

## BOOK REVIEWS

INTRODUCTIO IN S. THEOLOGIAM. By Gabriel M. Roschini, O.S.M. Rome: Officium Libri Catholici, 1947. Pp. 112.

Since theology is a science quite unique in character, many administrators and professors in theological faculties and in seminaries appreciate the desirability, or rather the need, of an orientation course that may serve to introduce students to the work that will occupy four precious years of their lives. The present book was undertaken with this purpose in mind. Written in simple Latin, it could well be employed as a text for such a course, or at least could aid the professor in marshaling his knowledge for a brief series of lectures.

The author professedly takes as his guide the first question of the *Summa* of St. Thomas. The book, however, is not a commentary on that important first question, but rather derives from the ten articles a series of headings for its own subdivisions. The whole is arranged into two main parts. The first deals with the nature of theology, and under that designation includes consideration of the definition, the division, the properties, and the subject matter of sacred theology. The second part, which owes scarcely anything to Aquinas, treats of the method of sacred theology, and discusses in turn positive theology, speculative or Scholastic theology, the relations between these two methods, the evolution of dogmas, and a short sketch of the history of theology.

Most of these topics are widely, even violently, debated in our own time. The author is aware of most of the controversies, and sincerely endeavors to give an impartial account of varying views. He is not averse to expressing his own verdicts, which are generally in harmony with majority opinions. Needless to state, no theologian *de métier* will accept all of them. Perhaps the greatest value the little volume may have for teachers of an introductory course to theology is the convenient abundance of references given to recent books and articles on disputed points.

Theological students who read the book carefully will be able to escape, to their profit, the confusing experience of discovering too tardily the nature of theology and its procedures.

*St. Mary's College*

CYRIL VOLLERT, S.J.

PROTO-HISTORY. By H. C. E. Zacharias, Ph.D. St. Louis: B. Herder and Co., 1947. Pp. x + 391. \$4.00.

The book is described in the subtitle as "an explicative account of the development of human thought from Palaeolithic times to the Persian

monarchy." The author is professor of history in the Catholic University of Peiping. It is rather a survey of civilizations than a history of ideas, as the subtitle suggests. It is distinctly of a popular character, compiled largely from standard modern works; the author, however, has consulted the most representative books on the various historical areas and periods with which he deals. The author is a disciple of Father Schmidt, and his treatment throughout is governed by the theory of cultural diffusion which is associated with the name of that eminent scholar. As presented in the book, the theory supposes the existence of a single "Archaic" civilization, which developed from the contact of primitive, venatorial, and agricultural civilizations and expanded over the greater part of Asia and into Africa. It was characterized by theocracy and pacifism. In the third millennium B.C. the principle of professional war was introduced by the pastoral barbarians of the Asiatic steppes, who in successive waves of invasion impressed their own militarism upon the Archaic civilization. Militarism reached its peak in Assyria; and the complete ruin of civilization and the barbarization of the world was checked only by the Persian Empire, which imparted to the barbarian ideal of world domination the ethical element of Zoroastrianism. In this sweeping view of history the author's theorizing is usually well ahead of his evidence. This is only natural; the book takes in too much territory. While in many parts it offers an excellent summary, the general impression is sketchy.

In a work of such a wide scope it is inevitable that some errors should creep in, and that some opinions should be admitted which most modern scholars regard as untenable. Certainly the view that Adam's sin affected the germ-plasm of the whole human race is supported neither by theology nor biology. It would be difficult to demonstrate that all art is originally of magical intent. Modern Egyptologists do not regard Osiris as the god of the Nile. The identification of the *ka* with the *anima vegetativa et sensitiva* is misleading, to say the least; the same is true of the identification of the Sumerian conception of destiny with the *lex aeterna* of the Scholastics. That the Sumerian was not completely self-conscious is not a legitimate conclusion from the omission of sins of thought from his penitential formulae, although this inference has been drawn often enough before. The identification of Aton and Adonai is indefensible. The author has not taken account of the most recent studies of Sumerian and Babylonian chronology. Some of his interpretations are due to his theory of a *praeparatio evangelica* in the civilization of primitive man; others, to too ardent an apologetic. Thus he attributes the lofty ethical character of Zoroastrianism to the influence of Israelite exiles (who could scarcely have been the Israelites addressed by

Amos and Osee), and the solar monotheism of Ikhnaton to the teaching of Moses. Such an approach hardly recommends itself to a strictly historical method; it is an abuse of the "comparative" method of the classical historians of religion in an orthodox direction.

There are a few quaint spellings of proper names both ancient and modern (Barzun has become Borzun, and Rawlinson appears as Rowlinson), and a few minor typographical errors, besides some evidences of careless revision. The index is very full. The book is illustrated by a number of plates (selected, it appears, somewhat at random) and end maps.

*West Baden College*

JOHN L. MCKENZIE, S.J.

LA VIE RELIGIEUSE DANS L'ANCIENNE ÉGYPTÉ. By Jean Saint Fare Garnot. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1948. Pp. viii + 146. 150 fr.

ANCIENT EGYPTIAN RELIGION. By Henri Frankfort. New York: Columbia University Press, 1948. Pp. xiv + 172. \$3.00.

These two books cover the same ground, but from a different point of view. Professor Garnot, writing for the *Mythes et Religions* series, attempts to give a popular survey of Egyptian religion in the light of the most recent special studies. It is remarkable how much the author has compressed into what appears at first to be a rather slight book. In three chapters he presents a very complete account of the major Egyptian divinities, the temple and the cult, the dominating theologies, burial practices and the beliefs in the after-life. A supplementary sketch of the development of the Egyptian religion is devoted mostly to the religious revolution of Ikhnaton; Professor Garnot places the level of Ikhnaton's monotheism too high. The first chapter, dealing with the religious psychology of the Egyptians, points out the characteristic traits which govern his treatment—its joyous and peaceable character, the lively imagination with which natural forces are personified, the transcendence of the supernatural world, the reality of the image, and the creative power of the word. These cannot all be equally well justified. As Dr. Frankfort points out, the Egyptian gods do not have well-defined personalities; and while the divine order may be said to transcend the sensible world in the sense that it is distinct from the visible universe, the Egyptian order is merely a duplicate of the sensible universe writ large. The gods of Egypt never rose above the forces of nature.

Dr. Frankfort's book is not a history of Egyptian religion, but, as its subtitle indicates, an interpretation. It is an effort to reduce to unity the bewildering paradoxes of Egyptian religion, which Professor Garnot attributes to the diverse origins of the cults, the sacredness of tradition, and

the "animism" of the Egyptians. Neither Garnot nor Frankfort is satisfied with the merely descriptive method of Erman; nor do they accept the evolutionary scheme of Breasted. The principle on which Dr. Frankfort's synthesis is based is that the Egyptian universe was essentially static, "an implicit assumption that only the changeless is ultimately significant." What the principle must in the last analysis signify is that the Egyptians denied the reality of change; and this, I think, is equivalently what Dr. Frankfort intends. For the only change to which any significance is attached, in his view, is the recurring cyclical changes of nature, which are really a form of the static. Dr. Frankfort approaches his thesis from five points: the Egyptian gods, the State, the Egyptian way of life, the conception of the after-life, and literature and art. The gods are the creative power in nature (and thus essentially immanent), which is changeless beneath its recurring cycles. The State is embodied in the divine king, himself changeless, and is integrated into the order of nature by the peculiar cosmologico-ethical idea which the Egyptians called *Maat*. The Egyptian way of life consists in a personal integration into the order of nature, which was actually realized at death when the deceased was incorporated into nature. In literature and art Dr. Frankfort finds his principle illustrated in the dominance of a single theme; the ideal is permanence, not progression. Such a religion, it seems, could be summed up as static pantheism; but since Dr. Frankfort does not so summarize it, it is perhaps an over-simplification to attach such a label.

It seems likely, however, that most students will regard Dr. Frankfort's synthesis as an over-simplification of Egyptian religion. Undoubtedly, to the mind of this reviewer, Dr. Frankfort's treatment of many paradoxes as instances of the "multiplicity of approach," of concepts valid within their proper limits, is a sounder interpretation than treating them as an unrelated congeries of contradictions; it is more in harmony with the universal laws of thought, and with the nature of religious experience as known by induction. The question is whether under the multiplicity of approach there really lies the basic principle enunciated by Dr. Frankfort. There is much evidence presented in the book (some of it too briefly) which suggests that this interpretation leads in the right direction; only further study and criticism will determine the limits of its value.

*West Baden College*

JOHN L. MCKENZIE, S.J.

DIE PSALMEN. By Friedrich Nötscher. Würzburg: Echter-Verlag, 1947. Pp. VIII + 292.

The appearance of this volume dispels the fear which scriptural circles have had since 1939, that one of the great casualties of World War II would be the destruction of the strong, German Catholic biblical movement. For already a new series of Bible commentaries has been launched, two volumes of which have reached our country. It is known as the *Echter-Bibel*, the complete title of which is *Die Heilige Schrift in Deutscher Übersetzung*. The general editor of the Old Testament is Dr. Friedrich Nötscher of Bonn, and of the New Testament, Dr. Karl Staab of Würzburg. Most of the translators are members of the diocesan clergy and many of them are well known for their prewar researches, e.g., Dr. Johann Fischer of Würzburg, Dr. Hubert Junker of Trier, Dr. Friedrich Stummer of Munich, and Dr. Joseph Ziegler of Regensburg.

This *Echter-Bibel* is to contain a translation from the Hebrew and Greek and a simple explanation of the individual verses. Not as complete or as scientific as the *Bonner Bibelwerk*, it aims to reach members of the clergy and laity who must be satisfied with a translation and a commentary which, though solid, are written in a rather brief and popular fashion.

Dr. Nötscher begins the series with *Die Psalmen*. After a very short explanation of Hebrew poetry with its evident characteristics, he devotes three pages to a consideration of Special Introduction to the Psalms. With all commentators on the Psalms, he calls attention to their great social and religious superiority over all other ancient literature.

Though David is the author of many, most of them were written after his time. It is difficult to determine in many instances who an author was or in what circumstances an individual Psalm was composed. Some Psalms were adapted for liturgical use but it is impossible to know in every case whether a Psalm had its beginning in the life of an individual or in that of the nation. Certain it is, though, that some Psalms which concern an individual were adapted later for community use, and certain too that the number of individualistic Psalms is greater than was at one time thought. There are several messianic Psalms, but one must be careful to distinguish between those New Testament references which apply to the Messiah only in an accommodated sense and those which definitely describe Him or His type.

The author in the last paragraph of his Introduction (p. 5) declares that it will be a great advance if the new Latin Psalter should displace in ecclesiastical use the Gallican Psalter. His work had been done when the new Psalter appeared in 1945 (p. VI), but he declares that, while there are a few differences, he believes there is great agreement in meaning. And a careful comparison of these two modern Catholic translations supports that state-

ment. (Cf. *Biblica*, XXIX (1948) 141-46, for a review of Nötscher's work by Father Vaccari, Vice-Rector of the Pontifical Biblical Institute, who is generally believed to have been one of the professors who prepared the Latin Psalter). In the footnotes the author himself makes occasional references to the Latin Psalter.

For each Psalm, Nötscher gives a brief title, a short introduction, then a translation divided into stanzas when possible and clarified by marginal notes, and finally what amounts to a verse-by-verse explanation. Between the translation and the commentary are brief critical notes, the Hebrew words however not being written in Hebrew characters.

The translation runs along smoothly and should appeal to German language readers. The explanatory notes are remarkably clear and interesting; they contain abundant references to other parts of the Bible, to ancient and modern literature and to the liturgical use of the Psalms. (The reference in Ps. 65: 2, 3, is to the Introit of the Requiem Mass rather than to the Offertory, as is stated on p. 124).

Dr. Nötscher does not give a bibliography, nor does his book contain an index. The format is quite inferior to that of prewar German books but it is far better than one might expect. Americans will be interested to see that the book was published under Military Government License Control.

The reviewer is happy to introduce this volume to readers of *THEOLOGICAL STUDIES* as the first in what he hopes will be an equally well received and successful series of postwar German Catholic commentaries.

*St. John's Seminary, Brighton, Mass.*

M. P. STAPLETON

**JEREMIAS: DIE KLAGELIEDER.** By Freidrich Nötscher. Würzburg: Echter-Verlag, 1947. Pp. 175. 23.

One of the first things which a reviewer of this volume does is to compare it with Dr. Nötscher's book on Jeremias, published in 1934 as a contribution to the *Bonner Bibelwerk: Das Buch Jeremias*. He finds that the treatment of the subject is essentially the same but that the present work is much more condensed, that its notes have been prepared evidently for a circle of less specialized readers, that in many instances the translation varies from the earlier one but that no great changes have been introduced, that, at least to this particular reviewer, to whom German is a foreign language, the more recent version seems to run along more smoothly than does that of 1934, that here and there the spelling of some proper names is different.

The author is quite successful in presenting Jeremias as one of the great characters of the Old Testament. He gives a good picture of the religious, political and social background of the late seventh and early sixth centuries

B.C.; and through his translation and notes he enables the reader to understand the rapid moral and material decline of the Chosen People from the comparatively high standards of the pre-Jeremian era to the fearful desolation of the Siege of Jerusalem and the beginning of the Exile.

In accordance with the plan of the *Echter-Bibel*, Dr. Nötscher gives a very brief introduction, in which the relationship between Jeremias and Osee and between Jeremias and Isaías is lightly touched upon (in his note on 49:7 he compares Jeremias and Abdias); the editorial work of Baruch is described and the differences between the Massoretic text and the Septuagint is referred to. Then follow his translation, based most frequently upon the Hebrew, and a verse-by-verse commentary, which is occasionally (e.g., 43:13; 47:5) too brief for a non-specialist to appreciate but which is rich in biblical, archaeological, and profane references. The many critical notes show how often the translator departs from the Massoretic text.

Very briefly does the author refer to the connection between the Pentateuch and Jeremias, e.g., 7:21; 11:1-14. The importance of Jeremias for the development of the messianic idea is stressed, though 31:22 is rightly rejected as referring to the Virgin Birth. The imprecations which are found in Jeremias do not militate against the inspired character of the Book, though admittedly they are not in accord with the higher ideals of Christianity. The note on 50:1 suggests the possibility of inspired additions to the original by a disciple of the prophet.

The reviewer confesses that in the light of present-day world conditions he had to pause at the mention in the note on 51:27 f. of two peoples who in modern speech are referred to as symbols of national cruelty, the Huns and the Turks; he feels that other names could well be substituted for these two.

The second part of the volume contains Dr. Nötscher's translation and commentary of Lamentations. These are five independent poems written on the occasion of Jerusalem's destruction in 586 B.C. All five have one and the same author, who was an eye witness of the catastrophe but cannot today be identified with certainty. Even though early translations considered Jeremias to be the author, perhaps the arguments against that view are the stronger. The first four poems are of course acrostic and written in the so-called *Qina* meter, and the fifth is alphabetic, i.e., there are twenty-two verses as there are twenty-two letters in the Hebrew alphabet.

The translation is very good, the commentary brief though clear, and the few critical notes understandable. In neither Jeremias nor Lamentations is there an index, nor is a bibliography given. The format is, as said above for *Die Psalmen*, not up to prewar standards but is far better than we might expect.

REVELATION AND RESPONSE IN THE OLD TESTAMENT. By Cuthbert A. Simpson. New York: Columbia University Press, 1947. Pp. x + 197. \$2.50.

The author of this little book (the Bishop Paddock Lectures of the General Theological Seminary) sets himself a triple objective: to show how the divine revelation to which the religion of Israel was a response was mediated through historical event; to show how the gradual unfolding of monotheism had as its concomitant a growing awareness of the essential unity of life; and to show how the creative minority in Israel came to realize the supranational significance of their community. The period included in the book extends from the beginning to the Exile.

Seven chapters describe the response of Israel to the successive revelations of historical events. Primitive Jahvism, in which Yahweh was revealed in the volcano of Sinai, learned the majesty and transcendence of God. This was merged with the Jahvism of Moses at Kadesh. The God of Kadesh, whose cult was in the hands of the Levitical priesthood, was pre-eminently a God of justice. From the fusion of the two cults there arose the concept of justice sanctioned by power. This concept was magnificently strengthened in the experience of that group of Israelites who fled from oppression in Egypt. The departure of the Israelites for Canaan was due to a revolt at Kadesh. In Canaan Jahvism assimilated the religion of Hebron, centered around the figure of Abraham, and from this religion derived the idea of the choice of God and personal submission to His will. The non-Mosaic Jahvism of the northern immigrants, by identifying Yahweh with the local gods of the land, gave him the attribute of creativity as manifested in the fertility of nature, but at the danger of destroying His transcendence. This danger was lessened when northern Jahvism was merged with southern. The unifying power of Jahvism was shown in the Philistine crisis, when it furnished a rallying point against the forces of disintegration, and became, under the statesmanship of Samuel, the basis of the monarchy. But when the monarchy under Solomon was perverted to a principle of disunity, then Jahvism became the protector of the common man against the state. The J<sup>2</sup> document, composed to supplement the J document of the south, was responsible for some important contributions: the inclusion of Babylonian myths of creation, which placed Jahvism against a world background and refined the embryonic idea of creativity, and the concept of the covenant relationship between Yahweh and His people. The work of Elijah in opposing Tyrian baalism resulted in the revolution of Jehu, based on the prophetic belief that merely national interests must be sacrificed to maintain the integrity of Jahvism. The ultimate failure of this revolution called forth the threats of Amos and Hosea's appeal to love; their "surrender to



the vision of God's righteousness and the holiness of His love" gave meaning to the catastrophe of the fall of Israel. Isaiah and Jeremiah both meet the problem of the relation of Jahvism and the state; and both see that the state is an instrument of the purpose of Yahweh, and must perish if it fail. The relations of Israel with other nations manifest the supranational character of Yahweh and of Jahvism, which cannot perish, whether it be saved, as Isaiah thought, in a remnant, or, as Jeremiah saw, in the individual's surrender of himself to God.

In a book of this size the history of the religious development of Israel can be drawn only in broad outline. The author, however, gives evidence of his acquaintance with the sacred text and with the scientific literature of the Old Testament. Nevertheless, the freedom with which he handles the history of the Hebrews is excessive. Certainly the development of the religion of the Hebrews is obscure in many points, especially in its earlier stages; certainly the sources of many Hebrew ideas may be traced to the contact of Israel with other ancient cultures; but it is not possible to write a history of the Hebrew religion on the basis of such a purely artificial reconstruction as we have here. Many such attempts have been made; they have all failed, and for the same reason.

Nor can the basic idea of "revelation and response" which gives the author his title be said to do justice to the Hebrew conceptions. The author desires to show the validity of this experience of the Hebrews; but his analysis, based on the work of Otto, leaves little if any room for objective reality in religious experience. In avoiding too crass a concept of revelation, it is not necessary to reduce the supernatural character of religious experience to the natural. In Dr. Simpson's interpretation, revelation is not only "mediated" through historical event, it is identified with historical event; and the formulation of the revelation, the "response," is nothing but a rational conclusion—if not a sentimental reaction—from events. Now it is true that the experiences of the prophets arose from historical events and receive their actual form from the personal "response" of the prophet; hence a grasp of the historical situation, and an understanding of the personality of the prophet, is essential to an interpretation of the writings of the Old Testament. But a rational conclusion from events is not to be dignified with the name of revelation; nor was this the experience which the prophets describe.

These basic misconceptions take much of the value from a book which otherwise shows a keen perception of the meaning of the Bible. It is well written and attractively printed. The index is quite complete.

**MENSCH UND MENSCHENSOHN.** *Vierzehn essays.* By Heinz Flügel. München und Kempten: Kösel, 1947. Pp. 204.

The author of this volume is a member of the Evangelical Church. As writer and lecturer he has been interested in doctrines that practically all the various Christian sects would admit. It is characteristic of him to be aware of the truth that Christianity is the solution to the otherwise tragic existence of man on earth.

The present book is composed of fourteen essays on scriptural topics: On the creation of man, in which he brings out the dignity of the first man coming from the hands of the Creator; on the sin of Cain and his followers throughout the history of mankind; on Job's piety; on Jeremiah's tragic prophecy; on John the Baptist; on the temptation of Jesus; on evil, by which he understands the complex of all evil that makes man subject to death; on the cure of the blind man described in John 9; on the betrayal by Judas; on the denial by Peter; on Pilate before Christ (significantly not, Christ before Pilate); on the Risen Savior; on Paul's sermon at Athens; on the last things. We liked particularly the chapters on John the Baptist, on Peter, and on the cure of the blind man.

There is much in this group of essays that deserves high praise. The author upholds the historicity of John's Gospel, and the historicity of man's creation and fall; he rejects the mere allegorical explanation of the temptation of Jesus; He speaks of the Incarnation of the Logos, thus holding the divinity of Christ. He also mentions the virgin birth of Jesus, the changing of bread into the Eucharistic food, and the eating of the flesh of Jesus and the drinking of His blood; supposedly he understands this as a reality. He correctly claims that Christ did not err when speaking of the end of the world, because by "this generation" He meant entire mankind.

There are some views of the author with which we cannot agree. He seems to hold that by eating the fruit Adam and Eve received sex knowledge (p. 22). The sons of God in Gen. 6:2 he thinks are angels who sinned with women (p. 24). Though he speaks of Jesus struggling with Satan himself, he seems to imply that the temptation was from within Jesus (p. 82ff). His interpretation of Matthew 16:18 in regard to Peter's faith in Christ as an earthly Savior is not correct. He sidesteps the problem of Peter's primacy in the Church.

Every once in a while the author chisels out a sentence that is worth remembering. "Speculative thinking of modern times believed it could answer this question (What is man?)—without God, and it soon showed that one robs man of his dignity by not giving God His honor" (p. 15). "Nowhere is the law of our being expressed in fewer words with such fearful sub-

limity and indisputable authenticity," referring to Gen. 1:27: "To the image of God he created him." "One certainly cannot deny that many an earthly potentate is made of the stuff in which the Antichrist himself will one day be incarnate" (p. 203). For the author, Christ is in his rightful place as the First-born of every creature; He stands on the summit of creation.

*Capuchin College,  
Washington, D. C.*

DOMINIC J. UNGER, O.F.M. CAP.

EXISTENZ UND OFFENBARUNG: EIN BEITRAG ZUM CHRISTLICHEN VERSTÄNDNIS DER EXISTENZ. By Heinz-Horst Schrey. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1947. Pp. xi + 170.

This study (not a dissertation) by a member of the Protestant theological faculty at Tübingen University will repay a careful reading by American Catholic philosophers and theologians. It reflects faithfully and contributes in its own right to a trend of thinking which began toward the end of the thirties and has become the dominant Lutheran standpoint in the postwar period. For a long time now, biblical criticism has ceased to be the reigning discipline which determines the content of faith. It has been seen that this field of research should neither be given the primacy nor allowed complete autonomy, but should rather be integrated with the other scientific studies which do not ground faith but make it reasonable in a world of critical intelligence. In the present book, there is not even an echo of the old controversies provoked by the alleged findings of unregulated Higher Criticism. But the resonances of crisis-theology are plainly heard. That movement was essentially ambiguous, for it could be interpreted either as a repudiation of all natural religious truth or as a covert exploitation of philosophical existentialism for theological ends. There was great need to clear up this ambiguity and to take a definite stand on the latest form of the problem of faith and reason. This has been the task facing Protestant thinkers during the past decade. The present work is a contribution to this discussion and is representative of a broad sector of opinion.

Due to the historical circumstances, the methodological question is of prime importance. Like many Lutherans today, Schrey is convinced that nothing is to be gained by establishing an opposition between revelation and natural reason such that they are in necessary conflict and consequently of no aid to each other. Catholicism's secret strength in the intellectual order has been its way of insisting upon the real distinction between the natural and supernatural orders, while also stressing the ultimate unity of all truth and the harmony which ought to obtain between various avenues

to truth. This lesson is not lost upon the contemporary Protestant mind, but it raises a difficulty which seems to preclude the development of any Protestant, especially Lutheran, counterpart of the Catholic position. Luther was notorious for his repudiation of "that whore, reason," along with all the pomp and works of philosophy. This attitude was in line with his theological view concerning man's natural state and powers (or impotencies) after the Fall. Apparently, there is no room for philosophy in the Lutheran ambit except at the cost of diluting the original deliverances of the Reformer or of denaturing philosophy.

Although he does not state this dilemma explicitly, Schrey is aware of his predicament and of the need to extricate himself without admitting the conclusion unfavorable to philosophy. His procedure involves both an historical and a theoretical side. Using Kant as a great hammer against previous philosophies, Schrey accuses them all of being infected with the illusion that metaphysics secures a general explanation of being in its entirety. He accepts as definitive the Kantian contention that metaphysics is in principle incapable of attaining the status of a strict science. But this still allows room for reason to work out an explanation of its object within a limited range. Schrey will recognize as genuine philosophy only that sort of speculation which keeps within the limits set by Kantian criticism. Philosophy must always be perspectival and modestly finite in intent. Furthermore—and here the influence of Heidegger's interpretation of Kant is apparent—philosophy is primarily concerned with man and humanly significant situations. Its basic question is not about the nature of being as such but about the nature and categories of human being.

How does this appeal to Kant further the Lutheran search after sound philosophical teachings? In close dependence upon the investigations of W. Link, Schrey maintains that Luther's struggle to free theology from philosophy did not issue in an unqualified rejection of philosophy but only of that Scholastic metaphysics in which he had been trained. His strictures were directed against the Scholastic *ratio*, not against a reason which knows its own shortcomings and operates only within a restricted sphere. Luther held that even in fallen man there remains the power of synderesis, which he understood to be a kind of natural light enabling the individual to appreciate his own destiny as a time-bound creature striving for complete perfection. This self-understanding of our natural condition is identified by Schrey with philosophy in the Kantian-existentialist sense of a perspectival inquiry into man's nature and activity in his environment. Philosophy is incommensurable with theology in two respects: it cannot make a deduction of the historical fact of revelation, and it cannot grasp human nature

precisely in its actual, historical determination as sinful. Hence faith is not built upon the foundation of philosophy. Yet this incommensurability is only a safeguard against the naturalizing of the supernatural. It prevents an immanentist interpretation of Christian truth, but it does not rule out all continuity between the deliverances of reason and those of revelation.

In accord with this benevolent interpretation of Luther, the relation between theology and philosophy is said to be dialectical and dialogic rather than antithetical. Since theology reflects upon God's redemptive dealings with man through Christ, an important step is taken when a philosophical theory of man is elaborated. Even the shortcomings of the philosophical approach are significant and useful as indicating in a negative way the transcendence of revelation and its "radicalization" of our notion of ourselves. Every age produces its own philosophical anthropology, and ours is best expressed in terms of existentialism. The main portion of Schrey's essay is an analysis of the temporality and historicity of human existence as a given reality, as a dialectical problem, and as an ethical crisis. In a brief concluding section, he shows how the Christian life realizes all the positive possibilities of man considered as a temporal being who longs for an eternal fulfillment. The result is an original and, at times, quite discerning description of this aspect of existence. Instead of relapsing into Dilthey's historicism, Nietzsche's prophetism, or Heidegger's atheism, Schrey seeks to synthesize the best features of these outlooks into a coherent view of past, future and present which is reconcilable with Christian revelation.

The present situation of German Lutheran theology brings philosophical issues more to the forefront than for a long time previously. Apparently, a similar development is occurring in American Lutheran circles. For Catholic thinkers who are interested in maintaining the lines of communication and serious discussion, this means that a wide field is being opened for mutual exploration. But the opportunity will be lost unless fundamental preparations are made through a direct study of the texts of Luther, Kant, Heidegger and Jaspers. This is the measure of good sense and good will which we must show under these circumstances. Moreover, attention must be directed to the main problems, such as the nature of metaphysics and the relation between philosophy, faith and theology. Numerous criticisms of details in Schrey's book come to mind, but the chief issues concern his interpretation of Luther's mind and his dependence upon Kant's judgment on first philosophy. These postulates should be considered at length before passing on to his exploitation of existentialist themes.

THE MYSTICAL BODY. By M. Eugene Boylan, O.Cist.R. Westminster: The Newman Bookshop, 1947. Pp. 130. \$1.75.

This is an American reproduction of an earlier publication in Ireland by the Mercier Press Limited. It comprises nine chapters which are, almost universally, good spiritual reading. Treating of our interior oneness of life with Christ, and of the centrality of Calvary as the source and focal point of all supernatural life, the author concludes to some splendid explanations of the meaning of our assistance at the Eucharistic sacrifice. A fervent chapter on Mary's universal motherhood and a final summary bring the book to a close. To be singled out for special praise is the handling of the book's central theme—the way in which our baptismal incorporation into Christ transcends “the time-sequence” and brings our whole lives into immediate vital contact with Christ dying upon the cross.

*The Mystical Body* is singularly free from technical phrases which would perplex the untrained reader. Such expressions as “that type of ‘incommunicability’ which is called subsistence” (to explain the idea of a “person”) occur but rarely in its pages. Less admirable, however, is the latitude which the author allows himself when he presents, within quotation marks, citations from other writers which do not exactly reproduce the text which is quoted. Thus we find two quotations (pp. 53, 67 f.) from Prat's *Theology of St. Paul*, each citing the same original passage, yet each differing verbally from the other and from the original passage cited. The second of these even interpolates (and stresses by partial italicization) a phrase which is entirely lacking in the original text. This is hardly calculated to inspire the reader with confidence in the general accuracy of the author's plentiful references to other writers.

Since this book has received special notice as a selection of the Spiritual Book Associates, it may be worthwhile here to remark that *The Mystical Body* is not all that its unqualified title might suggest. The reader who comes to it without an accurate understanding of what the Mystical Body is will still lack that accurate knowledge when he turns the last page. Indeed he might well gather some wrong impressions as he travels through the text; for he will not find a balanced explanation of the dogma of the Mystical Body, nor any integraton, however brief, of all the essential elements of that doctrine.

By far the more sublime element of “this social Body of Christ” (as Pius XII calls it so often in his more and more familiar encyclical) is the hidden divine life which activates it. This element the author describes at length, and often, as indicated above, with considerable excellence. But it is misleading to represent this secret flood of divine life into our inmost actions

as if it were the whole of the reality which transforms us together into Christ's Body. Yet this is what the present book does, by its silences as well as when it says: "We cannot see or perceive Christ or His Mystical Body, even though there is a sense in which the Church is visible" (p. 88). The author insists—and rightly—that Pius XII is giving an "authoritative interpretation of St. Paul" in the passages which he cites from the encyclical *Mystici Corporis* (pp. 41, 75). But quite equally authoritative are the words, in the same encyclical, which teach us that "this social Body of Christ has been designed by its Founder to be visible." Equally authoritative are the words which deplore a condemned error on the score that its champions "leave the Mystical Body of the Redeemer in such obscurity . . . that those who are seeking . . . cannot see it." And surely there is as much clarity as authority in the words with which the Holy Father opens his formal explanation of the doctrine of the Mystical Body, when he teaches us that this Body, precisely because it is a *Body*, must not only be an unbroken unity but "must also be something definite and perceptible to the senses."

Woodstock College

JOSEPH BLUETT, S.J.

MANUAL OF MISSIONARY ACTION. By J. E. Champagne, O.M.I. Translated by Roy L. Laberge. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1948. Pp. 743. \$5.00.

This volume, graced with a foreword by Cardinal Villeneuve, is the first of its kind since the translation of Schmidlin's *Catholic Mission Theory* by the Fathers of the Divine Word. It is a text-book of mission theory and practise and is a testimony to the industry and research of the author. Dr. Schmidlin based his earlier volume on the procedure of Gustav Warnek, a Protestant missiologist of the last century. This volume shows how Catholic missiology has come into its own in recent years.

The first part of the work discusses the idea of missions, missiography, the organizational side of the Church's missionary activity, the larger non-Christian religions and closes with a panoramic view of the expanding life of the Church through the centuries with a final emphasis on Canadian missions. The second part proposes the theological foundation of the missionary apostolate, drawing on Scripture, tradition and dogmatic theology. The third part develops the idea of missionary cooperation and missionary vocation. The fourth part is given to the consideration of the apostolate among dissenters with special and prolonged emphasis on the apostolate to Protestants.

The author accepts and defends as the specific objective of missionary work the establishment of the visible Church. This idea has been gaining

wider acceptance in the past few years, although there are some who still cling to the definition of the objective as the salvation of souls. One statement is made by the author with regard to some works on the missions which will not meet with universal agreement. He says: "Any work which is not concerned by its nature, or at least as a means, with the foundation of the Church, such as scientific works, linguistic works, ethnology, history, etc., is not a truly missionary activity" (p. 38). The exclusion of the above specified works seems to limit the scope of missionary activity too much. It seems arbitrary to exclude scholarly work and research. The norm for judging the missionary character of a work is stated by the author: "as long as these diverse ministries are directed toward the foundation of the Church, they are missionary works." But he excludes research, "economic and even medical works" from the category of strictly missionary works. The problem then is to determine what is meant by the "foundation of the Church." Generally it is stated that this means the establishing of the visible Church in such a position that it has most, if not all, of the instruments it needs for maintaining its own life. Such an objective requires that the Church have at least a minimum of economic well-being and cultural standing. Whatever, then, contributes to the elevation of the members of the Church from economic slavery and undignified dependence to economic security and independence in order that they may support the visible Church contributes to the foundation of the Church. Whatever contributes to the elevation of the members of the Church from ignorance to cultural superiority is part of the apostolate. Research and scholarly work in natural and human sciences certainly contribute to that cultural development whereby the wisdom of the Church and her sanctification of human knowledge are made more acceptable to non-Christian peoples. One cannot say that such fields of endeavor have no direct reference to or advantage for Christian life. Medical works certainly reveal the Church's sympathy with and care for the sick and underprivileged which is very necessary for the visible Church.

The missionary aspect of the Church's life in South America seems too restricted when the author says that "the missionary apostolate is confined to the Indians of the interior of the land still living in a state of savagery. Everywhere else, the Church already centuries old, is solidly established" (p. 50). One of the absolutely necessary conditions for an established Church is an adequate clergy. This does not exist in many parts of South America among great masses of people who are nominally Catholic. Notable progress is being made but conditions have not reached the stage where one can say that all of the dioceses are capable of taking ordinary care of the needs of souls. There are historical reasons for this condition, but the condition does



exist. With regard to the Philippines, while the author says that the Church is solidly established, he considers the archipelago in its entirety as a mission because of the scarcity of priests, and with that we agree. But we also apply the same idea to South America.

The scriptural foundation for the universality and unity of the missionary apostolate is well done. However, the proportion between the treatment of the Old Law and the Gospel seems out of balance; more space is given to the adumbrations in the Old Testament than to the revealed realization in the New. The Epistles of St. Paul and the Acts of the Apostles should be more adequately presented in a future volume, since they offer most complete scriptural foundation for the missionary apostolate and the idea of the universality of the mission of the Church.

The teaching of tradition is excellently done and shows a deep study of the Fathers. In presenting the teachings of the Holy See, it might have been good to offer the ideas of Pius XII in His Encyclical *Summi Pontificatus*, wherein he expresses so completely the unities which are the foundation of human solidarity in nature and in Christ. The chapter on the "Principles of Missionary Cooperation" profits much from the intense studies of our times on the nature of the member's participation in the life of the Mystical Body. This dogmatic foundation is built up out of the idea of the continuation of the Priesthood and Kingship of Christ in His Body, and the author applies to all members an obligation to participate by reason of their conformation to the priesthood of Christ effected by baptism. The moral foundation likewise is based on the necessity of the member's participation in the life, activity, and objective of the entire supernatural organism which is the Church. In discussing the motivation of missionary cooperation the author presents the objections of Fr. Charles. He says: "Certain missiologists have found it difficult to recognize in charity a *véritable raison d'être* of missionary cooperation" (p. 371). I doubt if Fr. Charles meant that the love of God and souls was not truly a motive for missionary activity. He could not deny that; but he does teach that the *raison d'être* or the specific reason for missionary activity is not charity. And I am inclined to agree with him. I think the author here confuses motive and origin of obligation; a primary motive need not be the primary source of the origin of an obligation. There is no doubt that gratitude to God for the gift of the faith and love of souls are exalted motivation for undertaking missionary work and for cooperating in missionary activity. I am sure there was no intention on the part of Fr. Charles to detract in any way from the primacy and excellence of love in the Catholic scheme of things. What he was objecting to was the idea of some that the origin of missionary activity is to be found in charity. These

objections of Fr. Charles should be treated not under the motives but under the dogmatic foundations of the obligation.

In presenting the works of missionary cooperation, necessary and extensive treatment is given to the pontifical works which rightly merit first place in eliciting the support of the faithful. The section on non-pontifical works is prefaced by a statement which does not tell the whole truth about them; "They sometimes provide such and such a mission . . . with the necessary help which could not be furnished by the pontifical works" (p. 458). It is certain that scarcely any mission could carry on with what it receives from the pontifical works alone. Not only sometimes but always must particular missions be given support by supplementary works; otherwise the power for expansion would be seriously handicapped. Among non-pontifical works are to be numbered not only national and specific organizations, but the vast undertaking of missionary congregations who gain by begging the greatest part of the material aid which is required for the missions. This point should have been emphasized by the author; otherwise an inadequate, if not false, picture is given of the way in which missionary enterprises are supported. The regulation of non-pontifical works in a given diocese is the right of the Ordinary. It is doubtful whether this power of regulation was intended to be an instrument for restriction and curtailment to the detriment at times of many particular mission works. It should be stated in all frankness that eighty percent of the material support necessary for many missions must be acquired by the missionary society that is evangelizing the mission. This does not detract from the primacy of the pontifical works, but it does reveal just how much begging has to be done by missionary societies.

Under works of "Intellectual Missionary Aid," could have been included the *Academia Studies on Foreign Missions* published by the National Office of the Society for the Propagation of the Faith in the United States. It is a unique undertaking in the Church which offers to all seminarians a rather comprehensive course in missiology, prepared for their level. At the end of the current scholastic year forty-eight distinct studies will have been published.

The volume closes with a rather long discussion on the apostolate to non-Catholics, especially Protestants. It offers ideas on such things as the requirements of the priest, misunderstandings, types of converts, the apostolate of laity and priest, instruction and Protestant missions. It is an apostolate which is very pertinent in North America but is not strictly a missiological problem in these areas. The Church is well established in Canada and the United States and therefore this apostolate is rather a question of conversion than of a mission. Responsibility for the further con-

version of a people in an established Church is the strict and direct obligation of the Ordinaries of the dioceses. Conversion of Protestants is a missionary problem in those countries where the Church is not visibly established: Sweden, Norway, Finland, Denmark, etc. Much valuable material is given in this part and its study would profit every priest.

In future editions the chapter on Protestant missions should be checked, especially for spelling of names; v.g., p. 725, Spener not Spencer; Zinzendorf not Ziezendorf; some prefer Francke to Franke; p. 730, Ziegenbald not Zingenbald. In view of the rather universal cry for Christian unity the following statement of the author requires modification: "The modern spirit is very much in favor of the creation of new sects founded by natives which would be self-sustaining through the adaptation which they have undergone" (p. 743). Such was the case in some instances twenty-five years ago but it is no longer true to characterize it as the modern spirit of the sects. There is a desperate effort for some kind of unity in Protestantism and it receives most encouragement from mission lands. The volume closes with statistical tables on Protestant foreign missions.

Unfortunately no valuable statistical tables on Catholic missions can be given. This is no fault of the author but a defect in our efforts to prepare statistics. There is no specific treatment of the technique of adaptation which has received so much emphasis from the Holy See in these latter years. Adaptation is a fundamental attitude of the Church and the missionary, and it is most necessary, especially in these times of exaggerated nationalisms and racism. Failure to follow the principles of adaptation has led too many missionaries to attempt to incorporate their own national and cultural pattern into the lives of mission peoples. Recent decisions of the Holy See with regard to Japan and Manchuria have called attention to the necessity of adaptation and the will of the Church to incarnate herself, so to speak, in the life of every people.

This English edition suffers by many examples of improper translation which should be corrected in future editions: Anschaire should be Ansgar; Methode should be Methodius (p. 42); build or establish instead of edify the Church (p. 55); embraced instead of englobed (p. 57); graphs instead of graphics (p. 57); prince of darkness instead of prince of shadows (p. 301); Pauline doctrine instead of Paulist doctrine (p. 353). Perhaps the title is too literal a translation of the French "action missionnaire."

Nothing but the highest praise is due the author for the preparation of this very valuable text-book. It should be in every seminary library and professors of religion in Colleges would derive much material from it, especially in discussing the phases of expansion in the life of the Church. The

objections of this reviewer do not in any way detract from the superlative quality of the work. They were intended as suggestions for further refinement of the matter.

*Weston College*

EDWARD L. MURPHY, S. J.

L'ÉGLISE DE FRANCE ET LA RÉVOLUTION DE 1848. By Jean Leflon. Paris: Bloud & Gay, 1948. Pp. 134.

To mark the centennial of the Revolution of 1848 plans were laid throughout France for local and general study of the period. In pursuance of this program Canon Jean Leflon, professor at the *Institut Catholique de Paris*, delivered a series of public lectures there. Five in number, and entitled "Rallying to the Republic," "Intellectual Renaissance," "Social Movement," "June and the Death of Msgr. Affre," and "Rallying to Prince Napoleon," they are now offered to the reading public in this slender volume. Eschewing the partisan attitudes which see in the Revolution of 1848 either a communist plot to overthrow the social and religious order, or a clerico-bourgeois plot to crush the workers, Canon Leflon traces developments with an eye to the factors which explain the seeming *volle-face* of the Church in 1848. In other words, his lectures seek an answer to the query why the hierarchy and clergy, in sympathetic entente with the Republic and democratic aspirations at the outbreak of the Revolution, rallied in the end around a man who only promised the preservation of order, when such rallying meant desertion of the Republic and loss of the working class.

Canon Leflon insists that, unlike that of 1830, the Revolution of 1848 was not anticlerical in the beginning. This he ascribes to the liberalism of Pius IX, the greater closeness of the Church to the people, its diminished ties with monarchy, the preponderance of clergy not of the noble class, and finally, the liberal views of bishops and distinguished lay journalists. Indeed laymen were in large part the exponents of Catholic thought because, preoccupied as they were with parochial duties, and for other reasons, the clergy as a class had sunk to a low intellectual level. To raise the standard of the clergy Bautain and Lamennais sought feverishly to adapt the Church to current thought, while Msgr. Affre, a man of vision, founded the *École des Carmes*, forerunner of the *Institut*.

The situation was complicated by the introduction of British economic liberalism which put the workers at the mercy of employers, and the Church, engrossed with the problem of political liberalism, turned too late to the defence of the helpless proletariat. Ozanam however, blessed as he was with clearer vision, pioneered the cause of social reform. But a financial crisis brought unemployment and suffering, and it cooled enthusiasm for the

Republic which could only offer national workshops as a solution. And when these failed, the alternately weak or autocratic measures of a bewildered government led step by step to insurrection. Unfortunately for the workers, the shooting of Msgr. Affre when he attempted to induce them to lay down arms was ascribed to them despite their disclaimers. With the conservatives aroused, Prince Napoleon capitalized on the identification of the revolutionary excesses with republican government, and posed as the champion and guarantor of order. A bitter journalistic controversy ensued over the demands of the workers and the need for social reform. While this was at its height the assassination of Rossi, and the outbreak of a revolt in Rome, convinced many that any association of the Church with democracy was impossible. Consequently, in the contest between Cavaignac and Prince Napoleon, support of the latter gave rise to the widespread belief that the Church was reactionary, and that Napoleon owed his power to clerical influence. Ozanam raised his voice in warning but his protests were unavailing. In vain, too, Montalembert insisted that the sacrifice of social reform to political expediency would result in the defection of the workers from the Church. In conclusion Leflon expresses the hope that, with the encyclicals of Leo XIII, Pius XI, and Pius XII as signposts, the error of 1848 may not be repeated by preferring present security to future prospects. In short, the burden of these lectures is a plea that the Church in France espouse the cause of the workers in the present unsettled state of affairs, if the workers are to be saved to the Church.

*West Baden College*

CHARLES H. METZGER, S.J.

THE HISTORY OF THE PRIMITIVE CHURCH. Volume IV. THE CHURCH IN THE THIRD CENTURY. Part II. By Jules Lebreton, S.J., and Jacques Zeiller. Translated by Ernest C. Messenger. London: Burns Oates & Washbourne Ltd., 1948. Pp. 391. 25s.

This volume completes the translation of the history of the primitive Church as it is found in Volumes I and II of the Fliche-Martin *Histoire de l'Église*. When the original appeared in 1935, it met with most favorable reception. Scholars everywhere hailed the work as one which has long been needed, approved the choice of Lebreton and Zeiller as writers eminently fitted for the difficult task of handling the first three centuries of the Church's history, and were unanimous in praising the general excellence of the presentation. As several critics pointed out, there is a certain carelessness in the arrangement of the material, which results in needless repetition and proves somewhat tedious to the reader. This is especially noticeable in the present volume, where the question of the conflict in the third-century Church be-

tween the learned and the unlearned type of believer is treated at length in two different sections of the book. It is a defect which mars the order and progress of the account, but it can easily be overlooked in view of the solid scholarship which characterizes the entire treatment of these three centuries of Christian life.

Father Messenger has made a faithful translation of all that is contained in the original. He omits nothing either from the text or from the critical apparatus, so that the reader need never fear that footnotes or references have been changed or abbreviated. He adds a few footnotes of his own, but indicates clearly that they are such. His most valuable contribution, apart from the essential service of presenting a handy and readable English version of the work, is the thirty-six page index which he has placed at the end of this volume. Thus he remedies a defect which was deplored by numerous reviewers of the original. The index is complete and covers all four volumes of the English translation.

In the translator's Preface there are two statements which are worthy of comment. The first is the somewhat misleading one which tells us that this volume "deals with the period which begins in the middle of the third century . . ." When the reader discovers that almost one-third of the book has to do with men and events dated before 250 A.D., he is apt to get the impression that the Preface must have been written before the final division of material for the various volumes had been made. The second statement is much more important. It is an announcement that "a beginning has now been made of the translation of other volumes" of this series, and that "the English version of the French third and fourth volumes, and possibly of the fifth also, will appear in due course, under the title *The Church in the Christian Roman Empire*." This is indeed good news. These carefully translated volumes make available to the English reading public a series of scholarly studies which gives every promise of presenting the most complete and the most satisfactory history of the Church yet written.

Weston College

FRANCIS O. CORCORAN, S.J.

CHRISTIAN APOLOGETICS. By Alan Richardson. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1947. Pp. 256. \$3.00.

Christian apologetics "is concerned with the implications of the Christian revelation for the rational understanding of the world and our existence in it. It seeks to show that revelation, as Christians understand it, is not merely compatible with the exercise of reason, but is actually a help and guide to the human reason in its attempt to understand; and, moreover, that revelation is not a figment of the imagination of Christians, but that it is a

category based upon observable facts and recognizable experiences, when they are correctly interpreted" (p. 21).

The author's conception of the relation between faith and reason may be deduced from the following excerpts. "It is becoming clearer nowadays that without a 'faith principle' no metaphysical system can be constructed" (p. 35). "Christian philosophy has given expression to its recognition of this universal truth about human thinking in the classical formula, *credo ut intelligam*" (p. 36). "The eighteenth-century conception of reason as a faculty by which men arrive at objective and rational judgements has been abandoned nowadays by almost all thinkers" (p. 72). "Man comes to the knowledge of the truth, not by the untrammelled exercise of his reasoning powers, but by accepting or being given the faith which enables him to use his reason aright; reason cannot work until it first makes an act of faith, and it does not work correctly—that is, rationally—unless it makes the *right* act of faith, unless it has faith in the Truth itself. Reason does not precede faith, as rationalism supposes, but faith precedes reason" (p. 77).

The author rejects the traditional distinction between natural and revealed knowledge, and supplants it with the doctrine of general and special revelation which he claims is Augustinian in conception. According to this theory, "it is maintained that all our knowledge of God is the result of divine self-revelation; indeed, we should rather say that all discovery, all knowledge of truth of whatever kind, is the result of the gracious and revealing activity of the God of truth. There is no such thing as a purely 'natural' or 'unaided' knowledge of God or of truth" (p. 120). The fall of man "signifies no mere loss of a *donum superadditum*, . . . leaving man's natural virtues and capacities (such as reason) intact. . . . (The) rationalism of Thomistic or eighteenth-century theories of a natural or rational knowledge of God is based upon an unduly optimistic view of human nature" (p. 132).

The relation between general and special revelation is quite complicated. Although "all revelation is saving" (p. 127), special revelation is "both an affirmation and negation of general revelation" (p. 129); it is a "correction and transvaluation of it" (p. 130). "The actual situation is that, until we accept the truth of special revelation, the truth as it is in Christ, we do not clearly see any portion of the truth as it really is" (p. 130).

According to the author, one of the great advantages of the doctrine of general and special revelation is that "it frees us from the traditional conception of revelation as a body of propositional truths contained in an infallible Scripture, from which the nineteenth-century viewpoint had broken loose" (p. 118). This reviewer fails to see the advantage resulting from this act of liberation, particularly since the whole biblical message is later de-

scribed as "God's address, or Word, to mankind; it is His authentic Word, and herein lies its authority" (p. 222). Such a description not only seems to confirm revelation as a "body of propositional truths contained in an infallible Scripture," but also leaves the impression that the author would be interested in the Catholic doctrine of inspiration which accounts both for the fact that God is the principal author, and allows for the "social conditioning," natural ability, and individual characteristics of each evangelist. He apparently does not have that doctrine in mind when he writes of the "progress of modern biblical science through its demolition of the traditional theory of the inspiration of the Scriptures" (p. 237).

The validity of the miraculous as a criterion of revelation is stressed, but post-Augustinian contributions and clarifications are noticeably absent. Both St. Thomas and Benedict XIV advanced beyond St. Augustine, particularly in regard to the probative value of miracles.

Perhaps the tone of the book and its essential weakness can best be exemplified by the following citation relative to St. Thomas and St. Augustine: ". . . in St. Thomas's view reason without revelation is still reason, and if it is true to itself it can still think rationally. Here lies the essential difference between St. Thomas's thought and St. Augustine's. For Thomas it is still theoretically possible for a man who has no faith to think rationally, however restricted may be the area in which rational thought is possible and however small be the likelihood of an individual thinker's becoming an Aristotle. Augustine has rejected even this degree of rationalism: reason without the light of revelation cannot function as reason, any more than a man's eye can function in a completely dark room" (p. 247).

Many would disagree with this interpretation of St. Augustine. As Gilson and others point out, St. Augustine never posed the question of whether the intellect could attain a modicum of truth without the aid of faith. Although his purely philosophical refutation of the sceptics would seem to indicate what his answer would be, his quest is for the fruition of infinite Wisdom, and in this it was obvious that reason alone would not suffice. St. Thomas, however, did face the problem of the competence of the unaided intellect within a restricted area, and his "hard and fast delimitation of the spheres of 'natural' and 'revealed' theology," instead of being his "cardinal mistake" (p. 245), was his signal triumph.

*Weston College*

DANIEL J. SAUNDERS, S.J.

THE PSYCHIATRIC STUDY OF JESUS. By Albert Schweitzer. Translated and with an Introduction by Charles R. Joy. Boston: The Beacon Press, 1948. Pp. 81. \$2.00.



With an introduction by the translator, and a foreword by Winfred Overholser, President of the American Psychiatric Association, this doctoral dissertation, which Schweitzer offered for the degree of Doctor of Medicine at Strassburg University in 1913, appears for the first time in an English version. The translator's introduction summarizes Schweitzer's conception of the messianic dignity of Christ, indicates how this conception occasioned the outbreak of various studies subjecting Christ to psychoanalysis, describes the concern felt by Schweitzer at this unexpected turn of events, and reveals his self-imposed obligation to refute the works of those scientists who had concluded that Christ was mentally ill.

The first concern of Schweitzer's refutation is to eliminate from consideration the entire fourth Gospel and certain parts of the Synoptics on the grounds that this material is unhistorical. This greatly facilitates the task taken in hand, since "three quarters of the matter studied by de Loosten, Binet-Sanglé and Hirsch come from the fourth Gospel" (p. 46). Schweitzer finds two radical faults in the scientists' treatment of the Gospel material which he accepts as historical. In the first place, their unfamiliarity with the apocalyptic viewpoint of the Jews disqualifies them from passing correct judgment on Christ's religious outlook; secondly, the data they have advanced cannot possibly conclude to a case of mental illness. Only this section of the dissertation is of any particular value.

*Weston College*

DANIEL J. SAUNDERS, S.J.

CATÉCHÉTIQUE. By Canon André Boyer. Paris: P. Lethellieux, 1947. Pp. 248.

The director of the Centre National Catéchistique of France here offers a simple and up-to-date manual on religious instruction. The volume is comprehensive in the sense that no important problem, movement or aspect in the field of catechetics fails to receive adequate treatment proportionate to the plan of a general manual. The author knows his field so well that he can write briefly and incisively.

A preliminary chapter achieves a solid basis for the work by a study of the catechetical directions of the Holy See. The remainder is then divided into two parts, the first dealing with the problems involved in teaching Christian doctrine, and the second with problems of Christian formation. In thus allowing the motto: "d'abord la vérité, la vérité pour la vie" to dictate the primary division of his book, Canon Boyer has achieved a much desired clarity and proper proportion between these two elements. In violent reaction against purely intellectual instruction in religion, recent manuals have too often confused the catechetical problem by depressing the

place of knowledge (as such) and exaggerating out of all proportion and even human possibility the place there is in the religion class for the application of religion to life. These two elements, always present in every well-conducted catechetical activity, are nevertheless distinct and separable, and they hardly enter in the same proportion into any two religion lessons. In the midst of the confusion, the separate treatment of these two interlocking aspects of catechetical work achieves a genuine clarity that may well be regarded as Canon Boyer's distinctive contribution to modern catechetical literature.

The first part of *Catéchétique* follows traditional lines in sketching content and method for the intellectual presentation of Catholic truth to various school groups. The chapter on the history of catechetics is briefer than one would expect. Worthy of special note for the American catechist—because such topics are often omitted from our catechetical manuals—are the chapters on the doctrinal preparation of adults for the reception of various sacraments and on the religious instruction of adolescent groups that correspond in general to our Newman Clubs and Catholic Action groups. A catechetical authority in his own right, the author shows by quotation and reference his familiarity with the findings of educational psychologists and methodologists as well as with those of other catechetical writers.

Rightly is the problem of Christian formation treated separately in the second part. It is a separate problem, however intimately connected with the first, and it is a problem that often belongs to others besides the classroom teacher of religion. Christian life is analyzed and found to be supernatural life, directed by faith, nurtured in hope by prayer, lived in charity; it is a life of supernatural virtues, even perhaps especially the "passive" virtues so prominent in the life of Christ. Formation for it must include an initiation into the liturgical and apostolic life of the Christian community.

Among the author's general observations on obstacles to the success of the catechist's labors, special note should be given to those on the danger of saturation that confronts many adolescents whose lives have been lived in sheltered Catholic associations. Human respect, bad companions, and the passions are the commonly recognized occasions for youthful falls. Canon Boyer traces many defections in the lives of hitherto young Catholics to the fact that they are "fed up" with religion. His observation merits attention.

*Fordham University*

JOHN F. DWYER, S.J.

DE CRIMINE PESSIMO ET DE COMPETENTIA STI. OFFICII RELATE AD ILLUD. By Aurelius Yanguas, S.J. Lucronii: Moderna, 1947. Pp. 31.

This valuable booklet is a reprint of an article published in the *Revista*

*Española de Derecho Canónico* and in the *Ilustracion del Clero*. The author has admirably attained his purpose of giving a brief but most clear and complete explanation of *crimen pessimum*. This ecclesiastical crime is treated fully in all its elements of definition, relation to canons 2358 and 2359, competence, procedure, and punishment.

Father Yanguas is not unmindful of the confused understanding that can exist of this crime. An example of this perception is his apt explanation that there is no obligation of positive law to denounce one who is guilty of *crimen pessimum*. This error is very possible, since the procedure for solicitation and *crimen pessimum* is the same. The author gives equal care to questions that can arise for priests in the handling of cases. The principles for imposing an obligation of denunciation from the natural law, the practical manner of fulfilling such an obligation, and the powers of religious superiors in relation to the crime are clearly detailed.

The practice of the Holy Office with regard to *crimen pessimum* was not published in the *Acta Apostolicae Sedis*. It has been difficult for priests to obtain even the text of the law. Father Yanguas' booklet will be a great aid to the wider knowledge and easy mastery of this important matter.

Woodstock College

JOSEPH F. GALLEN, S.J.

LA PRIÈRE DE L'ÉGLISE: LITURGIE DES SACREMENTS. By. L. Molien. Paris: Letouzey & Ané, 1947. Pp. 500.

This is the third volume of a set by its Oratorian author, the first volume of which handled the holy Sacrifice of the Mass, the second, the Liturgical Year. The present work devotes a preliminary chapter to Sacraments in general, and then in leisurely fashion, takes up the sacraments in the traditional sequence, baptism, confirmation, Holy Eucharist, penance, extreme unction, holy orders and matrimony. The treatment is liturgical in the main, but dogmatic and canonical considerations constantly recur, and historical explanations are afforded as needed.

It is to indicate the book's strength to say that it bases itself squarely on the great modern collections, *Dictionnaire de théologie catholique*, and *Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie*. It is also a limitation to note that it does not go far beyond the works named, excellent as they are, in selecting its materials. Great compilers, such as Morin, Martène, Renaudot, for instance, named at the outset, do not seem to have been often laid under direct levy, nor other important works consulted.

The style is very matter-of-fact, the outlines carefully drawn and indexed with precision, and the presentation couched, for the most part, in a French translation of the source-materials. The presentation makes for easy

orientation, and an informational survey of things not often found together save in such professedly historical treatments as Pourrat's. Every priest will surely find here what are for him new combinations.

*Saint Mary's College*

GERALD ELLARD, S.J.

THE THIRD SPIRITUAL ALPHABET. By Fray Francisco De Osuna (transl. by a Benedictine of Stanbrook). Westminster: The Newman Bookshop, 1948. Pp. xxxvi + 490. \$4.00.

Saint Teresa's copy of this book, now treasured in the Carmelite convent of Avila, is thus described by one who saw it: "Its yellow pages bear the traces of constant study. Whole passages are heavily scored and underlined, whilst on the margins, a cross, a heart, a hand pointing (her favorite marks) indicate the . . . thoughts which seemed to her most worthy of notice in the Gothic text." In chapter four of the *Autobiography* she herself relates that it was given to her by her uncle when she was quite young and that mainly from it she learned how to recollect herself and to pray. Throughout her life she continued to show a predilection for this encouraging book, and Fray Silverio de Santa Teresa, the latest editor of her works, does not hesitate to say that "the *Third Alphabet* is the book that had the strongest influence on her mysticism." The many footnotes to the present reprinted English edition draw attention to and strikingly verify this influence as it appears in her subsequent doctrine on prayer.

The author of the *Third Spiritual Alphabet* is Fray Francisco de Osuna, a Spanish Franciscan Observant of the Castilian Province, who was born about 1497 and died probably in 1541. He held important posts in his Order, was a preacher of some renown in Spain, published several collections of his sermons and also works on catechetics and spirituality, most of which have been forgotten. He brought out the *Third Spiritual Alphabet* at Toledo in 1527, followed it up with the *First Alphabet* in 1528, and finally with the *Second* in 1530. Together with three posthumous publications, all three Alphabets were gathered into one volume which appeared at Seville in 1554. Each Alphabet contains as many spiritual treatises as there are letters in the Spanish alphabet, each treatise in turn beginning with a successive letter of the alphabet.

As to content, the *First Alphabet* treats in traditional Franciscan fashion of the sufferings and passion of Christ; the *Second* is an ascetical tract; and the *Third*, beginning with five treatises on detachment from sin and mundane things, goes on to develop various spiritual topics as a setting for the two main themes of the book, namely, recollection and prayer.

The nature of prayer, its kinds, conditions, obstacles, and value are gone

into rather thoroughly, special stress being laid on the prayer of quiet. Indeed, the *Third Alphabet* is a kind of Franciscan manual leading the soul gradually to recollection and the prayer that goes by that name, but the ordering of the subject-matter leaves much to be desired, since it appears to be quite haphazard. The principal sources of the doctrine are Francis of Assisi, Bonaventure, Bernard, Gerson, Augustine, Gregory the Great, and several other Fathers of the Church, and the psychology of the medieval mystics is very much in evidence. The style is concrete, lively, and picturesque, abounding in scintillating metaphors and fanciful comparisons, already exhibiting some of that "preciosity" in writing which was to do so much harm to later Spanish literature. One can easily see how the *Third Alphabet* should have appealed to a temperament such as Teresa's was. Teresa found a kindred spirit in Fray Francisco de Osuna and like a true disciple she later on surpassed the master in her own descriptions of recollection and prayer. However, Osuna is still eminently worth reading and his book is recommended, particularly for its doctrine on the prayer of quiet.

The English translation here reprinted was made by a Benedictine some eighteen years ago and is a smooth one, easy to read. Father Cuthbert, O.S.F.C. in his introduction emphasizes Osuna's doctrine on the intimate relation of contemplation to the love of God, and insists that contemplation is not for the few but for the many. There is also a serviceable index.

*St. Mary's College*

AUGUSTINE KLAAS, S.J.

## BOOKS RECEIVED

- Aubier, Paris: *L'Évangile de Paul*, by Joseph Bonsirven. (pp. 364).
- The Beacon Press, Boston: *Channing Day by Day*, by José Chapiro. (pp. xxii + 446, \$5.00); *Essays on Freedom and Power*, by Lord Acton. (pp. lxvi + 452, \$5.00).
- Beauchesne et Ses Fils, Paris: *Verbum Salutis: Gratia Christi*, by Henri Rondet, S.J. (pp. 396); *La question des langues dans l'église ancienne*, tome I, by Gustave Bardy. (pp. vi + 293).
- Benziger & Co., Einsiedeln: *Die Grossen Ordensregeln*, edited by Hans Urs von Balthasar. (pp. 348).
- Charles Beyaert, Bruges: *Le bréviaire, prière de tous*, 2<sup>e</sup> édition, by Chanoine Rodolphe Hoornaert. (pp. 139, Fr.B. 38); *Caeremoniale in missa privata et solemni*, 5<sup>a</sup> editio, by C. Callewaert, I.C.D. (pp. x + 315, Fr.B. 158); *Newman et les Pères*, by Denys Gorce. (pp. 112, Fr.B. 48).
- The Bruce Publishing Company, Milwaukee: *De Eucharistia*, Tomus II, De Sacrificio, by Emmanuel Doronzo, O.M.I. (pp. x + 781-1219, indices pp. 47, \$7.00); *The Mass of the Future*, by Gerald Ellard, S.J. (pp. xviii + 360, \$4.00).
- Catholic University of America Press, Washington, D. C.: *The Ipso Facto Effected Dismissal of Religious*, by Benedict Anthony Pfaller, O.S.B. (pp. xii + 225); *Sacramental Penance in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries*, by Rev. Joseph A. Spitzig, A.B., S.T.L. (pp. xi + 196).
- Columbia University Press, New York: *The Critical Theology of Theodore Parker*, by John Edward Dirks. (pp. viii + 173, \$2.25); *The Naturalism of Samuel Alexander*, by John W. McCarthy. (pp. 111, \$2.50).
- Desclée et Cie., Tournai: *Initiation Biblique, introduction à l'étude des Saintes Écritures*, by Professeurs d'Écriture Sainte à l'Institut Catholique de Paris, sous la direction de A. Robert et A. Tricot. (pp. xxiv + 992, 4 tables and 8 maps, broché: Fr.B. 200).
- Die Dritttordenszentrale, Schwyz: *Das Psalmengebet*, by Peter Morant, O.F.M. Cap. (pp. xv + 1120 + 40).
- Editoria Liviana, Padova: *Attualità filosofiche*, by various authors. (pp. 370, L. 800)
- Fathers of the Sacred Hearts, Washington, D. C.: *Father Damien*, by Most Rev. Amleto Giovanni Cicognani. (pp. 47, .50).
- Fides, Montreal: *Plus de prêtres pour le salut du monde*, by R. P. Hermann Fischer, S.V.D., transl. by l'Abbé C. Poisson. (pp. 357, \$1.25).
- Harper & Brothers, New York: *Jesus, What Manner of Man?* by Henry J. Cadbury. (pp. xi + 123, \$2.00); *Morals and the New Theology*, by H. D. Lewis. (pp. 160, \$2.00).

- Herner Bücherei, im Kösel, München: *Musse und Kult*, by Josef Pieper. (pp. 98, DM. 3.60); *Wahrheit der Dinge*, by Josef Pieper. (pp. 145, DM. 4.80).
- B. Herder Book Co., St. Louis: *Dante Theologian, The Divine Comedy*, translated, with a commentary, by Patrick Cummins, O.S.B. (pp. 604, \$6.00); *The Joy of Serving God*, by Dom Basil Hemphill, O.S.B. (pp. x + 194, \$2.50); *Meditations for Everyman*, Vol. II, by Joseph McSorley, C.S.P. (pp. vi + 211, \$2.75).
- King's Crown Press, New York: *John Hales of Eton*, by James Hinsdale Elson. (pp. ix + 199, \$2.50).
- P. Lethielleux, Éditeur, Paris: *Scriptum Super Sententiis*, by St. Thomas Aquinas, recog. et iter. edidit Maria Fabianus Moos, O.P. (pp. 1142).
- Longmans, Green & Co., New York: *Essays and Sketches*, by John Henry Newman, edited by Charles Frederick Harrold. (Vol. I, pp. xviii + 382; Vol. II, pp. xvi + 368; Vol. III, pp. xvi + 381, \$3.50 per vol.); *The New Testament in the Westminster Version of the Sacred Scriptures*, by Cuthbert Lattey, S.J. (pp. 479, \$4.00).
- The Mission Press, San Antonio: *The True Concept of Literature*, by Austin J. App, Ph.D. (pp. v + 110, cloth \$2.00, leatheright, \$1.00).
- E. Nauwelaerts, Éditeur, Louvain: *L'homme nouveau, études de pastorale*, I, by various authors. (pp. 296); *Philosophie et théologie chez Guillaume d'Ockham*, by Robert Guelluy. (pp. xxiv + 383, Fr. 190).
- The Newman Bookshop, Westminster: *The Case of Peter Abelard*, by Ailbe J. Luddy, O. Cist. (pp. ix + 94, \$2.50); *Introduction to the Devout Life*, by St. Francis de Sales, edited and translated by Allan Ross. (pp. 272, \$2.50, paper \$1.25); *The Lord's Sermon on the Mount*, by St. Augustine, transl. by John J. Jepson, S.S., (from the series "Ancient Christian Writers"). (pp. vi + 227, \$2.75).
- Office du Livre Catholique, Rome: *La connaissance humaine*, by Leon Veuthey. (pp. 365).
- Officium Libri Catholici, Rome: *De Verbo Incarnato et de B. V. Maria*, by Corentino Larnicol, C.S. Sp. (pp. 246).
- Ferdinand Schöningh, Paderborn: *Katholischer Glaube*, by Matthias Laros. (pp. 248); *Theologie und Glaube; Werkheft für den Katholischen Klerus*, Heft 1. (pp. 88).
- Sheed & Ward, New York: *A Treasury of Russian Spirituality*, compiled and edited by G. P. Fedotov. (pp. xvi + 501, \$6.50); *Young Mr. Newman*, by Maisie Ward. (pp. xvii + 477, \$4.50).
- Società Editrice "Vita E Pensiero," Milan: *La Fecondazione artificiale*, by Fr. Agostino Gemelli. (pp. 75, L. 100).

- St. Anthony Guild Press, Paterson: *The Holy Bible: The Book of Genesis*, transl. by members of the Catholic Biblical Association of America. (pp. vi + 130, \$1.00); *Magnificent Man*, by Valentine Long, O.F.M. (pp. xiii + 270, \$2.50).
- St. Francis Major Seminary, Milwaukee; *Proceedings of the First National Congress of the Enthronement of the Sacred Heart in the Home, Milwaukee, Wisconsin, July 16-18, 1946*. (pp. 92, \$1.00).
- University of Chicago Press, Chicago: *Mysticism in Religion*, by Very Rev. W. R. Inge. (pp. 168, \$3.50).
- Zwingli-Verlag, Zurich: *Die Tauflehre des Neuen Testaments*, by Oscar Cullman. (pp. 80, Fr. 5.50).