it.

L.'s preference for a tensed theory of time, i.e. one that sees the division of time into past, present, and future as indicating time's deepest reality, is not convincing, though the argument of his book does not depend on it. In some places he seems to misunderstand what Aquinas is about, e.g. in objecting to Thomas's argument that eternity follows immutability. For Thomas has in mind an immutable thing or subject, not a form or an instantaneous reality like a beginning, which, if it is in a mutable subject, is evidently temporal. L. doesn't spontaneously use the analogy of being; this shows up, e.g., in the extended discussion of duration in Boethius, in the assertion that God is univocally a direct cause and agent, in the question about what constitutes grades of reality, and in defining existence as the unity of a system. Still, in all these matters he proposes something that is truly worth considering.

This book has much to recommend it, and every serious student of God and the divine nature will profit from working through it. In particular, L. has a brilliant analysis of the difference between dreams and reality, and uses this to show how a timeless being is more real than a temporal being. Likewise, his preservation of God's immutability by describing how God's act of creation has "built in" the divine responses to the possible acts of creatures is very well thought through. He also very insightfully suggests that as the study of light requires both particles and waves, so thinking about eternity may require the analogies both of a point and a line.

Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley

JOHN H. WRIGHT, S.J.

GOD FOR US: THE TRINITY AND CHRISTIAN LIFE. By Catherine Mowry LaCugna. San Francisco: Harper, 1992. Pp. xiv + 434. \$25.

As Ian Barbour, Sallie McFague, and others have noted, models are just as important in theology as they are in the natural sciences. Yet, as Barbour comments, models should be taken seriously, but not literally, since all models fall short of the reality to be thus comprehended. LaCugna offers here a critical assessment of classical models for the doctrine of the Trinity and a new model for the God-world relationship based on her own understanding of the relation between *theologia* and *oikonomia*.

In the first part of the book, L. argues that in both the Eastern and Western Church the gradual development of a theology of the Trinity led to its "defeat" in terms of practical influence on the pastoral life of the Church. That is, because *theologia* was conceived as a metaphysical explanation of the inner life of God, it became separated from *oikonomia*, the history of salvation. Both in the East and the West,

albeit in different ways, theologians focused on the incomprehensible essence of God rather than on the divine persons as the starting point for understanding God's dealings with human beings. Accordingly, in the second part of the book, she sets forth her own hypothesis: "There is neither an economic nor an immanent Trinity; there is only the *oikonomia* that is the concrete realization of the mystery of *theologia* in time, space, history, and personality" (223). The mystery of the divine being, to be sure, is not fully revealed in the *oikonomia*; but, since our only point of access to *theologia* is through *oikonomia*, "then an 'immanent' trinitarian theology of God is nothing more than a theology of the economy of salvation" (224).

In making an appraisal of L.'s hypothesis, one should first of all acknowledge that she has succeeded in presenting an understanding of the Trinity which is readily intelligible to most Christians who address the divine persons in personal prayer and the public worship of the Church but have long ago given up any attempt to comprehend the classical explanation of the Trinity in terms of immanent processions and subsistent relations. Likewise, L. argues persuasively that the doctrine of the Trinity must be better integrated with soteriology, the rest of systematic theology (grace, Church, sacraments, etc.), and the prayer life of the Church.

At the same time, I have serious misgivings with her proposal to drop the distinction between the immanent and economic Trinities. For, as I see it, this distinction guarantees that the reality of God will not be absorbed into the reality of human history even when the latter is presented as the progressive self-revelation of the triune God. Admittedly, philosophical reflections on the inner life of God are highly tentative and subject to revision. But the deeper issue here is to maintain the fundamental difference between the divine and human levels of existence even as one seeks to establish their basic interrelatedness. (L. herself suggests that the doctrine of the Trinity is an "icon" of the mystery of the divine being [321–22]; yet a true icon should give a genuine insight into the reality of that which it symbolizes.)

For similar reasons, I have reservations about L.'s designating the Father as the person/principle from whom all other entities (including the other two divine persons) emerge and to whom they all return (*a Patre ad Patrem*). Even though this line of thought is grounded in the theology of the Cappadocian Fathers and is even today reflected in the liturgical prayer of the Church, in my judgment it still raises philosophical questions about the necessary transcendence of God vis-à-vis the world process.

Yet I recognize that personal preferences have inevitably played a role in these judgments, and so I end with a commendation of L.'s work

to trinitarian theologians. The book is carefully researched and clearly written. Moreover, the problem which L. addresses is quite real; I take issue only with her "model" for solving the problem.

Xavier University, Cincinnati

JOSEPH A. BRACKEN, S.J.

THE PROMISE OF TRINITARIAN THEOLOGY. By Colin E. Gunton. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1991. Pp. vii + 188. \$31.95.

Gunton draws on a rich variety of thinkers to help him develop his fundamental thesis that the way we think about God affects the way we think about the world he creates and redeems. Rejecting individualist, collectivist, monist (pantheist), and dualist thinking, he grounds his understanding of the God-world relation, human relations, relations between persons and the universe (refusing to personalize the universe by making it an object of worship), and the structure of the Church (which may be described as congregationalist) in a trinitarian theology based in the economy and not on any abstract notion of transcendence or otherness.

Augustine's influence is presented as mainly negative. He drew apart God's being and act, seeing his oneness as a being which precedes the threeness of the persons. His theology is modalist in this sense, and since Western theology has failed to appreciate the particularity of the trinitarian persons, all aspects of theology have been affected. Augustine failed to appropriate the ontological achievement of the East and thus opened the door to monism and dualism. G. argues for the Cappadocian view that the persons *constitute* God's being in communion; he rejects the Western *filioque*; he favors more emphasis on the Spirit in relation to Christ and the Father; he believes a correct doctrine of *perichôrêsis* has an echo in the modern science of field relations and that relationality involves space which connotes the fact that God loves and is free by being other and in communion *in se* and *ad extra*.

G. so strongly advocates the Cappadocian view that he virtually ignores the problem with their solution to Sabellian and Tritheist alternatives which is so brilliantly addressed by Torrance in his book on the Trinity. In his quest for an ontology, it is not always clear that G.'s own notion of relationality is shaped by the Trinitarian actions *ad extra*. When emphasizing the Spirit, e.g., at times it appears that the function of the Word (Son) is slighted; when stressing that the Trinity is mutually constituted, Tritheism appears close (persons are described as beings); describing the essence of God's love as "outgoingness" comes close to making the incarnation necessary for God—something G. explicitly sees as a problem when advocating a stronger distinction of the immanent and economic Trinity.

These questions aside, this book is dense, clear, enlightening, brilliant, and is recommended as an example of how trinitarian theology really does lead to many thoroughly new insights which enable contemporary theology to avoid various Enlightenment pitfalls and affirm our communion with God without obliterating divine or human freedom.

St. John's University, N.Y.

PAUL D. MOLNAR

GOD'S POWER: TRADITIONAL UNDERSTANDINGS AND CONTEMPORARY CHALLENGES. By Anna Case-Winters. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox, 1990. Pp. 246. \$19.95.

A revision of Case-Winters's dissertation, this book is a study of Calvin, Barth, Hartshorne, and feminist theologians on divine power, with a concluding constructive chapter incorporating process and feminist thought. The book bears the marks of its original form, but it is also a clear and helpful study, bringing together Reformed Protestant thought on the issue of divine power, identifying key problems and proposing a solution.

C.'s thesis is that divine power, when defined as domination and control as C. argues it is in its classical formulations, leads to a number of insuperable problems: the reconciliation of a good God with the existence of evil, the diminishment of human freedom, and the tragic effects of this understanding on human action. The solution C. offers lies in a process-feminist conception that emphasizes God's power to influence and to be influenced. Such an understanding of God's power both retrieves and redefines omnipotence.

The book proceeds through a careful, step-by-step approach, with frequent summaries and questions. The classical formulation of divine power is found in Calvin: "the effectual exercise of the divine personal will in accomplishing divine purposes" (63). C. points out how Calvin rejects the medieval distinction between absolute and ordained power and shows how his understanding of providence is essential. Predestination receives scant attention; C.'s contention is that despite Calvin's use of personal metaphors, his classicist worldview serves to maintain an uncompromising emphasis on God's power as control.

C. then turns to Barth as a significant "modification" (along with Hartshorne) of the classical doctrine of omnipotence. Her argument is that Barth's allowance for God's self-limitation is not sufficient to overcome the problems inherent in the Calvinist formulation, and, in addition, his Christocentrism forces him into understating the problem of evil.

Process and feminist theology are then considered as alternatives to

the classical formulation. The major emphasis here is on a redefinition of power rather than a redrawing of its scope. Key for C. is a relational model of God's power which is at the heart of both process and feminist theology. Her treatment of feminist perspectives focuses on the now standard critiques of androcentric conceptions of God and the problems of raising male experience to the level of the divine. C. concludes with a "process-feminist synthesis" marked by its relationality and the image of God as Mother.

This is a very clearly written book, with frequent summaries, careful documentation, and a consistent focus. C. covers a vast amount of material and does not lose sight of her goal. Because there is so much material covered, there are inevitably gaps. One of the more serious ones, in my view, is her failure to address fully the issue of violence in the context of feminist theology. Her brief treatment of this issue touches on warfare, but the equally serious problem of domestic violence and its connection with male power and a male God are not even mentioned. And because the book is limited to a critique of the Reformed Protestant tradition, Roman Catholic treatments of power are not included. Nevertheless, C.'s treatment of the issue of divine power is clear, often painstakingly so, and her focus on both the intellectual and existential problems with the classical conception of omnipotence provides a valuable, if cautious, discussion of an important theological issue.

Loyola University, Chicago

SUSAN A. ROSS

GENESIS AND APOCALYPSE: A THEOLOGICAL VOYAGE TOWARD AUTHENTIC CHRISTIANITY. By Thomas J. J. Altizer. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox, 1991. Pp. 198. \$18.95.

For three decades Altizer has remained God-intoxicated. A thinker with a radical, unapologetic theological message, his rhetoric burns with the passion of someone seized by a magnificent vision. Not given to moderation nor constrained by concern for clarity, his style is incantatory, replete with overstatement. The richness of his highly eclectic intuition makes it difficult to trace the threads of coherent argument as he weaves together disparate strands: oriental mysticism, Augustine and Barth, Hegel and Nietzsche, crafters of cosmic epics, Dante, Milton, Blake, Melville, and Joyce, "radical Christians" all and provisioners of A.'s armature. No familiar mode of theological analysis, this is a genre we might label theopoesis. Remarkably consistent, A. is still proclaiming the elusive interpretive agenda he introduced in the 1960s. The present work is of a piece with what precedes it. Yet time works its alchemy. For many, A.'s radicality has lost something of its bite.

Affirmation of the death of God on the cross of the apocalyptic Christ and discernment of a profane form of Christ's presence in the world continue to be for A. the heart of the gospel, nonnegotiable preconditions for theologizing the uniqueness of Christianity. The world-negation of oriental mysticism is a dialectic of reversal. Once the world is annulled, its separateness and multiplicity vanquished, it is manifest as the primordial, sacred Totality. Profanity is swallowed up, identified with the sacred. The incarnate Word, however, thrusts us in the opposite direction. Incarnation is an inversion, a movement of the sacred into the profane. Rather than returning to an isolated, quiescent, transcendent Totality, it draws us ever more deeply into temporality, process, change. Not eternal return to a Reality beyond time, incarnation enlists us in history's forward march to an End in which the world in all its profanity is affirmed. Until the epochal shift to modernity, Christianity had not been able to appropriate the implications of its central conviction of God's gracious, kenotic self-negation in creation and incarnation. Yet Christians still long to return to paradise lost, to an eternal, impassive Reality beyond time's flux. Christ's resurrection/ascension fulfills the nostalgia by annulling the logic of incarnation and making it through return to a transcendent realm an event frozen in the past.

To this sacred-profane disjunction A. opposes a *coincidentia oppositorum*. Christianity fulfills the profane by negation of all previous forms of the sacred. Genesis is apocalypse; apocalypse, genesis. Transcendence yields to radical immanence; the sacred has its being solely in flesh. Incarnation is ongoing; previous manifestations of the Word know recurrent negation as Word becomes flesh in each new present. Coincidence is not abolition of the sacred but dialectical, transforming movement of flesh and spirit into each other. Without incarnation divine reality is deficient actuality. Correlatively, the goal of world process is realized when it no longer knows itself alien to divinity but one with it. First realized in Jesus, coincidence completes itself in embodiment in the self-consciousness of a universal community, the body of the apocalyptic Christ, cosmic eucharist in which God is all in all. While God's kenotic passover into flesh leaves us with the Word incarnate, the speaker of the Word seems no longer nameable. In Blake's words: "God is Jesus" (dare we say, world?). Yet God's death is redemptive, humanity's release from a sovereign, alien Other dispensing its fate and contradicting its life. That lawgiver, worshiped in churches as "God," is Satan. In speaking of Christ's presence in the world, A. invokes Nietzsche's eternal recurrence. The opposite of world-negating eternal return, eternal recurrence is "yes-saying" to life, intense willing of the present in all its ambiguity. Only the re-

deemed can dance. "Being (and incarnation) begins in every now." To seek life's center, the eternally significant, in another place or time is "no-saying" to life. The center is everywhere; eternity, in every now. Confession of Christ drives us into the profane; Christ is here, now or nowhere. The one who has come is ever the coming one. Gnostic flight is anti-Christian.

The vision is inspiring. For patient readers, A. again represents a stimulating work. Where dense poesis abounds, insight abounds all the more, especially in chapters dealing with the crucifixion of God, Augustine on the genesis of will, and Barth on predestination. Our reservations are obvious: A.'s eclectic appropriation of select features of his "radical Christians" and his facile fusions of them ("Augustine is the deepest ancient name of Nietzsche"); his hesitation about a tradition whose theology and literature are his intellectual capital; his negation of past epiphanies of the Word; his radical christocentrism that slights transcendence and imprisons God in the world process; his construal of resurrection/ascension as annulling incarnation when it is patient of a reading suitable to A.'s own collage. Perhaps we have here less interpretation of history than exploitation of it to make a philosophical-religious point considered corrective of all other theologies now passé and of another epoch.

Loyola University, New Orleans

STEPHEN J. DUFFY

TRUTH AND BELIEF: INTERPRETATION AND CRITIQUE OF THE ANALYTICAL THEORY OF RELIGION. By Heimo E. M. Hofmeister. American University Publications in Philosophy. Boston: Kluwer Academic, 1990. Pp. 256. \$92.

In this volume, originally published in German as *Wahrheit und Glaube*, Professor Hofmeister of the University of Heidelberg undertakes a project both admirable and daunting: "to offer a history of the problems of the linguistic-analytic philosophy of religion from its positivistic beginnings to the stage it has reached today," particularly in relation to "the question of the truth of religious statements" (11–12). In five chapters, he surveys virtually all of the major figures and developments of so-called "analytic" philosophy of religion prior to the mid-1970s, including the logical positivism of the Vienna Circle, and its popularization in the English-speaking world by A. J. Ayer; the philosophical shift from the earlier to the later Wittgenstein, and its implications; Antony Flew's "gardener parable," adapted from John Wisdom; R. M. Hare's notion of religious faith as kind of "blik," a basic presupposition or worldview (like the paranoid's erroneous "blik" that "everyone is out to get him") governing all behavior but unfalsifiable

in principle; work by James F. Ross and others on analogical language; the defense of the ontological argument by Malcolm and Hartsorne, together with the objections of their critics; and John Hick's (now dated) proposal of the possibility of an "eschatological verification" of religious claims after death.

And though H. attempts to show how each new contribution has arisen out of the unresolved questions of previous positions, his interest is not merely historical; rather, he hopes through this survey both "to provide a possible corrective to religious self-understanding," and to offer "a yardstick" for measuring the adequacy of "linguistic-analytical methods" in confronting "questions posed by the philosophy of religions" (10). H.'s many quotations and massive bibliography show a thorough familiarity with the important literature, and an ability to relate this material to the work of modern German philosophers and theologians, something rarely attempted by similar surveys written by Anglo-American philosophers. (It should be noted, however, that Hofmeister cites almost nothing written in the last two decades, during which there have been significant developments on the questions he treats.)

Unfortunately, this is a work whose high aspirations are almost totally undone by defects of style. There are countless small errors: all single quotation marks have become apostrophes; other punctuation marks (hyphens, commas, double quotation marks) are often misplaced or missing; and the text is replete with misspellings.

But the most serious difficulty is what seems to be overly literal translation from the original German that makes it often impossible to follow H.'s point, or to determine whether he is agreeing with or merely describing (or even criticizing) the viewpoint under consideration. E.g., in discussing one familiar illustration of the "analogy of attribution" developed by "Franz (sic) Suarez's school" (i.e., the predicate "healthy" as applied both to Jones and to his appearance), H. observes: "This means that a statement is not made about Mr. Jones and his appearance in the same way as the subject of the respective statements do not reach an agreement and are not univocata" (137).

Furthermore, H. often obscures his argument by relying on his own rendering of works already available in better English.

Examples of lack of clarity abound. E.g., while dealing with critiques of Norman Malcolm's defense of the ontological argument, H. says: "Just as Pegasus does not become a being who is clearly and distinctly conceivable when one imagines a horse with wings, "Nec" and his brothers "NEc" and "NEC"—as Paul Henle pleads against Malcolm . . . do not correspond to the requirements of clear and distinct knowledge" (161)—all without offering the reader any clue to the signifi-

cance of "NEc" and "NEC," or their distinction from "Nec" (which he defines only afterward)!

Such difficulties naturally raise a question about the intended audience of this book. It seems to be structured as a general introduction, yet would be difficult even for an expert to read. It seems to presume an extensive prior knowledge of the material listed in the excellent bibliography, in which most of the issues H. raises are discussed with greater depth and clarity than is possible in such an overview. Paradoxically, then, anyone sufficiently expert in the literature to follow H.'s synopsis probably does not need it.

To sum up, the bibliography is valuable, there are some useful sections, and the German original may be much easier to follow; but for readers interested in an overview of the "linguistic-analytic" approach to philosophy of religion, this reviewer would recommend other clearer and less expensive surveys already available in English.

Institute of Carmelite Studies
Washington, D.C.

STEVEN PAYNE, O.C.D.

CORPUS CHRISTI: THE EUCHARIST IN LATE MEDIEVAL CULTURE. By Miri Rubin. Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1991. Pp. xv + 432.

From time to time one comes across a book like this that has long needed to be written. Rubin, lecturer in Medieval History at the University of Oxford, has filled an important gap in the study of the Eucharist. What makes the book so significant is her treatment of the Eucharist in its social, political, economic, and cultural context. To produce such a comprehensive study R. employs the methods of anthropological research, especially a "thick description" of phenomena and the conviction that culture can be interpreted as a language, although she eschews consideration of only the linguistic aspects of eucharistic faith and practice.

Beginning with the Berengarian debate of the eleventh century and the writings of the early Scholastics, R. traces the theology of "ecclesiastical design" of the Eucharist with great care and competence. But this is only one aspect of the task to which she sets herself. Her prime interest is in how the Mass was really celebrated and in the reception of eucharistic doctrine and theology, which is quite a different matter from official documents and approved interpretations. Thus she makes ample use of popular pastoral treatises like Robert Mannyng's 14th-century *Handlyng Synne* and *The Lay Folk's Mass Book*. She also makes liberal use of manuscript illuminations demonstrating the Mass or other eucharistic symbolism.

R. proceeds to treat the origins of the feast of Corpus Christi in the

context of 13th-century Liege and particularly in relation to religious women, among whom Juliana of Cornillon is considered the feast's original inspiration. She also deals with the definitive establishment of the feast in the context of the 14th-century papal court at Avignon, and in describing the liturgy (Mass and Office) of Corpus Christi she rehabilitates Thomas Aquinas as its principal author.

The greatest value of the book lies in R.'s consideration of sermons, Corpus Christi fraternities, processions, and dramas. Here the reception both of the feast and of the Eucharist in general can be seen from their impact on society, in how they organize social groups and hierarchies and, of course, in the fact that the intent of such social organization is never entirely successful, as when riots occur during eucharistic processions. R.'s final chapter relates eucharistic doctrine, theology, and piety to other similar themes, such as the "Man of Sorrows" and the devotion to the wounds of Christ, as well as to heretical reactions especially in 14th-century England.

I have very few reservations about R.'s treatment of the Eucharist. The first has to do with a theological point. Despite her sophisticated description and analysis of medieval eucharistic theology, I think she misses the point of Thomas Aquinas's position on eucharistic realism when she states that "in Thomas Aquinas' *Summa* the present Christ was not really eaten by believers" (14) and then proceeds to quote *ST* 3, q. 77, a. 7 ad 3 to the effect that it is not the natural but rather the sacramental body of Christ which is eaten by believers. It is Thomas's enduring achievement to have been able to say this, all the while upholding a realistic understanding of the presence of Christ in the eucharistic species. In other words he does not limit the understanding of "real" to a literalist or "natural" meaning. My only other qualm has to do with the fact that R. treats the Corpus Christi processions wholly within the narrow grid of power relationships. To be sure outdoor processions are ideal phenomena upon which to cast our "ethnographic gaze" (to use her phrase), but they also want an analysis of how religious practice goes public as well as the dynamic connotations for the nature of Christian belief and practice.

These reservations are indeed minor in comparison to R.'s achievement. She has a monumental command of so many types of sources (treatises, manuals, sermons, iconography, hymnography) as well as of and secondary literature. Moreover, R. succeeds in demonstrating that an anthropological and hermeneutical approach to both the Eucharist and the feast of Corpus Christi involves more than tracing the causes of their developments. On the theological level R. shows that symbols cannot be dealt with as though they had univocal meaning and value. The lavish array of sources, understandings and reaction that she pre-

sents proves that ritual symbols can never successfully be overdetermined by systematic attempts to define them. It should be far more difficult in the future to deal with eucharistic theology and liturgy without this kind of contextual analysis. That makes R.'s book perhaps the most significant treatment of this subject in the last fifty years.

Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley JOHN F. BALDOVIN, S.J.

SOLDIERS OF CHRIST: PREACHING IN LATE MEDIEVAL AND REFORMATION FRANCE. By Larissa Taylor. New York: Oxford University, 1992. Pp. xiv + 352. \$55.

Historians who view late medieval Catholicism as decadent and in decline, as crippled by a famine of the Word of God, will be more than a little challenged by this new book. With a fascinating study of preaching in France from 1460 to 1560, Taylor, of Wellesley College and Harvard University, demonstrates the large quantity and high quality of biblically based preaching from both before and after the advent of the Protestant reform. Going beyond the work of literary scholars who have studied the genre, style and form of sermons, she focuses on theological content and makes use of it in reaching some provocative conclusions.

Late medieval preachers were for the most part Franciscans, Dominicans, and other friars. T. shows how they preached a Christocentric piety grounded in the words and deeds of Jesus. Purgatory and indulgences, the devil, hell, and other eschatological themes made but rare appearances in the pulpit. Sacraments were most often preached as occasions of comfort and consolation, only rarely as causes for fear and trembling. God was the loving, forgiving father of the prodigal son who calls us to love one another. If sin abounded after the Fall, grace abounded more. A pessimistic anthropology was "balanced by an optimistic soteriology in which, thanks to God, everything was possible for the repentant sinner" (86).

T. here offers an alternative not only to the "decline" thesis articulated by Huizinga and others, but also to Jean Delumeau's theses on fear and guilt, and to a characterization of late medieval Christianity as vitiated by rabid antisemitism and misogyny. At least in urban areas, preaching was abundant, in church and outdoors, at all hours of the day, often any day of the week; it encouraged not excessive fear and neurotic guilt but rather faith, hope, and charity. There is nothing in sermons from 1460 to 1560 to support the view that the late Middle Ages were an era of "existential anguish" (232). Mentioned infrequently, the Jews, if seen as enemies of Christ and his Church, were nevertheless portrayed as better than those Christians who did not live

as they should (154). Many late medieval preachers stressed the dignity of women and their equal role in Christian life. Adam was often depicted as more sinful than Eve, and women were recognized as more devout than men. While pre-Reformation preachers presented an "enlightened" viewpoint on women, attitudes tended to harden during the sixteenth century (175).

Taylor's exposition of Protestant sermons is relatively brief, due primarily to paucity of sources. Still, if there is a lacuna in this work, it is here. Twenty pages on Protestant preaching do not suffice, especially in view of the book's subtitle. Perhaps more could have been included on Calvin's preaching, even if most of his sermons were delivered outside France.

This book may well prove a seminal work, despite or perhaps in part because of its limits. It encourages reassessment of a broad range of presuppositions and historiographical commonplaces; it suggests the fruitful harvest that awaits those historians who carry the study of preaching further, not only in the Reformed context, but also beyond 1560, beyond the borders of France, and with in-depth examination of individual preachers. The Council of Trent identified preaching as the *praecipuum munus* of bishops; it would be very interesting to know if the post-Tridentine episcopate was as "enlightened" or as optimistic as T.'s late medieval friars.

St. Edmund's College, Cambridge

THOMAS WORCESTER, S.J.

THE MYSTICISM OF THE PASSION IN ST. PAUL OF THE CROSS (1694–1775): AN INVESTIGATION OF PASSIONCENTRISM IN THE SPIRITUAL DOCTRINE OF THE FOUNDER OF THE PASSIONIST CONGREGATION. By Martin Bialas. Translated from the German by Peter Gregory Anastasis. San Francisco: Ignatius, 1990. Pp. 365. \$14.95.

This work began as a doctoral dissertation directed by J. Ratzinger and the late J. B. Auer, and was accepted by the Catholic Faculty of Theology at Regensburg University in 1977. It was slightly modified for publication in German (1978), and additional revisions made for the English edition. Bialas, a member of the Congregation of the Passion, presents a comprehensive study of the spiritual and theological vision of Paul of the Cross, founder of the Passionists, preacher, spiritual writer and director, whose life centered on *Christus patiens et crucifixus*. Because of the dearth of serious Paulacrucian studies available in English, those interested in this field will be appreciative of this volume.

The first of two roughly equal parts provides an introduction to the life and times of Paul Danei, based on careful investigation of several

sources: Paul's spiritual diary; the rule of life written for his followers; his letters; sermons and meditations; the depositions of witnesses during Paul's beatification and canonization processes; and the annals of John Mary Cioni, Paul's contemporary and his successor as head of the Passionists. In charting out the influences on Paul's "spiritual-theological thought," careful attention is given to historical and cultural factors. This is the most satisfying part of the study. B. briefly treats the significance of Jansenism and Quietism in the spiritual and religious climate of 18th-century Italy. He then situates Paul Danei within the cultural and historical context of the Tuscan Maremma of the 18th century, plagued as it was by debilitating poverty and the ignorance of the clergy. This helps us understand Paulacrucian spirituality which is grounded in a mysticism of interiority, monastic in many of its observances, yet profoundly apostolic in its commitment to good preaching and zeal for mission.

The influence of Francis de Sales, Teresa of Jesus, and John of the Cross on Paul is addressed, highlighting the corrective function which they serve vis-à-vis Jansenist and Quietist influences on the spiritual and religious climate in which Paul was immersed. Of particular interest is B.'s treatment of Tauler's impact, particularly his mysticism of interiority and his understanding of the "ground" (*il fondo*) of the soul and "divine rebirth" (*la divina rinascita*) or divine nativity. B. maintains that the influence of French and Spanish mystics and the Rhinelander Tauler on Paul's spiritual-theological thought, nullify the criticism that Paulacrucian spirituality is representative of a specific "national mentality," i.e. 18th-century Italian. He also argues that the influence of these writers is an indication that Paul stands in continuity with mainstream currents of spirituality and mysticism in the West.

In Part 2, B. provides a lengthy treatment of Paul's "passioncentrism." The autodidact Paul was not a theologian in the strict sense. His is "an implicit theology" rooted in his "passion mysticism" which affirms Christ's passion as the quintessential manifestation of God's unbounded love. To participate in Christ's passion is to be united with Christ, which entails the embrace of all unavoidable and innocent suffering as the cross of Christ. B. is emphatic that Paul's focus on the suffering of the Crucified One does not eclipse his faith in the power of the resurrection, and that Paulacrucian spirituality provides a way of making sense of unavoidable and innocent suffering through participation in the suffering of the Crucified. This may serve as an antidote to the dolorism often found in representatives of a more enthusiastically voluntarist appropriation of Christ's passion and cross.

In his "introductory word," J. Moltmann emphasizes the singular

importance of the Crucified One in Christian faith and practice, highlighting the potential for a spiritual ecumenism rooted in the mystical experience of participation in the cross of Christ. M. suggests that there is an affinity between the mysticism of Paul of the Cross and the *anthropologia crucis* which underpins the theologies of liberation. He intimates that in Paulacrucian spirituality lie rich resources for a spirituality of solidarity with the weak, wounded, and suffering; a spirituality particularly appropriate to address present needs and exigencies; a tradition pertinent to contemporary modes of being and perceiving.

However, if there are in fact ecumenical or social-political ramifications of Paul Danei's mysticism of the passion which might contribute to a contemporary praxis of the gospel, B. himself does not adequately address these. His treatment gives the impression that, all protestations notwithstanding, spirituality and mysticism are rather individual, private matters isolated from wider ecclesial and sociopolitical concerns.

Lexington Theological Seminary

MICHAEL DOWNEY

HEGEL'S POLITICAL THEOLOGY. By Andrew Shanks. New York: Cambridge University, 1991. Pp. xii + 234. \$49.50.

Hegel so often seems to be all things to all people. In the present work, Shanks sets out on one of the more imaginative tracks of reinterpretation, arguing that Hegel's "inclusive" Christology and anti-authoritarian political theology render him both a continuing resource for the modern world and a useful dialogue partner in debates with, among others, Hannah Arendt, Johann-Baptist Metz, and Eric Voegelin.

S. starts from Milan Kundera's notion of kitsch. An easy and cheap attitude to life which promotes and celebrates premature harmony in human relations, it is an obvious partner for all forms of authoritarianism. Kitsch in this sense is no stranger to religion, and neither is authoritarianism, but what governs S.'s approach to Hegel is his belief that the inclusive Christology championed by Hegel challenges this religious kitsch. Christ on the cross, representing humanity, gives the lie to cheap grace and to the religious authoritarianism that put him there. Religious orthodoxies prefer an exclusivist Christology so that the crucifixion can be raised above ordinary human experience.

Two lengthy chapters discuss Hegel's Christology and his understanding of the relationship between philosophy and dogmatics, both issues on which much ink has been spilled. The first of these argues that Hegel's Christology is the definitive overcoming of "the Unhappy

Consciousness," that condition of mental estrangement from the "Unchangeable." The second sees Hegel principally as a religious reformer, insisting on the theological value of philosophy. While neither chapter is particularly original, they are both very clear considerations of the complex field of Hegelian religious thought, particularly in its earlier formulations in the *Phenomenology of Mind*.

The later chapters of the work are the more impressive. The lengthy central chapter on the philosophy of history, e.g., engages Voegelin, Kierkegaard, Adorno, and Foucault in a debate on modernity intended to show that Hegel's doctrine of the self-actualizing idea works as a Christocentric response to the idea of modernity as fate. For Hegel, thinks S., modernity is a space for freedom, but the Christian gospel has become kitsch, and opened the way for authoritarianism. Once again, the principal claim is not especially unusual, but the use of the language of kitsch puts it in an interestingly and quite suggestively new way. As for the debates with Voegelin et al., these seem less helpful, obscuring the focus on Hegel's concerns with relatively lengthy excursions on the other figures. This distracting shift of focus takes over in the final chapter on Hegel's political theology. We have here a right, it seems to me, to expect that Hegel will be the focus of discussion, but the debate is between Arendt, Isaiah Berlin, Metz and Hegel, and inevitably Hegel's share of the limelight is reduced.

There is a very interesting insight lurking behind the pages of this book, namely, that Hegel's Christology can be utilized in the modern world as a defence of freedom against both political and religious authoritarianism. For that to emerge more clearly than in fact it does would require more sustained attention to Hegel, interesting as the digressions are. S. also seems to have some pastoral concern, and that too might seem to the reader to be less frustrated if the focus had been more clearly upon the political theology. It may indeed be that the book is mistitled: *Studies in the Unhappy Consciousness* would be a much more accurate reflection of the contents. But for all these minor disappointments, the present work represents the emergence of a significant new voice in Hegelian interpretation.

Fairfield University

PAUL LAKELAND

CLEAR HEADS AND HOLY HEARTS: THE RELIGIOUS AND THEOLOGICAL IDEAL OF JOHN HENRY NEWMAN. By Terrence Merrigan. Louvain Theological and Pastoral Monographs. Louvain: Peeters, 1991. Pp. xvi + 272. Fr.b. 695.

The title of this work, a citation from Newman's epistemological study *An Essay in Aid of a Grammar of Assent*, conveys the model of

polarity that characterizes Merrigan's approach. In an exciting introduction M. delineates polarity as a theoretical model to structure Newman's religious epistemology in order to reveal its apparently conflicting aspects as united in constructive tension. This model is explained in light of 20th-century scholarship on paradigms for philosophical and theological interpretation.

Unfortunately, the initial hope for engaging Newman's thought with hermeneutical theory today quickly dissipates; there is no critical dialogue in the book beyond the specialized field of Newman studies. That is disappointing because on all the major topics that are discussed (epistemological theory, imagination, theological method, certitude, ecclesiology) there is an abundance of innovative literature today. Nonetheless, demonstrating a mastery of Newman's writings, M. provides a helpful map for introducing his religious epistemology. Although he offers no major new insight, M. carefully develops the work of his mentor, Jan Hendrik Walgrave, on the polar tension in Newman's thought while painstakingly summarizing the contribution of a vast array of Newman commentators.

The book's subtitle, the religious and theological ideal of Newman, opens the window on M.'s basic argument. He claims that Newman uses real apprehension (as experience/information about concrete reality) to explain his view of religion (Part 1) and notional apprehension (as general and abstract concepts) to explain his theological method (Part 2); finally, their polar interaction illumines the life of faith, of individual and Church alike (Part 3). The strength of his study is to present a well organized and clear account of the relation between Newman's epistemology and theology—not an easy task given the nonsystematic nature of Newman's writing. Further, this introductory study fills a significant gap in the secondary literature. M. uses extensive citations from Newman's texts, helpful for the novice, though a little tedious for others.

More substantively, however, there is a confusing ambivalence in M.'s argument on Newman's theological method, which plays a crucial role in the book. M. appropriately traces Newman's shift from a deductive (notional) to an inductive (real) method in theology. He argues insightfully that Newman's understanding of theology can only be adequately assessed when integrated with the polar character of his epistemology that balances in dialectical interplay the real and the notional. This integration suggests that theology should engage both with the real and the notional. But M. claims that Newman's mature view, reflecting his polar vision, engages in theology that is committed to notions, though inspired by the real knowledge of "religious imagination." Here the polar tension of the real and notional is a charac-

teristic of the relation between religion and theology, not a characteristic of theology itself.

It is frustrating that M. does not explore this polar tension within theology itself; the dimension of the real or imaginative (terms used interchangeably by Newman) in theology is replete with methodological significance and dialogical potential for engaging Newman's thought with the metaphorical and rhetorical studies of theology today.

Saint Louis University

GERARD MAGILL

AN ESSAY ON THEOLOGY AND HISTORY: STUDIES IN PANNENBERG, METZ, AND THE FRANKFURT SCHOOL. By J. A. Colombo. AAR Studies in Religion. Atlanta: Scholars, 1990. Pp. xiv + 264. \$44.95; \$29.95.

Colombo has written an important book aimed at clarifying a contemporary Christian theology of history. It is a series of three critical theological meditations. The conclusion at which C. arrives is that a Christian theology of universal history is better apprehended and understood if one recognizes the centrality of the sociophilosophical category of "nonidentity" for a Christian interpretation of the meaning of history. That is, Christian theology is capable of a more profound sense of the universal significance of history if it appreciates the intrinsic relevance of the apophatic or aporetic dimension of historical and social reality.

Moreover, C. concludes that the theology better able to provide a Christian theology of history today is the theological movement known as political theology (223). C. argues that there is clear "correlation" between a Christian theology of history and the project of political theology. He explains that, in particular, Metz's work constitutes a paradigm for a Christian theology of history precisely because it preserves the relevance of the category of nonidentity within its elaboration of a practical fundamental theology. Metz's notions of "dangerous memories" of suffering and of the "eschatological proviso" recognize and preserve the centrality of "nonidentity." The "eschatological proviso" declares to Christian consciousness of history that the irreconcilable events of human suffering, misery, and inhumanity to humanity always stand opposed to the quest for a definitive Christian theology of universal history. At best, the quest for a Christian reading of history, of these aporetic events of human suffering, can only anticipate and hope for a certain universal meaning of history. The nonidentity of human suffering critiques the hybris of a "complete" Christian theology of universal history.

How does C. construct his thesis? Briefly, there are three fundamen-

tal aspects to his argument. The first aspect derives from C.'s critical study of Wolfhart Pannenberg's theology. He endorses Pannenberg's theological recognition of history as the horizon for all religious language and reflection. Moreover, theology or religious language is co-extensive with the reflective or "theoretical" dimension, and not primarily with the prereflective or "practical" dimensions. C. finds himself in basic agreement with certain elements of Pannenberg's fundamental theology.

The second aspect of his argument derives from his critical reflections on Metz. C. finds himself in basic agreement with the practical fundamental theology of Metz. The particularly salient feature of Metz's theology is the latter's focus on the primacy of praxis which is informed by the concrete social reality of human suffering, marginalization, and victimization. The obstinate nonidentity of contemporary social realities (e.g., that three-fourths of the world's population lives in degrading and dehumanizing poverty, that 55,000 persons starve to death daily on our globe, that in the U.S. 3% of the world's population consumes 40% of the world's resources, that in many countries human and political rights are atrociously denied) challenges the project of a Christian theology of history to move in the direction of social praxis as the more meaningful response to the question of the significance of history.

The third aspect of C.'s argument is to join the contribution of Pannenberg to the insights of Metz through the mediation of the Frankfurt-School thinkers, Horkheimer and Adorno. Here C. argues that the realm of social reality is the locus for a discussion of the meaning of history. The critical theorists' contribution is to recognize and preserve the category of nonidentity in the context of a critical assessment of Western Enlightenment society. These important thinkers reason that a "dialectic of enlightenment" has accompanied the achievements of the Enlightenment. That is, the Enlightenment has and continues to harbor negative forces of dehumanization. What is called for is a social praxis of critique to identify and to negate these negative social forces. C. finds that the reflections of the critical theorists assist the theologian in the project of constructing a contemporary theology of history that intends to respect and take seriously the concrete social reality of nonidentity.

The result of C.'s three studies is a "prolegomenon" for a Christian theology of history which entails three specific nonidentities which radically critique and challenge any contemporary Christian theology of universal history. The first nonidentity derives from religions other than Christianity which challenge Christian universal truth claims. A Christian theology of history must remain an open discussion vis-à-vis

the challenge of world religions. C. argues that this constitutes a "confessional proviso" for a theology of history. The second nonidentity derives from theological traditions and methodologies other than the one to which a given theology of history might subscribe. A Christian theology of history must remain open to the theological challenges coming from alternative traditions of reflecting on and elaborating the content of Christian faith, of theological conceptualization and understanding of history. C. calls this the "theological proviso." The third nonidentity is precisely the nonidentity of history and society as suffering analyzed by Metz's political theology. A Christian theology of history must remain open to the challenges offered by history and society that give evidence of the irreconcilable facticity of human suffering. This nonidentity constitutes the "eschatological proviso" of political theology and of a Christian interpretation of history.

This is an important study that will be of interest not only to theologians concerned with philosophical foundations for a Christian reading of history, but also to theologians and intellectuals who are concerned to elaborate the theoretical bases for movements of praxis that desire to change the world. While C. has limited the scope of his attention to political theology as the better candidate for the exploration of a Christian theology of history, I would add that significant parallel and complementary theological resources are to be found in other theological movements as well, e.g. in liberation theology (particularly the work of Gustavo Gutiérrez), in feminist theology, Afro-American theology, and in other regions of the theological hinterland. C. has given us a fine discussion of important theological issues in several significant and challenging thinkers. His book will not be overlooked by serious theologians and scholars interested in the relationship of Christian theology and universal history.

Belmont Abbey College, N.C.

STEPHEN J. SCHÄFER

A BIBLIOGRAPHIC GUIDE TO THE COMPARATIVE STUDY OF ETHICS. Edited by John Carman and Mark Juergensmeyer. New York: Cambridge University, 1991. Pp. viii + 811. \$100.

The late 1970s began a period of rapid growth of interest in comparative studies of ethics, in which the publication and discussion of books like Little and Twiss's *Comparative Religious Ethics* (Harper & Row, 1978) and Green's *Religious Reason* (Oxford, 1978) played a large part. Building on this interest, Carman, Juergensmeyer, and others secured support from the National Endowment for the Humanities and the Henry Luce Foundation for the five-year project called the Berkeley-Harvard Program in Comparative Religion: Values in Comparative

Perspective. The papers and discussions of the more than 150 scholars participating in various aspects of the project between 1980 and 1985 have been published in several places; the present volume continues the dissemination of their efforts. In particular, it makes available essays originally developed as a kind of "readers' guide" to the study of ethics in a number of important religious and cultural traditions.

The result is a useful, if unwieldy tool for those interested in research or teaching in the area of comparative ethics. As Juergensmeyer's introduction notes, participants in the Berkeley-Harvard project recognized from the outset the value of "a comprehensive guide to bibliographic resources in each of the religious traditions" (2). These essays make a brave attempt to provide such a guide. For the most part, they focus on primary materials, e.g. the Scriptures, legal codes, and doctrinal works most crucial to an understanding of the traditions in question. Traditions covered include Hinduism, Buddhism, Ancient China, Taoism, Neo-Confucianism, Japan, Ancient Greece, Judaism, Christianity, Islam, and modern Western philosophy. Native American traditions are covered in a brief appendix, as are some of the more important writings in comparative ethics. Each author begins with a discussion of the history and major themes of his/her tradition as related to the study of ethics, followed by an introduction to the major categories of literature available to students of ethics and an annotated bibliography. All of the essays are competent, and provide a fair survey of the literature for the tradition in question, though many readers will find some of A. Kevin Reinhart's annotations for works on Islamic ethics rather cryptic. Speaking of Joseph Schacht's work on Islamic law, e.g., Reinhart writes: "It is very thorough, but . . . one gets the feeling that [Schacht] has somehow missed the point, that the *tone* of the *shari'ah*-sciences is missing" (550). To provide guidance to the reader is one of the functions of a bibliographic essay; it would be unfortunate, however, for readers to think that they can avoid or dispense with the work of Schacht.

The most outstanding essays are "Hindu Ethics" (Barbara Holdrege) and "Modern Western Philosophical Ethics" (Russell Sizemore and John F. Kilner). Holdrege not only provides an excellent survey of the literature available to those who would study Hindu ethics, but also makes an independent contribution to our understanding of ethics in her assigned tradition. And Sizemore and Kilner provide an excellent commentary on the relationship of contemporary moral philosophy to the development of diverse models for the comparative study of ethics. In doing so, they probably exceed the mandate of a "tradition essay." The results are extremely helpful, nonetheless.

The unwieldiness of the *Guide* will also be evident, however, to any-

one who gives the volume more than a cursory glance. Traditions are covered in an odd assortment of ways: While "Hindu Ethics," "Jewish Ethics," and "The Ethics of Muslims" attempt to survey whole traditions in a single essay, Buddhism is discussed in three essays. The first covers India, Tibet, and Southeast Asia; a second deals with Chinese Buddhism (in isolation from the discussion of Ancient China, Taoism, and neo-Confucianism); the third integrates Buddhism as part of "the Japanese religious tradition." Again, Christian ethics is the subject of four essays, distinguished according to chronology: Early Christian Ethics (to ca. 600 C.E.), Medieval (to ca. 1300), Early Modern (to ca. 1650), and Modern (1648 to the present). One must admit that this arrangement reflects the current state of the study of religious ethics. It is simply true that more is available to students of Buddhist or Christian ethics than to those concentrating on other traditions. Yet the result is a certain unevenness. Even more, the limits of space imposed by the chapter divisions prevent any writer on Buddhist or Christian ethics from producing the kind of extended essay that contributes to scholarship in a way equivalent to the essays by Holdrege, or Sizemore and Kilner.

There is more to say concerning both the usefulness and the unwieldiness of the *Guide*. The volume attempts to foster cross-cultural studies by classifying literature according to two variables: topic and genre. Of the two, the former is more obviously helpful to students of ethics, enabling the development of a ready appendix listing all those works covered in the tradition essays that are specially important to, e.g., discussions of friendship or the use of force. The genre classification seems less useful, at least to this reviewer, especially since the various tradition essays already contain annotations that classify literature for the reader.

In the end, however, one must say that the *Guide*'s usefulness far outweighs its unwieldiness. There is simply no other resource available to students of comparative ethics that serves the same function. While the price will be too steep for many individual buyers, every library should add this work to its reference holdings. We should all be grateful to Cambridge University Press, and to all the participants in the Berkeley-Harvard project, especially Professors Carman and Juergensmeyer, for making these essays available.

Florida State University

JOHN KELSAY

THE MORAL VIRTUES AND THEOLOGICAL ETHICS. By Romanus Cessario, O.P. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1991. Pp. x + 204. \$24.95.

Cessario presents a systematic analysis of the foundations of the Christian moral life through a careful explication of Aquinas' account of virtue. He has three goals: to present virtue as an integral component of moral theology; to examine the major theological elements of Christian virtue theory; and to indicate the relevance of the moral virtues and Christian faith to discussions in contemporary Christian ethics.

C. ought to be praised on a number of counts. He strives to provide an intelligent retrieval of Thomas' theory of virtue and draws upon what is obviously a keen knowledge of the *Summa*. He emphasizes the theocentric nature of Christian ethics. He makes abundant references to Scripture, and so attempts to move away from the almost exclusively philosophical center of gravity that marks most recent accounts of virtue theory that draw upon Thomas. Finally, he draws upon a wide variety of other sources within the Catholic tradition, including Ambrose, Augustine, Gregory the Great, and Duns Scotus.

At the same time C. is open to several criticisms. First, at times he is guilty of proof-texting and of employing biblical citations in an artificial manner, without any sense of their narrative context. Though he cites Scripture frequently, he nowhere offers an exegetical argument and this occasionally leads to an unfortunate use of the text, as, e.g., when he takes the story of the temple offering of the poor widow in Luke (21:1-4) to indicate the transformative effects of "infused virtue" (109).

Second, C.'s use of Thomas is sometimes strangely selective. Thus his desire to emphasize the distinctiveness of Christian ethics leads him to break with Thomas on the material content of the New Law. According to C., the "formal difference" that marks conversion "entails a radical change of life" including "the summons to a self-renunciation that goes to the extreme of martyrdom, . . . the command to love one's enemies, . . . to renounce one's rights, . . . and not to countenance divorce . . . [S]uch activities require not only a new set of divinely revealed norms, but also the capacity to follow them" (112). C.'s position is a far cry from Thomas' own claim that the New Law did *not* reveal new moral norms governing external action (see *ST* 1-2, q. 108, a. 2).

Third, C. recognizes that natural-law ethics receives its grounding in claims regarding human flourishing, but argues that the effects of sin upon human intelligence severely restrict our ability to employ nonreligious sources properly in the search to determine the content of the human good. Knowledge of what C. calls "the built-in teleologies of human nature" (23, 31) is not properly sought in either contemporary philosophy or the natural or social sciences but through revelation as authoritatively interpreted by the Roman magisterium. C. views the

agent as fundamentally dependent upon the "grace of the Holy Spirit" (153) but gives little complementary attention to the essential intelligibility of moral norms within Thomas' ethics. This ironically represents a position at some distance from that of Thomas, whose own use of Aristotelian logic, natural science, metaphysics, and ethics stands as the prime example of Christian openness to nonreligious and nondoctrinal sources of truth, however imperfect.

Fourth, while C. strives to provide an alternative to "legalism," he does not succeed. When he discusses moral norms, "virtue" is replaced by the language of "eternal law" and "divine plan." The life of virtue thus consists of habitually conforming to the teaching of the Church. "Only exaggerated notions of autonomy require one to dispute legitimate authority in the Church"; the life of Christian virtue, in contrast, recognizes that "the Magisterium faithfully and trustworthily represents the designs of the Eternal Law" (153). C. concentrates on the need to develop habits that will empower us to conform to Catholic moral doctrine rather than on providing us means of discovering what is right in situations marked by unclarity and ambiguity. His "moral realism" is thus not complemented with the sense of modesty and openness that we find in other "moral realists," nor with Thomas' sense that the more we descend into the concrete and particular the less moral certainty we attain (e.g., *ST* 1-2, q. 91, a. 3, ad 2).

C. correctly claims that we need to recover the theocentric nature of the Christian moral life. Yet, unlike Rahner and Lonergan, he never addresses the question of the transposition of Thomas in light of the "turn to the subject." As a result, excessively objectivistic assumptions about revelation and a positivist approach to magisterial authority generate a legalism rather than a truly creative retrieval of Thomistic ethics. C. displays an acute knowledge of Thomas' account of habitus and virtue and is most profitably read by those who seek greater knowledge of this aspect of Thomas' moral thought. Those in search of either a contemporary model for the use of the human sciences and contemporary philosophy within Thomistic virtue theory, or for its deeper contemporary theological grounding, however, will have to look elsewhere.

Boston College

STEPHEN J. POPE

THE SOCIAL GOSPEL IN BLACK AND WHITE: AMERICAN RACIAL REFORM, 1885-1912. By Ralph E. Luker. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina, 1991. Pp. xiv + 445. \$39.95.

To most Americans, the Social Gospel of the Protestants, like the Social Encyclicals of the Catholics, seemed to focus mainly on the

plight of the working class. The author refutes this one-sided interpretation which he blames on the influence of Arthur Schlesinger, who saw the Social Gospel as the response of "reform-minded churchmen to urban industrial crises of the late-nineteenth century." The failure to recognize that the Social Gospel was keenly attentive to the American problem of race relations has been called "the astigmatism of the historians" (2).

Even before the Social Gospel became the *Sprichwort* of Walter Rauschenbusch, much history had been made by religious support of the Abolition Movement and of the African colonization of ex-slaves. In Part 1 Luker recounts the postwar decline of racial reform even while religious-minded Northerners tried to Christianize both races in the South. The search for equal civil rights, conducted by religious leaders from Wendell Phillips to John Ireland, implied that to Christianize the South means to Americanize the South. The American Missionary Association "may have been the most important vehicle of the social gospel prior to the organization of the Federal Council of Churches in 1909" (14). The century has its "savage end" in the mid-1890s with the growing epidemic of lynchings and with racial segregation legalized through *Plessy v. Ferguson*.

Part 2, captioned "The Racial Mission Renewed," tells the story of higher learning at Hampton and Tuskegee in the South and of settlement houses and "institutional churches" in northern cities. The practical approach in both instances was based both on the social sciences as well as in the Scriptures. General Samuel Armstrong, founder of Hampton Institute, promised that "the Kingdom of God will come through sociology well studied and applied wisely in a levelheaded way" (126).

In spite of urban race riots in the North (New York, 1900) and in the South (Atlanta, 1906), "mainstream social Christianity still thought in terms of mission to black America" (165). Social work and welfare were integral to the religious mission of the churches. Salvation is for the whole person, as the Reverend H. Proctor said: "Save the body alone and you have a Jack Johnson; save the mind alone and you have a Robert Ingersoll; save the soul alone and you have an Uncle Tom" (190).

Part 3 covers the fall and rise of both the civil rights organizations and the social gospel advocates. The long decades of black disfranchisement began early in the century. State after State in the South consistently denied voting rights to the black population. The problems of the black people in the rural South "were more difficult than those facing the freedmen forty years earlier" (211). The nadir of race relations was reached in the polarization of black leaders and the inabil-

ity of white leaders to find a common organizational program. The common racial disabilities were the three social issues of the decade. The social-gospel press regularly addressed these issues: lynching, involuntary servitude, and disfranchisement. These were the discriminatory practices that kept black Americans in effective subjugation.

At this time, "close observers of American race relations believed they were witnessing a reprise of the antebellum crisis. In peonage, the chain gang, convict leasing, sharecropping and tenant farming, segregation and disfranchisement, the white South was patching together a new system of racial bondage" (242). The organized response to this series of racial oppression and discrimination was the interracial NAACP. The centennial of Abraham Lincoln's birth brought together people like Jane Addams, Ray Stanard Baker, John Dewey, W. E. B. DuBois, Willian Dean Howells, Lincoln Steffins, most of whom were deeply influenced by the social gospel. There followed the organization of the National Urban League, supported by active religionists of both races.

Chapter 10 reviews the contributions of the principal "theologians of race relations," whose social gospel was fairly uniform but who differed in their social and cultural definitions of race. Josiah Strong and Thomas Dixon promoted a radical cultural assimilation of the races, even while insisting on Anglo-Saxon superiority. H. Paul Douglass, whose *Christian Reconstruction in the South* was an early and powerful statement of "evangelical neoabolitionism," was among the first to use the term "social gospel." It was not until 1917 that Rauschenbusch published his *Theology for the Social Gospel*, in which he emphasized that "God is the bond of racial unity."

Luker's scholarly treatise on the racial impact of the social-gospel movement is an effective remedy for the astigmatism of historians who focused social gospel and social encyclicals only on the victims of the industrial wage and work system. The book is carefully researched, historically accurate, and presented in a highly readable style. Historians of the social-gospel movement will have to refer frequently to this volume.

Loyola University, New Orleans

JOSEPH H. FICHTER, S.J.

TOWARDS A SOCIETY THAT SERVES ITS PEOPLE: THE INTELLECTUAL CONTRIBUTION OF EL SALVADOR'S MURDERED JESUITS. Edited by John Hassett and Hugh Lacey. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University, 1991. Pp. xiv + 406. \$25.

This excellently edited volume appeared on the second anniversary of the brutal murder of six university Jesuits and two colleagues. Each

of the book's twenty essays reflects the contribution of liberation theology to research on crucial issues of the day. They were selected with the intention of offering a representative sample of the intellectual contribution made by Ellacuría, Martín-Baró, and Montes to social research and theological reflection. In grouping the essays, the editors have successfully highlighted the wide variety of ways in which the thought of these scholars is integrally linked with the world of the poor, as well as to one another's research. Eight of the essays are by Ellacuría, seven by Martín-Baró, and five by Montes.

In the first section, Ellacuría, referred to by a Hegelian scholar in Chile as "one of the most creative philosophical minds in Latin America," explores the role of faith, liberation and justice. "Liberation Theology and Sociohistorical Change in Latin America" addresses the political challenge of liberation theology. Liberation theology is politically effective only when it enters a relationship with other social movements. Ellacuría provides a typology to help one work through this insight. Next, his foundational essay, "Utopia and Prophecy in Latin America," targets the eschatological aspects of liberation theology. He considers prophecy as the method of the "poor with spirit" and Christian utopia as the horizon in the historical context of the liberation of the poor majority from unjust social situations in Latin America.

If the relation of liberation theology to social change in the first section is the foundation, the reflections on the university and its social-justice mission in the third section can be considered the book's centerpiece. The first essay in this section, "The Challenge of the Poor Majority," was a lecture given by Ellacuría in Barcelona just ten days before his death. In it he speaks of the university as "living in the midst of a situation where history itself is going through a crisis." The university seeks not to prescind from a context in which "the civilization of capital and empire has been manifesting some of its gravest evils." It works with a vision which integrates faith and justice.

In "Is a Different Kind of University Possible?"—a ten-year assessment of the University of Central America (UCA)—Ellacuría's experience as President of the Jesuit-run university flowers. He explains the role of the university in the transformation of society through its assumption of the world of the poor as the "horizon," i.e. the "ultimate standpoint and deepest purpose," of university activity. *Mutatis mutandis*, one finds, at the heart of the reasoning in this essay, as well as in the following one, "The University, Human Rights and the Poor Majority," a type of insight which can and should be given consideration even in our North American cultural context.

The last chapter in this section, by Martín-Baró, enters into the

functioning of the university as an institution of higher education. "Developing Critical Consciousness through University Curriculum" is a serious attempt to deal with the institutional mechanisms by which the social consciousness that comes out of liberation theology is concretely operative. It can be debated whether this "model" is strictly applicable to other universities. But the basic principles of liberation theology and the methodology by which they are operative merit our attention. In order to understand the notion of the poor as the horizon of university activity, e.g., we must first understand a way of doing theology whose principles reflect such a presupposition.

Three essays by sociologist Montes in the fourth section of the book, devoted to power and social structure, reveal the results of rigorous empirical research and political analysis which is at the same time informed by the principles of liberation-theology method. Finally, social-psychologist Martin Baró's three essays in the last section of the book are highly creative. They lay the foundations of a psychology of liberation which may well flower in coming years. English-speaking readers who wish to follow up with more from Baró can look forward to the publication of more of his essays in a sequel to the present volume on the occasion of the third anniversary.

The apparently unrevised style and incompletely organized structure of some of the essays reflects the fact that they are working papers. The authors were actually risking death as they continued their research, teaching, and writing at the UCA. As working papers, the essays do more than simply provide a great deal of data, method, and heuristic concepts on which further research can build. They provide us with intellectual work which is permeated with the sense that faith moves us to an ever clearer reading of politics, that Christian commitment is understood to be primarily social and that the Church has the responsibility for taking an active part in building a new social order.

Woodstock Theological Center, D.C. GASPER F. LO BIONDO, S.J.

VOICING CREATION'S PRAISE: TOWARDS A THEOLOGY OF THE ARTS. By Jeremy Begbie. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark; and McLean, Va.: Books International, 1991. Pp. xix + 286. \$24.95.

From within the Protestant tradition, Begbie offers a theological esthetic to link the arts and the Christian gospel. His purpose is not to discuss the morality of art or the effect of art on theology, but to examine "the bearing of theology on the arts," i.e. "what theology can bring to the task of understanding and enhancing the arts" (xviii). He first summarizes two Protestant approaches, those of Paul Tillich and

of five 19th- and 20th-century Dutch Neo-Calvinists, then critiques them and offers his own synthesis.

B.'s summary of Tillich is schematized but clear, presenting both Tillich's views on art and the artistic implications of his theology. He encapsulates Tillich's philosophy of meaning, his understanding of form, import, and content, and the relationship of the arts to "ultimate concern." Drawing on Tillich's essay "Existentialist Aspects of Modern Art" (1955), he also spells out "the four levels of relation between religion and art." Though B. admires Tillich, his critique is trenchant: Tillich overvalues German Expressionist art, minimizes music and literature, and works with an inadequate theory of symbol and an inadequate Christology. Nor is his philosophy of art "sufficiently marked by distinctively Christian insights" (256).

Turning from Tillich, B. investigates the Dutch Neo-Calvinism of Abraham Kuyper, Herman Bavinck, Herman Dooyeweerd, Hans Rookmaaker, and Calvin Seerveld. Some major themes emerge: God as the indomitably sovereign Lawgiver; human culture flourishing because of God's "common grace"; earthly beauty as grounded in and reflecting the beauty of God; Christian art presenting a Christian vision of the world under the Lordship of God. But B.'s critique is strong: though the "Dutchmen" (as he puts it) are more biblical than Tillich and more rooted in Protestant orthodoxy, they overstress law, duty and obedience; they downplay the Incarnation, the Trinity, and the importance of divine love; and in requiring "beauty" of Christian art, they eliminate such works as *King Lear*, Stravinsky's *Rite of Spring*, and Penderecki's *Passion of Luke*.

B. devotes Part 3 to "a better way forward" (160) towards a Christian esthetic with "a more rigorous concentration on the incarnation, crucifixion and resurrection of the Son of God" (167). After sundry comments and distinctions (e.g., on Kant and the alienation of art from society), B. adopts Gadamer and Polanyi as his philosophical mentors. He argues that art is not "spiritual" but embedded *in* creation; art discovers order and redeems disorder (imitating the broken Christ by entering disorder); transcending the artist's self, art involves meaning, norms, morals, and theological issues; an aesthetic based on redemption in Christ "would equip us with a concept of beauty more distinctively Christian than the somewhat pale Platonic notions . . . so often offered in theological discussions of art" (225). In a final chapter based on Polanyi, B. maintains that all art functions in the manner of metaphor.

Admirably, B. esteems the arts, and pays good attention to literature and music. Yet I think he tries to do too much. In 258 pages he presents, compares, contrasts, and evaluates the Christian esthetics of

seven different writers and himself. The result, though heroically researched and splendidly clear, is too terse and schematic, too tightly written.

Nor is it adequately explicit on the link between Christ's redemption and the arts. By stressing its "metaphor-centred, cognitive view of art" (248), it diffuses its focus on Christ and on "what theology can bring to the task of understanding and enhancing the arts" (xviii). And given that B. sometimes refers to Catholic scholars, he could well consult such works as William F. Lynch's *Christ and Apollo* which analyzes comedy precisely in terms of Christ's descent into the limitations of matter.

Saint Joseph's University, Philadelphia JOSEPH J. FEENEY, S.J.

SHORTER NOTICES

READING THE BOOK: MAKING THE BIBLE A TIMELESS TEXT. By Burton L. Visotzky. New York: Doubleday/Anchor, 1991. Pp. 240. \$12.

After four years of leading a monthly study of Genesis, attended by New York writers and Biblical scholars, Visotzky, professor of Midrash at Jewish Theological Seminary, has written a popular, vigorous midrashic account of some pentateuchal narratives which attempts to "undermine a way of reading the Bible which renders it useless for the modern world and so keeps it on the shelf" and "to illuminate some of the processes by which one religious community has forced the text to speak to the various elements in its Weltanschauung" (226).

The first three chapters and the last treat rabbinic hermeneutics and their rich mode of reading. Though the many examples show the potentialities of the texts, the stubborn problems of modernity, history, science, and epistemology are sidestepped, rather than worked out. In the other chapters V. weaves together biblical stories, rabbinic comments from a thousand years, and incisive insights

into modern culture in order to discuss "creation, faith, anthropology, theodicy, sexuality, parent-child relations and sibling rivalries" (225).

V. retells the biblical stories in the modern idiom (alluding to presidential speeches and weddings on Long Island) and with humor (God created humans to talk to; all the angels said was "Holy, Holy, Holy") in order to get at the imagined human situation behind the text in a way that makes the characters real (Abraham's moral ambiguity highlighted by the midrash makes the Bible the longest running soap opera in history). Through a brisk, earthy style, without footnotes, the major characters, stories, and narrative details come to life. V. is convinced that communal Bible reading can clarify our ideas about the world around us and link them historically to a long-standing tradition, and that we have the means at our disposal to make reading the Bible "a pleasurable and meaningful exercise" (235), an exercise which he carries out with sophistication and panache.

ANTHONY J. SALDARINI
Boston College

READING ISAIAH. By Edgar W. Conrad. *Overtures in Biblical Theology*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. xiv + 185.

In this enlightening work Conrad provides the first synthetic presentation we have of the Book of Isaiah. Dissatisfied with the older historical-critical approach to biblical interpretation with its focus on the content of its original historical background and in terms of its original authors' intention, C.'s methodological focus is on the newer advances in literary theory which acknowledges the primary role of the reader, rather than the author, in the construction of the text's meaning.

According to his analysis, the Book of Isaiah (1–66) provides the context and the occasion for reading another book, the book of Isaiah's vision (chaps. 6–39). Chapters 1–5 and 40–66 provide the present context as the framework for the reception of the ancient vision of Isaiah. C. understands these narratives in chaps. 6–39 not so much as documents from a historical past as "part of a literary construct consisting of poetry and narratives that suggest a setting for the poetry" (152). C. argues that the effect of this setting, possibly based on the historical events of the time of Uzziah, Ahaz, and Hezekiah, gives authority to the poetry in a new time—the "present"—when it is being received by the implied audience, whom he identifies as a "community of survivors."

Although C. stresses the role of the implied audience and the reception of the text by the reader, the identification of the community of survivors is not clear. One could justifiably ask: To whom does this "community" refer—the survivors of the destruction of Jerusalem living in exile, or the repatriated Jerusalemites of the post-exilic period? Furthermore, since C. appears to acknowledge that the text was written by a specific author (or

authors) whose intentions were directed to a specific audience and in a specific historical time, it is not clear how his methodology differs significantly from an "up-dated" version of the historical-critical approach.

DONALD B. SHARP, S.J.
Gonzaga University

JEWISH PRAYER: THE ORIGINS OF CHRISTIAN LITURGY. By Carmine Di Sante. Translated from the Italian by Matthew J. O'Connell. New York: Paulist, 1991. Pp. 259. \$14.95.

At once promising and flawed, Di Sante's work emphasizes the spiritual affinity between Judaism and Christianity, hoping to counter scholars (like Dom Odo Casel) who locate Christian origins in non-Jewish antecedents. It thus surveys synagogue and home ritual, providing a running spiritual commentary to contemporary Ashkenazi Orthodox Jewish texts. Though generally accurate and often insightful, the interpretations are marred by a typereader who missed a galaxy of embarrassing Hebrew errors, like *gabbalat* (not *qabbalat*) *shabbat*. Gender bias occurs throughout, as if British Orthodoxy of 1941 (the worship S. relies on) is still the worldwide norm.

Paulist Press has added the subtitle, "Origins of Christian Liturgy," thus misrepresenting S.'s work, which is a synchronic commentary to a single modern prayer book, itself a product of 2000 years of liturgical accumulation, almost none of it antedating Christianity, so hardly Christian origins! The new title presupposes the validity of reading back our current prayer wording to ancient worshipers—a view that has not been held for decades.

Above all, as intriguing as S.'s spiritual insights are (and some of them are sparkling!), one wonders whether they are Jewish. Some are outright

Christian, like the identification of "Adamic disobedience" as the grounds for petitionary prayer. Others rely on outdated apologetic literature that romanticize Judaism, without serious substantiation in rabbinic classics.

Thus, this is neither a study in Christian origins nor a synopsis of spirituality drawn from the talmudic/midrashic, the biblical/exegetic, or the philosophical/mystical traditional sources. But it is a loving identification with Judaism, a full and welcome acceptance of Jewish prayer as authentic and deep, and an interpretation of what contemporary Orthodox Jewish liturgy may conceivably imply to those who use it.

LAWRENCE A. HOFFMAN
Hebrew Union College, N.Y.

THE GOD OF CHRISTIANS. By Ronaldo Muñoz: Translated from the Spanish by Paul Burns. *Theology and Liberation.* Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990. Pp. xv + 192. \$34.95; \$16.95.

This book, while not breaking new ground, does two things well. It contributes to the series of which it is a part in showing that Latin American liberation theology can move past methodology to actual theological content. It also shows that, while bringing its own nuances, liberation theology, far from being an aberration, is within the mainstream of contemporary theology around the globe.

Muñoz introduces his book with the hermeneutic circle familiar to liberation theology, situating his theology within the experiences of the poor. Part 1 shows how God's name can be used to support conflicting socioeconomic and political positions, and that the crucial question is not so much whether God exists as what kind of God exists. M. then suggests, rather than a philosophical analysis, the approach of the base communities which present a Church opting for the

poor, show respect for popular religious culture, embrace popular movements of liberation, and offer a reading of the Bible out of their own particular history.

Part 2 details shifts in the popular culture of the base communities, highlighting especially the gaps between elders and the young, and points out the crises which these elicit in the understanding of God in both nature and humanity. Here we see, in technology, political movements, secularization, and urbanization, the challenges to all contemporary theology, though with a particular focus among the Latin American poor. Then M. suggests new perspectives in reading the Bible which address that situation. Part 3, though a bit repetitive, takes up Old and New Testament teaching, stressing a holy God who is nevertheless personally alive within history in faithfulness, justice, and love, especially for the poor, and is fully revealed as the God of Jesus. M. hopes that Jesus' vision of God is the key overcoming relativism for the genuine understanding of the God of Christians. One difficulty, of course, is controlling the varied interpretations of Jesus' vision of God.

ANTHONY J. TAMBASCO
Georgetown University

THE CREATION OF CHAOS: WILLIAM JAMES AND THE STYLISTIC MAKING OF A DISORDERLY WORLD. By Frederick J. Ruf. SUNY Series in Rhetoric and Theology. Albany: SUNY, 1991. Pp. xviii + 185. \$44.50; \$14.95.

Ruf analyzes the work of William James, not by examining his argumentative logic or his effective history, but rather by investigating his style. He argues that in James, matters of style are not merely ornamental; they shape the content of the text.

Focusing primarily on *The Principles of Psychology* and *The Varieties of Religious Experience*, R. shows how

James creates a world in which *chaos* is a primary feature of human experience. R. discovers two varieties of chaos: one has definite (though amorphous) boundaries, symbolized by the *stream*; the other is an utter chaos, symbolized by the *plenum*. Using a clear and readable style himself, R. carefully unpacks the ways in which James uses these metaphors.

The book is primarily about James and only secondarily concerned with theoretical issues in rhetoric. Thus, some readers might infer that the significance of stylistics is a peculiarly Jamesian phenomenon, whereas it actually applies to all authors (as perhaps R. would agree). Unfortunately, R. does not analyze the social, cultural, and economic factors which influenced James's approach. Yet James's declarations so often manifest such degrees of aloofness and bourgeois ennui that they positively cry out for some form of "political criticism"—which would be entirely appropriate within R.'s rhetorical method.

The book's chief contribution is its use of rhetoric to evaluate a highly influential thinker. It may be somewhat disappointing to theologians, however, since its theoretical conversation-partners tend to see religion as a cultural phenomenon, rather than as *fides quaerens intellectum*. Of course, this is true to James's approach in *Varieties*; and R. does go beyond the limitations of his subject by offering some original insights into the often "chaotic" nature of religious discourse generally. Moreover, many of R.'s insights could be profitably applied, *mutatis mutandis*, to other theological concerns.

DAVID S. CUNNINGHAM

University of St. Thomas, St. Paul

THE EMERGENCE OF LIBERATION THEOLOGY: RADICAL RELIGION AND SOCIAL MOVEMENT THEORY. By

Christian Smith. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1991. Pp. xiv + 300. \$14.95.

Sociologist Smith seeks to discover the "deepest motivating impulses and dynamics" that generated the movement of liberation theology within the Catholic Church of Latin America. Guided by a political-process model, he examines why and how the movement emerged and when and where it developed. S. argues that the movement arose in situations where political opportunities, organizational strength, and insurgent consciousness reached a threshold level that brought about radical social change in the Church, beginning in the late 1960s. He maintains that a small cadre of young, aggressive, radicalized theologians spearheaded the movement by gaining access to positions of influence within the Church.

S. presents an invaluable, dynamic historical analysis of the movement. He strives for objectivity and fairness by providing solid evidence from interviews, documents, and texts that includes viewpoints of those opposed to liberation theology. Moreover, he carefully avoids taking sides on key issues in the movement, such as development versus dependency theory and Marxist versus functionalist analysis. He does, however, make evaluative comments on certain issues that liberation theologians might challenge. Regarding dependency theory, e.g., S. says that when this theory is removed from liberation theology, "something essential in the spirit and logic" is changed.

Although S. rightly recognizes that the movement is steeped in the faith of the activists, he does not show clearly enough how their religious convictions influenced the insurgent consciousness that helped create the movement. He gives scant attention to women who contributed mightily to the movement itself and later (in

the 1980s) to its theology. In emphasizing the key role played by a small cadre of radical theologians, S. assumes the movement to be an elitist phenomenon, an assumption that may be contested. Nonetheless, the book presents an impressive and most engaging social history of the movement.

THOMAS L. SCHUBECK, S.J.
John Carroll University, Cleveland

HUMANE SOCIETY AND THE CHURCH OF TOMORROW. By Karl Rahner. Theological Investigations 22. Translated from the German by Joseph Donceel, S.J. New York: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. vi + 234. \$29.50.

This is a translation of the first three sections of volume 16 of *Schriften zur Theologie*, published in 1984, the year of Rahner's death. Half of the essays were written during the last year of R.'s life, and the others within a few years of his death. They resume and develop some of the main themes that preoccupied him during his final years.

Part 1, "Humane Society," stresses the need for tolerance and respect for the dignity and freedom of conscience in today's pluralistic society. R.'s transcendental Thomism enables him to explain the theonomous nature of conscience as the "voice of God" in a real sense, even when misinterpreted in the false dictates of an "erroneous conscience." Tolerance is limited by the common good, but is more conducive to a truly humane society than imposing moral laws. In Part 2, "Ecumenism," R. advances some of his bold proposals for church unity. The lack of positive agreement on particular theological points need not hinder unity unless it can be shown that such disagreements are irreconcilable with the Church's one faith. By a more radical appropriation of the truth of faith all the churches will become more Christian and more one.

Part 3, "The Future of the Church,"

points to dogmatic initiatives of Vatican II that still await further reflection and implementation in church life. Among them are the Council's hope in the universal offer of salvation and the relationship of the pope to local churches and their bishops. R. repeats his call for new ways of communicating "the marvelous message of Christianity" to people today. The last section, "Doctrine and Magisterium," assesses the various roles of the magisterium, theologians, and the *sensus fidelium* in the Church's life of faith. This *sensus fidelium* has a normative role for the magisterium as well as vice-versa. Admitting past mistakes and respecting freedom would not diminish but enhance authority in the Church.

The translator has rendered the German in a very clear and readable English text.

WILLIAM V. DYCH, S.J.
Fordham University

STATES OF GRACE: THE RECOVERY OF MEANING IN THE POSTMODERN AGE. By Charlene Spretnak. San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1991. Pp. 337. \$21.95.

This work offers a helpful commentary on postmodern thought (particularly that of Foucault, Derrida, and Lyotard), and presents solutions to many of the shortcomings, such as nihilism, characteristic of prominent postmodernist ideas. Spretnak, a writer and activist in the Green movement, finds much to admire in the work of postmodernist authors. She appreciates their ability to deconstruct the "truths" of modern culture, their attention to the manipulation of being, and their sensitivity to the irreducible particularity of human experience. But she nonetheless objects to their many exaggerations, including their claims that language is a prison house, that human society is entirely a cultural construction, and that ethical claims are groundless

and naive. S. rightly counters that language fosters genuine communion, that society is not completely reducible to artifice, and that eschewing ethics is a luxury we cannot afford. She accuses postmodernists of serving the patriarchal project of separation, involving the unrealistic and destructive wish to be independent of others, of society, of the earth. By now we know where this leads.

In response to the challenge of postmodernist thought, S. presents solutions from four prominent wisdom traditions. Buddhism provides resources for overcoming many of the atomistic and alienating tendencies of modern life by tracing the impulses of selfishness and violence to their mental origins. Native American religions stress communion with nature, and goddess spirituality similarly emphasizes the interrelatedness of all creation in the totality of Gaia, "the ecosphere that is our body" (15). And the Semitic religious traditions (Judaism, Christianity, Islam) embrace ethics by placing the quest for social justice and the moral community at their core.

Although I found S.'s prose occasionally unclear, I would recommend this work both to those who are familiar with the debates within postmodernism and those new to the arguments. It provides valuable insights for both types of readers.

MARY ELLEN ROSS

Trinity University, San Antonio

GENESE UND ENTFALTUNG DER ALT-KIRCHLICHEN THEOLOGIE DES MARTYRIUMS. By Theofried Baumeister. *Traditio Christiana: Texte und Kommentare zur patristischen Theologie*. New York: Lang, 1991. Pp. xl + 202. \$97.80.

Baumeister has devoted himself to the study of early Christian martyrdom in several studies, and the present volume represents his latest effort, albeit in a different form than

his previous writings on the subject. This is a collection of texts, freshly translated into German and with the original languages on the facing pages, setting out the genesis and development of the theology of martyrdom in Christian antiquity. The texts in question range chronologically from a passage from the Book of Daniel to one from Sulpicius Severus, hence covering both scriptural and patristic documentation, and they are accompanied by notes, many of them quite extensive. A brief introduction explains why these passages were selected: the intention was not to be exhaustive but rather to illustrate the most important themes, among them the Jewish roots of the Christian concept of martyrdom, the connection between martyrdom and apologetic, and spiritual martyrdom.

Probably, in the nature of things, no anthology is ever completely satisfying to anyone, and I found myself wondering, for example, why the earliest mention of baptism by blood in Tertullian's *De baptismo* 16 was omitted, although the theme itself appears several times in selections from later authors. Still, the passages are generally very well chosen, and the content of the book does not belie its title.

It is not clear, however, precisely to whom this book is directed. Would an anthology of basic texts such as these, useful as they may be, find an audience of experts? Yet the notes occasionally presuppose a familiarity with the subject that beginners would not have. The price, in any event, will make B.'s work inaccessible to most persons, whether beginners or experts, and that is a shame for a book as helpful as this, which deals with a topic of major importance for understanding the mind of the ancient Church.

BONIFACE RAMSEY, O.P.

*Immaculate Conception Seminary
N.J.*

THE DIPTYCHS: A HISTORY OF THE LITURGY OF ST. JOHN CHRYSOSTOM 6. By Robert F. Taft, S.J. *Orientalia Christiana Analecta*. Rome: Pontificium Institutum Studiorum Orientalium, 1991. Pp. xxxiv + 214.

Taft is probably the foremost living historian of the Byzantine liturgy. The present work is the fourth part of a projected five volumes on the history of the Liturgy of St. John Chrysostom, the most frequently employed Byzantine Eucharistic rite. One other volume, *The Great Entrance*, has been published to date.

The diptychs, or the names of individuals proclaimed by the deacon in the course of the Eucharistic prayer, are the subject of this study. In the present rite only the names of the living are recited and these (rarely) at pontifical liturgies. Building on the seminal studies of E. Bishop and G. Winkler, T. differentiates the Byzantine diptychs from the recitation of the names (*nomina*) of the offerers and/or their intentions before the Eucharistic prayer in the West and in other Eastern Christian traditions as well as from other types of intercessions and commemorations scattered throughout the Byzantine liturgy itself.

In a very helpful taxonomy T. distinguishes between "parochial" (local commemorations of offerers) and "official" diptychs. The latter category, which has more to do with the church's self-definition, is subdivided into "hierarchical" (commemorations of bishops within a particular church), "communion" (representatives of churches one is in communion with), "confessional" (affirmation of a doctrinal stance), and "mixed" types. Though not the object of the study, the fascinating ecclesiological history of the use of diptychs is recounted along the way. T. concludes with several pastoral considerations, chief of which is the question of whether the Eucharistic prayer ought to be recited silently in the Byzantine rite.

Reciting the Eucharistic prayer audibly would obviate the need for a diaconal proclamation of names at all.

Though T. himself eschews the term (xxxii), this work is the "definitive" study of a major chapter in the history of intercessory liturgical prayer. It is also a model application of T.'s own structural analysis of liturgical units and the methods of comparative liturgical studies.

JOHN F. BALDOVIN, S.J.
Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

THE ORTHODOX LITURGY: THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EUCHARISTIC LITURGY IN THE BYZANTINE RITE. By Hugh Wybrew. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary, 1990. Pp. xi + 189. \$9.95.

The Dean of the Anglican Cathedral in Jerusalem here presents the history, structure, and spirit of the Byzantine Divine Liturgy. Born of study, long contact with Orthodox churches, and deep affection for their ways of prayer, the book addresses two questions: how the Byzantine liturgy reached its current form, and what the churches of the West might learn from Byzantine forms of worship.

Wybrew presents the liturgy at each stage of its development as it would look and feel to one who was present. He examines five such stages: Constantinople at the time of Chrysostom, the 7th century of Maximus the Confessor, the time after the icon victory (8th and 9th century); the 11th-century influence of Nicholas of Andida; and the 14th-century completion of the liturgy under Patriarch Philotheos. He illustrates the influence of pseudo-Dionysius on the hierarchizing of the liturgy, the sacramentalizing of the liturgical space by Maximus, and the increasing importance of the visual and the contemplative as the iconic display became itself integral to the liturgy.

While W.'s work is primarily de-

scriptive, he does not uncritically romanticize the Byzantine liturgy. At the same time he is empathetic to the reluctance of the Orthodox churches to enter the path of liturgical reform.

W. intends an entry-level introduction to the liturgy, "not at all intended for the expert," but meant rather "for those who have had some experience of the Liturgy, and are curious about its shape and content" (x). He underestimates his contribution. It stands as an excellent complement to the work of H.-J. Schultz (*The Byzantine Liturgy: Symbolic Structure and Faith Expression*) and provides material to benefit Western liturgical students and indeed experts whose knowledge of the Byzantine churches and liturgy is usually quite limited.

PETER E. FINK, S.J.
Weston School of Theology

THE DIFFICULT SAINT: BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX AND HIS TRADITION. By Brian P. McGuire. Cistercian Studies. Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1991. Pp. 317. \$29.95.

This is not a biography but a series of studies that orbit around the life and influence of Bernard. The adjective "difficult" in the title comes from M.'s early ambivalence towards an historical figure who seemed to him so aggressive (e.g. in his promotion of the Crusades) and so conservatively punitive in his theology (e.g. towards Abelard), and whom he now sees in a more positive light.

Single essays treat Bernard's capacity for friendship (strong for men, limited with women); his relationship with Malachy (Ireland) and Eskil (Scandinavia); and the changing image of Bernard in early hagiography. Other essays are more thematic in character, including one on the role of tears in monastic piety and two wonderfully detailed studies of the role of Mary's breast milk as an image in medieval Marian piety and the embrace of Christ in Bernard's affective

spirituality. The latter two essays would be of value for the art historian. M. (American born but now teaching in Denmark) ends his volume with an act of *pietas*: a salute to the development of Cistercian studies in the U.S. in general and the role of the Institute of Cistercian Studies and the Cistercian Studies seminars at the annual medieval congress held at Western Michigan University.

M. has thought long and hard about the issues in this collection, has read widely in the sources, and is careful in his judgments. For those reasons, it is clearly a contribution to Bernardine research to have these essays in one place for the benefit of those interested in medieval spirituality in general and Bernard in particular.

LAWRENCE S. CUNNINGHAM
University of Notre Dame

WISDOM'S DAUGHTER: THE THEOLOGY OF JULIAN OF NORWICH. By Joan M. Nuth. New York: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. 217. \$24.95.

A valuable contribution to the task both of using the mystical tradition as a source for doctrinal theology and of recovering the thought of women in the tradition. Julian is an especially apt subject for this task, since hers is truly a speculative mind, searching for understanding and pressing doctrinal concerns more than most mystics.

N. first sketches the historical background and the major themes and method of Julian's theology, and then analyses Julian's theology around the focus of the love of God. She treats Julian's Christology and theology of the Trinity and deals with the effects of God's love: the works of nature, mercy, and grace. She clearly delineates the major contours of Julian's theology: a dynamic Trinity; the motherhood of God; a Christology that emphasizes soteriology and is rich in male/female imagery; the centrality of the cross; a provocative

treatment of sin; an inclusive and exalted anthropology; a portrait of a God marked by compassion and a startling dedication to creation.

Nuth makes important advances on two fronts. First, she reminds the theological community of the need to recover the mystical tradition as a source for theology. Second, she reveals the theologian Julian at work, using methods that have been pushed to the margin since the Middle Ages—a loss that we are beginning to perceive and correct. Julian's allegorical treatment of the parable of the lord and the servant unearths multiple levels of meaning in the God/human relationship. *Lectio divina*, the meditative reflection on a sacred text, plumbs the depth of meaning of who God is and allows that meaning to penetrate to the depths of the human spirit.

Here is a resource for anyone who wants to delve into the specifically *theological* contribution of this 14th-century English mystic. One hopes that similar analyses of other mystical writers will be forthcoming as we broaden the base from which we understand and do theology.

ELIZABETH DREYER

Washington Theological Union

PRINCES, PASTORS, AND PEOPLE: THE CHURCH AND RELIGION IN ENGLAND 1529–1689. By Susan Doran and Christopher Durston. New York: Routledge, 1991. Pp. vii + 216.

Doran and Durston present in a comprehensive yet popular manner the modern historical research of the revisionists Haigh, Scarisbrick, Sharpe, White, and Bernard who in the last twenty years have radically altered what once was the accepted view of the English Reformation. They arrange their material in nine thematic chapters, with an introduction and a conclusion, a glossary, and a list of important dates.

In the Introduction D. and D. ex-

plain the new understanding of the English Reformation which the revisionist school has achieved and why they are writing a popular work to disseminate the revisionist viewpoint. In the chapters which follow they lucidly explain nine topics central to revisionist research; theology and liturgy, the physical structure of churches, the Church in England and the churches abroad, religion and popular belief, heresy and dissent, the bishops, the parish clergy, the religious orders and society, the Church and social control. Their masterful presentation of this material with suggestions for further reading makes this study more than a superlative undergraduate textbook which they modestly espouse as their purpose.

The six-page Conclusion brilliantly summarizes the nine themes. D. and D. maintain that over the course of the period between 1529 and 1559, the English Church experienced a number of dramatic changes in its nature and status; starting out as a branch of the international Roman Catholic Church, it moved to become first an independent schismatic Catholic Church, and later a unique, hybrid Protestant Church. After 1560, this new English Church sought to establish its traditions and define its boundaries, a process completed only by the end of the 17th century.

HERBERT J. RYAN, S.J.

Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

A PECULIAR FATE: METAPHYSICS AND WORLD-HISTORY IN KANT. By Peter D. Fenves. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University, 1991. xii + 306. \$36.50.

The role of history within Kant's project of critical philosophy has become an object of renewed interest and debate among philosophers and historians of philosophy in recent years. Fenves, a professor of comparative literature, adds another perspective to that discussion. His study focuses on three works from different

stages of Kant's career: *Universal Natural History and Theory of the Heavens* (1755), "Idea for a Universal History from a Cosmopolitan Point of View" (1784), and "The Renewed Question: Whether the Human Race is in Constant Progress towards the Better?" (1798). F. uses these works as a filter through which to view Kant's prolonged struggle to relate metaphysics (particularly the topics of *metaphysica specialis*: the nature of God, of the rational soul, and the world) to history (understood both as a course of events and as human efforts to comprehend those events and their significance).

F.'s overall approach to the Kantian texts traces out the affective links among a set of images and metaphors that F. finds dominating these works. This approach occasionally proves insightful, e.g. in his discussion of moral incentives, the fact of reason, and the feeling of respect for the moral law (213–35). More often, however, it proves exasperating, particularly when it makes word play and word association its primary argumentative mode, e.g. in the discussions that build upon the double meaning of *Blatt* as leaf and page (134–47; 177–84). F. deals with Kant's texts in terms of a dominant concern of contemporary literary theory—the nature of reading. It is thus not surprising that his larger interpretive goal is to render Kant's critical project (or at least that part of it still relevant in a postmodernist world) into a theory of reading (6). The results, however, seem to tell us more about the preoccupations of contemporary literary theory than they do about Kant.

PHILIP J. ROSSI, S.J.

Marquette University, Milwaukee

TRANSFORMING VISION: IMAGINATION AND WILL IN KIERKEGAARDIAN FAITH. By M. Jamie Ferreira. New York: Oxford University, 1991. Pp. 168. \$39.95.

Focusing on the pseudonymous writings of Johannes Climacus, Ferreira argues that faith is presented as both a leap and a passion, that the passion involved in faith grows out of holding together in tension the elements of paradox, that it is the imagination which makes this possible, and that this positive role of imagination qualifies the discontinuity stressed by the metaphor of the leap with elements of continuity and, most importantly, discredits a one-sidedly voluntarist account of the transition to faith.

F.'s opening chapters explore the concept of qualitative transition in Kierkegaard as based on a concept of willing as something like rational appetite, more nearly in tune with classical accounts than purely volitionalist accounts imply. What Kierkegaard requires is a concept of transition that is both qualitative and free, but not necessarily an intentional volition or decision. Subsequent chapters develop this theme in relation to ethical imagination and religious imagination. The positive role of imagination in Kierkegaard's account of faith sets him off from Enlightenment models of subjectivity that either ignore imagination altogether or reduce it to the level of wishful thinking. At the same time the ethico-religious seriousness attributed to imagination distinguishes him from all romanticisms that restrict imagination to an aesthetic role.

This study is an illuminating contribution both to Kierkegaard studies and to the philosophy of religion in general. For F. makes it clear that it is intended as a challenge to a purely voluntarist account of the transition to faith, whether such a view is attributed to Kierkegaard (or Johannes Climacus) or simply presented as the truth about religious faith.

MEROLD WESTPHAL
Fordham University

THE GREAT DISSENT: JOHN HENRY NEWMAN AND THE LIBERAL HERESY. By Robert Pattison. New York: Oxford University, 1991. Pp. xiii + 231.

An intriguing thing about Newman is his capacity to elicit admiration from ideologically opposite sorts of Roman Catholics. Especially since Vatican II came to be referred to as "Newman's council," liberals have often claimed his patronage, placing emphasis on his teachings about the moral sovereignty of conscience, the importance of lay opinion for the formulating of church doctrines, the comprehensiveness appropriate to university teaching, the reasonableness of religious belief, and the naturalness of doctrinal development. These were certainly important aspects of his thought, and signs of his resistance to clerical narrowness and institutional rigidity. Yet, even while exploiting these resources of Newman for liberating the critical capacities of Catholics, one may wonder if anyone should ever have thought of Newman as a liberal if he were *not* a Roman Catholic. He was certainly not so perceived by non-Catholics, nor even by Catholics before he himself became one.

Skepticism about Newman's liberalism can be usefully tested, and may very well be intensified, by a thoughtful reading of this important new book of Pattison, for whom Newman is liberalism's utter antithesis and futile antagonist. Indeed, for P., Newman was in all his major undertakings profoundly a failure, and we inhabit a modern world that is dominated by the very liberalism he despised. Newman's own theology and philosophy have been generally deemed untenable, and the learned world remembers him chiefly for his eloquence. P. likens him to Nietzsche for the intensity of his hostility to values most characteristic of the modern world, though on grounds entirely dif-

ferent from Nietzsche's. And it is in this reactionary position that Newman retains some limited usefulness in an era characterized by overcomplacent liberalism.

P.'s thesis is well argued, and offers a desirable corrective for interpretations of Newman in which wishful thinking has played too great a part among Catholics yearning for a liberal hero who combines intellectual luster and ecclesiastical orthodoxy. What P. finds in Newman is there, and is not negligible. But Newman is less simple than P. might have us think, and, I would insist, less consistent!

JAMES GAFFNEY

Loyola University, New Orleans

UNDERMINED ESTABLISHMENT: CHURCH-STATE RELATIONS IN AMERICA, 1880-1920. By Robert T. Handy. *Studies in Church and State*. Princeton: Princeton University, 1991. Pp. xi + 204. \$29.95.

Immense challenges confronted the American republic during the forty years which form the time span for Handy's enlightening study. The related processes of industrialization and urbanization were fueled by unparalleled waves of immigrants, generating a doubling of the nation's population between 1880 and 1920. American's gradual emergence as a major world power coincided with the internal strains of absorbing millions of newcomers and a slow evolution into an increasingly heterogeneous society for which the Supreme Court's 1892 proclamation, "[This is] a Christian nation," was to become problematic. Such is the broad field within which the struggles and challenges inherent in changing relationships for religion, politics, and society are scrutinized.

Handy's command of primary sources and secondary literature allows him to engage in a perceptive

analysis of the subtleties and nuances which explain the almost imperceptible but very real reshaping of America's religious-political landscape by the end of World War I. The influx of millions of Catholic immigrants made their church the largest in the nation, while the arrival of sizable groups of Jews and Orthodox Christians undermined the Protestant dominance of America's first century with unfamiliar expectations and new challenges to the prevailing church-state relationship. Another chapter was written in the tensions between the public and private school systems, while the rise of the "social gospel" and the tide of progressive political reform affected religious and governmental institutions. As the state sought to meet a growing array of needs, new sources of conflict led religious groups to seek redress in state courts. And World War I altered the assumptions and operations of government and religious bodies, as well as the interaction between them, to such an extent that no "return to normalcy" was possible thereafter.

This important contribution to the understanding of church-state relations will be necessary reading for serious students of American religious history.

DONALD J. GRIMES, C.S.C.
King's College, Wilkes-Barre, Pa.

READING IN COMMUNION: SCRIPTURE AND ETHICS IN CHRISTIAN LIFE. By Stephen E. Fowl and L. Gregory Jones. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991. Pp. 166. \$13.95.

Fowl and Jones propose a new approach to the function of Scripture in moral life. The proper locus of moral discernment is the community of believers who seek to be faithful to the Word, not the individual confronted by a decision. F. and J. take on the dominant historical criticism that seeks to identify "the meaning" of

biblical texts, independent of the life context of believing communities. Instead, meaning emerges in the encounter between believing readers with their unique questions and the text of Scripture. This encounter depends not on interpretive brilliance but on the moral characters that have been shaped by the practices and friendships of Christian communities.

The most novel feature of this well-written volume is its insistence that sound spirituality is a prerequisite for Christian moral reflection. Because only those ready to be "performers of the Word" can discern its practical invitation, "the failure to hear the word of the Lord [is] a moral and not a hermeneutical failure" (91). Churches ought to form the characters of their members by teaching them disciplines of prayer and reflection. Otherwise, unconverted readers will find their prejudices reinforced when they read Scripture as "for them" rather than "over against them."

The authors refuse to do the work that is reserved for communities: they will not detail the demands of discipleship regarding current moral issues, let alone outline a method for recognizing those demands. This appealing case would have been strengthened by empirical study of communities that actually shape characters equipped for moral discernment. Closer scrutiny of their liturgy, prayer, religious formation, and social practices would provide the patterns of particular instances that are meant to take the place of universal principles and methods.

WILLIAM C. SPOHN, S.J.
Santa Clara University

CODE OF PEACE: ETHICS AND SECURITY IN THE WORLD OF THE WARLORD STATES. By Dorothy V. Jones. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1991. Pp. xvii + 208. \$24.95.

Are there ethical standards that apply to relations between states in the international system? If so, are they or can they be universal? What difference have these standards made? J. answers these questions by tracing, in theory and practice, the positive differences an evolving code of international ethics has made from the First Hague Peace Conference in 1899 to the Vienna Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe in 1989.

J. synthesizes key ideas, shifts, and nuances in the thought of various authors and players, and in the evolving ethical principles grounding international relations. What she defines as an "ethical framework" in the period prior to World War II has moved from the primacy of the principle of "self-determination" in 1919, to the triple legacy embodied in the principles of political independence, territorial integrity, and the sovereign equality of states. After World War II, J. argues for the use of the term "Code" to identify international ethics on the grounds that consistency of purpose and principles ties the various international instruments together. Especially after 1945, the Code reflects the predominance of human rights; well over 90 percent of the 53 international instruments and declarations from 1945–1989 deal with human rights. Moreover, the impact of the war and the brutality of the German state brought about greater involvement of individuals, private organizations, and international organizations in shaping the Code, including calls for civil, political, and legal equality of women with men.

With the admission of new states to the international community in the 1950s, the Code shifts to greater demands for social justice and economic equity within a New International Economic Order as incorporated in the 1974 U.N. Charter of Economic

Rights and Duties of States. Finally, with the 1975 Helsinki Accord, human rights become elevated to the same status as state rights. J.'s final chapter traces the status of peoples on whose behalf the states presume to act. Appendices include a compilation of major international agreements and declarations from 1919 to 1989.

This elegantly written work won the 1991 Lionel Gelber Prize for the best book on international relations published in English.

GREGORY J. WALTERS
St. Paul University, Ottawa

PREVENTING PRENATAL HARM: SHOULD THE STATE INTERVENE? By Deborah Mathieu. *Clinical Medical Ethics*. Boston: Kluwer Academic, 1991. Pp. 153. \$45.

In a brief preface Mathieu distinguishes, for three reasons, her emphasis from the usual title given this area of concern, namely *Maternal-Fetal Conflicts*. First, she wishes to place the emphasis on the born child, not on the fetus. Second, she does not want to assume a simple conflict between a pregnant woman and offspring. Finally she does not wish to imply that all pregnant women are mothers. M. clearly presents the law and the reasons for using and for not using legal coercion. Her arguments are masterfully marshalled. For those interested in the subject matter, this book is now their point of departure—regardless of their terminus.

The outcome, for M., is that a woman accepting to bring a pregnancy to term has a moral obligation to take reasonable precautions to optimize (my term) the health of her born child. This obligation is always balanced against the risk to the mother and the predictability of a favorable outcome for the child. The law should not be invoked since it would affect classes of people unfairly and would demand types of care—e.g.

rehabilitation, prenatal care, etc.—which are not even available in vast areas of the U.S. Thus to demand under penalty of law what the government does not guarantee for all women is incongruous. To maintain her libertarian balance, M. would allow the child to sue her parents for harm that could and should have been prevented *in utero*.

The one caveat I have is technical: mutation introduced through male and female germ cells is not distinguished from mutation in the embryo and fetus; and developmental biology is not demonstrated to be clearly understood. But it is not possible to do everything in one small book.

ROBERT C. BAUMILLER, S.J.
University of Detroit Mercy

THE WEB OF THE UNIVERSE: JUNG, THE "NEW PHYSICS," AND HUMAN SPIRITUALITY. By John Hitchcock. New York: Paulist, 1991. \$14.95.

Written by a physicist as a contribution to the Paulist series on "Jung and Spirituality," this work dwells on apparent parallels between Jungian psychology and contemporary physics. Although at times insightful and creative, the book as a whole is ragged and undisciplined in the writing.

According to H., the universe is a process of growing consciousness. Religion and spirituality are intended to help humanity sustain the cosmic process of "waking up." The awakening cosmos is not composed dualistically of matter and spirit; rather it consists of a complex web of various kinds of "spirit-matter" shaped by a transcendent "Patterning." But since spirit is always inseparable from matter, the science of physics must be revised and expanded in order to comprehend the spiritual as well as the material dimensions of the cosmos. Jungian psychology can mediate this transformation of physics into an all-

embracing science. Jung's psychology is not only the right spirituality, it is also good physics.

Coming from a scientist this is a remarkable thesis, and one that is hardly destined to prosper. Historically, physics has achieved its successes only by deliberately leaving so much out. If it had included within its scope such things as the evolution of life or the workings of the human psyche or the strivings of the spirit, it would have remained too fuzzy to have made the breakthroughs that it has during the past three centuries. Physics quite rightly abstracts from the narrative density and concrete complexity of the cosmos. It is not physics' abstracting from spirit that is inappropriate, but the identification of its abstractions with the whole of reality. Physics would better keep its limited status as one science among others than take over the work of spirituality as well.

JOHN F. HAUGHT
Georgetown University

WILDMEN, WARRIORS, AND KINGS: MASCULINE SPIRITUALITY AND THE BIBLE. By Patrick M. Arnold, S.J. New York: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. xii + 240. \$19.95.

Arnold adds to the "men's movement" the conviction that the Judeo-Christian tradition has powerful, challenging, and healing dynamics for men as they face the danger and emptiness of modern life. Part 1, "Gender and Spirit," stresses the differences between women and men. To the extent that the feminist movement is an attempt to dominate the complicated paradox of human sexuality, it can only result in new oppressiveness at least as serious as that which it set out to correct (21). This section shows A. at his most polemical. Yet, as I read it, his analysis does not raise another roadblock on the way to women's liberation; in many

ways, it is an outcome of it. For Jungians, A.'s psychological referent, the feminine is not wholly identified with women, any more than the masculine is felt to be synonymous with men.

Part 2, "Masculine Archetypes and the Bible," discusses ten classic archetypes as they appear in Scripture. E.g., under "patriarch," Abraham as an archetype is very generous and kind; the "patriarch" treats others as his own children. A. considers John XXIII a latter-day patriarch "who heard an inner voice that told him, in effect, 'Get up and move the Church to a land I will show you!'" A. also shows the shadow side of these archetypes; in Abraham, hospitality toward strangers is ironically contrasted with hostility toward his own sons, Ishmael and Isaac. Part 3 discusses the necessity of masculine theology and "why God would choose to reveal himself definitively to the world in the person of a male" (175).

What I most appreciate about this book is the passion with which it is written. It is free from a politics of guilt. It is straightforwardly about adult men, not about the *puer aeternus* so attractive in today's culture. Admittedly, A. does not attempt to present a balanced view from all perspectives.

CURTIS C. BRYANT, S.J.

St. Luke Institute, Suitland, Md.

RELIGIOUS LIFE: A PROPHETIC VISION. By Diarmuid O'Murchu, M.S.C. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria, 1991. Pp. 259. \$9.95.

O'Murchu believes that the Church needs a new paradigm to understand and to revitalize religious life and that he has discerned such a paradigm not only in the history of religious life in Christianity, but also in other world religions. He maintains that religious life, when it is vibrant in any religion, lives on the margins (liminal identity) of church life and lives from what he calls archetypal

values. As liminal, religious embody the deepest ideals of a society and thus challenge and inspire the society toward its ideals. These deepest ideals express the archetypal values imbedded in each person. In an historical overview O. tries to show that each form of religious life begins as a prophetic movement and then goes through a vitality curve of growth and decline which may and often does lead to its extinction. Decline begins when a religious group loses touch with its archetypal values and becomes too assimilated to the larger society of which it is a part.

O. also applies his theory of liminality and archetypal values to understand in a new way the three vows of religious life, and, finally, he looks to religious life in the 21st century. The book is wide-ranging and stimulating, raises important issues, and forces religious to reflect deeply on their life. Just as the concept of archetypes is somewhat opaque in Jung's writings, so too here. Moreover, scholars of Eastern religions might have problems with O.'s generalizations which equate religious life in Christianity with its forms in other religions. Finally, theories of religious life will not revitalize a congregation or a province; only committed and zealous religious can do that. At the same time a book such as this one can help religious find the still-glowing embers of the "fire in the belly" that is needed for revitalization.

WILLIAM A. BARRY, S.J.

Boston, Mass.

ECUMENISM IN TRANSITION: A PARADIGM SHIFT IN THE ECUMENICAL MOVEMENT? By Konrad Raiser. Translated from the German by Tony Coates. Geneva: WCC, 1991. Pp. vii + 132. \$12.95.

The overwhelming impression of observers of the ecumenical scene is that the movement has entered a period of stagnation. So argues Konrad

Raiser, the former deputy general secretary of the World Council of Churches. His book analyzes the changes which he sees as redefining the ecumenical movement over the last twenty years and suggests the emergence of a new paradigm.

In the past, the ecumenical movement was based on a Christocentric universalism which presumed the lordship of Jesus and a theological concept of salvation history. This paradigm legitimated the search for the unity of the Church. W. Visser 't Hooft was its leading advocate. R. can only suggest the outlines of the paradigm he sees emerging. Building largely on the thinking of Philip Potter, he develops the idea of the oikoumene as the one household of God, the real and endangered relationships between churches, cultures, peoples, societies, and religions in all their variety. From this perspective, the ecumenical task becomes one of manifesting the unity already given.

Full unity becomes an eschatological reality, the Eucharist its tangible anticipation. At the end, R. focuses on two "test samples" for the new paradigm. First, he suggests that a fellowship such as the WCC, precisely because it has no institutional authority and must rely only on its power to convince, "is the only appropriate expression for the fellowship of the church at world level" (116). Second, he suggests that a conciliar process which continues to address issues of justice, peace, and the integrity of creation offers a way to learn how to live together in the household of God.

R. may too easily assume the finality of the "reconciled diversity" model favored by the confessional churches. His book is not easy reading. But it is the work of one long involved with the WCC, and it suggests a way of seeing beyond the present impasse.

THOMAS P. RAUSCH, S.J.

Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

BOOKS RECEIVED

SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

- Accents of God.* Ed. M. Rohani. Oxford: Oneworld, 1991. Pp. 94. \$12.95.
- Bailey, J., and L. Vander Broek. *Literary Forms in the New Testament.* Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 219. \$14.95.
- Balthasar, H. von. *Paul Struggles with His Congregation.* S.F.: Ignatius, 1992 [1988]. Pp. 90. \$6.95.
- Barclay, J. *Obedying the Truth.* Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991 [1988]. Pp. 298.
- Beker, J. *Heirs of Paul.* Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 146. \$8.95.
- The Bible and Modern Literary Criticism: A Critical Assessment and Annotated Bibliography.* Ed. M. Powell. N.Y.: Greenwood, 1992. Pp. 469. \$65.

- Buttrick, D. *The Mystery and the Passion.* Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992. Pp. 246.
- Casey, P. *From Jewish Prophet to Gentile God.* Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 197. \$20.95.
- Castelli, E. *Imitating Paul.* Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 176. \$15.95.
- Crenshaw, J. *Old Testament Story and Faith.* Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 480. \$19.95.
- Fee, G. *Gospel and Spirit.* Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 143.
- Felber, A. *Ecclesia ex gentibus congregata (Jos 2).* Graz: Institut für Ökumenische Theologie und Patrologie, 1991. Pp. 197.
- Grappe, C. *D'un temple à l'autre.* Paris: Presses Univ. de France, 1992. Pp. 371. Fr. 380.

Theological Studies

SEPTEMBER 1992
VOL. 53, NO. 3

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Theological Faculties of the Society of Jesus
in the United States*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- The Faith of Jesus**
Gerald O'Collins, S.J. and Daniel Kendall, S.J...... 403
- The Magisterium of the Faculty of Theology of Paris in the
Seventeenth Century**
Jacques M. Gres-Gayer 424
- Moral Imagination in Theological Method and Church
Tradition: John Henry Newman**
Gerard Magill..... 451
- The Holy Spirit and Theology of the Cross: Significance and
Dialogue**
Harold Wells..... 476
- The Problem of Socialism in Liberation Theology**
Peter Burns, S.J...... 493

CURRENT THEOLOGY

- A Decade of Research on the Saints: 1980–1990**
Lawrence S. Cunningham..... 517

NOTE

- Final Causality: A Response**
Edward T. Oakes, S.J...... 534

BOOK REVIEWS

- WEINFELD, M.: Deuteronomy 1–11**..... 545
- MURPHY, R.: The Song of Songs**..... 547
- THEISSEN, G.: The Gospels in Context**..... 548
- LOHSE, E.: Theological Ethics of the New Testament**..... 550
- MCGINN, B.: The Foundations of Mysticism**..... 552
- ALSTON, W.: Perceiving God**..... 554

LEFTOW, B.: Time and Eternity	556
LACUGNA, C.: God for Us	558
GUNTON, C.: The Promise of Trinitarian Theology	560
CASE-WINTERS, A.: God's Power	561
ALTIZER, T.: Genesis and Apocalypse	562
HOFMEISTER, H.: Truth and Belief	564
RUBIN, M.: Corpus Christi	566
TAYLOR, L.: Soldiers of Christ	568
BIALAS, M.: Mysticism of the Passion in St. Paul of the Cross	569
SHANKS, A.: Hegel's Political Theory	571
MERRIGAN, T.: Clear Heads and Holy Hearts	572
COLOMBO, J.: An Essay on Theology and History	574
Bibliographic Guide to Comparative Study of Ethics (ed. J. Carman and M. Juergensmeyer)	576
CESSARIO, R.: The Moral Virtues and Theological Ethics	578
LUKER, R.: The Social Gospel in Black and White	580
Towards a Society That Serves Its People (ed. J. Hassett and H. Lacey)	582
BEBBIE, J.: Voicing Creation's Praise	584
 SHORTER NOTICES	 586
VISOTZKY, B.: Reading the Book of Isaiah	
Jewish Prayer	
Muñoz, R.: The God of Christians	
RUF, F.: The Creation of Chaos	
SMITH, C.: The Emergence of Liberation Theology	
RAHNER, K.: Humane Society and the Church of Tomorrow	
SPRETNAK, C.: States of Grace	
BAUMEISTER, T.: Genese und Entfaltung der altkirchlichen Theologie des Martyriums	
TAFT, R.: The Diptychs	
WYBREW, H.: The Orthodox Liturgy	
MCGUIRE, B.: The Difficult Saint	
NUTH, J.: Wisdom's Daughter	
DORAN, S.: Princes, Pastors, and People	
FENVES, P.: A Peculiar Fate	
FERREIRA, M.: Transforming Vision	
PATTISON, R.: The Great Dissent	
HANDY, R.: Undermined Establishment	
FOWL, S., and L. JONES: Reading in Communion	
JONES, D.: Code of Peace	
MATHIEU, D.: Preventing Prenatal Harm	
HITCHCOCK, J.: The Web of the Universe	
ARNOLD, P.: Wildmen, Warriors, and Kings	
O'MURCHU, D.: Religious Life	
RAISER, K.: Ecumenism in Transition	
 BOOKS RECEIVED	 601

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES (ISSN 0040-5639) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057. Second class postage paid at Washington, DC and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER, please send address changes to THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION 1992: U.S. individual: \$18; U.S. institutional: \$25; foreign individual: \$25 U.S. currency; foreign institutional: \$30 U.S. currency.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS and all correspondence dealing with subscriptions should be sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy or a computer printout of letter-perfect quality and a legible duplicate), TOGETHER WITH RETURN POSTAGE, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02167, USA. Author should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, 37 and O. Sts., N.W., Washington, DC 20057, USA.

BACK ISSUES are available from Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057, USA. Single copies prepaid: \$6 in U.S.; \$8 outside U.S.

FOR REPRINTS AND EARLIER ISSUES IN MICROFORM (35mm. and fiche), contact University Microfilms, Inc., 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1356, USA; phone (313) 761-4700.

Our September issue contains five articles, a survey of current theology, and a note. There are themes from biblical, fundamental, historical, systematic, spiritual, and liberation theology, as well as a further contribution to the science–theology discussion.

The Faith of Jesus takes up the much-neglected issue of the faith exercised by Jesus during his earthly life. Although the International Theological Commission has made obvious openings in this direction, theology has scarcely begun to analyze Jesus' role not only as the enabler and facilitator of faith, but also as its model and exemplar. GERALD O'COLLINS, S.J. of Rome's Gregorian University, long known for his books and articles in fundamental theology, and DANIEL KENDALL, S.J. of the University of San Francisco, who earned his doctorate under O'Collins at the Gregorian in 1975, have fruitfully collaborated several times, most recently in a study of "The Uniqueness of the Easter Appearances" in the April, 1992 *Catholic Biblical Quarterly*.

The Magisterium of the Faculty of Theology of Paris in the Seventeenth Century presents a fascinating account of what was perhaps the last significant resistance to the transfer of ecclesiastical teaching authority "from those who had acquired knowledge to those who received power." JACQUES M. GRES-GAYER, with doctorates in history from the Sorbonne and in theology from the Institut Catholique of Paris, is associate professor and chair of the Department of Church History at the Catholic University of America. A specialist in Gallicanism and Jansenism, he recently published *Theologie et Pouvoir en Sorbonne* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1991).

Moral Imagination in Theological Method and Church Tradition: John Henry Newman explains how the integration of three characteristics of discernment—dynamic, holistic, and subjective—in the moral imagination illumines Newman's view of theological method and church tradition. GERARD MAGILL, Ph.D. from Edinburgh University and assistant professor in the Department of Theological Studies at St. Louis University, has edited two volumes of essays on Newman which will appear shortly and is completing a book-length study on Newman: *Moral Theology and the Imagination*.

The Holy Spirit and Theology of the Cross: Significance for Dialogue argues that the doctrine of the Spirit, especially when understood within the genre of "theology of the cross," holds potential for both interfaith discussion and the dialogue of Christians with the secular world. HAROLD WELLS, Ph.D. from McGill University, is associate professor of systematic theology and director of advanced degree studies at Emmanuel College in the Toronto School of Theology. With particular interests in Christology, Pneumatology, and theological

method, as well as liberation and contextual theologies, he is co-editor of *A Long and Faithful March* (Toronto, 1989).

The Problem of Socialism in Liberation Theology examines Latin American liberation theology's association with and preference for socialism, analyzes criticisms of this position—some justified, some not—and points out the serious analyses liberation theology must undertake if it is to answer its critics and establish an authentically distinct future for itself. PETER BURNS, S.J., who recently completed his M.Div. at the Jesuit School of Theology in Berkeley, is continuing his studies along with pastoral work in London.

A Decade of Research on the Saints: 1980–1990 surveys research written on the saints from the perspective of theology and spirituality. LAWRENCE S. CUNNINGHAM, S.T.L. from the Gregorian University and Ph.D. from Florida State University, is professor and chair of the Department of Theology at the University of Notre Dame. His *Thomas Merton: Spiritual Master* (Paulist, 1992) is about to appear, and he is working on a study of the spirituality of Dante's *Divine Comedy*.

Final Causality: A Response argues, in reaction to C. Mooney, "Theology and Science: A New Commitment to Dialogue," *TS* 52 (1991) 289–329, that the substantive issue of final causality offers more hope for fruitful dialogue than does a discussion of the limitation of the mind of the scientist and the theologian. EDWARD T. OAKES, S.J., Ph.D. from Union Theological Seminary, recently published "Apologetics and the Pathos of Narrative Theology," *Journal of Religion* 72 (1992) 35–58; he is now preparing a study of the Christology of Hans Urs von Balthasar.

Robert J. Daly, S.J.
Editor

- Grassi, J. *The Secret Identity of the Beloved Disciple*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 135. \$7.95.
- Grelot, P. *What Are the Targums?* Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 144. \$11.95.
- Hawk, L. *Every Promise Fulfilled*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 172. \$14.95.
- Hermeneutics, the Bible and Literary Criticism*. Ed. A. Loades and M. McLain. N.Y.: St. Martin's, 1992. Pp. 199. \$45.
- Metzger, B. *The Text of the New Testament*. 3d ed. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1992. Pp. 310. \$16.95.
- Pardes, I. *Countertraditions in the Bible*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ., 1992. Pp. 194. \$29.95.
- Parker, D. *Codex Bezae*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1992. Pp. 349. \$85.
- Reading the Text*. Ed. S. Prickett. Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell, 1991. Pp. 354. \$54.95.
- The Revised Psalms of the New American Bible*. N.Y.: Catholic Book, 1991. Pp. 287. \$4.95.
- Reynier, C. *Évangile et mystère*. Paris: Cerf, 1992. Pp. 321. Fr. 165.
- Robbins, V. *Jesus the Teacher*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992 [1984]. Pp. 249.
- Smith, D. *John among the Gospels*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992. Pp. 210.
- Weaver, D. *Matthew's Missionary Discourse*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1990. Pp. 250. \$50.
- Pannenberg y E. Jünger*. Madrid: Univ. Pont. Comillas, 1992. Pp. 392.
- Chinnici, R. *Can Women Re-Image the Church?* N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 110. \$6.95.
- Christian Uniqueness Reconsidered*. Ed. G. D'Costa. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990. Pp. 218. \$34.95; \$16.95.
- Collected Works of Bernard Lonergan* 3. Ed. F. Crowe and R. Doran. Toronto: Univ. of Toronto, 1992. Pp. 875. \$95; \$35.
- The Future of Liberation Theology*. Ed. M. Ellis and O. Maduro. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1989. Pp. 518. \$29.95.
- Griffiths, P. *An Apology for Apologetics*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 113. \$39.95; \$16.95.
- Habermas, Modernity, and Public Theology*. Ed. D. Browning and F. Fiorenza. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 258. \$24.95.
- Hartmann, W. *Der Gedanke der Menschwerdung bei Novalis*. Freiburg: Herder, 1992. Pp. 190. DM 38.
- The Joseph Campbell Phenomenon*. Ed. L. Madden. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral, 1992. Pp. 168. \$10.95.
- Kassian, M. *The Feminist Gospel*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1992. Pp. 287. \$11.95.
- Keenan, J. *The Meaning of Christ*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1989. Pp. 312. \$29.95; \$16.95.
- Keshishian, A. *Conciliar Fellowship*. Geneva: WCC, 1992. Pp. 144. \$11.50.
- Laurentin, R. *The Meaning of Consecration Today*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1992. Pp. 208. \$11.95.
- Legrand, L. *Unity and Plurality*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1990 [1988]. Pp. 189. \$18.95.
- Mit dem Rücken zur Transzendentaltheologie*. Ed. R. Hoeps and T. Ruster. Würzburg: Echter, 1991. Pp. 286. DM 39.
- Migliore, D. *Faith Seeking Understanding*. Grand Rapids: Eerd-

SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY

- Beyerhaus, P. *God's Kingdom and the Utopian Error*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1992. Pp. 224. \$12.95.
- Beyleveld, D. *The Dialectical Necessity of Morality*. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1992. Pp. 523. \$55; \$22.50.
- Brown, B. *The Buddha Nature*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1991. Pp. 316. Rs. 225.
- Camino, J. *Recibir la libertad*. W.

- mans, 1991. Pp. 312. \$29.95; \$18.95.
- Mueller, J. *Practical Discipleship*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 175. \$14.95.
- O'Brien, J. *Theology and the Option for the Poor*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 167. \$23.95.
- O'Neill, J. *The Bible's Authority*. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1991. Pp. 323. \$24.95.
- Ogden, S. *Christ Without Myth*. Dallas: Southern Methodist Univ., 1991 [1961]. Pp. 191. \$9.95.
- Ogden, S. *Is There Only One True Religion or Are There Many?* Dallas: Southern Methodist Univ., 1992. Pp. 114. \$13.95; \$6.95.
- Ogden, S. *On Theology*. Dallas: Southern Methodist Univ., 1992 [1986]. Pp. 160. \$9.95.
- Ogden, S. *The Point of Christology*. Dallas: Southern Methodist Univ., 1992 [1982]. Pp. 191. \$9.95.
- Ogden, S. *The Reality of God and Other Essays*. Dallas: Southern Methodist Univ., 1992 [1963]. Pp. 237. \$10.95.
- Ormerod, N. *Grace and Disgrace*. Newtown, Australia: Dwyer, 1992. Pp. 212. \$9.95.
- Pedersen, O. *The Book of Nature*. Vatican City: Vatican Observatory; and Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1992. Pp. 92. \$9.95.
- Placher, W., and D. Willis-Watkins. *Belonging to God*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 192. \$9.99.
- Radical Pluralism and Truth: David Tracy and the Hermeneutics of Religion*. Ed. W. Jeanrond and J. Rike. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. 296. \$34.50.
- Samartha, S. *One Christ—Many Religions*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1991. Pp. 190. \$39.95; \$16.95.
- Sine, T. *Wild Hope*. Dallas: Word, 1991. Pp. 343.
- Stannard, B. *The Cosmic Contest*. Southport, U.K.: CARIB, 1992. Pp. 304.
- Thielicke, H. *Modern Faith and Thought*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990. Pp. 582. \$35.
- Wells, G. *Belief and Make-Believe*. La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1991. Pp. 328. \$36.95; \$16.95.
- World Religions and Human Liberation*. Ed. D. Cohn-Sherbok. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 143. \$39.95; \$16.95.

HISTORICAL

- Abelove, H. *The Evangelist of Desire: John Wesley*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford Univ., 1990. Pp. 136. \$25.
- Amengual i Batle, J. *Llengua i catecisme de Mallorca*. Mallorca: Institut d'Estudis Balearics, 1992. Pp. 269.
- Arrington, L., et al. *Building the City of God*. 2d ed. Champaign, Ill.: Univ. of Illinois, 1992. Pp. 496. \$16.50.
- Augustine: *From Rhetor to Theologian*. Ed. J. McWilliam. Waterloo, Canada: Wilfrid Laurier Univ., 1992. Pp. 237. \$35.
- Avis, P. *Anglicanism and the Christian Church*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989. Pp. 335.
- Barcatta, B. *A History of the Southern Vicariate of Colombo Sri Lanka*. Sri Lanka: Montefano, 1991. Pp. 590. \$30.
- Barlow, P. *Mormons and the Bible*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1991. Pp. 251.
- Becker, J. *The Re-Formed Jesuits 1*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1992. Pp. 422. \$19.95.
- Bowden, J. *Who's Who in Theology*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 152. \$18.95.
- Chidester, D. *Religions of South Africa*. N.Y.: Routledge, 1992. Pp. 286. \$24.50.
- Conflict and Competition*. Ed. E. Cleary and H. Stewart-Gambino. Boulder, Col.: Lynne Rienner, 1992. Pp. 234. \$35; \$16.95.
- Coogan, R. *Erasmus, Lee and the Cor-*

- rection of the Vulgate.* Geneva: Droz, 1992. Pp. 125.
- Dolan, T. "Some Seed Fell on Good Ground." Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America, 1992. Pp. 300. \$29.95.
- Ecrits apocryphes sur les apôtres 2.* Corpus christianorum series apocryphorum 4. Ed. L. Leloir. Turnhout: Brepols, 1992. Pp. lx + 408. Fr.b. 5,000.
- Fastiggi, R. *The Natural Theology of Yves de Paris (1588-1678).* Atlanta: Scholars, 1991. Pp. 281. \$29.95; \$19.95.
- Gardiner, H. *Edmund Campion.* S.F.: Ignatius, 1992 [1957]. Pp. 180. \$9.95.
- Il cuore indurito del Faraone.* Ed. L. Perrone. Genoa: Marietti, 1992. Pp. 151. L. 34,000.
- Janz, D. *Luther on Thomas Aquinas.* Stuttgart: Steiner, 1989. Pp. 124. DM 38.
- The Jews among Pagans and Christians.* Ed. J. Lieu et al. N.Y.: Routledge, 1992. Pp. 198. \$39.95.
- Las Casas, B. de. *In Defense of the Indians.* DeKalb, Ill.: Northern Illinois Univ., 1992 [1967]. Pp. 385. \$18.
- Leddy, M., et al. *In the Eye of the Catholic Storm.* S.F.: HarperCollins, 1992. Pp. 195. \$14.95.
- Letters of Catharine Cottam Romney, Plural Wife.* Ed. J. Hansen. Urbana: Univ. of Illinois, 1992. Pp. 317. \$32.50.
- Neusner, J. *An Introduction to Judaism.* Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 471. \$24.95.
- Neusner, J. *Judaism without Christianity.* Hoboken, N.J.: KTAV, 1991. Pp. 138. \$16.95.
- The Organizational Revolution: Presbyterians and American Denominationalism.* Ed. M. Coalter et al. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 400. \$16.95.
- Nuttall, G. *The Holy Spirit in Puritan Faith and Experience.* Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1992 [1946]. Pp. 192. \$12.95.
- Paris, P. *Black Religious Leaders.* Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 326. \$15.95.
- Patron Saint of the New World: St. Joseph.* Ed. J. Chorpenning. Philadelphia: St. Joseph's Univ., 1992. Pp. 61. \$14.95.
- Plunkett, D. *Queen of Prophets.* N.Y.: Doubleday, 1992. Pp. 114. \$8.
- The Pluralistic Vision: Presbyterians and Mainstream Protestant Education and Leadership.* Ed. M. Coalter et al. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 402. \$15.95.
- Religion in History/La religion dans l'histoire.* Ed. M. Despland and G. Vallée. Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier Univ., 1992. Pp. 252. \$24.95.
- Religion, the Independent Sector, and American Culture.* Ed. C. Cherry and R. Sherrill. Atlanta, Ga.: Scholars, 1992. \$34.95; \$19.95.
- The Secularization of the Academy.* Ed. G. Marsden and B. Longfield. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1992. Pp. 323. \$35; \$15.95.
- Slawson, D. *The Foundation and the First Decade of the National Catholic Welfare Council.* Washington, D.C.: Catholic Univ. of America, 1992. Pp. 380. \$55.95.
- Tsirpanlis, C. *Introduction to Eastern Patristic Thought and Orthodox Theology.* Collegeville: Liturgical, 1991. Pp. 277. \$16.95.
- Van de Paverd, F. *St. John Chrysostom, The Homilies on the Statues.* Rome: Pont. Inst. Studiorum Orientalium, 1991. Pp. 395.
- Wilkes, P. *In Mysterious Ways.* N.Y.: Avon, 1992. Pp. 252. \$4.99.
- Wolkovich-Valkavicius, W. *Lithuanian Religious Life in America 1: Eastern U.S.* Norwood, Mass.: LRLA, 36 St. George Ave., Norwood, MA 02062-4420, 1991. Pp. 629.

MORALITY AND LAW

- Boulton, W. *Out of Step.* Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1992. Pp. 106. \$26.50; \$11.75.

- Bratton, S. *Six Billion and More*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 217. \$12.95.
- Cahill, L. *Women and Sexuality*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 85. \$4.95.
- Cameron, N. *The New Medicine*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1991. Pp. 187. \$11.95.
- Corecco, E. *The Theology of Canon Law*. Pittsburgh: Duquesne Univ., 1992. Pp. 172. \$21.50.
- Elshtain, J., et al. *But Was It Just? Faith and the Intifada*. Ed. N. Ateek et al. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 207. \$13.95.
- Fuller, R. *Ecology of Care*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 118. \$12.95.
- Gabel, V. M. *Intentionalität des Geistes bei Max Scheler*. Dresden: Benno, 1991. Pp. 250. DM 48.
- Graham, G. *The Idea of Christian Charity*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Notre Dame, 1990. Pp. 190. \$24.95.
- Lejeune, J. *The Concentration Can*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1992. Pp. 216. \$12.95.
- McNeal, P. *Harder than War*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers Univ., 1992. Pp. 316. \$40.
- Machan, T. *Individuals and Their Rights*. La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1989. Pp. 250. \$32.95; \$16.95.
- Morreim, E. *Balancing Act: The New Medical Ethics of Medicine's New Economics*. Boston: Kluwer Academic, 1991. Pp. 184. \$49.
- Petrà, B. *Tra cielo e terra*. Bologna: EDB, 1991. Pp. 284. L. 30,000.
- Pieper, J. *Abuse of Language, Abuse of Power*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1992 [1974]. Pp. 54. \$5.95.
- Remele, K. *Ziviler Ungehorsam*. Münster: Aschendorff, 1992. Pp. 300. DM 49.80.
- Schumaker, M. *Sharing without Reckoning*. Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier Univ., 1992. Pp. 112. \$22.50.
- Social Justice*. Ed. J. Horgan and L. Fuchs. Saint Leo, Fl.: Saint Leo College, 1992. Pp. 184. \$15.95.
- Tilghman, B. *Wittgenstein, Ethics and Aesthetics*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1991. Pp. 193. \$16.95.
- Tillich, P. *Christianisme et socialisme*. Paris/Quebec: Cerf/Laval, 1992. Pp. 546. Fr. 195.
- Trust the Truth*. Ed. R. Smith. Braintree, Mass.: Pope John Center, 1991. Pp. 384. \$17.95.
- Van der Helm, A., and V. Meyer. *Comparer en droit*. Strasbourg: Cerdic, 1991. Pp. 213.
- Villafañe, E. *The Liberating Spirit*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1992. Pp. 270. \$42.50; \$23.50.
- Volf, M. *Work in the Spirit*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1991. Pp. 252. \$32.50.
- The Will to Arise*. Ed. M. Oduyoye and M. Kanyoro. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 230. \$16.95.

PASTORAL, SPIRITUAL, AND
LITURGICAL

- Asian Christian Spirituality*. Ed. V. Fabella et al. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 195. \$16.95.
- Bringle, M. *The God of Thinness*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1992. Pp. 171. \$13.95.
- Catholic Rites Today*. Ed. A. Bouley. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 596. \$29.95.
- The Changing Face of Jewish and Christian Worship in North America*. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1991. Pp. 271. \$32.95.
- Common Journey, Different Paths*. Ed. S. Rakoczy. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 175. \$18.95.
- Dombrowski, D. *St. John of the Cross*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1992. Pp. 223. \$16.95.
- Fernández, D. *The Father's Forgiveness*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1991. Pp. 87. \$5.95.
- Ganss, G. *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1992. Pp. 232. \$11.95.
- Gozier, A. *Prier 15 jours avec Maître Eckhart*. Paris: Nouvelle Cité, 1992. Pp. 117. Fr. 69.

- Hansen, T. *A Secret That's Never Been Told*. Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1992 [1991]. Pp. 106. \$7.95.
- Harris, C. *Creating Relevant Rituals*. Newtown, Australia: Dwyer, 1992. Pp. 116. \$9.95.
- Hessel, D. *Social Ministry*. Rev. ed. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 256. \$13.95.
- Jesuits in Profile*. Ed. C. Boly. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1992. Pp. 190. \$10.95.
- John Paul II, *The Pope Speaks to the American Church*. S.F.: HarperSan Francisco, 1992. Pp. 512. \$18.
- Jones, W. *Trumpet at Full Moon*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 208. \$12.95.
- Kakar, S. *The Analyst and the Mystic*. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1992. Pp. 83. \$15.95.
- Kreeft, P. *Love Is Stronger Than Death*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1992 [1979]. Pp. 121. \$8.95.
- Mann, T. *To Taste and See*. Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1992. Pp. 150. \$11.95.
- Martyn, D. *The Man in the Yellow Hat*. Atlanta, Ga.: Scholars, 1992. \$24.95; \$15.95.
- McGinty, M. *The Sacrament of Christian Life*. Chicago: Thomas More, 1992. Pp. 154. \$12.95.
- Mello, A. de. *Awareness*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1992. Pp. 184. \$15.95.
- The Minister's Annual Manual for Preaching and Worship Planning 1992-1993*. Ed. L. and M. Holck, Jr. Austin, Tx. Church Management, 1992. Pp. 512. \$19.90.
- Moore, D. *The Human and the Holy: The Spirituality of Abraham Joshua Heschel*. N.Y.: Fordham Univ., 1989. Pp. 215. \$29.95.
- Moore, J. *Helping Skills for the Non-professional Counselor*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1992. Pp. 67. \$3.95.
- Moseley, R. *Becoming a Self before God*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1991. Pp. 144. \$13.95.
- Murphy, S. *A Delicate Dance*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 143. \$14.95.
- Normile, P. *Visiting the Sick*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1992. Pp. 139. \$6.95.
- Sawyers, N. *A Personal Grief & A Reasonable Faith*. Flemington, Mo.: Dogwood, 1991. Pp. 138. \$11.95.
- Sobosan, J. *Bless the Beasts*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. 144. \$10.95.
- Stages of Faith and Religious Development*. Ed. J. Fowler et al. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. 280. \$27.50.
- Teologia spirituale*. Ed. M. Gioia. Rome: A.V.E., 1991. Pp. 293. L. 32,000.
- Thomas, L., and J. Alkire. *Healing as a Parish Ministry*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1992. Pp. 176. \$7.95.
- Timmerman, J. *Sexuality and Spiritual Growth*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 160. \$12.95.
- Valles, C. *Courage to Be Myself*. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1991. Pp. 237. \$7.
- Wallace, R. *They Call Her Pastor*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1992. Pp. 204. \$14.95.
- The Way of Ignatius Loyola*. Ed. P. Sheldrake. St. Louis, Mo.: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1991. Pp. 270. \$29.95.
- Zuercher, S. *Enneagram Spirituality*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1992. Pp. 172. \$8.95.

PHILOSOPHY, OTHER DISCIPLINES

- Allan, G. *The Realization of the Future*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1990. Pp. 318. \$18.95.
- Contemporary Classics in Philosophy of Religion*. Ed. A. Loades and L. Rue. LaSalle, Ill.: Open Court, 1991. Pp. 616. \$50; \$20.
- Ford, N. *When Did I Begin?* N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1991 [1988]. Pp. 217. \$37.95; \$16.95.
- Franklin, S. *Speaking from the Depths*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990. Pp. 410. \$27.50.