

BOOK REVIEWS

THE DEATH OF THE MESSIAH: FROM GETHSEMANE TO THE GRAVE. 2 volumes. By Raymond E. Brown, S.S. Anchor Bible Reference Library. New York: Doubleday, 1994. Pp. xii + 1608. \$75 the set.

During the past forty years, New Testament scholars have produced a vast body of literature which deals with nearly every aspect of the Passion Narratives. Given the importance of Jesus' suffering and death for Christology and soteriology, interest in these gospel accounts is not surprising. Brown's long-awaited, two-volume work on the Passion and death of Jesus summarizes and critically evaluates this research, defining and redefining what the discussion will be for the next generation and beyond.

Although this is an intricate and detailed study, its basic structure is simple and straightforward. After a 90-page introduction in which he lays out the perspectives of his work and the general issues pertinent to the Passion Narratives, B. divides his commentary into four acts, three of which have two scenes: Jesus' prayer in Gethsemane and his arrest, the Jewish trial and the mockery of Jesus, the Roman trial, and Jesus' crucifixion and burial. (As this division shows, B. does not comment on the Last Supper.) Dividing each scene into smaller units, B. provides a literal translation of the text, followed by comment and analysis. The "comment," in which he seeks to discover and explain what the evangelists wanted to convey, is the heart of his study. The section entitled "analysis" is shorter and secondary, focusing upon the literary relationships of the Gospels, pre-Gospel traditions, and questions of historicity. The precise borders of these two sections are not always clear and there are occasional border crossings. The work concludes with nine helpful appendixes, over 200 pages in length. One of them, "The Gospel of Peter—a Noncanonical Passion Narrative," deals a mortal blow to recent theories which view that Gospel as a source for the canonical Passion Narratives. Finally, there are a general bibliography on the Passion and seven sectional bibliographies totaling 70 pages. All voices are heard, and all theories tested.

While many will read only selected portions of the commentary, none should bypass the introduction in which B. clearly states his goals and presuppositions. Although I have espoused different views on some issues, a complete reading of the commentary convinces me that B.'s presuppositions are essentially sound. First, his primary goal is to help readers understand "the meaning intended and conveyed by the evangelists themselves" (7); he seeks the meaning of the text that

would have made sense to a first-century audience. Thus B. provides a healthy antidote to literary approaches that would entirely divorce the text from its historical setting. Second, B. accepts the likely existence of history and tradition within the Passion Narratives, but he is also aware that these narratives are "heavily scripturally reflective, kerygmatically orientated, and theologically organized" (22). Alert to the difficulties of reconstructing the historical events of the Passion but avoiding skepticism, B.'s primary concern is to make sense of what the biblical texts say rather than to reconstruct pre-Gospel traditions or to detect history. Historical reconstruction, therefore, is not the focus of this book. Nevertheless, B.'s proposals about the historical circumstances of the Jewish trial and Jesus' burial are among the most interesting aspects of this work. Third, B. makes the following decisions about the literary relationships of the Passion Narratives: there may have been pre-Gospel narratives of the passion, but whether or not there was a shaped pre-Markan narrative is not certain, and it is futile to try to reconstruct one; Mark's narrative was the earliest of the canonical gospel narratives; Matthew and Luke were dependent upon Mark, but both had access to popular oral traditions, though not to other Passion Narratives; the Johannine Passion is not dependent upon the Synoptic Passion accounts.

B.'s presentation of "Jesus before the Jewish Authorities" provides a fair example of how his method and presuppositions work. He acknowledges that the present forms of the trial narratives in the Gospels are heavily overlaid with the theologies of their respective evangelists. Therefore, one cannot simply accept them on face value when trying to determine why Jesus was condemned to death or the extent of Jewish responsibility. Accordingly, he seeks to understand the different versions of the proceedings in light of each evangelist's theological purpose. The theological dimension of these accounts, however, does not lead him to neglect their historical setting. Therefore, before commenting on the trial scene, B. provides a 69-page introduction to the Jewish trial and interrogation of Jesus in which he discusses Roman governance, the Sanhedrin, how it functioned, its competence to exercise capital punishment, the responsibility for Jesus' death, etc. This background and B.'s proposals for the literary relationships between the Gospels provide a reliable context within which he and his readers can assess the historical dimensions of the Passion Narratives.

Among B.'s more interesting and compelling conclusions are the following: Jesus was a troublesome religious figure rather than a political revolutionary; the Jewish authorities were involved in the process that led to his death, but it is better to speak of their responsibility than of their guilt; the Gospel of John may preserve a more accurate

account of the Jewish proceedings than do the Synoptics. Thus B. proposes that in the last period that Jesus was active in Jerusalem, a Sanhedrin was assembled to deal with him. Witnesses testified and there was a decision to put him to death, although Jesus was not present. Some weeks later Jesus was arrested, interrogated by the high priest, and brought to Pilate.

B.'s presentation of the Jewish trial is compelling and ecumenically sensitive without ignoring the data; e.g., he argues for the authenticity of Paul's harsh saying in 1 Thess 2:14–16. Moreover, as one moves through the trial unit by unit, one gains a deep appreciation of how differently each evangelist worked, discovering the distinctive Christology and soteriology of each Gospel. What I miss in B.'s presentation of the trial, and of the Passion Narratives in general, however, is the full sweep of each narrative. As he himself notes, he made "the controversial decision to work through the passion 'horizontally,' studying each episode in all four Gospels simultaneously" (viii). This approach allows him to compare and contrast the narratives and eventually make judgments about historical matters. But given the length and detail of this work, it is often difficult for the reader to grasp the narrative line and theological development of each Passion story. One wonders then if the method B. has chosen corresponds to his stated aims, or if it is better suited for historical reconstruction. However, I suspect that what is gained by his "controversial choice" outweighs what has been lost.

On balance this is, and will remain, the most authoritative and reliable guide to the Passion. It will be of immense service to those interested in Christology, soteriology, and Jewish-Christian relations, as well as exegesis. A work that consumed more than ten years in the life of a great scholar deserves a careful and respectful reading.

Catholic University of America

FRANK J. MATERA

ROMANS: A NEW TRANSLATION WITH INTRODUCTION AND COMMENTARY. By Joseph A. Fitzmyer, S.J. Anchor Bible. New York: Doubleday, 1993. Pp. xxxiv + 793. \$40.

The first part of this volume is devoted to translation, introductory questions, and a summary of Pauline teaching in Romans. Each area discussed includes a complete bibliography, and the entire section is followed by a thorough and competent general bibliography that includes a listing of patristic, medieval and subsequent commentaries. The major remaining portion of this work is devoted to commentary and notes.

Fitzmyer has adopted what is increasingly the consensus position,

viz., that Romans, including chapter 16, is addressed to Christians in Rome and addresses a concrete set of circumstances. In origin the Roman Christian community is Jewish; at the time of Paul's writing it is a mixed congregation, now predominantly Gentile Christian. Tensions between these two groups of Christians provide one of the multiple factors in the writing of this letter. Marxsen's emphasis on the importance of the effects of the Claudian edict on Roman Christianity and the influence of Stirewalt's description of Romans as a "letter-essay" (although F. prefers "essay-letter" or "Lehrbrief") are evident. In this "essay-letter" Paul introduces himself to the Roman Christians, seeks their support for his anticipated journey to Spain, requests prayer and intercessions concerning Jerusalem, and addresses concrete issues in the Roman community itself.

Given the lively contemporary discussions about Pauline theology and whether there is such a thing as a "center" or "key concept" that guides the whole of the Apostle's thought, one turns to the section on "Pauline Teaching" with anticipation. While not wishing to join fully Käsemann's assertion that justification is "the heart of the Christian message," F. is willing to assert that "to anyone who reads Romans justification [*dikaiōsis*, *dikaioun*] is clearly the effect that claims pride of place, the chief way that Paul expresses the effects of the Christ-event" (116). The related term *dikaiosynē theou* ("the uprightness of God") is interpreted, with Käsemann, as a subjective or possessive genitive throughout Romans; it is a manifestation of divine power and of a divine attribute, presumably one reason why *dikaiosynē theou* is translated as "the uprightness of God" throughout. In addition, a review of *sedeq/sedāqāh* in Qumran simply does not confirm the apocalyptic origin suggested by Käsemann; the divine quality of *dikaiosynē theou* is not characteristic of apocalyptic thought.

F. emphasizes, against Bultmann, the power character of God's gift with regard to *dikaiosynē theou* and maintains that the burden of proof is upon those who wish to import the objective sense of the phrase from 2 Cor 5:21 or Phil 3:9. Consistent with this interpretation is the recognition that the imperative coinheres with the indicative. So the *typos didachēs* of 6:17 can be described as either the gospel or a baptismal instruction based on the gospel "to which the baptized readily entrusted themselves as a form of uprightness. Thus Christian 'teaching' would include not only the proclamation about God's work in Christ Jesus, but also the 'pattern' according to which Christians are to live" (449).

Paul's understanding of the law is another neuralgic issue in contemporary interpretation. Basing his argument on the meaning of *ma'āšē hattōrah*, "the deeds of the law," in the Qumran texts, F. rejects

the interpretations of Dunn and Gaston. "To the extent that a 'works righteousness' would be indicated by the phrase in question [i.e. *erga nomou*, 'deeds of the law'], this reading reveals that Paul knew whereof he was speaking when he took issue with contemporary Judaism and its attitude to legal regulations" (338–39; 134). The fundamental problem with the law is that humanity is unable to observe it. Concerning the controversial phrase *telos nomou* ("the end of the law") applied to Christ in 10:4, F. opts for the interpretation "goal" as opposed to "termination" or "cessation." It is maintained that such an interpretation is consistent with both 3:31 and 8:1–4.

Some of the great contributions and strengths of this commentary include: its strong mastery of Judaism, especially the Qumran texts, its extensive knowledge and use of the secondary literature, and, in particular, its fluent dialogue with the great masters of the Christian exegetical tradition: Origen, Chyrosostom, Augustine, Aquinas, Erasmus, Luther, Calvin, Melanchthon, to just cite a few. How extraordinarily helpful it is to have the current discussion of *dikaiosynē theou* in 1:17 viewed by specific reference to the actual texts of Augustine, Ambrosiaster, medieval scholasticism, and Luther. Students will readily observe that the discussion between Bultmann and Käsemann, to cite merely one example, is not simply a 20th-century development but one that has precise historical precedents shaped by specific theological discussions at particular moments in history. To recognize this is both unusually informative and also liberating for the modern exegete.

Finally, it is important to note that F.'s summary of the exegetical issues, not only of the matters just discussed but also with regard to virtually every other critical issue, is concise, comprehensive, and insightful. A few further illustrations must suffice:

How should one translate the notoriously difficult *eph' hō* (5:12)? After reviewing the ten main options, a careful study by F. of the classical applications of this phrase reveal a consecutive usage, "with the result that, so that," which leads to the translation "so death spread to all human beings, with the result that all have sinned."

With regard to 7:7–13, one finds again, typically, a full array of ancient and modern scholarly opinions outlined precisely and concisely. F. then concludes that the *egō* of this passage refers to unregenerate humanity confronted with the Mosaic law as seen from the perspective of the Christ-event.

In discussing 11:26, F. rejects Stendahl's argument that "the Jesus movement is to be a Gentile movement", i.e. that the salvation of Israel would take place apart from Christ. A position that urges two different kinds of salvation, one for unbelieving Jews and one for Gentiles and

believing Jews, would contradict the Apostle's "whole thesis of justification and salvation by grace for *all* who believe in the gospel of Christ Jesus (1:16)" (620).

With regard to whether *Iounian* (16:7) is male or female, F. sides with the majority of ancient commentators who read it as a feminine noun. Here again F. provides a magnificent collection of ancient exegetical testimony.

F.'s achievement in this commentary can be summarized in one word: magisterial! Surely it will find its place as one of the celebrated commentaries in the exegetical history of Romans. Anyone wishing to know what the ingredients of a distinguished commentary are need look no further than this newest volume in the Anchor Bible series.

Smith College, Mass.

KARL P. DONFRIED

WHAT IS SCRIPTURE? A COMPARATIVE APPROACH. By Wilfred Cantwell Smith. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. x + 391.

What is scripture? Smith gives the short version of his answer at the start: " 'scripture' is a bilateral term. By that we mean that it inherently implies, in fact names, a relationship . . . no text is a scripture in itself and as such. People—a given community—make a text into scripture, or keep it scripture: by treating it in a certain way. I suggest: *scripture is a human activity*" (17–18). After illustrating his thesis by a vivid review of the reception of the *Song of Songs* in medieval and modern Jewish and Christian communities, Smith devotes the major part of the book to the longer version of his answer, describing how texts have become, and function as, scriptures in the Muslim, Jewish, Hindu, and Buddhist communities. He then delves into the notion of the "classic" in Chinese and Western contexts and addresses lingering questions (e.g. Do Shintos have scripture? How can we distinguish the Indo-European, Semitic, and Chinese ideas of scripture while recognizing how deeply intertwined they have become? Is it erroneous to say that oral traditions have "scriptures"?) Finally, he reaffirms his initial point: "*There is no ontology of scripture. The concept has no metaphysical, nor logical, reference; there is nothing that scripture finally 'is' . . . at issue is not the texts of scripture that are to be understood and about which a theory is to be sought, but the dynamic human involvement with them*" (237).

The subject matter and range of the book are formidable, and few scholars other than S. could have undertaken this venture credibly. His vast erudition, matured and refined over many decades, is put to excellent use here; each chapter is insightful and provocative, as he shows how both texts and the human ways of using them and talking

about them are always in transition as long as traditions are alive. Though of necessity he often relies on other scholars' work, his choices are apt and put to good use. Even when generalizing, S. avoids the easy path of merely assembling names, texts, and places encyclopedically, instead probing the gathered materials and also scrutinizing the questions scholars ask. Though informed by the concerns of critical scholarship, his work does not so favor historical criticism as to exclude attention to other ways in which texts are used; indeed, one of his major points is that we need to pay more attention to the *whole* range of possibilities.

Though erudite, the book is intended for a wide audience of scholars of religion; it also has a pastoral concern of very broad interest. S. is very aware of the new global situation, in which every tradition jostles against others: however committed we are to our own scriptures, the fact of other communities' parallel commitments impinges on our consciousness; however much we derive our faith story from our own sources, we nevertheless retell our stories in light of, even if over against, other peoples' stories about themselves and about us. Likewise, S. reminds us, large numbers of people, most often the young, are drawing on the texts of many traditions in fashioning what becomes, in fact, a personally designed scripture.

S.'s book, therefore, exemplifies the "history of religions" at its best, and must be appreciated in terms of the acknowledged limits of that discipline. Thus, S. does not venture to discern a direction in history, for this is not a historical study in that sense; rather, he is content to note the various twists and turns humans have taken, and to delight in anticipation of changes yet to come. The book is also (deliberately, I think) nontheological, deferring systematic questions in particular. This is broadly true (e.g., the chapter on Hinduism is silent on the theories of scripture developed in the great Hindu schools of exegesis, *Mīmāṃsā* and *Vedānta*), but the omission is particularly notable regarding the Christian traditions. Though the book has clearly been written with a consciousness of Christian theology, this stands as background to the things actually talked about; there is no chapter, parallel to the others, on the Christian understanding(s) of scripture; terms such as "faith," "inspiration," "revelation," and "tradition" do not appear in the index; issues of theological substance are touched on only in relation to how texts have been used.

S. does not do our theology for us; we must still ask the question regarding scripture on our own terms. But even so, the book argues persuasively that theologians must inform their writing with an awareness of the changing uses of words that are deemed holy, and that we must imbue our interpretations and doctrinal formulations

with an acute sense of the activity of the people, then and now, there and here, who call human words "scripture."

Boston College

FRANCIS X. CLOONEY, S.J.

BIBLICAL INTERPRETATION AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS. By J. I. H. McDonald. New York: Cambridge University, 1993. Pp. xiv + 305. \$54.95.

McDonald presents a constructive "sociohermeneutics" after chronicling the development of biblical interpretation and Christian ethics over the last century. The history falls into three phases: the liberal approach which emphasized the "eternal values" contained in the message and personality of Jesus, the eschatological turn which rejected 19th-century idealism, and finally postmodern hermeneutics which moves beyond historical-critical neutrality to appreciate meaning as participatory and contextual. M. clearly makes the case that hermeneutics is an ethical enterprise: "texts raise moral issues; ethics considers the treatment of such issues, in ancient and modern settings; interpreters consider the moral consequences of their interpretations" (244). He recognizes the distinctive dimensions of biblical interpretation by taking into account the theological commitments of the authors he reviews and acknowledging that the primary agent of moral transformation is not the text, but the Other encountered through the text.

M. mercifully avoids the arcane terminology and minute distinctions which can render discussions of hermeneutics unreadable. There are four historical elements in the process: the community which produced the biblical text in relation to its context interacting with present readers in relation to their context. This reflection requires a *distancing* of the present readers from the text and its world so they can appreciate its particular dynamics, as well as an *identification* with the text by today's readers as they bring it to bear on their distinctive context. The 19th-century liberals and Social Gospellers too easily reconciled their horizons with those of the New Testament. Schweitzer declared that the eschatological horizon of Jesus was completely disconnected to those of subsequent Christians. Bultmann held that the existential demand of God was perennial even though the specific New Testament mandates were not. M. points out that Bultmann produced "a fusion of horizons on the interpreter's terms" (159). Although M. judiciously considers the work of E. P. Sanders, T. W. Manson, C. H. Dodd, and W. D. Davies, it is not clear why he includes their covenantal nomism and kerygmatic theology under the broader rubric of eschatological existentialism.

In the third portion of the work M. emphasizes how the ethical di-

mention has come to the fore in hermeneutics, particularly through a sociopolitical reading of the biblical contexts. His discussion follows E. Schussler Fiorenza's distinction between an ethics of historical reading and an ethics of accountability. First, he offers a "contextual reading—that is reading primarily in ethical-political terms" (169) to appreciate the dynamics of power in biblical settings. The final chapter addresses the ethics of accountability, drawing on P. Ricouer, W. Wink, and T. H. Groome, as well as feminist and liberationist hermeneutics. Six cameos are presented which aptly portray M.'s sociohermeneutical reading of biblical texts on responsibility to the state, family, homosexuality, economic ethics, ecological ethics, and anti-semitism. The process begins by acknowledging our presuppositions and seeing their problematic character in our world, proceeds by engaging the text in relation to its context, correlating ancient and contemporary horizons, and concludes with a renewal of our vision and our story, which leads to moral action.

M. handles this complex interdisciplinary argument with insight and balance. An American reader may find the selection of authors somewhat restricted to European exegetes. Narrative theology receives only a paragraph of discussion (219), even though the renewal of vision and story is proposed to bridge interpretation and moral praxis. More attention is given to the moral challenges of hermeneutical reflection than to how that process leads individuals and communities to action. On the whole, this is an important work which should be accessible to the educated reader and informative to a scholarly audience. One is left, however, with a troubling question: Do late-20th-century sociopolitical readings fall into a "fusion of horizons" similar to that which constricted liberal and existentialist interpretations? In neither the biblical contexts nor our own is power the only motivating force in political relations or oppression the sole manifestation of evil. Once again, the face reflecting back from the biblical past may be suspiciously familiar.

Santa Clara University

WILLIAM C. SPOHN, S.J.

THE ORIGINS OF CHRISTIAN MORALITY: THE FIRST TWO CENTURIES. By Wayne A. Meeks. New Haven: Yale University, 1993. Pp. x + 275. \$30.

In the words of its author, Woolsey Professor of biblical studies at Yale, this book "sketches the beginning of that process by which there eventually emerged the whole intricate fabric of sensibilities, perceptions, beliefs and practices that we call Christian morality." To that

end, Meeks attempts to construct "a kind of ethnography," i.e. a procedure which studies the texts that are the primary sources for the history of Christian beginnings.

Since morality is an integral part of a community's culture, M. seeks to determine the nature of the early Christian community which was composed of people with the following characteristics: newly converted to Christianity, living in urban settings, familiar with Hellenistic and Roman moral philosophies, rooted in the Jewish tradition, and striving to live the gospel message in a changing world which many believed was about to come to an end.

M. bases his research on some of the primary texts of this period: the Gospels and the writings of Paul, as well as on some of the noncanonical documents such as *The Acts of Peter* and *The Gospel of Thomas*. He also employs extensively the works of Barnabas, Justin Martyr, Clement of Rome, and *The Shepherd of Hermas*.

Specific issues relevant to the formation of an ethic are investigated: the nature of religious conversion, basic attitudes toward the cultural milieu, existing lists of virtues and vices, precise action guides or rules, the problem of evil, the role of God's will, the proximity of the eschaton, and the stories of God's relationship with the world as recorded in both Jewish and Christian narrative forms.

As a "postscript," M. formulates a series of theses which he sees as growing out of his research and which he acknowledges as valuable to scholars seeking further insights into the nature and role of Christian ethics. A brief sampling of these is in order: to be faithful to their commitment, Christians must have a thorough knowledge of their community's past; a continuing dialogue with the Jewish tradition "as interpreted by Jews" is a rich and necessary source of insight and correction for Christian ethics; while the community strives and prays for a coherent moral system, it must always admit the need for some measure of diversity; the tradition may be diverse, but that does not mean that it is shapeless.

As an ethnographer of early Christianity, what M. finds is "only a record of experimentation, of trial and error, of tradition creatively misread and innovation wedged craftily into the cracks of custom, of the radically new mixed up with the familiar and the old, of disputes and confrontation, of fervent assertions of unity amid distressing signs of schism, of opposite points of view on fundamental matters, of dialectic and change."

This is a first-class book. It affords a well-documented view of Christian morality as it came to be formulated in the first two centuries. Its exposition and critique of the sources is sound. It is written in a very pleasing manner, and it affords a mine of information for the person

trying to gain some correct insight into "the making of moral theology" from its earliest years.

Boston College

JAMES A. O'DONOHUE

IRENAEUS ON THE SALVATION OF THE UNEVANGELIZED. By Terrance L. Tiessen. American Theological Library Association Monograph Series. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow, 1993. Pp. ix + 317. \$39.50.

This is an unusual work, whose value might be overlooked. Since few studies of the theology of Irenaeus are just now available in English, it will serve as a useful introduction to the subject. Its command of issues of context, contents, and interpretation of Irenaeus's writings is extensive and sound. Judgments on disputed points are clearly argued and frequently persuasive. Bibliography is extensive, though occasionally lacking reference to monographs and articles of interest to specialists. Indeed, Tiessen says that his intention is "to study the theology of Irenaeus in its own right" (30).

The difficulty, as T. knows very well, is that he approaches Irenaeus with an eye to answering a fundamentally anachronistic question, whatever its interest to contemporary theologians. T. looks to Irenaeus for an answer to the contemporary question of whether he, among the Greek Christian writers of the second and third centuries, had room for the salvation of those who do not hear or accept the gospel. T.'s treatment of this issue, the challenge of "religious pluralism," is of interest. He centers attention on support in these writers for the "anonymous Christianity" which underlay Karl Rahner's view of the divine "salvific will" (124) for the redemption of the whole of humanity.

T. is aware of the dangers of raising this question. He chooses to deal with Irenaeus, rather than with the more likely figures of Justin, Clement, and Origen, for several reasons. Irenaeus is less likely to provide support for Rahner's view, and he is important in the formulation of later Christian orthodoxy.

After a careful investigation of Irenaeus's thought, T. draws the not surprising conclusion that Irenaeus does not address the contemporary issue. He concludes, with estimable caution, that, had Irenaeus faced the contemporary situation, he might "have allowed for the salvation of individuals" outside of the Church (281), but he did not.

T.'s cautious conclusion evolves from consideration of Irenaeus's thought as a response to the challenge of Valentinian gnosticism—with its elitist view of those to whom true knowledge of the divine is given, of the revelation of the supernatural world available only to an elect spiritual few, and of the source of their knowledge in a secret teaching different from the teaching of the Church. In consequence,

Irenaeus's view of the general availability of knowledge of the divine, of the revelation of the divine purpose in the Incarnation of the Word in human nature, and of the function of the Church in bringing the generality of humanity within its saving embrace, sets him on Rahner's side. Yet, T. argues persuasively, following Antonio Orbe, that Irenaeus makes a clear distinction between general knowledge of the divine and saving knowledge based on the revelation in Christ. There is no saving knowledge of God apart from acceptance of that revelation. Irenaeus's "Old Testament righteous" are not "anonymous Christians," nor are pagans who reject the revelation in Christ.

Successive chapters deal with Irenaeus's approach to the Valentines, his view of the knowledge of the Father, of the revelation of his purpose in the redemptive work of the Son, of the significance of the Spirit as the revealer of the Son, and of the purpose of the Church as proclaiming and embodying the divine revelation. These are invaluable introductions to the main themes of Irenaeus. They set him in the intellectual context of his time, review the problems of the interpretation of his teaching, and show that his is a positive contribution to the development of Christian theology.

Episcopal Divinity School
Cambridge, Mass.

LLOYD G. PATTERSON

BAPTISM AND CHANGE IN THE EARLY MIDDLE AGES, c. 200–c. 1150. By Peter Cramer. Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought. New York: Cambridge University, 1993. Pp. xx + 356. \$59.50.

Cramer surveys the principal Western liturgical sources from the *Apostolic Tradition*, the *De baptismo* of Tertullian, and the writings of Ambrose and Augustine through the Carolingian period to the middle of the twelfth century in an attempt to explain the various interpretations of baptism within differing historical, social, and cultural contexts. In addition, he provides two excursions on the baptistery, liturgy, and city in Concordia Sagittaria and the wall paintings in that baptistery.

This work is less concerned with "changes" in the baptismal *rites* than it is with changing *perceptions* of baptism. Central to C.'s discussion is that the understanding of baptism and, hence, of sacrament changes, starting from the "crisis" situation of decision within the confrontation between the Church and pagan culture of Late Antiquity, the philosophical acquiescence to Christian truth (Tertullian), and what C. calls the movement of imagination and emotion evoked in Ambrose's approach to conversion, and ending with: (1) thanks to the legacy of Augustine, a medieval stress on the proper *form* of the rite as

an "operation" now performed *upon* an infant; (2) the "diminishing of baptism" in the movement from symbolic rite to allegorical use of the rite (e.g. in the *expositiones*) to portray Christian teaching; and (3) the ultimate loss of sacramental symbol itself in favor of realism (as witnessed to by the Berengarian–Lanfranc eucharistic controversy) or in the denial of the necessity of sacraments themselves in favor of individual moral choice.

I greatly appreciated C.'s discussion of the "psychological connection between baptism, martyrdom, and dream" in the *Passion of Perpetua* (73–86) where he argues that "in martyrdom, the imagined reality of ritual becomes a physical reality through death" (72), an association that continues to made in the medieval West through the uniting of baptistery with *martyrium*. Although I missed any reference to Augustine's classic understanding of sacraments as "visible words," C.'s treatment of Augustine's theology is a balanced discussion of both grace and the importance of faithful human cooperation in ongoing conversion. And I especially appreciated his treatment of the medieval shift in the meaning of the baptismal scrutinies (e.g. in *Ordo Romanus XI*) "from instruction and examination into exorcism" (143) and how this is related to childhood as symbolic of society itself within the early Middle Ages.

There are, however, a number of weaknesses that must be pointed out. First, a study which assumes a beginning date about 200 and in which 129 of 266 pages (not including the excursuses) are devoted to the patristic period does not warrant reference to "the Early Middle Ages" in the title. Similarly, since C.'s focus is so obviously on the *Western Church*, this too should have been indicated. Second, the style of this work is dense and, at times, very difficult to read. Clarity would have been helped immensely by short concluding summaries at the end of each chapter and, not least, by a major concluding chapter. As it is, it is often difficult to follow the developmental trajectory C. seeks to describe and interpret.

Third, more recent scholarship on patristic liturgy calls into question some of the foundational assumptions C. makes. Not only is the linking of Tertullian, Ambrose, and the *Passion of Perpetua* together in one chapter methodologically questionable, but the assumptions made about the date and authorship of the *Apostolic Tradition* and about the presumed norm of Easter baptism in the early Church are both subject to serious revision today. If, e.g., neither an early third-century date nor Hippolytan authorship can be assumed any longer for the *Apostolic Tradition*, then a claim of the document's authority for representing the "crisis" between Church and pagan culture in that period loses its force and credibility. Similarly, the "normativity" of Easter baptism in the early Church is increasingly being questioned, with the result that

the medieval "separation" of baptism from Easter appears to be less of a "change" than scholars have previously assumed.

Finally, one of the great "changes" in the Middle Ages was the separation of "confirmation" from baptism. Although C. treats this briefly, no reference is made to the foundational letter of Innocent I to Decentius of Gubbio (c. 416). Nor does C. refer to recent scholarship on confirmation, especially to those whose works have become standard in the field (e.g. Gerard Austin and Aidan Kavanagh). Furthermore, *this* change has such important implications for both medieval church and society that it should have its own chapter.

Those interested in medieval liturgical life (and willing to put forth the effort) will find in this book a wealth of information complete with abundant citations from Latin sources and C.'s own English translations. Those who desire a more accessible presentation of the historical changes in the perception of symbol and sacrament, however, are advised to read Bernard Cooke's *The Distancing of God* (1990).

Saint John's University, Collegeville

MAXWELL E. JOHNSON

SOUNDINGS IN ST. AUGUSTINE'S IMAGINATION. By Robert J. O'Connell, S.J. New York: Fordham University, 1994. Pp. x + 309. \$40; \$19.95.

O'Connell's comprehensive and detailed knowledge of Augustine's thought is a good basis for this intricate exploration of Augustine's poetic imagination. Like someone working on a "jigsaw puzzle" (243), O. patiently pursues, not Augustine's *theory* of the imagination, but his complex use of three central image-clusters: *omnia*, a model of the spiritual and corporeal universe as "a structured hierarchy of all things"; *peregrinatio animae*, the wayfaring soul, as exemplified by the Prodigal and Odysseus; and *fovere*, God's providential care for the soul in transit. These images, O. claims, are "foundational for the entire superstructure of Augustine's imaged thought" (11); together, they reveal an imaginative "picture of the universe" that is not contradictory to, but *is* somewhat different from his metaphysical view of reality (21).

Focusing "primarily but not exclusively" on Augustine's preaching, O. exposes the extraordinarily rich resources of this genre of Augustine's work for revealing the poetic "register" of Augustine's philosophical and theological thought. Predictably, the apparently "free" associations of his spontaneous speech are, in fact, patterned, repetitive, and always woven thickly into the ideas he sought to communicate to his congregation. Readers familiar with O.'s earlier writings will not be startled to learn that Augustine's *poetic* picture of the saga of human existence owes a lot to Plotinus, namely "that we are all wayfar-

ing souls, having turned our backs on our Heavenly Home and plunged down to the lowest reaches of the *Omnia*; now, with the help of God's fostering 'care,' we strive to 'return' (quite literally) to where we originally came from" (13).

Each of the three image-clusters O. discusses has an "associational logic" (7–10) characterized by the intersection of diverse images, by fusion, and by recession, i.e. the "tendency for certain [images] to lie patent on the surface in one period, and to 'go underground' at a later period" (254). O.'s task of identifying foundational images is not an easy one. He acknowledges that "almost any of Augustine's leading images can coalesce and fuse with a startling variety of others, and at times fuse with them so thoroughly as to become almost perfectly camouflaged" (246). Similarly, "Augustine returns to variants on [an] image time after time, but with a liberty of interpretation that sometimes appears disconcertingly arbitrary, even whimsical" (259). It is O.'s claim that he has identified the "logic" of Augustine's use of images which permits him to claim the three images mentioned above as foundational.

At certain points in his argument, O. claims to offer a "more natural explanation" (190) than those of other prominent interpreters of Augustine. The unexpected naivete of this claim betrays his strongly perspectival reading. Indeed, working with evidence as bewilderingly profuse and diffuse as Augustine's sermons, it is difficult to see how anything *but* a strongly perspectival reading could discern patterns. O. is somewhat petulant about scholarly criticism he has received for revealing, in his earlier books, the extent to which Augustine incorporated Plotinian ideas. "My Augustine," he insists, was determined to think as a Christian, even when using, and frequently transforming, the Plotinian philosophy he once thought would serve as a trusty ally in 'understanding the faith'" (174). Yet O.'s use of locutions such as "for a Platonist of Augustine's sort" (149), or "We, meaning our souls" (192), may fail to convince readers who seek a thoroughly Christianized Augustine. No doubt O. is right in remarking that differences and problems between Christianity and Platonism are much clearer to modern readers than they were to Augustine, who found it "consistent with his entire project as a Christian thinker to demonstrate that Christian faith was congenial to the deepest insights of pagan culture" (174).

O.'s particular contribution to Augustinian studies has been to point out, and to demonstrate in detail, Augustine's extensive use of a Plotinian repertoire of ideas and metaphors. This is an important task to the extent that it augments or refines our understanding of Augustine's theology. Does it do that in the work under review? As fre-

quently happens to authors, O. is completely right in what he sees in Augustine's sermons, but his exclusions are less convincing. E.g., in order to strengthen his longtime conviction that Augustine adopted and adapted Plotinus's picture of the soul's exile and return to its native land, O. ignores Augustine's vigorous and lifelong interest in human bodies as central to Christian conversion, life, and afterlife.

Augustine's awareness that a classical model of human being as stacked components with body on the bottom and rational soul on the top; his committed and concerted effort to read human bodies (*nunc* and *tunc*) through the Christian doctrines of creation, the Incarnation of Jesus Christ, and the promised resurrection of the body—these intellectual and emotional commitments are omitted in O.'s account. And Augustine's sermons are also full of *this* theological agenda. In short, a more adequate reading of Augustine's theology would surely include O.'s important work; it would also need to take as seriously as Augustine did the integrity of human bodies as the goal and reward of salvation.

Harvard Divinity School

MARGARET R. MILES

GRATIA CHRISTI—GRATIA DEI BEI AUGUSTINUS VON HIPPO: CHRISTOZENTRISMUS ODER THEOZENTRISMUS? By Basil Studer. *Studia Ephemeridis "Augustinianum."* Rome: Institutum Patristicum "Augustinianum," 1993. Pp. 323. L. 50,000.

"Neither fish nor fowl" is perhaps an appropriate description of Studer's study of the tension between Christ and God in the thought of Augustine. As S. explains in his forward, he had originally intended the two major sections of this book for publication in the *Augustinus-Lexikon* under the entries "Christ" and "God." When plans changed, the two articles were revised and united around the common theme of grace, which really plays a less significant role than one would be led to believe by the title.

With the celebrated *Dogmengeschichten* of the early-20th century as his point of departure, S. links Part 1, *Gratia Christi*, with Part 2, *Gratia Dei*, by means of an introduction and conclusion, which artificially frame the two dissimilar sections while highlighting the unifying theme of grace. Furthermore, each section is developed from an entirely different perspective. While Part 1 on Christ is encyclopedic, Part 2 on God is exemplary. The first part is a study of the word *Christus* in the works of Augustine, where S. seems loath to omit occurrences of the word from his survey. He then takes the accumulated evidence to present Augustine's Christology primarily in terms of grace, which permits him to assert a Christocentrism in the thought

of Augustine. The second part divides Augustine's works into three areas, from which S. chose a limited number of examples: autobiographical and personal writings such as the *Confessiones*, major theological treatises such as *De Genesi ad litteram*, *De Trinitate* and *De civitate Dei*, and pastoral works such as selected letters and anti-Pelagian writings. The latter exemplary method is, of course, a much more effective approach to Augustine than an encyclopedic word study, because both the varying goals of the works and the personal development of Augustine, which is always germane to his theology, are more explicitly taken into consideration. Nevertheless, despite structural and organizational flaws, which make the book aesthetically unpleasant reading, substantive flaws are less easily found. In fact, three significant contributions need to be mentioned.

First, the fundamental question S. poses is of paramount importance to anyone making a serious attempt to understand Augustine and his thinking: "Does Christ or God stand at the middle of the theological thought of Saint Augustine?" Well aware of the tension within Augustine's thought between Christocentrism and theocentrism, S. responds with the formula, *per Christum hominem ad Christum Deum*, taken from Augustine's *In Iohannis evangelium*. Although one may differentiate between God and man in Christ, Christ is always one subject, one person. Nevertheless, the above formula is less Christological than soteriological, because it addresses the salvation of human beings rather than the nature of God. *Deus in se* may be considered another expression for *Deus creator*, namely the unchanging God who created heaven and earth out of nothing while remaining separate from his creation. This concept of God grew out of Augustine's confrontation with Manichaeism. *Deus ad nos* is likened to the *pater familias*, namely the benevolent God who like the head of a Roman household provides for his children, who in turn are loyal to their father. In the Pelagian controversy Augustine further develops his Christology which is simultaneously a soteriology whereby Christ himself is the way to salvation. In the end, there are two ways of speaking about one God.

Second, S. rightly criticizes the eternally repeated and overly simplistic assertion concerning the relationship between the Greek and Latin theology of God. Supposedly Greek theologians of the East stress the three persons of the Trinity, namely the diversity within the Godhead, while Latin theologians of the West, like Augustine, stress the one God, namely the unity within the Godhead. S.'s assertion that "there can be no essential opposition between *gratia Dei* and *gratia Christi*, between creation and redemption" (285) suggests that the "God in himself" approach should be abandoned in favor of a "God for

us" approach which fittingly places Augustine's theology of God in the context of his theology of grace. Augustinian unity and Augustinian theocentricity remain unscathed because paradoxically the role of Christ becomes central.

Third, the single short excursus, "Eine neue Wende im theologischen Denken des Augustinus?" (181–86), should not be overlooked, because it touches upon a burning issue in contemporary Augustinian research. Kurt Flasch in his recently published *Logik des Schreckens* (Mainz: Dieterich'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1990) advanced the radical hypothesis that Augustine's *De diversis questionibus ad Simplicianum* represents a turning point in the development of Augustine's teaching on grace which grew out of his Platonic understanding of a transcendent God. Although S. deals with Flasch's hypothesis sympathetically, he rightly refuses to accept *Ad Simplicianum* as a turning point in the thought of Augustine for several cogent reasons. Despite the anti-Manichaean character of *Ad Simplicianum*, Augustine's concept of God as creator stands behind his understanding of God as eternal and unchanging will. Although S. concedes that Augustine may not have achieved a suitable synthesis between grace and freedom, Flasch overstates his case when he allows Augustine's affirmation of divine grace to call human freedom into question. Debate continues on this issue; see Thomas Gerhard Ring, "Bruch oder Entwicklung im Gnadenbegriff Augustins?" *Augustiniana* 44 (1994) 31–113.

Saint Louis University

KENNETH B. STEINHAUSER

CHRISTIANITY AND CLASSICAL CULTURE: THE METAMORPHOSIS OF NATURAL THEOLOGY IN THE CHRISTIAN ENCOUNTER WITH HELLENISM. By Jaroslav Pelikan. Gifford Lectures 1992–1993. New Haven: Yale University, 1993. Pp. 368. \$40.

The Gifford Lectures are devoted to the topic of natural theology, and this topic, as the title indicates, constitutes the subject matter of Pelikan's book. What the title does not reveal, however, is that the book may just as accurately be described as a study of Cappadocian theology. Every idea announced in the title is discussed exclusively through the lens of Cappadocian theology, and to that extent perhaps some reference to the Cappadocians should have appeared in the title. The book argues that Cappadocian theology represents a happy coincidence of the shared religious insights of Hellenistic philosophy and Christian revelation. To take two important examples, both philosophy and revelation began with the cosmos as a theological artifact; and both philosophy and revelation found a foundational role for apophatism in theological discourse. P. argues convincingly that the co-

incidence of such insights in Cappadocian theology gave fundamental shape to their apologetic. P. seems to have read all the works of Basil of Caesarea, Gregory of Nazianzus, and Gregory of Nyssa in preparation for this project—no mean feat given that the authors were so prolific and that so much is still untranslated.

There are precedents for using Cappadocian theology as a case study of the relationship between Christianity and natural theology. Harnack regarded the Cappadocians generally and Gregory of Nyssa in particular as perpetrators of a Hellenized, “scientific” dogmatic Christianity. What Paul had allowed, what Origen had enstructured, the Cappadocians conspired to preserve even when better minds (e.g. Athanasius) knew better. P. knows all this. He was trained, as he happily acknowledges, in Harnack’s tradition. This very connection lends a strange, haunting quality to the book and to P.’s conclusions. There are no significant references to Harnack; when P. mentions that some have judged the Cappadocians negatively, he cites Bethune-Baker and is all but silent about Harnack. The book provides every bit of evidence Harnack could have desired of “Hellenized” Cappadocian Christianity, while at the same time implicitly denying every bit of significance that Harnack found in Hellenization. P. says that he chose the Cappadocians as his subject for the Gifford Lectures because earlier lectures had neglected Byzantine theology, yet it was not neglect that previously injured accounts of Cappadocian theology, but rejection. My own judgement is that P. wrote this book to remove the crippling burden that his master placed on the modern understanding of Cappadocian theology and “Christianity and classical culture.” Most would agree that this was something that needed to be done. However, by not facing Harnack’s criticisms head-on P. has left himself preaching to the converted. Someone new to the Cappadocians may glimpse interesting thematic similarities between Hellenistic thought and the Cappadocians, but I cannot see that the book will change anyone’s mind.

As a Gifford Lecturer P. is participating in a conversation that began in 1881; his numerous remarks on previous lectures from the turn of the century are both useful and apropos. However, even aside from such comments, most of the scholarly references P. quotes or remarks upon are from the first half of this century. Cherniss and Jaeger loom large in these pages, while recent scholarship (such as Raoul Mortley’s work on apophaticism) remains unused. P. characterizes some doctrines as Cappadocian that are in fact characteristic of broader fourth-century theological categories (e.g. from Eusebius of Caesarea). He quotes passages out of context; he jumps from author to author and text to text without regard to chronology. He treats Gregory’s *Life of*

Macrina and *On the Soul and Resurrection* as literal accounts of Macrina's beliefs. In particular, P.'s assumption that there was a unitative "Cappadocian" theology now strains credulity. In short, the book ignores too many problems. One might pass over P.'s not answering such questions, but not his failing to even acknowledge them. This is a fair criticism to make of the book, because P. himself begins the book by criticizing his predecessors for failing to note the specifics of Cappadocian natural theology; the investigation of those very specifics, he announces, are the subject matter of the book.

Such problems in the book raise the question of whether the very *genre* of this book is still credible as history. Cherniss and Jaeger loom large in this book because it is fundamentally a methodological and conceptual artifact of the beginning of this century. Since we now see how forced and premature such a synthetic work is, the book's genre is no longer credible. The genre is forced, because experience has shown that the price of such thematic accounts is the loss of details, of the author's and the text's individuality. Our present ignorance of such details is due in large part to the dominance of a thematic approach in earlier treatments of the Cappadocians. The prematureness of the project is seen in the questions we have still not answered. P.'s results prove the wisdom of caution. *Christianity and Classical Culture* is magnificent, but it is not scholarship.

Marquette University

MICHEL RENÉ BARNES

HISTOIRE THÉOLOGIQUE DE L'ÉGLISE CATHOLIQUE: ITINÉRAIRE ET FORMES DE LA THÉOLOGIE. By Ghislain Lafont. *Cogitatio fidei*. Paris: Cerf, 1994. Pp. 474. Fr. 190.

After a long introduction this book has two unequal parts, *Itinéraire* and *Formes*. Lafont's purpose in Part 1 is to provide both a critical analysis of, and a theological reflection on, the ways theology has been done in the Latin Church. Extensive selective bibliographies follow each chapter of this part. Part 2, more theoretical but excessively short (it really should have been the kernel of another volume!), offers a synthetic view of L.'s interpretation of the history and a prescription for the future.

The history that is presented is guided by a basic option that may be called philosophical: The entire theological enterprise has been marked by the distinction, inherited from the Greeks, between Oneness and Being. Its high points are attempts, that have systematically failed, to think Oneness and Being together. L. illustrates the distinction by the difference between gnosis, which is a search for oneness, and ontology, a search for being. Gnosis gave rise to a mystical ap-

proach centered on the One, ontology to an encyclopedic approach concerned about the Many, since being is experienced primarily in numerous created beings. Both approaches have been at home in the history of the West, which, however, has not reached a happy synthesis of the two.

L. traces this fundamental dialectic in Augustine versus pseudo-Denys (whose oriental views had considerable influence in the West), and in theologies of the cross (Bonaventure, Luther) versus theologies of creation and glory (Thomas, Counter-Reformation). The symbolism of oneness has been at the core of institutional organization around the papal primacy and of the development of canon law, while the multiplicity of creation has inspired episcopal (conciliarist), monastic, and lay movements, the sacramental system, the growth of moral theology as a reinterpretation of law, each pole trying to incorporate and account for the other pole. In this story of Western theology L. gives unusual importance to John Scot Eriugena and to Nicholas of Cusa, two of the few theologians who attempted to obtain and justify a total view of everything, God and creation, the real and the possible.

The theological analysis, however, deteriorates when one comes to modern times. After the Reformation L. turns to a few secular authors (Spinoza, Darwin, Feuerbach, Marx, Freud) to describe the new intellectual paradigm of "modernity." In so doing he conveys the impression that Catholic theology was then so dominated by the papacy's political understanding of Oneness and that it was in such a state of subservience to the magisterium that it became entirely sterile. Neither systematic theology, as in Suarez, nor historical theology, as in Petau, is looked at. In fact, however, even secondary authors of the 18th century, like Tournély or Collet, although they were not creative in the sense that L. would like, were quite independent in their thinking. The very existence of the Jansenist and the Gallican controversies shows that the theologians of the 17th and 18th centuries cared little for "ultramontane" conformity.

L. returns to theology with the pontificate of Leo XIII, whose advocacy of neo-Scholasticism was, in spite of its excessive narrowness, the spark that allowed Catholic theology to open new directions, liturgical, biblical, and ecclesial. These have been responsible for a reinterpretation of Thomas Aquinas that goes far beyond what Leo XIII desired. L.'s conclusion for theology is well expressed in this formulation: "... theological truth perhaps lies where one attempts, not to reconcile Plato and Aristotle, but to *join Bonaventure and Thomas tactfully*. The symbolic polarity, Bonaventure—Thomas, is probably the key of theological discernment" (381). In another summary, L. sees the post-Vatican II period on the model of the pre-Nicene period.

In his second part, L. makes a succinct yet systematic attempt to show what tasks the theology of the future will have to face. The problems of Oneness and of Being remain. But they cannot be solved or even faced together without accounting for the problem of evil, and this in turn cannot be done without considering the problem of time.

On the whole this is a very impressive volume, given its intended scope and the range of the material it examines. Yet there are two kinds of difficulties. In the first place, the history of theology and its interpretation are entirely dependant on the paradigm of Greek thought, caught between Plato and Aristotle. If, instead of seeking for the ways in which Christian thinkers have dealt with the philosophical notions of Oneness and of Being (the mystical and the ontological), one sought how it has faced the questions of the Good and of Beauty (in Kierkegaard's terms, the ethical and the esthetic), one might have a very different view of the history of theology and of its future tasks. In the second place, there are obvious problems with the way L. treats history. Not only is the theology of the baroque period entirely passed over, but the 19th century is treated so selectively that neither Johann Adam Möhler nor John Henry Newman is looked at.

Marquette University

GEORGE H. TAVARD

MYSTICAL LANGUAGES OF UNSAYING. By Michael A. Sells. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1994. Pp. x + 316. \$49.95; \$18.95.

A synthetic account of the special logic and paradoxes of mystical apophaticism by means of a sustained philological, literary, and rhetorical reading of texts from five mystics. Here we meet Plotinus discussing the Awakening without an Awakener; John the Scot Eriugena propounding a nonsubstantialist understanding of *creatio ex nihilo* by equating the *nihil* with the divine nothingness; Ibn Arabi, the great Andalusian Sufi, who speaks of removing the psychic smudge due to the soul's resting in finite forms and stations, so that the Real can reveal itself to itself in the polished mirror of the soul; Marguerite Porete, the French beguine burned at the stake for heresy, who describes the annihilated soul which loses itself once it has been ravished by the divine lover; and Meister Eckhart, who explains the self-birth of God's Son within the soul, and for whom the apophysis of God's personal characteristics as Trinity recedes back into Unity. Porete's divine gender dynamic and Eckhart's virgin soul that births God's Son also reveal that "the apophatic unsaying of the substantialist Deity [is] . . . at one with the apophatic unsaying of gender essentialism" (180).

Mystical apophysis is not a theoretic negative theology at home within the larger confines of a kataphatic theology, but more radically,

an unceasing performative “unsaying” of God and of language itself. Apophasis is a kind of sacred deconstructionism which revels in the coincidence of opposites and in real violations of the laws of contradiction and excluded middle. Sells wants us to take the radical claims of apophatic writers seriously, not to dismiss them as hyperbolic or try to explain them away. Apophasis begins with the dilemma of transcendence: if God radically transcends names and thus is rigorously ineffable, then X cannot even be called “God.” There are three ways to respond to this dilemma: withdraw into silence before God’s mystery; distinguish between two kinds of names, one of which God does not transcend; enter a language of ephemeral, double propositions, where all statements need to be immediately corrected and where meaning is unstable, residing as it does in the momentary and tensive interstices between two propositions. Apophatic discourse soon reveals that the truly transcendent is identical with the absolutely immanent, that the self-other and subject-object dichotomies are undone in mystical union. This in turn leads to disontology and to a nonsubstantialist deity, and to a language that regresses from reifying reference while it uses metaphors of emanation that suggest the divine nothingness issuing forth into being. Apophatic grammar fuses subject and predicate, permits pronouns to refer to both the divine and human interchangeably, breaks down the distinction between reflexive and nonreflexive verbs, and at the microlevel of language destabilizes the usual temporal and spatial dualisms of everyday prepositions like *in* and *before*. Thus comes into existence the apophatic “meaning event,” which is “a reenactment (within grammar, syntax, and metaphor) of the fusion of self and other within mystical union” (209).

Taking the three responses to the dilemma of transcendence in reverse order, however, I think there is still some privileged kataphatic stance lurking behind the third response’s spiraling sacred deconstructions: Does the apophatic mystic really want deconstructively to unsay the fusion of self-other and subject-predicate once their opposite dualisms have been broken down, or to gainsay the complex kataphatic proposition that God is beyond both assertion and negation? Moreover, the description of the second response is unnuanced and oversimplified and thus permits it to be an easy foil for the third. There are subtle negative theologies, as in Aquinas, which distinguish meaning from truth, concept from judgment, and the divine reality signified from our way of signifying it—which allows temporal and spatial prepositions, *pace* S. (21, 49, 261), to connote something in God which transcends their normal denotations—and where God remains fully transcendent while at the same time in personally intimate and fully immanent union with the human. It is also wrong to attribute to Aquinas a

"distinction between God in himself and God in creatures" (190), or to speak in unshaded terms of his substantialist conception of Deity (159), since for him God's essence is identified with the infinite *act* of Being. Finally, since the hallmarks of mystical union are simplicity and lack of distinctions, it may be that the ultimate performative apophysis is the first response of uncomplicated and undistinguishing silence. In this light, mystical apophatic writings, and valuable studies about them like the present work, may be fruitfully viewed as propaedeutic to the paramount practice of silence.

This highly scholarly work is difficult, sometimes dense; the end-notes in six different languages comprise more than a quarter of the text. But the analysis is masterful, and the book is richly rewarding.

Dominican School, Berkeley

GREGORY P. ROCCA, O.P.

CLARE OF ASSISI. By Marco Bartoli. Translated from the Italian by Frances Teresa, O.S.A. Quincy, Ill.: Franciscan Press, 1993. Pp. xii + 244. \$21.95.

THE FIRST FRANCISCAN WOMAN: CLARE OF ASSISI AND HER FORM OF LIFE. By Margaret Carney, O.S.F. Quincy, Ill.: Franciscan Press, 1993. Pp. 261. \$12.95.

CLARE OF ASSISI: A BIOGRAPHICAL STUDY. By Ingrid J. Peterson, O.S.F. Quincy, Ill.: Franciscan Press, 1993. Pp. xxii + 436. \$20.95.

The appearance of these three works during the year celebrating the eighth centenary of the birth of Clare of Assisi (August 11, 1193) witnesses to the rather recent yet remarkable interest of scholars with this creative and original medieval woman, overshadowed for too long in both the Franciscan and scholarly worlds by the imposing figure of Francis of Assisi.

Bartoli attempts to reconstruct an historical biography of Clare in order to correct romantic portraits of this saint, as well as histories which portray Clare as a weak shadow of her mentor, Francis. B.'s own expertise with the ecclesial and social history of the period provides a rich background to Clare's position both in Assisi and in the Church of her day.

He presents Clare's conversion as a clear break with her past which signaled the "beginning of a completely different life" (38), then proceeds to detail the consequences of her choice to live at San Damiano. In subsequent chapters, B. investigates the implications of her choice of poverty, her understanding of the monastic enclosure, the theology which emerges from her life and writings, as well as her relation to and impact upon Assisi and the larger ecclesial world. B.'s treatment of Clare's experience of enclosure as an experience of active fruitfulness

underlines Clare's creativity in contrast to traditional approaches with which she had to contend.

Despite its positive contributions, two weaknesses in B.'s approach should be noted. First, even though this work appeared in Italian in 1989, he demonstrates no familiarity with insights of contemporary feminist research into the religious experience of medieval women. Second, in suggesting that Clare grew to become an *alter Franciscus* (132), Bartoli betrays a prejudice operative throughout the book that undermines Clare's position as foundress and creator of a new form of life for women, as she is constantly being compared to Francis as the standard for the charism.

Carney's study focuses on the development of Clare's form of life, or her Rule for the Poor Ladies. Beginning with a critical examination of the sources (writings, legends, chronicles, etc.) which treat of the relationship between Francis and Clare and the movement which grew around them, C. points to Clare's originality and responsibility for the unfolding of the Franciscan charism in the first decades of its existence. C. then turns her attention to the actual genesis of Clare's Rule. The methodology she uses to study the central issues of poverty, mutual charity, and governance is described as a "triptych" (99) wherein the text of Clare's Rule holds center place. On one side, the text is juxtaposed to the social, canonical, and ecclesial experience of medieval religious women; on the other side, the experience of the Friars Minor and their ongoing history provides the other piece of the picture. C. shows, e.g., how Clare's choice of poverty was made both in response to the legal situation of women with regard to ownership and inheritance and in response to the internal struggle of the friars themselves with the legal implication of both use and ownership of material goods. C. suggests links between the approach of friar-theologian Hugh of Digne from Provence in his 1241 commentary on the Rule of Francis and Clare's treatment of "most high poverty" in her Rule. The picture of Clare which emerges is one of active communication and engagement with common issues, rather than of cloistered aloofness and naive idealism.

Thus Clare's Rule witnesses to the one founding charism of the Franciscan movement—not merely as the feminine expression of Francis's charism, but as *the* Franciscan charism for which both Clare and Francis were responsible. As such, C. argues, the text of Clare's Rule deserves attention as a "primary source of general Franciscan spirituality" (97), and not simply as a text for Franciscan cloistered nuns.

The major contribution of Peterson's biographical study of Clare lies in her successful attempt to place Clare within the religious women's movements of her day. Peterson removes Clare from the shadow of

Francis by asking from the outset whether in fact Clare imitated Francis, or "could it not have been the other way around, that Francis formed a spiritual brotherhood in imitation of the noble ladies of Favorone's house?" (5).

In Part 1, Peterson relies on the acts of Clare's canonization process to show that Clare lived a penitential life with the ladies of her household even before Francis arrived on the scene. These noble women formed a religious circle in the home similar to that of the beguines in northern Europe. When Clare left her paternal home to join Francis and his brothers at the Portiuncula on Palm Sunday in 1212, she was already leading a religious life. Thus P. suggest that it was Francis who saw in Clare something of the gospel life he wanted to renew in the Church.

Part 2 studies the life of Clare and her sisters as it unfolded at the monastery of San Damiano as a life of poverty in enclosure. P. points out that Clare chose enclosure from the beginning, even prior to canonical legislation imposing it. After careful examination of the penitential practices of Clare, P. notes how she matured in this area without internalizing the prevalent negative messages about women's body.

In Part 3, P. discusses the inner life of Clare in terms of its impact on her relationships within the monastery, as well as how it sustained her in the long struggle to have her Rule approved. While influenced both by Bernard of Clairvaux's Christocentric mysticism and by Francis's own ministerial devotion to Jesus Christ, Clare's originality lies in her focus on the suffering, crucified Christ as spouse and bridegroom within the context of enclosed life. In the end, Clare's spirituality remains "domestic," similar to that lived with the noble ladies in her own family home prior to joining Francis and the brothers, yet now in the freedom provided by the enclosure of San Damiano. P.'s study is seminal, opening new vistas for further research into the life of this remarkable woman, and destined to become a classic in setting a standard for further work on Clare of Assisi.

Washington Theological Union MICHAEL W. BLASTIC, O.F.M. CONV.

THE CHURCH: THE UNIVERSAL SACRAMENT OF SALVATION. By Johann Auer. Translated from the German by Michael Waldstein. Dogmatic Theology Series. Washington: Catholic University of America, 1993. Pp. xxxiii + 541. \$39.95; \$24.95.

This is a fine translation of the eighth and penultimate volume in the series *Kleine Katholische Dogmatik* which first appeared in Ger-

man in 1983. Like the earlier seven volumes which Auer contributed (the ninth, on eschatology, is by Joseph Ratzinger), the treatment of the Church is centered around the theme of grace. Auer, who died in 1989, held that the doctrine of grace and especially the question of its action upon human freedom provided the center about which one could most effectively construct a truly systematic theology. Certainly he could claim many and good precedents for making grace the focus of his theological vision, from Augustine and Scotus to Möhler and Rahner. And his concern to find an organizing principle which will give a coherent structure to theology and thus render it rigorously "scientific" is in the tradition of Drey and Scheeben. Indeed, one way of describing the strengths of the textbook series to which this volume belongs is that it is squarely in the tradition of southern German theology centered on Tübingen and Munich in the 19th century.

The first section of the book is concerned with methodology. Auer insisted that the proper study of the Church is theological, not sociological or political. The second section reviews various theological resources for understanding the Church. Auer chose to emphasize the Church's sacramental nature which fits easily his grace-centered perspective. The third and by far longest section demonstrates this sacramental nature in the Church's forms of life and structures. The final section deals with the Church's mission in terms of realizing unity, holiness, and catholicity; Auer maintained that apostolicity was a given of the Church's nature whereas the three other traditional "marks" were tasks contained in its mission. Auer's preference for a sacramental understanding of ecclesiology is very typical of the southern German theological tradition. It allows him both to make connections with classical Christology, the doctrine of creation, and sacramental theology, and to take a moderate position with regard to questions of the Church's prophetic role as critic of culture, politics, and economics.

The book's strengths are those of a good textbook: clarity in style and organization, balance in the review of the relevant literature, solid synthesis. The hallmarks of the *Kleine Katholische Dogmatik Series* are the use of Scripture in a manner informed by the best historical-critical scholarship but open to reading the texts in light of the Church's experience, and the careful and knowledgeable use of historical study; both are evidenced again in this volume. Particular credit should be given to the translator who has managed to avoid the pitfalls of Germanized English and produced a genuinely readable book.

But there are some troubling caveats. First, more often than not the most revealing pages in a work of systematic theology are the table of contents. There the reader discovers what is treated and what is not, in

what order the various topics are arranged and how much space is allotted to each of them. And a glance at the table of contents of this book shows at once that certain biases are present. The chapter on the hierarchy is given 151 pages (almost one-third of the text), of which 95 pages are devoted to the Petrine office, 50 pages to the episcopacy, presbyterate, and diaconate combined, and 6 to the laity. This is ecclesiology "from above" with a vengeance!

By contrast to the 151-page chapter on the hierarchy, the ecumenical mission of the Church receives only 25 pages and the Church's "tasks in the world," dealing with the state, the society, economy, science, and culture, get a mere 21. This strange disproportion comes in part from Auer's repeated assertion that the Church can only truly be understood theologically. While sociology, political philosophy, and group psychology may have something to say, he tends to treat their contributions as so partial that they are almost dismissed as inevitably distorting. So much emphasis is laid on the unique quality of the Church as a supernatural community that I fear the text approaches an ecclesiological monophysitism. Surely the Church is *also* a natural society and therefore open to the investigations of historians and social scientists; and any purely theological study of a society which Robert Bellarmine described as being as visible "as the assembly of the Roman people, the kingdom of France, and the republic of Venice" runs the risk of being partial and perhaps distorting.

Finally, while the book's strengths are those of much of the finest of German theology, it must be remembered that not all theology is German. And Auer's ecclesiology is very German, which is to say not at all American. Its usefulness as a textbook in this country will be limited by the fact that it may address questions of great pertinence to German students but does not envision the pressing concerns of American ones. The great issue which confronts anyone teaching ecclesiology to American students—why does the Christian understanding of God, grace, revelation, salvation, etc., necessarily entail belonging to a community—is never raised here. Auer assumes that his readers know *why* there is the Church and so concerns himself with *what* it is. In a culture as thoroughly individualistic as the United States, no one teaching ecclesiology can make such an assumption.

Boston College

MICHAEL J. HIMES

A SALVATION AUDIT. By Colin Grant. Scranton: University of Scranton; London: Associated University Presses, 1994. Pp. 397. \$45.

Grant teaches at Mount Allison University in Nova Scotia. The title of his book communicates its contents indirectly. Salvation is the very

substance of Christianity and cannot be reduced to the doctrine of atonement or redemption. G. deals only in passing with soteriological doctrine. His subject is the broader state of the question of how theology deals with the saving interrelation between God and human existence basically from a North American and European perspective.

G.'s audit of the situation is not very positive or uplifting. There has been little interest in salvation since the turn to anthropocentrism and historical consciousness in the post-Enlightenment period. Christian theology has failed to make God's salvation intelligible to this age but only distorted it by making it relevant in terms of healing or social amelioration: God brings a fundamentally sound human existence to its fulfillment. Theology tends to substitute theodicy for salvation: instead of a sinful humanity requiring a holy God's salvific initiative, theology assumes human wholeness and tries to explain God in the face of human suffering.

Given our situation, there are three conditions for making salvation meaningful today. First, salvation cannot be equated with predestination or any form of determinism from either the past or the future. Freedom is a factor of an open history; its end is not programmed. G. seems sympathetic to process thought. Second, understanding salvation requires vision, a form of thought that encompasses the whole of reality. Theology has to break through technological reason and establish credibility for values that are objective and public. Third, salvation ultimately consists in union with God on God's initiative. Thus theology has to confront anthropocentrism and its dismissal of human sin and God's holiness.

G.'s first part deals with the tradition on salvation, and its opening chapter contrasting Jesus and Paul is the best in the book. Part 2 deals with the problem of the meaningfulness of salvation within the context of secularization, consumerism, and religious pluralism. Part 3 draws on possible resources for a constructive soteriology in Latin American liberation theology, the idea of personal salvation, and the passibility of God.

The various chapters are uneven. G. deals with the liberation theology of Latin America eclectically as though it were a unified whole. I believe he seriously misinterprets this theology by reading it in terms of Marxism instead of as responding and giving voice to the poor as most of its authors maintain. G.'s view that "without Marx, there could be no liberation theology" (239) confuses social analysis and theology. These are inseparable in liberation thought but distinct. And it seems inaccurate to say that piety "tends to occupy a somewhat random and disconnected domain in most liberation writings" (253).

The chapter on religions pluralism surveys a lot of material and is

thus informative, but it does not engage in a focused manner the soteriological and Christological issues implied in interreligious dialogue. And the chapter entitled "Eschatological Salvation" does not really discuss eschatology, though eschatology would be crucial to the role of human freedom in history and the unprogrammed character of the end-time.

Weston Jesuit School of Theology

ROGER HAIGHT, S.J.

THE DYNAMICS OF GRACE: PERSPECTIVES IN THEOLOGICAL ANTHROPOLOGY. By Stephen J. Duffy. *New Theology Studies*. Collegeville: Glazier/Liturgical, 1993. Pp. 398. \$22.95.

Duffy here offers a detailed historical and theological analysis of grace as it shapes our religious understanding of the human person. He first examines the language of grace in the Hebrew and Christian Scriptures and then presents an historical survey with chapters on early Christian anthropologies, Augustine, Aquinas, Luther, Trent, Rahner, and liberation theologies.

On the whole, the treatments of the historical figures and periods are even-handed and thorough. However, in the chapters on the 20th century, Rahner seems to receive scant critique, while liberation theologies are held far more rigorously accountable. In his survey D. attends to a plethora of relevant documents, situating the various positions and counter-positions in their respective ecclesial settings. Although his style is extremely dense and repetitious, theologians who relish careful, scholarly treatments of favorite giants in the history of the theology of grace will enjoy this material. That is the obvious strength of the volume.

Nevertheless, one wonders whether there is indeed a need for another book on grace. After an appropriate, post-Vatican II hiatus, there have been many treatments of this topic. Since 1973 books have appeared in English from Juan Segundo, Cornelius Ernst, Roger Haight, Leonardo Boff, Brian McDermott, Peter Phan, J. Carpenter, and Elizabeth Dreyer, as well as an earlier work by D. himself. (One must also note the many volumes on the theology of Karl Rahner which inevitably have grace at their center.) With the exception of his own previous work, D. does not reference or engage in dialogue with any of these authors apart from footnotes on Boff, Segundo, and Carpenter.

However, my primary question about this book has to do with method. Good theology requires both careful historical work and thoughtful analysis of the present situation. D. posits, but does not argue for, a contemporary concept of the human person that is quite negative. More attention to social analysis at the outset of the book

would have documented D.'s assessment and revealed how he planned to use the tradition as a remedy.

The Prologue acknowledges that D.'s approach does not attend to social history, to many Protestant thinkers, process thought, or feminist theology. Nor does he help us understand how our tradition on grace can help us relate creatively to other world religions. Of course no author should be expected to cover every aspect of a topic in one volume, but if the aim of the New Theology Series is to renew theology and the Church today, it does seem appropriate to ask for more specific, analytical grounding in present experience. E.g., are not psychological insights into the human person germane to Christian anthropology? And if not, why not?

At the outset, D. states that "the theology of grace is, perhaps, out of favor in a day when dogmatics is not in fashion. The rhetoric, language, and symbols of grace, indeed the experience that begets them, are foreign to many" (11). These judgments call out for elaboration. Is either statement true? Does the second statement follow from the first? Indeed what might the latter mean, given the surveys and media coverage that reveal what some call a modern-day spiritual revolution—however one might evaluate it?

It is only in his criticism of "liberation theologies" and in the Epilogue that D.'s preoccupations become clear. He is worried that when liberation theologies advocate the liberation of freedom they forget that freedom is also the ground of sin. "Augustine and Luther remain our teachers" (377). Further, D. is concerned about "post-Enlightenment anthropologies" that are characterized by the subject's freedom, autonomy, and capacity for self-making as actor, creator, and author. But he seems to emphasize only the excesses of autonomy and freedom, thereby placing them in competition with the grace of God rather than in harmony with it.

Because D.'s method is not adequately grounded in the concrete complexities of contemporary human experience, and because he does not argue against *specific* "liberation" and "liberal" anthropologies, he ends up refuting a "straw man" argument that unconvincingly pits grace against no-grace. What audience does D. have in mind when he says, "The Christian tradition conveys the strong conviction that the transcendent goal of human destiny and the depth of human sin doom all efforts to fulfill any capacity for self-constitution to futility in the absence of God's grace" (387). Is it Christian/Catholic believers who D. thinks are trying to create themselves without reference to the grace of God? Is it non-believers for whom grace (and therefore Christian tradition) is not a meaningful category?

D. is rightly concerned to make the theology of grace critical, rele-

vant, and important in a secular society that values matter, nature, freedom, self-actualization, and self-disposition. But he undermines this agenda by his lack of social analysis and by the vagueness of his argument with "post-Enlightenment anthropologies." Thus he argues that we need to become more aware of our fragility so that we will become more aware of our need for grace (388). But given the violence, chaos, and ecological disasters around the globe, are we not aware of our fragility to the point of paralysis, and isn't it *this* experience that should be addressed by a theology of grace? Surely a convincing theological anthropology presupposes careful and convincing analysis of the "signs of the times."

Washington Theological Union

ELIZABETH A. DREYER

THE BODY OF GOD: AN ECOLOGICAL THEOLOGY. By Sallie McFague. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. vii + 274.

Starting from her conviction that the critical moral issue of our day is ecological, "whether humanity and other species will live and how well we will live" (9), McFague undertakes an imaginative conversation between postmodern science and Christian theology of the Reformation trajectory. Her "conversation" joins voices from postmodern science, Christian theology, and feminist epistemology to support her "wager" that the metaphor of the universe as God's body is a hermeneutical construct for a more moral, meaning a more "responsible," way of life for the human species.

While M.'s method is dialectical, her aim is both practical and ethical: given the picture of reality coming to us from postmodern science's common creation story, what suggestions emerge about "the relation of God to the world and what we should do and how we should act in the light of it?" (77).

The book evidences M.'s feminist-based conviction that all knowledge, scientific and theological, is situated and embodied, and is inescapably influenced by some political agendas. She argues that scientific claims about "objectivity" and theological claims about "truth" manifest their own biases and are themselves in need of mutual correction.

If M.'s adoption of the common creation story is, as she believes, a credible picture of reality (and she concedes it is *a* picture of postmodern science, not *the* picture), it calls for radicalizing central theological doctrines. According to the common creation story, the universe and planet earth are products of a common origin dating back some 15 billion years. From this unified beginning of matter and energy incomprehensibly diverse and complex forms of being, all intricately

interrelated and interdependent, have evolved. "Nature," defined as the substratum of matter/energy which comprise everything, becomes in this model the corrective focus for theology as distinct from its preoccupation with "history" as the primary locus of God's revelation. Since creation's evolutionary process is toward greater diversity, arising as it does from chance mutations and random adaptations to local environments, all of life is understood to have both intrinsic value in itself and instrumental value in its interdependent relationship to the rest of creation. Intimately involved in this view of creation as continuing process is unavoidable suffering and pain, along with startling innovation and creativity.

A few examples illustrate the import for an ecological theology. "God" is understood as a continuing creator rather than an external architect, and God's relation to creation is radically sacramental; God is present in *all* of creation. Because humanity is the only species capable of knowing the common creation story, our role is one of responsible partnership for its well-being, understood to mean the well-being of the entire planet, not merely the human species.

Embracing a Teilhardian panentheistic interpretation of the Incarnation, M. argues that God, knowable to us only analogically and metaphorically, is seen *in* the creation; all bodies are "intimations" of God, but remain nonetheless "backside" views of divine glory, since face-to-face knowledge of God is inaccessible. The ethical import of this claim lies in M.'s embrace of a spirit theology, namely that if God is "the empowering, continuing breath of life throughout its billions of years of history and in each and every entity and life-form on every star and planet, then it is in the *differences* that we see the glory of God" (155).

The Body of God's important contribution lies in the dialectical theology of creation which is its centerpiece and central achievement. Rejecting natural theologies for a theology of nature, one which takes seriously contemporary views of cosmic reality, the book provides a solid foundation for expanding ethical obligation beyond the anthropocentric to the cosmo-centric. One wishes M. had developed in more detail the ethical piece of her work, especially since ethical questions are the book's starting point and central focus. After all, competing claims among humans have vexed ethicists for centuries and M.'s work rightly complicates our moral obligations by including claims arising from other species. However, this is not to diminish the power of M.'s project. True to her call for collegial theology, fine-tuning the ethical implications of her work becomes an invitation to the rest of us.

THE MORAL TRADITION OF AMERICAN CONSTITUTIONALISM: A THEOLOGICAL INTERPRETATION. By H. Jefferson Powell. Durham, N.C.: Duke University, 1993. Pp. ix + 296. \$39.

A professor of law and divinity at Duke, Powell argues that the history of American constitutional interpretation is most appropriately analyzed as a moral tradition within the conceptual framework of Alasdair MacIntyre's tradition theory. The fundamental purpose of his argument is theological in nature: heavily influenced by Stanley Hauerwas and John Howard Yoder, P. aims to speak the truth about constitutionalism to members of the Christian community, thus enabling them to live more faithfully in American society.

P. contends that the American constitutional tradition is presently suffering from an epistemological crisis precipitated by two Supreme Court decisions: *Eisenstadt v. Baird* (declaring unconstitutional a state law prohibiting the distribution of contraceptives to unmarried persons), and *Roe v. Wade* (recognizing a constitutional right to abortion). These decisions signaled a resurgence of a jurisprudence of "substantive due process," in which the justices appear to measure the constitutionality of a given statute by their own moral and political commitments rather than by the text and tradition of the Constitution itself. Substantive due process undermines the goods internal to the constitutional tradition, since the Court appears to be subverting our democratic process by usurping the policy-making role of the legislature. After surveying the response of leading academic constitutional theorists to this crisis, P. expresses his grave doubts that American constitutionalism will survive intact.

P.'s detailed attempt to recast American constitutional history in MacIntyrean terms is engrossing and in many respects compelling. However, his account does not address several key questions regarding the proper application of MacIntyre's theory to the American legal and political context. E.g., how broadly or narrowly should the "tradition" at issue be defined? Perhaps too dependent upon the subject-matter divisions adopted by American law schools, P. simply assumes that "the history of American constitutional interpretation" constitutes the proper scope for his analysis. Yet the federal judiciary, the primary institution upon which P. focuses, operates in a far broader context of federal law, which includes but is not limited to constitutional questions.

The scope with which a tradition is defined may affect one's assessment of the nature and severity of any epistemological crisis that it suffers. While P. believes that *Eisenstadt* and *Roe* have precipitated a mortal crisis, the situation may not appear so grave to one inclined to define the relevant tradition in terms of federal law as a whole. To such

a person, the continued intellectual vigor of the arguments conducted every day in U.S. district and appellate courts might be a sign that the resurgence of substantive due process has not been lethal to the federal legal tradition viewed in its entirety.

Even more intriguing than P.'s constitutional analysis is the theological perspective animating it, which is explicitly addressed only in the last, brief chapter of the book. Unfortunately, P.'s development of his own theological position, as well as that of his perceived opponents, remains quite sketchy. P. stands firm in his rejection of "Constantinianism," a term which he never fully defines but uses to encompass and dismiss in short order thinkers ranging from Reinhold Niebuhr to John Noonan. Furthermore, he offers no explanation of how the elements of his own "anti-Constantinian" position relate to the MacIntyrean analysis comprising the bulk of the book.

It is not clear, e.g., how several of P.'s theologically based judgments depend upon his prior account of the rise and fall of the American constitutional tradition. P. urges Christians to reject the dangerous falsehood of a Christian constitutionalism. At the same time, he argues that Christian commitments strategically converge to support a general judicial deference to majoritarian decision making, along with a limited role for judicial activism designed to protect the voices of discrete and insular minorities and insure just and efficient governmental procedures.

Would his advice to Christians be any different if constitutionalism had not failed? One suspects not, given P.'s acknowledgement that a tradition may surmount an epistemological crisis by less than admirable means. As he observes, constitutionalism survived the crisis brought on by slavery not by developing greater intellectual and moral virtue, but "by a gentlemen's agreement to inter and forget slavery, and otherwise to continue constitutional discussion as if *Dred Scott* and the Civil war never happened" (132).

In addition, a crucial element of P.'s theological framework stands in need of an extensive justification that is not supplied by his MacIntyrean analysis. His fundamental theological claim is that constitutionalism functions as "one of the most seductive masks worn by state violence" (47). This controversial thesis entails an eradication of the difference between judicial authority, governmental power, and state violence that simply does not follow from his account of American constitutional history. It will leave P.'s readers, impressed by the force of his mind even as they are frustrated by his book's theological loose ends, eagerly clamoring for a sequel.

AGAINST ETHICS: CONTRIBUTIONS TO A POETICS OF OBLIGATION WITH CONSTANT REFERENCE TO DECONSTRUCTION. By John D. Caputo. Bloomington: Indiana University, 1993. Pp. viii + 292. \$35; \$17.50.

Against Ethics is beautifully written, clever, learned, thought-provoking, and even inspiring. However, it is also a puzzling book, a puzzlement which begins on the level of authorship. Who is the author and what authority does he/she claim? These may seem like strange questions in a book review, but everything about the book invites us to ask them. The name John D. Caputo appears on the cover and on the title page, and a brief biographical sketch at the end identifies this John D. Caputo with the David R. Cook Professor of Philosophy at Villanova University and with the author of books on Aquinas and Eckhart, mysticism and hermeneutics, phenomenology and deconstructionism. Yet the models for this book are works like *Fear and Trembling, Either/Or*, and *The Concluding Unscientific Postscript*, attributed now to Soren Kierkegaard, but with Johannes de Silentio and Johannes Climacus on the title pages. Like Silentio and Climacus, the author of *Against Ethics* presents himself as no expert in the subject-matter, as incapable of metaphysics and ethics, indeed as at best a poet without theory and as more often a mere supplementary clerk. Nonetheless, he/she is a poet or clerk who can range from the Greeks and the Bible to Derrida and Lyotard, who can make sport with several foreign languages and who produces thirty-nine pages of dense and sober endnotes frequently referring the reader to the abundant books and articles of . . . John D. Caputo. This author makes no bones about the modeling and even adopts the Kierkegaardian strategy of incorporating the letters and essays of personages with names like Johanna de Silentio, Magdellena de la Cruz, and Felix Sineculpa. This mix of voices demands the question of author(ity) and leads us to wonder if the David R. Cook Professor of Philosophy has not played the ultimate trick of using his own name as a rhetorical ploy.

Mixing so many voices creates difficulty in laying out a set of theses for the book and in doing battle with them directly. *Against Ethics* is "against ethics" in the sense that the dominant author (let us call him/her "C.") foreswears any effort to construct an overarching ethical system in the manner of Aristotle, Aquinas, Kant, Mill, or Rawls, or even to invoke an originary ethics in the manner of Heidegger. He does not argue that such ethics is impossible or harmful, but that he is simply not up to it and that the others have not been altogether successful in their own undertakings. Nonetheless, this book "against ethics" is a prose poem about obligation(s), obligation(s) which come(s) to him as supposedly to Abraham without theoretical background, framework, or foundation. C. captures this sense of obligation in two

phrases: the German *es gibt* (literally *it gives*, properly *there is*) and the French *me voici* (literally *see me here*, properly *here I am*). Obligations happen to him and he must respond. The normal setting for these events is the presentation and the recognition of the suffering other on the margins of his experience. In talking about obligations thus, he challenges not just the great ethical theorists, but also those who (like Nietzsche at times and Deleuze interpreting and reappropriating Nietzsche) deconstruct obligations and who re-envisage life aesthetically without obligations or constraints. Among contemporaries, he finds sustenance mainly in the work of Derrida and Levinas. The penultimate lines "(in place of) a conclusion" tell almost the whole story: "Obligations happen; they happen because they happen; they happen for the while that they happen. Then the cosmos draws a few more breaths, the little star grows cold, and the animals made of flesh have to die."

I too think that life with its opportunities and its obligations has conceptual no less than practical priority over theory, but I believe that C. is both too abstract and too particular in talking about the opportunities and the obligations. Although he insists much on proper names, he tends to speak about groups and types (oppressed women, AIDS victims, Jews and Palestinians) rather than about the people he encounters personally (named family members, students, colleagues, neighbors). Surely it is these people of the everyday who constitute the real field of opportunity and obligation for him as for me. To pass them over for discourse about the big challenges of society is to be too abstract. He is too particular in that he does not sufficiently acknowledge the role of theory in deciding how to sort out our opportunities and obligations and what to do about them. We may reject all ethics until now, but we won't be able to do without ethics. Of course, these complaints have a place among the many voices of this book: C. can discourse against ethics while entertaining ethics just as he can assume obligation while entertaining nihilism and maintain resolve while entertaining despair. This feat of literary ventriloquism is the pleasure and the frustration of the book.

La Salle University, Philadelphia

MICHAEL J. KERLIN

CONTEXT AND TEXT: METHOD IN LITURGICAL THEOLOGY. By Kevin Irwin. Collegeville: Pueblo/Liturgical, 1994. Pp. xvii + 388. \$24.95.

Long committed to the study of method in liturgical theology, Irwin produces here a fine contribution to the work of scholars, pastors, and liturgical practitioners alike. His focus is the liturgy of the Church as it is enacted by living assemblies, and his primary concern is to explore

all that is involved when a universal liturgical form becomes at the same time the specific prayer of a specific liturgical community. The book is indeed an essay in methodology, and is rich with endnotes to guide the student and satisfy the scholar's taste. But it is by no means dry and abstract. Each chapter is laced with concrete examples to illustrate his point and to feed the pastoral imagination of those who serve the Church at prayer. The book may thus be read on many levels.

Liturgical theology is a relatively recent term. It embraces reflection on the liturgy as an event of faith, hope, and love; reflection *from* the liturgy, where the Church's prayer is taken to be a theological source; and reflection *on the implications* for those who worship of their participation in the liturgical act. In I.'s view, "the study of liturgy is essentially a *pastoral theology* in the sense that it concerns reflection on enacted liturgical rites which shape the faith and life of believing participants" (xi). Two poles of liturgical theology are the law of prayer and the law of belief, classically held together in the adage of Prosper of Aquitaine: *ut legem credendi lex statuit supplicandi*. I. explores the relation between the two, and adds a third, the law of living or *lex vivendi*. Faith, prayer, and human life form the triad of his concern.

The book is structured around two interrelated theses. The first is that *context is text*, by which I. insists that the liturgy which theology reflects upon is never simply the words of liturgical texts, but rather the full ritual event and, to the extent one can get a handle on it, all that is perceived in the event by the participants. He brings this thesis to bear on the proclamation of word, the use of liturgical symbols, the prayer of euchology, and the full range of liturgical arts. His second thesis is that *text shapes context*, in which he explores the effects which worship might have on the lives of those who participate. For the scholar, this means including doxology, the act of praise, as an essential contour of all theological reflection. For the ecumenist, this means recognition that far more is held in common by what the churches do in worship, and what they say *by what they do*, than by what they might otherwise say in doctrinal formulation. And for the full range of believers, it means the transformation of human life into that mode of living and being which the liturgy both envisions and enacts.

In the course of plying his two central theses, I. unearths a wealth of insight into the act of worship and its various constituent parts. Of particular note under *context is text* is his chapter on the Word, which is a must-read for anyone concerned with proclamation and preaching. Scripture is placed within the act of worship, and is a constituent part of worship. While a specific pericope may well have its various biblical contexts (in the text, in the life of the Church, in Jesus' own life), its

primary context in the act of worship is the act of worship itself. Its aim is not to inform but to transform; proclamation of the Word is a saving event. Of particular note under *text shapes context* is the section on spirituality, where the simple truth of liturgical action—that we become what we do—is exposed brilliantly.

I. takes the reader on a journey into liturgical theology, and at the same time acts as a careful guide. Almost to a fault he tells us what he is going to do before he does it, and what he has done after he has done it. This is at worst a very minor stylistic defect. He states his method clearly, applies his method well, illustrates it abundantly and, with lavish cross-reference to the works of other scholars, he invites the reader into a whole world of liturgical discourse. In the process he gives that world new shape and rich new insights into itself.

Weston Jesuit School of Theology

PETER E. FINK, S.J.

READING, WRITING, AND RITUALIZING: RITUAL IN FICTIVE, LITURGICAL, AND PUBLIC PLACES. By Ronald L. Grimes. Washington: Pastoral Press, 1993. Pp. xviii + 312. \$19.95.

This latest set of essays by Ronald Grimes, one of the foremost figures in the diverse conversation known as ritual studies, addresses an appropriately diverse set of topics. Some of its lectures, articles, and experiments in story-telling have been published before, others have not. While the overall internal coherence of the book is minimal, G.'s approach to ritual—primarily as a type of touchstone for engaging a full spectrum of interrelated issues having to do with embodiment, culture, and interpretation—is sufficiently clear that the range of the essays is, for the most part, intriguing rather than frustrating.

In a first section, on ritual in liturgical contexts, three essays address various aspects of “reinventing” ritual. G. questions long-standing assumptions about authentic ritual in order to argue for the authenticity of modern ritual invention. Yet he never quite explains *why* we came to have such erroneous assumptions or such new styles of ritual improvisation. Indeed, despite the cultural scope and methodological concerns of his inquiries, G. tends to leave little room for the complicating historical dimension of these phenomena.

The last essay in this section is a playful yet strongly critical challenge to those concerned with “reasserting” the lost “authority” and “integrity” of older models of ritual in the Roman Catholic Church. Using a clever contrast between two liturgical postures, erectitude and supinity, G. lays open the subtle forms of sexism and authoritarianism

that have entered into some of these arguments. His uncompromising commitment to gender equality in ritualization effectively illuminates how gendered ritual practice—and discourse—remains.

In a second section, on ritual in the public sphere, G. explores sacred geography, museums, and masking. Despite many valid points, at times his questioning of the politically dominant perspective seems somewhat at odds with his own construction of an authorial voice by means of the embracing categories of ritual and ritualization. While a charmingly candid tone (“Conceptually, I have almost painted myself into a corner” [92]) clearly intends to undermine traditional authorial conventions, G.’s insistence on ritual as a type of metacategory, no matter how stretched, pulled, emptied, and filled again, evokes the same response from this reader that G. has to examples of the dominant perspective on holy geography—“it is still a search for overarching oneness and unity” (82). The totalizing perspective afforded by this use of “ritual” is akin to those practices of political domination that G. critiques, and if we do not recognize this, we risk misunderstanding something very important about how and why such practices operate.

In a related critique of how museums “commoditize” and “singularize” the sacred objects of other cultures, it is a bit disconcerting to have G. assume that our museums are so full of the artifacts of the cultural “other,” missing perhaps the full dynamics of “othering” that also frame a Greek statute or a 17th-century snuff box. It is also disconcerting that as a response to the political hegemony of the museum he recommends a bit of private “contemplative ritualizing” in front of the singularized commodities on display (97). One wonders, in all honesty, if this would have been acceptable to the Native Americans seeking the return of ancestral bones from the Smithsonian.

In “the fictive” as a ritual context, G. explores the imaginative construction and narrative appeal to rituals in a number of literary works. Although these are “sanctuaries in which one can fruitfully reimagine ritual” (131), they also suggest that recourse to fictive rituals is linked to a very self-conscious alienation from more “primary processes” of ritual engagement—particularly, he idiosyncratically notes, among men who are authors, holders of liturgical authority, or university professors.

As with his earlier works, G. approaches a spectrum of issues with candor, humor, and insight. When he disappoints, he seems to manipulate the materials into too-easy oppositions or too-convenient foils—good guys and bad guys, authentic cultural practices and hegemonic cultural practices. It may be that he underestimates his own ability to rise to the full complexity of the cultural or intercultural situation and

pull out of the full human tangle a bit of insight that we can fruitfully take so much further down the road.

Santa Clara University

CATHERINE BELL

ENCOUNTERING THE WEST: CHRISTIANITY AND THE GLOBAL CULTURAL PROCESS: THE AFRICAN DIMENSION. By Lamin Sanneh. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994. Pp. 286. \$24.95.

Sanneh here moves forward with a thesis begun in his earlier works about the impact of translation of the Bible into local languages upon the cultures of Africa. By translating the Bible, missionaries actually strengthened local cultures rather than weakened them, as many histories of mission in Africa have asserted. Moreover, by engaging in the translation process, missionaries themselves are often won over to become defenders of local culture. S. goes on to claim that mother-tongue translations allowed local people to form their own interpretation of the Scriptures against what might have been proposed by the missionaries. The very fact that the Christian Scriptures could be translated (as opposed to the situation in Islam, where the Holy Qur'an can only be understood and interpreted from the original Arabic text) conferred a dignity on local cultures that formed in turn the basis for the reassertion of African cultures in nationalist and independence movements.

These are intriguing hypotheses that S. extends even further in this book, proposing that such vernacularization is intrinsic to the nature of Christianity, and that current global processes should be read through this lens. Rather than incessantly apologizing for the modern missionary movement as an unremitting act of colonial imperialism, Christians and others should focus upon how missionaries supported and promoted local cultures to make them players in the new global realities. This includes looking at cultures as moral forces rather than merely as material artifacts. Understanding that is part of the key to developing a post-Christendom, post-territorial vision of Christianity that will be both vigorous and spiritual enough to counter Muslim and fundamentalist resurgences.

This bold, revisionist view has many attractive elements. It comes at a time when missionary activity is being reassessed to provide a more variegated picture of just what went on. Likewise, concepts of culture of a less positivist nature are also being presented, and new proposals to understand the globalization process the world is undergoing are being put forward. Unfortunately, S. does not interact with these lit-

eratures and ends up contributing far less than might have been the case by his mode of argument.

Chapter 1 tries to trace the Enlightenment's influence on the concept of culture now prevalent. The argument does not follow any chronology, and it completely neglects the influence of Vico and Herder on modern anthropological theory. A plethora of quotations are adduced that tend to ornament rather than advance the arguments, since one wonders whether S. agrees with the general positions of the authors cited. And too many quotations are lifted from other authors' citations.

The historical arguments in the subsequent chapters prompt similar misgivings in the reader. S. tries to set out how vernacularization and a consequent commitment to pluralism have been part of Christianity from the beginning. He provides an intriguing rereading of Acts and Paul. Inexplicably he cites as historical evidence to support his argument (135–36) a piece of fiction that is a parable about the present state of seminary education cast as a newly discovered letter from Early Christianity. Minor figures such as Otfried von Weissenberg are perhaps too slender a thread upon which to string the argument for vernacularization in Carolingian Europe. One gets the feeling that the historical account, because of occasional errors of fact and heavy reliance on secondary sources, is less than compelling.

And so S.'s intriguing and important claims end up being less than substantiated by this book. The argumentation is too loose and isolated from larger discussions (except for that generated by Lesslie Newbigin, which is alluded to frequently). S. is a great admirer of Matthew Arnold, especially his *Culture and Anarchy*. The style of presentation of this book is strongly reminiscent of that famous essay. But that whimsical, sometimes jocular touch cannot carry the argument S. proposes.

Catholic Theological Union, Chicago

ROBERT J. SCHREITER

BUDDHIST SPIRITUALITY 1: INDIAN, SOUTHEAST ASIAN, TIBETAN, EARLY CHINESE. Edited by Takeuchi Yoshinori. World Spirituality. New York: Crossroad, 1993. Pp. xxvi + 428. \$49.50.

The first of two projected volumes on the Buddhist tradition. This volume covers the birth of the religion in sixth-century B.C.E. India up to Medieval Buddhism in China and Tibet. The perhaps-better-known traditions of Ch'an/Zen Buddhism, East Asian Pure Land piety, as well as modern developments, are left for the second volume. Many of the contributors are top names in their respective areas of specialization. Despite some unevenness of coverage, the volume on the whole succeeds in its goal of comprehensiveness and admirably avoids the sense of fragmentation that multi-authored efforts often fall prey to.

The title promises an inquiry into Buddhist spirituality. Many of the articles, however, necessarily engage in an historical exposition of Buddhism in geographical context. These articles, such as Winston King's "Theravāda in Southeast Asia," the chapter on "Theravāda Lands," Alex Wayman's "The Diamond Vehicle," and Whalen Lai's "The Three Jewels in China" are excellent and thorough introductions to the institutional history of Buddhism. Those seeking general knowledge of Buddhism in these lands will find much of value here.

Given Buddhism's 2500 years of history and its tremendous diversity of locale and practices, generalization on any aspect of the tradition must be approached with caution. The editors, however, boldly and rightfully assert an underlying integrity to Buddhism despite its many manifestations. The fragmentation of Buddhist studies into multiple planes of specialization requires periodic attempts to bring a holistic vision to the field. The focus on spirituality—or rather the Buddhist concern with *bhāvanā* ("cultivation")—offers a viable center for such a unifying vision. Although the history of religions often resists attempts to essentialize, the pursuit of spiritual liberation through self-cultivation remains the fundamental grounding of all Buddhist practice.

How successful is the volume in conveying an overarching sense of Buddhist spirituality? In an attempt to specify the search, the Preface identifies the practice of meditation and the doctrine of emptiness as primary foci. While admitting that the choices are a concession to the bias of current Western interests, they are defensible ones, considering the way Buddhism has repeatedly chosen to present itself. One cannot argue with the depiction of meditation as the central practice of Buddhism, nor with the focus on the doctrine of emptiness as a unifying perspective of the Mahāyāna traditions. The plausibility of these foci is foiled only by the degree of technicality with which many of the articles proceed.

An adequate discussion of meditation and emptiness cannot dispense with doctrinal explanations. Hence many of the entries are strung out in a chronological survey of the major schools of Buddhist philosophical thought. Sakurabe Hajime's "Abhidharma," the chapters on the Mahāyāna sūtras and philosophical schools, that on the philosophical schools of China, and Paul Swanson's "The Spirituality of Emptiness in Early Chinese Buddhism" all offer detailed discussions that are of pointed interest to the specialist, but which may prove somewhat inaccessible to the newcomer. The last article, "The Spirituality of Emptiness in Early Chinese Buddhism," is unfortunately quite abstruse. Paul Griffiths' "Indian Buddhist Meditation" is a systematic, if somewhat technical, elaboration of the meditational path

that marries well with King's more incidental discussion in "Theravada in Southeast Asia".

Despite the challenges of the volume to the non-specialist, a sense of the thrust of the Buddhist spiritual tradition is possible for those who know where to look. The Introduction conveys this sense when it asserts that Buddhist spirituality "is not a mere interior reality or a mere escape from ordinary existence" (xiii). The uniquely Buddhist technique of "insight" meditation (*vipāssana*), which strives for direct mental penetration of reality as such, and the assertion of emptiness (*śūnyatā*), which denies the distinction between sacred and profane, confront us with a truly profound and challenging vision of religiosity. One might utilize the Weberian language of "this-worldly" spirituality, although it must be amended to convey not only the sense of the possibility of meaningful action within the world, but the more radical assertion that spiritual liberation is actually "of this world" and makes no reference to anything beyond it.

Robert Thurman's "Monasticism and Civilization" gives one of the best overarching visions of Buddhist spirituality in its discussion of the evolution of the Buddhist monastic ideal. Sketching the monastic tradition as a movement from a focus on the individual self to an increasingly-immanent perspective that embraces the external world, Thurman concludes, "Buddhahood must be world-transformative as well as self-transformative, since the ultimate self-fulfillment is an experience of selflessness which is simultaneously interconnectedness with all living beings" (123). Such morsels of insight repay the efforts the book demands of the non-specialist. The insights are not systematically offered, but must be culled by the discerning reader. The Buddhist path of *bhāvanā* only occasionally claims to be an easy way; otherwise, the effort must be its own reward.

Georgetown University

FRANCISCA CHO BANTLY

SHORTER NOTICES

ISAIAH 1-39. By Christopher R. Seitz, Interpretation Commentary for Teaching and Preaching. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. xvi + 271. \$22.

While Isaiah 1-39 is commonly acknowledged to contain material from various historical periods, Seitz argues that the "conscious editorial efforts" of the "shapers of the Isaiah

tradition" organized it so as to present the prophet and his message to posterity. Working with the final form of the text, S.'s canonical assessment presumes a "reciprocal relationship" in which the shape and theological message of chapters 1-39 is integrally tied to the entire book of Isaiah. Hence, S. justifies a study which focuses solely on the first 39

chapters. Isaiah 1–39 looks toward the events of 587. Isaiah 40–66 looks back.

This valuable commentary sets forth a threefold “organic development” of Isaiah 1–39 and offers a theology. S. challenges popular assessments of Isaiah 1–12 as an arbitrary collection of early traditions. He argues for literary and theological coherence: Israel’s tendency to become like the nations (Is 1–4) leads to judgment (Is 5); then the account of Assyria as God’s agent of chastisement (Is 5–12) concludes with a glimpse into the future (Is 11–12).

S. sketches that future in a theological exposition of the oracles of the nations (Is 13–27) when God’s deeds are known to all. Historical references and literary arrangement indicate an overriding concern with Babylon’s destiny as instrument of judgment and symbol of national arrogance. Though Isaiah 24–27 are often regarded as extraneous apocalyptic tradition, S.’s interpretation incorporates them convincingly. They speak of the fall of Jerusalem and of the final judgment of Babylon. Finally, the exalted portrait of Zion and king in Isaiah 28–39 foreshadow a period after the destruction. Here S.’s incorporation of Hezekiah’s questionable actions (Is 39:1–2) is labored and not persuasive.

One may wonder to what extent coherence in Isaiah 1–39 is a product of S.’s interpretation rather than of the text. Still, the motivated reader is rewarded and challenged by this provocative alternative to traditional exegesis focusing on individual Isaian passages.

GINA HENS-PIAZZA

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

OLD TESTAMENT ETHICS: A PARADIGMATIC APPROACH. By Waldemar Janzen. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1994. Pp. 240. \$20.

This is a work addressed explicitly

to Christians who take the Old Testament as authoritative. Its goal, in the context of a synchronic method and “a version of canonical criticism,” is a model for the OT’s ethical message whose starting point is the genre of “story.” In this way Janzen endeavors to remain close to the OT’s own voice, insofar as “story” is for him the literary genre “most important in the transmission of theological-ethical instruction in ancient Israel itself” (2).

Accordingly, J.’s first chapter takes up five stories that in his view model right ethical behavior. Each offers a “paradigm” of exemplary behavior: Genesis 13, a “familial model”; Numbers 25, a “priestly model”; 1 Samuel 25, a “wisdom model”; 1 Samuel 24, a “royal model”; and 1 Kings 21, a “prophetic model.” Yet these stories do not represent five different paradigms for J., but one “comprehensive ethic,” in which the familial paradigm, the end and primary ideal of all OT ethics, subordinates all others to itself. Subsequent chapters develop the content of this family paradigm; the basis of OT law in the familial paradigm; the familial focus of all the paradigms; and finally the continuation of the OT’s familial ethics in the NT’s kingdom “paradigm.”

Regrettably, a synchronic method given to wide-ranging generalization, loose argumentation, and an inability to move beyond a somewhat superficial view of narrative’s role in ethics—all undermine J.’s effort to develop a narrative-based OT ethics. For J., ethics is essentially a “quest for right behavior” (110), and the narrative focus only thinly disguises his real motivation: a foundation not based upon “natural law, reason, or some other [foreign] soil” (71).

ROBERT A. DI VITO

Loyola University, Chicago

POSTSTRUCTURALISM AND THE NEW TESTAMENT: DERRIDA AND FOUCAULT AT THE FOOT OF THE CROSS. By

Stephen D. Moore. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1994. Pp. 143. \$12.

Moore has written an accessible introduction to poststructuralism as exemplified by Derrida and Foucault and as relevant to the New Testament. Two parts follow a general introduction to the broader field. The first briefly presents relevant aspects of Derrida's thought, applies these insights to a NT text (the Samaritan Woman), and then argues that preference be given to a Lacanian view of the incomplete, fragmented text/self over those more integrated understandings sought for and found by narrative and reader-response critics such as Gail O'Day and Alan Culpepper. Part 2 presents Foucault (as structuralist and poststructuralist) and offers a Foucauldian investigation of Paul's account of the cross. The concluding chapter is followed by an annotated bibliography and a short glossary; there are indexes to subjects/authors and to ancient literature.

M. is an extremely erudite (although self-conscious) performer who really does address the questions about poststructuralism that are relevant to NT scholars. As in his earlier books, M.'s exegesis frequently raises intriguing questions and possibilities. The chapter about the cross is less than satisfying, however. Admittedly, M. does show a parallel between aspects of Pauline theology and Foucault's developmental theory of how punishment has been understood in history (viz., from ritual torture to internal policing), and nobody would disagree that the Church has much to answer for. Yet when M. has done with blood, guts, and social control, one is left wondering where he locates the good news. Indeed, M.'s radical refusal to go where NT authors would lead their readers might tempt some of his own readers to reply in kind. This book does, however, offer students of the NT an overview of post-

structuralism and a demonstration that it can sometimes contribute to their overall enterprise, especially by defamiliarizing the familiar.

PATRICIA M. McDONALD, S.H.C.J.
*Mount Saint Mary's College
 Emmitsburg, Md.*

THE CLASH OF GODS: A REINTERPRETATION OF EARLY CHRISTIAN ART. By Thomas F. Mathews. Princeton: Princeton University, 1993. Pp. x + 223. \$35.

What makes this such a stimulating book is that, true to its subtitle, it undertakes the daring task of reinterpreting early Christian art, at least from the beginning of the fourth century, and in so doing challenges longstanding and canonized assumptions. Mathews contends that the theory which claims the images of Christ in post-Constantinian antiquity were modeled on the image of the Roman (or Byzantine) emperor is a false one.

M. shows how this theory, which was formulated by eminent scholars in the 1930s and which he refers to as "the emperor mystique," came to be accepted without demur and thus provided the perspective from which virtually every ancient image of Christ, and much related material as well, has subsequently been viewed. Hence, e.g., Christ's entry into Jerusalem (to which M. devotes one of his six chapters) is almost unquestioningly taken to be inspired by an imperial *adventus* ceremony. M.'s own thesis turns "the emperor mystique" on its head. He insists that neither the post-Constantinian Christ's clothing nor his coiffure nor his chair nor his bodily shape, nor anything else of his portrayed by ancient artists, may be construed as imperial; on the contrary, these things are often cast in such a way as to imply a criticism of the imperial style.

Instead, Christ's attributes are traceable to the pagan gods, and the wholesale borrowings from pagan im-

agery, as made by early Christian artists, represent a studied attempt to unseat those gods and to replace them with Christ in the awareness and affections of the populace. M. includes a provocative chapter on the manifold and even contradictory ways in which Christ was depicted in successful pursuit of this end. Numerous illustrations round out a well-argued and well-written monograph that should stir up discussion, in both art and theology, for some time to come.

BONIFACE RAMSEY, O.P.

Immaculate Conception Seminary
N.J.

ATHANASIUS AND CONSTANTIUS: THEOLOGY AND POLITICS IN THE CONSTANTINIAN EMPIRE. By Timothy D. Barnes. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University, 1993. Pp. xx + 343. \$49.95.

The aim of this very scholarly book is clearly stated at the outset: a thorough investigation into what Barnes claims are deliberate misrepresentations by Athanasius of ecclesiastical history and politics in the fourth century.

B. starts with the presumption that Athanasius consistently misrepresents central facts about his career and about his relations with other bishops and with the Roman emperors, Constantius in particular. Athanasius could not have so resolutely confronted the dominant powers of church and state, according to B., had he not been so conspicuously lacking in the virtues of meekness and humility. The gist of this book is that he was also lacking in honesty. To prove his thesis B. examines in minute detail the ups and downs of Athanasius' long pontificate in Alexandria, his conflicts with other hierarchs, with the emperor, his victories and defeats, and he seeks to demonstrate that the recollections of Athanasius are not always in accord with the historical facts.

This is professedly a historical study and does not enter into discussion of the theological problems at issue. B.'s presentation of his case is exhaustive and, I think, persuasive. The body of the book takes up 183 pages and is followed by eleven appendices on special topics. The documentation, in a list of abbreviations and in a large number of endnotes, is thorough, although there is no bibliography as such. There is a chronology of Athanasius's career and writings, and the book concludes with four indices. Anyone interested in Athanasius, or in the fourth century for that matter, must take cognizance of this book.

GEORGE T. DENNIS, S.J.

Catholic University of America

THE EARLY MEDIEVAL BIBLE: ITS PRODUCTION, DECORATION, AND USE. Edited by Richard Gameson. Cambridge Studies in Palaeography and Codicology. New York: Cambridge University, 1994. Pp. xiv + 242. \$64.95.

When David Ganz announces that "the dimensions of Carolingian sheep and their price await study" (55), the reader knows that this is a very specialized volume. The title presents some problems, including a very generous definition of "Early Medieval," which here extends to the 13th century, and a restricted definition of "use" which largely excludes its theological use. The title of the series provides a better guide to the contents since most of the essays deal with technical problems of bible production. In that limited sphere, one finds some very helpful pieces, including Patrick McGurk's "The Oldest Manuscripts of the Latin Bible" and essays by Ganz and Rosamond McKitterick on Carolingian bible production, especially since these authors go beyond the most technical questions to the effects these bibles had on medieval church history.

Recent research in scriptural stud-

ies has made scholars aware of the importance of canonicity in understanding the biblical text; the contributors to this volume emphasize the significance of the physical production of bibles to the medieval understanding (or misunderstanding) of the text. Examples abound, and some are funny, such as the illustrator who mixed up the two Old Testament arks and portrayed Moses and Aaron building a ship (194). For the most part the contributors establish links between the bibles and local churches and occasionally to national churches, but they provide few links between the text and theology. Lesley Smith's fine closing essay, "The Theology of the Twelfth- and Thirteenth-century Bible," emphasizes the influence of Augustine's *De doctrina christiana* upon medieval exegetes and manages to draw parallels between modes of producing and understanding the text, but one wishes Smith had pursued the topic at some length.

Indeed, many *TS* readers wishing to know the early medieval theology of the Bible will find themselves returning to a basic text by a frequent *TS* contributor, *The Bible in the Early Middle Ages* by the late Robert E. McNally, S.J.

JOSEPH F. KELLY
John Carroll University

LOVE AND MARRIAGE IN THE MIDDLE AGES. By Georges Duby. Translated from the French by Jane Dunnett. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1994. Pp. x + 231. \$37.50.

Duby, a world-renowned historian, has put into print 16 pieces from 1967–86 on French feudalism. Most of the chapters set forth a series of comments, given at conferences, on work in progress rather than well-argued and documented theses. The book offers several potential lodes of gemstones (which D. calls a "few superficial impressions"), and it invites

further digging and much more polishing.

D. notes that marriage and family are fundamental, yet evolving institutions. Early medieval, nonpeasant families allowed only their eldest son to marry, and they sent their other sons off to become either clergy or knights, so that family property would not be divided and thereby diminished. Thus one role of the princely courts was to channel the energy of these unmarried "youth." Later, because of a growing economy based less on land and more on money, greater numbers of men could marry. Jousts of the courtyards were then paralleled or even replaced by matching of wits in the schools. Individuals began to locate themselves less through horizontal patronage relationships and more through vertical family trees. D. argues, not very convincingly, that during this period women were mainly child-bearers whom men feared and despised.

Somewhat surprisingly, D. says that the twelfth-century renaissance relativized Christianity and completely reversed the understanding of human history. Human beings now sought perfection in the future, not in a past ideal; they claimed the ability to cooperate with God in making a better world. Whereas the sacred and secular had been in opposition, the two became interfused during this period.

Of interest mainly to specialists and graduate students, this book reminds us how much work remains to be done if we are to understand the feudal period better.

EDWARD COLLINS VACEK, S.J.
Weston Jesuit School of Theology

GRACE AND GRATITUDE: THE EUCHARISTIC THEOLOGY OF JOHN CALVIN. By B. A. Gerrish. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. xii + 210. \$13.95.

This is a fine scholarly study which, in addition to considering Calvin's views on the Lord's Supper, argues that "the theme of grace and gratitude, presented in the words and actions of the Eucharist, shapes his entire theology and makes it from beginning to end a eucharistic theology."

Gerrish shows that for Calvin, "the holy banquet" of the Lord's Supper is "simply the liturgical enactment of the theme of grace and gratitude that lies at the heart of Calvin's theology." Ingratitude to God who is the "fountain of all good" is the "shame of Adam" which has led humanity away from "grateful piety" to the generous Father. Only through the "true Son," Jesus Christ, is access to God as the "fountain of good" opened. As Christ saves, reconciles, and justifies, he "takes us for his brothers and sisters." The faith relationship engenders love, and through faith believers enter into a "mystical union" with Christ.

Christ is present in the Church through preaching. The Word is a "sacramental word" in conveying gospel promises for forgiveness of sins. Christ as the Word nourishes believers who are fed through spiritual food and drink. The Lord's Supper is a "visible word." For Calvin, the Supper is a gift; the gift is Jesus Christ himself; the gift is given with the signs; the gift is given by the Holy Spirit; the gift is given to all who communicate; and the gift is to be received by faith. In the Supper, Calvin affirmed the mystical presence of Christ who by grace feeds his people with himself—to which his people respond in gratitude.

This work enriches Calvin studies and is full of ecumenical promise.

DONALD K. MCKIM

Memphis Theological Seminary

THE SERMON NOTEBOOK OF SAMUEL PARRIS, 1689–1694. By Samuel Par-

ris. Edited by James F. Cooper, Jr., and Kenneth P. Minkema. Publications of the Colonial Society of Massachusetts. Charlottesville: University of Virginia, 1994. Pp. xii + 335. \$50.

In 1689 Samuel Parris became the minister of Salem Village, Massachusetts and began to preach the sermon series that, for the first time, is published complete in this volume. These were sermons delivered each Sunday he administered the Lord's Supper, which happened every five or six weeks, or, during one phase of his ministry, each month. Parris is famous because, in early 1692, several young girls in his community began to manifest the symptoms of "diabolical possession." Out of their accusations arose the event known as Salem witchcraft (or, more properly, witch-hunt, since no actual witches were involved). One interpretive tradition, originating in the 19th century and reasserted by historians in our own, assigns Parris a considerable role in causing the witch-hunt.

What do we learn from the sermon series that supports or challenges this interpretation? The editors vote for support, on the basis of some references to the devil and to Christ as an embattled figure surrounded by enemies, presumably a surrogate for Parris himself in his troubled dealings with the townspeople. Yet my reading leads me to the opposite conclusion. After an initial awkwardness (this was Parris' first stint as a minister), the sermon series, which Parris organized around the passion, crucifixion, and resurrection of Christ, emphasizes the basic stuff of evangelicalism, including much on Christ's "love" for the redeemed. True, he preached two fervid sermons in the midst of the witch-hunt on the theme of the devil(s) among us, but he was surely echoing a wider imaginative response to events of the time.

The editing and annotation are

well handled, with one or two exceptions, as in failing to expand the handwritten abbreviation "I" for "yes."

DAVID D. HALL
Harvard Divinity School

JOHN HENRY NEWMAN: SERMONS 1824–1843, 2: SERMONS ON BIBLICAL HISTORY, SIN AND JUSTIFICATION, THE CHRISTIAN WAY OF LIFE, AND BIBLICAL THEOLOGY. By John Henry Newman. Edited by Vincent Ferrer Blehl, S.J. Oxford: Clarendon, 1993. Pp. xx + 472. \$90.

This volume is the second in a series of five that will make available the previously unpublished sermons of Newman from 1824–43. In his own life he published 217 of the sermons that he wrote during this period. The manuscripts of another 246 sermons written during these years survive in the Archives of the Birmingham Oratory in Birmingham, England, of which 58 appear in this new volume. Insofar as these sermons offer a unique glimpse into Newman's Anglican years and the subsequent revision of them documents the growth of his spiritual theology, their publication is timely for the celebration in 1995 of the 150th anniversary of his conversion to Catholicism (1845).

Following Newman's own classification as a rough basis, the sermons are arranged thematically rather than chronologically. On biblical history, we read some of his early sermons as Vicar of St. Mary's Oxford; on sin and justification, we can trace the development of his thought leading to his published *Lectures on Justification* (1838); on practical questions dealing with the Christian way of the life, we encounter his Evangelical views at St. Clement's (1824–26); and on biblical theology, we engage his views about the Jewish religion. In the editorial comments there is an appropriate explanation of the historical situations of the sermons and of

the theological development within them, e.g. on the influence of the Church Fathers on his thought.

Here scholars will find a remarkable resource with insightful perspectives for a deeper understanding of the many well-known sermons that Newman published himself. Also, there is a chronological list of all his sermons for this period. And the three indexes (of persons, of subjects, and of sermons) add to the quality of such an excellent collection.

GERARD MAGILL
Saint Louis University

PARADISE WITHIN REACH: MONASTICISM AND PILGRIMAGE ON MOUNT ATHOS. By René Gothóni. Helsinki: Helsinki University, 1993. Pp. 183.

This brief work adds to the steady stream of books recently published on topics associated with Mount Athos. Gothóni, the distinguished Senior Lecturer of Comparative Religion at the University of Helsinki, has already published a study on Buddhist monasticism in Sri Lanka, and proposes here a similar exploration of Athonite monasticism. His disciplinary perspective is that of comparative religion. Particular attention is paid to the components and rituals within the monastic life of Athos and to its examination "from a mythological perspective, since biblical myths form the very basis of monastic life" (7). Weaving together these two concerns, the phenomenological and the mythical, constitutes the unique contribution of this work. This study is enhanced through G.'s extensive personal experience.

G. introduces his study with the governmental structure of Athos, its history, and its present monastic population. A subsequent chapter outlines the underlying "mythology" of Athos: the fall of Adam, the disordered life in the world, Christ as the channel of salvation, and the monastic order of Mount Athos, the Garden

of the Virgin. Descriptive chapters are given to those who come to "the Holy Mountain" to remain as monks, the life lived in the monasteries, pilgrims and the religious experience of pilgrimage. The volume concludes with the religious vision of the Athonites.

In an easy and readable style, G. has written an appreciative work that in many ways is both interesting and highly informative. Reservations are suggested especially on two scores: little attention is given to contemplative prayer, and G.'s reading of patristic, monastic theology is oversimplified and inadequate. But G. is not attempting to do theology. Recognizing these limitations, readers should find his work valuable and engaging.

MICHAEL J. BUCKLEY, S.J.
Boston College

MISSIONARY CONQUEST: THE GOSPEL AND NATIVE AMERICAN CULTURAL GENOCIDE. By George E. Tinker. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. ix + 182.

Tinker describes himself as part Osage, part Cherokee, and part Lutheran. In this pungent volume he charges five centuries of Christian missionaries with complicity in the cultural genocide of American Indians. The "lie" (94) underlying the "remarkable uniformity in motivations, strategies, and results of the missionary endeavor" (vii) has been that Indian values and cultures are inferior to those of Christians. T.'s task is to overturn that message. Examining the enterprises of four famous missionaries—John Eliot of 17th-century New England, Junipero Serra of 18th-century California, Pierre Jean De Smet and Benjamin Whipple in the 19th-century American West—he argues that the missionaries, working in unison with governmental and economic forces, were agents of an Indian holocaust.

T.'s findings are not new. Histori-

ans and other scholars have criticized missionary enterprises among the Indians on precisely these grounds. Eliot and Serra in particular have undergone intense scrutiny and condemnation for their service to English and Spanish hegemonies, and for the dire effects of their missions on the Indians who lived and died under their control. At the same time, T. is careful to aver that the missionaries did not have "conscious intent" to destroy Indian peoples; nor was the effect of their activities "genocide" (as defined by the United Nations Genocide Convention in 1948), but rather something "more subtle," called "cultural genocide" (5). Hence, his book must be read not as a diatribe, but rather as a revision of missionary hagiography, with a nuanced notion of causation. Of Serra, e.g., he says: "The building blocks for the Franciscan mission system in California included a variety of explicit and implicit principles that contributed to the missionaries' complicity in the cultural genocide of native peoples" (65).

Finally, however, as revisionism, T.'s book seeks not to understand missionaries, but rather to blame them. As such it is not incorrect, but it is surely incomplete.

CHRISTOPHER VECSEY
Colgate University, Hamilton, N.Y.

AFRICAN THEOLOGY: INCULTURATION AND LIBERATION. By Emmanuel Martey, Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. xii + 176. \$18.95.

This work by a Ghanaian Presbyterian provides a detailed survey of the ongoing debate between the two major theological approaches employed in Africa—inculturation and liberation. Martey proposes a solution to the impasse in a dialectical encounter of the approaches leading to convergence. The relevance of the topic for Christianity in Africa cannot be exaggerated.

M. first presents the historical

background of the two traditions and sketches a brief definition of the African reality. He then teases out the differences between the two approaches. "African Theology," emphasizing inculturation, uses an anthropological approach and has been the mainstream in the former English colonies. "Black Theology," emphasizing liberation, has been influenced by African-American and Latin American theologians and uses a more political-sociological framework. While the latter has taken root in some Francophone countries, the graphic testing ground has been South Africa. Finally M. offers a critical assessment of both models and presents his own synthesis in which Christology is the point of convergence. The text is most informative where it unpacks the debate with American Black Theology and the tightrope position of theologian John Mbiti. The discussion on the meaning of Jesus in the African context is insightful. "Africans cannot simply imitate Peter" (Mark 8). They have to say "who Christ Jesus is from an African perspective." Such questioning leads to a creative ancestor-liberator understanding of Jesus. In a few cases ideology outdistances theology. E.g., M. seems to accept without question Mosala's view that the Bible "is a ruling class document and represents the ideological and political interests of the ruling class."

Recent events in Africa support the need for some form of M.'s convergence theory which embodies both anthropological dignity as well as political and economic liberation. This work is a goldmine of bibliographical sources in a field little known to American scholars.

JOHN P. HOGAN
Peace Corps, Washington

EVANGELIZING THE CULTURE OF MODERNITY. By Hervé Carrier, S.J. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1993. Pp. vii + 168. \$18.95.

"Inculturation" is a relatively new term, but Christianity, beginning with the Incarnation and earliest missionary efforts, has always evangelized cultures. Vatican II explicitly recognized this, and inculturation has been a theme of magisterial teaching since. Carrier's work draws this teaching together and, in perhaps the book's most insightful chapter, reflects on the emerging awareness of the relationship between human rights and the rights of cultures. C. suggests a positive role for the Church in the protection of cultural integrity. Authentic evangelization-inculturation does not destroy but fulfills cultures.

The essential relationship between evangelization and inculturation requires a discernment of cultures rooted in critical analysis. C.'s specific concern is the culture of modernity. Chapters 2 and 7 contain his necessarily broad analysis of modernity, an analysis which generally reflects the present pope's assessment of the West.

In all C. emphasizes the teaching of Vatican II and of recent popes. While asserting a reciprocity between the Church and cultures, this work treats the Church's approach toward cultures. Indeed C. sometimes gives the impression that the Church universal holds the gospel free of cultural-historical influences and ready to insert into properly analyzed cultures. Chapter 3 on inculturation is mostly a collection of papal statements. A section on the African experience of inculturation is made up of papal statements to Africans. In an interesting use of Orwell's 1984, C. proposes that the Church can defend human dignity against the totalitarian tendencies of modernity but never considers the possible influence of totalitarianism on ecclesial polity. C.'s suggestion that the still-troubled relationship between Church and modernity be understood through criti-

cal cultural analysis is most promising. His book is a helpful first step which needs to be complemented by analysis of the Church and by a more realistic awareness of reciprocity.

JACK A. BONSOR
St. Patrick's Seminary, Calif.

ATHENS AND JERUSALEM: THE ROLE OF PHILOSOPHY IN THEOLOGY. By Jack A. Bonsor. New York: Paulist, 1993. Pp. v + 183. \$11.95.

Bonsor offers a brief sketch of various philosophical approaches employed over two millennia to support ecclesial efforts at the formation of doctrine and the reflection of theologians. This book is designed primarily to enhance a seminarian's grasp of the philosophical issues relevant to many theological questions, especially the meaning and truth of claims about such things as the nature of Christ, the way the sacraments work, the divine origin of the Church, creation in the light of modern science, and the social teachings of the gospel.

While developing the philosophical background for the contributions of Augustine and Aquinas, B. raises some important questions about fruitful ways to understand the interplay of faith and reason by contrasting the doctrine of Vatican I's *Dei Filius* with the understanding of historical consciousness widely accepted today. The unavoidable need to be selective in so short a book, however, results in some imbalances. E.g., the stress on the Neoplatonism in Augustine's view of the Eucharist leaves no room for the vast historical influence Augustine's vision of the city of God had on ecclesiology and eschatology, or the impact his distinctive views on grace and freedom exercised on moral theology. Likewise, in discussing Christology and the doctrine of God, B.'s admirable desire to explain Rahner's Kantian retrieval of Thomistic anthropology as a prior moment in the

modern appropriation of freedom as the central facet of human nature squeezes out the Cappadocian uses of philosophical distinctions crucial for Christology.

The second half of the volume studies the influence of modern philosophers like Hegel and Marx on theologians like Pannenberg and Boff. B.'s explanations are generally clear. And his bibliographical selections make some very practical suggestions for further reading in areas of interest that may have opened up for the theology student brought into the perennial conversation between Athens and Jerusalem.

JOSEPH W. KOTERSKI, S.J.
Fordham University

RETRIEVING FUNDAMENTAL THEOLOGY: THE THREE STYLES OF CONTEMPORARY THEOLOGY. By Gerald O'Collins, S.J. New York: Paulist, 1993. Pp. 225. \$14.95.

Convinced that the teaching of Vatican II has not been adequately heard and received from the perspective of fundamental theology, O'Collins intends to retrieve and interpret more satisfactorily the council's teaching that is significant for that discipline.

The core chapters of the book focus on the central theme of fundamental theology, God's self-revelation. Three chapters retrieve the Council's teaching on revelation: the genesis and content of *Dei Verbum*, the "other" conciliar documents on revelation, and saving revelation to all peoples. This retrieval of conciliar teaching prepares the ground for more systematic analyses concerning revelation as past and present, the nature of revelation as God's symbolic communication, our experience of this symbolic self-communication, and love as the key content of Christian revelation.

To set the stage for these core chapters of the book, O. clarifies the three "styles" of postconciliar theology, centered respectively on academic study,

social action, and worship; the nature of theology in the perspective of Vatican II; and the specific identity, content, and tasks of fundamental theology. The core chapters are supplemented by an exploration of the relationship between revelation and the Bible, and the contribution of *Dei Verbum* to contemporary exegesis. The book closes with a comprehensive bibliography on *Dei Verbum*.

In general O. has successfully fulfilled his intention. The work has been evaluated as "possibly the best available introduction to the teaching of Vatican II on revelation, theology, and the use of Scripture" (A. Dulles). Reservations are in order concerning O.'s thesis that Vatican II affirmed the presence of elements of revelation in nonbiblical religions. The Council, it appears, left this question open.

JOSEPH J. SMITH, S.J.

Loyola School of Theology, Manila

WHO DO YOU SAY I AM?: INTRODUCTION TO CHRISTOLOGY. By Jacques Dupuis, S.J. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994. Pp. vi + 194. \$16.95.

Dupuis offers a contemporary Roman Catholic Christology heavily influenced by Rahner and Kasper. It is governed by five hermeneutical principles: dialectic tension, totality, plurality, historical continuity, and integration. The volume traces the development of Christology from the apostolic kerygma to the present. The Christological model is the Chalcedonian one, with special attention given to the human psychology of Jesus and to his universal saving importance. The book is written with a sure hand, even if some use of Scripture can be disputed (e.g. D's conviction that the hymn in Philippians 2 obviously refers to preexistence). D. deals with the councils in a concise but impressive synthesis. Open to feminist and liberationist perspectives, the volume is more general in its orientation.

D. affirms an integral human psychological center of self-awareness and freedom in Christ, with the divine I of the eternal Word providing the ontological self who speaks and acts in and through the human psychological center. "The ego of the human consciousness of Jesus is not the human nature in intentional self-possession (Galtier); it is the divine, ontological person" (116-17). In his discussion of Christ and the world religions, D. defends a constitutive and inclusive Christology. He believes that Christian theology must be theocentric qua Christocentric, and vice-versa, because God is the one who constituted Jesus Christ the definitive and universal mediator of salvation (162).

The chief shortcomings are the sparse reference to Protestant theologians until the final chapter, the out-of-date character of a number of the references, and failure to refer to available English translations. Nevertheless, D.'s book can be confidently recommended to college teachers of Christology and to serious readers of theology who desire a brief but reliable contemporary synthesis in this area.

BRIAN O. McDERMOTT, S.J.

Weston Jesuit School of Theology

CHURCH AND ORGANIZATION: A SOCIOLOGICAL AND THEOLOGICAL INQUIRY. By Joseph F. McCann. Scranton, PA.: University of Scranton, 1993. Pp. 258. \$39.50.

Deftly synthesizing an enormous amount of organizational theory, McCann hopes to provide for both scholars and the interested nonspecialist a model of organizations coherent in itself and helpful for the analysis of religious organizations and churches. His achievement should be measured by the reach of his ambition. Although clearly written, with concise chapter summaries, the nonspecialist will find the work most useful as a

summary of a long and complex academic literature. This reviewer, e.g., found the treatment of the history of church-unity models admirably clear, concise and coherent. M. himself characterizes his synthesis of models of organizations (three explanatory variables, four structures, and eight "regimens" characterizing the task capabilities of the resulting structures) as a Rubik Cube. Still, he intends that the theoretically dizzying number of possible permutations make pastoral contributions, and to that end offers numerous concrete examples.

As M. employs them, either as "tests" of his multilevel model or as illustrations, the reader will find useful summaries of, e.g., church-sect theory, the Notre Dame study of parish life, the Hartford Congregational Religious Presence Research, and various reductionist approaches to ecumenism. M. himself is never reductionistic and frequently draws the reader's attention to the inherent tensions in church organization and the empirical inadequacies in the models he synthesizes. One result of his honesty is that frequently his dense analytics seem to labor toward common-sense conclusions. M. inclines towards a sociologically grounded appreciation of an open but formal polity represented by a hierarchical minister so that the tension between the pastoral needs of the local church and the Church's ministry of service to the whole world is maintained as challenge and as constitutive of religious identity.

JAMES R. KELLY
Fordham University

THE FAITH OF A PHYSICIST: REFLECTIONS OF A BOTTOM-UP THINKER. By John Polkinghorne. The Gifford Lectures for 1993-4. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University, 1994. Pp. 211. \$24.95.

As usual the Gifford lectures have

provided material for a noteworthy volume on natural theology. In this case Polkinghorne, an elementary particle physicist and Anglican priest, has interpreted the subject to include the religious experience of his Christian faith. To the data of this experience he applies the critical thinking of a scientist using those intellectual tools appropriate to the mode of experience involved. It is this start from the data that causes him to characterize himself as a "bottom-up" thinker. The title is apt as the book offers reflections in a somewhat informal, verbal style.

The framework around which P.'s exposition is built is the Nicene Creed, seen as a summary of the Church's experience. This enables him to focus on Christian issues and to propose an interpretation of Christian belief revised by 20th-century insights but in continuity with the developing doctrine of the Church.

Within this framework P. manages to deal with a vast amount of material in a clear if necessarily brief fashion. He touches on everything from the mind-body problem to epistemology, philosophical models for God, creation, Christology, eschatology, and world religions. Along the way he proposes a "dual-aspect monism" that sees the one stuff of the world occurring in two states, material and mental. The unpredictability of much of the macroscopic world allows his conjecture that events may be influenced in a downward-causality fashion by divine providence. He advocates a temporal theism which allows for a relational aspect in the divine essence.

P. has exposed us to the challenging worldview of a modern scientist and Christian clergyman. Use of the male pronoun for God and the abundant references to secondary sources detract from the presentation.

JERRY D. KORSMEYER
McMurray, Pennsylvania

TOWARD A THEOLOGY OF NATURE: ESSAYS ON SCIENCE AND RELIGION. By Wolfhart Pannenberg. Edited by Ted Peters. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. x + 166. \$20.

If God creates the universe, then the natural world cannot be understood apart from the idea of God. This implies that science would be adequate to nature only if it included exploration into God. Apart from such a widening of its field of investigation science cannot pretend to understand the universe. At the same time, theology should see itself as a scientific discipline whose "hypotheses" are no less subject to verificational testing (although of a unique kind) than are scientific ideas. This is the bold approach Pannenberg takes to the increasingly important subject of science and theology. He rejects the two-language approach which allows theologians and scientists to assume that each side is working in a neatly separable domain of inquiry. A facile divorce of science from theology unnecessarily impoverishes both disciplines.

It is especially the contingency and historicity of nature that invite us to bring science and theology together. Over the past three centuries science has attempted to exorcise all contingency from nature. Focusing only on abstract *laws*, science misled us into thinking that nature may actually be determined. And since theology could not embrace the idea of a necessary universe, because this would render hope and prayer meaningless, it understandably withdrew from serious encounter with science.

Meanwhile, science itself can no longer suppress the contingent, irreversible, historical character of natural occurrences. Evolution, geology, quantum theory, and big-bang physics are forcing science to look beneath its abstractions to the actual indeterminate flow of nature. (In this connec-

tion P. could have drawn more explicitly upon the new science of chaos which has also dramatically exposed the contingency of physical reality). For P., God's faithfulness, and not the dead necessity of a deterministic past, is what makes nature reliable and scientifically predictable.

In this rich collection of previously published essays P.'s most significant contribution is his highlighting the historical and contingent character of nature and its consonance with the theological doctrines of creation, Spirit, and eschatology. Ted Peters has done us a great service in bringing forth this important collection; his introduction to P.'s essays is especially recommended.

JOHN F. HAUGHT
Georgetown University

CHRISTIAN THEOLOGY AFTER THE SHOAH. By James F. Moore. Studies in the Shoah. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1993. Pp. xiii + 189. \$44.50

Moore dialogues with Wiesel, Eckardt, and Fackenheim. He proposes that teaching about the passion and resurrection might be less triumphal if believers acknowledged the tragedy of the Shoah and the new historical context of Jewish-Christian dialogue, rejecting a "theology of contempt" for Judaism. He calls his method "Christian midrash," affirming its dependence on Hebrew Scripture, and allowing for plurality and ambiguity of meanings from echoes with prophetic literature. Borrowing images from Wiesel's *The Night*, M. evokes the emotion of disciples at the empty tomb. The absence of the body of Jesus is like the loss of the gravesites and bodies of those who perished in the camps.

M.'s organizes his volume under four categories which describe authentic Christian responses during the Shoah. These are also paradigms

for discipleship today: the bystander (Peter); the collaborator (Judas); resistance to the kingdom of night (the trial and execution of Jesus, Lamb of God); and rescue (reunion through post-resurrection meals). Resurrection is not the consummation of history, for no finality of the kingdom of God has been achieved. It is both process and paradigm for understanding "God's final word on suffering and evil" (100). Nor is this event the start of a new Christian mission that separates Christian from Jew (129). M. rejects Pannenberg and relies on A. Roy Eckardt. This tension between Christianity's doctrinal history in defining Jesus' resurrection and the alternative thematic reading by M. is the most critical tension in this volume.

Price aside, the book is accessible as a "reserve shelf" text for college undergraduates or seminars, a challenge to Paulinists, and helpful for preachers who struggle during Lent for a fresh approach. M. does not offer new historical data or redactional comparisons, but rather a reflective, intertextual reading.

MARIE-ELOISE ROSENBLATT, R.S.M.
Santa Clara University

FACING THE ABUSING GOD: A THEOLOGY OF PROTEST. By David R. Blumenthal. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1993. Pp. vii + 318. \$23.

Blumenthal here interprets four psalms of rage and healing (Psalms 128, 44, 109, and 27) in light of the experiences of survivors of child abuse and the holocaust. The theological challenge posed by the injustice of such suffering by the innocent is highlighted by this correlation. The reality of evil renders trust in the providence of God problematic. B. explores with relentless determination and extraordinary courage the terrifying religious implications of these historical and biblical "texts" about an abusive God.

His is a biblical theology that promises not to find a solution by simply erasing the problem. He is swift in his rebuttal of efforts to vindicate God by talk of sin. They fail because "there is no such thing as righteous war against infants and small children" (209), and "even if the victim has wronged the abuser, the abuser's reaction is out of all proportion to the wrong committed" (248).

B. is more open to calls to abandon a patriarchal "logic of sovereignty," which exaggerates God's power over nature and history and inclines us to misunderstand the psalmists' rage. Though sympathetic, B. is not finally convinced by this hermeneutical strategy. Like all interpretations based upon a "canon within a canon," this effort to depatriarchalize the scriptural vision of providence ultimately privileges certain texts over others. Those others (in this case psalms of anger and rage) are then interpreted through the former. To persons wrestling with the problems posed precisely by these unprivileged texts, such selectivity appears, if not evasive, then too conveniently corroborative of preconceived solutions.

Instead B. argues that we must accept the diversity and contradiction found both in the Bible and in life. He argues that "God is abusive but not always" (247). He concludes that the ancient tradition of confronting God in faithful defiance must be revived. Room must be made for suspicion and protest among contemporary conceptions of authentic religious affection and prayer.

PATRICIA BEATTIE JUNG
*Wartburg Theological Seminary
Dubuque*

GETTING AND SPENDING: A PRIMER IN ECONOMIC MORALITY. By Peter L. Danner. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. Pp. xiii + 224. \$15.95.

This book is dedicated "to a gener-

ation of students of economics as a behavioral science" by a veteran of 40 years of classroom teaching at Marquette University. Marquette is one of a relatively few places where the acoustics are good for what Danner wants to say about blending moral and economic principles of action to find a reliable guide for business conduct.

D.'s Thomistic philosophy demonstrates high regard for the principle of finality; his Catholic theological outlook focuses on the relevance of the triple concupiscence (1 John 2:16) to economic behavior; and his familiarity with the history of economic thought enables him to match up moral principles with the classical and neoclassical principles of economics on his way to a final chapter that discusses "the economoral synergy."

What must surely be his own personal achievement is also his pedagogical objective in writing this book: "the actual weaving into a consistent and operational attitude of mind" of the facts of economic life and the values and virtues that make a full and truly good life possible. The title, *Getting and Spending*, is a classic description of a person's total economic effort. M.'s goal is to help others find the deeper significance of that effort.

WILLIAM J. BYRON, S.J.
Georgetown University

CAPITAL AND THE KINGDOM: THEOLOGICAL ETHICS AND ECONOMIC ORDER. By Timothy J. Gorringer. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994. Pp. xii + 200. \$18.95.

Gorringer constructs a coherent ethical foundation with which to address modern economic issues and assumptions about work, leisure, unions, profit, etc. Economic assumptions must receive ethical analysis, because it is these assumptions which today "govern the present practices of death" (x).

The fundamental ethical imperative is biblically rooted in the injunction of the Deuteronomist (Deut 30:19) to choose life. For G. the central value in a life ethic is human equality. A commitment to human equality is the bulwark against the three perennial evils cited by St. Paul (according to G.) and present today: distinctions drawn on the basis of race, class, and patriarchy. G. believes that economic ethics demands attention to participation and equality of outcome in economics. E.g., because society has equal need for a variety of services according to the analogy of a functioning body, "inequality of pay is profoundly irrational" (111). The traditional theory of a "just wage" is today an unjustifiable compromise.

Contemporary market economic theory and practice are understood from the perspective of a Marxist social science. In the market we have the exercise of power for the benefit of a few and for the exploitation of many. Shunning reformist approaches, G. looks for a radical break from contemporary market practices.

Clearly, the book will have much to recommend itself for persons who share G.'s perspective. However, I found the social science unconvincing. Furthermore, economic ethics conceived as concerned exclusively with equality is a reduction. Finally, the concluding chapter seems hastily written, with a serious misparaphrase of Michael Novak (163) and with curious practical proposals which include the legal abolition of all interest and the implementation of the land tax of Henry George (167).

RICHARD C. BAYER
Fordham University

THE ROLE OF THE MODERN CORPORATION IN A FREE SOCIETY. By John R. Danley. Notre Dame: University of

Notre Dame, 1994. Pp. xiv + 345. \$39.95.

Danley provides an insightful philosophical analysis and detailed overview of the normative presuppositions that underlie an important social question of modern society: What is the appropriate role of the modern corporation in a free society? He argues that two competing philosophies have dominated this question in the U.S.: the classical liberal position, which views the role of the corporation largely in economic terms, where the firm maximizes shareholder wealth within the political economic framework of property, liberty and contract; and the managerial position (a revisionist form of classical liberalism), which views the role of the corporation as balancing the interests of a wide variety of stakeholders, and not just shareholders.

D. argues that both these positions are inadequate frameworks in addressing a corporation's role in society. He summarizes and adds fresh arguments concerning the inadequacy of the classical rationale for corporate responsibility through economic and moral analysis. His real contribution, however, lies in his critique of the managerial position. D. rightly points to the weak philosophical framework of the managerialist which fails to adjudicate conflicts among various stakeholders.

While D. argues that liberalism, in both its classical and managerial forms, has dominated the discussion of the corporation's role in society, he inadvertently raises the need for other traditions to enter the discussion over a corporation's role in society. He seems to imply that religious traditions would be ineffective in addressing this issue; yet, the U.S. has been informed not only by a liberal tradition but also by a Judeo-Christian tradition, and I believe the Christian social tradition could help

and has helped the discussion immensely.

MICHAEL J. NAUGHTON
University of St. Thomas, St. Paul

PASTORAL CARE AND LIBERATION THEOLOGY. By Stephen Pattison. Cambridge Studies in Ideology and Religion. New York: Cambridge University, 1994. Pp. xiii + 273.

Pattison here weaves together three themes: liberation theology, pastoral care, and the mentally ill. His purpose is to use liberation theology to broaden the foundation and function of pastoral care and then to show what this would mean for the treatment of the mentally ill. His summary of liberation theology is drawn from the literature of Latin American authors rather than any direct involvement with the movement. The survey is clear and accurate and highlights the main emphases of this theological approach.

P. discusses the treatment of the mentally ill in Great Britain by drawing on his own research as well as published studies. It is an incisive and challenging assessment which illustrates well the value of social analysis in liberation theology. Applying the same analysis to the pastoral care of the mentally ill, P. exposes the shortcomings of a psychological model and describes its complicity in the poor treatment of mentally ill patients. He ends the book with a somewhat distracting discussion of how pastoral care has also failed to respond to women.

P. has leveled a telling critique of individual-centered pastoral care, while expressing genuine understanding for the predicament pastoral carers face. Unfortunately he relies almost entirely on Marxist-inspired social analysis and includes very little of the theology of liberation theology. This not only reinforces the mistaken perception that liberation the-

ology is thinly disguised Marxism but it does not provide a theologically appealing or persuasive basis for the type of pastoral care P. rightly espouses.

ROBERT L. KINAST
Center for Theological Reflection
Madeira Beach, Fla.

ECUMENICAL FAITH IN EVANGELICAL PERSPECTIVE. By Gabriel Fackre. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1993. Pp. x + 230. \$18.

This book, Fackre writes, "has a missionary purpose. It aims to demonstrate to ecumenicals what they are missing in evangelicals, and to show evangelicals that ecumenicals have not completely overlooked or failed to engage evangelicals" (viii).

F. places before the reader two types of ecumenists trying to find common ground with each other: "evangelical ecumenicals" and "ecumenical evangelicals." By "evangelicals" F. particularly means what is popularly called "the religious right" or "conservative evangelicalism," including "fundamentalism." F. seeks to demonstrate in this book that a legitimate ecumenical convergence can be made between "ecumenical evangelicals" and the "evangelical ecumenicals," basically the mainline Protestant churches. Much of the book, then, is more religious sociology than analytical theology, as F. sets about to describe the "evangelicals" to show their variety and spectrum.

The substance of the book retains this sense of engagement with theological partners by sociological description. In a section F. calls "Exploring the Boundaries," he identifies four areas of potential ecumenical convergence: the use of Scripture in theology; evangelical catholicity; the role and importance of "narrative theology"; and the place of Israel in Christian faith (particularly on supersessionism). The book ends with

two excellent essays on the particular theological work of the ecumenical evangelical Carl F. H. Henry and the evangelical ecumenical David Tracy.

The book is a good introduction to the topic of ecumenical engagement with conservative evangelical Christians. It is at its best in its description of the evangelical Christians, which is fair and balanced. F. writes to a popular audience; this would make a good classroom textbook. Parish clergy who often have to deal with conservative evangelicals would also find the analysis of great value.

MARK E. CHAPMAN
Chambersburg, Pennsylvania

THE SOUL OF THE AMERICAN UNIVERSITY: FROM PROTESTANT ESTABLISHMENT TO ESTABLISHED NONBELIEF. By George M. Marsden. New York: Oxford University, 1994. pp. xiv + 462. \$35.

Far from being opponents of Christian influence in the university, educational reformers like Dewey, Gilman, and Harper thought of themselves as progenitors of a new religious spirit which transmitted the best of the faith to American culture. Yet their zeal for a "progressive," "universalist" Christianity stripped the faith of its specificity and power, unwittingly creating the conditions that relegated religion to the periphery of intellectual life.

Two tendencies prevailed among them. First, they reduced Christianity to progressive but innocuous values congruent with "good citizenship." Second, they believed it sufficient to say that since they were Christian, whatever their universities did was also Christian. One reformer asserted, "The cause of Christ and the Church is advanced by whatever liberalizes and enriches and enlarges the mind." Ultimately, these assumptions made it more logical for the university to pursue those same

goals without need for explicit reference to Christian particularism. It was not long before "nonsectarian" came to be interpreted to mean "secular."

Marsden pays some attention to other factors that shaped the secular ideal of a university, but his primary and most controversial contributions lie in his analysis of progressive theological assumptions. The account is rich in detail, extremely readable, and well organized. It is by no means

a polemic: M. also demonstrates the role which fundamentalism played in sealing the fate of American universities' Christian identity. The deep ironies which M. exposes deserve more attention and discussion. For this reason, this book is very important reading for anyone concerned with the difficult task of shaping the identity of Catholic colleges and universities in the spirit of Vatican II.

THOMAS M. LANDY, S.J.
Fairfield University

BOOKS RECEIVED

SCRIPTURAL STUDIES

- Beck, N. *Mature Christianity in the 21st Century*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1994. Pp. 372. \$24.95.
- Bellis, A. *Helpmates, Harlots, and Heroes*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1994. Pp. 281. \$20.
- Davies, S. *New Testament Fundamentals*. Rev. ed. Sonoma, Calif.: Polebridge, 1994. Pp. 250. \$17.95.
- A Dictionary of Biblical Tradition in English Literature*. Ed. D. Jeffrey. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1993. Pp. 960. \$80.
- Doorly, W. *Obsession with Justice*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 166. \$12.95.
- Farmer, W. *The Gospel of Jesus*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1994. Pp. 240. \$20.
- Freed, E. *The Apostle Paul, Christian Jew*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1994. Pp. 256. \$49.50; \$32.50.
- Gillingham, S. *The Poems and Psalms of the Hebrew Bible*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1994. Pp. 311. \$45; \$16.95.
- Hoppe, L. *The Synagogues and Churches of Ancient Palestine*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1994. Pp. 145. \$11.95.
- Kelley, P., et al. *A Handbook to Biblical Hebrew*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1994. Pp. 223. \$18.
- Laghi, P., et al. *Chiesa e sacra scrittura*. Rome: Pont. Biblical Inst., 1994. Pp. 60. \$9.
- Lunny, W. *The Jesus Option*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 217. \$12.95.
- Matera, F. *Galatians*. Collegeville: Glazier/Liturgical, 1992. Pp. 252. \$24.95.
- McEvenue, S. *Interpretation and Bible*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1994. Pp. 187. \$12.95.
- Meier, L. *Jacob*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1994. Pp. 110. \$36; \$19.95.
- Meyer, B. *Five Speeches That Changed the World*. Collegeville: Liturgical, 1994. Pp. 139. \$9.95.
- Milavec, A. *Exploring Scriptural Sources*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. \$19.95.
- Nieto, J. *Tiempo de Anuncio*. Taipei: Facultad Theologica S. Roberti Belarmino, 1994. Pp. 341.
- Otto, R. *Coming in the Clouds*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1994. Pp. 293. \$55; \$26.50.
- Powell, E. *The Unfinished Gospel*. Westlake Village, Calif.: Symposium, 1994. Pp. 347. \$23.95.
- Quast, K. *Reading the Corinthian Correspondence*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 225. \$14.95.

Theological Studies

DECEMBER 1994
VOL. 55, NO. 4

*Published by Theological Studies, Inc.
for the Society of Jesus in the United States*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Anonymous Christians: Karl Rahner's Pneuma-Christocentrism and an East-West Dialogue**
Joseph H. Wong, O.S.B.Cam...... 609
- No Amnesty for Sorrow: The Privilege of the Poor in Christian Social Ethics**
William R. O'Neill, S.J...... 638

CURRENT THEOLOGY

- Sacramental Theology: A Review of Literature**
David N. Power, O.M.I., Regis A. Duffy, O.F.M., and Kervin W. Irwin..... 657

NOTE

- The Ordination of Women: Tradition and Meaning**
Dennis M. Ferrara..... 706

QUAESTIO DISPUTATA

- The Ordinary Magisterium's Infallibility**
Germain Grisez and Francis A. Sullivan, S.J...... 720

BOOK REVIEWS

- BROWN, R.:** *The Death of the Messiah 1-2*..... 739
- FITZMYER, J.:** *Romans: A New Translation and Commentary*..... 741
- SMITH, W.:** *What Is Scripture?*..... 744
- MCDONALD, J.:** *Biblical Interpretation and Christian Ethics*..... 746
- MEEKS, W.:** *The Origins of Christian Morality*..... 747
- TIESSEN, T.:** *Irenaeus on the Salvation of the Unevangelized*..... 749
- CRAMER, P.:** *Baptism and Change in the Early Middle Ages*..... 750
- O'CONNELL, R.:** *Soundings in St. Augustine's Imagination*..... 752
- STUDER, B.:** *Gratia Christi—Gratia Dei bei Augustinus von Hippo*..... 754
- PELIKAN, J.:** *Christianity and Classical Culture*..... 756

LAFONT, G.: Histoire théologique de l'église catholique	758
SELLS, M.: Mystical Languages of Unsayng	760
BARTOLI, M.: Clare of Assisi	762
CARNEY, M.: The First Franciscan Woman	762
PETERSON, I.: Clare of Assisi	762
AUER, J.: The Church	764
GRANT, C.: A Salvation Audit	766
DUFFY, S.: The Dynamics of Grace	768
MCFAGUE, S.: The Body of God	770
POWELL, H.: The Moral Tradition of American Constitutionalism	772
CAPUTO, J.: Against Ethics	774
IRWIN, K.: Context and Text	775
GRIMES, R.: Reading, Writing, and Ritualizing	777
SANNEH, L.: Encountering the West	779
Buddhist Spirituality 1 (ed. T. Yoshinori)	780

SHORTER NOTICES

782

SEITZ, C.: Isaiah 1-39	JANZEN, W.: Old Testament Ethics	MOORE, W.: Post-structuralism and the New Testament
BARNES, T.: Athanasius and Constantius	GAMESON, R. (ed.): The Early Medieval Bible	DUBY, G.: Love and Marriage in the Middle Ages
GRACE and Gratitude	PARRIS, S.: The Sermon Notebook of Samuel Parris	NEWMAN, J.: John Henry Newman, Sermons 1824-1843
PARADISE WITHIN REACH	TINKER, G.: Missionary Conquest	MARTEY, E.: African Theology
CARRIER, H.: Evangelizing the Culture of Modernity	BONSOR, J.: Athens and Jerusalem	O'COLLINS, G.: Retrieving Fundamental Theology
DUPUIS, J.: Who Do You Say I Am?	MCCANN, J.: Church and Organization	POLKINGHORNE, J.: The Faith of a Physicist
PANNENBERG, W.: Toward a Theology of Nature	MOORE, J.: Christian Theology after the Shoah	BLUMENTHAL, D.: Facing the Abusing God
DANNER, P.: Getting and Spending	GORRINGE, T.: Capital and the Kingdom	DANLEY, J.: The Role of the Modern Corporation in a Free Society
PATTISON, S.: Pastoral Care and Liberation Theology	FACKRE, G.: Ecumenical Faith in Evangelical Perspective	MARSDEN, G.: The Soul of the American University

BOOKS RECEIVED

799

THEOLOGICAL STUDIES (ISSN 0040-5639) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by Theological Studies, Inc., at Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057. Second class postage paid at Washington, DC and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER, please send address changes to THEOLOGICAL STUDIES, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

YEARLY SUBSCRIPTION 1995: U.S. individual: \$20; U.S. institutional: \$30; foreign individual: \$27 U.S. currency; foreign institutional: \$36 U.S. currency.

RENEWALS AND NEW SUBSCRIPTIONS should be accompanied by a remittance in U.S. funds and sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA.

CHANGES OF ADDRESS, claims, and all correspondence dealing with subscriptions should be sent to Theological Studies, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331, USA; phone (800) 352-2210 or (717) 632-3535.

MANUSCRIPTS (normally the ribbon copy or a computer printout of letter-perfect quality and a legible duplicate), TOGETHER WITH RETURN POSTAGE, should be sent to Editor, Theological Studies, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02167, USA. Author should certify that the article is not being submitted simultaneously to another journal.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW should be sent to Book Review Editor, Theological Studies, Inc., Georgetown University, 37 and O. Sts., N.W., Washington, DC 20057, USA.

BACK ISSUES are available from Theological Studies, Inc., Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057, USA. Single copies prepaid: \$6 in U.S.; \$8 outside U.S.

FOR REPRINTS AND EARLIER ISSUES IN MICROFORM (35mm. and fiche), contact University Microfilms, Inc., 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1356. The full text of THEOLOGICAL STUDIES is also available in the electronic versions of the *Humanities Index*. Fax copies may be obtained through the UnCover Company, 3801 E. Florida, Suite 200, Denver, CO 80210.

This issue begins with ARTICLES on a Rahnerian contribution to East-West dialogue and on the privileged place of the poor in Christian ethics, moves on, under the rubric of CURRENT THEOLOGY, to an extensive review of recent literature in sacramental theology, adds a NOTE on the question of the ordination of women, and concludes, under the QUAESTIO DISPUTATA rubric, with discussion on infallibility. The issue as a whole thus exemplifies a range of features which will be utilized more frequently in the future than they have been in the past.

Anonymous Christians: Karl Rahner's Pneuma-Christocentrism and an East-West Dialogue points out a shift in the later Rahner from the "anonymous Christian" theory to a broader trinitarian perspective and argues for a recognition of the rich potential for East-West dialogue which is latent in Rahner's thinking. JOSEPH H. WONG, O.S.B. CAM., S.T.D. from Rome's Gregorian University, is a research associate of the Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History at the University of San Francisco and director of the Camaldolese Institute for East-West Dialogue, Big Sur, California. Known for his research and writing on Karl Rahner, he is currently devoting his efforts toward the development of a Christian-Taoist dialogue on mysticism.

No Amnesty for Sorrow: The Privilege of the Poor in Christian Social Ethics offers a comparative assessment of the moral and epistemic privilege of the poor from the perspective of philosophical and theological ethics. WILLIAM R. O'NEILL, S.J. has his Ph.D. from Yale University and is assistant professor of social ethics at the Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley. His *The Ethics of Our Climate: Hermeneutics and Ethical Theory* has just appeared (Georgetown University, 1994). His current research focuses on an interpretation of public reason and the common good.

Sacramental Theology: A Review of Literature (in the major European languages since 1980) concentrates on general sacramental theology, especially on the methods employed. After a general introduction, its several authors take up the following topics: the (post-Rahnerian) turn to the subject, liberation theologies, postmodern approaches, feminist theology, and African and Asian contributions. DAVID N. POWER, O.M.I., S.T.D. from the Pontificio Istituto Liturgico, San Anselmo, Rome, and Shakespeare Caldwell-Duval Professor of Systematic Theology at The Catholic University of America, is the author of *The Eucharistic Mystery: Revitalizing the Tradition* (Crossroad, 1992). He is currently working on the liturgical theology of dying and burial. REGIS A. DUFFY, O.F.M., S.T.D. from the Institut Catholique in Paris, is associate professor of theology at the University of Notre Dame. Author of several of the chapters on the sacraments in the two-volume Fiorenza-Galvin *Systematic Theology* (Fortress, 1991),

he is currently working on a book on faith and sacrament in the American culture. KEVIN W. IRWIN, also an S.T.D. from San Anselmo, is director of the liturgical-studies program and professor in the theology department of The Catholic University of America. He is the author of *Context and Text: Method in Liturgical Theology* (Liturgical Press, 1994) and contributor/coeditor of *Preserving the Creation: Environmental Theology and Ethics* (Georgetown University, 1994).

The Ordination of Women: Tradition and Meaning contrasts the recent teaching of Pope John Paul II with the witness of the scholastics in order to argue the priority of intrinsic meaning over historical fact or divine will in addressing the woman-priest question. DENNIS M. FERRARA, an S.T.D. from The Catholic University of America and author of "Representation or Self Effacement? The Axiom *In Persona Christi* in St Thomas and the Magisterium," *TS* 55/2 (1994), resides in Washington, D.C. He is currently working on the dissonance between the apophatic tradition and the relational God of feminist and process theologies.

The Ordinary Magisterium's Infallibility: A Reply to Some New Arguments along with Reply to Germain Grisez and Response to Francis Sullivan's Reply constitute the *QUAESTIO DISPUTATA* for this issue. Grisez, taking issue with Sullivan's "The 'Secondary Object' of Infallibility" in *TS* 54 (1993), replies to Sullivan's new arguments and clarifies an important ambiguity in two recent magisterial documents to which Sullivan appeals. Sullivan, for his part, reaffirms his thesis that because it is not clearly established that the official doctrine on artificial contraception has been infallibly taught, this doctrine is not irreformable. GERMAIN GRISEZ, Ph.D. from the University of Chicago, is the Flynn Professor of Christian Ethics at Mount Saint Mary's College, Emmitsburg, Maryland. He recently published Volume 2 of his projected three-volume *The Way of the Lord Jesus* (Franciscan Press, 1993). FRANCIS A. SULLIVAN, S.J., S.T.D. and professor emeritus from the Pontifical Gregorian University, Rome, is adjunct professor of theology at Boston College. He is the author of *Salvation Outside the Church: Tracing the History of the Catholic Response* (Paulist, 1992).

Robert J. Daly, S.J.
Editor

- Rang, J. *How to Read the Bible Aloud*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 144. \$10.95.
- Sacred Writings*. Ed. J. Holm. N.Y.: Pinter, 1994. Pp. 201. \$16.
- The Shape of Q*. Ed. J. Kloppenborg. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1994. Pp. 224.
- Teani, M. *Corporeità e risurrezione*. Rome/Brescia: Gregorian Univ./Morcelliana, 1994. Pp. 336. \$36.
- Van Aarde, A. *God-With-Us*. Pretoria: Hervormde Teologiese Studies, 1994. Pp. 326. \$50 (SA).
- Van Seters, J. *The Life of Moses*. Louisville: Westminster/Knox, 1994. Pp. 524. \$33.
- Waldmann, H. *Heilgeschichtlich verfasste Theologie und Männerbünde*. Tübingen: Tübinger Gesellschaft, 1994. Pp. 183.
- Zucker, D. *Israel's Prophets*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 208. \$11.95.
- N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 233. \$14.95.
- Portier, W. *Tradition and Incarnation*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 380. \$14.95.
- Song, C. *Jesus and the Reign of God*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993. Pp. 304.
- Staffner, H. *Dialogue, Stimulating Contacts with Hindus*. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1992. Pp. 167.
- Visions of the Other*. Ed. E. Fisher. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 108. \$7.95.
- Wondra, E. *Humanity Has Been a Holy Thing*. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1994. Pp. 370. \$56.50; \$28.50.
- Yandell, K. *The Epistemology of Religious Experience*. New York: Cambridge University, 1993. Pp. 371. \$55.

SYSTEMATIC THEOLOGY

- Attitudes to Nature*. Ed. J. Holm. N.Y.: Pinter, 1994. Pp. 172. \$16.
- Dinoia, J. *The Diversity of Religions*. Washington: Catholic Univ. of America, 1992. Pp. 199. \$29.95; \$17.95.
- Fasching, Darrell J. *Narrative Theology after Auschwitz*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992. Pp. 198.
- Feminist Theology from the Third World*. Ed. U. King. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994. Pp. 434. \$19.95.
- Green, L. *Earth Age*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 139. \$8.95.
- Henry, C. *Gods of This Age or God of the Ages?* Nashville: Broadman & Holman, 1994. Pp. 323.
- Horvath, T. *Eternity and Eternal Life*. Waterloo, Ont.: Wilfrid Laurier Univ., 1993. Pp. 174. \$35.
- Meis, A. *El Rostro Amado*. Santiago: Comala, 1994. Pp. 347.
- Naming God Today*. Ed. H.-E. Mertens and L. Boeve. Leuven: Leuven Univ., 1994. Pp. 104.
- O'Grady, J. *Models of Jesus Revisited*.

HISTORICAL

- Accounting for Fundamentalisms*. Ed. M. Marty and R. Appleby. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1994. Pp. 852. \$47.50.
- American Catholics and Slavery, 1789-1866*. Ed. K. Zanca. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1994. Pp. 290. \$39.50.
- Bedouelle, G. *In the Image of Saint Dominic*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1994. Pp. 161. \$9.95.
- Bushnell, H. *Christian Nurture*. Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1994 [1861]. Pp. 432. \$12.95.
- Cragg, K. *Troubled by Truth*. Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1994. Pp. 328. \$14.95.
- Diethelm, W. *Saint Pius X*. S.F.: Ignatius, 1994. Pp. 163. \$9.95.
- Dragon, A. *Blessed Miguel Pro, S.J.* Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 148. \$4.
- Ellwood, R. *The Sixties Spiritual Awakening*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers Univ., 1994. Pp. 350. \$24.95.

- Eriugena: East and West*. Ed. B. McGinn and W. Otten. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1994. Pp. 281. \$39.95.
- Fackre, G. *The Promise of Reinhold Niebuhr*. Rev. ed. Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1994. Pp. 71. \$18.50.
- Forrest, J. *Love Is the Measure*. Rev. ed. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994. Pp. 166.
- Frontiers in Asian Christian Theology*. Ed. R. Sugirtharajah. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994. Pp. 263.
- Hultgren, A. *The Rise of Normative Christianity*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1994. Pp. 210.
- Idigoras, J. *Ignatius of Loyola*. Tr. C. Buckley. Chicago: Loyola Univ., 1994. Pp. 628. \$12.95.
- Institute for Ecumenical Research. *Crisis and Challenge of the Ecumenical Movement*. Geneva: WCC, 1994. Pp. 52. \$4.95.
- Kenis, L. *The Lowain Faculty of Theology in the Nineteenth Century*. Leuven: Leuven Univ., 1994. Pp. 232. Fr.b. 1300.
- Merton, T., and R. Lax. *A Catch of Anti-Letters*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994 (1978). Pp. 128. \$9.95.
- On the Way to Fuller Koinonia*. Ed. T. Best and G. Gassmann. Geneva: WCC, 1994. Pp. 350. \$21.50.
- Pelton, R. *From Power to Communion*. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1994. Pp. 95. \$21.95; \$11.95.
- Quest for an Indian Church*. Ed. K. Kunnumpuram and L. Fernando. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 215. \$6.
- Real Women*. Ed. C. Belleggia. S.F.: Ignatius, 1994. Pp. 244. \$12.95.
- Reimagining Denominationalism*. Ed. R. Mullin and R. Richey. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1994. Pp. 326. \$35.
- Religion in Africa*. Ed. T. Blakely et al. Portsmouth, N.H.: Heinemann, 1994. Pp. 512. \$24.95.
- Roem, P. *Pseudo-Dionysius*. New York: Oxford University, 1993. Pp. 267. \$39.95.
- Schillebeeckx, E. *I Am a Happy Theologian*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1994. Pp. 103. \$11.95.
- Staffner, H. *Blessed Rupert Mayer, S.J.* Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 144. \$4.
- Stowasser, B. *Women in the Qur'an, Traditions, and Interpretation*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1994. Pp. 206. \$29.95.
- Van Straelen, H. *L'Église et les religions non chrétiennes au seuil du xxi^e siècle*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1994. Pp. 330. Fr. 150.
- Versluis, A. *American Transcendentalism and Asian Religions*. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1993. Pp. 355. \$48.

MORALITY AND LAW

- Ashley, B., and K. O'Rourke. *Ethics of Health Care*. 2d ed. Washington: Georgetown Univ., 1994. Pp. 285. \$24.95.
- Catholic Women and Abortion*. Ed. P. King. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. Pp. 132. \$7.95.
- Christian Social Ethics*. Ed. J. Atherton. Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1994. Pp. 410. \$24.95.
- Code of Canon Law Annotated*. Ed. E. Caparros et al. Montreal: Wilson & Lafleur, 1993. Pp. 1631. \$92 Can.
- Drane, J. *Clinical Bioethics*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. Pp. 232. \$24.95.
- Fernandes, Angelo. *Building Bridges*. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 177. \$6.
- Glaser, J. *Three Realms of Ethics*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. Pp. 149. \$17.95.
- Lobo, G. *Church and Social Justice*. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 170. \$8; \$6.
- May, W. *An Introduction to Moral Theology*. Rev. ed. Huntington, Ind.: Our Sunday Visitor, 1994. Pp. 288. \$9.95.

- McKibben, B. *The Comforting Whirlwind*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1994. Pp. 95. \$9.
- Medicine and Moral Reasoning*. Ed. K. Fulford et al. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1994. Pp. 207.
- Post-Abortion Aftermath*. Ed. M. Mannion. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. \$12.95.
- Preserving the Creation*. Ed. K. Irwin and E. Pellegrino. Washington: Georgetown Univ., 1994. Pp. 153. \$40.
- Religion, the Missing Dimension of Statecraft*. Ed. D. Johnston and C. Sampson. N.Y.: Oxford Univ., 1994. Pp. 350. \$29.95.
- The Splendor of Accuracy*. Ed. J. Selling and J. Jans. Kampen: Kok Pharos, 1994. Pp. 182. Fl. 49.50.
- Steffen, L. *Life/Choice: The Theory of Just Abortion*. Cleveland: Pilgrim, 1994. Pp. 184. \$12.95.
- Theology and the Practice of Responsibility*. Ed. W. Floyd Jr. and C. Marsh. Valley Forge, Pa.: Trinity International, 1994. Pp. 334. \$25.
- Walzer, M. *Thick and Thin*. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame, 1994. Pp. 108. \$16.95.
- PASTORAL, SPIRITUAL,
AND LITURGICAL*
- Alphonso, H. *Placed with Christ the Son*. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 162. \$5.
- Alphonso, H. *Priestly Vocation and Consecrated Life*. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1994. Pp. 83. \$2.50.
- Armstrong, R. *St. Francis of Assisi*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1994. Pp. 240. \$12.95.
- Barry, W. *What Do I Want in Prayer?* N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 133. \$8.95.
- Bermejo, L. *The Allurement of the Summit*. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 204. \$12; \$10.
- D'Avila-Latourrette, V.-A. *Table Blessings*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1994. Pp. 175. \$12.95.
- Early Anabaptist Spirituality*. Ed. D. Liechty. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 307. \$19.95.
- Hayoun, M.-R. *La liturgie juive*. Paris: Presse Universitaires de France, 1994. Pp. 128.
- Ignatian Spirituality Centre. *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*. Anand: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1993. Pp. 400. \$10.
- Imaging the Word 1*. Ed. K. Lawrence et al. Cleveland: United Church, 1994. Pp. 272. \$39.95; \$29.95.
- Kopas, J. *Sacred Identity*. N.Y.: Paulist, 1994. Pp. 217. \$11.95.
- Lawrence of the Resurrection. *Writings and Conversations on the Practice of the Presence of God*. Washington: Institute of Carmelite Studies, 1994. Pp. 194. \$9.95.
- Love, J. *Liberating Leaders from the Superman Syndrome*. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1994. Pp. 242. \$32.50.
- My Song Is of Mercy*. Ed. M. Downey. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. Pp. 260. \$15.95.
- New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 2*. Ed. J. Scherer and S. Bevans. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1994. Pp. 215.
- Okumura, A. *Awakening to Prayer*. Washington: Institute of Carmelite Studies, 1994. Pp. 88. \$8.95.
- Pennington, M. *Vatican II*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1994. Pp. 167. \$13.95.
- Schmitt, M. *Seasons of the Feminine Divine*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1994. Pp. 143. \$13.95.
- Whitehead, J. and E. *Shadows of the Heart*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1994. Pp. 206. \$19.95.
- Worship*. Ed. J. Holm. N.Y.: Pinter/St. Martin's. 1994. Pp. 187. \$45; \$16.
- PHILOSOPHY, OTHER DISCIPLINES*
- Berleur, J. *Des rôles et missions de l'université*. Namur: Presses Universitaires, 1994. Pp. 404.

- Blau, P. *Structural Contexts of Opportunities*. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1994. Pp. 229. \$32.50.
- Dean, W. *The Religious Critic in American Culture*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY, 1994. Pp. 256. \$16.95.
- Eisenach, E. *The Lost Promise of Progressivism*. Lawrence, Kan.: Univ. of Kansas, 1994. Pp. 291. \$29.95.
- Glasziou, K. *Christ or Chaos?* N.Y.: Vantage, 1994. Pp. 196. \$13.95.
- Killen, P., and J. de Beer. *The Art of Theological Reflection*. N.Y.: Crossroad, 1994. Pp. 156. \$14.95.
- Kreiner, A. *Ende der Wahrheit?* Freiburg: Herder, 1992. Pp. 608. DM 78.
- Lambropoulos, V. *The Rise of Eurocentrism*. Princeton: Princeton Univ., 1993. Pp. 471. \$29.95; \$19.95.
- Mooney, P. *Images of Personal Value*. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed & Ward, 1994. Pp. 168. \$10.95.
- Neckebrouck, V. *Paradoxes de l'inculturation*. Leuven: Leuven University, 1994. Pp. 214. Fr.b. 760.
- Norem, B. *Psychological Development of Man as Expressed through Biblical Themes*. N.Y.: Vantage, 1994. Pp. 83. \$11.95.
- Novak, M. *Belief and Unbelief*. 3d ed. New Brunswick, N.J.: Transaction, 1994 [1965]. Pp. 241. \$19.95.
- Schelling, F. von. *On the History of Modern Philosophy*. N.Y.: Cambridge Univ., 1994. Pp. \$54.95; \$17.95.
- Woolhouse, R. S. *Descartes, Spinoza, Leibniz*. N.Y.: Routledge, 1993. Pp. 214.
- Zeitlin, I. *Nietzsche*. Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell, 1994. Pp. 178. \$19.95.

STATEMENT OF OWNERSHIP, MANAGEMENT, AND CIRCULATION

(Required by 39 U.S.C. 3685)

1. Title of publication: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES; Publication no.: 00405639
3. Date of filing: October 1, 1994
4. Frequency of issue: Quarterly
7. Location of office of publication: Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057
8. Location of headquarters: Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057
9. Publisher: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES INC., Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057
Editor: Robert J. Daly, S.J., Boston College, Chestnut Hill, Ma. 02167
Managing Editor: John R. Keating, S.J., Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057
10. Owner: THEOLOGICAL STUDIES INC., a Maryland Corporation, non-profit, non-stock, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. 20057
11. Known bondholders, mortgagees, and other security holders owning or holding 1 percent or more of total amount of bonds, mortgages or other securities: None
15. a) Total no. copies printed: Avg. 4997; single issue nearest to filing date 4811
b) Paid circulation to subscribers: Avg. 4430; single issue nearest to filing date 4355
c) Total paid circulation: Avg. 4430; single issue nearest to filing date 4355
d) Free distribution: Avg. 100; single issue nearest to filing date 62
g) Total distribution: Avg. 4530; single issue nearest to filing date 4417
h) Copies not distributed: Avg. 467; single issue nearest to filing date 394
i) Total: Avg. 4997; single issue nearest to filing date 4811
Percent paid circulation: Avg. 97.8%; single issue nearest filing date 98.6%
17. I certify that the statements by me above are correct and complete: (s) John R. Keating, S.J., Managing Editor

VOLUME 55

1994

INDEX TO VOLUME 55

AUTHORS

- BARNES, M. H. Demythologization in the Theology of Karl Rahner 24
- BONSOR, J. A. History, Dogma, and Nature: Further Reflections on Postmodernism and Theology 295
- CERE, D. Newman, God, and the Academy 3
- DUFFY, R. A., O.F.M., et al. Sacramental Theology: A Review of Literature 657
- FERRARA, D. M. The Ordination of Women: Tradition and Meaning .. 706
- FERRARA, D. M. Representation or Self-Effacement? The Axiom *In Persona Christi* in St. Thomas and the Magisterium 195
- GRISEZ, G., and F. A. SULLIVAN, S.J. The Ordinary Magisterium's Infallibility 720
- HAIGHT, R., S.J. Jesus and Salvation: An Essay in Interpretation 225
- HIMES, K. R., O.F.M. The Morality of Humanitarian Intervention 82
- GALVIN, J. P. From the Humanity of Christ to the Jesus of History: A Paradigm Shift in Catholic Christology 252
- IRWIN, K. W., et al. Sacramental Theology: A Review of Literature 657
- KEENAN, J. F., S.J. Christian Perspectives on the Human Body 330
- KILMARTIN, E. J., S.J. The Catholic Tradition of Eucharistic Theology: Towards the Third Millennium ... 405
- LANGAN, J., S.J. Ethics, Business, and the Economy 105
- MCCORMICK, R. A., S.J. Some Early Reactions to *Veritatis Splendor* ... 481
- O'NEILL, W. R., S.J. No Amnesty for Sorrow: The Privilege of the Poor in Christian Social Ethics 638
- PHAN, P. C. Contemporary Contexts and Issues in Eschatology 507
- POWER, D. N., O.M.I., et al. Sacramental Theology: A Review of Literature 657
- RIGALI, N. J., S.J. Church Responses to Pedophilia 124
- SANTOGROSSI, A., O.S.B. Scotus's Method in Ethics: Not to Play God—A Reply to Thomas Shannon 314
- STARKLOFF, C. F., S.J. Inculturation and Cultural Systems 66, 274
- SULLIVAN, F. A., S.J., and G. Grisez. The Ordinary Magisterium's Infallibility 706
- VAN BEECK, F. J., S.J. Faith and Theology in Encounter with Non-Christians 46
- VAN DEN HENGEL, J., S.C.J. Paul Ricoeur's *Oneself as Another* and Practical Theology 458
- WONG, J. H., O.S.B.CAM. Anonymous Christians: Karl Rahner's Pneuma-Christocentrism and an East-West Dialogue 609

ARTICLES

- Anonymous Christians: Karl Rahner's Pneuma-Christocentrism and an East-West Dialogue. *J. H. Wong, O.S.B.CAM* 609
- The Catholic Tradition of Eucharistic Theology: Towards the Third Millennium. *E. J. Kilmartin, S.J.* 405
- Demythologization in the Theology of Karl Rahner. *M. H. Barnes* 24
- Faith and Theology in Encounter with

Non-Christians. <i>F. J. van Beeck, S.J.</i>	46
From the Humanity of Christ to the Jesus of History: A Paradigm Shift in Catholic Christology. <i>J. P. Galvin</i>	252
History, Dogma, and Nature: Further Reflections on Postmodernism and Theology. <i>J. A. Bonsor</i>	295
Inculturation and Cultural Systems. <i>C. F. Starkloff, S.J.</i>	66, 274
Jesus and Salvation: An Essay in Interpretation. <i>R. Haight, S.J.</i>	225
Newman, God, and the Academy. <i>D. Cere</i>	3
No Amnesty for Sorrow: The Privilege of the Poor in Christian Social Ethics. <i>W. R. O'Neill, S.J.</i>	638
Paul Ricoeur's <i>Oneself as Another</i> and Practical Theology. <i>J. van den Hengel, S.C.J.</i>	458
Representation or Self-Effacement? The Axiom <i>In Persona Christi</i> in St. Thomas and the Magisterium. <i>D. M. Ferrara</i>	195
Some Early Reactions to <i>Veritatis Splendor</i> . <i>R. A. McCormick, S.J.</i> ..	481

NOTES

Christian Perspectives on the Human Body. <i>J. F. Keenan, S.J.</i>	330
Church Responses to Pedophilia. <i>N. J. Rigali, S.J.</i>	124
Ethics, Business, and the Economy. <i>J. Langan, S.J.</i>	105
The Morality of Humanitarian Intervention. <i>K. R. Himes, O.F.M.</i>	82
The Ordination of Women: Tradition and Meaning. <i>D. M. Ferrara</i>	706
Scotus's Method in Ethics: Not to Play God—A Reply to Thomas Shannon. <i>A. Santogrossi, O.S.B.</i>	314

CURRENT THEOLOGY

Contemporary Contexts and Issues in Eschatology. <i>P. C. Phan</i>	507
Notes on Moral Theology 1993. <i>K. R. Himes, O.F.M., J. Langan, S.J., N.J. Rigali, S.J.</i>	82
Quaestio Disputata: The Ordinary	

Magisterium's Infallibility. <i>G. Grisez and F. A. Sullivan, S.J.</i>	720
Sacramental Theology: A Review of Literature. <i>D. N. Power, O.M.I., R. A. Duffy, O.F.M., K. W. Irwin</i> ..	657

BOOK REVIEWS

ADAMS, E. M. Religion and Cultural Freedom (<i>J. H. McKenna</i>)	379
APPLEBY, R. "Church and Age Unite!" (<i>G. P. Fogarty</i>)	161
AUER, J. The Church (<i>M. J. Himes</i>)	764
BARNSTONE, W. The Poetics of Translation (<i>J. P. M. Walsh</i>)	350
BARTOLI, M. Clare of Assisi (<i>M. W. Blastic</i>)	762
BERNSTEIN, A. E. The Formation of Hell (<i>Z. Hayes</i>)	543
BIAGIOLI, M. Galileo Courtier (<i>M. F. McCarthy</i>)	549
BRODY, E. B. Biomedical Technology and Human Rights (<i>M. A. Ryan</i>) ..	580
BROWN, R. E., S.S. The Death of the Messiah (<i>F. J. Matera</i>)	739
BRÜMMER, V. The Model of Love (<i>J. J. Conley</i>)	376
Buddhist Spirituality 1 (ed. T. Yoshinori) (<i>F. C. Bantley</i>)	780
BURRELL, D. B., C.S.C. Freedom and Creation in Three Traditions (<i>J. Renard</i>)	556
BURTON-CHRISTIE, D. The Word in the Desert (<i>C. Stewart</i>)	352
CANNING, R. The Unity of Love for God and Neighbor in St. Augustine (<i>J. P. Burns</i>)	546
CAPUTO, J. D. Against Ethics (<i>M. J. Kerlin</i>)	774
CARNEY, M., O.S.F. The First Franciscan Woman (<i>M. W. Blastic</i>)	762
CAVADINI, J. C. The Last Christology of the West (<i>K. B. Steinhauser</i>) ...	354
The Church in Latin America, 1492–1992 (ed. E. Dussel) (<i>E. S. Sweeney</i>) ..	150
COHN, N. Cosmos, Chaos, and the World to Come (<i>J. J. Collins</i>)	347
COLLINS, J. J. Daniel (<i>R. J. Clifford</i>) ..	537
CRAMER, P. Baptism and Change in the Early Middle Ages (<i>M. E. Johnson</i>)	750

- CRONIN, K. Rights and Christian Ethics (*J. Haughey*) 574
 CUMMINS, J. S. A Question of Rites (*G. Minamiki*) 362
 DAVIDOVICH, A. Religion as a Province of Meaning (*P. Rossi*) 551
 DEL COLLE, R. Christ and the Spirit (*R. Haight*) 371
 DUFFY, S. J. The Dynamics of Grace (*E. A. Dreyer*) 768
 DUNNHILL, J. Covenant and Sacrifice in the Letter to the Hebrews (*A. C. Mitchell*) 144
 DUPRÉ, L. Passage to Modernity. (*J. E. Thiel*) 555
 ELLIOTT, D. Spiritual Marriage (*M. R. Miles*) 148
 FITZMYER, J. A., S.J. Romans (*K. P. Donfried*) 741
 FITZPATRICK, P. J. In Breaking of Bread (*L. Weil*) 570
 FREI, H. W. Theology and Narrative (*E. T. Oakes*) 384
 FUCHS, J., S.J. Moral Demands and Personal Obligations (*T. A. Shannon*) 572
 GELPI, D. L., S.J. Committed Worship 1-2 (*R. A. Duffy*) 172
 GILKEY, L. Nature, Reality, and the Sacred (*M. H. Barnes*) 567
 GRANT, C. A Salvation Audit (*R. Haight*) 766
 GRIMES, R. L. Reading, Writing, and Ritualizing (*C. Bell*) 777
 GUARINO, T. G. Revelation and Truth (*J. F. Haught*) 168
 GUNTON, C. E. The One, the Three and the Many (*N. A. Dallavalle*) 558
 HALL, R. L. Word and Spirit (*M. J. Matušítk*) 553
 HAMERTON-KELLY, R. G. Sacred Violence (*P. M. McDonald*) 349
 HANNAFORD, R. V. Moral Anatomy and Moral Reasoning (*J. T. Bretzke*) ... 375
 HAUGHT, J. F. Mystery and Promise (*A. Dulles*) 165
 HINZE, B. E. Narrating History, Developing Doctrine (*W. V. Dych*) ... 366
 HOLLADAY, W. The Psalms through Three Thousand Years (*J. C. Endres*) 140
 HOLLIS, S. Anglo-Saxon Women and the Church (*J. M. Nuth*) 356
 HUGHSON, T., S.J. The Believer as Citizen (*J. L. Hooper*) 368
 IRWIN, K. Context and Text (*P. E. Fink*) 775
 JOHNSON, L. The Acts of the Apostles (*R. J. Dillon*) 142
 JOHNSON, M. Moral Imagination (*T. R. Kopfensteiner*) 171
 KEENAN, J. F., S.J. Goodness and Rightness in Thomas Aquinas' *Summa theologiae* (*S. J. Pope*) 360
 KEKES, J. The Morality of Pluralism (*J. J. Conley*) 169
 KENNEDY, P., O.P. Deus Humanissimus (*V. Guagliardo*) 563
 KILCOURSE, G. Ace of Freedom (*R. J. Hauser*) 369
 LAFONT, G. Histoire théologique de l'église catholique (*G. H. Tavard*) 758
 LATHROP, G. W. Holy Things (*J. F. Baldovin*) 569
 LEVENSON, J. D. The Death and Resurrection of the Beloved Son (*A. J. Saldarini*) 538
 LOWE, W. Theology and Difference (*D. S. Cunningham*) 559
 MCDERMOTT, B. O., S.J. Word Become Flesh (*M. K. Hellwig*) 166
 McDONALD, J. I. H. Biblical Interpretation and Christian Ethics (*W. C. Spohn*) 746
 MCFAGUE, S. The Body of God (*S. L. Secker*) 770
 MEEKS, W. A. The Origins of Christian Morality (*J. A. O'Donohoe*) ... 747
 MENCHI, S. S. Erasmus als Ketzler (*J. W. O'Malley*) 155
 MICHALSKI, S. The Reformation and the Visual Arts (*J. Dillenberger*) .. 156
 MOTT, S. C. A Christian Perspective on Political Thought (*W. O'Neill*) 577
 O'CONNELL, R. J., S.J. Soundings in St. Augustine's Imagination (*M. R. Miles*) 752
 O'MALLEY, J. W., S.J. The First Jesuits. (*J. Hennesey*) 152
 OSBORN, E. The Emergence of Christian Theology (*J. T. Linehard*) 541

PASEWARK, K. A. A Theology of Power (<i>K. R. Melchin</i>)	579
PATTON, J. Pastoral Care in Context (<i>P. J. Howell</i>)	582
PAYER, P. J. The Bridling of Desire (<i>E. C. Vacek</i>)	359
PELIKAN, J. Christianity and Classical Culture (<i>M. R. Barnes</i>)	756
PERKINS, P. Peter (<i>J. Reumann</i>)	540
PETERSON, I. J., O.S.F. Clare of Assisi (<i>M. W. Blastic</i>)	762
POST, S. G. Inquiries in Bioethics (<i>M. N. Sheehan</i>)	378
POWELL, H. J. The Moral Tradition of American Constitutionalism (<i>M. C. Kaveny</i>)	772
POWER, D. N., O.M.I. The Eucharistic Mystery (<i>J. M. Powers</i>)	372
RIESEBRODT, M. Pious Passion (<i>J. A. Coleman</i>)	380
ROUTHIER, G. La réception d'un concile (<i>J. A. Komonchak</i>)	163
RUSSELL, J. C. The Germanization of Early Medieval Christianity (<i>H. Richter</i>)	548
SANNEH, L. Encountering the West (<i>R. J. Schreiter</i>)	779
SCHALLENBERG, P. Naturrecht und Socialtheologie (<i>T. R. Kopfen- steiner</i>)	575
SCHATZ, K., S.J. Vaticanum I (1869- 1870) 2 (<i>P. Misner</i>)	364
SELLS, M. A. Mystical Languages of Unsayng (<i>G. P. Rocca</i>)	760
SMITH, W. C. What Is Scripture? (<i>F. X. Clooney</i>)	744
SOBRINO, J., S.J. Jesus the Liberator (<i>M. L. Cook</i>)	565
SOSNA, W. Die Selbstmitteilung Gottes in Jesus Christus (<i>G. E. Griener</i>)	159
SPURR, J. The Restoration Church of England, 1646-1689 (<i>M. J. Hauran</i>)	157
STUDER, B. Gratia Christi—Gratia Dei bei Augustinus von Hippo (<i>K. B. Steinhauser</i>)	754
TAYLOR, M. C. Disfiguring (<i>T. E. Dempsey</i>)	382
TESSEN, T. L. Irenaeus on the Salva- tion of the Unevangelized (<i>L. G. Patterson</i>)	749

VAN BEECK, F. J., S.J. God Encoun- tered 2/1 (<i>R. B. Imbelli</i>)	562
VAN DAM, R. Saints and Their Mira- cles in Late Antique Gaul (<i>L. S. Cunningham</i>)	147
VAUCHEZ, A. The Laity in the Middle Ages (<i>K. B. Osborne</i>)	357
WETZEL, J. Augustine and the Limits of Virtue (<i>R. J. Teske</i>)	544
WILKEN, R. L. The Land Called Holy (<i>J. A. McGuckin</i>)	145

SHORTER NOTICES

BALL, M. S. The Word and the Law (<i>M. C. Kaveny</i>)	396
BARNES, T. D. Athanasius and Con- stantius (<i>G. T. Dennis</i>)	785
BEVANS, S. B. S.V.D. Models of Con- textual Theology (<i>C. F. Starkloff</i>)	591
BLEHL, V. F., S.J. The White Stone (<i>G. Magill</i>)	589
BLUMENTHAL, D. R. Facing the Abus- ing God (<i>P. B. Jung</i>)	795
BOISMARD, M.-E. Moses or Jesus (<i>W. S. Kurz</i>)	585
BONSOR, J. A. Athens and Jerusalem (<i>J. W. Koterski</i>)	791
CAREY, P. W. The Roman Catholics (<i>C. F. Crews</i>)	389
CARRIER, H., S.J. Evangelizing the Cul- ture of Modernity (<i>J. A. Bonsor</i>) ...	790
CHARLESWORTH, M. Bioethics in a Lib- eral Society (<i>R. J. Devettere</i>)	597
COCKSWORTH, C. Evangelical Eucha- ristic Thought in the Church of En- gland (<i>P. E. Fink</i>)	180
CURRAN, C. E. The Church and Moral- ity (<i>P. B. Jung</i>)	394
DANLEY, J. R. The Role of the Modern Corporation in a Free Society (<i>M. J. Naughton</i>)	796
DANNER, P. L. Getting and Spending (<i>W. J. Byron</i>)	795
DUBY, G. Love and Marriage in the Middle Ages (<i>E. C. Vacek</i>)	786
DUNNE, J. S. Love's Mind (<i>D. J. Casey</i>)	601
DUPUIS, J., S.J. Who Do You Say I Am? (<i>B. O. McDermott</i>)	792
DWORKIN, R. Life's Dominion (<i>R. J. Araujo</i>)	186

- The Early Medieval Bible (ed. R. Gameson) (*J. F. Kelly*) 785
- ETZIONI, A. The Spirit of Community (*J. C. Haughey*) 183
- FACKRE, G. Ecumenical Faith in Evangelical Perspective (*M. E. Chapman*) 798
- FARMER, J. T. Ministry in Community (*D. Donovan*) 597
- FERGUSON, T. P. Catholic and American (*T. Hughson*) 596
- FORSTMAN, J. Christian Faith in Dark Times (*D. J. Moore*) 390
- FOWDEN, G. Empire to Commonwealth (*J. Thomas*) 587
- GERRISH, B. A. Grace and Gratitude (*D. K. McKim*) 786
- GIAKALIS, A. Images of the Divine (*G. T. Dennis*) 586
- GILLIS, C. Pluralism (*F. X. Clooney*) . 392
- GORRINGE, T. J. Capital and the Kingdom (*R. C. Bayer*) 796
- GOTHONI, R. Paradise within Reach (*M. J. Buckley*) 788
- The Great Church Year (ed. A. Raffelt and H. D. Egan) (*A. Tallon*) 600
- GREENE, A. The Catholic Church in Haiti (*J. P. Hogan*) 390
- GREENSPAHN, F. E. When Brothers Dwell Together (*F. L. Moriarty*) ... 584
- GRISEZ, G. The Way of the Lord Jesus 2 (*P. F. Ryan*) 592
- GOULD, G. The Desert Fathers on Monastic Community (*R. K. Seasoltz*) 387
- HALL, D. C. The Trinity (*P. G. Crowley*) 178
- HAMILTON, A. Heresy and Mysticism in Sixteenth-Century Spain (*M. E. Giles*) 587
- HAMMOND, G. B. Conscience and Its Recovery (*C. E. Gudorf*) 396
- HARAK, G. S. S.J., Virtuous Passions (*P. J. Wadell*) 593
- HARE, D. R. A. Matthew (*L. Cope*) ... 175
- HAUGHT, J. F. The Promise of Nature (*D. Christiansen*) 184
- HEIM, F. La théologie de la victoire de Constantin à Théodose (*F. H. Russell*) 178
- HICK, J. The Metaphor of God Incarnate (*C. Gillis*) 590
- HIMES, M. J., and K. R. HIMES, O.F.M. Fullness of Faith (*T. D. Whitmore*) 596
- JANZEN, W. Old Testament Ethics (*R. A. Di Vito*) 783
- KEANE, P. S., S.S. Health Care Reform (*D. P. Sulmasy*) 187
- KELSAY, J. Islam and War (*D. A. Madigan*) 395
- KNOTT, J. R. Discourses of Martyrdom in English Literature (*J. F. R. Day*) . 388
- KOTILA, H. Memoria Mortuorum (*K. B. Steinhauser*) 177
- KURZ, W. S., S.J. Reading Luke—Acts (*M.-E. Rosenblatt*) 176
- LARDET, P. L'Apologie de Jérôme contre Rufin (*E. Clark*) 585
- LAURITZEN, P. Pursuing Parenthood (*M. A. Ryan*) 185
- LEFEBURE, L. D. The Buddha and the Christ (*R. Corless*) 591
- LENTZ, J. C., Jr. Luke's Portrait of Paul (*D. Hamm*) 176
- LIMBURG, J. Jonah (*F. L. Moriarty*) .. 175
- The Love Commandments (ed. E. N. Santurri and W. Werpehowski) (*S. J. Pope*) 182
- MARSDEN, G. M. The Soul of the American University (*T. M. Landy*) 798
- MARTEY, E. African Theology (*J. P. Hogan*) 789
- MATHEWS, T. F. The Clash of Gods (*B. Ramsey*) 784
- MCAULIFFE, P. Fundamental Ethics (*A. T. Hennelly*) 594
- MCCANN, J. F. Church and Organization (*J. R. Kelly*) 792
- MCCORMICK, R. A., S.J. Corrective Vision (*J. T. Bretzke*) 592
- MCGRATH, A. E. The Renewal of Anglicanism (*H. J. Ryan*) 589
- MARTINEZ, G. Worship: Wedding to Marriage (*P. Covino*) 601
- MILHAVEN, J. G. Hadewijch and Her Sisters (*P. Kirk*) 387
- MONTOYA, A. R. DE., S.J. The Spiritual Conquest Accomplished by the Religious of the Society of Jesus in the Provinces of Paraguay, Parana, Uruguay, and Tape (1639) (*M. A. Lewis*) 179

MOORE, J. F. Christian Theology after the Shoah (<i>M.-E. Rosenblatt</i>)	794	and Moral Community (<i>K. R. Himes</i>)	183
MOORE, S. D. Poststructuralism and the New Testament (<i>P. M. McDonald</i>)	783	ROLNICK, P. A. Analogical Possibilities (<i>G. P. Rocca</i>)	392
MUNK, L. The Trivial Sublime (<i>E. Ingebretsen</i>)	397	RUSSELL, L. M. Church in the Round (<i>T. H. Sanks</i>)	181
NEWMAN, J. H. Sermons 1824-1843, 2 (ed. V. F. Blehl) (<i>G. Magill</i>)	788	SCHOTTROFF, L. Let the Oppressed Go Free (<i>S. A. Quitslund</i>)	386
NOVAK, D. Jewish Social Ethics (<i>J. T. Pawlikowski</i>)	184	SCREECH, M. A. Clément Marot (<i>J. J. Conley</i>)	588
O'COLLINS, G., S.J. Retrieving Fundamental Theology (<i>J. J. Smith</i>)	791	SEBOTT, R., S.J. Fundamental Kanonistik (<i>M. Wijlens</i>)	598
ORMEROD, N. Grace and Disgrace (<i>S. J. Duffy</i>)	181	SEITZ, C. R. Isaiah 1-39 (<i>G. Hens-Piazza</i>)	782
PANIKKAR, R. The Cosmotheandric Experience (<i>J. L. Empereur</i>)	590	STOOKEY, L. H. Eucharist (<i>E. J. Cutrone</i>)	600
PANNENBERG, W. Toward a Theology of Nature (<i>J. F. Haught</i>)	794	THOMAS, J.-F., S.J. Simone Weil et Edith Stein (<i>C. B. Fischer</i>)	391
PARRIS, S. The Sermon Notebook of Samuel Parris (<i>D. D. Hall</i>)	787	TINKER, G. E. Missionary Conquest (<i>C. Vecsey</i>)	789
PATTISON, S. Pastoral Care and Liberation Theology (<i>R. L. Kinast</i>)	797	TRIMIEW, D. M. Voices of the Silenced (<i>A. F. McGovern</i>)	595
Pelagius' Commentary on St. Paul's Epistle to the Romans (tr. T. de Bruyn) (<i>D. G. Hunter</i>)	386	VERKAMP, B. J. The Moral Treatment of Returning Warriors in Early Medieval and Modern Times (<i>M. Johnson</i>)	394
PETERSON, R. L. Preaching in the Last Days (<i>M. I. Lowance, Jr.</i>)	389	VILLAFANE, E. The Liberating Spirit (<i>A. F. Deck</i>)	594
PIDERIT, J. J., S.J. The Ethical Foundations of Economics (<i>R. C. Bayer</i>)	185	VOGELS, H.-J. Celibacy—Gift or Law? (<i>W. C. McFadden</i>)	599
POLKINGHORNE, J. The Faith of a Physicist (<i>J. D. Kormeyer</i>)	793	WILLIAMS, D. S. Sisters in the Wilderness (<i>D. L. Hayes</i>)	393
POORMAN, M. L. Interactional Morality (<i>J. Reed-Boulay</i>)	598	YARBROUGH, S. R., and J. C. Adams. Delightful Conviction (<i>C. Viscardi</i>)	179
RASMUSSEN, L. L. Moral Fragments		ZIMMERMAN, J. A., C.P.P.S. Liturgy as Living Faith (<i>J. L. Empereur</i>)	397