

BOOK REVIEWS

THE WOMEN'S BIBLE COMMENTARY. Edited by Carol A. Newsom and Sharon H. Ringe. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. xviii + 416. \$19.95.

In 1889 Frances Willard urged young women to study Greek and Hebrew so they could become biblical commentators. Several years later when Elizabeth Stanton looked for scholarly contributors for her projected *Woman's Bible*, those with appropriate biblical credentials declined, fearing participation would compromise their careers. Stanton proceeded without their expertise. The appearance of the *Woman's Bible* in 1895 shocked many. Some feminists publicly dissociated themselves from it. Now, 100 years later a superb scholarly work exists which would have won highest praise from Willard and Stanton. Superlatives cannot do it justice. Yes, feminist scholarship has come a long way since 1889.

Many contemporary feminist scholars have done excellent critical works focusing on different books or passages, but the overview that only an in-depth analysis of each book offers was missing. In a sensitive yet straightforward way, the authors challenge the most basic and accepted biblical images of God and God's relation to humankind, especially gender-related ones (e.g. husband/wife). The collective impact of the role violence plays in the Bible stunned this reader—especially the violence directed against women and their bodies.

Scholars, teachers, and preachers need to counteract the effect such texts continue to have, lest people internalize harmful assumptions and usages. What does it mean to feminize cities and nations, and then set up God in a marital relationship, punishing, often brutally, his "wife" to heal a broken relationship, to return to a former intimacy? Does this mean God condones wife battering? Such texts appear to say "yes." In Jeremiah 13 God rapes the female nation because of its sins. Does that justify raping women perceived as sinners? What about prostitution as metaphor for infidelity, and menstruation as symbol of shame and humiliation? Today's prostitute is too often victim, not sinner. Menstruation should function as sign of creative potential. Can we remove this sexist bias from Scripture without destroying its message? Our commentators leave this problem unresolved. The continuing appropriateness of such images must be questioned. Without better images we risk alienating entire generations of women from the Church.

Stanton's book focused on verses of particular relevance to women.

By including even the apocryphal books and thought-provoking reflections on texts notable for the absence of women or where women are mentioned only in passing, the new Commentary goes much further. For example, Job's wife is usually brushed off as an unsympathetic nag. In the Septuagint and the Testament of Job she speaks of her own sufferings, recognizing the conflict between innocence and integrity, and God's goodness. She urges Job to say what is really in his heart. For seven days he ponders her troubling remarks. His patriarchal image of God, based on rights and justice, intensifies his suffering to the point that he longs for death. God as power for life challenges these assumptions with a radically different understanding of reality which balances the needs of *all* creatures, not just patriarchs. It is not enough that we understand the significance of every woman who appears or every gender-related statement. Job seen through feminist eyes highlights the presence of the depatriarchalizing principle ignored by most scholars for centuries. This makes the Commentary a particularly valuable resource.

To underscore liberating messages for women in books seemingly by, for, and about men and male concerns, the texts must be read through the lenses of women's multiple experiences in ancient and modern contexts (something the title wants to stress). After a brief résumé of a given book and consideration of critical problems, the authors proceed with deft strokes to raise hard and difficult questions about women's situation and make visible the invisible values and assumptions of the biblical authors, unmasking the dominant (patriarchal) culture. Their efforts enrich our understanding and appreciation of the text.

Is it legitimate to ask questions the original author did not ask? Given the finite limitations of the biblical author and the infinite depth and breadth of God and God's Word, the answer is obvious. In the Bible, women are objects, not subjects of the verbs of religious experience. How else do we discover what God meant to them? To distinguish between the intent of the biblical author and the results of how their words have been interpreted and applied is truly an enormous task, calling for a letting go and an attentive listening to the text.

In contrast, the treatment of some New Testament books proved disappointing after so many new insights gleaned from the Hebrew Scriptures. This probably reflects the obvious. Much of this terrain has already been explored in depth by Christian feminists who have noted how NT literature begins in the context of an egalitarian community and then shifts abruptly from pro to anti-egalitarian structures. Did late NT authors consciously set out to rewrite woman's role? Did they deliberately relegate women to the margins? In the Hebrew Scrip-

tures, authors generally reflect their male patriarchal experience, reinforcing the status quo rather than trying radically to reverse existing customs. Do we then read the NT authors as pragmatists sensing survival depended on conformity to the status quo, or simply as male chauvinists? Did women even protest? What happened to their legacy? In Genesis, patriarchal structures turned women into tricksters. Did something comparable occur in Christianity?

Clearly not intended as a definitive work, this Commentary stands head and shoulders over Stanton's, offering an excellent model of how to engage the text and how to understand the significance of the presence or absence of women. In addition, excellent articles on interpreting the Bible, everyday life for biblical women, and extracanonical writings may even stimulate further questions. How much one takes from this Commentary really depends on how much one brings to it. It is written in such a unique style that any educated person should find it both fascinating and challenging.

George Washington University, D.C.

SONYA A. QUTSLUND

THE COSMIC COVENANT: BIBLICAL THEMES OF JUSTICE, PEACE AND THE INTEGRITY OF CREATION. By Robert Murray, S.J. Heythrop Monographs. London: Sheed and Ward; and Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1992. Pp. xxv + 233. \$24.95.

The creation themes associated with Old Testament covenant thought have not often received attention. Murray, a British Jesuit known especially for his Syriac studies, seeks to rectify this situation through an often detailed analysis of relevant OT texts within their ancient Near Eastern setting. In a final chapter he pursues the effects of these themes in the history of Judaism and Christianity (into medieval times), concluding with an Epilogue regarding contemporary implications.

M. insists on the separate origins of a cosmic covenant, distinct from covenants associated with Abraham, Moses, David, the "Deuteronomic synthesis," and political models. The complex of ideas associated with this covenant (which provide a structure for the book) are: the binding of the cosmic elements by a conventional oath; the breach of this covenant by rebellious divine beings; its re-establishment by God in the "eternal covenant"; the earthly effects of the breach of the cosmic covenant; the ritual preservation of cosmic and earthly order (with links to sacral kingship); the ideal picture of cosmic harmony: humans and animals.

M. appeals to a widely disparate collection of texts, including Genesis 6-9; Isaiah 11, 24, 32-33, 54-55; Jeremiah 33 (on which the

book's title is based); Ezekiel 34; Hosea 2, 4; Joel 1–2; Psalms 46, 72, 73–83, 89; Job 38; and Enoch. Whatever the age of these materials, they “enshrine old mythical material and provide valuable clues to the thematic connections involved in the total picture of the cosmic covenant” (xxi).

M. attends well to the applicable secondary literature (though he has missed some American work). His stress on the symbiotic relationship of cosmic and social orders reveals his debt to the work of H. H. Schmid, and he acknowledges a special affinity with an article by B. F. Batto (“The Covenant of Peace: A Neglected Ancient Near Eastern Motif,” *CBQ* 49 [1987] 187–201). Whether his thesis can be sustained will depend on a detailed consideration of the texts he has gathered and whether they can be said to provide the coherent covenantal picture he claims. However this discussion turns out, M. has provided a service in focusing on these oft-neglected creation themes (he has a special interest in references to the animals, with seven illustration plates). He rightly extends the discussion of creation beyond beginnings and endings to the ongoing issues of order and disorder in the cosmos, the nonhuman world, and human society. Joining a growing chorus, he emphasizes that our conceptualization of divine revelation and God's gracious activity in the world must be conceived in terms that go beyond the usual historical categories. His treatment of messianic themes illustrates some implications of this more inclusive approach.

The book contains a bibliography and the usual indices. The reader is somewhat hampered by a less than lucid style.

Luther Northwestern Seminary, St. Paul TERENCE E. FRETHEIM

THE BOOK OF REVELATION: THE OPEN BOOK OF PROPHECY. By Charles Homer Giblin, S.J. Good News Studies. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1991. Pp. 231. \$14.95.

Giblin is well known for his trenchant and detailed literary analyses of Biblical texts. His subtitle, “The Open Book of Prophecy,” alludes to Rev 22:10 where, in contrast to the apocalyptic emphasis on *sealing* revelatory books until the end (see Dan 12:9), John's angelic guide commands him to leave this book *unsealed*; the task which G. sets for himself is the difficult one of making this “unsealed” book of Revelation intelligible to modern readers.

G.'s introduction to this compact and rewarding mini-course on Revelation focuses on three important yet often neglected features of the book: its literary structure (G. offers a helpful outline-precis), its apocalyptic-eschatological framework, and John's reworking of the major

integrating theme of the work, derived from the Old Testament, God's Holy War. This is followed by an extremely lucid running commentary on the text which tends to focus on the three central emphases of the book. These discussions are accompanied by a careful translation of the Greek text arranged in sense lines to enable the reader to grasp more easily the structure of each section of the text.

G. accepts many of the conventional critical views on authorship, date, and setting. The author is John of Patmos, a Palestinian Jewish-Christian who headed a prophetic school, though he did *not* write the Gospel or Epistles of John. He wrote Revelation about the year 95 from exile on Patmos to seven churches of the province of Asia who were experiencing persecution under Domitian (though recent scholarship suggests that Domitian did not in fact sponsor such a persecution).

G.'s literary analysis (which reflects the salutary influence of Ugo Vanni) assumes the literary unity of the book and is worked out in a very careful and convincing manner. The major part, 4:1–22:11, is divided into seven sections arranged in climactic order; John used a variety of interlocking literary devices for this arrangement. G. attempts to solve the problem of accounting for the various "interludes" (7:1–17 and 10:1–11:14) by considering them, not as intrusions into the literary structure, but as "enlargements" which look ahead to the climax of the book. He accepts the recent suggestion that the seven "letters" in Rev 2–3 are in fact structured as imperial edicts which serve to sharpen the antithesis between Christ and Caesar. He does not regard the serialized events attending the seven seals, trumpets, and bowls, as recapitulations or repetitions of each other (as many since Victorinus have), but thinks that they exhibit an overall progression, i.e. that earlier parts of the vision require the later parts for clarification.

In his use of the Holy War thematic, G. breaks new ground through his insistence that in Rev 4–22, the entire course of the narrative, in all its essential features is structured by the Holy War theme (29–34). His construction of the Holy War theme is dependent on several scholars (particularly G. von Rad and R. de Vaux) who have synthesized the various discrete features of the Holy War in the OT into an ideal type, and he is in dialogue with others who have seen the Holy War theme at work in Revelation, though in different ways and to a lesser extent (A. Yarbro Collins and R. Bauckham). Giblin argues, with Bauckham, that the theme of physical belligerency has been transposed into the theme of suffering witness.

The strength of this book lies in the thoughtful and compelling literary analysis which is the backbone of the book. G. has closely studied the Revelation of John for many years, and his commentary is filled

with important insights into the meaning of the many problematic passages, images and allusions which often hinder the modern reader. An essential feature of this analysis is the way in which G. sees the influence of the theme of the Holy War at work throughout the composition. I enthusiastically commend this volume as one of the best and most balanced recent discussions of the literary structure and meaning of Revelation.

Loyola University, Chicago

DAVID E. AUNE

BUT SHE SAID: FEMINIST PRACTICES OF BIBLICAL INTERPRETATION. By Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza. Boston: Beacon, 1992. Pp. x + 261. \$24.

Schüssler Fiorenza here clarifies and advances the arguments for a critical feminist interpretation for liberation found in her *Bread Not Stone* and also moves the discussion into the realm of rhetorical hermeneutics. She maintains that this latter step challenges the reader to use the biblical passage's rhetorical arguments against its own limited and limiting ideology. Not satisfied with demonstrating the patriarchal disposition of this ideology, she recognizes its elitist, racist, and classist character, thus identifying it as *kyriarchal* (master-headed).

Acknowledging her debt to liberation theologians and critical theorists relative to the question of social location of the reader, she is quite frank about her own political interests. Everyone may not share the extent of her feminist critique of society and church, but the straightforwardness of her position provides them with an opportunity to see how her passion affects yet does not diminish her scholarship.

The book is envisioned as a spiraling dance of three main movements: strategies of feminist biblical interpretation; feminist rhetoric of liberation; practices of biblical interpretation. She uses dance as a model to represent her approach, since interpretation is not accomplished in a purely linear fashion but, rather, consists of strategies that must be repeated again and again much like the patterns of a fugue or a dance. This "transformative dance of interpretation" includes intermittent appearances of the hermeneutics of suspicion, of remembrance, of evaluation and proclamation, and of imagination. Other poetic devices structure the work, such as naming the chapters after biblical women who "embody" elements of the method, introducing each chapter with a poem that serves as an "optic" through which the specific theoretical deliberations are viewed.

After briefly explaining several current strategies of feminist biblical interpretation, S. draws the contours of her own method which she identifies as a critical feminist rhetorical approach. Her fundamental concern is that the kyriarchal biases not be reinscribed in contempo-

rary interpretation. To this end she utilizes both historical and literary critical methods to uncover the rhetorical function of the text within its historical context, and then suggests the use of creative forms such as storytelling, bibliodrama, and dance to fashion a different historical imagination within which to recontextualize the message of the text.

Concerned about the rhetorical power of the biblical tradition, she insists that interpretation must be sensitive to the social location of the interpreter and to the power structures operative here as well as to the situations of the original communities. Such a critique liberates the text from any kind of positivism or formalism and opens it to multicultural interpretations. At each step in her argument, she explains her method quite theoretically and then demonstrates it with either her own interpretation or the work of one of her students.

This is not a book to read; it is a book to study. The development of her thought is both precise and well documented, but nonetheless complex. The image of a spiraling dance is a good choice for, while her argument is linear, different themes move in and out of the discussion only to reappear at another turn in the dance. Readers have come to expect penetrating critique, creative theologizing, and intricate literary articulation from this author. They will not be disappointed here.

Catholic Theological Union, Chicago DIANNE BERGANT, C.S.A.

SPUREN DER ALTEN LIEBE: STUDIEN ZUM KIRCHENBEGRIFF DES BASILIUS VON CAESAREA. By Klaus Koschorke. Paradosis. Freiburg, Switzerland: Universitätsverlag, 1991. Pp. viii + 403. Fr.s. 68.

Basil of Caesarea's ecclesial consciousness rested on antinomies. In practice, if not in theory, he had to seek a compromise between the spiritual and the temporal, the charismatic and the institutional, the religious and the secular, baptismal and monastic commitments, human authority and the sovereign lordship of Christ. Koschorke's study explores the ensuing tensions (*Spannungen*), following several of his predecessors, notably P. J. Fedwick and B. Gain. Rather than seeking a resolution, Basil's aim was to work out an acceptable compromise between the various poles underpinning Christian existence. On the one hand, according to Basil, the Church by its very nature is already measured by the criterion of her accordance with the love of Christ and the fulfilment of divine commandments. On the other, the Church is confronted with the public perception and the cycles of Christian identity, particularly vis-à-vis the growing power of the monastic movement, which Basil not so much fostered as tried to control in view of the criticisms leveled against it by church authorities, notably the Council of Gangra.

For Basil the mystery of baptism is the foundation not only of Christian life but also of the monastic vocation. To the question whether baptism administered outside the Church is valid, the several canonical letters, especially those addressed to Amphilochios, provide some answers according to the various levels of separation from the mainstream Church. In treating penance, K. highlights the changes from early rigoristic rules to ones in which, on the unspoken (Platonic) supposition that virtue is knowledge, the emphasis is placed on intellectual enlightenment rather than on corporal punishment. Because of K.'s rejection of the authenticity of *On Baptism*, he says nothing here about discipleship, one of the pivotal terms in Basilian ecclesiology.

The work *Moralia* provides K. with an outline of Basil's plan to reform the contemporary Church on the basis of scriptural teaching. Here, rather than talking of "Amt," K. could have placed more emphasis on Basil's notion of charisma (Moral Rule 60). This Pauline term plays a fundamental role in Basil; it is at the core of his conception of the Church as the charismatic body of Christ. The balancing of the functions or callings, both in the Church and in the ascetic community, is a challenge and test that Basil himself was exposed to, without always faring too well (see, e.g., his disastrous imposition of episcopal ordination on Gregory of Nazianzus).

In his longest chapter, K. addresses the question of the unity of the Church. He considers the very often shaky relationships of Basil with the see of Rome and whether or not a synodal structure of church government is not a most feasible alternative. The question whether unity is compatible with uniformity is not addressed by K., although Basil provides certain clues toward the resolution of this problem which in subsequent history, especially the Latin Middle Ages, played such a dominant role. Himself of an aristocratic ancestry, Basil did not view his role as a bishop as confined to the Church alone. K. describes his involvement with the state—at that time in the hands of Emperor Valens, whom Basil called the "first Christian persecutor of Christians." K. concludes with the discussion of a Church that is under the constant judgment of God, never allowed to rest on or boast of her achievements, always needing to be watchful and ready to fulfil God's will, "for we know not on what day or at what hour the Lord will come" (Matt 24:42). The task of always conforming oneself to the will of God weighs on all, including those who embrace monasticism. (The fulfilling of the will of a founder other than Christ is as foreign to Basil as it was to be to Stephen Muret).

Without detracting from the quality of this excellent study which shows a profound knowledge of both primary and secondary sources, I would question K.'s adherence to the chronology of the *Moralia* and its

preface "De iudicio Dei" (350s–360s rather than 370s) and his dating of the Council of Gangra (340s rather than 360s), both as proposed by Jean Gribomont. K.'s acceptance of the authenticity of the extant correspondence with Apollinarius of Laodicea and his rejection of the authenticity of the work *On Baptism* are other issues which readers should not accept without checking the arguments to the contrary.

K.'s is a historical but not an antiquarian study. Hence it provides modern readers with important ideas as to how to go about solving some of the problems confronting the churches today.

University of St Michael's College, Toronto

PAUL J. FEDWICK

SAINT ANSELM: A PORTRAIT IN A LANDSCAPE. By R. W. Southern. New York: Cambridge University, 1990. Pp. xxiv + 493.

Richard Southern's portrait of Anselm's life and thought is set in the landscape of what he describes as "one of the most momentous periods of change in European history, comparable to the centuries of the Reformation or the Industrial Revolution" (4).

Part 1 takes readers from Anselm's birth in Aosta in 1033 to his search for direction in life, a search that led him to Bec and to Lanfranc at a time when the monastery was engaged in intense intellectual and political activity. Lanfranc's influence on his monastic and intellectual life is set forth, as well as the growing differences in thought and spirituality between them. Part 2 presents Anselm's *Prayers* and *Meditations*. These, his most immediately influential writings, made him an important figure in medieval spirituality. They introduced into devotion a new kind of individual intense feeling, albeit with Anselm's typically rigorous underpinning. They also prepared the way for two of his greatest works, the *Monologion* and *Proslogion*. Anselm's letters in this period reveal his surprisingly new, passionate approach to friendship, which he valued as an exalted development of monastic life.

Part 3 opens with an important analysis of the historical and personal context of the *Cur Deus homo*, and of the work itself. It seems likely that it was at least partially occasioned by objections of Jewish scholars who maintained that God's becoming human and suffering indignities would be irreconcilable with God's supreme dignity and honor. It was written when Anselm was already Archbishop of Canterbury. Nearly a third of S.'s book deals with Anselm's often difficult and even stormy role as archbishop, especially in his struggles for the liberty of the Church, in particular of the monastic community and archepiscopal see of Canterbury. S. portrays Anselm as a brilliant monastic person unable to grasp the profound changes going on in

society and the Church. Part 4 examines the influence of Anselm in relation to his earliest theological disciples, the collectors of his words and letters, and his most important disciple, Eadmer, author of the *Life*. A substantial appendix seeks to unravel the thorny problems concerning the history of Anselm's letters. S.'s great knowledge of manuscripts and problems of codicology offer valuable insights unavailable to those who confine themselves to reading Anselm's texts. A useful index of topics and persons completes the work.

Although stating that he looks at Anselm's works primarily as a historian and so at their context and form without detailed analysis, S. does in fact give insights into their content that can guide or challenge readers of the works. It is often by particular insights that he is most helpful, since he assumes on the reader's part a rather full knowledge of the text and arguments of those among Anselm's works that he discusses. Although the book would be less helpful for those lacking this knowledge, it can still provide them with cautions against some fanciful interpretations.

The work is especially valuable for showing Anselm's development in thought and action. S. should convince students of Anselm that his works cannot be read as if they are an undifferentiated whole unrelated to various periods of his life and development. The presentation of the relations between the *Monologion* and *Proslogion* and of both of these to his monastic life and spirituality should remind contemporary philosophers that they neglect these relations at the price of misunderstanding the whole. The study of Anselm's prayers and meditations should also enlighten those interested in medieval spirituality.

Although S.'s work is a contextual biography and not a detailed analysis of each of Anselm's works, it is somewhat surprising that he should devote some seventy pages to Anselm's influence through "the harvest of friends and disciples" and only mention by name several important works that became authoritative and influential later in the twelfth century and afterwards. The many pages devoted to Eadmer might have been put in an appendix so as to allow room for discussion of, e.g., the *De processione Spiritus Sancti*, a key medieval work for Latins in their discussion with the Greeks. Among many important points seen as authoritative later, Anselm stresses that unity within God prevails "wherever any opposition of relation does not stand in the way"; this phrase, frequently quoted later, even by the Council of Florence, contributed (unfortunately, some would say) to a certain less personalized spirituality in relation to the trinitarian persons. His argument that the Holy Spirit would not be distinct from the Son unless the Holy Spirit proceeded from the Son was a key piece in the Latin defence of the *filioque*.

Again, the *De conceptu virginali et de peccato originali* includes Anselm's very important new view of original sin, a view later adopted by some theologians, including Aquinas. Setting aside the dominant Augustinian view that original sin consists in disordered concupiscence, Anselm sees original sin as a disorder of the will, the deprivation of rectitude or right order of the will to God, with the other disorders only consequent upon this fundamental lack. This marked a fundamental shift in theology and spirituality, a contribution that would have been well worth noting.

Contrasting Anselm with Abelard, S. states that Abelard and Grosseteste "later interpreted Anselm's argument in the *Cur Deus homo* in ways that greatly enlarged its human potentialities. But, for Anselm, the only enlargement was in the sovereignty of God: human nature contributed nothing to its redemption" (453). Since S., of course, accepts the role of the human *in Christ*, he must be thinking of the role of other humans in redemption. But Anselm himself indicates the need of our human activity if Christ's work is to have its effect: "Sacred Scripture," he says, "teaches us everywhere how we are to approach so great a grace in order to share in it and how we are to live under its influence"; there are other similar muted but real indications in the work of the need for a human subjective response. Further, Abelard emphasizes the sovereignty of God in redemption by insisting that the subjective response of love to Christ's display of divine love can be ours only under the graced movement of the Holy Spirit. Thus the contrast S. makes on this point is less than he makes it out to be.

These remarks aside, it is impossible to do justice here to the fascinating details given by S. or to his opinions on many issues. If the work is occasionally repetitious or overly extended in areas that particularly interest S., it still delights because it is written with such clarity, elegance, and with the assurance of someone who, like Anselm himself, has long meditated on his subject and come to his own conclusions. In view of so many fine insights, we are fortunate in having a concluding chapter giving S.'s own excellent summary and assessment of Anselm. S. rejects the usual tag about Anselm: he was neither the last of the Fathers (his methods, more Platonic and Cartesian in spirit, were not theirs) nor was he the first of the scholastics (he did not work from or use authoritative statements to pose questions or seek answers); rather, he developed his theology independently, using careful analysis of works and concepts more than dialectic and avoiding the give-and-take of scholastic disputation. While frankly indicating the limitations of the person he so evidently respects and cherishes, S. is able to show the positive aspect even of the qualities that sometimes led to failures. Much more, he is able to bring out in convincing fashion

the holiness, genius, and extraordinary accomplishments of this fascinating and saintly monk, theologian, and archbishop.

Pont. Inst. of Mediaeval Studies
Toronto

WALTER H. PRINCIPE, C.S.B.

MORALS OF THE HEART (FAWA'ID AL FU'AD). By Nizam ad-Din Awliya. Translated from the Indo-Persian by Bruce B. Lawrence, with an Introduction by Khaliq Ahmad Nizami. New York: Paulist, 1992. Pp. x + 404. \$18.95.

This valuable Sufi text, the title of which might be translated as "lessons to be absorbed in the deepest part of oneself," is a collection of conversations proffered during the course of 188 meetings by the early 14th-century Indian Muslim Shaykh Nizam ad-Din Awliya with his disciple/compiler Amir Hasan Sijzi at Ghiyathpur between the years 1308 and 1322 A.D. With this work, the noted scholar of Islamic mysticism and introducer of this bountiful volume, Khaliq Ahmad Nizami, tells us, "Sufi literature entered a new phase and assumed a more lively, realistic, and concrete form related to actual circumstances. It made Sufi teachings accessible to a broad audience of Indian Muslims."

The history of the text's survival is a story in itself begun with color and enthusiasm in a brief Preface by the retired archivist and distinguished scholar of pre-Mughal India, Simon Digby, followed with mounting energy and exhaustive detail by Khaliq Ahmad Nizami, and finally synthesized for his American readers by the text's translator, Bruce B. Lawrence, with proper credits given to his masters in Persian Sufism and in the art of translation, which he presents in lively and insightful prose.

The result of this crosscultural and transtemporal collaboration is a fascinating and convincingly authoritative first-hand glimpse into the ascetical and mystical path of Sufism as it was lived by a master and processed to others of his time by anecdotal retellings and animated evocations of prior *classical* Arab and Persian lives and embodied virtues, often lyrically highlighted by quotations from mostly Persian poetry. The book is a feast for readers drawn to accounts of disciplined mystical experience and thought, Islamic and comparative, and to religious history and literature, in a particular context and in general.

The spine of the conversations is the implicit narrative of the master-disciple relationship extending, by no means least, to the translator himself. Lawrence, following with the present volume his earlier study *Notes from a Distant Flute: The Extant Literature of Pre-Mughal Indian Sufism*, establishes himself as one of our leading authorities on Indo-Persian Islamic mysticism, and as one of a growing number of

distinguished American scholars who have mastered the language and thought of Islamic mysticism, as it were, from within, through direct association with master practitioners of the present and, through them *in situ*, of the past they have inherited.

It is a devoted work of scholarship, of prose translation, and, most of all, of approximate recreation of the age-old experience of the transmission of a master's teachings over time.

What might be added by way of a shyly offered general suggestion relates to the art of poetry and the elusive realm of the imagination. Lawrence, in close communication with Christopher Shackle of the London School of Oriental Studies, wrestles doggedly with an Indo-Persian couplet's meter and rhyme scheme, only to conclude with an unwanted parody worthy of Gilbert and Sullivan: "Even though He says He'll kill me, / That *He* says it can't but thrill me."

Unfortunately translation of what is authentic religious poetry in another culture cannot be approximated merely by sincerity and knowledge of languages. Indeed, approximation is not the right goal for this realm. One must give play to one's grasp of the authentic in another's voice by imagining what is unstated and what envelopes together the other and oneself. One must imagine what is not discoverable in the other's text: the air and light and aromas and noises one breathes and sees and hears in everyday experience that nourishes one's own heart with its rare spiritual aspiration and inspires oneself to transcend mere translation and thereby to *realize* a mutual experience in it. In simple terms, one must know one's own, especially contemporary, poetry even more deeply than the other's.

Boston University

HERBERT MASON

CHRISTIAN UNITY: THE COUNCIL OF FERRARA–FLORENCE 1438/39–1989. Edited by Giuseppe Alberigo. Proceedings of an International Symposium, Florence 1989. Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium. Louvain: Louvain University, 1991. Pp xii + 685. Fr.b. 3,000.

Like scorpions mating, intent on union but with stingers at the ready, so H. Chadwick graphically, but justly, describes the proceedings of the Council of Ferrara–Florence.

From these essays, in English, French, German, and Italian, intended to clarify the Council's history and draw from it lessons for future ecumenism, certain common themes emerge. Though both sides sincerely desired union, each had further political concerns. The Pope wanted to scotch the Council of Basel and strengthen papal primacy; the Emperor needed Western help to save his Empire from the encroaching Turks. Thus, differences were concealed behind acceptable

formulae without deepening understanding of the bases of these differences. With each side defending long-fortified positions, there was no real effort to discover whether the varying positions on the Trinity, ecclesiology and, of lesser importance, purgatory, were in fact complementary, not contradictory.

The West was influenced by the trinitarian theology of St. Augustine; the Greeks by that of the Eastern fathers. The West conceived the Father as so sharing divinity with the Son that the Spirit proceeds from Father and Son; the Greeks insisted the Spirit proceeds from the Father. Thus the addition of the "filioque" to the Nicene Creed was heresy and further a violation of the Council of Ephesus' prohibition of any addition to the Creed. The fact that the popes had sanctioned this addition compromised for the Greeks the popes' claim to primacy. In Greek ecclesiology, papal jurisdictional primacy was a distortion of the traditional government by the pentarchy, in which the pope had a primacy of honor, subject to the superiority of an ecumenical council called by the emperor. The doctrine of purgatory, analyzed by A. de Halleux in the most perceptive of these essays, was complicated by the West's penitential discipline assigning precise temporal punishment due to each category of sin and insistence on a temporary cleansing fiery punishment before final face-to-face vision of God. As Bessarion himself remarked, the whole scheme was incomprehensible to the Greeks, and was further complicated by the Greeks' rejection of any Origenist-type temporary punishment and their acceptance of the Palamite distinction between the divine essence and energies.

The two sides also differed in theological method. Though the best of the Greeks were no novices in dialectic, they thought it applicable to cosmology and anthropology, not to theology, arguing instead from the Scripture and its interpretation by the Eastern Fathers. They were strongly opposed to Western Scholasticism with its logical precision and to the citation of Western authors of whom they knew nothing. Even when the Westerners dealt with the Greek Fathers, now increasingly known to the West during the Renaissance, they lacked understanding of the hermeneutical milieu familiar to the Greeks.

Opinions seem divided on two of the stalwarts of each side. Giovanni di Montenero is described by one author as a lucid and learned defender of papal primacy, by another as a defender of Dominican interests, insensitive to Greek views and convincing only to the papal curia. Mark Eugenicus, metropolitan of Ephesus, often seen by the West as a long-winded intransigent whose main argument against the Westerners was that they falsified patristic texts, appears (to N. Lossky) as Saint Mark, who well understood the dangers Latin theology and ecclesiology posed to the East and who had deep roots among the monks

and faithful of the Empire. J. Meyendorff is more harsh in his judgment of the Greeks: "Equally tragic was the strictly defensive, uninformed and somewhat provincial attitude of the Eastern churchmen who came to Ferrara-Florence" (167).

However, the agenda of the Council were set by Greek objections to Western tradition, and in the final decree the Greeks were not compelled to use the "filioque" in their Creed, nor to celebrate with unleavened bread, nor to accept the Latin theology of purgatory, and papal jurisdictional primacy was not to prejudice the rights of the patriarchs. Nor did the West complain about Greek dependence on the civil authority in matters of episcopal appointments, synodal decisions and management of property.

Yet there was on the Latin side a lurking suspicion that the Greeks were schismatics to be "received" back into the Church. Nor did Pope Eugene lessen Greek suspicion of papal primacy by refusing to receive the whole Greek delegation publicly when they refused to kiss his foot, nor when he suggested making the papally appointed titular Latin patriarch of Constantinople the successor of the recently deceased Patriarch Joseph, nor when he insisted on retaining some uniate bishops in the Greek East. The Greeks felt justly slighted when their patriarchs were placed below the cardinals in order of precedence, when there was no public Greek Mass following the promulgation of the final decree because the pope and cardinals had first to "inspect" the Eastern liturgy, when there was no intercommunion at the public Latin Mass. Even the final decree issued in the pope's name and dated by his regnal year with a bow to imperial authority in matters conciliar offended the Greeks. Patriarch Joseph had been more sensitive to the niceties of ecclesiastical protocol when he refused to grant his blessing to the crowds until he had asked the pope's permission to do so in his patriarchate.

In the light of the resurgence of the Russian Church it is interesting that the Russians see the Greek Orthodox acceptance of the Council of Florence as the basis for the rise of the Moscovite patriarchate as the defender of orthodoxy but also as the cause of the breakup of the Russian Church by the secession of the Lithuanians, Ukrainians, and Bylo-Russians.

What lessons for the future can be drawn from the failure of the Council? There is need for both West and East to understand better each other's traditions not only at the speculative level but in every aspect of church life and thought. Both sides should examine the bases of their traditions in an attempt to arrive at a sound pluralism, wherever possible accepting variations in traditions as legitimately complementary. This intellectual deepening should be accompanied by

pastoral review by the various hierarchies and a program of education of the faithful at the grassroots level. Perhaps Chadwick best summarizes one last concern of non-Roman Catholics: "Roman ecumenism has often found it difficult to allay a paralysing fear in its ecumenical partners, namely that when the Orthodox or the Anglican churches acknowledge Roman primacy in terms which are the maximum that they can truthfully grant, those terms will be for Rome a minimum, later to be amplified into centralized control and uncongenial uniformity" (239).

Gonzaga University, Florence, Italy

LEO DONALD DAVIS, S.J.

LUTHER'S EARLIEST OPPONENTS: CATHOLIC CONTROVERSIALISTS 1518–1525. By David V. N. Bagchi. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992. Pp. xiii + 305. \$29.95.

This important book studies 180 writings by 57 Catholic controversialists in an attempt to investigate the nature and extent of Catholic use of the printing press at the beginning of the Reformation era. Bagchi imposes a logical division for the various phases of the controversy and then traces the Catholic response to Luther through those phases. Each was dominated by one or another main issue, such as indulgences, papal divine right, the value of Scholasticism, the sacraments, or Luther's appeal to German nationalism and anti-Italianism.

Along the way, B. presents information and analysis that ranges from the intriguing to the commonplace. E.g., few readers will be surprised at his assertion that the controversy hinged, for the Romanists, on their view of the threats that Luther's ideas posed for papal authority. Nor will those familiar with the *Unklarheit* thesis concerning the status of Roman "doctrine" prior to the Council of Trent be surprised at his suggestion that these authors were most at ease and most prolific on topics like transubstantiation, where dogmatic ground was already somewhat cleared, or at his indication of the considerable limits to that clarity. Far more interesting is what B. has to say about the difficulty many of the controversialists had in securing the publication of their ideas, even though subventions were not at all unusual for 16th-century academics who were unable or unwilling to produce shorter, more exciting, and therefore marketable, vernacular texts. The controversialists walked a delicate tightrope in attempting to provide the *rationes* for opposition to Luther that were to be reinforced by Roman authority, as they stood always in danger of appearing to engage in debate with a heretic on a negotiable faith. In addition, they

faced considerable frustration with the Roman curia, as it failed to provide sustained encouragement and financial support for their work and to exploit the possibilities of their international propaganda effort.

Thus B. sheds light on the literary production of these controversialists and its nature, and he rescues them from the oblivion to which they have been consigned by scholars who consider them literary and theological failures. But B. has accomplished a great deal more. He demonstrates how, through the variety of ways in which they responded to Luther, the controversialists produced a creative and variegated literature that included *compendia*, orations, and satire as well as the traditional point-by-point refutation. Some authors adopted and utilized the theory of subordination to papal power implicit in *Unam sanctam*, while others, conscious of the sensibilities of their audience, did not. Still others took a less theoretical, even practical approach, e.g. Simon Blich, who indicated that adaptation of Luther's views concerning the saints would have a decidedly deleterious effect—goldsmiths, jewelers and other craftsmen would be thrown out of work. B. also finds, like James Overfield before him, more hybrid “scholastic humanists,” and thus his book will be of interest for general intellectual history, in addition to the history of Reformation theology.

B. boldly asserts some theses here that are bound to generate controversy. He indicates, e.g., that far from merely responding to Luther's challenge, the controversialists themselves, by pushing him to consideration of the issues of authority behind his religious ideas, not only created Luther the rebel, but inspired his text *To the Christian Nobility*. He is quick to qualify the point elsewhere, indicating that the text is not to be exclusively attributed to their inspiration. He argues, like Remigius Bäumer, that the Romanists were “much less antagonistic to Luther's doctrine of the priesthood of all believers” than we might expect, provided that it did not detract from the ordained priesthood (137–38). Since he indicates, correctly, in my opinion, that the controversialists viewed the notion of the “priesthood of all believers” as a metaphor, quite differently from Luther, whose doctrine on this concept is most clearly expressed in his polemical rejection of the Mass as sacrifice, I am left unconvinced that this literature reflects the genuine lack of “antagonism” B. finds.

Still, B. provides more light on what is becoming a larger and larger tapestry of evidence that rejects the old over-simplifications about the Counter-Reformation and Catholic action in early-modern Europe. It was certainly not uniform. Its participants demonstrated, at times, genuine creativity and adherence to the main lines of Renaissance humanist thought, and the conviction of popes and curialists in the

necessity and importance of anti-Protestant action waxed and waned in an exceptionally human, and truly fascinating, manner.

Bloomsburg University, Pa.

WILLIAM V. HUDON

ISAAC HECKER: AN AMERICAN CATHOLIC. By David J. O'Brien. New York: Paulist, 1992. Pp. ix + 446. \$25.

This is the first full-length biography of Hecker (1819–1888) since Walter Elliott's admiring and ill-fated *The Life of Father Hecker* (1891). Vincent Holden's two biographical Hecker books, *The Early Years of Isaac Thomas Hecker* (1939) and *The Yankee Paul* (1958), while works of sound scholarship, fail to treat the last thirty years of Hecker's life and are limited by their defensive tone. Steering between hagiography and *apologia*, O'Brien brings to life a deeply contextualized Hecker who is both religiously compelling and humanly plausible.

In successive parts, O. traces Hecker's life up to his conversion in 1844 and his decision a year later to enter the Redemptorists, covers his Redemptorist years up until his expulsion in 1857 and the subsequent founding decade of the Paulists, locates Hecker with respect to late-19th-century Catholic anti-Modernism, and brings the story to its political and spiritual conclusions, reviewing the controversies over "Heckerism" during the 1890s.

Relying chiefly on Hecker's diary, O. follows his erratic pilgrimage between New York and New England and into the Catholic Church. O. renders the young Hecker and his precarious emotional states with an honesty lacking in previous treatments. O.'s attention to context lends credibility to Hecker's deep sense of God's presence, his urgent need to construct a self, and the paradigmatic nature of his oft-revised autobiography. This part could be read profitably with John Farina's 1988 edition of *The Diary* close at hand.

In Hecker's experience, religious liberty generated an evangelical imperative. Having introduced his interpretation of Hecker as an "evangelical Catholic" in his contribution to *Hecker Studies* (1983) and *Public Catholicism* (1989), O. places Hecker's dream of a converted America at the center of the present work's longest section and at the heart of Hecker's life. But as the century unfolded, this dream would conflict with the immigrant Church's commitment to parish work and Catholic missions. This tension between mission and maintenance is the key to O.'s interpretation of Hecker's significance as an American Catholic.

O. explores this tension in some detail. While Hecker was interpreting the definition of papal infallibility as a basis for evangelization, the Church at large was moving toward a logic of maintenance and resis-

tance to the modern world. In Chapter 14, one of the book's best, Hecker and Orestes Brownson embody the two opposing 19th-century Catholic responses to Modernity. This contrast is captured in a remarkable set of images (258). Confronting head-on the issue of what Elliott had called Hecker's "long illness," O. relates it to the increasing conflict between Hecker's vision of evangelization and the actual work of Catholic maintenance which increasingly occupied the Paulists.

O.'s treatment of Hecker's last years dwells upon his ambivalence as an evangelical Catholic in Protestant America. While he embraced American voluntarism as the condition of evangelization, Hecker never accepted as permanent the resulting denominational pluralism. He was just as uncomfortable with the sectarian posture of the emerging subculture as he was with the decorous competition of the denominational mainstream. While O. identifies the expectation of a Catholic America and eventually a Catholic world as the "deepest conviction of Hecker's public career" (289), he begins and ends this biography with accounts of Hecker's interior life. Despite his portrayal of Hecker's numerous character flaws (self-pity, self-indulgence, insensitivity, blindness to social injustices, and a sometimes irresponsible flight from conflict), O. successfully conveys the religious depth and authenticity of Hecker's abiding passion for God.

After his death, Hecker would become "the most controversial figure in American Catholic history" (377). The final chapter assesses his posthumous role in the Americanist controversies. The Epilogue situates him between the two contending parties. While conservatives were building an immigrant subculture and liberals were advocating Catholic assimilation to the middle class, Hecker urged middle-class Catholics to go out and convert America. O.'s most timely contribution is his real appreciation for and careful articulation of Hecker's dream of America's conversion and broad understanding of evangelization (399–401), an understanding perhaps more widely shared (e.g. by John Keane or even John Ireland) than O. acknowledges.

Except for an occasional error with a name or a publication date, this modestly priced volume has been well served by the publisher. In addition to the impressive cover photo, it includes 24 photographs, 32 pages of notes (most of which refer to primary sources), and a nine-page index of names. A work of painstaking scholarship and deep contemporary Catholic sensibility, this book is a major contribution to American Catholic studies and *the* standard in Hecker studies. This reviewer has waited more than a decade to read this book. It was definitely worth the wait.

GOD AND HISTORY: ASPECTS OF BRITISH THEOLOGY 1875–1914. By Peter Hinchliff. New York: Oxford/Clarendon, 1992. Pp. 267. \$65.

To explore the relation between the new understandings of history and faith during the late-19th and early-20th centuries is a daunting task, especially in Britain where the impact of German hermeneutics was so telling. Hinchliff's analysis throws a penetrating beam of light into the forest of scholarship in that period. He illumines a fascinating trail that perceptively identifies many similarities and differences of ideas whose variety could all too easily overwhelm the non-specialist. Because his book does not attempt to survey all of the relevant literature it does not constitute a comprehensive account of British theology at the turn of the century. Yet his limited selection of theologians, each astutely located in historical context, enables him to investigate such a difficult terrain in a manageable fashion. In that selection (as suggested by the word "aspects" in the sub-title) H. reveals his own interests while avoiding the danger of idiosyncrasy.

One effective way of glimpsing the multi-layered nature of this book is to view the basic theme of faith and history through the lens of doctrinal development that pervades most of the theological movements H. discusses. After an introductory explanation of historical and religious understanding in 19th-century Britain, sketched insightfully in the context of the question of causality in history and the rise of the historical-critical method, H. turns to John Henry Newman's concept of doctrinal development (1845, revised 1878) to sketch the problem of relating history and theology. While dubious of the rigor and impact of Newman's argument, H. accurately describes Newman's view as analogous to organic development (as distinct from finding some minimal persistent core) and applauds Newman's sensitivity to interpretation as arising from his awareness of the contingency of history (as distinct from Pusey's resistance to development in theology). But H. argues persuasively that it was the idea of development, not Newman's theory, that interested many of the later theological movements in Britain.

In Liberal Protestantism, Benjamin Jowett, the master of Balliol and the perceived leader of Oxford's theological liberals took up the topic of doctrinal development by examining how the Christian religion had changed. Influenced by Thomas Arnold's appeal to common sense as the means of interpreting the text of Scripture, Jowett argued that we do not arrive at a preserved set of dogmas. H. carefully notes that Jowett's propositional statements in belief were merely hints for exploration, not truths as suggested by Newman's theory. For Jowett, H. claims, interpretation resulted in rationally justifiable belief that both fits with experience and is distilled from the historical form of

revelation. With these views on interpretation and development Jowett had a significant influence upon the work of the British Idealists (who, in turn, distanced themselves from the orthodox intuitionism of the common-sense approach).

H. also succinctly contrasts the liberal view of tradition that characterized Oxford with the more conservative view of relating history and tradition that characterized Cambridge, especially the "Cambridge Triumvirate" of Lightfoot, Westcott, and Hort, each associated with Trinity College, and Edward White Benson, Archbishop of Canterbury (1883–96). H. indicates shrewdly that although all were concerned with the principles and methods of textual criticism, they remained convinced that theological questions could somehow be settled by appealing to history, thereby running the danger of making history serve preconceived theological truth.

The British Idealist movement, influenced especially by Thomas Hill Green in Oxford and Edward Caird in Glasgow, both professors of moral philosophy, tried to free religion from its historical context by studying religion philosophically. In a fascinating analysis H. highlights Caird's argument that the science of religion required an understanding of development (the developing way the human mind conceived of religion) as the yardstick for distinguishing the transitory and permanent in religion so that the history of dogma, not the history of Jesus, enshrined religious truth. It was precisely the connection between history and dogma, especially using history as the measure for the truth of theology, that concerned Catholic Modernism. Here H. examines the thought of John Acton, with the rejection of ecclesiastical authoritarianism that characterized his liberal Catholicism, as the forerunner of Modernism. Appropriately, to justify his argument he shows how Acton approached the development of doctrine by understanding Christianity as a history rather than a dogmatic system. Like the modernists, he recognized the importance of submitting dogmatic tradition to critical historical inquiry.

Even the finest studies have limitations, and perhaps the most noticeable weakness in this work is the dearth of connections between British and German scholarship of the day. However, H. serves the reader well by providing a helpful chronological table, an interesting list of suggestions for further reading, and an excellent index of names and topics.

Saint Louis University

GERARD MAGILL

PASSIO CARITATIS: TRINITARISCHE PASSIOLOGIE IM WERK HANS URS VON BALTHASARS. By Thomas Rudolf Krenski. Einsiedeln: Johannes, 1990. Pp. 406.

GOTTESWORT IM MENSCHENWORT: INHALT UND FORM VON THEOLOGIE NACH HANS URS VON BALTHASAR. By Wolfgang Klaghofer-Treitler. Innsbruck: Tyrolia, 1992. Pp. 516. öS 580

EINBERGUNG DES MENSCHEN IN DAS MYSTERIUM DER DREIEINIGEN LIEBE: EINE TRINITARISCHE ANTHROPOLOGIE NACH HANS URS VON BALTHASAR. By Hans Otmar Meuffels. Bonner Dogmatische Studien. Würzburg: Echter, 1991. Pp. xiv + 585. DM 64.

"How can You be at the same time compassionate and without passion?" Anselm asked of God in his *Proslogion*. This same question occupies, in differing ways and from different perspectives, the three books under review.

Krenski wrestles with this issue directly. After reviewing the impasse to which theology was delivered by its axiom of God's *apatheia* and impassibility, he briefly surveys the contemporary scene and shows that a break with the tradition is well-nigh inevitable, noting that an important consequence of such a rupture is "that an apparently unbridgeable cleft opens up between the traditional doctrine of God's incapacity to suffer and the supposedly modern talk about the suffering God" (58). But as the word "supposedly" implies, this tension is not completely new, nor does it arise only from modern challenges such as 20th-century genocide or the impact of process theology. The issue also arises internally from the *communicatio idiomatum*, the doctrine that any attribute that applies to one of Christ's natures applies to the whole of his person as well, so that in some sense we must say that God "suffers" and indeed even "dies." But how can this be understood without either ending up as an evangel of Nietzsche's *kerygma* that God is dead or in a kind of Sabellian modalism in which the Godhead fully undergoes what Jesus experiences?

It is no accident that each of these books has taken up this theological *aporia* by coming to terms with the theology of Hans Urs von Balthasar, for this issue determined the whole shape of his theology. Krenski and Meuffels concentrate on B.'s Theodramatics, while Klaghofer-Treitler focuses more on his Aesthetics and "Theo-logic" (without, however, neglecting the Theodramatics).

Krenski possesses a thorough command not only of the Balthasarian literature but also of the *theologoumenon* of the merciful/passionless God and the contemporary challenge to it. A close reading of this important work makes clear how complex the issue is and how many themes in the Christian dispensation must be marshalled for its satisfactory resolution. Krenski first gathers all those elements that B.

would call an "instrumentary": an analysis of how a concrete form (like a work of art) can express a universal truth *in* its very concreteness (*contra* Plato, who saw the universal behind the manifestation, not in it); the biblical materials of God's love, mercy, wrath, intervention, etc.; the forms of drama as analogues for the biblical drama; and finally the epistemological issue of what kind of perception faith furnishes.

His third chapter is the core of Krenski's book. It is a complex treatise, but its complexity is due to the total interrelatedness of all of the elements of the Christian *kerygma* of redemption: for redemption to be effective, it must redeem *from* suffering, but only *through* it; and it is the indissoluble connection between these two prepositions that accounts for the complexity of the theology (however simple the proclamation of the Church might have been in its earliest stages, as in Acts 2:24, 32–33). Krenski correctly sees that the distinction within the Trinity between Father and Son establishes the "fundament," as he puts it, for all further distinctions: between God and creation, between the abandonment felt by Christ in death and the hovering presence of the Father directing this death to be the salvation of the world, and between the tension of Jesus saving through his suffering and our being saved, eschatologically, from suffering.

This redemption then unfolds in a drama of salvation history that takes place because of the "economic" interplay between the Son's *processio* from the Father and Christ's *missio* on earth to be the incarnation of the Father. But the Incarnation cannot be understood univocally, which would lead to Patripassianism. The resolution of these tensions can only be resolved, in Krenski's interpretation, through an understanding of divine suffering that is analogical. Krenski argues his way to analogy in the same way B. does, negatively. That is, he first rejects what he calls the model of univocation (pain as a moment of God's self-realization) and the model of equivocation (the reduction of pain to God's economy). The rejection of these two alternatives leads to the only other option left: an analogical understanding of movement, suffering, and involvement by God in human history. It has often been urged that the resort to analogy in the history of theology has always been, when logically analyzed, a counsel of despair, an implicit admission that theology cannot really speak of these matters but must continue to do so *faute de mieux*. Krenski does not address this challenge directly, but he does make clear in his initial marshaling of the evidence that the issue will not go away, that the evidence cannot be wished away, and that therefore theology cannot abdicate its responsibilities in the face of its logically daunting task.

Klaghofer-Treitler's book forms an admirable complement to Krenski's for it deals more explicitly with the methodological issues that so

determine B.'s approach. As its title implies, this work is not so much concerned with the dilemmas of passiology as with the prior issue of how the phenomenon of word/form can assume a divine nature and be God's Word and Form in history. This accounts for Klaghofer-Treitler's much greater emphasis on the methodological foundations of B.'s thought in his Aesthetics and also for the continual attention he pays to B.'s Theo-logic, where these themes once more are taken in all their logical complexity.

The reader will come away from this work impressed not only by the author's thorough command of B.'s theology but also by how crucial the role of apologetics is in his thought. The capacity of human words and human forms to take on a divine nature depends not only on God's intervening decision to become man ("grace") but also on the initial capacity of the *humanum* to receive the divine ("nature"). This insight opens the way to an apologetic examination of creation itself as an act of grace (an important theme throughout B.'s theology), something the Church Fathers saw as the *vestigia Dei*. It is also for Klaghofer-Treitler the basis for the possibility of the sanctity of the Christian becoming a true agent and continuation of the Incarnation in the history of salvation after the coming of Christ, which is why a treatment of the saints and of the specifically *katholische Denkform* assumes so important a role in his presentation.

This is a theme that constitutes the heart of Meuffels's dissertation. Here everything revolves around the issue of anthropology, and for that reason the question of apologetics is especially determinative. Beginning with a presentation of "man today," Meuffels proceeds to show how anthropology forms a *Herzstück* of B.'s theology, and then shows how inherently dramatic this anthropology is, understood under the rubric of God's "world drama" with the whole of the human race.

This book, as one would expect of a dissertation, hews closely to the direction and outline of B.'s Theodramatics, but Meuffels shows an admirable familiarity with the whole corpus of B.'s theology and continually points to the interconnections between particular points made there with statements located in other works, including the collected essays.

One feature I particularly appreciated was Meuffels's stress on the positivity of the other (258–68). There is today a new resurgence of interest in "negative theology," but in that renewal of interest there is, in my opinion, the danger that the positivity of creation (and therefore its being "positively good") might be overwhelmed, making creation and the drama of salvation seem less crucial than it is or revelation less revelatory than it is. Meuffels, however, makes clear that the *Einbergung* of man in the mystery of the triune love does not overwhelm by drowning the creature but by exalting the creature to be "no

longer servant, but friend" (John 15:14–15). And friendship demands a positivity of standing over against the other; without that, the whole world would collapse into the *maya* of pure illusion.

I happen to have read these three works in the order reviewed, and I cannot help in retrospect but regard that as a happy coincidence: Krenski's book is the most demanding of the three, but a thoroughgoing effort to wrestle with the issues he raises provides a superb foundation for understanding the positions B. takes in the other issues stressed by Klaghofer-Treitler and Meuffels.

New York University

EDWARD T. OAKES, S.J.

SINO-VATICAN RELATIONS: PROBLEMS IN CONFLICTING AUTHORITY 1976–1986. By Beatrice Leung. London School of Economics Monographs in International Studies. Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1992. Pp. xix + 415.

When the People's Republic of China was established in Beijing in 1949, the papal nuncio, then in Nanjing, asked for a meeting with Mao Zedong. The reply he got two years later ordered his expulsion from China. He went to Taipei, Taiwan to open the nunciature that still exists. Whenever the Vatican later sought ways to discuss the status of the Catholic Church in China with the regime, Beijing insisted that the Vatican first had to break diplomatic relations with Taiwan. This monograph, a revision of Leung's 1988 doctoral dissertation, centers on the decade after the death of Mao in 1976; a lengthy postscript covers events up to 1990. Although noting that technically the Holy See enters into diplomatic relations with states, Beatrice Leung uses the Vatican as a term of convenience.

After portraying the cultural encounter of China and Christianity from 1552 to 1949, L. analyzes the Vatican's Ostpolitik and its applicability to the Church in China. From 1949 to 1978 China persistently opposed religions in general. The Catholic Patriotic Association (CPA) sought to break the "interference" of the Vatican in China and led to the 1958 consecration of bishops without prior Vatican approval.

The ascendancy of Deng Xiaoping in late 1978 opened a new phase in attitudes towards religion. The United Front policy that all Chinese were to work for the welfare of the state was supported by the CPA and allowed religious activities within limits. L. indicates that the CPA has continued to impose constraints on the nonofficial Church which has remained loyal to the Pope. The 1980 Beijing visits of two cardinals (Roger Etchegaray of Marseilles and Franz Koenig of Vienna) at the invitation of the Chinese were preliminary steps towards a dialogue. The Pope's 1981 speech to overseas Chinese students in Manila

was a further signal. A few months later he conferred the archbishopric of Guangzhou (Canton) on Bishop Deng Yiming (Dominic Tang), who had been released from prison after twenty-two years and was allowed to go to Hong Kong for one year for his health. Although Beijing denounced this papal appointment, there is some evidence that it received prior notification but returned the data unopened.

By early 1984, the bishops of Taiwan met with the Pope to preserve the diplomatic relations of the Vatican and Taipei and to assure him that they were ready to be a bridge between their fellow Catholics on the mainland and the universal Church. The Sino-British agreement about Hong Kong, concluded later that same year, led to the Church's building another bridge to Beijing to maintain religious liberty in the island after 1997. L.'s postscript highlights the Pope's condemnation of the repression in Beijing in June 1989. To protest China's persecution of Catholics, the Pope canceled his planned visit to Macao and Hong Kong in October that year. L. concludes that "the clash between the teaching authority of religion and state will continue if it does not accelerate."

This noteworthy study is marred by errors and unsatisfactory editing. Contrary to L.'s claim, the Kangxi emperor did not force the Jesuits to leave China in 1705, for the next year he ordered all missionaries to apply for a permit to stay in China provided they followed the practices of Ricci concerning the Chinese Rites. Her contention that Ricci was not as successful as St. Paul who preached Christ crucified, whereas Ricci preached "science and astronomy" and made the differences between Catholicism and non-Catholic beliefs "smaller than the truth" is a conclusion that shows a lack of reading of both his Chinese and Western works and the extensive literature about him and his confreres. Contrary to L.'s claim, Chinese Catholic literati were in fact consulted during the early 18th-century Rites controversy, since their opinions were translated into Latin and copies were printed in Rome. Again contrary to her assertion, after the suppression of their Order in 1773 the Jesuits were replaced by the Lazarists who took over the Beitang (North Church) in Beijing in 1785.

More precise editing would have resulted in removing the erroneous reference to Pope Paul VI in Hong Kong in 1959 and his statement about the Great Leap Forward (190); in adding the given names for many of the Westerners; in correctly spelling Costantini, not Constantini; and in accurate romanization of Chinese names (e.g. Luo Guang, not Lokuong). A second edition and any translations into Chinese should take these points into account.

These shortcomings aside, this first lengthy study on contemporary Sino-Vatican relations in English will be welcomed by a wide audi-

ence. Its significant interpretation of a very complex issue will be of special interest to those seeking to understand the Vatican's role in current international affairs.

Georgetown University

JOHN W. WITEK, S.J.

DIVINE INFINITY IN GREEK AND MEDIEVAL THOUGHT. By Leo Sweeney, S.J. New York: Lang, 1992. Pp. xx + 576. \$52.95.

Sweeney has been at work on the subject of infinity for forty years. The present book is largely a compilation of articles published over the years in a variety of journals and books but now arranged in chronological order according to subject matter (first, ancient authors and then medieval ones on the subject of infinity). The result is sometimes a bit repetitious, but the scholarly apparatus at the bottom of each page is truly impressive, exhibiting S.'s mastery of the primary and secondary literature on the subject of infinity in ancient and medieval authors.

Likewise, despite the sometimes uneven treatment of authors (e.g. five chapters on Plato and his commentators), S. presents a consistent argument about the way in which the notion of infinity was understood over the centuries. He notes, e.g., that most authors in antiquity including Aristotle considered infinity to be an imperfection since they associated it with lack of form or determination. Yet some, like Anaximander with his notion of *to apeiron* and, some centuries later, Plotinus with his notion of the One which is beyond Being, clearly thought that indetermination is a perfection, hence that there can be an actual infinite reality which is indeterminate.

Similarly, most Christian writers prior to the mid-13th century thought of the infinity of God in purely extrinsic terms, namely, as pertaining to the divine power, immensity or duration. They did not conceive God as intrinsically infinite in terms of the divine essence, if only because it would then be impossible for the blessed in heaven to enjoy the Beatific Vision, i.e. to see the divine essence. But certainly Thomas Aquinas and perhaps his predecessor in England Richard Fishacre affirmed that God is by nature infinite. For Aquinas, at least, this belief was grounded in an antecedent understanding of the doctrine of act and potency. Act determines potency, but potency in turn limits act. Since God's essence is the pure act of existence without any admixture of potency, God is by nature infinite. Similarly, among the Greek Fathers of the Church some centuries earlier, Gregory of Nyssa affirmed that God is by nature infinite since God is Being, Truth, Goodness, and Beauty, whereas all creatures only partially share in these divine perfections.

S. is quite convinced, of course, that with the doctrine of Aquinas in the West and Gregory of Nyssa in the East one has clear proof that God is by nature infinite. Yet the review of the history of the doctrine provided by S. allows one likewise to see that what one means by infinity is context-dependent. As S. himself admits (543–46), for someone like Anaximander who gives priority to becoming over being, an intrinsically indeterminate reality like *to apeiron* is more perfect than the determinate entities to which it gives rise. Similarly, like Duns Scotus one may question Aquinas's assumption that matter or potency limits form or act. Since form represents an objective intelligibility, it is apparent that form determines the matter into which it is received. But it is not apparent (at least to me) why potency, which is in itself purely indeterminate, should necessarily limit act, unless by potency one implicitly means a concrete subject of existence which can exercise the perfection in question. But this gives rise to the further question whether God as the Supreme Subject of existence is limited by the presence and activity of still other created subjects of existence. These questions notwithstanding, S.'s splendid work on the history of the doctrine of infinity provides excellent resource material for reopening the question of infinity.

Xavier University, Cincinnati

JOSEPH A. BRACKEN, S.J.

FAITHFUL PERSUASION: IN AID OF A RHETORIC OF CHRISTIAN THEOLOGY.
By David S. Cunningham. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1991. Pp. xviii + 312. \$29.95.

Dissatisfaction with the direction of modern theology has led many theologians to propose postmodern alternatives to the theological task. Some of the new approaches, e.g. deconstructive theologies, do not count faithfulness to the tradition of Christian belief a virtue. Cunningham's book, the recipient of the 1990 Bross Prize, sketches a postmodern approach that does so by proposing the method and practice of rhetoric as a way of configuring the theological task. Understanding theology as persuasive argument, C. contends, heightens an appreciation for the embeddedness of rhetorical interests and strategies in all forms of the linguistic construction that theology is, particularly in the ontologies and hermeneutical theories that classical and modern theologies respectively have employed to promote their interpretive aims.

C. invokes both ancient and contemporary rhetorical theory to stress the extent to which conviction is claimed, recognized, criticized, and reformulated in the argumentative relations that ensue between rhetor, audience, and speech. Theology, like all forms of argument, is misunderstood if seen as the valid deduction of formal logic. Rather,

theology is a thoroughly rhetorical enterprise, an intricate web of persuasive efforts molded by Christian belief and practice. C. examines the richness of this contextuality by devoting three central chapters to the theological reception of Aristotle's triadic division of rhetoric into *pathos*, "which is concerned with the audience," *ethos*, "which is concerned with the character of the speaker," and *logos*, "which deals with the arguments themselves" (18).

Encouraged by Enlightenment assumptions about the universality of explanation, modern theology, C. observes, has lost sight of the particularity of its audience, as well as the importance of that particularity for what, how, and why theological arguments are made at all. Modern—or better, postmodern—theology can be responsible to its task only by recognizing that the audience is a rhetorical construct that shapes the theological arguments by which it is in turn shaped. Persuasion to Christian faithfulness occurs within the mutuality of relations between theologian and constructed audience. For C., the personal character of the theologian is an important influence brought to bear on the persuasiveness of argumentation and the conviction it yields. He commends to theologians the rhetorical standard of cogency reached by expanded modes of reasoning that stress the value of ad hoc inference from ecclesially shared commitment. To this end, he proposes that the traditional sources of theology—Scripture, tradition, and experience (including reason)—are best understood as the vocabulary of theology's language of persuasion, to be invoked in any number of ways when they serve the purpose of cogency.

This book is an important contribution to theological method and one that deserves a wide reading. C. has explored a dimension of theology that has been almost entirely overlooked in the history of its disciplinary self-understanding, and he offers imaginative suggestions for the implementation of the approach he commends. Theologians would do well to heed his calls for understanding exegesis as persuasive argument and for the need to reassess the history of theology from a rhetorical point of view. In these respects his work is nothing less than ground-breaking.

I would offer two criticisms. First, C. does little more than acknowledge the negative side of the rhetorical approach. It is not at all clear, e.g., how a rhetorical theology would be capable of self-criticism if its primary commitment is to persuasion. In his efforts to persuade the reader of the value of a rhetorical approach, C. does not consider how cogent persuasion embedded in the Christian tradition itself (and not just in the character or arguments of particular theologians) has advanced false or even evil views (e.g. anti-Semitism and misogynism). To understand theology exclusively as persuasive argument might fos-

ter an uncritical regard for one's own assumptions and the assumptions of one's audience. Second, while a traditionalist rhetoric permeates C.'s book, it is never exactly clear what "faithful persuasion" is faithful to. C. would say that theology's rhetorical proclamation is faithful to God's rhetorical activity in revelation, the word faithful to the Word. And yet, C.'s proposal that Scripture, tradition, and experience be regarded as the ad-hoc vocabulary of, rather than as sources for, theology threatens their authority as revelational modes for encountering God's Word. It is helpful to consider theological authority in terms of persuasion, but treating authority exclusively in such terms raises questions about the object of and context for Christian faithfulness. These criticisms, however, intend to identify points in need of clarification and should not detract from a book that ventures and offers much.

Fairfield University

JOHN E. THIEL

MYSTIC UNION: AN ESSAY IN THE PHENOMENOLOGY OF MYSTICISM. By Nelson Pike. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University, 1992. Pp. xiv + 224. \$29.95.

Since the rise of logical positivism and linguistic analysis earlier this century, mysticism and religious experience, especially in their Christian forms, have often fared badly at the hands of English-speaking philosophers. However, new philosophical studies, more carefully rooted in the primary texts of the Christian mystical tradition, have now begun to appear. Among them, Pike here offers one of the most important and fully developed defenses of the possibility of phenomenologically theistic mystical states.

In Part 1, Pike attempts to "provide phenomenological analyses of several states of union as . . . described and explained in the classical primary literature of the Christian mystical tradition" (xiii), not only "to achieve clarity for its own sake," but also "to provide some hedge against the possibility that the subtleties of the Christian mystical literature might go undiscovered and thus unappreciated in the philosophical discussion of mysticism now in progress" (170). And so he examines in detail: three classic contemplative states (prayer of quiet, prayer of full union, and rapture) described by St. Teresa; some variants on such states, including the occasional blossoming of full union or rapture into the experience of "union without distinction"; the traditional doctrine of "spiritual senses"; and the "bridal" and "nursing" imagery found in many of the primary texts. He quotes from Augustine, Bernard, Angela of Foligno, Julian of Norwich, Suso, Teresa, John of the Cross, Francis de Sales, and many others. One may quibble with

his exegesis in places, or question the heavy reliance on excerpts anthologized by Poulain and Farges, but overall Pike makes a convincing case that Christian mysticism comes in a variety of phenomenally distinct forms.

In Part 2 Pike argues against modern attempts by Stace and others to collapse all mystical experiences (or at least those not classed as "extrovertive") into states of "undifferentiated unity," which Christian mystics only interpret theistically, under pressure from religious authorities. Pike contends, on the contrary, that the primary sources describe, and provide evidence for, a range of phenomenologically distinct states of mystic union, including not only states of apparent "union without distinction," but also others which seem clearly to be phenomenologically "dualistic" and even "theistic." In fact, he maintains that, given the reported phenomenological ancestry of experiences of "undifferentiated unity" among representative Christian mystics (by whom states of the sort Stace describes are usually experienced as intensifications of phenomenologically dualistic mystical experiences), these "undifferentiated unity" experiences can themselves be counted as phenomenologically theistic.

Does this prove that such states really are what Christian mystics take them to be, i.e. experiences of God? Pike does not press such a conclusion here. But this reader, for one, will be interested to see where the philosophical discussion goes from here.

Institute of Carmelite Studies, D.C.

STEVEN PAYNE, O.C.D.

NATURE AND SPIRIT: AN ESSAY IN ECSTATIC NATURALISM. By Robert S. Corrington. New York: Fordham University, 1992. Pp. xiii + 207. \$30; \$19.95.

In this so-called postmodernist era of systematic deconstruction, it comes as a breath of fresh air to read a serious metaphysics, ambitious in its scope, nuanced in its articulation, and rewarding in its insight. Corrington has made a major contribution to American philosophical thought and has re-opened American naturalistic philosophy to a theistic perspective and to the experience of transcendence.

Ever since the days of Dewey and Santayana, philosophical naturalism in this country has tended to connote religious atheism and agnosticism. Originally, however, in the writings of Emerson, the American philosophical celebration of nature included the celebration of God, of spirit, and of religious experience. Unfortunately, Emersonian naturalism fractured on its dualistic understanding of the relationship between nature and spirit; and it formulated and popularized all too well an ethic that Robert Bellah and others have correctly character-

ized as expressive individualism. C. implicitly acknowledges the affinity between his own philosophical enterprise and Emerson's by citing the sage of Concord on the flyleaf of his book. In my judgment, C.'s ecstatic naturalism succeeds much better than Emerson's. It avoids the dualistic split between matter and spirit that mars Emerson's thought and does so by portraying spirit as an openness within nature to transcendence. C. also avoids the blunder of individualism by developing a thoroughly relational, social conception of the self.

C. adopts as his method what he calls an "ordinal phenomenology." By that he means a systematic, descriptive exploration of identifiable, interwoven orders of reality. Ordinal phenomenology seeks to explore the full range of human experience at the same time that it portrays the human as solidly embedded in the physical processes of nature. Quite correctly, C. discovers at the heart of the human an experience of finitude and self transcendence. He proposes a genetic analysis of the self that draws on a variety of speculative sources, including Jung's understanding of individuation. C.'s human selves define themselves through dynamic interaction with the world and other selves. In the process of human self-definition, hope plays a crucial role in orienting the human toward self-transcendence.

C. shows an impressive mastery of the classical American philosophical tradition. He draws creatively on the philosophy of Peirce, Dewey, and Royce in his descriptive exploration of the complexities of human symbolic activity.

C. distinguishes the World from Worldhood, which yields conscious access to the World and consciously engages the human process. Spirit, for C., lives "in the outer circumference of Worldhood as its empowering force." C. completes his descriptive exploration of the human with an account of different dimensions of the human experience of God.

Anyone interested in the development of American philosophical thought will find here a creative reworking, update, and transformation of important themes in classical American philosophy. I found myself as I read experiencing only occasional reservations. C. failed to convince me that phenomenology provides an adequate method for pursuing metaphysics. I am inclined to agree with Peirce that phenomenology begins philosophical thinking, but that the normative sciences mediate the transition between it and metaphysical thinking as such. I found myself feeling particularly uneasy at using phenomenology to describe the modalities of divine life. On the whole, however, I found this book a richly rewarding work, one that repays rereading and close study, and I recommend it enthusiastically to others.

SHE WHO IS: THE MYSTERY OF GOD IN FEMINIST THEOLOGICAL DISCOURSE. By Elizabeth A. Johnson, C.S.J. New York: Crossroad, 1992. Pp xii + 316. \$24.95.

In this carefully researched, beautifully written, and persuasively argued volume, Johnson shows the consequences of the way we speak about God. Exclusive use of male imagery for God both oppresses women by implicitly denying that they are *imago Dei*, and supports idolatry by implicitly denying the depths of the divine mystery. Both Scripture and traditional theology, however, contain elements which a feminist analysis can retrieve for emancipatory language about God. Such language frees both women and theology from patriarchal oppression so that "the truth of the mystery of God, in tandem with the liberation of all human beings and the whole earth, (may) emerge for our times" (56).

J. objects to the distortions of God coming from classical theism, influenced by patriarchy, especially the view that God is not really related to the world, though the world is really related to God. She finds Aquinas the major culprit here.

J. brings her scholarship and reflection to bear upon the mystery of the Trinity. Her primary symbol for this reinterpretation is Sophia, Holy Wisdom, as a feminine metaphor for God. Sophia can be imaged in each of the three divine Persons, and in the Holy Trinity together. Beginning with the sphere of Christian religious experience, J. develops the image of Sophia-Spirit. In Jesus, Holy Wisdom becomes incarnate: Jesus-Sophia. Finally, the depths of the divine mystery is disclosed in Mother-Sophia.

In imaging the Holy Trinity together, J. wishes to avoid anything that is redolent of priority or subordinationism. She therefore avoids explaining the relations of the divine persons in terms of origins. Friendship and the ancient doctrine of *perichōrēsis* seems a way to do this.

Recognizing how classical thought has seen in the title of God "He Who Is" unbounded energy and creativity and not simply the metaphysical absolute, J. chooses "She Who Is" as an appropriate name for God: "In a word, SHE WHO IS discloses in an elusive female metaphor the mystery of Sophia-God as sheer, exuberant, relational aliveness in the midst of the history of suffering, inexhaustible source of new being in situations of death and destruction, ground of hope for the whole created universe . . ." (243).

Finally, J. expounds the traditional problem of evil, but judges that no conceptual solution is possible. She deals with the matter by describing the suffering God in intimate compassion with human suffering. This is not simply God who loves in weakness, for that would

reinforce unhealthy attitudes in women, but God whose power makes her suffer along with suffering humanity.

It seems to me that J. has in great part succeeded in her enterprise. But there are some questions. Surely, simple justice and the recognition that women are truly images of God should lead us to use female metaphors of God. If we ask further whether this leads us more deeply into the mystery of God, J.'s answer is certainly affirmative. But it becomes difficult to understand why she says this. The simplest view would be that women image God differently from men; but this would lead to saying that certain traits or attributes are more "feminine" than "masculine," and she wishes to avoid this, since language of "feminine traits" has been connected with the patriarchal oppression of women. She doesn't seem to conceive a complementary diversity, in which each sex serves the other, so that together they image God more fully than either one alone. But actually, J. frequently uses language that suggests that being a woman is a distinctive way of being human and thus of imaging God, such as, e.g., "Let us speak of the Spirit's actions, drawing attention to the affinity of such language with feminist values, highlighting as it does freely moving, life-giving, nonviolent power that connects, renews, and blesses" (133).

J.'s objection to the "unrelated God" seems not altogether well taken. No doubt the view of an "unrelated God" makes no sense to most of us today, but it did not originally wish to isolate God from the world but to avoid making him relative to a finite absolute. Aquinas regularly uses the words "ordo" and "respectus" and "habitus" to indicate how God is related to creatures, for he recognizes that only as God's love and power are actually directed toward creatures can he know them and cause them (e.g. *ST* 1, q. 19, a. 5).

The unqualified denunciation of patriarchy seems excessive. Patriarchy as a social structure played an important and beneficent part in the early development of the human race. It was a primitive way to unite the tribe, to protect them from predators and enemies, and to provide food, shelter, and clothing. No doubt we are beyond patriarchy, and attempts to maintain it in ecclesiastical and political organizations today are evil; but this is because it means persisting in social immaturity, not because patriarchy is intrinsically designed to oppress and demean.

It is not clear how friendship and *perichōrēsis* can distinguish the divine persons, though it may help to understand their unity.

Finally, the problem of evil is the greatest cause of atheism in the world today. While no "conceptual solution" in a positive sense is possible, still it belongs to a Christian theologian to show that there is no inner contradiction in affirming the reality of an all powerful, loving

God and the reality of the evil we experience in creation. The compassionate God is truly an important insight, but it is not by itself a sufficient response.

In spite of these questions, this is a major contribution to feminist theology, and we are all in Johnson's debt.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

JOHN H. WRIGHT, S.J.

SOCIETY AND SPIRIT: A TRINITARIAN COSMOLOGY. By Joseph A. Bracken, S.J. With a Foreword by John Cobb, Jr. Cranbury, N.J.: Susquehanna University; and London/Toronto: Associated University Presses, 1991. Pp. 194. \$29.50.

Bracken has written a creative and challenging new cosmology based on what he calls "a panentheistic understanding of the God-world relationship" (35, 140); to be precise, B. proposes a new cosmology based on a "field-oriented understanding of the God-world relationship" (142). His goal is to offer a response to Stephen Toulmin's call for a return to cosmology at a time when many major intellectual and cultural trends resist speculative, holistic interpretations of world and God. Toulmin's point is that contemporary thought needs a "comprehensive new worldview" in order to survive fragmentation and to provide a clear grasp of the goals and values that bind human beings together. B. sketches his comprehensive new worldview in three stages.

B.'s first stage is to develop the notion of "society." He derives the foundation for his understanding of society from the process philosophy of Whitehead. In order to sharpen that understanding, he critiques not only Whitehead but other process thinkers such as Ivor Leclerc, Charles Hartshorne, John Cobb and Edward Pols. He seeks in these critiques to develop his thorough-going metaphorical description (as distinct from a metaphysical description) of reality as "society." His discussion is also influenced by conversations with thinkers and theories in the natural sciences, in physics, chemistry, and biology. The result of his investigations is that "society" is the metaphor that best articulates a philosophy of nature and cosmology. Central to the conclusion is that "field theory" when applied to human communities and ecological systems provides philosophers with a significant conceptual advance beyond substance theories.

In stage 2, B. shifts his attention to "Spirit" with insights drawn primarily from Schelling and Hegel. He finds that the German Idealists' reflections on *Geist* provide a needed corrective complement to the Whiteheadian metaphor of society. From Schelling B. harvests insights regarding "subjective spirit as the power of radical self-

constitution" (88, 104); from Hegel he gleans insights regarding "objective spirit as embodied in progressively more comprehensive structures or intelligible patterns" (88, 118 ff.). These investigations result in a conceptual hybridization of Schellingian subjective spirit and Hegelian objective spirit with the Whiteheadian notion of society which provides, in B.'s judgment, a more adequately detailed metaphor capable of accounting for human agency, individual and social, within a cosmological framework.

Stage 3 "theologizes" or "baptizes" the earlier stages by situating B.'s retrieval of the metaphors of society and spirit within a panentheistic theological worldview, or, more precisely, within a trinitarian cosmology. This cosmology is built on his conceptual construal of the God-world relationship as panentheism, i.e. as one that "maintains that, while all finite entities exist in God and through the power of God, they are ontologically distinct from God in terms of both their being and activity" (123). B. argues that his reconstruction of the metaphors of society and spirit allows for a "genuinely panentheistic" model for cosmology that advances the conversation beyond the present state of the philosophical and theological literature. In developing these latter themes, B. relies on his earlier work, *The Triune Symbol*.

B. offers an important, interesting, and closely reasoned discussion of philosophical and theological cosmology. His attempt at integrating scientific insight with German Idealists and Anglo-American process thinkers is, indeed, very creative and successful. But the text is difficult; it is not accessible to those who do not possess at least an introductory knowledge of the various conceptual frameworks examined.

Finally, a question: In the relatively tranquil world of philosophical and theological cosmology, a world in which "everything" receives an explanation and coherent rationale, how is the aporia-ridden social experience of human exploitation, suffering, injustice, etc., given the paramount attention, critical analysis, and transformative praxis that it demands in our world today? It seems to me that one of the perennial problems of speculative cosmology is the seeming disconnectedness of the system to the concrete world of human activity. The abstraction of the speculative thought creates a distance from the social reality that is the foundation of knowledge and knowing processes. To reframe my question: What insights would a sociology-of-knowledge or critical-theory critique of B.'s study bring to light? I think the second part of B.'s work has resources that move in the direction of an answer to this question although, it appears to me, the task here remains incomplete.

Here is a book well worth the intellectual discipline needed to read

it. It is filled with insight and creative integration of many important thinkers. I recommend it to the speculatively minded.

Belmont Abbey College, N.C.

STEPHEN J. SCHÄFER

THE GRACED HORIZON: NATURE AND GRACE IN MODERN CATHOLIC THOUGHT. By Stephen J. Duffy. Theology and Life Series. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 247. \$16.95.

Duffy's purpose is to chronicle and interpret the nature/grace debate in Catholic theology during the middle decades of the 20th century, showing its crucial importance for Vatican Council II and the post-conciliar Church, and its implications for the larger issue of how God is related to the secular world and its history. He accomplishes his purpose admirably. His "major players" in the debate are Henri de Lubac (though a typo has him dying in 1919 before the play began) and Karl Rahner. Chapters are also devoted to other "representative voices:" Hans Urs von Balthasar, Edward Schillebeeckx, Juan Alfaro and Eulalio Baltazar. Before beginning his detailed study of these authors, D. clarifies the issues of the nature/grace debate and situates it in its 20th-century context, especially the problem of "extrinsicism."

Henri de Lubac did more than anyone to bring about a profound reexamination of the nature/grace issue, particularly in *Surnaturel* published in 1946. Against extrinsicism he situated the desire for God at the very heart of concrete, historical human nature, but he seemed thereby to some to deprive grace of any gratuity beyond that of creation. It was against this danger that Pius XII warned in his encyclical *Humani generis* in 1950. At this juncture Karl Rahner introduced the notion of the "supernatural existential" into the debate. By naming both the immanent presence of God's Spirit and call (uncreated grace) and the consequences of this for historical human nature and its desire (created grace) an "existential," Rahner situates this desire, with de Lubac, at the very heart of human existence. By calling this existential "supernatural," and therefore not necessarily given with human nature as such, he maintains with Pius XII its utter gratuity beyond that of creation.

Von Balthasar seems to D. to accept the notion of the supernatural existential but insists that we not think of God as facing a choice between a world order with or without grace. God created a graced world in the very act of conceiving it, and only in light of this actuality is another possibility thinkable. The gratuity of grace, then, must be understood primarily from the very nature and excellence of the actual gift, not from the abstract possibility of its absence. Alfaro deserves credit for insisting on the personal nature of grace and transposing the

issue from that of nature/grace to person/grace. Schillebeeckx's contribution to the debate is examined in the context of his study of Max Seckler's retrieval of Aquinas's *instinctus fidei*, with whose interpretation of the latter he disagrees, as he does with Seckler's own questionable understanding of the supernatural existential. Finally, D. finds promise in Baltazar's effort to transpose the debate from the scholastic category of substance to those of process philosophy. In spite of their differences, all these authors share a common starting point wherein D. sees the real significance and fruit of the debate: against the counter-Reformation theology of gratuity, they all begin with the actual historical order of grace, indeed, the grace of Christ, rather than with an abstract notion of human nature, and they see all else in function of the primacy of grace.

D. sees two challenges still outstanding as the debate continues. One is to broaden the anthropocentric focus so as to include the whole realm of creation in the order of grace. The other comes from Mark Taylor's doctoral dissertation, published as *God is Love*, which argues in the name of process logic and coherence that to be truly Rahnerian Rahner must be a process theologian. Rahner's dialectical approach rejects any univocal logic, process or otherwise, which makes God part of the larger whole which God must both create and grace in order to be God. D.'s seeming attraction to process thought acknowledges its problems with the gratuity of grace and the sovereignly free God of Christian tradition. Whatever the outcome of the debate, his book has made a valuable contribution.

Fordham University

WILLIAM V. DYCH, S.J.

INFALLIBILITY ON TRIAL: CHURCH, CONCILIARITY AND COMMUNION. By Luis M. Bermejo, S.J. Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1992. Pp. vi + 402. \$19.95.

Bermejo, professor of theology at de Nobili College in Pune, India, has written on a number of ecumenical issues. This time he sets his sights on what he considers the principal deadlock to ecumenical progress, the two papal dogmas of Vatican I, papal primacy and infallibility. He finds wanting the usual ways of dealing with Vatican I today, setting the teaching of *Pastor aeternus* in the new context provided by Vatican II or distinguishing the genuine understanding of the Council from its later exaggerations, the kind of "moderate infallibilism" practiced by Avery Dulles. Neither approach will work, B. argues, because the universal jurisdiction proclaimed by *Pastor aeternus* continues to be rejected unanimously by non-Catholic Christians.

What B. suggests is a reevaluation of Vatican I on the basis of the

concept of reception. He begins by examining four fundamental ecclesiological principles and drawing four conclusions: (1) that seeing the Church of Christ as present (*subsistit*) in the non-Catholic Churches in various degrees is not contrary to Vatican II, despite recent attempts of the CDF to interpret the *subsistit* clause restrictively; (2) that the "body of the faithful" which "as a whole cannot err" (*Lumen gentium* 12) should be understood as referring to the entire People of God, not just to Roman Catholics; (3) that the councils of the second millennium should be considered general rather than ecumenical since they do not meet the triple condition for ecumenicity; and (4) that conciliar unanimity is indispensable for decisions concerning the faith of the entire Church.

Then B. revisits Vatican I, finding serious doubts as regards both the moral freedom of the participating bishops and the required moral unanimity of their decision. He uses A. Hasler's 1977 work, arguing that the critical reviews it received did not adequately refute his two central charges concerning the council's lack of freedom and the doubtful sincerity of many of the minority bishops who accepted the dogmas after the Council. B. finds Hasler's views confirmed in certain respects by the recently published diary of Archbishop Tizzani, particularly in regards to the question of the Council's freedom, and he goes beyond Hasler in using a number of sources to calculate that, with absentees included, "the final strength of the minority votes on 18 July was "at least 115, probably 130" (167).

The remainder of the book is devoted to the issue of reception. B. raises questions about how profoundly Vatican I is being received today, noting that it is rejected by 47 percent of all Christians and that a growing number of Roman Catholic theologians seem to challenge it indirectly by arguing the non-ecumenicity of all the second millennium councils. Using various statistics, he shows that papal infallibility is not being received by a considerable number of lay Catholics in different countries today, with figures running from 31 to 71 percent. Two chapters argue that papal or conciliar teachings can later be reversed, tracing as examples the history of a number of official teachings—among them, the temporal power of the papacy; the impossibility of salvation outside the Church; the superiority of council over pope in matters of faith, unity, and reform; the toleration of slavery, sanctioned by four councils; and the justification of the use of torture—all of which were ultimately rejected.

B. is no stranger to controversy, and this book will be controversial. Not all will agree with his argument for the initial papal reception of Constance. His lengthy discussion of the cases of John Hus and Joan of Arc, while interesting, is a digression. Though the book is extensively

documented, he occasionally cites a foreign language report rather than the original text. But his study is a significant one, both for the questions he raises about Vatican I and for the ecclesiological principles he develops.

Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

THOMAS P. RAUSCH, S.J.

THE ARAB CHRISTIAN: A HISTORY IN THE MIDDLE EAST. By Kenneth Cragg. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1991. Pp. 336. \$29.95.

Arab Christians are seldom mentioned in Christian scholarship in the U.S. or in the West as a whole. Yet Christianity preceded Islam in the Middle East and had an impact on the religion preached by Muhammad, the Prophet of Islam. And there are around ten million Arab Christians in Arab countries today. Cragg, who has an intimate knowledge of the Middle East and its Christian communities, here attempts to tell their little-known history. One of the facts he emphasizes is that Christianity in the Middle East has always been hostage to internal divisions and Western Christian meddling.

In the Qur'an, "peoples of the book"—Christians and Jews—are treated as "protected peoples" (*dhimmis*), which literally means those on the conscience (*dhimma*) of the Islamic community. In order to be protected, non-Muslims had to pay a *jizya* (tax). During the Ottoman period, Islamic tolerance of Christians and Jews was defined by the *millet* system under which non-Muslims were autonomous in the conduct of their spiritual and civil affairs while still subordinate to the personal rule of the sultan.

The subordinate status of the Arab Christian in Islam (of the 22 Arab countries only Lebanon has a Christian head of state) and the Muslim suspicion that Christians in the Middle East are fifth columns of the West have led some of their leaders to become active in the Arab nationalist movement. Cragg's chapters on the predicament of Arab Christian communities in Egypt and Israel are full of valuable insights. In the case of Egypt, the Copts (from the Greek *aigoptos*, Egyptian), while the original inhabitants of Egypt, are today the victims of assassinations by Muslim rigorists. The Muslim Brotherhood and other extremist groups perceive that the Copts in Egypt have a disproportionate amount of power. Add to that the tensions created by the despicable "ethnic cleansing" against Muslim communities in the former Yugoslavia and the conflict between Christian Armenians and Muslim Azerbaijanis. In Israel, Arab Christians are faced with a painful tension. They have to reconcile the image of Israel as the biblical "spiritual ancestor" and contemporary Israel as the "political enemy" under which they constantly suffer. For Cragg, "a response to the tension, for

Arabs, between Israel-in-Scripture and Israel-in-Zionism can come only from within the conscience and wisdom of the local churches, not from external or patronizing advice" (243).

The chapter on Lebanon is full of inaccuracies. Cragg contends that religion in Lebanon became the fundamental source of conflict. He is very harsh on the Maronite Catholics and their responsibility in the civil war that began in 1975. He does not give a lot of weight to the external, regional, and global factors in fanning the flames of war in Lebanon. Some of the Maronite leadership bear a heavy responsibility for the tragedy of Lebanon, but they share it also with the Muslim communities, above all the PLO. In addition, Syria and Israel have ruthlessly used the Land of Cedars as a convenient springboard for all kinds of invasions and occupations.

This book could have benefitted from careful editing. There are several errors that need to be corrected. E.g. Cragg speaks about the "so-called Cairo Agreement of 1976" (229). Actually the Cairo Agreement, which is a fundamental cause of the conflict in Lebanon, was signed in Cairo in 1969; it allowed the PLO freely to attack Israel from South Lebanon. Elsewhere we find "Beth Shin" instead of "Shin Beth," the Israeli security service, and Ariel Sharon is wrongly named "Moshe Sharon" (237). Cragg also does not mention the role the Holy See and the Catholic Church has played in keeping a Christian presence in the Middle East.

Cragg concludes that the Arab Christians' future is one of continuing domestication within Islam. Arab Christians will have to gain the trust of their Muslim fellow citizens and through a frank and open dialogue smooth the theological differences between them. The West (especially American Christians) has a responsibility to see to it that other military operations and interventions such as "Desert Storm" be avoided. Arabs—Christians and Muslims—ought to be helped to co-exist with full respect for their human dignity and rights.

Franklin College, Ind.

GEORGE EMILE IRANI

WOMEN TOWARDS PRIESTHOOD: MINISTERIAL POLITICS AND FEMINIST PRAXIS. By Jacqueline Field-Bibb. New York: Cambridge University, 1991. Pp. xiii + 387.

Field-Bibb's work focuses on the issue of women and the ordained ministry as that issue arose in England and in particular in the Methodist Church and in the Church of England. Although only a brief section deals with Roman Catholicism, Catholic concerns and Catholic theology loom rather large in the overall interpretation. The book is

divided into two parts, the first and longer of which is entitled "Documentation" and the second "Interpretation."

The first of the three periods into which F. divides the history of the problem begins with John Wesley and continues to the mid-19th century. Initially women played a considerable role in Methodism, especially in some of the groups that seceded from the original movement. As these grew, however, and became increasingly institutionalized, the public teaching role of women gradually disappeared. A second period began in 1890 with the foundation of the Wesley Deaconess Order. Although the issue of women ministers was formally raised in 1922, it was only in 1973 that the final decision to ordain women was taken. F. traces in some detail the arguments made by those favoring and those opposing such a step.

A similar treatment is given to the debate in the Church of England. There it emerged in 1861 and initially and for some time thereafter was discussed in relation to sisterhoods and deaconesses. In what F. calls the third period of the debate, beginning in the early 1960s, the issue became the priesthood. Increasingly arguments against were based on appeals to tradition and to symbolism. F. associates the shift with the ecumenical movement and a growing preoccupation of Anglicans with Rome.

The section on Roman Catholicism reviews official arguments against ordination, especially as these were formulated in the 1976 Declaration and in the series of articles supporting it that appeared in the *Osservatore Romano*. The presentation here is marred by a number of minor but distracting errors.

Part 2 is more dense in its argumentation and, at first reading, more difficult to follow. Its subsections are entitled respectively "Undercurrents," "Strategies," and "Interpretations." The first relates the documentation of the first part of the development of post-Enlightenment culture and to various trends and counter-trends in the churches. The relative ease with which the Methodist Church accepted at least the principle of women's ordination is seen as flowing from its openness to contemporary culture. Because the Roman Catholic Church continued to be a church apart, with its identity reinforced by institutions and symbols from an earlier age, it remained relatively impervious to such influence. Here, as elsewhere, the Church of England occupied a middle position.

The section entitled "Interpretations" is the most substantial of the three and contains what is most creative in the book. F. proposes, more than she actually develops, a critical feminist hermeneutics, a major component of which is provided by Elizabeth Schüssler Fiorenza's *In Memory of Her*. Emphasizing the phenomenon of resistance, F. argues

that the key issues in regard to it are unconscious ones. To get at these recourse must be had to psychoanalytical theory. The book offers a critical reading of Freud which attempts to save his "brilliant description" of "the unconscious androcentric phantasy of 'woman'" (286), even while liberating it from its patriarchal and Western biases. The presentation is too brief to make a judgment about its success.

Having presented in such detail the struggle of women to be ordained, F. seems to undermine the significance of their achievement. She describes it "as part of the assimilation-re-presentation process . . . which absorbs and diffuses protests" (289). There are deeper issues of identity and sexuality that need to be dealt with. Her final judgment is that "a 're-view' of language is of more fundamental importance than ministry as an object of feminist concern" (288).

The documentation F. has brought together should be of interest to anyone concerned about the ordination of women. So too should the more creative and theoretical aspects of her argument, although some of these tend to be reductionistic and one-sided. As important, e.g., as unconscious factors clearly are, theological arguments deserve theological answers.

St. Michael's College, Toronto

DANIEL DONOVAN

SHORTER NOTICES

THE OLD TESTAMENT OF THE OLD TESTAMENT: PATRIARCHAL NARRATIVES AND MOSAIC YAHWISM. By R. W. L. Moberly. *Overtures to Biblical Theology*. Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1992. Pp. xvi + 224.

Moberly reorients pentateuchal studies from fascination with the history of Israel's religion to a more theological perspective, asking how one can understand the areas of continuity and difference in the presentation of the "God who is revealed in different ways and in different periods of time" (114). Regarding God's name, he pinpoints the apparent contradiction between Genesis 4:26 (people began calling on God as Yahweh) and Exodus 3 (the name Yahweh first revealed to Moses) and questions the theological value of the source critical

explanation. M. argues that speaking of Yahweh in Genesis, before the revelation to Moses, simply witnesses to the imposition of a later, post-Mosaic view onto patriarchal stories. Instead, the new meaning of this revelation of the name to Moses was its role in Mosaic religion.

M. piqued my interest by contrasting the religion of the Patriarchs ("ecumenical bonhomme," open, unstructured and nongeographical) with Mosaic Yahwism (sectarian exclusiveness with regard to sacred place, moral and cultic content, marriage, leadership) (99). The relationship between those "religions" suggests a parallel relationship, between the Old Testament (Judaism) and the New Testament (Christianity). Thus the question emerges: How do the old

and the new relate to each other? This issue is as important in Jewish-Christian dialogue as in biblical studies. M. finds the language of supersessionism—a vexing problem in Jewish-Christian dialogue—in the historically developmental description of patriarchal religion as *paidagōgos* to Mosaic religion (Alt).

M.'s reading of the Pentateuch demonstrates one way that Jews and Christians could converse, exhibiting continuity as well as difference, and offers a nonpolemical way to discuss concepts such as "dispensation," supersessionism, and Old Testament (for Christians). By demonstrating this relationship of old and new within the Hebrew Scriptures, M. shifts the tension backwards, but one wonders whether adherents of (either) "old" religious system will be as satisfied as their "newer" counterparts. For the exegete, M. outlines some creative paradigms for pentateuchal study; for the theologian, he offers a lucid biblical approach to questions about the relationship of NT to OT, Judaism to Christianity. This stimulating book poses critical challenges for the teacher, the scholar, and students of theology and religion.

JOHN C. ENDRES, S.J.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

A TALE OF TWO CITIES: SODOM AND GOMORRAH IN THE OLD TESTAMENT, EARLY JEWISH AND EARLY CHRISTIAN TRADITIONS. By J. A. Loader. Kampen: Kok, 1992. Pp. 150. \$28.75.

Since little systematic study has been devoted to the Sodom and Gomorrah traditions, Loader sets out to fill this lacuna. After analyzing Genesis 18–19, he covers all other OT references and then traces highlights of the use of those traditions in early Jewish and Christian literature up to about the fourth century.

Genesis 18–19 is a skillfully composed narrative complex of five units

arranged concentrically: A: three men visit Abraham (18:1–16); B: Abraham's questions about Sodom (17–33); C: God's wrath over Sodom (19:1–26); B': Abraham witnesses the destruction (27–29); A': Lot and his daughters (30–38). Other Jewish materials L. examines include texts from Genesis, the Prophets, the Apocrypha (Ben Sira and Wisdom of Solomon), the Pseudepigrapha (The Testaments of the 12 Patriarchs and The Book of Jubilees), Philo, Josephus, and rabbinic literature (Midrash Bereshith Rabbah). The early Christian literature he discusses includes the NT and a selection from patristic writers: Clement of Rome, Justin Martyr, Irenaeus, Clement of Alexandria, Tertullian, Basil, Jerome, Augustine—Origen, however, is missing.

Since these texts have figured conspicuously in discussions of homosexuality, it might be useful to summarize L.'s conclusions regarding the sin of Sodom. The Sodomites violate the sacred law of hospitality and give themselves over to depravity of homosexual mob rape. The emphasis is on the social, not the sexual aspect of their sin (37). In continuity with Genesis, the prophets highlight this social aspect; occasionally a sexual dimension is also included, often adultery, as in Jer 23:14, and not homosexuality (65, 69, 70)! Josephus and the rabbis also develop this line of thought: the wealthy but stingy Sodomites sin through hatred and cruelty toward strangers (100, 112). It is particularly the influence of Augustine that pushes homosexuality into the center of the debate (136).

While more work certainly will need to be done, especially on the later uses of the tradition, L. has provided a clearly written and argued foundation on which to build.

MICHAEL D. GUINAN, O.F.M.

*Franciscan School of Theology,
Berkeley*

RESPONSES TO 101 QUESTIONS ON THE DEAD SEA SCROLLS. By Joseph A. Fitzmyer, S.J. New York: Paulist, 1992. Pp. xviii + 201. \$8.95.

"Good things often come in small packages." When one has read this brief book, one will have about as good and current an introduction to the Dead Sea Scrolls as one can find. Not only did Fitzmyer serve with the scroll team, helping to piece together the myriads of fragments from Cave Four (1957-1958), but he has maintained close and continuing contact with their publication and developments in their study. His *The Dead Sea Scrolls: Major Publications and Tools for Study* is almost mandatory for anyone proposing to study the Scrolls.

The book is organized as a series of 101 questions and answers. The first section proceeds from the narrative of the discovery and a listing of the Scrolls, with a very brief description of each, to a gradual unfolding with longer descriptions, and finally to detailed descriptions of the major documents. The second discusses the impact of the Scrolls on the study of the Old Testament and ancient Judaism, especially the Qumran community. F. begins with an excellent introduction to Jewish apocalyptic and continues with a good review of the various teachings and practices at Qumran. He includes a careful discussion of the possible identification of the people of Qumran with the Essenes; while the identification is not certain at this point, it seems the best of current options.

F. goes on to treat the impact of the Scrolls on the study of the New Testament and early Christianity. Was John the Baptist an Essene? Perhaps—but no mention and no proof. There are no references to Jesus or to Christians. NT ideas such as Son of God, Servant of Yahweh, Son of Man, etc. are discussed, as well as parallels

in ideas and phraseology between the Scrolls and NT books. This section includes discussions on divorce and on possible analogies between the Qumran lifestyle and that of early Christian monasticism. Finally, F. handles recent developments in Scroll study, the release of the entire collection for scholarly study, and the charges of scandal and suppression which have been made. Here is a sober, well-balanced, carefully-phrased exposition of the recent developments which have been so widely—and often tentatively—publicized.

While this book is for the general reader—and is highly recommended—F.'s mastery of the materials provides much which will be of interest and use to the scholar as well.

VICTOR ROLAND GOLD

*Pacific Lutheran Theol. Seminary,
Berkeley*

THE FIGURE OF JOSEPH IN POST-BIBLICAL JEWISH LITERATURE. By Maren Niehoff. *Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums*. Leiden: Brill, 1992. Pp. 178.

This study in comparative hermeneutics compares the characterization of Joseph in Genesis, in late biblical and early postbiblical literature, and in Philo, Josephus, and Genesis Rabbah; there is an additional separate study of the targums. Niehoff begins by reviewing scholarship, taking a moderate hermeneutical position, and explaining literary terms. He distinguishes the genre of the four major works studied: Genesis, story; Philo, biography; Josephus, part of a general history; Genesis Rabbah, diverse exegeses. He then briefly backgrounds Philo and Josephus and explains the use of "narrator" for Genesis Rabbah.

N. discusses the narrative rhythms of the various texts. Narrative rhythm indicates the importance of

episodes. Partially by speeches, in which narrative time equals narrated time, narration decelerates during, and emphasizes, certain passages, e.g. in the initial description of Joseph and his relationship to his brothers, and in Joseph's meetings with his brothers. Philo and Josephus generally follow the biblical rhythm; Genesis Rabbah concentrates on a few different episodes, e.g. Joseph's bad report about his brothers and his encounter with Potiphar's wife. N. also analyzes the characterization of Joseph in the various works. Joseph emerges in Philo as an ideal model for the Hebrew in Egyptian/Hellenistic culture. Josephus presents Joseph as a practical model for a Jew in a Hellenistic culture, stressing his innocence, piety, and openness to foreign culture. Finally, Genesis Rabbah shows Joseph more as a religious figure than the Hellenistic interpretations do, as a person whose character is not all good but who grows through trials.

The topic of N.'s study is narrow, but interesting within its limits. The diverse natures of the works studied can seem to be overlooked. The reader must be familiar with the texts in order to appreciate the study.

EDWARD DOUGHERTY, S.J.
Annapolis, Maryland

THE PAPACY. By Bernhard Schimmelpfennig. Translated from the third German edition by James Siever. New York: Columbia University, 1992. Pp. vii + 330. \$60; \$20.

Schimmelpfennig's historical survey of the papacy examines the evolution of the institutional medieval Church from the Roman congregation before Constantine the Great through 1534. S. emphasizes the papacy as a historical institution and analyzes papal policy and the interplay be-

tween papal and political powers in Western Europe and Byzantium. Indicators of relationships between papal and political powers documented in this history include papal finances, the role of the pope in the coronation of emperors, lay investiture, and, for the relationship with the Roman civic administration, the construction of the Vatican.

Although this history focuses on the political factors that shaped the papacy, S. includes frequent references to the liturgy as well as to the cultural, artistic, and economic developments within the medieval Church. By conscious design, S. omits discussion of more ecclesiastical and doctrinal issues such as the filioque controversy which contributed to the schism in 1054. Although consistent with his purpose, this is somewhat regrettable, for it presupposes a development of the papacy abstracted from its relationship to church councils, doctrinal divisions, and theological schisms. Papal biography and contemporary European politics also remain in the background.

This work's greatest strength is also its greatest weakness: S. manages to synthesize volumes of history into one. This enables the reader to evaluate the continuity and change within the development of the papacy over time. Even though S. synthesizes with clarity, the development and contextualization helpful for a student meeting this material for the first time are missing. The brevity and swiftness of the narrative can result in a bewildering array of names difficult to identify without further information. Appendixes include a list of Roman bishops and popes with their dates, a selected bibliography, and a relatively brief index. There are no maps.

SUSAN WOOD, S.C.L.
Saint John's University, Minn.

THE LETTERS OF PELAGIUS AND HIS FOLLOWERS. Translated by B. R. Rees. Rochester, N.Y.: Boydell, 1991. Pp. 355. \$70.

An important contribution to studies of Pelagius and the social and religious world of the late-fourth- and early-fifth-century West. Translated here are five letters and treatises attributed to Pelagius by R. F. Evans (1968): *To Demetrias, On Virginity, On the Divine Law, On the Christian Life, and To Celantia*; six Pelagian treatises first edited by C. P. Caspari (1890): *To an Older Friend, To a Young Man, On the Possibility of Not Sinning, On Riches, On Bad Teachers, and On Chastity*; and seven miscellaneous works. With the exception of the Caspari corpus (which was translated under the title *The Works of Fastidius* by R. S. T. Haslehurst in 1927), most of these documents have never before been fully translated into English.

The translation of each text is prefaced with a brief introduction that provides the date, if known, and the likely situation of its author, if known. The general introduction to the volume gives an excellent overview of the world of Pelagius and a fine orientation to the current, complex state of Pelagian studies. Rees, the author of a good recent monograph on Pelagius (cf. *TS* 50 [1989] 398–99), is by training a classicist, and his rendering of the Latin is both literal and readable.

The Pelagius and Pelagians revealed in these texts are a far cry from the caricatures of heresiologists. Pelagius taught for two decades in the church at Rome without, it seems, arousing any opposition. He was by all accounts an effective, if austere, moral teacher. The traditions represented by Pelagius were deeply rooted in late ancient Christianity, both East and West. Patristic scholars and

students of early Christian ethics and asceticism should know this book; it may also serve as a salutary reminder to systematic and dogmatic theologians that labels of "Pelagian" may not always fit historical reality.

DAVID G. HUNTER

University of St. Thomas, Minn.

SAINTED WOMEN OF THE DARK AGES. Translated by Jo Ann McNamara et al. Durham, N.C.: Duke University, 1992. Pp. 341. \$45; \$17.95.

This volume contains translations of eighteen *vitae* of Merovingian saintly women who lived in the sixth and seventh centuries in Roman Gaul. Their names are not familiar save to those who are experts in early-medieval history and hagiography. In terms of time, these stories range from that of St. Genovefa (St. Genevieve, the patroness of Paris) who died circa 502 to Austreberta who died at the beginning of the eighth century. A wide audience should be grateful for this added resource for the recovery of the role of women in the history of Christianity.

The editors point out that these hagiographies have their own particular slant. The women were almost uniformly aristocratic; their lives did not emphasize poverty and self-abnegation, nor were their roles "monastic" in any narrow sense of the term. In fact, one can detect some monastic evolution in these stories. Their lives and activities were integral to the Christianization of the culture; they served as mediators between the secular power of their male family members and as intercessors for the poor and neglected. Beyond that, their saintly charisma held up the model of the *imitatio Christi* as an apologetic model for the gospel and their rank and saintly prestige aided the growth of the Church. In the seventh century, especially, their monasteries, often

endowed with their own funds and housing their own families (e.g. mothers and daughters), formed bonds with local bishops and had widespread influence on the shape of the local churches.

Each *vita* has a brief introduction. The volume as a whole has a detailed bibliography and an index of names. It is a valuable volume for those interested in hagiography, women's studies, and spirituality.

LAWRENCE S. CUNNINGHAM
University Of Notre Dame

THE RULE OF THE TEMPLARS: THE FRENCH TEXT OF THE RULE OF THE ORDER OF THE KNIGHTS TEMPLAR. Translated and introduced by J. M. Upton-Ward. *Studies in the History of Medieval Religion.* Rochester, N.Y.: Boydell, 1992. Pp. 200. \$59.

In the mid-twelfth century, Bernard of Clairvaux, praising the newly established Knights Templar, said that they might be considered both monks and soldiers. In the late-20th century, the Templars, rarely praised, are often considered more rogues than soldiers or monks. The publication of this English translation of their Rule will help explain Bernard's opinion.

Upton-Ward has translated the 1886 edition of the French text, which was based on 13th- and 14th-century manuscripts. The Rule has seven parts: the primitive rule of 1129; hierarchical statutes (from around 1165) outlining the duties and prerogatives of the order's officers and brothers; lists of penances (one from around 1165, the other from around 1265) to be imposed within the order; and sections (revised throughout the twelfth and 13th centuries) on conventual life, chapter meetings, and reception into the order. In all, there are six-hundred-eighty-six clauses or regulations, which collectively reveal a religious order self-consciously at-

tempting to shape itself for the greatest possible service to God and neighbor. Whatever one's previous opinion of the Templars, these statutes reveal a daring experiment that took the ideal of Christian action in the world to a logical extreme.

In the Introduction, Upton-Ward devotes ten pages to the origins and development of the order and six to the dating and content of the Rule. While sufficient information is provided to give an historical context for the text, a more substantial introduction could have dealt with the moral and theological justifications for the order and its suppression in the early 14th century. Additional quotation of the French text in the footnotes would sometimes be helpful. But what Upton-Ward has provided is valuable indeed, for this translation gives greater access to an often misunderstood form of religious life.

SHARON ELKINS
Wellesley College, Mass.

THE DAMNED AND THE ELECT: GUILT IN WESTERN CULTURE. By Friedrich Ohly. Translated from the German by Linda Archibald. New York: Cambridge University, 1992. Pp. xiv + 211. \$49.95.

For readers who enjoy a clear and wide-ranging presentation of a single theme over the course of centuries this book is a genuine delight. Its theme is set out much more clearly in the original subtitle, *Vom Leben mit der Schuld* ("on living with guilt"). Ohly is concerned with the origins and development of the motif of the "despairing" sinner versus the "holy" sinner. He focuses on German medieval tales about Judas and the Fall, especially as influenced by the recovery of the Oedipus material in Sophocles in 1150. He contrasts Judas's despair with its antithesis both in the tales of Pope Gregory with his conversion to goodness and subsequent sal-

vation, and in the later development of the figure of Faust, including Goethe's *Faust*, in which the condemned is saved, and Mann's *Dr. Faustus*, in which he is not.

The central question O. addresses is the poets' treatment of despair, the sin against the Holy Spirit, belief that one's sins are so heinous that God cannot forgive them. In the Middle Ages it was customary in this respect to place the sins of Judas and Peter side by side. In numerous exhortations cited here, Judas is urged to repent, to shed just one tear, and be saved; Judas never seems to feel that he can, and cuts himself off by suicide from forgiveness. Gregory, however, guilty of Oedipus' own sins, repents on an island for 17 years and is forgiven. The book ends, humanistically, with a look at Oedipus's "salvation" at Colonus.

The volume is well and smoothly translated and, despite Latin, Middle High German, and Medieval French, remarkably free of misprints. But the Foreword seems curiously unhelpful. Its author, perhaps misled by the (English) subtitle which promises too much, expresses disappointment that guilt for the Jewish holocaust and Judas's Jewishness are not treated in this thoughtful book on ancient and classical literature.

G. RONALD MURPHY, S.J.
Georgetown University

MAIMONIDES' ETHICS: THE ENCOUNTER OF PHILOSOPHIC AND RELIGIOUS MORALITY. By Raymond L. Weiss. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1991. Pp. x + 224. \$29.95.

Maimonides continues to fascinate Judaic scholars, rabbis, philosophers, and physicians—and now even ethicists. The twelfth-century philosopher, legalist, and physician was engaged in multiple intellectual tasks. Of the seemingly contradictory currents, Rabbi Moses ben Maimon de-

veloped a synthesis uniquely his own.

In a skilled, and well-written work, Weiss has shown us how M. walked the narrow ridge between philosophy and faith, the ethics of reasons and the demands of religion. Weiss, co-editor of *The Ethical Writings of Maimonides*, is systematic and disciplined in his exploration of the ethics of the great master. His work is lucid and goal directed. Gleaning from the entire corpus of M.'s work and exploring with fluency medieval Jewish and ancient Greek philosophy, Weiss explores M.'s *Commentary on the Mishna*, *Mishneh Torah*, and finally the *Guide of the Perplexed*. In each case, the analysis is learned and convincing. He has read M. with great care and meticulous concern to the detail, and he wields the weapon of his philosophical acumen with discernment and understanding.

Weiss is most convincing and most concerned when M.'s philosophical questions are deepened by faith. He is even more concerned when M.'s questions are resolved by faith. While the work is well worth reading on its own, the reader is even better served with Weiss as commentator, reading M.'s writings on ethics and using Weiss as the learned commentator that he is.

MICHAEL BERENBAUM
Georgetown University

DISSENT AND ORDER IN THE MIDDLE AGES: THE SEARCH FOR LEGITIMATE AUTHORITY. By Jeffrey Burton Russell. Twayne's Studies in Intellectual and Cultural History. New York: Twayne, 1992. Pp. xi + 126. \$22.95; \$12.95.

This is the proverbial "slim volume" that does what only a master historian can do—summarize scholarship on a broad and complicated issue in a way useful to both students and professional peers. At first glance the issue appears to be heresy, but R. immediately corrects that impression

with his sane thesis that heresy cannot be understood apart from orthodoxy, or dissent apart from order. These two kinds of reality define each other, and the tension between them created the ideas and institutions of Christianity in its history.

The chronological scope of the book is the millennium between Chalcedon and the Reformation, but attention is focused on the period after 1000. The method is what R. calls the "history of concepts," i.e. a combination of social history and the history of ideas. The presentation is after the manner of a textbook in that terms are clearly defined, chapters are short, and each chapter is concluded with a summary. For teachers one of the great merits of the book, aside from the superb "Bibliographic Essay," is the descriptions of phenomena like Catharism and Lollardy that are longer than those in the Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church but shorter than the latest monographs. Antijudaism and witchcraft fall within the book's purview.

R.'s humanity and good sense are evident in his eschewing the heresy-is-good-and-orthodoxy-bad thesis. His gifts as a teacher lead him to make some clarifying comparisons between past and present. I found his treatment of Scholasticism the weakest part of the book, for R. does not seem to understand the intrinsic dynamism that made it such a force for the creation of orthodoxy and heterodoxy and that, for instance, made Eckhart's mysticism suspect.

JOHN W. O'MALLEY, S.J.
Weston School of Theology

PROPHETS IN THEIR OWN COUNTRY: LIVING SAINTS AND THE MAKING OF SAINTHOOD IN THE LATER MIDDLE AGES. By Aviad M. Kleinberg. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1992. Pp. x + 189. \$27.50.

Here is "a study of sainthood as it was 'practiced' in day-to-day encoun-

ters between living individuals considered saints by their contemporaries and other members of their communities" (1). After a brief historical introduction and an analysis of the writers and audiences, medieval and modern, of saints' *Lives*, Kleinberg focuses on four medieval saints.

Though K. recounts events in these saints' lives, his focus on their audience/community is most interesting. K. calls the sainthood of Christina of Stommeln into question because her biographer, Peter of Dacia, encouraged her to report miracles, because her supernatural phenomena stopped after Peter's death, and because her own community remained skeptical. Although Lukardis of Oberweimar and Douceline of Digne gained the admiration of their communities, their relationship to their communities—cooperative and detached—differed. Once again, however, the audience was active in the formation of public sainthood.

The relationship between Francis of Assisi and his audience was more complex because of his immense following. By expecting his examples to be followed literally, Francis complicated the work of his successors who wished to make the saint's ideals more practical. When Bonaventure became minister general of the Franciscan Order in 1257, he "understood that the only way to unfasten the grip of Francis's dead hand was to offer an alternative that would transform Francis's history into a new, less action-oriented, and less radical message" (147). Francis's insistence on literal imitation and limits on his successors' authority to interpret his actions, however, "made it impossible to accomplish smoothly the necessary metamorphosis of living to dead saint—a process that consisted of forgetting the saint of reality and recreating him in his successors' image" (148).

By focusing on the audience of these four saints, K. provides a fascinating and sometimes iconoclastic view of saints in the medieval period.

SANDRA R. O'NEAL
Columbia College, S.C.

POLITICAL PROTEST AND PROPHECY UNDER HENRY VIII. By Sharon L. Jansen. Woodbridge: Boydell, 1991. Pp. x + 182. \$50.

Jansen edits ten prophetic texts which circulated in the 1530s, most of them previously unpublished. These prophecies are political, using animal symbolism in the tradition of Geoffrey of Monmouth, which the authors understood in terms of heraldry. They circulated especially during the Pilgrimage of Grace (1536–37), and J. tries to give us, as nearly as possible, the forms they had then. She selects those texts mentioned in government investigations, the ones which seemed most popular, and draws them from three manuscripts. J. prefaces her texts with a description of a sample case, that of John Dobson, executed for treason in 1538, and then sketches in the general political background. She follows the texts with her own brief analysis.

J. stresses the function of these prophecies in popular and clerical resistance to Henry's reforms. The Yorkist kings had already used them to influence popular opinion, but in the 1530s they circulated clandestinely in manuscript, presumably since no one would print such material. Usually, the prophecies were old, often from the 14th century, reinterpreted and reworked, so Dobson could say in his defence that he merely repeated what Merlin, Bede, and Thomas of Erceldoune had said. Old prophecies carried authority, since the prophets lacked involvement in current affairs and included events that had already happened, a fact which gave credibility to these forecasts of the future.

J. annotates but does not analyze the phenomenon of reinterpretation, inherent in this practice. "The Cock of the North" received three separate political readings in its 300-year career, and "The Marvels of Merlin" served both Catholic and Protestant resistance. They thus raise issues similar to those John Wallace studied in the political poetry of the 17th century and merit further study, as do other matters in these texts, among them the survival of the Crusading idea, not surprising in the older texts but present also in a 16th-century prophecy like "France and Flanders Then Shall Rise." Prophecy by dice, a late medieval development, suggests French origins by its terminology, while astrological prophecy by colors is completely obscure, and J. leaves that text without notes. In her background discussion she mentions other modes which no longer survive: the use of rolls and prophecy by pictures. The tradition of political prophecy obviously has many facets; by editing and annotating these texts, J. has laid the groundwork for their serious study.

MICHAEL MURRIN
University of Chicago

KIERKEGAARD AND KANT: THE HIDDEN DEBT. By Ronald M. Green. Albany: SUNY, 1992. Pp. xviii + 301.

Green calls his book a detective story. Its central theses are that Kierkegaard is heavily indebted to Kant, far more than has previously been noticed, and that a major reason this has been overlooked is that Kierkegaard deliberately obscured his dependence on Kant. The task of this book is to put an end to the coverup.

After chapters setting forth the information available about the extent of Kierkegaard's knowledge of Kantian texts and giving an overview of Kantian epistemology, ethics, and

philosophy of religion, two central chapters trace in detail the points where Green finds Kierkegaard indebted to Kant. A fifth chapter gives a rereading of *Fear and Trembling* in the light of the preceding argument, and the Conclusion speculates as to why Kierkegaard may have wanted to hide his linkages to Kant.

The case is considerably overstated, for, as Green himself keeps reminding us, themes that Kierkegaard may have read in Kant are often not distinctively Kantian and were available to him from other sources as well, especially the pietistic Lutheranism to which both he and Kant were heirs and the larger Augustinian tradition to which it belonged. When all these materials are set aside, what is left hardly seems as important as Green's overall presentations suggests. Still, he has called attention to an important part of Kierkegaard's intellectual background well deserving of attention, even if only more modest claims about it are warranted.

MEROLD WESTPHAL
Fordham University

JESUS CHRIST FOR THE MODERN WORLD: THE CHRISTOLOGY OF THE CATHOLIC TÜBINGEN SCHOOL. By Douglas McCready. American University Studies. New York: Lang, 1992. Pp. x + 353. \$52.95.

McCready is concerned about the issue of identity and relevance in Christology. His implicit question is: How can we develop an understanding of Jesus Christ that remains faithful to Scripture and tradition, especially the doctrine of Chalcedon, while also speaking to the hopes and concerns of contemporary Christians? Believing that we can begin to answer this question by studying the work of the Tübingen theologians, M. reviews the Christologies of Schelling, Drey, Möhler, Staudenmaier, Kuhn,

Schanz, Adam, Geiselman, Kasper, and Küng (M. treats Küng at the end, since he sees Küng standing somewhat independent from the school). He presents each theologian in 15 to 20 pages, excepting Adam and Kasper who receive 60 pages apiece.

A merit of this book is its sweep both of time and ideas. It covers a span of almost 200 years and discusses such rich material as Schelling's post-Idealist Christology, Möhler's view of the Church as the Body of Christ, and Kasper's pneumatological Christology. This breadth allows the reader to glimpse some of the continuities and discontinuities in these scholars' reflections on Jesus Christ. In this regard, M. notes recent German discussions of what it means to say that the Catholic theologians of Tübingen constitute a school. He also calls attention to Tübingen's recurring themes of freedom (divine and human), historical change, and the abiding truth of doctrine. The book's breadth has limitations, however. Some ideas could be explained in greater depth, e.g. the school's notion of the "living tradition." A fuller summary could be given of the school's continuities and discontinuities.

This book is a resource to aid English-speakers' understanding of the Catholic Tübingen School. Its primary audience is scholars. In the spirit of the ecumenism between the faculties of Catholic and Protestant theology at Tübingen, this book may be intended to serve as a bridge between Catholic and Protestant Evangelical faculties in North America.

ROBERT A. KRIEG, C.S.C.
University of Notre Dame

LES CENT ANS DE LA FACULTÉ DE THÉOLOGIE. Edited by Joseph Doré. Sciences théologiques et religieuses. Paris: Beauchesne, 1992. Pp. 391. Fr. 198.

This volume represents one of the ways in which the Institut Catholique de Paris celebrated in 1989 the centenary of the foundation of its Faculty of Theology, which in 1973 was renamed the "Unité d'Enseignement et de Recherche de Théologie et de Sciences Religieuses." The volume also initiates a new series of publications from the U.E.R.

In each of its three parts major papers are followed by round-table discussions. The founding and development of the Faculty are described in the first section by Claude Bressolette, while Bernard Sesboué discusses the work of Louis Duchesne and Alfred Loisy before the Modernist crisis. In the second section, Jacques Briend describes the development of biblical studies at the Institute, René Marlé the role of the Jesuits, and Claude Geffré the hermeneutical turn in theology. The final section offers Jacques Audinet's comments on the social function of theology and Joseph Doré's description of the current tasks of the U.E.R. The essays are quite informative and the round-table discussions often provocative.

The volume thus contributes to the history of Catholic theology in the last century and to the contemporary debate about the relationship between theology and religious studies.

JOSEPH A. KOMONCHAK
Catholic University of America

ULTIMATE HOPE WITHOUT GOD: THE ATHEISTIC ESCHATOLOGY OF ERNST BLOCH. By Thomas H. West. American University Studies. New York: Lang. Pp. xv + 368. \$56.95.

Ernst Bloch (1885–1977) has been a most influential figure in many 20th-century political, philosophical, and theological circles. He was, e.g., a major influence on Jürgen Moltmann who was responsible for a renewal of

eschatology in theological circles. The bulk of this volume is an analysis of *Das Prinzip Hoffnung*, Bloch's philosophy of hope.

West's study is a critical analysis of Bloch. At the same time it is a fulsome and fair exposition of the thought of Bloch, who is often read about and seldom read. West exposes an unresolved tension at the center of Bloch's work between his alpha-finalism and his omega-originism. Alpha-finalism, the source of Bloch's optimism, is the principle of continuity in the world process as it moves from the old aeon of late-capitalist barbarism through the new aeon of millennial socialism, which, in turn, creates the necessary conditions for the world's final rush towards its definitive utopia. Omega-originism is the principle of radical discontinuity that operates between the penultimate socialism and the ultimate utopia. Bloch is very vague about how this latter will occur except to say that this obscure principle of omega-originism will empower humanity to take the great risk that will vault it into the eschaton. Virtually indifferent to the penultimate which is perpetually perishing, omega-originism supplies humanity with a malleability and an unlimited openness to the future.

West describes Bloch's "oscillation" between these two moments and principles as contradictory. "As a philosopher (Bloch) does not persuade." His purely immanent universe is in need of a transcendent to ground his optimism, which never materializes. He has great faith in hope but no hope in faith. West ends his rewarding study on this note: "Bloch has a sure intuition about the reach of our hope, but in his Promethean zeal, he is egregiously immodest about the reach of our power."

JOHN C. HAUGHEY, S.J.
Loyola University, Chicago

KARL RAHNER. By William V. Dych, S.J. *Outstanding Christian Thinkers*. Collegeville: Liturgical; and London: Chapman, 1992. Pp. viii + 168. \$12.95.

Dych is well qualified to write this introduction, having been Rahner's student and the translator of his first and last magna opera, *Spirit in the World* and *Foundations of Christian Faith*. The opening chapter on the man and his work contains valuable personal insights, nicely complementing Vorgrimler. Nine thematic chapters follow. The style is expository (not critical of R.) and noncontroversial (R.'s critics are not engaged), but it is by no means superficial: historically important disputed questions are fairly treated.

Some comments. Dych seems defensive about philosophy's role in R.'s theology. We do not learn much of *Spirit* or *Hearers of the Word* here. Perhaps this is not the place for metaphysical subtlety, but R.'s saying that he learned more from prayer than from philosophy and theology came late in life. Perhaps the former made the latter possible. In any case, students must not get the impression that they will find R.'s technical systematic writings accessible without studying *Spirit*. On the other hand, Dych's summaries of R.'s theology are uniformly good, some excellent, e.g. on the supernatural, on nature and grace, on quasi-formal causality, and on sacraments. Students will find these sections invaluable. I personally found Dych's words on the obediential potency especially enriching, as well as his way of explaining symbol. There is a fine treatment of the Christian vocation centered on sacramental life. If one theme could be said to unify the whole, it might be that of grace as permeating all of life. R. emerges as the theologian of personal and social becoming through free response to God's unfailing grace experienced throughout history.

This is the best brief general introduction to R. now available, and it deserves to be highly recommended. It is accessible, solid, and authoritative.

ANDREW TALLON
Marquette University

LONERGAN. By Frederick E. Crowe, S.J. *Outstanding Christian Thinkers*. Collegeville: Liturgical; and London: Chapman, 1992. Pp. xiv + 146. \$12.95.

This work is unique in more than one way. Crowe knew his subject closely: he was Lonergan's student, colleague, and friend, and clearly he was "hooked for life," as he discretely hints (136), when he first learned about a fresh way of thinking and then watched the unfolding of intellectual discoveries. He had the opportunity to follow L.'s own struggle—literally from the beginning to the end—to bring Catholic theology to the "level of the times." When writing this book, Crowe counted 44 years of reflection on what he heard, read, and assimilated. From such capital the present work was born.

This is not a biography of Lonergan; that is still to be written. Nor is it an Introduction to his ideas, such as Maynell has given us. It is a presentation of the context in which L. lived and worked on both sides of the Atlantic. Even more, it is the saga of an intellectual venture that started with the great vision of *Pantón Anakephalaiósis* (the title of an article in 1935 with reference to the Pauline idea of bringing everything together in Christ) and eventually led to the understanding of the self-structuring dynamism of the intelligence (*Insight*) and to a new way of theologizing that springs from the experience of the Spirit poured out into the heart of the converted and reflecting subject (*Method*).

I found Crowe particularly enlightening in explaining L.'s long struggle to assign the correct place to history

in the theological enterprise; also I appreciated his nuanced evaluation of *Method*. This is a work that only Crowe could have written: the passionate dedication to his former teacher is finely balanced by a critically grounded exposition of L.'s development and achievement.

LADISLAS ORSY, S.J.
Georgetown University Law Center

THEOLOGICAL HERMENEUTICS: DEVELOPMENT AND SIGNIFICANCE. By Werner G. Jeanrond. New York: Crossroad, 1991. Pp. xv + 220. \$22.95.

Jeanrond's previous volume, *Text and Interpretation as Categories of Theological Thinking*, was principally an outline of Gadamer on interpretation, Ricoeur on the interpreted text, and David Tracy on the classic as applied to theological texts. Its last section shifted from a focus on linguistic theory of texts in general to the character of theological texts in particular. The present volume carries forward the discussion of Christian theology as itself a hermeneutical task. A bibliography of basic, oft-cited sources is accessible to readers of English.

Though the volume opens as an historical survey of theological hermeneutics prior to the modern era, the jump from Augustine to the Protestant Reformation can hardly do justice to either Augustine or the following millennium. The real aim of the volume is to outline the history of modern philosophical hermeneutics starting with Schleiermacher, Dilthey, and Heidegger as predecessors of Gadamer and Ricoeur. J. accounts for the impact of philosophical hermeneutics on Christian theology, localized in the argument between Barth and Bultmann. As a side-line, J. devotes some discussion to the nature of the written text, but this is a review of basic linguistics. A chapter

on reader-response theory is more extensive, in contrast to the short shrift it received in *Text and Interpretation*. J. seems to have shifted his allegiance from the normativity of text to the act of reading.

A final chapter on the new hermeneutics presents the challenges posed by three Christian theological paradigms: defense of dogmatic certainty, text-interpretation as dialogue with culture and world, and intra-textual consideration. On the question of whether text (Scripture), tradition (doctrine), or interpretation (theological hermeneutics) is ultimately normative for the Christian community, J. argues for the third.

MARIE-ELOISE ROSENBLATT, R.S.M.
Santa Clara University

SCIENCE AS SALVATION: A MODERN MYTH AND ITS MEANING. By Mary Midgley. New York: Routledge, 1992. Pp. x + 239. \$25.

The meaning of life is the subject of a central, unending search. Science, recognized as dangerous, yet seen as quasi-omnipotent, has pushed God off the stage as one element of the answer to that probing. Science has become the modern means to salvation. "Salvation" is a rich term, carrying with it tremendous baggage in the form of myths, epics, prophetic writings, and words of wisdom. As the modern means of salvation, science too has gathered around itself a vast, imaginative, sometimes phantasmagoric panoply of mythic elements.

Midgley seeks to explore this world where science saves the human family. She does not attack science. She does question whether we are dealing with an almost nightmarish distortion of the quintessential Reformation doctrine that transmogrifies its motto into "salvation through science alone."

M. objects to the tendency of some scientific writers to isolate science

from the rest of intellectual life. The situation has become more distressing as science becomes rigidly technical and less intelligible to anyone outside the steadily contracting circle of experts who can treat carefully circumscribed topics. A special interest surrounds M.'s analysis of scientists influenced by Marxism, now that at least Soviet Marxism has been swept away by the political judgements of the former Soviet peoples. Equally incisive, however, is her critique of the thought of Jacques Monod and his dour statistical atheism. M. is particularly taken by Freeman Dyson's attack on Monod. Yet Dyson in turn becomes a subject of largely critical analysis.

In her magisterial work, M. does not urge us to esteem science less, but to esteem it rightly and without artificial isolation from the rest of human cultural life. And yet, M. does not adduce tools that even approach some of the questions the scientific thinkers she criticizes struggle with. E.g., if the genetic code is now open to us, is human nature any more a constant? If not, may we reshape it? If so, in what ways? Not a problem that can be solved by just demanding that science limit itself to the problems of today without a necessarily imaginative and somewhat free-wheeling concern for tomorrow.

FRANK R. HAIG, S.J.
Loyola College, Baltimore

HEIGHTENED CONSCIOUSNESS: THE MYSTICAL DIFFERENCE. By David Granfield. New York: Paulist, 1991. Pp. vi + 219. \$12.95.

This excellent book succeeds partially in transposing mystical theology into a contemporary framework by using Lonergan's cognitional theory and Rahner's transcendental Thomism. As a critical realist, Granfield understands mysticism as consciousness of the mediated immediacy

of the human spirit's unrestricted desire to know and love God. To G., positive kataphatics appreciates creaturely beauty as the highest manifestation of divine glory. Nevertheless, the precariousness of our possession of creaturely beauty highlights our insatiable desire for God. Negative kataphatics affirms God's wisdom in the face of suffering and evil. Moreover, G. insists that positive apophatics, engendered by self-transcending love, results in a fecund nothingness, which gives the most intimate, conatural, awareness of the divine presence. It also reveals the sterility of negative apophatics.

However, G. does not understand Ignatian prayer (18 ff.). *Pace G.*, spirit, not only matter, makes persons unique (22). Is the mystical life one of temporal progression, as G.'s kataphatic-apophatic-anaphatic scheme implies? The requisite signs calling a person to the apophatic way are not mentioned. One might agree with Rahner and G. concerning the natural distinction between acquired and infused contemplation, but still disagree with G. that a graced distinction would be miraculous. In saying, "it is not clear that all holy people are mystics or that mystics are always the holiest of holy people" (142-43), G. seemingly contradicts his own description of mystical consciousness. If "the crucial act of the mystic is not in emptying the mind but in loving God" (133), how can G. assert that only positive apophatics gives perfect knowledge of God? The apophatic tradition insists that God is beyond *both* knowing *and* unknowing. I maintain that only a Christian elite can profit from G.'s call to use one's own alpha waves as a mantra in prayer (131). If consciousness is always both intentional and self-conscious, how is it possible psychologically to replace intentionality by a self-consciousness of one's unrestricted openness? Does

G.'s overemphasis upon positive apophatics ultimately undermine the historical, incarnational foundations of *Christian* heightened consciousness?

HARVEY D. EGAN, S.J.
Boston College

JUST PEACEMAKING: TRANSFORMING INITIATIVES FOR JUSTICE AND PEACE. By Glen H. Stassen. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 288. \$16.95.

Stassen's wide-ranging yet thematically unified work presents a "just peacemaking theory" as supporting pacifism and filling out the criteria of just-war theory (233). S. skillfully interweaves his extensive knowledge of international affairs, and especially of "the Turning" (the nonviolent revolution in East Germany), with a study of the call for peace in the New Testament. Of particular note is his new but thoroughly convincing reading of the "triadic" structure of Matthew's Sermon on the Mount, which directs the evangelized toward concrete transforming initiatives against the bondage of sinful practices. Thus "love your enemies," e.g., becomes the practical political "affirm their valid interests" (77).

The heart of the book is S.'s seven steps of just peacemaking, which emerge from his political and scriptural analyses. He supports each step with concrete examples. In connection with step 2, "Take Independent Initiatives," he discusses the formulation and implementation of the nuclear "zero option" in Europe, which was "not proposed but *opposed* by Washington" (117). To support his step 4, "Seek Human Rights and Justice," S. discusses the Christian origin of human rights before the Enlightenment in his illuminating presentation of Richard Overton. He uses the specific recovery program of Al-Anon to illustrate how concretely we are to

acknowledge and emerge from vicious cycles (step 5).

With such substantiation in their introduction, S.'s criteria for just peace are considerably less formal and open to manipulation than the criteria for just war. This is an informative and important work which will enlighten both the academic and broader human audiences which S. addresses.

G. SIMON HARAK, S.J.
Fairfield University

THE CHURCH AND POLITICS IN THE CHILEAN COUNTRYSIDE. By Hannah W. Stewart-Gambino. Boulder, Colo.: Westview, 1992. Pp. vii + 200. \$49.95.

A study of the interaction of the Catholic Church and agrarian politics in Chile from 1925 to 1964. Stewart-Gambino argues that, despite a verbal commitment to the social doctrine of the Church and to an officially neutral position in partisan politics after separation of Church and state in 1925, many Chilean bishops and priests continued for decades afterwards to offer clear moral support for the reactionary Conservative Party. They did this to stop the advance of Marxism in Chile, especially in the countryside where this party was the major political bulwark against the left. Only when the Conservative Party began to lose ground politically in the late 1950s did the Church begin to create significant change-oriented social programs for peasants and to shift its tacit support to a progressive Christian Democratic Party as a more effective defender of church interests rurally and in national society.

S. argues that she is unique in reaching these conclusions, and that she is the first to have studied the structural constraints placed on Chilean church decision making by the political system. Unfortunately, she

misrepresents the work of other scholars, including my own book (*The Church and Politics in Chile*, Princeton, 1982), at times citing quotes out of context. I actually make arguments similar to hers, documenting significant episcopal support for the right well beyond 1925 as well as strong urban Catholic electoral support for the Conservative Party as late as 1958. I also show that new political configurations (the decline of Conservative Party power, an upsurge of Marxism, and the emergence of a viable Christian centrist party) were major (albeit not exclusive) reasons why the Church created widespread social programs to stop the left after 1958 and offered tacit, but clear support for Christian Democracy leading up to the 1964 presidential election.

Her misrepresentations flaw an otherwise well-researched and clearly written book that offers important data on religion and politics in the Chilean countryside during the first half of this century.

BRIAN H. SMITH

Ripon College, Wisconsin

AFRICAN THEOLOGY IN ITS SOCIAL CONTEXT. By Bénézet Bujo. Translated from the German by John O'Donohue. Faith and Cultures. Maryknoll: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 143. \$16.95.

Bujo is one of Black Africa's most original and most respected theologians. He is committed to an approach to theology which rediscovers and reappropriates traditional African culture in such a way that it can contribute to the struggle against both domestic and foreign sources of oppression. In this sense Bujo would align himself with "post-colonial liberation theology." He insists that the task of African theology is to bring the essentials of African tradition and the basics of Christian faith into creative dialogue, and that African tradition, once purified, renewed, and

stimulated by the message of Jesus, can fulfill its role as a powerful force for the revitalization of African societies.

Bujo's first part analyzes African society before and during the colonial period. Of particular note is Bujo's explanation of the hierarchical ordering and mediational role of the ancestors in the "salvation-history" system of African traditions. All members of the community, the ancestors included, have the responsibility to transmit, protect and enhance the life of the group and of each of its members. The traditions of the words and deeds of the ancestors provide the key for knowing how to foster life in the fullest sense. His judgment on the inculturation of Christianity into African culture is that "the failure has been complete" (73).

Part 2 contains two samples of the sort of African theology for which Bujo is arguing and to which he himself is contributing. He proposes an African Christology in which Christ is understood as Proto-Ancestor, the one who, risen from the dead, has life, is life, awakens others to fullness of life. He successfully places this model within the mainstream of Christian tradition by situating it integrally within the paschal mystery and Incarnation. Building on this Christology, Bujo addresses questions about the organization of the Christian community. He spells out the responsibilities of pope, bishops, priests, religious, expatriate missionaries, and the ordinary believer from the perspective of a Proto-Ancestor ecclesiology. The work concludes with two "test cases" which illustrate how such a Christology and ecclesiology would permeate all dimensions of Christian life: the so-called "trial marriage", especially childless marriage, and the death and care of the dying.

GERALD R. BLASZCZAK, S.J.

Syracuse, N.Y.

Theological Studies

JUNE 1993
VOL. 54, NO. 2

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Society of Jesus in the United States*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

<i>Ressentiment and the Preferential Option for the Poor</i> <i>Patrick H. Byrne</i>	213
<i>Proper and Improper Partiality and the Preferential Option for the Poor</i> <i>Stephen J. Pope</i>	242
<i>Method in Ethics: A Scotistic Contribution</i> <i>Thomas A. Shannon</i>	272
<i>The Function of the Principle of Double Effect</i> <i>James F. Keenan, S.J.</i>	294
<i>Moral Methodology and Pastoral Responsiveness: The Case of Abortion and the Care of Children</i> <i>Todd David Whitmore</i>	316

BOOK REVIEWS

The Women's Bible Commentary (eds. C. Newsom and S. Ringe)	339
MURRAY, R.: <i>The Cosmic Covenant</i>	341
GIBLIN, C.: <i>The Book of Revelation</i>	342
SCHÜSSLER FIORENZA, E.: <i>But She Said</i>	344
KOSCHORKE, K.: <i>Spuren der alten Liebe</i>	345
SOUTHERN, R.: <i>Saint Anselm</i>	347
AWLIYA, N.: <i>Morals of the Heart</i>	350
<i>Christian Unity: The Council of Ferrara-Florence</i> (ed. G. Alberigo)	351
BAGCHI, D.: <i>Luther's Earliest Opponents</i>	354
O'BRIEN, D.: <i>Isaac Hecker</i>	356
HINCHLIFF, P.: <i>God and History</i>	358
KRENSKI, T.: <i>Passio Caritatis</i>	360
KLAGHOFER-TREITLER, W.: <i>Gotteswort im Menschenwort</i>	360
MEUFFELS, H.: <i>Einbergung des Menschen in die dreieinige Liebe</i>	360
LEUNG, B.: <i>Sino-Vatican Relations</i>	363
SWEENEY, L.: <i>Divine Infinity in Greek and Medieval Thought</i>	365

CUNNINGHAM, D.: Faithful Persuasion	366
PIKE, N.: Mystic Union	368
CORRINGTON, R.: Nature and Spirit	369
JOHNSON, E.: She Who Is	371
BRACKEN, J.: Society and Spirit	373
DUFFY, S.: The Graced Horizon	375
BERMEJO, L.: Infallibility on Trial	376
CRAGG, K.: The Arab Christian	378
FIELD-BIBB, J.: Women Towards Priesthood	379

SHORTER NOTICES..... 381

MOBERLY, R.: The Old Testament of the Old Testament	LOADER, J.: A Tale of Two Cities
FITZMYER, J.: Responses to 101 Questions on the Dead Sea Scrolls	NIEHOFF, M.: The Figure of Joseph in Post-Biblical Jewish Literature
SCHIMMELPFENNIG, B.: The Papacy	REES, B. (tr.): The Letters of Pelagius and His Followers
MCNAMARA, J., ET AL.: Sainted Women of the Dark Ages	UPTON-WARD, J. (tr.): Rule of the Templars
OHLY, F.: The Damned and the Elect	WEISS, R.: Maimonides' Ethics
RUSSELL, J.: Dissent and Order in the Middle Ages	KLEINBERG, A.: Prophets in Their Own Country
JANSEN, S.: Political Protest and Prophecy under Henry VIII	GREEN, R.: Kierkegaard and Kant
MCCREADY, D.: Jesus Christ for the Modern World	DORÉ, J. (ed.): Les Cent Ans de la Faculté de Théologie
WEST, T.: Ultimate Hope without God	DYCH, W.: Karl Rahner
CROWE, F.: Lonergan	JEANROND, W.: Theological Hermeneutics
MIDGELEY, M.: Science as Salvation	GRANFIELD, D.: Heightened Consciousness
STASSEN, G.: Just Peacemaking	STEWART-GAMBINO, H.: The Church and Politics in the Chilean Countryside
BUJO, B.: African Theology in Its Social Context	

BOOKS RECEIVED 397

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES (ISSN 0040-5639) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057. Second class postage paid at Washington, DC and at additional mailing offices. **POSTMASTER**, please send address changes to **THEOLOGICAL STUDIES**, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION 1993: U.S. individual: \$18; U.S. institutional: \$25; foreign individual: \$25 U.S. currency; foreign institutional: \$30 U.S. currency.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS and all correspondence dealing with subscriptions should be sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA; phone (800) 352-2210 or (717) 632-3535.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy or a computer printout of letter-perfect quality and a legible duplicate), **TOGETHER WITH RETURN POSTAGE**, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02167, USA. Author should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Georgetown University, 37 and O. Sts., N.W., Washington, DC 20057, USA.

BACK ISSUES are available from Theological Studies, Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057, USA. Single copies prepaid: \$6 in U.S.; \$8 outside U.S.

FOR REPRINTS AND EARLIER ISSUES IN MICROFORM (35mm. and fiche), contact University Microfilms, Inc., 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1356, USA.

June 1993 features five articles on various aspects of Christian ethics: the "preferential option," the foundations of proportionalism, the principle of double effect, and methodological and pastoral issues connected with abortion and the care of children.

Ressentiment and the Preferential Option for the Poor addresses the challenge that this notion might originate in the volitional attitude Nietzsche termed *ressentiment*. Analyzing Nietzsche's attack on Christian concern for the poor, and then the notion of a preferential option, Byrne draws on the work of Bernard Lonergan to offer construals of these Christian notions which would be free from the charge of *ressentiment*. PATRICK H. BYRNE, associate professor of Philosophy at Boston College, with his Ph.D. from the State University of New York at Stony Brook, specializes also in social ethics, Lonergan, and Aristotle. He is the author of "Insight and the Retrieval of Natural Law," *Lonergan Workshop 8* (1990), and has recently completed a book-length study, "Analysis and Science in Aristotle."

Proper and Improper Partiality in the Preferential Option for the Poor argues that the preferential option, properly understood, includes both a proper partiality of care for the needy and a balanced impartiality based on commitment to justice for all, an unbiased desire to know the truth, and a proper appreciation of the universality of God's love. It concludes with indications of the work still needing to be done by theorists of the preferential option. STEPHEN J. POPE, Ph.D. from the University of Chicago, assistant professor of social ethics at Boston College, specializes in theories of love and justice, the ethics of Aquinas, evolutionary theory, and theological ethics. He is the author of the recent "Agape and Human Nature: Contributions from Neo-Darwinism," *Social Science Information* 31 (1992), and the forthcoming *Love, Human Nature, and Catholic Ethics* (Georgetown University Press).

Method in Ethics: A Scotistic Contribution argues that, in Scotus's ethical theory with its shift from final to efficient causality, one can discover insights which help ground the distinction between premoral and moral evil, qualify the concept of intrinsic evil, and demonstrate the insufficiency of the structure of the material act for moral specification. THOMAS A. SHANNON, Paris Fletcher Distinguished Professor and Professor of Religion and Social Ethics at Worcester Polytechnic Institute, has his Ph.D. from Boston University. He specializes in bioethics and social ethics, is the editor of the forthcoming 4th edition of *Bioethics: Selected Readings* (Paulist, 1993), and is currently working on issues of human individuality and dignity in the context of genetic uniqueness and diversity.

The Function of the Principle of Double Effect, using recent studies

on casuistry, questions the legitimacy of the present practice of applying the principle of double effect to complicated cases in order to determine justifiable courses of action, and argues instead that the principle has not a justifying, but primarily a confirming and heuristic function. JAMES F. KEENAN, S.J., an S.T.D. from Rome's Gregorian University who specializes in virtue ethics, Aquinas, and the history of moral theology, is associate professor of moral theology at the Weston School of Theology, Cambridge, Mass. Author of the recent *Goodness and Rightness in Thomas Aquinas' Summa Theologiae* (Georgetown, 1992), he is also coeditor with Thomas Shannon of a collection of articles on casuists and their predecessors.

Moral Theology and Pastoral Responsiveness: The Case of Abortion and the Care of Children argues that the way in which one methodologically frames a moral problem shapes the pastoral responses one perceives to be plausible. E.g., a deductive method focuses on the issue of the status of the fetus at the expense of the broader social context that pressures women to have abortions. The "responsibility" approach illumines this broader context and suggests that the primary pastoral task of the Church is to join and aid women in the care of children. With his Ph.D. from the University of Chicago, TODD DAVID WHITMORE is assistant professor of social ethics at Notre Dame and codirector of the Woodstock Theological Center/University of Notre Dame Joint Project on John Courtney Murray. Author of recent articles on religious liberty and on just-war thought, he is currently working on a book-length project entitled "The Common Good and the Care of Children: A Catholic Response to Abortion."

Robert J. Daly, S.J.
Editor

BOOKS RECEIVED

SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

- Cassidy, R. *John's Gospel in New Perspective*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 132. \$39.95; \$18.95.
- Charles, J. *Literary Strategy in the Epistle of Jude*. Cranbury, N.J.: Univ. of Scranton, 1993. Pp. 258. \$39.50.
- Day, A. *Roget's Thesaurus of the Bible*. S.F.: HarperSanFrancisco, 1992. Pp. 927. \$28.
- Derrett, J. *The Victim: The Johannean Passion*. Shipston-on-Stour, England: Peter I. Drinkwater, 1993. Pp. 300. £18.50.
- Evans, C. *Noncanonical Writings and New Testament Interpretation*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1992. Pp. 281.
- Hillyer, N. *1 and 2 Peter, Jude*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1992. Pp. 297. \$9.95.
- Lambrecht, J. *The Wretched "T" and Its Liberation*. Louvain: Peeters; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1992. Pp. 165. Fr.b. 695.
- Levine, B. *Numbers 1-20*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1993. Pp. 528. \$40.
- Lindars, B. *Essays on John*. Louvain: Louvain Univ./Peeters, 1992. Pp. 233. Fr.b. 1000.
- Lührmann, D. *Galatians*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992. Pp. 161.
- McGlasson, P. *God the Redeemer*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 192. \$11.99.
- Mitchell, S. *A Book of Psalms*. N.Y.: HarperCollins, 1993. Pp. 87. \$17.50.
- Neusner, J. *A Rabbi Talks with Jesus*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1993. Pp. 154. \$21.
- Senior, D. *Jesus*. Rev. ed. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 161. \$9.95.
- Smiga, G. *Pain and Polemic*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 212. \$9.95.
- Stadelmann, L. *Love and Politics*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 243. \$9.95.
- Villey, L. *Soumission: La fonction d'une préposition (hypo)*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1992. Pp. 530. Fr. 198.

SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY

- Anglin, W. *Free Will and the Christian Faith*. N.Y.: Oxford/Clarendon, 1990. Pp. 218. \$55.
- Between the Flood and the Rainbow*. Ed. P. Niles. Geneva: WCC, 1992. Pp. 175. \$9.95.
- Bieler, M. *Freiheit als Gabe*. Freiburg: Herder, 1991. Pp. 528. DM 58.
- Braaten, C. *No Other Gospel!* Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992. Pp. 146.
- Carmody, D. *Mythological Woman*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 160. \$11.95.
- Cuschieri, A. *Anointing of the Sick*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1993. Pp. 188. \$39.50; \$22.50.
- Herder, J. *Against Pure Reason*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 264.
- Horizons on Catholic Feminist Theology*. Ed. J. and W. Conn. Washington: Georgetown Univ., 1992. Pp. 207. \$30.
- Joha, Z. *Christologie und Anthropologie*. Freiburg im Br.: Herder, 1992. Pp. 399. DM 68.
- Karl Rahner: *The Content of Faith*. Ed. K. Lehmann et al. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 668. \$42.
- La Mariologia nell'organizzazione delle discipline teologiche collocazione e metodo*. Ed. E. Peretto. Rome: Marianum, 1992. Pp. 532.
- Lies, L., and S. Hell. *Heils-Mysterium*. Graz: Styria, 1992. Pp. 351. ö.S. 350.
- Livingston, J. *Anatomy of the Sacred*. 2d ed. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1993. Pp. 460.

- Lodahl, M. *Shekhinah/Spirit*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 236. \$11.95.
- Ludwig, T. *The Sacred Paths of the East*. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1993. Pp. 310.
- Marthaler, B. *The Creed*. Rev. ed. Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1993. Pp. 480. \$14.95.
- Mooney, H. *The Liberation of Consciousness: Lonergan in Dialogue with von Balthasar*. Frankfurt/Main: Josef Knecht, 1992. Pp. 284. DM 58.
- Mysticism and Language*. Ed. S. Katz. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1992. Pp. 262. \$38.
- Norris, F. *The Apostolic Faith*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 178. \$14.95.
- O'Connor, J. *Land of the Living*. N.Y.: Catholic Book, 1992. Pp. 350.
- Of Human Bondage and Divine Grace*. Ed. J. Carter. LaSalle, Ill.: Open Court, 1992. Pp. 330. \$56.95; \$21.95.
- Padgett, A. *God, Eternity and the Nature of Time*. N.Y.: St. Martin's, 1992. Pp. 173. \$55.
- Pope-Levison, P., and J. Levison. *Jesus in Global Contexts*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 208. \$17.99.
- Prevost, R. *Probability and Theistic Explanation*. N.Y.: Oxford/Clarendon, 1990. Pp. 195. \$59.
- Reist, B. *Processive Revelation*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 205. \$25.
- Wagner, M. *The Sacred World of the Christian*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 147. \$9.95.
- Zitnik, M. *Sacramenta: Bibliographia Internationalis 1-4*. Rome: Pont. Univ. Gregoriana, 1992. Pp. 1170 + 1079 + 1038 + 450. \$109 + \$92 + \$84 + \$52.
- Bodo, M. *Tales of St. Francis*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1993. Pp. 187. \$7.95.
- Caraman, P. *A Study in Friendship*. Anand, India: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1991. Pp. 106. \$4.
- Carmody D. and J. *Original Visions*. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1993. Pp. 114.
- Charles Pietri. Ed. P. Levillain and J.-R. Armogathe. Paris: Beauchesne, 1988. Pp. 224. Fr. 120.
- Chittister, J. *The Rule of Benedict*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 180. \$11.95.
- "*Con tutte le tue forze*": *Omaggio a Giuseppe Dossetti*. Ed. A. and G. Alberigo. Genoa, Italy: Marietti, 1993. Pp. 400. L. 48,000.
- The Dawn of Religious Pluralism*. Ed. R. Seager. LaSalle, Ill.: Open Court, 1993. Pp. 502. \$59.95; \$28.95.
- Eggensperger, T., and U. Engel. *Bartolomé de las Casas*. Mainz: Grünewald, 1991. Pp. 154. DM 12.80.
- Grant, R. *Heresy and Criticism*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 160. \$17.
- Hamman, A. *How to Read the Church Fathers*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 132. \$19.95.
- Haren, M. *Medieval Thought*. 2d ed. Toronto: Univ. of Toronto, 1992. Pp. 315. \$60; \$19.95.
- Hochstetler, D. *A Conflict of Traditions*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1992. Pp. 232. \$42.50.
- Kleineidam, E. *Universitas Studii Erfordensis 2: 1461-1521*. 2d ed. Leipzig: Benno, 1992. Pp. xxvi + 398.
- Kristeller, P. *Medieval Aspects of Renaissance Learning*. N.Y.: Columbia Univ., 1993. [1974]. Pp. 195. \$40; \$15.
- Le Joly, E. *Mother Teresa*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria, 1993. Pp. 191. \$7.95
- Liebes, Y. *Studies in Jewish Myth and Jewish Messianism*. Albany,

HISTORICAL

- Bacik, J. *Tensions in the Church*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 171. \$9.95.

- N.Y.: SUNY, 1992. Pp. 226. \$49.50; \$16.95.
- Origeniana Quinta*. Ed. R. Daly. Louvain: Louvain Univ., 1992. Pp. 635. Fr.b. 2700.
- Paganism and Christianity 100-425*. Ed. R. Macmullen and E. Lane. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992. Pp. 296.
- Pekar, A. *The History of the Church in Carpathian Rus'*. N.Y.: Columbia Univ., 1992. Pp. 296.
- The Religious World*. 3d ed. Ed. R. Bush et al. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1993.
- Rubin, M. *Corpus Christi*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1992 [1991]. Pp. 432. \$22.95.
- Saint Augustine, *Four Anti-Pelagian Writings*. Fathers of the Church. Washington: Catholic Univ. of America, Pp. 351. \$36.95.
- St. John Chrysostom, *Homilies on Genesis 46-67*. Fathers of the Church. Washington: Catholic Univ. of America, 1992. Pp. 288. \$34.95.
- Taft, R. *The Byzantine Rite*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 84. \$9.95.
- Turner, P. *Sources of Confirmation*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 94. \$6.95.
- Walsh, M. *Opus Dei*. S.F.: HarperSan-Francisco, 1992 [1989] Pp. 230. \$18.95.
- Weigel, G. *The Final Revolution*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1992. Pp. 255. \$25.
- What is Scientology?* Ed. Church of Scientology. L.A.: Bridge, 1992. Pp. 835.
- MORALITY AND LAW**
- Bosk, C. *All God's Mistakes*. University of Chicago, 1992. Pp. 195 \$24.95.
- Cobb, J. *Sustainability*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. 130. \$39.95; \$16.95.
- Curran, C. *The Living Tradition of Catholic Moral Theology*. Notre Dame: Notre Dame Univ., 1992. Pp. 265. \$27.95.
- Ethics, Religion, and the Good Society*. Ed. J. Runzo. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 224. \$24.99.
- Im Dienst der Armen*. Ed. T. Fliethmann and C. Lücking-Michel. Münster: Aschendorff, 1992. Pp. 117. DM 32.
- Jones, A. *Capitalism and Christians*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 90. \$6.95.
- Maguire, D. *The Moral Core of Judaism and Christianity*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 286.
- McLellan, D. *Unto Caesar*. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1993. Pp. 102. \$19.95.
- McMahon, E. *Beyond the Myth of Dominance*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 273. \$16.95.
- Olasky, M. *The Tragedy of American Compassion*. Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 1992. Pp. 299. \$21.95.
- Prospects for a Common Morality*. Ed. G. Outka and J. Reeder. Princeton: Princeton Univ., 1992. Pp. 302. \$47.50; \$16.95.
- Religion and Politics in Comparative Perspective*. Westport, Conn.: Praeger, 1992. Pp. 240. \$45.
- Responding to Communalism*. Ed. S. Arokiasamy. Anand: Gujarat, 1991. Pp. 357. \$13; \$10.50.
- Rivers, I. *Reason, Grace, and Sentiment 1: Whichcote to Wesley*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1991. Pp. 277.
- The Search for Identity*. St. Louis: Catholic Health Association of the U.S., 1993. Pp. 88.
- Stefano, F. *The Absolute Value of Human Action in the Theology of Juan Luis Segundo*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1992. Pp. 330. \$42.50.
- Townes, E. *Womanist Justice, Womanist Hope*. Atlanta: Scholars, 1993. Pp. 229. \$29.95; \$19.95.
- Wisdo, D. *The Life of Irony and the*

- Ethics of Belief*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1993. Pp. 153. \$44.50; \$14.95.
- PASTORAL, SPIRITUAL,
AND LITURGICAL**
- Amaladoss, M. *Walking Together*. Anand: Gujarat, 1992. Pp. 185. \$8.50; \$6.50.
- Andrews, L. *To Thine Own Self Be True*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1993. Pp. 240. \$12.
- Barber, R. *Pilgrimages*. Rochester, N.Y.: Boydell, 1991. Pp. 159.
- Barry, W. *God's Passionate Desire and Our Response*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1993. Pp. 143. \$6.95.
- Bondi, R. *To Pray and To Love*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 152.
- Boyer, M. *Breathing Deeply of God's New Life*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1993. Pp. 170. \$7.95.
- Bundesen, L. *So the Woman Went Her Way*. N.Y.: Simon & Schuster, 1993. Pp. 207. \$20.
- Calkins, A. *Totus Tuus*. Libertyville, Ill.: Academy of the Immaculate, 1992. Pp. 334.
- A Calvin Treasury*. Ed. W. Keesecker. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992 [1962]. Pp. 206. \$7.99.
- Care of the Dying*. St. Louis: Catholic Health Association of the U.S., 1993. Pp. 68.
- Cave, D. *Mircea Eliade's Vision for a New Humanism*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993. Pp. 218. \$35.
- Chesto, K. *Why Are the Dandelions Weeds?* Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 147. \$8.95.
- Chupungco, A. *Shaping the Easter Feast*. Washington: Pastoral, 1992. Pp. 106. \$9.95.
- Collins, P. *Bodying Forth*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 187. \$12.95.
- DeBlassie, P. *Toxic Christianity*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1992. Pp. 170. \$17.95.
- De Mello, A. *More One Minute Nonsense*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1993. Pp. 161. \$10.95.
- Dominguez, L. *Las "Afecciones Desordenadas"*. Bilbao: Mensajero/Sal Terrae, 1993. Pp. 180.
- Ejercicios Espirituales y Mundo de Hoy*. Ed. J. Garcia-Lomas. Bilbao: Mensajero/Sal Terrae, 1992. Pp. 398. Ptas 2650.
- Elior, R. *The Paradoxical Ascent to God*. Albany: SUNY, 1992. Pp. 179. \$49.50; \$16.95.
- Empirical Theology*. Ed. R. Miller. Birmingham, Ala.: Religious Education, 1992. Pp. 304. \$18.95.
- Evans, D. *Spirituality and Human Nature*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1992. Pp. 314. \$44.50; \$14.95.
- Exploring Sacred Landscapes*. Ed. M. Randour. N.Y.: Columbia Univ., 1993. Pp. 217. \$40.
- Giuliani, M. *La Experiencia de los Ejercicios Espirituales en la Vida*. Bilbao: Mensajero/Sal Terrae, 1993. Pp. 148.
- Guide pratique de réflexion théologique*. Lyon: Université Catholique, 1992. Pp. 157.
- Hart, R. *Crossing the Border*. Springfield, Ill.: Templegate, 1993. Pp. 159. \$14.95.
- In the Company of Preachers*. Ed. R. Siegried and E. Ruane. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 227. \$13.95.
- Jones, R. *Prayers for Puppies, Aging Autos, and Sleepless Nights*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 96. \$6.99.
- Kenny, J. *Loving and Learning*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1992. Pp. 189. \$7.95.
- King, T. *Merton*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 150. \$12.95.
- Kramer, H., and K. Kramer. *Conversations at Midnight*. N.Y.: Morrow, 1993. Pp. 240. \$18.
- La teologia pastorale*. Ed. P. Vanzan. Rome: Veritas, 1993. Pp. 384. L. 40,000.
- Lischer, R. *A Theology of Preaching*. Rev. ed. Durham, N.C.: Labyrinth, 1992. Pp. 103.

- Moore, S. *The Crucified Jesus Is No Stranger*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1992 [1977]. Pp. 116. \$6.95.
- New Age Spirituality*. Ed. D. Ferguson. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 336. \$22.
- Nubiola, R. *Missionary Musings*. Anand: Gujarat, 1991. Pp. 110. \$4.
- O'Sullivan et al. *An Ignatian Journey for Lay Apostles*. Anand: Gujarat, 1991. Pp. 106. \$4.
- Osmer, R. *Teaching for Faith*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 240. \$13.99.
- Philosophy, Religion and the Spiritual Life*. Ed. M. McGhee. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1992. Pp. 257. \$19.95.
- The Politics of Prayer*. Ed. H. Hitchcock. S.F.: Ignatius, 1992. Pp. 379. \$16.95.
- Pottebaum, G. *The Rites of People*. Rev. ed. Washington: Pastoral, 1992. Pp. 127. \$9.95.
- Quenot, M. *The Icon*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's, 1991. Pp. 176.
- Schall, J. *What Is God Like?* Collegeville: Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 250. \$14.95.
- The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*. Tr. G. Ganss. St. Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1992. Pp. 232. \$22.95; \$11.95.
- The Study of Liturgy*. Rev. ed. Ed. C. Jones et al. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1992. Pp. 601. \$18.95.
- Valles, C. *Tales of the City of God*. Anand: Gujarat, 1992. Pp. 211. \$7.
- White, J. *A Brief History of Christian Worship*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1993. Pp. 192.
- Winter, M. *The Gospel according to Mary*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 143. \$10.95.
- Wolff, P. *Discernment*. Liguori, Mo.: Triumph, 1993. Pp. 145. \$9.95.
- Lang, 1992. Pp. 208. \$39.95; \$29.95.
- Clarke, W. *Person and Being*. Milwaukee, Wisc.: Marquette Univ., 1993. Pp. 126. \$15.
- Critical Reasoning in Contemporary Culture*. Ed. R. Talaska. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1993. Pp. 422. \$59.50; \$19.95.
- Ethos e cultura: Studi in onore de Ezio Riodato 1-2*. Ed. E. Berti et al. Padua: Antenore, 1991. Pp. xiii + 1279.
- The Future of Thomism*. Ed. D. Hudson and D. Moran. Notre Dame: Notre Dame Univ., 1992. Pp. 320. \$17.50.
- Hallyn, F. *The Poetic Structure of the World*. N.Y.: Zone, 1990. Pp. 367. \$23.95.
- Hopper, S. *The Way of Transfiguration*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 337. \$24.95.
- Kierkegaard on Art and Communication*. Ed. G. Pattison. N.Y.: St. Martin's, 1992. Pp. 189. \$49.95.
- Martin, R. *Pierre Duhem*. LaSalle, Ill.: Open Court, 1991. Pp. 274. \$44.95; \$19.95.
- Nebelsick, H. *The Renaissance, the Reformation, and the Rise of Science*. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1992. Pp. 237. \$29.95.
- Primary Readings in Philosophy for Understanding Theology*. Ed. D. Allen and E. Springsted. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 308. \$19.99.
- Taub, L. *Ptolemy's Universe*. Chicago, Ill.: Open Court, 1993. Pp. 188. \$35.95; \$14.95.
- Waugh, P. *Practising Postmodernism, Reading Modernism*. London: Edward Arnold; New York: Routledge, 1992. Pp. 176.

SPECIAL QUESTIONS

PHILOSOPHY, OTHER DISCIPLINES

Ahanotu, A. *Religion, State and Society in Contemporary Africa*. N.Y.:

Catholicisme hier, aujourd'hui, demain 61: Saint-Germain d'Auxerre-Salut. Ed. G. Mathon et al.

Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1992. Col. 513-768. Fr. 162.

Cypser, C. *Lion and Lamb*. Katonah, N.Y.: Kim Pathways, 1992. Pp. 95.

Ecumenism: A Bibliographic Overview. Ed. M. Fahey. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood, 1992. Pp. 416. \$69.50.

Hunt, M. *College Catholics*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 172. \$9.95.

Kelsey, D. *To Understand God Truly*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 271. \$16.99.

Neusner, J. *Telling Tales*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 176. \$10.99.

Ong, W. *Faith and Contexts 1-2*. Atlanta: Scholars, 1992. Pp. 493. \$149.95.

Prebish, C. *Religion and Sport*. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood, 1992. Pp. 264. \$47.95.

Schwehn, M. *Exiles from Eden*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993. Pp. 143. \$19.95.

MOVING?

To insure uninterrupted service on your subscription, please notify us at least six weeks before you move.

1. Attach your address label from a recent issue in the space provided below. If label is not available, be sure to give your old address with Zip Code.

old label or complete old address

2. Print your name and new address below. Be sure to include Zip Code.

Name

Address

City State Zip

3. Mail a copy of this notice to: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.