

BOOK REVIEWS

THE PSALMS THROUGH THREE THOUSAND YEARS: PRAYERBOOK OF A CLOUD OF WITNESSES. By William L. Holladay. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. xi + 395. \$36.

Holladay has written the book for which many of us have been waiting, a compendium of Psalms interpretation that demonstrates both breadth and depth. He arranges his material in three major sections, focusing on composition, interpretation, and use of Psalms in ecclesial communities. He begins and concludes with remarks on the centrality of Psalm 23 in American faith, and how it has become "an American secular icon."

Biblical students will find Part 1, "The Psalms Take Shape," especially interesting. H. attempts here to reconstruct the composition, collection, annotation, and translation of the Psalms in the biblical period. He locates psalmody in discrete eras (David, Solomon, Second Temple) and areas (Jerusalem/Temple, the North); for the dating of Psalms, H. integrates many recent studies as well as drawing on his own work in Jeremiah (whom he sees as incorporating Psalm texts). This reviewer appreciated attention to psalmody in the Second Temple era, though H. focused heavily on early postexilic texts (Ezra-Nehemiah, Haggai, Zechariah) and paid less attention to later developments (especially Chronicles, which incorporates Psalm texts in its description of worship scenes). H. includes helpful summaries of newer Psalm study: G. Wilson on the editing process detectable in the Psalter, and W. Brueggemann on categories of social function of the Psalms: orientation (hymns), disorientation (laments), and new orientation (psalms of thanksgiving, trust).

Part 2, "The Psalter Through History," reviews Psalm use by Jews and Christians, from the Dead Sea texts through contemporary church developments, providing a fascinating overview of reception of the Psalms in both Synagogue and Church. H. catalogues their use at Qumran, in the New Testament, in Church Fathers (both Eastern and Western), during the medieval era, the Reformation, and up to the present day. Historical introductions to various eras help to locate Psalm use in wider liturgical, theological, and missiological contexts. H. provides access to a wealth of interpretive material; as a reference work alone the book is worth its price.

In Part 3, "Current Theological Issues," H. surveys the most thorny problems in contemporary Psalm use and suggests a way to read, hear, and pray the Psalms "through Jesus Christ our Lord." Among the

issues with which H. wrestles are: how to let the raw emotion and language of laments inform our spirituality and worship; why should one censor harsh texts (especially imprecations) from the Liturgy of the Hours and the Lectionary; problems of translation (literal, dynamic equivalence) and the contemporary audience, especially concerns raised by feminist hermeneutics. He recognizes the problem of prayer hostile to enemies, and thus concludes with a nuanced version of an old approach: praying them through Jesus Christ, and understanding the enemies as all the forces of evil which God's justice aims to redress.

Two indices fill out the wealth of information: lists of Psalms in the Divine Office of the Roman Catholic Church just before the Reformation, and of those used in the Eastern Orthodox Church. Bibliographic references must be sought in the footnotes, but the index of names helps to locate them. A scriptural index is also included.

A few issues invite critique. Some outstanding Psalm interpreters are never mentioned, including Westermann, whose theological treatment of laments showed the displacement of lament by confession of sin in Western Christianity. H. pays little attention to issues of social location, which could clarify some of the comments about Psalm genres and their settings. The chapter on New Testament appropriation of Psalms bulges with references; yet its contribution would be greater, if H. had reflected on the process of writing that makes such extensive use of Psalms, e.g. possible patterning of passion accounts after the structure of lament Psalms cited in them.

One could suggest a number of additions to the landscape H. has provided, but two will suffice. To the musicians listed, add the Protestant composer Heinrich Schütz (1585–1672), whose *Psalmen Davids* are most notable for their concern to convey the mood of a Psalm genre while attending to individual words. H.'s excellent review of the Roman Catholic scene between *Divino afflante spiritu* and Vatican II bypassed an important work, Pius Drijvers's *The Psalms*, which presented Gunkel's notion of Psalm genres to Catholics and showed how they might parallel Christian patterns of worship and prayer.

Finally, H. considers the hesitancy of contemporary churches to employ laments in worship, relating it to a desire to suppress public articulation of anger. Yet his study of Psalms used in Jewish worship reveals a similar pattern: laments are "spectacularly underrepresented" (144). Though Jewish and Christian patterns are similar, the social function of Psalms in each religious body can hardly be the same; so some deeper hermeneutical issue may be at stake. Such intriguing questions naturally arise from pondering H.'s masterful presentation of Psalm interpretation. This work will prove a treasure for

all whose theology, spirituality, and worship is nourished by the Psalms.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

JOHN C. ENDRES, S.J.

THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES. By Luke Timothy Johnson. *Sacra Pagina*. Collegeville: Glazier/Liturgical, 1992. Pp. xvi + 568. \$29.95.

The rapidly expanding *Sacra Pagina* series now boasts two handsome and engaging volumes on the Lucan opus which, like the objects of their attention, are two installments of a continuous work by a single author. Johnson deserves our congratulations and our gratitude for publishing back-to-back commentaries on the third Gospel and the Book of Acts within but two years, both with moderate-sized, cross-referential introductions followed by the familiar series format of independent translation, verse-by-verse notes, and discursive interpretation for each pericope. A modest general bibliography, all English-language, follows the introduction; but then more technical titles, including German and French, are listed after the expositions of individual pericopes. The targeted constituency is professional and semi-professional students of the Bible, of whom the latter, including graduate students, clergy, and religious educators, would appear to be the better served.

J., whose previous publications on Luke–Acts are well known, is completely at home in the territory, and the vitality and sagacity of his interpretation shows it. He stands in the mainstream of current Luke–Acts scholarship in judging the two volumes to be a sequential *opus historicum*, not popular biography or edifying romance, of which the intention is apologetic and the audience is within rather than outside the Gentile Christian community. The species of apologetics is theodicy, the justification of the ways of God, addressing the discomforts of Gentile believers over the success of their own mission at the apparent price of the wholesale repudiation of the gospel by the Jews. Pervasive recourse to the tradition and typology of biblical prophecy helps to present the missions of Jesus and the Apostles as the authentic continuation of biblical history.

The methods and textures of Luke's writing are recognizably Hellenistic, so that a host of analogies in contemporary Greek (and Latin) authors—principally the Jewish Josephus and Philo, but also influential pagans like Lucian of Samosata, Plutarch, and Philostratus—proves to be one of the most valuable features of the commentary for the specialized reader (check the voluminous index of ancient writings following the biblical index). J. understands that Luke wrote history as a man of his time, influenced by the techniques of archaism, speech

composition, scenic condensation, commentative summaries, etc., which were cultivated amongst the epigones of Herodotus and Thucydides (both amply represented in the ancient-author index). Hellenistic historiography transmitted substantial historical information, not just edifying fiction. Accordingly, J. practices exemplary moderation ("extreme positions should be avoided," he declares) on matters such as the author's credentials ("possibly but not certainly . . . a companion of Paul"), the extent and authority of his sources (greater in the second half of Acts than the first), and the historical basis of individual reports (instance the cautious appraisal of Acts 15, holding its own somewhat against Galatians 2; also the generally trustful appraisal of the Paul-record, obvious legends aside).

Nevertheless, in both narrative and speech-material, Luke told what *should have* occurred rather than what did. This assessment, together with the acknowledged Lucan mastery of the sources (e.g. Mark) in rewriting them, accounts for J.'s overall preference to interpret the text as its author's seamless line of argument, rather than attempt to diagnose his source-strands or excavate the bedrock of historical facts. Among the dividends of this approach is a consistent and stimulating exposition of the symmetries between the Gospel and the Acts, true to the fundamental insight that both books were designed as a unified and sequential story. The disadvantage of source-shyness shows up in areas like the threefold account of Paul's conversion and Stephen's intriguing speech, where an adequate understanding of Luke's argument demands at least a hypothetical discernment of sources which needed to be re-tuned in order to express it. J. waxes confident, for instance, that it is "futile and even fatuous" to prospect for the theological outlook of the historical "Hellenists" in Stephen's speech (119). Mistaken, maybe, but not "fatuous," considering that the patriarchal survey and anti-temple sentiments of the speech cannot fit seamlessly into Luke's Greek Bible or his theology of history. This is why another recent commentator on Acts, Rudolf Pesch, could assert just as confidently that Luke's originating authorship of Acts 7 is "out of the question," and its derivation from the real Stephen-circle is plausible though not provable (EKKNT 5/1 [Zürich: Benziger, 1986] 246). J. sounded better in the beginning: "extreme positions should be avoided."

Between the source-maximizers (Pesch, G. Lüdemann, M. Hengel) and the source-minimizers like J., I confess to feeling more at home with him. And in any case, I rejoice in recommending one—I should say, *two*—of the most gracefully erudite, historically astute, and theologically rewarding commentaries available in a frugal market.

COVENANT AND SACRIFICE IN THE LETTER TO THE HEBREWS. By John Dunnhill. Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series. New York: Cambridge University, 1992. Pp. xii + 297. \$54.95

Dunnhill gives us a structuralist interpretation of the sacrificial symbolism in Hebrews. He adopts a structuralist methodology as a heuristic tool that may overcome a failure he perceives in modern historical interpretations and render a holistic reading of the letter.

In his introduction D. catalogues the failure of historical methods to answer critical questions regarding the powerful imagery of Hebrews, which, were it properly understood, would yield a more unified interpretation of the letter. D.'s more complete understanding of Hebrews is predicated on his appreciation of the integration of imagery and theology in the letter, whose "individual parts have meaning not in themselves, nor in reference to anything outside, but in relation to the whole which they constitute" (9).

D. uses sociology tempered with social anthropology to elucidate the situation presupposed in the text, rather than the historical identification of the community to which it is addressed. He first gives a very brief review of social-science methods used by some New Testament interpreters. D. favors the approach which understands New Testament literature as sectarian, and he is strongly dependent on the work of Bryan Wilson here. The results of his sociological analysis indicate "that Hebrews is an encyclical letter addressed to a series of small churches of predominantly Jewish Christians, most probably in Western Asia Minor" (22).

D. goes on to discuss the role of structuralism in biblical interpretation in general, as well as its importance for reading Hebrews, and to apply structuralist categories to the institutions of covenant and sacrifice in the Old Testament. He intends at this point to provide a basis for grasping the meaning of Hebrews within the contexts of its own symbolic structures, with the hope of gaining a deeper knowledge of the Hebrews' author's intention in appealing to these structures.

The discussion of the letter proper seeks to explain the structuralist transformation of covenant and sacrifice as found within the "systematic interpretation of Christian salvation as fulfilment of Old Testament sacrificial cultus" (115). Subscribing to the Kantian possibility that a later reader may understand a text better than its author or its first readers did, D. understands the author of the letter to be doing the same by consciously interpreting Levitical material anew for his audience. At the heart of his argument lies the thesis that cultic elements are both more extensive and integral to Hebrews than has been previously thought. D. contends, furthermore, that these elements have been misunderstood "when viewed selectively in light of an expiatory ideology" (239). D. prefers the view that each composite symbol or rite

expresses the whole of the sacral system. The author of the letter intends to move away from the expiatory focus of Leviticus and towards an "inclusive covenant-symbolism." In the end, Hebrews presents a different notion of sacrality, facilitated by a covenant-renewal rite, expressed in an extensive prophetic exhortation throughout the letter. Hebrews offers a theology of communion with God in a new and better covenant.

This book is for the initiated, who have some familiarity with methods of biblical criticism other than historical methodologies. Neophytes will have a harder time grasping the subtlety of its arguments. D.'s structuralist approach successfully shows the centrality of rich cultic images in Hebrews. The frequent references, however, to the need for structuralism as a corrective for the failures of historical methods work against the book's purpose. Some of D.'s conclusions about the centrality of sacrificial symbolism, Jesus's role as High Priest in mediating a new and better covenant, and the importance of sacred speech are not unlike those of other scholars employing nonstructuralist methods.

This revised dissertation would increase in value were the bibliography and notes brought up to date. Several important works are missing, notably B. Lindars, "The Rhetorical Structure of Hebrews," *NTS* 35 (1989) 382-406, and Hans Friedrich Weiss's substantial commentary *Der Brief an die Hebräer* (1991).

Georgetown University

ALAN C. MITCHELL, S.J.

THE LAND CALLED HOLY: PALESTINE IN CHRISTIAN HISTORY AND THOUGHT. By Robert L. Wilken. New Haven: Yale University, 1992. Pp. xvi + 355. \$35.

Wilken studies the notion and reality of Palestine as "the Holy Land," with particular emphasis on Christian attitudes to the Land, and the extensive monastic and imperial settlements the Church established, especially in the three centuries when Christians held possession of Palestine. His opening chapters survey the theological and political significance of the land within the Hebrew Scriptures and trace attitudes toward the land up to the Diaspora, with Philo and the apocalyptic rebel movement of the mid-second century. This is a useful context for what is to come, and W.'s biblical and rabbinic expertise is well to the fore. He clarifies that Hebrew tradition, despite centuries of mistranslation, never refers to the 'Holy Land,' but to holy ground. The political and liturgical implications of that are far-reaching and suggestive. His genuinely fresh discussion exposes unfamiliar and out-of-the-way sources.

In discussing the meaning of the beatitude about the meek inheriting the land (a central hope in the thought of Jesus), W.'s argument turns on how often Kingdom-of-God theology, especially in Christian usage, divests the term "land" and the beatitude of any spatial significance. W. observes the similarity of the phrase to the inheritance formula in Gen 15:7 and argues persuasively that Jesus originally meant the term to signify the arrival of the Messianic kingdom based in Jerusalem; but Christian interpreters throughout the centuries preferred to render it as "inherit the earth" so as to avoid the particularities of Jesus' Messianism.

The discussion of the cleansing of the Temple is less successful. W. cites the "curious detail" of Jesus looking all round the site before coming back the next day as evidence for the historicity of the account, whereas the text shows clear signs of having been artificially cut in two in order to sandwich in the narrative of the cursed and withered fig tree. Such editing argues against the historicity of the narrative in the form given, although the event itself is surely indisputable. W. follows Sanders's eschatological interpretation; presumably the new temple "not made by human hands" is an event to celebrate and anticipate. If this is so, however, perhaps more space ought to be given to why Jesus wept at the thought of the temple (and Jerusalem) destroyed, for surely the two text traditions are intrinsically related and consistency would demand their parallel analysis. Whatever the apocalyptic message of Jesus, however, Jerusalem became symbolic for Christians as the locus of Jesus' Passion, death, and resurrection; the basis of a new pilgrimage tradition had been laid, one that was destined to endure.

In studying Origen as biblical interpreter, W. brings out well the implicit paradox of the great allegorical interpreter who was so closely bonded to the land that he used to make research trips to fit together the topography and exegesis of texts he was analysing. In the end, however, Origen was highly influential in attacking the chiliast position that one day God would literally restore his Kingdom and his holy city Jerusalem to the saints. For Origen the Holy Land of Promise was quintessentially the spiritual inheritance of the saints in heaven, and this exegesis became standard among Christians.

In the Constantinian era, notable development of the holy sites took place, as Constantine sought to give substance to his theocratic dynastic ambitions by establishing Christianity's presence in the Empire on a more substantial footing. In many ways this was a new start: Romans and Christians "conspired to obliterate the memory of Jewish Jerusalem, the Romans by founding a new city dedicated to the gods of Rome, the Christians by directing people's affections to the heavenly Jerusalem" (83). W. brings together interesting sources from Eusebius

and others and discusses the purposes of the Palestinian building program under Constantine. The focus of Eusebius's account is the "discovery" or acclamation of no less than three sacred caves: the Anastasis, the grotto at Bethlehem, and the grotto of the Ascension (though the Byzantine chapel of Ascension placed it on the hilltop). W. discusses the rather flimsy logical arguments of Eusebius to the effect that the discovery itself validates the authenticity of the sites. He rightly and suggestively demonstrates the importance of epiphany in the Christian imagination of the fourth century (an epiphanic stress on sight that would soon move on to concretize itself in relic and icon theology). But one would have welcomed more direct discussion of other historical arguments, at least for the possible authenticity of the Anastasis location—given the massive expense Constantine's architects had to endure to locate the building exactly where they did, when only a few metres away would have given them a much more tractable building site.

W.'s narrative moves on in time to the famous pilgrimage accounts of Egeria and the spread of the Byzantine monasteries, culminating with the Islamic invasion of Palestine and its aftermath. An erudite and delightful book to read, to argue with, to learn from. Anyone going to Israel ought to go armed with an archaeological guide book in one hand, and this highly recommended intellectual and theological survey in the other.

University of Leeds

JOHN A. MCGUCKIN

SAINTS AND THEIR MIRACLES IN LATE ANTIQUE GAUL. By Raymond Van Dam. Princeton: Princeton University, 1993. Pp. 349. \$49.50; \$19.95.

Van Dam, a classicist at the University of Michigan, here provides English translations of a number of important hagiographical texts from sixth-century Gaul: miracle stories of St. Hilary by Fortunatus; the miracles stories of St. Julian and St. Martin by Gregory of Tours; a *passio* of St. Julian; an anonymous sermon in honor of St. Martin; and, gleaned from the old manuscript collection called the *Martinellus*, some inscriptions which may once have adorned the shrine church of Martin.

In the first part of the book, which prefaces the translations, V. uses those and cognate sources in order to provide orientation to these texts, to spell out their implications for our understanding of the cult of the saints, and to supplement and, where appropriate, correct Peter Brown's influential work *The Cult of the Saints* (1981).

V. establishes that the cult of the saints was closely tied to the

aspiration and social location of their promoters; and that the miracle stories tell us a great deal about the late antique understanding of health, illness, and social bonding; he also relates the cult of the saints to broad movements of population. He argues that any historian interested in untangling the various regal and ecclesiastical factions of the period should include in their researches "a prosopography of saints and their cults" (67). Most of all, I think, V. sensitizes us to the saint as a locus of power: "Relics were like radioactive elements, literally too hot to handle without safeguards; in Northern Gaul the snow that fell on one saint's tomb simply melted away" (150).

Those interested in the cult of the saints in relation to theology will find much to ponder here on the relationship of incarnation to sanctity, on the relationship of worship to pilgrimage, and on the interesting notion of "reverse pilgrimage" (i.e. the returning pilgrim telling his/her story and thus adding to the power of the saint—a kind of folk *paradosis*).

Saint Martin of Tours was a key figure in the development of Western hagiography. His *vita* by Sulpicius Severus was read with pleasure down through the Renaissance, and by 1800 there were 173 known ancient churches under his protection in the British Isles alone. Claire Stancliffe's *St. Martin and His Hagiographer* (1983) studies Martin in relation to his own time and through the *vita* of Sulpicius Severus who was his contemporary. V. moves the story to sixth-century Gaul with a focus on the redoubtable Gregory of Tours who, until these texts appeared, was best known to English readers for his history of the Franks.

Thoroughly researched, well written, and enhanced with a good bibliography, a map of the area in question, and a reliable index, this is an important resource for those interested in the saints. I was especially taken with V.'s caution that one should not generalize about saints without taking into account the precise cultural conditions in which their cults arose and flourished.

University of Notre Dame

LAWRENCE S. CUNNINGHAM

SPIRITUAL MARRIAGE: SEXUAL ABSTINENCE IN MEDIEVAL WEDLOCK. By Dyan Elliott. Princeton: Princeton University, 1993. Pp. xv + 375. \$39.50.

Tracing the religious and social history of sexless marriage, Elliott presents a truly fascinating and detailed picture of a neglected phenomenon. By defining what was perhaps the most extreme form of lay piety, she presents a view of the practice against which married Christians of the medieval West must perforce measure themselves. "Total sexual abstinence in wedlock," a practice documented from the earliest

Christian centuries to the later Middle Ages, was “a place in the middle” between ordinary marriage and the continent life in monastic community. It was, however, esteemed very differently by church leaders at different times. Spiritual marriage was “a frequently chaotic and unregulated practice [which] could be construed as a spontaneous and complex reaction against society’s expectations, a revolt against the reproductive imperative and a pious rebellion against the prevailing view that the call to a higher life of spirituality implied the separation of women and men.”

E.’s discussion of the complex religious and social conditions that affected clergy’s attitude toward vows of marital continence yields some important insights. During times when canon law permitted husbands to prevent or interfere with wives’ pious practices, but gave wives no similar prerogatives, “canonists and theologians alike feared that the transition from a carnal to a spiritual marriage might threaten the husband’s authority.” Indeed, the much greater number of women than men who instigated intramarital chastity implies that women experienced relief and freedom when they could persuade their husbands to the practice. In fact, “intramarital chastity could be every bit as threatening as extramarital sex.”

E. pays attention not only to sex but also to gender, examining how male and female socialization to gender roles and expectations intersected with spiritual marriage. Within the patriarchal societies of the dominantly Christian West, “the consummation of marriage was [viewed as] the supreme act of obedience.” Thought of as a female religious practice, men usually resisted spiritual marriage, either before or after consummation of the marriage and the birth of one or more children. E. may give too little weight to men’s interest in both sexual activity and offspring when she writes that in the late fourth century, “the husband’s relative foot-dragging bespoke his closer association with social position and public life, which a change to chastity undercut.” Nevertheless, her attention to the social *effects* of the practice as well as to its *intentions* includes close analysis of the devotional practices, institutional politics, and social arrangements that affected this “defiant female spirituality.”

Different gender patterns are also discernible in reports of spiritual marriage. In the 13th century, women were likely to vow virginity in childhood, often as a result of strong mystical experience, while men typically did so in penitence for particular crimes or sins. Moreover, male sanctity tended to take the form of strict separation from women; women, always dependent on male priests and confessors, did not have the option of total separation from men, but tended, when they wrote, to picture the sexes as complementary rather than adversarial.

Spiritual marriage was apparently a practice that not only reflected, but also extended women's social prerogatives. Yet women were "only its most celebrated practitioners. They were never its theorists." Dominating spiritual marriage for nearly a millenium and a half, women never controlled or defined it. Because spiritual marriage was "too adaptable to be suppressed and too useful to be ignored," it continued to be practiced, despite the apprehensions of clerical theorists and their never fully successful efforts to control and interpret it. Spiritual marriage was a point of intense and continuing negotiation between laywomen and clergy who often felt threatened when their monopoly on chastity was challenged. By the 16th century, intramarital chastity was in decline. A liberalized ecclesiastical rhetoric of sexuality devalued virginity and continence in marriage; a social consensus was gradually created in which humorists could even poke fun at it.

The practice of spiritual marriage raises crucial questions which E. does not avoid. She comments on the role of sexuality in relation to spirituality and mystical experience, on the ongoing tension between the value of sexual abstinence and patriarchal authority, and the class affiliations of the practice at different historical times. But a book on a practice as counter-cultural as this (historically, as well as in relation to late 20th-century North America) may be expected to raise as many questions as it answers. How did it *work*? To live, often to sleep, with one's partner without sexual congress is surely a step beyond the fantasies of temptation and resistance by which the fourth-century desert ascetics exercised their spirits. Were practitioners of spiritual marriage motivated primarily by fear of hell and damnation, or was the increased intensity of their religious lives a powerful and fulfilling attraction in itself? Good historian that she is, E. largely resists speculating on what she cannot document. She provokes questions, however, that will result in further inquiry into the societies of the Christian West. This is an excellent book, pleasurable even as it discusses the renunciation of pleasure.

Harvard University Divinity School

MARGARET R. MILES

THE CHURCH IN LATIN AMERICA, 1492–1992. Edited by Enrique Dussel. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1992. Pp. x + 501. \$49.95.

This remarkable volume, a hybrid tour de force of history, theology, sociology, and poetry by Dussel and 22 other contributors writing from the underbelly of Latin America, will get its readers roiling either with indignation at the institutional Church for its betrayal of the oppressed masses, or with fury at the authors of these razor-edged jeremiads bewailing Utopias lost. There is no room for indifference here. That is one of the many virtues of the work.

D. has pulled together an extraordinary account of the Latin American Church, emphasizing the experience of the oppressed native peoples, African slaves, mestizos, and their descendants. This hefty, three-part tome presents more than a standard history; it offers a chronological survey, a regional review, and a collection of special subjects of great interest by leading authorities, some at their writing best, a few at their worst. The sweeping range of topics and the depth of insight are remarkable. Although D. claims this work to be aimed primarily at an introductory-level readership, there is much here for all interested in the tumultuous adventures and misadventures of Christianity in the New World. D., president of the Commission for the Study of Church History in Latin America (CEHILA), opens up new horizons on the role and shortcomings of church service for the oppressed in the New World. His immense knowledge joined to his passionate concern for the good of God's people ennobles his narrative and makes it especially worthwhile.

The regional survey is impressively inclusive and raises a variety of burning issues, not always handled with balance and fair judgment by the authors. Eduardo Hoornaert's essay on the Church in Brazil, e.g., flows from a poisoned pen. Indian missions are presented as concentration camps with all the horrors that term conjures up in the holocaust tradition. There is no real sense here of colonial times in Brazil and the Caribbean, with the joys and exuberance of daily life as well as the problems and suffering in a frontier, tropical land. The lens is fixed on the terrible trials and sorrows of the human condition to be found everywhere. Often-told tales of folly, stupidity, avarice, and brutality are repeated in piercing rails against the plunder and oppression of captive and enslaved peoples carried out by rapacious conquistadors. The Church is charged as a collaborator in that great social sin. Such public flagellations of Catholics and the clergy drown the multifaceted reality of evangelization, often a splendid enterprise of great heroism, in a sea of social protest and ill-tempered generalizations.

Nonetheless, much that is worth saying is said well. The essay on Mexico is particularly penetrating and offers a message of hope in the struggle for justice in a land of endless strife and contradictions. The story of Hispanics in the U.S. presents a powerful analysis of an uprooted people challenged by opportunities as well as by alienation. Then, for those in search of a concise, factual, and focused account of the hellishly complex story of the Church in revolutionary Central America, the volume offers Rodolfo Cardenal's challenging analysis which goes to the heart of the struggle for liberation by a Church torn by internal conflicts and ideological confrontations. Other competent chapters follow on Northern South America. Then comes the nadir of

the narrative, a contentious treatment of the Church in the Southern Cone (Chile, Argentina, Paraguay, and Uruguay); the Church and the readers deserve better than is offered here.

The final essay by the ever-irascible and insightful José Comblin deals with the Church and human rights. He concludes: "The hierarchical Church is silent, not knowing what to say. We are in a period in which the Church is active only at the base, in the invisible cells in which the poor construct the forms of the presence of the Kingdom of God in a world without meaning. All the evidence is that the Church of the clergy and the clerical powers will become less and less capable of saying anything which is not a repetition of the empty formulas of the past which no one listens to in a new culture" (453). Such rantings may serve a good purpose, that of a wake-up call to action. The Church is losing ground in Latin America. It is time to get on with the new evangelization there and not just to talk about it.

Of special note are the bibliographical essay and listing of sources sufficient to satisfy the feeding frenzy of most graduate students. The work is a textbook to be studied and analyzed rather than a historical narrative to be relished for a good story told consistently well. The defining feature of the volume is its fervent commitment to justice for the poor. It jolts one's conscience into a keen awareness of how much remains undone in Latin America in carrying out the universal mission of service entrusted by Christ to the Church.

Loyola Marymount University, L.A.

ERNEST S. SWEENEY, S.J.

THE FIRST JESUITS. By John W. O'Malley, S.J. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University, 1993. Pp. xiv + 457. \$35.

This book is a superb achievement, the work of a theologically informed historian who is an expert in the period of which he writes. O'Malley describes the "ministries and culture" of the Jesuits from their formal founding as a religious order in 1540 until the death in 1565 of their second superior general, Diego Laínez.

O. has mastered the sources—no mean feat, since the correspondence of Ignatius Loyola alone fills 12 large volumes of the *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu* and numbers nearly 7000 pieces. It is the largest extant correspondance of any 16th-century figure. In addition O. relies on Ignatius's *Spiritual Exercises*, the primitive "rule" of the Jesuits contained in the *Formula of the Institute*, the Constitutions and *Autobiography*, and numerous other documents and letters left by significant people. He handles this documentation with a consummate historian's skill, seeing the interplay of theory with the lived practice of the first Jesuits, and interpreting their writings in the context of

time and culture. He observes the flow of Jesuit life in all its details, analyzes and digests his findings, and shares his reflections on major themes. The result is Jesuit history at depths rarely sounded before in any language.

O. has a fine sense of the evolution during the Society's first quarter-century from a band of pastoral itinerants into a cohesive, organized body focused on helping souls through the ministry of the word, administration of the sacraments, and practical works of mercy. He emphasizes the "customary ministries" of preaching, teaching Christian doctrine, giving the Exercises, visiting the sick, the poor and the imprisoned, and hearing confessions. Under the last heading, O. studies the development of casuistry and the exploration of moral issues and Jesuit attitudes toward them. Whatever theological development followed later, Ignatius's gifts along the theological line were basically pastoral, rooted in his ability to reflect on his own religious experience.

This is not a work of nonreflective hagiography. Ignatius himself is portrayed realistically. The faults and failings, as well as the virtues and successes of his early followers are on display. The errant provincialate in Portugal of Simão Rodrigues, one of the first companions who tried to shape a Society of Jesus significantly at odds with Ignatius's vision, is detailed, as are the eccentricities of another of the first companions, Nicolás Bobadilla, a zealous, stubborn man whom Ignatius rebuked for his imprudence and intransigence and to whom he entrusted no part in the Society's government, and who returned the favors by denouncing the founder as a "tyrant" and the Jesuit Constitutions as a "prolix labyrinth," which he had neither time nor inclination to study.

O. probes Jesuit relations with the Inquisition, whether as occasional object of its attentions or sometime co-operator in its investigations. Ignatius's own decidedly non-Iberian attitude towards Jews is explained, as are the more standard prejudices of some of his companions. O. emphasizes that the first Jesuits were men who accepted the Church as a given, generally believed in the system, and worked within it. They usually provided a moderating influence. Few were given to apocalyptic prophesying. They were bent on reconciliation. The Jesuits of the first quarter-century spoke and wrote little on structural reform of the Church. Their efforts were rather directed toward individual spiritual conversion and subsequent growth in the spiritual life. Neither were they in original intention a "counter-Reformation" body. Polemics would come, but they were not in the founding intentions.

O.'s interpretation of Jesuit obedience is that it is a vehicle of readiness for pastoral assignment, a distinctively Jesuit form of asceticism

and self-denial. But he also carefully distinguishes between the overblown rhetoric in which exhortations to obedience are framed and the actual practice. He understands the rhetorical devices of the 16th century and is able to translate them for 20th-century readers. His discussion of the much-misunderstood "fourth vow" of the professed Jesuit is similarly clear: the vow was never intended as a loyalty oath to the pope, but to facilitate deployment of personnel for the good of the Church and God's greater glory. Clarity is also brought to the question of Jesuits accepting bishoprics: episcopal appointments were to be resisted, as Nadal put it, "until the Apostolic See expressly obliges us under pain of mortal sin and will obviously brook no further resistance."

Particularly impressive is O.'s treatment of the ministry of education. An early preliminary decision had been made to run no schools, even for the Jesuits' own members, who would be sent to public universities. But the realization of pastoral needs made the Society "the first religious order to undertake systematically, as a primary and self-sustaining ministry, the operation of full-fledged schools for any students, lay or clerical, who chose to come to them." It was not a decision taken lightly or without serious consequences. College communities absorbed talented manpower, which became less mobile, less available for dispatch on missions at a moment's notice. Colleges exercised an undeniable pull to a ministry mainly for the middle and upper classes. At the same time, and O. explains this as well as I have ever seen it explained, adoption of the humanist approach brought to the Jesuits a deeper conviction about the relationship of learning to a life of virtue and public service that has remained a constant in their corporate consciousness down the centuries.

The first Jesuits' theological goal, according to Nadal, was "to join speculation with devotion and with spiritual understanding." Theirs was not a purely academic theology, and none of the original Jesuits held a theological degree, although they were masters in philosophy. They gave a primacy to religious experience, and Aquinas was their preferred theologian. His orthodoxy appealed to them, as did emphases such as the compatibility of nature and grace, reason and revelation, the axiom that grace perfects nature. Thomas provided a theological base for acceptance of some human responsibility acting under the influence of grace in the process of salvation that was more compatible with the *Spiritual Exercises* and *Constitutions* than were more Augustinian systems prevalent at the time. There were, even in the first days, the seeds of later theological developments among Jesuit theologians.

All this and more O. develops. Hardly a page fails to offer fresh and

valuable insights into the Jesuits and the religious culture of mid-16th-century Catholicism. Sound and well written, this is a true scholar's book.

Canisius College, Buffalo, N.Y.

JAMES HENNESEY, S.J.

ERASMUS ALS KETZER: REFORMATION UND INQUISITION IM ITALIEN DES 16. JAHRHUNDERTS. By Silvana Seidel Menchi. Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought. Leiden: Brill, 1993. Pp. x + 505. \$148.75.

Almost like Dante's *Commedia*, this book can be read on a number of levels. The most obvious is the story of Erasmus's literary fortune in Italy in the sixteenth century, where it moved from adulation in the early decades (though often grudgingly granted) to banishment and proscription by the end. The next level is to see it as a study of institutional history, to see how the Holy Office and other Italian inquisitions operated as they gained their momentum especially between 1555 and 1559, the pontificate of Paul IV. Another level is to use Erasmus's fate as a test for charting the dramatic change, even revolution, in religious and cultural sensibilities in the sixteenth century that took place within Catholicism in a relatively few years. If you ever doubted the existence of a repressive and paranoid aspect in Early Modern Catholicism, this story will certainly disabuse you of the illusion.

Still another is how in the sixteenth-century "theology" drove from its midst literary and philological considerations as petty and as irrelevant to the weighty truths of the study of divinity. Those considerations belonged to "mere grammarians," that is, to Humanists like Erasmus, as long as they did not have the temerity to think theology should be grounded in a critico-historical reading of the text of Scripture. Finally, the story is a case-study of a seemingly perennial phenomenon—of how religious institutions, when gripped by fear and challenged by new ways of thinking, do damage far worse than their real or supposed enemies under the guise of protecting the flock from evil—"for your own good." The Modernist crisis, as well as others nearer to hand, spring to mind.

Silvana Seidel Menchi is professor of Modern History at the University of Trent. She has won international respect for her work in sixteenth-century Italian history, which has consistently centered on Erasmus and other aspects of the religious problem. In the present volume she far surpasses in scope and significance her earlier achievements. This is a splendid book that will remain the standard study of its subject for many decades to come. It is a kind of Italian counterpart to Marcel Bataillon's masterpiece, *Erasme et l'Espagne* (1937). The

book is amply and meticulously documented, often from difficult archival sources, and it makes use of the best contemporary scholarship. Lucidly organized, it is also lucidly written. The four indexes and bibliography make it handy for reference. Curiously unmentioned in the volume, however, is the fact that it is the substantial equivalent of S.'s *Erasmus in Italia, 1520–1580* (Turin, 1987).

The book follows a basically chronological plan. S. shows the build-up of paranoia and resentment, especially as Lutheranism began to threaten the political and ecclesiastical establishments in the 1530s and 1540s. Erasmus was seen more and more as laying the egg Luther hatched—so the saying went. The fifth chapter, “Grammar Schools as Schools of Heresy,” is among the more fascinating. Several of Erasmus's works, including the Colloquies, were originally designed as textbooks, and they were widely used in schools. But by the middle of the century, schoolmasters that used them became suspect, and in the first papal Index of Prohibited Books (1559) even the strictly grammatical and rhetorical works were proscribed.

The vendetta had begun to swell earlier, but there can be no doubt, as S. shows, that the fanatical pontificate of Paul IV gave the movement the leadership and sanction it craved. Although his Index was later modified, the damage had been done, so that in Catholic circles derision and dismissal of one of the great theological and religious thinkers of the Western tradition would be the order of the day until quite recently. Even with his rehabilitation among specialists, Erasmus, *grammaticus simul et theologus*, has still to find recognition of his achievements among “serious theologians.”

Weston School of Theology

JOHN W. O'MALLEY, S.J.

THE REFORMATION AND THE VISUAL ARTS: THE PROTESTANT IMAGE QUESTION IN WESTERN AND EASTERN EUROPE. By Sergiusz Michalski. *Christianity and Society in the Modern World.* New York: Routledge, 1993. Pp. xiii + 232. \$49.95.

The translation of this volume, originally published in Polish in Warsaw in 1989, presents to the West a scholar who is versed in both East and Western Europe. Michalski, who taught at the Universities of Warsaw, Augsburg, and Braunschweig, is now a free-lance scholar residing in Augsburg.

It should be said at the outset that M.'s central preoccupation throughout the volume is understanding the image question from the underside of iconoclasm. The first third of his book deals primarily with the image question in Luther, Karlstadt, Zwingli, and Calvin. With directness and a thorough grounding in the sources, he lays out

their respective views of images. Here, Western readers, living in the context of writers such as Carl Christensen, Robert Scribner, and Carlos Eire, will find few surprises. But they will be impressed by the fresh forms of M.'s presentation. For myself, I would probably emphasize Luther's law and gospel motif in Cranach's art more than M. does. With respect to Calvin, M. follows an older accent on the Glory of God as referring to God's invisible nature, but he is convincing in the way he uses it with respect to images.

For me, and I think for many readers, the remaining two-thirds of the book is particularly suggestive in areas in which one has some acquaintance, and it is overwhelming in its account of the interaction of Protestants, Lutheran and Calvinist, with both Greek and Russian Eastern Orthodox groups. The chapter on "iconoclasm" probes the different meanings and associations of this term, a complex of factors of a social, human, and religious nature, as illustrated in various individuals and groups in the reformation period.

"Icon and Pulpit," M.'s longest chapter, deals first with the lands nearest to the Reformation, such as the abortive attempt to introduce Protestantism into Orthodox Moldavia and the Reformation in the Baltic lands. Then follows the contact with the Greek Orthodox, and finally the Russian. M. chronicles the history of the interrelations based on travelers, Protestant incursions, and publications. The history, as he states, is full of misunderstanding, based on the impossibility of remotely understanding each other when Scripture and Tradition respectively are so fiercely held. Only in the twentieth century has mutual appreciation developed.

M.'s last chapter examines the various historic meanings associated with the term "image," e.g. the word "sign" used both with respect to images and sacraments. Further, he notes the almost inevitable association of iconoclasm with less sacramental views, and the positive place of images in more sacramental understandings.

The wealth of M.'s historical knowledge and the dexterity of his thought are formidable. This makes the book an extraordinary achievement, a book one continues to ponder, wondering what more lies behind so many tantalizing suggestions. Admittedly, that also leads to some frustrations for the reader. But there are also hints in the book of avenues of exploration that are underway, making one look forward to the next installment.

Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley

JOHN DILLENBERGER

THE RESTORATION CHURCH OF ENGLAND, 1646-1689. By John Spurr. New Haven: Yale University, 1991. Pp. xvii + 445. \$45.

Stephen Baxter remarked in 1984 how few scholars had been attracted in recent decades to the later Stuart period because of the traditional character of research and a sense that "not much [was] going on." But by the 1990s, publication in anticipation of the Glorious Revolution's tercentenary had become a growth industry. Historians rejected the old idea that the Restoration represented little more than a reaction to the despised Interregnum. Neither 1660 nor 1688 looked anything like the milestones heralded by specialists from Lord Macaulay to David Ogg.

Historians of religion may have been slower to modify traditional interpretations of the later-17th century. Few worked in the field. Most still concentrated on the century before 1642, and a whole library was created on every aspect of puritanism in the context of a reactionary and increasingly unpopular established church. Cromwellian religious toleration remained interesting while Restoration Anglicanism continued to be portrayed as elitist and repressive. Meanwhile the pioneering work of scholars such as McAdoo, Bennett, and especially Beddard laid a foundation for a reassessment of the Church of England. This fresh approach can be seen in Hutton's magisterial biography of Charles II (1989), which speaks at length about the Church and dissent, in Spellman's fine study of the Latitudinarians in 1660–1700 (1993), and in Spurr's little masterpiece which is based partly on his 1985 Oxford D.Phil. thesis concerning Anglican apologetic during the Restoration.

S., lecturer in history at University College, Swansea, has made a great contribution to our understanding of the period. He is persuasive in his fundamental thesis that between the 1640s and 90s the Church of England came close to enjoying, perhaps for the first and only time, a single identity, a single "Anglicanism." His study is especially helpful on lay-clerical relations, the parochial clergy, episcopal administration and the ecclesiastical courts, the strenuous but ultimately failed effort by the clergy to overcome widespread public apathy and impiety through preaching and publication, and the decline of the Church from national to sectarian status by the early-18th century. We have at long last a comprehensive account of the Church of England, Anglicanism, and religious life in the period; it should become the standard work on the subject.

One of the book's greatest strengths is its description and analysis of the survival—and in a sense the transformation—of the Church of England during the dark years of the Civil War and Interregnum. It weathered the displacement of thousands of its clergy and repression by the Presbyterians and then other proponents of strident Calvinism to enter Restoration England surprisingly vital still. The faithful man-

aged to "ride out the storm of persecution" and to "take a private refuge in the family home, the chamber, or even the conscience," much as the English Roman Catholics had done for nearly a century. These stalwarts retained their liturgy wherever they could, thereby sustaining a continuity in belief and worship between the 1630s and 1660s. At the Restoration the Church, newly-empowered by parliament and the King, set out to enforce national religious conformity. At length, this program of repression and persecution failed because of opposition by the numerically insignificant but politically active dissenters, the decline of popular piety as the Anglican clergy defined it, and because of a secular outlook both at court and in the provinces, especially in the early years of William III's reign. The Church's efforts to contain these forces by legislation and a paper war of tracts, sermons and manuals of prayer and proper conduct were confounded by the Williamite toleration which freed the English from conformity to any religious organization. Thereafter the Church remained established but could no longer command national allegiance, either by law or through personal conviction.

There is much else to praise in this book. Theology is discussed at some length in Chapters 6 and 7, the latter entitled "The Surest Foundation': Anglican Piety," which I enjoyed immensely. The life of Anglican parishes and the role of the clergy are discussed in much of the second half of this work. S.'s last chapter, in which he provides an overview of major developments in the history of the Church of England during the 18th and 19th centuries, is a useful contribution and not merely anti-climactic.

The exhaustive notes and bibliography attest to S.'s painstaking research over a period of a decade. Yale University Press is entirely justified in saying that "this book will be indispensable for those concerned with the political, cultural, social, or religious history of 17th-century England."

University of Virginia, Charlottesville

MARTIN J. HAVRAN

DIE SELBSTMITTEILUNG GOTTES IN JESUS CHRISTUS: GRUNDLAGEN UND DOGMATISCHE EXPLIKATION DER CHRISTOLOGIE HERMAN SCHELLS. By Werner Sosna. Paderborner Theologische Studien. Paderborn: Schöningh, 1991. Pp. vii + 319.

This rich, tightly argued 1990 Paderborn dissertation appears as the latest monograph in a recent series of studies dedicated to the theology of controversial University of Würzburg Professor of Apologetics, Herman Schell (1850–1906). Sosna explores Schell's Christology, the

“teaching of the person of Christ,” as the theology of God’s personal self-communication in the Christ event.

Immanent-trinitarian and economic-salvation-historical perspectives form the constitutive factors of the investigation, and Schell’s philosophy of religion, grounded in the apriori unity of the orders of creation and salvation, provides the context. (S. argues that the condemned propositions contained in the 1898 indexing of Schell’s Dogmatics did not draw the multi-faceted Christological presuppositions of Schell’s enterprise into discredit, but he subjects them to critical review.)

S. investigates Schell’s philosophy of religion as the first step in understanding his Christology. The second move focuses on the Word as the immanent-trinitarian foundation of God’s self-communication as well as the inner unity of the orders of creation and salvation. The trinitarian focus continues when S. investigates God’s revelation in Jesus Christ with reference to the axiom of God’s immutability, the fittingness of the Incarnation of the Word, as well as the inner unity between the cosmological and salvific perspectives which can be read from the incarnation event itself. S.’s last major section turns to Schell’s triad of Christological categories: the heavenly human being, the Son of Man, and the ideal human being (*himmlischer Mensch, Menschensohn, Idealmensch*).

S.’s conclusion relates Schell’s Christology to Vatican II’s Christological concerns. A succinct twenty-eight-page recapitulation of the work (chap. 5) is highly recommended for those who might find working through the entire German text daunting.

Schell’s philosophy of religion is at once metaphysical, ethical, and anthropological; it combines an organic, intellectual model of revelation (paralleled in the Tübingen School) and a soteriological aspect—the longing for salvation by the spiritual, moral personality. The ethical component intends a wholeness and the fulfillment not only of the individual, but of the community and the cosmic order. This salvation is achieved, first, through the self-revelation of God’s personality in word and activity. The specific characteristic of Christian revelation, says Schell in unanimity with J. S. Drey, is God’s personal revelation in personal appearance: the ideal human being.

In treating the theology of persons and relations in God, S. rightly focuses on Schell’s theology of God’s *aseitas*, and the logical and ethical self-foundation of God as source of the Son and the Holy Spirit. The result is Schell’s definition of the divine persons as three “beings-for-another.” S. avoids use of Schell’s provocative *causa-sui* terminology, except in a footnote where he alludes to the debate (Berning vs. Hasenfuß) about the philosophical genesis of the concept. S. does not

take sides, but the reader wonders if exploration of the concept wouldn't prove valuable, especially in light of some recent attempts at a metaphysics of personal freedom (T. Kobusch).

S. elicits interest when he treats Schell's discussion of the ontological possibility and psychological consequences of the Incarnation, since the latter, for Schell, entails adoption of a modified subsistence Christology and the positing of a duplex moral person including the virtual-human personality of Jesus. S. notes Schell's ambivalent treatment of the knowledge and consciousness of Christ, resolved through Schell's distinction between *visio immediata* and *visio beata*.

If A. Günther and A. von Harnack are adversaries in Schell's work, K. Rahner and Vatican II stand in the background of S.'s investigation, and serve as contemporary referents, sometimes as interpretative paradigms, for the investigation. In a significant footnote, S. notes the limitation of the study, separating and excluding as it does the pneumatological from the soteriological dimensions of God's self-communication (7). Thomas Franke's *Leben aus Gottes Fülle: Zur trinitarischen Reich-Gottes-Theologie Herman Schells* (Würzburg, 1990) would complement S.'s work. An Index would have been helpful: the Table of Contents permits rapid location of topics treated, but not of authors.

No single book will capture the creativity which Schell brought to late-19th-century theology; but S.'s work is a praiseworthy, highly recommendable contribution to a rereading of Herman Schell.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

GEORGE E. GRIENER, S.J.

"CHURCH AND AGE UNITE!": THE MODERNIST IMPULSE IN AMERICAN CATHOLICISM. By R. Scott Appleby. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1992. Pp. viii + 296. \$29.95.

Appleby makes a valuable contribution to the growing body of literature on Modernism in the U.S. The title comes from the words of John Ireland, the Archbishop of St. Paul, who favored most things new without always understanding their implications. The title, with its source, and the subtitle indicate the link A. finds between Americanism and Modernism.

A. first treats John Zahm of Notre Dame, whose theory of theistic evolution sought to illustrate the compatibility of church teaching with scientific discoveries. Zahm was not original, and A. correctly points out that his association with Denis O'Connell and Americanism, as well as his espousal of evolution, led to the 1898 ban on his book, *Evolution and Dogma* (50). But Zahm, like other progressive thinkers, had challenged scholasticism and won the enmity of the Jesuits in Rome.

In "Signs of the Times," A. places the opposition to Zahm within a larger context of the neo-scholastic reaction against vital immanence (56). Theistic evolution, in which God worked within the nature He created, was linked to other theological tendencies that emphasized human endeavor, e.g. the role of the human authors of Scripture, the perennial issue of the relationship between nature and grace, and religious liberty. But the dominant orthodoxy spoke of "tradition as immutable" (72), and here A. could have cited Louis Billot, S.J., then professor at the Gregorian University and sometime cardinal, who wrote a treatise *De immutabilitate traditionis*. In the U.S., Isaac Heckler had already paved the way for future conflict with the dominant neo-scholasticism by emphasizing the indwelling of the Holy Spirit and calling for accommodation to American culture (81).

A. devotes a chapter each to Dunwoodie and *The New York Review*. At the New York seminary, the most creative figure was Francis Gigot, whose progressive exegesis of Scripture caused conflict with his Sulpician superiors and led him and four others to withdraw from the society. A.'s chapter on the *Review* summarizes the key articles that appeared in the short-lived scholarly periodical. When Pius X condemned Modernism in *Pascendi* (1907), his description of higher criticism, notes A., "could have been as easily lifted from the pages of the *New York Review* (142)."

Zahm and Dunwoodie are familiar to students of Modernism in the U.S., but A.'s chapter on William L. Sullivan and John R. Slattery breaks new ground. For both, the underlying issue was authority of the Church vs. individual freedom. Sullivan was a Paulist. A.'s discovery of his correspondence with Estelle Throckmorton in the Archives of the Harvard Divinity School sheds light on his growing critique of neo-scholasticism and his leaving the Church. He became fascinated with mysticism, if it was wedded "to a thirst for righteousness (176)." Like other reformers, he found in the early Church "genuine Catholicity," which for him meant "the dignity of democracy (178)." Slattery was a more tragic figure. The first superior of the Josephites, he became enthralled with Alfred Loisy and increasingly critical of church authority, and eventually left the Church—and his work with African Americans.

A.'s chapter "The Interrupted Conversation" summarizes the effect of the condemnation of Modernism on American Catholic intellectual life, as former progressives, such as several professors at the Catholic University, now repudiated their earlier positions. But here A. could have elaborated on the story of Henry Poels, a real martyr to the anti-Modernist reaction (215, 130).

A. has succeeded in showing the close relationship between Americanism and Modernism. Occasionally, however, he does have some

minor errors—"del Val," rather than Merry del Val (215); John J. Keane, the rector of the Catholic University, as later, rather than former, bishop of Richmond (94); and Satolli as apostolic delegate after the Spanish-American War (204).

University of Virginia, Charlottesville GERALD P. FOGARTY, S.J.

LA RÉCEPTION D'UN CONCILE. By Gilles Routhier. Théologie et sciences religieuses: Cogitatio fidei. Paris: Cerf, 1993. Pp. 265. Fr. 148.

In May 1991, Routhier successfully defended a dissertation for the Institute Catholique of Paris and the Sorbonne, entitled *La Réception de Vatican II dans une Eglise locale: L'exemple de la pratique synodale dans l'Eglise de Québec*. The main conclusions of this work are expected to be published soon; the work under review sets out the theological and methodological principles that guided R.'s research.

Part 1 reviews the emergence of the theme of reception, which began to attract attention in the early 1960s when the announcement of Vatican II prompted widespread attention to the role of councils in the Church. In the 1970s the idea really took off, particularly as a result of the seminal essays by Grillmeier and Congar. In the 1980s the theme took on other dimensions, most notably in the discussion of the reception of ecumenical agreed statements by their participant churches. It has become so widely noted that it runs the danger of becoming a catch-all, almost magical phrase, much invoked but needing critical definition to be useful.

Among the many areas in which the idea is relevant, R. focuses his attention on two spheres in the life of the Church: reception of doctrinal decrees and reception by churches of agreed ecumenical statements. R. proposes an "operational definition": reception is "a spiritual process by which the decisions of a council are welcomed and assimilated into the life of a local church and become for it a living expression of the apostolic faith." This "Amen of the whole Church to the faith proposed by the conciliar assembly" does not confer juridical validity on conciliar decisions nor is it the source of their truth; but it gives a force and effectiveness that would otherwise be lacking, testifies to the truth of conciliar teaching, and verifies its appropriateness to the life of the churches at particular moments and places.

This operational definition is then explicated at considerable length. His description of the often lengthy temporal process by which reception takes place permits R. to review the extensive literature and to make very helpful comments on the agents of the process, its steps, periodization, etc. R. rightly insists that the process involves the great

question of the relations between the one entire Church and the local churches. Reception thus appears as a particular instance of the mutual interiority of the one Church in the many churches. Taking locality as a realization of catholicity, R. goes on to speak of historical factors in the process of reception and of reception as assimilation, interpretation, and inculturation. He also outlines a theme that needs more historical and ecclesiological reflection: cases of nonreception and their causes and elements.

With regard to the agents of reception in a local church, R. correctly points out that the process involves not only the bishop and theologians but the whole local community. Studies of particular cases of reception thus cannot be limited to official (episcopal) or nonofficial (theological) statements but must make use also of more empirical research into the life of the local churches.

Finally a theological study of particular cases of reception cannot ignore the spiritual character of the good that is being communicated and received. This requires attention to the hermeneutics of conciliar teachings and to the criteria that must be operative in the local churches: that the conciliar teaching correspond to the apostolic faith and serve communion with God.

R.'s last chapter presents a balance sheet of the study of reception, pointing out both areas that have proven fruitful and areas that need further development. The literature has shown how the idea of reception illumines the relation between theory and practice, focuses attention on the concrete realization of the one Church in the many local churches, and shows the need for a total ecclesiology to integrate the contributions of the human sciences. Among the areas still needing further elaboration are communication and responsibility within local churches, reception as a reality of communion among the various local churches, the "bi-directionality" of reception, the criteria of reception, and the likely theological usefulness of literary and aesthetic theories of reception (this latter is very briefly addressed, and R.'s perceptive comments could be filled out by reference to other North American literature and in particular to the work of David Tracy).

This work will be of great value both for its review of the vast literature on the theme and for R.'s exploration of the ecclesiology which is implied in the historical instances of reception in the life of the Church over the centuries and required for further explorations of particular cases past or present.

MYSTERY AND PROMISE: A THEOLOGY OF REVELATION. By John F. Haught. *New Theology Studies*. Collegeville: Glazier/Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 224. \$14.95.

Haught presents a serious and interesting study of the theology of revelation. It is a substantial piece of work reflecting a good command of the recent literature in several fields. The influence of Whitehead, Polanyi, and Moltmann is particularly evident.

Viewing religion in an evolutionary perspective, H. points out that the sense of the sacred, already strong in archaic religion, gave rise to a sense of transcendence in the axial age. In biblical religion the transcendent is perceived primarily under the form of promise, calling for the response of hope. One can only agree with H.'s emphasis on the importance of promise and hope for revelational theology.

All religions, according to H., have four dimensions: sacramental, mystical, apophatic, and performative. This classification is defensible, but it tends to shortchange the historical and the doctrinal, which are basic to Christianity. There are advantages in von Hügel's scheme of three elements of religion: the historical, the doctrinal, and the mystical.

It would be pointless and arrogant, H. writes, to look upon Christianity as superior to other faiths. If he means that comparisons are odious and that Christians have much to learn from other religions, one can concur. But it is hard to know why one should profess Christianity if other religions are equally good. If Christ was the eternal Son of God living in our midst as a man, the religion that confesses him must have some superiority. The disagreements between the religions need not be suppressed for the sake of dialogue. Honesty in presenting one's own tradition is a prerequisite of fruitful dialogue.

A recurring theme, especially in the later chapters, is that God reveals himself by withdrawing, by leaving the world and its history to themselves. This withdrawal is seen as connected with God's vulnerability, his "kenosis." The idea of kenosis certainly deserves a place in the theology of revelation, but it needs to be held in balance with the power shown forth in God's mighty deeds, especially the resurrection. In spite of H.'s disclaimers, his concept of the absentee God is all too reminiscent of deism and even of the God-is-dead movement.

H. has some moving passages on Jesus' openness to the poor and marginalized, including sinners. But he gives the impression that Jesus set no standards or boundaries. His analysis fails to explain why Jesus required observance of the commandments and called for heroism in the face of persecution. According to the Gospels Jesus even provided for excommunication.

H. appeals to the category of hope "to avoid a one-sided emphasis on

the notion of revelation as symbolic communication." But the notion of hope, shorn of doctrinal content and symbolic expression, becomes vague and empty. H. practically reduces hope to an openness to surprises.

H. is not at his best in explaining the Catholic tradition. He gives an inexact account of the "communication of idioms." He caricatures Vatican I's understanding of revelation as "a fixed body of supernatural truths under the protection of papal authority." Apparently unaware that Vatican I said that God was pleased to "reveal himself," H. credits Vatican II with achieving this important insight. He states, without specific reference to any document, that Vatican II "explicitly affirmed the revelatory value and significance of the great religious traditions."

Weaknesses such as I have mentioned greatly limit the value of this work, especially as a manual of instruction for Catholic institutions. The discerning reader can, however, learn much from these pages about religion as viewed from the perspectives of modern philosophy and science. The chapter on "Revelation and the Cosmos" is particularly rewarding.

Fordham University

AVERY DULLES, S.J.

WORD BECOME FLESH: DIMENSIONS OF CHRISTOLOGY. By Brian O. McDermott, S.J. *New Theology Studies*. Collegeville: Glazier/Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 302. \$19.95.

A very thorough presentation of Christology as the topic stands in the mid-nineties. We have not had a book like this since Pannenberg's *Jesus—God and Man* in the 60s and Kasper's *Jesus the Christ* in the 70s. It is one volume in the systematics series initiated by Peter Phan of the Catholic University of America to meet the felt need in Catholic graduate and pontifical degree programs. This volume responds to that need amply.

McDermott's introduction describes the subject matter of Christology, briefly summarizes the distinction between the Jesus of history and the Christ of faith, and lays out the sources and methods of Christology. Next he is concerned with the ministry of Jesus as presented in the Gospels: the attitudes portrayed, the content of the teaching, the question of identity, and the specific differences in the sources. He then goes on to deal with the death of Jesus in three sections: historical, theologies of Jesus' death in the New Testament, and reflections on the understanding of Jesus' death in the New Testament. A longer consideration is devoted to the resurrection: the biblical proclamation and narratives, biblical and contemporary interpretation, and the link with formal Christology.

The final chapters deal more with the historical development of

Christology: its ontological aspect as foreshadowed in the N.T., developed in the Church Fathers and the great councils, and considered by contemporary theologians; its soteriological aspect as presented in the N.T. and Church Fathers, argued intensively in medieval theology, and considered by Reformation, modern, and contemporary authors; and finally some more technically philosophical aspects related to the concept of "person" in the history and contemporary discussion of Christology.

M. thus offers a very comprehensive account of Christology, particularly helpful in a Catholic context because of the attention given to doctrinal development. He writes from the experience of seventeen years of teaching Christology, and this is manifest in his thorough knowledge of the field. All major and many minor authors on the subject matter are included, as are all major and many minor issues that have arisen in Christology from N.T. times to the present, touching even recent movements such as liberation and feminist theologies. The biblical material is carefully presented in the light of contemporary scholarship, and specialized vocabulary is almost always explained within the text. The awkward ambiguities in the search for suitable formulations in and between the fourth- and fifth-century councils are admitted and explained and Scripture is given a certain critical primacy over subsequent doctrinal texts, providing a very healthy post-Vatican II Catholic balance. Perhaps most noteworthy among the many excellent features of this book is the fact that while established teachings are clearly documented, unresolved questions are equally clearly presented as unresolved.

Disappointments in the book are few. Two may be worth mentioning. First, in introducing types of theology, M. lists first the academic, secondly that found in, based on, and geared to worship, and thirdly that related more intimately to praxis (18-19). The treatment in the book more or less corresponds to that perception. In the light of both the history and the modern epistemological critique of the relation of praxis to theory, there might be a case for envisaging the structure in the reverse order: a Christology involved in discipleship, leading to a Christology in worship, and giving rise to academic Christology. Second, in spite of very comprehensive and competent treatment of the biblical material, the infancy narratives are given scant attention. Experience in teaching both at graduate and undergraduate level, and in lecturing to adult groups, including clergy and professional groups, suggests that fundamentalist readings of the infancy narratives, unrecognized by those who hold them, are still very much inclined to get in the way of serious systematic reflection in Christology. When the book is used in courses, this can of course be supplied by the professor.

The book is highly recommended for graduate and seminary Christology courses, for clergy who have been out of the seminary for some time, for theologians who have not been dealing specifically with Christology, and for educated laity who are willing to give it prime-time attention. It can safely replace the volumes by Pannenberg and Kasper mentioned above.

Georgetown University

MONIKA K. HELLWIG

REVELATION AND TRUTH: UNITY AND PLURALITY IN CONTEMPORARY THEOLOGY. By Thomas G. Guarino. Scranton: University of Scranton; and London/Toronto: Associated University Presses, 1993. Pp. 228. \$38.50.

How much credibility can Catholic theology command in a "post-modern" world that enthusiastically embraces pluralism and insists on the relativity even of the most rigorously scientific thought? Guarino offers a careful and convincing response to this challenging question. Scholars and students, if they can get past its formidable price, will find this book enormously helpful not only in setting forth the problem of Catholic theology's encounter with postmodernity, but also in providing important steps toward its solution.

G. begins with a crisp analysis of the postmodern emphasis on the conditioned, relative, tentative nature of all human knowledge and its aversion to the totalizing, ahistorical, provincial dogmatism that fails to embrace difference and "alterity." From there he moves cautiously into the question of whether Catholic thought today can live and thrive within the horizon of postmodernity without losing its identity. He argues that there is a solid basis for theological pluralism in the understanding of *esse* as developed by both the existential and transcendental interpretations of the Thomist tradition. This, along with an appropriate understanding of analogy, can provide traditional warrants for Catholic theology's own entry into a cultural world open to endless variety. In addition, the idea of a "hierarchy of truths" and even the old system of "theological notes" implicitly take a stand against theological monism. Finally, the magisterium's occasional admission of errors and the reversals it has actually made signal a fundamental openness in the tradition toward embracing a "commensurable conceptual pluralism" in Catholic theology today.

However, modern Catholic teaching and theology have generally resisted the movement toward pluralism. How do we explain the condemnation not only of Modernism but also of less ambitious movements in theology toward tolerance of a plurality of theological conceptualities? And how do we account for Neo-Scholasticism's strangle-

hold on theology, a dominance that still makes many wonder whether Catholicism can ever learn to exist as a vital contributor to the post-modern intellectual world?

The ideological basis for the modern Catholic distrust of theological pluralism, G. writes, lies in the conceptualism that emerged in scholastic philosophy, and perhaps especially in Cajetan. Forgetful that Aquinas himself distinguished *esse* from particular essences, conceptualism thought of theological *concepts* as adequately representative of the essence of revelation. This conceptualism led theology toward a narrow representational realism in which specific, usually scholastic, concepts allegedly mediated the fullness of revelation. Naive representational realism, however, whether religious or scientific, allows for no competitors. It shrinks our sense of reality and promotes an exclusivism that closes itself to the relativizing fullness of being itself and to the enrichment that comes from intercourse with other religious and secular ways of conceiving the world.

Since pluralism allows for a multiplicity of paradigms and conceptualities, it is a major threat to the conceptualist view of faith and theology. A more accurate understanding of *esse*, however, can overcome the restrictiveness of theological uniformism. Both Gilson's and transcendental Thomism's interpretations of being, as distinct from those of Cajetan, Garrigou-Lagrange, and other influential scholars in the scholastic tradition, allow us to appreciate the ineffable mystery of being as the goal rather than the already possessed object of *intellectus*. In doing so they allow us to accept the representational inadequacy, i.e. the relativity, of all present theological concepts. Thus the Catholic theological tradition is, after all, inherently open to a kind of theological pluralism—and in a way that avoids the relativism and nihilism of secular postmodern thought.

Only by accepting the venerable apophatic conviction that revelation always transcends our theologies will we be able to justify a conceptual pluralism. Thus, it is not so much postmodernity as the ineffability of God that relativizes our theologies and invites them to prosper from encounter with alternative approaches to the divine mystery.

G.'s arguments are nuanced and carefully worked out. They deserve close attention from all theologians concerned about Catholicism's potential relevance to contemporary culture.

Georgetown University

JOHN F. HAUGHT

THE MORALITY OF PLURALISM. By John Kekes. Princeton: Princeton University, 1993. Pp. xii + 227. \$29.95.

In this eloquent work, Kekes proposes an apology for moral plural-

ism. He conceives pluralism as a *via media* between the extremes of moral dogmatism and relativism. Dogmatism argues that there is only one, universally valid hierarchy of moral goods proper to the reasonable agent. Relativism contends that all moral judgments are contingent on the social contexts in which they emerge. K.'s pluralism diverges from dogmatism by its refusal to endorse one value or cluster of values as universally overriding other values. It differs from relativism by insisting on certain primary values which are necessary for the construction of any worthy life, no matter how varied the application of these values in different cultures may prove.

Influenced by M. Oakeshott and I. Berlin, K. develops his case for pluralism through a careful defense of six theses. These include the plurality and conditionality of values, the unavoidability of conflicts, the approach to reasonable conflict-resolution, the possibilities of life, the need for limits, and the prospects for moral progress. K. repeatedly underscores the legitimate plurality of moral and nonmoral values, which resist reduction to a monistic scale of uniform values. Simultaneously, he attempts to prevent a deterioration of pluralism into relativism by appealing to the moral minimum essential to human flourishing in any culture.

K.'s defense of the intermediate position of pluralism is only partially successful. As he himself admits, the critique of dogmatism and relativism is an easier task than the elaboration of the precise contours of a moderate alternative. In certain passages, K.'s pluralism veers close to natural law. Human nature emerges as the criterion of morality. "Primary values are derived from the minimum requirements of all good lives. These requirements, in turn, depend on universally human, culturally invariable, and historically constant facts of human nature" (121). In these naturalist moments, K. denounces certain actions as objectively immoral. "Not all possibilities of life are worth exploring, not even in our imagination. The fact is that we do not need moral imagination to recognize that the abominable fantasies of the Marquis de Sade, the fanaticism of Khomeni, the murderous resentment of Charles Manson, the inhuman cruelty of Idi Amin . . . are evil. . . . It is quite enough for us to know that there are certain ways in which all human beings, always, and everywhere are vulnerable to being undeservedly harmed and that it is evil to harm them in this way" (117).

In other passages, however, K.'s pluralism hews closer to relativism. His treatment of moral progress, which dismisses any objective criterion, is vaguely anarchic. "Moral progress does not consist in the gradual approximation to some ideal, such as the imitation of Christ or living according to the laws of history, psychology or sociology. It does

not require the subordination of passion to reason, or the reverse. Moral progress involves neither getting closer to a preestablished pattern nor removing obstacles to conformity to it, because there is no pattern" (141). Similarly, certain analyses of adherence to moral values are strongly subjectivist. "Conceptions of a good life are intended to select those values of the tradition whose possession would best fit the agents' character and circumstances" (97). In such passages, the validity of moral judgments appears to rest upon personal preference and internal coherence alone.

If K.'s version of pluralism is not always consistent, his ambitious work successfully treats several problems in contemporary moral theory. He painstakingly analyzes the radicality of moral conflict, which cannot be masked by resort to facile monisms. Further, he carefully sketches a reasonable approach to the practical resolution of value conflicts in the individual and the political orders. An astute psychologist, he provides a remarkable analysis of moral imagination as the locus of possible moral and aesthetic values, the rich horizon of our actual pluralism.

Fordham University

JOHN J. CONLEY, S.J.

MORAL IMAGINATION: IMPLICATIONS OF COGNITIVE SCIENCE FOR ETHICS. Mark Johnson. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1993. Pp. xiv + 287. \$29.95.

This is a provocative and innovative book in moral epistemology. Johnson brings into moral theory his earlier work in cognitive semantics. He argues forcefully in each chapter that moral cognition is irreducibly imaginative in character. The introduction of a critical or creative element into moral cognition—primarily by recalling the metaphoric morphology of reality and experience—is a welcome corrective to the received tradition that saw morality as "nothing more than a system of universal moral laws or rules that come from the essence of reason" (2).

J.'s constant foe is the legacy of the Enlightenment, or what he awkwardly calls the Moral Law folk theory and which he broadly conceives to encompass all of Western morality. This model of morality creates an anthropology of knowledge or network of assumptions about human nature and cognition against which a moral problem is defined and moral language is construed. Moral theory uncritically attempts to imitate the modern notion of science; problem solving becomes the deductive application of a rule to a particular case. This rationalistic conception of morality, far from being the pure or autonomous theory its proponents assumed, is guided by a vast and interrelated web of

metaphors through which the meaning of moral action, purpose, rights, duties, and character is structured. Criticism of *how* the Moral Law folk theory structured these moral realities, does not diminish the fact that metaphors erect the necessary cognitive topologies in which morally problematic situations are perceived and understood.

There is, however, another and more important epistemic role to the "metaphors we live by." Metaphor is the vehicle through which imaginative alternatives for action and critical transformations of value can emerge; metaphoric or imaginative reasoning is the means to transform a community's moral narrative in light of new experiences and insights. A change in metaphor will effect the *protonarrative* dimension of experience (Ricoeur). That is, a change in metaphor will change how experiences are synthesized or situations are framed. When the conditions of temporal existence are altered, new perspectives on the world emerge, new questions unfold, and new possibilities for action are explored. A change in metaphor, in other words, will effect a change in the mostly unreflective accommodation of language and the world. Moving beyond a univocal conception of language allows Johnson to undermine the claims of moral absolutism; moving into an historical ontology allows him to avoid the equally false claims of moral relativism.

J. here contributes to a growing research programme in fundamental moral theology. There is an emerging convergence of tendencies that have as their purpose a radical revisioning of moral theory in terms of postmodern epistemology and history. A wide variety of moral theologians will find in this book strong and compelling theoretical support for their projects: feminist ethicists, theologians interested in the role of emotion in moral decision making, people engaged in inter-religious dialogue, or even those on the Continent who are working to retrieve the virtue of *epikeia*.

Kenrick School of Theology, St. Louis THOMAS R. KOPFENSTEINER

COMMITTED WORSHIP: A SACRAMENTAL THEOLOGY FOR CONVERTING CHRISTIANS 1-2. By Donald L. Gelpi, S.J. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. xvi + 278; viii + 312. \$17.95 + \$17.95.

Gelpi's work in foundational theology is well known. These two volumes, however, seem to represent his most ambitious endeavor to date. The first volume, subtitled *Adult Conversion and Initiation*, frames the initiation sacraments in a highly developed and challenging theology of conversion. The second volume, *The Sacraments of Ongoing Conversion*, treats the remaining sacraments within this same framework. G. eschews footnote references and refers the reader to a partial bib-

liography of secondary sources at the end of the second volume as well as to his other work. Although G. credits the influence of the charismatic movement in his own life and theology, he prefers to describe his current work as "foundational and experiential."

The ongoing influence of Lonergan's treatment of conversion is acknowledged by the importance also given to a theology of inculturation, as well as to liturgical and liberation theology. In line with this approach, G. insists on a theology of conversion that affords "a comprehensive, authenticating ground for the enterprise of theological reconstruction." In order to accomplish this demanding goal, five forms of conversion are presented. The initiation sacraments as well as the other sacraments are then reviewed from an historical viewpoint and their postconciliar liturgical ritual described. Then the theology of the particular sacrament in question is developed within the five-fold theology of conversion, and a theological resolution of particular problems associated with the sacrament is offered. In other words, this is a highly systematic and closely argued theology of sacrament, written in a clear and persuasive style.

Citing *Sacrosanctum Concilium* 9, G. correctly argues that the deeper problem of postconciliar liturgy is the integral conversion that must accompany it. The resulting question is "How ought a community of thoroughly converted Christians to worship sacramentally?" The test of conversion is the movement from irresponsible to responsible behavior. The five forms conversion takes are affective, intellectual, moral, sociopolitical, and religious. G. gives a brief autobiographical example of each.

The development of these ideas which takes up the first half of volume 1 is at its most interesting and provocative in drawing out the implications of a sociopolitical conversion. This form of conversion authenticates the other forms by deprivatizing them. G. remarks that sociopolitical conversion is the form most resisted, especially in American culture where privatized values are the norm; it also presents an unwelcome challenge to institutionalized values. The sign of conversion is a transvaluation of other forms of conversion in religious conversion in which theological hope casts a transforming light on all reality. Thus, affective conversion moves into repentance and a reevaluation of all the aspects of human living attached to such a conversion. (Throughout these discussions, G. gives an interesting and sometimes insightful rereading of familiar concepts such as habitual and actual grace, the theological virtues, etc.). But G. also insists in several places that the initial consent of faith entails "consent to a felt encounter with the Holy." Shared worship involves the "sensibilities born of faith through which we respond to the touch of God."

A logical consistency is a mark of G.'s thinking. In his chapters on "the social dynamics of sanctification" and "socialization into the family of God," G. draws out some of the corollaries of his treatment of conversion at the same time that he develops the trinitarian and Christological foundations for his notion of sacraments. The divine experience affords a symbolic structure analogous to that of human experience.

The sacramental sections of G.'s work derive their consistent treatment and force from this carefully constructed comprehensive theology of conversion. The catechumenal process, e.g., suggests a more complete ecclesiology when the sociopolitical dimensions of conversion are taken seriously. G. insists on the importance of discerning the charisms of catechumens and on taking seriously the important differences between the situation of the first historical catechumenates and our own contemporary situations. He also reminds us that one can move from a conventional (in Fowler's sense) to a reflective faith without a more profound appropriation of conversion in all its dimensions.

In treating the other sacraments, G. consistently draws out the implications of his conversion model. E.g., marriage is seen as the initiation covenant deepened by the community's discernment of a charismatic ministry given to a particular couple. The confirmation of those baptized as infants should be linked to the level of converted commitment required of adult catechumens seeking initiation. G. is especially challenging in his discussion of reconciliation in connection with international greed, rampant consumerism, social fragmentation, and clericalism.

I believe that G. has succeeded, on the whole, in his efforts to construct an integrated systematic theology of sacrament premised on his theology of conversion. He certainly seems to avoid the weaknesses he so strongly criticizes in a therapeutic approach to sacraments. Within the limits imposed by such an ambitious project, G.'s historical surveys and liturgical descriptions of each sacrament are quite adequate.

There are, however, certain hesitations I have about this impressive work which arise from my own concerns. The ongoing debate about the specific methodologies that inform sacramental and liturgical theology is concretized in this work. The conversion model is obviously amenable to both theologies. But the underlying dynamic of G.'s work certainly does not seem to be *lex orandi lex credendi*. This is a legitimate choice. As a result, however, the strengths of his work seem to lie in his systematic resolution of key problems such as the indissolubility of marriage, the nature of character in orders, or the ordination of women. Perhaps this is the reason I found his discussion of the Eucharist somewhat disappointing despite its many merits. In contrast to the

work of Edward Kilmartin or David Power, e.g., there is no advancement of the discussion.

This set would serve as an excellent text for undergraduate theology majors or for seminarians, if supplemented by other readings. There are a number of typos in the bibliography, usually in the French citations.

University of Notre Dame

REGIS A. DUFFY, O.F.M.

SHORTER NOTICES

JONAH. By James Limburg. Old Testament Library. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 123. \$20.

This latest contribution to a prestigious series comes from an experienced teacher who combines theological insight with a talent for singling out major issues in a literary work. Limburg's independent translation is crisp and accurate; his division of Jonah into seven scenes captures the liveliness of the narrative and its artful surprises. L. suggests, on linguistic grounds, that the book was probably written in the postexilic period.

The generous use of questions as well as the frequent declarations about God point to Jonah's didactic character. The prevalence of direct discourse and repetition of key words suggests that the story was meant to be heard. I would further insist on the satirical character of the book; rarely do we find in the OT a work as rich in its ironies and as biting in its ridicule. The exact historical situation is irrelevant; that narrowness which sets limits to the mercy of God has neither a time frame nor geographical borders. Sad to say, it is endemic to the human condition.

L.'s analysis of the crucial confession of Jonah in 4:1-3 is excellent, but I would emphasize that Jonah is appealing to the magnificent self-revelation of God on Sinai (Exod 34:6-7) in explaining why he ran away

from the divine commission. A profound intuition of God's boundless mercy propels this flawed little man southwest when God orders him to go northeast. The commentary is enriched by attention to Jonah's appeal in painting, sculpture, song, and architecture. Finally, there is the abiding influence of Jonah in Judaism, Islam, and Christianity. This commentary will, I hope, find the wide audience it deserves.

FRED L. MORIARTY, S.J.
Boston College

MATTHEW. By Douglas R. A. Hare. Interpretation Commentary for Teaching and Preaching. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. vii + 338. \$22.

Readers of this volume need to remember the explicit purpose of the series, which "is designed to meet the needs of students, teachers, ministers, and priests for a contemporary expository commentary" (v). Perhaps no one has met that objective better than Hare does in this volume. Readers will not expect to find here Hare's reasoned scholarly interpretation of Matthew, fully buttressed by dialogue with the critical tradition, since that is not the intent of the series. Yet Hare's careful scholarship shines through in his concise summaries of current critical debate, as, e.g., in his treatment of the Son of God vs. Son of

David problem in the genealogy and infancy narrative (5–11).

Hare maintains here the general interpretation of Matthew which has always guided his work. He believes the Gospel's final author used Mark and Q and other available sources to produce a document for a post-Jewish Christian community with deep roots in the Jewish-Christian heritage. Consequently he reads portions of the Sermon on the Mount, the opening verses of chapter 23, and the closing commissioning scene as more firmly directed to a Gentile-Christian world than many contemporary scholars might. In this respect Hare continues to maintain the stance of his mentor, W. D. Davies, about the Jewish-Christian rootedness of Matthew but also its full transition to a Gentile-Christian focus. This reviewer particularly appreciated the perceptive stress on "discipling" in the interpretation of the Gospel and of its final scene, even though a parallel stress on "observing all that I have commanded you" might cause one to modify the pro-Gentile interpretation of the book and the passage.

The other purpose of this series (expository commentary) is also well met. Hare's tone is never strident, always searching. The awareness that Matthew was written well before the Greek theological "essence" debates emerged is carefully maintained. Readers are always asked to consider the moral and religious implications of the text.

LAMAR COPE

Carroll College, Waukesha, Wisc.

READING LUKE-ACTS: DYNAMICS OF BIBLICAL NARRATIVE. By William S. Kurz, S.J. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox, 1993. Pp. x + 261. \$16.

Kurz makes a substantial contribution to the intersection of Luke-Acts scholarship and narrative criticism. K. keeps his review of interpretive

theory lean and emphasizes the application of narrative criticism to specific texts. He focuses on material which has defied scholarly consensus in historical criticism: the prologues, the first four chapters of Luke, the variety of narrators, especially the "we" narrator, the three versions of Paul's conversion, and the indeterminate ending of Acts. Principal interlocutors include Sternberg, Tannehill, and Fitzmyer. The bulk of K.'s discussion concerns the Acts of the Apostles.

K. explains the terms "implied authors and readers," "plotting" and "gaps," and he suggests the function of plotting, repetition, redundancy of motifs, and the relation of the reader to filling in gaps (the end of Acts imitates Mark's enigmatic gap). Part 2, the heart of the book, deals first with a variety of narrators in the Gospel. Attention is on Luke 1–4, not much on the travel section of 9:51–19:44, and on the passion-resurrection. Then K. reviews Acts as a narrative with a single question: Who is the narrator and when does that "voice" shift? A well-wrought discussion of the identity of the "we" narrator after Acts 16:10 proposes that "we" refers to a group of persons around Paul. More patchy is a briefer section dealing with the motif of irony and misunderstanding in passages about opposition and rejection, e.g., Isaiah 6:9–10 in Acts 28. The final section discusses the interrelation of canonical criticism and literary criticism to the axis of orality-textuality.

Nearly a third of the volume is notes, bibliography and indexes—a resource for students and professors.

MARIE-ELOISE ROSENBLATT, R.S.M.
Santa Clara University

LUKE'S PORTRAIT OF PAUL. By John Clayton Lentz, Jr. Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series. New York: Cambridge University, 1993. Pp. xiii + 192. \$49.95.

This study is a careful rereading of Luke's portrayal of Paul with special attention to how this portrait would have been perceived by readers/hearers of the first-century Hellenistic world. Lentz's work exemplifies the turn in the study of Acts from questions of history to questions of rhetoric. Indeed, one of L.'s insights is that careful attention to historical problems in Acts alerts one to aspects of Luke's rhetorical intent.

L. makes a good case that Luke's picture of Paul as citizen of Rome, citizen of the Greek city Tarsus, and Torah-keeping Pharisee is historically improbable and indicates Luke's intent to present Paul as a person of high social status. Similarly, the narratives about the Apostle's interaction with the Roman legal system and its officials does not match Paul's own epistolary description of his legal troubles; again Luke's picture seems to focus less on history and more on Paul as exemplary Christian leader whose dignity contrasts with his interrogators and guards and exhibits him as a model of the virtues the Hellenistic world prized most.

L.'s use of contemporary Hellenistic parenetic and forensic material is persuasive. If his judgment regarding the questions of historicity leaves room for discussion, his highlighting of Luke's rhetorical intent and strategy is cogent.

DENNIS HAMM, S.J.
Creighton University, Omaha

MEMORIA MORTUORUM: COMMEMORATION OF THE DEPARTED IN AUGUSTINE. By Heikki Kotila. *Studia Ephe-meridis "Augustinianum."* Rome: Institutum Patristicum "Augustinianum," 1992. Pp. 219. L. 40,000.

A doctoral dissertation completed under the direction of Lionel Wickham at the University of Cambridge in 1990. Kotila was faced with the

daunting task of systematically presenting Augustine's teaching on a theme which is at best peripherally treated in his writings. To understand the cult of the dead and its role in the thought of Augustine, K. relies primarily on Augustine's *De cura pro mortuis gerenda*, written ca. 421 in response to an inquiry by Paulinus of Nola concerning the benefit of the custom of burial near the tombs of martyrs. K. also uses letters, sermons, *De civitate Dei* 12-14, and other major and minor works of Augustine.

After a brief introduction and an overview of Jewish, pagan, and Christian practices before Augustine, K. treats two aspects of Augustine's teaching on the subject. First, from the viewpoint of pastoral practice, Augustine had inherited an established and commonly accepted cult of the dead, a local amalgamation of Christian and Greco-Roman elements. Augustine's emphasis was ecclesial: the Church commemorated the dead in the Eucharist, by prayer, and through almsgiving. Second, from a theological perspective, pious communal practices confronted Augustine with the concrete question whether liturgical commemoration actually benefited the departed. This question then opened up the problem of predestination and postmortem purgation, which Augustine solved, or at least avoided, by describing the cult of the dead in terms of a theology of sign and sacrament. According to K. the relationship of the Church's prayer for the dead to the doctrine of predestination presents a conflict in the thought of Augustine which remains ultimately unresolved.

K. makes no mention of Cornelius Petrus Mayer's two-volume opus on Augustine's theology of symbol and sign (Würzburg, 1969) nor of Donald X. Burt's recent writings on Augustine and death in *Augustinianum* 28

(1988) 527–63 and in *Studia Patristica* 22 (1989) 223–28.

KENNETH B. STEINHAUSER
Saint Louis University

LA THÉOLOGIE DE LA VICTOIRE DE CONSTANTIN À THÉODOSE. By François Heim. *Théologie Historique*. Paris: Beauchesné, 1992. Pp. xv + 347. Fr. 270.

The theology of victory expresses triumphalism, the notion that Rome will always be victorious. Heim analyzes the changes from Lactantius to Paulinus of Nola that resulted from barbarian pressure and Christianity's supplantation of "paganism." Christians and pagans competed within a community of concern. Traditionally, victories were due to both human effort and divine aid, *virtus* and *fortuna*. The shocks of the fourth century privileged *pietas* and divine *virtus* at the expense of human virtues. Both sides would rather pray than fight, and prized victory without bloodshed. If the New Testament tradition stressed the victory of martyrs, the Old Testament buttressed Roman tradition with God's work now in battles with barbarians. Dialectically, pagans leaned toward divine aid in imperial *virtus*, while Christians stressed human effort. Both sides came to see battles as ordeals (325). Yet the shocks so exceeded human measure that many withdrew to religion. Catastrophes confirmed theories of divine wrath at sin, and so some urged moral amendment that would lead to a new society of prayer.

H. allows individual authors to speak for themselves (e.g. Paulinus on the saints). While his *mise au point* seldom surprises, H. demonstrates well the rich ambivalence of *virtus*. There are some inaccuracies and gaps in the bibliography, and there is no list of abbreviations or index to ideas. The book, part of a *thèse d'état*, is overlong and incomplete. H. seems,

properly, to be looking forward to Augustine, who, by breaking the link between virtue and temporal felicity, limited the theology of victory. H. announces a book to finish his story; we should anticipate it with interest.

FREDERICK H. RUSSELL
Rutgers University

THE TRINITY: AN ANALYSIS OF ST. THOMAS AQUINAS' *EXPOSITIO* OF THE *DE TRINITATE* OF BOETHIUS. By Douglas C. Hall. Leiden: Brill, 1992. Pp. vi + 131.

In this gem of a book, Hall situates Aquinas's unfinished *Expositio* within the framework of current issues of method. In disclosing the objective content of Aquinas's work, one is necessarily involved with the dialectical methodology Thomas employs. H. surveys the principal "thematics" of 20th-century Thomistic hermeneutics, all of which share historico-critical presuppositions. The "participationist" thematic stresses Aquinas's originality in adapting the Aristotelian and Neoplatonic traditions; the "transcendental" thematic emphasizes the dynamic a priori structures of the knower and the relation of knowing to being; the "analogical" thematic searches for the ontological grounds of real knowledge of God. While H. seems to lean toward the transcendental approach of Rahner, he fully recognizes that all three thematics are necessary for an adequate understanding of Thomas. H. asks how the dialectical aspects of each can be integrated into a single synthetic method. He finds that integration in Thomas's own method, which is inherently dialectical.

Thomas's dialectic moves by way of internal negation of his own arguments. On the one hand sensible reality can lead to real knowledge of God; on the other hand sensible reality impedes such knowledge. This leaves room for infused knowledge,

the *lumen fidei*, which gives "as it were only a kind of impression of the First Truth" and "as it were, kind of suffices" for making faith judgments (117). Thomas's heady confidence in the *lumen fidei* to strengthen the natural powers of reason is met by an equally forceful assertion of the impenetrability of the Divine Mystery. One is led, through the dialectic of negation, to a mystical speechlessness before the reality of God.

This very dialectic reflects, in turn, the structure of human consciousness. Indeed, the end point of trinitarian theology coincides with the end point of theological anthropology. In the final analysis, perhaps no thesis of theology tells us more about ourselves than does the Trinity.

Scattered proofing oversights by Brill do not ultimately detract from Hall's prodigious accomplishment.

PAUL G. CROWLEY, S.J.
Santa Clara University

THE SPIRITUAL CONQUEST ACCOMPLISHED BY THE RELIGIOUS OF THE SOCIETY OF JESUS IN THE PROVINCES OF PARAGUAY, PARANA, URUGUAY, AND TAPE (1639). By Antonio Ruiz de Montoya, S.J. Translated from the Spanish by C. J. McNaspy, S.J., et al. Jesuit Primary Sources in English Translations. St. Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1993. Pp. 223. \$24.95; \$17.95.

Students of Colonial Latin America will be pleased to learn of the translation of Antonio Ruiz de Montoya's *Spiritual Conquest* by the Institute of Jesuit Sources. This makes available to the English reader an important primary source concerning the indigenous people of South America. M. did not intend to write an anthropological report, nor did he claim to give an unbiased presentation of his subject; however he has left the historian important background information

and provided valuable insights into 17th-century Guarani life.

For theologians, M.'s work provides an interesting example of the inculturation of European spirituality into a successful Christian missiology. As the Introduction observes, M. "inculcates in his mystical treatise a . . . mysticism of the Pseudo-Dionysian type that has become familiar from the *Cloud of Unknowing*. . . [he] was a paradigmatic 'contemplative in action'. . . In this he strikingly parallels his North American contemporary and counterpart, St. Jean de Brébeuf, S.J." (20) This comparison to Brébeuf at the level of operative theology poses important questions concerning the importance of spirituality in developing missiology.

The translation, undertaken with the Institute's usual thoroughness, is clear while retaining a baroque flavor. The Introduction by C. J. McNaspy is excellent. McNaspy's clear love for the work and the workers of this story only enhances the informative and scholarly presentation that he gives us. The notes, unfortunately, are borrowed from earlier editions.

In an age of growing national identity and colonial expansion, M.'s identification with "his Indians" provides an important example of the separation of the gospel from the culture in which it had become embedded. This challenges the facile judgement that the Church was merely the instrument of imperial powers. In Paraguay at least, it brought about the political means to resist colonial exploitation.

MARK A. LEWIS, S.J.
University of Toronto

DELIGHTFUL CONVICTION: JONATHAN EDWARDS AND THE RHETORIC OF CONVERSION. By Stephen R. Yarbrough and John C. Adams. *Great American Orators*. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood, 1993. Pp. xxiv + 176. \$49.95.

Yarbrough and Adams have worked carefully to fulfill the goals of this series, dedicated to providing book-length studies of major figures in the history of American public address. The critical apparatus includes ten pages of selected bibliography and a thorough chronology of Edwards' life and works, in addition to index, notes, and a listing of works cited. Part 1 offers an analysis of the theology and sermons of E., particularly of three major sermons, whose texts are provided in Part 2.

The major thesis of the authors is that the ultimate goal of E.'s rhetoric is not persuasion, but conversion; E. does not aim to establish a common ground between orator and audience, but to dismantle all sense of self-sufficiency, thus preparing the way for God's converting grace. Analysis of his rhetoric, therefore, requires some analysis of his theological system. Y. and A. combine theological and socio-economic studies of colonial New England with their own area of expertise: literary and rhetorical analysis. Their grasp of the scholarship is basically sound, and their insights are sometimes fascinating, e.g. the concluding comparison with *Uncle Tom's Cabin*. On the other hand, it is clear they are not conversant with theological analysis. E.'s "thorough nihilism", for example, is hardly distinctive, but simply part and parcel of Calvinist dichotomies (total depravity or irresistible grace). Nor did they have the advantage of the most recent volume of the Yale series of E.'s works, which includes a long introductory essay on the sermons in general and a critical edition of those from the earliest period.

CHRISTOPHER VISCARDI, S.J.
Spring Hill College, Mobile

EVANGELICAL EUCHARISTIC
THOUGHT IN THE CHURCH OF EN-
GLAND. By Christopher J. Cocks-

worth. New York: Cambridge University, 1993. Pp. vi + 283.

Anglican Cocksworth presents a three-part study of Eucharistic theology from within the Evangelical strain of the Church of England. An initial historical survey traces the Evangelical heritage from the great Reformers, through its evolution in the Anglican and subsequent Puritan traditions, to its nadir in the 1920s and its gradual turnabout from 1930 to 1960. C. then takes a closer look at "the Evangelical reawakening" (1960-1990), when Evangelicals entered the world of liturgical renewal and ecumenical dialogue. Finally he takes a bolder step, giving fresh address to three Eucharistic questions: Eucharist as sacrament, as presence, and as sacrifice.

C. addresses a paradox of Evangelical thought and practice: in practice the Sacrament has not been given a place of honor, but in thought it has been held in high esteem. The point of his historical survey is to "identify the factors which have helped or hindered the expression of an Evangelical form of sacramentalism." The point of his second part is to show how both thought and practice have been challenged and transformed by Evangelical involvement in liturgical revision. And the task he undertakes in the last part is "to use resources which the tradition has at its disposal, both from within its own history and from the contemporary debate in the wider Church, to continue the process of theological reflection and integration, which has been identified as already happening and which is in need of further development."

C. engages this last task with both courage and care. While remaining rigidly faithful to Evangelical insight and concern, he is nonetheless broadly ecumenical in the resources he taps, including in his dialogue in-

sights from Latin Catholicism and Orthodox Christianity. The book is a rewarding read for Evangelical Christians, to be sure, but also for students of the Eucharist in any tradition and for Christians seeking the path of communion among the churches. C.'s work is a significant contribution to the Church as a whole.

PETER E. FINK, S.J.
Weston School of Theology

GRACE AND DISGRACE: A THEOLOGY OF SELF-ESTEEM, SOCIETY AND HISTORY. By Neil Ormerod. Newtown, N.S.W.: Dwyer, 1992. Pp. x + 212. \$12.95.

A useful popularization dealing with grace and original sin. The roots of these doctrines are sketched, then both are psychologized to render them meaningful in terms of self-esteem, Ormerod's controlling motif. Dependent mainly on the insightful work of S. Moore, O. identifies original sin as self-disesteem stemming from early childhood separation and Oedipal crises. Correlatively, grace is viewed as affirming and reassuring corrective, its other dimensions yielding to the therapeutic.

While this work will be effective at a popular level in dislodging misconceptions that bedevil grace and sin, it falls prey to the pitfalls of the genre. Often it begs nuance and precision and makes questionable assertions (e.g. concerning Augustine and Thomas). Psychological soundings, while essential to any articulation of sin and grace, require complementing by ontological analyses. And use of self-esteem (a fashionable first-world preoccupation?) as a hermeneutical key carries here its own burdens. It is never clearly distinguished from narcissism. Nor is it explained why self-disesteem, deriving from putative natural psychic processes, should be labeled (analogously) "sin."

O. is spot on in giving primordality

to grace, but his tone and drift appear to underestimate evil's tenacious grip, e.g. when he tells us that "the biggest and most damaging lie is that there is something wrong with us" (159). Consider Bosnia. Grace affirms, completes because it challenges. Given evil's relentless power and human being's persistent disintegration, the nature/grace dialectic is not simply one of capacity/fulfillment. It is also marked by conflict. For the facticity of the psychic and social givens that O. sees fostering self-disesteem meet with our complicity, the involuntary with the voluntary. Luther with his subtle *simul* remains our teacher. Redemption relates to finitude not just as perfection to imperfection. To see redemption solely as self-transcendence is illusory. Grace wrestles with a perverse negativity that we are cunningly in concert with. Case in point, the Jesus story.

STEPHEN J. DUFFY
Loyola University, New Orleans

CHURCH IN THE ROUND: FEMINIST INTERPRETATION OF THE CHURCH. By Letty M. Russell. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 253. \$15.

Following upon her earlier book *Household of Freedom: Authority in Feminist Theology*, Russell attempts a feminist interpretation of the Christian Church described as "a community of Christ, bought with a price, where everyone is welcome." Her root metaphor for elaborating this description is that of a round table. Thus, in Part 1 she describes a feminist spiral methodology of action and reflection to describe a Church connected to the marginalized in society, as well as to the biblical and ecclesial tradition, and suggests the implications for leadership in such a Church.

Part 2 takes up the metaphor of "kitchen table solidarity" to examine communities of faith and struggle, including feminist communities and

base Christian communities. She also suggests the ways in which the traditional marks of the Church would be changed by the experience of solidarity with the oppressed. In the final section, the metaphor of "welcome table partnership" is employed to discuss the "shifts needed in ecclesiology if everyone is to be welcome at God's table, both now and at the final feast of God." R. reexamines the doctrine of election to free it from supporting dominating and oppressive structures both in Church and society. The last chapter develops a feminist "spirituality of connection" as a way of nurturing those choosing to be connected to those on the margins of life.

One cannot help but be sympathetic with the desire for a Church of liberation, in solidarity with the poor and marginalized, that offers hope for a new way of being Church. R. correctly identifies the aspirations of feminists with those of the Latin American liberation theologians who have been saying much the same things for some time (e.g. Boff, Sobrino, and Gutiérrez). I fully support the intent and purpose of her ecclesiology, but found the constant repetition of the table metaphor and an abundance of politically correct jargon distracting and inhibiting the achievement of that goal.

T. HOWLAND SANKS, S.J.
Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

THE LOVE COMMANDMENTS: ESSAYS IN CHRISTIAN ETHICS AND MORAL PHILOSOPHY. Edited by Edmund N. Santurri and William Werpehowski. Washington: Georgetown University, 1992. Pp. xxiii + 307. \$25.

Nine essays examine the meaning and moral implications of *agape*, particularly as interpreted by proponents of "equal regard." Gene Outka's excellent opening essay, "Universal Love and Impartiality," provides a theocentric framework within which both love for neighbor and love for

self can be appreciated and intelligently coordinated. Subsequent essays extend inquiry into areas of central concern to both the history of theological ethics and the contemporary debate, including the nature of and limits to self-sacrifice, the relation between the universal scope of neighbor-love and the focused loyalties of "special relations," the validity and meaning of proper self-love, love as duty and as supererogatory, and the relation of love and justice. Several also examine the relevance of love for special ethics, including the justification of political violence and the moral status and rights of the profoundly retarded.

The unity of the volume lies primarily in its contributors' shared commitment to the claim that all human beings are objects of love (theological, warranted by the universality of divine love), the equal worth of all persons, and the alliance between this universalism and ethical impartiality as interpersonal consistency. Efforts are made to correct misunderstandings of impartiality, or at least of Christian appropriation of impartiality, within *agape*, e.g. criticisms that it is individualistic, insufficiently pro-active, eliminates legitimate self-regard, abstracts excessively from the identity of the agent, etc.

All the essays are well done, self-critical, and carefully argued. While clearly influenced by Outka, the authors are not slavishly dependent on him. Perhaps the only weakness is a noticeable absence of alternative perspectives, e.g. liberation theology on love as solidarity, feminism on mutuality, etc. Nevertheless, the work is superb and instructive for those who agree or disagree with the approach taken. It ought to be read, studied carefully, and appreciated by every scholar in Christian ethics and moral theology.

STEPHEN J. POPE
Boston College

THE SPIRIT OF COMMUNITY: RIGHTS, RESPONSIBILITIES AND THE COMMUNITARIAN AGENDA. By Amitai Etzioni. New York: Crown, 1993. Pp. 323. \$22.

Etzioni's book is more of an explanation of a movement than a scholarly inquiry into the subjects mentioned in the subtitle. The communitarian movement which E. and a colleague founded in 1991 along with some 70 anonymous "leading Americans" has two planks to its platform. It promotes "a moratorium on the minting of most, if not all, new rights"; and it reestablishes the link between rights and responsibilities. As a piece of rhetoric exhorting readers to build community, this volume succeeds admirably. As a piece of analysis of either rights or responsibilities, or their linkage, it fails.

While it is appropriate to lament the confusion over and conflation of rights with interests, one looks in vain here for the moral basis of human rights. One suspects that since E. refers to "new" rights as "minted," he either doesn't know, or doesn't subscribe to, the classical understanding of rights as inalienable or "God-given." More disconcerting, although the term "moral" appears repeatedly here, the moral basis of rights and responsibilities receives virtually no attention. E. would seem to be saying that Americans must become communitarian because our oft-cited individualism doesn't work. This is undoubtedly true, not to say obvious. But it is not obvious why we should be communitarian, or moral for that matter, for anything more than pragmatic reasons.

The book tries to explain how to bring about this pragmatic utopia of communitarianism, but without addressing the question "why?" It is written with an ethical passion, but without doing the ethics that would give that passion a foundation. On a more positive note, it is laced with

very engaging incidents and readable examples.

JOHN C. HAUGHEY, S.J.
Loyola University, Chicago

MORAL FRAGMENTS AND MORAL COMMUNITY: A PROPOSAL FOR CHURCH IN SOCIETY. By Larry L. Rasmussen. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 176.

Rasmussen has two objectives here: to provide a reading of the moral status of American society, and to offer a broadly sketched outline of how the Christian community can survive and revitalize that society. The volume had its origins in a lecture series given at several Lutheran seminaries, and the lecture style carries over into the book.

R.'s assessment of modernity is much beholden to certain social critics, such as C. Lasch, M. Borgmann, A. Wolfe, P. Selznick, R. Bellah and his co-authors. In the face of the allegedly bleak state of American society, R. wants to examine how we can do moral formation in a climate so inhospitable to the Christian way of life. He believes that the depth of our predicament is that we must reform society at a time when "we cannot simply assume a world of morally formed and responsible citizens" (112) are available to take up the challenge.

R.'s constructive response occurs in the final two chapters, the last of which is focused on the role of the Church. There is an admitted "sectarian" tone to the ecclesiology developed here (168, n. 67), not in the sense of withdrawal but in the presupposition that the Church will be an elite rather than a mass movement and in the strongly counter-cultural stance recommended. The analysis of American society R. offers may strike some as overly negative, yet he makes his case well and has a knack for the tell-

ing statistic or example to bolster the argument. While not as extensively developed as his social analysis, R.'s ecclesiology proffers several criteria for the Church's life which are a bracing challenge to an easy reconciliation of the Church's ministry and present American culture.

KENNETH R. HIMES, O.F.M.
Washington Theological Union

JEWISH SOCIAL ETHICS. By David Novak. New York: Oxford University, 1992. Pp. xiii + 252. \$39.95.

Novak is one of the most creative thinkers in traditional Jewish religious circles today. He is difficult to categorize. Generally neoconservative in his political leanings, and solidly rooted in the halachic milieu, he is at the same time open to genuine interreligious dialogue on a theological level and has maintained a long-standing commitment to genuine peace between Palestinians and Israelis. There is a rich texture and integrity in his thought that rarely disappoints, even when one sharply differs with him on a particular issue.

This new volume reveals N. at his best—a scholar deeply immersed in the varied interpretations of Torah as well as in Western philosophical and theological thought. He covers a broad range of issues, some quite general, others very specific, including natural law, theonomous ethics (P. Tillich), the thought of John Courtney Murray, S.J. (whom N. greatly admires), sexuality, AIDS, nuclear war, economics, violence, technology, and, finally, the theme of American Jews and the U.S.

In nearly the whole discussion of particular issues N. relies heavily on Torah teachings which he creatively applies to the contemporary setting. Jewish ethics are essentially theological ethics for N., even though he is a staunch defender of the natural-law

tradition. His particular genius lies in his ability to suggest ways in which the rabbinic tradition can respond to a whole range of issues which the rabbis themselves could not have envisioned.

There is only one area where N.'s ideology seems to have dulled his critical ability—the treatment of homosexuality and AIDS. His overly generalized portrayal of gay persons verges on the prejudicial, and I find his categorization of AIDS victims as sinners quite troubling, even though he would provide them with medical care. The quality of mercy is surely strained in this very disturbing chapter.

JOHN T. PAWLIKOWSKI, O.S.M.
Catholic Theol. Union, Chicago

THE PROMISE OF NATURE: ECOLOGY AND COSMIC PURPOSE. By John F. Haught. New York: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 156. \$9.95.

So testy are many environmentalists about traditional Christianity's alleged "anthropocentrism" that environmental ethics has become the occasion for renewal of the 19th-century wars between science and religion. Haught finds fault on all sides of the debate: with scientific materialists, with traditional Christian theists, and with the cultural despisers of Western religion. The cosmic pessimism associated with scientific materialism, H. contends, is "inherently at odds" with ethical concern for the natural world; and traditional theism is hampered by an inordinate focus on human salvation to the exclusion of the rest of creation. Both systems of ideas share a common attitude, namely "cosmic homelessness," a deficient feeling for humanity's bonds with the rest of the universe.

H. is likewise critical of views that Western religion is the single most important cause of the environmental crisis, but sympathetic to the de-

mands of "creation-centered theology" for "the radical transformation of all religious traditions." H. proposes, as he did in *The Cosmic Adventure* (1984), that the answer to the religious crisis posed by environmentalism lies with process theology. Process thought, he advises, offers the most appropriate paradigm for understanding the unity of humanity and the rest of creation. In particular, "thinking of religions as a prolongation of the cosmic adventure" enables us to accept our "homelessness" without becoming alienated from creation. In the end, H. argues, an adequate environmental theology must acknowledge not only the intrinsic value of nature, but also its ambiguity and its promise. To be faithful to that promise, he contends, we must be ready to be instructed not only by sacramental religion with its roots in the cosmos, but by the story of Abraham and his hope in God's promise.

This short, balanced essay looks with fresh eyes at the environmental crisis and provides a platform for all parties to the controversy to renew their dialogue with new insight and seriousness of purpose.

DREW CHRISTIANSEN, S.J.
United States Catholic Conference

THE ETHICAL FOUNDATIONS OF ECONOMICS. By John J. Piderit, S.J. Washington: Georgetown University, 1993. Pp. xxi + 339. \$35.

Piderit describes this book, intended as an undergraduate text, as an attempt to "integrate an established ethical framework into the neoclassical paradigm." The text shows a definite understanding of and appreciation for the questions pursued in orthodox microeconomics.

The book has uncommon strengths. In the integration of ethics and economics, ethicists frequently repeat a set of mistakes which include an inordinate focus on economic redistribution, a neglect of the exigencies of

production, and a superficial understanding of market forces. This work repeats none of these mistakes. At the same time, the text exhibits important limitations.

The economic framework relies on neoclassical microeconomics. P. describes his economics background as thoroughly neoclassical with only a "dash" of Keynesianism. This is the likely reason why there is little discussion of the important macroeconomic challenges to market economics emphasized by Keynes, which include market disequilibrium, prolonged unemployment, poverty, and racism. Keynesian macroeconomics and its variants constitute the dominant school occupying what may loosely be called the ideological center and left. Ethicists should be aware that P. is principally concerned with a traditional microeconomic framework which tends to assume market equilibrium.

The ethical framework relies on natural law. Perhaps the central feature of the framework is a very firm rejection of the use of proportionate reason in trading off between the fundamental priorities for social policy: "No attempt to compare effects on one fundamental value with effects on another is warranted, since . . . such comparisons reject the insight that each basic value is essential" (141). This is controversial from the standpoint of ethical theory, and it certainly seems unusual from the standpoint of economics. Economics is commonly described as a science dealing with social trade-offs.

RICHARD C. BAYER
Fordham University

PURSUING PARENTHOOD: ETHICAL ISSUES IN ASSISTED REPRODUCTION. By Paul Lauritzen. Bloomington: Indiana University, 1993. Pp. 167. \$19.95.

Too often in the debate over medically assisted reproduction the

spheres of personal narrative and moral analysis hardly touch. Here they are joined with skill and sensitivity. Lauritzen's own experience with infertility is both a window to the larger social, legal, and political questions at hand, and a benchmark against which claims about the effects of technology on human reproduction are judged.

The book's three parts present a defense of medically assisted reproduction against its most extreme critics (represented by the Vatican and a select group of feminists); an argument for an essentially social over genetic definition of legitimate parenthood; and a brief critique of common assumptions about the moral neutrality of adoption. L. argues that the important question to ask of any reproductive option is: How does it or will it affect the relationships of parents to children? This framework allows a careful distinction to be made between supporting the responsible use of artificial insemination and in-vitro fertilization (even where donated gametes are involved) and condoning the separation of genetic, gestational, and social parenthood for any reason whatsoever. Concern for the promotion of deep and enduring bonds between parents and children gives rise, e.g., to a different assessment of commercial surrogacy (where one set of such bonds is intentionally severed for profit) than of donor-assisted interventions in general.

L.'s arguments are careful and his research impressive. In some places, one could wish he went further. It is not clear, e.g., how the use of reproductive technologies by single individuals and gay or lesbian couples might be judged in light of the goods he identifies. His point that adoption is no panacea is well made and insightful, but he neglects to some extent the ways in which the emergence of reproductive technologies on the market may itself be a factor in the

disintegration of adoption as a social institution. And the brief nod given in his epilogue to the problems of funding for infertility treatment belies the urgency of these questions in this age of health care reform. Still, this is a rich, thoughtful, and provocative book. It is a welcome addition to the literature on the topic, a fine example of what can result when an ethicist thinks deeply about an issue of immense personal importance.

MAURA A. RYAN

University of Notre Dame

LIFE'S DOMINION: AN ARGUMENT ABOUT ABORTION, EUTHANASIA, AND INDIVIDUAL FREEDOM. By Ronald Dworkin. New York: Knopf, 1993. Pp. 273. \$23.

Regardless of one's perspective on the issues of abortion and euthanasia, Dworkin's contribution to the debates on these subjects is worth reading. He raises important questions that anyone concerned about the sanctity of human life must address. Most of his investigation focuses on abortion and the difficult and complex legal and moral issues surrounding it.

Throughout much of his discussion, D. follows the *Roe v. Wade* position that the fetus is not a person with constitutional rights and interests. He suggests that American history and tradition support this contention which was accepted by a majority of the Supreme Court in *Roe*. But should history and tradition be the sole guide in such an important and divisive debate, especially when we acknowledge that our nation's history and tradition have failed to extend constitutional rights and protections to African-Americans, women, and members of other minority and religious groups?

D. asserts that a fetus is human life possessing an "intrinsic value"; consequently, abortion "wastes the intrinsic value—the sanctity, the inviolability—of a human life," that is

entitled to some, but not all, protection. In the context of both abortion and euthanasia, he supports the need for self-determination for the mother who bears the fetus and for the person who prefers death to life. However, he avoids arguing the same rights for fetal human life.

If D.'s views regarding the intrinsic value of human life seem to conflict, the conflict is not due to any lack of insight on his part. Rather, it is due to the conflict that permeates most substantive discussions concerning abortion and euthanasia. D. admits that "[a]bortion is a waste of the start of human life . . . [b]ut whatever views we take about abortion and euthanasia, we want the right to decide for ourselves, and we should therefore be ready to insist [on] that right for everyone." D. acknowledges that the "greatest insult to the sanctity of life is indifference or laziness in the face of its complexity." This book is a tonic to indifference and laziness.

ROBERT J. ARAUJO, S.J.
Campion Hall, Oxford

HEALTH CARE REFORM: A CATHOLIC VIEW. By Philip S. Keane, S.S. New York: Paulist, 1993. Pp. viii + 232. \$14.95.

Keane has written a wonderful little book that is timely, clear, balanced, and simple without being simplistic. It is well organized, proceeding from an overview of the current state of affairs, to the basics of Catholic medical morals and social ethics, to the role of religion in the health-care debate, to the details of specific

proposals for health-care reform. While K. sometimes sounds like a cheerleader, I suspect that most readers of this journal will share his pride in the tradition's stand regarding these issues. In fact, the relative convergence of the health-care views espoused by the Catholic Health Association, the bishops, and the theologians is a remarkable thing in the contemporary Church.

K. is not very clear, however, in explaining just how one moves from the Catholic tradition to his specific proposals. His initial assertions about society's inability to deal with death are on target. But if all this means is that dying Catholics should not linger on respirators, then the upshot of this insight is neither dramatic nor new. And his conclusion that this will save lots of money is overdrawn. The book also underestimates the role played by numerous "stakeholders" who impede the kind of reform he envisions. For-profit hospital chains, billing agencies, health insurers, as well as the manufacturers of drugs, intravenous tubing, and CAT-scanners, all share with doctors a big financial stake in the status quo.

Nonetheless, this is a splendid text for inclusion in a course on either Catholic social ethics or medical morals, or even for adult education. And while I have some minor quibbles about some of his conclusions, in the end I really would have been quite pleased if Hillary and Bill had sent K.'s book to Congress instead of the one they did send.

DANIEL P. SULMASY, O.F.M., M.D.
Georgetown University

Theological Studies

MARCH 1994
VOL. 55, NO. 1

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Society of Jesus in the United States*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

Newman, God, and the Academy <i>Daniel Cere</i>	3
Demythologization in the Theology of Karl Rahner <i>Michael H. Barnes</i>	24
Faith and Theology in Encounter with Non-Christians <i>Frans Jozef van Beeck, S.J.</i>	46
Inculturation and Cultural Systems (Part One) <i>Carl F. Starkloff, S.J.</i>	66

CURRENT THEOLOGY

Notes on Moral Theology 1993

The Morality of Humanitarian Intervention <i>Kenneth R. Himes, O.F.M.</i>	82
Ethics, Business, and the Economy <i>John Langan, S.J.</i>	105
Church Responses to Pedophilia <i>Norber J. Rigali, S.J.</i>	124

BOOK REVIEWS

HOLLADAY, W.: <i>The Psalms through Three Thousand Years</i>	140
JOHNSON, L.: <i>The Acts of the Apostles</i>	142
DUNNHILL, J.: <i>Covenant and Sacrifice in the Letter to the Hebrews</i>	144
WILKEN, R.: <i>The Land Called Holy</i>	145
VAN DAM, R.: <i>Saints and Their Miracles in Late Antique Gaul</i>	147
ELLIOT, D.: <i>Spiritual Marriage</i>	148
<i>The Church in Latin America, 1492–1992</i> (ed. E. Dussel).....	150
O'MALLEY, J.: <i>The First Jesuits</i>	152
MENCHI, S.: <i>Erasmus als Ketzer</i>	155

MICHALSKI, S.: The Reformation and the Visual Arts	156
SPURR, J.: The Restoration Church of England, 1646-1689	157
SOSNA, W.: Die Selbstmitteilung Gottes in Jesus Christus	159
APPLEBY, R.: "Church and Age Unite!"	161
ROUTHIER, G.: La réception d'un concile	163
HAUGHT, J.: Mystery and Promise	165
MCDERMOTT, B.: Word Become Flesh	166
GUARINO, T.: Revelation and Truth	168
KEKES, J.: The Morality of Pluralism	169
JOHNSON, M.: Moral Imagination	171
GELPI, D.: Committed Worship	172

SHORTER NOTICES..... 175

LIMBURG, J.: Jonah	HARE, D.: Matthew	KURZ, W.: Reading Luke-
Acts	LENTZ, J., Jr.: Luke's Portrait of Paul	KOTILA, H.: Memoria Mortuo-
rum	HEIM, F.: La théologie de la victoire de Constantin à Théodose	HALL,
D.: The Trinity	MONTOYA, A.: The Spiritual Conquest Accomplished by the	Society of Jesus in the Provinces of Paraguay, Panama, Uruguay, and Tape
YARBROUGH, S., and J. ADAMS: Delightful Conviction	COCKSWORTH, C.: Evan-	geli-
cal Eucharistic Thought in the Church of England	ORMEROD, N.: Grace	and Dis-
grace	RUSSELL, L.: Church in the Round	SANTURRI, E., and W.
WERPEHOWSKI (eds.): The Love Commandments	ETZIONI, A.: The Spirit of	Community
RASMUSSEN, L.: Moral Fragments and Moral Community	NO-	VAK, D.: Jewish Social Ethics
HAUGHT, J.: The Promise of Nature	PIDERIT,	J.: The Ethical Foundations of Economics
LAURITZEN, P.: Pursuing Parenthood	DWORKIN, R.: Life's Dominion	KEANE, P.: Health Care Reform

BOOKS RECEIVED 188

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES (ISSN 0040-5639) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057. Second class postage paid at Washington, DC and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER, please send address changes to THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION 1994: U.S. individual: \$20; U.S. institutional: \$27; foreign individual: \$27 U.S. currency; foreign institutional: \$32 U.S. currency.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS and all correspondence dealing with subscriptions should be sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA; phone (800) 352-2210 or (717) 632-3535.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy or a computer printout of letter-perfect quality and a legible duplicate), TOGETHER WITH RETURN POSTAGE, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02167, USA. Author should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Inc., Georgetown University, 37 and O. Sts., N.W., Washington, DC 20057, USA.

BACK ISSUES are available from Theological Studies, Inc., Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057, USA. Single copies prepaid: \$6 in U.S.; \$8 outside U.S.

FOR REPRINTS AND EARLIER ISSUES IN MICROFORM (35mm. and fiche), contact University Microfilms, Inc., 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1356, USA.

This first issue of volume 55 features four articles, each of which challenges certain aspects of traditional thinking, and the annual review of moral theology.

Newman, God, and the Academy examines two developments in modern academic discourse: the suppression of theological inquiry and the dismantling of the liberal-arts tradition, and then analyses Newman's discussion of the marginalization of theology and its relevance to current debates about the university. DANIEL CERE, lecturer in religion and theology at Concordia University, Montreal and postdoctoral fellow of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, specializes in the modern Christian analysis of social- and political-ethical issues, as well as in Newman studies.

Demythologization in the Theology of Karl Rahner argues that demythologization, though often mentioned only in passing, is actually integral to Rahner's method, which integrates not only religious transcendental experience and traditional doctrine and its sources, but also the conclusions of science and philosophical reflection into a unified theology. MICHAEL H. BARNES, a Ph.D. from Marquette University and professor of religious studies at the University of Dayton, specializes in the areas of religion and science and of the evolution of religion and culture. Editor of *An Ecological Spirit* (1993), College Theology Society annual volume no. 36, and author of "Primitive Religious Thought and the Evolution of Religion," *Religion* 22 (1992), his long-term research focuses on major shifts in styles of thought in science and religion across cultures.

Driven by the central contention that "receptiveness" is of crucial theological import, since in it, radical fundamental-theological coincide with radical Christological intuitions, **Faith and Theology in Encounter with Non-Christians**, while making no claims about the religions, outlines a responsible Christian posture toward them. FRANS JOZEF VAN BEECK, S.J., Ph.D. from the University of Amsterdam, is John Cardinal Cody Professor of Sacred Theology at Loyola University, Chicago. Vol. 2/1, *The Revelation of the Glory* (Part I: Fundamental Theology), of his *God Encountered: a Contemporary Systematic Theology* appeared recently (Glazier/Liturgical, 1993). Vols. 2/2 (Part II: One God, Creator of All That Is) and 2/3 (Part III: Finitude and Fall) are scheduled to appear in 1994 and 1995.

On the assumption that inculturation represents the theology of Incarnation in the historical role of Christianity, **Inculturation and Cultural Systems (Part 1)** rehearses the meaning of inculturation and follows this with a description and clarifying analysis of the four cultural systems that Clifford Geertz has chosen out of a number of possible systems: ideology, religion, common sense, and art. CARL F.

STARKLOFF, S.J., with doctorates from the University of Ottawa and St. Paul University, is professor of pastoral and systematic theology at Regis College of the Toronto School of Theology and author of "Aboriginal Cultures and the Christ," *TS* 53 (1992). Further work of his which is about to appear includes "Dialogue, Evangelization, and Church Growth among Aboriginal North Americans" (*Studia Missionalia*), and "The Problem of Syncretism in the Search of Inculturation" (*Kerygma*).

In the *Notes on Moral Theology 1993*, there are three contributions:

1. **The Morality of Humanitarian Intervention** analyzes under three headings the question, now poignantly raised by the situations in Bosnia and Somalia, of military intervention for the purpose of protecting human rights: (1) legal arguments for humanitarian intervention, (2) political theory on its legitimacy, and (3) policy guidelines. KENNETH R. HIMES, O.F.M., a Ph.D. in religion with a specialization in public policy from Duke University, is associate professor of moral theology at the Washington Theological Union. Coauthor with M. J. Himes of *Fullness of Faith* (Paulist, 1993), he is currently working on Robert Coles's theory of moral development, and also researching the history of interaction between American Catholic social movements and other cultural forces.

2. **Ethics, Business, and the Economy** argues that the recent neo-conservative interpretation of *Centesimus annus* and polemical defenses of American capitalism by M. Novak and R. J. Neuhaus fail to incorporate internal ethical criticisms arising from things like self-interest, the need for a more participatory form of management, and the moral dilemmas that arise in business negotiations. JOHN LANGAN, S.J., Ph.D. from the University of Michigan, visiting scholar at the Jesuit Institute of Boston College, Rose Kennedy Professor of Christian Ethics at Georgetown University, and senior fellow at the Woodstock Theological Center, is a regular contributor to these *Notes*. He has published numerous studies on Catholic social teaching and on international politics and is currently preparing a book on capitalism and the moral life.

3. **Church Responses to Pedophilia** reviews major responses of the Church in Canada and the United States to the recently uncovered instances of sexual abuse of minors by priests and brothers. NORBERT J. RIGALI, S.J. has his doctorate from the University of Munich and is professor of theological and religious studies at the University of San Diego. Recent writings include "Reimaging Morality: A Matter of Metaphors," *Heythrop Journal* (1994), and "Christian Morality and Universal Morality: The One and the Many," *Lowain Studies* (1994). His current research focuses on the question of certainty in morality.

Robert J. Daly, S.J.
Editor

BOOKS RECEIVED

SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

- Bauckham, R. *The Theology of the Book of Revelation*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1993. Pp. 169.
- The Bible and Liberation*. Rev. ed. Ed. N. Gottwa and R. Horsley. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. 558. \$21.95.
- Boone, K. *The Bible Tells Them So*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1988. Pp. 139. \$19.95.
- Brodie, T. *The Gospel according to John*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993. Pp. 625. \$55.
- Brown, S. *The Origins of Christianity*. Rev. ed. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993, Pp. 179. \$39.95 ; \$14.95.
- Bryan, C. *A Preface to Mark*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993. Pp. 220. \$32.
- Collins, R. *The Birth of the New Testament*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 324. \$29.95.
- Comay, J. *Who's Who in the Old Testament*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993 [1971]. Pp. 398. \$15.95.
- Cook, M. *Responses to 101 Questions about Jesus*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 124. \$8.95.
- Doukhan, J. *Hebrew for Theologians*. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1993. Pp. 245.
- Donfried, K., and I. Marshall. *The Theology of the Shorter Pauline Letters*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1993. Pp. 208.
- Dunn, J. *The Theology of Paul's Letter to the Galatians*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1993. Pp. 161.
- Epp, E., and G. Fee. *Studies in the Theory and Method of New Testament Textual Criticism*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1993. Pp. 414. \$39.99.
- The Five Gospels*. Tr. R. Funk et al. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1993. Pp. 552. \$30.
- Hall, S. *Christian Anti-Semitism and Paul's Theology*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 192.
- Harrington, D. *Revelation*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 271. \$29.95.
- Hooker, M. *The Gospel according to Saint Mark*. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 424. \$24.95.
- In Search of Wisdom: Essays in Memory of John G. Gammie*. Ed. L. Perdue et al. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 352. \$24.99.
- Jacobs-Malina, D. *Beyond Patriarchy*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 211. \$13.95.
- Kingsbury, J. *Conflict in Luke*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Pp. 180.
- Korsak, M. *At the Start: Genesis Made New*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1993. Pp. 239. \$22.
- Kysar, R. *John: The Maverick Gospel*. Rev. ed. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 157. \$12.99.
- Ladd, G. *A Theology of the New Testament*. Rev. ed. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1993. Pp. 764. \$34.99.
- Léon-Dufour, X. *Lecture de l'Évangile selon Jean 3*. Paris: Seuil, 1993. Pp. 336. Fr. 180.
- Levenson, J. D. *The Hebrew Bible, the Old Testament, and Historical Criticism*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 192. \$15.
- Malina, B. *The New Testament World*. Rev. ed. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 224. \$14.99.
- Malina, B. *Windows on the World of Jesus*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 208. \$12.99.
- Marshall, H. *The Church or the Bible?* Boothwyn, Penn.: Marshall, 1993. Pp. 180. \$9.95.
- McCracken, D. *The Scandal of the Gospels*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1994. Pp. 204. \$29.95.
- Nelson, R. *Raising Up a Faithful Priest*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 208. \$19.99.
- Perry, J. *Exploring the Resurrection*

- of Jesus*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 145. \$9.95.
- Peterson, E. *The Message: The New Testament in Contemporary English*. Colorado Springs: Navpress, 1993. Pp. 544. \$20.
- Pleins, J. *The Psalms*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. 229. \$12.95.
- The Return to Scripture in Judaism and Christianity*. Ed. P. Ochs. N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 380. \$18.95.
- Searching the Scriptures* 1. Ed. E. Schüssler Fiorenza. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 397. \$24.95.
- Wainwright, A. *Mysterious Apocalypse*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1993. Pp. 293. \$19.95.
- Weren, W. *Intertextualiteit en Bijbel*. Kampen: Kok, 1993. Pp. 262.
- SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY**
- Altizer, T. *The Genesis of God*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 208. \$22.
- Augustine. *On Free Choice of the Will*. Tr. T. Williams. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1993. Pp. 160. \$27.95; \$5.95.
- Balthasar, H. v. *Mysterium Paschale*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1993 [1970]. Pp. 297.
- Bonaventure. *The Journey of the Mind to God*. Tr. P. Boehner. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1993 [1956]. Pp. 104. \$22.50; \$5.95.
- Christianity for Modern Pagans: Pascal's Pensées*. Ed. P. Kreeft. S.F.: Ignatius, 1993. Pp. 341. \$14.95.
- Faith in Theory and Practice*. Ed. E. Radcliffe and C. White. Chicago: Open Court, 1993. Pp. 254. \$34.95; \$16.95.
- Fides quaerens intellectum: Beiträge zur Fundamentalthologie*. Ed. M. Kessler et al. Tübingen: Francke, 1992. Pp. 639. DM 78.
- Hans Küng: New Horizons for Faith and Thought*. Ed. K.-J. Kuschel and H. Häring. N.Y.: Continuum, 1993. Pp. 402. \$27.50.
- Isasi-Díaz, A. *En la Lucha / In the Struggle*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 226.
- Kennedy, P. *Schillebeeckx*. Collegeville; Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 144. \$12.95.
- Kort, W. *Bound to Differ*. University Park, Pa.: Penn State, 1992. Pp. 150. \$25.
- Küng, H. *Credo*. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1993. Pp. 194. \$20.
- Lafont, G. *God, Time and Being*. Petersham, Mass.: St. Bede's, 1992. Pp. 348. \$34.95.
- Lawler, M. *Marriage and Sacrament*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 122. \$9.95.
- Liderbach, D. *Why Do We Suffer?* N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 146. \$11.95.
- Mahan, W. *Is It Possible to Be Christian and Modern?* Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1993. Pp. 79. \$27.50; \$17.50.
- The Making and Remaking of Christian Doctrine: Essays in Honour of Maurice Wiles*. Ed. S. Coakley and D. Pailin. Oxford: Clarendon, 1993. Pp. 294. \$45.
- Panikkar, R. *A Dwelling Place for Wisdom*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 176. \$12.99.
- Reasoned Faith*. Ed. F. Birtel. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 231. \$19.95.
- Reiser, W. *Forever Faithful*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 98. \$7.95.
- Richard, L. *What Are They Saying about the Theology of Suffering?* N.Y.: Paulist, 1992. Pp. 165. \$7.95.
- Schillebeeckx, E., and C. Halkes. *Mary*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 88. \$9.95.
- Sheed, F. *Theology and Sanity*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1993 [1946]. Pp. 461. \$17.95.
- Stewart, M. *The Greater-Good Defence*. N.Y.: St. Martin's, 1993. Pp. 202. \$55.
- Tamez, E. *The Amnesty of Grace*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1993. Pp. 208. \$14.95.
- A Troubling in My Soul*. Ed. E.

- Townes. *Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. 257.*
- Vahanian, G. *L'utopie chrétienne.* Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1992. Pp. 332. Fr. 128.
- Young, F. *Can These Dry Bones Live?* Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1993 [1982]. Pp. 119. \$10.95.

HISTORICAL

- All Together in One Place.* Ed. H. Hunter and P. Hocken. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1993. Pp. 281. \$19.95.
- Alt, K. *Weltflucht und Weltbejahung.* Stuttgart: Steiner, 1993. Pp. 277. DM 98.
- Augustine. *Confessions.* Tr. F. Sheed. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1993 [1970]. Pp. 295. \$29.95; \$5.95.
- Borresen, K., and K. Vogt. *Women's Studies of the Christian and Islamic Traditions.* Boston: Kluwer, 1993. Pp. 365. \$109.
- Carmody, D., and J. Carmody. *Native American Religions.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 270. \$14.95.
- Chávez, A. *My Penitent Land.* Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico, 1993 [1974]. Pp. 274. \$14.95.
- Ching, J. *Chinese Religions.* Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. 275. \$18.95.
- Cole, W., and P. Sambhi. *Sikhism and Christianity.* N.Y.: St. Martin's, 1993. Pp. 221. \$39.95.
- Crowe, T. *Pentecostal Unity.* Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1993. Pp. 282. \$13.95.
- Daniel, N. *Islam and the West.* Chatham, N.Y.: Oneworld, 1993 [1960]. Pp. 467. \$33.95.
- A Democratic Catholic Church.* Ed. E. Bianchi and R. Ruether. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 262. \$14.95.
- Domański, J. *For the Life of the World.* Libertyville, Ill.: Academy of the Immaculate, 1993. Pp. 159.
- Earl, R. *Dark Symbols, Obscure Signs.* Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. 226. \$19.95.
- The Ecumenical Movement Tomorrow.* Ed. M. Reuver et al. Kampen/Geneva: Kok/WCC, 1993. Pp. 410. \$27.50.
- Edwards, J. *Sermons and Discourses 1720-1723.* Ed. W. Kimmach. New Haven: Yale University, 1993. Pp. 670. \$70.
- Fundamentalism and Gender.* Ed. J. Hawley. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1994. Pp. 220. \$38; \$14.95.
- Gandlau, T. *Trinität und Kreuz bei Johannes Tauler.* Freiburg: Herder, 1993. Pp. 400. DM 68.
- God Struck Me Dead.* Ed. C. Johnson. Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1993 [1969]. Pp. 208. \$13.95.
- Goodman, M. *The Ruling Class of Judaea.* N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1993 [1987]. Pp. 263. \$19.95.
- History of the Church 1: The Early Church.* Abridged ed. Ed. H. Jedin. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 765. \$50.
- History of the Church 2: The Medieval and Reformation Church.* Abridged ed. Ed. H. Jedin. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 1054. \$50.
- History of the Church 3: The Church in the Modern World.* Abridged ed. Ed. H. Jedin. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 1067. \$50.
- Kamen, H. *Catalonia and the Counter Reformation.* New Haven: Yale University, 1993. Pp. 527. \$45.
- Kenny, A. *Catholics, Jews and the State of Israel.* N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 159. \$9.95.
- The Letters of Teilhard de Chardin and Lucile Swan.* Ed. T. King and M. Gilbert. Washington: Georgetown Univ., 1993. Pp. 316. \$24.95.
- McNamee, J. *Diary of a City Priest.* Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 258. \$14.95.
- A Museum of Faiths.* Ed. E. Ziolkowski. Atlanta: Scholars, 1993. Pp. 366. \$44.95; \$29.95.
- The Radical Tradition.* Ed. G. Márkus. N.Y.: Doubleday, 1993. Pp. 160. \$22.

- Raitt, J. *The Colloquy of Montbéliard*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993. Pp. 226. \$45.
- Religion in Postwar China: Critical Analysis and Annotated Bibliography*. Ed. D. Yu. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood, 1994. Pp. 367. \$79.95.
- Roussos-Melidones, M. *Ellenes Iesouites (1560-1773)*. Athens: K.E.O., 1993. Pp. 366.
- Sagesses de l'Orient Ancien et Chrétien*. Ed. R. Lebrun. Paris: Beauchesne, 1993. Pp. 250. Fr. 150.
- Saints for Now*. Ed. C. Luce. S.F.: Ignatius, 1993 [1952]. Pp. 331. \$12.95.
- Schowalter, D. *The Emperor and the Gods*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 164.
- Scotland in the Age of the Disruption*. Ed. S. Brown and M. Fry. Edinburgh: Edinburgh Univ., 1993. Pp. 183. \$35.
- Skerrett, E., et al. *Catholicism, Chicago Style*. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1993. Pp. 194. \$35; \$21.95.
- Soelle, D. *Stations of the Cross*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 146.
- Stein, E. *Self-Portrait in Letters 1916-1942*. Ed. L. Gelber and R. Leuven. Washington: ICS, 1993. Pp. 358. \$12.95.
- Stone, R. *Professor Reinhold Niebuhr*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1992. Pp. 284. \$21.99.
- Valdés' Two Catechisms*. 2nd ed. Ed. J. Nieto. Lawrence, Ks.: Coronado, 1993. Pp. 276. \$25.
- Women's Leadership in Marginal Religions*. Ed. C. Wessinger. Urbana, Ill.: Univ. of Illinois, 1993. Pp. 246. \$32.50; \$14.95.
- MORALITY AND LAW**
- Bioethics*. 4th ed. Ed. T. Shannon. N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 542. \$24.95.
- Bullis, R., and C. Mazur. *Legal Issues and Religious Counseling*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 127. \$11.99.
- Buse, G. *Macht, Moral, Weiblichkeit*. Mainz: Grünewald, 1993. Pp. 126. \$28.80.
- Dialogue about Catholic Sexual Teaching*. Ed. C. Curran and R. McCormick. N.Y.: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 602. \$22.95.
- Foster, M. *Gadamer and Practical Philosophy*. Atlanta: Scholars, 1991. Pp. 295. \$54.95; \$34.95.
- La Justicia Social*. Ed. L. Verdes and M. Vidal. Madrid: Perpetuo Socorro, 1993. Pp. 528.
- L'Éthique*. Ed. J.-L. Leuba. Paris: Beauchesne, 1993. Pp. 303. Fr. 200.
- Long, G. *Passion and Reason*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 176. \$14.99.
- Oppenheim, F. *Royce's Mature Ethics*. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1993. Pp. 294. \$36.95.
- Pilarczyk, D. "What Must I Do?" Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger, 1993. Pp. 83. \$4.95.
- Rauschenbusch, W. *Dare We Be Christians?* Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1993. Pp. 68. \$7.95.
- Rice, C. *50 Questions on the Natural Law*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1993. Pp. 332. \$14.95.
- Riding Time Like a River*. Ed. J. O'Brien. Washington: Georgetown Univ., 1993. Pp. 112. \$36.
- To Do Justice and Right Upon the Earth*. Ed. M. Stamps. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 119. \$9.95.
- Zaner, R. *Troubled Voices*. Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1993. Pp. 196. \$19.95.
- PASTORAL, SPIRITUAL,
AND LITURGICAL**
- Anderson, R. *Ministry on the Fireline*. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 1993. Pp. 235.
- Boys, M. *Educating in Faith*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 230. \$14.95.
- Capps, D. *The Poet's Gift*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 176. \$15.99.

- Cowan, M., and J. Futrell. *Companions in Grace*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 246. \$14.95.
- An Ecology of the Spirit*. Ed. M. Barnes. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1993. Pp. 248. \$52; \$21.50.
- Eulogēma: Studies in Honor of Robert Taft, S.J.* Ed. E. Carr et al. Rome: Studia Anselmiana, 1993. Pp. xxvii + 614. L. 100.000.
- Fiand, B. *Embraced by Compassion*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 144. \$10.95.
- Haase, A. *Swimming in the Sun*. Cincinnati: St. Anthony, 1993. Pp. 216. \$9.95.
- Habito, R. *Healing Breath*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. 166. \$14.95.
- Hebblethwaite, M. *Base Communities*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 198. \$10.95.
- John Paul II. *The Splendor of Truth*. Boston, Mass.: St. Paul Books, 1993. Pp. 154. \$2.25.
- La théologie pratique*. Ed. B. Raymond and J.-M. Sordet. Paris: Beauchesne, 1993. Pp. 396. Fr. 186.
- A Lectionary Commentary Based on the NRSV—Year B*. Ed. W. Brueggemann et al. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 704. \$32.
- Monick, E. *Evil, Sexuality, and Disease in Grünewald's Body of Christ*. Dallas: Spring, 1993. Pp. 191. \$17.50.
- O'Malley, W. *Why Be Catholic?* N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 169. \$11.95.
- Soelle, D. *On Earth as in Heaven*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. 96. \$9.99.
- South and Meso-American Native Spirituality*. Ed. G. Gossen. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 563. \$49.50.
- Templeton, J. *Discovering the Laws of Life*. N.Y.: Continuum, 1994. Pp. 300.
- Webb-Mitchell, B. *God Plays Piano, Too*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. 200. \$18.95.
- Williams, C. *Essential Writings in Spirituality and Theology*. Cambridge, Mass.: Cowley, 1993. Pp. 231. \$12.95.
- Women and Religious Ritual*. Ed. L. Northrup. Washington: Pastoral, 1993. Pp. 205. \$13.95.

PHILOSOPHY, OTHER DISCIPLINES

- Brown, M. *The Romance of Reason*. Petersham, Mass.: St. Bede's, 1993. Pp. 177. \$12.95.
- Communication and Lonergan*. Ed. T. Farrell and P. Soukup. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1993. Pp. 377. \$22.95.
- Europa: Gegenwart und Zukunft*. Ed. B. Mensen. Nettetal: Steyler, 1993. Pp. 110. DM 24.50.
- Ferguson, H. *Religious Transformation in Western Society*. N.Y.: Routledge, 1992. Pp. 269. \$55.
- Greisch, J., et al. *Comprendre et interpréter*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1993. Pp. 440. Fr. 190.
- Lonergan, B.: *Collected Works of Lonergan 10: Topics in Education*. Ed. R. Doran. Toronto: Univ. of Toronto, 1993. Pp. 308. \$Can 60; \$Can 24.95.
- Miller, B. *From Existence to God*. N.Y.: Routledge, 1992. Pp. 206.
- Nygren, D., and M. Ukeritis. *The Future of Religious Orders in the United States*. Westport, Conn.: Praeger, 1993. Pp. 344. \$59.95.
- Quantum Cosmology and the Laws of Nature*. Ed. R. Russell et al. Berkeley/Vatican: Center for Theology and the Natural Sciences/Vatican Observatory, 1993. Pp. 468. \$19.95.

SPECIAL QUESTIONS

- Catholicisme hier, aujourd'hui, demain 62: Salut—Sécularisation*. Ed. G. Mathon and G.-H. Baudry. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1993. Col. 769-1024. Fr. 164.