

## BOOK REVIEWS

NOTE. In 1943, to commemorate their tercentenary, the Fathers of the Congregation of Jesus and Mary undertook the publication of an English translation of the principal writings of their Founder, St. John Eudes. The complete series, entitled "The Selected Writings of St. John Eudes," will include the following volumes: *The Life and the Kingdom of Jesus in Christian Souls*; *The Sacred Heart of Jesus*; *The Admirable Heart of Mary*; *Meditations on Various Subjects*; *The Priesthood*; *Letters and Minor Works*. The translation has been made from the second French edition of the Saint's works, which was published in 1935 under the direction of the late Père Charles Lebrun, the leading authority on Eudistic research.

THE LIFE AND THE KINGDOM OF JESUS IN CHRISTIAN SOULS. By St. John Eudes. "The Selected Writings of St. John Eudes" Series, Volume I. Translated by a Monk of the Abbey of Our Lady of Gethsemani. New York: P. J. Kenedy & Sons, 1946. Pp. xxxv + 348.

The present volume is one of the classics of ascetical theology. It has been called a practical commentary on St. Paul's words to the Galatians, "I live, now not I, but Christ liveth in me." Its purpose is to teach the Christian how to perform all his daily actions in Jesus and for Jesus. The treatise is divided into seven parts. The central theme is developed in Part I, chapters twenty-ninth to thirty-second. "True Christian devotion is simply Jesus Christ's holy and divine devotion, which we are bound to fulfill in ourselves" (p. 74). We fulfill it in ourselves by seeing Christ in everything, by keeping Him before our minds in prayer and by destroying the love of creatures in our hearts in order to make room for His love (p. 79). The life of Jesus, referred to in the title of the book, is the life of grace, and his kingdom is the perfection of this life of grace in the souls of those who follow Him.

St. John Eudes was a disciple of Bérulle, Condren, and the early Oratorians, and to know his spirituality is to know, in its essentials, the spirituality of the French School of the seventeenth century, its characteristic preoccupation with affective prayer, its emphasis on the *culte de non-moi*, and its healthy insistence on the dogma of the Incarnation as the source and center of Christian piety. The Incarnate Word lives within us, and we must, in union with Jesus, glorify God. *The Life and Kingdom of Jesus in Christian Souls* expounds this teaching clearly and practically, and with the special authority which derives from the fact that it is the work of a man who achieved sanctity by following the practices he here recommends to others.

West Baden College

WILLIAM LE SAINT, S. J.

THE SACRED HEART OF JESUS. By St. John Eudes. "The Selected Writings of St. John Eudes" Series, Volume II. Translated by Dom Richard Flower, O.S.B. New York: P. J. Kenedy & Sons, 1946. Pp. xxx + 183. \$2.50.

There can be little doubt about the important and providential part played by St. John Eudes in the development of the devotion to the Sacred Heart. Père Le Dore, Superior General of the Congregation of Jesus and Mary, and a most ardent defender of his Founder's contributions to the devotion to the Sacred Heart of Jesus, declared that "Blessed Margaret Mary is pre-eminently the Apostle of the Sacred Heart of Jesus. It is to be the apostle of the holy heart of Mary that Father Eudes has been especially chosen. But it would be unjust to refuse to the ardent missionary the glory of having served as a powerful auxiliary and a worthy precursor of St. Margaret Mary."

What a powerful auxiliary he was, history and his writings amply testify. He helped greatly to give the devotion to the Sacred Heart of Jesus a firm theological foundation; he ably expounded and defended it and laboured zealously to spread it. And he first gave it liturgical expression in a special Mass and Office. It is not surprising, then, that Pope Leo XIII declared him "the institutor of the liturgical worship of the Sacred Hearts" and that Pius X and Pius XI pronounced him "the Father, the Doctor and the Apostle" of the devotion to the Sacred Hearts.

St. John's outstanding work is entitled *The Admirable Heart of the Mother of God*. It was completed in 1680, the year in which St. John died, but it did not appear until 1681. It comprises twelve books, of which eleven "discuss the theory, history and practice of the devotion of the Immaculate Heart of Mary," while the twelfth deals with the devotion to the Sacred Heart of Jesus. This last book, called by St. John "Of the Divine Heart of Jesus," contains twenty chapters, seventeen meditations—nine for the Feast of the Sacred Heart of Jesus on October 20th, and eight others on the Sacred Heart of Jesus—and a Litany of the Adorable Heart of Jesus.

*The Sacred Heart of Jesus* contains all but the first of these twenty chapters, all of the meditations, and the Litany. In addition, it includes the Mass and Office of the Sacred Heart of Jesus which St. John completed in 1670. The order of some of the chapters, however, has been changed from that of the original.

The devotion to the Sacred Heart that we find in this book is substantially the same devotion that we have today. Basing it mainly on the Sacred Scriptures and the Fathers, and on St. Bonaventure, Lanspergius, and St. Gertrude, Father Eudes develops his doctrine with a depth and simplicity,

a beauty and unction, that reflect admirably both his sanctity and his learning. The dominant theme of the chapters is, of course, love—the boundless love of the Sacred Heart for God, His Mother, His Church, and us, and the immense love, adoration, thanks, and reparation, which we owe that Heart in return. The meditations repeat, clarify, and complete this doctrine, and in warm colors paint the Sacred Heart as our refuge, oracle, and treasure, the perfect model and rule of our lives, the source of the life of grace.

The difference between St. John's doctrine and practice of the devotion to the Sacred Heart and ours today is largely a matter of stress and mode of expression. He stresses the metaphorical aspect of the Sacred Heart more often than the symbolical, and uses the word "heart" in a greater variety of senses than we do today. Hence we are surprised, and perhaps disconcerted, when we hear him speak of the Heart of the Father and of the Holy Ghost, the hearts of angels and saints and devils and damned, or when we read that "we have three Hearts to adore in Our Saviour . . . His Divine Heart . . . His Spiritual Heart . . . His Corporeal Heart," or that we are to have "but one Heart with our Heavenly Father and our holy Mother." But as St. John understands these expressions, they are all quite correct enough.

St. John's Mass, *Gaudeamus*, is a thing of moving beauty and very different from the Masses *Miserebitur* and *Cogitationes*—different in its Sequence and Preface, different in its dominant stress. Like the Office it flows from the discourse after the Last Supper. It has well been called "wholly a Mass of love. . . filled with the Sacred Heart of Jesus," "the Mass of Fire." Both Mass and Office are still in use today among the Eudists.

Both the theologian and the liturgist should find the book interesting and valuable both because of the early date of its composition and because of its doctrinal content and the sometimes unusual way of expressing that content. As a book for spiritual reading and meditation, however, it is particularly outstanding, for it seems to breathe forth the spirit of love that made St. John in such a special way the "Father of the devotion to the Sacred Hearts," a spirit of love remarkably qualified to communicate itself to others.

*West Baden College*

E. J. FORTMAN, S.J.

DE ECCLESIA ET DE LOCIS THEOLOGICIS. By G. Yelle, S.S. Montreal: Grand Séminaire, 1945. Pp. xiii + 173. \$2.00.

This is a neat little volume, a worthy addition to the series of theological manuals written by Father Yelle and Father Fournier of the Grand Séminaire of Montreal. As the title indicates, the book consists of two main

parts, "De Mystero Ecclesiae" and "De Locis Theologicis." An appendix (pp. 121-69) gives the whole of the encyclical *Mystici Corporis Christi*. The book closes with a brief index (pp. 171-73).

The introductory page of greetings to the seminarians informs them that the authorship of the manual is divided. The treatise *De Locis Theologicis* (pp. 78-120) substantially reproduces an earlier redaction by E. Yelle, now Archbishop of Arcadiopolis, while R. Fournier, who published *La théologie de l'Action catholique* in 1940, wrote some parts of the first treatise.

Nowadays the treatise *De Ecclesia* is broken up into a *pars apologetica* and a *pars dogmatica*, distinct in purpose and method. The authors published the apologetic part in 1945 (*Apologetica*). The volume now under review contains only the dogmatic part. The first section is noteworthy. It consists of two theses (though they are not called that): "Ecclesia est corpus mysticum Christi capitis" (p. 1), and "Spiritus sanctus est anima Ecclesiae" (p. 12). These theses are not only proved positively, but to each is added a speculative exposition. The whole is an admirable piece of theology. The second section (pp. 23-66) takes the Church "in suo operari," meaning the threefold function of the Church and its membership. The third section (p. 67-76) discusses the relation between Church and State. Only the principles which should govern their mutual relations are given, mostly after the encyclical *Immortale Dei* (1885) of Leo XIII; the application of the principles to actual conditions in the various countries is wisely left to the supreme authority in the Church.

The whole of the first part is very well done. The documentation is ample and of the best calibre, the principles are brought out clearly, the argumentation is excellent. Before leaving this first part, let me advert to the moot question discussed in the "Introductio" (p. xii): Where should the dogmatic part of the treatise *De Ecclesia* be placed in the course of theology? With many other theologians, the author would place it after the treatise *De Verbo Incarnato*. Theoretically, an excellent arrangement, no doubt. But deans of studies have a habit of deciding questions like this on more practical lines.

The very title of the second main part reminds one of the Melchior Cano, the originator of this treatise. But while his ten *loci theologici* are classified at the beginning (p. 78), this treatise follows an altogether different order. The first chapter deals with the two sources of revelation. The author is right in taking up tradition first, though the reasons for doing so are nowhere clearly stated. But I am afraid that the distinction of the two sources as well as the definition of tradition on page 80 is misleading. It would seem more satisfactory to define tradition as the preaching of the magisterium and to make it the primary source of revelation. The section on the Bible (pp.

84-97) omits all treatment of the canon of Scripture and the criterion of inspiration. However, the treatment is solid and well documented. The author holds verbal inspiration (pp. 93-94), regarding it as an immediate inference from the Catholic doctrine on inspiration.

I cannot see why the author says, without any distinction, that this treatise is strictly dogmatic (p. 78). Does not a strictly dogmatic argument already suppose the *loci theologici*? It is the purpose of fundamental theology to prove their dogmatic or theological value.

Each section of the book closes with a bibliography of Latin and French works.

*Weston College*

A. C. COTTER, S.J.

**HIS BODY THE CHURCH.** By W. Norman Pittenger. New York: Morehouse-Gorham Co., 1945. Pp. xviii + 158. \$2.50.

The past few decades have witnessed a growing consciousness among Protestants of the scandal of their disunion and a sincere desire to do something to remedy it. Already we have seen some concrete results of this in the formation of the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America; in the organisation of the World Congresses of Protestant Churches held at Stockholm, Lausanne, Oxford, and Edinburgh; in the union of several of the larger Protestant Churches of Canada into the United Church; in the still more recent union of the three largest bodies of Methodists in the United States into a single organisation; and in the proposed merger of Presbyterians and Episcopalians which has been discussed so frequently in recent years.

This movement towards reunion has naturally directed the attention of Protestants to a consideration of the nature of the Church and its place in the Christian life, with a consequent increase in the number of books on the subject. One of the more recent of these is the Reverend W. Norman Pittenger's *His Body The Church*, written for delivery at the Philadelphia Divinity School as the Bohlen Lectures of 1945. The author is an instructor in dogma and apologetics in the General Theological Seminary, New York, and a lecturer in the department of religion at Columbia University. By his own admission, he writes as "a Catholic of the Anglican obedience," and his views on the nature of the Church are doubtless shared by a considerable number of Anglicans both in America and England.

In his opening chapter Professor Pittenger discusses the Church in the New Testament, showing that it is "a divinely-established, divinely-commissioned and divinely-empowered fellowship" or society which forms one body with Christ its Head and manifests and communicates His life to the

world, so that the Church and the Church alone is "the true Israel" and "God's instrument for bringing salvation to the entire world." He turns next to a discussion of the four classical "notes" of the Church, which he treats in as many chapters on its unity, holiness, catholicity, and apostolicity. Two subsequent chapters treat of dogma, worship, and authority in the Church. There follows a discussion—very Catholic in tone—of the Church on earth and its relations with the Church suffering in purgatory and the Church triumphant in heaven, with a final chapter on the opportunities, responsibilities, and duties of the Church in the war-ravaged world of today and tomorrow.

While there is much in the first, the eighth, and the ninth chapters that a Catholic reader will agree with and study with profit, there is much in the other six chapters which will fail to satisfy him. The author's concept of the Church seems to be so comprehensive that it includes all baptized Christians of all sects and denominations. He pictures the Church as a "series of concentric circles in which there are arrows pointing in toward the common center" which is "the historic Jesus Christ, God-Man, worshipped in sacrament, lived in the supernatural life in grace, whose significance is stated in dogmatic belief." In this series of concentric circles, however, there are certain religious bodies—apparently those which retain the historic episcopate—"which may be said to belong to the mainstream of historic Christianity" and which lie "closest to the common center of the series of circles." Again, he tells us that "the Church's unity is not unlike the unity of a large city with its surrounding suburban communities. The heart of the matter, the city itself with the fullness of life therein, is to be found where there is actual empirical unity by agreement in the historic dogma, worship, life and ministry. In the suburban communities, however, there are many elements important to city life. But in these suburbs the elements of city life are lacking that unifying and central element which would give them their due balance and proportion."

Naturally, the author has his difficulties in fitting the traditional "notes" to such a Church. There is much in his treatment of the Church's notes of holiness, catholicity, and apostolicity which will seem novel, to say the least, to a Catholic reader, but his treatment of the note of unity seems especially unsatisfactory. Though his concept of Church unity includes only union in "faith, worship and life," he seems to admit that even this attenuated degree of unity is lacking in the "empirical" Church, as it exists today, and belongs only to the "ideal" Church, which unfortunately does not yet exist and apparently never has existed, except perhaps in apostolic times. He is therefore forced to admit that "the true unity of the Christian Church is a super-

natural unity. The Catholic Church is one, because it is the Body of Christ, who is one." A Catholic will naturally object that such a "supernatural unity" is something invisible, and therefore cannot be considered a note or mark of the Church.

The author's solution of the problem of Church authority in matters of faith and worship is also unsatisfactory.

If the Church be the Body of Christ, the locus of authority must be in the total organism, [since] authority could not be isolated in any one of the members of the body, as if one of these could function apart from or even instead of the whole. [Nevertheless,] since someone must speak for the Church . . . a particular agency has been designated . . . which, from the primitive days of the Church, by historical continuity and general consent, has possessed the right to proclaim and defend the faith. This agency is the historic episcopate, acting after theological advice and study as the mouthpiece for the Christian consciousness and constantly liable to the check of that consciousness. The authority is not oracular, nor has it ever properly been conceived to be such in the undivided Church. A statement by any large gathering of bishops, even by all of the bishops of the Church, would not have an automatic authority, of itself; it would possess authority only when it speaks for the whole Church, and when, having spoken, enough time has been given for the total Christian consciousness to have approved the statement as adequate and satisfactory.

This seems very much like saying that there is no authority in the Church today, since, even if it were possible to assemble all the bishops of the Catholic, Orthodox, and Anglican Churches in a council, the decisions of such a council would not have any authority until they were accepted by the whole Church, which includes, according to Professor Pittenger's theory, a good many sects who reject episcopal authority completely.

Perhaps the author's unsatisfactory attitude on the questions of Church unity and Church authority has its origin in his attitude towards the papacy. He thinks that "it would be inappropriate, in a book devoted to a consideration of the nature of the Church as the mystical Body of Christ, to enter into a detailed discussion of the controversial question of the papal claims, their authenticity and historical development, the notion of papal infallibility, the possible place of the papacy in a reunited Christianity." One can admit that a discussion of all these questions would have been impossible in the comparatively brief space of time allowed Professor Pittenger as Bohlen lecturer, but a Catholic can hardly help thinking that a discussion of the Church which deliberately omitted the Rock on which Christ built the Church resembles a performance of Hamlet without the Prince of Denmark.

least lacking in clarity. But apart from this criticism, we have only the highest praise for an excellent piece of work.

*St. Mary of the Lake*

THOMAS J. MOTHERWAY, S.J.

ANIMATION ET DÉANIMATION. By Maurice d'Halluin, M.D. Paris: Beauchesne, 1944. Pp. 78.

Dr. d'Halluin, professor of medicine at Lille, member of the Academy of Sciences, and evidently a Catholic, has published a small book that will be of interest to moralists as well as to psychologists. From an array of biological data he draws some interesting conclusions on the presence or absence of a human soul in the product of human generation. The following paragraphs present the author's conclusions together with some of his discussion.

As a fundamental presupposition, he accepts the almost common opinion of theologians and biologists, that the human soul is infused at the time when fecundation of the ovum opens the way to segmentation, and gives biological reasons for this thesis of immediate animation.

Also pertinent to his treatise is the fact that real death does not coincide with apparent death. In an earlier work (*La mort . . . cette inconnue!*), the same author distinguished apparent death, or imperceptible life; relative (clinical) death, or total suspension of life; and absolute death, or impossibility of life. The moment of absolute death cannot be exactly determined, but it does not require the total absence of living cells. It does mean that the organization which makes the body capable of co-ordinated immanent activity has come to an end.

The body of his work considers the phenomena of embryology, parthenogenesis, and teratology, in relation to animation. An active being, developing toward the organization of a living adult, is certainly animated. Can this be said of an ovum stimulated to segmentation by artificial means? Artificial parthenogenesis in mammals ends abortively, but adults have been obtained in experiments with batrachians. Hence, whatever the process which initiates segmentation, the being which is "on the way to organization" should be considered to be animated.

A kind of natural parthenogenesis takes place in women, even virgins, for dermoid cysts of the ovaries reveal an initial development towards organization. During the time of normal segmentation, it seems that there must have been animation with a human soul. God must be presumed to act according to His general laws for infusing a soul into an ovum stimulated to segmentation, even though He foresees its certain death. This is the presumption of the Church in baptizing every non-viable fetus.

Parthenogenesis of the human male sperm is reported in a unique case, in which testicular tissue contained thousands of formations, each corresponding to an embryo a few days old. The author hesitates to say that these are animated with a human soul, and awaits further study. But if they are human embryos, logic demands the admission that they have human souls while they live.

In the case of identical twins, he sees no difficulty in admitting successive animation: one soul originally, the other infused at the division of the embryo. But since this division is not instantaneous, the problem of time remains, and the question as to which twin receives the new soul.

In the case of double monsters, where twinning is incomplete, the problem is more complex. Some monsters are clearly two personalities; for example, the Siamese twins and many others recorded in medical literature. In other cases, in which it is biologically evident that there were originally two embryos, there may be doubt about the number of persons. With Capellman, Dr. d'Halluin says that where there are two vegetative systems, there are two persons, e.g., when there is one head and two hearts. Thus the cerebral function does not always designate individuality. In one case reported, a monster superficially appeared to be one body. But anatomical examination seemed to show that it was the result of the fusion of two embryos along the full length, with one side of each developing. In the absence of detailed information, the author thinks that this is now one person, but wonders whether one of the original souls remains, or whether there has been equivalent death of both embryos, and the infusion of a third soul.

He classifies omphalosites and parasites together. Omphalosites are more or less developed masses of flesh, perhaps with head or trunk, separated from the twin except for an umbilical connection by which the omphalosite is nourished from the circulation of the autosite. The appearance might lead one to baptize the omphalosite, but the author thinks it is not animated: it has no heart or circulation of its own, and it is incapable of independent existence; it is a mass of living tissue, but lacks the coordinated organization which connotes a living person; there was human life in the early embryo, but the developed monster is not animated. Parasites—small imperfect bodies living attached to another body, externally or internally, and nourished from its circulation—are also mere remnants of a once living embryo.

Single monsters appear with a wide variety of form and difformity. The only product of human generation is a human being; hence, if these monsters are living, they are animated with a human soul; the presence of life must be determined by the state of organization: to be living, the monster need not have an enduring viability, but must have independent life. An acerebral

monster, lacking part or all of the brain, is surely a human being; some have been known to live for several hours after birth. Amorphous masses, if they develop from generation, were once animated with a human soul, but are not now human persons; they are merely masses of living flesh.

The author's reflections upon the extraordinary phenomena of embryology are interesting, and some of the examples he takes from medical literature are startling. His definition of a living being seems to be philosophically sound; his discussion of the fact and the time of animation may help clarify the theologian's concept of life; and his conclusions may throw some light on the often thorny problem of the administration of baptism to monsters.

*Alma College*

HILARY R. WERTS, S.J.

MOTHER OF CARMEL. By E. Allison Peers. New York: Morehouse-Gorham Co., 1946. Pp. 220

In this volume the learned Anglican student of Spanish mystics and mysticism, Professor E. Allison Peers, has given us a companion piece to his short study of St. John of the Cross. *Mother of Carmel* is a portrait of St. Teresa of Jesus, famous foundress and mystic of sixteenth-century Spain, and friend of St. John of the Cross, with whom she shares honors as an exponent of the highest forms of mysticism. Needless to say, this portrait has been carefully drawn from a most exact and seasoned knowledge of the sources.

The book is divided into three parts: "Preparation," dealing with the Saint's early years, her "second conversion," and the launching of her program of reform; "Achievement," a sketch of her multiple foundations and an introduction to her writings; and "Fame," a brief discussion of St. Teresa as writer and saint.

Thus, *Mother of Carmel* is at once a personal introduction to Teresa of Jesus, an introduction to her writings, and a sketch of the exterior events of her life. Since in recounting the life of so active a person as St. Teresa there was danger of crowding such a small canvas, Professor Peers has focussed attention on the Saint and those nearest to her. The result is a narrative which enables the reader to get a clear picture of the main events of the Saint's life.

Throughout the book Professor Peers is anxious to bring out the naturalness of St. Teresa's character. This procedure was dictated partly by the fact that St. Teresa was of all persons the most artless and unaffected, and partly by the author's desire to get Teresa accepted as a very attractive

human being by readers who might feel no sympathy with her if she was first presented as a seraphic saint. Such an approach is very wise, but one wonders if in one or two places the author has not pushed it too far. For example, was the young Teresa "the absolutely normal child" that the author would have her? Her desire to go to the Moors and martyrdom might be explained as young imagination comparable to a healthy boy's desire to run away and be a pirate, but the desire "to be alone" when she prayed seems to indicate, in Teresa's case, a special guidance of the Holy Ghost.

Allied with St. Teresa's naturalness was her interest in beginners in the spiritual life. Professor Peers deserves thanks for bringing out how much of St. Teresa's teaching is directed to those who are still struggling at the foot of the mountain of perfection.

It is the author's hope to send his readers to the Saint's own writings "where they will find a still clearer reflection of her vital personality."

The book bears an imprimatur.

*Fairfield College, Conn.*

T. A. HARKINS, S. J.

*Laudes Regiae: A STUDY IN LITURGICAL ACCLAMATIONS AND MEDIAEVAL RULER WORSHIP.* By Ernest H. Kantorowicz. Berkeley-Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1946. Pp. xxii + 292; 15 plates. \$3.00.

The culmination of many years of effort is achieved in the issuance of this book in the spring of 1946. The first—and perhaps finest—of its seven chapters originated at Oxford in 1934; that and parts of three other chapters were ready for the press in 1936; two of the remaining three were added in Berkeley in 1940; and the whole delivered to the press in 1941—to issue five years later. Students in several historical fields will feel grateful that the author, thanks in part to a grant in Aid of Displaced Foreign Scholars, was thus enabled to bring his work to printed form.

"I do not pretend," reads his modest declaration of purpose, "to submit a final work on either 'Liturgical Acclamations' or 'Mediaeval Ruler Worship.' The book offers no more than I have promised in the title, a 'Study,' or rather a collection of 'Studies' braced by a common subject which by chance I became interested in many years ago. It contains the history, if incomplete, of a single liturgical chant, the *Laudes Regiae*" (p. ix).

It is only in recent times that "mediaeval liturgy, like the rites of the non-Christian cults, turned out to be suitable, not only to theological, but also to

politico-historical interpretations. . . The evaluation of these liturgical sources for the purpose of political, cultural, and constitutional history. . . is as yet in its first Phase" (p. viii).

It is gratifying that the author states his position with reserve and detachment. For there are, in the course of these engaging studies ranging over a period of several centuries, a good many details of political and historical interpretation and evaluation that tend to interpret themselves differently to the adherents of the Catholic faith—practices which the author "interprets" in a somewhat off-hand manner.

This interpretative shortcoming may be illustrated by the sub-title of the book, "A Study in. . . Mediaeval Ruler Worship." Now, worship is for Catholics such a precisely shaded expression that one would naturally expect to find, at least once, a careful differentiation between the homage shown a temporal ruler and the worship tendered the Godhead. I do not say that the author confuses the two meanings, but he does not make it clear that he remembers what widely differing meanings are contained in such expressions as "the ecclesiastical worship of the ruler" (p. 100).

Were one to generalize as to the author's basic position, it would be his tendency, as he says of the Carolingian clerics, to seek "a theocratic solution of political problems" (p. 56). It was, under the circumstances, all but inevitable that the author would link "the modern revival. . . of the acclamations, and their function, in modern dictatorial states, in which they appear as an indispensable vehicle of political propaganda" (p. x).

These reserves in interpretation once made, the reviewer wishes heartily to endorse the appearance of the book, and to bear witness to the many-sided store of erudition, especially from the history of coins and ivories, that the author has drawn upon in illustrating the history of the chant which commences, "Christus vincit, Christus regnat, Christus imperat."

The earliest known copy of this chant dates from the reign of Charlemagne between 783 and 785, but already developed, from chiefly Roman elements, into a stirring, litany-like series of invocations, acclamations, and good wishes voiced in prayer.

The acclamations are later found in connection with papal and episcopal elections and anniversaries, imperial coronations, general and local Church councils, political conquest and rule.

Their recent rapid spread, as an incidental product of the liturgical movement, is illustrated by *The New York Times'* despatch recounting the election of Pope Pius XII (March 3, 1939): "Suddenly and apparently spontaneously the whole crowd was singing. The noble notes of the hymn with the chorus *Christus vincit, Christus regnat, Christus imperat* rolled up to the sky

with an intensity and volume of sound that moved even skeptical observers. With this hymn the crowd wished the Pope peace, a long life, and glory" (p. 185).

The first of several appendices to the volume is a thirty-page treatment of the music of the acclamations, the work of Professor M. F. Bukofzer.

*St. Mary's College*

GERALD ELLARD, S.J.

RELIGION IN RUSSIA. By Robert Pierce Casey. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1946. Pp. 198. \$2.00.

Religion in Russia is one of the most fascinating problems because, in spite of the many disappointments brought about by Russian developments, old and recent, Russia is unquestionably a great reserve of flaming faith.

The present book treats of the problem from the historical viewpoint. Such a treatment should give clear answers to the following all-important questions: (1) How was it possible for religion, despite two decades of reckless persecution, to survive in Russia, and, in general, to preserve the traditional structure embodied in the Russian Orthodox Church? (2) How did it happen that, after having displayed unexpected strength, that Church became an ally—more exactly, an auxiliary—of the same atheist government which had tried so hard to destroy it.

Both the survival and the surrender to secular power are deeply rooted in history, and Mr. Casey's book should reveal this. However, it does not. In his survey of the religious situation before the Revolution, the author succumbs to the common temptation to treat the Russian Orthodox Church simply as an instrument of tsarist oppression; he assumes, as a corollary, that the common man supported the attack on Orthodoxy launched by the new government. But then, how could Orthodoxy have survived? Mr. Casey explains this by "the extreme tenacity of religion in Russian life." But to explain survival by tenacity is the same as to explain fire by the burning capacity of inflammable materials. Tenacity after the Revolution points to strong, though very simple and naïve, faith before the Revolution. Such a faith, as is known from history, is not destroyed, but fortified, by persecution.

The tenacity of religion was manifested by the believers' magnificent resistance to persecution. Of this resistance Mr. Casey says nothing. Instead of recognizing the intensification of faith in the age of persecution, he assumes that it was the German attack and the vandalism of the invaders which caused the revival of Orthodoxy. There is no reason to deny that in the course of the War men returned to religion; they always do in days of

calamity. In reality, the German attack was immediately followed by Sergius' pastoral letter enjoining all the believers to participate actively in the defense of the fatherland. The unanimity of their response, previous to any act of vandalism on the part of the Germans, proved to the government that religion was a strong force and that the hierarchy of the Russian Church was not inclined to use the War for a showdown with the secular power. This was the real background of Stalin's plan to offer the church leaders an alliance on the *do ut des* principle.

This phase of the development is told by Mr. Casey in its external features, but with no real insight into the significance of the events. The atheist State granted legal status to the Russian Church, and to the church dignitaries it offered high honors, material advantages, permission to resume the training of priests, to print the Bible and prayerbooks, as well as a religious journal, and even to teach religion to groups of children—outside of school or church. The Orthodox Church accepted the offer but had to pay for these advantages by supporting the foreign policy of the Soviets and by denying that there ever had been religious persecution on the part of the Soviets. The martyrs of the 'twenties and 'thirties have been repudiated—a very high price indeed! Of this Mr. Casey does not say a word.

The acceptance of the compromise by the Russian Orthodox Church needs some explanation. But none is offered by the author. He is satisfied with mentioning the "patience, resourcefulness and initiative of the patriarchate," and entirely ignores the bitter struggle between Sergius and a large number of Russian bishops who opposed his policy and who, almost without exception, died in a concentration camp in the former Solovki monastery.

The discussion of the role of Catholicism is also inadequate. There are excellent pages on the attempts at *rapprochement* in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, but no word appears on the persecution of the Uniats in 1839 and 1875—of which that of 1946 is an exact replica—or on the Concordat of 1847. The author recognizes that in the years of persecution the Catholics suffered as badly as the Orthodox—a fact hardly compatible with his contention that the Bolsheviks persecuted Orthodoxy as a survival of the tsarist regime. The beginning of the discrimination against the Catholics, traceable to 1936, is not mentioned, nor is Father Orlemansky's visit to Russia reported and commented upon. In the present day conflict between the Vatican and Moscow, the author espouses the cause of Moscow.

Time and again Russian names are misspelled, and historical facts are somewhat distorted. For example, Patriarch Tikhon never really abdicated. It is an exaggeration to call the High Procurator of the Empire "a high-

ranking imperial spy": spies work in the camp of an enemy, and it is preposterous to assume that the imperial government saw an enemy in the Orthodox Church. Pope Pius XI's "intercession for Russia" is wrongly attributed to Pope Pius XII.

*Fordham University*

NICHOLAS S. TIMASHEFF

CHRISTIANITY'S PROBLEM IN THE FAR EAST. By Andrew J. Krzesinski, Ph.D., S.T.D. South Bend: Fides, 1945. Pp. 145.

The present book is an enlargement of the subject of missions in the Far East treated in another book and in articles by the author. It has the advantage of first-hand information about the missions, since the author travelled widely in the Orient before coming to his conclusions. He discusses the importance of the missions at the present time, the benevolent influence of Christianity on nations, his own experiences in the Far East, and offers an appraisal of the present state of missions and the causes of retarded progress together with the remedies.

The author's conclusions reiterate what has been the growing strategy of the Church in the Orient in modern times. The importance of accommodation to native cultures is emphasized and the need of a well-trained missionary personnel. His analysis of obstacles is in agreement with the conclusions of others who have had experience in the field. The remedies suggested also are those which the majority of informed thinkers offer for the problem of the Far East. It is not according to accepted opinion to say that the Philippine Islands have ceased to be a mission country (p. 71). We know that there was indirect contact between Southern India and Christian centers through Mesopotamia in the years just preceding the arrival of the Portuguese (p. 75). Until more objective study is possible on the question of the Malabar and Chinese Rites controversy, it would be better for the author not to be so positive in his conclusions with regard to what he thinks were the excesses of Fathers Ricci and Nobili (p. 83). Not everyone would agree with Father Krzesinski that the penetration of Tibet ought to be undertaken in spite of the sacrifice of life that would be involved, and such disagreement would spring from no lack of love for martyrdom (p. 91).

One wonders whether the mixture of various nationalities of priests working in the same sections could be properly managed (p. 111). The Holy See for reasons known to itself has made a point of assigning definite sections to single missionary groups. The day may come when the supernaturalism suggested by the author and hoped for by all students of the problem will come. I do not quite see the author's point in desiring a new congregation of priests for the Orient (p. 113). The more the better, to be sure. But I

would not agree with the author that there are not international orders and congregations at work now which are "free from nationalistic aims and tendencies, full of zeal and enthusiasm, of thorough education, ready for any sacrifice, with improved methods." There is an implied condemnation, which is not warranted, of all organizations at work in the Orient at the present time.

*Weston College*

EDWARD L. MURPHY, S.J.

**MEN AND MOVEMENTS IN THE AMERICAN EPISCOPAL CHURCH.** By E. Clowes Chorley, D.D., L.H.D. New York: Charles Scribners Sons, 1946. Pp. ix + 501. \$4.00.

The Right Reverend Charles Rueben Hale was Bishop of Cairo, Bishop Coadjutor of Springfield. An enlightened man with a love for ecclesiastical culture, when he died in 1900, he left a fund to Western Theological Seminary now Seabury Western Theological Seminary, Evanston, Illinois, to endow a series of lectures on a variety of subjects connected with Church affairs. *Men and Movements in the American Episcopal Church* is the fruit of one of these series.

In this work Dr. Chorley gives us an interesting account of the various trends within the broad boundaries of the Protestant Episcopal Church. To avoid giving a mere catalogue of creeds and controversies, he presents the movements in the light of their outstanding leaders. The result is a highly personalized historical sketch or series of sketches, illustrating the history of the American Protestant Episcopal Church from 1732, when Devereux Jarratt was born, to the present.

While Dr. Chorley protests that a selection of representative leaders was inevitable, he does give the reader a wide variety of type personalities. Devereux Jarratt, friend of Wesley and Asbury, represents the early Evangelical movement with its close kinship to the Methodists in emotional and psychological outlook. The early High Churchmen are seen in the light of doughty old Samuel Seabury and John Henry Hobart, both of whom would agree to set themselves off from the Evangelicals by an insistence on Church and Prayerbook. Unlike Bishop Seabury, however, Hobart threw up his hands in horror at the idea of priest or sacrifice. Indeed, one of the saddest pages in the book is High Church Bishop Hobart's virulent attack on transubstantiation, in what Dr. Chorley calls "startling language" (pp. 180-81).

For Catholics, of course, the Tractarian Movement is of great interest. While the Church received no Newman or Manning from the ranks of the

Protestant Episcopal Church, she did welcome a number of excellent ministers and even one bishop, Levi Silliman Ives of North Carolina, a son-in-law of Bishop Hobart. The early Catholics (of whom Bishop Ives was a representative) tended to place emphasis on the apostolic order and the sacramental system.

The Broad Church movement, which so alarmed Newman and found its leaders in men like Whately and Wilburforce in England, had as one of its outstanding American personalities, the popular Phillips Brooks. Incidentally, to this Broad Churchman (who did believe in the divinity of Christ) we are indebted for the touching hymn, "O little town of Bethlehem."

The Anglo-Catholic movement is distinguished from the early Catholic movement by Dr. Chorley as placing "a larger emphasis on the doctrine of the Real Presence in the Eucharist; non-communicating attendance; fasting communion; reservation of the consecrated elements for the communion of the sick and for the purposes of adoration; unction; prayers for the departed and sacramental confession with private absolution" (p. 316). Ferdinand Ewer, James De Koven, and Arthur Ritchie are given as representatives of this group.

The growth of ritualism with its serio-comic crises of censers and chasubles is described by Dr. Chorley more through the controversies it aroused than through personalities. But the decline of the Low Church movement, which culminated in the founding of a new sect, the Reformed Episcopal Church, brings personality to the fore with George D. Cummins, Protestant Episcopal Bishop of Kentucky. Bishop Cummins was typical of many who disliked ritualist practices and Catholic tendencies, and who wished to emphasize the first word in the title of their Church. Bishop Cummins so despaired of clearing away the practices and tendencies which he bitterly deplored in the Protestant Episcopal Church that he founded the Reformed Episcopal Church in 1873.

In a final chapter, Dr. Chorley looks towards the future where he dimly discerns the vision of a united Church, at once Catholic, Evangelical, Liberal. Unfortunately, however, this unity seems to be attainable only at the price of doctrine. Real oneness in Christ will be found only in that Church which is His Bride and the infallible teacher of His doctrine.

Dr. Chorley has approached this work with high qualifications. He had already written the history of several individual Churches. He is the historiographer of the American Protestant Episcopal Church and of the Diocese of New York. In treating of the various opposing trends within the Episcopal Church his attitude is scholarly and impartial. Indeed, it

would be difficult to judge from this book which group claims his allegiance. I would hazard a guess that he is liberal Catholic with modernist overtones.

While the book as a whole is well done, it would have been better to have started somewhat less abruptly. Without any preliminary sketch of the Protestant Episcopal Church in America, we are plunged into a consideration of Devereux Jarratt and the Evangelical movement in the eighteenth century.

More emphasis on the modernist trend in the Protestant Episcopal Church in America would have been desirable. While we are given a little about Bishop Gore and others, we would like to have had considerably more on the effects modernism has had on fundamental doctrine in the Protestant Episcopal Church in America.

There are a few typographical errors in the book; e.g., p. 77: "much better will you designated us"; p. 79: "Calvanistic"; p. 276: "He fell on sleep."

But, not to conclude on a negative note, there is an excellent bibliography and, as becomes a book of this type, a full index.

*Alma College*

JOSEPH S. BRUSHER, S.J.

THE PRACTICE OF RELIGION. By Frederick C. Grant. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1946. Pp. 271. \$2.50.

Of set purpose the author's viewpoint is adogmatic. Yet, speaking for himself, "he finds the nearest approach to the ideal of free and comprehensive, and yet positive and historical, Catholicism expressed in the Churches of the Anglican Communion" (p. 265). His exhortations to practice religion, which he defines as "life controlled by the consciousness of God," are not merely colored, but dominated, by the supposition that God is the God apprehended historically by this "free and comprehensive Catholicism." The supposition, of course, invalidates to a degree the claim that the treatment is adogmatic, for arguably an individual's life may be controlled by consciousness of a God who is conceived as other than the God of "positive and historical, free and comprehensive Catholicism." In point of fact, then, the congregation that will docilely hear the exhortation will be a Liberal Protestant one. Others, Catholics certainly and old-fashioned Protestants not a few, will remain cold to Dr. Grant's hortatory efforts.

The meaning of faith, the distinction of natural from supernatural religion, would seem to need clarification before we talk of the practice of religion. Dr. Grant himself deprecates the emotional revivalism of the last century (pp. 25-27). Nevertheless, emotionalism appears to be the only alternative to a faith grounded on a proof of supernatural revelation. Faith, as far as

would be difficult to judge from this book which group claims his allegiance. I would hazard a guess that he is liberal Catholic with modernist overtones.

While the book as a whole is well done, it would have been better to have started somewhat less abruptly. Without any preliminary sketch of the Protestant Episcopal Church in America, we are plunged into a consideration of Devereux Jarratt and the Evangelical movement in the eighteenth century.

More emphasis on the modernist trend in the Protestant Episcopal Church in America would have been desirable. While we are given a little about Bishop Gore and others, we would like to have had considerably more on the effects modernism has had on fundamental doctrine in the Protestant Episcopal Church in America.

There are a few typographical errors in the book; e.g., p. 77: "much better will you designated us"; p. 79: "Calvanistic"; p. 276: "He fell on sleep."

But, not to conclude on a negative note, there is an excellent bibliography and, as becomes a book of this type, a full index.

*Alma College*

JOSEPH S. BRUSHER, S.J.

THE PRACTICE OF RELIGION. By Frederick C. Grant. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1946. Pp. 271. \$2.50.

Of set purpose the author's viewpoint is adogmatic. Yet, speaking for himself, "he finds the nearest approach to the ideal of free and comprehensive, and yet positive and historical, Catholicism expressed in the Churches of the Anglican Communion" (p. 265). His exhortations to practice religion, which he defines as "life controlled by the consciousness of God," are not merely colored, but dominated, by the supposition that God is the God apprehended historically by this "free and comprehensive Catholicism." The supposition, of course, invalidates to a degree the claim that the treatment is adogmatic, for arguably an individual's life may be controlled by consciousness of a God who is conceived as other than the God of "positive and historical, free and comprehensive Catholicism." In point of fact, then, the congregation that will docilely hear the exhortation will be a Liberal Protestant one. Others, Catholics certainly and old-fashioned Protestants not a few, will remain cold to Dr. Grant's hortatory efforts.

The meaning of faith, the distinction of natural from supernatural religion, would seem to need clarification before we talk of the practice of religion. Dr. Grant himself deprecates the emotional revivalism of the last century (pp. 25-27). Nevertheless, emotionalism appears to be the only alternative to a faith grounded on a proof of supernatural revelation. Faith, as far as

this reviewer can detect in the book, comes not by hearing, but begins in an innate consciousness of God. Its progress is "a venture," "self-committal, trust, launching out in confidence, the act of taking something for granted plus the further act of proceeding on such an assumption" (p. 72). There are indications and hints that the venture is not a pursuit of the will-o'-the-wisp, but they are considerably lower in logical weight than certain proofs. Broad-mindedly, to be sure, "we are prepared to assign an indefinite number of miracles . . . to the action of the naïve religious-artistic and poetic sense upon the early tradition of Christ's life and ministry" (p. 86). Faith, however, does not rest on miracles, nor upon "the deductive and artificial theories of Greek or Latin schoolmen" (p. 86). And, after all, what are miracles? "The modern mind is almost overwhelmed by the increase of the miraculous in our own times: only we call it the growth of science" (p. 84). We recommend to Dr. Grant's meditation the saying of Confucius: "If names be not used correctly, then speech gets tied up in knots; and if speech be so, then business comes to a standstill" (*Analecets*, XIII, 3). It were better to drop the term miracle than to attach to it a sense wholly alien to the traditional definition.

A faith too modern to rest upon "the antiquated assumption of signs and wonders" (p. 85) must seek justification in the assumption of the infallibility of autonomous immanence. "C'est le coeur qui sent Dieu et non la raison. Voilà ce que c'est la foi, Dieu sensible au coeur, non à la raison." So averred Pascal, who saw by intuition whither the dissolving thought of the Reformation was tending. Religion, avers Dr. Grant in Pascalian vein, must start with my inner consciousness of God, howsoever anemic that consciousness may be. Reason refuses to go bail for the trustworthiness of this consciousness, for reason at its best proposes God only as "the great Probability" (p. 97). To be "certain" of Him and of what He is, I must grope with the arms of "prayer and communion" (Ch. VI). This certainty, again, must not be understood as reasoned proof, but is the externalizing, the taking for granted, of my ideal of what kind of God is needed to bring order into the chaos outside me and within the microcosm of my own soul. "He must," apostrophizes Dr. Grant, "be one who is interested in the affairs of this particular universe. . . . He must be free . . . to follow up His original miracle of creation with continual acts of preservation and sustentation. . . . He must possess boundless foresight" (pp. 98-99). And so on and on, to the synthesis of a divine being such as will satisfy my exigencies.

Credentials of "the Church" are of the same order—the halo of antiquity on its brow, the varieties of its religious experience, the Kantian values of God, Freedom, Immortality, for which it stands. Even dogma, *bête noire*

though it be to the free modern mind, may have glamor. For "it has come as a great discovery to many a man of the present day that the old, traditional dogmas of the Christian faith, understood in a modern way, and interpreted as the products of religious experience, do shed light on life's central mysteries, and actually prove useful guides to a deeper and richer meaning in human destiny" (p. 208). Nor may Western man escape dogma, for Christian dogma is the ethos determining the mores of our civilization. His religious, mental, and moral reactions are conditioned by it as inevitably as his clothing habits run to two-piece suits instead of Tahitian sarongs. Dr. Grant sees fit to illustrate this osmotic absorption of dogma by "the Irish policeman on your beat or the washerwoman who comes on Monday" who allegedly know no more of their beliefs than is implied in simple prayers, but whose whole character is molded by their indirect influence (p. 205). However, merely noting this, along with a few other outworn *canards* about the True Church (e.g. pp. 186-87; 206-7), the reviewer wishes to register skepticism anent the possibility of "the Church" and "dogma"—in the sense attached to the terms by the author—erecting an effective sea-wall against the irreligious secularism of our times. Currently Dr. Morrison in *The Christian Century* is discussing Protestantism in America and is amazingly frank in admitting "the Church's" progressive loss of influence. Nor is Dr. Grant unaware of the same disquieting phenomenon (cf., e.g., pp. 162-63). Could these earnest gentlemen find footing on the Rock of Peter, they would see from that coign of vantage what is really wrong with religion in America.

In separate chapters Dr. Grant addresses sin, suffering, and social unrest, which nowadays impinge so painfully and persistently on our consciousness. Religion must take up the challenge hurled by these three disturbers of the peace or relinquish its claim to be the light of life. It must explain the anomaly of sin, suffering, and social strife; must argue down the despair or cynicism they engender, and afford motivation and means for the individual's combat against them. Christianity, Dr. Grant senses, should have all the answers, and the fervor of his emotional appeal in the three chapters is admirable. Doubtless, such emotionalism has its place and will stir the well-disposed. But we find it hard to fancy the complacent sinner, the sore-tried cancer-victim, the profit-gorged economic baron, reacting favorably to the exhortation. They would, belike, borrow Shylock's rejoinder: "On what compulsion must I? Tell me that!" For it is precisely when good works are asked of it, that religion founded on sentiment and of fluid dogmatic content is found wanting. Relatively futile, too, is the appeal to Christianity and its principles as the ethos of the Western world. As well

cherish the Pollyannish hope that the sentiment of patriotism will insure civic duty without the intervention of F.B.I. operatives and Internal Revenue collectors. Pippa cheerily sang her song of innocence, but it was only in the poet's fancy that the lechers and gangsters who heard her forthwith abandoned their dark designs.

*St. Mary's College*

GEORGE C. RING, S.J.

ROMANISM AND THE GOSPEL. By C. Anderson Scott. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1946 (first printed in Great Britain, 1937). Pp. 202. \$2.00.

The author of this book is intent upon showing how wide and deep is the chasm that separates the Catholic Church from the Church of Christ, as revealed in the Gospels. In two-hundred pages the reader is taken on excursions covering the whole field of theology and ecclesiastical history. Many great problems and their solutions are crowded into brief paragraphs.

The regular line is followed in discussing most of the controverted doctrines, such as: the necessity of good works for salvation, the existence of purgatory, indulgences, "Mariolatry," veneration of saints, the use of relics, the sacrifice of the Mass, and the priesthood. The author's general method is to trace each of these "perversions" either to Judaic influences or to pagan superstitions which were allowed, even in the earliest days of Christianity, to corrupt the pure teaching and discipline of Christ. Not until the sixteenth century did the Protestant Reformers rediscover the true message of the Gospels. Even these first Protestant theologians failed to reach the whole truth. They believed, for example, in "original sin," for which, we are told, "there is no place in modern Protestant theology" (p. 77). The author is also forced to lament Luther's persistence in holding out for the "real Presence" in his writings on the Eucharist (p. 84). Early Protestants had much to unlearn.

Much stress is placed upon the similarity between the Catholic Church and modern totalitarianism. In exposing the way in which the monarchic episcopate developed, the author tells us: "It [the Church] was to be a fascist state, a dictatorship" (p. 10). A quotation from the Bull of Pius IX, defining the Immaculate Conception, is followed by this comment:

The first thing we notice is how exactly the tone and attitude towards mankind by which this proclamation is inspired have in recent times been reproduced in the dictatorships which now control the peoples in certain countries of Europe. The only difference being that while the totalitarian State threatens penalties which extend to this life only, the Papal dictator threatens consequences which reach into eternity (p. 74).

Further on, we are told that "the Papacy is in fact a totalitarian State. . . as in Germany and Italy . . . the common people are under a local dictator (i.e., the clergy) as well as under a Supreme Dictator, who lives in the capital" (p. 184). It was in the proclamation of papal infallibility in 1870 that "the concentration of supreme authority in the hands of the Pope received final recognition" (p. 191). Significant in the Vatican decrees is the fact that the Pope is described as "the Roman Pontiff, a pagan title of a pagan office. The readoption of this title by the popes marks the fact that the Papacy is a human empire, using religious instincts and needs of men to forge fetters on those whom Christ would fain make free" (p. 193). Finally, any prospective convert to Catholicism is warned that the price for accepting the authority of Rome is "the dethroning of his reason . . . and the giving to his conscience notice to resign" (p. 200).

The book has no index; the text is rarely annotated; and a list of some dozen common reference titles takes the place of a bibliography. Not intended for scholars or for Catholic readers, it is worthy of notice only in so far as it illustrates the way one writer has made use of a popular antipathy of our day as a convenient and up-to-date weapon against the Church.

*Weston College*

F. O. CORCORAN, S.J.

**THE GREAT DIVORCE.** By C. S. Lewis. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1946. Pp. 133. \$1.50.

Commenting on a half hour he spent examining a railway bookstall, Mr. Arnold Lunn (*The Third Day*, p. xli) remarks: "C.F. [sic!] Lewis's books were prominently displayed. The popularity of his admirable works of Christian apologetics is clear evidence of an increasing demand for undiluted Christianity."

Surely "an increasing demand for undiluted Christianity" should encourage those whose privilege and duty it is to win an unchristian world to Christianity. But to assume that such undiluted Christianity is presented in the books of C. S. Lewis is quite another thing—in fact, something that is incapable of strict proof. Canon G. D. Smith (*The Clergy Review*, Feb., 1945, p. 65) has the following to say: "In his dynamist conception of sonship [as presented in *Beyond Personality* and based on Mr. Lewis' doctrine of the Fall as explained in *The Problem of Pain*] Mr. Lewis is akin to Baius, for whom 'the justification of the ungodly consists in the observance of the commandments'—a doctrine regarded by the Catholic Church as a departure from the Christian tradition (cf. *DB*, 1042)." And Canon Smith adds: that, although Mr. Lewis' "doctrine on the Christian life would thus be consistent with his doctrine on the Fall . . . , it is not the Catholic doctrine."

I do not wish in the least to detract from the very obvious good effects of Mr. Lewis' books. However, from the fact that they contain much good, it does not follow that they contain the whole good of an undiluted Christianity.

Moreover, a Catholic reviewer must take cognizance of the strictures of Canon Law, especially, in the case of such books as the present, of canon 1399, 4°, regarding the reading of books by non-Catholics treating *ex professo* of religion. In the past few years, many of Mr. Lewis' books dealing professedly with religious subjects have been warmly praised by Catholic reviewers. To me at least, it is not at all clear that these reviewers have been aware that those books of Mr. Lewis could not be read by a Catholic without permission from legitimate authority unless it was morally certain that they contained nothing against the Catholic faith. It is patently quite important that before praising Mr. Lewis' books and recommending them to Catholic readers, a Catholic reviewer should have such moral certainty. In my opinion, *The Great Divorce* does not come under the prohibition of canon 1399, 4°, and hence may be read without permission.

Following the legend that on a certain day of the year the damned enjoy a brief respite from hell, the author of *The Great Divorce* imagines a bus trip from hell to heaven. On arrival at the plains that lie before the heavenly mountain concealed in the distance, the damned souls find the grass hard as steel and the bushes as impenetrable as barbed wire.

Suddenly, the blessed appear and try to persuade the lost souls to forsake their sinful attachments. The modernistic bishop, the avaricious money-grabber, the cynic, the vain and selfish woman, the conceited artist, and the impure vampire—all refuse to give up their desires.

Though all this might seem to indicate that Mr. Lewis allows for a change of disposition of will and state of soul after death, nevertheless, he does not clearly teach this. By a most curious inversion of time (in fact, he turns it quite inside out!), the author shows that their souls had already on earth made the choices which they make for better or for worse, at the heaven-end of the bus ride.

Despite Mr. Lewis' insistence that he does not mean to speculate on the condition of the after-life, there are, nevertheless, indications of a certain indifferentism—a defect quite apparent in his other books. From the psychological point of view, *The Great Divorce* is very interesting as an imaginative analysis of attachment and detachment. But, for those who desire a really powerful story of the difference between heaven and hell, we recommend St. Luke's account of Dives and Lazarus.

UNE PHILOSOPHIE EXISTENTIELLE: L'EXISTENCE D'APRÈS KARL JASPERS. By Joseph de Tonquédec. Paris: Beauchesne, 1945. Pp. 141. 87 fr.

A recent report from Germany notes that the editorial board of the first postwar intellectual journal to be licensed at Heidelberg—*Die Wandlung*—includes the well-known professor of philosophy, Karl Jaspers. Taking an ever more critical and independent position with regard to his contemporaries, Jaspers has developed a highly personal philosophy of existence which treats the major problems in a lucid and orderly way rarely found in contemporary German philosophy. For this reason, Tonquédec has made a wise choice for his analysis of that “existential” mode of thinking which is so popular today in literature and theology as well as in philosophy. Except for a dissertation by the late German Benedictine scholar, Ludwig Jaspers, I know of no clearer or more succinct exposition of Karl Jaspers’ *Existenzphilosophie* than Tonquédec’s study. Of special value is the chapter devoted to the concept of liberty and its relation to arbitrary free choice, necessity, and predestination. Scholastically-trained minds should welcome the author’s guidance in clarifying the special use of terms and the dialectical approach which have characterized this current of thought from Kierkegaard to the present-day Theology of Crisis.

According to Jaspers, the first task of philosophy is provocative. It must rouse man from naïve engagement in empirical being and also from endless scientific investigation to a realization of his own existence and of the issues which it raises. Abstractive reason, however, is not a suitable instrument for exploring the mysteries of personal existence. Only in the act of free decision is light first cast upon the unconditioned ground of existence of which we become aware in genuine philosophizing. Abandoning the ways of objective knowledge, we can perceive human freedom only in the very “leap” itself by which a man accepts the responsibility for his entire self and for its placement in the mundane situation. But no man grasps himself fully unless he acknowledges both his need for communication with other men and his ultimate dedication to transcendence. It is only when the philosopher attempts to decode the ciphers of transcendence that the overwhelming ambiguity and equivocality of being is brought home to him in its full force. He learns that experience and technology, art and religious creeds, and even metaphysical systems are only obscure signs of the Absolute which beckon to us without ever compelling us by their evidence. The final and retroactively decisive cipher is failure itself. Jaspers holds out no consolation for the philosopher but offers the certitude which ruination and death bring concerning the lasting city, which does not pass when all things pass away.

Drawing upon his previous examinations of Le Roy, Bergson, and Blondel, the author briefly indicates the parallels between Jaspers and the phi-

losophies of creative evolution and action. It is unfortunate that these resemblances, already signalized by Przywara and Marc, were not discussed at greater length. If a more detailed analysis had been undertaken, the author would have been obliged to consider the profound differences which obtain notably between Jaspers' and Blondel's notions of philosophy, intelligence, and religion. In a final chapter of forty pages Tonquédec offers an appreciation and criticism which in some measure summarize the results of his previous studies in anti-intellectualism and voluntarism. This evaluation, as applied to Jaspers, recognizes the genuine service rendered by philosophy of existence both in defending the concrete individual against the tyranny of the Hegelian system and in insisting upon the ineffable mystery of God in the face of the banal features in modern devotional life and the suspicious facility of the ordinary treatise *De Deo Uno*. But neither personal human dignity nor the divine majesty is successfully defended by drawing a *cordon sanitaire* around reason and its functions: this is to relapse into another and irremediable form of abstractionism which cannot be reconciled with an integral humanism. But this critique would have been even more forceful and pointed if the differences between Heidegger and Jaspers over the possibility of a fundamental ontology and the very meaning of "existentialism" had been investigated. The chapter treating of *Dasein* suffers from a similar transposition of Jaspers into the French intellectual milieu.

Although this book was printed in 1945, it bears a 1943 imprimatur. This fact is noteworthy in view of the author's remark (p. v) that he was obliged to take a German version of existential philosophy because of the absence of any complete and organized exposition among French philosophers. It was in the same year 1943 that Sartre's thesis on Being and Nothing appeared along with Souriau's work on the Modes of Existence. Since then, existentialism of a somewhat Heideggerian sort has taken firm root in French philosophical soil, even becoming something of a literary sensation. If Tonquédec were now to consider this more recent French movement, he would place us even more deeply in his debt.

*Saint Louis University*

JAMES COLLINS

## DESCRIPTIVE NOTICES

SANCTITY IN AMERICA. By the Most Reverend Amleto Giovanni Cicognani. Paterson, N. J.: St. Anthony Guild Press. Pp. xxvi + 244. \$2.00.

In this third edition of *Sanctity in America*, His Excellency, the Apostolic

Delegate, adds new strength to his thesis that sanctity, even of the heroic stamp, is possible in these United States. The first edition of the work gave us only twenty-four short biographies, because then, the author says, "the purpose of the book was to place in relief those candidates for beatification and canonization whose Causes had been begun and were being carried on, or at least were in preparation." Since that time, however, the scope has broadened to include nineteen "others who died in the odor of sanctity in the territory that now forms these United States, even though up to the present there has been no thought of introducing their Causes." This gives a basis for division into parts. Part One includes those who have some official claim to sanctity, and Part Two those who have not. The author has gathered his material from every period of American Church History, from Pedro Martinez, the Jesuit protomartyr of Florida, down to Sister Miriam Teresa Demjanovich, who died in 1927. Representatives of almost every nationality, of every section of our country, of every walk of life—bishops, priests, religious, men and women—march through his pages to show that the land of the free is not sterile land once it has been watered by God's grace. Only New England seems not to produce.

Although His Excellency has uncovered no new facts of history to delight scholars, nor inspired his readers with a brilliant appreciation of any one of his subjects—for his accounts are factual and based on secondary sources—still his work is not without strong spiritual impact. It is hard to analyse, but it is there. Reflection on the forty-three saintly lives that have been lived by men and women around us, will bring the author's message home with its full force. "Ab esse ad posse valet illatio," he seems to say. Sanctity has been won in America; therefore, it can be won here. His thesis is just as certain, just as conclusive, as that. This third edition has a fine index, and the printing and illustrations are worthy of the St. Anthony Press.

*Lenox, Mass.*

JOHN R. POST

COLLECTED PAPERS OF EVELYN UNDERHILL. Edited by Lucy Menzies. New York: Longmans, Green and Company, Inc., 1946. Pp. 240. \$1.75.

This collection of studies in mysticism and prayer by Evelyn Underhill is introduced by Bishop Barkway of Saint Andrews who summarizes the author's progress in thought and spirituality. Most students of mystical theology are familiar with the works of this author. The lectures contained in this book show the advance of her thought from 1922–1937 in a series of discussions which she presented to various groups in her effort to foster the interior life among her associates in the Anglican Church. Her audiences

embraced the laity, priests, and teachers of Anglo-Catholic bent within that Church.

*Weston College*

EDWARD L. MURPHY, S.J.

**MIND THE MASS.** By Rev. Joseph A. Dunney. New York: Benziger Brothers, 1945. Pp. xii + 238. \$2.50.

The present book may aptly be said to be a sequel, a supplementary volume to the author's earlier work, *The Mass*. There, while not failing to point a pregnant spiritual lesson frequently, his chief concern appeared to be to interpret the inner structure of the Mass-liturgy. The present book, bearing the sub-title, "Eucharistic Meditations," is a series of thirty-seven papers suggested by, or related to, as many citations from the sacred liturgy. Revolving around the Mass of the Catechumens, the Offertory, the Consecration, and the Communion, these reflections are well calculated to awaken and foster deep religious emotions. Instructive, unctuous, often couched in biblical language, they link the Old and New Testaments closely together, while intimating applications very pertinent to our modern culture. They converge to convince us that the Mass is indeed the heart of our religion, and that in it we have everything needful, or even helpful, for the complete expansion of our spiritual life.

In its diction, *Mind the Mass* is widely divergent from its predecessor. This may well be owing to the fact that its author envisaged a set of readers differing greatly from those for whom he previously wrote. Whatever the explanation, if the style were simpler, more chaste, less flowery, many readers would suffer fewer distractions in its perusal and would comprehend the thought more readily and surely.

*Woodstock College*

D. J. M. CALLAHAN, S.J.

**A GREAT SACRAMENT.** By Dom Albert Hammenstede, O.S.B. St. Louis: Pio Decimo Press, 1945. Pp. 31.

It is the purpose of this artistically designed little booklet to furnish an inspirational interpretation of St. Paul's words to the Ephesians on the subject of marriage: "This is a great mystery, but I speak in Christ and in the Church." In the light of this text the author discusses his subject under the following heads: (1) the vocation of marriage; (2) the inner mystery of the marriage union; (3) the ideal of the betrothed; (4) the ideal of the married. The booklet is reprinted from an article which appeared in the *Homiletic and Pastoral Review*, XXXVII (1937), 25-33; 150-56.

Dom Hammenstede has written an eloquent explanation of, and plea for,

idealism in Christian marriage. Unfortunately, the style of his essay is marred by occasional exaggerations, such as this imaginary exchange between the bride and groom at the moment of marriage: "The Christ who lives in you is longing for me, and my Christ is yearning for you" (p. 15), and by occasional distortions such as: "Christ leads what may be called a womanly existence, inasmuch as since His Ascension He continues to live on earth in the Church" (p. 12). The brochure will be of greater interest to lay people and priests actively engaged in the ministry than to professional theologians concerned with speculation on the nature of marriage and the exegesis of Ephesians 5: 22.

*West Baden College*

W. LE SAINT, S.J.

INITIATION À L'HISTOIRE ECCLÉSIASTIQUE. By Dom Charles Poulet. Paris: Beauchesne et Fils, 1944. Pp. vi + 360.

This slender volume is a survey of the Church from the earliest times to the eve of the French Revolution. There it ends abruptly, because the Revolution, says the author, was too complex a movement to be explained succinctly. The inspiration of the book was the author's conviction that all baptized persons should know at least a little of the history of Mother Church. The critic is disarmed by the statement in the Preface that only those points which stand out in silhouette, as it were, will find a place in the text; only essentials, therefore, will be mentioned—only persons and events of interest to the casual reader. Striking omissions are acknowledged: for example, Julian the Apostate and St. Cyprian are not even mentioned; Donatism has no place; St. Ambrose receives only passing notice; and so of other persons and events. If the reader is interested in them, he may satisfy his curiosity, the author says, with other works which are at hand. Scholars and students preparing for examinations are warned that this book is not for them. How completely the author keeps his limited audience—casual readers—in mind is revealed by the bibliography, which lists only French works or translations into French; this leads to the paradox that not a single British scholar is referred to in connection with the Protestant revolt in England. The hope of the author is, in short, that this modest study will reveal to the reader the sufferings and the glory of the Church and will bring the saints closer.

*West Baden College*

CHARLES H. METZGER, S.J.

SPIRITUAL PROBLEMS OF OUR TIMES. By Luigi Sturzo. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., Inc., 1945. \$2.00.

The problems discussed in this book are not so much those of the ascetical life as those of the religious or Christian life in general. The distinguished

Italian priest and sociologist gives us the reflections and fruits of fifty years of experience with people of all sorts.

The first section of the book, "The Quest of the Truth," deals with "The Present," the morality of art, knowledge and the intuition of God, and the Absolute. Like Père Gabriel Picard, S.J., Don Sturzo defends a certain natural and obscure intuition of God.

The second part, "The Quest of the Good," is easier to follow and more practical. It will surely not surprise anyone that Don Sturzo should exert himself to make all his readers social-minded and thoroughly apostolic. He would have every Christian not only exemplary in his own private life, but also an intelligent and energetic collaborator with the hierarchy of the Church in extending the kingdom of God. Among the most interesting pages of this work are those which give a brief account of a number of contemporary Italian laymen who have signalized themselves as excellent Catholics and as models for all who would lead in Catholic action. Some of them were learned professors and writers, like Contardo Ferrini; some were physicians, like Moscati and Necchi; some, social workers, like Bartolo Longo; and some, students and youth leaders, like Frassati. Of these some already have the title "Venerable" and may become canonized saints.

A "political international structure" is necessary for world order and peace. In effecting a general peace everyone has a part to play and a duty to perform. Peace requires a certain spirit of sacrifice and much virtue in those who are to bring it about and maintain it.

*St. Mary's College*

G. AUG. ELLARD, S.J.

#### BOOKS RECEIVED

America Press, New York: *Major Trends in American Church History*, by Francis X. Curran, S.J. (pp. xviii + 198, \$2.50).

Aubier, Paris: *L'Exégèse de s. Augustin prédicateur*, by Maurice Pontet (pp. 638).

Beyaert et Fils, Paris: *Cogito cartésien et réflexion thomiste*, by Joseph De Finance, S.J. (pp. 185); *Être et agir dans la philosophie de s. Thomas*, by Joseph De Finance, S.J. (pp. viii + 372).

Beyaert, Bruges: *Guillaume de Saint-Thierry, l'homme et son oeuvre*, by Jean-Marie Déchanet, O.S.B. (pp. xiv + 214); *Praxis Matrimonialis ad Usus Parochi et Confessarii*, by A. De Smet, edited by A. Verhamme (3d ed.; pp. 180); *Aux sources de la spiritualité de Guillaume de Saint-Thierry*, by Jean-Marie Déchanet, O.S.B. (pp. xii + 85); *Tractatus de*

- Legibus*, by Joseph Brys (pp. xvi + 144); *Tractatus de Virtute Religionis*, by O. E. Dignant (pp. xvi + 356).  
 Bruce Publishing Co., Milwaukee: *De Sacramentis in Genere*, by Emmanuel Doronzo, O.M.I. (pp. xviii + 595, \$3.75).  
 Burns, Oates & Washbourne, Ltd., London: *Back to the Bible*, by Cuthbert Lattey, S.J. (pp. 128, 5/).  
 Catholic University of America Press, Washington: *The Doctrine of St. Augustine on Sanctity*, by Edward J. Carney, O.S.F.S. (pp. x + 121); *The Venerable Bede: His Spiritual Teachings*, by Sister M. Thomas Aquinas Carroll, (pp. ix + 270).  
 F. A. Davis Co., Philadelphia: *Medical Ethics for Nurses*, by Charles J. McFadden, O.S.A. (pp. xiii + 256, \$3.00).  
 Desclée, De Brouwer & Cie., Paris: *Notre sacerdoce*: by Abbé Georges Lemaître (pp. 260).  
 Duke University Press, Durham, N. C.: *Religion In the Struggle For Power*, by J. Milton Yinger (pp. 275, \$3.00).  
 Editorial Buena Prensa, Mexico City: *Metaphysica Generalis*, by Julio Dávila, S.J. (pp. xvi + 303, \$12.00 [Mexican], stiff binding; \$10.00 [Mexican], paper binding).  
 Gregorian University, Rome: *La doctrine trinitaire de s. Hilaire de Poitiers*, by Pierre Smulders, S.J. (pp. 300).  
 Harper & Brothers, New York, N. Y.: *Best Sermons*, edited by G. Paul Butler (1946 ed.; pp. xx + 324, \$2.75); *Faith And Reason*, by Nels F. S. Ferre, (pp. xii + 247, \$2.50).  
 Herder Book Co., St. Louis: *Are Catholic Schools Progressive?* by L. J. O'Connell, (pp. ix + 158, \$1.75); *Christianity*, by Joseph H. Fichter, S.J., (pp. ix + 267, \$2.50); *The Mysteries of Christianity*, by M. J. Scheeben, trans. by Cyril Vollert, S.J. (pp. ix + 834, \$7.50).  
 Instituto de Estudios Politicos, Madrid: *Cuadernos de estudios africanos*, (pp. 229); *Revista de estudios politicos*, Volume XIV, (pp. xvi + 519).  
 Kenedy & Sons, New York, N. Y.: *The Kingdom of Jesus*, by St. John Eudes, (pp. xxxv + 348); *The Sacred Heart of Jesus*, by St. John Eudes, (pp. xxx + 183).  
 Librairie Payot, Lausanne: *Traité de psychologie de la religion*, by Georges Berguer (pp. viii + 367, 12.50 fr.).  
 Longmans, Green & Co., Inc., New York: *Collected Papers of Evelyn Underhill*, edited by Lucy Menzies (pp. 240, \$2.75).  
 Morehouse-Gorham Co., New York: *Mother Of Carmel*, by E. Allison Peers (pp. 220, \$2.50).

- Newman Bookshop, Westminster, Maryland: *Counsels To Confessors*, by St. Leonard of Port Maurice (pp. xii + 86, \$1.50); *Life of St. Stephen Harding, Abbot of Citeaux*, by J. B. Dalgairns (pp. x + 208, \$2.50); *Master and Model*, by Simon Conrad, O.F.M.Cap. (pp. 123, \$1.50); *Meditation on the Passion*, compiled by a Sister of the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary (pp. viii + 305, \$3.75); *A Mystic under Arms*, by Eugene Boyland, O. Cist. R. (pp. 59, \$1.00); *The Sacred Ceremonies of Low Mass*, by Felix Zualdi, C.M. (pp. xx + 175); *The Spirit of Christ*, by Father James, O.F.M.Cap. (pp. xi + 222, \$2.50).
- Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Co., Philadelphia: *Christianity Rightly So Called*, by Samuel G. Craig (pp. viii + 270, \$2.00); *The New Modernism*, by Cornelius van Til (pp. xx + 384, \$3.75).
- Charles Scribner's Sons, New York: *Discerning the Signs of the Times*, by Reinhold Niebuhr (pp. x + 194, \$2.50).
- Vrin, Paris: *Dogme et spiritualité chez s. Cyrille d'Alexandrie*, by Hubert Du Manoir, S.J. (pp. 594, \$4.50).
- Joseph F. Wagner, Inc., New York: *Spiritual References for the Baltimore Catechism*, by G. H. Guyot, C.M. (pp. 155).