

God” (163). In chapters 3 and 4, she turns to the *Spiritual Exercises* of Ignatius of Loyola and *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, respectively, to suggest a flexible model (not a rigid mold) for forming ministers into persons of discernment capable of learning from the local church. Defining discernment as a virtue, a habitual disposition and practice, O. lifts up the qualities of imagination, humility, indifference, and consolation as resources for a spirituality of episcopal ministry. In reflecting on *The Constitutions*, O. focuses exclusively on the Jesuit superior and those persons and structures designed to assist his discernment.

Despite the clear personal, practical, and pastoral concerns of these chapters, the discussion remains fairly abstract. The book is a balanced theological reflection on a few primary texts, not an analysis of how personal or ecclesial forms of discernment have actually played out in the life of the church. Nor is there much explicit engagement with the extensive literature on the *sensus fidelium*, the theology of the episcopate, or the *Spiritual Exercises*.

In all of this, O. never suggests that the Ignatian way is the only path, or that every bishop ought to be a Jesuit. In a final chapter, O. appeals to broader principles for discernment: acknowledge limitations, learn with and through others, seek personal transformation. She draws on these principles to propose renovating specifically diocesan processes and structures—such as pastoral and presbyteral councils, diocesan synods, pastoral visitations, and the role of various collaborators, ranging from the college of consultors to a spiritual director—in order to deepen the bishop’s capacity for discerning the *sensus fidelium*. The appeal to one particular tradition serves to fire the imagination and open up other possibilities for grounding the question of the *sensus fidelium* in transformative spiritual processes, not only for the bishop, but also for other ministers, and for all of the faithful.

For many bishops formed in the unidirectional ecclesiology of recent church teaching, it can be hard to admit that there is something to learn from the flock entrusted to their care. At root this is a spiritual issue calling for spiritual conversion. Perhaps the constant encouragement of Pope Francis to bring discernment into every corner of ecclesial practice will open up space for O.’s argument to be heard. Francis (a Jesuit who also happens to be a bishop) has had a few things to say about pastors smelling like their sheep, and he knows that this flock is not a passive herd, but a people of faith “who have a flair for finding new paths” (161).

Edward P. Hahnenberg
John Carroll University, Cleveland, OH

The Theological Roots of Christian Gratitude. By Kenneth Wilson. Pathways for Ecumenical and Interreligious Dialogue. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015. Pp. viii + 239. \$100.

Kenneth Wilson’s goal in this ambitious, astute, and often inspiring work is first to explore how a Christian account of gratitude can enrich and transform our lives by

broadening our understanding of all for which we can be grateful. He argues not that other religions lack an appreciation for gratitude, but that an examination of gratitude in light of the Christian narrative's disclosure of God's ceaselessly creative and redemptive love heightens our appreciation of this virtue and its role in a flourishing life. Being deeply aware of God's blessings changes our understanding of ourselves and our place in the world, and nurtures the generosity and selflessness necessary for attending to and advancing the well-being of others. Second, W. contends that rediscovering the value of gratitude can renew the professions by helping persons in those roles see them not primarily as careers but as vocations. Gratitude also fosters the awareness that professional excellence, while requiring compliance with pertinent laws and regulations, foremost demands empathetic care for patients and clients.

The strength of W's. theological investigation rests in his pivotal claim that gratitude is awoken in us when we grasp the core message of Christian revelation: God, whose creative, insightful, and generous love, has brought everything into existence, remains fiercely committed to the flourishing of all God's creatures. "At the heart of the Faith," W. movingly explains, "there lies the life-giving belief that God desires the well-being of everything he is making and is wholly focused on its flourishing: he loves it with all that he is" (130). This awareness is rooted in a Christian theology of creation that sees everything that God has brought into being as a gift that is unqualifiedly good. Such recognition, W. suggests, evokes the wonder and curiosity that inspire gratitude and draw us out of ourselves in love. That recognition is deepened and sustained in the Eucharist where Christians celebrate the mystery of God's unbreakable love for the world as it is most eloquently revealed in the life, death, and resurrection of Jesus. The narrative of Jesus's life, recapitulated at the Eucharist, confirms "that God's love for his creation will never be withdrawn: He is *really* present, immovable" (40).

Perhaps the most compelling dimension of this volume is W's. analysis of what it means for human beings to be created in the image and likeness of God. If the essence of God's character is to be lovingly and redemptively committed to the flourishing of all God's creatures, then human beings most fully image God when, prompted by gratitude, they habitually aspire to do the same. Thanks to the freedom God has risked entrusting to us, our dignity lies in participating with God in caring for all creatures and in bringing other persons more fully to life. Put differently, we become ourselves most completely—and therefore discover the most truly human way of life—through love, a love that calls us out of ourselves in joyful service to the world's flourishing. Thus, for a Christian, gratitude, far from being a passive emotion, is a virtue that prompts us to be continually alert to how we can give of ourselves on behalf of others.

This is an important work that challenges the reader to appreciate the absolute importance of an often-overlooked virtue. But the book lags in spots because W. attempts to do too much. His desire to show the importance of gratitude for renewing and transforming the professions is laudable, but often becomes a distraction that seems more an unfortunate interruption of his rich theological analysis than an

essential element of the book. Perhaps it would have been better to devote an entire chapter to the potential impact of gratitude on the professions rather than to treat it intermittently throughout the book. Similarly, the breadth of topics that W. addresses is impressive, but it is not always clear how they fit a study of gratitude. This might be especially true of his argument for the value of a liberal education for anyone entering a profession. A reader may heartily agree, but also be baffled as to how it advances the book's central claims about gratitude. And yet, other subjects W. explores, perhaps especially beauty, are so intriguing that one wishes they could have been treated more fully.

These criticisms are minor. W. provides a thorough and convincing argument for why what might at first seem like a lesser virtue is truly essential for shaping a way of life that is both genuinely good and fulfilling precisely because it continually reaches beyond itself. That alone might make gratitude especially pertinent for our times.

Paul J. Wadell
St. Norbert College, De Pere, WI

Commonwealth and Covenant: Economics, Politics, and Theologies of Relationality. By Marcia Pally. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2016. Pp. viii + 419. \$50.

Pally combines the rival notions of separability and situatedness in a theology of relationality under the rubric of "separability-amid-situatedness," namely, preservation of the ontological integrity of the individual human person within an antecedent all-encompassing social context. Thereby one avoids extreme separability (rugged individualism) and extreme situatedness (totalitarian control of the structures of society). Her book is divided into two parts. In part 1, she develops her *ontology* of separability-amid-situatedness by reviewing the writings first of philosophers, political scientists, and economists who are known for their emphasis on separability but always within a pre-given social context: for example, Thomas Hobbes, John Locke, and Adam Smith. Then she reviews the writings of other thinkers who focus on situatedness but still try to preserve separability or personal freedom: for example, French structuralists like Émile Durkheim and post-structuralists like Michel Foucault, contemporary thinkers like Charles Taylor and Alasdair MacIntyre.

Then in a much longer part 2, P. reviews various *theologies* of relationality. She identifies the notion of *imago Dei* as best exemplified in "the capacity for responsible relationships" (161) and freedom of conscience (170–74), both exemplified in early American Protestantism (175–81). She reviews the notion of covenant in the Hebrew Bible and notes with Jewish commentators that covenant with God necessarily implies covenant with other human beings and non-human creation (182–213). Likewise, she reviews the development of the Christian doctrine of the Trinity in the hands of the Cappadocian Fathers with their emphasis on *perichoresis* as the link between the distinct divine persons (218) and in the modern trinitarian theologies of Pannenberg, Rahner, Moltmann, Boff, and Gunton (215–32). She then