

Scripture and tradition (DV, 9–10) and *Lumen Gentium* to redefine church membership (LG, 8). Through this analysis, W. successfully demonstrates how the presence of Orthodox and Protestants contributed to the development of conciliar teachings.

In chapters 3 and 4, W. further argues that just as the synods of bishops continue the collegial spirit of the Council, so too the post-conciliar participation of Orthodox and Protestants as fraternal delegates reveals the church's ongoing commitment to ecumenism. In contrast to the Council, fraternal delegates such as then Archbishop of Canterbury Rowan Williams, Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholomew, and Patriarch Abuna Paulus of the Coptic Church have been given an official and active status in past synods. In these chapters, however, W. misses an opportunity for analyzing the differences between the ecumenical conversation at the level of the universal church during the General Assemblies (chapter 3) with the local, contextual concerns mentioned during the continental synods for Europe, Africa, Asia, America, and Oceania (chapter 4). This analysis could have illuminated how the ecumenical conversation has developed beyond the Eurocentric tendencies of the Second Vatican Council.

Through exhaustive archival research in the first four chapters, W. illuminates the often hidden historical contributions of Orthodox and Protestants to the conciliar and synodal assemblies of the Roman Catholic Church. His most interesting theological insight, however, occurs in the final chapter. Grounded in an understanding of the Catholic magisterium as successors of the apostles and guardians of the deposit of faith, he claims that “in a way analogous to that of the Catholic faithful and theologians, the Magisterium [listens] to members of other Christian Churches and Ecclesial Communities in their capacity as observers, guests and fraternal delegates” by helping “the teaching office to present the substance of the deposit of the faith in new ways which are relevant for the times as well as providing insights that have led to a deeper understanding of that deposit” (319). In effect, he equates the insights of Orthodox and Protestant observers, guests, and fraternal delegates with the status of the *sensus fidei* and the vocation of theologians. W.'s perspective on non-Catholic Christians echoes the International Theological Commission's statement on the *sensus fidei* (2014), which argues for the fundamental role that the Catholic faithful and theologians play in assisting the magisterium in the development of doctrine. Because the title of this work promises a theological analysis, it would have been more effective if W. had woven this thesis into previous chapters as historical evidence presented itself. Future elaboration of this theological insight, however, suggests new possibilities for how the Holy Spirit may guide the church into greater depths of the tradition.

Jaisy Joseph
Boston College

Ireland & Vatican II: Essays Theological, Pastoral and Educational. Edited by Niall Coll. Dublin: Columba Press, 2015. Pp. xix + 330. \$24.

In a broad-ranging and very accessible account of how the Second Vatican Council affected (or failed to affect) the Catholic Church and other Christian bodies in Ireland,

Coll has brought together twenty-one other contributors and created a rich, informative volume. A high level is guaranteed by chapters provided by Eamonn Conway (“Vatican II on Christian Education: A Guide through Today’s ‘Educational Emergency’?”), Colin Harvey (“Encouraging Dialogue? Human Rights and Vatican II”), Baroness Nuala O’Loan (“Vatican II: Liberation and Authenticity”), and Oliver Rafferty (“The Catholic Church in Ireland and Vatican II in Historical Perspective”). An ecumenical perspective is supplied by Richard Clarke, the Church of Ireland Archbishop of Armagh (“Vatican II Fifty Years On: Some Anglican Reflections”) and Patrick Mitchel, Principal of Belfast Bible College (“The Influence of Vatican II on the Protestant Churches in Ireland”). While Mitchel’s chapter is illuminating, Clarke goes further with promising suggestions about the ecumenical celebration of baptism (51) and shared study of the Scriptures (53).

Personal experiences and memories color almost all the contributions. The autobiographical horizon is strongly present in such chapters as Paul Andrews (“A Whirlwind of Change, New Life: One Jesuit’s Experience”), Juanita Majury (“The Second Vatican Council and the New Religious Movements in Ireland”), and Gerry Reynolds (“Ecumenism: A Personal Pilgrimage”).

Over and over again contributors discuss trenchantly the forces and individuals responsible for the present state of the church and society in Ireland. Rafferty comments on “the magisterial authority” claimed by some in the media: they can pronounce “with an infallibility which would be impossible even in the ecclesiastical sphere” (14). Yet, as Andrews points out, a particular group, the Irish journalists covering Vatican II, proved “a remarkable band” (64) and better attuned to the work of the Council than lackluster bishops.

Some of the challenges that are highlighted belong to the particular history of Ireland, but many face the Catholic Church elsewhere. Andrews recalls the question Cardinal Suenens put in 1964 to the bishops at Vatican II: “Why are we discussing the reality of the Church when half of the Church is not represented here?” (34). More than fifty years after the close of the Council, the minor place of women in the governance of the church remains far from satisfactory—not only in Rome but also around the world. Andrews also underlines a scandalous episode in the liturgical life of the whole English-speaking church: “the new translation of the liturgy has been a catastrophe, both in the manoeuvrings that led to it and in the outcome” (65). Curiously Edward McGee (“Towards a Fuller Participation in the Liturgy: Embracing the Mystery of God”) remains silent about this liturgical scandal, which militates against priests and people participating fully in the liturgy. Sharon Haughey’s proposals about staff and students in Catholic schools developing prayerful and spiritual lives (“Spirituality in School: Encouraging Young Faith”) offer excellent advice for Catholic education anywhere.

In the area of social justice, the post-Vatican II Irish Church invites admiration. But more must be done, at home and abroad. Such contributors as Colin Harvey (see above), Aidan Donaldson (“The Preferential Option for the Poor”), Gerard McCann (“A Philosophy of Hope and Vatican II”), and Pascal Scullon (“A Response to the Violence in the Modern World”) draw on the Council, papal teaching, theological

writing, and recent history to make proposals that concern social action in the whole Catholic world. Apropos of Donaldson's account (162) of two documents on liberation theology issued by the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith (in 1984 and 1986, respectively), the second offsets somewhat the caricature that was the first. Cardinal Roger Etchegaray drafted the second text (see Gerald O'Collins, *On the Left Bank of the Tiber* [Brisbane: Connor Court, 2013], 197–98). What Eugene Duffy writes about the failure to practice collegiality and synodality ("Reimagining the Church in Ireland in the Light of Vatican II") touches the Catholic Church more or less everywhere.

An index of names would have enhanced the value of the volume. But, all in all, this is a valuable contribution to the study of the Second Vatican Council and its aftermath. It achieves its goal of evaluating the past impact of Vatican II and its relevance for a promising future.

Gerald O'Collins, SJ
University of Divinity, Melbourne

The Church: Always in Need of Reform. By Gabriel Daly, OSA. Dublin: Dominican, 2015. Pp. 302. \$20.05.

Twenty years ago it is doubtful that a Catholic publishing house would have accepted this manuscript. Had a venturesome publisher printed it, Roman authorities would assuredly have denounced its contents. But attitudes change, even in the church, and the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith has arguably become less defensive. Under a new pope, what was once labeled dissent might be assessed as faithful criticism. Daly, an Irish Augustinian friar, now in his late eighties, following a productive ministry of over thirty years of teaching at the Milltown Institute, the Irish School of Ecumenics, and Trinity College, Dublin, obviously feels free to bluntly critique problematic Catholic structures and vigorously to promote the agenda: *ecclesia semper reformanda*. His classic 1980 study, *Transcendence and Immanence: A Study in Catholic Modernism and Integralism*, serves as background to this assessment of ecclesiology. Reading this present work, I noted a similarity in tone and content between D.'s *Church* and Antonio Rosmini's ill-timed *Delle Cinque Piaghe della Santa Chiesa* (The Five Wounds of the Holy Church) written in 1832 but published only privately in 1848, whereupon Pius IX promptly had it placed on the Index. (Decades later, thanks in part to John XXIII's commendation, a papal apology to Rosmini was issued in 2001 and Benedict XVI even beatified Antonio in 2007.)

D.'s mature work contains seventeen chapters, including an autobiographical note and then discussions on a wide variety of topics including the reception of Vatican II, diversity and unity in the church, fundamentalism, ecumenism, the laity, the responsibility of theologians, revelation, collegiality, sexuality, and so on. This is not a collection of previously published articles but an original, tightly woven synthesis of topics long mulled over by the author and now brought to fruition. Begun during the papacy of Benedict XVI, it also incorporates the ministry of Pope Francis (elected pope March