

Book Reviews 749

between principles of faith (serving the poor, suffering people of Nicaragua) and concrete decisions (whether to support an armed revolution, lead the literacy campaign, accept the Minister of Education position and to remain a Jesuit) offers a fascinating look into a priest trying to live out the ecclesiology of Vatican II—that is, a church in service to the world. What emerges is a process of discernment firmly anchored in the love of God and Ignatian spirituality that addresses the messy social, political, and economic situation driven by fallible human beings with varying perspectives.

While most of North America has been riveted by the life and death of Oscar Romero and the UCA Jesuits (and rightly so), the church of Nicaragua offers some very important, though lesser-known examples of concrete ecclesiology we would do well to study. For example, reading of the role of Amando Lopez, SJ, who worked at the UCA in Nicaragua prior to his martyrdom in El Salvador, completely changed my image of the work of the Jesuits in Central America. Additionally, C. admits to a Cuban presence in Nicaragua, especially in relation to the literacy campaign, but minimizes the role of Cuba in the overall influence and conduct of the revolution itself.

Insightful, accessible, and very interesting, I highly recommend this book for upper-class undergraduates or master's students, or researchers studying the church of Latin America or global ecclesiology. The editing, translation, and interpretation by Kathleen McBride and Mark Lester are very well done.

Thomas M. Kelly Creighton University, Omaha

From Rome to Royal Park. By Gerald O'Collins, SJ. Ballarat, Australia: Connor Court, 2015. Pp. ix + 240. \$29.95.

This is the third volume of O'Collins's memoirs. It covers the period from his leaving Rome in June 2006 to Pentecost 2015. Not merely a personal diary packed with people, speaking engagements, and other events, it contains close argument on important church matters and a 27-page assessment of Pope Benedict XVI. While much of "self" is on display, so too are O'C.'s generous nature and ecumenism.

Three main concerns of O'C. about the Catholic Church emerge in this book: reform of the Curia, the proper interpretation of Vatican II documents and their faithful implementation, and strong disapprobation of the 2010 English translation of the Roman Missal.

Interpretation of the council's texts, he maintains, should not, as it has done, give preference to the intention of the drafters, but should give priority to the texts themselves, while also regarding the meaning ascribed by successive readers, to the readers' contexts and to the authors' intentions.

The elegant 1998 revised English translation of the Roman Missal, approved by all English-speaking conferences of bishops, was, "without any discussion . . . consigned to oblivion" (147) by Cardinal Medina Estévez. Its replacement, the 2010 Missal, largely the work of the "ironically" (147) named Vox Clara committee, aimed simply to follow closely the Latin original and employ a "sacral" style. O'C.'s withering critique

of the Missal and especially its sacral style is compelling. Though inconsequential overall, I disagree on one detail: O'C. deprecates the relative clause in, for instance, "O God, who on this day revealed . . . ," and says that *the* correct English is "O God, on this day you revealed . . ." The latter form is found in some modern Anglican collects, but, to my ear, its abruptness jars.

O'C.'s views on three popes constitute the book's remaining focus. To the few shadows in John Paul II's papacy noted in earlier volumes, O'C. adds "too many . . . regrettable choices of bishops" (8). He also criticizes the pope's reluctance to act on clear evidence against Marcial Maciel, founder of the Legionnaires of Christ, who was later disciplined by Pope Benedict XVI.

O'C. justifiably asserts that, had John Paul II died in the 1990s, Cardinal Martini, outstanding archbishop and eminent biblical scholar, would have succeeded him. But by the time of the conclave he had developed Parkinson's disease. Martini "would have ranked amongst the greatest papal preachers—with Leo the Great and Gregory the Great" (223).

The assessment of Joseph Ratzinger/Pope Benedict XVI is more balanced than his previous comments, which mainly arose from the pursuit of Jacques Dupuis. O'C. acknowledges Ratzinger's contribution to Vatican II, but that that belonged to his earlier years. He does not accept the view that Ratzinger in Rome was a theological giant: "that title applies rather to Cardinal Walter Kasper" (27). But, from the first, Pope Benedict's homilies impressed by being clear, brief, and intelligible, whereas Pope John Paul II's addresses were often too abstract for his audiences. O'C. praises (sometimes with qualification) several of the pope's encyclicals and books, his "groundbreaking" (38) letter to Catholics in China, his support of urgent causes for Christianity and the world, and his 2008 UN address. He concludes with a discussion of papal statements and actions that were "doubtful, disappointing, or worse" (41). These include harming relations with Muslims by his 2006 Regensburg University address; exiling the Islamic expert, Archbishop Fitzgerald and relying instead on Cardinal Bertone, his undistinguished Secretary of State; displeasing Anglican leaders by providing for ordinariates for converting Anglicans, which seem "at best unnecessary and at worst divisive" (43); saddening Jewish people by authorizing wider use of the 1962 Latin Missal without rewriting its outdated Good Friday prayer for the conversion of the Jews, and then issuing an unsatisfactory revised prayer; and lifting the automatic excommunication of the bishops illicitly consecrated by Archbishop Lefebvre, only to discover that one had long publicly denied the Holocaust. O'C. agrees with Peter Hünermann that lifting the excommunications proved a failure in the exercise of the papal office.

Pope Francis has brought the church and the world a "blessing" (145). His election "reflected a widespread concern for a radical reform of the Curia and the desire for a pope without links to an establishment widely seen as dysfunctional or even corrupt" (163). Trenchantly, O'C. shows how after Pope Paul VI—despite Vatican II's teaching on collegiality and its desire for curial reorganization—the Curia's power had, by arrogation and through acts and inaction of Francis's two predecessors, only increased at the expense of the bishops. O'C. records some hopeful signs

Book Reviews 751

from the current pope—his chosen name, the self-reformation he requires of the Curia, and his apostolic exhortation *Evangelii Gaudium* (*EG*). O'C. discerns areas where *EG*'s teaching builds on but goes beyond Vatican II, including that other Christians are no longer separated brethren, but pilgrims journeying alongside Catholics, and that Christians cannot consider Judaism a foreign religion.

John M. Batt Anglican Diocese of Melbourne (emeritus)

The Francis Effect: A Radical Pope's Challenge to the American Catholic Church. By John Gehring. New York: Rowman & Littlefield, 2015. Pp. xvii + 267. \$32.

The strength of Gehring's treatise is his juxtaposition of the fresh winds of mercy and reform that Francis has unleased alongside the history of the transformation of the American bishops from the 1970s to the present.

G., who is Catholic director at the advocacy group Faith in Public Life, recounts how in the initial years after the Second Vatican Council, the American bishops were a powerful force for social justice, for economic reform, and for international disarmament. But after his election in 1978, John Paul II put a severe brake on the reforming energies of the council. And as the bishops of the 1970s retired, the new appointments in the American hierarchy became known for a narrow agenda more closely aligned with one political party. G. states that during the 35 years that John Paul II and Benedict XVI led the church, leading American Catholics "baptized the Iraq War, made an idol of unfettered markets, and narrowed Catholic identity to a checklist that aligned neatly with the Republican Party" (19).

Although the council had resurrected the earlier ecclesial understanding that a local bishop had near sovereignty on pastoral care in his own diocese, John Paul II not only reined in the bishops, but quashed innovative initiatives in religious orders and among leading theologians. In addition, the men selected as bishops were scrutinized for what passed for orthodoxy on birth control, married clergy, and the ordination of women. The result was that, with some notable exceptions, the American bishops became increasingly defensive and more at war with the culture than engaged with it. G.'s chapter explaining how the American Catholic Church became a "culture warrior church" (19) aptly captures the denouement of the hierarchy's effective public leadership.

Even after Benedict published an encyclical in 2009 that denounced the "scandal of glaring inequalities" and included passages about the prudent oversight of global markets, George Weigel "knowingly assured us that the pope did not really believe what he said" but had to accommodate the curial officials in the Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace (20).

The battle for the identity of the church which ensued over three decades often paralyzed the church and muted its witness to Christ and the Gospel. In addition, the Supreme Court decision *Roe vs. Wade* in 1973 stirred up Catholics to address the