

a hostile Protestant state at a time when Catholicism was being effectively eradicated from other northern European kingdoms—we could justifiably expect to hear more than one-and-a-half cheers on this score.

The book does not advance any radically new theory or interpretation of the formation of a Catholic community in the core territories of the Tudor monarchy under Elizabeth I. Nonetheless, it is a rich and valuable conspectus of the core evidence and of the recent scholarly interpretations, and written with considerable empathy and insight.

*University of Warwick*

PETER MARSHALL

GEMEINSCHAFT DER KIRCHEN UND PETRUSAMT: LUTHERISCH-KATHOLISCHE ANNÄHERUNGEN. By the Gruppe von Farfa Sabina. Frankfurt: Otto Lembeck, 2010. Pp. 194. €18.

The Group of Farfa Sabina here presents its agreed statement on the thorny ecumenical issue of the role of the papacy in the service of Christian unity. It is an important contribution to the effort Pope John Paul II called for in his 1995 encyclical, *Ut unum sint*.

The response of the Lutheran and Catholic ecumenists in the report is serious and full of promise. It locates the Petrine ministry in the framework of the *communion of churches*, not the other way around. This perspective is the outcome of careful and (self-)critical historical reflection of the two confessional traditions, starting with Luther's judgment on papal authority and the Roman Catholic reaction (chap. 1), then Vatican I's stance on the primacy and infallibility of the pope (chap. 2). Further careful examination of the state of the question in recent decades leads to a "relecture" of Vatican I (in the concluding chap. 5). The statement critiques some positions taken recently by the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith (e.g., *Dominus Iesus* [2000]). Specifically, the nonrecognition of most Protestant ecclesial communities as full-fledged (or at least potential) "churches" would render the approach taken by the dialogue impossible. The Petrine ministry to Christian unity requires the pope to serve as linchpin of a communion of "churches."

In sum, the argument is that Vatican I did not rule out any communion ecclesiology, but simply failed to address that element of the tradition. Vatican II, treating the collegiality of bishops in *Lumen gentium* no. 23, complemented Vatican I with the perspective of a communion of churches by stating that "the one and only Catholic Church" "comes into being" "in and from" "the particular churches" led by bishops.

The extent of the consensus reached here obviates one known theological difficulty after another. It also adumbrates possibilities on the practical level. This remarkable articulation of a common understanding of the need

for, and the contours of, the role of the bishop of Rome in the communion of churches has not come without years of preparing the ground. James Puglisi, co-chair of the Farfa Sabina group and current head of the Society of the Atonement, edited a collection of essays on the topic in 2010 (see Jeffrey Gros's informative review in *Theological Studies* 72 [2010] 647–49). These essays were first presented as papers in 2005, when the dialogue group that produced the present report began its consultations. Previously Puglisi had published the papers of a 1997 Rome conference on the subject, an early response to *Ut unum sint*.

The Group of Farfa Sabina is made up of 14 Lutheran and Catholic participants from Scandinavia, Germany, France, Italy, and the United States. They prepared drafts (largely in English, though the final document, reviewed here, was redacted in German) and discussed them in six meetings over the years 2005 to 2010, principally in the Brigittine convent of Farfa Sabina. They modeled themselves, it would seem, after the long-standing francophone Groupe des Dombes, which over many years has put out several notable ecumenical statements. They take a similar tack in, e.g., distinguishing and relating the communal, the synodal/collegial, and the personal dimensions of the exercise of authority in the churches (see Groupe des Dombes, “*One Teacher*”: *Doctrinal Authority in the Church* [2010]). The prominent synodal character of authoritative acts in Eastern Christianity and in the churches of the Reformation can condition the personal service of the bishop of Rome as successor of Peter in connecting all churches in a bond of communion, and vice versa. A far-reaching autonomy of the single churches and of local churches seems to follow from the perspective of a koinonia, a communion of churches. Of course, this depends also on the desire of the churches to acknowledge the contribution of a reformed papacy to the Christian unity for which we pray.

All in all, this stimulating study is a worthy response to John Paul II's request in *Ut unum sint*. An English-language version should be made available.

*Marquette University, Milwaukee*

PAUL MISNER

WOMEN IN INDIA: NEGOTIATING BODY, RECLAIMING AGENCY. By Metti Amirtham, S.C.C. Delhi: ISPCK, 2011. Pp. xxxiv + 195. \$11.

The oppressive situation of women in India continues to a great extent in spite of the economic progress the country is making. Headlines about rape, kidnapping, abduction, battering, and dowry death have become the order of the day. As a result, feelings of frustration are rising among people who are committed to the empowerment of women. No improvement seems to be in sight in spite of efforts made so far. In this context the